This thesis has been submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for a postgraduate degree (e.g. PhD, MPhil, DClinPsychol) at the University of Edinburgh. Please note the following terms and conditions of use:

This work is protected by copyright and other intellectual property rights, which are retained by the thesis author, unless otherwise stated.

A copy can be downloaded for personal non-commercial research or study, without prior permission or charge.

This thesis cannot be reproduced or quoted extensively from without first obtaining permission in writing from the author.

The content must not be changed in any way or sold commercially in any format or medium without the formal permission of the author.

When referring to this work, full bibliographic details including the author, title, awarding institution and date of the thesis must be given.
Irish Migrant Identities and Community Life in Melbourne and Chicago, 1840-1890

Sophie Elizabeth Cooper

Doctor of Philosophy
University of Edinburgh
2017
I hereby declare that this work submitted is my own and that all references have been indicated. This work has not been submitted for any other degree or professional qualification except as specified.

_______________________________

Date:
Abstract.

This thesis examines the influences on Irish identity articulation within Melbourne and Chicago during the nineteenth century. Bringing together ethnicity and religious devotion, this thesis argues that the foundational identities encouraged by religious orders within parish schools and societies were fundamental to the shape of nationalist politics that emerged in each city. While the imperial and republican contexts of Melbourne and Chicago presented specific opportunities and restrictions on Irish cultural and political identity articulation, the ethnic pluralism of the Catholic Church in each city influenced the networks established between Irish migrants across class, occupation, and gender. In turn, the Catholic parish structures of each city altered how Irish identity was articulated at a local and global level.

While focusing on Irish Catholic identity, this thesis also examines the establishment of secular and ethnic Irish institutions utilised by middle-class culture brokers within Melbourne and Chicago to promote a civic Irish identity. It explores the ways that Irish migrants interpreted British imperial and American values to encourage diasporic Irish identities shaped by Irish and local contexts. Using comparison, this work identifies similarities between two cities previously dismissed as divergent and transnational links between Ireland, Australia and Chicago. Examining these societies over a fifty-year period allows for the interrogation of identity influencers over numerous generations, addressing the evolving shape of two cities and the Irish communities therein.
Acknowledgements.

Thank you to my supervisors Enda Delaney and Niall Whelahan. This thesis has changed in scope and focus throughout the four years that it has taken to research and write, and Enda and Niall have helped me to adapt to each twist and turn. I have enjoyed working with them both. I have been lucky to be able to knock on Enda’s door and know that I would be welcomed with a cup of tea and advice, while Niall has provided me with insight and feedback even from a different university. Particularly in the last year, Enda and Niall have proved to be supportive, kind, and flexible supervisors who have truly ‘rolled with it’.

Similarly, I would like to thank Anna Feintuck, Sarah Laurenson, and Felicity Loughlin who have been the best of friends throughout my PhD. Despite studying different aspects of history, they have been sounding boards for academic ideas and excellent distractors with ice cream, wine, and cake. Joe Curran, Bobbie Nolan, Roseanna Doughty, Andrew Phemister, Catherine Bateson, Tommy Dolan, Stuart Clark, Gareth Lyle, Rose Luminiello, Alison Garden, everyone else in the Modern Irish History research group, friends within the wider field of Irish history and from my TCD M.Phil in Modern Irish History have helped to make this thesis what it is through discussion and feedback. More senior academics like Diane Urquhart, William Jenkins, Dianne Hall, and David Fitzpatrick have given their time and advice freely and kindly. This is a thesis about community, and the academic community that I have found myself in has made studying, researching, and conferences enjoyable and stimulating. Bobbie and Joe in particular have been wonderful friends throughout the last four years.

Carrying out research on Irish communities in Melbourne and Chicago has required the kindness of sponsors and donors. Thanks is primarily due to Alan and Anne McFarlane who fund the William McFarlane Scholarship for the Scottish Centre for Diaspora Studies. The William McFarlane Scholarship funded my doctoral studies and contributed to my research expenses. I would have struggled financially to get to archives in Melbourne without the Simon Fennell Award (University of Edinburgh) and the British Association of Irish Studies and Royal Historical Society research awards. My research trip to Chicago was mainly funded by the
King V. Hostick Fund of the Illinois State Historical Society, complemented with a contribution from the Peter Parish Memorial Award of British American Nineteenth Century Historians (BrANCH).

Along with these funders I am grateful to the archivists and librarians who helped me in person and electronically, and allowed me to access their collections. Thank you to Meg Romero Hall of the Archdiocese of Chicago Archives, Rachel Naughton of the Melbourne Diocesan Historical Commission, Noelle Dowling of the Dublin Diocesan Archives, Kevin Molloy at the State Library of Victoria, Trenton Carls at the Chicago History Museum and Research Centre, and everyone else at the various archives that I visited. I would also like to thank everyone involved in digitising nineteenth-century newspapers, particularly those which are available without a paywall. Trove has been an invaluable resource.

My friends outside of academia have smiled and asked questions through my excited retelling of research trips and archive discoveries. Thank you to Fiona and Ash Gordon-Gurung, Courtney and Stephen Cunningham, Ruth and Matt Boomer, Danielle Egan, Stephen Goodman, Anne-Marie Flynn, Yvette Milford, and everyone else who has done this (in your couple and single forms)!

Finally, my thanks to my family. You are wonderful and filled with hopes. Mum and Dad, you have encouraged and supported me throughout my life and throughout the joys of this thesis. Liv and Ed, you are the best siblings I could ask for - mockery and all. I love you all. The extensions of our family, through cousins, aunts and uncles, grandparents and family friends have all helped to shape me and give me the willpower to complete this thesis. This work is dedicated to my Nana and Grandpa, Beryl and Gerry Jones. Thank you for taking me to view my first microfilm documents when I was 11 and for encouraging my love of history through storytelling and census excitement.
# Table of Contents

Abstract .......................................................................................................................... v
Acknowledgements ......................................................................................................... vii
List of Figures .................................................................................................................. x
Abbreviations .................................................................................................................. xi

## Introduction

### Chapter One: Setting the Scene: The Urban Contexts and Irish Inhabitants of Melbourne and Chicago, 1840-1890

- Chicago ....................................................................................................................... 27
- Melbourne .................................................................................................................... 32
- Immigration influences: The place of the Irish within the city .................................. 50
- Conclusion ..................................................................................................................... 58

### Chapter Two: Creating Cultural Affinity through Secular Ethnic Societies

- Early Years .................................................................................................................. 66
- Middle Years .............................................................................................................. 75
- Later Years .................................................................................................................. 88
- Conclusion ..................................................................................................................... 98

### Chapter Three: Religious Education: The Battle for the Control of Second-Generation Irish Identities

- The Establishment of Education Systems in Melbourne and Chicago ............... 105
- The Expansion of Schooling .................................................................................... 116
- The Introduction of Compulsory Schooling ......................................................... 128
- Conclusion ..................................................................................................................... 141

### Chapter Four: Religious Parish Life in Melbourne and Chicago

- Early years .................................................................................................................. 145
- Middle years .............................................................................................................. 149
- Later Years .................................................................................................................. 164
- Conclusion ..................................................................................................................... 178

### Chapter Five: Political Nationalism and the Limits of Diasporic Life

- Recovery and Reordering of Nationalist Ideologies, 1848-1867 ....................... 191
- The Development of Irish Nationalism, 1868-1880 .......................................... 195
- The 1880s: The High Point of Irish Nationalism? .............................................. 209
- Conclusion ..................................................................................................................... 216

### Chapter Six: St Patrick’s Day and the Public Rhetoric of Identity

- Creating an Image of Ethnic Community ............................................................... 235
- The Progression of Cultural Affinity ........................................................................ 238
- The Unification of Religious and Ethnic Identities? ............................................. 248
- Conclusion ..................................................................................................................... 260

## Conclusion ................................................................................................................... 271

## Bibliography

- Primary Sources .......................................................................................................... 279
- Secondary Sources .................................................................................................... 286
List of Figures.

Figure 1: The Increase of Population in Melbourne and Chicago, 1850-1890.....31
Figure 2: Total Population of Chicago and Melbourne, 1840-1890..................31
Figure 3: The Increase of Irish-born Population in Melbourne & Chicago, 1850-
1890........................................................................................................53
Figure 4: Irish-born in Chicago & Melbourne, 1850-1890............................56
Figure 5: Sands & McDougall's Melbourne Directory Map, 1869...............60
Figure 6: Warner & Beers Publishers' Map of Chicago, 1875. .................61
Figure 7: Schoolteachers in Illinois & Victoria, 1854-1890 (according to census
returns)..................................................................................................118
Figure 8: Religious Orders in Chicago and Melbourne, 1840-90...............147
Figure 9: Members of Irish Female Catholic Religious Orders..................166
Abbreviations.

Abraham Lincoln Presidential Museum & Library ALPML
Ancient Order of Hibernians AOH
Archdiocese of Chicago Archival Centre ACA
Australian Dictionary of Biography Online ADB
British Library BL
Catholic Young Men’s Society CYMS
Chicago History Museum & Research Library CHMRL
Dictionary of Irish Biography Online DIB
Dublin Diocesan Archives DDA
Hibernian Australasian Catholic Benefit Society HACBS
Irish National Foresters INF
Irish Jesuit Archives, Dublin JAD
Melbourne Diocesan Historical Commission MDHC
National Archives, Kew TNA
National Library of Ireland NLI
University of Notre Dame Library, Indiana ND
Public Records Office of Victoria PROV
Royal Historical Society of Victoria RHSV
State Library of Victoria SLV
Introduction.

In February 1884 John and William Redmond reached Chicago. The brothers were visiting the United States on their way back from a lecture tour in Australia, bringing with them John’s new wife Johanna, the daughter of a prominent Irish-Australian. The Chicago-based Western Catholic proclaimed that the Irishmen’s choice of the United States and Australia as lecture tour stops proved that there was ‘Unity in Trinity’. The point of the tour was to raise money and awareness of what the Redmond brothers wanted for the future government of Ireland, and what their vision of belonging to an international Irish nation looked like. Though greeted with varying levels of enthusiasm, there were engaged Irish audiences for the Redmond brothers to access for financial and political support in Melbourne and Chicago. Speaking in those cities symbolically linked their Irish communities with those still in Ireland and to each other. In doing so, the Redmonds encouraged an international sense of connection between those of Irish birth and descent, regardless of new locale. Despite the Western Catholic’s enthusiasm, historians have been slow to explore the connections within this ‘Trinity’. This thesis takes the cities of Melbourne and Chicago as its focus. These two urban case studies provide broadly similar environments in which to explore the mechanisms that a principally middle class group of Irish people used to promote a sense of community between Irish migrants and their children over a period of 50 years. This research is chiefly concerned with the evolution of Irish identities — those predicated on religion, class, gender — within Melbourne and Chicago, and the ways that individuals engaged with ideas of belonging to a global Irish nation in personal and group contexts.

Through detailed comparative analysis, this thesis examines the community structures which helped to order the hierarchies of ethnic and religious, class and gender identity in a republican (Chicago) and an imperial (Melbourne) city. Using a comparative framework with a transnational perspective, this research removes the study from the scholarly confines of the British Empire or the United States, to

---

1 Irish American Weekly, 9 February 1884.
2 Western Catholic, 2 February 1884.
focus on the tools that Irish communities established and utilised within two cities. The Irish societies studied are not solely made up of those born in the island of Ireland, but also their children and grandchildren who were born elsewhere. While there is a distinction made between those of Irish birth and those who identified as Irish through their social activities, public pronouncements, and parentage, this thesis is concerned with how a sense of belonging to an ‘Irish’ community within an Australian or American environment was encouraged.

As this research is principally concentrated on the middle classes, self-identification was important, often more so than negative ascription of Irishness which was so often aimed at poorer immigrants and their families. Ideas of civic society and middle-class associational culture are examined in the promotion of an imagined Irish nationhood to understand the personal and professional networks which linked community organisers in each city. However, this thesis connects these middle-class networks to both elites and the working classes through an exploration of religious schooling, nationalism, and parading. Therefore, despite the obvious differences brought about by distance from Ireland and global power positions, this study is situated within the religious and secular ethnic structures of two rapidly growing urban centres. It presents the construction of urban immigrant community lives which appealed to people separated by class, suburb, religious affiliation, financial concerns, and political vision but had the capacity to link them with each other and with those abroad, under the umbrella of Irish ethnic identity.

**Historiographies of the Irish Abroad.**

This thesis is located within the history of the Irish diaspora: the study of those who left Ireland and scattered around the globe principally in the aftermath of the Irish Famine (1845–52), and adding to work on the history of Ireland and the ongoing influence of the diaspora in shaping Irish ideas of belonging and nationhood.\(^3\) It adheres to Enda Delaney’s argument that to ‘write the Irish story

without the diaspora is to render a partial account’ while also arguing that to write the history of the diaspora without reference to Ireland is to ignore the continued influence of transnational networks. 

Ordered thematically, it engages with findings on the Irish Catholic Church, religious education, sport, associational culture, and public performance through parades within each chapter. It also acknowledges the varied experiences of those who joined the diaspora, which is critical in understanding the diverse influences to flow in and out of Ireland during the nineteenth century and after. There was no homogeneity of experience within the diaspora, though the image of the Irish abroad has often been dominated by scholarship of the American urban north. Within this, Kerby Miller’s landmark examination of life in Ireland and America has led to an overriding understanding of Irish Americans as working class, held back by a sense of exile from Ireland and brought together by a primordial identity. Despite this dominance, there has been a growing literature on the Irish abroad over the last 40 years, providing a useful framework for this research. This thesis utilises a comparative methodology to test the idea of ‘inherently Irish’ features of diasporic life.

Malcolm Campbell, William Jenkins, and Donald M. MacRaild have all used comparison to explore similarities and differences in Irish communities spread around the world. These comparisons assist in understanding the importance of

---


varying factors commonly credited with influencing how people saw themselves, and were seen and understood by others: family, friends, education, religion, geographical surroundings, the media and the state. Comparison helps to highlight the similarities and divergences within the Irish diaspora, however it can still restrict the diasporic experience to within the nation state. Instead, Kevin Kenny suggests a combined use of comparison and transnationalism to explore how particular immigrant groups can ‘retain, or develop, diasporic sensibilities that become integral to their emerging, nationally specific ethnic identities’. These methodologies, or perspectives, will be explored further later in this introduction. It is useful to first examine the nation-based literature that informs this research.

The scholarship on the Irish in Australia is small but growing. A sustaining belief that distance from Ireland forced an immediate prioritisation of class and Australian allegiance over national identity is largely responsible for this dearth. According to this argument, any insistence of continued ethnic identity was futile. The work of Patrick O’Farrell, the foremost scholar on the Irish in Australia, has provided the foundation for this belief. O’Farrell’s work primarily focused on the experiences of those living in Sydney and New South Wales, dismissing those in Melbourne as ‘Munster peasants’ who left their Irish allegiances on the boat. While O’Farrell’s scholarship is still important and unrivalled in scope, it has led to the echoing of a similar understanding of the Irish in Australia in many books from an Ireland or American-based perspective. This reflects a wider problem within the historiography of the Irish diaspora. The use of a small body of nation-based works to inform understandings of the experiences of those living abroad has resulted in illustrating the diversity of the diaspora while concurrently homogenising the experiences of those living within one national border.

---


This study aims to provide further insight into the diversity of life in nineteenth-century Australia. It counters the sometimes problematic and generalised conclusions that O’Farrell made regarding Irish life in Australian society, joining other, more recent scholarship in broadening understandings of Irish life in colonial Australia.11 Laurence Geary, for example, has studied Irish doctors in Victoria, and David Fitzpatrick and Patrick Coleman have explored connections between the Orange Order in Australia and Ireland.12 Fitzpatrick has also provided insight into the personal recollections of Irish migrants, using family letters between Australia and Ireland during the nineteenth century.13 Similarly Dianne Hall and Lindsay Proudfoot have utilised sources such as gravestone inscriptions and cartoons to examine how Irish people saw themselves and were seen in relation to location and race in Australia.14 These articles and book chapters have contributed to an alternative vision of Irish experiences in Australia, however the lack of geographical specificity in the major books on the subject has led to a persistent image of Irish-Australia steeped in convict history, nativism, and English-led Catholicism which has then been spread throughout Irish historiography.15

In studying the Australian colonies within an imperial context, the Irish have occupied a peculiar place in the historiography of both Ireland and the Empire.

13 Fitzpatrick, Oceans of Consolation.
15 Kevin Kenny, for example, argues that imbalance between the sexes weakened ethnic group cohesion in Australia. This gender imbalance was quickly rectified in Melbourne due to positive recruitment of women for assisted migration after the Famine, but O’Farrell’s work and the reliance of his arguments create an impression of homogenous experience throughout Australia. ‘Diaspora and Comparison’.
Ireland’s role as both a partner in the imperial project and as a colonised country have problematised the position of Irish migrants within the British Empire. The focus has been on the role of Irish temporary migrants in positions of colonial authority, as civil servants, colonial administrators, and the military. The principal subject of study in these works have been how living and working within the British Empire was used to improve social status and how Irish identity was balanced or compromised by different people. Alvin Jackson, Matthew Kelly and Jennifer Regan-Lefebvre have explored this balancing of economic mobility and national loyalty arguing that in cooperating with the mechanisms of empire, Irish, and particularly Irish Catholic, migrants could achieve economic and social mobility while using the language and tools of imperial networks to improve their position, and that of Ireland.

Unlike in Australia, Irish migrant groups in the United States have been the subject of a vast and varied literature ever since Oscar Handlin published *The Uprooted* in the 1950s. While for decades, working class Catholics in the urban north dominated studies, there has been a shift towards understanding the experiences of Irish people, mainly Protestants who left Ireland before the Famine, and those who settled in the rural and southern states. Within these works there have been explorations of race relations, particularly between the Irish and African-Americans who often worked side by side in badly-paid

---


unskilled jobs in the north, and the relationship between poor but free whites and black slaves in the south. The role of the Irish in the Civil War has also received the attention of historians, through the examination of ethnic regiments and within the wider Union and Confederate armies. These studies have widened understandings of the Irish experience in the United States during the nineteenth century, the structures that linked Irish migrants, and the forces which shaped perceptions of Irishness abroad. While there are a number of works on the rural American Irish experience, numerous books based within specific cities have provided in-depth study of communities over multiple generations and classes. These have allowed for repeated re-examinations of how northern urban Irish immigrants were connected and viewed, testing the image of perceived forced exile that haunted Irish immigrants, and the subsequent misery of *Emigrants and Exiles*. This has also been done in relation to Irish migrants who went further west, further examining whether the ghettoisation and poverty commonly attributed to Irish migrants was a temporary northern-eastern urban phenomenon rather than the plight of Irish migrants throughout the urban north.

Irish women have been the subject of important works of scholarship. Janet Nolan and Hasia Diner led the way in understanding the lives of Irish women in the United States, while Trevor McClaughlin has provided interested readers with insights from colonial Australia. These works have been supplemented by

---

22 Miller, *Emigrants and Exiles*.
studies into Irish Catholic female religious orders and their influences on Catholic identity. However, the distinctive influences of women and men on Irish community life and identity formation in the United States and Australia have not been examined in tandem. This thesis, using the idea of foundational and active identities, seeks to understand the differing but equally important roles of Irish men and women in shaping Irish community life abroad. It brings women in from the peripheries of St Patrick’s Day balls, the attics of domestic servitude, and the silent donors to nationalist subscriber lists. These are all important positions. However, they do not fully acknowledge the role of Irish women throughout society in shaping Irish community life from the roots upwards, creating a cultural affinity for children in schools and the family home which in turn could be built upon by male leaders. This study places men and women together to present a fuller image of the worlds that Irish immigrants and their children lived in, uniting the middle-class influences of associational culture with the cross-class influences of women in schools, societies, and the home.

This research explores the similarities and differences, and particularly the successes and failures, of the Irish in Melbourne and Chicago to create a community based on ethnicity. These cities were host to various Irish identities, related to ethnicity, religion and class, which could connect and conflict with each other. Oliver MacDonagh has researched those living in Melbourne, David Fitzpatrick has edited collections of letters based in Victoria, and Patrick Naughtin has examined the newspapers and networks related to Irish nationalism in the city. However, a book on the Irish communities of Melbourne throughout the

---


nineteenth century has yet to be published. The Irish in Chicago, conversely, have been the focus of a number of works which frame the questions asked in this thesis. This scholarship has led the way in understanding the worlds that Chicago Irish people inhabited. Given the prominence of Chicago’s Irish nationalists in the 1870s and 1880s, when militant nationalism and labour radicalism dominated headlines internationally, much of the work on the city’s Irish communities have focused on that time period. This thesis expands the focus to understand the structures and people who established a cultural affinity between those who identified as Irish in Melbourne and Chicago. It incorporates the role of the Catholic Church and its national parishes in connecting ethnicity and religion, utilising histories of the Church and religious orders in each city and further afield.

Building upon previous research into the lived experiences of those within the Irish diaspora, it explores the role of the Catholic Church in uniting ethnic and religious identities. A growing cause for complaint within histories of the Irish diaspora is that they are primarily concerned with Irish Catholics, equating the two identities and ignoring Irish Protestants, particularly those who emigrated before the Famine. While this research is primarily concerned with the structures employed by the Catholic Church to link ethnicity and religion, it also seeks to understand the ways that Irish ethnicity was separated from religion and portrayed

as an inclusive identity to be embraced by Catholics and Protestants alike. In the middle-class circles that this thesis focuses on, this bonding through ethnicity and class is examined in parallel to the transnational religious connections that were encouraged and profited from by Irish Catholics.

The Comparative Approach.

While scholarship on the Irish in each city has informed this discussion, comparison provides further insights into the influences on migrant identity. Explicit comparisons between different communities in the Irish diaspora have only become popular in the last decade, and they remain rare. Comparative history can reveal differences or it can universalise experiences. One criticism of comparative history is that it can lead to asymmetrical comparison in which another country is examined to better understand your own, or to prove exceptionalism. Malcolm Campbell was particularly critical of this with regard to early comparisons of Irish communities within the diaspora. The subjects of this thesis, the Irish in Melbourne and Chicago, provide a unique comparison of Irish communities. Both cities had similarly-sized Irish populations, relative to the total population, and therefore adhere to the ideal comparison of having ‘sufficient symmetry or equivalence’ while being different enough to highlight patterns or distinctions. This thesis utilises a contrasting comparison methodology to note the similarities of the Irish communities in Melbourne and Chicago in sufficiently differing environments to understand the varying pressures on retaining and encouraging ethnic communities.

In this way, this comparison of the Irish middle classes, and the tools that they used to promote Irish identity, in Melbourne and Chicago can help undermine ‘the smug assumptions made by national histories’. The people studied were

32 Campbell, ‘Other Immigrants’; Campbell, *Ireland’s New Worlds*.
34 Peter Baldwin, ‘Comparing and Generalizing: Why All History is Comparative, Yet No History is Sociological’ in Deborah Cohen & Maura O’Connor (eds), *Comparison and History: Europe in Cross-National Perspective* (New York: Routledge, 2004), 1-22.
communities of individuals, they were distinctive peoples differing across class, occupation, gender, and regional background. Generalisations about ‘the Irish’ have to made in this study, but they are made firmly within their city contexts. The Irish in Melbourne and Chicago were not the same as those in Sydney and New York, or anywhere else. However, there were shared images of what it was to belong, and common understandings of what it meant to identify as Irish. This thesis explores these moments of convergence.

Using a transnational history perspective can challenge national exceptionalism to understand and explore ‘how flows, circulations, parallels and exchanges are productive, how they lead to transformations and tensions, or why they fail to do so.’\(^{35}\) It therefore seeks to explore how migrants maintained connections to ‘their countries and communities of origin upon settlement in new countries’.\(^{36}\) While historians have been slow to apply transnational approaches to Irish history, the connections between the diaspora and Ireland have been considered in different guises. As MacRaild has noted, ‘the core meaning of diaspora comprises a triangular dialogue between the homeland and multiple new communities, as well as a consciousness of being part of an international community’.\(^{37}\) This research incorporates this triangular dialogue through an integrated approach suggested by Kenny, in which a comparative approach is combined with a transnational lens to provide a ‘comprehensive and flexible framework of historical analysis’.\(^{38}\)

A transnational methodology locates the Irish experience within an ever-changing network of influence and influencers, helping to link the Irish communities of Melbourne and Chicago with each other, with Ireland, and with international political and social movements which affected ideas of equality and freedom during the nineteenth century.\(^{39}\) However, as Patricia Clavin noted, the central paradox of transnational studies is that the study of transnational ties can dissolve


\(^{38}\) Kenny, ‘Diaspora and Comparison’.

some national barriers while simultaneously strengthening or creating others.\textsuperscript{40} Comparison helps to avoid this problem, maintaining the focus on weighing up the ‘distinctive cultural, structural, or institutional characteristics in yielding different results in different settings.’\textsuperscript{41} The use of comparison and transnationalism therefore help to understand the internal, external, and international impetuses behind particular variations in community creation and maintenance.

**Networks.**

Mutual shaping and adaption contributes to the question of what makes an ethnic community. Whether it is a defensive strategy or not, it was up to Irish migrants to decide whether they engaged with elements of Irish community life. Networks play an essential part in community or parish life. David Fitzpatrick’s description of networks as ‘open and optional rather than exclusive and fully reciprocal’, with community best analysed as a product of networks rather than of neighbourhood, is applied.\textsuperscript{42} Other elements of community life were less about choice, they were a result of religious devotion, family ties, or simple geography. Irish identity is viewed as an ethnic identity within this work, connected but not dependent on religious identity. Taking this into account, it is possible to explore the secular Irish institutions, usually through engagement with ideas of civil society. Secular society allowed people of Irish birth and descent to self-identify as Irish without conflicting with their religious identity.

The Irish communities which emerged during and after the Famine were linked through family ties and the increasingly quick technologies of telegram, international post, and newspapers. Melbourne and Chicago were new and bustling cities, filled with transient peoples and new waves of immigrants. Those who imagined and constructed Irish community life within Melbourne and Chicago were not static groups of people. New ideas and priorities were

\textsuperscript{40} Clavin, ‘Defining Transnationalism’, *Contemporary European History*, 14:4 (2005), 421-439.
\textsuperscript{41} Gallman, *Receiving Erin’s Children*, 17.
introduced constantly, evolving and changing those leading Irish society life, and providing new avenues for group and individual progress. As more power and communications links flowed into the white dominions, culture brokers were able to by-pass London and communicate directly with their counterparts in other dominions. Therefore, Melbourne politicians and reformers were frequently in discussions with their counterparts in Ottawa and Toronto with regards to imperial education policy, for example.\textsuperscript{43} The British Empire was ‘a complex communications network through which ideas spread’.\textsuperscript{44} Just as the British Empire acted as ‘an interconnected zone constituted by multiple points of contact and complex circuits of exchange’, so did the Irish diaspora and its religious institutions.\textsuperscript{45}

The Irish Catholic Church acted to facilitate the transfer of information and personnel around the world, to Australia and the United States. Colin Barr and Hilary Carey have discussed this parallel religious empire as a ‘Greater Ireland’, particularly after the rise of Cardinal Paul Cullen and what Emmet Larkin has named the ‘devotional revolution’ which occurred from the 1840s.\textsuperscript{46} Barr and Carey note that Greater Ireland was not ‘merely the collection of places to which the Irish migrated. Rather, Greater Ireland was a shared cultural space in which a sense of home and shared identity jostled with the varying challenges of the host societies and the inherited divisions of the Irish themselves.’\textsuperscript{47} These connections were facilitated by personal ties but also through the international movement of newspapers and people. The Irish communities in Melbourne and Chicago were linked to Ireland and throughout the diaspora. How these connections manifested in the creation of an Irish diasporic ethnic identity is the focus of this thesis.

\textsuperscript{44} Regan-Lefebvre, \textit{Cosmopolitan Nationalism}, 3.
\textsuperscript{47} Barr & Carey, ‘Introduction’.
Ethnic Identity as a Process.

Identity is a social construct. It is subjective, it is location-specific, and it is intersectional. That is to say that people are not just “human beings” but are also gendered, classed, ethnocized, etc. However, as an analytical term, identity needs to be studied with reference to why in some contexts, affinities lead to a bonded group based on identity and in others these identity categories are more flexible. Ethnic identification was a process influenced by culture brokers, families and through ascription from others. Kathleen Neils Conzen and colleagues argue that ‘ethnicity’ is not a “collective fiction,” but rather a process of construction or invention which incorporates, adapts, and amplifies pre-existing communal solidarities, cultural attributes, and historical memories. Alan O’Day expanded this understanding of ethnicity as a process to include second and later generations through ‘mutative ethnicity’ whereby ethnic identity is, often unconsciously, adapted to suit the changing needs of daily life abroad. By making it relevant to diasporic life, ethnic identity can sustain within communities even among those with weakening lived experience of Ireland. This adaptive ethnicity ‘encompasses a persistence, rediscovery or layered form of Irishness among the Diaspora’, placing ethnic identity within local contexts. If a ‘shared collective memory is a defining feature of a diasporic consciousness’, it is vital to explore how sense of diasporic consciousness of ‘being Irish’ was ‘constructed, represented and internalised’ by Irish migrants in Melbourne and Chicago over at least two generations. In response to these influences, ethnic identity is considered as a ‘result of the dynamic conjunctions of social structures, class conflicts, and cultural patterns in the old country and the new’.

52 Delaney, ‘Irish Diaspora’.
This research is based within the communities of Irish-born and Irish-descended people in Melbourne and Chicago, in their schools, in their clubs, and in their parades. All of these elements contributed to the ethnic communities which emerged in Melbourne and Chicago, and in turn, altered the idea of what it meant to be ‘Irish’ and how engagement with identity could be beneficial. O’Day argues that mutative ethnicity ‘is distinct from merely symbolic ethnicity because it is an active part of the everyday life’. 54 Irish identity therefore needs to be examined in a range of contexts to test the idea of inherent ‘Irish’ values, the importance of local settings in filtering these ideas, and the transnational influences which changed and shaped diasporic identities.

The term ‘parish life’ is used to denote the community structures of associational culture, religion, and education. Jay P. Dolan has noted that the parish ‘is a window in the wall, through which Catholic life can be observed’. 55 In this thesis the term is used in a more general way, though for the same ends. At times the ‘parish’ was located in the actual Catholic national parish, at other times it refers to the suburb. This could be further expanded to encompass a city-wide phenomenon based around ethnic identity. The term refers to the infrastructure and institutions that connected Irish and Irish Catholics to each other within the specific city of Melbourne or Chicago, and how these networks were widened to include activities in Ireland and elsewhere in the Irish diaspora. It is used in contrast with the city society which included people of different ethnic, immigrant, and religious backgrounds. Irish parishes interacted with wider city society fluidly, depending on class, gender, and timing. At times ethnic and religious identities were linked, at others they were not. This thesis explores the ways that different elements of Melbourne and Chicago society encouraged these identity hierarchies.

Within this study mutative ethnicity is explored through cultural affinity, encouraged by religious education and parish life. It argues that this cultural

54 O’Day, ‘Conundrum’.
affinity was promoted by surrounding Irish–born and descended children with teachers, priests, and employers who sounded like their parents. This affinity was more than a passing engagement with Irishness. Instead Irish heritage, and for most Catholic religion, became a ‘foundational identity’ that could be built upon by articulations of Irish or American or Australian nationality. This could be actively ignored, and was by some, however for many it provided an often unconscious identity through which all other interactions with host or immigrant society were viewed through. It aligns to MacRaid’s argument that though the ethnicity of the Irish ‘may have mutated or adapted…it continued to be sustained by features of religion, politics and daily life which were inherently Irish’. In this way, this thesis examines the ‘global uniformities’ which emerged in Irish communities in Melbourne and Chicago.\textsuperscript{57}

The concept of ‘foundational identity’ is used to distinguish between unconscious and conscious, or passive and active, engagement with ethnic identity which is central to this thesis. Foundational Irish identity was based within the parish, and considers the impact of being surrounded by people who look and sound like you and your parents. This thesis is in part influenced by sociological scholarship on inter-racial and inter-cultural relations, particularly in the United States. Central to how immigrant groups, and particularly second-generation immigrants, view themselves as an ethnic group is ethnic or social ‘mirroring’.\textsuperscript{58} While immigrant generations often form their identities with a frame of reference based in their country of origin, later generations form their identities in relation to positive or negative images of their ethnic group.\textsuperscript{59} The middle classes played an important role in encouraging the adoption of ‘a trans-regional national or ethnic ‘Irish’

\textsuperscript{56} Donald M. MacRaid, \textit{The Irish Diaspora in Britain, 1750-1939}, 2\textsuperscript{nd} ed. (New York: Palgrave MacMillan, 2011), 3.
\textsuperscript{57} Crosbie, \textit{Irish Imperial Networks}, 12; C. A. Bayly, \textit{Empire and Information: Intelligence Gathering and Social Communication in India, 1780-1870} (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996).
\textsuperscript{59} Wiley, Perkins & Deaux, ‘Through the looking glass’.
pride in themselves’ among Irish migrants of all classes and articulated through associational culture.\textsuperscript{60}

Timothy Meagher and John Belchem have joined other scholars in emphasising the need to consider multi-generational influences on migrant communities and social mobility.\textsuperscript{61} Meagher has historicised this generational difference in his study of Irish communities in Worcester, Massachusetts at the turn of the twentieth century. He argues that transformations in Irish American identity need to be understood over multiple generations as a result of changes in everyday activities, and as part of a community’s negotiation of its relations with its neighbours.\textsuperscript{62} Ethnic mirroring is an important element in this negotiation, providing the children of immigrants with positive role models who are part of their ethnic community, within the church, school, and local economy. As Meagher notes, second-generation Irish Americans moved through a ‘chronology of change from accommodation to ethnic revival to the forging of a new, broader group’.\textsuperscript{63} This study examines the way that foundational identities provided a lens for how second-generation Irish communities forged this new, broader group, based within an Irish-born community while also embracing their American or Australian identities. While foundational identities were formed in schools and the church, they provided a base layer of commonality which could be built upon to articulate a more political ‘Irishness’ through associational culture, public performance, and nationalism.

While Irish diasporic nationalism, associational culture, and political engagement have been the subject of wide-ranging scholarship, the foundational ethnic identity which provided this ‘shared collective memory’ which defined ‘diasporic consciousness’ has yet to be explicitly applied to Irish communities in Melbourne and Chicago.\textsuperscript{64} Belchem has focused on the ways that generational tensions were largely avoided in Liverpool by the rapid movement of second-generation Irish


\textsuperscript{61} Belchem, ‘Hub’; Meagher, \textit{Inventing Irish America}.

\textsuperscript{62} Meagher, \textit{Inventing Irish America}, 9-10.

\textsuperscript{63} Ibid.

\textsuperscript{64} Delaney, ‘Irish Diaspora’.
identification into ‘the commemorative memory of the land of their forebears, a sentimental portrayal of the ‘old sod’ promoted by religious and political leaders, ethnic entrepreneurs and commercial impresarios’ as well as Catholic schools staffed by Irish religious orders. This thesis situates these foundational identities as vital to a community’s subsequent interactions with more political and civil forms of identity. This base of commonality could then be targeted by community leaders to work towards domestic and international ambitions, political and financial, through active engagement with ideas of Irish ethnicity and identity. The Catholic Church and its predominantly female representatives were instrumental in creating this diasporic consciousness, through representation and ethnic mirroring in schools, clubs, and the home. Secular images of Irishness, through civil societies dedicated to ethnic fraternalism and nationalism were conversely led, in the main, by men. Together these active and passive engagements with Irish community life, also referred to as parish life in this thesis, created and promoted certain Irish identities in Melbourne and Chicago which could be deployed in public and private.

The Irish Middle Classes.

The main focus of this thesis is on the diasporic Irish middle classes – an inherently complex group of people encompassing Australian newspaper owners like Samuel and Joseph Winter, sons of an English Protestant convict and an Irish Catholic assisted migrant; lawyers such as James Mulligan, later organiser of the Irish Brigade in Chicago; Tipperary-born John O’Shanassy, the second Premier of Victoria, a draper, and a leading supporter of the Catholic Church; and Dr Patrick Henry Cronin, a County Cork-born physician and rival to leadership of Chicago’s Clan na Gael. Mary Poovey, Catherine Hall and Leonore Davidoff have highlighted the varied make-up of the English middle classes and the constant re-construction of what it meant to be part of the middle class. This variation

66 Geoffrey Serle, ‘Winter, Joseph (1844-1915)’, *ADB*.
translates into the Irish case. Belchem has echoed this focus on pluralism in Irish middle-class migrants, tracking divisions between those Irish at the ‘apex’ of middle-class professional and commercial circles across ethnicity, and those lower down the ladder, members of the merchant and professional classes who were in daily contact with the Irish poor. The diverse needs and motivations of the Irish middle classes in Melbourne and Chicago were partly brought together through ‘urban voluntary societies and their personnel, organisations which offered a pluralistic, yet hierarchical model which could embrace religious, as well as other divisions’. The role of secular and religious ethnic associations in creating and sustaining a multi-generational Irish community in Melbourne and Chicago is therefore explored with reference to a range of clubs and societies with different motivations and audiences.

The middle classes have also played an important role in supporting the spread of the Catholic Church within the Irish diaspora, through financial donations, children joining religious orders, or by attending church on Sunday and influencing others to do the same. They were also prominent in nationalist movements due to their ‘ability to imagine and communicate a national vision and to provide the organisational skills necessary to unify a dispersed population’. As Senia Pašeta noted in her study of Ireland’s university graduates, ‘while they were often expected to be all things to all people, they facilitated such anticipation by their own willingness and preparedness for leadership’. Despite these important positions in encouraging ethnic community, they are often an understudied element of the Irish abroad, particularly in Australia. This thesis

---

70 Davidoff & Hall, Family Fortunes, xxxi.
73 O’Farrell and Jennifer Ridden both consider the Anglo-Irish elites and minor gentry in their studies of the Irish in Victoria. Zoe Laidlaw has similarly studied colonial connections between Britain, the Cape Colony, and New South Wales in the early nineteenth century. However, there
does not claim to be an exploration of what it meant to be middle class, it instead focuses on the role of the middle class in promoting what it meant to be Irish.

Sources.

Newspapers account for the principal primary source within this thesis. A mixture of mainstream newspapers are used, primarily the Age and Argus in Melbourne and the Tribune and Daily Inter Ocean in Chicago. As newspapers have been considered ‘part and parcel of metropolitan identities’, they act as useful mirrors into the key debates and social expectations that were held by those living in the urban centres of Melbourne and Chicago. These newspapers, aimed at the higher echelons of society, provide conservative and occasionally nativist impressions of the Catholic Irish communities in both cities. As the nineteenth century progressed, newspapers provided an arena for political and social activity. In doing so, ‘the newspaper press became more closely associated with public opinion in the popular mind it wielded a sizeable degree of power’. Understanding what information newspaper editors and reporters chose to include in their pages, and how this news was organised, is therefore important in examining how societal priorities were framed by the press. Belchem has described middle-class migrants who acted as ‘culture-brokers who were to implant, celebrate and control a distinctive form of Irishness’. Stephen Vella has similarly noted that newspapers are not ‘neutral conduits of information, but rather gatekeepers and filterers of ideas’. The influence of the middle classes and newspapers were therefore linked, in part due to the preponderance of middle class and educated men and women who were reporters and editors. With very few by-lines, we are reliant on personal archives and other newspaper reports to


74 Miriam Dobson & Benjamin Ziemann (eds), Reading Primary Sources: The interpretation of texts from nineteenth- and twentieth-century history (London: Routledge, 2009), 13.
76 Belchem, ‘Liverpool-Irish’.
77 Vella, ‘Newspapers’ in Dobson & Ziemann (eds), Reading Primary Sources, 192-208.
illuminate who was actually reporting or editing the newspapers. This lack of neutrality is partly problematic, and therefore a range of newspapers have been examined within this thesis to highlight the varied influences on immigrant and host communities during the nineteenth century.

Despite this lack of neutrality, exploring how newspapers portrayed international and domestic information can provide insight into the priorities of those focused on in this thesis, particularly in the 1840s and early 1850s when newspapers provide invaluable insight into the lives of each city’s inhabitants. There are very few non-official governmental manuscript sources which relate to Melbourne and Chicago in their first decades. The information held within newspapers therefore allow for the exploration of how community institutions were established, as opposed to the nation building endeavours followed by governmental manuscript sources. The mid-nineteenth century was a time when internationally ideas about nationhood and belonging were being considered and reconstructed.78 Newspapers were vital in creating the ‘diasporic consciousness’ referred to earlier, both in attributing symbolic meanings to ethnic identity and in disseminating news from around the world. The language surrounding Ireland, Irishness, and belonging in newspapers, published speeches, and personal correspondence is also compared. How Ireland and Irish nationhood was presented - a land of poetry and valour, or a subjugated nation that had sent its exiles across the world - influenced how Irish people saw themselves and their position in the world. Therefore, this language of belonging and loyalty is also explored.

As the nineteenth century progressed ethnic newspapers were established to provide documentary evidence of the priorities of Irish and Catholics abroad. In the United States these were spread across the whole country, the *Irish American Weekly* was sent from New York City to join specifically Chicago-based newspapers which focused on Irish Catholic communities. The *Western Catholic*,

the *Western Tablet*, and the *Irish Republic* have been the predominant Chicago-based ethnic newspapers consulted.\(^79\) For those in Melbourne, the Sydney affiliate of the *Freeman’s Journal* provided Irish and Catholic news until 1868 when the *Advocate* was established, bringing together the Irish and Catholic priorities of its middle-class editors while uniting the community and cross-class lives through club columns.\(^80\) Irish newspapers provided both a link back to Ireland and to other Irish communities around the world, and mainstream newspapers provided an arena for public discussion, discrimination and acceptance of Irish communities.\(^81\) Newspapers therefore influenced the Irish identity formed abroad through editorial choice and public pressure, they were another way of controlling how people received their news, and how they understood the world that they lived in.\(^82\) In this way newspapers provided a medium through which transnational conversations took place as well as the construction of ethnic symbolism.

Newspaper sources are supplemented by archival records, often collected by the Catholic Church in diocesan archives and by religious orders. Letters published in newspapers help to present the voices of those who did not leave collections of manuscript material, including prominent Irish politicians like John O’Shanassy in Melbourne. Correspondence and diaries that do exist are largely those of Irish nationalist and community organisers, leaving the ‘silent majority’ largely silent. However, glimpses of the views and priorities of women and the less powerful

---


\(^{81}\) Enda Delaney notes the influence of transnational newspaper coverage and communications networks in ‘Ireland’s Great Famine: A Transnational History’ in Whelehan (ed.), *Transnational Perspectives*, 106–126.

can be seen in the projects that were funded, the bazaars that were hosted, and the societies that sustained. The types and varieties of Irish community life which filled the society columns of Melbourne and Chicago’s mainstream and ethnic newspapers can therefore be used as sources in themselves, supplemented by information found in city directories, school records, and society minutes.

Structure of the Thesis.

The people who made their homes in Melbourne and Chicago entered cities inhabited by Irish men and women since their European settlement. While much historiography on the Irish abroad has suffered from a ‘chronological foreshortening of the historian’s span of attention in which the 1830s and 1840s…are seen as the defining moments of Irish settlement’, this is truly the case in the examples of Melbourne and Chicago.  

As chapter one explains, there was no or little European migration to either Melbourne or Chicago before this time. Irish people were members of the founding fathers of each city, they shaped the communities which emerged and each city’s identity. These cities should have been the perfect venue for Irish people to assimilate into a new broader Melbourne or Chicago identity. Yet in both cities specifically Irish identities emerged, evolved, and were sustained throughout the nineteenth century.

The final decade of the nineteenth century heralded a transformation in the way that nationalism was engaged with in Ireland and signals a useful endpoint for this thesis. After the failure of the first and then second Home Rule Bill, in 1886 and 1893, cultural nationalism in the form of a resurgence in Gaelic games and the Irish language spread across Ireland, led by middle class and elite urbanites. This ‘Gaelic Revival’ was echoed throughout the Irish diaspora. With the centenary of the 1916 Easter Rising, the late nineteenth century has been the subject of a large scholarship seeking to understand the communities and influences on the

---

83 Donald M. MacRaild, Culture, Conflict and Migration: The Irish in Victorian Cumbria (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press, 1998), xiii.
future ‘revolutionary generation’. This thesis therefore examines how the Irish middle classes of the earlier nineteenth century negotiated new environments, and how these environments shaped many of the ethnic community networks and associations which would lay the groundwork for these later struggles.

Approaching the subject of ethnic community thematically, this research explores the ‘gradual, but powerful’ changes which took place over a five decades in Melbourne and Chicago. In doing so it balances the unconscious renegotiations which took place over different generations, with the self-conscious defining and redefining of ethnic boundaries which took place within associational culture, fights for religious education funding, and most clearly, through engagement with St Patrick’s Day festivals.

The first chapter explains the choice of Melbourne and Chicago as urban case studies for this comparison. It uses the concept of ‘instant cities’ to demonstrate the similar foundations of Melbourne and Chicago as urban sites in the early nineteenth century. After exploring the histories of each city, it places the Irish immigrant community within their local and international contexts. This establishes how the ethnic parish was formed, whether on a religious, national, or geographical basis, laying the foundation for the later examination of the diaspora space which emerged. The next three chapters explore the parish and community life which emerged within Melbourne and Chicago, identifying the main leaders and networks depended on for the promotion of an Irish identity within each city.

These structures, and the men and women who organised them, were often interconnected, allowing for secular and religious understandings of Irish identity to work in tandem. They thus provided different but useful opportunities for socialising, employment, and celebration within and outside a specifically Irish circle. This separation of secular and religious is an analytical division which was not necessarily reflected in the real lives of those studied, however it is useful in examining the different ways that ethnic identity was celebrated and promoted.

---

Chapter two approaches secular Irish community life in the two cities, focusing on the ways that ethnic fraternity was established and encouraged by middle-class men. It explores the secular institutions which, though they often overlapped with religious organisations and networks, allowed Irish people of mixed religious beliefs to associate and celebrate their Irish identity.

The Catholic Church provided a specifically Irish setting for socialisation in both Melbourne and Chicago, either through the active creation of national parishes in Chicago or the coincidental dominance of Irish people in the Melbourne Catholic Church. The variation inherent within Protestant churches also means that Irish ethnicity did not play such a large role in the Irish diaspora as in the Catholic Church. 87 This research therefore focuses on the linking of religion and ethnicity by the Catholic Church. Chapter three examines the evolution of elementary educational legislation in Melbourne and Chicago, between 1840 and 1890, with particular attention on the place of Catholic and Irish views expressed within. This chapter uses the attempts of the state to enforce a particular image of citizenship through education to explore Melbourne and Chicago's Irish Catholic communities’ influence in shaping the types of political subjects that emerged from their schools. Chapter four explores the structures of parish life that emerged to surround and support the religious parish schools which were discussed in the previous chapter. The religious parish was a vital point of connection for the Irish abroad and worked alternately in tandem and in conflict with the secular parish. The religious parish was a place for Catholics, particularly Irish Catholics, to meet and work with those of a different class or gender to themselves, allowing them to expand their networks outwards from their class or professional networks. These chapters are primarily concerned with the construction of a foundational Irish identity, built upon ethnic mirroring and frequent contact from childhood.

Chapters five and six build upon the parish lives explored in the previous chapters, examining the ways that Irish community life was articulated as Irish identity through nationalism and public performance. Chapter five examines how this cultural affinity was employed by community leaders from the parish and

further afield to promote Irish political nationalist activities whether armed rebellion, moral force, or constitutional change. The image of Ireland and the Irish people was a symbolic focus of ethnic community life, and was politicised and reimagined to serve a range of purposes, both in Ireland and in Melbourne and Chicago. Chapter six builds upon the themes of previous chapters to explore the rhetoric used by leading Irish organisations in Melbourne and Chicago on St Patrick’s Day. The language of belonging and loyalty used at St Patrick’s Day dinners and demonstrations brought together the priorities of diverse communities, encompassing educational, religious, and political identities within the differing environments of Empire and republic. Chapter six is primarily concerned with the presentation of certain images of diasporic Irishness within and outside the Irish community, and the people and groups who controlled that public platform. Together these chapters explore the shifting influences on the promotion and understanding of what it meant to identify as Irish in Melbourne and Chicago during the nineteenth century.
Chapter One: Setting the Scene: The Urban Contexts and Irish Inhabitants of Melbourne and Chicago, 1840-1890.

In 1852, John Onahan joined thousands of Irish people in the newly booming Chicago. Onahan was brought to the swampy and frontier city, from County Carlow via Liverpool and New York City, by the burgeoning canal dockyards and infrastructural development that promised employment for a labourer. John took his place among thousands of other Irishmen, women, and children, first as an itinerant labourer, then as the proud owner of a plot of land in the heart of Chicago.¹ Chicago, it was observed in 1856, was ‘the place for a man to make money, but a poor place to live in, the inhabitants being chiefly [sic] foreigners possessed of little principle having no regard for the Sabbath’.² As the years progressed, middle-class Irish migrants sought to make money, earn influence, and become respectable churchgoers. John’s son William would rise up to take political office in Chicago, become president of the St Patrick’s Society, and a leader of Irish Catholic life. The Onahan family’s rise in social and political influence was reflected by the city that they made their home. Over the next four decades Chicago went from being ranked twenty-fourth in population in the United States to the ‘second city’ of one of the most powerful countries of the world and the Catholic centre of the Midwest.³ A similarly rapid rise in population and power occurred in Melbourne which transformed from the second city of the New South Wales colony in the 1840s to the ‘Marvellous Melbourne’ of the 1880s, a city on its way to being the temporary capital of a newly federated Australia.⁴ This chapter seeks to justify the choice of Melbourne and Chicago as sites of comparison for this thesis.

The mid-nineteenth century signalled the advent of a new type of city - cities without a long history which benefited from an immediate prioritisation of industry and industriousness. Melbourne and Chicago had their roots in the land

---
¹ John Onahan to William Onahan. Chicago, 2 June 1854 (CAA, ADMN/C5920/601).
² J. Alonzo Leonard to unknown, Chicago, 15 December 1856 (ALPML, SC 909).
³ U.S. Census, 1850.
expansionism of 1830s and developed rapidly at the same time as Ireland’s rural and Catholic population began to emigrate in large numbers. In the middle decade of the nineteenth century, Chicago’s population increased by two and a half times, and Melbourne’s increased four-fold. Nineteenth-century Melbourne and Chicago have been the focus of significant scholarly work, but despite their many similarities these cities, and the Irish communities they housed, have received little comparative attention. James Belich focused on the two cities in connection, using Melbourne and Chicago, along with London and New York, to analyse the reach of the expanding Anglo-world during the long nineteenth century. While Belich’s work begins with comparison, he prefers to use Melbourne and Chicago as foundational case studies, comparing them to other cities in order to examine themes of economic boom and bust. Belich’s work does not focus on the people within the cities, nor their role in shaping the society or being shaped by them. Though there have been many incredibly useful works based upon one city, or on multiple cities within one country, this nation-bound approach does not take into account the influences of differing political and philosophical contexts of an imperial city as opposed to a republican city in altering immigrant identity. In situating immigrant communities within their social contexts, in this case rapidly growing cities, providing such a contrast point allows for the deeper interrogation of the transnational influences on diasporic ‘Irishness’.

The position of Melbourne and Chicago as ‘instant cities’ without established native-born elites offers an opportunity to explore the ways that nineteenth-century immigrant communities manoeuvred their way up and around the societies they inhabited. Gunther Barth identified the concept of instant cities in relation to San Francisco and Denver: cities that sprung up almost like magic in the mid-century. The concept can be applied to Melbourne and Chicago, two cities which quickly emerged as self-reliant cities based on a boom of natural and human resources and in spite of environmental pressures. This thesis sees the rapid growth of these communities as different to those within older cities that

‘resembled trees that grew haltingly, matured slowly, and decayed imperceptibly.’

Melbourne has been studied as an instant city in relation to San Francisco, but not Chicago. These cities were, in part, the focus of Campbell’s work comparing the Irish in Australia and America. Campbell argues that comparisons should provide equal weight to each case study, avoiding the promotion of national exceptionalism to the deficit of testing the role of local contexts. His research has focused on the gold rushes of eastern Australia and California, alongside rural New South Wales and the prairie lands of Wisconsin. Belich also dedicated a chapter to the ‘golden wests’ of California and Victoria in his study. While these comparisons are incredibly important in understanding the variation and nuance of Irish lives and identities, they focus on the trans-Pacific similarities and voyages of Irish immigrants to the goldfields, instead of the urban contexts that this thesis prioritises. It is the ‘new’ cities of Melbourne and Chicago, which had similar periods of growth (see Figures 1 and 2) and a lack of entrenched power structures at the beginning of mass Irish Catholic emigration, that form the base of this thesis.

The opportunities promised by the economic booms in Melbourne and Chicago brought many immigrants to the expanding cities, directly or indirectly, at a time of increasing nationalist and revolutionary fervour in Europe. The subsequent mixing of different nationalities and generations of immigrants in each city influenced the tone and image of Irish diasporic identity. These ‘instant cities’ had dominant cultures, but they did lack the entrenched Protestant elites of their older counterparts, and therefore their populations prioritised the position of religion in different ways. Barth hypothesised that in new cities, lacking common traditions, social cohesion was fostered by a communal need to order society. The egalitarian opportunities provided by quick success in instant cities meant that people from a

---


10 The United States Federal Census was taken in the turn of the decade year (1850, 1860…) whereas the Victorian Census was officially part of the British Census and was therefore taken, in line with the British census, in the first year of each decade (1851, 1861…).
diverse range of backgrounds could establish themselves in positions of authority, however in Barth’s study he noted that the egalitarian beginnings of San Francisco and Denver soon reverted to traditional hierarchies of authority based on ideas of class.\textsuperscript{11} However, lacking traditions of their own, instant cities’ inhabitants learned to adapt, piecing together ‘a mosaic of practices, largely borrowed from the past, but reflecting in their immediacy and usefulness the creativity of the new cities.’\textsuperscript{12} While certain national traditions were transferred abroad, the new and urban contexts provided a certain level of anonymity for those who lived there, and allowed for the opportunity to reshape individual and community identities. Julie Coddell argues that ‘[b]eing in another country offered a freedom from often-restricted identities of home, to which one could return when desired and from which one never entirely left.’\textsuperscript{13} Using Avtar Brah’s concept of ‘diaspora spaces’, the need to consider migrant identity as shaped by both internal and external community influences, the local contexts in which people of Irish birth and descent established a place for themselves, and reconfigured their priorities with regard to ethnic and religious identities are explored.\textsuperscript{14} The next sections introduce the urban environments and histories of Melbourne and Chicago, before examining the place of Irish-born men and women within them.

\textsuperscript{11} Barth, \textit{Instant Cities}, 156-163.
\textsuperscript{12} Barth, \textit{Instant Cities}, xxii-xiv.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Melbourne</th>
<th>% Increase</th>
<th>Chicago</th>
<th>% Increase</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1840</td>
<td>4,479</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>4,470</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1850</td>
<td>23,143</td>
<td>417</td>
<td>29,963</td>
<td>570</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1860</td>
<td>114,998</td>
<td>397</td>
<td>109,260</td>
<td>265</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1870</td>
<td>204,741</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>298,977</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1880</td>
<td>282,947</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>503,185</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1890</td>
<td>425,892</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>1,099,850</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Figure 1: The Increase of Population in Melbourne and Chicago, 1850-1890.*

1841 Melbourne census figure, reported in ‘Census of Port Phillip’, Geelong Advertiser, 17 July 1841; Victorian Census 1851, 1861, 1871, 1881, 1891. The figures for Melbourne or “Greater Melbourne” include the Melbourne city and suburbs.

U.S. Federal Census 1840, 1850, 1860, 1870, 1880, 1890. The population increases are also related to the changing city limits in 1863.

*Figure 2: Total Population of Chicago and Melbourne, 1840-1890.*
Chicago.

In 1823, fur traders from Quebec and the east coast of America became the first white settlers of Chicago. By 1840 it had become home to around 4,500 people, mainly men, who had seen Chicago’s incorporation as a city three years previously.\(^{15}\) The future prominence of Chicago was signalled in 1836 when the Illinois State Legislature authorised the digging of the Illinois and Michigan (I&M) Canal, bringing the first large influx of immigrants to the area.\(^{16}\) Immigrant navvies, predominantly Irish and German, were instrumental to the laying of the Galena and Chicago Union Railroad, the first section of which opened in 1850 two years after the opening of the I&M Canal. These transport links were the foundation of Chicago’s meteoric rise to the ‘second city’ of the United States over the next 40 years, establishing the city as the ‘gateway to the West’. The burgeoning railroad network brought in the rural economies of the surrounding prairie states: grain, lumber, and meat-packing, and distributed them across the country. In this way, the railroads helped to integrate the economies and populations of the Midwest into the global market place.\(^{17}\) Drawn by construction work and the promise of riches Chicago became a booming, but transient, society during the mid-century, labourers and carpenters converged on the city.\(^{18}\) When building the city’s institutions did not provide enough opportunities, Chicago’s unskilled population followed construction work out into wider Cook County, and the surrounds of Illinois and neighbouring states.

Despite this transience, David Galenson estimates that Chicago’s young male society witnessed a 14 percent turnover rate during the 1850s. This was the lowest turnover rate recorded in the main urban centres of the United States, providing


\(^{18}\) 1850 US Census. Farming was the largest occupation type (140,894) state-wide, second was ‘laborer’ (27,910) followed by carpenters (6,532).
relative community stability compared to Boston’s 39 percent and Philadelphia’s 32 percent turnover. 19 This stability was further aided when women arrived in the city, also attracted to the job opportunities within a new city. While men outnumbered women by 44,000 across Illinois state, single women tended to remain in the urban environment where there were more possibilities for quick and respectable employment and lodgings with families and other single women. 20 For young people, Chicago provided opportunities for entertainment, employment, and marriage.

For many, the lack of entrenched elites and industries in Chicago presented an economic opportunity for those willing to tolerate the city’s chaotic surroundings. During the 1850s, Chicago’s ‘elites were composed of merchants who were boosters, promoters, and real estate speculators’: elites that had benefited from luck, timing, and individual endeavour. 21 This elite lacked the familial interdependence and tradition of the Brahmins of Boston or the Knickerbocker enclave of New York City. 22 Instead, immigrants who brought skills in politics, community links, or entrepreneurship had the opportunity to join the city’s elite quickly. Chicago in the 1850s was a city of second sons and daughters: people who may have had social connections but could not necessarily rely on family wealth and position. It was also a youthful city in terms of population age. Those under the age of 30 dominated, in 1850 they accounted for 30,113 of Cook County’s 43,385 inhabitants. 23 The dominance of child-bearing aged people, particularly as the city became more mixed, led to a need for infrastructure, schools and hospitals, churches to get married in and for babies to be baptised, and saloons and dance halls to entertain them. During the 1840s, the Catholic

---

23 U.S. Census, 1850.
Church contributed manpower and money to the city’s ‘community projects’, providing assistance in the absence of a unified Protestant presence. Though separated by language and nationality, Chicago’s Catholic churches were linked under one bishop and through the Vatican in a way that its myriad of Protestant churches, sects, and nationalities seemed incapable of achieving. As such the early arrival of the Catholic hierarchy and religious orders was just as important as the lack of established elites in Irish Catholics finding and demanding a place in Chicago society throughout the nineteenth century.

Richard C. Wade remarked in his foreword to James W. Sanders’ The Education of an Urban Minority that Chicago’s Catholic diocese ‘was not only immense but encompassed an extraordinary ethnic mixture.’ This was reflected throughout the city. The Chicago area was originally a trade centre for Native American Nations of the Potawatomi, Miami, and Illinois and the area’s positioning as an economic nexus was an important impulse in the arrival of European settlers. The ‘founding fathers’ of the city were French Canadians and native-born Americans, however the Canadians soon gave way to European immigrants. During the 1850s and 1860s, immigrants from the Germanic states and Ireland made up the largest proportions of Cook County’s 71,834 foreign-born population. They were joined by immigrants from Britain, France, and Scandinavia. Catholics dominated the Irish, Germanic and Polish populations of the city, though each also had Protestant elements. They co-existed alongside Jews from Bavaria, Scandinavian Lutherans and native-born American and British Protestants in the city. While Catholic Italians had been present in Chicago from 1850, they only made up a handful of the city’s population until the great wave of unskilled southern European immigration in the 1880s. The same was true of free African-Americans, a very small community, until the Great Migration of

---

Chicago’s ethnic make-up was mixed, but Germans and Irish people competed for numerical dominance and primacy in the job market throughout the first four decades of the city’s existence. By the 1870s working and living alongside people of a different nationality was a common experience and ‘The myth of ethnic segregation simply did not hold true.’ As Louise Carroll Wade has noted, even areas like the Irish-dominated Bridgeport were ethnically mixed. However, ethnic groups still maintained their own separate community institutions and identities. Chicago was an ethnically plural city which gained new immigrant groups each year. These new waves of immigrants joined American-born children of immigrants creating multi-generational migrant communities who varied in occupation and financial status.

Due to Chicago’s rapidly expanding industries, there were constant labour shortages leaving Chicago’s manufacturers beholden to its immigrants and separating the city from established cities like Philadelphia and Boston. In 1852, just over half of Chicago’s population was foreign-born. While nativist politics gained in popularity throughout the United States during the 1850s, they failed to take hold of Chicago politics for long. The only Know-Nothing (American Party) Mayor of Chicago, Levi Boone, was elected in 1855 and for a time there were sympathetic newspapers ‘willing to nurse the bigotry and intolerance that gave them voice.’ Boone and city council enacted laws requiring that all city workers hired were native-born Americans and that beer licenses were raised in price, alienating Germans who worked and owned the city’s breweries, and the Irish and German labourers who sought employment and entertainment in them. The subsequent political collaboration between Irish and German communities in

---

33 Michael F. Funchion, ‘Irish Chicago: Church, Homeland, Politics, and Class – The Shaping of an Ethnic Group, 1870-1900’ in Holli & Jones (eds), *Ethnic Chicago*, 57-92. There are few occupational statistics based on nationality for the 1850s and 1860s. By 1870, 587 of Illinois’ 848 brewers were German.
Chicago resulted in the unseating of the Mayor within a year, and the reminder that ‘[f]rom the very first Chicago has been indebted to foreign-born citizens for the greater part of her prosperity and glory.’\textsuperscript{34} The native-born American population was in the minority. It could ill afford to alienate the workforce that it relied upon to create the city’s infrastructure, especially when the city was still firmly, or not so firmly, at its foundational level. In 1856 the grade of the land had yet to be raised, artificially elevating the ‘Chicago streets above the swamp which the almost indecipherable laws of commerce had made the site of a great city. An air of newness was over everything’.\textsuperscript{35} In the mid-century there was a real risk that the people of Chicago would literally sink in their homes and on their roads if not for the work of immigrant labourers. This artificial elevation was still not completed by the turn of the century, continuing the need for new waves of cheap labour.

Chicago’s position by Lake Michigan and within the canal and rail complex helped its economic boom. However, it was the Civil War that cemented Chicago’s place within the United States’ power hierarchy. Initially greeted with horror it soon emerged that for Chicago, the Civil War would provide ‘a wonderful stimulus to its commerce and manufactures’.\textsuperscript{36} Rail link improvements during the 1850s meant that by the time that war broke out, Chicago was established as the western terminus of the trade rail route from New York, via New York State, Ohio, and Pennsylvania. Through the canal network, the city’s transport reach also extended down the Mississippi River. The war brought an increased demand for Chicago’s resources and its position as a transport hub meant that troops, munitions, and supplies could be moved to any part of the country with relative ease. Additionally the Civil War stimulated the progress and use of machinery in the area as production continued apace despite the reduction of previously available manpower.\textsuperscript{37} Chicago’s entrepreneurs established industries to cater for the Union’s troops: stockyards to sell and buy animals,

\footnotesize

\textsuperscript{34} Flinn, Chicago Police, 63.
\textsuperscript{36} Taaffe, Gauthier & O'Kelly, Geography of Transportation, 97.
slaughterhouses to kill them and salting factories to preserve the meat before they were loaded onto railroad lorries. Further industries emerged using the by-products of these animals, and soap and candle makers set up shop near the stockyards. By the end of the Civil War, the Chicago Union Stockyard District provided employment for thousands of people which continued over the next century. These industries, the Stockyards and associated slaughterhouses, as well as towns like Pullman which were directly related to the railroads, meant that the population of Chicago doubled in each census year during the nineteenth century.

In nineteenth-century Chicago, there were certain jobs which attracted Irish people more than others. Kevin Kenny has noted that the ‘Irish provided most of the muscle and brawn’ of canal building and were a cheap, expendable labour force throughout the United States. As such, Irish men dominated Chicago’s labour industry and Irish women the city’s domestic service between 1850 and 1880. They followed a trend visible throughout the United States. In 1860, around 60 percent of gainfully employed adult Irish immigrant males held unskilled jobs compared to 15 percent of native-born Americans. While the agricultural backgrounds of many Irish immigrants meant that they were more suited to non-skilled manual work than Germans and Americans, this also meant that they dominated as teamsters, car-men, and draymen. However, by the mid-1860s the Irish were already making their presence felt in more powerful professions. In 1866, Irish-born men made up an estimated 27 percent of policemen in Chicago. As a sign of their growing influence, six out of the eight

---

40 1870 & 1880 U.S. Federal Census. In 1870, Irish labourers numbered 6631 in Chicago, compared to 3,522 Americans and 4307 Germans. As teamsters, car-men, and draymen, Irishmen numbering 1,325 compared to 314 Americans and 917 Germans. 3,503 Irish domestic servants worked alongside 3,753 Americans and 2064 Germans. Irish women also increasingly turned to laundry for income, accounting for 338 of the 709 laundresses in the city (169 Americans, 92 Germans). In 1880, there were more Irish domestic servants (2,823) than Germans (2,134) though less than the American-born children of immigrants, many of whom would have been of Irish descent (6,505).
41 Kelleher, ‘Class and Catholic’. 
men in the detective department were of Irish descent, as were three captains and two sergeants in the force. In certain districts in the city, Irish-born men accounted for five of six police officers. As a typical police officer in Chicago could make between six and seven hundred dollars a year, it was a dangerous but lucrative occupation which had the added perk of lengthening the arm of the often corrupt city political machine. Contacts within the government could also be utilised to benefit the ethnic community, politically and financially. In 1868 the Chicago Republican’s front-page listed “voters” who had fraudulently claimed citizenship and the witnesses that helped in this fraud. Most were Irish names and the same witness names appear repeatedly: Peter O’Malley appears as a witness 45 times in a list of around 900 names, P. O’Malley appears a further six times. These voters, it was claimed, were naturalised by city official Dan O’Hara, who procured their papers by swearing that the voters had come to the country as minors or by swearing that they had lost their papers. The corruption that late nineteenth-century Chicago became known for was used advantageously by its Irish citizens, friends of O’Malley as well as actual citizens. As will be seen later, occupational and ethnic networks and associations often overlapped and aided their members, helping to provide job opportunities and social security while also contributing to ethnic stereotyping and suspicion.

Though ethnic pride was often displayed by Chicago’s immigrant communities particularly in relation to ethnic associational culture, there was a unifying pride in the city of Chicago. An early historian of Chicago, Bessie Louise Pierce, observed that the growth of Chicago as an influential American and global city was the result of several factors ‘but it was accelerated by the faith of all these Chicagoans in the future of their city, a faith so assertive and boastful that it became contagious.’ This self-esteem had existed from Chicago’s early days usually in competition with the seeming ease and over-indulgence of established

---

43 Chicago Republican, 19 April 1868.
45 See chapters two, four and five for deeper discussion of these occupational and ethnic links.
cities like Boston and Philadelphia. Chicago’s inhabitants believed that the city’s rise to prominence was ‘the natural outcome of a realistic evaluation of the city’s progress’: a product of their society’s enterprise and energy.\textsuperscript{47} This self-belief was tested to its fullest on 8-9 October 1871 when the Great Chicago Fire wiped out an area four miles long and three-quarters of a mile across in central Chicago. With close to 17,500 buildings burnt down, 100,000 homeless, and between 120 and 300 dead, Chicago’s municipal government and charitable institutions had to come together in order to avoid a breakdown in order and a slowing of the city’s progress on the global stage. Newspapermen and contemporary observers proudly proclaimed that Chicago’s men and women rose to the challenge with the ‘motto on a shingle stuck up amid the ruins long before they had cooled, “All gone but wife, children, and energy.”'\textsuperscript{48} The supposed cause of the fire, Mrs O’Leary’s infamous cow, caused a brief resurgence in anti-Irish comment, but as immigrant neighbourhoods were some of the worst hit and more labour was needed to repair the damage, Chicago continued to welcome more workers from across the country and further afield.\textsuperscript{49}

In 1870 and 1880, 52 percent of working Irishmen and women in Chicago worked in the ‘Personal and Professional Services’, predominantly as labourers or domestic servants, and were over-represented in the unskilled and semi-skilled labour markets.\textsuperscript{50} This occupational clustering spilled over into personal solidarity at various points and not just in the ways that people spent their free time. After the murder of police officer Patrick O’Meara by fellow Irishman Christopher Rafferty in 1872, O’Meara gained the support of the city’s middle and upper classes. Rafferty, conversely, was financially and vocally supported by his peers in the working and criminal classes. Rafferty had been a brick-maker before he joined the U.S. Army during the Civil War. After his arrest, the brickyard workers of Chicago donated $1,400 towards Rafferty’s legal


\textsuperscript{48} Colbert & Chamberlain, \textit{Chicago}, 319.


\textsuperscript{50} 1870 & 1880 U.S. Census.
proceedings.\textsuperscript{51} Brick masonry and making were popular occupations for newly arrived Irishmen, who, according to one recollection, ‘can do bricklaying and everything of that kind’.\textsuperscript{52} In this way, Rafferty’s ethnic and occupational networks provided a support base for his legal battles, and after he was executed, the Irish community turned out en masse to bury him in style.\textsuperscript{53} Irish people were therefore dominant in the skilled, unskilled, and law and order occupations of the city, allowing for class-based community action and cross-class influence, when required.

The waves of immigrant labour that arrived in response to Chicago’s fire-inspired construction boom became an unemployment problem when the city’s economy was struck by international recession in 1873. Joel E. Black has described a ‘tramp menace’ surrounding the large number of itinerant and single men who passed through and settled in Chicago, using its position as a transport hub to search for work in the city and beyond.\textsuperscript{54} The Panic of 1873 ‘constituted the city’s first great crisis of hegemony’ as Chicago’s working class reacted against the growing industrial society leaders, separating elites from producers, and slowing production through ‘widespread strikes and quasi-insurrectionary rebellion of the immigrant working class during the 1877 railroad strikes.’\textsuperscript{55} These strikes set the stage for a newly unionised Chicago, inspired by international socialism and largely led by German labour revolutionaries. This increase in labour radicalism coincided with a change in immigrant nationalities in the city, with southern Europeans joined by an expansion in the Ukrainian and Polish communities during the 1880s.\textsuperscript{56}

Over the next decade Chicago began a home for labour radicalism, culminating in the 1886 Haymarket bombing and the 1893 Pullman Strike. The involvement of newly arrived immigrants in these activities, combined with the prominence of

\textsuperscript{52} John Devoy Papers, (NLI, MS 18,058 (3)).
\textsuperscript{53} ‘Dust to Dust.’, Chicago Tribune, 2 March 1874.
\textsuperscript{55} Jentz & Schneirov, Age of Capital, 9.
\textsuperscript{56} Holli & Jones (eds), Ethnic Chicago.
Irish physical-force nationalists in the city, stirred up anti-immigrant sentiment in the final decades of the nineteenth century. However the more established Irish and Germans, those who had arrived in earlier waves of immigration, retained control of city politics.57 The economic recession slowed the population explosion during the 1870s, however the 1880s brought about economic recovery and new employment opportunities. By the 1890 census the city’s population had increased by another 119 percent. The history of Chicago was one of reinvention and rejuvenation and though the position of immigrants fluctuated, they were afforded more opportunities to declare their national identities and move throughout society than in older and more entrenched cities. Chicago therefore provides a useful case study for exploring the place of an immigrant community, the Irish, within a new city in the United States. The Irish in Chicago will be examined in relation to those in the new imperial city of Melbourne in Australia Felix.

Melbourne.

Immigrants arriving in Melbourne in the summer 1851 met with a city in the midst of a transformation. Originally the land of the Kulin nation, white settlement began in the area in 1835 when John Batman led a group of Europeans from Van Diemen’s Land.58 Known as Batman Hill within the Port Phillip District, Melbourne was officially incorporated as an imperial city in 1847. Four years later, the colony of Victoria (formerly the Port Phillip District) separated politically from New South Wales after a campaign against a lack of representation in the large and difficult to traverse colony. This legislative separation was enacted in 1856 with the formal opening of the Victorian Legislative Assembly and Council, respectively the lower and upper houses of the Victorian Parliament. Imbued with new political and economic powers and a rapidly growing population, Melbourne boomed with relative independence from its older rival Sydney and from its imperial centre, London. The new colony of Victoria was settled by assisted immigrants predominantly from the United Kingdom, and while Victoria’s population included freed convicts from New

57 See chapters two, five, and six.
South Wales and Tasmania (then Van Diemen’s Land), Victoria’s inhabitants were proud of their lack of convict transportation legacy. This background would influence the ways that Melbourne society leaders interacted with the British state and Irish local governments with regard to the ‘relocation’ of their poor and unwanted populations. Immediately after Victoria’s separation, Melbourne’s population expanded exponentially presenting its own problems of slum-life, overcrowding, and lack of resources.

When Charles Gavan Duffy, an Irish Catholic Young Irelander, journalist and briefly member of the Westminster Parliament, arrived from Ireland in 1854 Melbourne was ‘a thriving village […] The public buildings were ultra-provincial, the Government offices were a two-storey villa, the law offices occupied a vacant corn store, the Public Works department was housed in a wooden shanty.’ He later observed that society ‘was existing in a state of discomfort and inconvenience difficult to realise.’ The city had been growing rapidly in the 1840s, but it was still being formed. The turning point for Melbourne was the discovery of gold in rural Victoria in July 1851. When news of this reached the wider world, gold prospectors streamed in. Between September 1851 and December 1852 the ground of Victoria yielded around 4,600,000 ounces of gold and brought between five and seven thousand people a month to Victoria’s shores over the next two years. This peaked in September and October 1853 when around 16,000 and 19,000 people arrived respectively. However Melbourne was not yet a destination point. People preferred to initially try their luck in the goldfields of rural Victoria, leading to a city which was gold-rich but not yet labourer-rich. One nineteenth-century historian of the Anglican Church in Melbourne noted:

59 ‘Proceedings of the Executive Council on the 1st and 23rd April 1846 relative to the erection of the Port Philip District into a separate Colony’, (TNA, CO 201/375, ff.42-68).
Melbourne, from a small town, expanded suddenly into a big city. Its streets swarmed with strange figures. Public-houses were filled with rough crowds of men who rioted in folly and extravagance. Robbery, violence, and murder, prevailed by day and night, and Van Diemen’s Land poured forth into this inviting territory a steady stream of rascality.63

Perhaps this ‘rascality’ should have been expected from such a young and temporarily rich city. The mean age of population of Victoria in 1846 was 23.6 years (25.7 for men and 20.3 for women), increasing to 24.5 in 1854 before declining each decade until 1891 when a peak mean age 25.6 was reached.64 As one contemporary visitor observed, ‘the population of a young colony has not, as a rule, many aged people: it is mostly composed of the young and healthy of both sexes: such only are fitted, and such only selected by emigration agents to perform the hard work of colonisation.’65 The city of Melbourne was predominantly populated by people of British and Irish extraction, encouraged there by a series of assistance schemes funded by local councils and the British and Victorian state.

Between 1831 and 1850, only one in three emigrants to Australia paid their own fare.66 The rise in workhouse intake during the 1840s and 1850s, particularly during the Irish and Scottish famines, meant that new schemes had to be dreamed up with the Australian colonies promoted as a fitting place to send the poor of the United Kingdom. The high proportion of Catholics in Irish workhouses was reflected in an increase of Catholic arrivals during the mid-nineteenth century, encouraged by assisted emigration schemes which meant that until 1890 many parishes only had to pay an emigrant’s fare to the point of embarkation, usually Liverpool, whereas they had to pay for an American emigrant’s entire voyage.67 A wave of anti-Catholic fear passed through Melbourne leading to debates about how emigration agents were chosen and how potential immigrants were vetted.

---

63 Goodman, Church in Victoria, 157.
64 Victorian Census, 1861, 1871, 1881, 1891.
65 Charles Rooking Carter, Victoria, the British “El Dorado”… a field for emigration (London: E. Stanford, 1870), 45-46.
When a group of Members of the Legislative Assembly (MLAs) suggested restricting the numbers of Irish Catholics recruited for the use of assisted passage, Martin Hood MLA refuted the idea. Hood argued that discriminating against recruiting Irish Catholics via agents would be pointless as four-fifths of those who sent home for their friends and therefore were not in need of government encouragement, were Irish Roman Catholics. Assisted migration may have acted as a cost-saving measure for parish authorities, however most potential migrants were still required to pay an expensive deposit and buy their own travelling clothes in order to avail of government assistance to Australia. Instead, this pattern of friend and family chain migration, which exempted migrants from government restrictions, was the preferred option for those reaching Victoria. The colony received the lowest percentage of assisted migrants from 1850, dropping from 86 percent in 1848 to 35 percent in 1852. Chain and assisted migration was actively facilitated by the British government. The schemes had the extra advantage of tempering the ‘influx’ of Chinese migrants who had arrived in Victoria with the finding of gold. While Melbourne society had elements of anti-Irish and anti-Catholic sentiment, it focused its hatred and fear on the ‘race weaker than themselves’: the male Chinese workers. Most Aboriginals had been forced out of Melbourne when it was a small town, leading to an almost entirely white settler city.

While some members of the gentry paid around £6 to get to the port of Williamstown, most who emigrated after 1840 did so with some assistance from the Colonial Land and Emigration Commission. During the 1850s these assisted migrants could be recruited by emigration agents, who would travel around the United Kingdom and provide information about the wonders of the British colony, or they could be put forward by ‘sponsors’ already in Australia. Assistance schemes helped many, however the gold rushes brought many more. Melbourne and wider Victoria were ‘synonymous with fame and fortune’ and in 1852 and 1853, more British and Irish emigrants bought tickets to Melbourne than to any

---

68 Victorian Hansard, 10 March 1857.
69 Haines, Labouring Poor, 23 & 198.
70 Victorian Hansard, 14 January 1857.
other place in the world.\textsuperscript{71} The people that bought these tickets had the resources to travel and made a choice to chase the possibility of wealth, bringing the second sons of wealthy families and experienced businessmen to the city as well as less financially secure fortune hunters. However, the swift growth of the city outpaced its infrastructural progress. A ‘Canvas Town’ emerged on the banks of the River Yarra (see Figure 5). Though initially a temporary camp area, by 1854 the area had two schools, one Presbyterian and one Catholic.\textsuperscript{72} The Canvas Town later became known as Emerald Hill, a reflection of the Irish demography of its inhabitants. In the short-term, Melbourne’s transient population was a burden to be carried through charity by the more stable and resourceful members of society. In the mid-1850s, Melbourne’s economy crashed as the goldfields yielded less precious metal. However, the city’s business minds adapted quickly. Small export industries, wheat and wool, were re-established, expanded, and the economy recovered quite rapidly. Utilising the economic markets of the British Empire between 1865 and 1888, Victoria’s wheat output increased sevenfold, half of which was exported. Its wool output roughly tripled in the same period, over 90 per cent of which was exported.\textsuperscript{73} These industries would lead to Melbourne’s meteoric rise to ‘Marvellous Melbourne’ in the 1880s and through its protectionist economic stance, exempted it from the recessions that afflicted much of the rest of the Western world during the 1870s.\textsuperscript{74}

After the initial boom, Melbourne’s society settled down and begun establishing a version of British society through governmental infrastructure and arenas for civilising entertainment. Being a world, or between 68 and 200 days, away from Britain meant that Victorians had a certain amount of freedom to reinvent themselves and their new home.\textsuperscript{75} Its society was free from the chaos of war, and while it struggled to combat the environmental pressures of wildfire and drought, its climate was not as extreme as elsewhere in Australia or in the United States. After the initial chaos of the 1850s the ‘instant city’ built on competition and the


\textsuperscript{72} Emerald Hill would later become ‘South Melbourne’.

\textsuperscript{73} Belich, \textit{Replenishing the Earth}, 317.

\textsuperscript{74} Davison, \textit{Marvellous Melbourne}.

\textsuperscript{75} Belich, \textit{Replenishing the Earth}, 110.
natural resources of its surroundings and its citizens settled down to deciding what would make Melbourne the best society possible. The Melbourne Public Library, now the State Library of Victoria, opened in 1856 and the rules for access reflected popular reforming ideas of the time. The original trustee Redmond Barry, an Anglo-Irishman from Cork, decided that ‘it would be advisable to adopt a greater freedom of ingress and liberality of access to the books than is usual elsewhere’. This was based in a hope that providing working people with accessible information and knowledge would encourage a prosperous and educated future. Free admission was given to everyone aged 14 and above ‘whether residents or strangers’, free reference was provided to all books, and the only stipulation was that readers had clean hands.76 These reforming desires coincided with the increase of available free time enjoyed by the working classes.

Beginning in 1854 with the Eureka Stockade77, Melbourne and the other cities of Victoria were host to a series of strikes and reforms. In 1856, Melbourne workers in the building trades achieved the eight-hour day, joined by the coachbuilders and irons trades over the next few years. Irish people dominated manual labour jobs, though they did not become prominent union leaders until the 1870s when more skilled workers arrived from Ireland and the Australian-born children of Irish immigrants began to reach adulthood.78 However occupational networks were created, bringing people together based upon occupation, ethnicity, and geographical base. Those involved in the railway industry were focused in the north and west of Melbourne, and Emerald Hill’s proximity to the River Yarra created ‘an uninterrupted vista of foundries, factories, and stores of all descriptions’ related to the river and harbour trades.79 Graeme Davison argues that the founders of urban Australia were ‘not from the villa-owning classes, but from those mobile sections of the British working class that had contributed most to the

77 Led by Peter Lalor, brother of James Fintan Lalor, the Eureka Stockade took place in the goldfields of Ballarat and became a focus point for labour and dissenting history in the colony. This event is discussed in further detail in chapter 5.
urbanisation of Britain itself.\textsuperscript{80} Labour radicalism mixed with the working class roots of urban Australia to create a Melbourne concerned with social reform, in theory if not action. In the 1870s Melbourne’s unskilled labourers unionised, by 1879 there were 17 eight-hour trades in Melbourne, and by 1888, 46.\textsuperscript{81} This increased unionisation culminated in a number of strikes during the 1880s.\textsuperscript{82}

By 1861, Melbourne had become ‘the largest as well as the most glamorous city on the continent’ with thriving cultural and literary ventures, a remarkably rapid transformation.\textsuperscript{83} With this position came a similar mentality about the unique fortune it was to be part of Melbourne society as existed in Chicago. While Melbourne was a proud part of the British Empire, it was apparently not seeking to emulate the embedded class hierarchies and flaws of Britain.\textsuperscript{84} In 1863 Melbourne’s \textit{Argus} newspaper commented that:

we may without breach of modesty fairly consider ourselves out in the world. Nursed and dandled by the careful ministering hand of Downing-street, it is now some years since we passed the age of pap and leading strings, and took to strong meat and walking alone [...] Nothing is more significant of our advance to maturity, and more reassuring to our youthful ambition, than the notice which we are attracting to ourselves from those other and elder members of the commonwealth of nations, whose notice is as good a credential of respectability and ripeness to a young country as the nod of a duchess’s head used to be to a young \textit{debutante}.\textsuperscript{85}

One contemporary observed that the general appearance of the inhabitants of Melbourne ‘is that of a well-to-do people. The population have an air and look of independence and respectability.’\textsuperscript{86} Melbourne’s protectionist economy meant that the city avoided the shockwaves of international depressions, and continued to rise in stability and international importance until the 1890s when the economy based upon land speculation and foreign investment imploded. The 1880s were, therefore, a time when trade and social ties could be consolidated to make

\textsuperscript{83} Davison, ‘Gold-Rush Melbourne’.
\textsuperscript{84} Codell, \textit{Imperial Co-Histories}.
\textsuperscript{85} Argus, 26 November 1863.
\textsuperscript{86} Carter, \textit{British ‘El Dorado}, 44.
Melbourne ‘marvellous’. Australia as a beacon of new hope and egalitarianism was a frequent feature of speeches and prints of the nineteenth century. The emigration of free settlers, people who possessed a desire to help themselves and had certain economic and social resources, were hailed as the reason for Melbourne’s success and served ‘to animate ‘Marvellous Melbourne’ in the coming generation’. By 1891, Melbourne was almost half the size of Chicago, and bigger than St Louis, Cincinnati, and San Francisco. Belich has argued that ‘Relative to host populations, [Melbourne] it was even more remarkable than Chicago’ and both were named among ‘the marvels of the world’.

While Irish people were establishing social and economic networks within the working classes, they also emerged as a coherent business and professional elite by the 1860s. This elite status was furthered in Melbourne through elevation to political office during the next decades. John O’Shanassy, Charles Gavan Duffy, and Bryan O’Loghlen all became state Premiers, raising Irish-born and Catholic men to the highest political office of the state and placing them alongside the most influential men in the British Empire; undermining both the contemporary argument that Irish Catholics were unable to govern themselves, and the historiographical argument of Patrick O’Farrell that the Irish in Melbourne were largely ‘Munster peasants’ without their own leaders. Outside of business elites, Irish people, particularly Trinity College Dublin-educated, were over-represented in the colony in law, medicine, and journalism, as they were throughout the British Empire. Similarly, ex-members of the Royal Irish Constabulary and British Army shaped the Victorian police force. Due to the promotion of Irish policing traditions as the ideal within the British colonies, Irish officers were encouraged to move around the Empire, exporting Irish training as well as ‘ideas

88 Belich, Replenishing the Earth, 2; Davison, Marvellous Melbourne, 231.
89 Davison, Marvellous Melbourne, 19.
90 O’Farrell, ‘Irish in Australia’. O’Shanassy was from Tipperary, Duffy from Monaghan, and O’Loghlen from Dublin.
about policies and procedures, [and] uniforms’. 92 Irish networks were actively encouraged within the police forces of the Empire. By 1874, 82 percent of the police officers in Victoria were Irish-born. 93 Therefore, as Irish people were characterised as drunken troublemakers by MLAs, 94 they were also providing the hard edge of law and order at a policing and legislative level. Irish men and women found a place and networks within each strata of Melbourne society influencing the shape of the new city and the social priorities therein.

Melbourne and Chicago emerged within very different international contexts. At the most basic level, Melbourne was part of a Crown Colony and as such loyalty had to be demonstrated to Queen and Empire. Chicago, conversely, was a city within a country which had achieved its republican system of governance through war with Britain. These contexts brought differing civil restrictions and opportunities for the Irish immigrant abroad. A key difference in image was between the immigration policies of the United States and Victoria. While the United States was portrayed as a haven for ‘the huddled masses’, Australia was very firmly a part of the British Empire, and though small numbers of migrants arrived from Scandinavia, Germany, and China, for most of the nineteenth century, Australia attracted immigrants predominantly from Britain and Ireland. Due to distance and chain migration it was possible for people from across Europe to reach the United States, whereas only a select group of people – white and British - were actively encouraged and supported in their quest to reach Australia. These different immigration dynamics altered the group relationships within each society. However, despite these divergences, Melbourne and Chicago were both instant cities, and their quick rise to wealth, and prominence gave their inhabitants a sense of self-confidence and fluidity. There were opportunities for social advancement, religious toleration, and political control in Melbourne and Chicago that did not exist in older, more established cities like Sydney and New York. Their inhabitants were also conscious of a sense of competition with their older neighbours, encouraging an image of an ambitious, less refined younger sibling,

94 O’Farrell, Irish in Australia, 80-82.
determined to make their mark. The Irish in each city utilised social networks often based around religion and occupation to claim control and space for themselves enabled by their early arrival in each city. The similarities in Irish population size relative to total population provide a further foundation for the comparison of the Irish identities and communities which emerged in Melbourne and Chicago during the second half of the nineteenth century.

Immigration influences: The place of the Irish within the city

The massive increase of Irish-born people living outside Ireland was originally prompted by the Great Famine of 1845-1852. Prior to the peaks of the 1850s, 48 percent of the assisted migrants arriving in New South Wales and Victoria were Irish, despite them only making up 30 percent of the United Kingdom’s population.\(^{95}\) Similarly, before the Famine Irish people contributed around one-third of all immigrants into the United States.\(^{96}\) The devastation brought about by the Famine led to a dramatic decline in Ireland’s population, the forced removal of starving tenants often in family units abroad by Irish landlords, and the emptying of British and Irish poorhouses into foreign cities. The change in rural Irish Catholic land ownership and emigration patterns, and the forced establishment of Irish communities abroad, enabled future chain migration and new networks within the growing Irish diaspora.\(^{97}\) Though Ireland’s close neighbours England and Scotland received large numbers of Irish people, it was the United States which received the highest proportions of Irish immigrants. Drawn by the financial opportunities and stories of success, relayed back to Ireland by friends and family members in the Irish communities which had emerged due to the Famine-induced mass exodus, the United States was home to 48 percent of Irish-born people living outside of Ireland by 1861, compared to the 3.5 percent to be


found in Australia. By 1870 this had risen respectively to 60.5 percent and 6.8 percent.  

Despite the large disparity in absolute numbers of Irish people arriving in the United States and Australia, Melbourne and Chicago attracted remarkably similar proportions of Irish immigrants until the 1880s (see figures 3 and 4). Irish emigration in the aftermath of the Famine was a ‘unique European emigration’ with Irish women emigrating in the same numbers as men. In the second half of the nineteenth century, 1,941,618 men and 1,789,133 women emigrated from Ireland, peaking in the 1890s when higher numbers of women left than men. Changes in land ownership patterns in Ireland led to a decrease in status for women, particularly those without dowries, and therefore a rise in single women. Faced with increased chances of dependence on older siblings or the convent, Irish women left to find jobs and, to a lesser extent, husbands, abroad. This near equity in numbers of Irish men and women in both Melbourne and Chicago enabled the creation of Irish communities abroad, where Irish men and women could marry each other and raise families while retaining their Irishness. The Superintendent of the US Federal Census in 1850 observed that these close Irish communities led many Irish parents to report their American-born children as ‘natives of Ireland’. He noted that

Foreigners associate so exclusively together, and are socially so generally separated from the natives for a long time, that their feelings of alienship are inseparably connected with their families, and their children as well as with themselves, and they do not always discriminate between locality of birth, parentage, blood, origin, even religion, and sometimes they merge all into one class, calling all Irish, &c., who are sons of Irish soil, because they have a common blood, origin, or religion.

---

98 Fitzpatrick, ‘Emigration, 1801-70’.
99 These figures are compiled from census data. In 1891, Government Statist Henry Hayter received permission to pulp all the individual household schedules to avoid handing personal information over to police officers searching for wanted criminals. Terence H. Hull, ‘The Strange History and Problematic Future of the Australian Census’, Journal of Population Research, 24:1 (2007), 1-22.
100 McCaffrey, ‘Irish-American Dimension’.
102 U.S. Census, 1850.
In Melbourne, Irish women outnumbered their male counterparts in the city and every suburb between 1857 and 1881. In an attempt to even out the single male influx that had accompanied the gold rushes, 21 percent of assisted migrants from the United Kingdom were Irish women compared to Irish men who accounted for nine percent between 1848 and 1856. This preference for women was reflected in every national group from the United Kingdom; the British and colonial legislatures’ attempt, according to Robin F. Haines, at ‘social engineering’. The employment opportunities for Irish English-speaking women in Melbourne and Chicago allowed women to remain single if they desired, and supported them when eligible men were not to be found. Domestic service and later teaching were principal occupations for Irish women in both cities, though as chapter four demonstrates, religious life also beckoned for some. Letters and money from abroad, particularly from older sisters, aunts, and cousins, further encouraged the mixed emigration of Irish sons and daughters.

Based on census returns from 1850/1, the Irish-born contingent of each city rose rapidly until the 1880/1 census. While the reasons for the downturn in migration to Melbourne and Chicago vary, and the death of earlier Irish-born settlers should be taken into account, there is a strong link to the economy. The Panic of 1873 was influenced by an international agricultural depression and affected Ireland badly in the short and long term, culminating in a period of hunger and rural unrest in Ireland between 1878-81. As the colony of Victoria was not negatively affected by the depression, the active downturn in the number of Irish-born residents was linked in part to the 1872 restructuring of the United Kingdom’s Colonial Land and Emigration Commission and its reduced role in state assisted migration. In Chicago, 1877 was the worst year of the economic collapse leading to wage reductions and job losses, important information transmitted to Ireland through newspapers, family letters, and religious anti-immigration societies.

103 Victorian Census, 1857, 1861, 1881 – no statistics could be found for 1871.
104 Haines, Labouring Poor, 32-33.
106 Harper & Constantine, Migration and Empire, 51-52.
107 Pacyga, Biography, 86; Fitzpatrick, ‘Emigration, 1871-1921’ in Vaughan (ed.), New History of Ireland, VI, 606-655.
The agricultural depression of 1878-81 had further consequences for the cause of Irish nationalism: the Land War and an upsurge in tenants’ rights agitation at the same time as increased popularity for the Irish Parliamentary Party and Charles Stewart Parnell. As Irish emigration to both America and Australia was dependant on chain migration, the depression of the 1870s impacted the ability of family and friends to pay for potential emigrants’ passage. The subsequent economic improvement of the 1880s signalled a recovery of, and increase in, the number of Irish-born in Chicago and Melbourne. For those destined for Chicago, this coincided with the growing importance of Chicago internationally and locally, including a rise in fortunes in Irish nationalist activities in the United States. This improvement of status and economic opportunity led to rising internal

---

migration into Chicago as well as international. The economic recovery of Ireland and Britain signalled increased migration into Melbourne, the decline in its own economy brought about by wild land speculation, maritime strikes and the shrinking of foreign investment, led to a reversal of its previous population and wealth boom.

Scholarship on the Irish in Australia and America has focused on geographical and occupational backgrounds as a motivating factor in differing journeys of adaption and interaction abroad. Oliver MacDonagh and David Fitzpatrick have argued that the preponderance of migrants, particularly farmers from the more prosperous areas of Kilkenny, Tipperary, east Limerick, east Clare and north Cork, along with the Ulster border counties, led to a less radical Irish diasporic community in Australia. America’s post-Famine migration was more mixed, leading to a greater number of poverty-stricken, Irish-speaking migrants from Connaught and Munster which had an opposite effect on the political outlooks of Irish migrants in the United States. While Melbourne received migrants from a range of backgrounds, overall Irish migrants to Melbourne left Ireland with a higher social status than those who migrated to Chicago.

Within Australia, Fitzpatrick has observed, Irish immigrants tended to be ‘economic outcasts whom “modernization” had left with cash but without a life-line’. After the Famine, the Irish tradition of splitting land between a family’s sons was overturned, younger sons lost their expected land inheritance and therefore often the chance to marry well. They were in clear contrast with the majority of Irish immigrants to the United States, those left without cash but little altered social status. However, recent research has uncovered a disproportionately large number of the immigrants to Illinois from the ‘northern half of Ireland (not Ulster alone)’ during the Famine. Even during the chaos of the Famine migrants from Antrim, Armagh, Derry, and Down tended to be more skilled than those

109 O’Brien, Blood Runs Green, 15.
112 Fitzpatrick, ‘Emigration in Nineteenth Century’.
from elsewhere in Ireland, with around 50 percent migrating as labourers opposed to the higher rate of 70 percent elsewhere in Ireland.\textsuperscript{113} While the poorer counties of Donegal, Roscommon and Cavan undermined this northern bias toward more skilled work, Tyler Anbinder and Hope McCaffrey’s research indicates a migration stream from Ireland to Illinois with increased financial capabilities and family connections. Understanding the social backgrounds of migrants was often more important than examining their county of origin, particularly in regard to exploring the social position that the middle classes adopted in Melbourne and Chicago where the formal county associations of New York were noticeably absent from parish life.\textsuperscript{114} Immigrants were often more readily accepted by their non-Irish and non-Catholic societal peers than by their Irish social betters.

The Irish-born population of Melbourne and Chicago varied in character but not in size relative to city totals. While it may seem irrelevant to compare an Irish-born community of 70,000 to one of 29,000 (as in 1890/1), the data reported in Figure 3 must be taken into account. Despite a diverging number of Irish-born people in each city after the 1870/1 censuses, one important element remains similar: the position of the Irish-born in portion to the larger population. Both figures decline as the cities expand and as later generations fell from the birth-specific census category of ‘Irish’; but as comparisons, these Irish-born communities remain on par. As figures 5 and 6 also demonstrate, based on the position of ‘Irish’ Catholic churches, Irish populations spread themselves through both cities instead of settling in Irish enclaves as in other cities. The Irish in Chicago and Melbourne lived side by side with their non-Irish peers, though they may have chosen to associate socially based upon ethnicity.\textsuperscript{115} The ‘Irish’ community as a whole cannot be quantified due to the lack of census material, but the 1890 census notes 149,795 white people living in Chicago with both parents born in Ireland, with an additional 33,547 with at least one Irish parent. Relying on these statistics, it is possible to estimate a wider Irish community, made up of

\textsuperscript{113} Tyler Anbinder & Hope McCaffrey, ‘Which Irish men and women immigrated to the United States during the Great Famine migration of 1846-54?’, \textit{Irish Historical Studies}, 39:156 (2015), 620-642.


\textsuperscript{115} MacDonagh, ‘A General View’. 
Irish-born and their American-born children, which accounted for 16.7 percent of Chicago’s population.\footnote{U.S. Census, 1890.} While the census records 70,000 Irish-born people living in Chicago in 1890, consideration of the Irish ‘community’ should take into account American-born children and adults who were raised by Irish parents and in Irish-staffed schools and churches. In Chicago, this would increase the ‘community’ size by 113,500. A similar extrapolation of the Irish community, additional to the Irish-born population, can be made in Melbourne. Of course not all Irish-born or second-generation Irish actively involved themselves with ‘Irish’ diasporic life, but these figures are useful when illustrating the numbers of people involved in moments of Irish public life, for example on St Patrick’s Day.

\begin{figure}
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{figure4.png}
\caption{Irish-born in Chicago \& Melbourne, 1850-1890.}
\end{figure}

The Catholic Church and the role of the Irish within each city’s hierarchy, religious orders, and laity are important considerations in the formation of Irish community life in Melbourne and Chicago. During the 1850s, 83 percent of the
Irish in Australia were Catholic, and 80 percent in America. These figures reflect a similar denominational make-up to Ireland at the time, 80.9 percent in 1834 before dropping to around 77 percent from 1861. Higher rates of Catholic allegiance within the diaspora was brought about by the mental and social impact of dislocation on nineteenth-century Irish migrants. By 1890, Chicago was the largest Catholic centre in the Midwest, second only to New York City in the whole of the United States. The Catholic Church in Chicago was one of a multitude of nationalities: Irish, German, Polish, and French to name a few.

The Catholic Church in Melbourne was a much more English-speaking affair, dominated by an Irish laity and clergy with a few English exceptions. It was only in 1871 that a non-Anglo-Irish group were mentioned when 332 Greek Byzantine Catholics were recorded, decreasing to 103 the next census year, and then climbing to 247 in 1891. Across Victoria, Protestants outnumbered Catholics roughly three to one in all census years. Protestants were also noticeable in the lists of notable Irish in Victoria. The migration of Trinity College Dublin-educated men and extended families sending out all their second and third sons to the colony, meant that among the key figures of Melbourne, and Melbourne Irish society, both Protestant and Catholic Irish people were represented. Power was wielded by Irish Catholics in both cities. All three of Melbourne’s Catholic Archbishops from 1848 to 1963 were Irish-born, as were four of Chicago’s five Catholic (Arch-)Bishops between 1844 and 1902. This Irish prominence was reflected through the clergy and religious orders of both cities. Members of the Irish Catholic laity also frequently rose to the status of Mayor, politician, magistrate, and merchant. As later chapters will demonstrate, the priorities of Irish Catholicism would be promoted at every level of Melbourne and Chicago society from an early stage.

118 Akenson, Irish Diaspora, 29.
119 See chapters three and four for further exploration of the role of the Catholic Church in community life in Melbourne and Chicago.
120 Victorian Census, 1881, 1891. The Greek Catholic Church has been considered as separate from the Roman Catholic Church since the eighteenth century. Greek Catholics are not considered alongside Roman Catholics in this thesis.
Conclusion

Melbourne and Chicago had similar beginnings in terms of economic and population boom, as well as a philosophical outlook based on individual endeavour and the uniqueness of their city. These cities, which adhere to Barth’s concept of an ‘instant city’, were in competition for respect and acceptance from their older counterparts and their populations walked a tightrope of industry and civility. These new urban contexts allow for the exploration of the different influences on identity formation within diasporic Irish communities. The Irish had been part of the original European settlement of each locale, and elements of the Irish-born communities of Melbourne and Chicago established themselves throughout society taking with them different understandings of what it meant to be Irish, or American or Australian, and where religion fitted into that identity. At times Irish Catholic communities were considered threats to the progress of the city and were threatened with restrictions and nativism. For the majority of the later nineteenth century however Irish Catholics and Protestants were accepted elements of white society. As this chapter has demonstrated these cities had very similar histories, particularly with regard to the heritage of their Irish populations. The comparison conducted within this thesis therefore provides a unique examination of the tools used by Irish immigrants to create a world for themselves abroad, enabling the shaping of a diasporic Irish identity and engagement with Ireland through remittances and political example and pressure.

Other networks existed in each city which consolidated ethnic links and associations. These included occupational networks which took advantage of, and encouraged the dominance of Irishmen and women in certain occupations and fields: manual labour, domestic service, and at the more powerful end of the spectrum, politics and the police and fire services of both Melbourne and Chicago. This gave the Irish middle classes a power base which could be extended across society and politics, still enduring a century later, and would have been much more difficult to achieve had the Irish not been present in the cities as early as they were. In the aftermath of the Famine poor rural workers migrated to the rapidly transforming and infrastructure-lacking urban worlds of Chicago and Melbourne as labourers. They housed transient communities who moved around
the city and surrounding areas in search of work. Both cities were also affected by the international unionisation of workers and subsequent general strikes during the 1870s and 1880s. All these elements influenced the reception of different waves of immigrants in the cities, as well as where the Irish placed in the hierarchy of acceptance. Occupational and political links enhanced the connections made during social events and on Sunday mornings, and often enabled the introduction of new members to organised ethnic fraternalism. The next chapter explores the secular life of Irish men and women in Melbourne and Chicago. Though the religious and secular lives of Irish communities were often indivisible, chapter two analyses the ways that connections were made with other Irish people through common ethnic heritage as opposed to religion which shall be the focus of chapter four. Secular ethnic fraternity was vital in forming an accessible ‘Irish’ identity abroad, shaping the image of Ireland which would be promoted by the influential middle classes and be reflected or reacted to in other areas of society.
Figure 5: Sands & McDougall's Melbourne Directory Map, 1869.

Catholic Church >1869

Catholic Church, est. post-1869.

Irish Institution (St Patrick’s Hall).

Catholic Institution.

Religious Order.
Figure 6: Warner & Beers Publishers' Map of Chicago, 1875.

Irish Catholic Church >1887  
Catholic Institution.

Non-Irish Catholic Church  
Religious Order.
Chapter Two: Creating Cultural Affinity through Secular Ethnic Societies.

Edmund Dwyer wrote with delight to his father in County Limerick to tell him that John O’Shanassy had written to him from Melbourne. O’Shanassy had thanked Dwyer for ‘all the warm expressions I wrote about him, and fears that he does not deserve so much praise’. He continued that while ‘Australia is on the whole a good country for an honest hardworking man, or a man of capital…He does not like to recommend me to leave Chicago’, fearing that Dwyer would not be able to procure permanent work as a labourer in Melbourne.¹ Dwyer had been encouraged by his siblings, who lived throughout Illinois and Massachusetts, to write to O’Shanassy. They had read in the newspapers sent by their father from Ireland to the United States, that O’Shanassy’s two sons had arrived in Ireland for their education. Pleased that O’Shanassy was demonstrating his belief in the Irish education system, Dwyer asked his father to inform him which college the O’Shanassy boys were to attend.² O’Shanassy, a Tipperary native and presumably a relative of Edmund through his mother Margaret Dwyer, became Premier of Victoria in March 1857, an honour ‘to the country of his birth and that of his adoption, it is [a] great pleasure to have one eminent man belong to our family’.³ Letters, newspaper reports, and family networks enabled Edmund Dwyer, a labourer in Chicago, to communicate with the Premier of Victoria, and to relay this information back to his father in Limerick. Dwyer’s letters also demonstrate the domestic networks within which this information was circulated. Friends in Chicago complemented the information Dwyer received from his family in Ireland and the United States with information that they had received from theirs.

Irish people in Melbourne and Chicago were separated by generation, gender, religion, and class. They may have self-identified based upon Irish county or city parish in close quarters, but abroad there were common values and traditions which bonded Irish immigrants to each other and to an ethnic identity. This

² Idem, 23 September 1860.
³ Idem, 5 July 1857; S. M. Ingham, ‘O’Shanassy, Sir John (1818-1883), ADB.'
cultural affinity was encouraged by the establishment of social clubs and ethnic newspapers. As William Jenkins has noted, print culture, routine interactions, and planned events worked together to mould ‘[i]magnative and symbolic readings of Irishness’ which were subsequently presented to wider society during St Patrick’s Day events and other cultural meeting points.\(^4\) Social clubs brought Irish people and their foreign-born children together with each other, furthering the regular interaction ensured by church and school attendance. Later in the century, meetings for club committees united people with common interests but based in different areas as well as people typically separated by class and gender. Examining the secular parish allows for the interrogation of Irish and Catholic identities as synonymous, acknowledging the intersectionality of Irish identity in Melbourne and Chicago.

Irish leaders used ethnic societies as vehicles for the promotion of a particular interpretation of Irish culture and history. This chapter utilises the idea of civil society as existing ‘between the prescription imposed by the state and the prescription imposed by the ritual and custom of tightly organized kin and quasi kin networks.’\(^5\) In cities defined by their opposing imperial and republican contexts, the restrictions and opportunities provided by the state and by non-Irish elites are critical to understanding the emergence of Irish associational culture. The presence of Irish people in positions of power from white settlement in each city present an important similarity in examining the pursuit of cultural affinity through clubs and sports. Tanja Bueltmann argues that ethnic associationalism was ‘intrinsically linked’ to ethnic identity, and was a vital vehicle for those in society interested in maintaining their ethnic identity. Bueltmann focuses on the middle classes and how ethnic associationalism allowed members to connect with people outside of their ethnic affinity but inside their class.\(^6\) This use of ethnic identity to connect with others in society, instead of purely using it to map out

---

\(^4\) Jenkins, *Raid and Rebellion*, 12.


borders, is seen in middle-class events such as the St Patrick’s Day society dinners explored in chapter six.

Social organisations were established to achieve certain goals: professional improvement, financial security in cases of joblessness or death, entertainment or exercise. They helped immigrants mitigate or overcome the loneliness which accompanied geographical dislocation. While most of these social meetings took place within a community hall, dining room, or saloon, this chapter also considers the ethnic bonding which occurred on the playing field or theatre stage. Both cities maintained young populations throughout the latter half of the nineteenth century, the involvement of men aged 25 to 70 in certain societies allude to the varied and evolving interests and needs of prospective members. Some of these societies managed to adapt to the changing needs of Melbourne and Chicago’s populations over 50 years, demonstrating to their members the material benefits of engaging with ‘imaginings’ of identity.  

This chapter explores the ethnic networks that were established and fostered within Melbourne and Chicago, and the transnational connections which supported a sense of ethnic affinity within Irish communities abroad. Belchem’s concept of ‘culture brokers’ is central to understanding the influence of middle-class Irish migrants over the less fortunate in superimposing ‘a wider ‘invented’ affiliation’ to ethnic Irishness. This research focuses on the secular institutions which, though they often overlapped with religious organisations and networks, allowed Irish people of mixed religious beliefs to associate and celebrate their Irish identity. It examines the men and women who established ‘Irish’ societies in Melbourne and Chicago, the connections between them, and how they used their position in each city to link Irish immigrants and their descendants to each other and to certain values.

---

8 Belchem, ‘Liverpool-Irish’.
9 Religious parish life is the focus of chapter four.
Early Years.

Melbourne

Melbourne during the 1840s was defined by secular community building activities, but it was not exempt from religious tensions. Historians have previously focused on the religious harmony of the growing town, however by 1846 the imperial government had ratified the passage of the Party Processions Act throughout Victoria. This Act would force Melbourne’s migrant communities to adapt to the restrictions of not gathering outside in groups for the celebration of ethnic identity, impacting how the secular parish life emerged within Melbourne. The St Patrick’s Society of Australia Felix was established in July 1842 and, reflecting the mixed denominational make-up of the Irish in Melbourne, involved a committee of nine Episcopalians, five Presbyterians, and five Roman Catholics. The St Patrick’s Society was to be non-sectarian and dedicated to encouraging Irish national feeling, ‘the relief of the destitute, the promotion of education, and generally, whatever may be considered by its members best calculated to promote the happiness, the honor, and prosperity of their native and adopted land’. The dual loyalties, to Ireland and to Victoria, would be the focus of the St Patrick’s Society for the next 50 years. T. H. Osborne, newspaper editor and former Presbyterian minister, declared in its establishing meeting that for Irish people

It is not the inanimate soil however fertile, it is not the glassy lake however attractive, nor is it the stupendous or rugged mountain however picturesque, which, intrinsically considered, secures our affections, but we love the green hills and lovely vallies [sic] because they are associated in our thoughts with the remembrance of those who in days gone by were near and dear to our hearts. Tis for this reason that the man who is indifferent to his country can never be a kind husband, an affectionate father, a good citizen or a loyal subject.

10 O’Kane, *A Path is Set*, 4-5.
12 *Port Phillip Gazette*, 2 July 1842.
13 *Melbourne Times*, 2 July 1842.
The original committee consisted of doctors, merchants, councilmen, and clerks: the town’s professional elite, named the ‘Middle-crust’ by chronicler and St Patrick’s Society member Edmund Finn.\(^\text{14}\) Though part of the town’s emerging elites, these were also young men and the committee of 1843 brought with it a swift change in members and priorities. The new leadership of Catholic Vicar-General Fr. Patrick Geoghegan and grocer-draper John O’Shanassy coincided with the establishment of an Orange Lodge in the city under the leadership of original St Patrick’s Society committee member and town clerk, John C. King.\(^\text{15}\) Geoghegan’s dual position in the St Patrick’s Society and as the highest ranking Catholic priest in the Port Phillip area, and the Society’s donation of £1,000 towards the erection of St Patrick’s Church in the city encouraged greater tensions between the societies.\(^\text{16}\) These tensions found an outlet on 12 July over the following three years.

The planned 12th July parades in Melbourne, and the reaction of the St Patrick’s Society, brought Irish migrants and sport together. The 25-year-old John O’Shanassy organised the first formal hurling match in the town in 1843, ostensibly for the enjoyment of the town’s young Irish men and women. The timing of the planned match, to be held on Batman’s Hill on 12 July, was deemed suspicious, or to be threatening violence and led to the cancelling of the Orange march. Similar hurling matches were arranged on 12 July in 1844, 1845, and 1846, angering the town’s Protestant newspapers. The *Courier* noted in 1845 that it was the ‘Ribbon-boys of the South and West of Ireland’ who sought out a ‘row’ with the Orange Order each year, when ‘a ragamuffin crew, which would have put even the County Tipperary to the blush’ gathered.\(^\text{17}\) The *Port Phillip Patriot* decried an advertisement ‘calling the Ribbon party to meet on Batman’s Hill today, ostensibly for the purpose of playing a hurling or shinty match, but virtually to form a riotous combination to assail with bludgeons, and if possible put down,\n
\(^{14}\) Finn, *Early Melbourne*, 643.

\(^{15}\) Edmund Finn noted that King was ‘so enamoured of Erin-go-Bragh, and so careful that neither north nor south should have reason to complain, that he determined to be impartial in the distribution of his favours, and so having assisted in figuratively planting the Shamrock in 1842, by helping to initiate a St. Patrick Society, in the next year he good-naturedly lent a hand to the culture of Orange lilies, as one of the founders of an Institution for the propagation of certain principles’, *Early Melbourne*, 646.

\(^{16}\) *Melbourne Times*, 27 August 1842.

\(^{17}\) *Melbourne Courier*, 16 July 1845.
any procession which the Orange party might attempt’.\textsuperscript{18} When Scotsman Donald Campbell was attacked that year ‘two “Hulers”’ were blamed.\textsuperscript{19} During the 1840s, organised and city-wide publicised games of hurling were about territory and power, not cultural recreation as it would be in future years.

Instead of educating Melbourne’s Irish poor in reading, writing, and arithmetic, the St Patrick’s Society was accused of ‘training [people] to flourish a shillelagh, and to band together in mock hurling matches, to intimidate those whom they choose to denominate as their enemies.’\textsuperscript{20} The tensions between the St Patrick’s Society and the Orange Lodge culminated in 1846 with a riot which broke out and shots were fired from the Orange refuge of the Pastoral Hotel at the gathered Irish crowd. Timothy Lane, landlord of the Builders’ Arms and St Patrick’s Society Treasurer, was noted as pulling an injured Orangeman from the clutches of ‘ruthless savages’, while O’ Shanassy, the Society’s president, was brought to court as a witness and a defendant of an assault charge.\textsuperscript{21} The Party Processions Act (1846) ensured that such riots would not hamper Melbourne society in the future.\textsuperscript{22} The St Patrick’s Society became an easily recognisable contrast to the town’s Orange Order and the focus of anti-Irish and anti-Catholic sentiment. However, its membership adapted to their altered circumstances, and the influx of Irish immigrants from Ireland changed both the St Patrick’s Society and the Orange Order in the next decades.

In the aftermath of the Party Processions Act, the professional and non-sectarian nature of the St Patrick’s Society membership rolls was emphasised. Geoghegan resigned his position as Chairman and religious harmony became the focus of speeches. The separation of Victoria from New South Wales brought new requirements of the city; most importantly the venue for the new Victorian Legislative Council. In the absence of any other large hall in the city, politicians turned to the St Patrick’s Society committee to request the use of St Patrick’s Hall. The Hall had replaced Timothy Lane’s pub as the Society’s home since it

\textsuperscript{18} Port Phillip Patriot and Melbourne Advertiser, 12 July 1845.
\textsuperscript{19} Melbourne Courier, 16 July 1845.
\textsuperscript{20} Argus, 22 December 1846.
\textsuperscript{21} Argus, 24 July 1846; Port Phillip Patriot and Melbourne Advertiser, 16 July 1846.
\textsuperscript{22} See 238-239.
opened in July 1849, two years after the foundation stone had been laid.²³ Timothy Lane was enacting a movement echoed by Irish publicans around the world, rising into the middle class while playing a crucial role in connecting ethnic leaders to the wider migrant community.²⁴ The financial resources of the Irish community in 1840s Melbourne can be inferred from the quick establishment and erection of the city’s largest hall. The rent of the hall improved the finances of the Society allowing it to observe its educational motto. The society opened a school in January 1850, and held lecture series and debating society meetings throughout the 1850s while also building a library of 450 books which circulated while the hall was host to the colony’s government.²⁵ On 8 October 1857, the St Patrick’s Society reopened their hall, the Legislative Council having their own Parliament building, with a public dinner comprising of:

several distinguished public men, not only Irish, but English, Scottish, and American. In fact, although the society mainly consists of gentlemen of Irish birth, it includes many members of other countries; and the entertainment may thus, to a considerable extent, be considered as a display of Australian Nationality.²⁶

Considering the Age usually joined the Argus in their anti-Irish sentiment, this consideration of Irish and Australian nationality as linked is important in judging the position of the St Patrick’s Society in the esteem of Melbourne society by the late 1850s. A toast to the clergy of all denominations helped to re-emphasise the civil role of the St Patrick’s Society in 1857 in bringing together the politicians and professionals of its committee with the leading men of other ‘kindred societies’ throughout Melbourne. A year previous, the Society’s annual report noted that while its members ‘revert with enthusiasm to many of her [Ireland] traditional glories, and dwell with sorrow upon her dark and undeserved tribulations, we still feel that we are in another hemisphere – that our new country has even more paramount claims upon us’.²⁷ The St Patrick’s Society was the

²⁴ Belchem, ‘Liverpool-Irish’.
²⁵ Finn, *Early Melbourne*, 654; Age, 7 July 1856, 8 April 1857, 28 November 1857.
²⁶ Age, 8 October 1857.
²⁷ Argus, 2 April 1856.
primary Irish ethnic organisation in Melbourne until the 1860s, and the foremost outlet for the middle classes of Irish birth or descent.

Women were involved on the peripheries of the Society, mentioned in reports of annual balls and banquets, and in bazaars fundraising for the improvement of Melbourne and Irish society. In 1856, the St Patrick’s Society bazaar stall, featuring a white satin cushion embroidered with a ‘harp, in gold, and surrounded with a shamrock wreath’ was presided over by Mrs J. Grant and Miss Farmer. Outside of these interactions, Melbourne’s female-led charities tended to be secular in name but Protestant in ethos, proving problematic for the Irish Catholics in Melbourne’s middle classes. The Melbourne Ladies’ Benevolent Society and similar middle-class charitable associations which received the goodwill of the wives and daughters of city elites would be overshadowed in the lives of Irish Catholic women by religious charitable work, though they did overlap at times. Women were also the focus of the St Patrick’s Society activities relating to the benefit of immigrants. In 1859, the St Patrick’s Society formed a committee of gentlemen from each district throughout Victoria to supply weekly or fortnightly news of the local labour market which would be then published in a standing advertisement in the press. This information could then be accessed by newly arrived immigrants in Melbourne, helping to avoid ‘Strong, healthy young men strolling listlessly through the streets, - fair and innocent-looking young girls sitting in the labor marts…these are the materials which supply the gaol and brothel in Victoria.’ The committee also planned to establish a newspaper to disseminate the information throughout Victoria and Ireland. This was quickly postponed due to worries about party politics. The St Patrick’s Society, which in 1858 numbered 135 members, provided societal influence through the doctors, politicians, and lawyers on its membership rolls. Through its immigrant information schemes and medical provision provided the services of a benefit society the St Patrick’s Society sought to improve the

---

28 Argus, 14 November 1856.
29 B. J. Gleeson, ‘A Public Space for Women: The Case of Charity in Colonial Melbourne’, Area, 27:3 (1995), 193-207. The Catholic charitable organisations which became a focus for Irish Catholic middle-class women in Melbourne will be the focus of chapter four.
30 The Star, 26 August 1859.
31 Argus, 5 October 1859; Age, 12 October 1859.
32 Age, 7 April 1858.
position of Irish people in Melbourne and in Ireland. It demanded a place for the Irish, both Catholic and Protestants, within Melbourne arguing that their combined demonstration of loyalty to the British Empire and retention of Irish heritage made them better citizens.

Chicago

Similarly, the first Irish ethnic organisations in Chicago were city-wide, and more concerned with demonstrating loyalty to the United States, and the place of the Irish within it, than with celebrating continued links to Ireland. Beginning in 1842, militia units were established throughout the city, playing a role in civil society as well as reflecting Chicago’s settler status and perceived need for defence. The Montgomery Guards were the first Irish militia formed, named after Richard Montgomery an Irish-born soldier and later Major General of the Continental Army during the American War of Independence. The Montgomery Guards were joined by the Shields Guards, named after County Tyrone-born Illinois Representative and soldier James Shields, and the (Robert or Thomas Addis) Emmet Guards. The naming of these militia units dually demonstrated the long heritage of the Irish within America and their continued position within Chicago society. Though militia units were ethnic organisations later used widely in St Patrick’s Day parades and other events of national significance to the Irish in America, they were established primarily to demonstrate loyalty to their adopted home. While Chicago, in its frontier-like state, may have had more perceived need for a volunteer defence corps, the use of volunteer units to demonstrate a capacity to bear arms and as a step to full citizenship was reflected by immigrant and working-class men in the United Kingdom during the mid-century. In both the United Kingdom and the United States, working- and middle-class men used involvement in militias to improve their social standing and respectability. Members and officers of these militias were better-off financially, and socially superior to other Irish immigrants who did not participate in similar endeavours. This was in large part due to the social acceptance gained by involvement in

militias, from both native-born Americans and their compatriots.\textsuperscript{34} However, these militias were dependent on the economic well-being of their men. By 1860 the Emmet and Montgomery Guards had both ‘succumbed to the pressure of hard times, and was now practically among the things of the past’. When the American Civil War broke out, only the Shields Guards, a company composed mostly of mechanics, were regularly drilling ‘with Irish energy’.\textsuperscript{35} The others had to be revitalised. Belonging to a militia brought status and structure, however membership of a militia unit required time to drill and financial resources to buy and maintain a uniform. Not everyone had these resources, and the desire to give them up.

The most prevalent forms of non-militarised Irish associational culture in Chicago life during the city’s early years were self-improvement and benefit societies. The Hibernian Benevolent Society was established in 1852 and chartered three years later.\textsuperscript{36} It followed the Chicago Repeal Association of the 1840s which supported Daniel O’Connell’s campaign to repeal the Act of Union. Both societies had received mixed denominational support in the city uniting for political and charitable causes in Ireland and the United States.\textsuperscript{37} In 1855, the Hibernians had a membership of ‘several hundred’.\textsuperscript{38} They were joined in 1860 by the United Sons of Erin Benevolent Society.\textsuperscript{39} Each society had a mixture of occupations on their executive committees, primarily labourers, foremen, clerks, and merchants, and these men remained with the societies over multiple decades.\textsuperscript{40} Their committee memberships also overlapped with ethnic organisations involved with Irish nationalism within the city. Benefit societies fostered middle-class values of respectability and economic self-sufficiency, and the overlapping membership with nationalist activities hint at an organising committee dually concerned with improving the position of the Irish in Ireland and in Chicago, raising issues of self-respect and ownership of city space.\textsuperscript{41} Benevolent societies helped migrants

\textsuperscript{34} Cowan, ‘Immigrants, Nativists’, 93-94, 102.
\textsuperscript{35} Andreas, History of Chicago, v2,161.
\textsuperscript{36} Chicago Directory, 1855.
\textsuperscript{37} Chicago Directory, 1844.
\textsuperscript{38} Chicago Daily Times, 19 March 1855.
\textsuperscript{39} Chicago Directory, 1861.
\textsuperscript{40} Chicago Directory, 1861, 1866, 1868, 1869, supplemented with information from the U.S. Census, 1860 and 1870.
\textsuperscript{41} Kelly, Shamrock and the Lily, 146.
to find jobs, aided families monetarily in cases of death or sickness, and provided a venue for social events. They linked those in the middle class, or who aspired to be, with those that they were helping to help themselves.

The Civil War created new opportunities for ethnic pride, while also proving loyalty to the United States. Irish volunteer units were quickly raised, mirroring those in New York and other eastern cities. New York’s Irish Brigade was assembled by Young Irelander hero Thomas Meagher. Without the heroes of Irish nationalism, Chicago turned to its ethnic organiser, James Mulligan.\(^{42}\) Mulligan, a prominent lawyer of Irish parentage, led the 23rd Illinois Brigade, popularly known as the Irish Brigade. Mulligan used the cause of Irish freedom to recruit men from Chicago.\(^{43}\) A newspaper advertisement in April 1861 called on the Irish of Chicago, ‘For honor of the Old Land, rally. Rally for the defence of the new’.\(^{44}\) Alongside this advertisement was a similar one from Scandinavians equally as keen to demonstrate their loyalty to their new home. By the end of one of Mulligan’s rallies at the North Market Hall he had secured 325 recruits, and within four days the number was nearly 600.\(^{45}\) Despite a promising start, the War Department rejected their offer of service. Confronted with cries of discrimination on racial and political lines, Mulligan went directly to Washington D.C. and secured the government’s acceptance. Irish parish priests, politicians and packinghouse workers in Chicago took pride in the Brigade and Mulligan received scores of letters from hopeful-soldiers and priests suggesting future recruits.\(^{46}\) A second Irish-Catholic regiment, the 90th Regiment or ‘Irish Legion’,

\(^{42}\) See chapter five, 197-9.  
\(^{43}\) Kelleher, ‘Class and Catholic’.  
\(^{44}\) The call to arms was signed by Mulligan, Captains M. Gleason, C. Moore, J. C. Phillips, F. McMurray and Peter Casey, Alderman J. Comisky, Alderman M. C. McDonald, Daniel McIlroy, Daniel Quirk, John Tully, Philip Conley, T. J. Kinsella ‘and three hundred others’. ‘The Flag of our Union Forever’, Chicago Tribune, 20 April 1861. Comisky was the President of the United Sons of Erin; Kinsella was also involved in the Hibernians and the St Vincent de Paul Society (ACA, St Vincent de Paul Society Administrative Records, ADMIN/M3300/964); Chicago Tribune, 18 March 1862.  
\(^{46}\) Edward C. Russell of Knox County, Illinois assured Mulligan that he could provide good references if he could join the Irish Brigade, 28 January 1862; Capt. J. C. Fitzgibbon asked that his entire company be transferred out of the 14th Michigan Infantry as ‘they are partially American and bigoted Protestant. In Almighty God’s name, if you can possibly do it, get us transferred to you, where we can be with and amongst our own race and people’, 10 February 1862 (CHMRL, Mulligan Papers, Box 1).
was formed by Fr. Dennis Dunne of St Patrick’s parish in 1861 and 1862.\textsuperscript{47} Mulligan encouraged the link between religion and ethnicity, arranging for a Catholic chaplain to comfort his men and Sisters of Mercy nuns, mainly from Ireland, to nurse them. Though the Irish Brigade and Irish Legion had Catholic links, Mulligan recruited based upon Irish ethnicity not religion.

By the end of the Civil War, Chicago was home to the St Patrick’s Society and the Fenian Brotherhood.\textsuperscript{48} The committee of the city’s benevolent societies overlapped with the Fenian Brotherhood’s Centers, primarily clerk L. H. O’Connor who was both corresponding secretary of the United Sons of Erin and the District Center of the Fenian Brotherhood.\textsuperscript{49} O’Connor was in a position to act as a conduit between those involved in the Catholic Church-endorsed United Sons of Erin and the Church-condemned Fenian Brotherhood, crossing distinctions in ambition for Irish charity and politics while retaining his status within civil and ethnic life. Chicago’s secular parish in its early history was defined by military training, through ethnic militias and nationalist organisations. These associations united during the Civil War when militia leaders and Irish nationalists joined with people who had never participated in ethnic associational culture to form Irish Brigades. These connections were re-established in Chicago in the aftermath of the war. To the Melbourne St Patrick’s Society, Fenianism was an explicitly American institution and had no place in Australia, and in the absence of a disruptive war, the St Patrick’s Society provided a consistent message of Irish identity in the city. Ethnic associations in both cities sought to supplement the work of religious charities to support newly arrived immigrants from Ireland, establishing benevolent societies and providing information about job opportunities. This work had the dual effect of helping Irish people to support themselves and improving the reputation of the Irish within Melbourne and Chicago. Members of secular ethnic associations sought to place themselves as loyal Americans and Australians, seeing their Irish identity as aiding their loyalty to their new homes.

\textsuperscript{48} Chicago Directory, 1863 & 1866; chapter five, 194-19897.
\textsuperscript{49} Chicago Directory, 1861; \textit{Daily Inter Ocean}, 3 January 1866; \textit{Daily Inter Ocean}, 5 May 1866.
Middle Years

As the 1860s continued, the growing Irish middle classes and ethnic elites in Melbourne and Chicago sought to continue improving the position of the Irish across society. While established societies such as the St Patrick’s Society and the Hibernian Benevolent Society continued to cater socially to city and professional elites and charitably to those less fortunate, ethnic fraternalism expanded to involve friendly societies, sports clubs, and building societies. The community leaders who often established and organised these activities were connected through private networks, influencing and reinforcing their priorities, ethnic, social and political. The public alliance of these disparate societies in parades and picnics, as well as the reporting of society minutes and meetings in the mainstream and ethnic press, helped to create the image of a unified Irish community abroad. However, as David Fitzpatrick notes, communities are the product of open and optional networks: not all Irish immigrants sought out this ethnic community. 50 Alan O’Day argues that while a small section did, ‘somewhat more sought to be part of an ethnic association, but for most an ethnic network or even more often an ethnic category sufficed’. 51 Irish people abroad joined many clubs, but it will be the ethnic fraternities that were publicly associated with and promoted Irish identity that are studied here.

Melbourne

The late 1860s heralded a rise in formal ethnicity-based societies instead of purely informal networks. The education debates taking place in the Victorian Parliament and wider society regarding the place of religion in schooling led to heightened tensions between different elements of Melbourne society. 52 After almost two decades of relative peace between the communities, the 1867/8 state visit of Prince Alfred to Australia led to a surge in Orange Order activity in Victoria. In

50 Fitzpatrick, ‘Irish in Britain’.
52 See chapter three.
Melbourne a ‘large transparency, representing William III, crossing the Boyne, with a figure of Britannia on one side, and the motto “This we will maintain” on the other’ was hung outside the Protestant Hall.53 Local authorities entreated the Orangemen to remove the banner, but when they failed a large crowd of ‘Ribbonmen’ gathered in front of the building singing ‘The wearing of the green’ and threw stones at the banner. In response, shots were fired from the hall, injuring a number of youths who had joined in the singing ‘evidently out of fun, and with the intention of making a noise, rather than taking part in a political demonstration’.54 A nine-year old boy died from his wounds. John Milner and Oswald W. Brierly who accompanied the prince on his travels, commented that ‘Nothing can excuse the Orangemen for having…exhibited a party device, which they knew would provoke retaliation’.55 The St Patrick’s Society maintained their non-sectarian stance, but used their prominent position in Melbourne society and its press to present a clear opposition to the actions of the Orange Order and their supporters. Rural Victoria was the usual home of sectarian clashes between Orangemen and Irish Catholics, however, the increased tensions brought about by legislative debates and a prominent guest led to the overflow into Melbourne. As in 1846, the St Patrick’s Society became a mouthpiece and focus for the Irish opponents of the Orange Order in the city.

The St Patrick’s Society and their committee speeches provided a voice to the Irish in Melbourne. It did not encompass the multitude of religious, gender, and class divides within the city’s Irish communities, but the Society and its Hall acted as a unifying point for Irish people and descendants within the city. The newly established Irish Catholic newspaper, the Advocate, supplemented this image of an active engagement with Irish civil life in Melbourne, linking members of societies within Victoria with each other and with those in Ireland. The St Patrick’s Society and Advocate also sought to connect Irish people settled in Melbourne with those newly arrived in the city for mutual benefit. While certain social and occupational groups, particularly Trinity College Dublin-educated

54 Australasian, 30 November 1867; Illustrated Australian News for Home Readers, 20 December 1867.
lawyers and doctors, had international support systems enabling patronage and employment, most Irish immigrants had to rely on other systems. The St Patrick’s Hall provided a venue within which shared cultural experiences, memories and interests, could be used as a foundation for judgements on character and trust.\textsuperscript{56} Building upon the opportunities presented by the hall, the Advocate’s readers suggested ways of helping newly arrived immigrants which ‘will not be limited to singing and comic enjoyment, but that they will be framed for permanent, useful, practical work, and be self-supporting as well’.\textsuperscript{57} The St Patrick’s Society had been one of the city’s founding societies, and maintained a membership roll filled with wealthy and well-placed potential employers. ‘An Old Colonist’ observed that a registry office could be opened in St Patrick’s Hall, a centrally located and well known institution, to connect newly arrived Irish immigrants with members of the St Patrick’s Society thereby creating a catalogue of references based upon the international knowledge of family, parish, and county gleaned from different waves of immigrants, family letters, and newspapers. This, it was expected, would allow respected and respectable members of Melbourne society to help their new countrymen while bringing together members from different parts of society in a common shared experience.\textsuperscript{58}

The St Patrick’s Society’s registry office opened on 5 July 1869 at the St Patrick’s Hall. Servants, men and women, were induced to use the office in order to avoid ‘being entrapped into disrespectful situations’ and potential employers to protect themselves from ‘being imposed upon by unsuitable servants’.\textsuperscript{59} The St Patrick’s Society also pledged to send information back to Ireland regarding the state of the labour market in Victoria, to act as agents for Irish people in Victoria who wish to ‘bring out friends from home’, and to make enquiries concerning missing friends.\textsuperscript{60} This was the plan at the beginning of the decade and now the St Patrick’s Society put it into action utilising their greater resources and the international links encouraged by the nationalist and humanitarian fundraising of

\textsuperscript{56} Craig Bailey, ‘Metropole and Colony: Irish Networks and Patronage in the Eighteenth-Century Empire’ in Delaney & MacRaid (eds), \textit{Irish Migration}, 18-38.
\textsuperscript{57} Advocate, 14 November 1868.
\textsuperscript{58} Advocate, 28 November 1868.
\textsuperscript{59} Advocate, 19 June 1869.
\textsuperscript{60} Ibid.
the late 1860s which will be further explored in chapter five. While the Scottish in Melbourne had attempted a similar project, ‘they had had no permanent society such as St. Patrick’s’ and therefore failed.\textsuperscript{61} Having had an early and strong presence in the city, the Irish were able to benefit from an established society in a way that other ethnic groups could not. The \textit{Advocate} used examples of American nativism directed at the Irish to encourage Irish-Australians to work together to extend ‘their sphere of usefulness’ and invest ‘their purpose with somewhat of national dignity’.\textsuperscript{62} The St Patrick’s Society also provided its members with the benefits of benevolence societies, with members paying into a fund which could be accessed in times of sickness or death.\textsuperscript{63} Membership of the St Patrick’s Society, therefore, provided advantages for Irish members of society throughout the city and across different classes.

Members of the St Patrick’s Society also sought to benefit from the international trend for monetary return on savings through ethnic building societies. In 1869, the Irish-Australian Permanent Building and Investment Society was established by St Patrick’s committee members. Michael O’Grady was President, Michael Curtain was treasurer, Patrick Hanna and P. J. Martin were trustees, joined by Edward Loughlin Nolan and Michael O’Meara as stewards. These were networks made between middle-class peers, encouraged by frequent contact in social and business circles, and used to improve the lives of Irish people in Melbourne. The building society objectives were to encourage ‘prudent and economic habits of saving amongst its members’ and to provide its members with ‘means and facilities of investment of a mutually remunerative character’ to enable members to purchase or erect buildings and to acquire freehold properties.\textsuperscript{64} The \textit{Advocate} promoted the aims of the Irish-Australian building society warning that its competitor, the Victoria Permanent Building Society, though financially sound included Edward Cope, MLA, and John Branscombe Crews, MLA as officers. Cope had previously been involved in the Australasian Reform Association, who

\textsuperscript{61} \textit{Advocate}, 28 November 1868.
\textsuperscript{62} \textit{Advocate}, 24 July 1869.
\textsuperscript{63} The court case of Dr McCarthy was fired as the St Patrick’s Society chief medical officer in 1869 brought this aspect of provision into the public arena. \textit{Age}, 13 December 1869; \textit{Argus}, 24 December 1869.
\textsuperscript{64} \textit{Advocate}, 31 July 1869.
endeavoured to ‘band together our English and Scottish fellow-colonists, and to exclude every Catholic, or anyone who would support a Catholic from any public position in the country’. Crews, similarly, was the only MLA to attend the Orange festivities in the Protestant Hall the previous 12th July. Shares for the Irish-Australian building society were £50 each with a monthly subscription of 5s per share. This organisation provided a bridge between the elite entertaining of St Patrick’s Society events, its benefit society, and its registry office for potential servants and newly arrived immigrants.

Melbourne was increasingly industrialised during the nineteenth-century’s last decades meaning that workers did not have to scour the land in rural Victoria to earn money. Factories, particularly in the brewing and manufacturing industries, brought Irish people together and led to the expansion of sports teams based on work and ethnicity, coinciding with a rise in wages after the dip of the early decade. Thanks to the early success of the eight-hour day movement in Victoria across the artisan and building trades, there was increased opportunity to socialise, and for many that involved watching or playing sports. Those who were involved in the running of sports teams, in management, fundraising, playing, or in the audience, had their own reasons for volunteering or spending their hard-earned money, but an important reason was the connections created, ethnic or otherwise, by spending time with each other in a sporting environment. During the late 1860s, the people of Melbourne flocked to grounds playing rugby, cricket, athletics, or Victorian/Aussie Rules Football. Irish people joined sports clubs, even when the sport considered was not a traditional Irish one, such as cricket. Sport was used to link Irish people to their fellow immigrants in Australia and also to temporary inhabitants of the city. In June 1870, the Carlton Football Club played the visiting 18th Royal Irish Regiment at the Melbourne Cricket Ground. Carlton’s team list included J. Conway, J. Clarke, J. Donovan, W. Gorman, F. McCarthy, and O. O’Brien. As members of the British Empire, Irish people in Melbourne and Ireland embraced traditionally British sports, like cricket, and used

65 Advocate, 17 July 1869.
66 Rae, ‘Eight Hours’.
67 Paul Darby, Gaelic Games, Nationalism and the Irish Diaspora in the United States (Dublin: UCD Press, 2009), 53.
68 Australasian, 4 June 1870.
them to connect with each other, to an Irish identity, and to a wider imperial identity.

A variety of sports were used as a conduit for ethnic pride and collaboration. One letter to the editor of the *Advocate* from ‘Shamrock’ asked why there was not an Irish national cricket club established in Melbourne. ‘Shamrock’ was able to list at least eleven possible players who would ‘be well able to uphold the glory’ of the “green isle” against “all comers”, suggesting John O’Shanassy and Captain McMahon as possible sponsors.69 Cricket and rugby were popular games for Ireland’s middle classes and this was transferred into the wider Empire.70 As Paul Rouse has noted, sport in Ireland developed ‘as a shared culture across time and place’, influenced and enjoyed by both Gaelic tradition and Ireland’s place within the British Empire.71 The enthusiasm for an Irish cricket team with the support of prominent Irish Australian politicians, suggests a cross-generational and cross-class interest (perceived or real) in cricket when there was no public cry for Gaelic games. The editor of the *Australasian* responded that, ‘A match Irish versus English and Scotch has been talked about. The former can turn out a very strong eleven’.72 ‘Shamrock’ observed that these nationality-based games ‘would far surpass ordinary club matches. John, Sawney, and Pat would give and take any amount of chaff in good part on such as occasion’.73 These matches between descendants of different corners of the United Kingdom were promoted as an opportunity for spectators to show ethnic pride in a good humoured way, avoiding the political and violent tensions brought about by earlier demonstrations of ethnic society competition. The previous decade O’Shanassy had commented that ‘It was a novelty to him to witness a game of cricket…and he hoped that at some future

---


70 Alan Bairner, ‘Ireland, sport and empire’ in Jeffery (ed.), *An Irish Empire?*, 57-76.


72 *Australasian*, 2 November 1867. The players suggested were ‘Conway, Kelly, Horan, Turner, O’Brien, McGann, Figgins, O’Neal, Ryan, Cullen, and others whose names I cannot call to mind; these, with Ballarat Dan at their head’ suggesting a certain amount of public notoriety at this stage.

time, he would be able to show them on that ground the Irish national game of hurling.\(^74\) He would not have to wait for long.

The Gaelic games of hurling and football had suffered under the strict coercion laws which outlawed mass meetings in Ireland to the extent that one scholar has deemed the playing of hurling across most of Ireland as ‘well-nigh extinct’ by the 1870s.\(^75\) More recently, scholars have disputed this, arguing that although hurling had ‘retreated to the margins’ of Irish life, it was played throughout the country and in the diaspora. What it had not done was adopt a more modern form with codified rules and club tournaments.\(^76\) In its absence, athletics grew as a key pastime from the 1850s, particularly in Dublin where it was spearheaded by Trinity College Dublin (TCD), and later the Irish Champion Athletic Club established in 1871. This was reflected in Irish Melbourne celebrations, both on St Patrick’s Day and on St Stephen’s Day and the Queen’s Birthday picnics.\(^77\) The resurgence of hurling in a codified form if not as a sport, began with an increase in interest in the game in Dublin. In 1870 a set of rules entitled \textit{Laws of Hurling} was drawn up and publicised by the Dublin University Hurley Club.\(^78\) This was followed by a revised set in 1879 when the Irish Hurley Union was established.\(^79\) TCD graduates made up a large proportion of the professional population of Melbourne from its earliest times.\(^80\) These men were linked by training and family, sometimes referred to as the ‘Irish cousinage’, and though there were not enough of them to establish distinct clubs they remained linked through their recreational participation.\(^81\) Trinity graduates participated in Melbourne elite culture, Irish and civil, and many had the resources to travel back to Ireland in a way that others could not.

\(^{74}\) The match was played between Victoria and New South Wales. \textit{Age}, 6 February 1860.


\(^{76}\) Rouse, \textit{Sport and Ireland}, 93-98.

\(^{77}\) \textit{Advocate}, 28 December 1872; Art Ó Maolfáthail, ‘Hurling: An Old Game in a New World’ in Jarvie (ed.), \textit{Making of Celtic Cultures}, 149-165.

\(^{78}\) Ó Maolfáthail, ‘Hurling’.

\(^{79}\) T. West, \textit{The Bold Collegians: The Development of Sport in Trinity College, Dublin} (Dublin, 1991), 57

\(^{80}\) By 1891 TCD (48) ranked third, behind the University of Melbourne (243) and Cambridge (56), in the number of graduates living in Victoria. The Royal Ireland University produced 11 graduates and Queen’s University Ireland, 6. Victorian Census, 1891.

\(^{81}\) Ronayne, \textit{First Fleet}, 14.
For aspiring migrant lawyers, this travel was partly a journey of necessity. Victoria had strict rules about residence in the colony before a person could be called to the Victorian Bar, requiring years of residence without a trade or business. Being called to the Irish Bar helped to avoid this residency law, and many recent migrants bounced between Melbourne and Ireland until they were qualified to work in Victoria.\(^82\) The sporting trends in Trinity and their reflection in Melbourne can be attributed to the influence of TCD educated Irish-Australians who spearheaded the change, pre-empting the international Gaelic Revival in 1884. As well as providing a link to Ireland, hurling presented opportunities to visit other Victorian cities, helping to encourage a constant recalibration of what it meant to be Irish and Australian. In September 1877, Melbourne Hurling Club went to Geelong for the first formal inter-city match in twelve years. The arrival of the ‘metropolitan hurlers’ in Geelong signalled a ‘demonstration of the part of the Hibernians’. The visitors were met at the railway station by officers of the local club and escorted through the town by the band of the local St Patrick’s Society.\(^83\) Gaelic games worked alongside civil organisations like the St Patrick’s Society to publicise and promote Irish identity, and inter-city matches provided an opportunity for Irish people to come together, claim public space, stadiums, and newspaper columns, and join in activities promoting cultural nationalism.

*Chicago*

In Chicago, this ethnic claiming of public space and newspaper columns was aided irreversibly by the Civil War. Four years of fighting outside of Chicago had resulted in a wealthier and more productive city, and an increase in ethnic nepotism in politics and business. Nationally, it heralded a ‘Golden Age of Fraternity’ with up to 50 percent of Americans participating in fraternal lodges, service clubs, and leisure organisations of some kind in the aftermath of the Civil

\(^{82}\) A number of Irish lawyers, trained in Melbourne returned to Ireland when called to the Bar to gain professional experience. Politicians similarly made the journey back to the metropole, and can be seen attending dinners in London and Dublin during the second half of the nineteenth century. John Waugh, *First Principles: The Melbourne Law School, 1857-2007* (Melbourne: Melbourne University Publishers, 2007), 17-22.

\(^{83}\) *Geelong Advertiser*, 17 September 1877.
The Irish who joined these organisations were therefore joining a national trend, one which emphasised membership requirements and entry fees and were by their inherent nature self-segregating. Concurrently, Irish nationalist organisations led to an increase in ethnic fraternal visibility in Chicago. The Fenian Brotherhood placed considerable importance on the Civil War to train militarily for a future uprising in Ireland, and ethnic organisations, nationalist and civil were established for Irish veterans. For many, nationalist organisations were places to meet with other Irish-born and descended men to socialise, and build upon existing familial, friendship, and occupational networks. They were invariably located in different areas of the city with numerous branches, allowing for the continuation and complementing of parish life. In April 1868 the flooring gave way in Healy’s Hall, 543 Archer Avenue, during a Fenian meeting. Patrick Ryan was killed and at least nine others were injured. All the men injured lived in and around Archer Avenue in the Bridgeport area of Chicago working as labourers or in the more skilled occupations of teamsters, carpenters, and one soap manufacturer, a by-product of the local slaughter houses. The injuries included fractured and dislocated hips and legs, severe bodily contusions, and head injuries: injuries which would have reduced the incomes of an entire stretch of Archer Avenue families. Membership of benefit and fraternal societies provided monetary and medical support for those without extended familial networks.

While pursuing political aims, the Fenian Brotherhood also sought to provide alternative reforming and educational entertainments for their members. The Chicago-based Fenian newspaper, *Irish Republic*, argued that there were hundreds of Irishmen in America ‘who are thinking, and, in a great measure, educated men,

---

86 See 198-201.
87 *Irish Citizen*, 2 May 1868; *Daily Illinois State Register*, 24 April 1868 – in this report, 30 or 40 men were wounded.
88 Injured: Thomas Dennis (Archer Ave & May St. – labourer for Kretsinger Bros.); Nicholas Conlon (cor. Archer & Quinn St.); Michael Higgins (552 Archer Ave. – labourer); Charles Kavanagh (Bonfield St. (off Archer Ave.) – carpenter); Patrick Murphy (533 Archer Ave. – teamster); Richard Brown (550 Archer Ave. – soap manufacturer); Daniel Murphy (610 Archer Ave. – labourer); Timothy O’Callaghan (417 Archer Ave.); Mike Delaney (596 Archer Ave.) Information from *Irish Citizen* supplemented by the Chicago Directory, 1868 & 1869.
and who, but for the mental stimulus supplied by Fenianism, would be “mere clods”. The Fenian Dramatic Club was one product of this provision. The first drama put on by the men and women of the club was ‘Robert Emmet’. One review acknowledged the production’s distance from brilliance, ‘the fact that most of them had busily employed at their various occupations up to the very evening of the performance, their first appearance in public cannot be considered anything but a brilliant success, and another proof that our countrymen have capacities to achieve almost anything they earnestly strive for’. The educational opportunities provided for by the Fenian Dramatic Club could also be found in other societies in Chicago.

The Chicago Irish Literary Association was established in 1868. Its president John J. Fitzgibbon paid tribute to the founder of the Father Mathew Total Abstinence and Benevolent Association temperance society in his welcome speech, noting that the Literary Society was also ‘established for the welfare, culture, and literary advancement of its members’ and was strenuously non-religious. He declared that

It numbers among its members men of energy, of character, and a high order of talent – broad, liberal and tolerant in its principles, rising above sectarianism and partisanship of every kind, elevated in tone and spirit in its efforts to disseminate knowledge, it cannot fail to enlist the sympathies and meet with the hearty cooperation of the citizens of Chicago.

Fitzgibbon was the joint owner of the company Fitzgibbon & Scanlan as the partner of Mortimer Scanlan. The Scanlan brothers were prominent in both Irish nationalist and business circles, linking the secular literary society with Irish political nationalism through business links. By 1870, it was commented that the Literary Society included ‘the most ultra of the Chicago Irish element. Protestants, Presbyterians and Catholics mingle fraternally and advocate the independence of

---

89 *Irish Republic*, 20 July 1867.
90 *Irish American Weekly*, 12 June 1869.
91 Ibid.
92 See chapter five introduction – Mortimer was the brother of Michael, Edward, and John F. Scanlan. Charles Ffrench (ed.), *Biographical History of the American Irish in Chicago* (Chicago: American Biographical Publishing Co, 1897), 366; Chicago Directory, 1870.
Ireland’. This civil society aimed to ‘give ample scope for the mental discipline and intellectual improvement of the members’, helping to publicise the intellectual position and history of the Irish in Chicago and the world while contributing to political nationalist awareness and activities.

While the Literary Society connected Irish people of different religions to each other, other associations used Irish links to improve business. The Hibernian Savings Bank was established in 1867, while proudly bearing the seal of an eagle, harp, and Irish greyhound surrounded by shamrocks, there were no ethnic regulations as there were in many Irish benefit society rules. Systems were also established to encourage safe Irish immigration to Chicago during the late 1860s. The Chicago General Emigration and Foreign Exchange Agency provided tickets to and from Ireland, Britain, California, and Australia all available using Bank of Ireland drafts. To avail themselves of this service, interested parties were encouraged to apply to John Graham, Catholic Publishers and Bookseller with the assurance that if they paid for their family to emigrate, they would be escorted to Chicago from New York by trustworthy emissaries. Once they reached Chicago, newly arrived Irish immigrants could access the networks that already existed within the city. In the absence of a recognised secular society dedicated to Irish nationality, organisers established a variety of associations to cater to the different needs of Chicago’s Irish communities.

Middle-class society life in Chicago was disrupted by the fire of 1871 which affected large numbers of inner-city residences. That year, Chicago’s St Patrick’s Society disappeared from city directories. It had among its committee, city elders, school inspectors and aldermen such as Charles McDonnell, Thomas Brennan, and William J. Onahan. While these men retained their influence in Chicago, they redirected their energies into Catholic charities and Irish political nationalism

---

93 Chicago Post, 19 August 1872.
94 Daily Inter Ocean, 15 July 1870.
95 Hibernian Savings Bank book (CHMRL, Henry W. Magee Papers, Box 1).
96 The Bank of Ireland had been established by the Bank of Ireland Act, 1781 and remained open throughout the nineteenth century.
97 Irish American Weekly, 13 February 1869.
98 Chicago Directory, 1866, 1868 & 1869. McDonnell had been involved in the Repeal Association of 1844 demonstrating a life-long commitment to secular national/ethnic associationalism.
in the aftermath of the fire. In their wake, the Ancient Order of Hibernians (AOH) emerged. Established in New York in 1836, the AOH was a Catholic social and benevolent society which appealed to lower and middle-class Irish people. It entreated that its members:

aid and protect your Irish sisters from all harm and temptation. As the Irish woman is known for her chastity all over the world; some of them may differ from you in religion, but, brothers, bear in mind that our good Lord died for all, therefore be it known unto you that our wish is that you do all that you can for the Irish emigrant girls, no matter who they may be, and God will reward you in your new country, and doing this you will keep up the high standing and honor the Irish in America.  

The AOH was a ‘socially conservative lower-middle-class welfare and friendly association, [which] could offer material benefits’. Mark McGowan has described the organisation that emerged in Toronto as ‘more of an ethno-cultural insurance society than a vociferous exponent of Irish nationalism’. While the AOH has become synonymous with Irish associational culture, it does not feature in Chicago’s directories until 1875. If McGowan’s analysis of the organisation also held true in Chicago, the late emergence of the AOH may have been due to the alternative options for Irish people already in existence in Chicago. The Hibernian and United Sons of Erin benevolent societies provided the insurance element, and the militias, church, and the St Patrick’s Society and Fenian Brotherhood provided the social. In the aftermath of the fire, the Chicago Relief and Aid Society took charge of distributing financial compensation, while societies like the St Vincent de Paul Society took over the spiritual and domestic aid. After the immediate destruction was taken care of, a new society was required. The AOH took on this need. The AOH permeated occupational and community life in Chicago from that time, and its guard unit joined a number of other Irish militias that had been prominent in Chicago from the 1840s.

---

99 History of the Ancient Order of Hibernians...1898 (Cleveland: T. F. McGrath, 1898), 55.

100 Hutchinson, ‘Diaspora Dilemmas’.


102 Chicago Directory, 1875.
The mid-1870s heralded a boom in ethnic associations in Chicago and it was not purely an Irish phenomenon. While the Irish had the AOH, United Sons of Erin, the Hibernian Benevolent Society, Knights of St Patrick, among others, there was an increase in organisations dedicated to other nationalities, including the Cambrian Benevolent Society, Highland Association, Alpine Hunters, Caledonia Club, Chicago Scandinavian Turner Society, German Society for the Protection of Immigrants, and the St Andrew’s Society.\(^{103}\) By 1872 there was at least one branch of the Orange Lodge in the city. The Red, White and Blue Loyal Orange lodge, No. 57, regularly met to study for the Royal Arch Purple degree, though the Orange Order never became an influential ethnic institution in Chicago.\(^{104}\) In June 1876, the United Irish Societies of Chicago and Cook County (UISC) was established, bringing together Irish people from across the city and surrounds, out of their parish life connections and encouraging cross-community Irish mixing. In later years, this federalised system of society life enabled the hijacking of control from local representatives. The increased ethnic fraternalism within Irish communities during the 1860s and 1870s was an outcome of an international trend for secular and religious association.

Melbourne and Chicago both witnessed an expansion of the secular ethnic parish during the middle decades of the latter nineteenth century. Secular parish life was dominated by men with women existing on the peripheries. While middle-class women often worked as caretakers within society, Irish women were either subsumed into broader charitable work or focused on religious activity. As such, men led civil society and dominated the articulation of public Irish identity. The St Patrick’s Society in Melbourne acted as a focal point for Irish people, and for anti-Irish sentiment, in the city. The Society’s evolution, to offer the services of a registry office and benefit society, ensured that it and its committee retained an important role in shaping Irish identity within Melbourne. These services were supplemented by an ethnic building society and the growth in popularity of Gaelic

\(^{103}\) Ibid.

\(^{104}\) By 1883 another lodge had been established in the Hyde Park area, though it only had a membership of 40 after a year of existence and it was ‘of a purely social and benevolent character’. A female branch was established by 1890. Chicago Evening Post, 26 November 1872; Sunday Times, 25 October 1874 & 7 March 1875; Daily Illinois State Register, 25 December 1883; Hyde Park Herald, 4 October 1884; Hyde Park Herald, 28 December 1888; Daily Inter Ocean, 2 August 1890.
games, appealing to people of different ages and classes. In Chicago, conversely, Irish people continued to be separated by their needs and class. In response a variety of ethnic societies emerged, often connecting Irish people based upon class and occupation. Chicago’s Catholic Church separated their parishioners on the basis of ethnicity from 1844, emphasising the links between religion and ethnicity, whereas in Melbourne, the homogeneity of the city’s Catholic Church encouraged the separation of religion and ethnicity. The education debates of the late 1860s blurred these boundaries in Melbourne. Political and cultural nationalist societies rose in prominence during the 1880s, providing an ethnic focus for members of the Irish diaspora of different classes and political outlook. Land and labour agitation grew in importance during the 1870s, finding an audience intent on reducing social inequality in the industrialising cities of Melbourne and Chicago. Organisers in each city used the inequality in Ireland to unite Irish workers regardless of denomination.

Later Years

The labour disputes of the late 1870s, and the organisations that emerged from within them were reflected within Irish associational culture. Irish working-class organisers sought to establish beneficial societies based upon ethnicity, thereby placing the ‘Irish within, not apart from, the wider working class’.105 Irish workers in Melbourne and Chicago sought out those with similar backgrounds and occupational prospects as each other, using benefit societies to procure some monetary and medical insurance for themselves. Concurrently, political nationalist organisations provided social outlets for their members while providing a link back to Ireland, and with similar organisations around the world. Existing personal relationships were encouraged by these organisations through cross-city annual meetings, frequent letters, and newspaper editorials. Successful ethnic organisations, such as the St Patrick’s Society in Melbourne continued to adapt, encouraging new generations of Irish immigrants to find their place within the mix of older Irish and their foreign-born descendants. This allowed for a

recalibration of what Irish identity meant in recognition of the new challenges faced by the Irish diaspora.

Melbourne

The St Patrick’s Society maintained its position within Melbourne society. Its St Patrick’s Day celebrations evolved to include a wider variety of people, but the committee retained its position as the dominant voice for the concerns of Melbourne’s Irish communities, at least on 17 March. However by the end of the 1870s the gap between the financial resources of the elites and those in the working classes had become clear. The St Patrick’s Society could not provide the services required by the expanding Irish working class, especially those who needed security not charity. The Irish in Melbourne were often labourers on the railway or loaders in the dockyards, jobs without the income that would provide financial assistance to their families if they were injured or killed. The Irish National Foresters (INF) Benefit Society was established in 1886 and was specifically aimed at men aged between 16 and 40 years of age, who ‘must be Irishmen or of Irish descent, of good moral character and industrious habits’. The objectives of the INF were to provide monetary support to members and their families in case of sickness and help with burial expenses for the member or predeceased wife. Surgical and medical aid was to be provided for members, their wives and children, as well as for the widowed mothers of unmarried members. The membership rolls of the INF’s Henry Grattan Branch, based in Carlton and named after eighteenth-century Irish politician, was dominated by the labouring and lower middle classes. Though the leadership was often of the higher occupational level of clerk, in 1891 most of the new members declared their occupation as ‘labourer’. As the 1890s continued, and the economic depression

---

107 General Laws, 4.
108 Henry Grattan Branch, Irish National Foresters form of declaration for new members, 1899-1903 (MDHC, Box 2/0/INF 5). Davison suggests that four-fifths of clerks during the mid-1880s were earning annual salaries of less than £300, half of which earned less than £200. Despite this, they maintained the white-collar respectability of their occupation. Semi-skilled manual labourers at the same time could earn between £90 and £120 a year, while unskilled labourers could earn £95-105 per year if they found employment every week in the year. Marvellous Melbourne, 192-193.
deepened, working men needed the security brought by social connections and benefit societies. In 1892, a clergyman in Richmond, close to the Carlton base of the Henry Grattan Branch, observed that most workingmen in his parish were about £4 in arrear with rent on average.\footnote{Davison, \textit{Marvellous Melbourne}, 21.}

In 1879, it was estimated that 80 to 90 percent of Australia’s manual workers were members of friendly societies. By 1890, Charles Dilke, an English visitor to the colony, believed that in Victoria alone there were 800 lodges of what he called ‘provident societies’ with 70,000 members including ‘nearly all the manufacturing hands, as well as a considerable number of small shopkeepers’.\footnote{Quoted in Dan Weinbren & Bob James, ‘Getting a Grip: The Roles of Friendly Societies in Australia and Britain Reappraised’, \textit{Labour History}, 88 (2005), 87-103.} The INF was operating within a wider trend of working class collective action, supporting themselves and families while also encouraging connections within their locale and ethnic community. It operated a system of electing members, requiring a new member to be proposed by an existing member, or at least to have access to the platform, and have that proposal seconded in an open meeting.\footnote{\textit{General Laws}; INF notebook, c.1889 (MDHC, Box 2/0/INF 3).} In 1891, Melbourne organisers of the INF decided to join with other branches in Australia to affiliate with the organisation in Ireland, Great Britain, and Africa. The annual convention terminated with ‘all the delegates standing and singing the National Anthem, “God Save Ireland.”’\footnote{\textit{Advocate}, 31 October 1891.} The international movements of the Irish diaspora were acknowledged. Utilising the ethnic community within a city allowed new arrivals to Melbourne to use existing familial and friendship networks to find support within society.

The INF provided financial and medical support to Irish workers. It also presented Irishmen with access to a social network based on ethnicity. The Henry Grattan INF meetings were held at the Commercial Hotel, a popular pub on Drummond Street. This venue provides a useful case study in culture brokers and influencers.\footnote{\textit{Irish-Australian Almanac} (Melbourne: Winter & Co., 1888); Belchem, ‘Liverpool-Irish’.} Irish pub landlords across the diaspora served as conduits ‘between the ethnic leadership cadre and the wider migrant community’, using their
position within the aspiring middle classes to link the ethnic messages of those above and below them together.\textsuperscript{114} The Commercial Hotel was run by Matthew Rahilly from at least 1880, though its licensee changed over the years between a number of people with Irish surnames.\textsuperscript{115} Rahilly had emigrated from Liverpool to Melbourne in September 1859 as a 19-year-old labourer. He was registered on the ship with a Michael Driscoll, possibly an older cousin on his mother’s side.\textsuperscript{116} Rahilly ‘evinced a practical interest in Catholic and Irish national affairs’, demonstrated by his involvement in St Patrick’s Day parades in 1887 and 1888 as well as the INF.\textsuperscript{117} Through his connections with Irish associational life, Rahilly was able to provide a friendly venue and supplement his income.\textsuperscript{118} Just as Timothy Lane had offered the Builders’ Arms to the St Patrick’s Society in the 1840s, Irish secular parish life benefited the local economies of Irish people as well as helping to create a sense of ethnic community within the wider city. The spread of local branches into the suburbs also helped to make membership of an ethnic association more relevant to the everyday interactions of Irish people in Melbourne.

While the INF provided an element of financial security to workers, other organisations were established to unite people with an interest in the political future of Ireland. Melbourne had branches of the Land League/Irish National League during the early 1880s, and its citizens gave generously to Irish constitutional and humanitarian relief efforts throughout the decade.\textsuperscript{119} There was a desire to learn about Irish events and history and knowledge was provided by the Advocate, Catholic organisations, and public institutions like the Melbourne Public Library which by 1887 had 2,500 volumes categorised as ‘Ireland’.\textsuperscript{120} As

\textsuperscript{114} Belchem, ‘Liverpool-Irish’.
\textsuperscript{115} \textit{Age}, 9 December 1880.
\textsuperscript{116} \textit{Inward Overseas Passenger Lists (British Ports)}, Microfiche VPRS 7666, PROV; \textit{Australia, Death Index}, 1787-1988 (Ancestry.com).
\textsuperscript{117} \textit{Advocate}, 20 May 1920; St Patrick’s Society marshal in parade, \textit{Argus}, 18 March 1886; district president of St Patrick’s Society and marshal in parade, \textit{Argus}, 19 March 1887.
\textsuperscript{118} Rahilly’s links to the Catholic Church were reflected throughout his family. Of the nine surviving children of the 14 born to Matthew and his wife Elizabeth, three daughters became nuns, two in Melbourne and one in Tasmania. \textit{Advocate}, 1 April 1916; ‘Mr. Matthew Rahilly’, \textit{Advocate}, 20 May 1920. Sister Ildephonsus (Sisters of Charity, East Melbourne), Sister Eustace (Hobart), Sister Canisius (Sisters of Mercy, Nicholson Street).
\textsuperscript{119} These societies will be explored further in chapters four and five.
\textsuperscript{120} Hogan, \textit{Irish in Australia}, 30.
the 1880s continued, and the possibility of Irish Home Rule increased, club life in Melbourne reflected and supported this. The Celtic Club was formed in Melbourne in 1887 to support the Home Rule cause. It took seven months before the Club had permanent lodgings, by which time the membership roll comprised 196 city and country members, including 20 clergymen of different faiths and 37 members of the learned professions. The Club’s first constitution declared that it was

to unite, regardless of creed or Australian party politics, men who sympathised with Ireland’s aspirations for Home Rule […] They envisioned a Club of patriotic Irishmen and the sons of Irishmen, who were prepared to support the Irish cause financially as well as spiritually.

Familiar names emerge in the original committee, politician John Gavan Duffy (son of Charles), wine merchant Martin Hood, and Irish linguist and doctor Nicholas O’Donnell. Duffy and O’Donnell were the sons of Irish immigrants and had been educated in Melbourne, with O’Donnell becoming the leading advocate and scholar of the Irish language in Australia. Martin Hood, conversely, was a connection with the city elders who had established and adapted the city’s ethnic associationalism. Hood had arrived from Galway in 1854, had been involved in the St Patrick’s Society since 1868 and was in business with P. J. Martin of the Irish-Australian Building Society. As Irish nationalism extended its reach throughout the Irish clubs and societies of Melbourne, a sense of unification across the Irish communities emerged through the use of society columns in the newspapers. The annual meeting of the representatives of the Irish National League (INL) of Victoria involved representatives of the Irish National Foresters, the Celtic Club, the Advocate newspaper committee, as well as members of the Irish elite in Melbourne. The secretary of the Henry Grattan branch of the INF in 1889, P. F. Kerwick, was also a representative of the Celtic Club at that year’s INL delegates’ meeting. Considering the mixed occupational and generational membership of these organisations, men like Kerwick and Hood had the

---

122 Buggy, Celtic Club, 3.
123 Nicholas O’Donnell to John Redmond, 4 March 1902 (NLI, Redmond Papers, MS15,235/1).
124 Advocate, 14 August 1909.
125 Advocate, 8 November 1890.
126 INF notebook, c.1889 (MDHC, Box 2/0/INF 3).
opportunity to influence the image of Irish identity and fraternity across Irish-born and Australian-born Irish society.

Chicago

Irish ethnic fraternalism in Chicago was most visible during the 1880s in relation to political nationalism. An 1880 parade heralding the arrival of Irish Home Ruler Charles Stewart Parnell and former Irish MP and land agitator John Dillon involved members of the Clan na Gael Guards, Hibernian Benevolent Society, 14 total abstinence and benevolent societies, two sodalities, five benevolent associations, and the Knights of St Patrick. The men of these societies were accompanied by four regiments of the Ancient Order of Hibernian Rifles and 17 Ancient Order of Hibernian divisions. Proudly showcasing the ethnic prowess and good standing of the Irish in Chicago to the leaders of the Irish nationalist cause in Ireland was an opportunity not to be missed. Secular organisations marched alongside representatives of Catholic societies such as the sodalities, and the AOH had a clear Catholic mantra, further linking Irish and Catholic identities in the city. The St Patrick’s Society was reconvened in 1878 with a new focus on the ‘question of Irish colonization and in caring for the Irish immigrant’ under William Onahan. This focus on Irish colonisation was a clear Catholic mission and Onahan’s position as a leading Catholic layman indicates that the St Patrick’s Society had retired its secular ethos. While the St Patrick’s Society was keen to ‘express sympathy with the Irish people in their efforts to secure a change in the land laws and a wider measure of home rule for that country’ it was a conservative society. Chicago’s Irish societies under the UISC linked those with political nationalist outlooks and those where social networks were the focus.

Alongside the Clan na Gael which shall be examined in chapter five, Chicago’s most prominent Irish society was the Irish-American Club, established in 1880. The Irish-American Club membership rolls included ‘nearly every prominent Irish-American resident of Chicago’ and was open to anyone who believed in the

---

127 Daily Inter Ocean, 24 February 1880.
129 Ibid.
right of Ireland to be governed by and for her own people as an independent nation. The Irish-American Club in 1882 numbered 250 members, including ‘many Americans and one English members’. The Club served as a link between the different Irish fraternal societies in Chicago, bringing together representatives on organising committees to maintain ‘support networks that included but also transcended their immediate group’. Ethnic societies can therefore be understood as a stepping stone to higher economic and political power through the utilisation of networks. The Irish-American Club brought representatives of Irish communities across society together and thus facilitated social and economic mobility through access to employers, employees, and potential voters. The organising committee for a visit from Irish nationalist T. P. O’Connor MP, included politician and publisher John F. Finerty, policeman Michael Keeley, Sheriff Frank Agnew, brewer and distillery owner John W. Enright, and lawyer W. J. Hynes. Each man was prominent in Irish nationalist activities and Chicago civil life, furthering the bonds built in a variety of Irish nationalist associations and professional life. While Finerty was a vocal supporter of militant activities in Ireland, Keeley was the ‘man who started the “no rent” fund in America’, favouring Land League agitation. Both served as president of the Irish-American Club during the 1880s, encompassing a range of Irish and American social, political and economic concerns.

The Irish-American Republican Club was also gaining national prominence during the 1880s. When Benjamin Harrison, future President of the United States, addressed the Irish-American Republican Club of Cook County, he began ‘You were Irishmen, you are Americans [cheers] – Irish-Americans’. He cited the audience’s experience in Ireland as their inspiration for voting Republican in the United States, particularly ‘local home rule’ in the form of protectionist policies. Though an Irish-American society, the Republican Club reached out to those from different ethnicities who shared their aims. In 1880, the club president

---

130 Irish Nation, 7 January 1882; Andreas, History of Chicago, v3, 410.
131 Kelleher, ‘Class and Catholic’.
132 Daily Inter Ocean, 21 November 1881; U.S. Census, 1880; Daily Inter Ocean, 30 December 1888; Ffrench (ed.), American Irish, 203-207 & 721.
133 New York Herald, 27 December 1888.
134 ‘September 14, 1888’ in Benjamin Harrison, Speeches of Benjamin Harrison, twenty-third President of the United States (New York: United States Book Company, 1892), 124-126.
Justice A. L. Morrison appointed twelve special vice-presidents including Washington Hesing of the German-publication *Illinois Staats Zeitung*, State Attorney Luther Laflin Mills, and coroner General Orrin L. Mann. Despite this show of political friendship, the Irish-American Republican Club’s courting of important Chicago professionals did not always translate into political import. When Matthew Brady of the Club demanded representation on several committees at the Illinois state convention in 1888, on equal footing with two military veterans’ groups, the ‘contemptuous treatment accorded Mr. Brady was greatly enjoyed by the negroes, who have an intense hatred of natives of the ‘Green Isle’.* In the case of the Irish-American Republican Club, ethnic heritage was used as a focus for domestic political change, with speakers using Irish history for American ends.

Political organisations, both American and Irish nationalist, provided connections within and between different elements of Irish Chicago society. The Irish-American Republican Club was an outlet for Irish professionals disillusioned with the traditionally Irish Democratic Party, and the unconventional allegiance was justified through the framing of American policies, like protectionism, as based in Irish nationalist politics. The Land League, Irish-American Club, and Clan na Gael all connected men, and to a lesser extent, women concerned with Ireland’s position in the world. The Ancient Order of Hibernians joined with religious societies to link those who prioritised their Catholic identity, and provided charity through the now-distinctly Catholic Hibernian and United Sons of Erin benefit societies. However, for those who did not wish to embrace their Irish identity through dinners or military drilling, Chicago began to offer alternative celebrations of Irish identity, reflecting the growth of cultural nationalism taking place in Ireland in the mid-1880s and 1890s. Cronin, Doyle, and O’Callaghan have argued that once overseas, the Irish ‘tended to choose assimilation over cultural isolation’ when it came to sport. Baseball clubs were set up by

---

137 These benevolent societies had been reordered to “Catholic” in the 1878 Chicago Directory.
members of Chicago’s middle classes, and Irishmen like Jimmy Hallinan and Terry Larkin soon gained fame for their sporting prowess and drinking problems. This focus on sporting assimilation changed in Chicago after an Irish Gaelic Athletic Association (GAA) sponsored fundraiser tour of around 50 Irish hurlers and athletes made its way around the USA and into Chicago’s newspapers.

The Emmets and the Shamrocks, both Gaelic football clubs from the city’s west side, were founded in 1888. Patrick Couglan, a founder of the Emmets, cited the growing Irish cultural revival and Irish nationalism as reasons for the club’s establishment. He encouraged others to do similar, demanding ‘Is it not time that the young men of our race who have settled in Chicago, should help revive and perpetuate the manly exercises in which our forefathers excelled?’ The first American GAA affiliated league in the United States was in Chicago in 1890, and three years later there were ten Gaelic football teams, all suitably named to show their Irish heritage. Class divisions joined ethnic pride in 1892 when Mayor Washburne banned the playing of Gaelic games on Sundays. To enforce this, 67 police officers marched into Gaelic Park at the beginning of a football match. John Schofield, the ex-captain of the Wanderers Cricket Club and attendee at the planned GAA match, argued that ‘the boys working in the packing-houses from 7 a.m. until 6 p.m. have only Sunday to enjoy themselves’ whereas ‘the people on Prairie and Michigan avenues won’t even give us this small privilege, for they enjoy themselves every week day and rest Sunday.’ While the city’s Irish-

141 Ibid.
142 In 1891, the nine clubs were called: Columbia [later expelled], Grattan, O’Brien, Innisfail, Emmet, Shamrock, O’Connell, Wolfe Tone, and Davitt clubs, ‘Deplore the death of Parnell’, Chicago Tribune, 22 October 1891; ‘The third annual convention of the Gaelic Athletic Association of Illinois was held in Curran’s Hall, No. 352 Blue Island avenue, yesterday afternoon. The meeting was presided over by B.J. Mahoney of the Emerald club and Richard W. Wolfe of the Davitts was Secretary. Each of the eleven clubs in the association was represented by at least five delegates.’ Chicago Tribune, 27 February 1893; George B. Kirsch, Othello Harris & Claire E. Nolte, Encyclopedia of Ethnicity and Sports in the United States (Westport: Greenwood Publishing Group, 2000), 176.
143 Chicago Tribune, 26 September 1892. Hurling teams ‘bowed in submission to the authority of the law’ but the cancelled game turned into an ‘indignation meeting’; Darby, ‘Emigrants at Play’.
American Club involved men of rank and influence, the GAA attracted working men, allowing the 1892 incident to be framed as a class struggle with the wealthy residents of Michigan Avenue misusing police power to curb the harmless, if noisy, leisure pursuits of workers. Two years later, the Chicago Tribune was reporting the results of Gaelic games played at 39th Street. The presence of Irish sporting life in the mainstream and traditionally conservative Tribune instead of in the ethnic press indicates a growing acceptance of the place of Irish cultural nationalism within Chicago, and its widespread appeal across the city.

The 1880s witnessed an increase in ethnic fraternalism catering to the labouring classes. In previous decades elite societies provided for newly arrived immigrants through charity. Labour agitation and the rise of trade union activity during the 1870s led to an increase of friendly societies in Melbourne and Chicago. Irish labourers and clerks organised themselves into friendly societies, paying into insurance funds which could be transferred between city and country. Ethnic connections were further encouraged through engagement with cultural nationalist activities such as Gaelic games, though these outlets were determined by the influence of Melbourne and Chicago’s Irish organisers. Whereas Chicago reflected changes throughout Ireland, particularly the emergence of the Gaelic Athletic Association in 1884, Melbourne’s engagement with hurling was contingent on its Trinity College Dublin alumni and the growth of hurling at the university. While non-nationalist secular societies were established in Chicago, they did not endure. Chicago’s secular life was reliant on emissaries from Ireland to bring change and focus to the city’s Irish life. Due to its distance from Ireland, Chicago’s Irish communities could rely on regular prominent visitors to bring news and focus from Ireland. Conversely, Melbourne’s distance prevented these relatively short promotional opportunities. Instead, Melbourne was reliant on imperial middle-class networks and influence of Trinity-educated professionals therein. These men, often involved in the St Patrick’s Society, encouraged the continuity and prominence of secular associational culture in the city throughout the nineteenth century. Secular ethnic fraternalism in both cities was directed and

144 ‘Football between the Emmets and O’Connells was the opening event, and the former did not have matters all their own way…The ground afforded good footing, and some fine hurling was seen when the Innisfails met the O’Briens’. Chicago Tribune, 10 September 1894.
shaped by men of Irish-birth and descent. Secular activities helped to unite people of Irish heritage regardless of religion, this was of particular use within imperial Melbourne. It also helped Irish people to create and maintain professional links across their new societies, proving their loyalty and encouraging international political pressure which could be utilised for Ireland.

Conclusion

Secular parish life was contingent on personal networks, building upon connections made in Ireland and abroad, at university, in shared interests, and on occupation. These personal networks could be expanded throughout the city and internationally by membership in elite organisations, such as the Melbourne St Patrick’s Society and the Irish-American Club, through the issuance of invitations to prominent national and international speakers. Membership of these clubs therefore sought to improve and maintain the representation of Irish people within Melbourne and Chicago, and specifically cement professional bonds between individuals involved in committee positions. Societies aimed at decreasing social inequality, the INF or the Fenian Brotherhood, operated within more local parish surroundings. Based within a parish or suburb, these organisations created the sense of an ethnic community, providing social and financial support while linking men from similar geographical and occupational backgrounds to their local pub or hall. Relying on a system of recommendations, these societies took into account the transient nature of life for many Irish labourers during the nineteenth century. Affiliation with branches in different states and countries provided a transnational and fluid system of support for often young, migratory workers. Melbourne and Chicago therefore had a variety of organisations which appealed to different generations and sections of its city’s Irish inhabitants. These organisations, disparate as they often were, were often linked by their organising committee members, personally, professionally, or through city-wide ethnic society meetings.

The main difference between the secular ethnic life which emerged in Melbourne and Chicago was the role of the Catholic Church in defining Irish identity. The
Catholic Church in Melbourne was homogenously Irish, whereas Chicago’s Church was ethnically plural from its beginning. Irish and Catholic identities were therefore linked in different ways. The early legislation against religiously-inspired public activities in Melbourne, the Party Procession Prevention Act, ensured that ethnic associationalism was clearly linked with secular civil society. The St Patrick’s Society adapted to the changing requirements of the immigrant Irish population of Melbourne, enabling its continued influence in the city. In Chicago, conversely, ethnicity and religion were closely linked publicly. While benefit societies were quickly taken under the control of the Irish Catholic Church, politically nationalist organisations maintained their secular position, at least officially, within the city. Men dominated the establishment of secular ethnic society in both cities between 1840 and 1890. While ethnic societies aimed directly at women were established as the nineteenth century drew to a close, women existed on the periphery of secular Irish ethnic societies: at dances and behind bazaar stands. Men were therefore responsible for directing the image of secular Irish identity in relation to American and Australian priorities. They built upon cultural affinities which were promoted by women in other spheres of immigrant life. These affinities will be the focus of the next two chapters.
Chapter Three: Religious Education: The Battle for the Control of Second-Generation Irish Identities.

On Friday 15 November 1850, a grand parade made its way through the streets of Melbourne. The parade ended four days of celebrations in honour of Victoria’s separation from New South Wales, and brought together the city’s social, political and religious leaders and organisations. Alongside the main trade unions, the Freemasons and the Odd Fellows, and in front of the Mayor and Members of the Legislative Council, an estimated 600 children joined the parade’s ranks. This ‘immense assemblage of children’ was made up solely of pupils and teachers from Melbourne’s Catholic schools. Melbourne’s leading newspaper, the Argus, remarked that ‘The appearance of the children was creditable to their parents, and full of promise to the future “Victoria”’.1 These Catholic children marched alongside the St Patrick’s Society and the Father Matthew Total Abstinence Society, positioning current and future representatives of Irish and Irish Catholic religious and secular communities at the forefront of the new colony’s foundational story. The prominent position of Catholic children in the parade, and the lack of remark on the involvement of Protestant children, indicates the fluidity of the hierarchy of religion in the Australian colonies during the mid-century. The role of education in moulding the identities of new generations of Australians and Americans was to be a source of debate for educators and legislators in both Melbourne and Chicago in 1850, and continued to be a subject of dispute for the rest of the nineteenth century. This chapter follows the public policy debates which shaped the worlds inhabited by Catholic children and their families in Melbourne and Chicago.

This chapter details the evolution of elementary educational legislation in Melbourne and Chicago, between 1840 and 1890, with particular focus on the place of Catholic and Irish views expressed within. Using the public debates found in newspapers and politics, it explores the priorities of parents, clerics, and politicians, and how their views were articulated on the subjects their children were taught, who they were taught by, and crucially, who paid for that education.

---

1 Argus, 19 November 1850.
Most parents paid a fee towards their children’s education until the final decades of the nineteenth century, though schoolteachers in Melbourne and Chicago were all encouraged to give free education to orphans and children of indigent parents. Education is considered a key ingredient in creating and sustaining a devout Catholic community. What could be gained from religious education, the moral and economic progress of children, was related to the entire local Irish Catholic community’s position within wider society. As Mary Hickman has highlighted, educational reform in the nineteenth century was primarily concerned with building political subjects, and was therefore a tool of state construction. Both Melbourne and Chicago were new cities and populated by young people during the second half of the nineteenth century. This chapter uses the attempts of the state to enforce a particular image of citizenship through education to explore Melbourne and Chicago’s Irish Catholic communities’ influence in shaping the types of political subjects that emerged from their schools.

The schoolroom is understood to be an important place in the shaping of children’s minds and hopes: a place where non-familial adults have influence on future paths taken. Melbourne and Chicago, growing rapidly and in harsh conditions during the nineteenth century were environments where Protestant-inspired ideals of human autonomy and liberalism reigned. Catholics conversely saw ‘moral choice and personal development as inseparable from virtues nurtured in families and churches’. The Irish Famine encouraged a devotional revolution in Ireland, continuing a process began in the 1840s which prioritised uniformity and ritual in the Catholic Church over more local traditions which had previously defined Catholic Ireland. Under Cardinal Cullen, the Catholic Church in Ireland was transformed into an ultramontane institution, drawing together the support that he had from the Pope and Roman authorities with the Irish clergy and laity to reform the pastoral provision of the Irish Catholic Church. Cullen was able to achieve this pastoral reform because the two decades before the Famine had

---

4 Larkin, ‘Devotional Revolution’.
witnessed a growth of religious orders, often established by wealthy women, who sought to improve the spiritual and welfare provision of the needy and poor of Ireland. The increase in religious order numbers in Ireland in the 1840s was consolidated after the Famine when the rapid decline in Irish population led to the transformation of the position of the clergy within Irish society. While 33 percent of Catholics went to Mass in pre-Famine Ireland, this number rose to over 90 percent by the end of the nineteenth century. Larkin argued that the devotional revolution ‘provided the Irish with a substitute symbolic language and offered them a new cultural heritage with which they could identify and be identified’. As part of the revolution the leaders of the Catholic Church in Ireland felt that ‘the full reinstatement of its authority lay in achieving untramelled control over the management of all educational institutions patronized by the Catholic laity.’ This concern for the education of Catholic children spread around the world was supported by religious orders trained to teach them, encouraged by directives from the Vatican, and was enforced at different times by threats of excommunication and other spiritual downfalls. This chapter explores the transnational and local influences on the education of Irish-born and Irish-descended Catholic children in Melbourne and Chicago.

For many Catholics, it was in educational institutions that Catholic ritual was instilled from a young age, helping to create a Catholic adult population which prioritised religious devotion and community over individual liberty. Schools were linked to churches, both physically and socially, and the provision of sodalities and other social organisations linked to the Church meant that children could be surrounded by the priorities of faith, family, and with such large numbers of Irish religious in the diaspora, mother country. For ‘liberal’ and non-Catholics, this immersion represented a threat to the prosperity and peace of their new nation. The education debates therefore provide an insight into each society’s

---

7 Larkin, ‘Devotional Revolution’.
9 Further explored in chapter four.
position on citizenship, religion and loyalty during the nineteenth century. Irish women, in their position as teachers, lay and religious, helped to bond children, and therefore new generations of Irish descendants, into communities based on Irish and Catholic identities. While the previous chapter focused on the male-dominated Irish associational culture which emerged in Melbourne and Chicago, this chapter explores the debates which ensured the daily interaction of children and parents with ideas of ethnicity and religion through their often female teachers.

The use of comparison allows for a greater understanding of how the Catholic Church adapted to the local contexts of the British Empire and the United States to improve the future social progress of their pupils and their communities. David Galenson’s work emphasises the need to examine regional educational provision when evaluating the progress of immigrants in the nineteenth century. Differences in the government and religious authorities’ priorities led to skewed provision, training and payment of teachers in different places and for people of different wealth. Comparison also provides a deeper understanding of the importance of an individual Bishop or Archbishop’s charisma, power, and interpretation of Vatican decree in shaping the priorities of the Catholic and Irish Catholic communities in a city, and how the differences between liberal and conservative Catholics in power were managed and understood by Protestant and Catholic observers. As wealthier Catholics could send their children to religious private schools if they so desired, these debates fundamentally affected the working and middle classes, helping to spread priorities of Irish and Catholic identity throughout immigrant society.

---

Melbourne’s state education system was a product of the city’s position within the British Empire from its founding. White settler educationalists looked to their experiences growing up in Britain and Ireland as inspiration, and later corresponded with their counterparts in other English-speaking areas of the Empire, particularly in British North America, for reforming ideas. Central to the educational reforms in the Australian and Canadian colonies was the Irish National School system. Established in 1831, the Irish National School system was the product of efforts to mediate tensions between Protestant and Catholic leaders and communities in Ireland. In Ireland, schools were administered by a Board of Education, made up of local representatives of business and religion, who would be responsible for establishing new elementary schools, taking control of existing schools, and for hiring and paying teachers with state funds. In order to satisfy the spiritual concerns of each religious representative, religious instruction was provided separately to the secular school day, and only with the permission of parents. As such, it aimed to improve the educational progress of all Irish children, while promoting non- or un-denominational education. In reality, the Irish National School system created a country of denominationally separated schools and children.\(^{12}\) Authorities in New South Wales first looked to Ireland and the Irish National School system as a way of financing and administering their schools in 1836. When this was rejected by the Legislative Assembly, the *Port Phillip Gazette* campaigned for ‘the establishment of a system of education, which, supported by government aid, should embrace the instruction of all creeds without adopting measures and enforcing rules inimical to religious prejudices, or subversive of sectarian tensions.’\(^{13}\) Five years after the Gazette’s article a dual system of education was organised across New South Wales, leading to the


\(^{13}\) *Port Phillip Gazette*, 13 February 1841.
establishment of a small number of national schools alongside denominational parish schools.

The National Education Board Incorporation Act of 1851 established a version of the Irish National School (henceforth INS) system as Victoria's state-funded education system from its very start. Schools would receive a portion of state money, relative to the size of the school and in the case of denominational schools, relative to the size of the religious population to pay the salaries of teachers. It differed from Ireland in its administration, with a Board of Education (henceforth NSB) for national (and non-denominational) schools and a Denominational School Board (henceforth DSB) to oversee religious schools. The differing size and population distribution of Victoria and Ireland was a significant reason for this variation: Victoria's landmass is roughly three times the size of Ireland's and with far fewer large towns. Therefore, while denominational schools prospered in more densely populated areas, national schools were established in places where denominational schools would be problematic due to small numbers of children of different denominations. The school boards effectively had different remits and largely either focused on rural or urban areas. At the end of 1850, seven months before the separation of Victoria and New South Wales, only seven national schools existed in the Port Phillip District, three in settled areas, four beyond. In their stead were a number of denominational schools and private schools. There was little immediate impact on these figures when the new Victorian Legislature in Melbourne was given control of its educational system and the 12,590 children already on the colony's school rolls. By the end of 1851, the NSB had only increased its school control to 11 of 135 schools operating in the colony.

---

14 Victoria's area is 91,749.1 square miles compared to Ireland’s 32,595.
15 Children were also focused in different areas due to the demographic make-up of newly settled areas. The goldfields, for example, did not house many children in the 1850s as it was mainly young single men who went to find their fortune. The centre of Melbourne, conversely, was the home of many children and families. This altered the density of children needing schooling and focused the efforts and resources of denominational schools into urban areas.
Despite the widespread control of the DSB in Victoria, the dual board system went from being a 'real boon to the community' to the product of a flawed system which suffered from poor quality of teaching, irregular pay, and a lack of oversight within two years. A Select Commission was established in 1852 to investigate the flaws of the dual system, however there was little actionable improvement in response to the Commission’s negative observations. The main result was the introduction of upper schools and advanced subjects such as language for children aged 10 and above by the DSB in 1854. The DSB schools were predominantly run by the Catholic Church, and therefore Catholic Bishop James Alipius Goold sought religious and teaching support from Ireland. In requesting this increase of Irish clerics and religious orders, Goold consolidated the links between the Catholic religion and Irish nationality of most of his parishioners. The first response to Goold’s request was the 1857 arrival of the Sisters of Mercy, temporarily stationed in Western Australia. The nuns were joined six years later by the Sisters of the Good Shepherd, a French order based in Ireland.

While the Sisters of Mercy were initially concerned with the education of Melbourne’s poor, they were instructed by Goold to provide selective education for the young ladies of the city as ‘being ignorant, [the young ladies] were to be considered the poorest of the poor’. Goold was primarily concerned with providing religious and educational instruction to the daughters of Victoria’s growing Catholic elite. In this he reflected the view of Cardinal Cullen of Dublin who believed that ‘each class ought to be educated for the sphere of life in which they have to move’ and that wealthy Catholics should be educated separately to their poorer co-religionists. The Irish Catholic Church was concerned with maintaining the status quo, however within the diaspora, education was also seen

---

18 Argus, 21 June 1852.
21 Some of the Fruits of Fifty Years: Ecclesiastical Annals... Since the Erection of Each (Melbourne: A. H. Massina & Co., 1897), 16.
23 Joseph Doyle, ‘Cardinal Cullen and the system of national education in Ireland’ in Keogh & McDonnell (eds), Cardinal Paul Cullen, 190-204.
as a tool for social uplift.24 Between 1854 and 1857, girls in Victoria had benefited from a rapid increase in the number of female teachers, but their opportunities to learn were still dependent on the whims and resources of inspectors in the area. Where religious orders were unavailable, religious schools were staffed by lay teachers and, depending on the area, visited infrequently by local clerics. The introduction of lay and religious female teachers ‘constituted an unprecedented female invasion of the public sphere of men’ and provided young Australian and Irish Australian girls with new role models outside of the home.25 The predominance of Irish women within the ranks of Catholic schoolteachers resulted in an educational environment tied to Ireland and Irish identity, ethnic mirroring within the community acting as a subtle daily reminder to students of their religious and ethnic heritage.

As Goold used the transnational resources of the Catholic Church and the growing Irish religious orders to improve the schools under the control of the DSB, NSB boards looked to the networks of British Empire to bring education experts to Melbourne. In July 1854, INS inspector Arthur Davitt and his wife Ellen arrived from Ireland to act as principal and senior mistress of the newly built Model School and Training College.26 Several other teachers arrived from Ireland soon after to train Australian-based teachers bringing with them a reliance on INS Books, described by one regional paper as 'very popular, excellent, and remarkably cheap school books' with a 'world renowned' superiority.27 These school books were approved by the Anglican and Roman Catholic Archbishops of Dublin, had most references to Ireland removed, and focused on the preservation of Britain's social hierarchy and order.28 They were therefore useful lesson books for mixed English-speaking immigrant communities. While the school books were not printed by the government as in Canada, they were widely available from booksellers around Melbourne and Victoria and, being used around the Empire,

24 Fitzpatrick, ‘Honeycomb’.
26 Warwick Eunson, ‘Davitt, Arthur (1808-1860)’, ADB.
27 Portland Guardian and Normandy General Advertiser, 11 July 1859.
helped to instil a sense of imperial coherence. Davitt also established industrial classes for adults, and sent a number of his trainees to lectures at the University of Melbourne. He was improving the quality of the teachers and therefore the quality and opportunities provided by the NSB. By 1859, 169 teachers had been trained at the school, 130 deemed worthy of classification for NSB appointments. The competition for control of Victoria's education continued.

The education debates which occupied Irish politics were transferred to Melbourne through politicians and immigrant populations. The Catholic Church in Victoria was almost homogenously Irish, and the religious freedom that they had been promised by the New South Wales Church Act of 1836 which had eliminated state religions in the Australian colonies, meant that Irish Catholic politicians were at the centre of education debates in Victoria. John O'Shanassy, Premier of Victoria and devout Catholic, was repeatedly accused by M.L.A.s of having ‘Popish designs’ on the school system. Attacks such as these, led by the Age newspaper, linked Irish and Catholic prejudices in the minds of both opponents and proponents of the DSB. Critics argued that through his support for the partial state-funding of denominational schools, O'Shanassy was hoping to extend ‘the influence of the Roman Catholic priesthood in the ministration of the educational wants of the colony. To preach and prate about the madness of raising sectarian animosity is, under such circumstances, sheer insanity.’ Seeking to obscure the newspaper’s national and religious biases, the Age framed its concerns about religious schools as protection of the new colony’s democratic system, fearing that raising Catholic children in Catholic schools would lead to clerical control and voter influence. In arguing that they were acting purely as ‘Englishmen breathing that free English spirit which distinguished our forefathers’, Age journalists participated in stereotyping Irish people, and

29 Age, 17 February 1857; Age, 11 October 1858.
31 Age, 17 June 1859; Age, 2 July 1859.
32 Age, 21 June 1859.
particularly Irish Catholics, as unquestioning devotees of their priests, a popular image within the British press.34 The Melbourne press therefore reflected the rhetoric expressed by anti-Catholic and anti-Irish newspapers in Britain and the United States. Using examples of Irish corruption in the United States, the Age warned that in Melbourne ‘The “Catholic vote” will be given to the highest bidder; and there are few candidates, indeed, who will refuse to bid for it.’35 The religious priorities of Irish Catholics were seized upon to blame the Irish immigrant population for political divisions in a colony that was supposed to have removed itself from the sectarianism of Europe.

Davitt argued that the national schools encouraged the mixing of children from different backgrounds, helping to create a more unified society, and that religious teaching could still exist, just outside of school hours.36 However he bemoaned the lack of Catholic clerical support for the NSB, an issue that had blighted the system in Ireland.37 Goold based his concerns on the inability to ensure that the national schools were truly secular. Instead of removing all religious elements from schools, there was a continued dependence on Protestantism, and particularly the Church of England, for resources and guidance. If the national school system could be monitored and all elements of Protestantism could be removed, alongside Catholicism and Judaism, prominent Catholic clerics such as Bishop Hynes, Goold's uncle, could see its use in helping the social progress of Catholics.38 Anglicans joined Goold in criticising the NSB, conversely they opposed it for removing religious education from the foundation of state-funded teaching.39 Goold also worried about ‘liberal Catholics’, like Charles Gavan Duffy, who agreed with the call for state aid abolishment.40 Duffy argued that the

36 Arthur Davitt, Origin and Progress of the National System of Education... Mixed Community (Melbourne, 1856).
38 Hynes to Goold, 23 December 1858 (MDHC, Hynes to Goold correspondence, File 1).
39 Age, 24 December 1859. A similar Anglican response to the National System was found in England where Anglicans criticised the ‘secular’ system as an encroachment of popery and Irish rebellion into the British system, Hickman, Religon, Class and Identity, 142.
40 Goold to Abp Paul Cullen, 11 December 1858 (DDA, Cullen Papers).
‘grand old race of Irish Catholics’ could survive without separate schools.\textsuperscript{41} Duffy’s class and financial resources allowed for this self-confidence, he sent his son Frank to England for a Stonyhurst education five years later.\textsuperscript{42} Catholics without those financial and social resources remained the majority, and it was their souls that remained in question and at the mercy of political and theological disputes.

Despite the educational improvements made by the NSB and DSB, there were calls for the reform of the colony’s education system in 1859. Two education bills for the establishment of a single Board of Education were put before the Victorian Legislature, inspired in part by the economic recession which had forced the closure of the INS training school and the dismissal of the Davitts.\textsuperscript{43} Both were defeated.\textsuperscript{44} The NSB’s supposed anti-Catholicism was also a target of criticism. At the time, nine of the 25 appointments to the Model School were Irish Catholics, a representative if not Catholic Church approved, proportion of Melbourne's society at the time.\textsuperscript{45} Accusations of blackmail, intimidation of female teachers, and bad teaching were traded between competing school inspectors, in one case between two Irishmen, Geary and Donaghy.\textsuperscript{46} For those who did not have alternative educational opportunities, the lack of decision on state funding of religious schools meant that ‘Imperfectly educated young men had risen up whilst the question was being debated.’\textsuperscript{47} Melbourne’s Catholic elites sought to redress this imbalance of opportunity through the establishment of the Catholic Young Men’s Society in 1859. This society offered evening classes, a library, and other educational pursuits to Melbourne’s Catholic young men, helping to inspire and stimulate them intellectually while encouraging attendance at church, where the CYMS was hosted, and ethnic socialising.\textsuperscript{48} The influence of the Irish National School system on Melbourne's school system met the Irish influence of the Catholic Church in the denominational schools, allowing for two

\textsuperscript{41}{Sutton, Hierarchy and Democracy, 232.}
\textsuperscript{42}{H. A. Finlay, 'Duffy, Sir Frank Gavan (1852–1936),' ADB.}
\textsuperscript{43}{Eunson, 'Davitt'.}
\textsuperscript{44}{Argus, 5 December 1859. A comparison of the Fellows and Michie bills is provided in Argus, 30 December 1859.}
\textsuperscript{45}{Age, 8 September 1859.}
\textsuperscript{46}{Ibid; Argus, 30 December 1859.}
\textsuperscript{47}{Mount Alexander Mail, 22 August 1859.}
\textsuperscript{48}{The CYMS will be addressed in chapter four.}
elements of Irish life to make their way into the Victorian education system: Protestant-inspired non-denominational state control and Catholic Church control through education. The dominance of Irish immigrants within Melbourne’s Catholic Church provided for unconscious promotion of ethnic identity through education. Chicago’s Catholic Church had parishioners from a variety of nationalities from its establishment and separate from the Protestant ethos of the British Empire. Educational legislation in Chicago was therefore subject to differing schedules and administrative systems than in Melbourne.

Chicago

Illinois passed its first school law in 1833 providing for an elected school commissioner to apportion funds among teachers in Chicago and further afield. The city’s first purpose-built school opened in 1835, and a Board of Inspectors was elected in May 1837. Over the next ten years, Chicago’s state school system was reorganised repeatedly, school districts emerging to cater for the expanding population and textbooks being chosen in an attempt at educational uniformity. In Chicago, education played an important role in the life of Catholics from the arrival of the first bishop, King’s County-born William Quarter. Chicago had a quick procession of four more bishops, three of whom were Irish-born, and all of whom prioritised the expansion of Catholic educational institutions, even if they were basic: one school was based at Bishop Quarter’s house, others were simple frame structures. The first Catholic school for boys, the College of St Mary [of the Lake] on Madison Street, opened a month after Bishop Quarter’s arrival in 1844. The next year, Bishop Quarter took advantage of the tax-free charters presented by the Illinois State Assembly to denominationally affiliated higher education institutions, and oversaw the digging of the foundations of the University of St Mary of the Lake. This university provided post-elementary education for students of any religious persuasion, as per the charter, as well as providing training for future Catholic clergymen in the city. Irish labourers and architects were used to design and build St Mary of the Lake, meaning that the educational

50 Walch, ‘Catholic Social Institutions’.
foundations of Chicago were rooted in Irish and Catholic workmanship. These foundations were soon extended by the arrival of the Irish Sisters of Mercy from Pittsburg in 1846.\textsuperscript{51}

The Catholic Church in Chicago was ethnically and linguistically plural from its beginning. To avoid conflict and misunderstandings between priest and parishioner, Quarter quickly adopted a system of separating parishes, and parish life, based upon ethnic heritage. This national parish system was reflected in the parish school system, concurrently joining Catholic children in a shared devotion to their faith while separately them from each other on national lines. German immigrant children could be taught in German by German teachers, and Irish children were taught by English-speaking Irish religious orders, continuing an Irish Catholic Church tradition of using English not Irish in services.\textsuperscript{52} Quarter’s educational work was continued by his successor Bishop Van de Velde, a Dutch Jesuit who occupied the bishopric between 1849 and 1853. The 1852 Plenary Council of Baltimore reminded parents of their God-delegated custodianship over their children, warning of the spiritual dangers that the inherent Protestantism of public schools held for children, and encouraging parents to ‘make every sacrifice’ to establish and financially support Catholic schools.\textsuperscript{53} By 1853 there were 12 free or parochial schools in Chicago providing schooling to the children of Irish, German, and French-Canadian Catholics. The following year four ‘partly free and partly paying’ schools were added to this number.\textsuperscript{54} Partially a result of the Plenary Council's decree, this expansion should also be seen as a natural continuation of the Chicago Catholic Church's educational priorities. Free schools were offset financially by the establishment of private, and fee-paying, day and boarding schools run by respectable women religious and attended by girls of all

\textsuperscript{51} According to the 1850 U.S. Census, 9 of the 24 Sisters of Mercy had been born in Ireland. Of the remaining 15, 10 had been born in North America allowing for a likelihood that more of them were of Irish descent.

\textsuperscript{52} Gilbert J. Garraghan, \textit{The Catholic Church in Chicago, 1673-1871} (Chicago: Loyola University Press, 1921), 112-114 & 123-124; Larkin, ‘Devotional Revolution’.


\textsuperscript{54} Garraghan, \textit{Catholic Church}, 153.
religious backgrounds. This system meant that itinerant immigrant workers such as John Onahan, who could not afford the $120 that the nuns charged to educate each of his daughters privately, could still place his children in a parish school. Parents, politicians and religious leaders worked together to establish parish schools based within and around their communities, and for most Irish people this meant creating Irish Catholic schools staffed by Irish teaching orders and funded by those who could pay. This community support helped parents to choose and pay for the education provided to their children. While the first priorities of Irish parish schools in Chicago were faith, elementary education, and community loyalty, commitment to those left in Ireland was also an inherent element of parish life. Irish women were therefore instrumental in creating a cultural affinity through daily, or at least frequent, interaction with their students and the imparting of Irish and Catholic priorities.

The Irish Sisters of Mercy were the only female religious order in Chicago until 1856 and ‘spearheaded a separate school system’ for Catholic immigrant children. The Western Tablet argued that the ‘real object of education is to give children resources that will endure as long as life endures; habits that will ameliorate, not destroy’. In the eyes of nuns and parents, to read and write was to rise. If Irish and Irish Catholic children could read and write, they could manage their household accounts and they had the opportunity to find permanent white collar work instead of the drudgery and uncertainty of labouring. They therefore had the potential to financially and politically support their family, their wider community, and crucially, the Catholic Church’s endeavours. To educate an Irish Catholic child in American Irish Catholic schools was to improve the future chances of that child and their entire community.

55 Elite Protestants ‘enrolled their daughters of St. Xavier’s Academy because they believed that the nuns offered Chicago a missing element of refinement. They viewed the Sisters of Mercy as elite women despite their ethnicity…and constant contact with the poor.’ Kathleen A. Brosnan, ‘Public Presence, Public Silence: Nuns, Bishops, and the Gendered Space of Early Chicago’, The Catholic Historical Review, 90:3 (2004), 473-496.
56 John Onahan to William Onahan, 30 May 1852 (ACA, Onahan Collection, Box 1)
57 ‘Annual Commencement of the Academy of St Francis Xavier: For the Tribune’, 16 July 1851 (ACA, Bishops Quarter and Van de Velde Diary).
58 The Sisters of the Holy Cross arrived in 1856 to conduct schools for “German and English girls”; Brosnan, ‘Public Presence’.
59 Western Tablet, 14 February 1852.
60 Hoy, Good Hearts, 6.
While parish schools increased in number, so did the state school system. These schools were overseen by the Office of Superintendent of Schools but each school remained independently governed, allowing for an ethnic state school system to emerge in parallel to the denominational school system. By 1857 there were 10 public schools with two minor branches of the grammar and primary grades, 10,636 were students enrolled in Chicago's public school system with an average daily attendance being 3,318.\footnote{Andreas, \textit{History of Chicago}, v1, 216-17; William Wells, the Superintendent of Schools (1856-1864) spearheaded much of this public school expansion.} Despite this expansion, few Irish children attended public schools; by 1860 only four percent of Chicago’s public school children had been born in Ireland.\footnote{Mimi Cowan, """We Know Neither Catholics, nor Protestants, nor Free-Thinkers Here": Ethnicity, Religion, and the Chicago Public Schools, 1837-94” in Barr & Carey (eds), \textit{Religion and Greater Ireland}, 187-205.} While Mary Hickman has argued that the Catholic Church in England used education to strengthen children's Catholic identity at the expense of weakening their Irish identity, a strengthening of both identities was the outcome in Chicago.\footnote{Hickman, \textit{Religion, Class and Identity}, 173.} The Irish background of the educators was vital to this. However, the sense of difference felt by Irish Catholic children, and Irish Catholics more generally, was aided by an antagonistic press and nativist politics within the United States. As the number of Irish Catholics in the United States grew during the 1850s and began to gain political and cultural power, supportive newspaper editors declared that they could ‘by gradual and legitimate action recover Ireland’ as well as ‘engraft its own nature and sympathies on the future people and history of America.’\footnote{Reprinted \textit{Western Tablet}, 28 February 1852.} For others the progress of Catholicism in Chicago was heralded as a warning of the dangers held by the new cities of the West where ‘the Catholics have the best situations; they have land on the sites of every future Chicago. Popery follows the locomotive closely’.\footnote{Boston Recorder, 16 December 1869.} The national parish system in Chicago helped to create a close-knit, supportive and increasingly powerful community for Irish Catholics, however that same system separated the Irish from other Catholics and led to the perception that they were a threat to American, and Protestant, ways of life.
Educational provision was a priority in Melbourne and Chicago from each city's beginning, and the influence of Ireland, the Irish laity and Catholic Church can be seen in the education systems of both cities. The national parish system of Chicago allowed for Irish Catholic children to be taught by Irish religious teaching orders within a parish built and supported by Irish parishioners. Education was a product of the Irish Catholic community and this brought children and parents together with politicians and the religious: to improve one generation through learning was to potentially improve older and future generations of Irish Catholics in Chicago. In Melbourne the entire education system was rooted in Ireland in some way. While there were non-Catholic denominational schools, Irish Catholics did not need to compete with any other nationality within the Catholic parish system, as such it was the Catholicism of the system that appealed, not its nationality as there was little possibility of them having to learn in anything but English. The national school system was based on the Irish system and people found similar benefits and flaws in it in Melbourne as they did in Ireland. In Chicago, Catholics were able to establish a school system parallel to the state school system, and split on national lines in the 1840s due to an engaged Bishop and early arrival of Irish nuns. In Melbourne, conversely, the later arrival of a Bishop and even later arrival of teaching orders required an initial state solution which acknowledged the mixed make up of the city’s founding population and was based upon Irish educational reform. Irish people in both Melbourne and Chicago took it upon themselves to create systems of education that challenged the presumed dominance of Protestant and liberal thinking, and encouraged systems of support based around ethnicity and religion.

The Expansion of Schooling.

Melbourne and Chicago continued to attract large numbers of immigrants during the 1860s, and as post-Famine Irish immigration was split equally between genders, there was a consequent explosion of school-aged children. During the 1860s the number of boys in Victoria under the age of 14 increased at ten times the rate of boys and men over that age. Therefore, while the population of Victoria increased by a third in the decade after 1861, the number attending schools
trebled. Likewise, in Cook County, the children of school-age jumped from 19 percent of the total population to 27 percent between 1860 and 1870. As a result, the educational provision in both cities had to increase at a time when the Pope published his *Syllabus of Errors* which guarded against the mixing of Catholics and non-Catholics. Figure 7 is flawed due to inconclusive and missing census data, however it demonstrates a major growth in the number of teachers, and particularly female teachers, during the later nineteenth century. As the nineteenth century continued, girls increasingly outnumbered boys among those enrolled in Ireland's national schools, and these women filled the schools of Melbourne and Chicago as teachers, nuns, and mothers hoping for similar educational opportunities for their children. In the 1860s Ireland witnessed a growing resurgence of nationalist political awareness that was exported with its migrants to Melbourne and Chicago, cities that were becoming more established bureaucratically and internationally. This awareness was aided by the spread of Irish and Irish Catholic religious orders, both helping parochial schools to function and worrying those who supported public school systems, particularly Protestants who feared the international reach of the Catholic Church. Concurrently, the Catholic Church and state legislatures actively recruited more teachers to sustain their educational systems and improve teaching standards. This section explores how Catholic religious representatives and their lay counterparts used state education reform to forge a clear, and distinct, place for themselves in Melbourne and Chicago society. The communities had different approaches and objectives but the transnational networks of the Catholic Church and Irish diaspora ensured some convergence on community and faith priorities, as well as economic sensibilities.

---

67 Comparing the population aged 5-15 in 1860 (28,870 of 144,954) to those aged 5-18 in 1870 (94,836 of 349,966). U.S. Census Summaries, 1860 & 1870.
69 See chapter five.
**Figure 7:** Schoolteachers in Illinois & Victoria, 1854-1890 (according to census returns).

*The census did not separate Victoria from Bourke which included Melbourne in most years, in 1857, they did. The breakdown was 349 males and 550 females in Bourke County. This split of c.50% of schoolteachers being based within the city of Melbourne can be transferred to other census years.

±The 1891 Victorian census made greater work of separating tutors from school teachers leading to a smaller number of schoolteacher returns than previously. There were an additional 1179 and 2268 respectively returned as tutors and governesses.

**The 1880 Federal Census noted the nativity of occupations – in Illinois, 14,894 were born in the United States, 224 were from Ireland, 436 from Germany, and 225 from Great Britain. Many of those American-born teachers would have been second-generation immigrants, particularly Irish-American.

*Melbourne.*

In 1862 the Victorian Legislature passed the *Common Schools Act*. The dual board system was ended after a decade of debates with the establishment of a single Board of Education composed of members representing the principal churches, to oversee the state-funded schools in Victoria. At the time, the DSB controlled 460 of the 647 state-funded schools in the colony, and the choice of transferring them to the single board system was given to all school boards.\footnote{Waugh, ‘National System’.} In order to receive state funding, denominational schools had to comply with the national school's approach to education, separating religious teaching from the four and a half to five hours of secular instruction provided per day.\footnote{Akenson, *Irish Education*, 227.} The Catholic Church in Melbourne opted out of the new system preferring to charge fees for private school tuition and fundraise, through donations and community events, to offset the costs of keeping poor schools running for little tuition.
The Academy of Mary Immaculate in Melbourne was the main school run by the Irish Sisters of Mercy in 1863, and demonstrates how the Catholic Church responded financially to the new funding requirements brought about by the 1862 Common Schools Act. The school comprised three sections, a boarding and day school for young ladies, a middle school for children of humbler means, and an infant school. The fees of the boarding school supplemented the small fees that parents paid for the other schools, if they were able. The work of the Sisters of Mercy in Melbourne was a firm step forward for Catholic education in the city, however when Archbishop Paul Cullen of Dublin declared in 1863 that no priest could send teaching candidates to be trained in the state controlled and non-denominational Model Schools, and that no teacher trained in one could be employed in a Catholic school, the Irish-controlled Melbourne church followed suit. The Church’s campaign against ‘mixed education’ required the importation of more seminary and convent-trained teachers into Melbourne’s Catholic parochial school system. The French and English Sisters of the Good Shepherd arrived in 1863 and 1864, and their numbers were soon supplemented by the daughters of Irish Catholics from the colony. The Society of Jesus (Jesuits) arrived in 1865 to establish and take control of schools for boys, and they were joined by the Christian Brothers three years later. The ban on Catholic attendance at Model Schools led to an influx of predominantly Irish and Catholic trained teachers and religious orders into Melbourne and the wider colony of Victoria. While the Sisters of Mercy were inspired by the specifically Irish contexts of their community's foundations, and undoubtedly brought these influences to their pupils, it was with the male teaching orders' arrival that a specifically political Irish influence was brought into Melbourne's schools.

Joseph Lentaigne SJ and William Kelly SJ were the first Irish Jesuits to arrive in Melbourne and they immediately took over the running of St Patrick's School.

---

74 Allen, Labourers' Friends, 40.
originally founded by the St Patrick’s Society. Lentaigne's position as the first Irish Provincial (1860-63) and his experience teaching at many of Ireland's top Catholic schools denoted the importance with which Melbourne's Catholic children were considered by the Irish Catholic Church's hierarchy. The inclusion of Kelly, a man who had been expelled from Maynooth for his public support of the Young Irelanders, in this first mission also indicated the strongly Irish nationalist strand to the education that Melbourne's Catholic boys would receive. With the arrival of Superior Fr. Joseph Dalton SJ a year later, the Jesuits were able to instil a joint sense of Irish and Catholic loyalty in Melbourne's Catholic population that would reach across the classes. It quickly became more vocal and united after the establishment of the Advocate newspaper in 1868. The Christian Brothers would later help to cement this sense of difference from wider society through the education of the sons of Melbourne’s poorer families. While Melbourne's Irish Catholics were not detached from Protestant society, they were creating a separate sphere in which they were increasingly comfortable inhabiting.

By March 1867, children attending school made up one-sixth of Melbourne's population. They were a sizeable and important element of society, and their position as future citizens was remarked upon by visitors and educators alike. One visitor from England remarked that 'Here the Australian “youngsters,” part of the future “people” of, it may be, an independent State, may be seen at work or play – doing either by turns with equal satisfaction to themselves, to their parents, and to the Government that furnished the means'. The Catholic Church was shaping the minds of many of these 'youngsters' but the promise of future devotion did not offset the expenses incurred in educating them, particularly as the 'proportion of so-called destitute children was rapidly, and even alarmingly, increasing in the schools from year to year'. A petition presented to the Legislative Assembly in March 1869 argued that Catholics did not receive a fair share of the annual vote in the Assembly in aid of elementary education, and as a result the views of Catholics were underrepresented in education decisions. This was in part due to a

---

76 Carter, British “El Dorado”, 82-83.
77 ‘Legislative Assembly’, 20 August 1868, Victorian Hansard VI, 754.
flaw in the collection of religious affiliation information within the census, failing to link those of ‘Catholic’ and ‘Roman Catholic’ faiths in the calculations of the religious population of Victoria. The clergy and laity who signed the petition noted that they ran 46 schools, attended by 2,561 pupils, without any financial support from the Board of Education. In this way they were ‘annually deprived, for Educational purposes at about twelve thousand pounds (£12,000) sterling'. If the Catholic Church's schools had access to that money, they could 'give a sound primary education to the children of their communion.’ The petition was prompted by a proposal to remove grants given to schools who opted out of the Board of Education's control, if they had been established before January 1869. Catholics in Melbourne believed that they were being financially punished for the Church's quick response to the Common Schools Act.

As parish schools gained the resources to provide secondary education, middle-class parents became increasingly concerned with the ability of schools to help their children pass civil service and law school examinations. While working-class parents tended not to take advantage of higher levels of education which required the payment of additional school fees, the upwardly ambitious middle classes paid for their children to have the opportunity to join the professional and governing classes of the city. However, they were confronted by poor examination results in the Catholic college established by the Jesuits, in contrast to the results of pupils attending the Anglican, Presbyterian, and Wesleyan colleges in the city. Fr. Joseph O’Malley SJ complained to the Jesuit Provincial that these disappointing results were due to the Irish training of the Jesuits as ‘the books we studied of old are unknown here. The exams. are v. strict and unavoidable. No one can be an attorney who has not passed. We had then to teach a Syst. we were unaccustd. to, and hardly understood and the results were evd.’

The training of teachers in competing educational institutions in Britain was therefore providing an advantage to their students. As a result of failing examination results, ‘The parents began to withdraw their childr., and send them

78 Advocate, 20 March 1869.
79 “Ours” in charge of convictus must be first class scholars we must educate for university and compete with Eng Scotch & Wesleyan Colleges - no alternative.”, Fr. Dalton to Fr. Moore, 6 September 1870 (JAD, MSSN/AUST/236/13).
to protest. Fr. Moore has gone round and got several back, and at pres. matters are going on well - Boys better and cleverer than I have ever known. About 130 in numb.  

Ciaran O’Neill has noted the tendency for Irish Catholic middle-class sons to choose occupations based upon ‘consolidation and a preference for positions and professions with existing status in society’. As O’Malley noted, students had to pass their examinations in order to have the opportunity to progress socially in Melbourne and achieve respectability and status. Presented with lower success rates in the Jesuit College, parents had to balance ethnic and religious loyalties with value for money and upward social progression. This removal of students from Catholic schools based on poor exam results and entrance into Protestant schools demonstrates a prioritisation of results over religious and ethnic identity from some parents. Lacking the ethnic nepotism and political machines of some American cities, Melbourne's Irish Catholics were, to a larger extent, dependent on good grades and social contacts to progress up the political and social ladder. However, Irish Catholics from across the classes took advantage of the separate school system run by Irish Catholic teaching orders and their denominationally-trained lay counterparts, when it was available to them. The ‘Irish system’ of state-funded dual education had failed and in response the Catholic Church opted out of any state supervision. While the Catholic Church, and their representatives in the schools, took on the responsibility of educating Catholic schoolchildren, it was up to the wider community to support the parish school system which emerged.

---

80 Fr. O’Malley to Fr. Provincial, nd - the year has been estimated based on news in the letter on Fr. Isaac Moore’s departure which occurred in 1870. (JAD, MSSN/AUST/242).
81 O’Neill, Catholics of Consequence, 156.
As the 1850s concluded violent disputes erupted in Boston and New York City regarding the teaching of the King James’ Bible in schools. Chicago’s school system conversely continued in relative calm: schools were overseen by a district inspector but individual schools were managed by a local board or community. Chicago’s state-funded public schools operated separately to the religious schools, the largest proportion under the control of the Catholic Church, creating a parallel school system which kept children separate from each other. German and Irish immigrant communities supported each other in improving their social status through education, balancing and sharing the economic hardship with each other and proving their family commitment to education. Catholic parishioners continued to support their local parochial school financially and with labour when required. Though the financial burden was borne and shared, the payment of both public school tax and parochial school fees was a matter of consternation. Daniel Reily, a representative at the Illinois Constitutional Convention in 1862, raised the issue of double-taxation arguing that if any tax-payers ‘shall have conscientious scruples against sending their children to the common schools, they shall be entitled to a share of the funds’. Reily declared that ‘Millions of Irish who for centuries were suffering under the penal law, and paying tithes to a church they could not accept as a religious teacher come to America for freedom of conscience’. Though Reily’s amendment was defeated, and the Illinois Constitution was not altered until 1870, his argument of freedom of conscience in the United States was one that was raised by other proponents of state funding for all or none. This was the ‘New World’ and as such Catholics should have protection from economic discrimination as well as religious persecution.

In the absence of new government policy, Chicago’s parish schools took their lead from the Catholic Church. The Second Plenary Council held in 1866 recommended that a school be built in close proximity to every Catholic church to enable children to be taught according to the Catholic Church’s ethos. The Council also encouraged the establishment of Sunday schools to help children

82 McGreevy, Catholicism, 7.
who were attending public schools to receive religious instruction. Schools in close proximity to Catholic churches were already a prerogative of Chicago’s Catholic hierarchy, particularly aided by the national parishes which led to multiple schools within a few blocks of each other. By 1861 the numbers attending these schools could be supplemented by an additional 5,180 students attending Sunday Schools attached to Roman Catholic churches. Four years later, 82 percent of Chicago’s parishes had elementary schools, which equalled a city-wide enrolment of 16.5 percent of students in Catholic schools. Irish religious orders, lay teachers, and volunteers from the St Vincent de Paul Society staffed these day, boarding, and Sunday schools, further linking the representatives of ethnicity and religion, Irish and Catholic, with the wider parish community. Attendance at the local parish school ensured that ‘Home and school functioned in harmony[…]Catholic protagonists posed the parochial school where children would learn the ethnic truth.’ New generations of Irish teachers, lay or religious, enabled and encouraged ethnic mirroring within parish schools, subliminally creating an intergenerational cultural affinity to Ireland. While this remained the case education could be a religious but not an ethnic issue for Irish Catholics in Chicago during the 1860s.

While ethnic representation within the national parish was useful for the promotion of an Irish and Catholic identity, Catholics could also use their new American context to press the municipal government. The prime motivator for this action was the financial support of religious schools. In this, as in instances of perceived religious discrimination, there were opportunities for intra-faith cooperation, principally with the Germans. There were potential allies across the Catholic Church, and therefore a united Irish voice was not essential nor aspired to for change to be achieved. Just as in Melbourne, there were debates about religious education within Irish Catholic communities, especially at a civic level where professional and personal networks were built upon engagement with city-wide reforming efforts. This left the option open to those who believed in secular

---

85 Murphy, *Irish Emigrant Educators*, 233.
86 Chicago Directory, 1861.
state education to work from within the system to achieve it. The involvement of Irish Catholics in the public school system, as inspectors, teachers and cleaners, has led to the conclusion that, while Chicago’s schools were not ‘completely devoid of instances of anti-Catholicism’, there was intra-religious cooperation regarding the education of Chicago’s schoolchildren. This co-operation was reflected in the city’s education boards:

Great benefit is being derived in the West from the co-operation of the foreign residents in the work of education. In Chicago, which is the headquarters of emigrants from the north of Europe, this is especially the case. We learn from the Superintendent of Schools in that city that a considerable number of experienced foreigners hold positions as teachers or school officers there, and from their thorough training are most valuable assistants…The Board of Education in Chicago is now presided over by a very intelligent German. Around the Board sit Germans, Danes, Irish and Americans, equally honored and equally useful.

Catholic social and business leaders, such as James Carney, Charles McDonnell, Thomas Brennan, and James Ward, were all involved in the Chicago Board of Education from the start. As well as involvement in civil society positions as the Board of Education, these men also participated in specifically Irish improvement endeavours. Charles McDonnell, a School Superintendent in the late 1860s, had been a founder of the city’s Repeal Association and attempted to establish an Irish Emigrant Aid Society in 1869. Similarly when James Ward died, representatives of the government, judiciary, religious, and nationalist strands of Irish Catholic Chicago attended his funeral. Ward, it was observed, was a ‘poor man when he came among us first, he desired that God would grant him a little wealth in order that his children might receive the advantage denied to him of a good education. These men were joined within the teaching ranks by increasing numbers of Irish National School-educated women, and later their American Catholic parish school educated daughters. Education was the key to social

---

89 Cowan, “‘We Know Neither Catholics’.
90 The Sun quoted in the Irish Citizen, 29 August 1868.
91 Cowan, “‘We Know Neither Catholics’. James Carney and Charles McDonnell were both included on the letter to Archbishop Feehan relating to the priest appointed to St James’ Parish in 1883 (see chapter four, 185).
92 Chicago Tribune, 12 April 1869; Daily Inter Ocean, 9 July 1881.
93 Nolan, Servants of the Poor, 24.
progress and moral fortitude, whether it took place in a Catholic school or a public one.

The issue of state-funded religious schooling was settled when Illinois’ new constitution was enshrined in law. The 1870 Constitution provided for a system of free education for children aged between nine and 14. This was amended in 1872 (in effect, 1st July 1872) to include a stipulation that no grant of any school funds or property could be made ‘for sectarian purposes’. It was the hope of legislators that by providing free and early education ‘the spirit of evil is curbed and crime proportionally diminished’. That the scheme would require higher taxes was a small price to pay to improve and progress society. To aid this moral advancement, it was declared that the educational instruction in free public schools should not ‘in any manner, be hindered or clogged by any sectarian teachings’. There was no chance of combining the school systems to allow for religious teaching in public schools or for state funding of denominational schools.

Though parochial schools had not benefitted from state funds before the 1870s, the knowledge that there was little potential for future funding was perceived as a slight against Catholic Americans who were working hard to improve their status within a predominantly Protestant society. For Irish Catholics, America was hailed as a place for educational and occupational progress, a country where they could overcome the repression of their religious education system at home. The 1872 amendment was woven into a wider story of discrimination alluded to by Daniel Reily ten years previously. Their battle for freedom of conscience without excessive economic affliction was to continue. While in 1862 the issue of state funding of religious schools was a consideration, educational provision in some

94 Illinois Constitutional Convention, The constitution of the state... July 2d, A.D. 1870 (Chicago: Western News Co., 1870) – Article VIII relates to Education.
95 True Republican, 18 May 1872.
97 Ibid.
98 The excitement of Irish children to learn, once outside of Ireland, was commented upon by a number of journals in Chicago and Melbourne. One instance, in the Western Catholic described how ‘The children of the very lowest order of Irish (if there be any such order) learn as though they were bounding on their native heath’, 16 March 1872.
form was the priority for Chicago’s Catholics, leading to cross-community cooperation on the Board of Education and within the public school system. As native English speakers, opportunities within the public school system continued for Irish Catholics as the nineteenth century drew towards a close. However, the codification of the secular public system of education underlined the separate sphere inhabited by many Irish Catholics within Chicago. Children attended school and clubs with the children of other Irish immigrants where they were taught by Irish or Irish American teachers. The Chicago Tribune noted in 1873 that the public school system helped ‘the muddle, by insisting that children are, after all, merely human clothes pins, to be turned out by the dozen, all alike’, and if Catholics were discontented by this system, they should be prepared to provide a substitute which would meet their religious needs.  

The Western Catholic countered that Catholics:

object to the Public School laws, or rather the compulsory clauses […] They simply ask to be relieved from taxes for a false system of education, that they may be enabled to appropriate their spare means for the purposes of building up a true one. This just demand is refused; and the more aggravating part of the refusal is, that it is given in the name of liberty.  

The 1872 amendment had made it clear that Catholic priorities were not the same as the government’s. Religious education was deemed to hinder improvement and the discordant responses of the ethnic and mainstream press highlighted the antipathy felt by proponents of the different education systems. What made a good citizen in Catholic minds diverged from the state, and representatives of each viewed the other as hampering progress and promoting backwardness in a new democracy.

The 1860s witnessed the establishment and expansion of a separate community-funded system of schooling for Irish Catholic children in both Melbourne and Chicago. In Melbourne this was the product of decades of debates. The survival of religious schools without the benefit of previously available funds required the efforts of newly arrived Irish Catholic teaching orders. Chicago’s parallel system

99 Chicago Daily Tribune, 9 March 1873.
100 Western Catholic, 15 March 1873.
of education had existed since 1844, aided in large part by the early arrival of its women religious and diverse population. Though Chicago’s education system progressed for decades without experiencing the tensions of eastern cities, the issue of double taxation became a cry of discrimination against the Irish Catholic community, just as it did in Melbourne. Those choosing Catholic-controlled religious schools in both cities faced coded accusations of backwardness and unthinking clerical devotion which would undermine the freedoms provided by living in a new city without an established religion. Melbourne and Chicago had distinct educational systems, but both witnessed a growth of Catholic religious control on the Irish Catholic parish life during the 1860s, complemented by an awareness of community links between ethnicity and religion. While the link between Irish and Catholic identities had previously existed in both cities – Melbourne’s Catholic population was made up of Irish people, and Chicago’s Catholic Church was based on a system which separated people based on ethnicity – the debates of the 1860s and 1870s brought the public image of these two elements closer in Melbourne, while encouraging Chicago’s Irish to seek support from their co-religionists. In both cases, education continued to be seen as the primary opportunity for the potential improvement of the child, community, and city.

The Introduction of Compulsory Schooling.

The educational reforms of the 1860s and early 1870s were reconsidered in Melbourne and Chicago during the next fifteen years with debates centred around the idea of free and compulsory elementary education for all children. These new laws increased the financial burden on Catholic families and communities, as well as the pressure on the Catholic teachers who staffed the schools, particularly as a series of Vatican decrees were issued emphasising the undesirability of mixed schooling. However, the increase in the numbers of Irish Catholic children attending school had the positive effect of bringing local Irish Catholic communities together to fundraise for their schools. These events emphasised the Irish and Catholic identities of the parishioners and utilised the skills that were used to raise funds for other Catholic endeavours and Irish national causes. While
men may have supported the schools financially and politically, lay women used their fundraising capabilities to support their religious orders, particularly women religious. These education-related connections were built upon within the wider religious parish community which is further examined in chapter four.

Compulsory education caused financial and resource problems for the Catholic populations of Melbourne and Chicago but the solutions that they found to combat this ‘double taxation’ brought together ideas of nationhood and religion, further linking Irish and Catholic identities. As the 1880s drew to a close and the nineteenth century entered its last decade, these community bonds continued to cause conflict with the wider non-Catholic communities in Melbourne and Chicago, but they also helped to create a stronger parish life, based on ethnicity and religion, which could be engaged with both domestically and internationally.

*Melbourne*

On 16 March 1871, Melbourne’s Irish and Catholic worlds collided with wider politics at the general election.\(^{101}\) The reform of the Common Schools Act and the place of religious schooling, was a dominant subject of election campaign debates, and the vocal campaigning of Irish Catholics in Melbourne had led to speculation that St Patrick’s Day would not be observed in order to maintain the focus on political matters.\(^{102}\) To the surprise of journalists, the ‘Irish people, not a section, nor a portion of them, celebrated the day. As if obeying one impulse, they all came forth for the purpose’ of commemorating St Patrick.\(^{103}\) This show of unity, between Irish people of all classes and religious persuasions, may have been due to the increasing tensions between Irish and non-Irish people within the pages of the city’s newspapers. John O’Shanassy later commented that ‘thousands of free traders voted in the protectionist interest […] who would no more have thought of doing so if they had not the larger question of education over-riding them, than they would have thought of flying.’ Whether or not the education question was actually about education or a ‘question of religious controversy’, as


\(^{102}\) *Advocate*, 18 March 1871.

\(^{103}\) Ibid.
another MLC declared, there was a tinge of anti-Catholicism surrounding the results of the election for months after.\textsuperscript{104} The ongoing debates on religious education in the Victorian Parliament resulted in very little actual change, drawing lines within political parties based upon religious and liberal opinion, and dominating discussions. As such, Charles Gavan Duffy compared the ongoing and cyclical debates to those which took place in the House of Commons 50 years previously regarding Catholic emancipation.\textsuperscript{105}

The anti-Catholic sentiment that had filled the Age for decades met the Irish Catholic Advocate’s increased narrative of international discrimination against Irish and Catholic people to create a community voice which linked respect, nationality, and religion. The importance of education to the financial and societal progress of the Irish in Melbourne was underlined by the Advocate in a series of articles during 1870 and 1871. One such article argued that:

\begin{quote}
With a sense of pain and humiliation we have to point to the fact that wherever the Irish people are found as immigrants, a proportion of them so large as to be remarkable – so large as to have attracted general observation – are engaged in those menial occupations of the most laborious character, for which strength, endurance, and an absence of self-respect, are the only qualifications necessary […] through a want of education they gravitate to the lowest positions in society, and they have most hardwork with least pay […] This is the case throughout the States of America, and it is the case also in Australia.\textsuperscript{106}
\end{quote}

Melbourne’s Irish community included successful and wealthy Catholics, however it also consisted a large proportion of the elements of society that could not afford to pay for private and secondary denominational education for their children. These people were dependent on government and Church-aided education for their children, and educating their children could have the effect of removing extra wages from the household. Under the Common Schools Act, religious schools were eligible to a share of around £170,000 per year to contribute towards education.\textsuperscript{107} The share received by Catholic schools was a

\textsuperscript{104} Victorian Hansard, XIII, 1674-5.
\textsuperscript{105} Victorian Hansard, XIV, 40.
\textsuperscript{106} Advocate, 19 March 1870.
\textsuperscript{107} Victorian Hansard, XIV, 51-52.
matter for dispute, with the Advocate reminding readers to note their census return with ‘Roman Catholic’ instead of ‘Catholic’ as census collectors had separated the two leading to ‘sustained considerable loss’ to funding.\textsuperscript{108} This had also affected the portion of votes ascribed to Catholics in the Legislative Assembly. The Advocate therefore provided information to its readers to improve the financial position of Catholic religious schools, seeking to adhere to the laws of the country while protecting the household economies of parishioners.

Inequality through education was the central concern of the framers of the 1872 Education Act who argued that education should be secular, compulsory and free, and that the public school system should be managed by a new Department of Education.\textsuperscript{109} Children aged six and 15 were required to attend school for no fewer than 60 days in each half-year, with certain exemptions, or their parents risked a fine of five to 20 shillings, or by default could be imprisoned for up to seven days.\textsuperscript{110} It was therefore the parents who could least afford to lose the wages of their children who risked being fined for non-attendance. In this way opponents argued that the legislation ‘effectively removed the common law parental right to determine whether or not a child should be given a formal education.’\textsuperscript{111} However, supporters argued that if every child was given the same education and a common set of shared values, they all had an equal chance at life success.\textsuperscript{112} Religious and lay community leaders campaigned against the introduction of the 1872 Act. Archbishop Goold wrote to Cardinal Cullen declaring ‘In the face of this formidable opposition we hope with God’s help, to hold our own and secure to your people the system of education approved by the church and now employed in our schools’.\textsuperscript{113} A demonstration was held by

\textsuperscript{108} Advocate, 25 March 1871.
\textsuperscript{109} Sweetman et al., State Education, 65.
\textsuperscript{110} Education Act 1872 (Vic), 36 Vic. No. 447, pts. 13 & 14. Simon Sleight notes that truancy was not a priority for law enforcement officers and only 25 officers were employed throughout Victoria to implement the Education Act’s compulsory declaration. Simon Sleight, Young People and the Shaping of Public Space in Melbourne, 1870-1914 (London: Routledge, 2013), 51.
\textsuperscript{113} Goold to Cullen, 10 September 1872 (DDA, Cullen Papers). Goold and Cullen were in Rome at the same time during the 1830s, and Goold assisted in Cullen’s installation ceremony as Archbishop of Dublin. Freeman’s Journal (Sydney), 18 November 1852.
parishioners at St Ignatius’ Church ‘to enter a protest against the action of the
government in establishing a purely secular system of primary instruction, and to
plan for the maintenance of Catholic schools.’¹¹⁴ Despite this, the Education Act
1872 (Victoria) was passed, removing state funding from non-government schools
and centralising the public school system. This bill was forged in Victoria, and
though the Education (Scotland) Act 1872 also made education compulsory that
year for those aged between five and 13, Victoria’s bill was the outcome of local
contexts and years of debates, not a product of the British Empire.

While the Education Act sought to remove inequality of opportunity from
Melbourne’s youthful population, some Catholics responded with accusations that
the Act was actually increasing inequality through double taxation of parents.
Archdeacon Slattery warned that ‘When the people of the colony are saddled, as
they surely will be, with a school rate, they will have to thank for it the bigotry
which inspired the promoters of a godless system of education to attempt, by its
means, the destruction of Catholicity in Victoria’.¹¹⁵ In the aftermath of the 1872
Education Act, parish schools relied on fees, donations and community
fundraisers to support themselves. These fundraising events served to bring parish
life closer, with Irish Catholics working together to provide the education that
they wanted for their children who now went to school together as well as being
neighbours and seeing each other at ethnic clubs and social events. Despite this
increased financial pressure on Catholic schools, the number in Melbourne
ballooned. At the dedication of St Francis’ new girls’ school under the Sisters of
Mercy it was commented that of the 200 children who were being educated in the
school, 100 were paying between three-pence to one shilling per week. The others
were all on a free list.¹¹⁶ These schools, and the often female teachers within
them, were therefore educating children from a range of backgrounds, as well as,
presumably, educating them at different levels, as post-elementary schooling
along with music and languages were charged for. As the school numbers
expanded, more religious orders arrived from Ireland. The Presentation Sisters

¹¹⁴ David H. Murphy, ‘Irish Jesuit Schooling in Victoria, Australia’, Irish Journal of Education,
¹¹⁵ Advocate, 30 January 1875.
¹¹⁶ Advocate, 26 July 1873.
from Limerick arrived in December 1873 in direct response to the passing of the Education Act, defending against a perceived attack on the spiritual welfare of Catholic children, they had left ‘friends and home for us and for our children, and therefore we owe them, on our own part, and as sponsors for those children’.¹¹⁷ As more religious orders arrived in Melbourne, control of religious educational provision expanded and changed while remaining in Irish and Catholic hands.

Though the Catholic Church put systems in place to support its separate schools, its laity still fought for political change through the Catholic (Education) Defence Association, formed in 1879 to unite the Irish Catholic vote behind a political candidate, regardless of political party or affiliation. In July 1879 there were nine branches of the Association in Victoria, including three in Melbourne and its suburbs, by September the total number had increased by five.¹¹⁸ The officers of the Association were to choose a candidate who would support the Catholic population in obtaining ‘redress for Catholic grievances in respect to education’,¹¹⁹ and the officers ‘had a noble duty to perform in this new colony’.¹²⁰ Though they might not be successful immediately the organisers of the Catholic Defence Association argued that they ‘were in this colony making the same sacrifices as the Irish did at home.’¹²¹ This reference to the Irish ‘at home’ demonstrates how the Catholic Defence Association framed their actions as continuing a fight begun in Ireland to improve the position of Catholics within the British Empire. The Land League were concurrently demanding a redress of social inequality in Ireland, and branches abroad were converting these aims into their urban contexts. The religious school debate therefore became part of a wider Irish struggle for social equality and progress.

The political upheaval of 1880 saw the fall of two ministries, a three-month election cycle for Members of the Legislative Council, and two elections (February and July) for Members of the Legislative Assembly. A war of words between the Age and Argus raged on the subject of constitutional reform, splitting

---
¹¹⁷ Advocate, 9 October 1875.
¹¹⁸ Advocate, 26 July 1879 & 20 September 1879.
¹¹⁹ Argus, 29 July 1879.
¹²⁰ Ibid.
¹²¹ Ibid.
the non-Catholic vote. The Advocate, meanwhile, worked with priests and the Catholic Defence Association to project the threat of a unified Catholic voting bloc. The Catholic Defence Association observed that ‘there is no denial of the power they exercised in determining the issue that was before the country’.\footnote{122 Advocate, 13 March 1880.} Reframing the issue, the Advocate declared that ‘since the State undertakes to collect and spend our money lavishly on such a system of education, the question ceases to be a merely religious question, but becomes a question of political right’. As such, Catholics ‘are fully entitled to organise so as to render their political influence effective, and may fairly employ all such influence for the redress of their grievances.’\footnote{123 Advocate, 6 March 1880.} The reforms to the Education Act promised by the liberal Scottish migrant James Service were deemed by the electorate to be a better solution than those offered by English protectionist Graham Berry; Service won the February election gaining a majority of 12 in the Legislative Assembly.\footnote{124 Argus, 10 July 1880; Geoffrey Serle, ‘Service, James (1823-1899)’, ADB.} These reforms were not addressed however in the short ministry of Service nor the subsequent one of Berry. In 1881, the Catholic Diocesan Synod warned that ‘The enemy never slept, and it might be that they would sleep, and the enemy might gain an advantage over them; hence if they grow slack in the war against secular education the faith might possibly perish in this country’.\footnote{125 Advocate, 23 May 1885.} This was a battle to protect Catholicism, one that the Irish had fought for centuries in Ireland. As Melbourne’s Catholics were predominantly Irish, the religious school debates were framed as a continuation of anti-Catholicism, similar to Daniel Reily’s argument in Chicago.

Pope Leo XIII continued the Vatican’s campaign against mixed schooling and socialising in 1884 when he declared in On the Religious Question in France that the Catholic Church ‘has always expressly condemned mixed or neutral schools; over and over again she has warned parents to be ever on their guard in this most essential point’.\footnote{126 Martin R. West & Ludger Woessman, “Every Catholic Child in a Catholic School”: Historical Resistance to State Schooling, Contemporary Private Competition and Student Achievement Across Countries’, The Economic Journal, 120:546 (2010), 229-255.} In 1886, the Catholic Defence Association was joined in fighting against the Education Act by the Undenominational Education League.
Their main criticism, however, was the use of Irish National School textbooks in public schools, which were deemed to be too Ireland-focused for Australian schoolchildren. In this they reflected a wider impulse of Australian distinction that grew as Victoria and the other Australian colonies moved towards federation. While earlier generations had criticised religious schools for transplanting sectarian divisions from the old world to the new, the last decades of the nineteenth century witnessed a surge in a new distinctive Australian identity removed from ethnic and religious heritage. By 1890 the education question had still not come to a conclusion that Catholics found appropriate. Melbourne Catholic Archbishop Dr Carr commented to Archbishop Dr Walsh in Dublin that ‘The school question affords the only grievance we feel. It entails the necessity of supporting our own separate schools while we have to constitute to the support of the state schools.’

Many Catholic parents still had to pay a double tax for religious education, but Carr’s words reflect the image presented by prominent Irish Catholics in Melbourne, that they benefitted from the opportunities of living within the Empire but as a state with responsible government. Education was the tie that bound Irish Catholics to each other and the arrival of more Irish Catholic religious communities as the century came to a close provided an alternative for Catholic children, while surrounding them with fellow Irish and Irish Australians who held faith and heritage in high regard.

Chicago

When the issue of compulsory schooling was raised in the Illinois Legislature in 1873 and 1874 it was greeted by the Irish Catholic press as a threat to the liberties promised to all Americans by the Bill of Rights. While the Chicago Post argued that compulsory schooling was good training ‘for the franchise of the citizen; to make the man entirely competent for the duties of self-government’. The Hon. M. C. Quinn spoke for many when he derided the bill as ‘invoking against them the terrors of a personal statute’.

---

127 Age, 15 May 1886.
128 Carr to Abp Dr Walsh (Dublin), 20 September 1889 (DDA, uncatalogued).
129 Chicago Post, 30 January 1873.
130 Irish American Weekly, 17 May 1873.
opportunities provided by education, the prospect of funding a separate system of religious schools with the added burden of thousands of extra students galvanised community pressure on legislators to resist compulsory school policies. In 1873 the Irish Catholic Benevolent Union resolved, along with the German Catholic Central Association, that the public school system, in ‘ignoring all supernatural authority, and making God, the first knowledge, the last thing to be learned, is a curse to our country and a floodgate of atheism and of sensuality, and of civil, social and national corruption.’\textsuperscript{131} Compulsory education became even more dangerous for Catholics after the ‘Instruction of the Propagation of the Faith’ of 1875 which declared that public education ‘was opposed to Catholicism since it excluded all religious instruction and thus constituted a great evil if children were allowed to be exposed to it.’ Bishops were instructed to use every means in their power to prevent Catholics from all contact with public schools.\textsuperscript{132}

That year President Ulysses Grant urged Congress to pass a constitutional amendment banning government aid to religious schools, and to enforce taxation on Catholic Church owned property. In this, Grant argued that the government was curbing the ‘tyranny’ of the priesthood in American cities.\textsuperscript{133} The amendment was blocked by Democrats in the Senate but the public support of the President for such anti-Catholic sentiment was indicative of the wider problem faced by Catholics in the United States. The \textit{Pomeroy’s Democrat} warned that the Catholic Church’s policy of separate schooling was ‘its death’ due to the financial burden placed upon Chicago’s poor Catholic communities.\textsuperscript{134} Unable to afford to pay both private school fees and municipal school taxes, poorer families had to ‘forfeit their right to every particle of it [school tax] unless they send their sons and daughters to the common schools. This they cannot conscientiously do, in view of the sectarian tendencies and hostile character of many of them.’\textsuperscript{135} Just as in Melbourne, the double taxation of Catholic families who wished to send their children to Catholic schools disproportionately targeted the labouring classes in

\textsuperscript{131} \textit{New York Herald}, 18 October 1873.
\textsuperscript{132} Hunt, ‘Vatican Teaching’.
\textsuperscript{133} McGreevy, \textit{Catholicism}, 92-93.
\textsuperscript{134} Quoted in \textit{Daily Inter Ocean}, 28 January 1876.
\textsuperscript{135} \textit{Pomeroy’s Democrat}, 4 March 1876.
Chicago who lacked the resources to have a choice but required the social progress brought by education.

In 1876, Chicago’s Catholic parochial school system was educating 15,000 of Cook County’s 138,282 potential students, a small but significant proportion, not sufficient to present a threat of tyranny. Chicago’s Catholic schools may not have directly influenced the majority of the city’s students, however, its alumni filled the public school system as teachers. For the daughters of Irish immigrants teaching replaced domestic service as the respectable occupation of single Irish women during the last decades of the nineteenth century. Public schools afforded ‘excellent education at slight cost and supplied a large number of Catholic girls with responsible and moderately profitable posts as teachers.’ As the Irish national parish primarily operated through English, unlike the German parish, Irish Catholic women were ideally suited to teaching in multi-ethnic schools. Consequently Catholic schools like St Patrick’s Girls High School trained their students to become ‘self-supporting teachers who could also make significant contributions to their family’s economic well-being’; they also ensured a continued presence of Irish Catholics in the daily lives of Chicago children who did attend public school. Irish Catholics therefore adapted to the compulsory education laws of Chicago. Irish-descended women provided post-elementary education within the public school system, enabling the maintenance of Irish cultural affinity and ethnic representation begun in elementary school and emphasised through parish life through their teachers. Further education for women was encouraged, providing an alternative to convent life and helping Irish and Irish-descended families to become upwardly socially mobile through their daughters, aunts, and sisters.

Fundamentally, Chicago Irish Catholics were caught between economic, social, and religious pressures: the pressure to provide a good and affordable education for their children, to observe the Church’s teachings, to adhere to peer pressure,

137 Diner, Erin’s Daughters, 96-7.
138 Sunday Times, 31 October 1875.
139 Nolan, Servants of the Poor, 24.
and to make use of the social and ethnic networks available to them. By taking advantage of the religious education provided by their parish, Catholics opened themselves up to negative comments regarding the power of the priest over their vote, which in turn led to accusations of disloyalty to the United States. However, by supporting these schools financially, the labouring and middle classes who sent their children to parish schools were taxed doubly and rejecting a potential future employment opportunity for many Irish children, in politics and in education.

Now, Mr. Editor, it is not true that a Catholic is conscientiously bound to oppose any system of education a State may adopt. He is at full liberty to enjoy his political rights, free from church dictation or authority, as any citizen can be. The truth is – and every Catholic appreciates this truth – every Catholic is bound to respect and submit to the authority of the church in spiritual matters only, and then the matter must be pronounced upon by the judgement of the proper authority, vis., the Pope or a Catholic council.\textsuperscript{140}

For many, religion and moral education could not be separated. Catholic organisations were willing to work with those of the Protestant faiths to protest against the increased intervention in private matters by the state.\textsuperscript{141} At the Catholic Young Men Convention held in Chicago in 1881, the assembled delegates resolved with pleasure the work of ‘the Episcopalians, Lutherans, Congregationalists, Presbyterians, and others their secession to our ranks in this fight we are making in behalf of the dearest rights of man: and that, encouraged by their zeal, we will renew our efforts in the contest’.\textsuperscript{142} Despite this joint effort, in 1883 the Illinois Congress enshrined compulsory education, for 12 weeks in each school-term for children aged between eight and 14 years old.\textsuperscript{143}

The 1883 Compulsory Education Act was met by ‘the most rapid construction of parochial schools in the nation’s history’.\textsuperscript{144} Government legislation was supported by the Third Plenary Council’s decree a year later that a priest who was deemed ‘gravely negligent’ in erecting schools near churches within two years of the Council should be removed from the church. Parishes that did not help their

\textsuperscript{140} \textit{Daily Inter Ocean}, 26 May 1876.
\textsuperscript{141} McGreevy, \textit{Catholicism}, 118.
\textsuperscript{142} \textit{Daily Inter-Ocean}, 13 May 1881.
\textsuperscript{144} West & Woessmann, ‘Every Catholic Child’.
priest in erecting parochial schools would be reprimanded by their Bishop and could be in receipt of ‘spiritual punishments’. The need for more parochial schools to cater for the children affected by compulsory schooling was seized upon as a community project requiring the response of both priest and laity. However, as the Irish Catholic influence spread across more realms of power in the city, the doctrinal argument ran into conflict with economic priorities. The *Western Catholic* complained that there had been a misunderstanding with how Catholic parish schools were funded. It argued that the Mayor of Chicago had ‘fallen into a grave error’ in believing that most Catholic parochial schools were charitable schools. It continued that ‘one of the reasons why Catholics ask to be exempted from contributing to the public school funds is the heavy outlay they – for conscience sake – expend on their own institutions.’ The *Western Catholic’s* relocation to Chicago in 1872 allowed it to be used by Archbishop Feehan who used its wider circulation, across parish boundaries, to raise the issue of Catholic education in the 1880s. He specifically called for a centralised school board for parish schools in the city, attempting to raise religious schools to a similar administrative level as state schools.

Though the dispute over compulsory and state-funded education was multi-denominational, the blame for disagreements often lay at the feet of the Catholic Church. Proponents of religious schooling were accused of attempting ‘to Coerce American Catholics into a Dangerous Foreignism’ and split the allegiance of American children. Indictments of disloyalty were aimed at Catholics from the growing American Protestant Association or Know-Nothing Party as the 1880s progressed, taking over from the secular government’s attempts to federally influence school systems. The show of loyalty to the Union became particularly important in 1890 during the thirty-fifth anniversary commemorations for the Grand Army of the Republic. The Chicago district of Englewood was to host the memorial services at Protestant churches in the district in direct tension with the

145 Murphy, *Irish Emigrant Educators*, 236.
146 *Western Catholic*, 26 January 1884.
148 *Daily Inter-Ocean*, 1 November 1890.
Catholic Church’s stance on mixing Catholic and Protestant children. The Board of Education ordered that

the children in the five public schools in Englewood must fall in line, Catholic and Protestant, march to the church designated, and there take part in the memorial services. The children were warned that they must not be absent, under pain of having a black mark opposite their names, which would interfere with their record of average attendance.

In response, the Catholic clergy demanded in a letter to the Board of Education that the services be held in the non-denominational schoolhouses instead. If this was not possible, they declared that ‘if the Catholic children are withheld from the services, the Church must not be blamed for being un-patriotic and un-American.’149 The previous year the Baltimore Congress of Catholic Laymen had emphasised that ‘the world should know that loyalty to God means loyalty to the State.’150 Perceptions of loyalty was at risk, but there was also a financial threat. The compulsory education act threatened guardians with a fine of between five and 20 dollars if their charges failed to attend school for less than 12 weeks in a school year: the memorial services counted toward this.151 The fight for separate schooling for Catholic children away from the influences of individualistic Protestants was to continue for decades in Chicago’s Catholic Church. The ethnic parish system and the close community structures that it encouraged provided Irish Catholics with a multitude of avenues in which to access and criticise the government including across the Catholic faith.

The education debates of the 1870s and 1880s led to a recalibration of the identity hierarchy within Chicago and Melbourne. While Chicago’s Irish Catholics had traditionally linked their ethnicity and religion, during this time their religion was prioritised as the Catholic community came together to protest against compulsory education. In Melbourne conversely, the debates of the 1870s and 1880s took on an increasingly ethnic tinge. In both cities, the religious education debates were framed by the Irish Catholic ethnic and religious press as a continued attack on Catholic Irish people who had suffered from the imposition of Protestant

149 New York Tribune, 30 May 1890.
150 New York Herald, 13 November 1889.
151 True Republican, 30 June 1883.
teachings in education in Ireland, and while seeking the religious freedom of the new world, were again confronted by an ascendancy dedicated to undermining the social progress of their children. The ethnic pluralism of the Chicago Catholic Church allowed for cross-community pressure on the municipal authorities, bringing the usually separate national parishes together temporarily. In Melbourne the homogeneity of the Catholic Church meant that religious education became a subject of discussion within ethnic associational culture, featuring in the speeches of St Patrick’s Day and finding a voice in the Advocate. Debates about religious education and the place of religious as opposed to political and societal freedom overlapped with wider themes of nationalism, both national and diasporic, and social activism in both cities. As such, the continued existence and funding of religious schools became inextricably linked to themes of belonging and citizenship.

Conclusion

Education of children was a central issue for Irish migrants. The second half of the nineteenth century witnessed the expansion of public and parochial schools in Melbourne and Chicago, and by the century’s final decades, provided both elementary and secondary schooling to children of all backgrounds for the first time. While hailed as social progress, the widening of educational opportunity also brought tensions about funding and the denominational mixing of children. The position of the Catholic Church was clear, they had a social mission to provide moral and educational instruction to the next generations of Catholics, and therefore Catholic parents were risking their children’s moral and spiritual future if they were sent to public schools which, in the eyes of many Catholics, as government institutions had a strong Protestant influence. In response, the Catholic Church and laity in both Melbourne and Chicago sought alternative resources with which to educate their children. In this they benefited from the expansion of Irish Catholic teaching orders during the nineteenth century, providing a labour source which did not require the finances of the state government. These women and men allowed for the entrenchment of religious communities in Irish diasporic life, and for the influence of Irish and Catholic
teachers on new generations of Irish descendants. The form of this influence shall be discussed in depth in the next chapter.

In these new cities education was a vital tool in shaping good citizens, and there was a fundamental disconnect in how education reformers interpreted the priorities and shaping of future ‘good’ citizens. While non-Catholics argued that Catholic religious education created unthinking devotion to the priesthood, hindering the progress of their new cities, Irish Catholics argued the complete opposite. Their arguments were framed around Protestant discrimination, keeping Irish populations around the world in uneducated lowly and dependent positions within society. It was only through religious and political freedom to practice their religion as they wished, that Irish Catholic people could thrive within their new societies. These distinctions were the source of debates which crossed generational and community lines.

Melbourne and Chicago both benefited from the legislative prioritisation of education early in their histories, however the Catholic Church’s capacity to cope with these demands at that time altered the future path of each city’s educational system. While Chicago benefited from the early arrival of Bishop Quarter and the establishment of a parallel school system in 1844, expansion would not have been possible without the arrival of a congregation of Sisters of Mercy in 1846 to staff the school. These women were followed by other religious teaching orders and lay teachers to create a system of parochial schools to cater to the multi-national Catholic Church that existed in the city. Melbourne’s Catholics were dependent on Bishop Goold who arrived in 1848 and the later arrival of the Sisters of Mercy in 1857. In the absence of numerous religious orders, the city’s children were instead dependent on the public school system which drew its inspiration from the Irish National School system and retained an unconscious Protestant bias. While Catholic schools emphasised their loyalty to the United States and British Empire, and to the homes of their students, they also required the separation of children from Protestant influences. They wanted to make Catholic children, not Protestant-inspired Americans or Australians.
In Melbourne and Chicago, religious education instilled a sense of difference in Irish Catholic children, aiding the creation and continuation of Irish and Catholic community identity. While Irish male religious orders did run schools for boys they focused their efforts on post-elementary teaching, often leaving elementary teaching to lay teachers or nuns. It was Irish female religious orders who had daily interactions with schoolchildren in Melbourne and Chicago, building upon the familial home to encourage a sense of cultural affinity with Ireland, an identity that was inextricably linked to the national parish and religion. Through ethnic mirroring, Irish and Irish-descended women in Melbourne and Chicago were responsible for the creation and advancement of a foundational identity which connected ethnicity and religion. As Catholics who could afford to often sent their children to private schools, domestically or back in Europe, Irish women in religious orders and in public schools were responsible for the spread, unconscious or otherwise, of Irish and Irish Catholic priorities throughout the labouring and middle classes. They created an ethnic community which could then be built upon by the religious, secular, and nationalist leaders who emerged in Melbourne and Chicago. This extension of Catholic parish school priorities into the wider community is the focus of the next chapter.
Chapter Four: Religious Parish Life in Melbourne and Chicago.

The 232 children resident in the Lake Avenue St Joseph’s Orphan Asylum on census night did not know their parents or their parents’ nativity.¹ Most, according to the 1880 census enumerator, had been found in the street at a young age with few identifying details. Despite this, most had Irish names. Kate McCormick and Maggie Comerford played alongside Nellie Mulligan and Bridget O’Connell, and Eugene Hanifan slept beside Michael Denehy and Willie Powers. The entire adult population of the orphanage was from Ireland: 13 Sisters of Joseph, two male servants, and one elderly priest. These Chicago children were given Irish names, raised by Irish people, and presumably continued on to be part of Irish communities into adulthood. Similar could be expected of the children who attended Immaculate Conception School on North Franklin Street, where five of the six Sisters of St Dominic were born in Ireland or had Irish parents, or those attending St Joseph’s School on Emerald Avenue where that was true of all seven Sisters. The Sisters of Mercy School and Orphanage on Wabash Avenue had 152 people in residence on census night: only 28 were not of Irish birth or descent.² These were Catholic and Irish institutions transferred abroad and once there altered the growing Irish community in ways that might not be immediately recognised. Religious-run schools and institutions created a structure for parish life, and through the incorporation of confirmation classes and sodalities, the religious life of children continued into adulthood, taking and expanding the bonds of friendship, loyalty, and identity across generations. Both Irishness and Catholicism marked these communities out as different to the social norm of Anglo-Saxon Protestant in the United States, Australian colonies, and the wider British Empire. How the Catholic Church used this difference to bind its, often very different, parishioners to each other, and the Church, is the focus of this chapter.

This chapter explores the activities with which the religious parish encouraged a sense of shared Catholic identity in its Irish congregations. Through the actions of

¹ U.S. Census, 1880.
² Ibid. Of the 63 nuns, 26 were born in Ireland and a further 30 had Irish parents. 10 of the 89 children had been born in Ireland, and a further 58 had Irish parents.
the laity, clergy, and religious orders, engagement with a particular Irish strain of Catholic communion resulted in more than spiritual protection, it created a community focused around a person’s suburb, parish, or city. The ways in which identification with a particular parish or central church helped to shape Irish identity in Melbourne and Chicago will be examined, highlighting the parish’s importance in the creation of voting blocs based on Catholic, and Irish Catholic, concerns as those in the previous chapter. Many of the religious organisations and institutions that emerged in Melbourne and Chicago over the latter half of the nineteenth century complemented the ethnic fraternalism of the secular parish explored in chapter two, filling a perceived void in education, charitable action, and civic service across the class divides. The Irish Catholic Church ‘retained the cultural power to both bind and loosen’ ethnic identity in Ireland and abroad.³ As William Jenkins notes, the interactions which took place within visible neighbourhood institutions such as churches and schools affected ‘the sorts of conversations and routine practices that were undertaken within other spaces such as homes and meeting halls’.⁴ Therefore, this chapter explores how individuals and groups altered the Catholic communities within Melbourne and Chicago, at times binding, and at others loosening, the links between Irishness and Catholicism. Amidst the onslaughts of modernisation, nativism, and Protestant state intervention, the Catholic Church could provide a haven of continuity and community for immigrants and their children. How ethnicity and religion were linked by the lay and religious representatives of the Catholic Church, particularly in relation to the secular ethnic life examined in chapter two, is the focus of this chapter.

The great migration from Ireland during and in the aftermath of the Famine, prompted the Irish Catholic Church hierarchy and supporters to make efforts to ensure that their increasingly dispersed parishioners could still access religious services and the structures that encouraged continued devotion and religious loyalty.⁵ Women religious played a large role in this diasporic endeavour:

⁴ Jenkins, Between Raid and Rebellion, 107.
teaching Catholic children in parish and private schools, running orphanages, hospitals, and institutions for the elderly and those considered social delinquents. As religious orders of both genders increasingly recruited from all strata of Irish life, especially through All Hallows College, Dublin (established 1842) and St Brigid’s College, Callan (established 1884), Irish communities outside of Ireland benefited from interaction with educated and devoted men and women who had similar experiences and backgrounds to them. Though infrequently dwelt upon, their Catholic identities outweighing their Irishness, this chapter considers the influence that female and male religious orders and secular priests had on linking Irish and Catholic identities in Melbourne and Chicago during the nineteenth century.

Figure 8: Religious Orders in Chicago and Melbourne, 1840-90.

Religious orders provided a visible and vocal Catholic presence and aided the spread of Catholic principles in each city. However the influence of the laity in promoting religious parish life cannot be ignored. This chapter utilises the methodologies of Sarah Roddy and William Jenkins, concentrating on the efforts of the Irish laity to spread Catholicism outside of the church walls and bring Catholic families together in devotion.6 By focusing on the Irish Catholic parishes

of Melbourne and Chicago, this research examines the transnational links that the Irish laity brought with them to the diasporic parish. These lay endeavours were particularly important in Melbourne during the 1850s when there was a total of 13 priests caring for eight missions in Victoria. These Catholics in Chicago were slightly better provided for, but in both cities, the laity took on a role in religious parish life that priests and religious orders could not. The religious parish was a vital point of connection for the Irish abroad and worked alternately in tandem and in conflict with the secular parish. However, despite the lay mobilisation that occurred in both cities, activities still took place within the structures of the religious parish which gave the clergy ‘an in-built advantage’ in their desire to control their parishioners’ activities. These came together within the religious parish where Irish immigrant communities directed their limited resources to establish Catholic parish complexes as beautiful and powerful monuments to their faith and ethnic connections. This investment in religious schools, churches, convents and hospitals, referred to as ‘brick and mortar Catholicism’ by Ellen Skerrett, demonstrably claimed space within the city for Irish Catholic communities while providing a focus for religious parish life. As such, while Colin Barr’s episcopal thesis is considered, this chapter is largely based within the parish not the diocese, using the weekly interactions that shaped the everyday lives and identities of Irish Catholics in Melbourne and Chicago.

The source material for this chapter denotes the different ways that Catholics in both cities interacted with their parishes. It relies heavily on parish histories in Chicago, indicating the strong ties that bound generations of the same family to the local and national church. In an ethnically plural city, the name of a community’s church identified its congregation’s ethnicity and class. In Melbourne, conversely, where Irish people made up the entire Catholic Church laity, there was a greater identification with the wider city, and then suburb and

---

7 Goodman, *Church in Victoria*, 154.
the class of people that lived therein. The record of parish life can therefore be found in the city’s newspapers and city histories instead of parish histories. This chapter examines some of the processes through which the image of, and loyalty to, the religious parish were encouraged and adapted by the clergy, religious communities and the laity. It is an investigation of the structures of parish life, and how Irish Catholic communities adapted to the different challenges they faced in Melbourne and Chicago. This comparison emphasises the importance of the local contexts of each city, the ethnic pluralism or homogeneity of each parish, and the common strands of influence from the Irish origins of its congregation.

Early years.

Melbourne

The early years of Melbourne society were marked by religious cooperation and compromise. While there were moments of sectarian upheaval, for the majority of the first two decades of imperial Melbourne’s life, its inhabitants could not afford to separate themselves based on religion. Even if they had wanted to differentiate themselves, there were simply not enough priests to support their efforts. This was not a product of state religious favouritism, the New South Wales Church Act of 1836 had diminished the power of the Anglican church in the Australian colonies, ensuring that one religion was not overtly financially or legally protected by the state. The early settlers in Melbourne were keen to make the most of this state protected denominational acceptance. Protestants and Catholics spent the 1830s and 1840s working together to build up Melbourne’s infrastructure, donating to the erection of each other’s religious schools and chapels. Father Geoghegan had brought some structure to Port Phillip’s Catholic Church in 1838, however his attempts to make the St Patrick’s Society an Irish Catholic society resulted in tensions between the communities. Religious practice became a private and personal activity until such a time that Ireland’s bishops responded to the laity’s requests for religious leaders to supplement the efforts of Geoghegan and his 13

12 O’Kane, A Path is Set, 4-5.
13 Chapter two, 66-67.
priests. The Catholic laity in Melbourne actively petitioned for religious representation, as did their compatriots from the Protestant faiths. These requests were answered in 1848 when James Alipius Goold was named as the Catholic Bishop of Melbourne, arriving in 1849. Charles Perry, the Anglican Bishop of Melbourne, had been consecrated in 1847 and arrived the year before Goold. At this point, the competition between the Catholic and Protestant bishops signalled a change in the religious harmony of the growing city. Goold determined to create a stronger and more defined Catholic community in Melbourne. Perry felt similarly. Perry’s immediate refusal to acknowledge Goold’s position as a ‘Bishop of Melbourne’ was reflected in a growth of antipathy between Catholics and Anglicans in the city.

While Geoghegan had acted in defence of his parishioners’ civil and religious liberties, Goold sought to protect the authority of his position and the Catholic Church in the city. The arrival of, and backlash to Earl Grey’s Irish orphan girls, 4,000 Irish girls and teenagers sent from Ireland’s workhouses to Sydney, Melbourne, Adelaide, and Hobart presented Goold with his first opportunity to rally Irish Catholics around a common cause. In 1850, Melbourne’s City Council wrote to Queen Victoria and her government representatives to protest the use of the Immigrant Fund to send girls of ‘abandoned character […] the sweepings of Irish workhouses’ to Melbourne instead of those who could provide ‘suitable labour’ for the colony. Goold organised a public meeting in support of the orphans ‘whom the distress of Ireland, unparalleled in the annals of her sufferings, compelled to migrate to this distant Colony’. He endeavoured to connect the Irish in Melbourne to each other, to himself, and to those who remained in Ireland, through religion and common experience of life in Ireland.

14 A. De Q. Robin, ‘Perry, Charles (1807-1891)’, *ADB*.
16 O’Kane, *A Path is Set*, 1.
18 *Geelong Advertiser*, 13 April 1850. The *Argus* continued their attacks on the ‘poor, stunted, ignorant creatures’ over the next weeks, *Argus*, 20 April 1850.
19 April 1850, Goold diary (MDHC).
While Goold took up the Catholic response, others spoke in defence of Irish female virtue and beauty. Rev. A. Dowling, of the Anglican Irish Church Mission to Roman Catholics,\(^{20}\) noted that in virulent anti-Catholic Alderman Kerr’s Melbourne Council address, the “fair daughter of Erin had been assailed - as a man he honored the Irish character, and would defend it from assailants”. Other speakers noted Irish women’s purity, virtue and bravery throughout time, including at the Siege of Limerick when women held back an attack, ‘stimulated by the virtue derived from God through St Patrick’.\(^{21}\) Irishmen of different denominational backgrounds spoke for the Irish orphan girls’ character and goodness, and Goold took on the role of witness for their religious devotion. Two months later, Goold called another meeting of ‘Catholics and the Irish generally’ to ‘repel this low attack on the unprotected orphans of excellent character’.\(^{22}\) The low attack he spoke of was the charge of ‘wholesale prostitution against 1,300 poor unprotected Irish Orphan Females in Melbourne’.\(^{23}\) Instead of being stranded and turning to prostitution, Goold noted that the girls had been brought into Melbourne’s Catholic communities, he had personally given Confirmation to 65 of them, and the majority ‘complied with their religious duties.’\(^{24}\) Goold promoted himself as a link between the Irish Catholic populations of Melbourne, Victoria, and Ireland while bonding his representatives and congregation to his religious and ethnic identities and heritage.

Goold was able to expand these connections between Ireland and Melbourne and as the years progressed he was able to provide support and the promise of community to Irish people, before they had even left Ireland. Within his papers are a noticeable number of letters of introduction from Cardinal Cullen in Dublin. When Mrs Clarke considered emigrating to Melbourne from Navan, she was ‘highly recommended as a person of most excellent character by all those who have been acquainted with her in the above town’.\(^{25}\) The prospective Melbourne parishioner was usually commended by their respectability or their status as a

\(^{20}\) *Freeman’s Journal* (Sydney), 18 October 1856.

\(^{21}\) *Geelong Advertiser*, 20 April 1850.

\(^{22}\) June 1850, Goold diary (MDHC).

\(^{23}\) *Irish Exile and Freedom’s Advocate*, 22 June 1850.

\(^{24}\) June 1850, Goold diary (MDHC).

\(^{25}\) Cullen to Goold, Dublin, 14 September 1852 (Goold Papers, MDHC).
‘sincere and practical Catholic’, and requests for introduction to specific Catholic churches and parish societies often accompanied the letters.26 Letters of introduction, based upon Irish Catholic religious networks, at episcopal and clerical levels, helped new immigrants form bonds with prospective countrymen, while emphasising the homogeneity of Victoria’s lay Catholic Church. After non-Irish Catholic clergy members came into conflict with their parishioners, in Colac (Victoria) ‘indiscreet language [was] used by the clergyman, who is a native of England, and having reference of the country and habits of the congregation, who are all Irish’, Goold sought to have his parishioners’ national background reflected from the pulpit.27 While Irish-born clergymen may have aided ethnic community building in Catholic parishes, it also transferred territorial loyalties from Ireland into an Australian context. Disagreements between All Hallows’ College, Dublin, and St Patrick’s College, Carlow-trained priests and its Cork Diocese-trained Bishop emerged regarding the running and financial administration of the diocese.28 These tensions were mediated through the Catholic hierarchy in Ireland, further emphasising the transnational ties between the Catholic Church in Ireland and Victoria.

To encourage harmony between the Catholic clergy and their Irish parishioners, Goold sought religious support from Ireland. Central to this plan to bond Melbourne’s Catholics together was a unification of their religious and ethnic identities, aided by the arrival of religious communities who would imbue devotion and ritual in younger generations of Catholics. The first to arrive were the Sisters of Mercy who travelled across the country from their temporary base in Perth, Western Australia. The three Irish women arrived in Melbourne in 1857, established a base in Fitzroy and quickly opened the Academy of Mary Immaculate, a fee-paying private school for young ladies.29 The Sisters’ presence soon attracted new blood. By October 1857, the Sisters had their first Australian-born postulant, Miss Butler, joined by a second nine months later, Miss Bambo. This growth in numbers allowed the Sisters ‘to enlarge their sphere of usefulness,

26 Ibid, 15 November 1864.
27 15 July 1853, Goold diary (MDHC).
28 Christopher Dowd, Rome in Australia: The Papacy and Conflict in the Australian Catholic Missions, 1834-1884 (Boston: Brill, 2008), 244-245.
29 Fruits of Fifty Years, 16.
by affording refuge and protection to virtuous Catholic females landing in the colony, through the instrumentality of a House of Mercy.\textsuperscript{30} Seven years after the virtue of Irish women were attacked by the Melbourne City Council, Irish women religious were establishing schools and community institutions which crossed across convent walls into Catholic family homes. Women religious therefore provided a pathway into, and structure around which to form, Catholic communities.

The growth of women religious communities within Ireland during the 1830s and 1840s provided a tradition of convent life that Irish and Irish-descended women and girls would have been aware of by the late 1850s. Experience of convent charity and the vocation of extended family members within Ireland encouraged recruitment within Melbourne. The Sisters of Mercy, and subsequent religious communities, also actively utilised expanding parish and private school systems to encourage Irish and Irish-Australian girls to seek a life of religious service. After three years of residence in Fitzroy, Kate Collins became the fifth recruit admitted into the Sisters of Mercy. Collins, a young lady in possession of ‘a considerable fortune’ followed her sister into the cloister, another sister remaining close by as a boarder at the Sister of Mercy’s school.\textsuperscript{31} Margaret Magray has examined this ‘feeder system’ between convent school and cloister in Ireland, and similar routes into convent life were quickly established in Melbourne. The routinised behaviour encouraged within convent school increased the likelihood of students joining religious orders, in turn, this common experience also augmented the chance of postulants knowing each other.\textsuperscript{32} Religious community life created networks between Victoria’s convents and their Irish counterparts, as well as between religious life and lay associational culture as demonstrated by the Collins sisters. The movement of Irish Catholic women from local families into the cloister, as lay and Choir Sisters, also tied transnational Catholic institutions to the local

\textsuperscript{30} Age, 22 October 1857; Age, 10 June 1858.
\textsuperscript{31} Age, 12 April 1860; Argus, 12 April 1860.
Melbourne parish, creating international and domestic points of convergence based upon religious devotion and Irish heritage.

The work being done by women religious and the clergy were complemented by a group of active and connected Catholic laymen and women. The city’s leading Catholic laymen, along with Father Bleasdale, were instrumental in establishing the Catholic Young Men’s Society (CYMS) in Melbourne. Originally established in Limerick in 1849 by Reverend Dr Richard Baptist O’Brien, Melbourne’s branch opened ten years later and swiftly spread around Victoria. The aim of the society was the ‘fostering, by mutual union and co-operation, and by priestly guidance the spiritual, intellectual, social and physical welfare of its members and in obedience to and under the guidance of the Hierarchy.’ Though principally concerned with the spiritual welfare of their members, the CYMS also included a vital element of further education in its meetings. Evening classes were provided alongside social and physical activities in the Sacred Heart schoolroom, linking parish elementary education provision with a wider need for societal improvement. The CYMS acted as ‘a Catholic version of a mutual improvement society, like the Mechanics Institutes.’ The 1857 expansion of the franchise to all men in Victoria increased this need, with one 1859 lecture declaring that ‘each one of them in a measure held the destinies of this great country in his hand’. While the franchise was withheld from their compatriots in Ireland, those in Victoria had to rise to the challenge of responsible government demonstrating that Irish Catholics could ‘exercise the powers they held, not only with integrity and independence, but with knowledge and intelligence.’ Just as elementary religious education was primarily concerned with the creation of good citizens, Melbourne’s Catholics were cognisant of providing separate educational opportunities to its adults: improving the social and economic opportunities of the community while maintaining their religious priorities.

---

37 Age, 10 May 1859.
The CYMS leaders were training Catholics, who were largely Irish, to be active citizens of Melbourne society. In this way, they were supporting the arguments presented by Melbourne-based promoters of Irish home rule, that Irish people were able to organise and promote responsible government within the British Empire. An examination of the 1863-64 membership list indicates that this desire for the promotion of Catholic young men was achieved. That year, Melbourne’s CYMS included James Francis Hogan, later nationalist M.P. for Tipperary, Samuel V. Winter, who helped to established the Advocate newspaper and later edited the Melbourne Herald, and prominent magistrates, John and James Rowan. The CYMS was training proud Catholic Irish and Irish-Australian men who rose to be leading and influential professionals in Australia and Ireland. While the CYMS provided an outlet for many of Melbourne’s Catholic young men another improvement society was sought to encourage men to save and therefore protect themselves and their families from the changing whims of an industrialising city, especially within an economy based upon speculation. In response to this need, members of the CYMS organising committee established the St Francis’ Benefit Society in 1864. Goold was heavily involved in the society’s establishment, considering it to be a viable alternative to ‘objectionable societies with signs and passwords’. As previous chapters have argued, organisations such as the CYMS and St Francis’ Benefit Society combined with the separate schooling of Catholic children by Irish religious orders to form a clear group of adults in the 1870s and 1880s who promoted Irish and Catholic culture and heritage. This cultural affinity could then be built upon, primarily by Irish and Irish-descended men, to encourage engagement with Irish ethnic fraternalism and nationalism within Melbourne. This active participation with political Irish nationalism was enabled by the foundational connections of religious education and parish life which provided a common experience based within Irish diasporic life.

38 John W. Howard, The First Thirty Years’ Rise and Progress of the Hibernian Australasian Catholic Benefit Society (Melbourne, 1896), 58.
39 John Howard and Edward Nolan were involved in the establishment of both the CYMS and the St Francis’ Benefit Society. By July 1869, there were an estimated 220 members of the benefit society. Advocate, 17 July 1869.
40 Howard, First Thirty Years, 14-15.
The religious education provided by the Sisters of Mercy was supplemented by the Sisters of the Good Shepherd in the aftermath of the 1862 Common Schools Act. After establishing the Abbotsford Convent in 1863, to provide care and education for orphan and reform children, they too were eagerly joined by the daughters of Irish Catholics from the colony. Just as with religious education of children, the reformatory care of children in Catholic institutions was a cause of controversy in the Legislative Council and in the newspapers. The 1864 Reformatories Bill followed the precedent of the Common Schools Act, aiming to provide state-aided reform schools for juveniles of all denominations, with religious instruction provided by visiting clergymen. Concerns were raised by lay and clerical Catholic leaders who worried about the mixing of Catholic children with non-Catholic children, a central concern of Pope Pius IX’s 1864 Syllabus of Errors. The Age argued that as the Catholic clergy forbade the children of faithful Catholics from attending common schools, they should also take on the burden of establishing their own reformatory institutions.41 Women religious, soon to be joined by their male counterparts, provided an alternative option to state sanctioned, and Protestant-influenced, institutions. In this way, they created a sense of belonging to, and dependence on, the religious parish which was imperative to the future Catholic family units of the city, particularly within areas of Melbourne society where networks of financial and familial support were unavailable.

The Church of St Francis, next to the Bishop’s house, acted as a hub for the CYMS and other Catholic activities, bringing parishioners together from across Melbourne. This was Melbourne’s Catholic Church, near to the Fitzroy convent and a short walk from the State Library of Victoria, religious and secular representations of Melbourne’s Irish-led reforming endeavours. It was at the other side of Melbourne’s epicentre from the Anglican Church, creating a clearly delineated Catholic space which would soon become the site of its cathedral. As the 1860s progressed, new branches of the CYMS extended into the suburbs, following the exodus of Catholics from the centre of Melbourne. The movement

41 Age, 16 February 1864.
of weekly meetings of the CYMS and other religious organisations into the suburbs encouraged parishioners to socialise with other Irish people from the same Melbourne suburb, and often class and occupational background, as them. Though these branches slowly encouraged Irish parishioners to base themselves in their suburbs, St Francis’ Church continued to act as a central base for ethnic and religious celebrations and occasions, helping to facilitate a common Irish and Catholic city-wide parish to marshal the activities of each suburb and club, family and individual voter.

Chicago

The Catholic diocese of Chicago was established in November 1843, and welcomed its first bishop Irish-born William Quarter in 1844. Quarter’s arrival signalled the creation of a parish system in Chicago that would alter Chicago’s Catholic interactions with the rest of society until the 1960s. The main distinction was Quarter’s decision to separate the English-speaking and predominantly Irish Catholic churches from non-English language churches. The justification for this was that the church was a place of calm, recollection, and community, and part of this was communion in a parishioner’s native language. The ‘national parish’ system was therefore reflected out from the church into schools and clubs, and through the religious orders who arrived to staff them. The first separate church was for the city’s German population, and was soon followed by French Canadian, Polish, Bavarian, and later Italian congregations. The English-language parishes were quickly dominated by Irish immigrants and their Irish clergy, helping to create ethnic and linguistic links between priest and parishioner. An Irish Catholic religious community based around nationality, connected but outwith Sunday Mass, was encouraged by the arrival of Irish women religious to run parochial schools, hospitals, and orphanages in 1846. These women, and their male teaching counterparts, worked to promote a sense of transnational community: bridging the ocean between Ireland and Chicago, via Rome. Through their position in institutions utilised by the whole community, men, women, children, across society’s class divisions, the American Irish Catholic Church was
therefore able to influence new generations of Irish and Irish American Catholics, linking ethnic and religious identities within an American immigrant church.\(^{42}\)

While later arrivals of women religious from Germany and other Catholic countries helped to expand the Church’s welfare provision within Chicago, for the first ten years Irish Catholics dominated the city’s provision. The first five women religious to arrive were Sisters of Mercy, originally from Ireland. These women, the oldest of whom was 24, soon established themselves within Chicago. The women became recognisable as the ‘Walking Nuns’, emphasising a particular brand of religious service brought from Ireland: obedience and humility balanced with meaningful service.\(^{43}\) Recruiting from within the United States quickly began, and by the outbreak of the Civil War, the Sisters of Mercy had accepted 100 members into their convent, built the city’s first permanent hospital, while concurrently establishing and running parochial schools, select academies, and orphan asylums. Amidst stories of Irish women running bars or drunkenly fighting,\(^{44}\) women of the habit provided Irish Catholics with an image of moral agency. Sister Mary Agatha noted, a year after their arrival, that

\[\text{Our Schools are already numerous - every moment that can be spared from religious exercises - the Sisters are occupied in teaching the poor, or in instructing the ignorant in their catechism, or teaching protestants (many of whom visit us) that Faith and doctrine of the Catholic Church, or else, in visiting the Sick.}\(^{45}\)

In visiting the sick, these women took their lives in their hands, and often lost them. The cholera outbreak of 1854 led to the death of four Sisters of Mercy, a devastating loss for the small community.\(^{46}\) Later that year, the Sisters opened St Agatha’s Academy in memory of their Mother Superior, Mary Agatha, who had died of the disease. They opened a Magdalen asylum in 1858, soon transferring its

\(^{42}\) Gilley, ‘Roman Catholic Church’.
\(^{43}\) Brosnan, ‘Public Presence’.
\(^{44}\) Newspapers frequently listed the ethnicity of those arrested for public disorder; McGreevy, \textit{Catholicism}, 94.
\(^{45}\) Sister Mary Agatha (St Francis Xavier Academy for Young Ladies, Chicago) to the President of the Society for the Propagation of the Faith at Lyons, 4 December 1847 (Madaj Collection, Box 1, ACA).
\(^{46}\) \textit{Daily National Intelligencer}, 31 July 1854.
control to the four newly arrived Irish Sisters of the Good Shepherd. The selfless charity demonstrated by the Sisters of Mercy connected them to their parishioners, encouraging the expansion of the religious community and the work that they could do. The Sisters of Mercy were joined by the Sisters of the Holy Cross in 1856, Sisters of St Joseph’s Carondolet (1858), Sisters of Charity (1858), and the Religious of the Sacred Heart (1859), providing support for parochial schools that male religious could not compete with. The Irish brothers of the Dutch Jesuit Province and the Irish Christian Brothers had an important presence, however male religious orders did not have the numbers or mission statement to construct ‘a miniature welfare state’ as the Irish women in the city did. When male religious orders were based in schools, they focused their efforts on post-elementary education and most boys’ schools were run by lay teachers during the 1860s. Women religious, conversely, staffed their own schools as well as the hospitals and refuges that they administered. Irish-born and descended women were therefore the most frequent representatives of a joint Irish and Catholic identity in the everyday lives of Chicago’s immigrant Irish communities, more approachable than the priest and more ubiquitous.

Women religious helped the women and children of Chicago, but they also worked to improve the infrastructure of the Church. In 1855 the ‘lady teachers and pupils’ of St Agatha’s Academy presented Quarter’s successor, Bishop O’Regan with ‘a purse containing $100, in gold, to aid in building his house.’ They were helping to raise the profile of the Church in Chicago, using their links within the parish to tie the bishop to his congregation. Similarly, in 1859 the lay members of Holy Family Parish managed to donate $1,004 within ten weeks for stained glass windows. The collection for the main altar of the Holy Family church took place between 1863 and 1865, and in the absence of enlisted husbands, the subscriber

---

48 Andreas, History of Chicago, v2.
50 Chicago Directory, 1868 & 1878.
51 Leader, 10 March 1855.
lists note donations from women, ranging from $2 to $25. This focus on institution building, ‘brick and mortar Catholicism’, was criticised by the Chicago Tribune in 1857 who noted the numbers of Irish beggars in Chicago in need of help while the Irish Catholic bishop lived in a large mansion. Despite these criticisms, Ellen Skerrett has argued that ‘churches and schools became important symbols of respectability and commitment’ for the Irish Catholics who first established parishes in Chicago. The support of the parish therefore ‘became a prime objective of Irish immigrants as they moved up the social ladder’. As poor Irish people continued to arrive in Chicago, Irish parishioners were forced to balance charitable activity with ambitions for an institutional presence for the Catholic Church in the city, and to conceal internal strife for the sake of external pride.

Chicago’s Catholic laity did not just contribute financially to the religious parish, they also established their own organisations to complement the secular and ethnic fraternities that had begun to emerge during the 1850s. The first of these was the Society of St Vincent de Paul, established in the Holy Family Parish in January 1858. It operated using a system of two or three men who called on parishioners for contributions, in the form of money or provisions, for the poor of the community. Four ladies then ‘constituted a committee to visit the poor to prevent imposition, and give the deserving tickets for supplies.’ By 1861, there were seven conferences of the Society of St Vincent de Paul in Chicago. The committee membership of these conferences overlapped with the leadership of the Hibernian Benevolent Society established in 1852 and the Benevolent Society of the United Sons of Erin, uniting the laity in their ethnic and religious identities, as well as providing a group of community leaders across Chicago. Despite these connections across Irish associational culture, the Society of St Vincent de Paul were ‘principally laborers and mechanics - the true and ever faithful friends of the

54 Skerrett, ‘Brick and Mortar Catholicism’.
55 Ibid.
56 Whelan, ‘Religious Rivalry’.
57 Mulkerins, Holy Family, 18-20.
58 Mulkerins, Holy Family, 18-20.
59 Chicago Directory, 1861.
poor and friendless.  

The Society of St Vincent de Paul was an example of working class Irish people helping out their peers while they were in a financial position to do so. Many Irish immigrants were reliant on a precarious labour market, and participation in such organisations in wealth could help a family when they were in financial difficulties. As these conferences were based within the national parish, there was a further connection to the local Irish Catholic community as a support network to be relied upon in times of need.

While the laity may have led the committees of these societies, they were organised with the aid of parish clergy, enabling the communication of clerical values to the laity. This, according to Brian P. Clarke’s work on Irish Catholics in Toronto, was in order to avoid tensions between a clergy wary of lay activism and an enthusiastic congregation. Seizing on the desire for religious social and devotional organisations, and supported by the arrival of more religious communities, Chicago’s Catholic churches began to establish sodalities to unite their parishioners from school age to adulthood. The Married Men’s Sodality was established in the Holy Family Parish in 1859, and ‘was from the beginning the mainstay of the parish…the right hand of the pastor in carrying on his wonderful work.’ The married men’s organisation was soon followed by the ‘Congregation of the Consolers of Mary’, a school sodality based in Sacred Heart school in 1860. This was complemented by the Young Ladies’ Sodality in 1861, and St Anne Sodality (the Married Ladies’ Sodality) in 1862. Similar organisations emerged in Chicago’s other parishes and schools, uniting parish congregations around their church and ethnicity. These sodalities encouraged devotion and community bonds: while membership of a sodality promised protection of a person’s soul during life and death, it also required collecting funds from other parishioners, visiting sick members, attendance at funerals, and charitable services. These activities brought members together in religious and charitable endeavour, and helped local clergymen to establish a clear parish community, financially and

---

60 Irish American Weekly, 17 October 1863.
62 Mulkerins, Holy Family, 548.
63 Mulkerins, Holy Family, 24, 454, 565 & 579.
spiritually. These sodalities encouraged a sense of interdependence, particularly for women left without their husbands and brothers during the Civil War.

During the Civil War, women religious continued to encourage their own reputation as the ‘church’s shock troops’. In 1861, the Sisters of Mercy were renamed the ‘soldiers of Mercy’ when they travelled to Missouri and then to the Empress, a hospital ship of the United States Sanitary Commission, to tend to the wounded. When an Irish Brigade for Chicago was raised, James Mulligan asked the Irish Sisters of Mercy to accompany them to tend to their injured. They returned to Chicago in May 1862 and their work was continued by the Daughters of Charity who closed their school the following month to go and tend to the sick in Philadelphia. Women religious at home visited the sick and wounded Confederate prisoners in Camp Douglas, a camp commanded by Colonel Benjamin Sweet, a parent at the Sisters’ St Xavier’s Academy. The laity also played their part in supporting the religious community during the Civil War, organising bazaars and fundraiser concerts. In April 1864 a ‘grand union fair’ was held in Bryan Hall for the benefit of the city’s orphans. The following year, the ‘ladies of the parish’ were again called upon to support the Society of St Vincent de Paul’s fair which lasted two weeks and included visits from 400 boys from the St Patrick’s schools, and 120 boys from the orphan asylum on one day. These were opportunities for Chicago’s Catholics to fundraise for their institutions, but considering the amount of dancing and musical entertainments, they were also opportunities for the members of the gender-segregated organisations to come together to enjoy themselves. Events may have encouraged mixing, but they were organised for specific parish institutions and by parish-based societies, parishes that were separated by nationality. These events were concerned with Irish Catholics meeting Irish Catholics from elsewhere in the city, further encouraging identification and socialisation with a particular Irish and Catholic community.

64 Hoy, Good Hearts, 37.
65 Chicago Tribune, 18 September 1861.
66 Hoy, Good Hearts, 41–42.
67 Mulkerins, Holy Family, 43.
68 Daily Inter Ocean, 15 October 1865; Daily Inter Ocean, 4 November 1865.
These connections were based within networks of middle-class Catholics and then expanded upwards and downwards to create a sense of unity within the Irish Catholic parish. Despite this vertical and cross-class interaction, the status quo of the Catholic parish’s power structures was maintained through familial and economic ties. An examination of the leading voices in Chicago’s Irish Catholic parishes reveals intergenerational connections between active middle-class Catholic families, the Catholic education system, and the cloister. An Irish Catholic family could therefore improve their social standing through effective engagement with the religious parish within Chicago and further afield.

After the cholera-induced death of Mother Agatha, Mother Vincent became the Superior of the Chicago Sisters of Mercy. Mother Vincent, and her sister Sister Francis Xavier, connected lay and religious power through their brother, Professor John McGirr who was the Professor of Anatomy at St Mary’s on the Lake, author of Bishop Quarter’s biography, and president of the Hibernian Benevolent Society. A similar familial connection across lay and religious Irish life can be seen through Mr and Mrs Redmond Sheridan a decade later. The Sheridan family lived at 375 West Taylor Street within the Holy Family Parish: Mr Sheridan was the first president of the St Vincent de Paul conference in that parish in 1860, and Mrs Agnes Sheridan was the first prefect of the Married Ladies’ Sodality. The Sheridan family were therefore already heavily involved in the parish life of Chicago when they sent their daughter to the Sacred Heart Academy on its opening day. In 1873, their daughter became Mother Sheridan of the Madames of Sacred Heart, succeeding Irishwoman Madame Gallwey. As the years progressed, the leaders of Chicago’s Catholic female religious orders were products of its American, and Irish, schools and sodalities. They continued existing middle-class influences within the Catholic parish, and remained connected to lay life through their family members.

69 Mulkerins, Holy Family, 471.
70 Ibid, 473.
During the early years of the Catholic Church of Melbourne and Chicago, religious parish life emerged in varying ways. The key difference was where this ‘parish’ was envisioned to be. In Chicago the parish was based largely on local geography, dictated by the national parish system, linking ethnicity with religious allegiance from the 1840s. The early arrival of women religious from Ireland encouraged this centring of life around local provision. Melbourne’s Catholic Church was limited by a lack of clerical and religious in its founding years. Instead, Irish Catholics in Melbourne made the most of the resources that they did have by focusing their activities around St Francis’ Church. This central concentration was enabled by the ethnic homogeneity of the Melbourne Catholic Church, subconsciously linking Irish and Catholic religious life while allowing for the secular defence of Irish virtue and goodness. Due to the ethnic make-up of the Catholic Church in Melbourne and Chicago, and the choices of parish structure implemented by the Catholic hierarchy in the 1840s and early 1850s, Catholic identity was centred around the contrasting images of the parish and the city. This began to change with the arrival of Irish religious communities in Melbourne coinciding with the gradual movement of Catholics into the suburbs. While based in differing abstract locales, the religious parishes in Melbourne and Chicago were linked by their dependence on active middle-class community leaders who built upon familial and professional networks. In both cities, the organisers of religious parish life were also connected through ethnic secular life, through the St Patrick’s Society in Melbourne and organisations such as the Hibernian Benevolent Society in Chicago. Irish religious and ethnic parish life therefore enjoyed and relied upon a symbiotic relationship between members and organisers, contemporaneously encouraging the continuation and evolution of a sense of Irish diasporic community.

Middle years.

Irish Catholic institutions had spread across both Melbourne and Chicago by 1865, taking with them the religious and social priorities of the Catholic hierarchy into the everyday worlds of each city’s Irish communities. While the Catholic Church provided social and educational opportunities for Irish men and women in Melbourne and Chicago, there was an emphasis on Irish women, both as ‘the
occasions of sin’ and as providers of succour. This condemnation of women who
did not conform to ideals of domesticity had become central to Irish society in the
aftermath of the Famine, and was reflected in the emergence of Magdalen
laundries and female reform institutions in both Melbourne and Chicago during
the 1860s.\textsuperscript{72} While the Irish Catholic origins of these reform institutions cannot be
ignored, it must also be acknowledged that these cities were stabilising societies
during the late 1860s. Members of the each society’s middle class and
professional elite were seeking to improve the international recognition of their
city, moving away from their frontier foundations and the resultant crime and
poverty associated with immigrant communities. Irish-born religious orders were
supplemented numerically by local girls and women who had benefitted from
schooling within the ethnic religious parish and the growing welfare provision
within each city. Irish institutions were therefore adapted for these urban
requirements just as they had been introduced in Ireland from French contexts.

Women were regarded as the primary providers of moral and religious education
in the young. If this provision did not come from nuns, it was provided by
mothers, aunts, and sisters.\textsuperscript{73} Religious education was therefore imperative for
women of all classes in continuing devotion in Melbourne and Chicago’s parishes.
As the religious community expanded, the laity were called upon to actively
counter the threat of poverty and loss of virtue within Irish society abroad. The
Irish Catholic Church therefore, though controlled by the clergy and engaged
middle class, was able to influence the lives of Catholics throughout Melbourne
and Chicago. Using social and charitable activities and the presence of Irish-born
and trained religious representatives, the priorities of the local Catholic Church
and the Irish Church could be linked. Thomas Harmon noted in 1916 that a parish
priest is dependent ‘to a great extent upon the co-operation and moral support of
his parishioners; the willing hands and the hearty support of early settlers’.\textsuperscript{74}

\textsuperscript{72} Nolan, \textit{Ourselves Alone}, p.36.
\textsuperscript{73} Martha Kanya-Forstner, ‘Defining Womanhood: Irish Women and the Catholic Church in
Victorian Liverpool’ in MacRaid (ed.), \textit{Great Famine}, 168-188.
\textsuperscript{74} Thomas L. Harmon, \textit{Fifty years of parish history: Church of the Annunciation, Chicago, Ill.,
Melbourne | Chicago  
---|---
1850 | 0 | 40  
1860 | 13 | 57  
1870 | 53 | 79  
1880 | 67 | 128  
1890 | 106 | 349  

*Figure 9: Members of Irish Female Catholic Religious Orders.*


Chicago statistics compiled from U.S. Federal Census 1850-1880; *Hoffmann’s Catholic Directory, Almanac and Clergy List - Quarterly, For the Year of Our Lord* (Chicago & Milwaukee: Hoffman Bros., 1891). These figures were compiled by census returns based on the search terms ‘nun’, ‘Sister’, and ‘Mother Superior’. Later census return questions allow for the examination of nativity of these nuns, earlier returns do not allow for this, but literature on the foundations of these orders provide information on the nativity of their founding sisters. Irish religious orders: Sisters of Mercy, Sisters of Charity BVM, Sisters of St Joseph, Little Sisters of the Poor, Sisters of the Good Shepherd.

While chapter two noted a flux in the leadership of secular parish organisations, religious organisations expanded and evolved over the nineteenth century, boosted by the arrival of religious communities and growing sectarian tensions in both cities. As the Catholic Church in Melbourne and Chicago expanded, the control of parish life changed hands depending on the personalities and resources of the local community. While the Irish background of these women linked the communities implicitly, the training of male religious often brought with it more explicit ethnic pride. For Chicago’s Irish, in particular, religious organisations provided a religious and ethnic continuity that was lacking in secular fraternalism.

*Melbourne*

While increasing numbers of women religious arrived in Melbourne from Ireland, the established communities were joined by local girls who had benefited from their educational influence. Their institutions were both gratefully received and
sources of curiosity for non-Catholics in Melbourne, particularly communities like the Sisters of the Good Shepherd who were viewed as ‘reclaiming the lowest and worst kind of outcasts, the old miserable “maneaters” of society’. In 1867 it was reported that 248 female penitents had been admitted to Magdalen Asylum over the previous four years, of whom 170 were ‘discharged, reclaimed, and fitted for the pursuit of honest and good livelihoods’. The reputation of the Sisters in improving the lives of the city’s poor and despised encouraged new postulants, as did the routinised behaviour of convent school life. Miss Egan (in religion, Sister Ignatius) was accepted into the Sisters of Mercy after her education at the ‘Convent Boarding School, and had not remained long in her parental home when she returned to the institution as a novice’. In 1869, the Order of the Good Shepherd received four postulants and three more made their profession of vows, acting to ‘relieve the good nuns from their unremitting and too severe labours.’ These women, and their Irish background, thereby influenced the communities that they ministered to, both in their spiritual and their ethnic identity. Religious culture was supported by the growth of public institutions such as schools and benefit societies. However it is noticeable that when a dinner of congratulations was held for the Good Shepherd nuns’ work, Fr. Dalton was the one to return the thanks ‘on behalf of the Nuns’. These women may have been transplanted to a completely new society, but the traditional hierarchy of the Catholic Church continued to dictate relations within religious communities.

Women religious from Ireland were, by 1870, providing education, care, and moral reprobation for all levels of Irish Melbourne society, and promoting the generosity and selflessness of Irish Catholics in wider society. While the Sisters of Mercy and Good Shepherd provided much of the charitable and educational provision, in 1865 they were joined by members of the Irish Province of Jesuits and two years later, the Christian Brothers. These men slowly took control of the management of the city’s Catholic male schools and orphanages. The Jesuits, in particular, were vital in ensuring the role of Irish politics and tradition in

---

75 *Argus*, 27 January 1877.
76 *Advocate*, 21 March 1868.
77 *Advocate*, 9 October 1869.
78 *Advocate*, 12 June 1869.
Australian Catholicism. As Catholic higher education opportunities expanded in Ireland during the early nineteenth century, later generations of Irish Catholics within the diaspora benefited from the products of linked Irish and Catholic education through men like Father Joseph Dalton SJ. Dalton witnessed the influence of newspapers, education, and pulpit in shaping identification with the nation during the mid-century, and sought to utilise these tools to create an Irish Catholic voice in Melbourne. His Richmond parish included John O’Shanassy, Michael O’Grady, and Peter Lalor, providing the Jesuit educator with a powerful and connected Irish Catholic audience. Additionally, Dalton worked with one of his parishioners, Samuel V. Winter (a CYMS graduate) and other leading Catholic men, to establish the Advocate newspaper in 1868 coinciding with the increase in debate about religious education. The Irish Jesuits worked within the parish system to complement community institutions that the laity had established, resulting in an Irish Catholic society that was being attacked from the outside and supported from within.

It was not just men who collaborated between cassock and congregant to improve the standing of Irish Catholic priorities and institutions in the city, laywomen supported their local Catholic institutions financially through bazaars and fundraising committees. Annette Shiell had argued that the charity bazaar model was brought to Australia by the Irish Sisters of Mercy, continuing a ‘philosophy and strategy of fundraising’ which had been developed by the Order in the 1820s and 1830s. The increasing movement of religious parish life from the central hub into the suburbs was reflected in bazaar organisation. As the majority of Melbourne’s Catholics were Irish, there was no need to refer to church name to denote the national allegiances of the congregation. Instead, the suburb became the local base for parish activities. One bazaar in honour of the Sister of Mercy’s St Vincent de Paul Orphanage, which sheltered almost 300 children, was set out based on suburb. The female committee ordered the six fundraising stalls around

---

79 Murphy, ‘Irish Jesuit Schooling’.
81 Naughtin, ‘Melbourne Advocate’.
suburb, placing adverts in the newspaper and linking women who would have seen each other on a weekly basis at church and on the street. The Advocate facilitated this sense of parish organisation and unity. A similar bazaar was held the following year to help the Sisters of the Good Shepherd maintain, clothe, educate, and train 140 female children, as well as 98 ‘female penitents’. More bazaars were held to help the various religious communities pay off debts incurred when expanding their buildings and institutions, with suburban committees joining together to support a rotating number of charities based in different areas of the city. In this way, parish communities were still linked centrally to work towards a fairer and respectable Melbourne.

When Mother Mary of St Joseph, the Superior of the Sisters of the Good Shepherd, died suddenly in 1869 a committee was established to raise funds to erect a memorial chapel in her name. The wives and daughters of prominent Melbourne men, Mrs P. J. Martin, Mrs M. Curtain, and Mrs A. C. Brownless for example, led a system of local collections in Melbourne and the suburbs. Studying the lists of women involved in Catholic charity bazaars during the late 1860s and 1870s illuminates a core group of laywomen, mainly married to leading Catholic politicians and professionals present in the rolls of the St Patrick’s Society. As well as being connected through social and religious ties, these women were linked to the work of women religious in the community, often between teacher and parent or pupil. Women were also involved in the Melbourne Ladies’ Benevolent Society, and collections were made in all the Catholic churches in the city and suburbs for the support of their work in 1871. While women were involved in the creation of community spirit for the good, their work also aided the subversion of Protestant-inspired state legislation. The Sisters of Mercy declared in 1879 that all ‘proceeds of Bazaars, &c., are most faithfully divided by the Sisters of Mercy, between the two departments of the Institution, Girls and Boys, and subscribers are earnestly requested to specify…that this division may

83 Advocate, 6 March 1869; Advocate, 26 June 1869.
84 Advocate, 1 October 1870.
85 Ibid; Advocate, 21 December 1872; Advocate, 28 September 1878.
86 Advocate, 30 September 1871.
be made’. Equal donations to the education of both genders were required in order to ensure that government grants continued to the religious institution.

The St Francis’ Benefit Society had evolved into the Hibernian Australasian Catholic Benefit Society (HACBS) by 1871, bringing branches together from across the Australian and New Zealand colonies. The transnational organisation linked Irish people together through bureaucracy and centralised conventions, while providing a ready-made support network across Australasia for those on the move. Societies such as the HACBS provided a source of financial support, but were also important in encouraging a linked Irish, Australasian, and Catholic identity. Within the HACBS this was achieved through the provision of opportunities to participate in ethnic public ceremonies, and to ‘cherish the memory of Ireland’ through engagement with Irish history and culture. The CYMS meanwhile encouraged the study of Irish history ‘to obviate the reproach of indifference, to cultivate a spirit of individual independence and self-respect’. Catholic associations encouraged debate and education, preparing the politicians, journalists, and voters of the future to think for themselves, but based on a core set of values of Catholic education and devotion. The Advocate and the political debates on Ireland and Victorian religious education that were presented therein continued the efforts of young men’s sodalities, the CYMS, the HACBS, and similar associations based in and around the parish. These lay and clerical endeavours also contributed to the emerging transnational links with Irish nationalist organisations in Ireland and elsewhere in the diaspora. After Goold declared that Catholic parishioners needed to separate themselves from mixed friendly and oath-bound societies at the risk of excluding ‘themselves from participation in the benefits derivable from communion with the Romish Church’, there was a greater need for interaction with proudly Catholic societies.

87 The St Patrick’s College Gazette, December 1879 (JAD).
88 The Irish-Catholic Benefit Society (originally the St Francis’ Benefit Society) amalgamated the Catholic Benefit Society with the other Irish benefit societies in 1871, resulting in the HACBS name.
89 Bourke, Catholic Church, 74.
90 Howard, First thirty years, 10.
91 Ballarat Courier, 15 July 1873.
The 1872 Education Act precipitated the arrival of the Presentation Sisters from Limerick in 1874, as well as more Jesuits and Christian Brothers. Highlighting the local and transnational links between Melbourne’s Irish parishioners and Ireland, Fr Corbett welcomed the Sisters to St Kilda with ‘an interesting and touching account of the departure of the Nuns from Limerick for their distant new home from a Limerick Paper’. The Sisters soon established a select day school providing ‘a thorough education’ for the young ladies in the suburb ‘young, highly educated, and of respectable parentage’ nuns. These were women who would fit into the affluent suburb well, presumably coming from a similar class to those that they would be teaching and influencing. The Presentation Sisters were one of five religious communities, male and female, that worked within Melbourne until 1882. These women, respectable and educated, were aiding women and children from across the city, not just Irish or Catholics, and thereby extending their influence outside of the Catholic parish. While the Irish women religious of the city received thanks and interest from non-Catholics in Melbourne, the male religious courted scandal. They, along with Archbishop Goold and Irish Catholic politicians, became the focus of anti-Catholic feeling related in part to their primary role as educators and influencers.

Religious and educational priorities and fears were brought together with dramatic effect when Fr. Dalton was arrested for the ‘kidnap’ of two children, Mary Ann and Ellen Bates. The children, raised Protestant, were taken by Dalton from a neighbour’s house after the death of their mother. Dalton argued that the children were actually Catholic, their mother’s dying request for a Catholic priest was proof of this, and in the absence of any relatives, they should be raised in a Catholic orphanage. The battle for Dalton’s good reputation, and by extension the reputation of the Catholic Church in Victoria, was fought in the Argus and Age illustrating the importance of the newspaper press in shaping approaches to religious and social control during the 1870s and 1880s. The Protestant press berated Dalton, the Catholic Church, and all those who defended Dalton’s actions, for over six months. Concurrently, a meeting of Catholic subscribers raised

---

92 Advocate, 7 February 1874.
93 Advocate, 17 January 1874; Advocate, 24 January 1874.
enough money to pay Dalton’s attorney’s bill and other expenses that the Jesuit had incurred ‘in the support of the children’. The chair of the committee, Mr Fitzgerald remarked,

the charges made against Father Dalton were not made against him as an individual, but as a Catholic priest, and as every Irish Catholic and descendant of an Irish Catholic was ever ready to come to the back of his priest and take a share in his sufferings, Father Dalton’s friends came to his support on this occasion in this spirit.94

In the contentious atmosphere of the mid-1870s, Melbourne’s Catholics rushed to the defence of their influential priest, and the Catholic Church more widely. The Advocate provided a counter voice in the press, uniting Catholics behind a joint religious and ethnic identity rooted in Irish lay support for their priests.

Melbourne’s Irish Catholics did not only fundraise for their own institutions, they also participated in efforts to improve the status of the Catholic Church around the world, particularly in Ireland. Visiting priests engaged in speaking tours of Australia to fundraise for building efforts encouraging a sense of linked churches when Rev. Peter Byrne preached a sermon in St Francis’ Church in aid of St McCartin’s Church in Monaghan.95 Closer to home, Catholics were encouraged to take heed of the building work taking place in Ireland to donate to local building funds. In one sermon, Cardinal Wiseman noted that in Ireland, ‘Wherever he went, notwithstanding the poverty of the people, he saw churches, colleges, and religious houses erected.’ If people struggling in Ireland could find the funds,

Father Finn pathetically reminded his hearers of the last sad farewell which they took of home and country, and asked them if they did not remember that the parting words of the good old father and mother were – “Go abroad, my children, and prosper but mind your religion.” He appealed to them that day, in virtue of that pious parental charge, to aid in a great work of religion – the erection of a grand temple to Almighty God, under the invocation of St. Patrick, the apostle of their country.96

94 Mercury, 17 July 1875; Advocate, 4 December 1875.
95 Advocate, 26 June 1869.
96 Advocate, 5 December 1874.
It may have taken decades to build, but St Patrick’s Cathedral once again became the central focus of Catholic in Melbourne. Dedicated in 1851, it was finally consecrated in 1897 after years of partial use. Not only was St Patrick’s a powerful reminder of the strength and presence of Catholics in the city, its patron saint, and the Daniel O’Connell statue which was erected in front of the Cathedral in 1891, was a reminder of the linked Irish and Catholic identities of its builders and funders.97

Chicago

The end of the Civil War brought increased industrialisation and wealth to Chicago, and with this, new communities of Irish Catholics. The Church of the Annunciation was one result of this transplantation of people into new areas of Chicago. St Columbkille’s was the closest ‘Irish’ church to the Rolling Mills area of Chicago and with a parish radius of five to six miles, this was not conducive to a close or devout congregation. A frame church was erected in 1866, receiving a resident pastor, a ‘zealous young priest, fresh for the shores of his native Ireland’ to join a congregation principally made up of immigrants from County Clare in 1868. A parish school was established and taken over by the Sisters of Charity, B.V.M., an Irish community, in 1872.98 The official history of the church took great pride in noting how many of the women from the parish entered the Sisters of Charity convent. Similarly, the Holy Family Parish history listed 11 pages of the names of women who had entered the Sacred Heart Sisters from the parish and their schools.99 The feeder system, from school to cloister was a matter of satisfaction and community creation for families and local historians alike. While priests in the immigrant church have been described as ‘neighborhood chieftains’, religious sisters, who were subordinate to priests, ‘were spiritual authorities of immense significance for the children in their classrooms and objects of reverent respect in the larger community.’100 Boys did not tend to spend as long in schools as their sisters, therefore for men secular parish life was in direct competition with

97 Sydney Morning Herald, 1 June 1891.
98 Harmon, Church of the Annunciation, 5-6.
99 Harmon, Church of the Annunciation; Mulkerins, Holy Family.
the religious. For Catholic girls, who tended to stay in school for a longer time, the birth to death influence on their everyday lives increased female interaction with the religious authority of women in the parish.101

For those who did not or could not attend a Catholic school during the week, the Sunday School Association was established in the city in the late 1860s, encouraging children and young adults to continue their education within the church. The Sunday School Association served another purpose of investing members of the parish in the improvement of all. Each year, two men were assigned to each district ‘to go from house to house’ to collect one dollar from each family for the upkeep of Sunday schools and the distribution of Catholic literature to those in need. In return, subscribers received a copy of the monthly educational publication, The Messenger, and four Masses were said each month for the spiritual well-being of the members.102 The organisers of the Sunday School Association provided support for their students in spiritual matters as well as educational, attending all the public functions of the schools, including processions on First Communion and Confirmation Days. Described as ‘a most devoted bodyguard for the children’, these adults provided students with community networks linked to the Church, parish, and professional society.103 For many middle-class parishioners, they ‘had to identify as Catholics and Irish, but Irishness could be a taken-for-granted background social fact. This privileged Catholicism’.104 One way to improve the position of the wider Irish population of Chicago was through charitable activity, a popular option for the middle classes around the world during the later decades of the nineteenth century.

The Great Fire of 1871 brought new challenges for Chicago’s inhabitants, and the Catholic Church therein. Catholic parishes in the centre of the city were faced with burned-down churches, orphanages and schools, displaced children and families, and a serious shortage of money to replace the hard-saved cash that had allowed for the infrastructural expansion of the previous 15 years. One descendant

101 Nolan, Servants of the Poor, 85-86.
102 Mulkerins, Holy Family, 464.
103 Mulkerins, Holy Family, 459.
104 Kelleher, ‘Class and Catholic’.
of a St Mary’s parishioner noted that her father and his friend, ‘prudent far-seeing young men’, had run into the burning church to rescue the parish records. The local church was the keeper of family histories and the links between family and community. In a time when marriage and baptism records were needed to claim Civil War pensions, this salvage of church records was particularly vital. Despite the hardships brought about by the Chicago Fire, parishioners sought to restore the Church’s institutions. When the Good Shepherd nuns and their wards were left without a home, those who could donated stone and lumber to help rebuild the city’s institutions in the absence of monetary support. Catholic lay charities also continued to distribute relief through previously established charitable associations linked to the Church. Though the Chicago Relief and Aid Society (CRAS) helped those affected financially, its committee were firm in their position that only residents who could prove themselves completely destitute or those who had lost the homes that they owned, were eligible for financial aid: many were left without help. In the meantime, Good Shepherd Sister Martha ‘became so familiar a figure to the citizens of Chicago’ due to her walks ‘travel-stained and weary, but ever cheerful and contented’. As the CRAS’ ‘contributions to helping destitute women were…negligible’, women’s aid organisations and women religious worked hard to improve the position of the women and children of the city. The way that the nuns dealt with their reduced circumstances was applauded, continuing the work that they had become famed for during the Civil War.

The Society of St Vincent de Paul continued to grow throughout the city in the aftermath of the fire, and by the end of the decade there was a conference in every parish. These conferences were instrumental in bringing together Irish Catholics, those providing aid and those in need, as well as spreading charity around the city. Working alongside other Catholic and community organisations allowed them to spread their influence into the city’s schools, charities, and homes. The St Vincent

105 Julia Mary Doyle to Harry Koenig, 10 June 1951 (Madaj Collection, Box 1, ACA).
108 Flanagan, Seeing with their hearts, 21-22.
de Paul members attempted to fill some of the void left by CRAS, ‘distributing words of consolation and also inducing the Catholic portion of them to send their children to both Sunday and day school, any of whom are destitute are supplied with books and the schooling paid for.’\textsuperscript{109} Educationally, the Society of St Vincent de Paul conference in Bridgeport recorded an attendance of 300 boys at their Sunday school in 1872.\textsuperscript{110} Socially, people continued to be affected by the chaos of the Chicago Fire. Those who had been forced from their homes by the fire spent the winter surviving in ‘scantily covered board shanties’, with life further complicated by a labourers’ strike, a horse sickness, and ‘now the excessive cold with the thermometer frequently 30° below zero’. The Society of St Vincent de Paul helped the needy with donations of food, wood, and occasionally money, however the quarterly report of the Holy Family Parish demonstrates the Society’s preoccupation with education

The visitors of the Conference call every week at the houses of our poor clients and endeavor to induce parents to send their children to Catholic schools, but our little library is quite neglected and probably less attention is paid to the mental and spiritual improvement of the poor than in older cities where the members of the Society are not under the necessity of working hard for the support of themselves and families.\textsuperscript{111}

Agreeing with the Holy Family conference’s concerns, one leading newspaper commented that Chicago’s Catholic charitable institutions ‘do not compare favorably, either in number or in support, with those of other cities’. They continued, ‘Are not orphan asylums preferable to stained glass windows?’\textsuperscript{112} Despite this criticism about the use of funds for non-charitable endeavours, subscriber lists for stained glass windows, altars, and buildings, fill the official parish histories of Chicago, creating a familial connection to the expansion of the Church’s institutions.

As the population of Chicago continued to expand, more religious orders arrived from Ireland, directly or otherwise (see Figure 9). With these new arrivals came

\textsuperscript{109} ‘Report of St. Stephen’s Conference, From October 1, to December 31, 1871’ (St Vincent de Paul Society Administrative Records – Minutes – ADMIN/M3300/964, ACA).
\textsuperscript{110} ‘Report of the Conference of St. Bridget, Chicago’, 1 January 1872, Ibid.
\textsuperscript{111} ‘Report of Holy Family Conference, For the Year ending December 31, 1872’, Ibid.
\textsuperscript{112} \textit{Sunday Times}, 22 June 1873.
the opportunity to expand the provision offered to the Catholics of the city and to adapt to the types of people who were flooding into the city. In 1876, the Ladies of the Immaculate Heart of Mary opened St Joseph’s Home for ‘young working girls and those coming to the city without friends or means’.¹¹³ Juvenile bands were established in parish schools, uniting younger generations with their older co-parishioners, to march and parade as part of the parish. One such band was the Emerald Cadets who ‘dressed in tight-fitting green jackets, black trousers, brown leather belts and caps of military type, such as the soldiers of ’61 were. They were equipped with real muskets’. While older boys could join the Emerald Cadets, younger students were encouraged to join the Crusaders who drilled with tin swords.¹¹⁴ In the midst of accusations of loyalty to a foreign prince in the Vatican,¹¹⁵ these cadet units showed religious and ethnic loyalty to the United States, and particularly the Union, in a similar way to the ethnic militias who paraded with the St Patrick’s Society and reminded others of the Irish Catholic sacrifice in the Civil War. The 1879 Silver Jubilee of the definition of the Immaculate Conception brought all of these elements of the Holy Family parish together, a process that had begun the year previously when the first corner stone of the parish’s Sodality Hall was laid, under a ethnic religious banner instead of a purely ethnic one.¹¹⁶

The years after 1865 had witnessed the expansion of the Catholic Church’s resources and organisations in Melbourne and Chicago. Parishes were increasingly separated by class and occupational connections, encouraged by lay charitable activities, religious schooling, and extracurricular religious organisations. The ethnic homogeneity of the Catholic Church in Melbourne encouraged a new focus on geographical suburb. St Kilda was known for its wealthy parishioners and was home to a number of Irish politicians, whereas Collingwood and Richmond became working and aspiring middle-class Irish centres. In Chicago, parishes and their congregations also had their own identities. As this chapter has illustrated, the Holy Family Parish was the largest and second

¹¹³ Mulkerins, Holy Family, 107 & 151.
¹¹⁴ Mulkerins, Holy Family, 452-454.
¹¹⁵ McGreevy, Catholicism, 102-103.
¹¹⁶ Mulkerins, Holy Family, 139-140.
oldest parish, encompassing large swathes of Chicago’s South Side. It welcomed some of the city’s most powerful and wealthy Irish Catholics, whereas the Nativity of Our Lord was in the centre of South Halsted Street, a working class community on the cusp of the stockyard neighbourhoods. The 1870s had left both cities with a more vocal working class as a result of labour disputes and increased educational provision. This manifested differently in each city, but common themes of increased ethnic and class solidarity emerged in both.

Later Years

This ethnic and class solidarity was continued in the 1880s, separating people and channelling their efforts into transnational community action. For Irish people of all colours, it was a time of heightened political and cultural nationalism. For Catholics, Pope Leo XIII’s *Arcanum on Christian Marriage* discouraged the mixing of Catholics and non-Catholics. The *Arcanum*, issued on 10 February 1880, warned of the dangers of mixed marriages and the formation of associations that led to these connections, mixed schooling as well as mixed socialising.117 Influencing the parish lives of those in Melbourne and Chicago, the *Arcanum* codified a trend of separation that had begun the previous decade. The religious education debates of the late 1870s and 1880s encouraged a more defensive Irish and Catholic community in Melbourne, echoing the ethnically and religious linked Irish Catholic communities in Chicago. In both cities, the Catholic parishes that they inhabited were inherently Irish, through migration patterns or through an early established plan of national parishes. As Irish nationalism became a more potent force throughout the Irish diaspora, the Catholic Church came into conflict with political organisations and priorities. How the Catholic Church in Melbourne and Chicago adapted to these new tensions, tensions brought about by a sustained encouragement of ethnic and religious links over the previous 40 years, will be the focus of this chapter’s final section and expanded upon in the following chapter.

---

117 Hunt, ‘Vatican Teaching’.
The Sodality of the Blessed Virgin Mary (BVM) was the largest sodality in Melbourne’s Catholic Church. With at least 500 members, this sodality brought together young Catholic men to assist the Archbishop and other senior clergy in their religious and charitable duties throughout the city.\footnote{Age, 10 July 1886.} Considering that the uniform of the sodality was black tie or ‘academical robes’ and many of the names recorded at one meeting correspond to members of the Legislative Assembly, this sodality sought members from the professional classes. Joseph Rowan and Frank Gavan Duffy are just two of the ex-students of the Jesuits’ St. Patrick’s College and former CYMS members who emerge in their rolls.\footnote{Advocate, 2 July 1887.} Just as women religious encouraged a feeder system from convent school to convent, religious schools also instilled in Catholic boys a continuing dedication to the Catholic Church and its associations into adulthood. The social standing of many sodality members meant that imperial loyalty was still an important consideration in public ceremony. While at one sodality dinner, Dr Kenny proposed the first toast to ‘their Holy Father the Pope’, this was clearly not a usual option. It was only because ‘the dinner was exclusively a Catholic one in a Catholic college [St Patrick’s]’ that the toast to their ‘temporal ruler’, the Queen, was subordinate to their spiritual ruler.\footnote{Advocate, 20 August 1887.} Jesuit schools such as St Patrick’s College were used to instil imperial as well as religious priorities in their students, and connections with Catholic schools in England and Ireland were encouraged, particularly with Stonyhurst College. William Tobin was a noted cricketer who travelled between St Patrick’s, Stonyhurst, and back to Melbourne’s Cricket Club, while Charles Gavan Duffy’s son Frank was similarly sent from Melbourne’s parish schools to Stonyhurst, continuing to encourage links between the Catholic elites in the United Kingdom and Australia.\footnote{St Patrick’s Gazette, December 1879 (JAD).} The parish school system linked Irish Catholic men to each other and their faith throughout life. Even if they did not actively engage with the religious parish’s extra-curricular activities, friendships and
occupational links maintained some link to their religious identity. Those from the upwardly mobile middle classes could be expected to transfer these priorities into their professional and political lives.

Members of the clergy in Melbourne belonged to, and were welcomed into, leading social circles, and in turn, lay members were recognised by the Catholic hierarchy. One way that the laity were recognised was through the award of papal knighthoods, such as the Order of St Gregory the Great. Patrick O’Brien, J.P. was a wine and spirit merchant who had arrived in Port Phillip in 1840, he was a founder and trustee of the St Patrick’s Society and an MLC for Kilmore, Kyneton, and Seymour. In 1886 he gave £1,000 to the St Patrick’s Cathedral fund and in recognition of his long service to the Catholic cause, he was invested as a papal knight, as a member of the Order of St Gregory the Great.\(^{122}\) His wife was also an active member of the Catholic Church’s fundraising committees, often noted in reports for chairing the Hawthorn suburb’s stalls.\(^{123}\) The O’Briens were just one example of the crossing of religious, political, and societal elites within Melbourne society. The extended Collins and Quinn families of Sandridge acted in a similar fashion, with wives and daughters fundraising at bazaars or entering religious orders as postulants. The heads of each family were noted for their ‘energy and perseverance’ and the gift of the ‘seating accommodation’ in the erection of St Joseph’s Catholic Church, Sandridge.\(^{124}\) In this way, the professional classes could benefit socially from engagement with the Catholic Church, and senior clergymen could further their religious endeavours financially by mingling with the laity. However, this was not purely powerbrokers working together for mutual improvement: bishops and senior clergymen were often from similar social and geographical backgrounds to Melbourne’s professional classes and could therefore gain intellectual and nostalgic stimulation from each other. Middle-class religious networks were therefore self-sustaining and mutually beneficial. The political and cultural ambitions held by those in those circles, for Irish and imperial Irish identity were thence transmitted through secular and religious parish life to the wider Irish community.

\(^{122}\) Freeman’s Journal (Sydney), 30 April 1887; Thomson & Serle, Biographical Register, 153.
\(^{123}\) Advocate, 26 June 1869.
\(^{124}\) Age, 9 May 1881.
While primarily concerned with religious devotion, connections between Irish Catholic religious facilitated social and political action through faith. The spread of religious educators throughout Melbourne’s suburbs both separated parishes and united them under a city-wide Catholic community. Just as bazaars brought Melbourne’s Catholics together in charitable endeavour, so too did the networks of religious men and women throughout the city. In August 1882, members of the Children of Mary Sodality at St Peter’s and St Paul’s school in Emerald Hill concluded their 12 months’ prayer for the ‘peace and prosperity of Ireland with a general communion and procession.’ According to reports, branches of this sodality throughout Melbourne and wider Victoria had brought 4,000 ‘monthly communicants’ from Melbourne’s convents, the Christian Brothers, and all the children and pupils under their care, together for monthly Mass. The Sodality of the BVM at St Patrick’s College also veered into political matters when they held a debate on the premise “That the time has come when the Imperial Government should introduce a scheme for the granting of Holy Rule to England, Ireland, Scotland, and Wales, together with a scheme for the federation of those countries.” School sodalities were central to the unification of Catholic children from across schools and institutions and wider Victoria. These sodalities were designed for children, and adults who had been taught by religious sisters, to aid the continued interaction of Catholic children with the Catholic Church, and specific religious communities, localities, and schools.

Just as sodalities aimed to expand and unite the devout congregations of Melbourne, the CYMS united their suburban branches to form the Victorian Catholic Young Men’s Societies Union in 1886. The Richmond branch filled a potential void in their members’ lives by meeting on Wednesday nights for lectures, and then on Tuesdays and Fridays for “off” meetings at which ‘Every inducement is offered’ with a selection of amusements including a reading room, cards, draughts, boxing, and fencing, as well as the use of a gymnasium and piano

---

125 Manual of the Children of Mary for the use of all establishments, schools and orphan asylums of the Sisters of Charity (New York: P. J. Kennedy & Sons, 1867), 11.
126 Advocate, 26 August 1882.
127 St Patrick’s Gazette, December 1879 (JAD).
128 Bourke, Catholic Church, 74; Irish-Australian Almanac, 1888.
available.\textsuperscript{129} The CYMS aimed to fulfil a ‘great need in the life of a young man’, both spiritually and educationally, providing the tools needed to aid their personal and economic betterment.\textsuperscript{130}

Just as the city’s religious orders were expanding their provision, the laity were also attempting to improve the lives of those in the city who could not afford the black tie uniform of the Sodality of the BVM. In the eight months since it opened in October 1887, the St Vincent de Paul’s Home for Men in Fitzroy noted that they had sheltered and fed ‘4653 poor men of all classes and creeds’.\textsuperscript{131} These charitable institutions helped to combat the potential enticement of secret, oath-bound societies linked to Irish separatism that remained a very unlikely threat to Melbourne society, and the more realistic social evils brought by wild economic speculation and failure. In 1889, at a presentation to Fr. Aylward to 16 years’ service to St Joseph’s in Collingwood, reference was made to the religious societies established in the parish over that time. Among them were the Christian Doctrine Society, the Society of St Vincent de Paul, the CYMS, the Apostleship of Prayer, the Altar Society, and HACBS.\textsuperscript{132} These organisations demonstrate the mix of religious, national, and social activities which helped the Irish Catholic Church intercede in most aspects of the lives of those who chose to associate, and take advantage of the provisions of Irish Catholic life. Engagement with their Catholic identity was therefore beneficial to the Irish in Melbourne. Middle-class networks helped to reinforce respectability and existing connections formed in religious schools and secular organisations based on Irish ethnicity. Sodalities helped to spread Catholic identity across the classes, supporting the benefit societies of HACBS and INF.

\textit{Chicago}

Chicago’s Irish Catholic Church was, by 1880, in a position to expand their care and guidance due to the city’s economic recovery and the arrival of more religious

\begin{flushleft}
\textsuperscript{129} Catholic Magazine (January, 1890), 28. \\
\textsuperscript{130} Bourke, Catholic Church, 74. \\
\textsuperscript{131} Advocate, 16 June 1888. \\
\end{flushleft}
communities. The Holy Family Parish took the opportunity to establish a sodality for working boys in 1880, and a female counterpart was organised in 1891 at the St Joseph’s Home for Friendless Girls.\(^{133}\) Seven years later, the Holy Family Parish sought to encourage devotion in the parish’s children who were unable to attend parish schools. From the first Monday in Lent 1887, all Catholic children over the age of 12 were required to attend lessons to prepare for their First Holy Communion. Girls and boys, and working girls and boys, were all instructed separately at different times and in different venues.\(^{134}\) Devotional Catholicism ‘influenced the way Catholics thought about themselves and the world in which they lived’ and with more religious communities available, the parish took on the role of internal monitoring the morals and social lives of their parishioners more thoroughly.\(^{135}\) Part of this expansion was enabled by the exponential increase of Irish religious women in Chicago’s parishes. Between 1880 and 1890, the figure jumped from 128 to 349 in specifically Irish female religious communities.\(^{136}\) In the same decade, Chicago’s population increased by 119 percent, and though the city’s religious orders could not keep up with this expansion, they opened more parish schools and reform institutions in an attempt to stem the threat of poverty and heresy. This could bring women religious into conflict with both the Catholic hierarchy and the city financiers, as when the Good Shepherd nuns’ Chicago Industrial School which was opened in November 1885. Though it had operated unofficially since 1866, in 1885 it received a charter and therefore county money. Within two years, the Sisters were suing the city for money owed.\(^{137}\) The control of Chicago’s institutions was a constant battle, but the women of the Catholic Church were becoming more adroit at utilising their skilled former pupils in their fight.

The religious press acted as an ‘important educator of the people’ outside the parish school, increasing the importance of editorial choices in shaping identity.\(^{138}\) The *Western Catholic* became Chicago’s foremost Irish Catholic journal in 1872.

\(^{134}\) Mulkerins, *Holy Family*, 159.
\(^{136}\) See Figure 9.
\(^{137}\) Hoy, *Good Hearts*, 63-64.
Pastorals from Cardinal Cullen of Dublin were frequently published, as were articles devoted to specifically Irish Catholic. Its pages were filled with Irish news, life, landlordism, and nationalism.\textsuperscript{139} Newspapers were vital in the creation of an Irish Catholic voice, both in promulgating views and priorities and forcing a reaction between Irish and non-Irish communities. By covering Irish events, history, and (re)printing letters and editorials, Irish people were able to create ‘their own transnational public sphere’ as well as international networks.\textsuperscript{140} The *Western Catholic*’s Irish focus was possible because of the preponderance of German-language newspapers which also blended ethnicity with religion. Timothy Walch has explored the ways that the Catholic clergy encouraged their parishioners to ‘campaign’ for Catholic issues, particularly in relation to supporting the parish school system.\textsuperscript{141} Combining newspaper influence with the weekly opportunities of parish priests and women religious to ‘cajole and convince’ their parishioners, the Catholic hierarchy were able to approach their parishioners at a local and city level.

These avenues for contact could be used by parishioners as well as the clergy. By the 1880s, Irish people in Chicago were secure in their position as the dominant ethnic group of the Chicago Diocese. The presence of another Irishman in the archbishopric and the number of Irish religious communities in the city had encouraged a linking between leading Irishmen in the city and their religious leaders. The St James’ Parish, established in 1855, had close familial and civil links with the Sisters of Mercy’s St Agatha Academy and Mercy Hospital providing the parishioners with influential connections. After the parishioners heard that they may not get the priest that they had hoped for, they travelled up Wabash Avenue to Archbishop Feehan’s house to request a meeting. After finding Feehan out, they left a respectful but direct letter suggesting that

\begin{quote}
\textit{in case there was any reason personal, or otherwise why you could or should not appoint Father D. J. Riordan then that your Grace considering the best interest of Church and Family would most graciously appoint some other}
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{139} *Western Catholic*, 5 March 1881.
\textsuperscript{141} Walch, ‘Catholic Press’.  

184
good and zealous priest who would be in harmony with the people of the Parish.\textsuperscript{142}

The men who signed this letter included prominent and wealthy businessmen like Michael and John Cudahy as well as bookseller Bernard Callaghan and labourer Dennis O'Connell.\textsuperscript{143} All 16 of the men that signed the letters had ‘Irish’ surnames, and cross-referencing their names demonstrates the overlapping religious, ethnic, and nationalist concerns of these men. Michael Cudahy, John Guerrin, and Bernard Callaghan were noted as attending an 1879 anti-rent gathering supporting Irish land reform.\textsuperscript{144} Guerrin, a doctor, was also the chairman of the Chicago Committee for the Irish National League Convention in 1886, a committee that included four of the sixteen above signatories.\textsuperscript{145} The connections of these men, in just one of Chicago’s Catholic parishes, illustrate some of the ways that parishioners’ lives crossed over, on religious, national, and geographical issues. With these priorities, it is clear that the desired for ‘harmony’ within the parish related to the wish for an Irish priest to reflect the Irish make-up of the parish.

The Catholic laity in Chicago followed an international trend when they decided to establish a separate organisation dedicated to the social progress of their parishioners. The Ancient Order of Hibernian Benefit Association of the State of Illinois filed a certificate of organisation in 1881.\textsuperscript{146} By 1884, there were 30 divisions of the Ancient Order of Hibernians within Chicago, and a further four in the soon-to-be Chicago districts of Brighton Park, Pullman, and Cummings.\textsuperscript{147} There were also eight divisions of the Hibernian Rifles in the area.\textsuperscript{148} Joining the

\textsuperscript{142} Letter to Archbishop Feehan, Chicago, 30 September 1883 (HIST/H3300/63 – Historical Records – Various Bishops, ACA).
\textsuperscript{143} U.S. Census, 1880.
\textsuperscript{144} \textit{Daily Inter Ocean}, 29 December 1879.
\textsuperscript{145} ‘Circular, Chicago Committee to Eugene Kelly, Chairman of the Irish Parliamentary Fund Committee, NYC’, 7 January 1886 (John Devoy Papers, MS 18,048(1), NLI).
\textsuperscript{147} Chicago’s city limits were expanded in 1889, annexing large parts of the South Side into the city.
\textsuperscript{148} \textit{Third Annual Directory of Ancient Order of Hibernians of the United States, Containing the names and addresses of all national state, county, and division officers: 1884-1885} (Dayton: Sweetman’s Book & Job Printing House, 1884), 50-55.
work of the AOH in 1883 were the Illinois Catholic Order of Foresters, established by leading Irishmen, Deputy Sheriff P. J. Cahill and Hon. John F. Scanlan. Patricia Kelleher has argued that Americans, and therefore Irish-Americans, perceived acceptance by their own cultural group, ethnic and occupational, ‘as a criterion for access to the higher rungs of the social ladder’. The challenge for ambitious Irishmen was to maintain ‘support networks that included but also transcended their immediate group, by striving to increase their cultural group’s prestige, and by exhibiting a style of manliness that commanded respect from all sides.’ Organisations like the AOH blended these networks of militia, benefit, and entertainment. By 1888, all the Holy Family Parish sodalities had their own libraries and reading rooms, making their Sodality Hall ‘the heart or center of social activities of the parish’. Ethnic societies based within the national parish allowed for cross-class networking, and in 1894, the opportunity was extended to the women of Chicago when the Women’s Catholic Order of Foresters (WCOF) was established, providing life insurance for most female members for the first time. The WCOF was an alternative for the growing secular women’s labour and temperance unions that were uniting working women in the city, particularly white immigrant women, from the late 1880s. Irish and Irish-American women emerged in leadership positions within Chicago’s labour assemblies, eventually leading strikes. Catholic organisations aimed at women complemented and competed with the secular, political, and socialist unions that the Church saw as threats to society and family values. These Catholic organisations linked people throughout the parish, across class boundaries, and provided them with financial support and relative independence.

The parishes within Melbourne and Chicago were fundamental in creating Catholic identity in the cities. As these were the places that Irish immigrants and descendants lived, where they filtered the different influences of diasporic life

149 Ffrench (ed.), American Irish, 83 & 167.
150 Kelleher, ‘Class and Catholic’.
151 Mulkerins, Holy Family, 161.
152 Ibid, 714-716.
through their ethnic, class, and occupational points of reference, there was an explicit connecting of Irish and Catholic identities. Melbourne and Chicago both benefited from an improvement in public transport in the years after 1882, enabling increased movement between central and more suburban parishes.\textsuperscript{155} Individual parish associations were brought together for bazaars and central committee meetings, complementing the connections between members who were often involved in multiple organisations. The 1880s saw the maintenance of Catholic parish organisations begun in the 1850s and 1860s, but also benefitted from the international increase of fraternalism, reflected in both religious and secular parish life. Ethnic and religious separation of Irish Catholic communities had been encouraged for 30 years, and the codification of this in the Pope’s \textit{Arcanum} collided with the increase in Irish nationalist activity. At times, these ethnic and religious connections were utilised for political gain, while at others they were in direct conflict. These conflicts and connections will be the focus of the next chapter.

Conclusion.

The Catholic Church provided a foundational point of commonality and acted as a moral and comforting force for the Irish communities in both cities, aided in large part by the Irish background of many of its members and leaders. As Ciara Breathnach has emphasised in her study of the Irish in Otago, New Zealand, for the Catholic Church to truly embed in a community, it must have a receptive population.\textsuperscript{156} In both Melbourne and Chicago, there had been repeated requests to Ireland for spiritual support in the 1840s: the Irish Catholic Church was therefore responding to an existing Catholic audience instead of purely a mission of conversion.\textsuperscript{157} The desire to help to expand the Irish Catholic Church was enabled by an active laity, encouraged by sodalities, charities, and benefit societies. The extent to which the local Catholic Church supported and restricted

---

\textsuperscript{155} Improvements to the Chicago cable car system began in 1882, while the Melbourne cable tram system opened in 1885.


ethnic and secular fraternalism impacted the types of organisations which emerged at different times. If the Bishop said that ‘good’ Catholics should not mix socially with non-Catholics, this was only sustainable if the Church provided alternatives. These substitutes were inspired by the Irish roots of the religious and lay communities that shaped the religious parish life in both cities. This chapter has explored the ways that parish identity and locale were shaped and changed by the local religious and laity over 50 years. While the Catholic Church in Melbourne and Chicago has received scholarly attention based on geography, comparison of the parish lives that emerged in both cities allows for further understanding of personal influence and institutional structures.

The growth of the parish school system allowed for the entrenchment of religious communities in Irish diasporic life, and was built upon by the promotion of devotional practice which linked middle-class parishioners to each other through charity, social activities, and family. By encouraging school children and young adults to attend Mass, visit the sick and needy in the parish, and read doctrinal books, magazines, and pamphlets, Irish Catholics grew up with a sense of community responsibility. Virtue, moral choice, and personal development were all intertwined with religious and community devotion. Both cities prioritised a Catholic’s virtue and personal development, providing educational facilities and charitable opportunity, improving their social, physical, and spiritual position in life and death.

The Irish backgrounds of the religious communities and clergy in Melbourne and Chicago congregations with a community lineage intimately related to Ireland. As such, the national parish, locally and city-wide, bonded Catholics to each other and to Ireland. The position of Irish religious women in the daily lives of schools and sodalities, as well as in institutions like hospitals, helped to provide a consistent ethnic mirroring throughout Catholic life. Where women encouraged their students to join the convent, organise bazaars, and participate in religious education, men were encouraged to continue their religious devotion through connections and associations resembling the secular civil society of each city. Men and women benefitted from engagement with the Catholic parish in terms of
rising social status and community support. Their involvement with a particularly Irish Catholic church life in Melbourne and Chicago helped to sustain links with Ireland and Catholic communities elsewhere in the diaspora. While this foundational engagement with Irish identity and community was spearheaded by women, these links could be built upon by male political nationalist leaders.
Chapter Five: Political Nationalism and the Limits of Diasporic Life.

In 1867, the *Irish Republic* became the latest addition to the Irish ethnic press of the United States. Established by P.W. Dunne, Michael Scanlan and others in Chicago, this newspaper’s organising committee illustrates the professional, ethnic, and familial connections that were used to promote Irish nationalism in Chicago and the wider diaspora. Central to the *Republic*’s organisation was Michael Scanlan. Born in County Limerick in 1836, Scanlan emigrated with his family to Chicago when he was seven years old; as he grew older, he became known as the ‘Poet Laureate of Fenianism’ and was joined by his brother John F. Scanlan on the Fenian Council of 1863. The brothers served in Company B of the 67th Illinois Volunteer Infantry Regiment during the American Civil War, alongside an officer from the Montgomery Guards and at least six more members who were in the Fenian Brotherhood or Clan na Gael.\(^1\) The Republic used contacts in other cities and communities to distribute the newspaper outside of Chicago including Alexander Sullivan who would later become a linchpin in Chicago’s Irish nationalist circles, and while the newspaper was in circulation, it acted as a medium through which to promote political and cultural nationalism within Irish communities within the United States. It also created a sense of a close Irish community in Chicago, publishing accounts of the Fenian Brotherhood and Sisterhood’s events alongside poetry and news from Ireland.

This chapter explores the connections that evolved between middle-class leaders and their labouring class counterparts in Ireland, Melbourne and Chicago. Understanding how nationalist activities built upon secular and religious networks, both transnational and within the parish, provides valuable insight on the moments where communities, embedded in completely different political atmospheres and across the world from each other, converged for common aims for Ireland. The term ‘nationalism’ incorporates a diverse range of motivations and activities, bringing together people of different classes, religions, and

moments of migration. How those of Irish birth and descent articulated their relationship with Ireland, and their vision of Irish governance, depended on their class allegiances as well as a range of other influences. Previous chapters have outlined how foundational identities, based in cultural and ethnic affinities, were created and encouraged within middle-class diasporic communities in Melbourne and Chicago through education, religious and secular parish life, and political debate. This chapter examines how this cultural affinity was utilised by community leaders from the parish and further afield to promote Irish political nationalist activities whether armed rebellion, moral force, or constitutional change.

The reasons presented for involvement in Irish diasporic nationalism have been varied, but they often often revolve around ideas of counteracting humiliation, loneliness, and aspirations of respectability. Thomas Brown argued that in the American context, Irish nationalism gained its ‘most distinctive attitudes: a pervasive sense of inferiority, intense longing for acceptance and respectability, and acute sensitivity to criticism’. However, he largely focuses on those with the status and resources to rise to leadership positions through ‘their ability to exploit the sentiments of Irish-America’. Though a preoccupation with diasporic experience may have shaped the support of Irish nationalism for most, Timothy Meagher counters that radical Irish nationalism was rooted in a ‘visceral and direct response to the concrete injustices of an oppressed Ireland’. The debates on how and why Irish-American nationalism emerged in the ways it did, and the role of class tensions within that, will be applied to Melbourne to test the position of imperialism, distance, and middle-class dominance in the fortunes of Irish nationalism in the city.

These variants of engagement with Irish nationalism are examined, placing them into the differing contexts of Melbourne and Chicago to explore the role of the middle classes in shaping how Irish nationalism emerged and progressed in each

---

3 Ibid, 24 & 27.
city. Timothy Lynch has argued that the language of nationalism redefined the immigrant experience, allowing Irish migrants to define themselves in terms of ethnic pride and new world loyalty. By focusing on certain motifs within Irish nationalism, such as exile, republicanism or political autonomy, migrants could be both Irish and American/Australian, allowing them to continue to be different without ‘feeling as if they were outsiders’. The apparently one-sided nature of comparison between Irish nationalism in Melbourne and Chicago has dissuaded exploration, however through comparison within a wider study of the two communities’ cultural and ethnic evolutions, this study of political nationalism shows vital similarities in the creation of diasporic Irish identities.

Male leaders dominate this chapter, as they do throughout the historiography on nationalism and politics across the world. Irishwomen have traditionally been dismissed from discussions on nationalism as irrelevant, the toils of everyday life leaving little time or inclination for abstract ideals of nationalism, or as naïve donators to subscription lists and little more. This chapter does not however focus solely on the elite male leadership. Instead, it explores the role of the middle class in leading and facilitating nationalist ambitions in Melbourne and Chicago, echoing the work of John Belchem on ‘culture brokers’ in Liverpool. In studying the position of publicans and priests in how Irish nationalism emerged and was portrayed in Melbourne and Chicago, it is understood that men built upon the shared sense of Irishness that had been fostered within the family and parish by parents, teachers and religious. Women had a central role to play in forming these foundational links within the Irish diasporic community which were then built upon for different, but related ends by men. Within political nationalism, women were important participants and fundraisers.

---

7 Funchion, Chicago’s Irish Nationalists; McCaffrey et al., Irish in Chicago; O’Brien, Blood Runs Green.
8 Diner, Erin’s Daughters; Brown, Irish-American Nationalism, 23.
9 Belchem, Irish, Catholic, Scouse; Belchem, ‘Liverpool-Irish’.
However, nineteenth-century Irish nationalism was a story of gendered ideas of nationhood and the quest for respect, either abroad or in Ireland; of men fighting for the honour of Ireland, to release her (as Ireland is typically portrayed) from England’s shackles in the United States, or to restore Ireland to her true potential as a self-governing loyal part of the Empire in Australia. These ideas were encouraged within arenas which were usually only open to men, the Ladies Land League presenting a visible anomaly in the nineteenth-century history of Irish nationalism. The British misrule and lack of employment opportunities which pushed Irish men to leave Ireland were supplemented for women who were also affected by the embedding of patriarchal society in Ireland in the aftermath of the Famine when land ownership patterns and decreasing marriage opportunities led to the exodus of Ireland’s women. These systems were echoed abroad leading to nationalist agitation ‘rooted in the homosocial world of the fraternal association and the saloon’.10 The overlapping membership of nationalist organisations within Melbourne and Chicago led to stronger fraternal links, but could also result in the confusion and dilution of ideologies. The social advantages of joining Irish nationalist organisations could therefore outweigh the ideological differences, prioritising ethnicity over politics.

Irish nationalism in Melbourne and Chicago worked in tandem and tension with those active in Ireland, and was influenced by the evolution of nationalist thought in Ireland and elsewhere in the world. Fearghal McGarry and James McConnel argue that Fenianism was a product of the Irish diaspora ‘and cannot be understood without reference to this wider context’.11 In turn, the transnational connections which funded and promoted activities in Ireland and Great Britain cannot be removed from the diasporic conditions in which Irish nationalism developed. The local became global through newspaper reports, lectures, and fundraising campaigns, which linked Chicago, Melbourne, and Ireland, providing an insight into the transnational networks that funded activities in Ireland and

Great Britain. This chapter follows the evolution of diasporic nationalist narratives within Melbourne and Chicago.

Recovery and Reordering of Nationalist Ideologies, 1848-1867.

Irish nationalism abroad was completely transformed in the years between 1845 and 1852 when Irish society was decimated by the effects of the potato blight. The Famine fundamentally altered the way that British control of Ireland was viewed worldwide and how land was distributed and farmed in Ireland. Republicanism in Ireland ‘went into hibernation’ during the 1850s while people recalibrated ownership patterns and familial structures in the aftermath of the Famine. The focus of Irish political nationalism therefore shifted out to the newly reshaped diaspora. The Famine provided a cause and an image of British repression and systematic cruelty, even genocide, for nationalist leaders to unite around, and the failure of the Young Irelander rising in 1848 aided the promotion of this message after its leaders were flung across the globe. Young Irelander leaders like John Mitchel and William Smith O’Brien, many of whom had attended Trinity College Dublin and emerged as prominent newspapermen in Ireland, were transported to Van Diemen’s Land sending the eyes of Ireland briefly to the Southern Hemisphere and then to North America and Europe where most found their new homes. Bringing together men from across Ireland from a mix of religious and class backgrounds, the legacy of the Young Irelander movement was the creation of a distinctive Irish history written ‘to collective memory and reinforce allegiances and obligations to the nation’. The emphasis of Irish national identity based principally in cultural and historical arguments, not religion or language, allowed for the possibility of engagement with a range of images of nationalism as the nineteenth century progressed. This section explores how Irish communities

---

13 Ibid, 94.
in Melbourne and Chicago began to organise themselves regarding the control of Ireland in the midst of the chaos of the 1850s and early 1860s.

Chicago

The Chicago Repeal Association which supported Daniel O’Connell’s attempts to repeal the Union had been one of the principal associations in the growing town of the 1840s. After support for O’Connell’s cause declined and Chicago’s Irish population began to respond to the waves of Famine migrants, nationalist organisations in the city disappeared. It was in 1856, when Young Irelander exile John Mitchel reached Chicago, that the city’s rise in Irish population and influence within the United States was acknowledged. Three years earlier, after escaping from Van Diemen’s Land, Mitchel had arrived in New York to welcome parades, and soon began serialising the litany of abuses he had experienced at the hands of the British Government in his newspaper, the Citizen, further promoting his image of Irish republican and martyr in Ireland and abroad. Copies of the Citizen and other Irish-American newspapers had heralded Mitchel’s escapades, meaning that when he reached Chicago on his lecture tour, a crowd of ‘thousands of his fellow countrymen [were] anxious to see and hear the man who had done and suffered so much for Ireland’. William Onahan, then an Irish-born clerk recently arrived from New York City noted the presence of women in the audience, ‘God bless them; giving expression evidence that in spirit and patriotism – they may vie with us at least’. Onahan recalled that while Mitchel was ‘far from being eloquent’, his words were ‘sternly cold even to a kind of rigidity, - they may rouse you to deeds to desperate resolve…his words, at least possessed that power. They thrilled through every heart there. You could almost hear a pin drop.’ Mitchel’s choice of Chicago demonstrates a response to the growing nationalist sentiment in the city. He was

---

18 Citizen, 11 January 1854.
19 William Onahan diary, 1856-7 (ACA, Onahan Papers, HIST/D3300/7).
20 ‘John Mitchel, November 27 1856’, Onahan Diary 1856-7 (ACA, Onahan Papers, HIST/D3300/7).
21 Ibid.
the first ex-Young Irelander to reach Chicago on a lecture tour, but Mitchel was not the last.

Lecture tours allowed political leaders to concurrently raise money for personal and ideological activities, and to raise the profile of their message. Though the message veered between separatism and home rule, lecture tours became an important tool used by Irish nationalists throughout the nineteenth century. James Mulligan took on the mantle of lecture tour organiser within Chicago. He would later utilise these skills and connections as the secretary of the Shields Guards and organiser of the Illinois Irish Brigade, the 23rd Regiment of Illinois Volunteers.

Mulligan, an American-born lawyer and active Catholic layman, established himself as a person of influence in Chicago through nationalist, religious, and secular life. Following Mitchel on the lecture circuit was Thomas Francis Meagher. Meagher’s lecture gained less praise from Onahan, a close friend of Mulligan, who despite not having set foot in Ireland since his early childhood, judged it lacking in splendid pictures - eagerness, the tart rollicking humor. The gorgeous coloring...He had no storied memories of national wrongs to conjure, no pictures of our grand old country which are so aptly calculated to make thrilling...We pictured no Irish skies to night – the genius of her Sons - and the sad mournful call of the mother were not there - to give to his words, that restless vigor - that fiery beauty, so thrilling and so touchingly fervid.

These lectures were attended for their sense of occasion and the accompanying parties, as well as for their nationalist rhetoric. Onahan’s preferences in speech highlight the heady mix of nostalgia, romance, and high drama which Irish nationalism provided for people in Chicago. This was escapism and ethnic promotion – a particularly enticing mix for a young population trapped in a daily toil to survive in a new city and chaotic economy.

The Young Irelander movement further influenced the shape of Irish nationalism in the United States when ex-Young Irelanders John O’Mahony and Michael

---

23 18 June 1857, Onahan diary 1856-7 (ACA, Onahan Papers).
Doheny established the Fenian Brotherhood in 1858. Evolving from the Emmet Monument Association, an organisation dedicated to fostering hope for future military resistance in Ireland, funded and supported by those abroad, the Fenian Brotherhood was the sister organisation of the Irish Republican Brotherhood (IRB) which operated in Ireland under the command of fellow former-Young Irisher, James Stephens.\(^{24}\) The parallel and linked organisations facilitated the funnelling of American monetary, political and military support to Ireland. While the Fenians did not gain large traction in Chicago immediately, the Civil War and the 1861 funeral of Terence Bellew McManus gave new inspiration to the movement.\(^{25}\)

Chicago’s position as an economic and transport hub for Union Army supplies led to its rapid rise in prominence during the Civil War, as did its position within American Irish nationalism. In 1863 Chicago was chosen as the host city for the Fenian Convention. This war-time convention was used to set out the Brotherhood’s priorities regarding American loyalty and Irish freedom, amending their constitution to pledge their ‘entire allegiance to the constitution and laws of the United States’. Their long-term strategy did not alter though, encouraging younger members of the Fenian Brotherhood’s Circles to study military tactics and the use of arms in order to drill ‘so as to be prepared to offer their services to the United States government, by land or sea, against England’s myrmidons’ in the event of war between Britain and the United States.\(^{26}\) They would use their position in the United States army to aid the Union while also frustrating the military might of Britain, if required.

The Irish at home in Chicago also supported the IRB and Ireland-based nationalist activities through fundraising. The Chicago Irish Fair was held during Easter week 1864, bringing together material donations from Ireland and monetary

\(^{24}\) Irish American Weekly, 29 December 1855; James Stephens, James Stephens, Chief Organizer of the Irish Republic. Embracing An Account of the Origin and Progress of the Fenian Brotherhood (New York: Carleton Publisher, 1866); McConnell & McGarry (eds), Black Hand.


\(^{26}\) National Convention, 32.
donations from the United States. In response to a series of advertisements placed in the *Irish People*\(^\text{27}\), customers were offered stones from Blarney Castle, clay from Wolfe Tone’s grave, picks from 1798, and a crowbar ‘used by the drummer bailiff when headed the crowbar brigade from the Clonakilty district’.\(^\text{28}\) In the absence of fighting Irish men, Chicago’s women used the skills that they were already familiar with to engage with Irish nationalism and ethnicity. Despite delivery problems related to the ongoing war and customs duties, the Chicago Irish Fair of 1864 collected around $55,000 for the buying of arms and ‘other separatist aims’ in the United States and Ireland.\(^\text{29}\) The fair’s immediate audience were already in Chicago, however those at the front also played their part in the fundraising effort. The 23rd and 90\(^{th}\) Regiments (the Illinois Irish Brigade and Legion) sent $990 from their ranks.\(^\text{30}\) The Assistant Secretary of the Irish National Fair, J. C. S. Fitzpatrick also sought public support from prominent Catholic and military leaders, particularly Mulligan, now a Colonel in the Irish Brigade.\(^\text{31}\) While this support was granted, it led to further complications when Mulligan’s letter of support for armed rebellion against the British, after the Civil War was won, was circulated throughout Chicago’s churches by Duggan.

The Irish Fair sought the support of middle-class customers, those with the money to spend. However, it brought disputes between nationalist and religious allegiances in the public arena. In 1863 Henry O’Clarence McCarthy, the Chief Fenian Center in Illinois, wrote to Orestes A. Brownson, a leading Catholic-convert and theologian, to ask whether there was anything ‘antagonistical to the spirit of Catholicity’ in membership of the Fenian Brotherhood.\(^\text{32}\) Chicago’s priesthood and hierarchy were split on the subject. Bishop Duggan issued a

\(^{27}\) *The Irish People* was an Irish newspaper funded by the Fenian Brotherhood in the United States and operated from Dublin. Established by James Stephens in 1863, the newspaper was managed by Jeremiah O’Donovan Rossa and Thomas Clarke Luby, and edited by Luby, Charles Kickham, and John O’Leary. The paper was suppressed by the British Government in 1865. Catherine Shannon, ‘Thomas Clarke Luby’ *DIB*; Matthew Kelly, ‘The *Irish People* and the Disciplining of Dissent’ in McConnell & McGarry (eds), *Black Hand*, 34-52.


\(^{30}\) Cowan, ‘Immigrants, Nativists’, 117.

\(^{31}\) Fitzpatrick to Mulligan, 22 January 1864 (CHMRL, Mulligan Papers, Box 3, Folder 1).

\(^{32}\) Clarence McCarthy to Brownson, 16 April 1863 (ND, CBRO, I-4-b A.L.S. 1p 8vo. 2), original emphasis.
circular, read in all Catholic churches, which condemned the Brotherhood as ‘there is an oath and a secret somewhere in the Society that he cannot find out, and which he ought to know as a Catholic Bishop’, while also warning of the descent of nationalist political rhetoric from moral force into bloodshed. Peter Sherlock, on behalf of the other Catholic Fenians organising the fair, countered that ‘there is nothing in the organization which conflicts with the established laws of the church – no oath, grip, sign or password whatever – and they are conscious of this fact, and assured of their political rights’.34

Despite the organisers’ protestations, Duggan decreed that funeral processions that made their way to the city’s outermost limits to the Catholic Cavalry Cemetery would not be allowed into the cemetery if they were accompanied by any members of secret societies, including the Fenians, wearing regalia or carrying banners.35 In 1865 Duggan’s representative, the Very Rev. Dr Dunne, expanded this when he declared that Duggan had instructed his clergy not to administer the sacrament to Fenians, and to refuse them a Christian burial.36 Some priests joined with their Bishop in disavowing the Fenian Brotherhood as a secret society, despite its vocal protests to the contrary. Others argued that it was not inconsistent for Catholics to love their country, Ireland, and ‘they cannot, nor shall they, be alienated from either, by the misrepresentations or assaults of those who would be much better and more profitably engaged in the performance of their ecclesiastical duties.’37 The image of Fenians as anti-clerical was widespread, but falsely homogenising.38 The attempts of the ‘Catholic Fenians’ to persuade Duggan of their loyalty to the Church is proof of this nuance.

While members of the hierarchy disavowed Fenianism, the parish networks provided by the Church added to the occupational and military networks which facilitated the growth of the Fenian Brotherhood in Chicago. The Fenian

33 *Chicago Tribune*, 9 February 1864 & 26 February 1864; Church of the Immaculate Conception, unsigned, to Col. Mulligan, 27 February 1864 (CHMRL, Mulligan Papers, Box 3, Folder 2).
34 *Irish People*, 23 April 1864.
35 Burial indenture between James Duggan, Bishop of Chicago, and Patrick Leigh and Patrick Nolan, 25 August 1863 (ACA, Madaj Collection, Box 2, 1-1863-C-1-1).
36 *Chicago Evening Journal*, 5 December 1865.
37 F. K. Barrett to Mulligan, 9 February 1864 (CHMRL, Mulligan Papers, Box 3).
Brotherhood, just as the IRB in Ireland, recruited heavily from urban tradesmen, labourers, and white collar workers. As the majority of Irish men in Chicago were involved in unskilled trades, labourers and stockyard workers, the fraternal links encouraged by close and precarious working conditions and military service during the Civil War, meant that the Fenian Brotherhood leaders had an easily accessible pool of potential members. Jentz and Schneirov have also highlighted the ways that the Fenians connected with labour activism from across different nationalities to encourage both mobilisation of people in the North and organised labour. However, the Irish Fair was a chance for a variety of people of Irish-descent, members of the Fenian Brotherhood and not, to demonstrate their Irish identity, and the material history of that identity, to American-born children and Americans of other ethnic heritage, as well as providing an economic and morale boost to the organisation. The proceeds may have been going to the Fenian Brotherhood and IRB, but attending the fair did not automatically denote support for armed rebellion against Britain.

Thomas Brown has argued that the Fenian movement in the United States was ‘a product, or by-product, of the Civil War’. The movement of large numbers of Irish and Irish-American men into different units, and particularly into ethnic regiments, facilitated networks of Irishmen across the United States. Nationalist leaders had new and expanded means of communication for their message of Irish independence and exile. However, these expanded networks also led to a split in the motivations and ambitions for action: for many the Fenian Brotherhood was a social organisation. By 1866 an interested reader could find out that the Fenian Brotherhood met every Tuesday and Friday at their Hall at the northwest corner of Wells and Randolph, and that L. H. O’Connor was the Center, and Dennis O’Connor the treasurer. The Fenian attempts to invade Canada in 1866 and 1867 combined with the failure of an Ireland-based Irish Republican Brotherhood (IRB) sponsored uprising in 1867 led to the collapse of the Fenian Brotherhood in the

39 Brundage, Irish Nationalists, 89.
41 Brown, Irish-American Nationalism, 43.
42 Chicago Directory, 1866.
United States. Despite this, Irish nationalism continued to grow in other forms, proving to many that

Fenianism owes its origin to a profound national sentiment - a sentiment uprooted and eternal as the foundations of the earth - we have only to remember that it lives still; lives after shocks that would have overthrown any other political combination that ever appeared; it not only lives, but is full of life.

Irish nationalism in Chicago in the first 15 years after the Famine was a story of growth. At the beginning of the 1850s, New York City was the focal point of nationalist activity. By the 1860s, Chicago was growing in importance in relation to nationalist activity and national relevant. While Chicago had an exploding Irish population, it was the Civil War which brought the city to national prominence and a subsequent growth of money and ethnic newspapers. The Irish Catholic Church reflected this change in priorities. The Church only began to take a clear stand on Irish nationalism in the city once it grew powerful enough to challenge Irish Chicagoans’ allegiance to the Church. By the mid-1860s, Chicago was rising in prominence however it had not yet garnered the public support required to dominate Irish-American nationalism. The Church was against it, and due to the Civil War, American needs were prioritised. This was soon to change. Similarly, Melbourne was rising in international prominence and economic strength.

Melbourne

While the lives and tribulations of the Young Irelanders, and their families back in Ireland, caught the interest of people in Melbourne and in Europe, there was little actual interaction between those in Melbourne and the transported men. Most of the Young Irelanders who were transported to Australia left as soon as they could lest they catch ‘the contagion of respectability’ and decide that they could live happily within the British Empire like Kevin Izod O’Doherty did. However the

---

43 Female correspondents in the *Irish Republic* also credited misogyny as a reason for Fenianism’s failure, arguing that the Fenian leadership were slow to summon “to their aid a power which is all but omnipotent on the earth – the power of women?” thereby weakening the movement. *Irish Republic*, 20 July 1867.

44 *Irish Republic*, 20 July 1867. Original emphasis.

promise of new opportunities, wealth and excitement drew others to Melbourne’s shores. Charles Gavan Duffy, politician and editor of the *Nation*, growing tired of the lack of nationalist sentiment in Ireland in the aftermath of the Famine sought a new home in Melbourne in 1854, as did Peter Lalor, the younger brother of land reform advocate James Fintan Lalor. However, in the absence of relatively easy travel to and from Ireland, and the departure of most heroes of Young Ireland, Melbourne society prioritised making sense of the chaos that accompanied the gold rush.

Melbourne may have lost access to the majority of their Irish nationalists, but not all transported agitators left Australia. Earlier in the century, New South Wales had been the final destination for around 800 transported Irish radicals, United Irishmen and Defenders, who were joined by Chartists and other nonconformists from across the United Kingdom. This new mix of freethinking had more of an impact on Melbourne society, and the formulation of early Irish Victorian identity than the Young Irishmen who left.

The Eureka Stockade of 1854 is connected in the popular mind to Irish-Australian identity. Though it occurred in the goldfields of Ballarat, Eureka informed Melbourne society during the nineteenth century. The state enforcement of gold diggers’ license fees and the release without charge of an ex-convict and hotel proprietor who kicked a drunken Scottish digger to death led to accusations of corruption being levelled at local officials and the influx of troops into the area. The diggers began to organise in response, with leading Chartists working with agitators from other backgrounds to combat the increased militarisation of the goldfields and to the demand the release of those arrested for the Eureka Hotel’s arson. Together they formed the Ballarat Reform League, promoting moral force tactics of resistance over physical force. In mid-November 1854, Governor of Victoria Charles Hotham ordered all available troops in Victoria to Ballarat, ‘a

---

decisive step towards conflict’. The radical labour protest gained its reputation as an Irish protest when an advance guard of troops marched through an Irish area with bayonets fixed. Though the troops had been met with derision throughout their march, the Irish who lived in Eureka Lead threw stones at the soldiers and subsequently the regiment’s drummer boy was shot and killed. Retribution was expected, and as the non-Irish Ballarat Reform League leaders distanced themselves from the potential violence, diggers gathered together at the Eureka lead, enclosing an acre as a stockade with 1,000 diggers joining the cause by 1 December. On 2 December, a reduced group of 150 diggers were ambushed before dawn by 400 soldiers. Five soldiers and 30 diggers were killed, with 100 more arrested. The next night, soldiers fired indiscriminately into tents with lights illegally on: three more people were killed.

The 1854 Eureka Stockade has been hailed as an example of Irish people challenging the British establishment, and therefore as a nationalist moment. This connection was largely due to the choice of ‘Vinegar Hill’, the site of one of the final battles of the 1798 United Irishmen rising, as a password for those entering the stockade. British commentators, conversely, blamed ‘foreigners’ for the uprising, French, Germans, Italians, Americans, Chinese, New Zealanders and even ‘native blacks’ were blamed for the dishonouring of the British flag. The involvement of Peter Lalor as the leader of the rebels infers some influence of Young Irelander principles relating to popular sovereignty. Lalor’s future role as an M.L.A meant that his role did influence Irish identity in Victoria, however Eureka was not a united Irish rebellion against British troops due to ethnicity or

50 Serle, Golden Age, 155-169.
51 C. H. Currey, The Irish at Eureka (Sydney: Angus & Robertson, 1954); Hogan, Irish in Australia, 65-78.
projection of British power over Irish. Instead, it was part of a wider radical stream of thought brought about by the mix of people in Victoria at that time, where Chartists mixed with Dissenters, and Young Irelanders mixed with trade unionists. Eureka was one moment of convergence which ‘sealed in blood the marriage between Irish Catholics and social and political radicalism in Australia: this is Young Ireland’s and Eureka’s chief bequest to Australia.’ The apparent disillusionment with British rule did not follow the diggers when they returned to Melbourne and the increasingly stable industries that had emerged there. Instead, these were the people that led to Victoria’s skilled workers achieving the eight-hours day two years later.

The Eureka Stockade’s Irish nationalist credentials are contentious, and this uncertainty has dogged the image of Irish nationalism in Melbourne during the mid-century. Patrick O’Farrell has argued that for most Australian Irish ‘involvement in Irish causes was a luxury they could not afford’. Similarly, Keith Amos notes that ‘there seemed to be little point of conspiring for Irish freedom 14,000 miles away’ after achieving ‘a measure of social and political equality, religious toleration and a chance to prosper’ in Melbourne. However, the absence of Irish political nationalism in the form of the Fenian Brotherhood does not equal a lack of visible loyalty to the nation and values of democratic Ireland. When news reached Melbourne of a food crisis in Ireland during 1862, a collection for its relief was launched by Robert Bennett, the Irish-born Mayor of Melbourne. He noted that ‘When people were living in abundance in a plentiful country like this, it was very easy for them to forget the distress which might exist in the land from which they had come’. A sense of duty to those in Ireland was a theme that emerged throughout the latter nineteenth century.

55 Peter Lalor, in an open letter to the Argus asked if the harsh repression of civil force at Eureka was to ‘prove to us that a British Government can never bring forth a measure of reform without having first prepared a font of human blood in which to baptise that offspring of their generous love?’ Lalor later became a member of the Victorian Parliament. Argus, 10 April 1855.
56 Sutor, Hierarchy and Democracy, 225.
57 Rae, ‘Eight Hours’.
58 O’Farrell, Irish in Australia, 200.
59 Amos, Fenians in Australia, 286; MacDonagh, ‘A General View’.
60 Argus, 5 September 1862.
If Irish nationalist activity is only judged by American standards of Fenianism, the arguments of Amos and O’Farrell are persuasive. However, if the local imperial context and the restrictions on activities are taken into account, Irish nationalism is visible in Melbourne during the 1860s. The shape of this nationalism had to be acceptable to the local context, and therefore the rhetoric tapped into British values of democracy, and a particularly Australian value of religious toleration and opportunity. In 1864, Bishop Hynes noted that the people of Victoria had donated £1,000 for a statue of Daniel O’Connell to be erected in Dublin.\(^{61}\) Commemorating the ‘Great Liberator’, who helped to extend the franchise and Catholic freedoms through constitutional means, was deemed to be respectable by Catholic clergymen as well as Victorian politicians. Confronted with obstacles of distance and imperial loyalty, Irish people in Melbourne engaged with nationalism most prominently through monetary donations to cultural and religious empowerment in Ireland. Irish Australian monetary support was not solely dedicated to the promotion of Irish Catholic religious and cultural empowerment. Pre-empting the Land League’s tactics of the 1880s, Charles Gavan Duffy alluded to the importance of the British economy in demanding recognition for colonial aims. At a dinner in his honour in 1865, Duffy noted that he was puzzled by the lack of friendly sentiment in England toward the colony of Victoria as ‘She had never cost the imperial treasury a guinea except for strictly imperial purposes…she had poured a tide of gold averaging nearly a quarter of a million sterling every week for the last dozen years into the commercial capital of England’.\(^{62}\) Irish Victorians were contributing to the support of the Empire, therefore they expected their voice to be heard.

In 1866 and 1867 the Fenian ‘scare’ reached Melbourne’s newspapers, bringing news of secret societies, American attempts to invade Canada, Irish revolt, and the killing of a British police officer during an escape attempt in Manchester. While Irish middle-class leaders were quick to condemn the actions of physical-force nationalists, there was a concern for those affected by British retribution. A letter from Mrs Molly O’Donovan Rossa and Mrs Letitia Clarke Luby, republished in

---

61 Hynes to Goold (Dublin), 24 August 1864 (MDHC, Goold Correspondence, folder 2).
62 *Irish People*, 3 June 1865.
Sydney’s *Freeman’s Journal* the foremost Irish Catholic newspaper in Australia at the time, declared that ‘Our paternal Government takes good care of the stalwart [sic] husbands, brothers, and sons; but what is to become of the wives, sisters, and little children?’ Their plea for support was met with debate and efforts to help through the State Prisoners’ Relief Fund across the Australian colonies, however this support came with caveats. In July 1866, a meeting of 700 to 800 people was held in Melbourne to raise funds for the distressed families of ‘young men who might place themselves in very awkward positions’. It was clearly noted that the meeting was not held to express any sympathy with Fenianism. Mr James Murphy, a prominent land surveyor, followed this sentiment by observing that although he had been for many years a resident of Melbourne, he had never before taken part in any political or public movement, and that he was unwilling to come forward on the present occasion lest motives by which he was not actuated should be attributed to him. However, ‘This was not a Fenian movement, and it was not intended to send the money home, as some had said, for “physical force purposes.”’ The mixed religious backgrounds of those attending the meeting was emphasised at a time when the St Patrick’s Society was the dominant Irish ethnic force in Melbourne, people were united by ideology not religion.

An awareness of the threats posed by Irish nationalists to the British Empire meant that even the explicitly non-political charitable meeting for the State Prisoners’ Relief Fund was attended by policemen and detectives who would stop the speeches if they were deemed to be inciting treason. The high population of Irishmen in Melbourne’s police force was undoubtedly of use during these moments of tension. Days later, the *Argus* was asked to ‘advance, and not obstruct, what the charitable and humane people of all religious denominations in Victoria should aid – to feed the hungry, clothe the naked, and dry up the tear of sorrow from afflicted helpless wives and children.’ Similar subscriptions had

---

63 *Freeman’s Journal* (Sydney), 7 July 1866.
64 *Age*, 12 July 1866; *Argus*, 14 July 1866.
65 *Argus*, 14 July 1866.
66 *Freeman’s Journal* (Sydney), 14 July 1866.
67 *Argus*, 14 July 1866.
68 *Argus*, 18 July 1866.
been raised for the families of fishing accidents and famine within the United Kingdom earlier in the decade without police intervention.\footnote{A year later there was a subscription fund for the distressed families of a Shetland shipping disaster, \textit{Argus}, 26 January 1867; \textit{Geelong Advertiser}, 3 July 1866.} Those in charge of Victoria’s law and order were aware of the growing anti-imperialist sentiment growing throughout the Empire, in India and Ireland particularly. It was at this time that the Winter brothers rose to prominence in Melbourne’s Irish nationalist movement. Samuel and Joseph Winter, journalists and newspaper editors, were both on the committees of the St Patrick’s Society and the Irish-Catholic newspaper, the \textit{Advocate}. They were both influential in shaping Irish identity in Melbourne. In the aftermath of Murphy’s meeting, Samuel Winter established a subscription fund for the families of state prisoners. A limited amount of £500 was collected.\footnote{Amos, \textit{Fenians in Australia}, 29.} In the absence of any Irish nationalist organisations in Melbourne, and a St Patrick’s Society which banned discussion of politics, the rise of the Winter brothers and the establishment of the \textit{Advocate} newspaper provided a stimulant to constitutional nationalism in the colony.

The 1850s and 1860s witnessed the rise of Chicago in national prominence, a rise which would have international consequences later in the nineteenth century. Accompanying its economic and population boom was a drawing of attention in Irish nationalist affairs from New York City. The choice of Chicago as a host city for the Fenian Convention and the Irish National Fair acted in tandem with the city’s rise in wealth and importance. Melbourne was also experiencing an ascent in economy and status, however without the frequent stimulus provided by nationalist visitors and newspapers, the focus was on charitable subscription funds which did not threaten the imperial status quo in Victoria. Despite these attempts to emphasise the loyal and altruistic motives of the Irish communities in Melbourne, the presence of police officers at charity gatherings dedicated to Irish causes demonstrate an imperial worry about the spread of separatist Irish designs.
The Development of Irish Nationalism, 1868-1880.

Links between labour, land, and Irish nationalism were built upon in both cities during the 1870s, just as they were in Ireland. The rise of ethnic fraternalism that accompanied the post-Civil War years was reflected internationally, and coincided with an influx of Irish religious teaching orders into both Chicago and Melbourne. These networks worked within wider webs of communication facilitated by improved telegraph, postal, and newspaper links. Through the printing and reprinting of opinion pieces from the Anglophone ethnic press, it was possible to universalise and internationalise experiences of anti-Irish and anti-Catholic discrimination. The armed Fenian rebellions in Ireland and Canada during 1866 and 1867, and the British response to those involved led to fears of uprisings throughout the British Empire, a period known as the ‘Fenian scare’. Concurrently, a sense of solidarity was encouraged between those within labour movements and nationalism, both transnationally and locally, resulting in law and order worries about a slide into anarchy.71 The ways that middle-class leaders balanced respectability and nationalism, and connected with the labouring classes through education, information, and organisation, are explored.

Chicago

Bishop Duggan declared in 1868 that his stand against the Fenian Brotherhood had led to its declining popularity in Chicago. The Catholic Church under his direction had beaten the anti-clerical nationalists.72 However, disillusionment with the Fenians had not led to a waning of nationalist activity. Instead, Chicago’s Irish separatists switched allegiance to the Clan na Gael which had been formed in New York as the Napper Tandy Club in 1867. By 1871 there were branches in most of the Irish districts within Chicago, making the city the organisation’s stronghold outside the Northeast.73 Unfortunately for Duggan and his hopes for ending secret societies in Chicago, the Clan’s leadership placed a much higher

72 Abp Duggan (Chicago) to Abp Cullen, 2 February 1868 (DDA, Cullen Papers 334/8/iv/4).
73 Funchion, Chicago’s Irish Nationalists, 28-29.
value on secrecy than the Fenians had, disguising the numbered camps with a public name like the Emmet Literary Society. This secrecy did not last for very long however, as the transient lifestyles of many Irish labourers in Chicago meant regular movements between camps, and the social aspect of Irish nationalism often resulted in drunkenness and a loosening of secrecy codes.\textsuperscript{74} The fraternal element of Irish nationalism continued to boost and hinder the cause in Chicago.

While the Clan grew quickly, Chicago’s Irish communities remained affected by the daily struggles of the city. The Chicago Fire of 1871 resulted in a need to prioritise family finances over the struggles of the homeland, even if only temporarily. While the fire’s devastation slowed the Clan’s development, the 1873 economic crisis had the alternative result of raising class awareness and solidarity amidst dropping wages and rising redundancies for labourers. A fresh enthusiasm for the ‘consciousness of being Irish and downtrodden’ emerged, linking labour radicalism with Irish nationalism across class lines.\textsuperscript{75} Irish nationalism, and particularly land reform, It became a focus for working class organisations like the Knights of Labor and the Clan which held high Irish memberships.\textsuperscript{76} As an alternative, a specifically Catholic and less political organisation emerged in Chicago to unite middle and labouring class Irish Catholics. The Ancient Order of Hibernians (AOH) was a religious and non-political alternative to the Clan, but it often supported the organisation in parades and rallies. While the AOH has become synonymous with Irish associational culture, particularly in the United States, it does not appear in Chicago’s directories until 1875.\textsuperscript{77}

The Irish middle classes in Chicago were confronted with a decision: seek new world respectability on a class basis, or prioritise the struggles of the old world by connecting with those of a shared heritage regardless of class. Some found a middle way, encapsulated by the ‘New Departure’ of 1878. At a meeting in New York, Michael Davitt and John Devoy, leaders of Irish republican strands in Ireland and the United States, decided on the New Departure compromise.

\textsuperscript{74} O’Brien, \textit{Blood Runs Green}, 24.
\textsuperscript{75} Brown, \textit{Irish-American Nationalism}, 74.
\textsuperscript{77} Chicago Directory, 1875.
Physical-force strategies, preferred by the Clan na Gael, would conditionally cede control of Irish nationalism to Ireland’s rising constitutional stars, including Charles Stewart Parnell, in Westminster. As Home Rule looked more possible than ever before, Davitt also pushed forward his plan to radically restructure Ireland’s land ownership system within a politically autonomous Ireland.\(^78\)

Though the New Departure signalled an Irish move away from physical-force tactics, this was not accepted by all Irish nationalists in the United States.

There was a belief that increasingly connected labour and nationalist organisers, that social justice would only to be achieved through the use of violence. For Irish nationalists in Chicago, this resulted in the Skirmishing and Emergency Funds, public subscriber funds organised to support the armed overthrow of British rule in Ireland. These funds were promoted within the ethnic press, particularly Patrick Ford’s Irish World, which was renamed the Irish World and American Industrial Liberator by 1878 demonstrating the merging of these class and nationalist priorities in one widely read Irish-American newspaper.\(^79\) That year however, Illinois Senator, John A. Logan, warned the Emerald Benevolent Association’s Ogden Grove demonstration against increased labour solidarity in the form of riots, strikes, and attacks on capital as they could ‘only make matters worse instead of better.’\(^80\) A few weeks earlier, the tone of language at a large demonstration of ‘workingmen and socialists’ in the Chicago was deemed to be ‘threatening’ and ‘fanatic’, words that were not used in relation to the Irish gathering.\(^81\) These gatherings had related motivations but journalists did not link Irish nationalism with labour radicalism. In the wider context of the New Departure, in which economic inequality joined political freedom in the aims of Irish nationalism, this is surprising.

The economic challenges of the 1870s led to the linking of labour and Irish nationalism in the shape of the Land League, however it also brought the Irish communities of Chicago into more direct class conflict. The desire for middle-

\(^79\) Whelehan, Dynamiters, 70-137.
\(^80\) Daily Register, 29 July 1878.
\(^81\) Daily Inter Ocean, 1 July 1878.
class respectability reflected the improving position of many of Chicago’s Irish citizens. Men and women like William Onahan, who had been in Chicago for decades, were at odds with men like Alexander Sullivan who received their support from more recently arrived migrants who believed in more radical responses to British, and capitalist, control. Similarly, the Catholic Church in Chicago was split at a parish level with priests supporting and condemning labour and nationalist activity depending on the occupational make-up of their congregation.

Labour radicalism and the Clan na Gael, together with the remnants of the Fenian Brotherhood, found support in the working and lower middle classes. However, there were still attempts to present a unified, and middle class-led, spectacle of Irish nationalist activity in Chicago. The Ogden Grove demonstration and picnic which usually took place in early-mid August, became a political alternative to the ethnic and civic nationalism of the St Patrick’s Day parade. Its timing during summer also meant that it was an opportunity for Irish people, adults and families, to come together for a day’s celebrating and discussion. As the years progressed more Irish organisations became involved in the day, and speakers often came from Ireland to speak to a large crowd of picnickers. Despite fictional Bridgeport bartender Mr Dooley’s misgivings that, ‘Whin we wants to smash th’ Sassenach an’ restore th’ land iv th’ birth iv some iv us to her thre place among th’ nations, we gives a picnic’, these picnics were vital in the promotion of certain messages of Irish nationalism, which were subsequently reported by newspapers in Chicago and the ethnic press of the wider United States.82 The Ogden Grove demonstration also became a fixture in the summer social calendar of the city, joining similar picnics by militia units, German communities, and the political parties. This claiming of a space, literal and print, for Irish nationalism in Chicago was an important step in promoting a sense of unification for Irish people in Chicago.

82 Finley Peter Dunne, Mr. Dooley in the Hearts of His Countrymen (orig. 1899, repr. The Floating Press, 2014), 61.
The Fenian scare reached Australia’s shores in the shape of Henry O’Farrell in early 1868. O’Farrell, born in Ireland but raised in Victoria, attempted to assassinate Prince Alfred, Queen Victoria’s son and the Duke of Edinburgh, as he visited Sydney on 12 March.\(^\text{83}\) Coming five days before St Patrick’s Day, O’Farrell’s claim that he was acting as part of an international Fenian conspiracy led to hyper vigilance surrounding the planned festivities. Responding to rumours of a mock funeral for the ‘Manchester Martyrs’, the Victorian police and soldiers of the 14\(^{th}\) Regiment, increased their precautions against demonstrations: soldiers were ordered to defend the city’s gaol and powder magazine, while foot and mounted police spread throughout Melbourne armed with carbines and revolvers. Sectarian tensions were observed throughout the city, crowds of men and boys feared to be members of the Orange Order sang the National Anthem outside St Francis’ Cathedral while ‘detachments of well-known Fenians’ were dispersed.\(^\text{84}\) Accusations were levelled at Irish Catholics of ‘religion, Duffyism and Fenianism’ uniting popular fears about Catholic education, Irish politicians, and physical force nationalism.\(^\text{85}\) However, the good reputation of the colony remained at the forefront of the newspaper commentary and the St Patrick’s Society dinner speeches.\(^\text{86}\) In this way, the Irish leaders in Melbourne were following a similar pattern as their compatriots in Canada, showing by their responsible and civil behaviour that Irish people could be trusted with self-governance. The details of these speeches are explored in more detail in chapter six.

Though the middle-class leaders of the St Patrick’s Society were keen to emphasise their innocence of any relationship to Irish nationalists, the rise of the Winter brothers and the establishment of the Advocate newspaper led to more vocal interest in Irish nationalist issues in Melbourne. After Gladstone’s 1869 reprieve of Fenian prisoners left 34 Fenians in Western Australia with no funds to

\(^{84}\) *Illustrated Australian News*, 23 March 1868.
\(^{85}\) *Age*, 17 March 1868.
\(^{86}\) *Illustrated Australian News*, 23 March 1868.
return to Ireland, and the Influx of Criminal Prevention Act precluded Irish political prisoners from landing in Melbourne, a new subscription fund was established. The Released State Prisoner fund brought together a number of prominent Irishmen within Victoria, declaring their support for those who had been arrested and transported for Irish nationalist activities.\(^87\)

Fundraising committees were established throughout Melbourne, its suburbs, and in other towns in Victoria, with the Advocate office also acting as a collection point. The newspaper ran subscription lists for two months during mid-1869, detailing the men and women who donated their pounds, shillings, and pence to help the released state prisoners in Western Australia. Members of the St Patrick’s Society such as Edmund Finn and Edward Ievers joined ‘A Fenianess’, ‘Irish Tyranny’, ‘An Irish girl with an Irish heart’ and a ‘Scotch Fenian’. These pseudonyms, alongside frequent references to a subscriber’s county or town of origin, ‘A Tipperary Priest’, ‘A Killeavy Man’, ‘A Cork Girl’, demonstrate a clear allegiance to ideas of Irish nationhood within Melbourne’s Irish communities. The Melbourne CYMS donated a total of £7 10s, as did the men who worked in Patrick Cooney’s boot factory on Little Lonsdale Street. Pub around the city also held collections for the cause continuing their important role in secular Irish culture.\(^88\) Importantly, female subscribers make up roughly half of the names.\(^89\) A total of £5,000 was raised by a mixture of Melbourne’s middle and working classes, a clear divergence from the attempts of the State Prisoners Relief Fund of four years earlier.

As previous chapters have observed, the 1870s saw increased ethnic identification within Irish Melbourne due to the expansion of religious schooling and the consolidation of community life. This was reflected in the city’s engagement with Irish nationalist activity, with the Winter brothers reaching out to the

\(^{87}\) The Victorian ‘Criminals Influx Prevention Act’ decreed that ‘Anyone coming into Victoria from a British possession, and whose sentence shall not have expired 3 years before, may be brought up before 2 justices, and may be sent back in custody to the country he came from, or may be sentenced to hard labour for 3 years. Any master of a vessel bringing such a person, is liable to a fine of £100 or 6 months imprisonment, or both, at the discretion of the justices.’ (BL, Carnarvon Papers, MS 6080751/183); Amos, Fenians in Australia, 176-189.

\(^{88}\) Belchem, Irish, Catholic and Scouse, 167-169.

\(^{89}\) Advocate, 19 & 26 June 1869, 10, 17, 24, 31 July 1869.
constitutional nationalists in Ireland and the *Advocate* serving as a central point for monetary support. When word spread of John Mitchel’s ill-health and financial problems in 1874, the *Advocate* launched a subscription list, uniting its readership in celebrating the past glories of the controversial Mitchel. John Martin, of the Dublin-based Irish Home Rule League, wrote to Joseph Winter thanking him for £100, which was soon increased to £450. Martin wrote:

> Glad and proud I am that the Irish in Melbourne are sensible of the great and high qualities of John Mitchel and gratified for his life-long devotion to the national cause of Ireland. But indeed I never doubted their generous appreciation of services to Ireland or even of attempts to serve Ireland.

The personal contacts of men in Melbourne with the instigators of Irish constitutional nationalist activity in Ireland were growing as the decade progressed, and editors were keen to share. One letter from John Martin in February 1875 declared that he hoped that before he died he would see ‘a grand union of all good Irishmen around the globe for the one object [Home Rule] that touches the interests, or the sentiments, or the dignity and honour of all men of Irish race’. The international dignity of the Irish people, through Home Rule, was a way to appeal to the Irish abroad regardless of whether they had made their home within the British Empire or in America.

While the Winter brothers made use of the increasingly cheaper telegraphic technology to create a deeper knowledge of political change in Ireland and the United Kingdom within Melbourne society, other men of influence encouraged alternative engagement with Ireland’s tribulations. The Irish-born Mayor of Melbourne, George Meares, followed his predecessor Robert Bennett in demonstrating Melbourne’s solidarity with the Irish food crisis of winter 1879-80. Though not technically a famine, it constituted a humanitarian crisis. Meares

---

90 *Advocate*, 24 January 1874.
91 Martin to J. Roche & Winter, 2 June 1874 & 7 December 1874 (SLV, Joseph Winter Papers, MS 8622, Box 1798/1).
92 *Advocate*, 13 February 1875.
wrote to the Lord Mayor of Dublin expressing his sympathy for the ‘distress now unhappily prevailing in Ireland.’ By-passing the links between nationalist organisations, Meares could communicate with his counterpart in Dublin to aid his homeland in a respectable manner while also promoting his city of settlement. Meares announced that an initial sum of £4,000 had been transferred to Ireland from a Melbourne Town Hall meeting, after receiving £600 in one day. Patric Naughtin has argued that the success of the non-political and non-sectarian Irish Famine Relief Fund was due to its charitable appeal to non-Irish members of Melbourne society. However, the success of the earlier Released State Prisoner fund indicates that there was already a move toward more vocal support of Irish nationalism within the colony. While the Winter brothers dominated nationalist politics, the involvement of Irish-born Mayors of Melbourne and its suburbs allowed for widening engagement with Irish society through a lens of civic duty and respectability.

The 1880s: The High Point of Irish Nationalism?

The 1880s have been the focus of studies on Irish nationalism in both Melbourne and Chicago, as well as in Ireland. This was a decade of turmoil and almost success. The 1880s saw the rise in prominence of the Irish Parliamentary Party (previously the Home Rule League) and Charles Stewart Parnell, and the public support of Irish Home Rule from British Prime Minister, William Ewart Gladstone. The growth of the Land League combined the labour activism and fight against economic inequality across the world with the desire for Irish political autonomy. The First Home Rule Bill was introduced in 1886, and though it was beaten in the House of Commons, it signalled a change in British mentalities regarding Irish self-government. While constitutional nationalism was witnessing an uplift, the decade saw an international swing towards the use of physical force to achieve change. The actions of each branch of Irish nationalism influenced each other, with the actions of physical-force separatists occasionally

---

94 Advocate, 31 January 1880.
95 Naughtin, ‘Green Flag’, 52.
creating an atmosphere of fear and restrictions on constitutional nationalist speakers. The splits in Irish nationalism that emerged during the 1880s had ongoing influences on diasporic engagement with Irish politics for the next 30 years.

Chicago

Chicago continued its rise in national prominence, economically and in terms of Irish nationalism, during the 1880s, acting as the site of many of the big changes in Irish America. Parnell and John Dillon visited the city on their lecture tour of the United States to large crowds of supporters. It hosted the Irish Race Convention in November 1881, which sought to heal the fractures between physical-force republicans and moderate and conservative nationalists. The Chicago Clan na Gael’s Alexander Sullivan became arguably the most important leader in Irish-American nationalism, or a close second to John Devoy, over the next decade, and under his leadership Chicago was the site of a public dispute between Michael Davitt and the Clan na Gael in 1886. It also saw a slide into criminal enterprise with the murder of Sullivan’s Clan rival, Dr Patrick Henry Cronin, and made its way into the British courts through the spy Henri Le Caron (aka Thomas Beach) in the Parnell Special Commission of 1889. It is therefore tempting to document the wider changes within Irish-American nationalism through the lens of Chicago. However, this section will focus on the changes that took place within Chicago society itself, highlighting the range of Irish nationalist activities which emerged in the city. Ely Janis has declared the Midwest ‘a hotbed of physical-force nationalism’ during the 1880s, and in 1882, John F. Finerty established the Chicago Citizen newspaper to provide support for the armed resistance of British rule. The influence of the Clan na Gael’s dynamite campaign has dominated the historiography of Chicago’s Irish communities. After years of fundraising, Irish nationalists in America grew tired of waiting for the surge for Irish independence to come from Ireland. Launched by the Skirmishing Fund under Jeremiah O’Donovan Rossa, the Irish-American Dynamite Campaign

97 Janis, Greater Ireland, 169.
began on 14 January 1881 with an explosion in Salford Barracks, Manchester.\textsuperscript{98} A competition for dominance soon broke out between Rossa’s Skirmishers and Sullivan’s Chicago Clan na Gael.

Despite the prominence of physical-force separatists in Chicago, the links between labour radicalism and Irish nationalism forged in the 1870s found a home in the American Land League, established in 1879. In December 1880 there were three branches of the ALL in Chicago, by April the following year there were branches in six city wards with a membership of around 1,260.\textsuperscript{99} The cause of land and social reform in Ireland and the United States found support from men and women within the city. Branches of the Ladies’ Land League (LLL) emerged throughout the city, by March 1882 there were 11 throughout Cook County, though they were focused in and around South Chicago and the Stockyards, working-class and predominantly Irish areas.\textsuperscript{100} Three of the women on the LLL committee for the Tenth Ward were married to skilled manual labourers, carpenters, machinists and sewer builders, and were in their late thirties.\textsuperscript{101} Chicago was also the home of two ‘leading figures of the Ladies’ Land League’ in the form of journalists Alice May Quinn (and her sister Daisy) and Irish-born Margaret Buchanan Sullivan, the wife of Alexander Sullivan.\textsuperscript{102} The women who led the LLL in Chicago, at least in the Tenth Ward, were predominantly children of the Famine, women who had left Ireland as young children, presumably because of the effects of the Famine. Quinn was an exception to this, and represented the importance of social reform internationally in encouraging


\textsuperscript{99} \textit{Daily Inter Ocean}, 9 December 1880; \textit{Daily Inter Ocean}, 28 April 1881.

\textsuperscript{100} \textit{Daily Inter Ocean}, 31 March 1882.

\textsuperscript{101} \textit{Daily Inter Ocean}, 7 March 1881; US Census, 1880 data for Mrs M.B. (Elizabeth) Rigney, Mrs (Anna) May, Mrs Catherine Reid, Mrs (J.H.) Bishop.

involvement in the Land League. Just as the LLL was led by journalists and the
wives of socially and occupationally important men, the ALL was led by
Chicago’s lawyers and other prominent men.

The ‘No Rent Manifesto’ issued by the arrested Irish leaders of the Land League
called for the boycott of English goods in Ireland and abroad, attacking Britain
economically. The Eighth Ward Land League pledged ‘not to buy, use, or wear
any goods manufactured in or the product of [English] manufactures.’103 Women
in the LLL enthusiastically supported the No Rent Manifesto in the United States,
using their position as controller of the family economy to show their nationalist
allegiances.104 As John S. Thomas later noted in a letter to the Citizen, ‘Irishmen
are not profitable to England until they come America; then they become
purchasers of England’s goods, thus creating two-thirds of her wealth’.105 The
Land League was therefore working in tandem with the efforts of physical-force
separatists to hamper British power in Ireland and capitalist inequality more
widely, one through economic means, the other through terror.

The No Rent Manifesto created tensions within the Land League, reflecting wider
splits in the Irish community in Chicago between the rising middle classes and the
working class. It also divided those who prioritised economic inequality in Ireland
and the United States from conservative nationalists who feared a slide into
radicalism. Onahan became a conservative nationalist, siding with Parnell and his
promotion of constitutional nationalism. In Onahan’s view, the No Rent agitation
would ‘reduce society to a state of anarchy; and uproot all moral and christian
principles.’106

Though Onahan worried about the uprooting of all Christian principles, it was
during the 1880s that Irish nationalism in Chicago gained the tacit approval of the
Catholic clergy in the city. Chicago’s Archbishop Feehan was described as

103 Daily Inter Ocean, 9 February 1881.
104 Ely M. Janis, ‘Petticoat Revolutionaries: Gender, Ethnic Nationalism, and the Irish Ladies’
106 Chicago Tribune, 17 March 1883; William Onahan to B. Callaghan, Vice-President of St
Patrick’s Society, 25 November 1881 (ACA, Onahan Papers, ADMN/C5920/601 Box 5).
‘perhaps the most vehement defender of the Clan-na-Gael and other Irish groups’ in the city.\textsuperscript{107} Other Catholic priests supported the aims of the Land Leaguers, but fought against the growing power of the Clan, and specifically Alexander Sullivan\textsuperscript{108} Irish Protestants who may have joined in the fight for Irish nationalism were hindered by ‘a very natural fear of the intolerance of the Roman Church…If Irishmen haven’t manhood enough to put the cause of their country above that of their respective churches they will never be anything but what they are’.\textsuperscript{109} The link between Irish and Catholic in Chicago was thereby encouraged by the lack of strong clerical resistance to Irish nationalism, alienating prospective Protestant allies and encouraging further socialising between priest and congregant.

The decline of the Land League in the aftermath of the No Rent Manifesto led to a transition of membership in Chicago. While constitutional nationalists were reorganised into the Irish National League of America (INLA), supporting Parnell’s fight for a Home Rule Bill, the Land League’s more radical members split themselves between the Clan na Gael and the Knights of Labor. The Ladies’ Land League had an international proclivity towards radicalism, stronger than in the men’s movement.\textsuperscript{110} For Chicago’s men, the differing social and economic opportunities offered by Irish nationalist organisations often led to a cross-over in membership, for example Dennis O’Connor who was the treasurer of the Illinois State Land League and a member of the Clan na Gael.\textsuperscript{111} Similarly, Judge Richard Prendergast, a vocal Land Leaguer became a Clan na Gaeler. Prendergast, one of the most powerful Irishmen in Chicago, was introduced to bricklayer and IRB organiser Andy Foy’s wife at an Ogden Grove picnic in 1882.\textsuperscript{112} The opportunities provided by public events and membership of nationalist organisations facilitated networks which transcended class boundaries.

\textsuperscript{107} McMahon, \textit{What Parish}, chapter 1; Funchion, \textit{Chicago’s Irish Nationalists}, 38.
\textsuperscript{108} Janis, \textit{Greater Ireland}, 169.
\textsuperscript{109} \textit{Chicago Tribune}, 14 August 1881.
\textsuperscript{111} Janis, \textit{Greater Ireland}, 170.
\textsuperscript{112} Elizabeth Foy’s typed recollections (NLI, John Devoy Papers, MS 18,058(3)).
The Lady Day Ogden Grove demonstrations continued in earnest throughout the decade and in 1883 it was estimated that 10,000 ‘Celtic people’ gathered of whom many were ‘outspoken in their hate of England and everything English’. However, unlike John F. Finerty and the speakers, the Tribune believed that very few of those applauding would act on their words, arguing that ‘There are perhaps millions of Irishmen who share his feelings of hostility to England. Are they prepared to act on this feeling of hostility and unite in an armed effort to rid Ireland of English rule? Mr. Finerty knows very well that they are not.’

The potential for nepotism was an incentive to participation in Chicago Irish nationalism, particularly in a city where city politics and jobs were decided by ethnic competition. Therefore, despite the thousands of attendees, the Ogden Grove picnics were a mixture of supporters of the Land League, Clan na Gael, and members of the Irish community with little interest in political nationalism.

By 1885, the dynamite campaign had resulted in the imprisonment or death of many Irish Americans of a ‘soldier standard’ with no visible results for the establishment of an independent Ireland. Concurrently, Gladstone regained office, Parnell continued to rise in popularity, and the campaign for Irish Home Rule gained traction. The battle for control of the Clan and the funds raised for the next fight for Irish freedom resulted in a conflict between the Triangle (led by Alexander Sullivan, Michael Boland and Denis Feeley) and anti-Trianglers (led by John Devoy and Patrick Cronin) emerged in Chicago. In 1886, there were two rival Lady Day demonstrations, the Triangle-supporters in Ogden Grove, and their opponents in the West Side Driving Park. The militarised organisations of the Hibernian Guards and Clan na Gael attended the former, while the Ancient Order of Hibernians, the Parnell Aid Association, the Palmer House Committee, and a committee of ladies selected by the Sisters in charge of St Joseph’s Catholic Orphan Asylum attended the latter. The split between secular and religious organisations, as well as secret and public, was clear. The 50¢ that patrons paid to attend the Triangle event was pledged to the armed fight for Irish independence.

---

113 Chicago Tribune, 19 August 1883.
114 Irish American Weekly, 21 August 1886; Irish American Weekly, 28 August 1886. This split between the Ancient Order of Hibernians and Hibernian Rifles is interesting considering they were part of the same parent organisation, the Chicago divisions of both organisations appearing next to each other in the National Directory of the Ancient Order of Hibernians, 1884-85.
whereas the alternative demonstration was to split the proceeds between the orphanage and the Parliamentary Fund. As the years progressed, the Triangle’s reach left the confines of the Clan, extending throughout most of the city’s Irish nationalist organisations under the umbrella of the United Irish Societies of Cook County.\textsuperscript{115}

The Haymarket bombing of 4 May 1886 has been credited with dampening Chicago’s appetite for dynamite and the associated tools of anarchist and socialist movements.\textsuperscript{116} However, the Irish physical-force adherents who spoke at the Ogden Grove demonstration that year did not heed this change in mentality.\textsuperscript{117} Finerty, one of the organisers, pledged that the demonstration was to ‘furnish aid to Ireland, so that she may avail herself of the privilege of self-defence [...] When coercion is inaugurated, Ireland will be compelled to resist. Agitation will be chained.’\textsuperscript{118} He was followed on stage by the equally vehement Matthew P. Brady, a lawyer, who gave ‘a long and most bombastic address’ in which he declared that the Home Rule Bill was ‘unauthorized, and a violation of his sacred trust’.\textsuperscript{119} However, despite the strong words from the Irish-American speakers, the visiting speaker Michael Davitt, refused to be drawn into the violent rhetoric that would have enthused his audience. Instead he argued that he would prefer to plod along in life striving for self-government than giving in to revenge. In a moment of rebuke, he observed

It was easy to set up an ideal Irish Republic by patriotic speeches 3,000 miles away, they could not do it on the hills and plains of dear old Ireland [...] The Irish leaders had been charged in America with accepting an unsatisfactory solution of the Irish question. Very good. But their critics must admit that, with all its faults, the scheme recognized that principle of self-government for which the Irish had so long contended.\textsuperscript{120}

\textsuperscript{115} \textit{Ancient Order of Hibernians}, 73-74; Pat Grant found that the Board of Erin Ancient Order was the ‘true order’ - \textit{Daily Inter Ocean}, 16 September 1890.
\textsuperscript{116} Cowan, ‘Immigrants, Nativists’, 203-204.
\textsuperscript{117} \textit{Irish American Weekly}, 28 August 1886.
\textsuperscript{118} \textit{Citizen}, 14 August 1886, quoted in \textit{The Queen’s Enemies in America Assembled in Convention at Chicago} (London: William Ridgway, 1886), 20. The idea of the Irish as helpless slaves during the Famine was promoted by revolutionary nationalists as a criticism of constitutional nationalists. Donnelly, \textit{Great Irish Potato Famine}, 240.
\textsuperscript{119} \textit{The Queen’s Enemies}, 22-23.
\textsuperscript{120} \textit{Irish American Weekly}, 28 August 1886.
The subsequent support of Davitt’s argument from Devoy, the anti-Trianglers, and many of the Home Rulers based in Ireland signalled a disconnect between nationalist activity in Ireland and in Chicago. In response, Finerty accused those who did not agree with him of cowardice.121 The split between constitutional nationalists and radical separatists was, on the surface, complete. However, the links between labour radicalism and Irish nationalism was not. Three weeks after the Davitt-Finerty debacle, an estimated 13,000 men and women of the labouring classes participated in a demonstration at Ogden Grove. Congressmen and labour organiser Frank Lawler, the brother-in-law of Michael Scanlan, spoke at the demonstration alongside Judge Prendergast and Mrs Delia Parnell. Prendergast’s speech allied the labour movement with support for Parnell, further complicating the narrative and focus of Irish nationalists within Chicago.122

As the 1880s closed, Chicago’s Irish nationalist organisations imploded. Faced with the murder trial of Patrick Cronin, one of Sullivan’s fiercest critics, the Clan na Gael’s secrets were exposed to the world.123 Irish physical force nationalism in the city was forced into relative silence during the 1890s. By 1893 the Ogden Grove demonstration had taken on a new tone as the ‘Shamrock, Rose, and Thistle’ came together to support Home Rule, and denunciation of England was declared out of order. It was asserted that ‘the barring out of the excoriation of the hated Saxon made ducks and drakes of their tropes and figures, which, under the circumstances, would be almost as useful as wings in a swimming contest.’124 However, although the links between Ireland-based nationalists and Chicago’s Clan na Gael events weakened, Chicagoans continued to read publications like the Citizen. In 1889 the paper’s Saturday edition had a circulation of around 14,500 per week nationwide. By 1894, this circulation had increased to 16,350.125 Internal divisions had pushed the city’s Irish nationalists to the limit, and some struggled to find a place in a world where Home Rule was prized and militant nationalism was ridiculed. However, Chicago had always demonstrated strong

---

121 Ibid.; Kansas City Times, 16 August 1886; Irish Nation, 26 August 1886.
122 Chicago Tribune, 7 September 1886.
123 The subject of O’Brien, Blood Runs Green.
124 Daily Inter Ocean, 16 August 1893.
support for constitutional change and reform of social inequality. For those who demanded physical force action, the decade that had started with a bombing campaign ended in infamy.

Melbourne

Melbourne’s 1879-80 Irish Relief Fund was supported by donations from the Christian Brothers, as well as the Mayors of Koroit, Richmond, and Stawell. With the support of respected and respectable members of Melbourne society, the Fund’s subscriptions had reached £9,290 by January 1880. While the Argus raised the concern that ‘the contributions of Victorians would be misapplied to a political purpose,’ the support of the prominent citizens, not just politicians but civic leaders, and the constitution of the Dublin Committee of the Irish Relief Fund helped to dispel the fears of duping perpetuated by the Age and Argus. At the same time as funds were being raised for the Irish poor, the Advocate also announced a subscription fund for the legal defence of Parnell and other Land Leaguers. The Parnell Land League Defence Fund was established in November 1880, headed by Joseph Winter and Thomas Fogarty, the popular Mayor of Hotham. It was expected that people of all nationalities who held ‘liberal views on the land question’ would donate, however the responses of donators show the importance of lived experience in Land League support. Pat McGrath noted that

It is not easy for people of other nationalities to enter into the state of feeling of an Irish father of a family on the day of his eviction. In spite of his best exertions the land did not produce sufficient to meet the demands of his landlord, and so, for no fault of his, because he could not accomplish the impossible, he and his family are cast forth on the highway to die

Seizing upon the monetary support provided to Parnell’s legal defence, Irish Land League organiser John Walshe visited Victoria in mid-1881 to promote the League, and was received enthusiastically in the particularly Irish areas of Hotham, Richmond, and Collingwood, all areas with thriving Irish ethnic

126 Argus, 29 January 1880.
127 Advocate, 31 January 1880; Age, 4 August 1880; Argus, 14 August 1880.
128 Advocate, 27 November 1880.
129 Advocate, 4 December 1880.
fraternities and subscriber lists for Irish causes during the 1870s. By mid-October 1881, there were 30 branches of the Land League in Victoria, mostly in rural and regional Victoria, along with 15 branches of the Ladies’ Land League, 13 of which were outside of Melbourne.\textsuperscript{130}

The \textit{Age} and \textit{Argus} united in their attempts to discredit the Land League. The former through fear mongering about sectarianism and the latter by emphasising the lack of respectability and lower class support network that it received. Rural Victoria had a history of concern with land ownership and rights since gold was found in the 1850s and had continued with the lively debates on land ownership and leasehold occupation of Crown Land, known as squatting, in parliament.\textsuperscript{131} The rapid expansion of Land League branches in Victoria led to tension between nationalist organisers in rural and urban areas. On 18 October 1882, the Melbourne Central Committee adopted formal resolutions that they would be responsible for representing all Victorian Land League branches on the advice of Joseph Winter. Melbourne’s nationalist leaders were officially charged with speaking for ‘all adherents to the cause and sympathisers with it, of whatever religion or nationality they may be’.\textsuperscript{132} It also provided a link between promoters of Irish nationalism in different settlements around Melbourne and rural Victoria. Frequent donations were sent from Melbourne to the Irish Land League, directly to Dublin or through personal contacts as when Mrs James Calligan sent £1 from Melbourne to Mrs Y. G. Hazel of the Gort Ladies’ Land League.\textsuperscript{133} These donations added to spiritual support being sent to Ireland through the Catholic school sodalities’ prayers for the peace and prosperity of Ireland.

Following the positive reaction to Walshe, John and William Redmond visited the colony in 1883, beginning a connection that was cemented by their marriages to two cousins from New South Wales.\textsuperscript{134} However, their lecture tour was marked by

\textsuperscript{130} Naughtin, ‘Green Flag’, 68-78.
\textsuperscript{132} Naughtin, ‘Green Flag’, 74.
\textsuperscript{133} \textit{Freeman’s Journal} (Dublin), 14 December 1881, 1 & 8 February, 19 April 1882.
\textsuperscript{134} Parnell asked that Redmond ‘proceed to Australia and New Zealand for the purpose of placing...before our friends the present deplorable state of things in Ireland and soliciting this
dissent and displeasure. The news of the Invincibles murders\(^{135}\) and the Irish-American Dynamite Campaign led many of Melbourne’s leading Irishmen to condemn all Irish nationalist orators.\(^{136}\) Further demonstrating the tensions between urban and rural Victoria, it was recommended that John Redmond did not visit Ballarat ‘owing to the strong opinions of the local press, which goes as far as to say that loyal citizens should unite and drive him out of the town’.\(^{137}\) Similar responses had greeted the efforts of Irish Victorians the previous year when five M.L.A.s and two prominent barristers signed an address from ‘the Irish People in Victoria and Their Descendants’ to their brothers in Ireland. The address was to commemorate the centennial celebration of Grattan’s declaration of Irish independence.\(^{138}\)

While the Grattan Address celebrated the ‘prudence and firmness with which you [the Land League and its Home Rule MPs] are acting’, it caused a crisis in the Victorian Legislature. Irish-Australian Premier, Sir Bryan O’Loghlen, and the signatories, John Gavan Duffy, Francis Longmore, Daniel Brophy, W. O’Callaghan, and James Toohey were forced to defend themselves from charges ranging from indiscretion to treason. While all the signatories repeatedly pledged their loyalty to the Queen and the Imperial Parliament, they stood by their signing of the address, arguing that loyalty did not mean that gave up their right to discuss grievances in the British Empire, or that they could not support Home Rule in Ireland. Afterall, the loyalty of the Canadian parliamentarians or Gladstone had not been explicitly questioned after their support for Irish rights.\(^{139}\) In this way the signatories echoed the sentiments of Thomas Davis who declared in 1842 that

sympathy and support in the great struggle which our people are making for the attainment of their national rights.’ Charles Parnell to John Redmond, 1 December 1882 (NLI, Redmond Papers, MS 15220).

\(^{135}\) On 6 May 1882, a group of Irishmen acting under the name of the Invincibles attacked Lord Frederick Cavendish and Thomas Henry Burke, the newly appointed Chief Secretary for Ireland and the Permanent Undersecretary, in Phoenix Park, Dublin. While the Invincibles were condemned, they became celebrated in some Irish nationalist circles. This was demonstrated when one of the informers was tracked down to a ship in South Africa to be assassinated. There was an international campaign to prevent the execution of his assassin. Patrick J. P. Tynan, *The Irish National Invincibles and their times* (London: Chatham & Co., 1894); Whelehan, *Dynamiters*, 117.


\(^{137}\) Daniel Brophy to Joseph Winter, 3 March 1883 (SLV, Winter Papers MS 8622, Box 1798/1).

\(^{138}\) *Advocate*, 27 May 1882.

\(^{139}\) *Age*, 7 June 1882.
‘We owe allegiance to Victoria, Queen of Ireland’ but ‘We owe no allegiance either in law or conscience to the prosperity of English crime’. These men were predominantly Catholic and had left Ireland under differing circumstances. They had spent decades in Melbourne, but all retained a wish to celebrate the idea of Irish self-government.

Home Rule may have gained the support of some Irish politicians, but for the city’s elders, the stability of Melbourne society overruled Irish politics. John O’Shanassy joined with Archbishop Goold in denouncing active support of Home Rule in Melbourne. While Goold stated that ‘I wish the Home Rule principle were strictly observed. Each one to mind his own business at home […] Keep your red hot politicians in Ireland’. O’Shanassy demonstrated the split in priorities of Irish middle classes in Melbourne, arguing that the signatories should ‘drink to the memory of the Irish patriot Grattan on St. Patrick’s day at the St. Patrick’s Hall’ but that it ‘would be better for his countrymen to avoid exciting scenes and language, and endeavor on the other hand to show to Scotch and English that they desired to help her in Victoria to build up a great empire and live under good laws.’ O’Shanassy had left his hurling days behind.

A year later the Redmonds’ vision of a British Empire of ‘mutually interdependent nations underpinned by liberal political ideas’ should have found a welcoming audience within conservative Melbourne. However, the Redmonds’ lectures had a noticeable absence of men of means, observing publicly that there were a “large number of cowardly Irishmen who hadn’t the common manliness to stand by their side and adhere to the principles which they professed to hold”. John Gavan Duffy rebuked Redmond saying that while he understood Irish

---

141 Quoted in Campbell, ‘Irish Nationalism’.
142 Age, 1 June 1882.
143 Kelly, ‘Nationalist Opinion’.
144 Quoted in Campbell, ‘John Redmond’.
Australians who supported the Irish National League\textsuperscript{145}, he also understood that many prioritised their lives in Melbourne, and their links (no doubt economic as well as social) to non-Irish neighbours. Despite the mixed reception to the Redmonds’ visit, their tour brought in a total of £14,657.10.3 to the Irish National League in Dublin, their travelling expenses of over £2,500 being offset by the Australasian branch.\textsuperscript{146} The HACBS and CYMS had provided a venue for discussion and debate on Irish history since the 1870s, and as these ethnic fraternities expanded and found new audiences in new arrivals as well as second and third generation Irishmen in Australia, they supported the work being done by visiting and high profile speakers, Working men could not always spare the money to attend special lectures, and therefore the weekly work of the benefit and young men’s societies were vital to spreading a constant message about Irish history and suffering to all levels of Irish-Australian society.\textsuperscript{147} The Irish ethnic organisations of Melbourne utilised the introduction of ‘an overt, rather than merely a latent, nationalism into the ideological arena’.\textsuperscript{148}

Melbourne’s Irish ethnic organisers may have criticised Westminster policies in Ireland, however they provided a consistent message of Irish loyalty to the British Empire. There was a recognition that Melbourne’s Irish communities needed more than letters asking for money from nationalist leaders in Ireland to keep the spirit of political nationalism focused and enthusiastic. In 1884, John Redmond wrote to Joseph Winter ‘I suppose the Austr-Irish feeling has very much moderated since I left’.\textsuperscript{149} Aided by this knowledge and the increased ease of travel to Australia during the 1880s, there was a rise in visits from Irish envoys to the city, as well as the relocation of Irish informers by the British Government.\textsuperscript{150} There was also a shift in the priorities of Melbourne’s established organisations, demonstrating the growth of respectability of the Home Rule cause. The St

\textsuperscript{146} J. Harrington to J. Winter, 7 February 1884 & Receipt signed by J.W. Redmond, William K. Redmond, John W. Walsh, 13 December 1883 (SLV, Winter Papers, 1798/1).
\textsuperscript{147} \textit{Advocate}, 22 April 1882 & 23 May 1885.
\textsuperscript{149} J.E. Redmond to J. Winter, 2 June 1884 (SLV, Winter Papers, Box 1798/1).
\textsuperscript{150} \textit{Gippsland Times}, 24 August 1883; \textit{Age}, 23 August 1883; \textit{Advocate}, 23 May 1885.
Patrick’s Society, a vocally non-sectarian and non-political organisation, established branches of the Irish Members’ Fund in 1886, transferring some of the St Patrick’s Society’s power into the local parish. The subscription list was to assist the 86 Home Rule members to ‘defray their expenses in going to England until they shall have obtained a Parliament of their own in College Green.’ Laurence Buckley established the Brunswick committee arguing that

If they allowed the opportunity to slip by without assisting Mr. Parnell by the only means in their power, they should not call themselves Irishmen. Notwithstanding [sic] that their district was poor, and the majority of them were labouring men, nevertheless they should help the cause, no matter in how small a way.

In that first meeting of 22 men, the sum of £5.7s.6d was collected, the Hotham branch also collected £50 during one meeting. Buckley had been a member of the Brunswick CYMS and later acted as the honorary secretary of the Ladies’ Association of Charity of St Vincent de Paul. He joined other leading members of Melbourne’s Irish organisations who were spread throughout the main institutions of Irish Catholic life. By 1887 it was commented that Australia had sent ‘a continuous stream of gold to Ireland to carry on the struggle’ for the Irish national cause. That year the Celtic Club was organised to support the Home Rule cause in Ireland. Named the Celtic Club rather than the Irish Club because ‘Ireland’s aspirations for self government had the support of a great body of opinion which had no Irish ancestral affiliations’. John Gavan Duffy, Dr Nicholas O’Donnell, Morgan P. Jaguers, and Martin Hood were all on the organising committee, bringing together old stalwarts of the St Patrick’s Society, politicians, and supporters of Irish language and cultural nationalism as detailed in chapter two.

During the 1880s, Melbourne’s Irish middle-class leaders were able to encourage and consolidate the different branches of nationalist organisations so that the centre of power was in Melbourne, not in rural Victoria. Society columns in

---

151 Advocate, 6 February 1886
152 Age, 15 June 1886.
153 Advocate, 30 June 1883 & 18 February 1888; Age, 1 March 1890.
154 Age, 15 June 1886.
155 Advocate, 8 January 1887.
156 Buggy, Celtic Club.
newspapers brought about a sense of unification which was enhanced by an annual meeting of all the Irish nationalist organisations in the city convened by leading members of Irish-Melbourne society.\textsuperscript{156} By 1889, there was another ‘successful’ Irish envoy to Melbourne, John Dillon’s mission, which stopped off in Melbourne, was more widely supported by the leaders of Irish society in Melbourne, its welcoming committee including Sir Bryan O’Loghlen, members of the Celtic Club committee, doctors, Justices of the Peace, and lawyers.\textsuperscript{157} It was now socially acceptable to be linked with Irish nationalist thought. Archbishop Carr of Melbourne noted that ‘here at least hopes are higher that Gladstone’s speedy return to office will end the long chapter of the Irish struggle’ and hoped that the lecture tour would collect around £30,000.\textsuperscript{158} Links between Ireland and Melbourne were therefore protected and promoted at a social, nationalist, and religious level. Melbourne’s Irish society embraced elements of the Gaelic Revival and, led by Winter and Nicholas O’Donnell, brought the Irish societies under one roof. They received a visit from Michael Davitt in 1895, and continued to support the United Irish League financially throughout the 1890s while encouraging the learning of the Irish language.\textsuperscript{159} In this way, the 1880s was a decade of awakening for Irish nationalists in Melbourne which would continue to evolve until Archbishop Mannix was able to capture the attention of the world with his focusing of an Irish-Australian nationalist feeling in the aftermath of the First World War.

Conclusion.

This chapter has documented the evolution of Irish nationalist organisations and thought in Melbourne and Chicago over the latter half of the nineteenth century. In both cities the middle classes sought to dominate the direction of nationalist

\textsuperscript{156} Advocate, 8 November 1890.
\textsuperscript{157} Advocate, 13 April 1889.
\textsuperscript{158} Carr to Abp Walsh (Dublin), 20 September 1889 (DDA, uncatalogued).
\textsuperscript{159} By 1902, Nicholas O’Donnell was asking for Irish language promoter Thomas O’Donnell, MP for West Kerry, to be sent on a lecture tour to Australia as a ‘large number of Melbourne natives attend the classes conducted under the auspices of the local Gaelic League and they are making good progress with their studies’ (O’Donnell to O’Brien, 2 June 1902, NLI Redmond Papers, MS15,235/1).
activity. Their success depended on who they had to appeal to for support, and how they framed the fight for Irish political freedom. In Melbourne, the principal organisers were journalists, politicians and the Irish-born mayors of the city and suburbs who accessed their secular transnational networks of influence by communication with their Irish counterparts. Many of these men had been brought up attending CYMS and St Patrick’s Society events, and articulated foundational and loyal identities formed in these organisations. In Chicago, conversely, nationalist organisations dominated Irish secular life from the late 1850s. Members of the middle class, like James Mulligan, may have been the organisers in the mid-century but the chaos of the Civil War and Chicago Fire dispersed control of ethnic life across the classes.

As the decades progressed, the messages of nationalist leaders in Melbourne and Chicago diverged. In Melbourne, Irish nationalism was consistently framed as an Irish problem which those abroad could support and set an example for improvement. In Chicago, the industrialised nature of the city allowed for the blending of Irish land reform and social disenfranchisement with American labour disputes. This was partially enabled by the differences in land mass. In Victoria, radical politics and action was found principally in the goldfields of rural Victoria. This was true in 1854 and can be seen in the location of most Land League branches during the 1880s. While Melbourne’s middle classes sought to bring everyone under the control of the urban conservatives through the Melbourne Central Committee, distance enabled a separation in motivations. In industrialised Chicago, however, there was a mix of radical and conservative Irish nationalist thought within one city. Radicalism was not, as in Melbourne, in wider Illinois. In order to exert power and control in Chicago, middle-class organisers were required to respond and represent a range of views, splitting the Irish middle class along physical force and constitutional activities.

However, while there were many differences, there were similarities in how the Irish communities of Melbourne and Chicago responded to Irish nationalism. The influence of the Catholic Church in each city was important in the progress of Irish nationalism, and the form that it took. Chicago’s hierarchy sought to curb the spread of the Fenian Brotherhood through threats of excommunication in the first
decades of the mid-century. Later, the rise of the Clan na Gael and the Land League were facilitated by a sympathetic Archbishop and parish priests. In Melbourne, Archbishop Goold worked with imperial law and order structures to condemn Irish threats to the British Empire, however his successor Carr was influenced by the participation of respected citizens in nationalist endeavours. The Catholic Church’s parish structures, and dependence on female fundraising, benefited Irish nationalism in Melbourne and Chicago by utilising the skills of women in organising fairs, dances, and collecting committees.

By the late 1870s, labour radicalism blended with constitutional nationalism internationally to unite the moderate Irish communities of Melbourne and Chicago in the fight for Irish self-rule. The Land League garnered similar support and rhetoric in Melbourne and Chicago, undermining the argument that those who went to Australia were fundamentally different in experience and background to those who emigrated to the United States. These organisations were linked to each other through the Freeman’s Journal in Dublin. However, the political structures of the British Empire and the United States created differing tensions for earlier manifestations of Irish nationalist activity. The Civil War had inspired violence as a means to achieve change in the United States and Ireland and it provided the tools and training that was needed. In Melbourne, conversely, geographical distance from Ireland prioritised monetary donations and education of Irish history. The line between the Empire and the actions of the Westminster government was blurred by some Irish nationalists, and the threat of militant intervention within the Empire’s outposts was noticed by Melbourne’s Irish-established police forces.

Diasporic Irish communities built upon the foundational identities created by the Catholic Church, education, and parish life to evolve a spectrum of Irish nationalist activity acceptable to both Irish society and the ideological and global power positions within which they were placed. Nationalist organisations provided an additional venue for socialising and nostalgia which built upon connections founded elsewhere within the parish. How the middle-classes constructed and internalised a ‘shared collective memory’ of Irishness influenced
how each city responded to Irish nationalism. A vital tool in the representation of Irish diasporic life, and the construction of a sense of belonging to an ethnic community, was St Patrick’s Day. This language of belonging to Ireland and America/Australia over multiple generations is explored further in the next chapter.

160 Delaney, ‘Irish Diaspora’.
Chapter Six: St Patrick’s Day and the Public Rhetoric of Identity.

In 1869 a letter to the editor of the Advocate suggested a change in how Melbourne’s Irish community celebrated their patron saint, St Patrick. Until that point, the powerful and influential men of the city had met to listen to each other make speeches on Irish and imperial loyalty, to toast the Queen, and to eat the delicacies of the best caterers in the city. The St Patrick’s Society dominated the organisation of Ireland’s patron saint’s day, and restricted its celebration to ‘two hundred of the colony’s leading citizens’ by invitation and entrance fees. By the end of the 1860s it was observed that in not including them, there was a danger of losing the national allegiance of Melbourne’s less elite Irish people.¹ The decade had seen a stabilising of the city’s population and the increase of religious education and social organisation of Melbourne’s Irish lower classes. In response events celebrating Irish identity were requested for the mechanics, tradesmen, and labourers ‘and the classes generally who cannot afford to pay high for amusements’.² There was also a younger generation of Irish-descended people who had been raised in Melbourne. The writer enquired whether it would not be more satisfactory if the prosperity of Ireland was toasted, not just in St Patrick’s Hall, but ‘re-echoed in the air by a few thousand voices, and that the children of Irish parents witness…[and] remember it. This is the purpose that patriotism abroad should have in view’.³ Religious and ethnic education combined with an emphasis on teaching Irish history in social clubs and benefit societies to make organisers more aware that if they wanted to create a sustained and unified ethnic community within Melbourne, they needed to expand their presentation of what it meant to be Irish across generational and class boundaries.

This chapter builds upon the themes of previous chapters to explore the rhetoric used by leading Irish organisers in Melbourne and Chicago on that most public Irish holiday. The language of belonging and loyalty used at St Patrick’s Day dinners and demonstrations brought together the priorities of diverse communities, encompassing educational, religious, and political identities. These were

---
¹ Advocate, 18 March 1868.
² Advocate, 27 March 1869.
³ Advocate, 27 March 1869.
opportunities to present certain images of diasporic Irishness within and outwith the Irish community. It explores the role that St Patrick’s Day played in shaping Irish identity as a national identity, and conversely, the extent to which the day reflected the concerns of those already involved in Irish community life. The celebration of St Patrick’s Day on 17 March was a particularly diasporic phenomenon in the nineteenth century. While in Ireland the emphasis was on religious devotion, the diaspora used the day in a multitude of ways. For some, the Catholic Church loomed large and occasionally the Protestant churches claimed the day for their Irish parishioners. Others took the opportunity to claim space in the city, declaring their right to be there and the power that they wielded with those who supplied parade permits. At times, it was a moment to declare solidarity with political movements, and at others to celebrate the Irish community’s networks of ethnic organisations and pride in cultural nationalism. Most of the time, they were a mix of all of these elements. This chapter uses St Patrick’s Day celebrations to understand how diasporic communities prioritised the image of Ireland and the United States or Australia, and their distinct identities through different generations and domestic circumstances.

The importance of St Patrick’s Day to the perception of Irishness in different contexts should not be overestimated, but it should be considered as one of the ways that groups of people portrayed themselves to a large audience. Mike Cronin and Daryl Adair present St Patrick’s Day as an ‘arbiter […] of the “progress” and “destiny” of the Irish’ and therefore as an annual opportunity for advocacy on different issues. However, they warn that the position of St Patrick’s Day as an ‘Irish’ day can distort the impression of the Irish communities in a particular context, creating a false sense of homogeneity and ignoring the ‘silent majority’. While St Patrick’s Day celebrations did not claim to represent each Irish person in the diaspora, they did provide Irish people around the world with the opportunity to select the elements of Irishness that would form the Irish Story of that

---

6 David Fitzpatrick, Irish Emigration, 1801-1921 (Dublin: Economic & Social History Society of Ireland, 1984), 36.
community. St Patrick’s Day was used by Irish-Americans and Irish-Australians to frame their lives within a proud cultural Irish heritage. This chapter examines the ways that Irish organisations and leaders used memory to legitimate ‘a particular image of its present and its future, and a particular structure of power and social relations.’ The deployment of art, oratory, and ritual combined with institutional history and presence, the St Patrick’s Hall and Irish-American Clubs among others, provided diasporic communities with an Irish tradition steeped in the history of Melbourne and Chicago.

Just as the study of Irish nationalism has been dominated by men, the make up of St Patrick’s Day processions in Melbourne and Chicago during the nineteenth century present an image of predominantly middle-class male involvement. Through the careful application of invitation and admission charges, there was an organiser-led distinction of who was deemed to be respectable or worthy of participating in and claiming particular Irish identities. However, though St Patrick’s Day was often a stage for middle-class men, there were other groups involved in the wider events: in the religious ceremonies, in the streets, and at the fairs. These people influenced and were influenced by the middle-class culture brokers who were central to defining Irishness abroad. Parades in both cities were male-only affairs, however the crowds that lined the streets and those who attended picnics were a mix of ages and backgrounds, allowing for a family-friendly celebration of Irish identity and power. Outdoor events permitted the inclusion of men, women, and children from a range of classes to come together and celebrate Ireland’s patron saint. In this way, this chapter brings together the themes of this thesis, primarily ethnic affinity, education, religion, and associational culture to examine how Chicago and Melbourne's Irish culture brokers influenced or reflected the priorities of their communities during the nineteenth century.

8 Belchem, ‘Liverpool-Irish’.
Creating an Image of Ethnic Community.

Chicago and Melbourne’s societies had similar priorities in the 1840s and 1850s. They were cities of immigrants, rapidly increasing in wealth but without the requisite institutions to support them. As chapters two and four detailed, the secular and religious parishes were expanding, creating organisations to occupy, improve, and entertain their expanding populations. St Patrick’s Day provided an opportunity for the Irish in both cities to come together to celebrate Ireland and its heroes, as well as to reach out to their non-Irish neighbours. These events were often informal gatherings, however as the 1840s and 1850s progressed, certain societies took charge of formal events allowing for the promotion of a select group’s priorities as the voice of Melbourne or Chicago’s Irish communities. The St Patrick’s Day commemorations of the early years were important elements in the creation of a sense of stability and culture within the professional classes if not further afield. In both cities, the themes that emerge consistently are loyalty to their new homes, the mass migration of people from Ireland and their sense of belonging or exile, and the need for charity within Irish communities. This chapter examines the ways that these themes were articulated by different elements of the Irish diaspora.

Melbourne

St Patrick’s Day in Melbourne was dominated by the St Patrick’s Society from its establishment in 1842 until the end of the nineteenth century. The men of this organisation, Irish-born and descended politicians, doctors, and businessmen used the opportunity provided by the attendance of journalists at their dinners to prove their loyalty to their new imperial home and their social peers within that society. Between 1842 and 1845 the leadership of Fr. Geoghegan resulted in a strong correlation between the Catholic Church and Irish nationality. Under Geoghegan’s leadership, religious services featured heavily in the St Patrick’s Day celebrations of 1843 and 1844, resulting in heightened tensions between the Catholic and Orange

---

9 Bourke, Catholic Church, 10.
elements of Melbourne society. The Party Processions Act of 1846, initiated in response to these tensions, banned the public celebration of sentiments that ‘may create religious and political animosities between different classes of her Majesty’s subjects’ illegal. Bowing to this new requirement, the St Patrick’s Society reemphasised their dedication to being ‘open to all and influenced by none’ and moved their celebrations inside. The final parade the 1840s took place in 1846 when 400 people marched, a high level of participation in a city of 4,500. The move from public celebrations to private signalled a change in audience, from a parade which anyone could participate in to a select group of the middle class. To gain access to the now indoor St Patrick’s Society ball, revellers had to pay 6s with wine presenting an extra expense. The numbers of participants in these events ranged from 120 to 250 during the 1850s, an increasingly small number within an Irish-born population of between 4,500 and 17,500 over the decade. This was one of the events of the season and a chance to access the membership of ‘one of the most influential society’s [sic] in this province.’ The St Patrick’s Society events held in Melbourne between 1845 and 1860 emphasised the separation of religion and ethnicity of its members. Encouraging this secularism were the large number of Trinity College Dublin alumni in the Society. Within Melbourne, to be Catholic was to be Irish, but to be Irish was not necessarily to be Catholic, this was reflected in the city’s St Patrick’s Day celebrations.

Though the St Patrick’s Society organised the formal celebrations in Melbourne, there were a number of unofficial events for those who could not afford or have the contacts to attend. In 1852 Melbourne’s streets were filled with domestic servants and diggers from the goldfields, racing around in ‘almost every description of vehicle’ with long green ribbons streaming from their hats. Though swept up in the excitement of the gold-rushes, the St Patrick’s Society were keen to note their continued remembrance of Ireland presenting John

---

10 See chapters two and four.
11 ‘Party Processions Prevention Act’ (1846), 10 Vic. No. 1; Melbourne Morning Herald, 19 March 1851.
12 Port Phillip Gazette, 18 March 1846; Victorian Census, 1841.
13 Port Phillip Gazette, 14 March 1846.
14 Age, 26 March 1856; Age, 17 March 1858; Age, 19 March 1859.
15 Port Phillip Gazette, 18 March 1846.
16 Melbourne Morning Herald, 18 March 1852.
O’Shanassy with an address of thanks which, after mourning the suffering of Ireland at the ‘capriciousness of a dark and cruel Destiny’ praised their luck in finding in the ‘bright and golden land of Victoria, a union of Erin’s sons associated in an undertaking eminently calculated, whilst it enshrines the memory of their native home, to advance the prosperity of the home of their adoption’.  

By blaming destiny, not the actions of the British Government, Melbourne’s St Patrick’s Society made sure that their sorrow for the fate of their compatriots was not viewed in conflict with their loyalty to the imperial governance of the Australian colonies. The previous year they engaged with the famine in a similar way, through humour, allusion, and national competition, saying:

There was one circumstance, however, of which he [Mervin] thought not only the Irish, but the natives of other countries had reason to complain, viz. the spirit of exclusiveness which prevailed at the dinners of the Sons of St. George. John Bull, he was sorry to see was not at all so generous as his brother Patrick, for John generally monopolised all the roast beef to himself, whereas if Paddy had but a potatoe [sic] he would divide it. (Laughter) This was anything but fair, for John should be as just and generous as Pat, and he (the Speaker) hoped that at all future dinners of St. George, Englishmen would take a hint to be a little more neighbourly than usual.

This subtle chastisement of British policy in Ireland during the Famine, which disguised criticism within a toast to the fellowship of both societies, meant that the speaker could maintain the order banning political speeches, as well maintaining loyalty to British policies and choices. As noted in the earlier address to O’Shanassy, the granting of ‘responsible government’ in Victoria created an image of the colony as a testing ground for possible improvement in the governance of Ireland. Charles Gavan Duffy described Australia, and more specifically Melbourne, as an experiment in enlightenment. The new freedoms enjoyed by Irish Catholics in Melbourne led to the St Patrick’s Day promotion of an identity which reflected Daniel O’Connell’s more than more militant nationalists: that of the loyal British subject who was also proud of his Irish Catholic heritage.

17 Melbourne Morning Herald, 19 March 1852.
18 Melbourne Morning Herald, 19 March 1851.
Loyalty to the British Empire and Crown at the same time as loyalty to the memory of Ireland was a key theme throughout Melbourne’s St Patrick’s Day celebrations. The 1850 ball demonstrated this with organisers hanging a banner of St Patrick next to one of St George and the Dragon, lent for the occasion by the St George’s Society. The scene was described as ‘the contrast thus formed between the Rose and Shamrock side by side (as they should forever be) had a most imposing effect’.\(^{21}\) As Edmund Finn noted in 1851 ‘it appeared to him that nothing could be more appropriate or truly patriotic than a holy alliance of the fine dear old country they still so ardently loved and the newborn blooming land in which they then lived; with which their worldly interests were so closely entwined, and where the mortal remains of most of them would find a resting place.’\(^{22}\) The toast of Melbourne Mayor, Mr Smith, in 1855 ‘dilated on the well known loyalty of Ireland, and dwelt so forcibly and in such flattering terms of the spirit of devotion always felt by the Milesians for their beloved Queen, that he drew forth thunders of cheers for her Majesty’.\(^{23}\) The compatibility of Irish and British-Australian priorities were proudly declared, maintaining the people of Ireland’s place in the continued progression and prosperity of Victoria. While St Patrick’s Day was celebrated as the national day of Ireland, a moment for declaring an identity distinct from a wider British identity, a conscious effort was made to gain respectability and acceptance from the wider Melbourne society.

In 1854 Finn, the president of the St Patrick’s Society and a noted journalist, extended thanks to the ball’s attendees who were not Irish.\(^{24}\) The St Patrick’s Society provided links with other class and ethnicity based organisations and through newspaper publicity, they were able to forge links with organisations elsewhere within Victoria and the Australian colonies. These men were contributing to an image of separate but linked nations, a family of nations, encouraged by the attendance of representatives from the city’s other ethnic clubs. The men involved in organising St Patrick’s Day events were joining the leaders of St Andrew’s and

\(^{21}\) *Melbourne Morning Herald*, 20 March 1850.
\(^{22}\) *Melbourne Morning Herald*, 19 March 1851.
\(^{23}\) *Age*, 21 March 1851.
\(^{24}\) *Melbourne Morning Herald*, 20 March 1854.
St George’s Societies in contributing to a public image of Irish identity based in middle-class priorities. Despite the reservations of one newspaper correspondent who disapproved of exclusive meetings based on country of origin, celebration of ethnic identity spread and continued throughout the latter half of the nineteenth century. At this stage however, these celebrations were led and enjoyed by only a small number of people within Melbourne society. Their speeches were aimed at peers in politics and business. As such there were themes of loyalty and imperialism that may not have been echoed in other social clubs, however, these speeches were reported in newspapers across Victoria and as such, influenced the views of people from all social classes and backgrounds. These men were making a case for Irish involvement in Melbourne society and imperial life more generally.

The 1860s heralded a more vocal and closely-knit Irish community in Melbourne. However, in the midst of this increased solidarity, the St Patrick’s Society temporarily split over the society’s direction and this, combined with wet weather, resulted in no formal celebrations in 1860. In the absence of St Patrick’s Society events between 1860 and 1862, ‘a number of pleasure parties’ were held in Melbourne’s public gardens and coastlines. Alongside these informal events, the Catholic Church demonstrated its growing strength and position in the city when Bishop Goold held a Mass at the partially built St Patrick’s Cathedral. The three pillars of the church had been paid for by the Catholics of Ballarat, Emerald Hill (later South Melbourne), and Richmond. This was a celebration of increased Catholic wealth and community, as well as dedication and loyalty to the Catholic faith. The St Patrick’s Society soon regained their control of Melbourne’s St Patrick’s Day, but their absence had opened a space for the Catholic Church in the celebrations. This would grow over time, allowing the Catholic religious identities of Melbourne’s Irish communities to share the day with the secular and middle-class control of the St Patrick’s Society. The imperial restrictions of the Party

26 Argus, 2 May 1851.
27 The splits of 1860 were due to the society’s fall into political partisanship and financial mismanagement. In the midst of this dispute, the St Patrick’s Day celebrations were forgotten. Argus, 10 February 1860.
28 Age, 18 March 1861; Argus, 18 March 1862.
29 Argus, 19 March 1860.
Processions Prevention Act ensured the dominance of a secular elite, and the prioritisation of Melbourne’s political and social opportunities in the presentation of Irish identity in Melbourne.

Chicago

Unlike in Melbourne, the early years of Chicago had not been shaped by legislation banning processions. Parades took central stage, demonstrating the place of Irish people within the city. However, weather conditions often hampered the public promotion of Irish identity. Not for Chicago was the sunshine of Melbourne instead, Chicagoans were treated to snow storms and floods leading to cancellations, postponements, and complaints about weather-appropriate clothing for participants and observers alike. In 1849 St Patrick’s Day events were cancelled due to a devastating flood which caused the loss of around £250,000 worth of property as well as the sweeping away of bridges and the loss of at least two children’s lives.30 Similarly, St Patrick’s Day in 1858 was described as having ‘Premium weather for suicide and the “blues”’.31 The 1850 parade, however, was ‘large and well conducted’. Led by the Montgomery Guards in uniforms and juvenile musicians with flutes, the procession of the St Joseph’s Temperance Society had ‘quite a gala day appearance’ due to the badges and banners.32 These difficult conditions served as a test of ethnic loyalty and large turnouts in spite of bad weather were noted with pride in newspaper reports.

The main focus of the day was the public parade, however Irish societies also held their own evening balls and banquets. These events were attended by the city’s established citizens and were used to promote themes of loyalty to state and country, as well as loyalty to Ireland and Irish heroes. Chicago’s ball organisers, just as in Melbourne, ensured the attendance of people of influence and respectability by the charging a fee for admittance.33 The Chicago Hibernian Benevolent Society banquet in 1850 donated all of its profits to the relief of destitute

30 Daily Commercial Register, 22 March 1849; Daily Atlas, 23 March 1849.
31 Chicago Daily Journal, 17 March 1858.
32 Chicago Daily Journal, 21 March 1850.
33 Chicago Daily Times, 2 March 1855.
emigrants.\textsuperscript{34} This was the society’s third such festival, and participants toasted the United States, the State of Illinois, the memory of Washington, and the signatories of the Declaration of Independence, before toasting the memory of Daniel O’Connell and the patriots of 1798 and 1848. These toasts aligned the Irish citizens of Chicago with the heroes of American and Irish revolution, similar to the Irish militia units which had emerged over the previous eight years. By framing the American Revolution as sacred and linked to the Irish experience, those at the St Patrick’s Day events were contributing to a shared set of presumptions about life and loyalty in America.\textsuperscript{35} Though most of the toasts were led by men, women had a role to play in the proceedings of the evening. Just as male toast makers observed the part of women in keeping the Irish spirit abroad alive, two women raised a glass to the Emerald Isle. Miss Ellen Spear to ‘The Green Isle of Erin – A memory and a hope; a memory to those who have wandered; a hope to those who remain’. Miss Mary Carey followed with a note that Ireland was ‘Long remarkable for the gallantry of her Sons and the virtue of her daughters’.\textsuperscript{36}

A shared sense of Irish experience was emphasised by the reporting of St Patrick’s Day events in the ethnic press. The New York-based \textit{Irish American Weekly} included a large report on the 1852 St Patrick’s Day in Chicago, focusing on the banquet held by the Hibernian Society. The Chair, D. Mellroy, introduced the speeches saying that the meeting was ‘neither of a religious or a political character. They met for interchange of those feelings of national fraternity it was their duty at all times to inculcate and which it was so delightful to witness’. Despite Mellroy’s claims that the meeting was of neither a religious or political character, Irish nationalist politics were clearly exempt. Toasts were raised to Irish exiles, the Irish struggle for liberty, and to the ‘memory of the brave Montgomery’ after whom the Montgomery Guards were named on its establishment that year.\textsuperscript{37} In 1852, before the Chicago parades began in earnest, the Montgomery Guards accompanied by their band ‘and took their station before the communion rails in front of the pews’

\textsuperscript{34} \textit{Chicago Daily Journal}, 18 March 1850.
\textsuperscript{36} \textit{Chicago Daily Journal}, 23 March 1850.
\textsuperscript{37} \textit{Irish American Weekly}, 3 April 1852.
at St Mary’s Cathedral. In Chicago, Irish loyalty was proved by military power and prowess in the past and in the present.

The Catholic Church was represented throughout St Patrick’s Day events, with services beginning each St Patrick’s Day celebration. The day was an opportunity to pledge both religious and ethnic loyalty outside of the parish boundaries. However, organisers acknowledged that Irish people were separated by class, religious dedication and education. Despite the importance of the Catholic Church in celebrating St Patrick’s Day and Irish identity in the city, not all events revolved around one particular religion. From 1853 Chicago public celebrations were organised centrally by a committee of representatives from the city’s ethnic organisations. As no particular society took control, the committee allowed for multiple images of what it was to be Irish in Chicago. It also resulted in competition between the different elements of Irish parish life. The importance of the St Patrick’s Day parade in claiming public space for the celebration of Irish history, strength, and identity in both Irish and non-Irish minds was encapsulated by the competition for the role of chief marshal. Respect shown by and to the Irish of Chicago was a very important element in St Patrick’s Day. In 1860 it was angrily noted that the new municipal administration would be inaugurated on St Patrick’s Day. This was deemed to be ‘Another Insult to the Irish’. Chicago’s St Patrick’s Day parades were a clear staking of territory and belonging in the city, and to hinder them was threaten the place and power of a rising city influence.

In the years that St Patrick’s Day fell on a Sunday the separation between religion, charity, and ethnicity was emphasised in reports of the day’s events. In his welcome to the 250 attendees of the Hibernian Benevolent Society’s ball, T. J. Kinsella noted that the society had been established ‘to soften, to subdue, and destroy all these personal and sectarian animosities and prejudices’ that had separated the ‘sons of old Erin’. It was open to all and had charity and benevolence as its main objective. Religious organisations used the opportunity of St Patrick’s Day to raise money for

---

38 *Western Tablet*, 20 March 1852.
39 *Chicago Republican*, 19 March 1867.
40 *Chicago Daily Herald*, 11 March 1860.
41 *Chicago Daily Times*, 19 March 1855.
the support of the community while bringing together its elites.\textsuperscript{42} The Civil War provided another element to these celebrations encouraging ethnic and religious solidarity in Chicago while increasing the influence and visibility of the Fenian Brotherhood and later the Clan na Gael in the city.\textsuperscript{43} During the Civil War, parades were largely held in honour of departing regiments and in 1862 there was no St Patrick’s Day parade, instead ethnic pride was displayed most prominently on 14 June when the Irish Brigade departed the city.\textsuperscript{44} The Light Guard Band provided the music for the Sons of Erin Benevolent Society ball, bringing the war into the celebrations.\textsuperscript{45} When parades were held however the influence of wartime imagery can be seen. In 1863 it rained all day, leading to

Occasionally a flash of lightning shot through the rank vapors steaming up from the unctuous streets. Bipeds and quadrupeds were moist and unpleasant. Men were dripping and women trailed their bedraggled skirts through the mire, ignoring bedaubed hose and defiled ankles. Equine flanks emitted clouds of steam and the gay cavalcade of the morning might have rivalled a squad of army mules in the afternoon […] But in spite of the frowning skies and drenching rain, the procession formed and moved through the streets between living walls of Emerald Islanders.\textsuperscript{46}

This imagery of grim Irish determination against harsh conditions can be found in stories of Irish-American valour during the Civil War. The conflict between the Catholic Church and the growing nationalist sentiment in Chicago was usually ignored on St Patrick’s Day with an implicit understanding that the services that began the day were the religious element of the day, while the parades were secular and therefore a venue to express nationalist sentiment. The 1864 parade publicised these conflicts when the ‘church party having abandoned the field’ left the Fenians to run the event.\textsuperscript{47} Catholic education was used to prioritise religious devotion and community over individual liberty, however that year Irish Catholics with nationalist sympathies were forced to make a decision about which community they prioritised, and very publicly, when the Vicar-General of Chicago declared ‘that the Fenians shall not be admitted to any Catholic Church on that [St Patrick’s] day, nor

\textsuperscript{42} Chicago Daily Journal, 16 March 1861; Chicago Daily Journal, 18 March 1861.
\textsuperscript{43} See chapter five.
\textsuperscript{44} Chicago Tribune, 14 June 1862.
\textsuperscript{45} Chicago Tribune, 14 March 1862.
\textsuperscript{46} Chicago Tribune, 18 March 1863.
\textsuperscript{47} New York Times, 27 March 1864.
shall any member of a religious society be permitted to walk in procession where a Fenian takes a part. Original two parades were to be held, one Fenian parade led by John Comisky, and another ‘composed of the Catholics who remain loyal to their spiritual directors’ led by Michael Keeley. Though the latter decided to withdraw, it was understood that though all the Catholic societies had declined to march, ‘there is no doubt that members of all will be present in plenty.’ The following year, representatives of the Catholic Church returned to the streets during the St Patrick’s Day parade, a sign of the declining anti-Fenian rhetoric of the Church in Chicago.

The Irish communities of Melbourne and Chicago were linked by their presence in new cities with transitional populations. Members of both societies sought to recreate middle-class elements of Irish life, and mirror those already in place in other ethnic immigrant communities. This included the establishment of societies such as the St Patrick’s Society and Hibernian Benevolent Society which brought important people of Irish-birth and descent together to enjoy balls and banquets for a fee. These banquets provided an opportunity to highlight loyalty to Ireland and new communities, and were reported widely in local newspapers as well as those with national and international readerships. The foundational years of each city had long-term impacts on the shape of St Patrick’s Day events. In Melbourne, processions were illegal automatically restricting who could be involved in moulding the public Irish priorities. In Chicago, the formal events retained their class distinctions, however the processions allowed for a demonstration of Irish power and popularity throughout society. Women had a greater role in Chicago’s St Patrick’s Day dinners, but women remained on the peripheries of celebrations in both cities. As the 1860s progressed, public expressions of Irish identity expanded as the Catholic Church’s presence became more strongly Irish-based and ethnic fraternalism increased in both cities.

48 Irish People, 23 April 1864.
49 Chicago Tribune, 17 March 1864.
The Progression of Cultural Affinity.

The later 1860s witnessed heightened ethnic and religious tensions in both cities. Susan Davis argues that parades are ‘public dramas of social relations, and in them performers define who can be a social actor and what subjects and ideas are available for communication and consideration’. The organisers of St Patrick’s Day events responded to these changes and priorities by expanding, and restricting, who could be involved in the public expression of celebrating Ireland’s national hero. The Catholic Church’s presence in both cities had expanded to include widespread parish schooling by religious communities and an increase in religious social life provision. Irish people at all levels of society were being taught Irish history and, in many cases, about the inequality that had existed between the wealthy and the peasantry and tenants, through benefit societies and other aspects of parish life. A tighter community was created in both cities as Irish Catholics united to support parish schools and Irish charities, and were promoted as a cohesive community by the ethnic press. St Patrick’s Day provided a moment for Irish religious and secular organisations to come together as an example to Irish people throughout society, as well as to show a united front against their critics. Though they were usually split by geography, St Patrick’s Day was an opportunity to demonstrate that Irish organisations were spread across the city, in every ward, and that together, they could have a big impact.

*Melbourne*

The image of Australia as a land of freedom and opportunity, so often the pull of the United States, was one that was emphasised in Melbourne Irish political speeches. Australia was divorced in the abstract from the tools of the British Empire which enforced coercive measures in the country of their birth. This began to change in 1867 when the St Patrick’s Society speeches were tinged with bitterness, influenced by the Victorian political questions of the time as well as by

---

Charles Gavan Duffy’s recent return from Dublin. The Loyal Toasts began the night.\textsuperscript{51} Charles Gavan Duffy responded to the toast of ‘Our Native Land’. Having just returned from Ireland, and while relating tales of improvements in farming methods and ‘in the plate-glass and other decorations of their capital’, ‘to him Ireland meant the people of Ireland’ and in this, he was dismayed.\textsuperscript{52} Duffy remarked that as Ireland’s population was still decaying, and wherever the mass of people was discontented, whether in Poland, Hungary, or Ireland, it was because that country was misgoverned. Duffy pointed to Ireland’s policy of land tenure as the principal motive for people leaving, as Ireland ‘was the only country where, when a landlord had got all he could out of his tenants, he could throw them aside like he would an old shoe’.\textsuperscript{53} While a larger criticism of land control in Ireland, Duffy chose to focus his censure on the landlords of Ireland, not British government control. However, this anger was unusual for Melbourne’s St Patrick’s Day events, and was balanced by a return to the wisdom of the British government in granting Victoria responsible government. Duffy concluded his speech by remarking that ‘if ever any English friend asked them what would content Ireland, let them reply, in one sentence, that Ireland would be thoroughly contented, thoroughly loyal, when she had the same liberty that they possessed in Australia’.\textsuperscript{54} While criticising the action of Irish landlords, Duffy maintained that the Irish in Victoria and Ireland were loyal citizens of the British Empire, uniting Irish identity near and far with the imperial project.

St Patrick’s Society events were widely reported upon, and therefore what orators said reached large swathes of Melbourne society, presenting a message on behalf of the whole Irish community and consequently protecting Irish people from widespread backlash at times of panic. In Melbourne, this was brought into clear focus in 1868 when Henry O’Farrell shot at Prince Alfred on 12 March. It was remarked that the shooting of Alfred ‘had a depressing influence upon the commemoration’ of St Patrick’s Day and the focus of the celebrations that did happen were chiefly concerned with reiterating the loyalty of the Irish in

\textsuperscript{51} Argus, 19 March 1867.
\textsuperscript{52} For a brief account of this trip, see Patrick O’Farrell, ‘Charles Gavan Duffy: That Other Hemisphere’, Clogher Record, 3 (1975), 63-77.
\textsuperscript{53} Argus, 19 March 1867.
\textsuperscript{54} Ibid.
Melbourne.\textsuperscript{55} Despite the claims of newspaper editors that Fenianism existed in Melbourne even at a low level, the attendees of the Melbourne St Patrick’s Society dinner in 1868 were keen to emphasise Fenianism’s roots in the United States, and the consequent lack of opportunity for O’Farrell to have interacted with those involved in the cause. That there were any Fenian, or quasi-Fenian, organisations in Australia was ‘an idle fable’, according to Charles Gavan Duffy. The Irish in Australia, as opposed to in America, were simply to be too far away for political intervention in Britain, instead ‘Their business is to become good citizens of the state in which they live…and that is the way in which they can be of most service to their native country’.\textsuperscript{56} These sentiments were reprinted in newspapers around Australia and made their way to the United Kingdom. In this way St Patrick’s Day events provided an international platform for pledging loyalty and condemning violence, as well as a domestic one. The message of dual loyalty and good citizenship had been, and would remain, the loudest message of the Irish in Melbourne throughout the nineteenth century.

Though the St Patrick’s Society retained their control of the day’s celebrations, and remained religiously inclusive in membership, the Catholic Church gained a larger role in Melbourne St Patrick’s Day in recognition of its evolving societal influence. This increased presence was led by Bishop Goold and the growing numbers of Irish religious orders aided by the establishment of the \textit{Advocate} in the city. In reaction to the shooting that had occurred five days previously, the St Patrick’s Day of 1868 featured the Catholic Church more prominently than in the past. A solemn High Mass was celebrated, the \textit{Advocate} reminding its readers of St Patrick’s role as patron saint of Ireland and the importance of celebrating the day as a religious festival of ‘unwonted solemnity’.\textsuperscript{57} It argued that the main manifestations of national and patriotic sentiment, the speeches, toasts, and balls, ‘completely throws into the shade any displays of devotional feeling’, especially when considering the religious sentiment was confined to Irish Catholics, whereas ‘the love of Ireland is felt and exhibited by Irishmen of every creed.’\textsuperscript{58} The access

\textsuperscript{55} \textit{Advocate}, 21 March 1868.
\textsuperscript{56} \textit{Argus}, 18 March 1868.
\textsuperscript{57} \textit{Advocate}, 14 March 1868.
\textsuperscript{58} Ibid.
to those in power and the newspapers provided by attending balls and banquets was brought into question after the celebrations of 1869. The balls and dinners were mainly male-dominated events, with women eating separately away from the main hall or on the balcony and then joining the men for dancing. Oliver MacDonagh has argued that two of the main objectives of the organisers of the dinners was to gather as many prominent Irish or Catholics in the colony together, and particularly to get as many of Victoria’s leading men, particularly politicians, to respond to the toasts.\textsuperscript{59} This was a way of consolidating the position of Irish and Catholics in the higher echelons of Victorian society, and this was re-iterated in the speeches of the evenings. This bonding of Irishmen of all creeds but not all classes became a problem for some in Melbourne after the 1869 celebration, and the St Patrick’s Society took note. The following year’s St Patrick’s Day heralded an extension of Irish community power from an elite group of politicians and professionals to those active in religious and parish life.\textsuperscript{60}

In 1870 parades returned to the St Patrick’s Day celebration. In Melbourne, the processions that took place between 1870 and 1890 were organised by the St Patrick’s Society, later in tandem with the HACBS. While Chicago’s participants altered with time, reflecting both domestic and international concerns, the Melbourne parade was securely the realm of these two societies. Led by the community’s elites in the case of the St Patrick’s Society and the aspiring Catholic working and middle class in HACBS, both societies had invested in promoting the educational and social progression of Irish people in the city, and benefited from a respectable image of Irishness which was easier to achieve when the processions were controlled by a select group of people. The collaboration of the HACBS, which had Catholicism at its very heart and the non-religious St Patrick’s Society led to Catholicism playing a more public part in the festivities. In the years after 1870, the HACBS attended religious ceremonies and after the

\textsuperscript{59} MacDonagh, ‘Irish Culture and Nationalism Translated: St Patrick’s Day, 1888, in Australia’ in MacDonagh, Mandle, & Travers (eds), \textit{Irish Culture and Nationalism}, 69-82.

\textsuperscript{60} Keith Amos claims that it was only in 1875 that the observance of the Act had weakened to a point whereby an O’Connell parade was allowed to go through Sydney’s streets - this observation, implying the this was the first such parade in the Australian British colonies, is one example of the generalisation of events that happened in Sydney being the same throughout New South Wales and Victoria after 1851. This is a common generalisation by historians of the Irish in colonial Australia.
service finished, they mustered outside the cathedral and marched slowly down to Swanston Street where they were met by the St Patrick’s Society division. The two societies then amalgamated and marched together.\(^6^1\) In 1870, the procession numbered 500 with boys running alongside.

The handsome appearance of their bright green scarfs attracted considerable attention on the line of the march…and the varied colours of [the boys not in the societies] their scarfs much enhanced the attractions of the spectacle.\(^6^2\)

The colourful ‘spectacle’ was a proud demonstration of Irish identity, both Catholic and Protestant, and a very visible reminder of the dominant place of the Irish within Melbourne society. By 1871, the St Patrick’s Day parade included a total of 1,300-1,400 marchers, made up of five hundred members of St Patrick’s, and 800 members of 13 branches of the HACBS. The procession was accompanied by two to three thousand people of all ages within which there was a ‘great prevalence of the emerald colour’ and the wearing of the shamrock. The procession ended in the Friendly Societies’ gardens where around 6,000 people gathered to enjoy the bank holiday.\(^6^3\) Melbourne’s Irish-born community numbered c.29,000 that year, indicating a participation level of around 20 per cent in the day’s main event.\(^6^4\) Other people could have participated in the celebrations at evening events organised by the St Patrick’s Society as well as events that took place at the suburban town halls, parish schools, and concert halls.

The Melbourne St Patrick’s Society and HACBS also added a grand fete to the end of the procession proceedings. The Friendly Societies’ Gardens acted as host for the joint outdoor fete held by the St Patrick’s Society and HACBS after the procession each year. Once at the Friendly Societies’ Gardens there was a programme of sports, as well as a fleet of boats on the lake, a stud of donkeys, merry go rounds, a company of minstrels, and Simpson’s Zoetrope Circus. This was an event that was enjoyed by a wider portion of the community than the 200 ‘leading citizens’ that were invited to SPS balls. However, the newspaper reports

\(^{61}\) Argus, 18 March 1870; Argus, 18 March 1873.
\(^{62}\) Argus, 18 March 1870.
\(^{63}\) Age, 15 March 1871; Australasian, 18 March 1871.
\(^{64}\) Victorian Census, 1871.
of the day were still sure to include the names of prominent citizens who attended the day’s entertainments, as well as emphasising the respectability of attendees. In 1870, although there was a considerable amount of excitement, ‘the proverbially excitable temperament of the Irish seemed almost dormant’. The reports of St Patrick’s Day celebrations throughout the next years emphasised that the Irish people, well-dressed and thriving-looking citizens, who attended the day events proved to be ‘highly creditable to the country’, and those who had ‘over-indulged’ in the past were reduced.

The speeches of Melbourne’s St Patrick’s Day balls retained their focus on the positives of life in Australia: a place where Irish people had ‘the prosperity that was banished from our native country’, as well as the ‘complete self-government that we desired in our native country.’ Joseph Rowan, the vice-president of the Society in 1872, proposed a toast to ‘Kindred Societies’ because Irishmen of all creeds should be united on ‘a national platform, from which all sectarian differences should be excluded.’ Inclusion and unison of Irish people was encouraged across generational and class lines as well as sectarian as the 1870s continued. John Gavan Duffy brought a youthful point of view to the proceedings in 1875. He ‘spoke as the representative of a later generation, and was glad to say that the young people of Irish extraction in this country, if Australians, were not the less Irish on that account.’ Duffy and Rowan were both products of the CYMS and Melbourne’s Irish Catholic schools. As the second-generation of Irish in Melbourne grew towards adulthood, the importance of widening involvement in Irish activities increased. Speakers could not rely on nostalgic imagery of Ireland to incite Irish-Australians to tears and anger, for most of the second generation had and would never set eyes on Ireland’s rural landscapes or experience the effects of coercive laws. Instead, the leaders of Melbourne’s Irish communities had to manifest elements of Irishness for a new generation to grasp onto. The St Patrick’s Society speeches gained a new bitterness with regard to the landlord system in Ireland, while cultural nationalism was visible at St Patrick’s Day events after 1870,

65 Argus, 18 March 1870.
66 Age, 18 March 1876; Argus, 18 March 1876.
67 Argus, 19 March 1872.
68 Ibid. Joseph Rowan was also a member of the CYMS and Sodality of the BVM.
69 Argus, 19 March 1875.
involving adults and children alike with Gaelic games, lectures on Irish history and culture, concerts of Irish songs, and Irish dancing classes. These were often Australians who had grown up benefiting from Irish Catholic education and participation in an increasingly active parish life centred around Irish and Catholic identity. They had the cultural affinity with the Irish community in Melbourne and the increasing familiarity with Ireland’s problems, encouraged by political and charitable subscription lists, allowed for new ways of expressing love and understanding of ‘home’ without threatening their loyalty to the British Empire or Crown.

Chicago

In the years before 1866, it was observed, Chicago’s St Patrick’s Days had been ‘honored by friendly gatherings, by speech makings, by the interchange of old memories, by processions where the emblems of charitable societies and of trades floated to the breeze.’ That year, however, the planned Fenian raids on Canada resulted in these ‘merry meetings chang[ing] to loud alarums [sic]’. In an open letter to the Chicago Republican, the local organisers of the Fenian Brotherhood declared that

Ireland today lies a mangled but defiant victim beneath the claws of the British lion; her bravest and most devoted sons are pining in English dungeons; the entire people are under the most merciless and despotic military sway that has ever cursed a nation.

The rhetoric of Irish slavery and weakness, and the perceived lack of respect received by the Irish abroad, was highlighted as a problem to be resolved. The Fenian Brotherhood in the St Patrick’s Day parade took on military formation, in regimental order and led by Colonel James Quirk and then marshalled by the centres of local circles, relating the experience of the Irish in the Civil War to the future struggle for Irish freedom. The ‘officers of the district’ assured their fellow countrymen that ‘By the next St. Patrick’s day we shall either hold our heads erect

---

70 See chapter two.
71 Chicago Republican, 16 March 1866.
72 Chicago Republican, 16 March 1866.
73 Chicago Evening Journal, 16 March 1866.
or slink aside, shamed to flaunt our slavish flags in the light of freedom [...] the Fenian Brotherhood is resolved to do or die for Ireland’.\textsuperscript{74} Irishmen were urged to go to work, raise money, and to get their fighting men into companies, ‘Don’t wait for organizers or speakers; it is impossible to supply the demand for them now…To work, then, at once, every man in his own little circle; nations are made up of individuals, armies are made up of individuals. The fate of Ireland rests on the exertions of every individual child of hers’. Though they were not to wait for inspiring speeches from visiting lecturers, in honour of St Patrick’s Day, the president of the Fenian Brotherhood Col. W. R. Roberts gave two lectures to raise money for rifles, and the local Fenian Brotherhood invited ‘all, rich and poor, high and low, Irish-American, German, the merchant, mechanic, laborer, and teamster’ to attend.\textsuperscript{75} Immigrant communities and classes were united in the struggle against oppressive forces, and were united with charitable Irish organisations in the city who, by encouraging the improvement of the Irish in America, also contributed to the restoration of Irish liberty.

Just as John Mitchel had conjured images of Ireland in his lecture tour of 1856\textsuperscript{76} the Fenian Brotherhood tapped into the idea of loyalty to nation instilled in Irish people from birth, arguing that St Patrick

is a name ineffaceably engraved in his memory. While he slumbers in the cradle the grandmother croons some wild ditty of Christianized Ireland; as a boy seated at the blazing turf fire the elders tell over and over each strange legend; and grown to man’s years, the first born, the one who completes the trinity of the household, receives at the baptismal font the name of the patron saint of his native land.\textsuperscript{77}

The St Patrick’s Society referred similarly to a love of Ireland and its heroes. The Society banquet was attended by 100 of the city’s elite; at the top table, James Washington Sheahan, at times editor of the Chicago Times, Post, and Tribune,\textsuperscript{78} was joined by his father-in-law Judge J. B. Bradwell and his colleagues on the bench, Hon. A. W. Arrington and Hon. Joseph E. Gary, leading Catholic clergymen,
Rev. Dr. McMullen and Rev. Dr. McGovern, and the visiting Irish cleric Rev. Dr. Meahan who had delivered the panegyric of the city’s pontifical Mass that morning.\textsuperscript{79} These men were joined by representatives of the St George’s and St Andrew’s Societies, Messrs. Stewart and Wayman.\textsuperscript{80} Reflecting the audience assembled, Sheahan declared that those gathered ‘met, not to devise schemes or to taunt the Saxon with his stained hands, but to celebrate Ireland as the home we have loved’.\textsuperscript{81} Similar to the proceedings of the St Patrick’s Society in Melbourne, Chicago’s Society privileged St Patrick above all, before toasting the hierarchy and clergy of Ireland, the President of the United States, Ireland, the Union and the Constitution, and the State of Illinois. These were men of rank and stature, figures of respect within Chicago and the wider United States, and though they were there to celebrate St Patrick, many of the secular representatives of law and order in the city were not of Irish descent. While the Fenian Brotherhood’s events prioritised the freedom of Ireland, the St Patrick’s Society emphasised the rapid rise of Chicago from ‘a howling wilderness’ to ‘a mighty State’ and the home of Abraham Lincoln.

Despite the threats of the Fenian Brotherhood to retreat into mortification if their military plans did not secure Ireland’s freedom in 1866, the Fenian Brotherhood were prominent celebrants of St Patrick’s Day in 1867. They organised events alongside the St Patrick’s Society, Knights of St Patrick, the Logan Circle and Thomas Davis Circle of the Fenian Brotherhood, the Kickham Circle of the Fenian Brotherhood of Bridgeport, the Hibernian Benevolent Society, and the Zouaves who all hosted balls.\textsuperscript{82} The creation of splinter groups, brought about the Fenian raids on Canada and disputes within the Fenian leadership, led to a variety of hosts provided different opportunities for fundraising schemes and promotion of Irish collective identity, for one day a year at least. After the apparent success of the St Patrick’s Day parade in 1864, when the Catholic Church had forced their

\textsuperscript{79} Chicago Evening Journal, 19 March 1866.
\textsuperscript{80} The 1866 St Patrick’s Day banquet was the second anniversary banquet for the Chicago St Patrick’s Society; the St George’s Society were established in 1860. The Illinois St Andrew’s Society had the oldest vintage, established in 1846. The St David’s Society (est. 1852) were not explicitly mentioned in St Patrick’s Day celebrations. Chicago Evening Journal, 19 March 1866; Tanja Bueltmann & Donald M. MacRaid, The English Diaspora in North America: Migration, Ethnicity and Association, 1730s-1950s (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2017), chapter 2; Pierce, History of Chicago, II, 17.
\textsuperscript{81} Chicago Evening Journal, 19 March 1866.
\textsuperscript{82} Chicago Evening Journal, 18 March 1867.
parishioners to choose between nationalism and religious piety, Catholic clerics and societies were visible participants and organisers of events aligned with nationalist societies. While the Catholic Church did not condone involvement in secret societies, Catholic societies often marched and spoke alongside Irish nationalist organisations in Chicago parades, using processions to spread their priorities and mottos to the wider public, and to demonstrate Catholic power throughout the city. In 1867, the Catholic Juvenile Temperance Society joined with the Father Mathew Temperance Society during the parade. Around 60 ‘little fellows’ carried banners with the words ‘Our motto is Temperance’ on one side, and the emotive ‘All is right; Dad is sober’ on the other.\(^{83}\) Just as the Catholic Church’s priorities were spread throughout society, so were its representatives. At the St Patrick’s Society ball in 1867, Rev. Dr. McMullen of Chicago argued that ‘The Irish clergy were a portion of the Irish people, and sympathised with their wrongs, their misfortunes, and their sufferings, and would indorse a movement for revolution against tyranny if it took a form that promised success.’\(^{84}\) The Irish Catholic clergy used the St Patrick’s Society banquet and those organised by other societies, as a platform from which to connect to their parishioners on an ethnic level as well as a religious one, while using the parades to unite their organisations across class boundaries.

Chicago’s parades provided more opportunities for the involvement of non-traditional groups, often through the lens of sympathy with small or oppressed nations and peoples, as well as a shared Catholicism. This was particularly true during the 1870s. As one newspaper editor pointed out in 1872, ‘Not to Ireland alone does St. Patrick belong. Anyone who brings light into dark place, who elevates what is low, who refines what is coarse and savage, is a benefactor to all mankind.’\(^{85}\) In 1870, a ‘colored regiment’ was to be involved in the procession under the Fenian flag but unfortunately they did not have enough time to organise themselves.\(^{86}\) The Chicago Tribune commented that ‘More of the broad and liberal spirit displayed by the Fenians in this matter is wanted among the majority of Irishmen.’\(^{87}\) The involvement of the Chicago Laboring Men’s Benevolent Society

\(^{83}\) Ibid.
\(^{84}\) Chicago Republican, 19 March 1867.
\(^{85}\) Western Catholic, 16 March 1872.
\(^{86}\) Chicago Tribune, 18 March 1870.
\(^{87}\) Chicago Tribune, 18 March 1870.
and Laborers’ Union, and the Horse Shoers’ Benevolent and Protective Society, had been a standard of the parade since 1867, but during the Panic of 1873, solidarity was sought with the wider working class. 88 The parade was led by the Polish American Guards, a signal to solidarity with oppressed peoples, and an important ally in the pro-liquor stand that the Irish of the city had supported. The Western Catholic commented ‘Their kindness in volunteering to parade was duly appreciated, and formed the subject of many commendatory remarks.’ 89 The Polish Guards were involved again in 1874 when they concluded the organised procession, on that occasion they were preceded by the Italian Alpine Hunters who had been established in Italy in 1872. 90 The involvement of non-traditional groups show an international outlook which may have had a positive domestic repercussions for the Irish of the city, linking Irish groups with religious and occupational peers from different ethnicities to achieve change.

Another non-traditional group to be increasingly involved in St Patrick’s Day celebrations were the students of parish schools. In 1868 it was noted that the Holy Family School observed the day by taking part in the procession, and then in the evening ‘giving an exhibition in the school-room’ which included singing, dialogues, and music by the school bands. 91 The involvement of school children indicates the important place of education and parochial schools in the Irish community life in Chicago. These events acted as fundraisers for schools and open days of sorts, showcasing the Irish and Catholic upraising of the children of Irish Chicagoans to members of the public and instilling an acknowledgement of the importance of celebrating St Patrick’s Day and ethnic pride in children. By 1873, the celebration at the Holy Family School brought 350 children together from the four parochial schools in the parish. 92 According to the Western Catholic reporter that attended, the ‘Tableaux was the crowning feature of the evening.’ The first tableau was based on the scriptural history of Joseph and his brothers in the Book of Genesis. This proved the scriptural education and training of the children: their

88 Chicago Republican, 19 March 1867; Chicago Republican, 18 March 1868; Chicago Post, 15 March 1873.
89 Western Catholic, 22 March 1873.
90 Daily Inter Ocean, 14 March 1874.
91 Chicago Republican, 18 March 1868.
92 Western Catholic, 22 March 1873.
Catholic education was acknowledged. The second tableaux proved their training in Irish history, and the nationalist edge of that education. It was a ‘descriptive of “The Wexford Massacre” – was divided into three parts, also, viz., “Praying around the cross,” “The Massacre,” “After the Massacre”. The priorities of the next generation of Irish Chicagoans were clear. These were to be the adults who would become involved in Irish nationalist activities in the city in the 1880s.

The late 1860s and 1870s saw increased inclusivity in both Melbourne and Chicago’s St Patrick’s Day celebrations. By this time both cities were stabilising as societies, they were still expanding rapidly but not at the exhausting rate of the previous decade. While Chicago’s different organisations competed for favour and power, Melbourne was able to provide an image of Irish unity through an established group of Irish people who ran and participated in Irish life at all levels. Branches of the HACBS were emerging in parishes across the city and complemented the more centralised St Patrick’s Society. As new suburbs gained in prominence, the St Patrick’s Society appointed representatives who would run separate branches but these societies worked in tandem. Fundamentally this decade saw a closer association between Irish ethnicity and Catholic religious allegiance in both cities. The plight of other oppressed nations, particularly Catholic nations like Poland and Hungary, featured in the St Patrick’s Day events of Melbourne and Chicago, alluding to the transnational struggle of the oppressed and religious. While Melbourne’s speeches focused on social inequality created by unfair systems, Chicago aimed their fury at England and the Saxon. These distinctions in rhetoric were made manifest by the different atmospheres of the British Empire and the United States, but both led to societies which produced popular Land League activism. New forms of St Patrick’s Day celebrations also took on culturally nationalist elements. The involvement of children in the celebration of Irish ethnic pride was emphasised, drawing attention to next generations of Irish Australians and Irish Americans who were being raised to appreciate and enjoy their heritage, and in some cases, to fight for the rights that their ancestors were denied.

93 Ibid.
The Unification of Religious and Ethnic Identities?

The Irish communities in Melbourne and Chicago celebrated St Patrick’s Day in some form or another every year throughout the latter half of the nineteenth century. They were unique within Melbourne and Chicago’s immigrant communities to be consistently granted the space within the city for the celebration of their ethnic heritage, providing Irish cultural and political leaders with a position of influence and competition not afforded to others. The 1880s saw the testing of the limits of Irish identity and loyalty in both cities, bringing together religious and nationalist priorities deemed unacceptable in previous generations. The news of change in Ireland, the Land War, Invincibles’ murders, the First Home Rule Bill, and the establishment of the Gaelic Athletic Association, all presented new strands and nuances to Irish identity in the diaspora. How these changes were filtered through Australian and American lenses, and within new generations of immigrants and children, were most clearly articulated during St Patrick’s Day celebrations. However, there was a distinction between the celebrations of Irish identity expressed on St Patrick’s Day, often an ethnicity based in the long narrative of Irish and Catholic oppression, tradition, and romance, and the political speeches which featured at nationalist rallies and lectures. St Patrick’s Day, therefore, focused on an inherent ethnic identity as opposed to the conflicting possibilities of political nationalist identities.

Melbourne

Beginning at the Model School and ending with a match of hurling, the influence of Ireland’s imperial and cultural histories were both represented in the St Patrick’s Day parades of the late 1870s. As the St Patrick’s Society and HACBS members marched, Melbourne’s streets were bedecked with green flags with golden harps. When the 1878 procession reached the Treasury, the procession stopped and three cheers were given for the Governor who appeared and bowed his thanks. The increase in public prominence of Melbourne’s St Patrick’s Day

---

94 Australasian, 30 March 1878.
95 Argus, 25 March 1878.
celebrations was reflected in the expressions of loyalty to Crown and State. The subsequent year the procession stopped at the Treasury while the bands played the British national anthem, and the members of the societies gave three cheers for the Queen.96 This custom was henceforth an accepted part of the St Patrick’s Day procession until the turn of the century at least. Despite the increased criticism of British rule in Ireland, loyalty to the Queen and representatives of the British Empire remained a central element to the promotion of Irish ethnic identity and the enjoyment of St Patrick’s Day in the colonial world of nineteenth-century Melbourne. The involvement of community leaders in Irish nationalist activities, particularly the mayors and civic leaders, ensured the continued demonstrations of loyalty to law, order, and society in Melbourne.97 This was especially important in light of improved cabled and telegraphic information transmission which brought news of violence in Europe.98

As well as information, the 1880s heralded a new element of St Patrick’s Day celebrations. Through the examination of games and activities played at St Patrick’s Day events, it is possible to track the changing expectations of traditions and associational sporting cultures that the organisers had of their attendees. By 1881, the open air fete was attracting crowds of over 10,000 visitors and was therefore having an effect on a wider element of the Melbourne population.99 The Friendly Societies’ Gardens fete incorporated a hurling match as well as the traditional Irish dancing competitions. This move towards a more staunchly Irish cultural nationalism did not become the norm in Ireland until the 1890s. There were plenty of non-Gaelic games featured in the fair, the description of a ‘grand hurling match’ in 1880, with sides selected by Messrs. Noonan and Russell indicate a larger affair than O’Farrell suggests.100 In 1881 the Collingwood Hurling Club won, demonstrating the existence of numerous suburban hurling teams. In 1884 the South Melbourne club beat Hotham.101 Hurling competitions were not mentioned in the St Patrick’s Day events of the years after 1884, though

---

96 Argus, 18 March 1879; Advocate, 17 March 1883; Argus, 19 March 1883.
97 See 215-216.
98 William Davis in Campbell, ‘Irish Nationalism’.
99 Argus, 18 March 1881; Australasian, 19 March 1881.
100 Argus, 18 March 1880.
101 Argus, 18 March 1881; Argus, 18 March 1884.
that does not mean they did not occur. Instead in the years after 1884 there was an increased coverage of the Irish dancing, as well as the embrace of a wider Celtic identity with the Highland Fling joining the schedule of events. The dancing, at times, inspired competition, with the jig dancing contest of 1878 leading to the comparison of the Australian-born dancers to their Irish-born counterparts.\textsuperscript{102} Informal events continued to be held in Melbourne, most prominently the horse racing which had been a staple since the 1850s, gaining a particularly Irish element with the Erin Hurdle Race and the Shamrock Handicap by 1887.\textsuperscript{103}

The increase in Irish nationalist activity brought about by the Irish Land War, the Irish-American Dynamite Campaign, and constitutional nationalists’ progress in Westminster meant that the St Patrick’s Society speeches of the 1880s had a political edge that was rarely seen in the previous decades. In 1881, Sir Bryan O’Loghlen said that he could hardly trust himself to speak of Ireland. Instead he ‘could only express his hope that God would send its people a safe deliverance’. O’Loghlen hoped that the amelioration of the country would come about by actions ‘within the limits of the law’ and that the Irish abroad would have a ‘beneficent effect on future legislation’ regarding Ireland.\textsuperscript{104} O’Loghlen would regain his Premiership four months later, making these sentiments particularly strident within the British Empire. Two years previously, Charles Gavan Duffy had reiterated his belief that national societies ‘were a great good in a new community, where there are so few social or moral ties to bind men together’. He argued that Irishmen had ‘done their full share in rearing and developing, guiding and directing, the new nation in its [Australia’s] peaceful progress.’\textsuperscript{105} In 1883, Rev. Prior Butler noted that, while not wishing to stir up ill-blood or ill-feeling, he was astonished, as any thoughtful man ought to be astonished, that the judicious, powerful, and glorious nation to which Ireland belonged could give a helping hand to freedom in every land, and yet crush and destroy it in a sister country. (Applause) What was wanted for Ireland was not severance from England, but alliance and equality with her.\textsuperscript{106}

\begin{footnotes}
\item[102] \textit{Argus}, 25 March 1878; \textit{Australasian}, 30 March 1878.
\item[103] \textit{Argus}, 18 March 1887.
\item[104] \textit{Argus}, 18 March 1881.
\item[105] \textit{Argus}, 18 March 1879.
\item[106] \textit{Argus}, 19 March 1883.
\end{footnotes}
The role of Irish people in Melbourne as good citizens who had helped to shape the society was again alluded to, placing the Irish as loyal to both the Empire and Ireland within the ‘friendship of nations’ that the Redmond brothers had promoted on their visit to the colony.

The Catholic Church in Melbourne shed its distaste for Irish nationalism and embraced Home Rule for Ireland. This was reflected in the events held by religious organisations such as the CYMS.\textsuperscript{107} They joined with their fellow Irish Australians to ‘muster in their full strength at any demonstrations by which the traditions and early cherished memories of their native land are honored and revived’.\textsuperscript{108} The CYMS held a ball along with the St George’s School Committee in 1882 in aid of the St George’s School in Carlton. At this ball songs such as ‘Though the last glimpse of Erin’, ‘Savourneen Deelish’, and ‘Kathleen Mavourneen’ were all sang, bringing together a social and national event with institution building fundraising.\textsuperscript{109} Schools were not the only fundraising focus for the Irish communities of Melbourne on St Patrick’s Day, money was also raised in aid of the St Patrick’s Cathedral Fund and St Ignatius Church.\textsuperscript{110} These fundraising projects involved the coordination of various Melbourne societies, with the useful side effect on publicly demonstrating through newspaper subscriber lists the community spirit and increasing wealth, of the Irish in the city. Balls and banquets that coincided with St Patrick’s Day were a useful marketing tool, used by people within the Irish community as well as non-Irish entrepreneurs. However, by using St Patrick’s Day to support the building of infrastructure used by the wider Irish society, a sense of community across the classes on a nationality and religious-level was reached for. In Melbourne, the St Patrick’s Day events became more inclusive as the decades progressed, and while there was an increased association between ethnicity and religion by the 1880s, it did not dominate the celebrations to the extent of exclusion and alienation.

\textsuperscript{107} See chapter four.
\textsuperscript{108} Age, 18 March 1882.
\textsuperscript{109} Argus, 18 March 1882. In 1886 there was also a concert of Irish music at the South Melbourne Town Hall to raise money for the St Peter’s and St Paul’s School, Argus, 18 March 1886.
\textsuperscript{110} Age, 18 March 1882; Argus, 18 March 1885.
As the years progressed and Melbourne’s Irish people moved out to the suburbs in large numbers, smaller events were organised by local chapters of the societies however, they were reunited in the annual processions. The 1890 parade involved five bands and 20 branches of the HACBS, four branches of the St Patrick’s Society, and seven branches of the newly established Irish National Foresters. It was watched by spectators proudly wearing sprigs of ‘the dear little, sweet little, shamrock of Ireland’, many of which had been dried-pressed and sent from Ireland. The evening festivities included an address by Archbishop Carr who noted that ‘The Irish people loved liberty, but the Irish people loved loyalty also’, a sentiment which would have no doubt pleased the Governor and Lady Hopetoun who were in attendance. The custom of halting the procession at the Treasury to show their loyalty was altered slightly. In 1886, a month before Gladstone’s second Home Rule Bill was vetoed by the House of Lords, three cheers were also given for Mr Gladstone who, according to a recently received cable message, had ‘devised a scheme for the buying out of the Irish landlords and the restoration of the Irish Parliament’. By 1891, the changes in Irish nationalist allegiance was acknowledged, ‘The banner representing Mr. Gladstone and Mr. Parnell side by side had probably not been revised up to date, unless it was intended to convey an idea that all would end happily, with the characteristic way of looking on the bright side of affairs’. Though the shape of Melbourne’s St Patrick’s Days changed dramatically, a demonstration of loyalty to the Queen and her representatives, the British Empire and to the wider community of Melbourne, as well as the promotion of principles of home rule in Ireland were fundamental parts of the day.

Chicago

Chicago’s St Patrick’s Day organisers were equally keen to show their loyalty to the country in which they lived arguing in 1885 that ‘none are more devoted to the land of their adoption than the Irish people they will become more and more

111 Argus, 18 March 1890.
112 Ibid.
113 Argus, 18 March 1886.
114 Weekly Times, 21 March 1891.
influenced by the American spirit. The St Patrick’s Day balls and banquets in Chicago were partly organised to cement the existing power structures and social networks, particularly within an atmosphere of dissent and disagreement on Irish nationalism. Senators and members of the State Legislature often sought the support of their Irish voters by attendance at St Patrick’s Day, risking the ire of their non-Irish constituents. This irritation increased from 1883 when Irish nationalist tensions emerged in conflict with the priorities of wider Chicago society. The Common Council and the Board of Education decided to designate both St Patrick’s Day and Good Friday as bank holidays in the Chicago school system. This was deemed to be ‘a very unwise and impertinent thing – unwise, because it drags religious questions into municipal affairs; and impertinent, because it has been done in the face of public sentiment’. The choice of St Patrick’s Day was seen as unfair for reasons of religious preference and national privilege, and reflecting the continued control of Irish and Irish Catholics on city life not undermined by the presence of Senators at their events.

The balls and banquets of the day brought together the power brokers of Chicago society, Irish and non-Irish. These alternative, private and fee-charging balls and dinners circumvented the Clan-controlled Irish-American Council. The St Patrick’s Day events which took place behind closed doors tended to be a stage for the leading citizens of the city: an opportunity for clergymen, lawyers, politicians, and journalists to gather together and promote their views to a group of likeminded individuals. When it was understood that there would be conflicts at the dinner, people did not attend. This was the case in 1883 when a reporter from the Tribune questioned a number of Chicago’s leading Irish Americans on the dynamite campaign. John F. Finerty was so disgusted by William Onahan’s negative reaction to the news of the campaign that when Finerty was asked why he was not at the St Patrick’s Society banquet at the Palmer House, he replied:

I was invited, and had fully intended to present until I read Mr. Onahan’s interview […] I think that Mr. Onahan has disgraced himself and his countrymen by the cowardly and disgraceful sentiments to which he gave

115 Hyde Park Herald, 23 March 1885.
117 Chicago Tribune, 17 March 1883.
utterance on the subject of the interview, and as I knew Onahan would be one of the prominent guests I concluded to remain at home.118

St Patrick’s Day events were a time to present a unified front and an example to others. For this reason, there was an increasing separation of nationalist rhetoric during the celebrations. After the public splits in 1883, and the continuing disagreements on the best ways to achieve Irish self-government in the mid-decade, the place of public nationalist rhetoric moved to the Ogden Grove demonstrations. Thereafter, the Ireland of public St Patrick’s Day celebration was a more inclusive and civic image, of a great and proud past and a hopeful future. How to achieve that future remained out of focus. When parades were held during the 1880s ‘No transparencies or banners indicative of the Irish-American sentiment on the Irish national troubles were visible’. Instead, harps on green backgrounds and the American colours were flown during the parades. The headquarters of the Irish-American Club displayed the national colours of both Ireland and the United States.119 On St Patrick’s Day in Chicago, loyalty to both the United States and the idea and history of Ireland was prioritised over political in-fighting.

The Chicago Catholic Church retained its position in St Patrick’s Day through the involvement of Catholic organisations in the parades and separate school-based events. Just as the parochial school system played a large part in Melbourne’s celebrations of St Patrick’s Day, Chicago’s parish schools remained involved in the St Patrick’s Day celebrations, and by 1881 the entertainments that they put on had become an established fundraising event. The Holy Family Sunday School Association staged a two night entertainment which cost 50¢ for admittance, the proceeds of which went to ‘educate the Catholic youth of the parish,’ as such the Western Catholic urged that ‘our readers should remember them’ when deciding on how they would spend their day.120 Children also featured in the public displays with young boys that ‘yelled and plowed through the mud in the wake of the patriotic sons of old Ireland’.121 These children were looking up at their

118 Chicago Tribune, 17 March 1883.
119 Western Catholic, 22 March 1884.
120 Western Catholic, 12 March 1881.
121 Western Catholic, 22 March 1884.
parents, teachers, and community leaders and seeing heroes past and parents, and this was an important element in the creation of a sustained sense of community and belonging across the generations of Irish-born and Irish descendants. St Patrick’s Day celebrations were increasingly staged events, and by the late 1880s some were voicing criticisms of the day’s spectacle. Finley Peter Dunne, through the mouthpiece of Mr Dooley in the early 1890s for example, objected to the ‘transformation of St. Patrick’s Day from a cultural to a political event.’ ¹²² This change was largely brought about by the control of the Irish-American Council.

Parades, however, were not held on four St Patrick’s Days between 1880 and 1890. In 1881 it was noted that while yellow and green ribbons in button holes indicated that the day was an Irish holiday, there were no celebrations other than a High Mass held by Archbishop Feehan. The weather was cited as a reason for this lack of the ‘usually lively and hilarious’ day, but more important was the organisers’ inclination to use the money which would be so expended in ameliorating the sufferings and strengthening the bonds of their fellow countrymen across the Atlantic in obtaining what they consider to be their rights as against the oppression of “landlords.” The Irish citizens here have sent considerable sums of money, and it is understood more is ready to go forward now for that purpose. ¹²³

In 1881, the Western Catholic offered its congratulations to the Irish societies for adopting their advice ‘in abandoning the useless custom of parading the streets’. The Western Catholic editors’ opposition stemmed from their belief that the parades were a ‘wasteful expenditure’ and that the money could do more good elsewhere. ¹²⁴ This was repeating a sentiment first advocated in 1880, when processions were cancelled throughout the United States in favour of donating the money that would have been spent to Irish relief funds. ¹²⁵ This custom was mirrored within the banquets and balls in 1880 and 1881 which donated the proceeds of the celebrations to Irish relief funds, and later, the Irish Land

¹²² Fanning, Finley Peter Dunne, 167.
¹²³ Daily Illinois State Register, 18 March 1881.
¹²⁴ Western Catholic, 26 February 1881.
League. In 1886, it was deemed that to hold parades which required ‘so heavy an outlay as would be required would be little less than treason to the mother country’, money was instead donated to the Parnell Fund.

By the end of the decade, the Irish-American Council voted 48 to 18 not to have a parade on St Patrick’s Day. Vice-president Fitzgerald argued that ‘This is the time of all times, gentlemen, for the Irishmen of Chicago to show the people of this city that they are united. In years gone by three halls wouldn’t hold the Irishmen who came to such meetings as this, and this afternoon, where are they?’ He observed the importance of showing a united from to the city’s press, and to demonstrate to ‘these people [their city opponents] that we are alive and mean to stay alive.’ His concerns were overruled. The inconsistencies in Chicago’s public displays of ethnic pride during the 1880s denote the fluctuating competition for control and priorities in the city. In the years that parades did not take place, the money saved was sent to Ireland for the support of nationalist activities there. In other years, the need for a show of power and unity in the American city was prioritised, bringing thousands of marchers and multiple organisations together under the banner of Irish pride.

While in Chicago the 1870s had seen an extension of solidarity and friendship to those outside of the leading Irish communities, to Polish militias and labour unions, the control of the Irish American Council and greater emphasis on the needs of Ireland meant that by the 1880s, walls had come crashing back down around the Irish community. The editor of the Western Catholic used the argument of ethnic patronage to dissuade organisers from hosting future parades. He complained that there was only one Irish band in the city, and therefore it was the German bands that benefited monetarily from St Patrick’s Day parades. The lack of Irish banner-makers was also a concern as the money ‘expended on these parades goes directly into the pockets of people who have neither friendship or sympathy for Ireland or the Catholic Church.’ Balls and banquets that coincided with St Patrick’s Day

---

126 Daily Inter Ocean, 17 March 1881.
128 Morning Star, 18 February 1890.
129 Daily Illinois State Register, 18 March 1884.
130 Western Catholic, 26 February 1881.
were a useful marketing tool, used by people within the Irish community as well as non-Irish entrepreneurs. However, as the 1880s continued, Chicago’s St Patrick’s Day organisers became increasingly inward looking, eschewing solidarity with other ethnic and civic groups in order to force the dominance of certain Irish societies.

Conclusion.

Irish diasporic identity, as well as cultural and political nationalism, had to work within the priorities and parameters of the host country. The Irish in Melbourne managed to create St Patrick’s Day events which emphasised loyalty to both Irish nationalism and British imperialism. As many speeches detailed, they had to remain faithful to their home country, and not lose their national identity (however they understood that) in order to commit to their Australian brethren. In a similar way, St Patrick’s Day events in Chicago emphasised the heritage of the Irish in America, and the positive influence they had on the United States’ republican history. Irish events in both cities focused on loyalty to Ireland, and held up their new home as the ideal for Irish society to aim for. Within this was the way that Irish and Irish Catholic societal and political freedoms should be achieved: in Melbourne it was by setting a good example and proving that Irish people could be trusted with authority and political freedoms. In Chicago it was by supporting the overthrow of imperialism and the ‘old’ in order to give oppressed peoples time to prove themselves equal to any other. Criticism of the old order was accepted in both societies because it was done with distance from Britain and Ireland, and because it was done within the parameters of acceptance in each new context.

In both cities, public events allowed for the participation of women and children in community events, though processions remained a male only spectacle for most years. Special church services opened the day, and members of the clergy were involved in speech-making and the blessing of parade banners. The religious services meant that families could join together to begin the day of celebration. Children were also involved in more public spectacles through Sunday School pageants and sports days expanding Irish pride and identity to new generations. St
Patrick’s Day was an opportunity for community leaders to present a particular image of Irishness to the wider world, but it was also a time to set an example of what they expected from members of that community. By celebrating in a public space, they were also carving out a space for the Irish communities in the city and demonstrating the power wielded in local politics which allowed them to be escorted by police officers and close down public routes for the duration of the procession. This was a power not wielded by other nationalities on their national days, and while the Irish organisers were proud of this power, it also drew comment from opponents.

The comparison of St Patrick’s Day celebrations over a 50-year period has allowed for the investigation of the evolving influences on the presentation of public Irish identity. There were many factors to be considered in the celebration of St Patrick’s Day and the comparison of two cities in different hemispheres and in ideological power structures helps to highlight the importance of these external factors in the public performance of Irish diasporic identity during the second half of the nineteenth century. As this chapter has illustrated, the nineteenth century Irish communities of both cities grew in number and resources, and accordingly adapted their celebrations of Ireland and Irishness. The longevity of the St Patrick’s Society in Melbourne indicates a successful evolution of tactics to meet these changes. In Chicago, conversely, the lack of one established group of Irishmen led to fractured and fractious attempts to create an image of a united Irish community. Imperial and republic contexts are vital considerations in this comparison, but so are the men and women involved in presenting Irishness to wider society. Organisers used their networks within the religious and Irish secular community to present an Irish identity in each city which incorporated the intersectional connections and affinities of their fellow citizens, aiming to improve the position of Irish people and their institutions within Melbourne and Chicago society and around the world. These were the power brokers who influenced how cultural affinity was translated into an Irish identity for younger generations, Irish people elsewhere, and the wider world.
Conclusion.

In September 1889, the Irish Race Convention opened in Melbourne. The Carmelite priest Prior Butler declared the ‘the hearts of Irishmen and Australians beat in unison because Ireland had specific claims to be considered a nation’.¹ In the fight for Home Rule, Butler continued, ‘every Irishman in Australia was with them [the Irish in Ireland] hand and glove, and was with the British democracy’.² This thesis opened with a discussion of the Irish in Australia, the United States, and Ireland as a ‘Unity in Trinity’. It has investigated the middle-class structures and groups established in Melbourne and Chicago which served to create and sustain a sense of Irish peoplehood in distinct cities between 1840 and 1890. The image of the Irish nation referred to by Prior Butler evolved over time, conjuring differing ideas of political autonomy and religious devotion, heroism and slavery, literature and misery. However, the imagined Irish homeland remained a rallying point around which secular and religious community life could be established and maintained. Within Irish Melbourne and Chicago, a sense of belonging to an urban diasporic and transnational Irish nation could be found.

Instead of beginning with a specifically Irish struggle, rebellion, or tragedy, this thesis introduced two towns. These towns, Melbourne and Chicago, had small middle-class migrant populations attempting to implement their versions of ‘civilisation’ on new and chaotic societies: places to entertain and be entertained, social societies to join, and people to provide spiritual succour and mortal aid. As those towns became cities, and the cities became two of the most influential and powerful in the nineteenth-century world, their inhabitants had to adapt to new challenges of massive immigration, sectarian animosity, and class conflict. This thesis explored how Irish and Irish Catholic middle-classes adapted to these new encounters in the specific contexts of Melbourne and Chicago. By comparing two cities over 50 years, this research presents a fuller and more nuanced understanding of the successes and failures of ethnic community creation and maintenance than has previously been examined in each city.

¹ Star, 18 September 1889. ² Ibid.
Within six thematic chapters, this thesis investigated how Irish people living in Melbourne and Chicago connected to each other, to a transnational image of the Irish nation, and to the cities and countries in which they lived. The justification for Melbourne and Chicago as case studies for comparison were outlined in chapter one. Located in the republican political environment of the United States and the imperial atmosphere of the British colonies in Australia, this research adds to the scholarship on both countries. Using detailed comparative analysis, this thesis examined the transnational and local influences on the creation and maintenance of an Irish ethnic community over multiple generations. The choice of Melbourne and Chicago allowed for the comparison of two instant cities with prominent Irish populations from their European settlement.

Secular associational culture was the first to arrive in both cities, preceding the religious orders which shaped Irish Catholic life. As chapter two explored, organised secular life was established by the middle classes in the form of the St Patrick’s Society and militias. By the end of the nineteenth century, the financial and personal benefits of ethnic networks had extended across generations and society particularly in the form of benefit societies like the Irish National Foresters. While established by the middle classes, secular ethnic fraternalism helped to create connections between Irishmen, and to a much lesser extent Irishwomen, of different classes. These societies often met in local Irish-owned pubs and halls, bringing money into the Irish community and extending social networks between business owners and their neighbours. This research expands the work of John Belchem and Craig Bailey, locating middle-class brokers like Timothy Lane in Melbourne within the wider organisation of Irish diasporic community life. As Melbourne was more predominantly middle class than Chicago, how networks were made and sustained across class boundaries was an important element in this research.

The connections made between Irish people of all faiths through secular ethnic fraternity were framed by the religious parish. In the young and fertile cities of

---

Melbourne and Chicago, one point of community focus was the parish or local school. Schools had the power to encourage social progress, but they also imbibed children with religious devotion and a sense of acceptance from their peers. Chapter three explored the constant re-consideration of ethnic and religious identity hierarchies within the Irish communities of Melbourne and Chicago. The religious connections between the powerful and the powerless were studied through an examination of legislative debates on the funding of religious schools. The influence of Ireland surrounded school children in both cities: in Melbourne through the importation of the Irish National School system and subsequently through the use of Irish-born and descended teachers, and in Chicago through the national parish system which ensured Catholics were educated with those of a similar heritage to themselves. This has been referred to in this research as ethnic mirroring. In both cities, parish schools allowed for the creation of communities united in a shared mission to fund religious schools once legislation removed state funding. These communities were based in the local parish or suburb. Irish enclaves did not emerge in either city, and these parish schools helped to bond Irish Catholics to each other within ethnically and religiously plural neighbourhoods, a focus which was utilised by religious parish life.

As chapter four demonstrated, the boundaries of the religious parish could move. In Melbourne the Catholic Church was almost homogeneously Irish. At times this expanded the religious parish across the city, uniting Catholics in St Francis’ Church and then St Patrick’s Cathedral. It demanded Catholic space in the city which could then be reduced in size to focus on the local suburb. The events which supported Irish and Irish Catholic endeavours, and the clubs which linked families to each other and to the Church all helped to create a specific sense of Irish Catholic identity connected to the local neighbourhood. In Chicago, the national parish was the centre of activities, linking Irish Catholics to each other and to an Irish Catholic identity. These secular and religious connections were created and sustained through frequent interaction with neighbours and friends made in school in social and devotional environments. Together these interactions helped to create a foundational, and often unconsciously-created, identity related to ethnic belonging.
The sense of ethnic belonging formed in schools, parishes, and clubs was articulated in a variety of ways. Chapter five focused on the political nationalist activities which were established in the two cities. While Melbourne’s Irish communities have previously been dismissed as distant and uninterested in Ireland’s political future, this chapter highlighted the ways that its leaders made a fight for Irish self-government proof of their loyalty to the British Empire. This study complicates the version of Irish-Australian nationalism presented by O’Farrell and Amos. Instead of distance and ‘Munster peasants’ precluding engagement with Irish nationalism in Melbourne, this research has demonstrated that there were a variety of ways that Melbourne’s middle classes participated in supporting Irish politics. Criticisms of British policies in Ireland were often couched in metaphor or hidden within a promotion of life in self-governing Melbourne, but migration to Melbourne did not result in an abandonment of Irish politics on stepping off the boat. Similarly, through comparison, this research has underlined that the history of the United States did not create an exceptional American engagement with Irish nationalism in northern industrialised cities like Chicago. While the republican outlook of Chicago did allow for more freedoms of expression than Melbourne, the radical Irish nationalism which emerged was also the result of a national parish system which facilitated the early convergence and defence of ethnic and religious identities. As the nineteenth century continued, Melbourne’s Irish middle class sought to direct Irish nationalist activities in the city and Victoria. They were supported in this by the creation and sustenance of a foundational identity based in the celebration of Irish culture and heritage, and middle-class ethnic networks. This consistent middle-class control of Irish nationalism and ethnic community was missing from Chicago, necessitating increased cooperation with the international influences of labour radicalism.

In Melbourne and Chicago, secular and the Catholic parish organisations became recruiting grounds for nationalist activities, with and without the support of the Church hierarchy. The comparison of these two cities allowed for the reconsideration of similarities in nationalist rhetoric within the Irish diaspora. Leaders in Melbourne and Chicago used ideas of belonging, loyalty, and

---

community improvement in Ireland and abroad to encourage a sense of peoplehood between Irish people around the world. They did so within the confines of their local environment and with multiple political ambitions for Ireland within each. However, the re-evaluation of Melbourne, with its seemingly absent interactions with political nationalism, and Chicago, which took a prime position in late nineteenth-century militant nationalism, uncovers more similarities in rhetoric and tactics than is usually acknowledged. As demonstrated in this research, the resulting differences in engagement were largely contingent on the middle-class control of nationalist organisations, or lack thereof. This comparison therefore provides new insights into the role of class in understanding diasporic engagement with Irish nationalism.

The final chapter explored the ways that these diverging images of Ireland and ambitions for its political future were brought together under an umbrella of Irish pride. It united the themes of previous chapters by focusing on the public promotion of Irish identity, as an inclusive and intersectional identity, on St Patrick’s Day. On 17 March, these related but distinct branches of Irish diasporic community life, secular and religious, loyal and subversive, were brought together in a public celebration of Irish identity. While not everyone engaged with St Patrick’s Day celebrations, chapter six assessed the public and institutional reordering of Catholic and ethnic identities over 50 years. It tracked the changing hierarchies of power in relation to personal and professional networks, and the ways that new generations of Irish-born and descended people were included in an idea of Irish nationhood. This thesis adds to the work of Malcolm Campbell and William Jenkins in comparing the Irish communities in imperial and republican contexts while testing popular ideas about Irish loyalty and subversion.

Located in the cities of imperial Melbourne and republican Chicago, this thesis has presented a unique comparison of Irish middle classes during the nineteenth century. It develops the histories of the Irish in Melbourne and Chicago both chronologically and in scope. While historians have traditionally focused on the turn of the century, considering the junctures of Irish migrant identity and the second-generation, this thesis has investigated how middle-class leaders created and adapted a ‘mutated’ Irish identity from a city’s European founding through to
the final decade of the century.⁵ In doing so, this research acknowledges the range of people and compromises required to create a multigenerational sense of ethnic belonging within the strictures of new communities. Culture brokers, the middle classes who facilitated the promotion of Irish identity throughout society, in Melbourne and Chicago relied on similar abstract images of Irish nationhood while adapting them to prove loyalty and good citizenship within both the British Empire and the United States.⁶ This thesis has explored the ways that people engaged with their ethnic and religious identities in everyday life, and how this was articulated within and outside the Irish communities of Melbourne and Chicago.

The importance of Irish women in schools and neighbourhoods in creating foundational identities through representation and ethnic mirroring has been central to this thesis. The role of women in influencing Irish ethnic identity may not have been publicly articulated in St Patrick’s Day speeches and in middle-class civil society, however this research has argued that their presence in the day-to-day lives of Irish-descended children was vital in sustaining an ethnic identity. The engagement of women in Irish nationalism through the Ladies Land League has been considered in the work of Meagher and Janis.⁷ The LLL was an important outlet for Irishwomen, however it was not the only way that they found their voice within the Irish ethnic community. This study has demonstrated the similar ways that women in Melbourne and Chicago influenced the creation of a foundational identity based in Irish culture, heritage, and Catholic faith. While female religious orders dominated Catholic schools, their students made their way into the public school systems of both Melbourne and Chicago, helping to spread the influence of the Irish Catholic Church and support for an Irish nation throughout wider society. This thesis therefore brings together the important scholarship being produced in religious history and the history of migrant communities. Irish-born and descended women surrounded boys and girls, and often continued these connections into later life in the home, hospital, and through charity work.

⁶ Belchem, ‘Liverpool-Irish Enclave’.
⁷ Janis, *Greater Ireland*. 

276
This research has also explored the ways that women connected with each other to facilitate change and influence. Their names appear on subscription lists for Catholic churches and schools, contributing to the claiming of urban space for Catholic ambitions. They established fundraising committees and events for Irish nationalist and humanitarian causes, facilitating networks across the city and the world. Within Melbourne and Chicago, religious and lay women encouraged identification with the Irish and Catholic community through education, care, and by simply appearing, with their Irish accents and names, in the daily lives of migrant children and their families. At receptions acknowledging the work of women religious, men like Fr. Dalton received the praise with thanks, however this research has brought women back to the fore in exploring the influences on Irish community identity. By placing the work of men and women side-by-side, this thesis complicates the story of Irish diasporic identity. It takes middle-class women out of the home and cloister, and highlights the work done by men and women in creating and sustaining Irish migrant identity over multiple generations.

This thesis therefore unites the often separate scholarship on the roles of Irish men and Irish women in diasporic societies. In doing so, it also evaluates the ways that religious and secular understandings of belonging were at times united and at others discordant. The role of the Catholic Church in dictating interaction with secular ethnic fraternalism cannot be underestimated and this thesis has contributed to the study of the transnational Irish Catholic Church and their role in shaping ethnic identity abroad. The Irish communities within Melbourne and Chicago were caught within a torrent of transnational influences. The Catholic Church connected many of them across the world. The imperial and republican environments that they lived in placed restrictions and opportunities on how Irish belonging was understood and articulated. Labour radicalism and political nationalism poured in from Europe. This research has focused on the Irish and Catholic transnational influences on Melbourne and Chicago’s Irish communities, however more needs to be done to address the impact of labour disputes on Irish identity as the nineteenth century drew to a close. Melbourne’s economy sank in the 1890s leading to increased labour strikes and radicalism. Chicago was also the scene of railroad strikes which negatively impacted much of the United States’
trade and transport networks. The connections between Melbourne and Chicago’s Irish trade unionists and labour leaders, particularly those which were based in the Land League activities of the 1880s is one possible avenue for further research.

This was primarily a study of the Irish middle classes in Melbourne and Chicago during the second half of the nineteenth century. Using comparison, this thesis investigated the mechanisms through which Irish-born and descended middle-class leaders sought to cement their position within the Irish diasporic community, and within American and Australian society. How Irish communities were spurred to action on issues like the funding of religious education depended in large part on the networks of power and communication between Catholics and non-Catholics, and Irish Catholics and Catholics of other nationalities. This study has explored the reordering of religious and ethnic identities, particularly in the Catholic national parish of Chicago and the homogenously Irish Melbourne Catholic Church.

This thesis has considered Irish-born and descended men and women over 50 years, incorporating a range of people and migrant waves to provide further insight into the influences on migrant community life and identities within the Irish diaspora. The principal outcome of this research has been a new appreciation for the importance of women in creating an Irish cultural affinity across different generations. Lay and religious women encouraged a passive, or unconscious, engagement with Irish ethnic identity through their presence in Catholic schools and homes across society. In both Melbourne and Chicago, the women were fundamental in laying the groundwork for a multigenerational Irish community. It was then incumbent on their, often middle-class, male counterparts to articulate and control how this foundational identity should be utilised.
Bibliography.

Primary Sources.

ARCHIVE AND MANUSCRIPT SOURCES

AUSTRALIA

Melbourne Diocesan Historical Commission (Melbourne, Victoria)
Archbishop Goold Correspondence.
Archbishop Goold Diary.
Catholic Magazine.
Irish National Foresters Papers.

Public Record Office of Victoria (Melbourne, Victoria)
Inward Overseas Passenger Lists (British Ports), Microfiche VPRS 7666.

Royal Historical Society of Victoria (Melbourne, Victoria)
Hugh Buggy, Celtic Club A Brief History, 1887-1947, PAM 1233.

Sisters of Mercy of Australia & Papua New Guinea (Alphington, Victoria)
Register of Sisters taking the Habit, Sisters of Mercy, Fitzroy.

State Library of Victoria Archives (Melbourne, Victoria)
Joseph Winter Papers, MS 8622.

IRELAND

Dublin Diocesan Archives (Dublin)
Cardinal Cullen Papers.
Uncatalogued letters.

Irish Jesuit Archives (Dublin)
Melbourne Collection, MSSN/AUST/236 & 242.
The St Patrick’s College Gazette.

National Library of Ireland (Dublin)
John Redmond Papers, MS 15220 & 15235.
John Devoy Papers, MS 18048 & 18058.

UNITED KINGDOM

National Archives (Kew, London)
Commonwealth Office, CO 201/375.

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

Abraham Lincoln Presidential Museum and Library (Springfield, Illinois)
J. Alonzo Leonard Papers, SC 909.
Archdiocese of Chicago Archives (Chicago, Illinois)
Bishops Quarter and Van de Velde Diary.
Historical Records – Various Bishops.
Madaj Collection.
St Vincent de Paul Society Administrative Records.
William Onahan Diary and Papers.

Chicago History Museum and Research Library (Chicago, Illinois)
Henry W. Magee Papers.
James A. Mulligan Papers.

University of Notre Dame Archives (South Bend, Indiana)
Orestes A. Brownson Papers.

ONLINE

Ancestry.com
Australia, Death Index, 1787-1988.

Fold3.com
Civil War Pensions Records.

Other.
Board of Education Register (Chicago), 1857-1907.
file:///Users/s1343464/Downloads/31_SCHISNU_PART%203_BOARD%20OF
%20EDUCATION%20REGISTER.pdf accessed 14/9/16.

Academy of Mary Immaculate (Melbourne) website: www.academy.vic.edu.au


CITY DIRECTORIES

General Directory and Business Advertiser of the City of Chicago for the Year 1844 (Chicago: Ellis & Fergus Printers, 1844).

The Chicago City Directory, and Business Advertiser (Chicago: Robert Fergus Book & Job Printer, 1855).


Edwards’ Chicago Business Director: Embracing a Classified List of all Trades, Professions and Pursuits in the City of Chicago, for the Year 1866-7 (Chicago: Edwards, Greenough & Deved, 1866).
Edwards’ Annual Director to the Inhabitants, Institutions, Incorporated Companies, Manufacturing Establishments, Business, Business Firms, etc., etc., in the City of Chicago, for 1868-9 (Chicago: Edwards & Co. Publishers, 1868).


Edwards’ Annual Director to the Inhabitants, Institutions, Incorporated Companies, Manufacturing Establishments, Business, Business Firms, etc., etc., in the City of Chicago, for 1869-70 (Chicago: Edwards & Co. Publishers, 1869).

Edwards’ Annual Director to the Inhabitants, Institutions, Incorporated Companies, Manufacturing Establishments, Business, Business Firms, etc., etc., in the City of Chicago, for 1870-71 (Chicago: Richard Edwards Publisher, 1870).


CENSUS LISTS

Victoria.

United States.
Seventh Census of the United States, 1850.
‘Report of the Superintendent of the Census for December 1, 1852; to which is appended the report for December 1, 1851’, Seventh Census of the United States, 1850 (Washington D.C.: Robert Armstrong, 1853).
Eighth Census of the United States, 1860.

Ninth Census of the United States, 1870.

Tenth Census of the United States, 1880.

Eleventh Census of the United States, 1890.

CONTEMPORARY NEWSPAPERS AND PERIODICALS

Chicago
Chicago Daily Journal
Chicago Daily Herald
Chicago Daily Times
Chicago Evening Journal
Chicago Post
Chicago Republican
Chicago Tribune
Daily Inter Ocean
Hyde Park Herald
Irish Republic
Pomeroy's Democrat
Sunday Times
Western Catholic
Western Tablet

United States of America
Boston Recorder (Boston, Massachusetts)
Citizen (New York City, New York)
Daily Atlas (Boston, Massachusetts)
Daily Commercial Register (Sandusky, Ohio)
Daily Illinois State Journal (Springfield, Illinois)
Daily Illinois State Register (Springfield, Illinois)
Daily National Intelligencer (Washington D.C.)
Daily Register (Rockford, Illinois)
Irish American Weekly (New York City, New York)
Kansas City Times (Kansas City, Missouri)
Leader (St Louis, Missouri)
Morning Star (Rockford, Illinois)
New York Herald (New York City, New York)
New York Times (New York City, New York)
New York Tribune (New York City, New York)
Quincy Daily Whig (Quincy, Illinois)
Sangamo Journal (Springfield, Illinois)
True Republican (Sycamore, Illinois)

Melbourne
Advocate
Age
Argus
The Australasian
Catholic Magazine
Illustrated Australian News for Home Readers
Melbourne Courier
Melbourne Morning Herald
Melbourne Times
Mercury
Port Phillip Gazette
Port Phillip Patriot and Melbourne Advertiser
Weekly Times

Australia
Ballarat Courier (Ballarat, Victoria)
The Star (Ballarat, Victoria)
Freeman’s Journal (Sydney, New South Wales)
Geelong Advertiser (Geelong, Victoria)
Gippsland Times (Gippsland, Victoria)
Irish Exile and Freedom’s Advocate (Hobart, Tasmania)
Mount Alexander Mail (Castlemaine, Victoria)
Portland Guardian and Normanby General Advertiser (Portland, Victoria)

Ireland
Freeman’s Journal
Irish Citizen
Irish Nation
Irish People

PUBLISHED PRIMARY SOURCES

Carter, Charles Rooking, Victoria, the British “El Dorado”: or, Melbourne in 1869: shewing the advantages of that colony as a field for emigration (London: E. Stanford, 1870).


History of the Ancient Order of Hibernians, *From the Earliest Period to the Joint National Convention at Trenton, New Jersey, June 27, 1898* (Cleveland, Ohio: T. F. McGrath, 1898).


Illinois Constitutional Convention, *The constitution of the state of Illinois as adopted in convention, May 13, 1870: and ratified by the people of the state July 2d, A.D. 1870* (Chicago: Western News Co., 1870)


Manual of the Children of Mary for the use of all establishments, schools and orphan asylums of the Sisters of Charity (New York: P. J. Kennedy & Sons, 1867).


Third Annual Directory of Ancient Order of Hibernians of the United States, Containing the names and addresses of all national state, county, and division officers: 1884-1885 (Dayton, Ohio: Sweetman’s Book & Job Printing House, 1884).


____ The Victorian Hansard containing the debates and proceedings of the Legislative Council & Assembly of the Colony of Victoria, vol. 6 1868-70 (Melbourne: Government Printer, 1868).


Warner Beers Publishers’ Map of Chicago, 1875

Secondary Sources


———, ‘The Liverpool-Irish Enclave’ in Donald M. MacRaild (ed.), *The Great Famine and Beyond: Irish Migrants in Britain in the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries* (Dublin: Irish Academic Press, 2000), 126-146.


Clutterbuck, Lindsay, ‘Countering Irish Republican terrorism in Britain: Its origin as a policy function’, *Terrorism and Political Violence*, 18:1 (2006), 95-118.


Cohen, Deborah & Maura O’Connor (eds), *Comparison and History: Europe in Cross-National Perspective* (New York & London, 2004).


Cooper, Sophie, “‘A policy of terrorism is not one to which Englishmen will succumb’: British Policing and the Irish-American Dynamite Campaign (M.Phil: Trinity College Dublin, 2011).


Delaney, Enda & Donald M. MacRaild (eds), Irish Migration, Networks and Ethnic Identities since 1750 (London & New York: Routledge, 2007).


Dickson, David, Justyna Pyz & Christopher Shepard (eds), Irish Contexts in the Origins of Modern Education (Four Courts Press: Dublin, 2012).


Dobson, Miriam & Benjamin Ziemann (eds), Reading Primary Sources: The interpretation of texts from nineteenth- and twentieth-century history (London: Routledge, 2009).


Dowd, Christopher, Rome in Australia: The Papacy and Conflict in the Australian Catholic Missions, 1834-1884 (Boston: Brill, 2008).


Doyle, Joseph, ‘Cardinal Cullen and the system of national education in Ireland’ in Dáire Keogh & Albert McDonnell (eds), Cardinal Paul Cullen and his world (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2011), 190-204.

Dunne, Finley Peter, Mr. Dooley in the Hearts of His Countrymen (orig. 1899, repr. The Floating Press, 2014).


Emmons, David M., Beyond the American Pale: The Irish in the West, 1845-1910 (Norman, Ok.: University of Oklahoma, 2010).
Fanning, Charles, Finley Peter Dunne and Mr. Dooley: The Chicago Years (Lexington, Kentucky: University of Kentucky Press, 1978).
Fitzpatrick, David, ‘Exporting brotherhood: Orangeism in South Australia’ in Enda Delaney & Donald M. MacRaild (eds), Irish Migration, Networks and Ethnic Identities since 1750 (Abingdon: Routledge, 2007), 129-62.
—— Oceans of Consolation: Personal Accounts of Irish Migration to Australia (Cork: Cork University Press, 1995).
—— Irish Emigration, 1801-1921 (Dublin: Economic & Social History Society of Ireland, 1984).


Jeffery, Keith (ed.), *An Irish Empire’? Aspects of Ireland and the British Empire* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1996).


_____ *Barefoot and pregnant? Female orphans who emigrated from Irish workhouses to Australia, 1848-50* (Melbourne, 1991).


——— *Servants of the Poor: Teachers and Mobility in Ireland and Irish America* (Notre Dame, Indiana: University of Notre Dame Press, 2004).


Quinn, James, *Young Ireland & the Writing of Irish History* (Dublin: UCD Press, 2015).


Young, Linda, Middle Class Culture in the Nineteenth Century: America, Australia and Britain (Basingstoke: Palgrave MacMillan, 2003).