THE UNIVERSITY *of* EDINBURGH

“Why do I connect that cookery book with Communions?”

A critical examination of the lives of women of the manse in the novels of O. Douglas (Anna Buchan).

Gemma C. King

Doctor of Philosophy

University of Edinburgh

2023

Abstract

This thesis examines the depiction of the lives of women of the manse offered by the novelist O. Douglas. O. Douglas is the pseudonym of Anna Buchan (1877-1948), who was a daughter of a Free Church minister, brought up in Pathhead, Kirkcaldy then Gorbals, Glasgow. She was a highly popular author in her own time (one of Hodder and Stoughton's top five bestselling authors) yet in comparison with her brother John Buchan has since largely been forgotten by readers and scholars. She wrote three novels inspired by her experiences of growing up in a manse: *The Setons* (1917), *Ann and Her Mother* (1922) and *Eliza for Common* (1928). The women of the manse in these and other works by Anna Buchan will be compared and contrasted with literary and real-life contemporaries.

The first two chapters of this thesis situate Anna Buchan in her historical context with a particular focus on her upbringing in the manse. They also consider the literary influences on Anna Buchan and attempt to situate her work in its literary context. The next three chapters explore Anna Buchan's depiction of women of the manse at worship, in the parish and at home. The first of these considers Anna Buchan's depiction of the experiences these women had of public worship, their personal devotional practices and their overlooked role providing hospitality during sacrament times. The next examines the diverse range of activities these women of the manse carried out in the parish. These activities included visiting, teaching in the Sunday school and most significantly fundraising. The final substantive chapter examines Anna Buchan's depiction of manse life for these women. The examination of her portrayal of women of the manse as being responsible for maintaining the household finances is of particular significance.

This thesis contributes to knowledge in the fields of both Scottish literature and Church history. In the field of literature, it provides a new appreciation of the historical context in which Anna Buchan was writing and its literary influence. In the field of Church history, this examination of Anna Buchan's novels offers a fresh and extensive insight into the contemporary lives of women in the manse through Scottish literature of the early twentieth century. Anna Buchan's novels are examined as historical source material, and their significance as early twentieth century propaganda for the improvement of the lives of women of the manse is uncovered. In this thesis the novels are read alongside Anna Buchan's autobiography *Unforgettable, Unforgotten* (1945) and her manuscripts and papers

which are primarily held in the National Library of Scotland. This thesis demonstrates the importance of literary sources for uncovering the often overlooked voices of women in the church.

Lay Summary

This thesis examines the depiction of the lives of women of the manse offered by the novelist O. Douglas. O. Douglas is the pseudonym of Anna Buchan (1877-1948), who was a daughter of a Free Church minister, brought up in Pathhead, Kirkcaldy then Gorbals, Glasgow. She was a highly popular author in her own time (one of Hodder and Stoughton's top five bestselling authors) yet in comparison with her brother John Buchan has since largely been forgotten by readers and scholars. She wrote three novels inspired by her experiences of growing up in a manse: *The Setons* (1917), *Ann and Her Mother* (1922) and *Eliza for Common* (1928). The women of the manse in these and other works by Anna Buchan will be compared and contrasted with literary and real-life contemporaries.

The first two chapters of this thesis situate Anna Buchan in her historical and literary context. They explain the historical events that took place in Anna Buchan's lifetime and explore the authors Anna Buchan read and interacted with. The next three chapters explore Anna Buchan's depiction of women of the manse at worship, in the parish and at home. The first of these considers Anna Buchan's depiction of the experiences these women had of public worship, their personal devotional practices and their overlooked role providing hospitality during sacrament times. The next examines the diverse range of activities these women of the manse carried out in the parish. These activities included visiting, teaching in the Sunday school and most significantly fundraising. The final chapter examines Anna Buchan's depiction of manse life for these women. The examination of her portrayal of women of the manse as being responsible for maintaining the household finances is of particular significance.

This thesis provides new insights to scholars in the fields of literature and church history. To those in the field of literature, this thesis gives a new understanding of the historical church context Anna Buchan was writing in. Meanwhile to those in the field of church history, this thesis shows how Anna Buchan's novels give an insight into the often hidden voices of women of the manse as well as the role of her novels as propaganda for the improvement of the lives of women. In terms of sources, this thesis has examined Anna Buchan's novels alongside her autobiography *Unforgettable, Unforgotten* (1945) and her archive held by the

National Library of Scotland. This thesis has shown the importance of novels as sources for recovering the often overlooked voices of women.

Acknowledgements

There are so many people who have supported and encouraged me throughout my doctoral research.

My supervisors Professor Alison Jack and Dr Linden Bicket both of whom have gone far beyond what was required of them. Also, Professor Stewart J Brown for his wise support while Dr Bicket was on maternity leave.

The John Buchan Society for their interest in their work, especially to Dr Andrena Telford in the early stages of my research.

The Scottish Network for Religion and Literature for the opportunities it gave me to expand my thinking in the field as well as the support they gave me to run the “Unforgettable, Unforgotten Scottish Women Writers” conference.

The informal Scottish Women Writers network which has given me fellowship and support.

The Scottish Church History Society for the opportunities to present draft material from this thesis and receive invaluable feedback.

The congregation of Craigsbank Parish Church for their patience with me when I balanced working there as their Church Administrator with my studies.

My friends at Colinton Parish Church who have encouraged me throughout my PhD research.

My friends for their support throughout my studies. Particularly to Simon and Bethany for the reminders to not take on too much and all the walks and laughs.

My family for their tolerance of my many mini lectures as I developed my thesis and their unfailing support.

Table of Contents

Introduction

Anna Buchan, in the draft of a script for a talk to fellow children of the manse, wrote "I spent years as a daughter of the manse. Ministers' children are always I think, a little different from other children."[1] Much has been written about the lives and achievements of sons of the manse, but daughters of the manse have remained largely neglected figures. The first instance in the *Scottish National Dictionary* (1965) of a term describing someone as a 'child of the manse' is the gender-neutral term "bairn of the manse" used in Margaret Oliphant's *Lilliesleaf* (1856). Thereafter, instances of children of the manse expressions seem predominantly to refer to "sons of the manse".[2] A. W. Fergusson entitles his book *Sons of the Manse* (1923), to which he devoted all bar eight pages to references to males. He entitles one chapter "Daughters of the Manse", which he opens by noting:

> Between three and four hundred Sons of the Scottish Manse have their biographies in the 66 volumes of the D.N.B. But only one daughter it seems – Joanna Baillie of Bothwell Manse!
>
> Which is very, very terrible! But to be explained by the fact that it is only within the last generation that women have entered generally upon careers that ensure the record of their name and fame in the pages of biographical dictionaries. Up to that time it was only fame of the most pre-eminent kind that secured this perpetuation.[3]

This neglect applies to fictional daughters of the manse as much as to their real-life counterparts. Most of the records of the church have been written by men about the areas of church life which concern them, leaving the voices of women largely silenced.[4] This thesis will examine the lives of fictional women of the manse depicted by Anna Buchan/O. Douglas, who was herself a daughter of a Free Church of Scotland manse. It will also examine her depiction of women's involvement in the life of the church more widely.

---

[1] Anna Buchan, 'Red Exercise Book' (n.d.).
[2] 'Dictionaries of the Scots Language:: SND :: Manse', accessed 10 January 2023, https://dsl.ac.uk/entry/snd/manse.
[3] Adam Wightman Fergusson, *Sons of the Manse* (Dundee: JPMatthew, 1923), 121.
[4] John H. S. Burleigh, *A Church History of Scotland*, Fourth impression.. (Edinburgh: Hope Trust, 1983) C.f. A. C. Cheyne, *The Transforming of the Kirk: Victorian Scotland's Religious Revolution* (Edinburgh: Saint Andrew Press, 1983).

This thesis will attempt to demonstrate the usefulness of Anna Buchan's novels for understanding the thus far understudied lives of women of the manse. Women of the manse, while they are mentioned in histories of women in the church of the late nineteenth and early twentieth century, have not yet received any specific scholarly attention. Finally, it will demonstrate the importance of literary texts as source material for church historians.

Biography of Anna Buchan

Her life

Anna Buchan (1877-1948) was a daughter of a Free Church manse growing up initially in Pathhead in Kirkcaldy, then Gorbals in Glasgow. She was the second child of the Rev. John Buchan (1847 - 1911) and Helen Buchan neé Masterton (1857-1937). Her elder brother was the successful novelist and statesman John Buchan (1875-1940) and she had three younger brothers William, Walter and Alasdair (known as the Mhor) and a younger sister Violet (who only lived till her fifth birthday). The manse household also had two servants, Marget Heggie and Ellen Robinson.

Wendy Forrester perceptively opens her biography of Anna Buchan with the proviso that anyone "setting out to write a biography of Anna Buchan meets a serious problem in dealing with her childhood; she wrote about it better herself than anyone else is likely to do."[5] Anna Buchan describes her childhood in great detail in her autobiography *Unforgettable Unforgotten* (1940), although she has little interest in dates. She spent her childhood in the manses of Pathhead Church in Kirkcaldy until 1888 and John Knox Church in Gorbals Glasgow from 1888 to 1906, when she moved to Bank House in Peebles with her younger brother Walter. These manses were Free Church of Scotland manses. The Buchan family followed the majority in each of the church unions which took place throughout Anna Buchan's life. They were successively Free Church, United Free Church (1900) and finally Church of Scotland, following its 1929 reunion with the United Free Church. As Anna describes it, her minister father was a dreamer and fond of telling the Buchan children

[5] Wendy Forrester, *Anna Buchan and O. Douglas* (London: Maitland Press, 1995), 9.

Border ballads, while her mother was the practical one who ran the household.[6] Anna Buchan describes how, despite growing up "under the shadow of a steeple" and in the doctrine of John Calvin, "Calvinism sat lightly on our shoulders. I think Father had too keen a sense of humour to be the stern Victorian parent."[7] In terms of schooling she attended Queen's Park Academy and Hutcheson's Grammar School for Girls both in Glasgow and, following the death of her sister Violet, an unidentified small genteel school in Edinburgh, which Wendy Forrester describes as a "true young ladies' academy".[8]

Following the birth of her youngest brother Alastair in 1894, Anna moved back home from Edinburgh to the John Knox church manse, where she spent the following twelve years assisting her parents in their ministry in the parish. During this time, she had the experiences which would later inspire the writing of her daughter-of-the-manse novels. With her brother John, she also had the opportunity to visit Zermatt in Switzerland and spend time on the continent – she would later draw on this experience in her third daughter-of-the-manse novel *Eliza for Common* (1928).

In 1906, Anna's uncle William Buchan died and the Buchan family business was taken over by Anna's younger brother Walter, who followed in his uncle's footsteps becoming Town Clerk, Burgh Fiscal and Writer to the Signet in Peebles.[9] Anna moved to Peebles with Walter to keep house for him. It was at this time John decided to give Anna the very generous allowance of £100 a year.[10] This gave her an income of her own, something few of her literary contemporaries had. It also meant that when she began her literary career, she did not need to write in order to earn money.

In 1907, Anna Buchan travelled to India to visit her younger brother William, who was working in the civil service there. It was whilst she was there that she was inspired to begin writing what would be her first novel, *Olivia in India,* which was eventually published by Hodder and Stoughton in 1912. In 1917, she published a second novel, *The Setons.* Reminiscing about the publication of *The Setons,* Anna Buchan notes:

[6] Anna Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten* (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1945), 18.
[7] Ibid., 21–22.
[8] Forrester, *Anna Buchan and O. Douglas*, 16.
[9] Deborah Stewartby, 'Walter Buchan - Who He?', *The John Buchan Journal*, no. 55 (2022): 18.
[10] £100 in 1906 is equivalent to £14,370.18 in 2023.

> This book, I felt, was too intimate, too home-made, to be published, but when J.B. [John Buchan] read the MS. [manuscript], to my surprise he got quite excited about it (he was no lover of mild domestic fiction), and sent it off to Sir Ernest Hodder-Williams.[11]

The time in between the writing of those two novels was a time of grief for the Buchan family. Anna Buchan's father died in 1911, followed by her brother William in 1912, who died of a disease he picked up during his time in India. Finally, her youngest brother Alasdair died in the Battle of Arras in 1916 during the First World War. Walter Buchan's friend, Rev Dr Robert Alexander Cameron MacMillan, who may also have been in a relationship with Anna Buchan, also died in the Battle of Arras.[12] The deaths of Alastair and R A C MacMillan profoundly influenced her writing of *The Setons,* turning it from some reminiscences about her father and life in the Gorbals manse to an outpouring of grief.

The 1920s was the high point of Anna Buchan's literary output, seeing her publish a novel every two years throughout the decade. During this time, she published the second and third of her daughter-of-the-manse novels, and the first of both her *Priorsford* and *Rutherfurd* series. All of these were initially published by Hodder and Stoughton and then republished with John's help by Thomas Nelson and Sons. By the end of the decade, all of her then existing novels were republished by Thomas Nelson and Sons in their 1/6d series – Hodder and Stoughton had initially published each of them in their 3/6d series.[13] It was during this time that John Buchan moved from Portland Place in London to Elsfield an estate in Oxfordshire to bring up his children in the countryside. While the move took place, John and his family stayed in Broughton with Anna, her mother and Walter. Anna and John took the opportunity to write together:

> He was writing the history of the South African Forces in the war. I was writing *Penny Plain.*

[11] Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*, 155.
[12] Andrew Lownie in *John Buchan The Presbyterian Cavalier* (Edinburgh: Cannongate, 1995) describes how "Robbie Macmillan, a Glasgow University contemporary of Walter Buchan and friend of Anna was killed in action. These deaths had a deep and lasting effect on Buchan. In the space of a few days he had lost a brother, his best friend and a possible brother-in-law." P133.
[13] John Buchan, 'Letter to G. Graham (Thomas Nelson and Sons Ltd. Publisher)', 5 November 1929, B/14/149, Records of Thomas Nelson & Sons Ltd, Coll-25. University of Edinburgh Library Heritage Collections.

> We each chose our own window. John said he wanted to look out at the Catscleugh, I preferred the Drummelzier hills.[14]

Anna's writing flourished during opportunities to write alongside her brother, although their writing practices were very different. Anna describes herself as writing "doggedly so many words a day" and loving quotations from other publications to the point that she exasperated her brother.[15] It was also during this time that Anna began to see the results of the popularity of her writing and began to be invited to open "Bazaars and Sales of Work, and speak at luncheons and public dinners."[16] She made the transition from being the daughter of the manse who asked people to open such events to being the one being asked.

During the 1930s, Anna Buchan's literary output slowed down. The most significant event in the Buchan family life in this period was the appointment of John Buchan as Lord High Commissioner to the General Assembly of the Church of Scotland in 1933 and 1934. He was the first son of the manse to hold that role and Anna served as lady-in-waiting to John Buchan's wife Susan. In spring 1935, John Buchan was appointed as Governor-General of Canada and the following year, Anna and her mother went to Canada to visit him and Susan. This visit would later inspire her writing of *The House That Is Our Own* (1940). It was in October 1937 that Helen Buchan died, leaving Anna and Walter in Bank House in Peebles.

The year 1940 marked the publication of Anna Buchan's final literary work *The House That Is Our Own* and the death of her brother John. Martin Green suggests that those two facts are linked, arguing that "there seems no reason to give a detailed account of those last years; the mainspring of her activity was clearly broken."[17] Her main publication in those years was her autobiography *Unforgettable, Unforgotten* (1945). She ultimately died of cancer at home in Bank House in Peebles on the 24th November 1948. Following her death, a collection of previously unpublished short stories and an unfinished novel was published by her relatives and friends in 1950.

[14] Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*, 169.
[15] Ibid., 167.
[16] Ibid., 178.
[17] Martin Green, *A Biography of John Buchan and His Sister Anna: The Personal Background of Their Literary Work*, Studies in British Literature, v. 8 (Lewiston, N.Y., USA: E. Mellen Press, 1990), 229.

Her novels – O. Douglas

Before her novels are explored further, it is essential to explain Anna Buchan's use of the pseudonym O. Douglas. Her decision to adopt the pseudonym was the result of her (mostly) sharing the same publishers as her brother, John – Hodder and Stoughton and Thomas Nelson. By using a pseudonym, Anna Buchan hoped to avoid comparison with her already successful sibling. In her autobiography she comments:

> I did not want to use my name as (in my opinion) John had given lustre to the name of Buchan which any literary efforts of mine would not be likely to add to, so I called myself 'O. Douglas.'[18]

She also hoped that by using a pseudonym, she could deflect attention away from how autobiographical her works were. Reflecting on her decision in her autobiography *Unforgettable, Unforgotten,* she admits that:

> It did not strike me at the time that it was a particularly daring thing to publish a book in which practically all the incidents were true and in which the characters could all recognise themselves and each other; in some cases the names were not even altered. In the most ostrich-like way I thought that by not putting my own name on the title-page I had made everything all right. [19]

Although at this point in her autobiography, she is primarily discussing her first book, *Olivia in India* (1912), her comments can apply to much of her writing. Throughout her work, she blurs the lines between autobiography and fiction. As a result, her works are historically significant, as they carry a form of authenticity in terms of events and people. The names of people and the chronology of events in the novels may be fictional, but the characters and events depicted are strongly rooted in Anna Buchan's life experience and that of her friends and family. William Urquhart, in his memories of Anna Buchan, notes that there was a mixed reaction from those depicted.[20] He remarks that William Buchan (Anna's brother):

[18] Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*, 138.
[19] Ibid., 138–39.
[20] William Spence Urquhart, 'Corrected Typescript, circa 1948, of the Reverend Dr William S Urquhart, "Some Memories of O Douglas"', 1948, http://manuscripts.nls.uk/repositories/2/resources/10063.

> is reported to have said that if the book had been published in its original form it would have entirely wrecked his career, so recognisably, and yet so caricaturingly had the authoress described some of the high officials and their wives.[21]

Sheila Scott suggests that Anna Buchan may not have gone far enough in her editing, noting that:

> The reactions of some of the people Anna had known in India and had put into her novel afterwards were very different to those of the reviewers. She admitted afterwards that she should have realised that they might be hurt; the members of one family, even though portrayed in a most attractive light, were deeply offended.[22]

In contrast, Urquart observed that "Anna Buchan found that, on the whole, people rather enjoyed appearing in a book even if they had to pay the price of slight caricature."[23] This is a reflection on her novels as a whole, so it is likely that, as she developed as an author, she got the balance better when including real people in her novels.

Anna Buchan published twelve novels, and a collection of short stories was published posthumously. Some of her novels are standalone, while others are part of series with characters often reappearing in multiple works. Sheila Scott notes that:

> John Buchan used to say that when he wrote stories he invented, but in her books Anna was always remembering; and she can still be found in them today, together with the people and places that were part of her life.[24]

Thus, when considering the novels, it is important to acknowledge how closely they relate to experiences and events in the life of Anna Buchan. This close relationship between fact and fiction in her works makes her novels a significant resource for understanding the lives and attitudes of upper middle-class women in late nineteenth- and early twentieth- century Scotland. These novels, as will be argued throughout this thesis, are especially significant when attempting to understand the lives of women in the churches.

---

[21] Ibid., 3.
[22] Sheila Scott, *'O. Douglas': The Story of Anna Buchan* (Biggar: Sheila Scott, 1996), 41.
[23] Urquhart, 'Corrected Typescript, circa 1948, of the Reverend Dr William S Urquhart, "Some Memories of O Douglas"', 4.
[24] Scott, *O. Douglas*, 48.

Her novels in date order are:

Olivia in India (1912)

The Setons (1917)

Penny Plain (1920)

Ann and Her Mother (1922)

Pink Sugar (1924)

The Proper Place (1926)

Eliza for Common (1928)

The Day of Small Things (1930)

Priorsford (1932)

Taken by the Hand (1935)

Jane's Parlour (1937)

People Like Ourselves (1938) [Omnibus of *Penny Plain*, *Pink Sugar* and *Priorsford*]

The House That Is Our Own (1940)

Unforgettable, Unforgotten (1945) [under the name Anna Buchan]

Farewell to Priorsford (1950)

Anna Buchan's first novel, *Olivia in India* (1912), is quite different to the rest of her novels in many ways. In form, it is an epistolary novel, which is made up of letters from Olivia to an unnamed friend while she is on her travels to and in India. This work and Anna Buchan's final novel, *The House That Is Our Own,* are the only two to be inspired by her direct experiences of the British Empire, with the latter being inspired by her visit to her elder brother John in Canada. In writing *Olivia in India,* Anna Buchan developed writing practices which she would continue for the rest of her literary career. She based many of the characters on real people she met while visiting her brother in India. Martin Green, in *A Biography of John Buchan and his sister Anna The Personal Background of Their Literary Work,* notes that "Even after Anna's death, forty years later, some of her old Indian

acquaintance[s] wrote forgivingly about her amusing sketches of them."[25] This novel, published by Hodder and Stoughton, was highly successful and made Anna Buchan a recognised name in the literary world. The Fiction columnist in the *Aberdeen Journal* when discussing Anna Buchan's second novel, *The Setons,* notes "Four years ago Miss Anna Buchan made a decided "hit" with "Olivia in India," a brilliant little sketch of an English girl's visit to our great dependency."[26] An advert in the *Pall Mall Gazette* on 8th May 1913 describes *Olivia in India* as a "happy book… by a certain young woman who calls herself O. Douglas, though I suspect that it's a pen name"[27] Anna Buchan went on writing "happy books" for the rest of her literary career. Throughout her career, Anna Buchan aimed to write novels which would comfort ill people and middle and upper class women.

Her second novel *The Setons* (1917) alongside *Ann and Her Mother* (1922) and *Eliza for Common* (1928) form her daughter-of-the-manse collection. In these three novels, she reflects most closely on her experience of growing up in the Pathhead and Gorbals manses. Anna Buchan describes in her autobiography how *The Setons* "was really written for my mother, an attempt to reconstruct for her our home-life in Glasgow. My father was in it; and Alastair (Buff I called him)…and most of the characters were composite portraits of people we had known."[28] The oddity of *The Setons* is that Anna Buchan depicts Mrs Seton and Sandy (John) as having died before the action of the novel takes place. Mrs Buchan and John were very much alive at the time when the novel was written – it was Mr Buchan, William and Alastair who had died by the time the novel was published. *The Setons* follows the life of daughter of the manse, Elizabeth Seton, in the years leading up to and during the start of World War One.

Where Anna Buchan focused on her relationship with her father in her first daughter-of-the-manse novel, she focuses her attention on her relationship with her mother in the second, *Ann and Her Mother*. Prior to Anna Buchan writing this novel, Mrs Buchan had written "her life in pencil in a tuppeny notebook" but had never got to the stage of publishing it.[29] Here in *Ann and Her Mother,* Anna Buchan experiments with form. In this novel, Ann (daughter of

[25] Green, *A Biography of John Buchan and His Sister Anna*, 121.
[26] 'Fiction', *Aberdeen Journal*, 14 December 1917, British Library Newspapers.
[27] 'Olivia In India | Pall Mall Gazette | Thursday 08 May 1913 | British Newspaper Archive', accessed 15 November 2022.
[28] Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*, 155.
[29] Ibid., 140.

the manse) is depicted as writing her mother's (Mrs Douglas) biography. Martin Green describes how:

> The three women [Ann, Mrs Douglas and Marget the family servant] talk past each other, remembering; Ann especially is a voice, an entertainer. The fragments of setpiece humour and pathos are inserted into the evening conversations like photographs into a family album. Anna Buchan is more skilful at composing this sort of sequence than at a straightforward plot.[30]

In doing so, Anna Buchan takes her readers into her confidence. Debbie Sly in her article "Pink sugary pleasures: Reading the novels of O. Douglas" insightfully suggests:

> The fact that much of the time each contributor is telling her listeners a story they already know does not seem to matter; indeed, the situation reflects what must increasingly have been the experience of her readers as they were taken again and again into Douglas's confidence and encountered the curious patchwork of autobiographical fragments.[31]

It is through these conversations that the readers also gain an insight into what Anna Buchan's life was like as a daughter of the manse and what her mother's life was like as a wife of the manse. The autobiographical nature of this work, while a significant literary technique, also raises its significance to historians seeking to understand what women of the manse's lives were like at the turn of the twentieth century. Since the novel covers a lifetime and includes the perspectives of three different women of the manse (mother, daughter and servant) it allows the reader to intimately see the dynamics between these women and their differing experiences.

Anna Buchan's last daughter-of-the-manse novel, *Eliza for Common* (1928), follows the life of Eliza Laidlaw, daughter of the minister Jim Laidlaw of Martyrs Church in Glasgow. This novel is set in the early 1920s, however, Wendy Forrester notes that "most of the events in the book happened in the late 1890s, because *Eliza for Common* is almost completely autobiographical."[32] This is important to consider when examining this novel through the

[30] Green, *A Biography of John Buchan and His Sister Anna*, 185.
[31] Debbie Sly, 'Pink Sugary Pleasures: Reading the Novels of O. Douglas', *Journal of Popular Culture; Oxford* 35, no. 1 (Summer 2001): 8–9.
[32] Forrester, *Anna Buchan and O. Douglas*, 73.

lens of understanding the lives of women of the manse – some elements of the portrayal and attitudes may be more reflective of the 1890s, while others may be more common in the 1920s. Of all the novels, this is the one where the daughter of the manse is the most rebellious – ultimately Eliza leaves the manse life behind and marries a wealthy English friend of her elder brother Jim. Eliza is also the most adventurous of the daughters of the manse, with the exception of Olivia in *Olivia in India*– traveling first to Oxford and London, then later in the novel to France and Switzerland.

Whilst not specifically about women of the manse, Anna Buchan's Priorsford trilogy, *Penny Plain* (1920), *Pink Sugar* (1924) and *Priorsford* (1932), feature several different women of the manse in the fictional Priorsford, which is based on the real-life Borders town Peebles, where Anna Buchan lived throughout her writing career. These three novels were later republished by Hodder and Stoughton as the *People Like Ourselves* (1938) omnibus. The women of the manse in these novels are Mrs Macdonald, the unnamed Episcopalian wife of the Parish Church minister, Mrs M'Candlish and Rebecca Brand. It is in these novels that Anna Buchan goes into greatest detail in her depictions of the lives of women of the manse in rural charges. These women of the manse are all shown to have different life experiences and roles in the community, despite their background. Some are better off than others. This trilogy of novels is the one for which Anna Buchan is best known. It is also the collection which has received the greatest scholarly attention. The title *Pink Sugar* was adopted by Debbie Sly for the title of her article discussing the work of Anna Buchan. Though not officially part of the Priorsford series, Anna Buchan's last novel, *The House That Is Our Own* (1940), does include several scenes and many of the characters from Priorsford. It follows the stories of Kitty Baillie, a widow, and Isobel Logan, a spinster. Isobel moves to the village of Glenbucho, which is near to Priorsford. This is the novel where the church and ministers play the smallest role – the minister is only mentioned as being the recipient of Kitty's plea for information about places to stay in Glenbucho. During the time of the novel, the church in Glenbucho is served by a "supply".[33]

The other trilogy written by Anna Buchan is the Rutherfurd (or "Fife" as Wendy Forrester describes it) trilogy, *The Proper Place* (1926), *The Day of Small Things* (1930), and *Jane's*

[33] O. Douglas, *The House That Is Our Own* (Thomas Nelson and Sons, Ltd, 1951), 83.

Parlour (1937).[34] In these novels, Anna Buchan charts the changing fortunes of two families – the rising middle class family, the Jacksons and the impoverished upper class family, the Rutherfurds. In many ways, these novels are largely novels about the changing social landscape in interwar Scotland. It is the series where the church and women of the manse play the smallest role in the community and the novels as a whole. In terms of women of the manse, there is only Mrs Jeanie Lambert (wife of Mr Lambert the Presbyterian minister). Janet Symington, whilst not a woman of the manse, acts as host to many visiting preachers and missionaries and lives an exemplary Presbyterian life.

Published in 1935, *Taken by the Hand,* unlike the majority of Anna Buchan's novels, is set outside of Scotland. It tells the story of Beatrice Dobie, a quiet, shy daughter of a Glasgow merchant who, upon the death of her mother, goes initially to stay with her wealthy step-brother and then to a quiet Oxfordshire village. Although Beatrice is a granddaughter of the manse, Anna Buchan's depiction of the church and manse families in this work are scarce. While staying with her step-brother in London, she attends St Andrews Scots Church, where she heard the preaching of Dr Stronach – there is little detail given about Dr Stronach and none about his family. Slightly more detail is given about the Rev. Norman Snow and his wife, although it must be noted that Norman Snow is the Anglican rector of the church in the village of Oxlip in Oxfordshire.

Farewell to Priorsford (1950) is a posthumously published collection of short stories and an unfinished novel entitled *The Wintery Years*. Many of the short stories take place in the worlds of Anna Buchan's earlier works set in the Borders. There is one short story, however, entitled "Jock the Piper", which is an adventure story for children, based on Borders Ballads and folk tales including Red Etin. The only short story which features a woman of the manse is "Miss Bethia at the Manse", which is a four-page story of a conversation between Miss Bethia and Jane (a woman returning to the Borders village in which she grew up). Miss Bethia is the devoted servant of Glenriska Free Church manse, who has looked after the widowed minister for many years.

[34] Forrester, *Anna Buchan and O. Douglas*, 73.

Literature Review

Anna Buchan

As I have previously noted, Anna Buchan's novels have been largely neglected by literary scholars. The first scholarly work undertaken on Anna Buchan's novels was Martin Green's *A Biography of John Buchan and his sister Anna* (1990). In this work, Green examines the life and work of the Buchan siblings, giving a biography of them both as well as reviewing their works. Throughout the work, Green assesses Anna's work in relation to John's and argues that John was the largest influence on Anna's writing – going so far as to suggest that he wrote some of her work. The idea that John wrote some of Anna's work is attested in her autobiography, where she notes that John wrote a description of a drawing room in *The Proper Place.* This does seem to be an isolated incident, however – it was more common for John to tell Anna to rewrite things in her own words.[35] Throughout his work, Green considers the Buchan siblings' writing in the context of the English middle-brow literary tradition. This is particularly the case with his handling of Anna's work. It is reasonable to consider the work of John Buchan in the English literary context given that, from the time he left home to study at Oxford, he never returned to live in Scotland. It is not reasonable to consider Anna Buchan solely in the English literary context. She lived in Scotland her whole life; her work was set in Scotland and, while it did not conform to the dominant literary trends in 1920s Scotland, it was very much in the Scottish female literary tradition. Juliet Shields helpfully defines Buchan's place in that tradition, noting that "Douglas writes herself into a tradition of Scottish women's fiction that celebrates the romance of everyday life."[36] Anna Buchan followed in the tradition of Margaret Oliphant (1828–1897), the Findlater sisters, and Katharine Burrill and was a contemporary of Emma Menzies and Marion Lochhead (1902-1985). All of these female writers wrote novels which focused on the lives and experiences of women of the manse. Nevertheless Green suggests that the strongest sources of inspiration for Anna Buchan are English female authors, in particular Jane Austen and Elizabeth Gaskell. However, Anna Buchan, in her own writings, as we will see shows a greater appreciation of the works of Margaret Oliphant and other Scottish literary figures.

[35] Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*, 167.
[36] Juliet Shields, 'Scottish Modernism and Middlebrow Aesthetics', Scottish Women's Writing in the Long Nineteenth Century: The Romance of Everyday Life (Cambridge University Press, July 2021), 159.

It was not until the publication of Sheila Scott and Wendy Forrester's biographies in 1995 and 1996 respectively that her writings received any significant critical attention in their own right. Of the two, Forrester's *Anna Buchan and O. Douglas* is the more substantial – Sheila Scott's biography *"O. Douglas": the story of Anna Buchan* is a short pamphlet-sized publication. Forrester's main assertion in her biography is the autobiographical nature of Anna Buchan' novels. Throughout her biography, she draws parallels between events and people in the life of Anna Buchan and events and characters in the novels of Anna Buchan.

Until the publication of Beth Dickson's chapter "Annie S. Swan and O. Douglas: Legacies of the Kailyard" in *A history of Scottish women's writing* (1997), Anna Buchan only received a passing mention in broader works on Scottish literature.[37] In her chapter, Dickson contrasts the writings of Annie Swan with those of Anna Buchan and explores their relationship with the Kailyard school. The Kailyard school is a movement within Scottish literature which is commonly associated with J. M. Barrie, Ian MacLaren and S. R. Crockett characterised by sentimental tales of Scottish village life. She resists any such association, suggesting that Anna Buchan's works are more sympathetic in their depiction of their "small-town-and rural, upper middle-class" context than the "big three Kailyarders".[38] Although her chapter looks at the relationship with the Kailyard school, the primary focus of Dickson's assessment of Anna Buchan's writing is her depiction of women and what it tells the reader about her views on the acceptable roles for women. She does not discuss any of Anna Buchan's women of the manse. Like Dickson, Alison Jack briefly discusses the work of Anna Buchan in relation to the Kailyard school, noting the similarities between the Kailyarders and Anna Buchan in their descriptions of faith and religion in her chapter "Let us worship God! Worship in Scottish Literature from Robert Burns to James Robertson" in *Worship and Liturgy in Context Studies and Case Studies in Theology and Practice* (2009). In this chapter, the only work of Anna Buchan discussed is *The Day of Small Things* (1930).

Since the publication of Dickson's chapter, three journal articles have also been published – two more substantial assessments of different dimensions of Anna Buchan's novels and one very brief article looking at the reception of Anna Buchan's novels within Muriel Spark's

[37] Beth Dickson, 'Annie S Swan and O Douglas: Legacies of the Kailyard', in *A History of Scottish Women's Writing*, ed. Gifford, Douglas and Dorothy McMillan (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1997).
[38] Ibid., 341.

novel *The Prime of Miss Jean Brodie*.[39] The earlier of the two journal articles "Pink sugary pleasures: Reading the novels of O. Douglas", written by Debbie Sly, explores from a feminist perspective the paradox that Anna Buchan's novels were highly conservative, especially in their depiction of acceptable roles for women, yet the novels were especially popular with a female readership.[40] Given the focus of her work, Sly rightly focusses her attention on the female characters within Anna Buchan' novels. Sly's discussion of Anna Buchan's women of the manse is more extensive than Dickson's. Elizabeth Seton, Ann and Mrs Douglas all receive substantial attention. However, Sly's focus in her examination of these characters is largely on those characters significance as "unrebellious women" rather than as women of the manse. She acknowledges that Mrs Douglas is a wife of a Reformed minister. In an exploration of Anna Buchan's possible manifesto for writing, Sly briefly explores Anna Buchan's life as a daughter of the manse. Samantha Walton, in her chapter "Scottish Modernism, Kailyard Fiction and the Woman at Home" in *Transitions in Middlebrow Writing, 1880-1930* (2013), similarly considers how Anna Buchan responded to the Kailyard – focussing her attention on the characters Elizabeth Seton and Jean Jardine.[41] While Elizabeth Seton is given some attention as an example of a daughter who took her mother's place in the home, her status as a daughter of the manse is ignored.

The religious context of Anna Buchan's novels receives more attention in Juliet Shields' article "O. Douglas and the aesthetics of the ordinary" in the *Scottish Literary Review* in 2016.[42] In this article Shields argues for the influence of the Free Church of Scotland and its views on the writing of Anna Buchan. Early in the article, Shields briefly explores the extent to which Rev John Buchan imparted Free Church views of literature and the arts on his children, suggesting that he did not impose the views very strongly. She highlights Anna Buchan's description of how her father imparted a love of literature (particularly the works of Walter Scott) and an appreciation of the Bible as a repository of great stories.[43] Eliza

[39] Dorothy McMillan, 'Allusive Spark: The Prime of Miss Jean Brodie and O. Douglas', *Notes and Queries* 65, no. 3 (1 September 2018): 431.
[40] Sly, 'Pink Sugary Pleasures', Summer 2001, 5.
[41] Samantha Walton, 'Scottish Modernism, Kailyard Fiction and the Woman at Home', in *Transitions in Middlebrow Writing, 1880–1930*, ed. Kate Macdonald and Christoph Singer (London: Palgrave Macmillan UK, 2015), 149–51.
[42] Juliet Shields, 'O. Douglas and the Aesthetics of the Ordinary', *Scottish Literary Review* 8, no. 2 (2016): 113–31.
[43] Ibid., 115.

Laidlaw from *Eliza for Common* and Rebecca Brand from *Pink Sugar* are the two women-of-the-manse characters whom Shields focuses on in her article. These two women of the manse are those whom Anna Buchan depicts as expressing the greatest dissatisfaction with their lives. In her article, Shields neglects the women of the manse who are more typical in Anna Buchan's novels. Shields also discusses the work of Anna Buchan in Chapter 5 – 'Scottish Modernism and Middlebrow Aesthetics' in her book *Scottish Women's Writing in the Long Nineteenth Century The Romance of Everyday Life* (2021). The argument she makes in this chapter is substantially the same as the argument she makes in her earlier journal article.

Women of the manse

This thesis also is also an attempt to shed some more light on the day to day lives of women in Scottish churches during the interwar years. The most significant study on women in the Presbyterian churches in Scotland is Lesley Orr Macdonald's *A Unique and Glorious Mission Women and Presbyterianism in Scotland 1830-1930* (2000). In her book, Orr Macdonald examines the work of women in the churches in Scotland and in the foreign mission fields. The more mundane activities of women in the Scottish churches are discussed in her chapter on "Women's Mission and Women's Work", although the focus of her work largely is on the expanding involvement of women in the polity of the churches and the relationship between Scottish church women and the political movements in the time period of her study.[44] Other research on the lives of women in the Scottish churches largely comprises of chapters in broader works on the lives of women in Scottish society. Most of this work was edited by Esther Breitenbach and Eleanor Gordon and published during the 1990s.[45] Callum Brown and Jayne Stephenson's chapter "'Sprouting Wings?': Women and Religion in Scotland c.1890-1950" in Breitenbach and Gordon's *Out of Bounds: Women in Scottish Society 1800-1945* is invaluable when considering the lives of the female parishioners in

[44] Lesley Orr Macdonald, *A Unique and Glorious Mission: Women and Presbyterianism in Scotland 1830 to 1930* (Edinburgh: John Donald Publishers, 2000), 41–103.

[45] Esther Breitenbach and Eleanor Gordon, eds., *Out of Bounds: Women in Scottish Society 1800-1945*, Edinburgh Education and Society Series (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1992); Eleanor Gordon and Esther Breitenbach, *The World Is Ill-Divided: Women's Work in Scotland in the Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries / Edited by Eleanor Gordon and Esther Breitenbach.*, Edinburgh Education and Society Series (Edinburgh: University Press, 1990).

Anna Buchan's Gorbals novels (*The Setons* and *Eliza for Common*). However, the focus on working-class women and the absence of consideration of the lives of women of the manse must be noted. In terms of the theological implications of the ideal woman and her depiction in nineteenth- and early twentieth- century literature Callum Brown's chapter "Angels: Women In Discourse And Narrative 1800–1950" in his book *Death of Christian Britian* (2000) is important in bridging the gap between studies of women in church history and literature.[46] However, his discussion of women of the manse is largely confined to examples from the early nineteenth century. Scholarship on the domestic lives of women during the interwar period has largely been focussed on Britain at large. Deirdre Beddoe's *Back to Home and Duty Women Between the Wars 1918-1939* (1989) represents the most significant study in the domestic lives of women in this period, however, she discusses their lives largely by drawing on English and Welsh source material. Her discussion of the specific experiences of women in Scotland is scarce.

In terms of approach, this thesis follows in the tradition established by Horton Davies in his work, *A Mirror of the Ministry in Modern Novels* (1959) – that is, of approaching literary texts and characters through the lens of church history. In his work, the focus is largely on the character of the minister in English literature broadly defined, although he does make passing reference to the character of "wife of the manse". In this work, the Scottish manse family is entirely neglected, as is Scottish literature with the exception of a brief quotation from Robert Burns. More recently, Scottish church historians have begun to use literature as a source for understanding Scotland's religious and political history. Angus Calder, in his chapter "The Disruption in Fiction" in *Scotland in the Age of Disruption* (1993), explores the time of the 1843 Disruption as depicted in the work of Lydia Miller (Hugh Miller's wife), William Alexander and Robin Jenkins. His main argument is that, although the Disruption did not capture the imagination of as many authors as the Reformation and Covenantors did, there were some significant works written which explored that passage in the life of the church.[47] Valerie Wallace and Colin Kidd in their chapter "Between Nationhood and Nonconformity: The Scottish Whig–Presbyterian Novel and the Denominational Press" in

[46] Callum G. Brown, 'Angels: Women In Discourse And Narrative 1800–1950', in *The Death of Christian Britain* (Routledge, 2000).
[47] Angus Calder, 'The Disruption in Fiction', in *Scotland in the Age of the Disruption*, ed. Stewart J. Brown and Michael Fry (Edinburgh: University Press, 1993).

Literature and Union: Scottish Texts, British Contexts (2018) argue that denominationalism was the most dominant feature of Scottish literature from the mid-eighteenth century onwards. In terms of texts, their focus is primarily on the magazines and newspapers published by the various Presbyterian denominations. Their examination of novels is largely restricted to those of the Kailyard triumvirate (J. M. Barrie, Ian Maclaren and S. R. Crockett) and Annie Swan.

Contribution to the fields of literature and church history

This thesis represents an attempt to give Anna Buchan the attention in her own right that her work deserves. In this respect this is the most significant contribution of this thesis to the field of Scottish literary studies as thus far her work has largely only been considered in comparison to others. It also is an attempt to take Anna Buchan's women-of-the-manse characters seriously within their church context and explore in more depth the richness of Anna Buchan's depictions of these characters. In this respect this thesis contributes to both the field of literary studies and church history as it enhances the understanding of the women-of-the-manse characters and demonstrates the importance of these literary characters in understanding the lives of real life women of the manse.

Overview of thesis

This thesis will begin by exploring the historical and literary context in which Anna Buchan lived and wrote. It will continue by critically exploring the different facets of the lives of Anna Buchan's women of the manse. It will conclude by assessing the significance of Anna Buchan's depiction of the lives of women of the manse as well as the significance of her work more broadly.

Historical Context

In order to understand the novels of Anna Buchan, it is helpful to understand the world in which Anna Buchan grew up and lived. In this chapter Anna Buchan's childhood growing up in the manses in Pathhead and the Gorbals will be examined – the two areas which will be focussed on are her education and her sabbath experiences. Although Anna Buchan does

not discuss schooling in any depth in her novels, it is important to understand her own educational background. The latter is important, given her father's intense involvement in the Sabbatarian movement in the Free Church – this percolates through into Anna Buchan's daughter-of-the-manse novels. Given the centrality of the British Empire to the lives of the Buchan family and foreign missions in the lives of Scottish church women at the turn of the twentieth century, it is important to understand them too. Finally, it is worthwhile understanding the complex web of Scottish presbyterian secessions and unions which took place during Anna Buchan's lifetime, so this will also be explored where it is relevant to her work.

Literary Context

This chapter will explore Anna Buchan's evolving literary tastes, beginning with texts she read as a child before examining those she read as an adult. I will assess the extent to which her reading habits were typical of her contemporaries. I will also discuss which of her contemporaries' works she read and how far their work inspired or influenced her. In this chapter I will also assess where, if anywhere, Anna Buchan's work fits in the Scottish literary canon. In doing this, I will engage with the current debates around the placement of early twentieth century Scottish women writers and assess the extent to which her work fits with her contemporaries. I will also explore who Anna Buchan's readers were.

Women of the Manse in the parish

This chapter will examine Anna Buchan's depiction of the activities of her women of the manse which included visiting parishioners, leading Band of Hope and Sabbath schools and a variety of different types of fundraising for missionary and other church causes. Here, I will argue that, while the tasks Anna Buchan's women of the manse carried out were typical of women of the manse of their time, she sometimes subverts expectations in terms of attitudes towards those tasks. As will be argued, this was particularly the case with Eliza in *Eliza for Common,* Anna Buchan's most restless daughter of the manse.

Women of the Manse at worship

This chapter will explore the experience of Anna Buchan's women of the manse at worship. It will examine her depiction of the experience of women of the manse families listening in the pews as well as their involvement in helping the minister prepare. It will compare and contrast their views and experiences with her descriptions of the experiences and attitudes of other women. It will attempt to discern the extent to which their respective preferences indicate any class distinctions in preaching preferences either in form or content.

This section will also include a discussion of Anna Buchan's women of the manses' experiences of the celebration of the sacrament. It will argue that Anna Buchan's women of the manse had a distinctive ministry during these times. This was a ministry of middle class hospitality to visiting ministers and elders and the sometimes reluctant receipt of the working-class hospitality of the parishioners.

Women of the manse at home

This chapter will examine Anna Buchan's depiction of the home lives of women of the manse. It will assess the extent to which her depiction of their role as managers of the household finances served as propaganda in favour of improving and standardising ministers' stipends. It will explore the challenges Anna Buchan's women of the manse faced maintaining a middle-class lifestyle on an insufficient income.

A key section in this chapter is the discussion of the lives of the servants of the manse, all of whom were female. These women of the manse have largely been ignored in literature and in historical study but were essential to the running of the manse. Anna Buchan's family had servants throughout their time in the manses – though latterly their pay was funded by the generosity of John Buchan, rather than his father's stipend. All Anna Buchan's manses have at least one female servant. In this section their lives will be examined.

A focus in this chapter will be her depiction of the lives of the daughters of the manse, comparing and contrasting them with the lives of their mothers. It will look specifically at their day-to-day lives at home and their aspirations, whether realised or not, in the course of the novels. It will examine the tasks they carried out, their hobbies and who they

socialised with. It will assess the extent to which it is possible to define any generational shifts in activities and or attitudes.

Chapter 1: Historical Context

In order to understand Anna Buchan and the novels she wrote it is essential to understand the world in which she grew up and began writing. She grew up in Victorian Fife and Glasgow as the daughter of a minister of the Free Church of Scotland. As a young woman she travelled and heard about travels to various parts of the British Empire. Two of her brothers served overseas in the Empire – John Buchan initially in South Africa and in later life as Proconsul in Canada, and William Buchan in India. Like so many families of her time her family experienced loss during First World War – her youngest brother Alastair lost his life serving in France in 1916. In this chapter I will explore what life was like for Anna Buchan and her family during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, a time of great change in church and society in Scotland and beyond. These changes reverberate in the background of Anna Buchan's novels.

Scottish Victorian Childhood

Education

In her novels O. Douglas scarcely makes reference to schools. In some of her novels it is mentioned in passing that the children go to school but the focus is on them getting ready to go to school or coming home from school. Little to no description of life at school is given. What was interesting in Anna Buchan's childhood and something which she drew on in her writing was the education and activities for young people organised by the church, although this was largely from the perspective of a helper rather than as a participant. In *Unforgettable, Unforgotten* she recounts how her brother John taught a small Sunday School class in their father's church. She notes how the experience of teaching the boys in his class inspired a set of characters in his novel *Huntingtower*.[48] Anna herself helped with the Band of Hope. The Band of Hope was a United Kingdom wide organisation founded in 1847 which advocated for temperance, promoting this idea amongst young people. Meetings were held for young people where they were encouraged to pledge abstention from drinking alcohol, socialised, sang songs and were given educational talks. In her

[48] Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*, 71.

autobiography she describes the sort of chaos which was normal at an average meeting. Those leading the Band of Hope had little control over the children who attended who were generally very wild and unruly in their behaviour. Her description of the contrast between the behaviour of the children in the presence of the Band of Hope leaders and in the presence of her minister father is striking:

> I was trying to separate two boys who were beating each other on the hand when the door opened and father came in.
>
> What a yell of welcome from the children! And when he began to speak, what a blessed calm.[49]

The sense of calm which Anna describes her father bringing is what the Sunday School teachers wanted from the minister. In an article in *The Sabbath School Magazine* William Watson describes what the Sabbath School expected from the church and in particular the minister. He describes how the minister should be a "confidential and reliable friend of the teacher" and should help and support the teachers in their work.[50] He also highlights how the "Church and school are one. The minister is the pastor of the children."[51] Going by Anna's description of her father's philosophy on interacting with children at Band of Hope meetings he seems to have been in complete agreement – "It was not merely a crowd of little dirty children he was looking at, he saw them as the young generation that might help make all things new."[52] In chapter three Anna Buchan's depiction of women of the manse's involvement in the Sabbath schools and Band of Hope will be assessed in greater detail.

Sabbath Observance

One thing which is striking about Anna Buchan's recollections of her childhood is her memories of the observance of the Sabbath – perhaps a more strict observance than that of her contemporaries since her father was an active member of the Sabbath Observance committee of the Free Church.[53] Anna and her brother John Buchan's descriptions of their childhood are significant for research into the experience of children of the Sabbath in the

[49] Ibid., 73.
[50] William Watson, 'What the Sabbath School Expects from the Church', *The Sabbath School Magazine*, January 1888, 3.
[51] Ibid., 4.
[52] Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*, 73.
[53] 'The Press and Sabbath Desecration', *Edinburgh Evening News*, 1 March 1897.

late nineteenth century Scotland. Between their memories and Anna Buchan's semi-autobiographical novels many details about their experience of the Sabbath can be gleaned.

Sabbath observance in Scotland until the mid 1900s has been considered by many restrictive and puritanical in terms of what were regarded as acceptable activities.[54] The Scots family would typically attend at least one long service (often two or three). These services took up a significant part of a day. Children's activities, like those of adults', were heavily restricted. Children's toys were typically put away and reading materials were strictly limited to a small selection of approved appropriate religious/moral texts. One of the most widely read texts on the Sabbath by Scots children particularly in the Victorian era was John Bunyan's *The Pilgrim's Progress* (1678). In contrast to the image of the Scot's Sabbath as outlined above many Scots have fond memories of the Sabbath remembering all the fun they got up to despite all the restrictions in what they were allowed to do. It is also interesting that many Scots writing about their experiences of the Sabbath as children also note the place of family worship in addition to the often multiple church services which they had attended with their family. Some children seem to have had a part to play in the family worship being given a passage of scripture (often a Psalm) in the morning to learn in time to recite it during family worship in the evening. Family worship tended to consist of the reading of a passage of scripture, a reflection by the head of the household, a prayer, and in some households the singing of psalms. I will explore these features of a Scots Sabbath in the examples which follow.

Colonel Bannerman I. M. S.[55] gives a striking description of what life was like for him as a child on a Sabbath in Abernyte (Carse of Gowrie, Perthshire) in the years shortly following the Disruption of 1843. He affirms the rigours of the Scots Sabbath while at the same time noting the fun that he and his siblings had. He describes the family preparing to leave to go to Church thus "Before starting for the walk to Church each member stowed in his or her pockets the biscuits and sweeties necessary to sustain the youngsters through the double service which was the rule in those days."[56] It seems that even in the mid nineteenth

[54] Callum G. Brown, *Religion and Society in Scotland since 1707* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1997), 1.
[55] I.M.S. – Indian Medical Service
[56] Adam Philip, *The Evangel in Gowrie: Sketches of Men and Movements* (Edinburgh: Oliphant Anderson & Ferrier, 1911), 427.

century parents used sweets as bribery to keep their children quiet and happy through long services. Though at that time children had to be kept quiet for a much longer time than today as families typically attended two church services (neither of which were particularly short) which were commonly nearly back to back. These services are described differing only slightly in terms of the congregation.[57] In terms of special religious activities for children on the Sabbath the only activity noted by Bannerman was the rote memorisation of a psalm each Sunday – the children were given a psalm in the morning prior to leaving for church which they were expected to have memorised and recited to their parents after dinner in the evening.

Lucy Bethia Walford (1845-1915) describes her experiences of the Scots Sabbath as a child in her memoirs *Recollections of a Scottish Novelist* (1910). Walford was from an upper-class family who had both a winter residence in Edinburgh and a summer residence in the Loch Lomond area. In her recollections she describes of the Sabbath both in their country house and in Edinburgh. Her memories of Sabbaths in their country house were dominated by the freedom they experienced during the afternoons after the morning of services and the family worship in the evenings presided over by her father. Describing a Sunday afternoon in the country estate Walford remembers how:

> We were free to do as we choose throughout the long afternoon – than which children can have no greater boon. We were indeed expected to read "good" books, but the supply was varied, and how much or how little we perused was not enquired into; we were not looked after; we were not herded; we walked or sat at our own sweet will, and I can truly say that unless the days were wet, necessitating our being kept indoors, we were never bored.[58]

Whereas she describes her experiences of the Sabbath in Edinburgh in a more gloomy tone. For her:

> Those were terrible Sundays indeed; yes, I fear I must say it, they were. I do not believe anyone of us young ones every went to bed at night without a sense of relief that the day was over. Yet let me not be misunderstood. We were so far from being

[57] Ibid., 430.
[58] Lucy Bethia Walford, *Recollections of a Scottish Novelist* (Waddesdon: Kylin Press, 1984), 28.

> uninfluenced by our parents' example, or incapable of being advantaged by their teaching, that the impress of both was indelible; but it was the mistaken idea of "winding ourselves too high" on one day of the week which bore so hardly on our tender years, and I rejoice to think no Presbyterian child of to-day is likely ever to suffer from it.[59]

Walford's description reflects the stereotype of the Scots Sabbath and the impact on children who experienced it. Earlier she recounts all the things which she and her siblings were expected to do such as reading "good books" and memorising bible verses and hymns. She also recollects the relentlessness of the Sabbath.

In contrast Anna Buchan describes her experience of the Scots Sabbath as a child in an urban setting twenty or so years later in a much more positive way. In her autobiography *Unforgettable Unforgotten* Buchan's description of Sundays are infused with the sense of fun she and her siblings had. As children the Buchans invented a series of games which their parents permitted on the Sabbath as they were based on scripture. Anna Buchan describes how:

> We used to march round and round the nursery table blowing lustily on trumpets to cause the walls of Jericho to fall, or Walter, as Jeremiah, would be lowered by John and Willie into the pit (which was the back of the old sofa) with 'clouts under his armpits,' or again, Willie and Walter as spies, lay prostrate on the sofa (now the flat roof of an Eastern house) while I, as Rahab, the harlot, concealed them with flax. Shadrach, Meshach and Abednego in the firey furnace was the most thrilling game of all, but it was stopped when we burned the nursery rug and nearly set the house on fire.[60]

Games like this one described by Buchan seem to be a common feature of a late nineteenth century Scottish childhood. A friend of Buchan, Katharine Burrill in her book *Corner Stones* (1907) remembers that she "spent the evening singing hymns or playing some sort of Biblical game, which gave us a knowledge of Jewish history that remains with us to this

[59] Ibid., 30.
[60] Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*, 24.

day."[61] It is revealing that the games all seem to be inspired by Old Testament texts since these seem to be the texts that are appreciated in later life.

Anna Buchan also remembers singing songs on the Sabbath but her family unlike Bannerman and Walford does not seem to have been as restrictive in their choice of songs. This is perhaps a reflection of changing attitudes towards the appropriateness of different songs on the Sabbath over the course of the Nineteenth Century as the Buchans grew up twenty years later than Bannerman and Walford. Bannerman remembers the old psalm tunes – "they would hear the strains of 'French' or 'Martyrdom' or some other 'grave sweet melody'".[62] Whereas the sort of songs Buchan remembers were songs like "prophet Daniel" which she describes thus:

> It was a sort of chant. The first line ran: "Where now is the Prophet Daniel?" This was repeated three times and the fourth line was the answer: "Safe in the promised land" the second verse told the details: "He went through the den of lions" (repeated three times) "Safe in the promised land". The great point about this hymn was that any favourite hero could be added at will.[63]

This hymn seems to have been a source of great amusement to the young Buchans on the Sabbath considering the fondness with which Buchan wrote about it and the frequency with which she noted them requesting it. The family's creative streak is reflected in their fondness for making up verses for that hymn. The Buchan family took the observance of the Sabbath seriously and their family practices reflected the importance which was placed on making the Sabbath different to ordinary days. Yet they managed to find ways of making it fun.

Glasgow City Bank

In the opening pages of Andrew Lownie's biography of John Buchan he discusses the life of John and Anna Buchan's grandfather. Lownie notes;

---

[61] Katharine Burrill, *Corner Stones: "That Our Daughters May Be as Corner Stones, Polished After the Similitude of a ...* (J.M. Dent & Co., 1907), 220.
[62] Philip, *The Evangel in Gowrie*, 431.
[63] Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*, 24.

> the crash of the City of Glasgow Bank in 1878 almost bankrupted the family. As a trustee of the bank he was liable for the debts, and though the case went to the House of Lords, John Buchan (Anna's grandfather) was forced to cover the losses.[64]

The Buchan family had to sell many of their assets to cover the losses and it took until 1883 for the debt to be discharged. The City of Glasgow Bank was discovered to be more than five million pounds in debt. Lorna Mackenzie notes that the shareholders (including Anna Buchan's grandfather):

> had invested in the bank with unlimited liability, which meant they were responsible, to an unlimited extent, for the bank's debts. In total, for each £100 share, the shareholders now had to pay out £2750. This was well beyond the reach of most and, as a result, over 1500 of the 1800 shareholders were bankrupted.[65]

She goes on to observe the impact the crash had on the popular imagination noting that Walter Smith, a popular poet at the time of the crash, wrote a poem entitled "The Cry of the Maiden Shareholders". Smith was inspired by the plight of the widows and spinsters who had been shareholders of the City of Glasgow Bank. I would argue that while Anna Buchan wrote many years after the crash it cast a shadow through her novels. Many of her families are depicted as experiencing times of financial hardship. This is particularly the case with many of her manse families who, like Anna Buchan's parents, were reliant on the stipend on the church as they did not have family wealth to fall back on or to supplement their income. The impact of this financial precarity on the women of the manse will be discussed in greater depth in Chapter four where the fundraising for supplements to the minister's pension is discussed and Chapter five where the realities of maintaining the middle-class lifestyle expected of ministers on an often insufficient stipend for women of the manse is discussed.

[64] Andrew Lownie, *John Buchan: The Presbyterian Cavalier* (Edinburgh: Canongate, 1995), 20.
[65] Lorna Mackenzie, 'Bogus Banking: The Failure of the City of Glasgow Bank', *The Hunterian Blog* (blog), 18 September 2017, http://hunterian.academicblogs.co.uk/bogus-banking-the-failure-of-the-city-of-glasgow-bank/.

The British Empire, and Foreign Mission

Anna Buchan grew up during the period when the British Empire reached its largest territorial extent – by the end of First World War the British Empire included over 600 million people and nearly a quarter of the world's land surface.[66] Many believed that a major purpose of Empire was the spread of Christianity and most denominations in the United Kingdom were active in missionary activities – including evangelisation, education and medical work. The main missionary fields were India, Africa and China (Manchuria). The three mainstream Presbyterian denominations in Scotland were highly active in missionary activities, each supporting vast numbers of missionaries both male and female. In 1919 the Church of Scotland alone supported 564 missionaries and native agents.[67] As a family the Buchan family were actively engaged in life in the British Empire at the turn of the century. John Buchan served as Lord Milner's Private Secretary in South Africa from 1901 to 1903 and from 1935 until his death in 1940 he served as Governor-General of Canada. William Buchan served in the Indian Civil Service from 1904 initially in Calcutta but later in Mofussil as Registrar of Banks. He served in India until shortly before his death in 1912. Anna Buchan herself went out to visit her brothers both in India and Canada and she was involved in Foreign Mission work at home - while her father was serving in John Knox Church in Glasgow she helped collect for the Zenana missions.[68] In this section I will explore the question of why despite her family's Free Church background and great involvement in the life of the Empire Anna Buchan seems in both her autobiographical and fiction writing to be disinterested in foreign missionary activity. There are a number of possible reasons, some personal, some relating to her sense of appropriate roles for women and some relate to prejudices which she perhaps held.

Given the autobiographical nature of her novels it is important to consider potential personal reasons for Buchan' lack of interest in foreign missionary work despite her brothers' service in the life of the British Empire and their church background. Anna Buchan's biographer Wendy Forrester suggests that "If she [Anna] had expressed a

[66] Christopher Riches and Jan Palmowski, 'British Empire', in *A Dictionary of Contemporary World History* (Oxford University Press, 2019).
[67] Church of Scotland General Assembly, *Reports on the Schemes of the Church of Scotland.*, *Reports on the Schemes of the Church of Scotland.* (Edinburgh: William Blackwood and Sons, 1920), [149-150].
[68] Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*, 70.

passionate desire to be a doctor, nurse, teacher of missionary it might not have been opposed"[69] Forrester suggests that there was no expectation for a girl of Anna Buchan's status to take up paid employment but it was becoming common at that time for girls to go into missionary work. Lesley Orr Macdonald suggests that "the organisation and conduct by women of work in the foreign missions of the Church was one of the most distinctive and significant elements of evangelical religious life in the 19th and early 20th century Anglo-Protestant world."[70] The lives and stories of female missionaries were a source of inspiration as to what it meant to be a Christian woman. Their work in 'unknown' lands expanded the boundaries as to what was possible for Christian women. Thus it is surprising that Anna Buchan as a novelist who wrote works highlighting the life of women of the manse would make such scant direct reference to foreign missionary activity and show such little interest in it.

A personal reason for her apparent disinterest in foreign missionary work is that in the time when she did most of her writing she had little connection to the mission fields. Her first novel and the only one to feature missionaries in a semi-significant way, *Olivia in India* (1912), was inspired by her trip to visit her younger brother William in India in 1907. In that novel the titular daughter-of-the-manse character spends some time staying with missionaries in the Mofussil areas of India. She gives a particularly striking description of the Russels, a medical missionary family and their work:

> One can hardly underestimate the boon a man like Dr. Russel is to a district. Trust is a plat of slow growth with the natives, but they have learned to trust him entirely, and go to him in all their troubles as children go to a father. And he has a very real helpmate in his wife. I never saw such a busy woman. If she isn't in the hospital helping at operations (she has a medical degree) she is teaching girls to sew, or a woman to read, and yet the children are beautifully cared for, and the house excellently managed.[71]

The passing mention of Mrs Russel's medical training suggests that by the 1910s it had become normal but was still notable that a woman should hold a medical degree and serve

[69] Forrester, *Anna Buchan and O. Douglas*, 18.
[70] Macdonald, *A Unique and Glorious Mission*, 104.
[71] Anna Buchan, *Olivia in India* (London Hoddler and Stoughton, 1922), 134–35.

as a trained medical missionary. It was in the 1880s as Anna Buchan was growing up that the need for female medical missionaries in India was beginning to be recognised and women began to be trained. It was the Church of Scotland which pioneered this but the other Scottish missionary societies agreed with the principle.[72] This description also highlights another important facet of foreign mission work – that medical missionary work was one of the most important parts of missionary activity but that medical missionaries also undertook a range of other tasks including building relationships with local people and teaching.

While describing the Russels' missionary work O. Douglas describes her titular character Olivia's ignorance and disinterest in foreign missionary activity:

> I don't suppose you know anything about mission work? Neither do I, which is very shocking, as I have had every opportunity of acquiring information. Perhaps, as a child, I was taken to too many missionary meetings, with their atmosphere of hot tea and sentiment, had heard too much of "my dear brothers and sisters in the mission field," for I grieve to say, before I came to India, I quite actively disliked missionaries and thought them a feeble folk. Mother was the only kind of missionary I liked. She had a mission - so we tell her - to the dreary people of this world.[73]

Her description of the ignorance and disinterest in Foreign Missionary work is odd coming from a daughter of the manse in Scotland growing up in the 1880s to 1910s. That time period was the high point in foreign missionary activity – early 1870s there were over 120 missionaries serving between the Presbyterian denominations, rising to 327 by the 1890s and by 1910 the figure had risen to 509 missionaries.[74] In her second novel *The Setons* (1916) O. Douglas depicts the foreign missionary activities at home in a slightly more positive light though still tinged with reluctance. She depicts collecting for foreign mission funds (particularly the Zenana mission in India) as a routine and significant task of Elizabeth Seton and her minister father Rev. James Seton in their life as the manse family in a poor area in Glasgow. Elizabeth Seton is apologetic when collecting for the foreign missionary

[72] Macdonald, *A Unique and Glorious Mission*, 121.
[73] Buchan, *Olivia in India*, 131.
[74] Esther Breitenbach, *Empire and Scottish Society: The Impact of Foreign Missions at Home, c. 1790 to c. 1914* (Edinburgh, UNITED KINGDOM: Edinburgh University Press, 2009), 57–58, http://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/ed/detail.action?docID=475759.

activities from some of the poor people in the parish, yet the people of the parish are proud to be able to give to the missionary activities. In response to Elizabeth Seton's apologetic tone when asking her for money for the Zenana Mission, Mrs Veitch (a poor woman who lives with her daughter) responds with the comment "'What for wud I no' give?" she asked, and her tone was almost defiant. "Oh," said Elizabeth, looking rather frightened, "you're like Father, Mrs. Veitch. Father thinks it's a privilege to be allowed to give."[75] The depiction of Olivia and Elizabeth's respective disinterest and reluctance towards mission work suggests that O. Douglas and therefore Anna Buchan was perhaps uncomfortable with the foreign mission movement or at least was by the time she began writing her novels. This is possibly unusual for an active church person of her time given the significance of foreign missionary activity both in the wider life of the British Empire and on life in Scotland.

Given the cultural importance and impact of foreign mission in Scottish life and society it is likely that Anna Buchan's decision not to continue writing about foreign mission and foreign missionaries was a result of personal circumstances. *Olivia in India* her novel which explored in greatest depth foreign missionary activity was published in the year her brother William died. William as previously noted was her main connection with India which was one of the most important missionary fields. Upon his death she no longer had an active connection with India. Also, by the time she began actively writing she was no longer living as a daughter of the manse. A major part of her life as a daughter of the manse was collecting for foreign missions. In her autobiography she gives an extract from a diary she kept when she was seventeen living at home in the manse. She notes that:

> It is full of such items as:
>
> "Read paper to meeting on Hannah More,
>
> "Collected for Foreign Missions,
>
> "Recited Barrie at Samaritan Hospital,
>
> "Went to Band of Hope,"[76]

[75] O. Douglas, *The Setons* (London ; Edinburgh: Thomas Nelson and Sons, Ltd, 1917), 62.
[76] Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*, 69.

Other than her Glasgow novels (*The Setons* and *Eliza for Common)* where she reflected on that life it was not something which inspired her at the time of writing. This waning of interest in Foreign mission work in the post War period is reflected in Annie Swan's *Seed Time and Harvest* (1937). She places the waning of interest in foreign mission work as beginning just after the First World War when she suggests that there was a sense of the increased importance of missionary work at home. Swan writes in a regretful tone about the state of support for foreign mission work in the aftermath of the 1929 Union of the Church of Scotland and the United Free Church. She describes how "it was somewhat depressing to discover that one of the first problems the reunited Church had to face was a great drop in contributions to missions."[77]

While direct descriptions of foreign missionary activity are scarce in Anna Buchan's novels the impact of them at home as will be explored in chapters three and four was felt by several of Anna Buchan's women of the manse. In these chapters Anna Buchan's depiction of the extensive collecting for foreign missions as well as the opportunities foreign missionary committee work provided for women of the manse will be assessed.

Church life in Scotland

The time when Anna Buchan grew up and began writing was a time of great change in the Scottish Presbyterian churches. These changes would have been felt by manse families of all denominations throughout Scotland. On an institutional level this was the time of unions and reunions. On a national and local scale, it was also the time of revivals. In this time the Churches were also faced with responding to great social change.

Church Unions

It was in Anna Buchan's lifetime that some of the historic splits in the Presbyterian churches in Scotland were healed. Anna Buchan's father Rev. John Buchan was a minister of the Free

[77] Annie S. Swan, *Seed Time and Harvest: The Story of the Hundred Years' Work of the Women's Foreign Mission of the Church of Scotland.* (London ; New York: TNelson, 1937), 149.

Church of Scotland at the time when she was born. The Free Church of Scotland came into being in 1843 after ten years of intense conflict between the Moderate and Evangelical parties in the Church of Scotland over the issue of patronage. The issue at stake was at its heart a question of what the rightful relationship between Church and State should be. The test case was the issue of patronage or who should have the power to decide on the appointment of a minister to a charge. 451 ministers followed Dr Welsh and Dr Chalmers out the Church of Scotland to constitute the Church of Scotland Free (commonly known as the Free Church). This was the Church that the Rev. John Buchan was brought up in and later was ordained in.

After several failed attempts over the preceding decades the Free Church which the Buchans were part of united with the United Presbyterian Church forming the United Free Church in 1900. Initially in the talks in the 1860s the main issue was the question of what the role of the civil magistrate should be and the related question of whether the Church of Scotland should be disestablished. On the latter the two Churches after some deliberation in the Free Church found common ground agreeing that the Church of Scotland should be disestablished. It was Robert Rainy who became known as the leader in the Free Church for disestablishment and more widely the leader of the majority of the Free Church. When Anna Buchan was growing up in 1880s and 1890s Glasgow and her father was active in his ministry there was a significant shift in emphasis in doctrinal matters. This was the time when Burleigh describes the younger generation being "in revolt against the Calvinism or hyper-Calvinism of an earlier age".[78] This is seen in the Declaratory Act passed in the Free Church in 1892 giving office bearers in the Free Church freedom of individual conscience regarding points in the Confession of Faith which "do not enter into the substance of the faith".[79] It is unclear what the Rev. John Buchan's views on this were, but it seems that this freedom of conscience was important for his children (particularly John and Anna Buchan). In the Buchan manse Anna remembers "arguing with Father one day about the doctrines of Free Will and Foreordination".[80] These sorts of topics seem to have been a regular talking point in her adolescence.

[78] John H. S. Burleigh, *A Church History of Scotland*, Fourth impression.. (Edinburgh: Hope Trust, 1983), 366.
[79] Similar Acts were passed in the United Presbyterian Church in 1878 and in the Church of Scotland in 1910.
[80] Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*, 89–90.

It was in 1897 that serious union talks began, and they ultimately came to fruition in October 1900 when the United Presbyterian and Free Churches united with the exception of a small group of Free Church people (known as the Free Church continuing and often referred to as the "Wee Frees"). Those of the Free Church continuing brought about legal action in the civil courts in 1904 claiming to be the rightful owners of the property of the former Free Church according to the law of trusts. Their claim was based on the argument that the original Free Church at its founding had opposed Voluntaryism (that is the funding of the work of the church by voluntary donation only) and that by uniting with the Voluntary United Presbyterian Church those who had united had broken with one of the founding principles of the Free Church. It was John Buchan's friend Richard Haldane who was the lead lawyer for the United Free Church in the case which came before the House of Lords. One of the points to be settled was who were the rightful owners of the Free Church buildings (churches, manses, theological colleges) – the minority who remained or the new United Free Church. This resulted in many of the new United Free Church congregations losing their buildings to the "Wee Frees" and many of their ministers losing their manses. Churches across the country were affected. Some ministers faced confrontation as the "Wee Frees" demanded their manses and churches.

During this time Mr Buchan was the Moderator of the Free Presbytery of Glasgow and in March 1899 moderated a debate on the Union question and the implications for Glasgow presbytery of the impending Union.[81] In general that Presbytery were in agreement with the recommendations of the Union Committee – the main points of discussion were on the issue of the boundaries of the resultant united presbytery. Anna Buchan does not make reference to this episode in Scottish church history in her autobiography or in any of her works of fiction. Anna Buchan was living at home in the manse of the John Knox church at that time so either the Buchans were secure in the manse of the John Knox church and did not experience the uncertainty and tensions some of Rev. John Buchan's colleagues were facing or Anna Buchan chose not to mention it. In his autobiography *Memory Hold-The-Door* (1940), Anna's brother John makes reference to this episode discussing Haldane's handling of the House of Lords case.[82] Buchan describes how Haldane's way of appealing to

[81] 'The Union Question', *Glasgow Herald*, 15 March 1899.
[82] John Buchan, *Memory Hold-the-Door* (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1940), 130–31.

philosophy in his argumentation "made him a formidable advocate, especially in questions of constitutional law, but now and then it led to disaster. The Scottish Church case was an example."[83] He went on to suggest that "Lord Halsbury's masculine intelligence dealt harshly with Haldane's metaphysics, and the Court – wrongly I think – decided against the United Free Church."[84] Clearly Buchan was on the side of the new United Free Church. This would make sense with his father following the majority of his fellow Free Church ministers into the United Free Church.

In the years after the First World War more Presbyterian Church union talks took place. This time the talks were between the United Free Church (the Buchan family's church – although by the time these talks began the Rev. John Buchan had passed away) and the Church of Scotland. These talks were largely focused on the question of whether the resultant United Church would be established (as per the Church of Scotland) or disestablished (as per the United Free Church). The talks eventually came to fruition in 1929 and the newly reunited Church of Scotland numbered four fifths of the Protestant church-going population. These talks are alluded to in Anna Buchan's 1922 novel *Ann and Her Mother* when Mrs Douglas remarks "People may talk about union and one great Church, but when we are all one I'm afraid there may be a lack of interest – a falling off in endeavour."[85] Mrs Douglas's comment is slightly prophetic. While there was a brief growth in the church following the Union there was a slight falling off from 1931. Ultimately the most significant decline did not begin until beginning of the 1960s.[86] It was in 1933 and 34, shortly after the Union that John Buchan served as the Lord High Commissioner to the General Assembly of the Church of Scotland. It was an event which caused great excitement in the Buchan family and was of historical significance as John Buchan was the first son of the manse to hold that high office. Anna Buchan describes in great detail her experiences as a lady in waiting at both the General Assemblies in *Unforgettable Unforgotten.* In terms of her description of her experiences at the General Assemblies she focused on the activities of the Lord High Commissioner and their entourage and made no reference to what was debated at the General Assemblies. What was significant to Anna Buchan in general about the General Assemblies she attended

[83] Ibid., 130.
[84] Ibid.
[85] O. Douglas, *Ann and Her Mother* (London: Thomas Nelson and Sons, Ltd, 1922), 74.
[86] Robert Currie, *Churches and Churchgoers : Patterns of Church Growth in the British Isles since 1700* (Oxford [Eng.] : Clarendon Press, 1977), 170.

was the ritual and ceremony of the occasion. This is the case in all her descriptions of the General Assembly. Earlier in her autobiography she describes her mother's embarrassment about her father consistently picking the losing side in debates. She does not give any detail about what was being debated – just that her father was on the losing side.

The Buchan family supported the Presbyterian Church unions of 1900 and 1929. Despite the fact that Rev. John Buchan was known for taking the unpopular side in debates at the General Assembly he seems to have been sympathetic and fallen in line with the church unionists in at the time of the union of the United Presbyterian Church and the Free Church. This is unsurprising due to the fact that he was a lowlander who was serving in Glasgow at the time. Those who refused to enter into the union in the Free Church were predominantly Highlanders. Unfortunately, there is no record of Rev. John Buchan's views on the Church union which took place in the time when he was active as a minister.

Revivals

Anna Buchan's childhood years were also a time marked by revivals throughout Britain. This phase of revivals were sparked by the arrival of the American evangelists Dwight L. Moody and Ira D. Sankey who conducted a tour of the United Kingdom. Having been invited by some of the Free Church of Scotland ministers to come to Edinburgh in November 1873 Moody and Sankey drew great crowds there and had their greatest success later in 1874 in Glasgow.[87] This revival tour sparked a series of revivals in the years following. In that year the young Rev. John Buchan was left in charge of Broughton Church (Broughton is the Borders village in which he met his wife Helen Masterton) and having heard Moody and Sankey in Edinburgh he introduced their hymns to the people of Broughton.[88] This found its way into Anna Buchan's semi-autobiographical novel *Ann and Her Mother* (1922) where the mother character reminisces:

> But your father was so young and ardent; he went through the district like a flame. He held meetings in lonely glens where no meeting had ever been held before. He

[87] David W. Bebbington, *Evangelicalism in Modern Britain: A History from the 1730s to The 1980s* (London, United Kingdom: Taylor & Francis Group, 1989), 300, http://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/ed/detail.action?docID=179445.
[88] John Buchan, *John Buchan, April 23, 1847 - November 19, 1911. [His Literary Remains, with a Biographical Sketch and Appreciations. With a Portrait.]* (Peebles: Privately printed, 1912), 5.

> kindled zeal in quiet people who had been content to let things go on as they had always gone; it was a wonderful six months.[89]

Later in the same novel Anna Buchan describes the differing experiences of a revival which happened in the fictional Fife village of Kirkcaple (inspired by the real life village Pathhead in which Rev. John Buchan served during Anna Buchan's early years). This revival in *Ann and Her Mother* was possibly inspired by the visit of the evangelist George Clarke which is described in a tribute to the Rev. John Buchan written by Mr. G. Livingstone, a member of the congregation in Pathhead:

> In the early part of Mr Buchan's ministry, George Clarke, the eminent evangelist, paid a visit to Kirkcaldy. Mr Buchan threw his whole energy into the movement, and at the close of Mr Clarke's campaign, Pathhead congregation became a centre for evangelistic work in the district.[90]

This evangelistic work bore fruit as in 1886 sixty new communicants were added to the membership roll of Pathhead Free Church with the majority of them of them being new converts.[91] Tom Lennie in *Glory in the Glen* suggests that "the year 1886 appears to have been attended by special blessing" on account of the vast number of revivals which took place across Scotland in that year.[92]

For Ann's mother in the novel the revival in Pathhead was a great and wonderful thing but for Ann the experience was different. She describes how "You [her mother] didn't realise, you and Father, how miserable it was for us children going to so many evangelistic meeting."[93] She goes on to acknowledge that she enjoyed singing the hymns and listening to the addresses but really hated the one-to-one after meeting conversations.

As well as the revivals which introduced new hymns and ways of worshiping there were many other changes to the patterns of worship in the Presbyterian churches in Scotland. Anna Buchan particularly in her second novel *The Setons* (1916) highlights some of the

---

[89] Douglas, *Ann and Her Mother*, 31–32.
[90] Buchan, *John Buchan, April 23, 1847 - November 19, 1911. [His Literary Remains, with a Biographical Sketch and Appreciations. With a Portrait.]*, 317–18.
[91] Tom Lennie, *Glory in the Glen: A History of Evangelical Revivals in Scotland, 1880-1940*, 2013, 46.
[92] Ibid.
[93] Douglas, *Ann and Her Mother*, 115.

changes which had taken place in the course of her father's ministry. The changes to patterns of worship and the responses of women of the manse to these changes will be explored in full later in Chapter four in this thesis.

Christian Social Thought

The Free Church which as previously noted was the Church Anna Buchan grew up in was a Church which sought to avoid Voluntaryism although in financial matters it bore similarity to Voluntary churches. Burleigh argues that "from the beginning the Free Church gave to all Churches a matchless example of Christian liberality, outplaying the Voluntaries at their own game."[94] This spirit of giving to the Church was something which became integral to life in the Free Church of Scotland and is reflected in Anna Buchan's novels. The period just before Anna Buchan was born was the high point of Evangelical voluntaryism, by the early 1870s 80 percent of the Scottish population was a member of one of the three biggest Presbyterian denominations – Established Church of Scotland, Free Church and the United Presbyterian Church. These three Churches Stewart J. Brown notes "held the same theology, church government and social ideals" and in particular concern for "the pervasive poverty in industrialising Scotland, and a commitment to improving the conditions of the poor."[95] In the biography of the Rev. John Buchan it is noted that as a student at New College he spent much of his spare time "working hard in the Edinburgh slums," and that Helen Chalmers, daughter of Thomas Chalmers, was a great friend at the time.[96] Later his ministry took him to work in the Gorbals slums of Glasgow. While discussing Rev. John Buchan's ministry in John Knox Church his friend from New College the Rev. Charles Shaw observed:

> The conservative bent of Mr Buchan's mind led him to oppose various "forward" movements in the Church. At one time, indeed, he was spoken of Dr Begg's successor in Edinburgh. Never for a moment did he conceal his views on these public questions, and often advocated them fearlessly in Church Courts.[97]

[94] John H. S. Burleigh, *A Church History of Scotland*, 355.
[95] S. J. Brown, 'Reform, Reconstruction, Reaction: The Social Vision of Scottish Presbyterianism c. 1830-c. 1930', *Scottish Journal of Theology* 44, no. 4 (1991): 493.
[96] Buchan, *John Buchan, April 23, 1847 - November 19, 1911. [His Literary Remains, with a Biographical Sketch and Appreciations. With a Portrait.]*, 5.
[97] Ibid., 315.

The Dr Begg referred to here is Rev. Dr James Begg (1808-1883) minister latterly of Newington Free Church and Moderator of the General Assembly of the Free Church in 1865.[98] Sandy Finlayson notes that "James Begg could lay claim to being a social reformer even a radical one, but this was mixed with a strong strain of ecclesiastical conservativism."[99]

As a social reformer Begg was interested in improving the welfare of his working-class parishioners in Liberton and Newington parishes in Edinburgh. This included a desire to improve the housing and education of the working classes. The concern about the housing of the working classes was one which was particularly pertinent to the Buchan family's experiences in John Knox Free Church parish in the Gorbals, Glasgow since the Gorbals was one of the most impoverished parishes in Scotland. Stewart J. Brown argues that at the turn of the twentieth century "Glasgow's housing remained among the worst in Europe."[100] The question of appropriate housing for working class parishioners is one which Anna Buchan explores in her Gorbals novels. Mr Laidlaw the minister father of Eliza in *Eliza for Common* observes that "it's not much good talking about better houses for the poor, until you can manage to put some self-respect into the people themselves."[101] If Mr Laidlaw's comment can be taken as close to Mr Buchan's views, it seems there was a shift in views around housing being a priority for improving the welfare of the poor from Begg in the 1850s and Buchan in the 1890s. Mr Buchan and his contemporaries seem to be more cynical about the good better housing could do for poor people. This may be the result of John Buchan serving in the Gorbals which was one of the most deprived areas of Glasgow so having a more direct exposure to the worst experiences of people in Scotland.

---

[98] James Begg was a friend of the Buchan family. Anna Buchan in *Unforgettable, Unforgotten* (1945) describes how;

> We were often told the story of Dr. Begg's visit to our manse. The parents had to go out and left their guest reading by the fire. John had looked in and, seeing him alone, lugged from a low shelf a large volume for his entertainment. Dr. Begg told him not to bring anymore but John persisted with a second and a third. Then Dr. Begg beat him, and when Mother came in announced, "I have had dealings with your son." P190.

[99] Alexander Finlayson, *Unity and Diversity : The Founders of the Free Church of Scotland* (Fearn, Ross-shire, Great Britain : Christian Focus, 2010), 170–71.

[100] Stewart J. Brown, *Providence and Empire: Religion, Politics and Society in the United Kingdon, 1815-1914*, Religion, Politics and Society in Britain (Harlow: Pearson Longman, 2008), 430.

[101] O. Douglas, *Eliza For Common*, 5th ed. (London ; New York: Hodder and Stoughton, 1930), 73.

Temperance

The 1880s to 1890s was a time of growth in support for the temperance movement in the churches in Scotland: in 1880 89 ministers of the Free Church of Scotland were members of the Scottish Temperance League (one of the major temperance organisations in Scotland); by 1900 that figure had more than doubled to 200 ministers.[102] In parallel to the ministers joining the Scottish Temperance League, Helen Lockhart Gibson and Margaret Blaikie sometime after 1883 set up the Free Church Manse Ladies Total Abstinence Society. By 1888, the year the Buchan family moved to Gorbals Glasgow, the Society had grown to "considerably over 500".[103] It is likely that Helen Buchan (Anna's mother) was one of that number. The United Presbyterian Church had a sister organisation. Lesley Orr Macdonald notes that "by 1900 when the United Free Church was formed, the united number of the two societies was two thousand." [104]

Discussing the Buchan family's commitment to the cause, Martin Green suggests that "Mrs Buchan had a horror of alcohol; her children saw it as a part of generous living."[105] Here Green appears to suggest that Anna and John were not committed to the temperance cause. William Buchan (John's son) in his autobiography counters Green noting that

> In a harsh winter time or a chill, uncertain summer, calories were needed, which many men got from alcohol, something not possible for my aunt and grandmother or other good-living people, although Walter, still guarding his male territory, kept a stock of excellent matured whisky which I was to come to appreciate greatly in later years.[106]

So, Anna and her mother were committed to the cause of temperance promoted by the Band of Hope while her brother Walter and later her nephew William did not practice. Here It seems that within the Buchan family temperance was practised along the same gender lines as in wider society. In wider society it was typical that women and girls were more

[102] D. C. Paton, 'Drink and the Temperance Movement in Nineteenth Century Scotland', 1977, 348, https://era.ed.ac.uk/handle/1842/17777.
[103] W. Gibson, *'Not Weary in Well-Doing'; or The Life and Work of Mrs. Helen Lockhart Gibson* (Edinburgh, 1888), 142.
[104] Macdonald, *A Unique and Glorious Mission*, 253.
[105] Green, *A Biography of John Buchan and His Sister Anna*, 30.
[106] William Buchan, *The Rags of Time: A Fragment of Autobiography* (Southampton: Ashford, Buchan & Enright, 1990), 49.

committed to temperance than their male contemporaries. Lesley Orr Macdonald argues that "contemporary accounts convey a general impression that the United Free Church women were more directly involved, with greater enthusiasm, than those of the established church."[107] However, she goes on to suggest that "it is likely that most middle- and upper-class churchwomen regarded temperance simply as an instrument of home mission work."[108] This is likely the case with the young Anna Buchan and her family who were enthusiastic about running the Band of Hope and the women were total abstainers but do not seem to have been interested in the wider political discussions around temperance.

Changing roles for women

There were many changes to the lives of women which came about during Anna Buchan's lifetime both in wider society and within the Church. A number of areas of life were opened to women around the turn of the century – universities were opened to women, it became more acceptable for middle-class women to work outside the home, some women got the vote after a long and intense period of campaigning, and new opportunities for service in the Churches came about.

Higher Education

It was during Anna Buchan's lifetime that University education became open to women. Just before Anna Buchan was born the push to open universities to women was spearheaded by Sophia Jex Blake. By the time Anna Buchan herself was of age to go to university, the University of Glasgow where her brothers had attended had opened its doors to women. Anna Buchan in her autobiography notes that on her return to Glasgow from Edinburgh she attended Queen Margaret College. Queen Margaret College was founded by the Glasgow Association for the University Education of Women in 1883. On the opening up of the University of Glasgow to women in 1893 the College was transferred to the University initially reserved specifically for the education of women. It retained a strong community identity. Wendy Alexander notes that the Queen Margaret College in its early years was "the centre of a highly organised corporate life" with two important student societies – the

[107] Macdonald, *A Unique and Glorious Mission*, 253.
[108] Ibid., 254.

Queen Margaret Suffrage Society and the Queen Margaret Settlement Association. Anna Buchan generally downplayed the education she received growing up. In the same paragraph where she mentions Queen Margaret College she goes on to suggest that "the only real education I ever had was listening to Father and the boys talking."[109] This is striking because Anna Buchan both in her autobiography and in her women-of-the-manse novels idealises Oxford and the university circles in which her brother John was involved in. As will be explored in Chapter five Eliza's reading habits and pushback against life in the manse in *Eliza for Common* are the result of her brother Jim's influence from Oxford. In any case Anna Buchan in her novels does not depict any of her female characters going to university or having a university education. This is significant because this was something that several of Anna Buchan's contemporaries drew on for inspiration.

Employment

The turn of the century was also a time of change in women's employment. It was in the very late 1800s that the professions of medicine and the law were opened up to women. Medicine proved especially controversial. Lesley Orr Macdonald notes the high proportion of ministers daughters who took up the opportunity to enter the professions at the turn of the century: "Between 1898 and 1910, 50 per cent of ministers daughters went into teaching, and 22.8 per cent into medicine, 86.4 were in paid employment: a higher than average proportion of female graduates unmarried and working."[110] Although these fields were opened up in Anna Buchan's lifetime, the women who actually went on to pursue careers in these fields were exceptional. Rosalind Marshall suggests that "the development of professional careers has been a fluctuating process. In the 1920s and 30s when these new career opportunities [medicine, law, politics etc.] were an exciting novelty. From 1930 until 1950 there was a lessening of impetus"[111] It is strange that Anna Buchan does not feature more working women in her novels considering that the novels were set in the 1920s and 30s. Debbie Sly notes that Anna Buchan's' "heroines are middle or upper class women, none of whom needs to earn her living; they all turn their backs on new-fangled ideas about a

[109] Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*, 68.
[110] Macdonald, *A Unique and Glorious Mission*, 284.
[111] Rosalind K. Marshall, *Virgins and Viragos: A History of Women in Scotland from 1080 to 1980* (London: Collins, 1983), 314.

women's role."[112] In the novels women who work are typically depicted as working class servants or writers. The one stand out exception is Betty Barton in *Priorsford* (1932): she is described as having been educated at Somerville and serves as Lady Bidborough's private secretary. This is important to note as it reveals the social status of Anna Buchan's women-of-the-manse – they are better off than the average woman-of-the-manse as they do not seem to need to work and they fill their days with the activities which will be discussed later in this thesis.

First World War and its aftermath

The First World War brought profound changes to the lives of all people in Scotland and further afield. Many families lost loved ones and the Buchans were no exception. Many people found themselves taking on different roles or jobs to support the war effort. The Churches were faced with the challenge of supporting the people of Scotland through the challenging times. The end of the war brought with it both a time of mourning and sense of optimism for the future. The Buchans were involved in the War effort in a variety of ways. Alastair Buchan served in the army and ultimately lost his life. John Buchan was war chronicler for Nelson publishers (starting at the beginning of the war and completed at the close), war correspondent for *The Times* and *Daily News* (1915 to the end) and in a variety of roles in GHQ (Second Lieutenant in the Intelligence Corps, writer for the War Propaganda Bureau) as well as the Ministry of Information which was formed in January 1918. His war career was exceptional, whereas Anna Buchan's was perhaps more typical of a woman of her class. Throughout the War she volunteered with the Soldiers' and Sailors' Families Association where she visited the bereaved families in her district of Northgate and Cuddyside.[113]

The Church

Just as there were changes to the lives of women in wider society in Anna Buchan's lifetime there were also changes in the lives of women in the Churches though much remained the

[112] Debbie Sly, 'Pink Sugary Pleasures: Reading the Novels of O. Douglas', *Journal of Popular Culture* 35, no. 1 (2001): 5.
[113] Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*, 153.

same. The most significant changes to opportunities for women for service in the Church of Scotland came about in the 1890s. This was the time that Archibald Charteris developed the role of Deaconess and Parish Sister in the Church of Scotland. However, it was not until 1916 that the role of Church Sister was developed in the United Free Church of Scotland. Thus, Anna Buchan's lack of mention of these roles makes sense. By the time these roles were introduced in the United Free Church Anna Buchan was no longer as active in the Church – her active involvement in the Church waned when she moved out of the John Knox Free Church manse to live in Bank House in Peebles where she kept house for her brother Walter. Anna Buchan's life story and that of her characters reflects Lesley Orr MacDonald's assessment of the changes which happened in the 1880s to 1930s:

> For numerous women of all classes, church worship and church-based organisations had for long provided the only significant community beyond the domestic domain. That was no longer true: organised religion would now have to compete for the time, talents and means of some of that erstwhile majority which it had invariably taken for granted.[114]

The work that women undertook was primarily philanthropic. Women who were giving time to the Churches did a variety of different things many of which are mentioned by Anna Buchan in her autobiography and novels. These activities included helping with the Sunday school and/or the Band of Hope, collecting for the Home and Foreign missionary activities of the churches, distributing religious tracts and running Bazaars. The work undertaken by the women of the manse will be discussed later in this thesis.

Anna Buchan in general resisted depicting the changing opportunities for women in her novels choosing instead to largely present women in traditional roles. Buchan's fictional women were women who were primarily homemakers, wives, mothers and daughters living at home. Their days were filled with household tasks and paying social calls to neighbours.

[114] Macdonald, *A Unique and Glorious Mission*, 63.

The Scottish Churches and First World War

Although Anna Buchan does not discuss the Churches' response to the outbreak of war in her autobiography it is a significant feature of the closing chapters of her second novel *The Setons* (1916). Thus, it is important to explore how the Churches in Scotland responded to the war supporting both those on the frontline and those on the Home Front. Within *The Setons* the diversity of responses of ministers is shown – from the patriotic preaching of the older Rev. Johnston Christie and Mr. Smillie to the decision of the young minister Andrew Hamilton to enlist as a soldier. It is interesting that Buchan should omit to include a minister serving as a Chaplain. The chapters in *The Setons* which are set during the First World War are set during the early years of the war (1914 to 1916). In the early part of the war there was a sense of patriotic optimism for the War and the prospect of a national religious revival in the churches in Scotland. Stewart J. Brown argues that "With the outset of the war, Scottish Presbyterian clergy took a prominent role in recruitment, and delivered sermons and addresses in support of Britain's war effort"[115] In the early days of the War Scottish ministers were active in recruitment with many signing up to serve as chaplains and as many as 90 percent of sons of the manse volunteered for service in the armed forces.[116] This statistic is mirrored in the experience of the Buchan family – Walter was the only one of Anna Buchan's brothers not to volunteer for service in the armed forces. Deborah Stewartby suggests that he was exempted because his roles as Town Clerk for Peebles and Burgh Fiscal were reserved occupations.[117] Indeed, it was a Scottish Minister George Duncan whom Gerard de Groot suggests was "in every sense Haig's personal preacher".[118] In these early days a sense of the war being a Christian war with Britain defending Christian values was widespread amongst the presbyterian Churches. Stewart Brown argues that "During the early months of the war, the Church of Scotland and the United Free Church had sought to identify the cause of Christian morality with that of the British war effort."[119]

[115] Stewart J. Brown, '"A Solemn Purification by Fire": Responses to the Great War in the Scottish Presbyterian Churches, 1914–19', *The Journal of Ecclesiastical History* 45, no. 1 (January 1994): 84.
[116] Ibid.
[117] Stewartby, 'Walter Buchan - Who He?', 19.
[118] Gerard de Groot, '9 "We Are Safe Whatever Happens" - Douglas Haig, The Reverend George Duncan, and the Conduct of War, 1916-1918', in *Scotland and War AD 79-1918* (Edinburgh: John Donald Publishers, 1991), 197.
[119] Brown, '"A Solemn Purification by Fire"', 90.

As the war dragged on and there was not the Christian revival which had been hoped for there was a growing weariness and division amongst people in the Churches. As well as uncertainty about what the Churches' response to the war and the changes to society brought about by the war. In general, the Churches continued their support for the war effort and the Government throughout the war. It was in the United Free Church that there were the strongest voices for pacifism from people in the progressive wing of the Church. James Barr of St Mary's Govan[120] was the strongest voice for peace in the United Free Church and in 1916 was brought before Glasgow Presbytery for his outspoken support for peace negotiations though he was successful in defending himself. Stewart Brown suggests that Barr was a "largely isolated voice in Scotland" with most people believing the war to be a righteous war against a godless enemy. [121] As the war progressed and conscription was introduced the Churches generally took the position of hard-line opposition to conscientious objectors.[122]

The war permeated all the business of the Churches. George Reith of the United Free Church described how in 1915 "the war cast its shadow over every detail of Assembly business. Yet perhaps "shadow" is scarcely the right word to use. One might almost say that the war was the inspiration of the business."[123] This sense of the war impacting all the work of the Churches from Home Mission to Foreign Mission, the Colleges to the Central Fund Committee was something which carried throughout the war. The war also impacted the union negotiations between the United Free Church and the Church of Scotland. Although the war hindered the official talks between the denominations it brought the churches together in a much more practical way. Ministers of both denominations served as chaplains to the armed forces and with so many serving abroad ministers at home took to covering for their fellow ministers regardless of denomination.[124]

[120] James Barr was later the first Moderator of the United Free Church (Continuing) – the small anti-establishment remanent of the United Free Church which refused to enter into union with the Church of Scotland in 1929.
[121] Brown, '"A Solemn Purification by Fire"', 90.
[122] Ibid., 92.
[123] G. M. (George Murray) Reith, *Reminiscences of the United Free Church General Assembly, 1900-1929* (Edinburgh: Moray Press, 1933), 161.
[124] Ibid., 168.

Loss of life

The number of Scots casualties in the First World War is debated but the figure is likely to be between 100000 and 135000 deaths.[125] By 1916/17 ministers in the Churches in Scotland were faced with offering hope and consolation to mourning congregations. Stewart Brown argues that:

> In the Presbyterian Churches, ministers were hard-pressed to comfort the growing numbers of bereaved and give hope to those with sons or husbands at the front - especially as so many ministers were themselves suffering personal loss. Over 90 per cent of the sons of Church of Scotland clergy who were of military age, it will be recalled, had enlisted during the first year of the war, most taking commissions - and the death rate among officers was very high.[126]

Although Rev. John Buchan had died in 1911 before the First World War began the Buchan family were amongst the many manse families who had sons enlist in the armed forces. Alastair Buchan (the youngest of the Buchan children) joined the Cameron Highlanders and first went out to France as an officer with the 9th Battalion of the Royal Scots Fusiliers in 1915. He later was killed on the 10th April 1916 in the Battle of Arras. His death shaped Anna Buchan's writing of her second novel *The Setons* (1916). She was part way through writing the novel when her bother was killed, and it seems his death changed the course of the novel. She channelled her grief into her writing of the final chapters of *The Setons,* reflecting on the impact of the death of soldiers on those left behind. This loss of life permeates Anna Buchan's later writing – many of her novels feature at least one family which she depicts as having lost a son or sons in First World War.

Surplus women

A result of the great loss of life in First World War was that in the aftermath of the war there were a great number of what the press of the time referred to as "surplus women": women who were unable to marry due to a lack of men. According to the 1921 Census of England

[125] National Records of Scotland Web Team, 'National Records of Scotland', Document, National Records of Scotland (National Records of Scotland, 31 May 2013), /research/learning/first-world-war/scotlands-people-and-the-first-world-war.
[126] Brown, '"A Solemn Purification by Fire"', 91.

and Wales there was "a ratio of 1,096 females to 1,000 males".[127] The ratio was similar in Scotland where between 1911 and 1921 the female population increased by 3.3 percent while the male population only increased by 1.7 percent.[128] The term predates the First World War but was popularised by the press of the early 1920s. It is a term and concept which has been debated both in the 1920s themselves and in later scholarship on the period. Anna Buchan herself could be considered one of those "surplus women", although by 1921 she was in her 40s so probably would have expected to marry before the outbreak of First World War. While she does not write about her romantic relationships (or lack of) in her own autobiography, William Buchan (Anna Buchan's nephew) in his autobiography comments:

> I think but can merely only surmise as the evidence is scanty, that Anna when young loved and was loved by an extremely handsome and charming young Minister, who went joyfully off to the 1914 war, was as an army padre, won the Military Cross and was killed in action. There is some evidence of his affection for Anna and so, had he survived the war, life for her might have taken a different turn. [129]

Andrew Lownie goes further in his identification of who Anna Buchan's admirer was. He suggests that it was Rev. Dr. Robert (Robbie) Alexander Cameron Macmillan, a close friend and contemporary of Anna's younger brother Walter. Debbie Sly points out that "Douglas's writing allows us to read the stories of a largely ignored portion of the "surplus women" – those "unrebellious women""[130] Buchan's novels with their focus on the single women of her novels either making good marriages or becoming satisfied spinsters reflects some of the anxieties and fate of the "surplus women" of the post-First World War era.

Conclusion

In this chapter I have outlined and explored the key changes and events which took place in Anna Buchan's lifetime both in the church and wider society. In different ways these informed and inspired Anna Buchan as she wrote her novels. In many ways Anna Buchan

[127] '1,918,863 Surplus Women', *Evening Telegraph*, 29 May 1922, Gale Primary Sources.
[128] Ibid.
[129] Buchan, *The Rags of Time*, 44.
[130] Sly, 'Pink Sugary Pleasures', 2001, 6.

can be regarded as a novelist whose writing reflected her times. The big political events explored in this chapter are the backdrop to all her novels and therefore essential to understand before the novels are analysed.

I have attempted to paint a picture of what life was like for Anna Buchan growing up as a daughter of a Free Church of Scotland minister in the late nineteenth century and her life as a young woman in the early twentieth century. Her childhood was conservative with an emphasis on strict observance of the Sabbath yet she had fun with her siblings. Through her siblings' involvement in Empire life (John Buchan in South Africa and William Buchan in India) she had close experience of life in the British Empire and the Foreign mission activities of the Scottish Churches. As a daughter of the manse in the late nineteenth and early twentieth century she lived through the time of the Unions in the presbyterian churches and one of the major periods of revival in the churches in Scotland. It was also the time that the temperance movement was at its peak. Anna Buchan's early adult life was marked by significant changes to the opportunities for women in public life, although these changes she tended to resist depicting in her novels. The First World War changed the lives of all, and the Buchan family was no exception. Like many families the Buchans lost a son in battle. This sense of the loss of life brought about by the War permeates Buchan's writing. Much of her writing despite being set in the interwar years has tinges of harking back to the times discussed in this chapter.

Chapter 2: Literary Context

Having explored the historical world in which Anna Buchan lived, it is also important to give attention to the literary world in which she lived so as to understand the literary influences which Anna Buchan drew on as she wrote her own novels. Anna Buchan grew up in a house full of stories and books and her parents, and in particular her father, told the Buchan children many tales and stories and encouraged them to read for themselves. As she matured, Anna Buchan's literary tastes evolved, although she retained many of her childhood favourites throughout her life. This chapter will begin by examining the texts she read as a child, assessing how typical they were for young people of her time. Key authors under consideration here include Walter Scott and Robert Louis Stevenson. I will then go on to assess Buchan's evolving tastes through adolescence, highlighting her love of William Shakespeare and her 'Yellow Book' phase. The first section of this chapter will conclude with an exploration of the authors Anna Buchan either refers to or is noted to have read as an adult. Many of these authors were her contemporaries, so here I have attempted to assess the extent of her links with them. The chapter will then go on to assess where Anna Buchan fits as an early twentieth century author writing about the experiences of women of the manse and Scottish middle-class women in general. It will conclude with an exploration of who Anna Buchan's readers were.

Anna Buchan's Reading

Childhood and adolescence

As a child Anna Buchan grew up surrounded by books and reading. Her father in particular was a great storyteller and reader. The early chapters of her autobiography *Unforgettable Unforgotten* (1945) where she describes her childhood are full of references to authors and texts she either had read to her by her Nurse Ellie Robbie (Ellen Robinson) or her father or that she read herself. In this section I will explore what texts Anna Buchan encountered as a child/adolescent, her attitudes towards them and assess the extent to which they were

typical of a child of her class and time. I will also assess the extent to which these texts influenced the older Anna Buchan's writing.

Early Childhood

It is perhaps unsurprising that the first text Anna Buchan recounts as having been read to her as a child was a biblical passage. She recalls how, when going to bed in the Pathhead manse in the winter she heard the story of the Virtuous Woman in the book of Proverbs (Proverbs 31) – her own experiences as a child fuelling her imaginative understanding of the verse "She is not afraid of the snow for her household: for all her household *are* clothed with scarlet." (Proverbs 31:21).[131] She remembers:

> In winter we wore nightgowns of red flannel, and when we heard of the Virtuous Woman in *Proverbs* who clothed her household in scarlet, we felt we could picture them exactly, down to the white herringboning on the belts and cuffs.[132]

It is interesting that she should recall that passage in particular given that in her works of fiction she tends to depict women as homemakers who value their family and seek to make sure that they are provided for. Perhaps here she is subtly highlighting the passage of scripture which underpinned her life philosophy. The Bible in the Buchan household was enjoyed perhaps unusually for a manse family more as literature than as the Word of Life. Anna Buchan described the Bible in the context of her childhood experiences as "a veritable mine of wealth to us, not, I fear, because it was the Word of Life, but because it was full of such grand stories".[133] This was in the context of a description of the imaginative games the Buchan children enjoyed playing on the Sabbath which I discuss in the historical context chapter. The Buchan children as children of the manse also heard the Bible stories in church in the multiple Sunday services they attended as well as at Sunday School and meetings of the Band of Hope. In her novels, Anna Buchan demonstrates the impact of this intensive exposure to the Bible as a source of story. Her novels are steeped in biblical allusions and

[131] Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*, 10.
[132] Ibid., 10.
[133] Ibid., 23.

quotations and demonstrate the impact this early deep exposure to the Bible had on Anna Buchan in her later writing.

Typically, of children of her time Anna Buchan's sabbath reading was dominated by John Bunyan's *Pilgrims' Progress* alongside stories in "bound books" of worthy Christian men and women who had "suffered for their faith".[134] These bound books likely included John Foxes' *Acts and Monuments* (*The Book of Martyrs*). Katharine Burrill (a friend and contemporary of Anna Buchan) in *Corner Stones* (1907) considers:

> Foxe's *Book of Martyrs* most interesting reading. Does anyone, child or grown-up, read Foxe now, or know anything of those who –
>
> "Climb'd the steep ascent of heav'n
>
> Through peril, toil, and pain"?[135]

Anna Buchan was very likely one who read Foxe. This seems to have been common for presbyterian children of her time. It would have reinforced the message that the heroes of the faith were ones who suffered for it. I explore the Sabbath experience of children in more detail in chapter one.

Anna Buchan's exposure to Scottish literature as a child

Walter Scott

Anna Buchan grew up in a house where a love of Scottish literature was fostered. Her father loved reading the works of Walter Scott and Robert Louis Stevenson and shared his passion for these authors with his children. In a talk given during the centenary celebrations for Walter Scott Anna Buchan reminisces "I was brought up in the Scott tradition, my father worshipped Sir Walter hardly on this side of idolatry, nothing pleased him more than to make his children familiar with the writings he loved so well."[136] His love of Walter Scott inspired her depiction of the minister James Seton (who is based on her father) in her second novel *The Setons*:

---

[134] Ibid., 23–24.
[135] Katharine Burrill, *Corner Stones*, 220.
[136] Anna Buchan, 'Sir Walter Scott' (n.d.), acc11627.119, NLS.

> Mr. Seton was standing in what, to him, was a very characteristic attitude. One foot was on a chair, his left hand was in his pocket, while in his right he held a smallish green volume. A delighted smile was on his face as Elizabeth entered.
>
> "Aha, Father! Caught you that time."
>
> Mr. Seton put the book back on the shelf.
>
> "My dear girl, I was only glancing at something that——"
>
> "Only a refreshing glance at Scott before you begin your sermon, Father dear, and 'what for no'?[137]

Given the limited reference to the works of Walter Scott elsewhere in her writing it is likely that Elizabeth's reaction to her father reading the work of Walter Scott is close to that of Anna Buchan's own response. Sheila Scott suggests that "Anna was to become an ardent Shakespeare fan, but references in her writings suggest that she found it difficult to read Scott herself."[138] She associates Walter Scott with her father but personally is not very interested in his work. In her autobiography she recollects her father commenting in despair on her lack of aptitude in her studies which was "what was to be expected of a girl who couldn't read Scott".[139] This is surprising considering that around the early 1880s the work of Walter Scott was more popular amongst girls than boys.[140] In the Buchan household it seems that being able to read and enjoy the works of Walter Scott was a mark of intelligence primarily reserved for the men of the house. John Buchan in particular came to

---

[137] O. Douglas, *The Setons*, Nelson's Novels (London: Thomas Nelson and Sons, Ltd, 1947), 46. The phrase "what for no" is a quotation from Walter Scott which demonstrates Anna Buchan's knowledge of Walter Scott's work and the influence of Walter Scott on her writing.

[138] Scott, *O. Douglas*, 6.

[139] Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*, 47.

[140] Paul Barnaby, 'Scott and the Nineteenth Century Child Reader', in *The Land of Story-Books: Scottish Children's Literature in the Long Nineteenth Century : Scottish Children's Literature in the Long Nineteenth Century*, ed. Sarah Dunnigan and Shu-Fang Lai (Glasgow, UNITED KINGDOM: Association for Scottish Literary Studies, 2019), 30, http://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/ed/detail.action?docID=5826402. Alec Ellis in *A History of Children's Reading and Literature* cites the following results from a survey conducted by Charles Welsh in 1884:

> it was found that the favourite authors of 790 boys aged 11 to 19 were Charles Dickens, Kingston, Scott, Marryat, Ballantyne, Ainsworth, Mayne Reid, Kingsley, Defoe, and J. G. Wood. Names which were not rated high in popularity were those of Farrar, Henty, "Ascot R. Hope", and Gordon Stables. Favourite titles were Robinson Crusoe and The Pickwick Papers, whilst the least favoured were Farrar's Eric and Marryat's Masterman Ready. A similar survey among approximately 1000 girls in the same age group revealed a preference for Dickens, Scott, Kingsley, Yonge, Shakespeare, "Hesba Stretton", Mrs. Walton, Bunyan, and Emma Marshall. P72.

love the writing of Walter Scott as much as his father did. In the course of his writing career he wrote two biographies of Water Scott – the first *The Man and the Book: Sir Walter Scott* in 1925, the second in 1932 *Sir Walter Scott.* In his own writing he followed in the tradition of Walter Scott in writing Scottish historical novels. Douglas Gifford describes Buchan's *Witch Wood* (1927) as "undoubted masterpiece of this late period of the tradition".[141] Even if Anna Buchan did struggle with the work of Scott as Sheila Scott suggests, she seems to have appreciated Walter Scott enough to say during the celebration talk referred to earlier:

> Generally we spell Scotland with one T but this last year it might as well have been spelt with two, for it was certainly the land of Scott. And I think we did him proud. There was not a celebration in one town that was not a success, some were wonderful.[142]

While direct references to Walter Scott in Anna Buchan's novels are largely unenthusiastic she does seem to have absorbed his practice of using the medium of the novel as a form of propaganda for a cause. While his cause was largely the revival of interest in the Scottish national identity I will argue that hers was for the more domestic cause of the improvement of the lives of women of the manse.

Scottish Ballads

Another passion of Anna Buchan's father which he shared with his children to their delight was a love of Scottish Ballads – particularly Borders Ballads:

> Being a passionate lover of his own countryside, Father never tired of repeating to us the Border Ballads ; how "Jamie Telfter of the fair Dodhead" carried the fray to Branksome Ha", and how Johnny Armstrong went out in all good faith to meet his King, only to find that death was to be his portion.[143]

It is striking that Anna Buchan's father should enjoy ballads and folk tales so much considering that he was a Free Church minister. Stewart Brown notes that the Folklore

[141] 'Scott's Legacy to Scottish Historical Fiction', *The Bottle Imp* (blog), 1 November 2014, https://www.thebottleimp.org.uk/2014/11/scotts-legacy-to-scottish-historical-fiction/.
[142] Buchan, 'Sir Walter Scott'.
[143] Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*, 11.

Society in Britain was founded in 1878 and that several ministers including those from the Free Church "became amateur folklorists, helping to collect and publish accounts of popular beliefs."[144] Balladry and theatre by the time of Anna Buchan were generally acceptable things for ministers and manse families to enjoy.

These ballads and folk tales fuelled the children's imagination and were for both John and Anna a source of inspiration for their own writing throughout their writing careers. In a poem he wrote for Anna during his days at Oxford, John Buchan wrote of their childhood adventures in the Borders reminiscing about how their childhood adventures were full of faeries, princesses and kings. These same ballads and adventures were a source of inspiration for Anna Buchan when she wrote the short story "Jock the Piper" – a story written for young and old featuring many of the children who appear in her other works. In "Jock the Piper" Anna Buchan draws particularly on the folk tales "The King of Errin" and "Red Etin" among a wide variety of stories.[145] These tales provide characters and narratives for episodes in the grand adventure the children of the story go on in their imaginative play. The story largely takes place in their imagination – very little of the story takes place in "real" time, just the first chapter and the last section of the second last chapter where it is revealed that no time has passed in the "real" word though for the children in their adventure many days passed. A love of ballads is something which many of the well-read Scottish characters in Anna Buchan's novels are described as having. Often, in lists of books owned or read by a character, ballad collections are mentioned as being an important part of their collection of literature/literary texts.

Robert Louis Stevenson

Although Anna Buchan barely mentions either Stevenson or Burns in her autobiography they seem to have been authors whose works she enjoyed reading. After William Shakespeare and her brother John Buchan, the author whose works she used the most quotations from as chapter headings in her novels is Robert Louis Stevenson. Two out of the

[144] Stewart Brown, 'Beliefs and Religions', in *A History of Everyday Life in Scotland, 1800 to 1900*, ed. Graeme Morton and Trevor Griffiths (Edinburgh University Press, 2010), 141.
[145] Anna Buchan, *Farewell to Priorsford: A Book by and about Anna Buchan (O. Douglas).* (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1950), 63–83.

seven quotes by Stevenson which she used are from poems published in his poetry collection *A Child's Garden of Verse* (1885). Alec Ellis in *A History of Children's Reading and Literature* notes that between 1860 and 1890 (the years Anna Buchan was growing up) "[t]here were very few books of poetry apart from Robert Louis Stevenson's A Child's Garden of Verses (1885)" written specifically for children. [146] The one instance where she mentions Stevenson in her autobiography is in the course of her description of spending time with her Great-uncle John who lived in London and was highly dismissive of the writing of Stevenson noting "I never liked scribblers. That R. L. S. that they made so much fuss about…he couldn't write". In contrast Anna would have contradicted him had she been sure that the shock of it would not have killed him.[147] This difference in opinion perhaps is indicative of generational differences of views on the work of Stevenson – perhaps suggesting that his work resonated more powerfully with younger readers of the time – those of Anna Buchan's age – than with older readers. Anna Buchan's difference of opinion on Stevenson is one which is also found in her final daughter-of-the-manse novel *Eliza for Common* where Eliza and her brother Jim both are portrayed as loving the work of Stevenson and the Great-uncle James Pringle despising it.

Other works read by the Buchans as children

As I have already suggested the Buchan children were well read and grew up surrounded by books and stories so, beyond the authors already explored, they read the work of many others. Many of the authors and works which Anna Buchan mentions reading during her childhood are relatively typical of a child of her time. She recalls her father reading Lewis Carroll's *Alice in Wonderland* (1865). Carroll's *Alice in Wonderland* was a work which although not initially popular grew in popularity to the point that his publisher Macmillan according to Ellis "seriously underestimated the demand" for its sequel.[148] Anna Buchan also remembers her father reading to her and her siblings the fairy tales of the very popular at the time Hans Christian Andersen and Brothers Grimm as well as the American author Mark Twain's Huckleberry Finn stories.

[146] Alec Ellis, *A History of Children's Reading and Literature* (Elsevier, 1963), 74.
[147] Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*, 81.
[148] Ellis, *A History of Children's Reading and Literature*, 68.

Alongside the works of specific authors which she names Anna Buchan also notes that she and her siblings enjoyed reading the following magazines – *Punch, Blackwood's Magazine* and *Good Words*.[149] *Good Words* was a Scottish magazine edited by the Church of Scotland minister Norman MacLeod and included contributions from many of the leading authors of the mid-nineteenth century. It was popular amongst non-conformist lower middle classes and was known for its distinctive Christian outlook and as acceptable Sabbath reading. *Punch* on the other hand was a highly irreverent and satirical cartoon magazine. *Blackwood's Magazine* founded and initially edited by the publisher William Blackwood was a Conservative supporting journal which like *Good Words* featured contributions from many leading authors including James Hogg and Margaret Oliphant. Thus, the Buchan children read a diverse range of magazines.

Anna Buchan's Adolescent reading

William Shakespeare

In her late adolescence Anna Buchan developed a love of the work of William Shakespeare. The highlight of a trip to visit her brother John in Oxford was seeing a production of *Midsummer Night's Dream* by the Oxford University Dramatic Society. In her memoir she describes the experience – "It was my very first visit to the theatre and I have never forgotten it. I knew the play by heart and now I was to see it in the flesh and blood".[150] Her love of Shakespeare is reflected in the vast number of quotations from his work that she uses as chapter titles in her novels. She quotes from thirty-three of his works, several of them multiple times. *Midsummer Night's Dream, As You Like It* and *Twelfth Night* are the three works which are used most widely by Anna Buchan as sources for quotations for chapter headings.

J. M. Barrie

Alongside Shakespeare Anna Buchan had a love of the work of J. M. Barrie – in particular his plays. J. M. Barrie was one of the triumvirate of authors most commonly associated with the Kailyard school. The other authors being Ian Maclaren and S. R. Crockett. It is perhaps

[149] Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*, 26.
[150] Ibid., 80.

surprising that Anna Buchan enjoyed the work of J. M. Barrie so much as a teenager. At this point in her life her reading habits were largely guided by her brother John. John at that point was a student at Oxford and active in the Union Society.[151] At the December 1897 meeting he presented the motion "That this House condemns the Kailyard School of Novelists".[152] Anna Buchan enjoyed giving recitals of the work of Barrie to various groups including the Samaritan Hospital in Glasgow. It is interesting though perhaps unsurprising that Anna Buchan should enjoy the work of Barrie and love the work of Shakespeare. Caitlin Hansen identifies a wide range of ways in which Barrie was deeply inspired by the work of Shakespeare particularly in reference to the depiction of children and childhood.[153] Their rejection of depicting an idealised or sentimental portrayal of children is something which Anna Buchan later drew on in her own work – children in her works are depicted as fully developed characters.

This may also be attributed to Anna spending a lot of time looking after her youngest brother Alasdair who was born when she was in her late teens. Her experience of looking after Alastair, and later John's children, seems to have inspired her little boy characters within her novels.[154] Her depictions show great insight into the lives and characters of small boys - the sense of adventure, quick wit and reluctance to do their lessons. Wendy Forrester in her biography of Anna Buchan discussing *The Setons* (1917) suggests that her "portraits of the oldest and of the youngest of *The Setons* are very winning…the portrait [of Alastair (Buff)] is so successful that it is somehow quite difficult to think of Alastair Buchan as a grown man and a soldier."[155] William Urquart goes further than Forrester reminiscing that "Anna Buchan is responsible for some of the most delightful portrayals of boyish life I have come across in fiction."[156]

[151] Lownie, *John Buchan*, 299.
[152] Ibid., 52.
[153] Caitlin Hansen, '14. Betwixt-and-Between: Barrie, Shakespeare, and Playing at Childhood', in *The Land of Story-Books: Scottish Children's Literature in the Long Nineteenth Century*, ed. Sarah Dunnigan and Shu-Fang Lai (Glasgow, UNITED KINGDOM: Association for Scottish Literary Studies, 2019), http://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/ed/detail.action?docID=5826402.
[154] Forrester, *Anna Buchan and O. Douglas*, 48.
[155] Ibid., 48.
[156] Urquhart, 'Corrected Typescript, circa 1948, of the Reverend Dr William S Urquhart, "Some Memories of O Douglas"', 2.

Church Publishing

As previously noted Anna Buchan stayed with one of her father's minister friends during the year she spent at school in Edinburgh. The friend of her father that she stayed with was Dr Norman Walker formerly the minister of Dysart, a neighbouring parish to Pathhead Kirkcaldy in Fife. Dr Walker was as Anna Buchan notes the "Editor of the *Free Church Record*, a scholarly man, with a witty and sarcastic tongue."[157] His house, like the Buchans', was filled with books. While she stayed with him she learnt to entertain him, becoming what she describes as "regrettably pert".[158] It may be that it was during this time that she began to properly develop her powers of observation of church figures which would stand her in good stead as she wrote her descriptions of ministers and members of manse families. In general, it was while she was staying with him that she really flourished academically in English literature. She won an award for English literature while at the school in Edinburgh.[159] It is likely that she was helped by Dr Walker's attention. It seems that at home in Glasgow she was largely overshadowed academically by her brothers.

Classic Authors and Anna Buchan's "Yellow Book phase"

The mid to late 1890s was the point in Anna Buchan's life where she seems to have spent most of her time reading. In the opening paragraph of the chapter where she recounts her life in the late 1890s she describes the time she had to read a vast array of different classic authors:

> Looking back from an age when the years fly faster than leaves in an autumn gale, it seems to me that in my youth time 'stood still withal' and large tracts of unoccupied time lay all about one. How else could one have had time to read Dumas, Hardy, Meredith, George Eliot, the Brontës, Jane Austen, Thackeray, not to speak of the poets?[160]

It is significant that of the authors named by Anna Buchan in the above list the only author living at the time she was reading them was Hardy because it indicates that at this point in

[157] Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*, 57.
[158] Ibid.
[159] Ibid., 61.
[160] Ibid., 83.

her life she was absorbing the classics. It is also interesting that at that point in her life she seems to have predominantly read the great English authors – none of those named are Scottish. This is surprising considering her exposure to Scottish literature in her younger years. This may be the result of John Buchan's influence from Oxford.

This was also the time in her life when she went through her "Yellow Book" phase. The *Yellow Book* was a wide ranging quarterly arts magazine published by John Lane of Bodley Head publishers in Vigo Street from 1894 to 1897. It was associated with decadence and scandal. At its launch it faced critical hostility from the press who took offence at its subversiveness and decadence.[161] A variety of authors had their work published in the *Yellow Book* including the English author and poet, Richard Le Gallienne, who Anna Buchan met when he came to Glasgow to meet with her brother John. Another writer in the Yellow Book whom she met during her time in Glasgow as a young woman was Walter Raleigh, the Professor of English Literature in the University of Glasgow. She reminisced in her autobiography about the meeting that "somehow or other, we got onto Shakespeare and I was on top of the world, everything forgotten except the interest of the talk."[162] Her brother John also had work published in the *Yellow Book*. Although, reflecting on having his work published in the *Yellow Book* later in life John Buchan thought that it "was a very odd medium for a work of mine to appear in."[163] This may be an indication that he did not feel like he fitted in with the *Yellow Book* set. There is an interesting exchange in *Eliza for Common* (1928) where Eliza and her elder brother Jim talk about the *Yellow Book* in the context of despairing about their parents' lack of taste in décor for the manse drawing room. Jim is baffled at how their parents could have such bad taste when at the time the room was decorated the *Yellow Book* and aestheticism were in fashion. Eliza notes that their parents were not interested in that scene.[164]

In a case of life reflecting art Anna Buchan's *Yellow Book* phase brought her into conflict with her own parents when, inspired by the Yellow Book attitudes towards things, she revamped the drawing room in the Glasgow manse and began sitting around with the blinds

[161] J.lewis May, *John Lane And The Nineties* (John Lane The Bodley Head, 1936), 75–76.
[162] Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*, 85.
[163] Katherine Lyon Mix, *A Study in Yellow: The Yellow Book and Its Contributors.* (Lawrence: University of Kansas Press, 1960), 197.
[164] Douglas, *Eliza For Common*, 93.

down, burning incense during the afternoon.[165] A part of her revamp of the drawing room included the organising of two bookcases in which she shelved the books which were most precious to her – mostly books which her brother John had given to her. The list of books she gives is quite impressive and revealing:

> Thackeray, Jane Austen, Dorothy Osborne's Letters, Kenneth Grahame's *Pagan Papers* and *The Golden Age*, Kipling, Stevenson, Sir Walter Scott's *Diary, Peter Ibbetson* and *Trilby*, an edition of Shakespeare, two stout volumes of Browning, Keats, Shelley; *The Oxford Book of English Verse*; meek little volumes like *Goody Two-shoes, A Flat-Iron for a Farthing,* and a very early edition of Hans Andersen's *The Will o' the Wisps are in Town* and many others.[166]

Many of these authors works are later sources for Anna Buchan as chapter heading quotations and more general inspiration in her writing. These works and authors also reappear within her novels – she frequently depicts her characters reading one or many of these authors. Kitty Baillie's library in Anna Buchan's final novel *The House That Is Our Own* (1940) closely reflects that of her creator's – most of the authors in the above quotation appear in the description of Kitty Baillie's collection often using the same terms.[167] It is surprising that these works should be the ones Anna Buchan chose to put on her bookshelves during her 'Yellow Book' phase as only Kenneth Grahame and Stevenson are particularly associated with the *Yellow Book.* This *Yellow Book* phase was the most significant time of rebellion for Anna Buchan and a time which she draws on in her depiction of Ann and Eliza's teenage rebellions.

Anna Buchan's Adult Reading

In contrast to the expansive lists of works she had read to her or read herself as a child and adolescent, Anna Buchan's mention of works and authors she read as an adult are few and far between. Of the forty-six authors/works named by Anna Buchan in her autobiography only ten are mentioned in the course of her account of her adult life. Of these ten works

[165] Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*, 87.
[166] Ibid.
[167] Douglas, *The House That Is Our Own*.

three were written by Neil Munro and two were written by Sarah Macnaughtan. The former Anna Buchan singles out as a particular favourite whose works she first read in childhood but continued to reread as an adult. The latter she mentions meeting one time while she was in London with her mother to meet Susan Grosvenor who was to marry John Buchan and become Mrs Susan Buchan, and from 1935 Lady Tweedsmuir. In this section I will explore their work and that of the other authors Anna Buchan mentions as having read as an adult.

Sarah Macnaughtan

As I have noted above Anna Buchan met Sarah Macnaughtan at a bethrothal party held in London in 1906 for her brother John and Susan. In her autobiography she recollects Sarah Macnaughtan as being one of the after dinner guests at this party. She describes the meeting thus:

> the person I was most interested in was Sarah Macnaughtan, whose books, *Christina McNab* and *Thee Expensive Miss du Cane,* I had much enjoyed. She was delightfully easy to talk to and we made friends at once, and there and then she invited me to stay with her when the wedding came off.[168]

Her love of Macnaughtan's work and friendship with her seems to have had a strong influence on Anna Buchan's own writing. The two authors share several common interests in terms of themes and content. A review in *The Times* March 2, 1906 of Sarah Macnaughtan's *A Lame Dog's Diary* (1906) opens:

> The Latin proverb says, "It is better to be first at Praeneste than second in Rome." This bears a moral for writers, for, freely rendered, it means that a close observer of village life will probably be more famous than those who "spread themselves" on cities or on the universe…The latest illustration of this truth is "A Lame Dog's Diary," by S. Macnaughtan.[169]

[168] Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*, 104.
[169] 'A Lame Dog's Diary', *The Times*, 2 March 1906, Gale Primary Sources.

The above statement could later apply to Anna Buchan and her work for she became a highly popular and famous author for her close observations of life in the fictional villages of Priorsford, Rutherfurd and Kirkmeikle. In her novels she depicts the lives of ordinary people living in these villages – this is particularly the case in the Priorsford world. Another common feature of the work of Anna Buchan and Sarah Macnaughtan is their focus on the lives of upper middle class and lower upper-class people. They particularly focussed on the transitions/dynamics between people of these two classes – the financial and social issues people of each of these classes face. The contrast between life in Scotland and England, particularly London, is also a common area of exploration for the two authors. Macnaughtan is primarily interested in depicting the experiences of Scots moving to England and the struggles they face, whereas Anna Buchan is more interested in the lives of people who lived in London moving to rural Borders Scotland – her characters tend to more easily embrace the Borders lifestyle. The most significant exception to this rule is Eliza in *Eliza for Common* who leaves the Glasgow manse of her childhood to move to the Meade's in King John's Lodge near London.

Katharine Burrill

In *Unforgettable, Unforgotten,* Anna Buchan describes Katharine Burrill as one of her book friends whom she corresponded with throughout her writing career. Katharine Burrill was the daughter of the Writer to the Signet A. D. M. Black and lived in Edinburgh and Tweedside until her marriage when she moved to Liverpool. It was following her marriage and move that she began writing essays which were published both in essay collections and as standalone pieces in *Chambers Journal*. Her writing career seems to have been a short one spanning only four years. In these four years she published three single author collections of essays: *Corner Stones* (1904), *Shell Gatherers* (1905) and *Loose Beads* (1906). Her only other published book was a co-authored cookbook *The Amateur Cook* (1905) with Annie M Booth. Katharine Burrill's work seems to have been largely forgotten by critics and scholars. The writer of an article in *The Musselburgh News* on August 10th 1906 comments "When one considers the brightness and cleverness of her writing, one is surprised that her

work is not even better known than it is."[170] While it does not seem to have gained wide popularity, Katharine Burrill's work seems to have made a significant impact on Anna Buchan. Many of the ideas and descriptions in Katharine Burrill's work have found their way into the novels of Anna Buchan. These will be noted in later chapters of this thesis.

Findlater Sisters

Mary (1865-1963) and Jane Findlater (1866-1946) were authors who like Anna Buchan grew up in a Free Church manse. Their father Eric Findlater was minister of the Free Church in Lochearnhead. There was an age gap of roughly ten years between them and they seem to have moved in different political circles – Anna Buchan was Conservative whereas the Findlaters were Liberals whose friends included Lady Frances Balfour, the Greys and the Haldanes. Wendy Forrester in her biography of Anna Buchan *Anna Buchan and O. Douglas* (1995) notes that they were among Anna Buchan's favourite modern Scots authors, though Anna Buchan makes no mention of the Findlater sisters in her autobiography *Unforgettable Unforgotten*.[171] In a letter to Marion Lochhead in August 1930 Anna Buchan comments:

> You may be interested to know that I had a letter recently from Miss Jane Findlater asking if she might take an incident I tell in the *Proper Place* and make it into a story. Needless to say I was only too pleased and happy to agree![172]

This was at a time where Anna Buchan was at her publishing peak but the Findlater sisters had waned in popularity and were struggling to get published. In the same letter Anna Buchan notes that Jane in her letter to her she wrote of her sister Mary's struggles to get the novel published on the grounds that it was "too middle class". The sisters' last novel to be published was *Beneath the Visiting Moon* in 1923. Jane Miller in her biography of Mary Findlater notes that Mary's novels "with their discursive plots and lack of psychological

[170] 'A Woman Essayist• | Musselburgh News | Friday 10 August 1906 | British Newspaper Archive', accessed 27 March 2023.
[171] Forrester, *Anna Buchan and O. Douglas*, 67.
[172] Buchan, Anna, 'Letter from Anna Buchan to Marion Lochhead Aug 3 30', 3 August 1930, MS.26190, NLS.

analysis, had, by the 1920s, fallen out of fashion."[173] Meanwhile, the 1920s was when Anna Buchan was at the peak of her writing career.

There are some similarities between the Findlater sisters' work and Anna Buchan's both in terms of content of the novels and in terms of how their work has been read by scholars. Both the Findlaters and Anna Buchan tended to write novels which focussed on the lives of Scottish women in small rural Scottish villages and in London. Also, they both wrote daughter-of-the-manse novels in which the fictional daughter of the manse remains unmarried just as their writers were unmarried daughters of the manse. Interestingly Eileen Mackenzie in her biography of the Findlater Sisters views Anna Buchan as a successor to the Findlaters but with a caveat - "On the upper levels of the art, Henry James and Virginia Woolf were setting the tone. On the lower, the pink sugar of O. Douglas was preferred to the Findlaters' stringency."[174] The suggestion that Buchan's work was sweeter and more gentle than the Findlaters' is fair. However, the suggestion that her work was "lower" is perhaps an unfair assessment of the work of Buchan as her work has been considered worthy of critical attention by more scholars than the Findlaters.

Margaret Oliphant and Annie Swan

Margaret Oliphant and Annie Swan were both writers whom Anna Buchan admired greatly. Both wrote extensively and published novels, short stories and histories. Margaret Oliphant was born in Wallyford East Lothian in 1828 but spent her writing years in England. She published over one hundred works. Anna Buchan in the draft of a script for a talk she once delivered observes "I think it right to know something of the life of that splendid woman of whom us as Scots people are justly proud. Mrs Oliphant was easily without doubt the greatest Scotswoman of the century."[175] Anna Buchan goes on to suggest that "Although in fiction she was great, I think it was in biography she excelled."[176] Oliphant wrote biographies of significant figures in religious and literary history including Edward Irving and John Tulloch. Anna Buchan on a smaller scale followed her heroine in writing biography. She

[173] 'Findlater, Mary Williamina (1865–1963), Novelist', Oxford Dictionary of National Biography, accessed 31 March 2020.
[174] Eileen MacKenzie, *The Findlater Sisters: Literature & Friendship.* (London: JMurray, 1964), 144.
[175] 'Mrs Oliphant' (n.d.), 1.
[176] Anna Buchan, 'Mrs Oliphant' (n.d.), 2, acc11627.118, NLS.

wrote her father's biography and in *Ann and Her Mother* creatively wrote her mother's biography. In terms of fictional work Oliphant wrote several novels about the lives of manse and vicarage families as well as many works following the lives of Scottish women. In *The Minister's Wife* (1869) she wrote what is perhaps the first novel written by a woman about the life of a woman of the manse. In doing so she started a genre which several of Anna Buchan's novels can be included in.

At an event in honour of Annie Swan under the auspices of the P.E.N. Club in Edinburgh in January 1935, Anna Buchan spoke in honour of the aforementioned author. She commented that "for 50 years Annie S. Swan had been taking tired people to the islands of the blessed. Looking back and forward, she thought Annie S. Swan must be one of the happiest women in the world."[177] Annie Swan (1859–1943) was a novelist who sought to emulate the success of Margaret Oliphant. She was also a columnist in both *The British Weekly* (founded by William Robertson Nicoll) and *Annie Swan's Magazine.* It was because of her association with Robertson Nicoll that she became associated with the Kailyard school. Annie Swan was politically Liberal. Anna Buchan read and appreciated the work of Swan which is perhaps unsurprising given the fact that they were both very popular authors whose works were read widely by people in similar circles. Both authors works were highly popular and focused on domestic life particularly of women and were fairly traditional in outlook. This is why scholars and critics have tended to associate both authors with the Kailyard school. In her chapter in *A history of Scottish women's writing* Beth Dickson argues that both Swan and Douglas have a complicated relationship with the Kailyard but in different ways.[178] Swan was closer to the core Kailyard figures of Robertson Nicoll, Barrie, MacLaren and Crockett than Anna Buchan was.

Scottish P.E.N.

It is interesting that Anna Buchan made no mention of her involvement in P.E.N. in her autobiography though it is perhaps a result of her tendency to focus on her family life rather than her writing career in her autobiography. Considering she was asked to speak at the event in honour of Swan it seems likely that she was fairly actively involved and probably

[177] 'Annie S. Swan Honoured', *Dundee Courier*, 10 January 1935, Gale Primary Sources.
[178] Dickson, 'Annie S Swan and O Douglas: Legacies of the Kailyard', 329 & 341.

knew and read the works of other authors who were members. The Scottish Centre of P.E.N. (Poets, Essayists and Novelists) describes themselves as providing "Scottish writers – novelists, poets, essayists, dramatists, historians, script-writers, editors – with their national forum and their only international corporate voice. It also provides opportunity for social contact in a club-like atmosphere."[179] Anna Buchan's association with the Scottish P.E.N. is significant since the best known figures involved in the club were mostly those associated with the Scottish literary renaissance – Hugh MacDiarmid, Helen Cruikshank, Neil Gunn, and Edwin and Willa Muir were among the founding members. According to the 1931 members list of the Scottish Centre of P.E.N. Anna Buchan was a member at that point.[180] Most of the authors I have listed above were proponents of Scottish Nationalism and many were early or founding members of the National Party of Scotland (the forerunner to the Scottish National Party). In terms of her political affiliations Anna Buchan was conservative and a unionist. Her brother John Buchan served as a Conservative MP from 1927 and Anna is known to share her brother's political views. She recalls in her autobiography sitting on the platform of a Unionist political meeting with Susan (John's wife).[181] Within her novels the party she makes most positive reference to is the Conservatives – one of the characters within *The Day of Small Things* (1930) is depicted as the Conservative candidate in upcoming elections and the heroine in that novel is depicted as a supporter of them.[182] Anna Buchan's membership of the Scottish Centre of P.E.N. perhaps is a recognition of her standing as a Scottish writer. Her brother John Buchan does not appear on the 1931 members list – this is likely a result of him living and working in Oxfordshire by this time. It represents a literary social group that she engaged with separately to her brother John and suggests that her work should be understood within the context of the Scottish literary arena.

[179] International P.E.N. Club, Scottish Centre, 'About Scottish P.E.N. – National Library of Scotland', 1953.
[180] Scottish P.E.N. 'The P.E.N. An International Association of Poets/Playwrights Editors/Essaysists Novelists | List of Members Scottish Centre', June 1931. Acc8560/8. NLS.
[181] Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*, 104.
[182] O. Douglas, *The Day of Small Things*, Greyladies (Edinburgh: Greyladies, 2012), 159.

Marion Lochhead

Marion Lochhead was a fellow member of the Scottish Centre of P.E.N. whom Anna Buchan corresponded with warmly on several occasions. In one letter in June 1930 to Marion Lochhead Anna wrote:

> I can't think how I didn't know you were a poet. I have read several of your poems but thought it was another of the same name. Last night I read some of your poems aloud. Enjoyed them all greatly. I love "Painted things".[183]

It is likely that Anna Buchan knew Marion Lochhead better as a journalist. However, throughout the 1930s Marion Lochhead was to become known for writing poems and novels which reflected her church interests. The first of these novels published in 1934, *Anne Dalrymple,* explores the Tractarian Movement in the 1830s and 40s from the perspective of a daughter of a Scottish Episcopal Church priest. In her novels Marion Lochhead gave an insight into the historical lives of people including daughters of priests in the Scottish Episcopal Church, the denomination to which she belonged.

Poets

Anna Buchan's love of poetry continued into adulthood with her maintaining a love of the poets she read as a child/adolescent and developing an interest in contemporary poets. She was a passionate proponent of Scots poetry, giving talks on Scottish poets at events including meetings of the Vernacular Circles of the London Burns' Club. An article in the *Aberdeen Journal* from 9 December 1924 describing the talk she gave to the London Burns' Club reveals the wide variety of authors on which she spoke. [184] She began her talk with a defence of the Scots language as a literary language. The first works mentioned in the article are *A Window on Thrums* by J. M. Barrie, *Wee Macgregor* by J. J. Bell and an unnamed lowland Scots song. This selection of works interestingly reflects the places in which Anna Buchan spent time during her life and the Scots dialects/accents she had been exposed to – Fife, Glasgow and the Borders. Lady Jane Scott is also noted as being mentioned by Anna

[183] Buchan, Anna, 'Letter from Anna Buchan to Marion Lochhead Dated June 8 30', 8 June 1930, MS.26190.46.
[184] '0. Douglas on Scots Poets', *Aberdeen Journal*, 9 December 1924, Gale Primary Sources.

Buchan. This is a misprint in the article, as in her manuscript of the talk it is revealed that Anna Buchan was actually talking about Lady John Scott (Alicia Ann Spottiswoode) who was a Scottish song writer and collector of folk tales who lived near Lauder. Anna Buchan described her thus: "her refinement was coupled with a robust appreciation of national humour".[185] In her talk Anna Buchan was highly critical of J. B. Selkirk and other authors who only wrote in Scots to show that it could be done. She also made comment about the work of R. L. Stevenson suggesting that he could write good Scots verse but that his use of Scots was ironic. She also quotes at length from some contemporary Aberdonian poets including Charles Murray whose work she appreciated, C. M. Grieve (Hugh MacDiarmid) and Violet Jacob. The latter was an associate of the Buchan family. Susan Tweedsmuir met her on a trip to Egypt and John Buchan in a letter to her praised her novel *Flemington* (1911) as "the best Scots romance since *The Master of Ballantrae."*[186]

Poetry in Scots was something Anna Buchan enjoyed giving talks on to various groups. However, she did not write poetry in either Scots or English herself: instead she focused on novels, short stories and talks. In terms of her use of Scots in her own work she mostly followed the Kailyard tradition of using the Scots dialect as a marker of the social class of the speaker. The lower the class of the character the more Scots they used. In general, most characters in her works speak in English. In this Anna Buchan differs from her contemporaries including Nan Shepherd and Lewis Grassic Gibbon who tend to use Scots more extensively within their writing. Though this is perhaps more of a difference between the Aberdonian Doric writers and Scots authors from other parts of Scotland given the two aforementioned authors and others who used dialect more extensively were predominantly Aberdonian Doric writing authors.

It is important to understand Anna Buchan's relationship with the Scots dialect and Scots poetry when reading her women-of-the-manse novels. As will be examined in greater detail in the servants section of Chapter five her servants all are depicted speaking in Scots dialect. One of the servants in *Ann and Her Mother* notably composes a song about herself in the Scots dialect.

[185] Buchan, Anna. 'A Talk about Books', n.d. Acc11627.118. NLS.
[186] National Library of Scotland, MS 27416

Buchan Family

As a family of writers, the Buchans regularly read each others' works. John and Anna were particularly close – when they could, they would share a room while writing and read each others' draft material.[187] Anna enjoyed writing her third novel *Penny Plain* (1920) in the company of John, particularly appreciating his assistance with description – something she felt she struggled with. Anna was very proud of her brother's literary achievements; throughout her autobiography she mentions his various published works. John Buchan's *John Burnet of Barns* published 1898 was a particular favourite of Anna and her younger siblings. She loved his descriptions of Tweeddale and it remained a favourite work throughout her life.[188] Her sister-in-law Susan Buchan (nee Grosvenor) was also an author. She began her writing career with a biography of Wellington entitled *The Sword of State: Wellington after Waterloo* in 1928. She wrote biographies, essays and works of fiction including a co-authored novel with her husband *The Island of Sheep* (1920) under the pseudonym Harmonia. However, Anna Buchan does not make any comment about what she thought of Susan Buchan's writing.

Situating O. Douglas's novels in their literary context

Having identified the authors and works which Anna Buchan read herself it is important to situate her novels within their context. This section will assess the extent to which her works fit into any of the established literary traditions of the time – considering the extent to which they can be considered part of the Kailyard tradition, the clerical novel tradition or the Scottish literary renaissance amongst other categories of the time. It will conclude by suggesting where Anna Buchan's works fit into the Scottish literary canon.

[187] Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*, 166–67.
[188] Ibid., 75.

Kailyard

Within Scottish literary studies the term 'Kailyard' is one which has been subject to much debate and redefining since it was first coined as a description of a particular type of literature by the critic John Hepburn Millar in his article "The Literature of the Kailyard" in *The New Review* in 1895.[189] Kailyard literally refers to a kitchen garden where kail (cabbage) and other vegetables were grown but it later came to be used to describe a particular school in Scottish literature which sentimentally portrayed life in a rural Scottish village. The authors most often associated with the Kailyard school are J M Barrie, Ian Maclaren (John Watson) and S R Crockett – all Free Churchmen – the latter two were Free Church ministers. However later scholarship has identified a variety of subtypes of Kailyard literature each with their own distinctive features. Traditional Kailyard largely consists of the works of the trio of authors discussed above. The anti-Kailyard subtype is the reaction against it typically associated with George Douglas Brown's *The House with the Green Shutters* (1901). The urban Kailyard is works with kailyard tropes and themes but set in a city or large town rather than a rural village. Female Kailyardesque literature consists of works which are written by women which share many of the tropes and themes of Kailyard but, because they are written by women, are not typically included in the standard canon. Feminine domestic fiction is sometimes associated with the Kailyard. Late Kailyard is works which are similar to those of the core canon but were written after the core time of writing (1890s). The clerical Kailyard subtype includes works which can easily be defined as Kailyard and which focus attention on the minister character. The work of Anna Buchan fits quite a few of these categories but none of them fully. In so many ways the work of Anna Buchan does not fit neatly into any of the existing categories of Kailyard though features many of the key characteristics of Kailyard broadly defined. Moira Burgess in *Imagine a city: Glasgow in fiction* (1998) demonstrates the difficulty in categorising Anna Buchan's work within the Kailyard tradition. She observes that:

[189] J. H. Millar, 'The Literature of the Kailyard', ed. William Ernest Henley, *The New Review; London* 12, no. 71 (April 1895): 384–94.

> The novels of "O. Douglas" (Anna Buchan) might seem to qualify as kailyard, but at its best her writing has a humorous sharpness which suggests that she is observing, rather than subscribing to, the ethos of the urban kailyard.[190]

The novels of Anna Buchan which Burgess is discussing here are *The Setons* (1917) and *Eliza for Common* (1928). These two as I have noted earlier are Anna Buchan's most significant clerical novels. Each depicts life in a Glasgow United Free Church manse in the 1910s and 1920s respectively though based on Anna Buchan's own experiences of growing up in the Gorbals manse in the 1890s.

Scottish Whig-Presbyterian novel tradition

In their chapter "Between Nationhood and Nonconformity: The Scottish Whig–Presbyterian Novel and the Denominational Press" in *Literature and Union: Scottish Texts, British Contexts* (2018) Valerie Wallace and Colin Kidd argue that:

> Religion rather than nationhood was the dominant feature of Scottish literature after 1707. In particular, the history of Scottish literature between the Napoleonic era and the First World War is in substance, or should be—if properly parsed—a matter of church history, inseparable from a saga of denominational divisions and alignments.[191]

It is with this lens that Anna Buchan's work should be approached. While Kidd and Wallace place the parameters of this as ending at the First World War, Anna Buchan's novels written in the 1920s and 1930s also should be considered within this framework. While more subtle in her discussion of denominational divisions than her predecessors including her family's beloved Walter Scott which Kidd and Wallace discuss, Anna Buchan does engage with the church landscape with a distinctly Free Church perspective. In her writing she pokes fun at the United Presbyterians which by the time she wrote her novels were an extinct denomination. She also reflects the tensions described by Wallace and Kidd between Presbyterians and Episcopalians. A key phase in the development of the Whig-Presbyterian

[190] Moira Burgess, *Imagine a City: Glasgow in Fiction* (Glendaruel: Argyll Publishing, 1998), 71.
[191] Valerie Wallace and Colin Kidd, 'Between Nationhood and Nonconformity: The Scottish Whig–Presbyterian Novel and the Denominational Press', in *Literature and Union* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2018).

novel as identified by Wallace and Kidd was the development of the Kailyard school under the vision of William Robertson Nicoll. Wallace and Kidd identify Nicoll with the promotion of Scots works which had Scots Presbyterian themes but he was more strongly a supporter of British Nonconformity. This was the position held by the publisher Hodder and Stoughton who published Anna Buchan's works. Wallace and Kidd recognise the turning point in Scottish literature provided by the anti-Kailyard movement suggesting that "Arguably, much of twentieth-century Scottish literature—as far removed as so much of it is from ostensibly religious matter—evolved in reaction to the arcadian Presbyterian whimsy of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries."[192] Here, Wallace and Kidd seem to be suggesting that twentieth century Scottish literature post World War One largely is a reaction to the late nineteenth century Kailyard literature which sentimentally portrayed Scottish Presbyterian values. This is true to an extent of Anna Buchan's writing although she does moderate the excesses of the Kailyard. However, she does retain a sympathy towards the Presbyterian values which she grew up with. Her novels reflect the values of Scottish Presbyterian middle-class women. While her Priorsford and Rutherfurd series to an extent suffer from the "small town-parochialism" which Wallace and Kidd identify as a feature of the Kailyard, her Gorbals novels *The Setons* (1917) and *Eliza for Common* (1928) do not. In both these novels she depicts the seamier side of life in Glasgow, although perhaps not to the extent the anti-Kailyard novels do. Anna Buchan's relationship with the Kailyard will be examined later in this chapter.

Clerical novel tradition

In many works of Scottish literature the minister character plays an important role but despite this prominence the character has remained largely understudied in Scottish literary scholarship. More widely the character of the minister or priest has been given more attention in English Literature. Horton Davies explores the character in English literature in a book length study *A mirror of the ministry in modern novels* (1959). However Davies's work nearly entirely neglects Scottish literary works and thus has been largely ignored by Scottish literary scholars.

[192] Ibid.

Much of the discussion about the character of the minister has been in the course of an examination of other aspects of church life or faith in fiction. Ian Campbell in his article "'A Thin and Tattered Veil': Lewis Grassic Gibbon and the Church of Scotland" (*Studies in Scottish Literature* 43:1) makes reference to the different ministers in Grassic Gibbon's *Scots Quair* trilogy briefly observing how the ministers act as symbols of the state of the church. In his chapter "Scottish Literature in a Time of Change" in *The History of Scottish Theology, Volume II: From the Early Enlightenment to the Late Victorian Era* (2019) Campbell observes the changes and constants in the depiction of the church and ministers in Scottish literature from the time of Walter Scott to present day. However, all the authors whose work he discusses are male. In the same volume Alison Jack also makes reference to ministers in her chapter "The Calvinist Paradox in Eighteenth- and Nineteenth- Century Literature" in which she explores the influence of Calvinism in the poetry of Robert Burns and the novels of Susan Ferrier, Catherine Sinclair and Margaret Oliphant. In her book *The Prodigal Son in English and American Literature: Five Hundred Years of Literary Homecomings* Jack devotes one chapter to "Prodigal Ministers in Fiction".

The minister is a significant character in the Kailyard school of literature which Anna Buchan's writing has been associated with and has received some attention from scholars. Most scholars critiquing the Kailyard school at the very least mention the presence of the minister as a major character in novels associated with the Kailyard. To differing degrees the relationship between minister as author and minister as character is also explored – two out of the three leading lights in what has been defined as the Kailyard School were Free Church of Scotland ministers like Anna Buchan's father. The most significant study of the character of the minister in Kailyard novels is Callum Brown's chapter "Rotavating the Kailyard: Reimagining the Scottish "meenister" in discourse and the Parish State since 1707" in *Anticlericalism in Britain c. 1500-1914* (2000).[193] Brown begins by outlining the history of ministers and their parishes and then examines the minister as a character in fiction.

The "clerical novel tradition" as I define it is the tradition of writing novels which feature ministers and other similar clergy figures such as Rectors and Vicars as the lead or significant

[193] Callum G. Brown, 'Rotavating the Kailyard: Re-Imagining the Scottish "Meenister" in Discourse and the Parish State since 1707', in *Anticlericalism in Britain c. 1500-1914*, ed. Nigel Aston and Matthew Cragoe (Gloucestershire: Sutton Publishing, 2000), 138–58.

character. The depiction of the minister differs from work to work with some being portrayed in a more positive light than others. This is a tradition which is particularly strong in the canon of Scottish literature. A key early example of a text which is part of this tradition is John Galt's novel *Annals of the Parish* (1821) which features the Rev. Micah Balwhidder, minister of the fictional village of Dalmailing, as the narrating lead character. John Buchan's *Witch Wood* (1927) which tells the story of David Sempill's time serving as minister of Woodilee is another significant example. It is a tradition which continues within Scottish literature to this day with James Robertson's *The Testament of Gideon Mack* (2006) featuring Gideon Mack a minister in the fictional town Monimaskit who in the course of the novel has an encounter with the Devil. It was in the 1890s that the tradition reached its high point. In the 1890s the Kailyard school with the minister as a key character in works associated with that school emerged. Ian Campbell in *Kailyard: A New Assessment* (1981) highlights the importance of the minister as a character in novels in the Kailyard tradition. In his definition of the Kailyard he features the minister as a key stock character noting that "not for nothing is the minister…held in total veneration."[194] He later observes that an important feature of the portrayal of the minister in Kailyard works is the resistance to the changing status of ministers in society. In Kailyard works the minister maintains his status as the most respected character in the fictional community and novel. In anti-Kailyard works the minister tends to lose the respect of the characters in the fictional community over the course of the novel.

Beginning with Margaret Oliphant in her 1869 novel *The Minister's Wife* a tradition developed of women writers turning their attention to the women of the manse as significant characters in their own right. Oliphant's *The Minister's Wife* is a romance which focuses on the character Isabel Diarmid being wooed by the parish minister Mr Lothian – the first two thirds of the novel is the romance and the final third focusses on her life as Mrs Lothian the minister's wife. The novel ends with the tragic death of Mr Lothian. This tradition was taken up by Jane Findlater who in *Rachel* (1899) depicts in the titular role Rachel, the daughter of the Rev. Nathaniel Chesney of Easter Hithe church, as a potential love match for the key character Michael Fletcher, a charismatic preacher. Nancy Brysson Morrison is another female author writing in the interwar years whose work is part of the

[194] Ian Campbell, *Kailyard*, New Assessments (Edinburgh: Ramsay Head, 1981), 14.

clerical novel tradition. Like the Findlaters and Anna Buchan, Brysson Morrison also focuses her attention on the daughters of the manse in her clerical novel *The Gowk Storm* (1933).

While the works of Oliphant, Findlater and Morrison tended towards a darker portrayal of the life of women of the manse, writing about themes of betrayal and death, Anna Buchan tended to portray manse life in a lighter light. While Anna Buchan does handle themes of death, poverty, and illness in her work she offers more relief from these darker moments. In this regard her work represents a turning point in the tradition away from the Gothic darkness of Oliphant. Several authors followed Anna Buchan in this lighter women-of-the-manse novel tradition. These included Marion Lochhead with her novel *Anne Dalrymple* in 1934 who took this novel tradition out of the presbyterian church and into a Scottish Episcopal Church and Church of England context. In the Church of Scotland context Emma Menzies, wife of a minister on Mull, wrote *Achachlachar* (1936) exploring the life of a woman of the manse on the island of Mull.[195] This is a novel Kate Macdonald rightly defines as "Kailyard fiction without the melodrama or the deaths."[196] Lavinia Derwent follows in the tradition of Anna Buchan in using a pseudonym to enable her to write about events in her own life. Lavinia Derwent was the pseudonym of Elizabeth Dodd. In *Lady of the Manse* (1985), one of her autobiographical works, she wrote about her life as a young woman keeping house for her elder brother who was a minister in Berwickshire. In tone, however, this book is closer to Anna Buchan's autobiography *Unforgettable, Unforgotten* than her fictional works.

Anna Buchan's women-of-the-manse novels tread the line between the darker works of Oliphant, Findlater and Morrison and the lighter works of Lochhead, Menzies, and Derwent. Her daughter-of-the-manse novels *The Setons* (1917) and *Eliza for Common* (1928) have the distinction amongst the works of the authors previously identified of being the only ones to explore the lives of women of the manse in an urban setting. Despite these works having an urban setting Anna Buchan's novels in general like those of Findlater and Menzies have tended to be linked with the Kailyard tradition.

[195] It is likely that Anna Buchan could have met Emma Menzies as she regularly went on holiday to Mull with her family.
[196] Kate Macdonald, 'Achachlacher, by Emma L Menzies', *Kate Macdonald* (blog), 6 February 2019, https://katemacdonald.net/2019/02/06/achachlacher-by-emma-l-menzies/.

Anna Buchan as a female Kailyardesque clerical novelist

Several of the novels written by female Kailyardesque novelists (women whose work conforms to some of the traits of Kailyard but are not typically included in the canon of Kailyard works) fit into the clerical novel tradition. It is difficult to define which works and authors belong to this group. Annie S. Swan (1859-1943) is the female author whose work has been most readily associated with the Kailyard school. However, Beth Dickson argues that "to designate Swan exclusively as a "Kailyard" writer is to fail to recognise the significance of her popular appeal".[197] Interestingly her most prominent clerical novel *Adam Hepburn's Vow: A Tale of Kirk and Covenant* (1885) does not conform to the typical traits of a Kailyard novel. In this novel she depicts the life of the minister Adam Hepburn and his family at the time of the signing of the National Covenant in 1638. Here her work conforms to the broader tradition of the Scottish clerical novel – many Scottish clerical novels are set in seventeenth century Covenanting Scotland with figures such as Montrose, Argyll and Alexander Peden looming large. Martin Green suggests that scholars should be cautious in their association of Anna Buchan with Annie Swan noting that "Nicoll's [W. Robertson Nicoll] periodicals…published the "domestic fiction" with which Anna Buchan's was sometimes lumped together (such as Annie S. Swan's) which Anna and her brother regarded with implicit contempt."[198] As noted earlier Anna Buchan was close enough to Annie S. Swan to give a tribute to her at a Scottish P.E.N. event in Swan's honour. Thus, the objection to which Green refers is likely to the association with Nicoll and the Kailyarders than to Swan. This is also indicative of the issues scholars face in attempting to categorise works written by women in the categories defined by male critics and scholars. It seems that the Scottish female literary canon perhaps has its own set of categories distinct to those of the male literary canon.

In the 1900s two of the Scottish female writers whom Anna Buchan was inspired by and friends with wrote essays where they discussed the need to moderate the excesses of the works written by the male Kailyard and anti-Kailyard writers. These writers were Jane Findlater and Katharine Burrill. Both writers critically respond to the picture of Scotland

[197] Dickson, 'Annie S Swan and O Douglas: Legacies of the Kailyard', 340.
[198] Green, *A Biography of John Buchan and His Sister Anna*, 126.

given by the Kailyard and anti-Kailyard writers. Jane Findlater in *Stones from a Glass House* (1904) observes that "Thrums is indeed the antithesis of Barbie to an extent that falsifies the one picture of the other as we choose to accept them; they cannot both be true."[199] Thrums is the fictional village in J.M. Barrie's *Auld Licht Idylls* (1888) series which has commonly been included as one of the exemplar works in the Kailyard School. Barbie is the village in George Douglas Brown's 1901 novel *The House with the Green Shutters* which was written in response to the excessive sentimentality in the Kailyard works. Katharine Burrill takes Findlater's observation and attempts to suggest a way to reconcile the tension described by Findlater. She suggests in *Corner Stones* (1907) that "If you take a man from Barbie and another from Drumtochty, and shake them up together in a bag, you will get a compound fairly resembling the average Scotchman."[200] When Burrill mentions Drumtochty she refers to the village in Ian MacLaren's series which began with *Beside the Bonny Briar Bush* in 1894. Anna Buchan develops the suggestion of Findlater and Burrill in her Priorsford series and depicts an average Scottish village moderating the excesses of the Kailyard writers and Brown's anti-Kailyard response.

Anna Buchan's Readers

Having established the authors Anna Buchan read and associated with and where she belongs in the Scottish literary canon, it would also be helpful to establish who she was writing for. This section will begin by exploring who Anna Buchan identifies as her readers in her own writing both autobiographical and fictional. It will then go on to outline the scholarly debate on her readership.

In her autobiography, she mentions readers from places as disparate as Glasgow and India, both men and women. The main description of her readers is found in her reminiscences of the release of *The Setons*:

> It came out in November 1917, and almost immediately a stream of letters began to pour in from all sorts of people. The one I liked best was from a man in the trenches. He wrote: "I'm a Glasgow man myself and it's pure Balm of Gilead to me."

[199] Jane Helen Findlater and James Nisbet and Co, *Stones from a glass house.* (Edinburgh: National Library of Scotland, 2005), 104, http://digital.nls.uk/128693602.
[200] Katharine Burrill, *Corner Stones*, 119.

> Some wrote from distant parts of the Empire saying they could never hope to see the "blessed, beastly place" again, but now when the longing for it came over them, they could sit down with *The Setons* and smell the rain in the Glasgow streets."[201]

Anna Buchan also describes her mother's experience of reading her novels, as she imagines it:

> But if J. B.'s books were beyond her, mine delighted her heart. They were as pure and almost as sweet as home-made toffee, their pages unsullied by swear-words, and they were about happy comfortable people. Like Dr. John Brown's sister, she might have said, "They are very nice people—so like ourselves."[202]

Whilst in her autobiography, Anna Buchan largely describes her readers' experiences of reading her work, it is in her novel *Pink Sugar* that the best insight into her intended readership may be found. Merren Strang like her creator began writing novels about the people she knew – these novels are largely about nice gentle people living on the bright side of life. In other words novels like *Pink Sugar*. The novelist character, Merren Strang, sets out her manifesto for writing as:

> I thought of all the sad people, and the tired and anxious people, and the sick people. Have you ever had any one lie very ill in a nursing-home while you haunted lending libraries and bookshops for something that would help through sleepless nights for him? If you have, you will know how difficult it is to get the right kind of books.[203]

Strang's manifesto for writing might at least in part be read as Buchan's own. In other words, her readers were likely people looking for something gentle and happy to soothe their anxieties and ease their discomfort. However, her intended readership especially of her daughter-of-the-manse novels was likely wider than this. In these more autobiographical novels she writes a novel which deals with slightly darker issues compared with those she explored in *Pink Sugar.*

[201] Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*, 156.
[202] Ibid., 159.
[203] O. Douglas, 'Pink Sugar', in *People Like Ourselves*, 1st ed. (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1938), 467–68.

A survey of contemporary reviews of Anna Buchan's novels offers some helpful insights into who reviewers at the time thought would read her novels. A review of *Penny Plain* in an August 1920 edition of the *Times Literary Supplement* reveals who Anna Buchan's readers were not, from one reviewer's perspective. Anna Buchan's books were "not the kind of book that the Marxian kind of person would like. Nor does the author like the Marxian kind of person."[204] The reviewer goes on to praise the homeliness of *Penny Plain* and Anna Buchan's depiction of family love. This suggests that Anna Buchan's perceived intended readership were largely people who were socially conservative and not radical progressives. Meanwhile, an article in the *Times Literary Supplement* in April 1938 discussing the novels which explore the Scottish social scene comments that "At the same time the Cranford type of story in which O Douglas excels (Neil Munro attempted it less successfully in "The Daft Days") has endeared the social habits of the Scots to thousands of English readers."[205] These articles demonstrate the two major areas of debate when considering Anna Buchan's readers: the class and political persuasion of her readers and the geographic location of her readers.

John Attenborough, in his history of Hodder and Stoughton Publishers (the publisher Anna Buchan used), identifies her readers as he praises her work:

> His sister, 'Anna Buchan', who lived in the Buchan family home in Peebles, was less predictable, but she shared with her brother an innate story-telling skill born of a Scottish manse, which evoked from upper- and middle-class women readers the same loyalty that John Buchan won in the male world of sportsmen and schoolmasters.[206]

In terms of popularity, Attenborough notes that Anna Buchan was one of the 'big five' authors published by Hodder and Stoughton in the 1920s – the other four were her brother John Buchan, A. S. M. Hutchinson, A. E. W. Mason and Sapper (H. C. McNeil).[207] It is not clear

[204] H. O. Lee and H. O. Lee, 'Penny Plain', *The Times Literary Supplement*, 19 August 1920, Gale Primary Sources.
[205] Charles Langbridge Morgan et al., 'NOVELS ON THE SOCIAL SCENE', *The Times Literary Supplement*, 30 April 1938, The Times Literary Supplement Historical Archive.
[206] John Attenborough, *A Living Memory : Hodder and Stoughton Publishers, 1868-1975* (London : Hodder and Stoughton, 1975), 99.
[207] Ibid., 99.

what this meant in terms of readership numbers.[208] He goes on to suggest that these five authors automatically received top numbers in terms of pre-publication orders, "from the commercial lending libraries of W. H. Smith, Boots and Harrods— not to mention Douglas and Foulis in Edinburgh, Cornish in Birmingham and Argosy in Dublin."[209] Nicola Beauman in *A Very Great Profession* argues that the lending libraries listed by Attenborough are the ones which catered "more for suburban shoppers than for fashionable ladies."[210] She examines the work of middle-class writers in the years between the wars observing that:

> "The 'woman's novel' between the wars was usually written by middle-class women for middle-class women. Novelists wrote for women leading much the same kind of lives as themselves, the leisured who could perhaps still afford one or even two servants, who were beginning to enjoy the new labour-saving devices such as vacuum-cleaners and refrigerators, and who would still have been considered unusual if they tried to do any¬ thing 'for themselves'.[211]

It is this tradition which Debbie Sly in "Pink sugary pleasures: Reading the novels of O. Douglas" argues that Anna Buchan's novels belong. Anna Buchan's readers were the sort of readers described by Beauman. Attenborough and Sly suggest that Anna Buchan's readers were primarily middle-class British women. However, Martin Green discussing Anna Buchan's work in the 1920s and in particular *Penny Plain* suggests that at this point Anna Buchan had moved social circles and was at that time socialising with the country gentry. Green praises her skill in observing those she socialised with, noting regretfully that by the 1920s "she enjoyed these friendships, and probably feared to jeopardise then by any play of satire or bold wit."[212] This suggests that at least some of the gentry were likely to have read Anna Buchan's novels. Green goes on to note that "the drive to escape from a dull middle-class existence into the "daft" world of the aristocracy, is what animates O. Douglas's plots,

[208] I have been unable to access the ledgers for Hodder and Stoughton Publishers from the time when Anna Buchan was publishing her work. Anna Buchan's novels were republished by Thomas Nelsons (the publisher John Buchan served as director for) but the ledgers from the years Anna Buchan had her work published by them are missing from the Thomas Nelsons Archive held by the University of Edinburgh.
[209] Attenborough, *A Living Memory*, 101.
[210] Nicola Beauman, *A Very Great Profession : The Woman's Novel 1914-39* (London : Virago, 1983), 10–11.
[211] Ibid., 3.
[212] Green, *A Biography of John Buchan and His Sister Anna*, 160.

and those of many contemporary novelists."[213] This suggests that her readers were largely middle class people looking for an escape.

In terms of nationality of her readers, Martin Green argues that:

> O. Douglas had a large overseas public in the Empire, because of the migration of Scotsmen there. Her books made nostalgic reading for people from Glasgow or from the Border Country. It was said that in some parts of Canada John Buchan was identified as the brother of O. Douglas; and the present Lord Tweedsmuir says that his aunt's books sold very widely in Canada, and somewhat less in Australia.[214]

Whilst this was the case, Green goes on to note that, by the 1950s in England "her books seem to have vanished from the public library shelves, where they had long reigned, while the university libraries, which preserve dead authors, had never stocked her. (In Scotland, these generalizations do not apply for obvious reasons.)"[215] It can therefore be concluded that, in her own lifetime, Anna Buchan's work was highly popular throughout Britain, but not among the intellectual classes. His parenthetical comment is telling; it indicates that Anna Buchan's work retained popularity in Scotland and seems to have been better respected by the intellectual community there.[216] Green comparing John Buchan's output to Anna's describes how:

> In a 1941 list of Nelson reprints there are there are twenty of his titles, ten of hers, and other authors follow a long way behind. Her sales figures could not compete with his, but *Ann and Her Mother,* for instance, went through twenty two printings.[217]

Nelsons was the Edinburgh based publisher which John Buchan served as director of from 1909 to 1929. As a publisher they were known for publishing religious books and fiction by popular authors.

---

[213] Ibid., 161.
[214] Ibid., 206.
[215] Ibid., 233.
[216] The libraries of the Universities of Edinburgh and St Andrews alongside the National Library of Scotland hold the full collection of Anna Buchan's novels.
[217] Green, *A Biography of John Buchan and His Sister Anna*, 179.

Juliet Shields, in her chapter on Anna Buchan and Catherine Carswell, argues that in common with English middlebrow novelists of the 1920s and 1930s "Douglas's fiction is similarly invested in shaping the manners and mores of a formative Scottish middle class."[218] In the interwar years, such class boundaries were in flux. In terms of understanding Anna Buchan's readership the increasingly blurry lines between the upper middle classes and the aristocracy were significant. Nicola Humble, in *The Feminine Middlebrow Novel, 1920s to 1950s: class, domesticity, and bohemianism,* notes that:

> The Edwardian aristocracy had been severely weakened by the First World War…by the 1930s, with 'the upper class more or less relegated, like Red Indians, to reservations (mostly in Scotland)', public life, manners, and codes of conduct had passed largely into the hands of the middle classes.[219]

John Stevenson highlights this shift in terms of wealth noting:

> It has been estimated that as late as the 1880s half of the men leaving estates valued at over £500,000 were landowners, but that by the outbreak of the Great War their place was increasingly being overtaken by those who have made their money elsewhere."[220]

The places where the latter group made their money from included manufacturing, consumption industries (food and drink and tobacco) and commerce and finance. The Jackson family in Anna Buchan's Rutherfurd series is typical of these group of people – they made their money through commerce and bought Rutherfurd an estate in the country. It was these middle-class people who John Attenborough, Debbie Sly and Juliet Shields identify as Anna Buchan's readers; those on the boundary between upper-middle-class and the aristocracy, like herself and her family. These people were important as they were the people who shaped the values of society. They are important when considering the readership of Anna Buchan's novels as they were the people who were newly wealthy and working out what to do with their wealth. As will be argued in the "Women of the Manse at

[218] Juliet Shields, 'Scottish Modernism and Middlebrow Aesthetics', *Scottish Women's Writing in the Long Nineteenth Century: The Romance of Everyday Life* (Cambridge University Press, July 2021).
[219] Nicola Humble, *The Feminine Middlebrow Novel, 1920s to 1950s : Class, Domesticity, and Bohemianism* (Oxford ; New York : Oxford University Press, 2001), 61.
[220] John Stevenson, *British Society, 1914-45*, Reprint, The Pelican Social History of Britain (Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1986), 336.

Home" chapter Anna Buchan's novels were propaganda for the improvement of the lives of manse families. Her novels were at least partially directed at these people who had the money to make a difference.

Conclusion

Anna Buchan grew up surrounded by tales and books in a family who encouraged a breadth of reading. Her reading as a child was largely fairly typical of a Scottish child of her social class and time. Her father fostered an appreciation for the works of Scottish authors in his children. In Anna Buchan's teenage years, she developed a particular love for the works of William Shakespeare. These years were also the time when her brother, John Buchan, encouraged her to broaden her horizons and she went through a phase where she appreciated the decadence and aestheticism promoted by the *Yellow Book*. Elements of this phase would be influential in her depiction of her final daughter-of-the-manse character Eliza Laidlaw in *Eliza for Common* (1928). In her autobiography, she rarely mentions works she read as an adult, although she did continue to read a variety of authors, several of whom she knew personally. Several of the authors whose work she read and interacted with were significant in terms of the development of her own writing. Her brother John Buchan and others in her family were most influential. Outside of her family, the writers who were the most influential on Anna Buchan were the Findlater sisters and Katharine Burrill. Throughout her writing career, she corresponded with them and held similar views and values which permeated her writing.

Anna Buchan wrote two novels which can be considered clerical novels but with the caveat that the focus of each of them is the daughter-of-the-manse character and not the minister father. In general, it is difficult to define where exactly Anna Buchan's work fits with the traditionally accepted categories of works in the Scottish literary canon. As Anna Buchan's heroine character, Jean Jardine, in the Priorsford series says "I have thought of writing and trying to give a truthful picture of Scottish life— a cross between Drumtochty and The House with the Green Shutters". I argue that here Anna Buchan is describing her own literary manifesto. I believe that Anna Buchan's work, like that of the other female authors I

have mentioned, sits between categories. She moderates the excesses of the Kailyard and anti-Kailyard in all her works. In her daughter-of-the-manse novels, she writes a modified clerical novel focusing attention on the daughters-of-the-manse instead of their minister fathers.

Having contextualised the life and works of Anna Buchan, her fictional women of the manse can now be examined. In the following chapters, their activities in the parishes, experiences of worship and home life in the manse will be explored. The question of the categorisation of Anna Buchan's novels raised in this chapter is one which will be explored throughout the chapters that follow.

Chapter 3: Women of the Manse in the Parish

Introduction

Mrs Anna Lendrum (wife of Robert Alexander Lendrum of Kirkliston Free Church) describes the state of the work of women in an article in the January 1897 issue of *Youth*:

> To share in the work has always been open to women – as collectors, Sunday School teachers, missionary workers and district visitors…might there not be in every congregation a number of women who would perform some at least of the duties?[221]

This comment is in an article asking that more women in the Free Church (presumably young women) would come forward and take on elements of the work carried out by the Deaconesses in the established Church of Scotland. Writing over twenty after Lendrum's article was published, Anna Buchan in her three daughter-of-the-manse novels, *The Setons* (1917), *Ann and her Mother* (1922) and *Eliza for Common* (1928), depicts such women as Lendrum identifies. These novels were inspired by her experiences assisting her father in the parishes of Pathhead in Kirkcaldy and John Knox Free Church in the Gorbals area of Glasgow where she served as a collector, Sunday school teacher and district visitor.[222] In her autobiography she describes writing *The Setons* as "an attempt to reconstruct for her [her mother] our home-life in Glasgow" and "in *Ann and Her Mother* I wrote my mother's life."[223] In this chapter I will recover the attitudes of women of the manse towards the various activities they undertook in the parishes in support of their male minister relatives. I will also examine the relationships between the women of the manse and their parishioners.

Ministry of women of the manse

In Anna Buchan's *The Setons* (1917) the daughter-of-the-manse lead character Elizabeth Seton explains to her father that:

[221] Anna Lendrum, 'Deaconesses in the Free Church', *Youth*, January 1897.
[222] Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*, 69–73.
[223] Ibid., 155 & 177.

> I find myself becoming horribly minister's daughterish. I'm developing a 'hearty' manner, I smile and smile, and I have that craving for knowledge of the welfare of absent members of families that is so distinguishing a feature of the female clergy."[224]

It seems that Elizabeth has in her mind an archetype for a minister's daughter and is feeling that at that point in the novel she is living up to it though wishing she was not. Immediately prior to this scene in the novel the reader is introduced to Elizabeth at a party held by one of her father's parishioners and she is shown as taking an interest in those at the party and instinctively doing acts of kindness. Earlier in her conversation with her father Elizabeth describes with sympathy Jessie's (the daughter of the family hosting the party) embarrassment about having church people at the party. Elizabeth suggests that typical characteristics of a minister's daughter are smiling and desire for knowledge about the welfare of people. The idea of being minister's daughterish is developed further in *Eliza for Common* during a conversation between Eliza Laidlaw and Mary Neish at a party hosted by the Laidlaws. Eliza replies to an enquiry about whether she has "any special work" with a description of her work in the manse and church noting "I help in the house, and collect for the Central Fund and Zenana Mission and three or four other things, and I've got a Sunday school class".[225] When challenged by Mary Neish about whether she does anything for pleasure she comments "Ministers' daughters have souls above pleasure."[226]

Elizabeth's use of the term "female clergy" in the above quotation is significant when the date of publication of *The Setons* is taken into consideration. Less than ten years after the publication of this novel the United Free Church began debating the issue of the ordination of women. In 1926 Elizabeth Hewat graduated from New College, Edinburgh with a BD in Theology and at that time she felt called to serve as an ordained missionary in China.[227] However, women were not permitted to be ordained and the presbyteries of Edinburgh, Hamilton, Forres and Nairn, and Manchuria brought overtures before the 1925 General Assembly asking that ordination would be opened to women. At that point it was decided

[224] O. Douglas, *The Setons* (London: Thomas Nelson and Sons, Ltd, 1917), 42.
[225] Douglas, *Eliza For Common*, 48–49.
[226] Ibid., 49.
[227] Lesley Orr, 'HEWAT, Elizabeth Glendinning Kirkwood', in *The New Biographical Dictionary of Scottish Women*, ed. Elizabeth Ewan and Rose Pipes, 2nd ed. (Edinburgh University Press, 2017), 198.

not to open ordained ministry to women.[228] Manchuria was the presbytery in China in which Elizabeth Hewat intended on serving in. The matter resurfaced four years later in the United Free Church (Continuing) and the newly reunited Church of Scotland five years later. In 1930 the General Assembly of the United Free Church (Continuing) agreed to open ordination to the Eldership and Ministry of Word and Sacrament to women. Elizabeth Barr, the daughter of the Free Church's first Moderator, the Rev James Barr, was ordained to the United Free Church in Auchterarder in Perthshire in 1935.[229] In 1931 in the Church of Scotland Ishbel, Lady Aberdeen presented a petition signed by over 300 Scotswomen calling for the ordination of women as ministers, elders and deacons. This petition generated some discussion in the following years but it was not until 1966 that women were able to be ordained as Elders and 1968 that women were finally able to be ordained as Ministers of Word and Sacrament in the Church of Scotland. Therefore, Anna Buchan's use of the term "female clergy" could be seen to be a slightly prophetic turn of phrase given that these debates took place in the following years in the presbyterian churches in Scotland.

Alternatively, it could be an attempt to elevate the status of the work of women of the manse to a parallel complementary status to that of their minister menfolk. In *Ann and Her Mother* Anna Buchan describes Mrs Douglas commenting "I had absolutely no training for a minister's wife, but I went into it quite blithely."[230] This could be read as suggesting that the role of minister's wife is a role that would benefit from a parallel training to that of the minister's own training. Also, it suggests that the role of the minister's wife is a vocation in its own right. It is later revealed that Mrs Douglas was not being fully accurate in saying that she had no training. As she prepared for her marriage she was taken under the wing of Mrs Watts (the wife of Dr Watts, her family's minister) who arranged for her to go to cookery classes. Mrs Watts is described as an exemplary minister's wife and trainer of manse servants. Anna Buchan notes that "servants trained by her were eagerly sought after".[231]

---

[228] United Free Church of Scotland, 'Overtures Anent Eligibility of Women for Ordination', United Free Church of Scotland Proceedings and Debates of the General Assembly Held at Ednburgh, May-June, 1926 (Edinburgh: United Free Church of Scotland, 4 June 1926).

[229] Lesley Orr Macdonald, 'Barr, Elizabeth Brown (1905–1995), Minister of the United Free Church of Scotland', in *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography* (Oxford University Press, 2004), http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/10.1093/ref:odnb/9780198614128.001.0001/odnb-9780198614128-e-48834.

[230] Douglas, *Ann and Her Mother*, 32.

[231] Ibid., 39.

Women of the manse's responsibility as managers of the manse servants will be explored in greater detail in Chapter five. In terms of Mrs Watts as an exemplary minister's wife Mrs Douglas describes how "She kept everybody busy: visitors (the house was always full), village, the whole countryside, and there is no doubt that the state of being pleasantly busy is the best we can attain to in this world."[232]

The term "female clergy" is echoed in Willa Muir's 1936 novel *Mrs Grundy in Scotland* where she describes the minister's wife needing to justify herself by being an "unpaid Lay sister".[233] Douglas and Muir's similar yet different terms to define the role of the women of the manse in the life of the church give a revealing insight into their differing world views. Muir's term highlights the lack of pay given to the women of the manse for the vast amount of work they carry out in the parish in support of the minister father/husband. It also emphasises the fact that these women were not ordained to do the tasks they end up doing – where the male minister is. Meanwhile Douglas's term "female clergy" is a far more positive and status-elevating term. It recognises the work the women of the manse carry out as being a distinct female ministry complementing that of the minister. Her disinterest in indicating the lack of pay is likely a result of her views on voluntary philanthropic work. Buchan herself never sought pay for the philanthropic work she carried out and seems to hold fairly paternalistic views on philanthropy. She idolised the Victorian woman philanthropists Florence Nightingale, Sister Dora and Lady Burdett-Coutts. In an unpublished script for a lecture she once gave she describes how

> We have not perhaps got the great organising genius of a Florence Nightingale, the marvellous capacity of a Sister Dora or the boundless wealth to use for good of the Baroness Burdett Coutts but we can, in our small way do something for fellow creatures.[234]

Forrester suggests that in the time when Buchan came to adulthood it would have been socially acceptable for the daughter of a manse to seek paid employment in a range of

---

[232] Ibid.

[233] Willa Muir, *Mrs Grundy in Scotland*, Voice of Scotland Series (London: George Routledge and Sons, 1936), 62.

[234]Anna Buchan in her lecture manuscripts only gives them a title and does not note who she was speaking to, or when she wrote them. In this thesis I will refer to them as a script for a lecture in line with the National Library of Scotland catalogue entry. Anna Buchan, 'Women Philanthropists' (n.d.), 17–18, acc11627.117, NLS.

different fields – yet Buchan never did.[235] This was because her brother John gave her an allowance of £100 a year and continued to do so even when Anna was earning from her novels.[236] This is a distinction between Anna Buchan and Willa Muir. The latter worked for money most of her life. Perhaps Anna Buchan's term "female clergy" was an attempt to legitimise her life choices in an era where many of her contemporaries were seeking paid employment. The rest of this chapter will assess Anna Buchan's depictions of the work the women of the manse carried out in the parish. It will assess to what extent the novels represent an attempt to support or critique the idea of there being a specific ministry of the "female clergy".

Visitation

Of all the tasks carried out by Anna Buchan's fictional women of the manse in support of the minister, the one which seems to occupy most of their time is visitation. For the purposes of this section, 'visitation' refers to visiting members and parishioners in their own homes outside organised church events. In the same 1897 article Anna Lendrum complains "At present [1890s] we have very little systematic visiting except to collect money! Is not regular visiting too often left to a minister's wife, sisters, or daughters, instead of being spread over a large number of visitors!"[237] This section will examine how Anna Buchan portrays these visits, looking at their purposes, the reception of the women by those they visit and the impact of the visiting on the women of the manse.

Pastoral visits

Of the various reasons for visiting people, visiting the sick, dying and grieving is one which took up a lot of the time of Anna Buchan's women of the manse. It was also a way in which they both lightened the load of and assisted the minister in his ministry. One such visit is reflected on by Elizabeth Seton to Arthur Townshend (an English visitor) in *The Setons:*

[235] Forrester, *Anna Buchan and O. Douglas*, 18.
[236] Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*, 102.
[237] Lendrum, 'Deaconesses in the Free Church', 14.

> And there is another odd thing – the use of the word 'annoyed.' When I went to condole with a poor body whose son had been killed in an explosion, she said, 'Ay, I'm beginnin' to get over it now, but I was real annoyed at first.' It sounds so *inadequate.*[238]

The reported word choice of the parishioner and Elizabeth's response to it is significant in demonstrating their different attitudes towards death. The parishioner seems to have processed the death in a much more matter of fact way than Elizabeth expected. This might be reflective of class differences with regard to views on violence and death. Judy Giles argues in *Women, identity, and private life in Britain 1900-50* discusses that: - "Working-class tales of violence in which appalling accidents are recounted without apparent feeling or even with relish".[239] Elizabeth's description of the parishioner's comment reflects Giles's argument that working-class people tended to view accidents and deaths in a muted sort of way. Her resistance to the word "annoyed" establishes her as holding typically middle-class views on death in contrast to those of her father's parishioner.

Later in *The Setons,* Elizabeth takes Arthur with her to visit seventeen year old Peggy Donald, a parishioner who is dying, and her mother. Andrena Telford suggests that Peggy is "wasting away, presumably of consumption."[240] This is the visit which Anna Buchan describes in greatest detail in all her works. Through this encounter the reader can gain an insight into different approaches to death and dying – Anna reveals the views held by Elizabeth, Arthur and Mrs Donald. It is interesting that Elizabeth disapproves of Mrs Donald's approach to the impending death of Peggy. Elizabeth says of Peggy and Mr and Mrs Donald

> "She doesn't know she is dying, and they are not at all sure that they are doing the right thing in keeping it from her. They have a dreadful theory that she should be 'prepared.' Imagine a child being 'prepared' to go to her Father!"[241]

[238] Douglas, *The Setons*, 1917, 141.
[239] Judy Giles, *Women, Identity, and Private Life in Britain, 1900-50* (New York : St. Martin's Press, 1995), 43.
[240] Andrena Telford, 'Gone but Not Forgotten: O. Douglas and the Great War"', in *Hail to Priorsford* (Peebles: The John Buchan Story, 2021), 32.
[241] Douglas, *The Setons*, 1917, 168.

Mr and Mrs Donald's anxieties around preparing Peggy for death reflect those of "a mother with a loved sick child" as described by an unnamed "Minister's Wife" in an article entitled "Our Sunday Fireside. The Blessing of a Sick-bed" in the April 1896 edition of the *Life and Work* (the magazine of the Church of Scotland). The Minister's Wife describes how:

> If the sickness is "one unto death," what thoughts come crowding in upon her!...She begins to inquire how she has kept her sacred trust of motherhood. Has she trained her child for God? Has she been worthy of the honour God has bestowed upon her in making her a mother? Or has she forgot her mission and taught her loved one everything save how to die?[242]

It seems that while Mr and Mrs Donald have similar concerns to the Minister's Wife Elizabeth is less convinced about their concern to prepare Peggy for death. However, in her approach to interacting with Peggy Elizabeth does seem to in practice share the ideas espoused by the Minister's Wife in the *Life and Work* article. While she discusses happy things like new dresses and Etterick,[243] when Peggy asks Elizabeth to sing a song to her Elizabeth chooses to sing a selection of verses from "Jerusalem, my happy home" a song which describes heaven. When Mrs Donald questions Elizabeth about her choice of nice things to talk to Peggy about Elizabeth responds "it is only to help Peggy over the hard bits of the road."[244] Elizabeth goes on to justify her suggestion that Peggy might visit Etterick in the summer when she knows Peggy will die before the summer comes. She comments to Mrs Donald:

> "If Peggy is not here when summer comes, we may be quite sure that it doesn't vex her that she is not seeing Etterick. She" – her voice broke – "she will have far, far beyond anything we can show her – the King in His beauty and the land that is very far off."[245]

[242] A Minister's Wife, 'Our Sunday Fireside - The Blessing of a Sickbed', *Life and Work*, April 1896, 62.
[243] While it looks like a misspelling of Ettrick, the village in the Ettrick Valley with which James Hogg is associated, the description of the place in the novel makes it more likely that Anna Buchan had Broughton in mind. Broughton was the Borders village where Anna Buchan's mother grew up and her family stayed. The Buchan family regularly went there for holidays and in her autobiography Anna Buchan remembers it as a place of freedom.
[244] Douglas, *The Setons*, 1917, 172.
[245] Ibid.

The "land" Elizabeth mentions here is a reference to heaven or the New Jerusalem which she described to Peggy using the hymn mentioned earlier. In the hymn there is a comment that the New Jerusalem is a place of lavish pleasure so Elizabeth's description of pretty dresses and Etterick can in some ways be read as offering a glimpse of what it could look like to Peggy. Therefore, Elizabeth is subtly doing her part in preparing Peggy for life in heaven.

Elizabeth Seton and Arthur Townshend continue exploring the question of life after death in their post-visit conversation. Arthur challenges Elizabeth, asking if she really believes what she told Mrs Donald and Peggy. He asks:

> "Do you really believe all of that?"
>
> "All of what?"
>
> "Well about the next world. Are you as sure as you seem to be?"
>
> Elizabeth did not speak for a moment, then she nodded her head gravely.
>
> "Yes," she said, "I'm sure you can't live with Father and not be sure."

Anna Buchan's depiction of Elizabeth learning the faith from her father rather than her mother is striking. Lesley Orr Macdonald argues that in the nineteenth century "the mother had a special duty to instruct children in the precepts of religion".[246] In other words the handing down of the core beliefs of the faith was part of the women's sphere. Anna Buchan's depiction of Elizabeth learning the precepts of religion from her father is significant as it demonstrates the role of the minister father in teaching the faith to the manse household where in other households it would be the domain of the mother. Elizabeth's portrayal as being sure about "the next world" strengthens her characterisation as a dutiful daughter of the manse.

Elizabeth's confidence in her faith contrasts with Arthur's inquisitive questioning of her beliefs. Elizabeth's strength of faith is, as she goes on to explain, rooted in being "brought up on the Bible and the Shorter Catechism".[247] The Shorter Catechism is a teaching document which was written by the Westminster Assembly 1646-1647. It was designed with the purpose of teaching children the basics of the Reformed faith. Anna Buchan's use of the

[246] Macdonald, *A Unique and Glorious Mission*, 45.
[247] Douglas, *The Setons*, 1917, 174.

Shorter Catechism here as a source of Elizabeth's certainty about her faith contrasts with her brother John Buchan's creative use of the Shorter Catechism in 1912 as a title for a poem about wrestling with faith. Throughout the poem the narrating character who is a long serving elder in the church looking back over his life, expresses his doubts about the ability of men to live morally. In the poem John Buchan suggests that the character is "just like a' that e'er were born" so no different to any other.[248] This contrasts with the context of Anna Buchan's use of the Shorter Catechism. She mentions it in a comment about how ministers' children are different from other people. It is offered as an explanation for Elizabeth's certainty about her faith and her belief in the "next world". This contrast suggests that both Anna and John Buchan grappled with the Catechism but that for Anna it was important as a source for faith in the afterlife but for John it was more as source of inspiration for exploring moral doubts.

This visit is significant in terms of Anna Buchan's development of the idea of the ministry of women for several reasons. Firstly, for the fact that through this visit Anna Buchan reveals the depth of theological knowledge and understanding Elizabeth holds. Secondly it is significant for the depth of detail Anna Buchan provides about the flow and content of the visit. While sources including *Life and Work* articles do include reflections on pastoral visits from the perspective of women none provide as much detail about the minute details of such a visit. Even more significantly, Anna Buchan echoes the pattern of the visit in the closing chapters of the novel which portray Mr Seton's visit to his former parishioners, the Thomsons. While there are some differences between the two visits in terms of the state of the people being visited, the pattern is the same – a general discussion about the welfare of the family followed by a time of prayer that mostly consists of singing a hymn. In both the visits the prayer time is used to sing a hymn that reflects the concerns raised during the visit. Elizabeth uses the verses from "Jerusalem, my happy home" to help prepare Peggy for life after death and to comfort Mrs Donald. Mr Seton uses "The Lord's my Shepherd" to comfort the Thomson family as their son Robert prepares to go to serve as a soldier in the First World War. He chooses it as it is a comforting familiar balm to the Thomsons in uncertain and fearful times. The prayer and hymn singing time is what brings the visit to an

[248] John Buchan, 'The Shorter Catechism', in *The Moon Endureth: Tales and Fancies* (Edinburgh; London: William Blackwood and Sons, 1912), 84.

end. Therefore, it seems likely that Elizabeth learned the craft of a pastoral visit from her father.

In the closing chapters of *The Setons,* Anna Buchan describes visits conducted by Elizabeth Seton to bereaved war widows. These are set during the first few years of World War One and were written following the death of Anna Buchan's youngest brother Alasdair Buchan at Arras in 1916. In her description of Elizabeth Seton's visits on behalf of the Soldiers' and Sailors' Families Association to bereaved families the focus is on remembering the dead. The SSFA was a benevolent association which provided support to war widows and their families.[249] One of the major tasks of the SSFA was validating claims to the Patriotic Fund which was a fund set up by the Government to provide additional support to supplement the war widows' pension. Anna Buchan's depiction of this makes *The Setons* the one exception to Juliet Shields' conclusion that "the Great War – is always excluded from representation" in the work of Anna Buchan.[250] Anna Buchan holds a space for those families like her own who had lost loved ones on the battlefield in her depiction of Elizabeth's visits. Elizabeth is described as a welcome visitor because she gives the women the space to talk and to grieve the loss of their loved ones. In her observations she subtly critiques how quickly the names of battlefields became normal – how quickly life in wartime became normal.

Anna Buchan in general is quite uncritical of the work Elizabeth Seton does as a district visitor. Janis Lomas in her article '"Delicate Duties": Issues of Class and Respectability in Government Policy towards the Wives and Widows of British Soldiers in the Era of the Great War' argues that the SSFA and similar philanthropic associations demonstrated attitudes of suspicion and surveillance towards war widows.[251] The SSFA's organisational values were rooted in principles of self-help and a "dread of encouraging dependency and idleness."[252]In

[249] 'Methods and Work of the Soldiers' and Sailors' Families Association', *Charity Organisation Review* 38, no. 223 (1915): 6–20.
[250] Juliet Shields, *Scottish Women's Writing in the Long Nineteenth Century: The Romance of Everyday Life* (Cambridge, UNITED KINGDOM: University of Cambridge ESOL Examinations, 2021), 194, http://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/ed/detail.action?docID=6685013.
[251] Janis Lomas, '"Delicate Duties": Issues of Class and Respectability in Government Policy towards the Wives and Widows of British Soldiers in the Era of the Great War', *Women's History Review* 9, no. 1 (1 March 2000): 132.
[252] Ibid., 126.

contrast Anna Buchan portrays Elizabeth Seton's work as largely benevolent provision of pastoral care to bereaved mothers. She describes how:

> To mothers who lost their sons she was a welcome visitor. They never felt out of place, or an embarrassment, this tall golden-haired creature, as she sat on a wooden chair by the kitchen fire and listened and understood and cried with them.[253]

This very different description of the tone of a visit from a SSFA visitor may suggest a difference in treatment of bereaved mothers to widows. Alternatively, it may reflect Anna Buchan's uncritical depiction of her own experiences. In many respects her description of Elizabeth Seton's visits as a District Visitor for the SSFA have a similar tone to the descriptions of visits she conducted earlier in the novel to both raise money for the Foreign Missions and to provide pastoral care. There is one significant difference between Anna Buchan's portrayal of the pastoral visits carried out by Elizabeth in her father's church and the SSFA visits. In the former spiritual themes are raised during the visit whereas during the SSFA visits those she visits simply pour out their grief and memories of their lost sons.

Anna Buchan does not confine loss of life to the chapters of *The Setons* which depict life in wartime Scotland. In her other novels she also reflects on death and grieving. In *Ann and her Mother* Anna Buchan describes the transformative effect on Mrs Douglas of visiting a dying young woman in her early days as a wife of the manse.

> Well, I sighed for the South Country, and one day, when I was miserably moping over the fire, your father said to me: 'Come on, Nell, I'm going to visit a sick girl about your own age. She's always asking me questions about you, and I said you would go and see her.' "I didn't want to go, for I was shy of sick people—the being ill in bed seemed to put them such a distance away—but I put on my best clothes to make a good impression, and went. … "I went home crying bitterly for the girl who was dying in the May morning of her days. I don't think I moped any more."[254]

The transformative effect of this visit echoes what an unnamed minister's wife wrote in the *Life and Work* in April 1938 about "the blessing of the sick-bed". She concludes her article suggesting "Would that we women could get all our sickness sanctified! Let us be careful not

[253] Douglas, *The Setons*, 1917, 261.
[254] Douglas, *Ann and Her Mother*, 51–52.

to miss the blessing it is meant to bring, and never doubt that it is a real gift from God."[255] This blessing is rooted in the idea that "sickness comes by God's permission".[256] This article written by an unnamed minister's wife discussing their experiences providing pastoral care in the parish alongside their male minister husband describes similar experiences and attitudes to those found in Anna Buchan's novels. In the encounter above, the young Mrs Douglas was blessed by her experience of sitting at the sickbed of a girl who is of a similar age to her. It transformed her understanding of religion and gave her a real sense of the purpose of her role as minister's wife.

Meanwhile, Anna Buchan's depiction of Eliza Laidlaw's final pastoral visit to a member of Martyrs church is not regarded by her as such a blessing. Her final visit is to Phemie Brown, a young girl who is of a similar age to her., whom her father suggests that she visits to offer comfort. While for Mrs Douglas visiting the dying girl was a blessing, visiting Phemie Brown for Eliza is a tragedy. Anna Buchan in *Eliza for Common* uses this pastoral visit as a transitional scene in a similar yet contrasting way to how she used the visit in *Ann and Her Mother*. For Mrs Douglas the visit marked a transition into her role as wife of the manse – from that point on she got to grips with the tasks expected of her. In contrast for Eliza this visit marked the end of her life as a live-at-home daughter of the manse with all the duties that it entailed. Anna Buchan describes this transition as an emotional one:

> With a lump in her throat Eliza caught the gloved hands and bent and kissed the little drawn face. "Phemie," she said – "oh, Phemie…" then walked quickly out of the room and out of the house.[257]

The very next sentence has Eliza leaving Glasgow not to return to her life at home. This visit seems to be more of a narrative device signalling the end of an old way of life and the beginning of a new life for Eliza than a depiction of an average pastoral encounter between a woman of the manse and a parishioner. It is interesting though that Anna Buchan has young women of the manse conduct the visits to the young women of the parish. The repeated use of this trope in all the daughter-of-the-manse novels may be primarily an artistic choice as in her autobiography she describes visiting a wide variety of parishioners

[255] A Minister's Wife, 'Our Sunday Fireside - The Blessing of a Sickbed', 63.
[256] Ibid., 61.
[257] Douglas, *Eliza For Common*, 272.

from old men and women to young families. Anna Buchan's extensive description of women of the manse conducting pastoral visiting is also a reflection of the historical norms of the time. As early as 1884 Archibald Charteris, Convenor of the Life and Work Committee of the Church of Scotland, observed "The District visiting – hardest, most trying, but the most effective of all mission agencies – is as a rule entirely done by the minister and his 'lady visitors'."[258] Charteris wrote this as a plea to the menfolk in the congregations to step up and undertake this task. Although this is evidence from the Church of Scotland Lesley Orr Macdonald suggests that this can be applied cross-denominationally.[259] Given trends in the work of women in the church it is likely that by the time *Eliza for Common* is set this is still the case. It is also likely that the 'lady visitors' to whom Charteris refers included the women of the manse given their extensive involvement in parish activities.

Tract Distribution

A more mundane reason for women of the manse to visit parishioners on a regular basis was the distribution of tracts – that is, leaflets which explain various aspects of the faith. A key example of a woman of the manse carrying out that task in Anna Buchan's novels is Elizabeth Seton in *The Setons*. In the gap between two of the services on a Sunday Elizabeth is depicted as going out to deliver tracts to her closes. These tracts are likely the sort of leaflets which give information about doctrines of faith published by the Drummonds under the guise of the *Stirling Tract Enterprise.* The *Stirling Tract Enterprise* published three different sorts of tracts: some written by Peter Drummond on typical evangelical themes including sabbath observance, temperance, and justification by faith, some compiled by Drummond on a specific theme and ones written by other authors.[260] Drummond like Anna Buchan's father was active in the Free Church Sabbatarian movement. Elizabeth takes Arthur Townshend with her. Over the course of this episode Eliabeth's anxieties about this task are revealed. Firstly, it is revealed that she struggles with coming up with an appropriate greeting when handing over the tract. Initially, she took her father's prayers for the "silent messengers" to mean the "tract distributors" but as she gained confidence she

[258] Archibald Hamilton Charteris, 'Women's Work: And Its Possible Organisation. A Woman's Guild.', *Life and Work A Parish Magazine*, March 1884, 33.
[259] Macdonald, *A Unique and Glorious Mission*, 59.
[260] Michael J. Cormack, *The Stirling Tract Enterprise and the Drummonds*, Occasional Publications (University of Stirling. Bibliographical Society) 3 (Stirling: University of Stirling Bibliographical Society, 1984), 15.

"plucked up courage now to venture a few remarks, but they generally fall upon stony ground."[261] The reference to "stony ground" is a reference to the parable of the Sower found in Matthew Chapter 13 and refers to those who receive the message with joy but when trouble comes they fall away. Therefore, Elizabeth is suggesting that most of the recipients of the tracts are grateful on the surface but ultimately she fears that her words will not have the intended impact. The second source of anxiety for Elizabeth is how her visit is received by her father's parishioners. Their responses often contrasted:

> You see, Mrs. Conolly is a nice woman and Mrs. O'Rafferty is the reverse. Mrs. Conolly takes the tract and thanks me kindly; Mrs. O'Rafferty, always gruff, told me on my last visit that if I knocked again at her door she would come at me with a fender. So you see it is rather a problem.[262]

Here it is revealed that Elizabeth is sometimes threatened with violence when she attempts to deliver tracts. This highlights how dangerous some of the work Elizabeth carried out on behalf of her minister father actually was.

In terms of generational shifts it seems that men and women of the younger generation by the time Anna Buchan was writing *The Setons* may have been largely sceptical of the good the tracts actually did. Elizabeth like Townshend, is depicted as being sceptical about the efficacy of the tracts she distributes commenting "I expect the men light their pipes with them, but that isn't any business of mine. My job is to give out the tracts and leave the results in Higher Hands, as Father would say."[263] In comparison, the older generation represented by Mr Seton may have had more faith that these tracts actually made a difference in some people's lives. Although even Mr Seton's real life counterparts expressed doubts similar to Elizabeth's about the good the tracts actually did. Michael J. Cormack notes that an article in the *Stirling Journal* in November 1861 began "with some fairly harsh criticisms of the Enterprise's [Stirling Tract Enterprise] work. "We question altogether the likelihood of tracts distributed wholesale doing much good. Everybody knows the base uses to which as a rule paper so easily come by is put".[264] Here generational differences are

[261] Douglas, *The Setons*, 1917, 139.
[262] Ibid., 140.
[263] Ibid., 141.
[264] Cormack, *The Stirling Tract Enterprise and the Drummonds*, 18.

clearly depicted. Elizabeth of all Anna Buchan's daughters of the manse is the one most dedicated to supporting her minister father in the work in the church. Yet here she is sceptical of the good of the task of tract distribution. A general theme of the novel is that Elizabeth does all the tasks well but is slightly sceptical of their outcome – this is largely revealed in conversations where she expresses her scepticism and reluctance about the various tasks. Alternatively, her response could be read to be reflecting ideas believed by people involved in tract distribution. The entire scene reflects the situation described by Aileen Fyfe in her history of the Religious Tract Society. By the 1890s, the Religious Tract Society's income was in decline and what was sustaining it was the sale of magazines and books.[265] The tracts were no longer profitable or popular. This scene is significant in that it demonstrates that even the women-of-the-manse distributors seem to have become sceptical of their benefits by the turn of the twentieth century.

Visiting Band of Hope/Sabbath School Families

It was not just visiting the sick and dying that had a transformative effect on the women of the manse's self-understanding in the work of Anna Buchan. A visit to the family of one of the Sabbath school scholars who missed a lesson in *Eliza for Common* (1928) gave the titular daughter-of-the-manse Eliza Laidlaw a renewed sense of purpose in her role as a Sabbath School teacher. Eliza, while visiting one of her Sabbath school scholars named Jessie, and her grandmother Mrs Calder came to realise that her teaching was appreciated by at least some of her scholars. The other visit (to the Henry family) she carried out in that trip was not so edifying and did more to confirm her prejudices and suspicions about her scholars and their families.

It does seem that Eliza's attitudes toward the families of her father's parish are rooted in class prejudice typical of the time. They are also a reflection of her aesthetic preferences. This novel, although written in the late 1920s and published in 1928 is perhaps the one novel where the influence of Anna Buchan's "Yellow Book phase" comes through most strongly in her writing. Eliza's view of the world is told through the lens of aesthetic beauty.

[265] Aileen Fyfe, 'A Short History of the Religious Tract Society', in *From The Dairyman's Daughter to Worrals of the WAAF: The Religious Tract Society, Lutterworth Press and Children's Literature*, ed. Dennis Butts, Pat Garrett, and Children's Books History Society (Cambridge: Lutterworth Press, 2006), 12–35.

Reflecting on her day visiting her Sabbath scholars' families she comments "I was trying to forget the smell of Mrs Henry's kitchen. I'm sick of everything. Life in Glasgow is about as ugly and drab as – as that gasometer."[266] This view of an impoverished working class neighbourhood is typical of views of those whom Diana Maltz identifies as "Missionary Aesthetes".[267] Key figures in this group were the social reformer Octavia Hill, the art critic John Ruskin and the poet Matthew Arnold. Missionary aesthetes in Britain held the view that the lives of poor working class people could be improved through educating them in art and giving them access to the arts. A major campaign associated with this group was the Sunday opening of museums and art galleries. Maltz identifies the movement as "an ethos, and ultimately a discourse, through which late Victorians attempted to articulate their ambition for social reform, their belief in duty, their compassion for the impoverished, their revulsion at squalor, and their faith in the beautiful".[268] Eliza is largely revolted by squalor and in general lacks compassion for the impoverished.

Anna Buchan's depiction of Eliza's dissatisfaction with the drabness of life in the Gorbals reveals that while Eliza embraced the aesthetic culture she did nothing to promote it amongst her Sabbath scholars or their families. The extent to which Eliza attempted to help the Henry family is by complaining to her father "One of my class girls was there to-night: she told me she had got a second baptism! This afternoon I was at her house, such a house as I never imagined… Can nothing be done?"[269] After handing over the problem to her father the Henry family are not mentioned again in the novel. This lack of interest in improving the lives of the working classes may be a result of Anna Buchan largely writing for middle class readers who read as an escape and attempting as Juliet Shields argues to foster an appreciation for the "aesthetics of the ordinary" which "offers a middle way between deprivation and excess, austerity and frivolity"[270]. This middle way would be achievable by

[266] Douglas, *Eliza For Common*, 74.
[267] Diana Maltz, *British Aestheticism and the Urban Working Classes, 1870-1900: Beauty for the People*, Palgrave Studies in Nineteenth-Century Writing and Culture (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2006), 2.
[268] Ibid., 217.
[269] Douglas, *Eliza For Common*, 73.
[270] Shields, *Scottish Women's Writing in the Long Nineteenth Century*, 169.

the middle class readers including women of the manse like Rebecca Brand and Eliza Laidlaw though probably not by working class women women like Mrs Henry.[271]

The idea of improving people's lives by teaching them to appreciate art is portrayed by Anna Buchan in many of her novels. However, as Juliet Shields argues these efforts were focussed on improving the lives of middle-class characters. In this respect Anna Buchan's characters are unlike the missionary aesthetes who were focussed on improving the lives of working-class people. Many of Anna Buchan's characters are focused on improving the lives of upper middle-class people. In both *Eliza for Common* and *Pink Sugar* wealthy and creative types are depicted as trying to improve the lives of women of the manse through enabling them to appreciate art and beauty. One of Mary's Neish's first questions upon meeting Eliza is "And where does pleasure come in?"[272] She follows Eliza's negative reply with an invitation to come to tea in her studio which Eliza fell in love with. The women of the manse receive this in contrasting ways: Eliza laps up the encouragement of Mary Neish and comes to appreciate beauty and art while Rebecca Brand (sister of the minister of Muirburn) resists Kirsty Gilmore's (the protagonist of *Pink Sugar*) attempts to get her to appreciate art and nice things – at least initially.

Rebecca Brand in many ways represents the typical Scottish Presbyterian woman of the manse attempting to make ends meet on limited means. In her depiction of Rebecca Brand's explanation to Kirsty Gilmore about how she feels about Kirsty's interventions Anna Buchan reveals the uncertain social and financial status of manse families. Many manse families while socialising with upper middle-class people largely did so on far less income – stipends of the time generally were not in step with professional wages.[273] This is definitely the case with the Brands in Muirhouse – the siblings live off an income which is so small that they cannot afford a servant. Meanwhile the Laidlaws in the Gorbals as a family of five are able to live off Mr Laidlaw's stipend with funds for extras and a servant. This reflects the historical reality where ministers received different amounts of stipend depending on the

[271] The economic circumstances of women of the manse in the work of Anna Buchan will be examined in greater depth in the Women of the Manse at Home chapter later in this thesis.
[272] Douglas, *Eliza For Common*, 49.
[273] In 1919 the targets for minimum stipend were £240 plus a manse. John W. Sawkins and Em Bailey, 'Ministerial Stipend Cross Subsidy in the United Free Church of Scotland', *Scottish Church History* 50, no. 1 (1 April 2021): 1–27.; In comparison Pember Reves notes that in 1914 the average rage of middle class salary was between £500 and £2000. Mrs Pember Reeves, *Round about a Pound a Week* (London : G. Bell, 1913).

parish in which they were minister.[274] In describing the contrasting fortunes of the Laidlaws and the Brands Anna Buchan offers her middle-class readers an insight into the financial issues faced by manse families.[275] This may be an attempt to write subtle propaganda encouraging congregations to provide more adequate stipends for their ministers revealing the disparity of income between parishes.[276] Anna Buchan wants women of the manse to be like Eliza Laidlaw – able to afford to indulge in the aesthetic culture promoted by the likes of Mary Neish.

The views generally espoused by Eliza Laidlaw and her minister father Walter seem to suggest that Anna Buchan may be reflecting on the legacy of the thinking of social reformers like Octavia Hill (1838-1912), a pioneering thinker who emphasised the importance of teaching poor people temperance and cleanliness and to desire beauty. Hill in her 1875 essay *Homes of the London Poor* suggests:

> I think no one who has not experienced it can fully realize the almost awed sense of joy with which one enters upon such a possession as that above described, conscious of having the power to set it, even partially, in order. Hopes, indeed, there are which one dare scarcely hope; but at once one has power to say, 'Break out a window there in that dark comer; let God's light and air in;' or, ''Trap that foul drain, and shut the poisonous miasma out;" and one has moral power to say, by deeds which speak louder than words, " Where God gives me authority, this, which you in your own hearts know to be wrong, shall not go on."[277]

Victoria Kelly discusses in *Soap and Water: Cleanliness, Dirt and the Working Classes in Victorian and Edwardian Britain* how in the writings of late nineteenth and early twentieth century social thinkers, including Hill, mentions of cleanliness and filth carried with them moral judgements about the person's character. She cautions:

[274] John W. Sawkins, 'Ministerial Stipends in the Free Church of Scotland: Edinburgh 1843–1900', *Scottish Church History* 41, no. 1 (1 June 2012): tbl. 7, https://doi.org/10.3366/sch.2012.41.1.5.
[275] The management of household finances by women of the manse is explored in greater depth in the Women of the Manse at Home chapter.
[276] The impact of low ministers' stipends on women of the manse will be examined in the Women of the Manse at Home chapter.
[277] Octavia Hill, *Homes of the London Poor* (Macmillan, 1875), 17.

> In understanding notions of cleanliness and dirt in late Victorian and Edwardian Britain, it is necessary to also understand that even the simplest and most straightforward citation often carried with it not just a judgement about domestic propriety, but also an additional moral sense of purity and filth.[278]

These warnings also should be taken into consideration when reading the comments of the members of the manse family in Anna Buchan's novels. While the language used had shifted slightly by the early 1900s when Anna Buchan was writing, the principles seem to have remained the same. For middle-class people who were interested in social reform consistently connected the state of a person's living environment with their spiritual status and vice versa. Mr Laidlaw comments:

> If you put your friend Mrs. Henry into one of those clean new houses she'd probably have it a pig-sty in a week. On the other hand, a decent, God-fearing woman can, in the worst slum, make her house shine like a good deed in a naughty world.[279]

It does seem though that Mr Laidlaw places a higher importance on the religious standing of the poor person in question than social reformers more generally did. Similarly, Elizabeth Seton in *The Setons* comments "I've no use for people's religion if it doesn't make them keep a clean house."[280] It is significant that both Mr Laidlaw and Elizabeth Seton go further and are more explicit in making the connection between cleanliness and morality. It indicates that for ministers and members of the manse family there was a direct connection between cleanliness and religious status. For both Mr Seton and Elizabeth right belief should lead to a clean home.

Collecting for Missionary causes

One of the major reasons why Anna Buchan's women of the manse visited the people of the parish in their homes was to collect for the various missionary activities of the church. These missionary activities included the Zenana Mission, the Central Mission Fund and the

[278] Victoria Kelley, *Soap and Water: Cleanliness, Dirt and the Working Classes in Victorian and Edwardian Britain / Victoria Kelley.* (London: I B Taurus, 2010), 38.
[279] Douglas, *Eliza For Common*, 75.
[280] Douglas, *The Setons*, 1917, 74.

Women's Foreign Mission fund. The first of these – the Zenana Mission – was the Free Church/United Free Church's flagship women's foreign mission project.[281] It was the main missionary project carried out by that church in India. The focus of the mission was Indian women who lived in the Zenanas which were spaces where male missionaries were not permitted to enter.

The contrast of tone between Anna Buchan's reminiscences about collecting for the Zenana Missions and Anna Buchan's depiction of the women of the manse's feelings about collecting for mission is interesting. In her autobiography her reminiscences are generally positive. She remembers that to "visit their homes…collecting for Zenana Missions, was always a pleasure".[282] Meanwhile Anna Buchan's fictional women of the manse are not as positive about collecting for missionary activity. Generally, they are described as going out visiting to collect for mission reluctantly and feeling guilty about imposing on people to ask the poor parishioners to give some of what little money they had to missionary causes. The contrast in tone may reflect a shift in attitudes towards this sort of visit from the time when Anna Buchan was doing the collecting in the pre-war Gorbals parish to the interwar years when Anna Buchan was writing her novels. Her interwar readers may have resonated more with the discomfort depicted in her novels.

Fundraising

As noted earlier in this chapter fundraising was a major task carried out by the daughter-of-the-manse characters. In both *The Setons* and *Eliza for Common* Anna Buchan depicts the women of the manse as being the lead organisers of all the fundraising activities carried out in the church. When taken together, these two novels depict most of the major ways in which women of the time raised money for the activities of the church. Martin Green argues that:

> Foreign Missions were an important part of Free Kirk evangelism, and especially important in marking the difference between the more fervent members and lukewarm people like Anna Buchan – to judge by the latter's novels. Foreign

[281] Macdonald, *A Unique and Glorious Mission*, 118.
[282] Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*, 70.

> Missions and their collections are the dreariest of obligations to her heroines, and seem the most outdated, though in fact the movement was young and still growing through the first half of Anna's life.[283]

This section will explore the extent to which Green is right to deem the collections the "dreariest obligations" to Anna Buchan's women of the manse and how far it is reasonable to correlate Anna Buchan's heroines views as being the same as those of Anna Buchan herself. It will begin by exploring what these different fundraising methods were and the views the characters had towards these methods. It will assess how far this reflected the activities and views of women of the time.

Doorstep visits

The 1915 Report to the General Assembly of the United Free Church on "The Place of Women in the Church's Life and Work" notes that "the task of collecting is almost left entirely in their [church women's] hands"[284]. Contrastingly, ten years later Lucy Webster in the February 1925 *Record of the Home & Foreign Mission Work of the United Free Church of Scotland* discusses "The Trials and Joys of a Collector" noting the reluctance of people to "take a district."[285] This section will examine Anna Buchan's depiction of the task of doorstep collecting. It will also assess the extent to which her novels reflect the shifting attitudes towards collecting demonstrated by the above report and article.

It is interesting that Anna Buchan should depict the fundraising for foreign missionary activities of the church as a taking place in one of the more impoverished parishes in Scotland. These are people she also describes as needing to be recipients of home missionary or philanthropic activity. In her novels she wrestles with this conflict. It is interesting that she tends to depict the poor people in the parish as willing donors to missionary causes. This is especially true of Mrs Veitch in *The Setons* (1917):

---

[283] Green, *A Biography of John Buchan and His Sister Anna*, 99.
[284] United Free Church of Scotland General Assembly, 'Report of the Committee on the Recognition of the Place of Women in the Church's Life and Work', *Reports to the General Assembly of the United Free Church of Scotland.*, Reports to the General Assembly of the United Free Church of Scotland. (Edinburgh: United Free Church of Scotland, 1915), 3.
[285] Lucy Webster, 'The Trials and Joys of a Collector', *The Record of the Home and Foreign Mission Work of the United Free Church of Scotland.*, February 1925.

"It's the Zenana Mission. I called to see if you cared to give this year?"…

"What for wud I no' give?" she asked, and her tone was almost defiant.

"Oh," said Elizabeth, looking rather frightened, "you're like Father, Mrs. Veitch. Father thinks it's a privilege to be allowed to give."

"Ay, an' he's right. There's juist Kate and me, and it's no' verra easy for twae weemen to keep a roof ower their heads, but we'll never be the puirer for the mite we gie to the Lord's treasury. Is't a shillin'?"[286]

Mrs Veitch demonstrates great pride in being able to give from her limited funds to the missionary work of the church. Her language here echoes the story in the Gospel of Mark 12:41-44 of the widow's mite. Douglas's depiction of her interpretation of this passage reflects G. A. Chadwick's interpretation in his 1899 commentary on the Gospel of Mark where he suggests that "the Lord had converted her [the widow in the Markan passage] two mites into a perennial wealth of contentment for lowly hearts"[287] For Mrs Veitch her small contribution to the Zenana Mission fund gave her great contentment. Meanwhile, Elizabeth is uncomfortable with asking Mrs Veitch on account of her poverty. It is unclear whether Douglas intended this interaction to be an attempt to justify this form of fundraising to her readers (i.e. it is acceptable to ask poor people to give because the poor want to give as giving gives them a sense of pride) or whether she intended this interaction to be a critique of this form of giving (i.e. her sympathies lie with Elizabeth the collector who is uncomfortable about asking). Anna Buchan in her autobiography writes positively about this sort of giving so it may be more likely to be the former but in her autobiography it is possible that Buchan is sugar-coating her experiences and her actual views and those of her readers lie closer to Elizabeth Seton's.

It is the members of the manse family who are doing the collecting who are depicted as uncomfortable with collections from people. Eliza comments to her elder brother Jim when discussing whether their parents are unhappy that he did not follow his father's footsteps into the ministry "I'm sure she finds Martyrs [their church] a pretty hard struggle. If it were

[286] Douglas, *The Setons*, 1917, 62.
[287] G. A. Chadwick, *The Gospel According to St. Mark by G.A. Chadwick.*, Seventh edition., The Expositor's Bible (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1899), 344.

only the preaching and visiting, but there is the constant intimating of collections (poor Father does so hate to ask for money!)".[288] It is not clear whether these collections were for foreign mission or local church funds. Later, Jim affirms his sister and father's discomfort with pressure of fundraising in the church commenting "what a huckstering God yours is! You talk as if you could square the Almighty with a fiver."[289] This is in response to his mother's pestering about tithing his income to his father's church. It is possibly reflective of a contrast in attitudes between the mother, whose life is largely spent managing the funds of both the family and the fundraising in the parish, and the son who is striking his own way in the world at university in Oxford and as a writer. In general in the novel it is only Mrs Laidlaw and her social circle who are comfortable with the fundraising activities they carry out. For women of the manse of her generation in Anna Buchan's novels, the success of the church could be measured in the level of giving in the congregation. Mrs Douglas in *Ann and Her Mother* comments "How easy the church work was that winter! The Wednesday prayer-meeting overflowing from the hall into the church, money forthcoming for everything – you may know conversion is real when it touches the pocket."[290] This comment comes in the context of a description of a revival which happened during the Douglas family's time in Kirkcaple. Mrs Douglas's views on the relationship between religiosity and financial giving contrast with the younger generation exemplified by Jim and Eliza. Eliza as the daughter of the manse like her brother has no intention of following in her parent's footsteps and generally holds different social views to those of her mother. It is perhaps the case that Eliza's rejection of the older generation's focus on this task may have resonated with Anna Buchan's younger readers. Even by 1906 women were beginning to resent being relied on to fundraise to "meet congregational expenses which should be defrayed by the Kirk Session or the Managers."[291] There may have been a generational shift in thinking around the relationship between having faith and financial giving to church causes. For the older generation coming to faith is demonstrated by financial giving while the younger generation rejects the connection. In any case Elizabeth and Eliza are certainly depicted as being far less enthusiastic about collecting for the missionary activities of the church than Mrs Laidlaw.

[288] Douglas, *Eliza For Common*, 94.
[289] Ibid., 130.
[290] Douglas, *Ann and Her Mother*, 119.
[291] Anonymous, 'Parish Grievances', *Woman's Guild Life and Work*, August 1906.

Sales of Work and Bazaars

Meanwhile Anna Buchan also describes other forms of fundraising for foreign missionary activities. One of the most successful which she describes in her novels is the "Sale of Work" or jumble sale. Sales of Work were events held by churches where people would set up stalls and sell various handicrafts to raise funds for church work. This is depicted as a major task masterminded by the women of the manse. Anna Buchan's description of Mrs Douglas's first attempt at organising a jumble sale in Kirkcaple (the first parish where she was wife of the manse) in *Ann and Her Mother* reveal Mrs Douglas's then inexperience at the task. It is portrayed as not terribly well organised. Mrs Douglas reminisces:

> It was the first one we ever had, and you know the sort of madness that seizes you when you see people eager to buy. I rushed home and looked out everything we could do without – my wedding slippers among the lot. … The sale was for Women's Foreign Missions, and when at the end of the most strenuous evening any of us had ever spent the treasurer and I lugged our takings home in a cab, her husband met us at the door, and, lifting the heavy bag, said, "I doubt it's Alexander the coppersmith." But it wasn't; it was fully £100.[292]
>
> Dear, dear the excitements of a ministerial life![293]

It is interesting that despite the inexperience the sale is depicted as a major success when Anna Buchan describes Mrs Douglas's first attempts at other typical tasks of minister's wives as not so successful. This may be a reflection on Helen Buchan's giftings towards fundraising as Wendy Forrester argues in *Ann and Her Mother* "The fictional Ann is writing a biography of her mother, just as the real Anna is writing – more or less – a biography of hers."[294] In Anna Buchan's autobiography Helen Buchan is described as the practical one with a head for finance in comparison with her dreamer minister husband. It is also an interesting feature of this sale that the treasurer is depicted as another woman in the congregation. The fact that

[292] £100 in 1875 (roughly the year in which this sale is depicted as happening) is the equivalent to £12,294.64 in 2022. https://www.in2013dollars.com/uk/inflation/1875?amount=100
[293] Douglas, *Ann and Her Mother*, 33.
[294] Forrester, *Anna Buchan and O. Douglas*, 60.

it was the minister's wife supported by other women in roles including treasurer as the lead organisers reflects just how dominated by women these sales were.

In *The Setons,* Anna Buchan's only mention of a bazaar occurs in a conversation between Elizabeth Seton and Christina Christie (both daughters of the manse). It is an attempt to turn the conversation to something more serious after a joking conversation about getting old.

> Elizabeth laughed, and by way of turning the conversation asked Christina's advice as to what would sell best at coming bazaars. At all bazaar work Christina was an expert, and she had so many valuable hints to give that long before she had come to an end of them Elizabeth was hauled away to play "Yellow Dog Dingo"[295]

This is significant as it reveals that there was a collegiality between women of the manse running bazaars and sales of work. Christina as a more experienced organiser of bazaars shares her knowledge with the younger Elizabeth. The collegiality of women of the manse will be explored in greater detail in the women of the manse at home chapter.

A contrasting depiction of a sale is found in *Eliza for Common* where Eliza and her mother organise a sale of work. In the novel it is traditionally Mrs Laidlaw (the mother of the manse) who would have done most of the organising of it. However, in the run up to the sale of work she falls ill and a lot of the task of organising falls to Eliza. It is at this point she realises just how much work her mother did. One of the major discussions about the sale of work in the novel is a discussion about the organising of a speaker to open the sale. After an attempt to ask Mr Laidlaw to find someone when he was in Edinburgh fails, the task of asking the person falls to Eliza as she suggests an acquaintance of hers. Eliza finds this task a great responsibility. In the end she asks a friend Mrs Neish (an artist friend) to ask Mrs Ralston (the wife of a Professor). The fact that she gets a woman to open the Sale perhaps is indicative of the time when *Eliza for Common* is set. By the 1920s it perhaps was becoming more common to have a woman open a Sale of Work – at least smaller scale ones in less prestigious places. This portrayal of Eliza is interesting given when Douglas wrote this novel – she wrote this novel later in life after she had carried out the task of opening many sales of work successfully as a speaker. Anna Buchan was in high demand as a speaker to open sales of work by that point in her life. She would often take her mother along with her as

[295] Douglas, *The Setons*, 1917, 80.

her mother (being a former wife of the manse and organiser of sales of work) enjoyed these occasions greatly. Sales of work were one of the events which seem to have occupied much of the time and energy of women in the early twentieth century and beyond.[296] The contrast between Eliza and her mother is striking here – where Eliza does the required things to make the Sale happen it seems it is her mother's vocation to organise Sales of Work. Eliza in the midst of the preparations grumbles to Mrs Neish "Oh, this awful Sale!" Eliza groaned. "Mother is an absolute little whirlwind, sweeping us away in her track."[297] This suggests that there was a difference in attitude towards Sales of Work between the generations, the elder generation being far more enthusiastic than the younger. This reflects the shifting attitudes towards church work in the interwar years – where the elder generation found the Sales of Work highly fulfilling and energising the younger were more disinterested. Her interwar readers likely would have sympathised with Eliza's groans having experienced the trials and tribulations of organising Sales.

As a daughter of the manse Eliza did the work more out of expectation than genuine interest. This may be a general indication of shifting attitudes – perhaps the lack of interest shown by daughters of the manse indicates a broader trend among women of her generation. Eliza as a character is more interested in the arts and romance than church work. In contrast Mrs Laidlaw is committed to fundraising: "he [Mr Laidlaw] feared that there was nothing to which she [Mrs Laidlaw] would not stoop to bring in funds".[298] Mr Laidlaw's comment reflects the reality that at the turn of the century churches in Scotland were dependent on the fundraising work of women, and that these women prized their fundraising work. Bazaar programmes from the time reveal the number of women who are involved in making them happen. A Bazaar Guide for a bazaar held by Great Hamilton Street Free Church in Glasgow in 1890 reveals that the stalls were exclusively organised and staffed by women of the congregation. [299] The John Knox United Free Church Deacon's Court Minute Book records the ladies of the congregation being met with to discuss the possibility

[296] Brown, *Providence and Empire*, 444; Macdonald, *A Unique and Glorious Mission*, 83.
[297] Douglas, *Eliza For Common*, 179.
[298] Ibid., 179.
[299] James Gage, *Great Hamilton Street Free Church Glasgow. Historical Sketch of the Congregation and Bazaar Guide.* (Glasgow: Carter & Pratt, 1890), 80–86.

of holding a Bazaar to help resolve the issue of the Church bank account being overdrawn.[300] In the end it was decided that the church would not hold a bazaar.[301] The Bazaar Guide for the 1898 Bazaar in Shettleston Church of Scotland similarly suggests that while the organising and staffing of a bazaar was largely left to women it was the male church officials that were responsible for the oversight of it.[302]

The depiction of the sales of work in Anna Buchan's *Eliza for Common* are echoed in Barbara Pym's *Excellent Women* (1952) where in the opening chapters of the novel the lead character Mildred Lathbury, a spinsterish daughter of the manse, is described as helping with the bazaar that is taking place in her local church. There are some significant contrasts between Douglas's and Pym's depictions of the sales of work/bazaars. Where Douglas focuses attention on the preparation in the long run up to the sale of work noting the things that each member of the family made and other practical things, Pym uses the bazaar to demonstrate the dynamics between the different parishioners. The contrast between the focus on home-made items in Douglas's work and second hand items in Pym's work perhaps is demonstrative of a shift in custom between 1920s Glasgow and 1950s London. Pym's depiction of the bazaar in the London Church of England parish suggests that the custom of women's (and in particular women of the manse's) major involvement in sales of work/fundraising is not something confined to the Scottish churches and was a broader United Kingdom wide phenomenon.[303] Thus, Anna Buchan's readers throughout the country would have resonated with this element of her novels.

In all of Anna Buchan's depictions of fundraising it is the women of the manse who were most active and concerned about the task. This is significant when her novels are considered as propaganda for increased giving to the church. Anna Buchan highlights to her readers the extent of the work the women of the manse put into fundraising for the various causes of the church. In doing so she echoes the sentiments expressed by the editor of the Church of

[300] 'John Knox United Free Church Deacons Court Minute Book' (Glasgow: John Knox United Free Church, 6th November 1895.), 192–93, Mitchell Library.
[301] 'John Knox United Free Church Deacons Court Minute Book 4th December 1895', 194.
[302] *Shettleston Parish Church Bazaar Guidebook and Timetable 3rd, 4th-5th Novr 1898* (Glasgow: Carter & Pratt Printers, 1898).
[303] Derwent in her autobiography devotes a whole chapter to describing a Bazaar she was involved in organising in her brother's Berwickshire parish. Lavinia Derwent, *Lady of the Manse / Lavinia Derwent; Illustrations by Elizabeth Haines.* (London: Arrow, 1985), 126–40.

Scotland's Woman's Guild Supplement in 1906 who observed that "there is a danger lest too much energy is absorbed in fundraising…We should be careful how we lift all the burden for raising money for parish needs off men's shoulders."[304] Anna Buchan's descriptions of their experiences conducting doorstep visits and organising sales of work and bazaars put flesh on the dry statistics given in church magazines and reports. They offer an insight into the variety of attitudes held by those undertaking these activities revealing the sometimes surprising contrast between the views of the women-of-the-manse collectors and the parishioners from whom they collect from. As will be explored in the 'women of the manse at home' chapter the women of the manse were also the driving force behind the maintenance of the household finances.

Educating the young

As mentioned earlier in this chapter a task carried out by Anna Buchan's daughters of the manse was assisting in the running of Band of Hope and the Sabbath School. This was an activity Anna Buchan herself carried out while she lived in the Gorbals manse. This section will examine Anna Buchan's depictions of the Sabbath schools and Band of Hope meetings assessing the impact of such activities on both the young people who took part and the daughters of the manse who assisted.

Band of Hope

The first mention of Band of Hope in the work of Anna Buchan is in *The Setons* where Elizabeth comments that it is "Band of Hope night".[305] It is significant that it is referred to quite casually as though Anna Buchan expects that her readers would immediately know about the Band of Hope. Anna Buchan herself helped with the Band of Hope. The Band of Hope was a United Kingdom-wide organisation which advocated for temperance, promoting the idea amongst young people. Meetings were held for young people where they were encouraged to pledge abstention from drinking alcohol, socialised, sang songs and were given educational talks. The 1880s to 1890s was a time of growth in support of the

[304] Editor, *Life and Work Woman's Guild Supplement*, 1906.
[305] Douglas, *The Setons*, 1917, 82.

temperance movement in the churches in Scotland: in 1880, 89 ministers of the Free Church of Scotland were members of the Scottish Temperance League (one of the major temperance organisations in Scotland); by 1900 that figure had more than doubled to 200 ministers.[306] Callum Brown notes that "Band of Hope, the Protestant children's total abstinence organisation in 1908 had 147000 Scottish children enrolled and pledged to abstinence".[307] The figure likely was similar earlier in the same decade when Anna Buchan helped with the Band of Hope. As discussed in the 'Historical Context' chapter it seems Anna and her mother were fully committed to the temperance cause but her brother Walter certainly had lapsed in his later years. It is in *Eliza for Common* that Anna Buchan gives the most detailed description of the proceedings of a Band of Hope meeting. She describes a particularly chaotic meeting of the Band of Hope in Martyr's Church in farcical detail – everything that could go wrong did until Mr Laidlaw came in and brought calm to the proceedings. Here it seems that Anna Buchan is attempting to amuse and horrify her readers while asserting the social role of the minister in their parish.

Evangelistic meetings

In terms of educating the young, the latter half of the nineteenth century was the high point in the growth of voluntary organisations. John Springhall discussing the state of church provision of activities for youths in late nineteenth century Britain notes:

> In this situation, with the Churches seeking to retain the illusion of exercising a supervisory role over a rootless, urban population, agencies were developed under middle-class control to penetrate and organise the leisure of working class adolescents.[308]

Springhall in his study focused on organisations such as the Boys Brigade and the Scouts. However, another example of the churches' attempt to organise the leisure time of working class young people is the evangelistic meeting depicted in *Eliza for Common.* It is a meeting

[306] Paton, 'Drink and the Temperance Movement in Nineteenth Century Scotland', 348.
[307] Callum G. Brown and Jayne D. Stephenson, '"Sprouting Wings?" : Women and Religion in Scotland c. 1890-1950', in *Out of Bounds: Women in Scottish Society 1800-1945*, ed. Esther Breitenbach and Eleanor Gordon, Edinburgh Education and Society Series (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1992), 101.
[308] John Springhall, *Youth, Empire and Society: British Youth movements 1883-1940* (London Hamden, Conn: Croom Helm Archon books, 1977), 15.

organised by Martyr's church where guest preachers are brought in to preach and provide wholesome entertainment for the young people of the parish. Anna Buchan describes this meeting as being highly successful with many of Eliza's class being present including Maggie Henry, whose mother Eliza is depicted as visiting earlier in the day about her absence from her class. Maggie is described as liking "going to meetings and singing Sankey's hymns and had several times professed conversion".[309] It is interesting that Maggie is described as liking singing Sankey's hymns. This reflects the working-class community which Martyr's Church is described as serving and that the novel is set in the early twentieth century. Brown and Stephenson suggest that:

> Introduced to Scotland during the Moody-Sankey revival of 1874, most middle-class controlled congregations of the Church of Scotland and United Free Church dispensed with them before 1900, but working-class mission halls and 'tents' retained these until the middle of the century as a major attraction for worshippers.[310]

However, Maggie's attendance at Eliza's class is described as patchy. Eliza and Mrs Henry put her absence down to spending time with her boyfriend. Thus, the case of Maggie Henry is an effective example of the tensions resulting from middle class church control of working-class adolescents. Eliza as a daughter of the manse is middle class and is depicted as working to control the life of Maggie and her family. She organises for her father to intervene in the life of the Henry family where the mother is drunk, and Maggie's baby half-sister Beenie is sick and severely neglected. Here Douglas is portraying the Band of Hope/Sabbath School helpers (Eliza) as having a holistic view of the adolescents in the class. Eliza is portrayed as more concerned about the home life of Maggie than the state of her learning. However, in conversation with her father Eliza does show concern about Maggie's understanding of the faith commenting in concern about Maggie's talk of having received a second baptism at the evangelistic meeting. Second baptism is not an orthodox part of Presbyterian doctrine. It is interesting that Anna Buchan depicts this encounter between Eliza and Maggie at the Evangelistic Meeting rather than at the Sabbath school meeting – the Evangelistic meetings seem to have inspired her in her writings more than the sabbath

[309] Douglas, *Eliza For Common*, 71.
[310] Brown and Stephenson, '"Sprouting Wings?" : Women and Religion in Scotland c. 1890-1950', 107.

school meetings (though in her autobiography she discusses more at length the Sabbath School meetings and in particular her brother John's attempt at teaching a class). In *Ann and her Mother* Anna Buchan describes a conversation between Ann and her mother where Ann reminisces about how much she hated evangelistic meetings as a child/adolescent daughter of the manse. Her attitude is nearly the complete opposite to that of Maggie Henry. She hated the pressure on her to come forward after the meeting to talk with the evangelists and like Eliza found them uncomfortable and uninspiring. It seems that the experience of attending evangelistic meetings was perhaps different for daughters of the manse than their father's parishioners. Here Anna Buchan may have been challenging her readers' stereotypes of daughters of the manse.

Sabbath Schools

As well as helping run the Band of Hope in the churches Anna Buchan's women of the manse are depicted as having responsibility for Sabbath School classes. This was particularly true of the older generation of women of the manse. Anna Buchan's most extensive description of women of the manse running Sabbath School classes is in *Ann and Her Mother* where Mrs Douglas reminisces about her first experience of running a Sabbath School class in Inchkeld, her minister husband's first charge. She recalls how terrifying and unexpected a prospect it was to be a Sabbath school teacher as a very young wife of the manse:

> It had never entered into my head that such an awful duty would be required of me. Think – until a short time before I myself had been a scholar (and a restless, impertinent one at that!), and the very thought of trying to control a class made my brain reel.[311]

It would have been understandable to Anna Buchan's readers that the young Mrs Douglas was startled at the prospect of leading a Sabbath school class. However, there is evidence that young women made up a significant proportion of the Sunday-school teachers. Callum Brown argues that the "large army of Sunday-school teachers — two-thirds of them male in

[311] Douglas, *Ann and Her Mother*, 54.

the 1850s but a majority female by the 1890s — formed a force which, more than any other group, crafted the voluntary educational institutions of modern Scotland."[312] It is slightly surprising that it never occurred to her that it was a duty of a minister's wife. Fellow fictional minister's wife Isabel Dewar writing to her friend Bessie comments about her church work in her husband's first charge at Achachlachar Parish church on the Island of Sonas (Mull) "Of course I teach in the Sunday School. I seemed to think that you would take that for granted."[313] The obviousness of Isabel teaching in the Sunday School here is likely due to the fact that she briefly was a teacher with Bessie prior to her marriage to her minister husband Sandy. Although, it does also suggest that it was an expectation that the wife of the manse would teach.

Mrs Douglas's experience of taking her first class (a class of seven fifteen-year-old girls) was a terrifying experience to her as a new wife of the manse. She was expected to hear the girls say the lesson for the day (that first Sunday it was one of the parables) then offer some instruction on the passage. This was task she felt she had miserably failed to do. Reflecting on the incident Mrs Douglas comments:

> They told me the lesson – one of the parables – but my mind was a blank and I could think of no comment to make over it. I stumbled and stuttered, every moment getting more hot and ashamed, and finally went home, feeling, … the most miserably inadequate minister's wife that had every tried to reign in a manse.[314]

It is significant that Anna Buchan depicts Mrs Douglas making the connection between her failure in her eyes to teach the Sabbath school class and her ability as a minister's wife. It indicates that at least for Anna Buchan a key task of a minister's wife is teaching in the Sabbath school. In *Ann and Her Mother* the precedent for this was set by the previous minister's wife.

Eliza Laidlaw is similarly unconfident in her leadership of her Sabbath school class in Gorbals Glasgow in *Eliza for Common.* Where in *Ann and her Mother* the reader only gets insight into

[312] Callum G. Brown, 'The Sunday-School Movement in Scotland 1780-1914', *Scottish Church History Society* 21 (1981): 19.
[313] Emma L. Menzies, *Achachlacher / by Emma L. Menzies.* (Edinburgh: R. & R. Clark, 1936), 22.
[314] Douglas, *Ann and Her Mother*, 55.

Mrs Douglas's experience, in *Eliza for Common* the reader gets insight into Eliza, her Sabbath scholars and their guardians' experiences of Eliza's Sabbath School teaching.

> Jessie was working a sewing machine in a corner by the fire, and rose to greet her teacher with a shy, pleased smile….
>
> "She'll be back at the class gin Sabbath."
>
> "I didn't like missing it," said Jessie.
>
> Eliza felt surprised and quite absurdly pleased. She had thought her scholars came only from a sense of duty.
>
> "Na," said Mrs. Calder, "she was in a way aboot it. Ye're young to be a teacher, but that's mebbe why they like ye – youth draws to youth."[315]

In an interesting contrast Anna Buchan in her autobiography does not give much attention to her mother's or her own experience as a Sabbath School teacher, only noting briefly her mother's work in running a Bible class in John Knox church and her own fear of public speaking whenever she was required to deputise for her mother. Instead, she focuses on recounting her brother John's efforts as a Sabbath School teacher. She discusses how the Sunday School class which John taught in John Knox church provided inspiration for the gang of boys named the Gorbals Die-Hards in his novel *Huntingtower* (1922). She also notes that John used his storytelling skills to entertain his class – he told them adventure stories with missionaries as the heroes much to their enjoyment. Her observations about Sunday School classes as sources of inspiration for John are also applicable to her. In *Ann and Her Mother* and *Eliza for Common* there are incidents which seem to have been drawn from Anna Buchan and her mother's experience teaching classes. Though in her autobiography there is no direct mention of her having a class of her own – her Sunday School teaching experience there seems to have been confined to substituting for her mother. The description of this experience is similar to the description of Mrs Douglas's first time leading a Sabbath school in *Ann and Her Mother* – both Anna and Mrs Douglas felt out of their depth.

[315] Douglas, *Eliza For Common*, 65–66.

Towards the end of *Eliza for Common* Anna Buchan describes Eliza preparing to organise a Sabbath school theatre production. This play is written by a friend of Eliza's mother called Miss Bracebrig and is described as "a small religious play, a musical thing" and is titled *The Seeker*. It seems that the play was in aid of a missionary cause as Eliza criticised Miss Bracebrig for "only wanting to get her name into the Missionary Record".[316] Eliza takes on the duty reluctantly. In the text her main concern is the stress of having to prepare her sabbath scholars and have the play ready in three weeks. The thing that generated the most stress for Eliza was the fitting of the parts, particularly the part of the Virgin Mary – "please, ma mother says I'm not to be the Virgin Mary," was the message brought by three likely damsels in succession"[317] The response from potential Virgin Marys is possibly a reflection of sectarian prejudice in the Gorbals at this time. The Gorbals was an area of Glasgow with a large Roman Catholic population and Glasgow as a whole was a hotbed of sectarian prejudice throughout Anna Buchan's time. Her younger brothers Rob and Geordie take great delight in playing the Wise Men and are depicted as enjoying the whole experience far more than Eliza herself. Her other reason for reluctance is possibly part of her wider issues around collecting for mission which have been discussed earlier in this chapter given one of her major complaints about being asked was because she felt that Mis Bracebrig only wanted to get a mention in the Missionary Record. Throughout the novel Eliza has nothing positive to say about missionary activity.

From the parts mentioned (Virgin Mary and Wise Men) *The Seeker* seems to have been a form of Nativity play. The fact that it is being performed at Easter time would have been strikingly odd to Anna Buchan's readers. By the time Anna Buchan wrote *Eliza for Common* the practice of celebrating the festivals of Christmas and Easter had become common practice even in the Presbyterian churches in Scotland. It was John Macleod in the 1870s who attempted to reintroduce the celebration of these festivals in the churches in Scotland amid great controversy.[318] Anna Buchan's depiction of this play being performed out of season may be a hint at her more conservative ecclesiological upbringing. It is likely that while Eliza was teaching scholars the play, she would also be expected to teach them the

[316] Ibid., 230.
[317] Ibid., 233.
[318] Douglas M. Murray, 'Chapter 6 From Disruption to Union', in *Studies in the History of Worship in Scotland*, ed. Duncan B. Forrester (Edinburgh: T& TClark, 1984), 84–85.

relevant scriptural passages. She would have been teaching her scholars the nativity story while many in Scotland and most of England were celebrating Easter.

It is significant that the one instance of Eliza a daughter of the manse being involved in producing a play is in the context of a sabbath school play. In the other instances of Anna Buchan depicting women producing and directing plays it is not the women of the manse who take the lead or are involved and the play that is put on is a secular one without religious themes. The play that is performed in the novel *Priorsford* is performed by the Priorsford Community Drama Group and the only manse family member to be involved is the young minister Mr Thornton. The play is put on as a part of a theatre competition between various local community drama groups in the Borders. The depiction of Eliza's theatrical experience is significant for the characterisation of Eliza as being very much constrained by her role as daughter of the manse. Eliza dreams of Shakespeare and loved seeing it performed by the Oxford University Dramatic Society when visiting her brother Jim in Oxford. However, when she is at home she is confined to producing and directing what she describes as "the worst show in Christendom" with her sabbath scholars as the actors.[319] This highlights the limited life Eliza led in the manse. Eliza's love of the theatre will be explored in more depth in Chapter 5.

It is significant but unsurprising that in all of Anna Buchan's novels the Sunday School classes the women of the manse are depicted as teaching are all girls with the exception of Elizabeth Seton who taught a class of six small boys. It seems to suggest that it was a common thing that the women of the manse were expected to teach the older girls of the parish. It certainly seems to have been the case that it was common to segregate Sabbath School classes by gender and have the children taught by a teacher of the same gender. An article in the March 1882 issue of *St Stephen's Parish Magazine* notes

> It was suggested that if there were space in the Parish Buildings, so that the Boys' School could meet at four instead of at six, there might be less difficulty in getting male teachers from among the Congregation than at present.[320]

[319] Douglas, *Eliza For Common*, 232–33.
[320] 'Sabbath Schools', *St Stephen's Parish Magazine*, March 1882, 2.

This both indicates that classes were segregated and that in St Stephens it was particularly difficult to find teachers for the boys. In contrast Anna Buchan's description of women of the manse teaching teenage girls reflects the comments throughout the novels that Anna Buchan found teenage girls particularly challenging to manage. Mrs Laidlaw reflects "pondering on the problem of a daughter. Boys were comparatively easy – bad, noisy, untidy, but you knew where you were with them; but girls were queer, unsettled creatures, full of whims and fancies."[321]

Conclusion

In this chapter I have analysed the work carried out by Anna Buchan's women of the manse (mothers and daughters) in the parish in support of the ministers in the novels. This work included visiting the sick and needy, collecting for missionary causes, running sales of work, and educating the young of the parish through helping with Band of Hope or teaching Sabbath School classes. In her depiction of these activities Anna Buchan gives a sensitive portrayal of the interactions between the women of the manse and the impoverished parishioners which reflects Anna Buchan's own experiences as a daughter of the manse in Pathhead Kirkcaldy and Gorbals Glasgow. Here I have argued that especially in *Eliza for Common* Anna Buchan subverts her readers' expectations about the attitudes of daughters of the manse towards the work in the parish portraying Eliza carrying out the tasks grudgingly and ultimately leaving home and stopping carrying out these tasks. Over the course of each novel Anna Buchan subtly protests the fact that women and women of the manse in particular were relied on by the church to do much of the work in the parish. In her depiction of her women of the manse Anna Buchan largely is reflecting the changes in attitude towards church work of her readers. Lesley Orr Macdonald observes that by the 1900s (the time when Anna Buchan moved out of the manse) "Even that archetypal angel of mercy and dogsbody, the minister's wife, felt able to express a grievance".[322] Anna Buchan's older characters (Mrs Douglas and Mrs Laidlaw) whom her older readers might have empathised with largely are portrayed as finding the work they did in the parish fulfilling. In

[321] Douglas, *Eliza For Common*, 111.
[322] Macdonald, *A Unique and Glorious Mission*, 91.

contrast, her younger characters are described more frequently doing the work in the parish reluctantly or protesting about the work thus being characters her younger readers may have empathised with. In *The Setons,* that contrast is not so marked – Elizabeth continues to support her minister father in his retirement. Then, during wartime, drawing on her experience of visiting the people of her father's parish she volunteers for the Soldiers' and Sailors' Families Association. Eliza Laidlaw meanwhile following trips to Oxford/London visiting her elder brother Jim at Oxford is set to marry one of her brother's friends at the end of the novel – abandoning her church work for life in the south of England.

In order to fully analyse Anna Buchan's depictions of the lives of women of the manse in her novels it will be essential to explore other areas of their lives. In the forthcoming chapters I will examine Anna Buchan's depiction of her women of the manse at worship and then their home lives. In the next chapter, I will complete my analysis of the life of women in the church exploring their involvement in supporting the minister in his preparation for leading worship alongside what the women did and thought during the Sunday services. As in this chapter contrasts between the reactions and attitudes of women of the manse and the women of the parish will be analysed. Comparisons between Anna Buchan's depictions and the likely attitudes of her readers will be drawn in order to understand the extent to which Anna Buchan supports or subverts typical attitudes towards worship amongst women of the early twentieth century.

Chapter 4: Women of the manse at worship

Told from the perspectives of women of the manse, Anna Buchan's novels offer a distinctive insight into the experience of women's worship in Presbyterian churches in Scotland at the turn of the century and in the inter-war period. This chapter will explore Anna Buchan's depiction of those women's experiences looking at the role they are portrayed as playing and the views they are described as having about worship and preaching. The personal devotional practices of Anna Buchan's women of the manse will also be examined. The chapter will consider why, apart from in *Ann and Her Mother,* there is so little depiction of the sacraments in Anna Buchan's novels. It will assess the ways in which Anna Buchan's novels advance our understanding of women's experiences of and contributions to worship in late-nineteenth/early twentieth-century Scottish history.

Personal devotions

Through centring her attention on the women of the manse, Anna Buchan offers some insight into the private devotional lives of these women. Her depiction of the levels of commitment to undertaking personal devotional practices differs between the generations and suggests a waning of interest in these over time. This section will explore what these devotional practices were and what this indicates about the devotional lives of Anna Buchan's women of the manse and middle-class church women of the time more generally.

Of all her female characters, Anna Buchan offers the most extensive insight into the daily devotional practices of Mrs Douglas in *Ann and Her Mother*. Mrs Douglas's practices take the form of reading a set of devotional works. In all of her novels Anna Buchan uses the texts a character is reading as an element of characterisation and in some cases offers the reader a peek into a character's bookshelves. This is particularly the case with Mrs Douglas in *Ann and Her Mother.* Anna Buchan, in the opening of chapter II, describes how:

> She [Mrs Douglas] was sitting in her favourite chair doing what she called her "reading." Beside her was a pile of devotional books, from each of which she read the portion for the day. Nothing would make her miss this ceremony, and she carted the whole pile about with her wherever she went.[323]

Thus, it is clear that reading was a daily activity, although this sort of reading was confined to devotional works. In the passage that follows, Anna Buchan names the texts which were in Mrs Douglas's "pile of devotional books". They were: *Hours of Silence, Come ye Apart, From Day to Day* and *Golden Grain*. These four books will be examined in this section.

It is uncertain which text Anna Buchan has in mind with the title *Hours of Silence* as there are three texts which would be likely candidates. The earliest is *Hours of Silence* published in 1839 by James Nisbet and Co. This is a collection of forty short four-page meditations on verses of scripture – it is not clear who the author of this work is or its intended readership. Alternatively, it could be Alexander Smellie's (1857-1923) *In the Hour of Silence: A Book of Daily Meditations for a Year* (1899) – Smellie was a minister in the Scottish Original Secession Church (known colloquially as the Cameronians).[324] The Scottish Original Secession Church was a very conservative denomination which arose in 1822: – many of its members united with the Free Church in 1856, so it was a tradition which had influence in the Free Church of which the Buchan family were members. In this book, Smellie gives a daily verse of scripture and a short single page meditation on the verse. Perhaps more likely it could be John Edgar McFadyen's (1870-1933) second book, *In the Hour of Silence* (1902) which was published by Westminster Co. in Toronto. McFadyen was a Scottish theologian and biblical scholar, who was professor of Old Testament at Trinity College, Glasgow (1910-1933). Given that the Buchans lived in Glasgow and several of Anna Buchan's brothers attended the University of Glasgow, it is possible that the Buchan family would know McFadyen. His book is a collection of short meditations on spiritual themes, each around six-pages long. It is the latter of the three texts which is the most likely given Anna Buchan in the final chapter of the novel describes the book in this way: "Ann rose and fetched the pile

[323] Douglas, *Ann and Her Mother*, 22.
[324] Alexander Smellie, *In the Hour of Silence: A Book of Daily Meditations for a Year.* (London: Andrew Melrose, 1906).

and put them beside her mother. "Biggest first," she said, and handed her Hours of Silence".[325] McFadyen's text is the longest of those mentioned.

From Day to Day is the only text written (or at least compiled) by a female author. It was written by Theodora Walton Woolsey (1840-1910), an Episcopalian, and niece of Theodore Dwight Woolsey, President of Yale University. *From Day to Day* was published by Little, Brown and Company in 1898. It is a book which gives a scripture verse for the day in English, French, German and Italian – this text is unique of the set Anna Buchan names in that it does not offer any commentary on the passage of scripture. *Come ye Apart* was an 1887 text by J. R. Miller (1840-1912), an American presbyterian pastor and Christian writer. It is similar in structure to Smellie's *In the Hour of Silence,* giving a verse and a reflection on the verse per day. *Golden Grain* was a text by John Follette (1883-1966), a Bible teacher at Southern California Bible College. This selection of texts suggests that Mrs Douglas was a devout woman who as part of her devotional reading read texts by a variety of contemporary Christian thinkers. These texts are largely short accessible meditations or lections so while at first glance it seems that the passage in *Ann and Her Mother* where these texts are named suggests that Mrs Douglas has a heavy and intensive programme of reading, in reality she is only reading about three to four pages per evening. All the books she is depicted as reading would have likely been widely available to a woman like Mrs Douglas, including those written by American writers. From this description, it is clear that Mrs Douglas's main devotional practice took the form of reading and reflecting on scripture guided by devotional literature.

The second longest description of the devotional practices of Anna Buchan's women of the manse is in *Eliza for Common.* Anna Buchan's description of Eliza's prayer on her first night alone away from the manse takes up a whole page in the novel. Eliza's devotional practices are very different to Mrs Douglas's and serve a different function in the narrative of the novel. Her devotional practices take the form of saying prayers in the evening just before going to bed. She begins her prayers by repeating two verse short sentence prayers which she presumably learnt in childhood. These are followed by a series of intercessions for her family and friends and situations from the day and conclude with the words "May I get what

[325] Douglas, *Ann and Her Mother*, 281.

I want - *if it be Thy will."*[326] These final words of her prayer echo the prayer Jesus prayed on the Mount of Olives – "Saying, Father, if thou be willing, remove this cup from me: nevertheless not my will, but thine, be done." (Luke 22:42). For both Jesus and Eliza these words mark a transition point. The depiction of Eliza praying at this point in her life echoes Charlotte Brontë's Jane's Eyre's prayers at perhaps more dramatic turning points in her life, although there is a distinct difference in terms of the portrayal of God's response to these prayers. In *Jane Eyre,* Jane receives a voice from God telling her what to do, whereas, in *Eliza for Common,* God's response is more subtly portrayed – the things Eliza prays for do happen in the novel. What she wants is for Gerald Meade to express his love for her. In the final chapter this does happen and they get engaged in her final scene in the novel. This may be a reflection of Anna Buchan's broader scepticism towards religious experiences which will be explored in the "Revivals" section of this chapter.

Where Anna Buchan's portrayal of Mrs Douglas's devotional practices serves as a description of her as a devout older woman, Anna Buchan's depiction of Eliza's devotional practices (or changes in them) serves as a signifier of Eliza growing up and making the transition from child to young woman. Eliza, until she goes to London on a solo trip, does not seem to do any personal devotions – she goes to public worship services but is not depicted spending any time in private prayer. It is in the evening of her first night alone in London that her practice of saying evening prayers is depicted. There, she says her prayers in bed, but she has "an uneasy feeling that it was not quite respectful".[327] Presumably at home she would say her evening prayers somewhere else, probably at the bedside. Saying prayers kneeling by the bedside seems to have been the norm. Anna Buchan's contemporary and friend, the novelist Marion Lochhead, writes about the young Scottish Episcopal woman of the manse and notes that "it struck Anne, as she knelt to her own devotions after, that they had not had family prayers, as her father and she regularly performed."[328] While Eliza and Anne pray in different postures, it is significant that an element of the description of each prayer is a reflection on normal practice at home – for both these Scottish young daughters of the manse, these prayers are on first nights away in

[326] Douglas, *Eliza For Common*, 281.
[327] Ibid.
[328] Marion Lochhead, *Anne Dalrymple / by Marion C. Lochhead.* (Edinburgh ; The Moray Press, 1934), 50.

the south of England. The contrast between them is that where Eliza is concerned about her choice to break with her normal practice at home, Anne is concerned about the fact that her cousins do not say family prayers in the way her father and she did. Anna Buchan in portraying Eliza changing her personal prayer practices highlights the personal transition Eliza is going through at that time.

Eliza's prayers begin with the first two lines of a version of the classic children's bedtime prayer "This night when I lie down to sleep, I pray the Lord my soul to keep."[329] In only quoting the first two lines of this prayer, Anna Buchan omits the darker second half of this prayer which typically reads "If I should die before I wake, I pray Thee, Lord, my soul to take. And this I ask for Jesus's sake. Amen."[330] The reasons for this omission are unclear – death is not shied away from in this novel or in this time of prayer, as later in the prayer she prays for Phemie Brown, the young parishioner of her father's, whom she visited just before leaving Glasgow and whose fiancé was dying in hospital.[331] Thus, the omission is perhaps more to create an atmosphere of familiar comfort in an unfamiliar place. An alternative would be that it could be indicative of a growing discomfort with the latter half of the prayer; Anna Buchan may have appreciated the comfort of the first two lines but the second half may have been uncomfortable for her.

Anna Buchan's depiction of what follows this introduction to prayer demonstrates how Eliza personalised her prayers. Eliza is described praying:

> instead of the simple "Bless Father and Mother and the boys, and all dear friends, and make me a good girl, for Christ's sake" she had an elaborate list of petitions which she went over carefully every night.[332]

The "Bless Father and Mother" form of prayer which Eliza rejects is one which was parodied in the caption of an image of a child praying in the satirical magazine for children *Punch* in

[329] Douglas, *Eliza For Common*, 281.
[330] Melancthon Woolsey Stryker and Hubert P. Main, *The New Alleluia : A Collection of Hymns and Tunes for the Church School, and the Mid-Week Meeting* (New York : Biglow & Main, 1886), 171.
[331] This visit has been explored in the "Visitation" section of the "Women of the Manse in the Parish" chapter of this thesis.
[332] Douglas, *Eliza For Common*, 181.

1916.[333] From this, it can be assumed that in the time of Anna Buchan, it had become a common form of prayer for children. The list of petitions which follows the learned prayer discussed earlier are very specific prayers for individuals and her precise needs at that time. She also spends devotional time here conducting a sort of daily examen reflecting on the "long and exciting" day that she had and her interactions with the various people she had met on her journey to London.

Anna Buchan's portrayal of Eliza choosing to script her own prayers, as well as repeating prayers that she was taught, demonstrates the seriousness with which Eliza approaches her prayers. Since this prayer occurs at the transition point of Eliza leaving the manse, it indicates that, although she is leaving behind her work in the church, she is not leaving behind her faith. Here it is clear that Eliza's devotional practice takes the form of saying a mixture of learned and self-scripted prayers.

Elizabeth Seton, despite being depicted as one of Anna Buchan's more active women of the manse in the life of the church, is the character who is portrayed as having the lightest personal devotional practices. The extent of Elizabeth Seton's personal devotional practices seems to be joining in with family prayers and having conversations with her minister father about the contents of the readings he selected for the family prayer time. During the time of morning family prayers in the first chapter, which is set in the manse, Mr Seton chose Jeremiah 45:1 ("The word that Jeremiah the prophet spake unto Baruch the son of Neriah, when he had written these words in a book at the mouth of Jeremiah, in the fourth year of Jehoiakim the son of Josiah king of Judah"). While Mr Seton read the verses from Jeremiah, Elizabeth's concern was for the activities of the day "full of the usual little busynesses—getting Buff away to school, ordering the dinner, shopping, writing letters, seeing people" which were a world away from the concerns of Jeremiah.[334] Elizabeth's comment to her father following this time of family prayers is revealing: "There's just one thing – about the chapter at prayers. I was wondering – only wondering, you know – if Baruch the son of Neriah had any real bearing on our everyday life?"[335] Here Elizabeth struggles with family devotions, which to her are rather abstracted from the everyday life. Emma Menzie's

[333] Punch, *Cyril (Whose Father Has Just Had the Telephone Installed). 'And Bless Father and Mother, and Make Me a Good Boy - and Keep Away All Zeppelins (Pause). Watkins Junior Is Speaking.'*, 1916.
[334] Douglas, *The Setons*, 1917, 44.
[335] Ibid., 47.

fictional wife of the manse, Isabel Dewar, in *Achachlachar,* similarly only seems to join in with family prayers. The prayer time in the Achachlachar manse follows a similar pattern to that of the manse of the Seton's kirk. It begins with the minister reading a portion of scripture and then following it with a time of prayer. The one difference is that the Dewar family kneel to pray, something that baffles the schoolmaster's daughter. Isabel suggests that "We were evidently going just too far with our popish practices, so the little Calvinist [the schoolmaster's daughter] sat bolt upright and left us to carry out our ritual alone."[336] It is significant to note that in both cases family prayer time was regarded as abstracted from everyday manse life and is as a result treated with a degree of sombreness than the rest of life. Elizabeth's faith, like Isabel's, is one which is more grounded in the day- to-day activities of life than reflecting upon scripture. Here, Anna Buchan also offers a criticism of Mr Seton who is disinterested in the day-to-day and hides behind scripture and spiritual matters.

Anna Buchan's women of the manse demonstrate a range of approaches to personal devotions from the very committed Mrs Douglas to the stretched-for-time and disinterested Elizabeth Seton. Her depiction of the devotional lives of women of the manse is important in terms of the character development of Mrs Douglas and Eliza Laidlaw in particular. For the former, the depiction of her devotional life being a set of daily readings denotes that she is a well read and devout woman with a suitable amount of leisure time. Meanwhile, for the latter, the moment of personal devotional practice depicted represents a point of transition in her life and a moment of character building. It also is significant in that it reveals the sort of prayers that children of Eliza's generation grew up with and carried with them into young adulthood.

Conducting elements of worship

Anna Buchan's novels are significant in that they feature women of the manse leading times of worship as part of their ministry in the parish during the week. This was, as will be argued, very restricted, but leadership nonetheless.

Eliza for Common contains Anna Buchan's only reference to a woman of the manse leading public prayer. This occurs during a missionary committee meeting which Mrs Laidlaw

[336] Menzies, *Achachlacher / by Emma L. Menzies.*, 138.

attends. These sorts of Scottish missionary committees were, as Lesley Orr Macdonald suggests, typically led by "women from Edinburgh and (to a lesser extent) Glasgow, who were usually the wives, sisters and daughters of prominent ministers"[337] All the women mentioned by Anna Buchan as being present at the meeting led by Mrs Laidlaw were from Glasgow and two of the three women were explicitly described as wives of the manse. Anna Buchan describing the preparation for the meeting notes that, in the midst of a busy day, Mrs Laidlaw:

> Did manage to glance through the Births, Marriages, and Deaths, and scan the page which contained news of the churches. During dinner she was distinctly distrait, for that afternoon she was to preside at a missionary committee meeting, which meant that she would have to open the proceedings with prayer.[338]

From this description, it seems that the prayer may have included specific intercessions about local church events and people. It is significant that she is depicted as being "distrait" at the prospect of leading the prayer. It suggests that leading prayer was a source of anxiety for Mrs Laidlaw. In a similar vein, Lavinia Derwent, in her autobiographical novel *Lady of the Manse* (1983), describes the anxiety she felt undertaking the duty of the President of the Women's Guild to "begin and end the meetings in prayer".[339] The scarcity of descriptions of women of the manse leading public prayer suggests that either it was such a common occurrence that was not notable to many authors or it was something which rarely happened. It is likely that the former is the case given that the occurrences are in works which depict the ordinary things of manse life. For fellow women of the manse readers these descriptions were likely a source of amusement and comfort, while for more general readers these descriptions reveal the anxiety and pressure felt by the women of the manse undertaking this task.

As Anna Buchan's description of the context of the prayer unfolds, it becomes apparent that the anxiety is because the meeting is held in the house of a fellow committee woman, who is depicted as sounding very confident and polished in her delivery of public prayer. Mrs Laidlaw remarks to Eliza:

---

[337] Macdonald, *A Unique and Glorious Mission*, 149.
[338] Douglas, *Eliza For Common*, 81.
[339] Derwent, *Lady of the Manse / Lavinia Derwent; Illustrations by Elizabeth Haines.*, 82.

> I've written out what I want to say – I don't know whether that was right or not, perhaps I should have waited for guidance – but if I stick, my paper will be no use to me, I'll just have to stop. And my voice shakes so. I wish I had Mrs. Kemp's freedom; she stands up and pours out petitions in a way that leaves me gasping.[340]

Her uncertainty about having written her prayer out reflects views at the time regarding the preference for extemporary prayer. It suggests that women of the manse felt the same pressure their minister husbands felt to lead prayer and worship without notes. It is unclear whether Mrs Kemp is a woman of the manse, but it is likely given that the other woman mentioned as being present at the meeting is Mrs Stit, who is a wife of the manse. In this respect, Anna Buchan's depiction of Mrs Laidlaw's leading of prayer affirms conservative but generally accepted theological ideology around the place of women in worship. Drawing on 1 Timothy 2:12, it was considered acceptable for a woman to lead a group of women in prayer, but not to lead a mixed or male group. This is significant, as Anna Buchan was writing in the time where presbyterian churches in Scotland were beginning to consider the possibility of opening ordination to the Ministry of Word and Sacrament to women. The consequences of this would include the possibility for women to lead worship and prayer in Sunday services and expanding women's leadership of prayer beyond women's groups, such as the missionary meetings and the Women's Guild.

The other context where Buchan considered it acceptable to depict a woman of the manse leading worship is during pastoral visitation. In *The Setons,* Elizabeth Seton, towards the end of her visit to Peggy Donald, is asked by Peggy to sing a song.[341] Elizabeth's practice of leading a hymn as an act of worship at the end of a visit would appear to be inspired by how her minister father conducts his own visits. At the very end of the novel, Buchan describes a visit conducted by Mr Seton, where he ends a visit to the Thomsons (parishioners) by singing Psalm 23. The song choice is significant in that it reflects a generational shift in the use of psalms and hymns. Mr Seton, as representative of the older generation, chooses a psalm, whereas Elizabeth selects a hymn.

[340] Douglas, *Eliza For Common*, 81.
[341] This visit is explored in greater detail in the "Women of the manse in the Parish" chapter of this thesis.

Anna Buchan describes how Elizabeth choses to sing a selection of verses from "Jerusalem, my happy home" as a closing act of worship for the visit. Anna Buchan's choice of verses here is interesting, as the verses which she quotes in the novel are not found in any of the contemporary hymnbooks of the time.[342] In *The Setons* Anna Buchan quotes the following verses:

> There lust and lucre cannot dwell;
> there envy bears no sway;
> there is no hunger, heat, nor cold,
> but pleasure every way.
>
> Thy walls are made of precious stones,
> thy bulwarks diamonds square;
> thy gates are of right Orient pearls;
> exceeding rich and rare;
>
> Thy gardens and thy gallant walks
> continually are green:
> there grow such sweet and pleasant flowers
> as nowhere else are seen.
>
> Our Lady sings Magnificat
> with tune surpassing sweet,

[342] *The Church Hymnary* (1902) gives the following verses:
JERUSALEM, my happy home,
Name ever dear to me!
When shall my labours have an end.
In joy and peace, and thee?

2 When shall these eyes thy heaven-built walls
And pearly gates behold.
Thy bulwarks with salvation strong,
And streets of shining gold?

3 There happier bowers than Eden's bloom.
Nor sin nor sorrow know.
Blest seats, through rude and stormy scenes
I onward press to you.

4 Why should I shrink at pain and woe.
Or feel at death dismay?
I've Canaan's goodly land in view,
And realms of endless day.

6 Jerusalem, my happy home!
My soul still pants for thee;
Then shall my labours have an end,
When I thy joys shall see.

and all the virgins bear their part,
sitting at her feet.[343]

Where the version Elizabeth uses praises "Our Lady" the hymnbook versions of Anna Buchan's time focus the praise on the:

Apostles, martyrs, prophets there
Around my Saviour stand;
And soon my friends in Christ below
Will join the glorious band.

Anna Buchan's choice to use the verse "Our Lady sings Magnificat" instead of "Apostles, martyrs, prophets there " is significant when Elizabeth's context is taken into consideration. It is surprising that Elizabeth, who otherwise is such a staunch presbyterian, should make use of this verse since in the Church of Scotland of the 1880s discussing the Virgin Mary was considered controversial. "Dilating upon the Virginity of the Mother of our Lord" was one of the many practices the elders of the East Church of St Nicholas, Aberdeen, objected to, when the Scoto-catholic James Cooper introduced it to their pattern of worship.[344] It is even more surprising considering it is not one of the verses which could be found in the hymnbooks which Anna Buchan or Elizabeth Seton would have used in church. This suggests that Anna Buchan might have been familiar with the full twenty-six stanza version from the late sixteenth or early seventeenth century.[345] It also suggests that it might have been appropriate for women to use these more feminine verses of the hymn irrespective of the issues faced by their male contemporaries in discussing Mary in public worship.

These two different examples of women of the manse leading worship offered by Anna Buchan in *Eliza for Common* and *The Setons* give an insight into the extent to which worship leading was open to women. The example of Mrs Laidlaw demonstrates that it was acceptable for women of the manse to lead the prayer time prior to church committee meetings which they attended. Additionally, the example of Elizabeth leading the Donald family in a hymn during a pastoral visit demonstrates an instance when it was acceptable for a woman of the manse to lead parishioners in worship. Both these instances are in private domestic settings during the week and not during the main Sunday services.

[343] Douglas, *The Setons*, 1917, 171.
[344] Bryan D. Spinks, *Scottish Presbyterian Worship: Proposals for Organic Change, 1843 to the Present Day* (Edinburgh: Saint Andrew Press, 2020), 107.
[345] John Julian, *A Dictionary of Hymnology* (New York : Scribner's, 1891), 580–81.

Attending Services

When thinking about the experience of women at worship at the turn of the century in the Presbyterian churches, it is easy to assume that they were largely passive observers watching the ministers and elders at the front of the church. This was largely true of the women of the manse's experience of the worship services. In all Anna Buchan's descriptions of church services, the narrative attention switches from the women of the manse to the minister for the duration of the act of worship. Anna Buchan's daughter-of-the-manse novels reveal that, whilst this was the case during the service itself, it was not the entire picture – she shows the involvement of the women of the manse in the preparation for worship – and the input they had into the services. They also show that, for women of the manse, a sabbath morning was in fact a busy time.

One distinctive task Anna Buchan describes her women of the manse carrying out is supporting their minister relatives in preparing for worship. Her depiction of the women carrying out these tasks is significant, since it is an activity which would have gone unnoticed by members of the congregation. It is Elizabeth Seton in *The Setons* who is described in greatest detail as carrying out this task. This is how Anna Buchan describes a scene in the manse study on the Sunday morning before a day of services and other Sabbath activities:

> There he sat, calmly contemplative, in the study while his daughter implored him remember the "intimations," and to be sure to put in that there was a Retiring Collection for the Aged and Infirm Ministers' Fund.
>
> Mr Seton disliked a plethora of intimations, and protested that he had already six items.
>
> "Oh, Father," cried his exasperated daughter. "what *is* the use of saying that when they've all to be made?"
>
> "Quite true, Lizbeth," said her father meekly.[346]

This scene, while it demonstrates the contrast between the calm Mr Seton and the whirlwind Elizabeth, also reveals the support Elizabeth gives her father. Here Elizabeth is portrayed as demonstrating a great awareness of the activities and fundraising efforts in the

[346] Douglas, *The Setons*, 1917, 126.

church. The "Aged and Infirm Ministers' Fund" she mentions the Retiring Collection going to is a fund which did exist in the United Free Church at the time. This fund was one which was significant in the 1910s when Anna Buchan wrote the novel, as it was the fund from which the ministers' pensions were provided. It was not until 1946 and the passing of the National Insurance Act that a Universal State Pension was established. Before then ministers would be reliant on the "Aged and Infirm Ministers' Fund". Thus, the depiction of it being a notice which Elizabeth considered important to have read by her father makes sense considering her interest in the financial position of the manse household. As will be argued in the Women of the Manse at Home chapter, it was the women of the manse who were responsible for the maintenance of the household finances – Elizabeth here likely has in mind the state of the family finances when her father retires. This is also a slight moment of foreshadowing in the novel since, later on, Mr Seton is forced to retire due to ill health and likely would at that point have needed to apply to the Fund for assistance. Therefore, in this instance, the support is both the short-term assistance in preparing the intimations but also in the long term considering the family's financial future.

Elizabeth, between the morning service and distributing her tracts, takes the lead in responding to Mr M'Auslin, the President of the Fellowship Meeting, who visits the vestry while the family are having lunch. While Mr Seton discusses the Fellowship meeting with Mr M'Auslin, Elizabeth's conversation with him focuses on his family's pastoral needs and an upcoming Social Evening which he is planning with her:

> "How is your aunt?" Elizabeth asked him.
>
> "Poorly, Miss Seton; indeed I may say very poorly. She has been greatly tried by neuralgia these last few days."
>
> "I'm so sorry. I hope to look in to see her one day this week."
>
> "Do so, Miss Seton; a visit from you will cheer Aunt Isa, I know. By the way, Miss Seton, I would like to discuss our coming Social Evening with you if I may."[347]

[347] Ibid., 137.

This conversation demonstrates that the pastoral care work carried out by women of the manse during the week, as discussed in the previous chapter, continued on the Sunday morning and was a part of their experience of the time between worship services.

Another way in which Elizabeth is depicted by Anna Buchan as supporting her minister father in and around the worship services is in the conversations at the church door. Anna Buchan describes how, after the afternoon service on the same day as the aforementioned incidents: "At the church door, the service ended, people stood in groups and talked. Elizabeth was constantly stopped by somebody."[348] This description reveals the way in which Elizabeth supported her minister father in the post-church socialising. The members of the congregation seem to look to Elizabeth for the casual pastoral care that happens after the service. There is no mention of her father being present at this time, so it seems that one of the ways she supported her father was taking responsibility for this. One of the people who stopped to speak to her was a "stolid youth" of the parish, who upon being asked by Elizabeth how he was doing, announced "Fine, thanks. Of coorse ma faither's deid and buried since I last saw ye."[349] This response prompts a discussion between Elizabeth and Arthur Townshend about the youth's use of the phrase "of coorse/course". Here, it seems that Anna Buchan is suggesting that there are linguistic differences between the working-class members of the Seton's kirk and the middle-class daughter-of-the-manse Elizabeth in terms of language around death. The working-class parishioners use more matter-of-fact language when talking about death, while Elizabeth is uncomfortable with it and thinks that it is "so *inadequate".*[350] Here it is clear that Mr Seton's parishioners felt they would be listened to by Elizabeth.

Preaching preferences

Women of the manse attended many services conducted by their minister husband or father sitting in the manse pew. This section will explore the opinions Anna Buchan depicts her women of the manse holding about preaching and worship leading. An area which will

[348] Ibid., 141.
[349] Ibid.
[350] Ibid.

be explored is the contrast in the reception of the preaching between members of the ministers' families and their wider congregation.

Anna Buchan's first description of Mr. Seton is one of the reception of his preaching from the perspective of a loyal member of his congregation. While socialising at an evening party in the opening chapters of the novel, Elizabeth Seton enters into a conversation with one of the other guests, a member of her father's congregation, who compliments her father's sermon from the preceding Sunday. However, as the compliment comes from Mr Taylor (a member of the congregation and organiser of the Sabbath School) just before he asks Elizabeth to sing at an upcoming Sabbath School social it is likely to be flattery.[351]

Seton's preaching seems to have been captivating and brief enough that his young and restless son Buff could sit quietly through it and remember vague details, even if his friends could not remember anything of the sermon. Arthur Townshend is deeply impressed with Mr. Seton's preaching, remarking after the afternoon service that "in the Church of England a man who could preach like your father would be a bishop".[352] Elizabeth Seton agrees with him, noting that in the Presbyterian church there is a "fairly high standard of preaching".[353] They agree that Mr. Seton as a preacher is wasted on the small congregation which he has. Arthur goes on to remark that in the pulpit "His [Mr. Seton] very face is an inspiration. His eyes seem to see things beyond."[354] The latter remark has echoes of Jane Findlater's description of the preaching of the charismatic preacher Michael Fletcher in her novel *Rachel* (1899). In that novel, Findlater describes how Michael Fletcher when preaching would "see" the words of what he was to preach on the wall opposite the pulpit.[355] In *The Setons,* the reader only gets an insight into how the various ministers' preaching was received by ministers' families and their friends.

It seems that an appreciation of short and to the point sermons are a distinguishing feature of Anna Buchan' writing about preaching, reflecting what Anna Buchan valued about her father's sermons.[356] David Weekes observes that Mr Buchan "did not fit the stereotype: long

[351] Ibid., 31.
[352] Ibid., 144.
[353] Ibid.
[354] Ibid., 145.
[355] Jane H. Findlater, *Rachel* (London: Methuen, 1899), 111.
[356] Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*, 44–45.

sermons and perhaps an hourglass. Almost every sermon and address included in *In Memoriam* is preachable within twenty minutes; he delivered without notes."[357] In *The Setons,* Mr. Seton's twenty minute sermons without notes are engaging and a source of pride for his daughter Elizabeth. Anna Buchan does not give much of a description of the content of these sermons – for the sermon at the morning service that is described, all that is given is the text (Matthew 22:2-5). In the afternoon service, Mr Seton is described as having "preached on Paul. It was a subject after his own heart, and his face shone as he spoke of that bond-slave of Jesus Christ— of all he gave up, of all he gained."[358] This is possibly an allusion to Mr Buchan's sermon "What St Paul says of Himself" (May 1910) which is one of the seven sermons posthumously published in *John Buchan (April 23, 1847 – November 19, 1911)* (1912).[359] This collection is believed to have been arranged by Anna Buchan and therefore is likely include the sermons which are most representative of her preferences in her father's preaching. These short sermons preached by Mr. Seton were in line with the sort of sermons which were common in parishes like the Setons'. Callum Brown describes how a "mission hall for boys in the Townhead district of Glasgow" advertised in the 1890s that they had "No Long Sermons". [360] Elizabeth Seton's appreciation of these short sermons reveals that it was not just the working-class parishioners who appreciated them– they were appreciated by daughters of the manse too.

Given the description of Mr Seton's delivery as being simple, to the point and without notes, his preaching is the sort of preaching that William Milroy in *A Scottish Communion* (1881) describes as preferential, though falling out of fashion:

> Very different it is now, at least to the use of "notes." Some, indeed, preach without them still, committing their sermons to memory as of old, or speaking the substance of what was written. But the majority (probably) read their discourses, more or less, closely. In large towns and cities this is even fashionable, although in country congregations by the people it is abhorred and set down to sheer laziness on the part of the preacher. They do not say of him that he "preaches" the gospel, but that

[357] David Weekes, 'John Buchan (1875-1940) : A Reassessment of His Christian Faith and Practice' (St Andrews, University of St Andrews, 2017), 28.
[358] Douglas, *The Setons*, 1917, 141.
[359] Buchan, *John Buchan, April 23, 1847 - November 19, 1911. [His Literary Remains, with a Biographical Sketch and Appreciations. With a Portrait.]*, 267–76.
[360] Brown and Brown, *Religion and Society in Scotland since 1707*, 131.

> he "*reads"* it. He is called a "*paper* minister!" Strangest of all in these days of short sermons, the preacher pleads inability to commit his sermons and that he cannot speak effectively in that way.[361]

Anna Buchan's other works suggest that, even by the 1920s, read sermons still had not gained full acceptance in country congregations. In *Ann and Her Mother,* Ann and Mrs Douglas had moved to the Green Glen, the Borders village where Mr Sharp was the minister. Ann talks to her mother about Mr Sharp's preaching, saying:

> Mother, don't you like Mr. Sharp? I do. You needn't have rubbed it in about sermons being no use if they are read. He sat with such a guilty look like a scolded dog. I like his painstaking sermons and his sincere, difficult little prayers. He will never make a preacher, but he is a righteous man.[362]

Here there is clearly a slight generational contrast. Mrs Douglas, Ann's mother, seems to be the one who has the greater issues with sermons being read, whereas Ann is a little more tolerant of them. Mrs Douglas grew up in Etterick, a Borders country parish in the 1860s and 1870s. It is likely there that she developed her contempt of read sermons. While Ann, whose formative years took place in the town Kirkcaple, (inspired by the real-life village Pathhead, Kirkcaldy in which Rev. John Buchan served during Anna Buchan's early years) and Gorbals, Glasgow, seems to appreciate Mr Sharp's "painstaking sermons". This depiction therefore conforms to Milroy's assessment of the difference between urban and rural hearers of sermons.

In general, the preaching of the minister relatives in Anna Buchan's novels is well received by their families and other members of their congregations. It is other ministers within the novels who have their preaching critiqued by characters in the novels. In *The Setons,* other ministers are usually described as poor preachers. The minister whose preaching receives the greatest criticism is the father of Elizabeth's friend, Kirsty, Mr. Christie. He is described as a poor preacher but an excellent church administrator overseeing a well-to-do suburban church. In contrast Mr. Seton is portrayed as an excellent imaginative preacher but chaotic in terms of practicalities and financial matters requiring Elizabeth's assistance in these

[361] William Milroy, *A Scottish Communion / by William Milroy.* (Paisley: Alexander Gardner, 1882), xvi.
[362] Douglas, *Ann and Her Mother*, 93.

matters; throughout the novel, Mr. Seton receives constant reminders from his daughter to remember the notices and to take the correct money for cab journeys.

Later in *The Setons,* we are also introduced to Andrew Hamilton, the fiancé of Kirsty (the daughter of Mr. Christie), who has struggled to find a church as a result of his old-fashioned preaching. When he introduces himself to Elizabeth, he explains that:

> "I haven't got a church yet," he told her, "though I've been out a long time. Somehow I don't seem to be a very pleasing preacher. I'm told I'm too old-fashioned, not 'broad' enough nor 'fresh' enough for modern congregations."[363]

This highlights the importance of the standard of preaching conducted by a minister in their search for a charge and reflects Anna Buchan's tendency to place great importance on the standard of preaching conducted by ministers. In the character of Andrew Hamilton, Anna Buchan seems to be playing with and reframing the stickit minister trope, which was a common feature of kailyard novels.[364] A stickit minister is a minister who had completed their training but was unable to find a parish to be minister of. Ian Campbell, in *Kailyard* (1981), discusses this with reference to S. R. Crockett's *The Stickit Minister* (1893), arguing that writers in the kailyard tradition tend to trap their characters (and in particular their stickit ministers) in their environment.[365] Anna Buchan, in contrast, allows Hamilton to escape from his situation in the form of the charge of Langhope.[366] By the end of the novel, he has come into his own, showing commitment to his values and ultimately becomes a source of pride to his congregation when he goes to fight in the First World War alongside members of his congregation. This is significant as it reveals Anna Buchan's sympathy for the more old-fashioned preachers, as she allows them to be heroes instead of trapping them.

Elizabeth is sympathetic towards him commenting that "When I hear men sacrificing depth to breadth or making merry-andrews of themselves striving after originality, I long for an old-fashioned minister – one who is neither broad nor fresh, but who magnifies his

[363] Douglas, *The Setons*, 1917, 201.
[364] Charles Mackay, *A Dictionary of Lowland Scotch :With an Introductory Chapter Onthe Poetry, Humour, and Literary History of the Scottish Language and an Appendix of Scottish Proverbs /* (Boston :, 1888), 216, http://hdl.handle.net/2027/nyp.33433069243495.
[365] Campbell, *Kailyard*, 106–7.
[366] Douglas, *The Setons*, 1917, 207.

office."[367] In other words she looks for a minister whose preaching is like her father's – traditional and dignified. Later in conversation with her father, she further defines the sort of sermons she believes Hamilton will preach, suggesting that he is likely to preach "solid well-reasoned discourses" with anecdotes about the 'great Dr Chalmers,' and with here and there a reference to the 'sainted Dr Andrew Bonar' or Dr Wilson of the Barclay.'".[368] Dr Chalmers is Thomas Chalmers (17 March 1780 – 31 May 1847), the leader of the Disruption of the Church of Scotland and leading light in the Free Church. Dr Andrew Bonar (29 May 1810 – 30 December 1892) was a Free Church Moderator, though Lionel Alexander Ritchie in his biography notes that he "was little interested in church courts and accepted the moderatorship with reluctance; his interest lay in evangelism and revival, and he latterly worked closely with the American Dwight L. Moody."[369] Dr Wilson of the Barclay refers to James Hood Wilson (7 February 1829 – 6 December 1903), who was also a Moderator of the Free Church of Scotland (1895/96) and served as the first minister of the Barclay Church in Edinburgh. He was particularly associated with the Temperance Cause. The trio of Free Church figures mentioned by Elizabeth represent the three main church causes which Anna Buchan is interested in – Free Church heritage, revival and temperance. This whole conversation highlights the tensions in the Scottish tradition of preaching between the scholarly intellectual preaching and preaching which is entertaining for congregations. The former has been considered characteristic of Scottish preaching and the gold standard of preaching.[370] By praising the heroes of the Free Church, Elizabeth plants herself firmly within it. Here Anna Buchan is making it clear that Elizabeth is a traditionalist, who values the words of the great thinkers in the Free Church. Given that *The Setons* was written in the 1910s, after the Free Church and United Presbyterian Church union of 1900, this is significant, as it reveals where the Setons' sympathies lie – with the Free Church part of the heritage of their Church.

It is in regard to scholarly preaching that Mrs Daw, a working-class member of the Kirkcaple congregation in *Ann and Her Mother,* differs in preaching preferences to Elizabeth. She is

[367] Ibid., 201.
[368] Ibid., 207.
[369] 'Bonar, Andrew Alexander (1810–1892), Free Church of Scotland Minister', Oxford Dictionary of National Biography, accessed 9 September 2022.
[370] David Read, 'The Scottish Tradition of Preaching', in *Studies in the History of Worship in Scotland*, ed. Duncan B. Forrester and Douglas M. Murray (Edinburgh: T& TClark, 1984), 139.

depicted as liking the preaching of Mr Douglas "because he's no what ye ca' a scholarly preacher. I dinna like thae scholars they're michty dull. I like the kind o' minister hat misca's the deevil for aboot twenty meenits and then stops."[371] Mrs Douglas does not regard this praise of Mr Douglas's preaching as "very flattering" and thus is in the same school of thought as Elizabeth Seton with regard to what constitutes good preaching. Both Mrs Douglas and Elizabeth Seton appreciate scholarly preaching. However, Mrs Daw of Kirkcaple's preaching preferences are similar to those of Miss Bethia, who was the servant in the Glenriska manse in Anna Buchan's short story "Miss Bethia at the Manse" in *Farewell to Priorsford* (a posthumously published collection of writings by Anna Buchan). Miss Bethia, reminiscing to Jane (a young woman who grew up in Glenriska), makes the following scathing comment about the preaching of a young supply preacher:

> Then he began his sermon. Eh, me, me! He was mebbe 'brilliant' – I'm no a jidge o' that – but I never yet kent what he was speakin' about. He yammer an' he yammer till he had me fair aivart. Puir Mistress Small was in the kirk; she had walkit frae the Hopehead to get a word o' comfort, for her man was just buried a wee while syne, an' ma hert was wae for her. 'Puir body,' I said to masel, 'ye've come to a bare pasture; ye'll no get a bite.' But they're a' the same, the young preachers. They gang on about Love an' the All-Father till ye're fair provokit but they never let on aboot the Wrath to come.[372]

Mrs Daw and Miss Bethia's comments on the preaching follow the same pattern. A comment about how scholarly in style the preacher is – in both cases there is a clear preference for non-scholarly preaching. For both, scholarly preaching is dull and off-putting. They both demonstrate a clear preference for preaching that emphasises the danger of the Devil and the Wrath to come as opposed to preaching which focuses on God's love. The "young preachers" whom Miss Bethia criticises for focusing on "Love an' the All-Father" are likely based on the generation of preachers who heard the teaching of preachers including James Reid, (1877-1963) who delivered the Warrack Lectures on Preaching in the Theological Colleges of the United Free Church in 1923-24. The Warrack lectureship was founded to provide a more effective training in preaching for candidates and ministers in

[371] Douglas, *Ann and Her Mother*, 90.
[372] 'Mrs Bethia at the Manse' Buchan, *Farewell to Priorsford*, 152.

the United Free Church.[373] In his lectures, Reid only twice mentions the Devil and many times mentions the love of God. However, Reid cautions the preachers listening to his lecture on "The Preacher's Task":

> Christianity is going to mean nothing as power in the world except as it saves men into the mind and attitude of Jesus through and through, and this involves a change which nothing but the full message of God's grace can produce and nothing but the fulness of His love can sustain. (Christianity cannot survive at all in a world like this, upon an emasculated gospel or a message which is reduced to a few genial observations about the love of God.)[374]

Thus, while the young preachers described by Miss Bethia reflect the preference for preaching on the love of God, they failed to heed the warning that they likely would have received at theological college, that their preaching needs to go beyond a series of observations about the love of God. Therefore, Anna Buchan's depiction of Miss Bethia's criticism of their preaching reveals that manse servants could offer insightful criticism of the preaching delivered by ministers.

The description of Mrs Daw and Miss Bethia's comments on preaching also demonstrates a preference for sermons which emphasised the wrath of God and the dangers of the Devil over sermons which are more concerned about moral living in the here and now. This was at a time where middle-class people were very concerned about moral living and, in particular, the moral living of the working-class – particularly working-class women. Brown and Stephenson, discussing the views expressed by working-class women in oral history and autobiography, argue that "churches expected women to sustain moral behaviour in families where male behaviour (primarily of fathers) was often compromised".[375] Anna Buchan is perceptive in her depiction of the working-class women characters' preferences that concerns about moral living in the here and now were not foremost in their minds. For

[373] Richard Rehfeldt, 'The Relationship between Preaching and Other Ministerial Functions as Viewed in the Warrack Lectures on Preaching, 1921-1971 : Plus a Comparison of These Views with Selected Writings by British Authors of Homiletical and Pastoral Literature in the Fifty Years Prior to the Warrack Lectureship', 1975, 5, https://research-repository.st-andrews.ac.uk/handle/10023/14076.
[374] James Reid, *In Quest of Reality : Being the Warrack Lectures on Preaching Delivered in the Theological Colleges of the United Free Church of Scotland, Session 1923-24* (New York : George H. Doran Co., 1924), 45.
[375] Brown and Stephenson, '"Sprouting Wings?" : Women and Religion in Scotland c. 1890-1950', 97.

them, being preached to about the Wrath of God to come was more comfortable listening than a sermon on middle-class moral values.

Anna Buchan's women of the manse in general are depicted as preferring more traditional old-fashioned preaching styles while favouring the shorter sermons, which were popular in working-class parishes. This depiction suggests that women of the manse were perhaps on the conservative side with regard to worship preferences – preferring scholarly well-reasoned discourses over dramatic comedic styles of preaching. In this, they contrast with working-class women of the congregation, who tend to regard scholarly preaching as dull. This depiction of the contrasting views is significant, as it reveals that Anna Buchan's women of the manse's preferences conformed to what was regarded as good preaching at the time, whilst women members of the congregation's preferences did not.

Wartime preaching

In the final few chapters of *The Setons,* we get an insight into the diversity of preaching conducted by minsters at the outbreak of and during the First World War. Anna Buchan describes the different responses to the outbreak of war amongst the ministers in her novels, particularly noting their preaching.

Some, like Mr Christie, responded to the war by preaching patriotic sermons railing against the German Kaiser and inspired by the patriotic preaching of the Anglican bishops. The tone of Anna Buchan's description of this is dismissive, suggesting that sermons of that sort were impressive to their hearer, but not very helpful. She describes how:

> The Rev Johnston Christie confined his usefulness to violent denunciations of the Kaiser from the pulpit every Sunday. He had been much impressed by a phrase used by a prominent Anglican bishop about the Nailed Hand Beating the Mailed Fist – neat and telling he considered it, and used it on every possible occasion.[376]

This description suggests that Anna Buchan did not find this approach to preaching very useful. In some ways, Lewis Grassic Gibbon's description of the Reverend Gibbon's sermons towards the end of *Sunset Song* (1932) can be seen as a development of this trope of a

[376] Douglas, *The Setons*, 1917, 270.

minister finding a favourite patriotic phrase and repeating it regularly in their preaching throughout the war – the Reverend Gibbon's phrase/argument is that the Kaiser is the Antichrist and that the Germans have been sent by God as a curse on the world.[377]

Meanwhile, Anna Buchan's description of the preaching of the Mr Christie's son-in-law, Mr Hamilton, during the war chapters is much more positive. She describes Hamilton taking "Thou hast given a banner to them that fear thee" (Psalm 60:4) as his text for his final sermon on his final Sunday before leaving to fight in the war as a private soldier (he was too young to serve as a chaplain).[378] His decision to leave the village and go to war is described as a source of pride for the village even though it was a source of great anxiety for his wife Kirsty. It is Kirsty that Anna Buchan depicts as noticing the change the war brought to the congregation the most. She notes how "The war did not trouble Kirsty much. She was rather provoked that it should have happened, for it hurt church attendance and sadly thinned the choir."[379] It is significant that her strongest objections to the war (at least until her husband Andrew volunteered to go and fight) were related to the fall in church attendance. The fall in church attendance during the war is something that women seem to have drawn inspiration from in their literary writings. Friend of the Buchan family, Christine Orr, in her first novel *The Glorious Thing* (1919), describes an Edinburgh church congregation during World War One as "scattered among empty pews…the greater part of it was women – elderly ladies in toques."[380] It is through the novels written by women such as Anna Buchan and Christine Orr, that readers get a sense of what the experience of Scottish worship during war time was like. Most Scottish male war novelists neglect the experience of people in the pews.

Whilst Anna Buchan's description in *The Setons* of the preaching of Rev Smillie (a former minister of Langhope, who came back to cover for Rev Hamilton while he was away fighting) is also positive, noting how he preached with more vigour than he had done for years, she is vague about his renewed passion. These different instances of preaching reflect the preaching of ministers of the time who were inclined towards patriotism. She does not include the voices of anyone critical towards the war, with the exception of Mrs Christie,

[377] Lewis Grassic Gibbon, *A Scots Quair* (London: Penguin Books for Lomond Books, 1998), 148, 149, 165 & 189.
[378] Douglas, *The Setons*, 1917, 275.
[379] Ibid., 270.
[380] Christine Orr, *The Glorious Thing*, 2nd ed. (Edinburgh: Merchiston Publishing, 2013), 134.

who does not approve of her minster son-in-law going to fight.[381] Whilst her objections are largely that she thinks it is beneath the dignity of a minister of the church to fight in the war as a soldier, it would have been acceptable to her for him to serve as a chaplain. Through Anna Buchan's descriptions of the preaching of the different ministers at the outbreak of war, the reader gets an insight into the diversity of patriotic responses to the war amongst ministers in the Presbyterian churches. At the time she wrote *The Setons,* Anna Buchan volunteered for the Soldiers' and Sailors' Families Association, visiting families and offering comfort. These visits are explored in detail in the "Women of the manse in the Parish" chapter of this thesis.

Revivals

Anna Buchan's childhood years were also a time marked by revivals throughout Britain. The phase of revival which happened during Anna Buchan's childhood was sparked by the arrival of the American evangelists Dwight L. Moody and Ira D. Sankey, who conducted a tour of the United Kingdom . Having been invited by some of the Free Church of Scotland ministers to come to Edinburgh in November 1873, Moody and Sankey drew great crowds there and had their greatest success later in 1874 in Glasgow.[382] This revival tour sparked a series of revivals in the years following. In 1874, the young Rev. John Buchan was left in charge of Broughton Church (Broughton is the Borders village in which he met his wife Helen Masterton) and, having heard Moody and Sankey in Edinburgh, he introduced their hymns to the people of Broughton.[383] This found its way into Anna Buchan's novel *Ann and Her Mother* (1922), where the mother character reminisces:

> But your father was so young and ardent; he went through the district like a flame. He held meetings in lonely glens where no meeting had ever been held before. He kindled zeal in quiet people who had been content to let things go on as they had always gone; it was a wonderful six months.[384]

[381] Douglas, *The Setons*, 1917, 274.
[382] Bebbington, *Evangelicalism in Modern Britain*, 300.
[383] Buchan, *John Buchan, April 23, 1847 - November 19, 1911. [His Literary Remains, with a Biographical Sketch and Appreciations. With a Portrait.]*, 5.
[384] Douglas, *Ann and Her Mother*, 31–32.

Later in the same novel, Anna Buchan describes the differing experiences of a revival which happened in the fictional Fife village of Kirkcaple. This revival in *Ann and Her Mother* was possibly inspired by the visit of the evangelist George Clarke, which is described in a tribute to the Rev. John Buchan written by Mr. G. Livingstone, a member of the congregation in Pathhead:

> In the early part of Mr Buchan's ministry, George Clarke, the eminent evangelist, paid a visit to Kirkcaldy. Mr Buchan threw his whole energy into the movement, and at the close of Mr Clarke's campaign, Pathhead congregation became a centre for evangelistic work in the district.[385]

This evangelistic work bore fruit as, in 1886, sixty new communicants were added to the membership roll of Pathhead Free Church, with the majority of them being new converts.[386] Tom Lennie in *Glory in the Glen* suggests that "the year 1886 appears to have been attended by special blessing" on account of the vast number of revivals which took place across Scotland in that year.[387]

For Ann's mother, in the novel, the revival in Kirkcaple was a great and wonderful thing but for Ann the experience was different. Ann explains why she did not wholeheartedly enjoy the experience of the Kirkcaple revival:

> I don't know, but I do dislike to hear people talking glibly about that sort of thing. It somehow seems rather indecent. You didn't realise, you and Father, how miserable it was for us children going to so many evangelistic meetings. We liked shouting Sankey's hymns, and the addresses were all right, but oh! those 'after-meetings,' when we sat sick with fright watching earnest young men working their way down the church to speak personally to us.[388]

Anna Buchan, throughout her works, depicts the younger generation of women of the manse as being suspicious of spiritual fervour and openness about matters of personal faith. For Ann, questions about the state of her soul are akin to questions about her "bodily

---

[385] Buchan, *John Buchan, April 23, 1847 - November 19, 1911. [His Literary Remains, with a Biographical Sketch and Appreciations. With a Portrait.]*.
[386] Lennie, *Glory in the Glen*, 46.
[387] Ibid.
[388] Douglas, *Ann and Her Mother*, 115–16.

health" and thus, for her, details about such matters should only be discussed with close friends or relevant professionals and never strangers.[389] Ann counts visiting evangelists as strangers. This may suggest shifting attitudes regarding ideas of public and private faith. Alternatively, it may represent uncertainty about the state of her soul and the strength of her personal faith. Later in the conversation, Ann describes how:

> You've simply no idea how difficult it is for a minister's family to be anything but mere formalists. You see, we hear so much about it all. From our infancy we are familiar with all the shibboleths, until they almost cease to have any meaning.

This suggests that Ann largely goes through the motions in her faith life or at least struggles with notions of faith. In this respect Ann is perhaps similar to Chris Colquhoun in Lewis Grassic Gibbon's *Cloud Howe* (1933). Chris in *Cloud Howe* is the wife of Robert Colquhoun, the minister in Kinraddie, a fictional village in Aberdeenshire in the 1920s. Chris, as a character, is around ages with Ann and while one is a wife of the manse and the other is a daughter of the manse, they seem to share similar thoughts about faith. Ian Campbell notes that Chris:

> Asked by her minister second husband, Robert, whether she believes in the Church life she is living, "she bent her head as she answered, No, not looking at him; but his laugh was kind. You will sometime, however you find Him"[390]

It is important to note the contrast between them in terms of their journey to their shared position. Ann seems to have become jaded about church practices through overexposure, whereas Chris has never believed in her activities as a wife of the manse. There is also a contrast in the responses of their respective relatives to their admission that they go through the motions. Ann's mother takes her to task for turning her thoughts about church life into ridicule, whereas Chris's husband is more hopeful about Chris's prospects. Ultimately, Chris's husband is wrong though. These discussions are important, as they offer readers an insight into the private doubts of women of the manse, who throughout history have faced great pressure to keep up appearances with regard to their faith. Harry Reid's

[389] Ibid., 116.
[390] Ian Campbell, '"A Thin and Tattered Veil": Lewis Grassic Gibbon and the Church of Scotland', *Studies in Scottish Literature* 43, no. 1 (1 May 2017): 118.

findings in *An Old Kirk in a New Scotland* (2002) make it clear that this is an issue which continued throughout the twentieth century. He notes:

> The meeting was with a minister's wife…Her problem, in essence, is that she has no faith; she does not believe in God. This might not be a problem for many people in our secular society, but it is certainly a huge problem for a minister's wife. Celia told me: 'If you are the minister's wife, so many things are expected of you. You must not say certain things. You are not supposed to have your own mind.'[391]

Anna Buchan's and Lewis Grassic Gibbon's novels make it clear that this was an issue which faced women of the manse as early as the 1920s. Their depiction of Ann and Chris's doubts perhaps represent, at least in a fictional context, an early expression of openness regarding doubts and concerns about belief from women of the manse. Anna Buchan's portrayal of Ann is especially significant in that it is an expression of religious struggle from someone who is otherwise a dutiful daughter of the manse.

In contrast, in *Eliza for Common,* Maggie Henry, a parishioner in Eliza's father's church, is depicted as being much more enthusiastic about discussing her personal faith. In a conversation with Eliza after an evangelical meeting, she comments "My! He was grand. I go' a second baptism the night".[392] The "second baptism" referred to by Maggie is likely the sort of baptism Andrew Michael Jones describes in the conclusion of his book *The Revival of Evangelicalism Mission and Piety in the Victorian Church of Scotland*: "holiness teaching maintained that victory over sin was attainable for every Christian man and woman who underwent a post-conversion experience of spiritual baptism."[393] This holiness teaching was also strongly linked to ideas around purity. Eliza later in a conversation with her father despairs of Maggie's insistence that she has had a second baptism. Her despair is likely the result of a mixture of things. As a daughter of the manse, Eliza is depicted as having a good knowledge of the doctrines of the church and her instinct here seems to deny the spiritual experience which Maggie has had in favour of affirming orthodoxy. It may also reflect her general attitudes towards Maggie – just prior to this incident, Eliza visited Maggie's mother

[391] Harry Reid, *Outside Verdict : An Old Kirk in a New Scotland* (Edinburgh : Saint Andrew Press, 2002), 42–43.
[392] Douglas, *Eliza For Common*.
[393] Andrew Michael Jones, *The Revival of Evangelicalism: Mission and Piety in the Victorian Church of Scotland*, *The Revival of Evangelicalism* (Edinburgh University Press, 2022), 199.

to check up on Maggie as a result of Maggie's poor attendance at Bible Class. In the conversation with Maggie's mother, it becomes apparent that Maggie missed bible class to spend time with her boyfriend. Eliza's despair is likely because of the conflict between Maggie's enthusiasm at the meeting but the lack of it carrying through into her life outside the meeting. It is also perhaps despair born out of personal feelings of discomfort towards the sort of spiritual experiences which took place at evangelical revival meetings. Here, there are echoes of Jane Findlater's depiction of her titular character Rachel Chesney, daughter of the Easter Hithe manse in *Rachel* (1899). Rachel, like Eliza, is sceptical of those who profess to have had charismatic experiences. Rachel comments that Mrs Creame, one of her father's parishioners, is "a little like myself, I think. She has never gone through any "experiences," and that's why she has such a refreshing grip on things temporal".[394] The scepticism about spiritual experiences depicted by Anna Buchan and Jane Findlater likely subverts readers' expectations about daughters of the manse, who in public likely appeared to be devout believers and enthusiastic about revivals and religious experiences. It also indicates that there were class distinctions regarding attitudes towards spiritual experiences. Working-class characters seem to embrace them more than middle-class characters.

Sacraments

In the Presbyterian tradition to which Anna Buchan belonged and depicted her characters as belonging to, two sacraments were recognised – Baptism and Communion. This section will explore Anna Buchan's scant depiction of the sacrament of baptism. It will assess the possible reasons for the lack of description of baptism and what this tells us about the experience of women of the manse of baptism. It will also include discussion of Anna Buchan's depiction of the related practice of confirmation or profession of faith. The sacrament of Communion and the involvement of women in the practices that surround it will also be examined.

[394] Findlater, *Rachel*, 63.

Baptism

For a novelist who features so many children in her work, Anna Buchan's depictions of baptism are remarkably scarce. This section will begin with an exploration of the instances where Anna Buchan mentions baptism and the related communicants' class. It will go on to offer possible explanations for the brevity of the references to baptism.

Anna Buchan's first mention of baptism or christening occurs in her first daughter-of-the-manse novel *The Setons*. It comes in the course of a conversation between Elizabeth Seton and Arthur Townshend, where Elizabeth describes the challenges of being a daughter of the manse. Elizabeth describes how:

> Perhaps the most terrible experience I have had, as yet, in my ministerial career was being invited to a christening party and having to sit down in a small kitchen to a supper of tripe and kola.[395]

Tripe and kola were very much considered working-class foods in the early twentieth century. Marjory Houlihan in *Tripe: A Most Excellent Dish,* observes that tripe "has something of a 'poor' image, smacking of the 'clogs and shawl era'".[396] The "High Class Cookery book" referred to by Anna Buchan in *Ann and Her Mother* does not contain any recipes utilising tripe as an ingredient. Kola was a non-alcoholic tonic and stimulant which, in the late nineteenth century, was advertised as a temperance drink. Here, Anna Buchan is likely making a comment on the differing experiences of receiving hospitality from other women of the manse (of her own social class) and from the working class members of the Gorbals parish. Elsewhere in the Gorbals novels, Anna Buchan describes her women of the manse as being repulsed by what their parishioners are eating and the hygiene standards of their homes. In contrast the hospitality they receive from other women of the manse is generally described in favourable terms. Here in the kitchen of the poor parishioner, the hospitality is accepted but memorable for all the wrong reasons. It is her father who judges Elizabeth for her comment – he tells her off for talking a "great deal of nonsense."[397]

[395] Douglas, *The Setons*, 1917, 148.
[396] Marjory Houlihan, Roy Shipperbottom, and Lynda Brown, *Tripe: A Most Excellent Dish* (Blackawton, Totnes, Devon: Prospect Books, 2011), 95.
[397] Douglas, *The Setons*, 1917, 149.

In the above instance, the focus is on the party after the service and not the service itself. This point of focus is significant given the use of the term "ministerial career". As a woman in the United Free Church in the 1910s, Elizabeth would not have been permitted to perform the sacrament in the service itself – women were not ordained and, therefore, not permitted to administer the sacraments in the United Free Church until 1930 at the earliest. As we have seen, elsewhere in *The Setons,* Elizabeth describes herself as part of the "female clergy".[398] It seems here that Elizabeth is suggesting attending christening parties was one of the duties of the "female clergy", whereas the duties of the male clergy included administering the sacrament in the service. Anna Buchan's idea of the "female clergy" has already been discussed in the "Women of the manse in the parish" chapter, where their ministry in the parish is discussed. Here the focus is on the way in which the women of the manse had a distinctive ministry around sacramental services.

Anna Buchan's decision to depict Elizabeth Seton talking about a "christening party" is significant when it is contrasted with her depiction of Weelum Dodd's enquiry about having the "bairn bapteezed". The terms "christening" and "bapteezed" (Scots. baptised) while referring to the same act in worship have different inflections and cultural usages. Emma Menzies in *Achnachlachar* (1936) uses the terms inversely when Isabel Dewar writes about an interaction between Sandy Dewar (the minister) and a young parishioner:

> "Sandy…was going to baptise a baby…"No," answered Sandy looking down at the questioning face, "it's a christening." "Who'th getting chrithened?" went on the insatiable on, and Sandy from the height of his dignity gave the necessary information."[399]

Here "baptised" is used in the formal context while "christened" is used informally and by parishioners. Sarah Lawrence in *A Rite on the Edge The Language of Baptism and Christening in the Church of England* (2019) explores the contrasting usages of the terms "baptism" and "christening" in the Church of England context. She suggests that throughout history these words, while similar, reveal a lot about the speaker and their background. She suggests that, at least in England, "the use of *christening* continued to decline through most

[398] Ibid., 43.
[399] Menzies, *Achachlacher / by Emma L. Menzies.*, 133–34.

of the twentieth century, and *baptism* continued to be the preferred term among higher social groups, and most obviously in church circles."[400] Menzies's usage of the terms seems to reflect Lawrence's description, therefore suggesting that it is possible that Lawrence's conclusions about term usage also apply in Scotland. However, Anna Buchan's converse usage suggests that this may not be the case. Significantly, her depiction of Elizabeth's use of the term "christening" may signify that Elizabeth was a culturally aware character. When Elizabeth uses the term "christening party", it is in the context of a conversation with an English person, Arthur Townshend, so she could be modifying her use of terms to the one which would be more familiar to him. Townshend is an Anglican (though not terribly devout) who has spent much of his time overseas. Anna Buchan may also be using "christening", the unfashionable term, to amplify the terribleness of the experience. Weelum Dodds, meanwhile, through the voice of Mrs Douglas, uses "bapteezed." The depiction of a working class character using the Scots version of the term, is typical of Anna Buchan's broader use of the Scots dialect as a class marker. This is discussed in the "Servants" section of the "Women of the Manse at Home" chapter. Here, however, the use of the term "bapteezed" or "baptised" is more significant when denominational use of terminology is considered. Baptised seems to be used more often colloquially in the Presbyterian churches in Scotland, while in the Anglican church, it is a term more often used by scholars and clergy. The consistency of the use of the term "baptised" throughout the Presbyterian churches in Scotland may be a demonstration of the greater emphasis placed on education in the Scottish Presbyterian tradition. It is the use of the Scots version of the term that denotes the class and position in the church of Weelum Dodds and not the use of the term itself.

Meanwhile, the main reference to baptism in *Ann and Her Mother* occurs during Mrs Douglas's reminiscences about her initial impressions of Kirkcaple (the second parish which the Douglases served in). She reminisces how:

> One night when I reached my haven I found a tall man standing against it. I had hardly strength to gasp, 'Who are you?' and the man replied 'Weelum Dodds. I cam'

[400] Sarah Lawrence, *A Rite on the Edge: Baptism and Christening in the Church of England* (London: SCM Press, 2019), 30.

> to see the minister aboot getting' the bairn bapteezed, but the lassie wadna open the door.'[401]

In this incident, the women of the manse (Mrs Douglas and the servants) are depicted as being guilty of accidently nearly depriving a child of the parish baptism. Mrs Douglas, when she went out for an evening, had told her young servant girls to keep the chain on the manse door and not let anyone in because she wanted to protect them and the manse. Weelum Dodd then proceeded to wait in the front garden until Mr or Mrs Douglas returned. It is Weelum Dodd's persistence that means that he, in the end, does get to see the minister to organise for the baptism of his child. This incident indicates the importance of baptism to people of the parish – it is something that they are prepared to wait all night to speak to the minister about. The depiction of Weelum Dodd's asking to have his bairn baptised reflects the norms of the Presbyterian tradition at the time.

A related practice in churches which practice infant baptism is that of becoming a communicant - that is becoming a communicant member of the church and therefore being able to receive the sacrament of communion. Anna Buchan depicts one memorable incident involving a class for new communicants in *Ann and Her Mother*:

> One of the few times I ever saw Father really angry was when he was holding a class for young communicants, and we crept into the cubby-hole under the stairs, where the meter was, and *turned off the gas.* Father emerged from the study like a lion, and caught poor Jim, who had loitered. The rest of us had gained the attics and were in hiding. It must have been a great day for the young communicants.[402]

This class was for young people preparing to become communicants in the church – an important stage in their life. The fact that Ann and her siblings were willing to turn off the gas, which powered the lights in the manse, and disrupt the class indicates their mischievous disrespect towards the class and their father. This incident is based on one in Anna Buchan's own childhood which she recalls in her autobiography rehashing nearly word for word the quotation in *Ann and Her Mother*. The only difference was that in the autobiography she omits the final sentence where in the novel she suggests that it would

[401] Douglas, *Ann and Her Mother*, 64.
[402] Ibid., 110.

have been a "great day for the young communicants."[403] It seems Ann is depicted in in the novel as less ashamed of the incident than Anna Buchan was in real life.

Communion

The most expansive description of communion in Anna Buchan's novels can be found in *Ann and Her Mother*. Anna Buchan's novels focus on the experience of the women of the manse during the communion seasons in the various churches in which their minister husbands officiate and demonstrate differing experiences, depending on whether it was held in a city or a more rural parish. Her depiction of the sacrament of Communion is significant since she does not depict the actual sacrament. Instead, she focusses her attention on the manse routine surrounding it.

The first mention of Communion occurs in the midst of a discussion between Ann and her Mother about a cookery book:

> "Why do I connect that cookery book with Communions?"
>
> Mrs Douglas laughed. "Because at Communion times, when we had strange ministers assisting, we had puddings out of that book, at least expurgated editions of them."[404]

This cookery book was acquired by Mrs Douglas during her time preparing for her marriage to Mr Douglas. It seems that it was as invaluable to her, in her role as wife of the manse, as commentaries would have been for her minister husband. A friend of her mother's took her to Edinburgh to get some lessons in high class cooking, for it was thought that such lessons would stand her in good stead as a wife of the manse. While Mr Seton went to theological college in training to be a minister, Mrs Douglas went to cooking classes and meetings with other wives of the manse to train for her vocation as wife of the manse. Where Mr Douglas was taught by eminent theologians, Mrs Douglas was taught by renowned housekeepers and wives of the manse. It is noted earlier in that passage that Mrs Douglas attended meetings of ministers' wives during assembly week – at these meetings, wives of renowned

[403] Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*, 25.
[404] Douglas, *Ann and Her Mother*, 38.

ministers would give talks on useful subjects for ministers' wives such as how to make good coffee.[405] While the depiction does affirm conservative traditional views on the separate spheres of work for women and men of the manse (women being responsible for the domestic, while men were responsible for the public), it does raise the profile of the role of the wife of the manse. Anna Buchan's depiction raises it to a vocation in its own right, in parallel with that of ministry for men. It was a vocation which required training and the acquisition of books. Ann and Mrs Douglas remember how the cookery book was brought out as a guide for their role during communion seasons. It was a solemn occasion, which required the best hospitality for visiting ministers. While these ministers provided the congregation with the bread of life, the women of the manse provided them with good food and accommodation.

Later in the same novel, Anna Buchan develops her depiction of the connection between communion time and hospitality for her women of the manse. She depicts Mrs Douglas reminiscing about the contrast between her experience in Kirkcaple and Glasgow. Mrs Douglas comments:

> I missed in Glasgow the constant interchange of hospitality that we had in Kirkcaple. For instance, when your father exchanged with another minister it was always a question of staying the week-end; and, if the minister who came to help at the Communion was a friend, his wife (if he had one) was always invited with him…In a big city everything is different. Ministers came to preach, but we only saw them for a few minutes in the vestry; they had no time to come out to us for a meal.[406]

Here, Anna Buchan makes a strong connection between Communion and hospitality. This may reveal a distinctive experience for women of the manse. For these women, the hospitality they offered visiting ministers and their families involved them more than the sacrament itself. This is an element of life her non-manse family readers likely would be unaware of. For them, Communion probably would be remembered as the highly formalised worship service in the church. In contrast, the women of the manse would remember the routine of offering hospitality to visiting manse families and receiving that hospitality

[405] Ibid., 39.
[406] Ibid., 147.

themselves. However, this hospitality, both given and received, was more the sort of middle-class hospitality associated with housekeeping than the radical hospitality Jesus demonstrated through his life. Their hospitality was restricted to fellow ministers and their families not to the poor and outcast in the community. It was more those in rural charges who gave and received this domestic hospitality. Life in city parishes was far more rushed and the women did not have the same opportunities to provide hospitality to visiting ministers. It is likely that the sadness in Mrs Douglas was the result of her feeling like her ministry at communion time was being diminished. Women of the manse in city parishes are depicted as side-lined and their hospitality refused in the rush of a busy city ministry.

It was not just other ministers and their families who received hospitality from the women of the manse during the communion season. Ann and her Mother remember how:

> "It was at Kirkcaple we had Elders' Suppers, wasn't it. Mother - never in Glasgow?"
>
> "Only in Kirkcaple. They were held after the November Communions to purge the roll."
>
> "*Purge the roll,"* Ann murmured to herself; "of all delicious phrases!"[407]

To purge the roll meant to perform an audit of the Congregational Roll which was the list of communicant members of the church. It seems that it was the responsibility of the women of the manse to provide the hospitality for the Elders' suppers – this took the form of a meal and conversation over the meal. This seems as though it was a way of the women of the manse ministering to the Elders, who had ministered to the congregation in preparing them for communion. The Lord's Supper was the domain of the Minister and his Elders while the Elders' Supper was the domain of the women of the manse.

Where Anna Buchan depicts Communion in relation to the domestic realities of Communion seasons for the women of the manse, her brother John Buchan depicts Communion (or refusal of) in *Witch Wood* (1927) in relation to theological warfare against the devil. Buchan depicts David Sempil, the minister of Woodilee, declaring "that till there was a general confession and repentance there would be no Communion in the parish of Woodilee, for those who sat down at the Lord's Table would be eating and drinking damnation to

[407] Ibid., 95.

themselves."[408] Here there is a complete contrast in tone in describing Communion. Buchan's attention is firmly on the congregation in his depiction of Communion, whereas Anna Buchan's attention is focussed on providing hospitality to those celebrating it. Like his sister, Buchan's depiction of Communion is scarce and there is only one mention of it in the course of a whole novel depicting the life of church people.

The Buchan family's scarce description or depiction of Communion contrasts with their contemporary Marion Lochhead, who in her 1934 novel *Anne Dalrymple,* depicts many Eucharist services both in the Scottish Episcopal Church and the Church of England. Lochhead depicts the contrasting levels of frequency of celebration of the Eucharist between Ninian Dalrymple (Anne's father) in the Scottish Episcopal Church and his brother-in-law Dr Austin in the Church of England, noting that "for the first time since her Confirmation Anne must forgo that early hour of peace and worship and Communion."[409] This depiction is set in the 1830s, significantly earlier than the work of Anna Buchan, at the time when the Tractarian movement was beginning in the Church of England. However, the frequency of the Scottish Episcopal Church celebrating the Eucharist was something that continued to the time when the Buchans and Lochhead were writing. Anna Buchan's scarce depiction of the sacraments is reflective of her Presbyterian upbringing, where the sacrament of Communion was celebrated at most twice in the year.

Anna Buchan was writing in the time just prior to the debates on ordination of women in the United Free Church. Her novels affirm and promote the ministry of women as wives and daughters of the manse. Her earlier women of the manse novels *The Setons* and *Ann and Her Mother* read in this context are a defence of a distinctive ministry of women in the manse as wives and daughters. In both of those novels, she uses the terms "female clergy" and "ministry" in relation to the work of women of the manse. This ministry is one of hospitality and philanthropy. In the debates about the ordination of women, the strongest female voices opposing ordination of women were wives of the manse who believed women could not be ministers due to the conflict of duties. In an article in the April 1931

[408] John Buchan, *Witch Wood* (Boston ; New York : Houghton Mifflin Company, 1927), 120.
[409] Lochhead, *Anne Dalrymple / by Marion C. Lochhead.*, 60.

Life and Work entitled "Elders, but not Ministers" an Elderly Minister's Wife comments on the practical difficulties of combining womanhood and ministry:

> A married woman's first duty is to her family and household. Very few stipends in the Church of Scotland are such as to allow a woman to hand over the care of her children to others, even did her conscience permit it.[410]

This article was one in a series of articles debating the possibility of opening ordination to the Ministry of Word and Sacrament to women in the Church of Scotland. Anna Buchan's novels therefore could be read as a supportive companion to the voice of the above elderly minister's wife as a form of subtle resistance to ordination of women to Ministry of Word and Sacrament. Alternatively, they could be read as planting seeds of affirmation of the distinctive ministry of women of the manse in her readers.

Conclusion

In this chapter I have argued that Anna Buchan's depiction of women of the manse's experiences of worship are significant since they reveal a variety of facets of the female experience of worship in the early twentieth century Presbyterian church in Scotland. While some of the experiences, including supervising children, would have been an experience shared by many women at worship, other experiences would have been reserved for women of the manse, such as advising the minister on the intimations to be delivered. Her depiction of the diverse range of devotional practices offers the reader an insight into the spiritual life of women of the manse. It reveals a shift in practices between women of the manse of differing ages. The older generation setting aside more time to their devotional practices while the younger generation tended towards practices which did not take up as much of their time. As has been argued, Anna Buchan's depiction of Eliza Laidlaw's prayer life reveals the evolution of a young woman's prayer life from that of a child to that of an adult.

[410] An Elderly Minister's Wife, 'Elders, but Note Ministers', *Life and Work The Record of The Church of Scotland*, April 1931.

In terms of Anna Buchan's development of her idea of the "female clergy" the analysis of her women-of-the-manse's involvement in the worship of the church has revealed two important features of their contribution to worship. Firstly, Anna Buchan's portrayal of Elizabeth Seton and Mrs Laidlaw's leadership of small acts of worship is significant as it reveals that missionary committee meetings and pastoral visits were places that women could lead worship in the time before ordination was opened to them. In this chapter I have argued that this leadership of worship especially within the context of pastoral care had a particularly feminine inflection in terms of appropriate material to draw on. Secondly, her linking of hospitality with the sacraments in the lives of women-of-the-manse suggests that this is a distinctive feature of the ministry of Anna Buchan's women-of-the-manse characters. Her scarce depiction of references to baptism indicate its routine nature in the lives of women of the manse, while the references which she does give suggest that the occasion is a time where the idea of the ministry of women of the manse is connected with accepting the hospitality provided by parishioners. Her references to communion, meanwhile, develop a link between hospitality and communion for the women of the manse. Anna Buchan's women of the manse ministered to the visiting ministers by providing hospitality in the form of good food and a bed for the night if needed. Her depiction of this work develops her description elsewhere of the idea of the female clergy as having a special role (at least in rural parishes) in the communion season. Therefore, while Anna Buchan primarily develops her description of what the role of the female clergy is through her description of their work in the parish during the week, their activities on Sundays and in particular sacramental Sundays also play a significant part.

Chapter 5: Women of the Manse at Home

Introduction

Juliet Shields argues that "When Douglas's characters learn to appreciate and to create instances of everyday beauty, they become reconciled to the ordinariness of middle-class, evangelical Scottish society, which they realize is not so ordinary after all."[411] This chapter will explore Anna Buchan's depiction of the ordinary lives of the women of the manse at home to gain an understanding of what Anna Buchan viewed as ordinary – examining the extent to which her depiction differed from trends of the time. Debbie Sly observes that "women are the subjects of her [Anna Buchan's] books, and their object is not the singular "pleasure" of sex, but the multiple, apparently trivial, pleasures of gardening, house-keeping, shopping, tea-parties, and above all, reading and talking about books".[412] The ""pleasure" of sex" described by Sly refers to grand romance. Here in this chapter, I will explore Anna Buchan's depiction of women of the manse engaged in these typical middle-class activities identified by Sly. I will begin by exploring her depiction of housekeeping and the management of servants before exploring the activities women of the manse engaged in during their leisure time. I will also explore Anna Buchan's depiction of the lives of the often-overlooked servants of the manse – all of whom were women. Throughout this chapter I will critically explore Robert Crawford's claim that "this daughter of the manse [Anna Buchan] presents home as a feminized place of struggled-for safety, a domestic sanctuary."[413]

Housekeeping or Management of the household finances

At the time when Anna Buchan was writing her women-of-the-manse novels one of the major debates in the Church of Scotland was the standardisation of stipends. Finlay Macdonald notes that a major difference between the Church of Scotland and the United Free Church "lay in the fact that many of the Church of Scotland ministers received at least

[411] Shields, 'Scottish Modernism and Middlebrow Aesthetics', July 2021.
[412] Sly, 'Pink Sugary Pleasures', 2001, 7.
[413] Robert Crawford, *Scotland's Books: The Penguin History of Scottish Literature* (London ; New York: Penguin Books, 2007), 529.

part of their stipends from teinds, the revenues to which the church was entitled from the owners of land."[414] It was following the passing of the Church of Scotland (Properties and Endowments) Act in, 1925 that a process of standardising teind stipends began.[415] Prior to that, one of the issues the United Free Church faced after the 1900 union, was how to amalgamate the two different systems of supplementing the stipends of the ministers of the Free Church and the United Presbyterians. Within the Free Church, ministers faced similar issues of disparity of income as their contemporaries in the established Church of Scotland. Anna Buchan's women of the manse novels are firmly situated in the pre-union United Free Church. In *Ann and Her Mother,* Mrs Douglas remarks "People may talk about union and one great Church, but when we are all one I'm afraid there may be a lack of interest – a falling off in endeavour."[416] Here it seems that Anna Buchan is demonstrating that in the early 1920s union between the United Free Church and the Church of Scotland was something that was discussed but had not yet come to pass.

John Sawkins shows that, with the exception of the year 1843 (the year of the Disruption and foundation of the Free Church), there was a significant disparity between the average ministerial stipend and the highest ministerial stipend in the Free Church of Scotland and throughout the time of Anna Buchan's childhood the disparity was at its greatest.[417] In 1888, the year that the Buchan family moved to the manse of John Knox Church in the Gorbals, Glasgow, the typical ministerial stipend was £376 and the highest ministerial stipend was £1137 – a difference of £761.[418] It is likely that John Buchan's stipend was around the level of the typical ministerial stipend, or perhaps a little below, given the level of poverty in the parish. The differing financial situations which Anna Buchan depicts her manse families experiencing highlights the issues around the question of standardisation of stipend. Some of her manse families are depicted as being fairly comfortably off (particularly those in Glasgow), whereas others are depicted as struggling financially (particularly those in the Priorsford series). In her novels, it is clear that it is the women of the manse who bear the

[414] Finlay Macdonald, *From Reform to Renewal: Scotland's Kirk Century by Century* (Edinburgh: Saint Andrew Press, 2017), 169.
[415] Ibid., 169–70.
[416] Douglas, *Ann and Her Mother*, 74.
[417] John W. Sawkins, 'Ministerial Stipends in the Free Church of Scotland: Edinburgh 1843–1900', *Scottish Church History* 41, no. 1 (1 June 2012): tbl. 9.
[418] Ibid., 110.

brunt of the financial issues – they are the ones responsible for controlling the family's finances. Anna Buchan's novels can be read as propaganda in favour of standardising the ministers' stipend to a standard which allowed manse families not to struggle to maintain a lifestyle consistent with that of the middle classes, to which manse families were expected to belong. As discussed in the "Literary Context" chapter of this thesis, Anna Buchan's readers were people like herself – middle class women who either had money themselves, or were married to men who had. It was therefore suggested that they could do something about the situation.

Mrs Macdonald, in *Penny Plain,* describes the struggles she faced in maintaining the household of two adults and four boys on her minister husband's stipend of £250:

> Living has doubled. I couldn't manage as things are now, and I'm a good manager, though I says it as shouldn't…. The fight I've had all my life nobody will ever know. Now that we have plenty, I can talk about it. I never hinted it to anybody when we were struggling through; indeed, we washed our faces and anointed our heads and appeared not unto men to fast! The clothes and the boots and the butcher's bills![419]

Anna Buchan depicts here the challenges the women of the manse faced in maintaining the living standards of their family on such a small income. Mrs Pember-Reeves in the Fabian report on poverty and infant mortality in London, *Round about a pound a week,* suggests that, in 1913, the range of income which was considered typical for a middle-class man was between £500 and £2000.[420] Therefore it would have been striking to Anna Buchan's middle-class readers how low Mr Macdonald's stipend was.

The example of Mrs Macdonald also shows how well the women of the manse maintained a mask of coping in difficult times. Mrs Macdonald's words are echoed by an anonymous minister's wife in the February 1928 issue of *The record of the home and foreign mission work of the United Free Church of Scotland.* In her article "More about Life in the Manse", the anonymous minister's wife bemoans that:

> For the past three years the Central Fund has worked hard to procure the minimum of £300. This sum, however much it may seem to some people, is altogether

[419] O. Douglas, 'Penny Plain', in *People Like Ourselves*, 1st ed. (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1938), 264.
[420] Pember Reeves, *Round about a Pound a Week*, 23.

> insufficient. Frankly speaking, life in many manses is nothing but one of genteel poverty, bravely hidden, for the highest of all reasons – love of the work. Manses are expected to keep up a certain standard; where there is a small family, with the strictest economy on all hands and at all times, this can be managed; but where the family is large, the question is how ends can be made to meet. The constant worry and strain is a great hinderance to both minister and wife.[421]

Given the extent to which the issues faced by women of the manse maintaining their household on insufficient stipends is a theme that runs throughout Anna Buchan's work, it seems it was not just a concern for ministers and their wives. It was a concern which was felt by children of the manse too. John Baillie (1886-1960) recalls his mother successfully maintaining a similar mask when faced with raising three boys on the stipend of her husband, "who had never enjoyed more than the minimum ministerial stipend of the day, and who died so soon after marriage, had left her with only the most exiguous of incomes".[422]

It says a lot about the pressures that Mrs Macdonald was under earlier in her life that when she advises Jean Jardine what to do with a small fortune, she commends Jean's idea to set up a fund for minsters on small salaries. She comments that it would "ease things a little for a worn-out wife".[423] This suggestion is perhaps partially inspired by the example of Baroness Burdett Coutts whom Anna Buchan, in a talk on "Women Philanthropists", praised, noting "the needs of the Church to which she has been a most merciful benefactor".[424] The sentiments expressed by Mrs Macdonald are echoed and taken further by Mrs Norman Sargant (a daughter and wife of the manse) speaking at the Wesleyan Conference on July 17 1920 (the same year that *Penny Plain* was published). Mrs Norman Sargant is recorded as saying:

[421] Minister's Wife, 'More about Life in the Manse', *The Record of the Home and Foreign Mission Work of the United Free Church of Scotland.*, February 1928.
[422] D. M. Baillie, *The Theology of the Sacraments, and Other Papers / Donald M. Baillie ; with a Biographical Essay by John Baillie.* (London: Faber, 1957), 17.
[423] Douglas, 'Penny Plain', 267.
[424] Buchan, 'Women Philanthropists', 12.

> that their sons were being deterred from entering the ministry by the existing condition of things. She had heard more than one minister exclaim "I would rather see my boy dead than he should go through what I have gone through lately."[425]

While it is possible that this situation was unique to the Wesleyans and England it seems likely that it was the case in other denominations and places including the United Free Church in Scotland. Mrs Sargant's comment was preceded by another regarding the ridiculousness of a denomination's ministers struggling so badly when it counted amongst its members several millionaires. While Callum Brown argues the peak of the involvement of the wealthy businessmen including the chrome manufacturer Lord Overtoun and the merchant and head of shipping company Sir Michael Connel in the life of the Free Church of Scotland occurred in the 1880s, it is likely that people of similar wealth remained in a less active capacity in the United Free Church of the 1920s.[426] Thus, it would be equally ridiculous in the United Free Church that Anna Buchan is writing about for its ministers and manse families to be struggling so much when there were wealthy members who could be giving more to support the church at large.

It seems that an extra £50 in a stipend was enough to make the difference between a struggle to make ends meet and to be comfortable. The Lamberts, manse family in Kirkmeikle in Fife, in *The Proper Place* (1926) are described as having:

> £300 a year to live on, and it shows how little money really matters, for they are absolutely happy. They have everything that any reasonable being could desire, a house where love is, good health, good books and a good fire. Also, by a merciful dispensation of Providence, they have a small servant called Betha, a wise and virtuous child, and she and Mrs. Lambert between them cook, clean and look after the two children.[427]

However, it must be noted that the Lamberts had two fewer children than the MacDonalds, so they had fewer mouths to feed and generally lower household expenses. This highlights the disparity of experiences of families reliant on the stipend - a smaller household on a

[425] 'Ministers' Stipends', *Hull Daily Mail*, 17 July 1920, British Library Newspapers.
[426] Callum G. Brown, *Religion and Society in Scotland since 1707* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1997), 126–27.
[427] O. Douglas, *The Proper Place* (London ; Edinburgh: Thomas Nelson and Sons, Ltd, 1929), 155.

higher stipend could live comfortably within the means provided by the stipend, whilst a larger family on a lower stipend could struggle significantly.

In *Ann and Her Mother*, Anna Buchan describes how Ann's mother became a "sternly practical" because Ann's father was such a "dreamer" and how it was Ann's mother who was the one responsible for managing the family finances. Ann's mother describes "If we had both been alike we would have wandered hand-in-hand into the workhouse."[428] Jane Findlater in *The Story of a Mother,* perhaps reflecting on her own experiences growing up in the Lochearnhead Free Church manse, reverses this scenario. Mrs Hosëason, wife of the Carradale manse when Lord Ruston (the local landowner) offers to take her son to the continent at his expense, comments "Ah, well; but why should we not pay our son's expenses after all? I am afraid I had never thought about that practical side of the question, but you see my husband is so business-like."[429] Ultimately, Mrs Hosëason accepts her husband's judgement on the question and refuses to let Lord Ruston pay. Mr Hosëason, is business-like in that he controls the family finances and budgets. However, Anna Buchan's language is echoed, although in some ways subverted, in Noel Streatfeild's *Parson's Nine* (1932). Streatfeild describes Catherine Churston's (wife of the parson, David Churston) attempt to explain to her husband her frustrations: "But how to make a saint who sees all the glory of life in "The daily round, the common task," grasp the point of view of the ordinary person?"[430] It seems that it is a common trope – the dreamer minister and the practical wife who focusses on the mundane day to day running of things. Just as it was the women in the parish who were responsible for the fundraising in the church (even if it was the Deacons' Court or finance committee who was ultimately responsible for the management of the church funds), it was the women of the manse who were responsible for the management of the manse purse-strings. Anna Buchan, in her novels, depicts the women as being or becoming highly prudent in their approach to managing the finances of the family, to keep the family afloat on the (often low) ministers' stipend.

Elizabeth Seton, daughter of the manse, in her mother's absence, takes responsibility for the family finances and the paying of bills. Like Mrs Macdonald, she is depicted as having

[428] Douglas, *Ann and Her Mother*, 51.
[429] Jane Helen Findlater, *The Story of a Mother* (London: J. Nisbet, 1902), 104, http://digital.nls.uk/128693600.
[430] Noel Streatfeild, *Parson's Nine* (Edinburgh: Greyladies, 2014), 30.

financial struggles, although hers seem to be more the result of poor management. She comments: "How bills do come home to roost! I wish I had paid this at the time. Now I must write a cheque— and my account so lean and shrunken. What an offence bills are!"[431] This may be indicative of her relative inexperience in managing the household finances. Here she does not seem to have developed the organisational skills yet to manage the household accounts as carefully as Mrs Macdonald seems to have.

In *Ann and Her Mother,* Mrs Douglas describes how she was forced into taking control of the family finances:

> Not that Mark spent money on himself—bless him—but nobody ever asked him for help and was refused; and he did like to buy things for me. I found I just had to take control of the money. Not at first, of course; it came to it by degrees. And your father was only too glad; money was never anything but a nuisance to him. I don't think I'm inordinately fond of money either.[432]

Here it is clear that, while Mrs Douglas gradually became competent in maintaining the family finances, it was not something that came naturally to her. This could, however, be an indication of the discomfort she experienced having to control the family purse strings because of her minister husband's disinterest and inability. It is likely that Elizabeth's control of the family finances is for similar reasons; her minister father is depicted as needing reminders not to give away all the money he is given to the poor and leave himself without a bus fare. As Elizabeth and her father prepare to go out to do their work in the parish, Elizabeth remarks:

> "Now don't try to save money by walking in the rain ; that's poor economy. And oh! have you the money for Mrs. Morrison?"
>
> "No, I have not. That's well minded. Get me half a sovereign, like a good girl."
>
> Elizabeth brought the money.

[431] Douglas, *The Setons*, 52.
[432] Douglas, *Ann and Her Mother*, 51.

> "We would need to be made of half sovereigns. Remember Mrs. Morrison is only one of many. It isn't that I grudge it to the poor dears, but we aren't millionaires exactly."[433]

Here, Elizabeth is clearly responsible for managing the household finances and keeping her father's generosity in check. As a daughter of the manse, she understands the needs of the parishioners, who are significantly poorer than her own family, but is also aware of her own family's financial position – that their own money needs careful stewardship and should not all be given away to the poor. She is also aware of the health of her family and how her father's potential poor health would impact the household economics (as well as perhaps those of the church).

The careful stewardship of personal finances, in terms of philanthropic causes, was something which Anna Buchan also reflected on outside of her fictional writings. In an unpublished talk script on "Women Philanthropists", she reflects on the enterprises of Florence Nightingale, Sister Dora and Baroness Burdett Coutts. In the case of the latter, she discusses how Baroness Burdett Coutts used her wealth to improve the lives of the poor and needy both at home and abroad. Anna Buchan praises her for her careful setting up of her various enterprises, observing:

> So full is the record of good works accomplished by that honoured and kindly woman Baroness Burdett Coutts during the past half century, that to go over but the most important of these would be to compile a list of some of the noblest charitable schemes which England is proud to have fulfilled, by the aid of one of her largest hearted philanthropists.[434]

This admiration of the work of Baroness Burdett Coutts and the others reflects Eve Colpus's description in *Female Philanthropy in the Interwar World: Between Self and Other* (2018) of the way in which Anna Buchan's contemporaries, English missionary and writer Emily Kinnaird (1855-1947) and first female General of the Salvation Army Evangeline Booth (1865-1950), related to their philanthropist heroines. Colpus observes that Kinnaird "regretted the anxiety and reluctance of young women to forge personal attachment to

[433] Douglas, *The Setons*, 1917, 59.
[434] Buchan, 'Women Philanthropists', 12.

female religious leaders in the ways that she and others of her generation had done with British evangelical women such as Catherine Marsh and Elizabeth Garnett."[435] Likewise, in the chapter on "Knowledge", Colpus assesses the ways in which female philanthropists developed and contributed to knowledge of the theory and practice of philanthropy. She discusses the way in which women philanthropists of Evangeline Booth's generation developed an iconography which celebrated "pioneers of modern medical, scientific and philanthropic practices, including Josephine Butler, St Elizabeth of Hungary, Elizabeth Fry, Florence Nightingale, Edith Cavell and Marie Curie."[436] Colpus goes on to argue that "in the interwar years women's organisations consciously reverenced past female luminaries."[437] Anna Buchan, in her talk script, demonstrates both the personal attachment described by Kinnaird and the admiration of heroines Colpus associates with Booth and the interwar years. In Anna Buchan's admiration of Baroness Burdett Coutts, she is showing an appreciation for Victorian models of women's philanthropy in line with her contemporaries.

The struggles Anna Buchan depicts her women of the manse facing in managing the household finances on an often meagre stipend indicate that for them the manse was not a sanctuary. It was a place of careful watching of the family expenditure making the stipend stretch to accommodate a lifestyle that it was insufficient to maintain. In this respect Anna Buchan reveals to her middle- and upper-class readers the challenges faced by women of the manse in maintaining an equivalent lifestyle on an income which was below average for that class.

Servants

Manse families, in common with other middle-class families of the time, were among those of sufficient status and means in society to employ live-in servants. In the late nineteenth and early twentieth century, it was seen as a mark of being middle class to have a servant.[438] The middle and upper classes tended to judge each other's wealth on the number and level of experience of servants they were able to employ. John Stevenson, in

[435] Eve Colpus, *Female Philanthropy in the Interwar World: Between Self and Other* (London: Bloomsbury Academic, 2018), loc. 158.3/770, https://nls.ldls.org.uk/welcome.html?ark:/81055/vdc_100052020056.0x000001.
[436] Ibid., loc. 202.9/770.
[437] Ibid.
[438] Hugh McLeod, 'White Collar Values and the Role of Religion', in *The Lower Middle Class in Britain, 1870-1914 / Edited by Geoffrey Crossick.*, ed. Geoffrey Crossick (London: Croom Helm, 1977), 63.

British Society 1914-1945, quotes a middle-class woman in the early 1930s saying "I remember girls at school judging each other's wealth by the number of maids each had. And sometimes, I suspect, inventing an extra one to impress their friends. We had two."[439] Anna Buchan depicts most of her manse families as being comfortably middle class – able to employ at least one fairly experienced servant. Anna Buchan's own family had two servants, although by 1902, it seemed they would have to give up at least one of them. This was the position until John Buchan, then working as Lord Milner's Private Secretary in South Africa, agreed to pay the wages of his parents' two servants.[440] When the novels are taken chronologically in terms of time setting, it can be argued that, to a certain extent, there was a gradual reduction in the means to support servants and the availability of servants. This suggests that there was a waning of servant keeping in the interwar period. This section will begin looking at how the women of the manse managed their servants before giving attention to Anna Buchan's depiction of the lives of these servants.

Management of Servants

All of Anna Buchan's manse families had servants to assist them and the responsibility of managing them largely fell to the women of the manse. As John Stevenson notes in the above quote the number of servants a family could afford to keep was a marker of the wealth and social status of the family. This section will examine Anna Buchan's portrayal of her women of the manse managing their varying numbers of servants, it will assess their struggles in recruitment and their attitudes towards the servants they kept. It will also assess the extent to which servant keeping was a class marker for manse families.

Anna Buchan, in her earliest women of the manse novel, *The Setons,* depicts the Seton family being sufficiently wealthy to keep two experienced servants: Marget, a very experienced cook who had been with the family for a long time, and Ellen, a younger housemaid. To contextualise the parish in which Mr Seton serves, Anna Buchan depicts the Thomsons (a family which is well off by the standards of the parish) as having one inexperienced servant Annie. By the time of *Eliza for Common,* Anna Buchan's manse family, in a similar parish to that of *The Setons*, is depicted as having trouble finding a suitable servant. Anna Buchan portrays it as being the responsibility of Mrs Laidlaw to manage and

[439] Stevenson, *British Society, 1914-45*, 345.
[440] John Buchan, 'John Buchan Fonds, 2110-1-11-5', 3 October 1902, Queen's University Archives.

recruit the servants.[441] In no place is Mr Laidlaw depicted as bearing any responsibility for the servants – during the time of Mrs Laidlaw's illness it falls to Eliza, as the daughter, to manage Mary the servant.

In the opening chapters, Anna Buchan describes the issues the Laidlaws had following the departure of their initial servants Maggie and Annie who were "sisters from Arbroath, who had been nineteen years with the Laidlaws."[442] Following the War, the Laidlaws were only able to afford one general servant instead of the two they had before the war. Maggie and Annie's replacement, Martha, is described as "lazy, she was pert, she was dirty, she objected to going twice to church, made excuses for not coming up to prayers, and left asserting that if she stayed any longer she would be a "fair missionary".[443] This list of poor qualities reflects typical complaints of mistresses of the time, though perhaps more specifically complaints of mistresses of manses. Mistresses of middle-class homes often tested their servants on the sermon to determine whether they had attended church. [444] It was the expectation of women of the manse that their servants would attend church. Martha's replacement, Mary from Skye, was a significant improvement. She was "twenty-eight and a good plain cook, and had been in a manse in Portree for five years."[445] Anna Buchan's description of her is revealing and representative of servants in cities like Glasgow. Those servants from rural areas were in general thought by mistresses easier to manage. Lucy Delap in her chapter "Servant keepers and the Management of Servants" explains that this was because they had "fewer resources and social networks to fall back on."[446] The former was certainly true in the case of Mary in *Eliza for Common* but in terms of social networks to support her she had the support of family members in Glasgow and her church community.

It is significant that it is Mrs Laidlaw who is depicted as being responsible for the recruitment of servants and not Mr Laidlaw. This is reflective of the responsibilities held by middle-class women of time – they were responsible for the recruitment and management

[441] Douglas, *Eliza For Common*, 78–79.
[442] Ibid., 78.
[443] Ibid., 79.
[444] Lucy Delap, 'Servant-Keepers and the Management of Servants', in *Knowing Their Place* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011), 72.
[445] Douglas, *Eliza For Common*, 79.
[446] Delap, 'Servant-Keepers and the Management of Servants', 77.

of servants.[447] Of the novels which feature women of the manse, it is *Eliza for Common* which depicts the transition to a reduced number of servants and the difficulties related to the recruitment of servants most explicitly. Anna Buchan describes how, when Martha left the Laidlaws, "Mrs Laidlaw had to throw herself on the tender mercies of a servants' registry, a place she had never before had occasion to visit."[448] *Eliza for Common* is set during the 1920s in the years following the First World War. Beddoe notes that at this time:

> The shortage of domestic servants, labelled by the middle class the "servant problem", had become acute: middle-class women, who had been prepared to put up with the lack of help during the war, were no longer willing to do so. It was considered an outrage that unemployed women would be living it up on their donations whilst mistresses struggled, servantless, at home.[449]

This was the time when many women who prior to the war would have worked in domestic service were refusing to return to that work.[450] The clash between the middle-class women's demand for servants and the working class women's refusal to undertake this work resulted in legislation being introduced which barred women from unemployment benefit if they refused to work in domestic service. This resulted in the stereotype of the workshy servant woman becoming popular – Martha, in an ironic subversion of her name conforms to this stereotype, while Mary does not. Martha in Luke 10:38-42 is portrayed as the one who was too busy doing housework to sit and listen to Jesus.

In contrast with the situation the Laidlaws faced in *Eliza for Common,* the Douglas family in *Ann and Her Mother* and the Setons in *The Setons* both had a significantly easier time managing their servants, though this is because their servants were established members of the manse household. *The Setons* had Marget and Ellen, both of whom were highly competent and reliable. In *Ann and Her Mother,* Mrs Douglas comments how "Both she [Marget] and Ellie were ideal servants for a minister's house; they were both so discreet. No tales were ever carried by them to or from the Manse."[451] Her comment suggests that there

[447] Delap, 'Servant-Keepers and the Management of Servants'.
[448] Douglas, *Eliza For Common*, 79.
[449] Deirdre Beddoe, *Back to Home and Duty: Women between the Wars, 1918-1939* (London ; San Francisco: Pandora, 1989), 51.
[450] Ibid., 51.
[451] Douglas, *Ann and Her Mother*, 85.

were special requirements of discretion for servants of the manse. This is understandable given the confidential conversations which would take place there. Elsewhere in *Ann and Her Mother,* meetings of elders are described as taking place in the manse. Mrs Douglas's comment is also a sort of cruel irony on the part of Anna Buchan, given Marget is based on a real person. It is significant that Anna Buchan thought it acceptable to insert Marget into her novels without giving her a pseudonym or disguising her identity in any way, when all the other real people whom Anna Buchan based characters on were at least thinly veiled. This may be indicative of how Anna Buchan viewed Marget and servants more generally. In *Ann and Her Mother,* Anna Buchan seems to have regarded it as acceptable to have Mrs Douglas (based on her mother, Helen Buchan) comment "Marget and Ellie got on very well together, although they were as the poles asunder – Ellie so small and neat and gentle, Marget rather like a benevolent elephant. She is a much better looking old woman than she was a young one."[452] Here, despite not using a pseudonym, she describes Marget more harshly than in her autobiography, where she softens her description slightly. In her autobiography Anna Buchan describes Marget as "a great figure in our childhood. She was a large woman with a broad, plain face, and a most capacious and comfortable lap."[453] While Marget was considered an excellent servant because she never told tales, Anna Buchan, in her novels, tells tales about Marget.

In *The Setons,* it fell to Elizabeth to be in charge of managing the servants in the absence of her mother. As a mistress, she is depicted as fair and kind. She clearly has had to navigate the transition to being in charge of the servants, whom she had known since she was a small child. While Elizabeth is fortunate to have the dependable and loyal Marget, she is fully aware of the issues less fortunate middle-class women face in managing their servants. In an attempt to wind up a rather hypocritical pompous gentleman at a dinner party, she comments "Servants are a nuisance. What a relief it would be to have slaves!"[454] While she is clearly making a joke in bad taste, her comments echo the often tense and ambiguous relationships mistresses had with their servants. Delap argues that "The inability of servant-keeping women to manage their servants and sustain their self-identities as 'good' (liberal, firm, caring, knowledgeable) mistresses was a pressing domestic concern that dwarfed

[452] Ibid.
[453] Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*, 20.
[454] Douglas, *The Setons*, 1917, 203.

concerns over the dwindling supply of domestic workers."[455] This may reflect the sort of attitudes which lay behind Elizabeth's joke.

Buff is the youngest son of the manse, who is of primary school age in the novel. Examining his relationship with Ellen and Marget reveals the dynamic between children of the household and servants. He is forever getting into trouble and Marget is depicted as regularly telling him off – most notably for bringing stray animals, especially kittens, into the house. In Anna Buchan's depiction of this relationship, it is clear that it is Marget who has the authority. This reflects Delap's observation that servants "had some level of authority over small children."[456] There is also an incident where Buff and his friends take Marget's peg bag as to use as a prop in a game where they re-enact the Pilgrim's Progress story. Mr Seton tells Buff off and gets him to return the peg bag to Marget.[457]

It is in *Eliza for Common* that Anna Buchan gives the clearest depiction of the evolution of a child-servant relationship. Anna Buchan describes how "Mrs Laidlaw had always arranged, and often cooked, the simple meals, and Eliza and Mary were quite unaccustomed to the responsibility."[458] At least in terms of cooking, Mrs Laidlaw was normally in charge and upon her incapacitation, Eliza and Mary were considered equal in their responsibility. It is during that time that Eliza grows into responsibility for the household with particular responsibility for managing Nurse Coats who comes to care for Mrs Laidlaw during her time of illness.

Meanwhile, Ann and Mrs Douglas have a very close relationship with Marget, who has been with the family since before Ann was born. Ann and Mrs Douglas include Marget in their reminiscence sessions while Ann is writing her mother's biography – in many ways, they include her memories as equal to theirs. From the outset of the novel, Ann says to Marget "we'll need your help to decide what is to be put in. One thing, of course, *must* go in – your age."[459] Marget never gives Ann her age in the novel and therefore it never is included in the biography thus portraying Marget as having a degree of agency in the conversations and the decisions about the contents of the Ann's mother's biography.

[455] Delap, 'Servant-Keepers and the Management of Servants', 64.
[456] Ibid., 93.
[457] Douglas, *The Setons*, 1917, 85.
[458] Douglas, *Eliza For Common*, 144.
[459] Douglas, *Ann and Her Mother*, 21.

By the time of the novel, Mrs Douglas is depicted as confidently managing the house and interacting with Marget and the other servants. However, this was not always the case. Mrs Douglas when reminiscing about her first year as mistress of the Inchkeld manse, describes how "Poor Maggie Ann was very patient with her inefficient mistress, and was young enough rather to enjoy my effort to housekeep."[460] It seems being the mistress of servants was something women had to learn to do. Given Mrs Douglas was based on Mrs Buchan, she would have been seventeen at the time and making the transition from living at home with her mother being responsible for the management of servants, to being responsible for servants herself.[461] Alternatively, this depiction could be read as revealing the issues middle class women faced in managing their servants and navigating the mistress/servant relationship. Anna Buchan's depiction of Mrs Dewar (another mistress of the manse) in *Ann and Her Mother* also faithfully depicts the anxieties mistresses experienced when dealing with servants. She describes how "if the servants worried her [Mrs Dewar] she walked about saying the hymn beginning, 'Calm me, O God, and keep me calm.'"[462] However this depiction is slightly comedic and patronising.

Whilst the Setons, Douglases and the Laidlaws were all sufficiently wealthy to keep at least one live-in servant, the Brands, in *Pink Sugar,* can only afford to employ an unreliable live-out servant. The former novels are inspired by Anna Buchan's experiences of growing up in the manses in the Gorbals in the 1880s and 1890s, despite being set in the 1910s and 1920s whilst *Pink Sugar* is firmly set in the 1920s in the Borders. The reader is introduced to their servant when Rebecca Brand complains "Jeanie has never turned up this morning. I suppose she will say that her mother is ill again, but it's more likely to be the thought of the washing that has kept her away."[463] Rebecca is described as being resigned to do much of the housework such as cooking and cleaning herself. Comparing Rebecca Brand's trials with managing an unreliable servant with the life of the other women of the manse, she clearly is depicted as the worst off. Her situation is revealing of the uncertain position in society which manse families held. Rebecca's father had been minister of Muirburn before her brother took on the charge. It is unclear whether there had been a servant in the manse in

[460] Ibid., 50.
[461] Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*, 177.
[462] Douglas, *Ann and Her Mother*, 101.
[463] Douglas, 'Pink Sugar', 384.

the time of her father, though it seems unlikely given how Anna Buchan describes how the "stipend of Muirburn was small, and Ebenezer Brand, having been entirely without worldly wisdom, had married a girl as penniless as himself; but they had struggled along light-heartedly, pinching and scraping to educate their two children".[464] The trials of Rebecca Brand in managing her unreliable servant would have evoked sympathy in Anna Buchan's middle class readers, many of whom would have faced similar issues in managing their servants. Beddoe suggests that "middle-class women felt tyrannised by the new more confident type of servant who emerged after the First World War".[465] This is based on articles such as K. Gibberd's in the influential women's magazine of the time *The Woman's Leader.* In their article "Domestic Service" in the April 1, 1920 issue of the magazine, they discuss the "problem of domestic service" and note that it is in "the middle classes, the so-called backbone of the country, that this problem concerns."[466]

The disparity between the Brands and the Macdonalds in the Priorsford series and the Setons and Laidlaws in the Glasgow series highlights the range of experiences of servant keeping amongst manse families who were typically regarded as middle-class. As has been argued servant-keeping in the interwar years was a sign of social class – the greater the number of servants the higher class a family was. Her middle-class readers would largely have sympathised with Rebecca Brand's challenges and with Anna Buchan longed for the days where the experiences of the Setons and the Laidlaws were more typical.

Lives of servants

As noted above, all of the manse families in Anna Buchan's novels employ servants. These female servants assisted the women of the manse in carrying out the house work in the manse. This section will examine what their lives were like.

Of all of Anna Buchan's servants, the most fleshed out and significant character is Marget in *Ann and Her Mother.* She also appears in *The Setons* as the cook and head servant with a younger servant Ellen working under her. Anna Buchan, in *Ann and Her Mother,* depicts her as an active participant in the discussions between Ann and Mrs Douglas, as Ann writes

[464] Ibid., 382–83.
[465] Beddoe, *Back to Home and Duty*, 61.
[466] K. Gibberd, 'Domestic Service', *The Woman's Leader*, 1 April 1920, https://digital.library.lse.ac.uk/objects/lse:rag239cuy/read/single#page/1/mode/1up.

about her mother's life. Ann and her Mother are depicted as valuing Marget's input in the discussions.[467] Marget, in *Ann and Her Mother,* is based very closely on the real life Marget. Buchan's description of Marget in her autobiography, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten,* is very similar to the description of Marget in *Ann and Her Mother*; both are described as large figures, with impressive caps, long serving and touchy about their age.[468] In *The Setons,* she is described as having "been twenty-five years with *The Setons* and was not so much a servant as a sort of Grand Vizier."[469] This description is reflective of Anna Buchan's connections with India. In *Ann and Her Mother,* Marget is given a niece, Mysie, who serves the Douglas's alongside her, whereas, in the autobiography, it is unclear what family Marget has. Marget is depicted as very much an old school sort of servant who is devoted to her job and to the family which she has served faithfully for many years.

Although Marget is depicted as a faithful and devoted servant to Ann and Mrs Douglas, the housekeeper to Mr. Sharp their minister in the Green Glen is generally portrayed as workshy and lazy. When discussing the housekeeper's threats to quit her job Ann comments: "Better not tell Marget that," Ann warned her mother. "She is so sorry for Mr. Sharp that she is quite capable of going to the Manse and publicly assaulting the woman."[470] While this is not the words of Marget herself, it is clear that Marget had a strong sense from her years of service of how a manse servant should behave. The unnamed housekeeper did not meet her high standards. It also reveals that there was a degree of competition amongst servants. While the age of the housekeeper is not revealed it is likely that she was of the younger generation who in the interwar years were less committed to the work and duties of service and more capable of standing up to weak masters and mistresses. While Marget here is portrayed as strong willed, she is also dutiful and has a sense of honour regarding the work of a manse servant.

While details about what Anna Buchan's servants of the manse did in their spare time are fairly scarce, there is some description of their activities. Anna Buchan, introducing Mary from Skye in *Eliza for Common,* describes how "Every Thursday evening Mary went out to meet her Skye friends somewhere about Jamaica Bridge. On Sunday she attended Martyrs

[467] Douglas, *Ann and Her Mother*, 21.
[468] Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*, 20; Douglas, *Ann and Her Mother*, 20.
[469] Douglas, *The Setons*, 1917, 48.
[470] Douglas, *Ann and Her Mother*, 223.

morning and afternoon, but in the evening went to her own church, the Free Presbyterians."[471] From this description, it is clear that Mary did have her own social networks – she had her friends whom she met on Thursdays as well as her Free Presbyterian church community. This description also is significant when thinking about and comparing the religiosity of Mary with Martha. While Martha complained about attending church, Mary willingly went to three services – two with the manse household and one on her own. The depiction of Mary attending three services on a Sunday could be read as artistic hyperbole or suggest that manse families had higher service attendance requirements than other middle-class families. Callum Brown observes that women in domestic service "were almost uniformly required by their middle- and upper-class employers to attend church on the alternate Sundays they had "off".[472] Mary here is true to her biblical namesake, when given the freedom to choose her activities she chooses to spend her time in worship. In characterising Mary as a devout Free Presbyterian, Anna Buchan is amplifying her faithfulness to her religion but also her faithfulness as a servant.

Marget, the most fully fleshed out servant character in Anna Buchan's novels, like the family she served, was also creative. She is described in *Ann and Her Mother* as being called on by the children of the manse to say her poem. Her poem being:

> Marget Meikle is ma name,
>
> Scotland is ma nation,
>
> Harehope is ma dwelling place –
>
> A pleasant habitation.[473]

In her poem, she seems to be describing herself. Harehope given Anna Buchan's tendency to draw on Borders placenames likely refers to the area northwest of Peebles, so her describing it as her dwelling place suggests that she is from there originally. She came to the family when they were living in Kirkcaple (a pseudonym for Kirkcaldy). Thus she seems to have moved from the Borders to Fife for work, just as Mary in *Eliza for Common* is depicted as moving from Skye to the Gorbals, to serve the Laidlaw manse household. What is

[471] Douglas, *Eliza For Common*, 80.
[472] Brown and Brown, *Religion and Society in Scotland since 1707*, 199.
[473] Douglas, *Ann and Her Mother*, 85.

significant about Marget is her loyalty to the family she served, having moved with them from Kirkcaple to Glasgow then finally to Green Glen near Priorsford following Mr Douglas's death. The latter move makes clear that she is depicted as a servant of the family and not just of the manse. She was able to continue in the employment of the Douglases when they left the manse and was not expected to stay behind to serve the new incoming minister. In her loyalty to the Douglas family, her life runs counter to that of the typical servant of the time, who by the interwar years felt little sense of loyalty to the family they served – Martha, in *Eliza for Common,* is more typical in that regard.[474] This is likely sentimentalism on the part of Anna Buchan (she was very fond of the real life Marget) as the real life Marget had certainly left service and retired to Cardenden parish by 1922. Rev. James Mackay, her minister there, reminisced in a memorial article in the January 1925 edition of *The Record of the United Free Church of Scotland* about meeting her shortly after he was ordained into the parish.[475] It was highly unusual for a servant woman to have a memorial article written about them in *The Record,* most of the memorial articles published in *The Record* were for prestigious church figures such as former moderators and scholars. It was only because of her connection with the Buchan family and the fact that Anna Buchan had written about her in her novels that Marget received a memorial article. This is significant because it highlights how unusual the real life Marget was as a servant.

A significant feature of Anna Buchan's depiction of her servant characters is that all the servants are depicted as speaking in a variety of Scots regional dialects, whilst their mistresses are depicted as speaking in Scots Standard English. This feature of Anna Buchan's portrayal of servants is important when her place in the Scottish literary canon is considered. Beth Dickson observes that:

> Anna Buchan's works cannot truly be called Kailyard. They have some elements in them which are commonly identified as Kailyard: notably in the presentation of Scots dialogue of servant women, which together with an ironic view of their attitudes, is offered for the reader's amusement.[476]

[474] Beddoe, *Back to Home and Duty*, 61.
[475] James Mackay, 'The Passing of Marget', *The Record of the Home and Foreign Mission Work of the United Free Church of Scotland.*, January 1925. The Fasti of the United Free Church of Scotland 1900-1929 notes that he was ordained into Cardenden Parish on 28th June 1922.
[476] Dickson, 'Annie S Swan and O Douglas: Legacies of the Kailyard', 341.

This is certainly true of Marget in *The Setons* who is introduced chastising the poorly behaved Buff. “instantly Marget’s wrath was aroused and her manners forgotten. “Tak’ that cat aff yer faither’s breeks, David,” she said severely.”” Neither Elizabeth nor her father were nearly as perturbed by Buff’s actions. Therefore, her disproportionate wrath reads as amusingly indignant.

Likewise, Marget in *Ann and Her Mother* is introduced speaking in broad Borders Scots, however the content of what she says is more serious:

> "Ye'll aye be a lassie to me," Marget told her; "but," turning to her mistress, "is it true, Mem, that she's gaun to write yer Life? I never ken when Miss Ann's speakin' the truth and when she's juist haverin'. … It wad be rale interestin'. Ye wad need to pit in aboot thon daft man wha cam' to see the maister and the pollis efter him, an' that awfu' fricht we got wi' the big fire in the linoleum factory, and aboot the man wha drooned hissel in the Panny Pond and floatit. … "[477]

The density of broad Scots dialect words used by Marget here heightens the excitement she is portrayed as having towards Ann’s project of writing Mrs Douglas’s life. All the incidents described by Marget are shocking but the use of Scots regional dialect here softens the effect. While the use of Scots regional dialect here creates an amusing effect here, the content of her contribution to conversation is also typical for someone of her class. As discussed in chapter 3 working class people in the early twentieth century tended to be more comfortable discussing horrific incidents that their middle-class peers found shocking. In this regard, Anna Buchan is setting Marget up as having interests typical of a stereotypical working-class servant and voicing them in a typical manner. In largely confining her usage of Scots regional dialects to servant characters such as Marget Anna Buchan is largely at odds with her Scottish Renaissance contemporaries who sought to revive Scots as a respectable literary language. It is likely that at least in part this is a reason why Anna Buchan’s work has received such limited scholarly criticism. Her usage of Scots confining it to servants clashes with the modernist and nationalist project of the Scottish Renaissance writers. Scholars

[477] Douglas, *Ann and Her Mother*, 21.

exploring the Scots literary landscape of the 1920s and 1930s have tended to neglect writers who do not fit into this narrative of innovation and nationalism.[478]

It is only in *Eliza for Common* that Gaelic is mentioned – it is the Laidlaws' servant Mary from Skye who is described as having Gaelic as her first language. Anna Buchan describes this as one of Mary from Skye's faults: "Though she could speak English she thought in Gaelic, which made her slow in taking things in."[479] Anna Buchan's lack of sympathy towards the Gaelic language here (describing it as a fault in a servant) places her in opposition to the leading Scottish Renaissance writers who promoted and wrote Gaelic as a literary language including Sorley MacLean.[480] Despite this, the attitude towards Gaelic which she demonstrates here is reflective of wider attitudes among Scots of the time towards Gaelic in Scotland at the time. Kenneth MacKinnon notes that in the years following the 1872 Education (Scotland) Act which made education for children aged five to thirteen compulsory "the use of Gaelic was actively discouraged in the schools" and that the pressure to rid Scotland of what was described by a Her Majesty's Inspector of Schools as "the Gaelic nuisance".[481] There was a popular antipathy towards the Gaelic language, apart from amongst a small group of enthusiasts in the interwar years when *Eliza for Common* was written. John Lorne Campbell (1906-1996) Scottish Gaelic scholar notes that "The Report of the Special Committee of An Comunn Gaidhealach (1936)" observed that even amongst Gaelic speaking parents, there was "antipathy and antagonism" towards the teaching of Gaelic to their children, driven by the fact that during their own school years "the Gaelic language was absolutely prohibited in schools and generally looked down on."[482] Thus it is reasonable to assume that Anna Buchan's depiction of Gaelic as something to be looked down upon is representative of typical attitudes towards Gaelic in the time she was writing. This is significant because it suggests that while she held opposing views to some of

[478] Ian Brown, Alan Riach, and Alan Riach, *The Edinburgh Companion to Twentieth-Century Scottish Literature* (Edinburgh, UNITED KINGDOM: Edinburgh University Press, 2009), http://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/ed/detail.action?docID=1961970.
[479] Douglas, *Eliza For Common*, 80.
[480] Alan Riach, 'Chapter 4 Arcades – The 1920s and 1930s', in *The Edinburgh Companion to Twentieth-Century Scottish Literature*, ed. Ian Brown and Alan Riach (Edinburgh, UNITED KINGDOM: Edinburgh University Press, 2009), 58, http://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/ed/detail.action?docID=1961970.
[481] Kenneth MacKinnon, *Gaelic: A Past and Future Prospect* (Edinburgh: Saltire, 1991), 74–75.
[482] John Lorne Campbell, *Gaelic in Scottish Education and Life: Past, Present and Future / by John Lorne Campbell.* (Edinburgh: Pub. for the Saltire Society by W. & A.K. Johnston, 1945), 80.

her contemporaries in Scottish writing such as Sorley MacLean, her views were likely closer to those of her readers.

Leisure time

Social lives

Anna Buchan's women of the manse asides from the servants, when not engaged in church business or running the house, are typically depicted as socialising with a variety of people. Anna Buchan does, to an extent, suggest that there were generational differences with regard to the sorts of people who were considered acceptable to socialise with. Much of the socialising depicted by Anna Buchan is with other women though in some cases it was with male friends. This section will examine Anna Buchan's depiction of the romantic and platonic relationships her women of the manse had.

Romance

In "Pink Sugary Pleasures: Reading the novels of O. Douglas", Sly argues that for Anna Buchan's heroines "marriage is only the icing on a cake that is already full of good things".[483] While the majority of Anna Buchan's heroines were married by the end of her novels, this was not true of her daughter-of-the-manse heroines. Only Eliza Laidlaw was married by the end of the novel. Elizabeth Seton and Ann Douglas both remained single and had a role in supporting their surviving parent. In terms of minor characters, Christina Christie (daughter-of-the-manse friend of Elizabeth Seton) and the Stit girls (the four daughters of Mrs Laidlaw's wife-of-the-manse friend Mrs Stit) are all married to ministers by the end of the novels in which they appear. This section will examine Anna Buchan's decisions regarding the spinsterhood or matrimony of her daughters of the manse characters.

Sly argues that a key element of Anna Buchan's heroines who get married is "the stability of their sense of self" and that it is important that "0. Douglas's heroines are happy and secure in their own identities, and recognized as important and valued members of their communities before they meet Mr. Right.".[484] It is perhaps surprising that Eliza Laidlaw is the

[483] Sly, 'Pink Sugary Pleasures', 2001, 15.
[484] Ibid.

daughter-of-the-manse heroine who ultimately does get married over the course of the novel, given that she is the one who does not conform to Sly's description. Eliza, by the time she accepts Gerald's offer of marriage has largely broken with the community in Glasgow in which she grew up. Anna Buchan, describing Eliza meeting Gerald on the evening he went on to propose to her, notes "It was a chastened Eliza that greeted Gerald that evening, a softened Eliza, shaken somewhat in her belief in herself, doubting almost if she were worthy of this young man."[485] Through this more conventional romance narrative, Anna Buchan highlights Eliza's romantic character.

Eliza for Common is the novel with the most extensive discussions about love and relationships. Early in the novel, Mrs Laidlaw (Eliza's mother) comments to Mr Laidlaw:

> I must say Mrs. Stit [fellow mother of the manse] is a sickness with her 'girlies.' I'm glad we have no assistant for Eliza to marry – I can't think why all the Stit girls wanted to marry their father's assistants, but their mother is more than pleased.[486]

Here Anna Buchan is being slightly derisive of her contemporary daughters of the manse, who marry ministers. It also highlights contrasting expectations parents held for daughters of the manse, suggesting that for some, the ideal would be that daughters of the manse would marry ministers and follow their mothers' footsteps in becoming mistress of the manse. Christina Christie, in *The Setons,* is the only daughter-of-the-manse character who is described positively for having married a minister. Elizabeth responds with surprised excitement upon hearing the news that Christina had become engaged to the young minister, Andrew Hamilton.[487] She goes on to be supportive of Christina in her new relationship. Ultimately, although Christina enjoys a brief time of marriage to Hamilton, she ends the novel as a widow as Hamilton dies in the First World War.

In this respect Anna Buchan through her novels highlights that while on the surface daughters of the manse would be the most suitable partners for ministers having been trained from childhood to undertake all the tasks required of a wife of the manse they did in fact know too much of what the life entailed. None of her titular daughters of the manse

[485] Douglas, *Eliza For Common*.
[486] Ibid., 75.
[487] Douglas, *The Setons*, 1917, 198–201.

aspire to be ministers wives, instead they hope to make a match that will get them out of the manse.

Friendship

Barbara Caine in *Friendship: a history* suggests that "the nineteenth century was the first period in which, particularly in Britain and in the United States, the literary discussion of women's friendship was both more extensive and more important than that of men."[488] As will be examined in this section Anna Buchan in her portrayal of her women of the manse continued this tradition into the early twentieth century. Sly in "Pink sugary pleasures: Reading the novels of O. Douglas" argues that

> Female friendship plays an increasingly important part in Douglas's work: both *Pink Sugar* and *The House That Is Our Own* open with conversations between the heroine and her only close companion, an older woman. And although both novels end conventionally with wedding bells for the heroine, their final pages are devoted to plucky spinsters making the best of life on their own.[489]

This section will assess the extent to which Sly's assessment applies to Anna Buchan's women of the manse. It will explore the friendships Anna Buchan's women of the manse maintain.

Of all the friendships Anna Buchan depicts, the strongest one is that of Elizabeth Seton and Christina (Kirsty) Christie in *The Setons.* Anna Buchan describes how:

> That Elizabeth Seton and Christina Christie should be friends seemed a most improbable thing. They were both ministers' daughters, but there any likeness ended. It seemed as if there could be nothing in common between this tall golden Elizabeth with her impulsive ways, her rapid heedless speech, her passion for poetry, her faculty for making new friends at every turn, and Christina, short, dark, and neat,

[488] Barbara Caine and Marc Brodie, 'Class, Sex and Friendship: The Long Nineteenth Century', in *Friendship : A History*, ed. Barbara Caine (London ; Oakville, CT : Equinox Pub., 2008), 230.
[489] Sly, 'Pink Sugary Pleasures', 2001, 16.

> with a mind as ordered as her raiment, suspicious of strangers and chilling with her nearest – and yet a very true friendship did exist.[490]

Throughout the novel, Christina and Elizabeth are depicted as frequent visitors to each other's manse homes. They are portrayed as sources of practical wisdom and support for each other. In the conversation which follows the above quotation, Elizabeth offers Christina advice on puddings, while Christina returns the favour giving Elizabeth advice on what would sell at bazaars.[491] It seems significant that Christina and Elizabeth are both daughters of United Free Church manses, though with fathers who are as opposite in character and ministry style as their daughters are. It seems that their fathers, while being colleagues, are not friends in the same way as their daughters. Their friendship does not quite fit into any of the categories of friendship identified by Tess Cosslett in *Woman to woman: female friendship in Victorian Fiction*. Although Elizabeth and Christina are described by Anna Buchan as opposites with only their role of daughter of the manse to unite them, they are not different enough to fit into any of the pairings suggested by Cosslett which included "angels and monsters, Madonnas and Magdalens, etc."[492] While there is an age difference between them and Elizabeth's mother is dead by the time the novel starts there is not the mother/daughter dynamic that Cosslett suggests was prevalent in Victorian fiction where the mother was often absent and replaced by a female friend.[493] This is important as Cosslett in her book focusses her attention on the types in Victorian fiction. As *The Setons* was written in the 1910s it suggests that by then there might have been a shift in trends in depictions of female friendships towards ones which were more friendships of equals.

When considering the friendships and social lives of Anna Buchan's women of the manse, it is helpful to compare and contrast the women of *Ann and Her Mother* with those in *Eliza for Common.* Ann and her mother are depicted by Anna Buchan as having fairly similar friends and as mostly socialising together. However, in some of the reminiscences it becomes clear that it was not always the case. Ann when describing her transition to adulthood,

---

[490] Douglas, *The Setons*, 1917, 78.
[491] Ibid., 80.
[492] Tess Cosslett, *Woman to Woman : Female Friendship in Victorian Fiction* (Atlantic Highlands, NJ : Humanities Press International, 1988), 4.
[493] Ibid., 7.

remembers her friendship with an artist Margot Stronach whom Mrs Douglas disapproved of. The older Ann describes Margot in the most disparaging of terms: "She was only a woman with a certain amount of money and a small talent, good looks, and a vast amount of conceit. Even my foolish young eyes saw that very soon."[494] Wendy Forrester discussing the identity of Margot Stronach helpfully observes "The picture – an unusually ungenerous one – is certainly not of Katharine Cameron, and is not repeated in the autobiography. Perhaps she was pure invention."[495] In any case Ann's brief friendship with Margot serves more to highlight how impressionable she was as a young woman than as an example of deep lasting friendship. However, Margot was not the only artist the young Ann made friends with. She also was friends with Kathleen and Jim Strang who are likely based on Katharine and D. Y. Cameron, whom Anna Buchan was friends with and sometimes sat as a model for.[496] Katharine Cameron, like Anna Buchan, was a daughter of the manse with an elder brother who overshadowed her. Her friendship with Kathleen is described as lasting to the present time in the novel. These artists are friends whom Mrs Douglas does approve of.

Eliza and her mother Mrs Laidlaw, however, have quite independent social lives and groups of friends. Eliza, as a late teenager, is at that stage where she has her own social circle but also is young enough to still be expected to go with her mother to visit her mother's friends at times. In terms of her own friends, she is friends with a group of artists who are very different to the friends of her mother. Her closest friend seems to be the artist Mary Neish, who encouraged her to adopt the lifestyle of an artist though Eliza is never depicted as doing art as a hobby herself. Mary Neish is likely based on the watercolour artist Katharine Cameron. If Mary Neish is based on her, then a case could be made that the friendship between Mary and Eliza is another instance of a daughter of the manse friendship – though a contrasting one to that of Elizabeth Seton and Kirsty Christie. The former both drifted out of the manses in which they were brought up – Mary is depicted as being supportive of Eliza's adventures out of the world of the manse and parish.[497] Meanwhile, the Elizabeth and Christina supported each other to maintain their lives in the manses – Elizabeth is supportive of Kirsty's marriage to a minister and continues to live with her minister father

[494] Douglas, *Ann and Her Mother*, 212.
[495] Forrester, *Anna Buchan and O. Douglas*, 22.
[496] Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*, 85.
[497] Douglas, *Eliza For Common*, 186, 263.

into his retirement and old age. Elizabeth Seton is also depicted as being acquainted with artists – she spends time with Stewart Stevenson, an artist. Like their creator, Eliza and Elizabeth are depicted as being interested in art and socialising with artists but are not practitioners in their own right. This may be a reflection on the social landscape of creative people in Glasgow at the time Anna Buchan was living there. In the 1890s to 1910s, the Glasgow School (a circle of influential Art Nouveau artists), was at its peak and Glasgow was the centre for a flourishing group of artists, including Charles Rennie Mackintosh, Herbert McNair, Margaret and Frances Macdonald.[498] This was the group that the young Anna Buchan socialised with. In her autobiography she reminisced "Perhaps the most enjoyable parties we attended were at the Camerons' house…Katharine was one of the youngest, and already distinguished when we met and became friends."[499] Anna Buchan wrote a touching verse in Katharine Cameron's friendship book *Album amicorum*:

> You are my friend
>
> What a thing friendship is
>
> World without end.
>
> I'd like you part when you are weary
>
> I'll light you latterly to the end
>
> I'll listen when you sing a song
>
> And write thank you letters too long
>
> Because you are my friend.[500]

This is the sort of devotion Anna Buchan portrays Eliza having towards Mary Neish. Describing Mary Neish's studio, she notes "Eliza had adored it; of course she had fallen in love with her new friend, and had asked nothing better than to be allowed to worship at her

[498] Roger Billcliffe, 'Glasgow Boys (Act. 1875–1895)' (Oxford University Press, October 2009); Ailsa Tanner, 'Glasgow Girls (Act. 1880–1920)' (Oxford University Press, January 2010),
[499] Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*, 85.
[500] Buchan Anna, '"Album Amicorum - V A Heylinger 1787", a Friendship Book of Katharine Cameron Kay Containing Dedications, Mainly in Verse, from Various People, with a Frontispiece by David Young Cameron.' (n.d.), Acc.8950/19, NLS.

shrine."[501] Eliza's friendship with Mary has to a degree the intensity Caine describes as more commonly found in female friendships in the nineteenth century.[502] However, it ultimately is typical of friendships of the early twentieth century described by Mark Peel in "New Worlds of Friendship: The Early Twentieth Century" in *Friendship: a history.* He argues that in this period "friends were those with whom changes could be experienced, anticipated, enjoyed and savoured."[503]

While Sly is right to highlight the importance of female friendship she is perhaps inaccurate in suggesting that they play an increasingly important part in Anna Buchan's work. This examination of the friendships of Anna Buchan's women of the manse has demonstrated that the strongest friendship is found in Anna Buchan's first daughter-of-the-manse novel *The Setons* between Elizabeth and Christina. The later daughter-of-the-manse novels do not feature as important friendships and instead depict familial relationships as being more important. It has also demonstrated that of all Anna Buchan's characters it is the younger generation of women of the manse who were portrayed as having slightly broader friend groups, including artists. Ann and Eliza's friendships with artists demonstrate that at least in terms of their friendships their lives were not entirely ordinary for middle-class women of their time.

Hobbies

Dancing

Whilst Anna Buchan's depiction of her daughters of the manse having friendships with artists seems to have been allowable, there were some limits on what it was socially acceptable for a Free Church daughter of the manse to do while socialising. As an example of this, Eliza could go to parties, but she was "not allowed to play bridge or dance". [504] It is significant that Eliza's mother forbade her to dance, considering that this novel was written during a time of debate in the United Free Church about the morality of dancing and dance halls. Beddoe, in *Back to Home and Duty,* argues that "the interwar years can be fairly

[501] Douglas, *Eliza For Common*, 49.
[502] Caine and Brodie, 'Class, Sex and Friendship: The Long Nineteenth Century', 242–45.
[503] Mark Peel, 'New Worlds of Friendship: The Early Twentieth Century', in *Friendship : A History*, ed. Barbara Caine (London ; Oakville, CT : Equinox Pub., 2008), 289.
[504] Douglas, *Eliza For Common*, 34.

described as dance crazy" and that "the dance boom affected all social classes in Britain."[505] The popularity of dancing and dance halls in the interwar years was such that it attracted the attention of writers in the *Record of the United Free Church of Scotland* (the monthly magazine of the United Free Church). In the May 1925 issue of *the Record*, an unnamed author wrote an article entitled "What of the Dance Hall?". While the article in general highlights the social problems associated with the dance halls, it concludes with the following advice for readers:

> What should be our attitude to the dance halls? We have stressed the undesirable features, but we cannot deny the fact that the dance hall *per se* has much to recommend it. It exists as the natural response to a revised attitude towards dancing and can, if properly regulated and free from objectionable features, minister to innocent and healthy pleasure.[506]

This article suggests that at least some people within the United Free Church considered dancing an acceptable pastime and that in the mid-1920s, social attitudes within the United Free Church were changing towards dancing and dance halls. It may be that Eliza represents the more progressive views on dancing, while her mother, who has forbidden her from dancing, represents the views of those who were more fearful and disapproving. The depiction of Eliza as being not allowed to dance indicates that one social group who were excluded from this boom were Free Church daughters of the manse – or at least those from more conservative manses.

Eliza being forbidden to dance may have been an exaggeration on the part of Anna Buchan, though there certainly were restrictions on the lives of daughters of the manse. Wendy Forrester, in her biography of Anna Buchan, notes that while Anna Buchan did "confess to having an unsuitable yearning to be an actress…there is little doubt that the Buchans would have considered the stage hardly more suitable a career for their daughter than safebreaking."[507]

---

[505] Beddoe, *Back to Home and Duty*, 117.
[506] Anonymous, 'What of the Dance Hall?', *Record of the United Free Church of Scotland*, May 1925.
[507] Forrester, *Anna Buchan and O. Douglas*, 18.

Theatre

Although Anna Buchan was not allowed to fulfil her yearning to be an actress, she maintained a deep appreciation of theatre. This love of theatre, in particular Shakespeare, was something she imbued many of her characters with. Of all her women of the manse, the one with the greatest enthusiasm for theatre is Eliza Laidlaw. This enthusiasm for theatre is encouraged by her elder brother Jim, who in his spare time at university wrote plays. For Jim, the most important part of Eliza and his mother's visit to Oxford was that "Eliza would see the O.U.D.S. performance."[508] The O.U.D.S. is the Oxford University Dramatic Society and the performance Eliza went on to see was Shakespeare's *Hamlet*. Until that point Eliza has "only seen Shakespeare done at school, when the girls giggled."[509] In the midst of Eliza's excitement, her mother's moral debate is revealed: "I don't know whether I'm doing right to go," Mrs Laidlaw said. "I wouldn't enter an ordinary theatre, but this is amateur and Shakespeare…".[510] Lawrence Senelick, in his chapter on "Sexuality and Gender" in *A Cultural History of Theatre in the Age of Empire,* describes the elements of professional theatre Mrs Laidlaw likely objected to. He observes that throughout the nineteenth century, professional theatre was linked with prostitution and was regarded with suspicion, especially by the middle classes, who sought to control moral behaviour.[511] Therefore, Mrs Laidlaw's uncertainty would have been understandable to Anna Buchan's older readers even if her younger readers resonated more with Eliza's excitement.

The contrast between Eliza's excitement and Mrs Laidlaw's moral doubts reveals a generational shift with regard to attitudes towards theatre. This contrast reflects Senelick's conclusion that "It will take the Great War to eradicate many of the persistent moral attitudes of the previous generation and allow more open treatment of hitherto taboo subjects."[512] Eliza represents the younger generation, who is more open to theatre and who resists the more conservative values held with regard to what was acceptable material to view and perform. As discussed in the "Sabbath school" section of the "Women of the manse in the Parish" chapter of this thesis, Eliza is disparaging towards a small religious play

[508] Douglas, *Eliza For Common*, 183.
[509] Ibid., 201.
[510] Ibid.
[511] Lawrence Senelick, 'Sexuality and Gender', in *A Cultural History of Theatre in the Age of Empire*, ed. Peter Marx (London, UNITED KINGDOM: Bloomsbury Publishing Plc, 2019), http://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/ed/detail.action?docID=5846548.
[512] Ibid., 96.

that she is forced to organise the performance of by her mother, doubting whether "any one will see the point."[513] Here, she is suggesting that the play is out of step with contemporary interests and values.

It is striking that of Anna Buchan's women of the manse only Eliza, the most rebellious, shows any enthusiasm for theatre, when so many of Anna Buchan's other characters embrace the theatre in a similar way to their creator. In *Priorsford* (1932), a major narrative sub-plot is the performance of a Community Drama production in the Borders Community Drama Festival. In this novel, the majority of the village of Priorsford join in, including the minister Mr Thornton, who, while at Oxford University, was an inconspicuous member of the O.U.D.S. It is through this novel that Anna Buchan reveals the world of local amateur dramatics and her appreciation of it as a participant.

Published almost a decade later than *Eliza for Common, Jane's Parlour* includes the major character Caroline Eliot, who attends drama school, supported unenthusiastically by her mother Kathryn Eliot, a writer. Kathryn comments to her friend Alison:

> "I can't tell you how I hate letting her go to London to start again at that Drama School."
>
> "She is going again this winter?"
>
> "Yes, and it's such a worry to Tim. That's why I wish so much she'd fall in love—the new love would push out the old."[514]

Ultimately, Caroline does as her mother wishes and leaves the Drama School. The closing scene of the novel is Caroline's engagement to George the young man her mother hoped that she would fall in love with. It is in this novel that Anna Buchan expresses her uncertainty about her niece Alice Fairfax-Lucy's decision to pursue acting as a career. Forrester, in her biography of Anna Buchan, notes whilst discussing Alice's decision that even "Anna herself, dearly though she loved both the theatre and amateur acting seems to have been uneasy about a career which took a girl away from home and into mixed

[513] Douglas, *Eliza For Common*, 230.
[514] O. Douglas, *Jane's Parlour* (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1937), 76.

company."[515] Similarly to the fictional Car, Alice abandoned her desire to act and married Brian Fairfax-Lucy. Martin Green criticises Anna Buchan's portrayal of the theatre world in this novel commenting: "It is a striking case of Anna Buchan's failure to use her resources that she finds nothing more than the obvious to say about the two girls' acting, or their experience of theatre life."[516] However, it may be that the weakness Green identifies here is not so much a failure but an artistic decision on the part of Anna Buchan. Through this novel the limits of how far Anna Buchan was willing to embrace the theatre and acting are demonstrated.

Both *Priorsford* and *Jane's Parlour* were published in the 1930s, whereas *Eliza for Common* and Anna Buchan's other daughter-of-the-manse novels were published a decade earlier. This suggests that there might have been a growing tolerance for the theatre over the time when Anna Buchan was writing. It also highlights the restrictions placed on women of the manse in the early twentieth century – especially that those with interests in acting or producing were limited to religious plays in a church context and were discouraged even from attending performances of secular works.

Sewing

Beddoe, discussing sewing in the interwar years in *Back to Home and Duty* argues that "sewing was another, particularly female, 'leisure' activity. One hesitates to regard needlework as leisure, but the fact that it is generally so regarded reinforces the point that women's leisure was often productive."[517] This section will explore Anna Buchan's depiction of the sewing undertaken by women of the manse and argue that her depiction reinforces Beddoe's argument about the tension between whether the sewing women undertook was a work or leisure activity. This section will also explore how Anna Buchan's novels conform to the observation made by Barbara Burman that: - "Popular fiction represents home dressmaking in an important though subtle role in better-off middle class Edwardian England. Tasks using the needle were shown as moments when women could talk

[515] Forrester, *Anna Buchan and O. Douglas*, 72.
[516] Green, *A Biography of John Buchan and His Sister Anna*, 222.
[517] Beddoe, *Back to Home and Duty*, 128.

together."[518] Although Burman is describing the situation in England, it is likely that it was also the case in Scotland given the similar examples found in Anna Buchan's novels. Throughout Anna Buchan's novels, women are depicted sitting sewing while having quite detailed conversations about important things including church business and running households. These conversations, as will be explored, are largely amongst middle class women - women of the manse and their social equals. In some ways, the sewing is depicted as the thing that enables the women to feel that it is acceptable to be sitting around chatting.

Many of Anna Buchan's women remark that they feel like they need to be doing some sort of work even during times when others around them were resting. It seems likely that sewing was seen as work which satisfied the Protestant work ethic embedded in Scottish Presbyterian culture.[519] Women, perhaps even more so than men, were drawn into following this - various types of household tasks, including sewing, were classed by women as work. This was defined during a time when it was not considered proper for middle class women to work for income, yet despite this, there was a sense of a need to be "working". Elizabeth Seton, in *The Setons,* is depicted as regarding sewing as work - it is one of the many tasks on her to do list alongside cleaning clothes, looking out things for a jumble sale, replying to letters and paying bills. Her attitude towards these tasks reflects the presbyterian work ethic - "Elizabeth had a notion that when one felt depressed the remedy was not to give oneself a pleasure but to do some hated duty, so she now thought rapidly over distasteful tasks awaiting her."[520]For Elizabeth, the mending of her brother's suit "completed the cheering process".[521] These descriptions are quite similar to those found in *Eliza for Common,* particularly amongst the older generation. Anna Buchan depicts Mrs Laidlaw commenting "Bring in the mending basket, Rob, so that we can talk with a clear conscience."[522] Thus, it is clear that to Mrs Laidlaw, sewing is a work activity which permits

[518] Barbara Burman, 'Made at Home by Clever Fingers: Home Dressmaking in Edwardian England', in *The Culture of Sewing Gender, Consumption and Home Dressmaking*, ed. Barbara Burman, Dress, Body, Culture (New York: Berg, 1999), 40.
[519] Robert Smith, 'Religion, the Scottish Work Ethic and the Spirit of Enterprise', *International Journal of Entrepreneurship and Innovation* 10, no. 2 (2009): 111–24.
[520] Douglas, *The Setons*, 1917, 51.
[521] Ibid., 52.
[522] Douglas, *Eliza For Common*, 86.

leisure conversation. However, her views on the importance of sewing are not shared by her daughter Eliza.

Anna Buchan contrasts: "Eliza by way of mending, but often dreaming with her hands idle, and Mrs Laidlaw sewing rapidly as she told of all the things that had amused and interested her during the day".[523] This contrast is continued later in the novel, when Eliza grumbles about attending a sewing class - "I've got to go to the sewing-class to-night anyway; and it's a beastly day", whilst her mother is described as "sewing placidly".[524] It is interesting that Eliza, as a late teenager, is described as attending sewing class grudgingly - here, Anna Buchan is reflecting a societal shift, where the younger generation is less interested in sewing as a hobby – for Eliza, it seems to be a chore. Anna Buchan's niece, Alice Buchan, in *A Scrap Screen* (1979), describes how "Anna could never have spun, was no knitter and was far too impatient to master the art of lace making with ivory bobbins (bones), but a 'free maid' she was to the end and gloried in her state."[525]Eliza of all Anna Buchan's women of the manse is closest to her creator in this respect. She is the most reluctant to sew and the biggest dreamer and is often upbraided by her mother for this.

It seems significant that Mrs Service (an elderly lady in the congregation who spends a day a week with the Laidlaws) should be described thus: "She had clever hands and liked to sit and mend and makeover garments".[526] It seems the terms "clever hands/clever fingers" was a common praise of women, given Burman's titling of her chapter in *The Culture of Sewing*.[527] Throughout the novel, Mrs Service is depicted as sewing anytime she is sitting down. In this respect, and in many others, Buchan's depiction of Mrs Service echoes her description of the biblical figure Dorcas in a script for a talk she gave. Buchan praises Dorcas: - "People would say "She has nothing else to do." She has no family to look after. "She has plenty of time on her hands" "It's almost a kindness to take her sewing'".[528] Mrs Learmond is also at times depicted (in a similar manner) sewing when visiting the manse - "at the same time as trying to pay attention to what her hostess was saying as she fumbles in the workbasket for

[523] Ibid., 87.
[524] Ibid., 110–11.
[525] Alice Buchan, *A Scrap Screen* (London: H. Hamilton, 1979), 129–30.
[526] Douglas, *Eliza For Common*, 97.
[527] Burman, 'Made at Home by Clever Fingers: Home Dressmaking in Edwardian England'.
[528] Anna Buchan, 'Dorcas Acts IX 36-43' (n.d.), 4–5, acc11627.118, NLS.

wool to mend a large hole in one of Rob's stockings".[529] Elizabeth Seton likewise sews when sitting down chatting with visitors. When Arthur Townshend visits, after dinner, Elizabeth "settled herself down in an armchair with some needlework and pointed out the cigarettes and matches to her guest".[530] It seems that it was normal for her to sew while her male companions sat and smoked. It is unclear what type of sewing "needlework" was - it was probably fancy sewing, such as embroidery, since elsewhere, mending is described as "mending". This is similar to Margaret Oliphant's description of Isabel Lothian's sewing in *The Minister's Wife* (1869). Oliphant describes a similar evening scene in the manse: "This was the very centre of her quiet, unemotional happiness. The fire-light and the pretty bright glow of the lamp, and Mr. Lothian and the Dominie talking, arguing, commenting upon everything, while she sat, half listening, hemming her cambric."[531] "Hemming her cambric", while it sounds like it is referring to practical sewing, is actually describing part of the process of creating ruffles to add to shirts and other items.[532] What is interesting is that most of the sewing portrayed is mostly repairs rather than the making of full garments - the only character depicted as making full garments is Mrs Service. The amount of references to repairing clothes (though for a family with two young boys) in some ways seems excessive, but maybe this is a reflection on the care people took of clothes and the cost of them.

In contrast to the other characters depicted in Anna Buchan's novels, Kate, the daughter of Mr Veitch, is the only character who is depicted as making money from her sewing. Kate is a working class parishioner in the parish. When Elizabeth calls on Mrs Veitch to collect for mission, Mrs Veitch comments that:

> "This is juist the busy time, ye ken, pairties and such like. She's workin' late near every nicht, and she's awful bad wi' indigeestion puir thing. But Kate's no' yin to complain."
>
> "I'm sure she's not," said Elizabeth heartily.

[529] Douglas, *Eliza For Common*, 114.
[530] Douglas, *The Setons*, 1917, 120.
[531] Mrs (Margaret) Oliphant, *The Minister's Wife* (London : Hurst and Blackett, 1869), 300.
[532] Ibid., 299.

> "I wonder - some time when things are slacker - if she would make me a blouse or two? The last were so nice."[533]

This interaction suggests that Kate, as a seamstress, is both skilled and in high demand, especially during party season, where there is a demand for new outfits to wear to events. It also suggests that, while Elizabeth does repairs to clothes, she does not make new clothes herself. She goes to a seamstress, even for simpler garments such as blouses. This reflects the social class difference between Elizabeth and her parishioners. Elizabeth is of the class who can afford to employ the services of a seamstress to make their clothes.

Burman cites the example of a middle-class teacher who had some of her clothes made for her and made some things including blouses herself.[534] Meanwhile, for Kate, the daughter of Mrs Veitch, it was seen as a very respectable form of employment to be a seamstress and while pay was seasonal, it was a well-paid job that allowed Kate to be the main breadwinner for her and her mother. Anna Buchan's appreciation of the craft of sewing in her novels has echoes of that of her heroine Margaret Oliphant, who in her novel *Kirsteen,* depicts the titular character Kirsteen (the daughter of the minor noble family the Douglases) running away from her Argyllshire home and becoming a famous and well-respected mantua maker in London. It must be noted that her decision to leave home was not approved by her family. Throughout that novel, Oliphant's appreciation for clothes worn and the craft of sewing shines through. What is different between *Kirsteen* and Anna Buchan's novels is that in *Kirsteen* sewing is emphatically depicted as a trade), whilst in Anna Buchan's novels, sewing is more often depicted as a hobby or, if not a hobby, a domestic task (aside from Kate in *The Setons*). This shift in the depiction of sewing is likely a result of the novels being set around one hundred and fifty years apart.

For Anna Buchan's women of the manse, sewing was not paid work in the way it was for some of her other characters but, it was more of a work task than a leisure task. The sort of sewing that she depicts her characters undertaking was largely practical – repairing the family's clothes, for example. As has been argued, Anna Buchan's depiction of sewing supports Burman's observation that time spent sewing was time which women could talk

[533] Douglas, *The Setons*, 1917, 62.
[534] Burman, 'Made at Home by Clever Fingers: Home Dressmaking in Edwardian England', 39.

and socialise together. In this way, the sewing which was primarily depicted as practical, was also a time of leisure for the women of the manse in Anna Buchan's novels. Her depiction of sewing reflects what Burman observes as a phenomenon in popular fiction of the time - therefore, Anna Buchan's women of the manse were likely typical at least of their literary contemporaries.

Gardening

Like sewing, gardening is an activity which straddles the line between work and a hobby. It was an activity which became typical of middle class people in the interwar years, when Anna Buchan wrote her novels. Lynn Abrahms and Linda Fleming describe how in early twentieth century Scotland:

> Gardening, bowls at the local clubs, odd jobs about the house and so on were said to have displaced the public house for relaxation. It was among the middle-class suburban dwellers though, that gardening really took off as a leisure pursuit … In Stirling, the wife of a minister commented on her first manse in 1947: 'it had a big garden and fortunate that my husband was very keen in the garden and always had a very delightful arrangement of flowers and some vegetables and worked hard in it.'[535]

This section will examine Anna Buchan's descriptions of women of the manse's attitudes towards gardening and the level of enthusiasm with which they took it up as a hobby.

The most expansive descriptions of gardening in Anna Buchan's novels are found in *Penny Plain* and *Ann and Her Mother.* Mr Macdonald, the minister in Priorsford in *Penny Plain,* is described by Anna Buchan as delighting in working in the garden.

> Mr. Macdonald loved his garden and worked in it diligently. It was his doctor, he said. When his mind got stale and sermon-writing difficult, when his head ached and people became a burden, he put on an old coat and went out to dig, or plant or mow the grass. He grew wonderful flowers, and in July, when his lupins were at their best,

[535] Lynn Abrams and Linda Fleming, 'From Scullery to Conservatory:: Everyday Life in the Scottish Home', in *A History of Everyday Life in Twentieth-Century Scotland*, ed. Lynn Abrams and Callum G. Brown (Edinburgh University Press, 2010), 64.

> he took a particular pleasure in enticing people out to see the effect of their royal blue against the silver of Tweed.[536]

While Mr Macdonald is depicted as gardening as a break from the work of ministry, later in the chapter, Mrs Macdonald is described as the one more actively tending the garden:

> Mr. Macdonald was pacing up and down the path overlooking the river, with his next Sunday's sermon in his hand, while Mrs. Macdonald raked the gravel before the front door (she liked the place kept so tidy that her sons had been wont to say bitterly, as they spent an hour of their precious Saturdays helping, that she dusted the branches and wiped the faces of the flowers with a handkerchief) and carried on a conversation with her husband which was of little profit, as the rake on the stones dimmed the sense of her words.[537]

Here it is clear that, while for her husband gardening was a joy and a rest from the grind of parish ministry, for Mrs Macdonald, gardening was a chore undertaken with the same approach as housework. For her, the goal of gardening was tidiness and cleanliness not peace. This is reflected in the soundscape Anna Buchan creates in the scene. In Mrs Macdonald's efforts to tidy the garden, she creates such a racket that conversation cannot be held and disturbs the peace of the rural manse. Anna Buchan's depiction of Mrs Macdonald's approach to gardening, in terms of dusting and cleaning, seems to have stronger echoes in descriptions of middle-class women's approaches to housework than gardening. There is also a sharp contrast between her "wiping the faces of the flowers with a handkerchief" and the sooty Christmas-rose in the Setons' garden in the Gorbals. This is perhaps indicative of a contrast in levels of interest and availability of time between the elderly rural minister and his wife, Mr and Mrs Macdonald, and the single father urban minister with a disinterested daughter, Mr Seton and Elizabeth. Mr and Mrs Macdonald are depicted as having plenty of time to maintain a beautiful garden while Mr Seton struggled to maintain a large urban garden.

[536] Douglas, 'Penny Plain', 258.
[537] Ibid., 261–62.

The other woman of the manse to enjoy and appreciate gardening is Ann in *Ann and Her Mother* – though this is at the point in her life that she is no longer living in a manse. She is introduced in the first chapter of *Ann and Her Mother* in the first piece of dialogue:

> "I wish," she said, without looking up, "I do wish I knew more about gardening. I can't make out from this what will grow best with us. … Don't you think, Mother, it is almost lèse-majesté to call a rose Queen Mary, and describe it as 'a gross feeder'? Oh, and this! Mr. Asquith, 'very compact in form, rosy in colour.' What humourists the compilers of seedsmen's catalogues are! And what poets! Where was it we read that article about catalogues? It said that the very names were like a procession of princes—'amber and carmine Queens, and Princes' Feathers, and Cloth of Gold.' The names tempt one simply by the glory of the sound. 'Love-in-a-Mist … Love-Fire, a rich cream with a faint suggestion of apricot primrose in petal'—and with a drop one learns that this beauty can be bought for the sum of tuppence! … Delphiniums we must have—dozens of them. I can picture us next summer lying on the lawn in deck-chairs on hot, sunny days, looking between tall, blue delphiniums to green hilltops. Won't it be lovely, Mother?"[538]

This poetic view of gardening contrasts sharply with Mrs Macdonald's practical approach. It sets up Ann's character as an enthusiastic romantic with a sense of humour. It also indicates that it is a fairly newfound hobby – the opening sentence reveals her inexperience as a gardener.

Later in the novel Ann comments appreciatively of the Miss Scotts: "They are going to help me a lot with the garden; their own place is lovely. It's a nice happy way to end one's days – living peacefully among growing flowers!"[539] Here it seems that she believes gardening is a suitable occupation for older women – a restful occupation for former women of the manse. When read in conjunction with the quotation above it is clear that Anna Buchan is suggesting that gardening is a hobby which brings about sanctuary and fellowship for retired women of the manse.

[538] Douglas, *Ann and Her Mother*, 9–10.
[539] Ibid., 34–35.

It is clear that for Anna Buchan's women of the manse, gardening is either a hobby taken up in retirement or a task to be approached with the same sort of practicality as housework. The latter description suggests that at least for some women of the manse the garden was not the sanctuary others found it to be. From Anna Buchan's description of gardening, it seems it is more of an activity for those in rural charges or who have retired to the countryside. These categories of women of the manse had the time to devote to maintaining the garden, unlike those in urban charges, whose lives were busy with the activities examined earlier in this thesis.

Reading

As discussed in the introduction and Chapter Two, Anna Buchan and her family were all avid readers - her autobiography *Unforgettable, Unforgotten* is strewn with references to novels and poetry she and her family were reading. Her novels reflect her love of reading with many of her women of the manse characters similarly enjoying reading. But what exactly were they reading and how does what they are reading reflect their characters? How do the texts Anna Buchan portrays them reading offer an insight into their desires and understanding of culture amongst other things?

Anna Buchan infrequently mentions works her characters are reading in *The Setons* and, perhaps oddly for a woman who enjoyed reading so much, her heroine Elizabeth is not depicted as reading much. It is more often the men in the house, such as Mr Seton and Arthur Townshend, who are depicted as reading. Mr Seton, like his real-life inspiration Mr Buchan (Anna Buchan's father), is depicted as loving the work of Walter Scott, which he likes to read when he takes breaks from sermon writing.[540] The main conversations Elizabeth has about books are with her father and Mr Townshend. When trying to figure out what Mr Townshend could do in the gap between services on a Sunday when she is delivering tracts, she suggests "I can lend you something to read – *The Newcomes* is in the cupboard – and show you a quiet cubby-hole to read it in, if you would like that."[541] *The Newcomes* referred to in this quotation, is the 1855 novel by W. M. Thackery. Ultimately, Mr Townshend does not read the novel, but instead goes with Elizabeth to deliver her tracts. A novel Anna

[540] Douglas, *The Setons*, 1917, 46.
[541] Ibid., 139.

Buchan depicts both Elizabeth Seton and Mr Townshend as having read is Anne Douglas Sedgwick's *Valerie Upton* (1907). They are depicted discussing it in the context of Mr Townshend asking Elizabeth why she does all the parish work. Elizabeth responds saying "You've read *Valerie Upton?* Do you remember the loathly Imogen and her 'radiant goodness,' and how she stood 'forth in the light'? I sometimes have a horrid thought that I am rather like that."[542] A review of *Valerie Upton* in the Spectator on November 16, 1907 observes:

> Thus it is noteworthy that in the book before us none of the dramatis personae belong to the strenuous or adventurous type. They are all either rich or well-to-do, enjoying unearned incomes, freed from the necessity of labouring for a livelihood, and devoting their leisure to art, travel, mild philanthropy, and, above all, conversation and the study of each other.[543]

This observation certainly could be applied to Elizabeth Seton and several other of Anna Buchan's characters. However, Elizabeth's own description of Imogen is not quite an accurate description of herself. While she is a good and dedicated character, she is not without her faults - at times, she complains about her work and is sometimes judgemental of her father's parishioners.

It is in *Ann and Her Mother* that Anna Buchan depicts the most detailed conversations between women of the manse about what they have read or are reading. Throughout that novel, Ann and Mrs Douglas are depicted as reflecting on novels they read in their younger days. Anna Buchan also mentions the novels they are reading while the action of the novel takes place. Both Ann and Mrs Douglas are depicted as avid readers - Anna Buchan introduces Mrs Douglas in this way: "Mrs Douglas had a book in her lap and in her hand a half-finished stocking, for she considered that she was wasting time if she did not knit while reading."[544] Her view that reading was not a worthwhile activity in its own right reflects attitudes towards reading amongst her generation (at least amongst those in the literary

[542] Ibid., 177.
[543] 'VALERIE UPTON (Book Review)', *The Spectator* (London, United Kingdom: The Spectator (1828) Ltd., 16 November 1907).
[544] Douglas, *Ann and Her Mother*, 9.

world of Anna Buchan). Mrs Learmond, an older lady of the same generation as Mrs Laidlaw in *Eliza for Common,* remarks to Eliza:

> "I was brought up, my dear, never to read in the daytime, and I will stick to my habit. Knit, work, write letters, walk, talk – anything you like all day, and in the evening you really enjoy your books and papers. I feel guilty even now if I find myself reading in the morning."[545]

In some ways, Mrs Douglas's commitment to the protestant work ethic is even more extreme, given she is knitting while reading in the evening. This may be the result of her generation of women of the manse having more extreme ideas about what constitutes worthwhile activities than their non-manse contemporaries. In contrast, the younger generation of women of the manse, with the exception of Elizabeth Seton, have more relaxed attitudes towards reading considering it a worthwhile activity on its own regardless of the time of day.

For Eliza, reading is an escape from the drudgery of her mundane day-to-day life in the manse (especially during the time when she cares for her sick mother) – "It was a dreary time for a young girl, but perhaps Eliza did not feel the monotony and confinement as much as some would – she had two unfailing consolations, her dreams and her books."[546] Eliza's books of choice were decadent novels such as Joseph Hergesheimer's *Java Head* (1919), which offered her an escape into a world of clipper ships in Salem, Massachusetts in the 1840s. In many ways this novel is a shocking choice of book for a daughter of a Free Church manse as it focuses on the lives of people involved in the opioid trade and includes themes of drug addiction and suicide. However, the opening chapters have echoes of *Eliza for Common* – they feature the transition of Laurel Ammidon from childhood to young womanhood – the same transition Eliza is in the process of making when she is depicted as reading the novel.

The reference to *Java Head* perhaps is more highlighting Eliza's rebelliousness at this point in the novel: rebelling against anything that she sees as conventional for a girl of her background and wanting to spend all her time reading. She is reading the more avant-garde

[545] Douglas, *Eliza For Common*, 69.
[546] Ibid., 151.

novels, where women are depicted as having glamourous bohemian lives and dreaming of having that sort of life for herself. She is depicted as reading titles including Joseph Hergesheimer's *Java Head* as well as developing an interest in contemporary poetry - in particular, poems in *The Oxford Book of English Verse* given to her by her brother Jim. At this point in the novel, Eliza is fed up with anything mundane and desires the glamour of the stories she is reading. This is slightly ironic. Anna Buchan writes about the mundane; Eliza is not reading the sort of novel she appears in.

Contrastingly, the heroines in some of the novels written by Anna Buchan's contemporaries are ambitious and rebellious in terms of the social norms of the time. Like Anna Buchan, Catherine Carswell grew up in a Free Church family in Glasgow in the 1880s and 1890s. In her 1920 novel *Open the Door* Carswell's heroine Joanna escapes the confined life of Free Church Glasgow. Joanna's escape is one filled with tragic and dramatic romance. Whereas, Eliza while she dreams of that sort of romance when reading *Java Head* ultimately has a more mundane happy romance which ends in engagement to one of her brother's friends. Anna Buchan, in *Eliza for Common*, gives an insight into the more average woman's experience.

It may be that Anna Buchan's intended readers of this novel were typically older women of her own age, who were of similar ages to Mrs Laidlaw and trying to figure out what to do with their rebellious daughters, rather than younger women of Eliza's age. Earlier in the novel, Mrs Laidlaw, reflecting on her time having tea with Eliza and fellow minister's wife, Mrs Stit, comments "Eliza's discontented…girls often are when they first grow up. I'm ashamed that I find it so hard to be patient with her."[547] The tone of this comment evokes sympathy for Mrs Laidlaw and the situation she faced with Eliza.

Throughout her work, Anna Buchan uses the texts a character is reading as an element of characterisation and, in some cases, offers the reader a peek into a character's bookshelves. This is particularly the case with Mrs Douglas in *Ann and Her Mother.* As discussed in Chapter Two Anna Buchan lists the books that formed Mrs Douglas's evening devotional reading. Thus, it is clear that reading was a daily activity, although this sort of reading was

[547] Ibid., 75.

confined to devotional works. In contrast, Mrs Laidlaw, in *Eliza for Common,* seems largely to have read in the small gaps in her busy day. To an extent, Mrs Laidlaw seems to have wanted to give the impression to visitors of being someone who read. Anna Buchan describes how:

> Mrs Laidlaw dashed into the room and sank panting, into a chair, crying, "Quick, Eliza, a book!"
>
> "Hostess discovered reading," murmured Jim, who noticed with delight that the book his mother appeared absorbed in was *The Crowning Phase of the Critical Philosophy*.[548]

This whole scene has a comedic tone, poking fun at Mrs Laidlaw's attempt to give the appearance of being a reader while not having the time to actually sit down and read. What adds to the incongruous nature of this scene is the book that she is looking at – a rather dry philosophy book.

Throughout *Ann and Her Mother,* Anna Buchan portrays Ann as comparing her writing efforts unfavourably with other authors she has read. Having written about her mother's childhood, Ann comments "When I think of what Hugh Walpole or Compton Mackenzie can make out of somebody's childhood, I blush for my few bald sentences."[549] It is significant that Hugh Walpole should be one of the authors Anna Buchan depicts Ann as comparing her work with. Like her, he was a child of a minister (Anglican) and he was also known by her brother, John Buchan; Walpole worked under John Buchan in the Foreign Office Department of Information. Anna Buchan, in her autobiography, describes Bishop Walpole (Somerset Walpole, Bishop of Edinburgh in the Scottish Episcopal Church and the father of Hugh Walpole) as "a great friend" of her mother's.[550] Meanwhile Compton Mackenzie was a Roman Catholic convert who was a co-founder of the National Party of Scotland and part of the group of authors who formed the core of the Scottish Renaissance literary circle. Both were highly accomplished authors though they were very different in style.

[548] Ibid., 94.
[549] Douglas, *Ann and Her Mother*, 36.
[550] Buchan, *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*, 159.

A book which Anna Buchan depicts Ann and Mrs Douglas both reading is Sheila Kaye-Smith's 1920 novel *Green Apple Harvest*. Like Compton Mackenzie mentioned above, Sheila Kaye-Smith (1887-1956) was a Roman Catholic convert. She married an Anglo-Catholic curate Penrose Fry in 1924 and in 1929 they converted to Roman Catholicism following a trip to Sicily. *Green Apple Harvest* was one of the first books published by Kaye-Smith following her turn from the literary world to the religious. Mrs Douglas when reminiscing about an experience early on in her time as a wife of the manse mentions *Green Apple Harvest*:

> "A sentence in the book we were reading, *Green Apple Harvest*, reminded me of that girl [the dying girl Mrs Douglas visited] … You know when Robert is dying and his brother Clem says to him:
>
> "Oh, Bob, it seems unaccountable hard as you should die in the middle of May!"
>
> "And Robert replies: '… I've a feeling as if I go to the Lord God I'll only be going into the middle of all that's alive … If I'm with Him I can't never lose the month of May…"[551]

Here it is clear that reading is a social activity for the Douglas women – they read the novel together. It is also clear that it is an activity mother and daughter enjoy together. The fact that Mrs Douglas is depicted as using a quotation from a novel to describe her thoughts and feelings about visiting a dying young girl in her early days as a wife of the manse is typical of Anna Buchan's use of texts she read in her writing. It is possible that the use of quotation in conversations was a regular feature of conversations between Anna and her mother in real life. This seems likely since, as a family, all the Buchans had a love of literature and reading and shared their appreciation of books they were reading with each other.

Mrs Douglas is described as having a strong sense of the appropriate place to read different authors' works. She believes that "Really to appreciate Robert Louis you must read him immersed in a town with no hope of a holiday…I'd rather read Ethel M. Dell".[552] For Mrs Douglas, the work of the English romantic author Ethel M. Dell (1881-1939) is far more appropriate to read in a lonely Borders village than the work of Robert Louis Stevenson (1850-1894). This may be a reflection on Mrs Buchan's views on literature; as discussed in

[551] Douglas, *Ann and Her Mother*, 53.
[552] Ibid., 16.

the Introduction Mrs Buchan preferred Anna Buchan's writing to that of her brothers. Ethel M. Dell's work is in some ways similar to that of Anna Buchan – it is romantic and was highly popular amongst women readers. However, there are some differences – where Ethel M. Dell particularly focussed on depicting a romanticised imperial world, Anna Buchan, despite her family connections to the Empire, only wrote one novel inspired by it (*Olivia in India,* her first novel published in 1912) and seems to have been largely indifferent to it as subject matter asides from the collections which are discussed in Chapter Three of this thesis.

The other novelist mentioned by Anna Buchan as one Ann and her mother had read is *The Benefactress* (1901), the fourth novel by Elizabeth von Arnim. *The Benefactress* follows the life of the single Anna Estcourt and her family, including her rich sister-in-law Susie. The names here are significant to Anna Buchan – Anna obviously is her own name and Susie is the family nickname for Susan Buchan (John Buchan's wife). It is similar to *Ann and Her Mother* in that it mostly portrays the lives of women. A major difference between the two works is that, where Ann and her mother settle in a rural Borders village, Anna Estcourt moves to rural Germany to set up her life having received a property there as her inheritance from a beloved uncle. Also, where Anna Buchan largely depicts middle-class Scots, Elizabeth von Arnim explores the world of the German aristocracy. It is significant that a work of Elizabeth von Arnim's should be mentioned in *Ann and Her Mother – Ann and Her Mother* is perhaps Anna Buchan's most autobiographical novel and, like Anna Buchan, Elizabeth von Arnim's writing, and in particular, *The Benefactress,* has been noted as autobiographical.[553] The mention of *The Benefactresss* may be a subtle attempt to justify writing such an autobiographical novel as *Ann and Her Mother* and indicative of the sort of novels Anna Buchan was reading, which might have given her confidence to write a more openly autobiographical work.

One of Anna Buchan's other women of the manse, Rebecca Brand, in *Pink Sugar* (1920), would have disapproved of the work of both Ethel M. Dell and Elizabeth von Arnim. She is depicted as being highly puritanical in her reading habits to the extent of policing the sort of texts her minister brother, whom she lives with, reads. Her brother Robert is depicted as wanting to switch magazine subscriptions to receive the *Times Literary Supplement* and the

[553] 'Elizabeth von Arnim: The Forgotten Feminist Who's Flowering Again', The Independent, 8 November 2011.

Spectator instead of the *Chambers Journal* and the *Sunday at Home*. Later in the novel, when Lady Carruthers describes an article they had read in *The Fortnightly* (the influential magazine *The Fortnightly Review*) to Kirsty Gilmore (the protagonist of *Pink Sugar*), Rebecca Brand comments "'but I haven't much time for reading just now. With one small girl as sole servant there's a lot to do in a house, and when I do have a minute I like a good story to take me out of myself. But I daresay Rob might enjoy it: he would read anything.'[554] This explanation may also apply to Elizabeth Seton in Anna Buchan's earlier novel, *The Setons,* who is rarely depicted as reading, despite enjoying it and having a good knowledge of literature. As previously noted, Eliza, in *Eliza for Common,* is also depicted as reading for escapism. It seems that a shared feature of Anna Buchan's women of the manse's reading habits is largely reading to escape the dullness of life. This is significant for understanding her novels. One of the major reasons why she wrote was to provide women like herself (a daughter of a Free Church manse) an escape from the dullness of life. Her novels are an escape into a familiar, yet subtly different world – a world which is mundane yet has happy endings. She was writing in a time where many of her readers would not have the happy endings which she depicts in her novels.

Conclusion

Robert Crawford is correct to conclude that "this daughter of the manse [Anna Buchan] presents home as a feminized place of struggled-for safety, a domestic sanctuary."[555] This chapter has explored the role of the women of the manse in making the manse a domestic sanctuary for its inhabitants. It was a place of sanctuary for the manse family to relax in, in the midst of all the work they undertook in the parish described in earlier chapters. However, it took a significant amount of work on the part of the women of the manse, especially the wives of the manse, to make it so. Anna Buchan's depiction of that work revealed to readers of the time, and today, what happened behind the closed doors of the manses. This chapter has revealed the work behind the ordinary task of housework.

Anna Buchan's depiction of the women of the manse as being responsible for the maintenance of the family finances offers readers an insight into the careful work that the

[554] Douglas, 'Pink Sugar'.
[555] Crawford, *Scotland's Books*, 529.

women had to do to maintain an upper-middle class lifestyle on a minister's stipend income. In this respect her novels serve as propaganda to support the improvement of ministers' stipends through revealing the impact low stipends had on the wider manse family. Her readers were largely middle- and upper-class women like herself who would have been in the position to persuade their husbands and sons to put pressure on the churches to increase the stipends given to ministers.

Through her depiction of the servant women in her novels, Anna Buchan firmly situates her manse families as middle-class – though differing levels within that. A comparison of the number and quality of servants Anna Buchan's different manse households employed reveals that some manse families could afford more and better servants than others, but all had at least one live-out servant. In the interwar years, when the novels were written, it was a mark of being middle-class to be able to employ a servant, although this was the time that working-class women were beginning to reject service as an occupation. It was also the time when middle-class families were forced, through both financial pressures and shortage of servants, to reduce the number of servants they employed. All these changes are depicted in Anna Buchan's novels and increase the sense of the ordinariness of manse life for her middle-class readers who were facing the same struggles. Anna Buchan's novels also offer a glimpse into the often-overlooked lives of the servants of the manse – all of whom were women. Her depiction of the servants reveals the distinctive challenges that servants of the manse faced – there were greater expectations of them with regard to religiosity and discretion than were placed upon servants in other middle-class homes. Anna Buchan's more fondly described servants were typically from rural Scotland – either the Borders or Highlands. Her depiction of the servants as speaking Borders Scots or as having Gaelic as their first language, whilst the manse family are all depicted as speaking Scots Standard English, places her in opposition to her literary contemporaries who sought to revive Scots regional dialects as respectable literary languages. This is reflective of her holding more conservative social values than the Scottish Renaissance authors who were the dominant school at the time she was writing.

Anna Buchan's novels also offer readers an insight into the leisure pursuits of women of the manse and manse families more broadly. Debbie Sly's observation "that their object is not the singular "pleasure" of sex, but the multiple, apparently trivial, pleasures of gardening,

house-keeping, shopping, tea-parties, and above all, reading and talking about books"[556] is correct to an extent. As has been explored, sewing was a hobby engaged in by some of Anna Buchan's women of the manse – though, like their middle-class contemporaries, their sewing was largely functional – repairing clothes – not creative. Sly is right to argue that the most significant hobby of Anna Buchan's women of the manse is reading. Anna Buchan's depiction of the reading habits of the women of the manse offer an insight into shifts in reading trends. While some of her older women of the manse read the sort of texts one would expect women of the manse in that era to be reading (devotional literature and the classics), some of the younger generation read more unexpected sorts of books, such as decadent novels. Similarly, theatre attendance is an activity where the writings of Anna Buchan demonstrate a generational shift in views of women of the manse with the older generation being much more uncertain about it than the younger women who fall in love with it.

The hobbies which Anna Buchan's women of the manse are banned from engaging in are significant as they reveal the moral restrictions placed on manse families. They show that, while in many ways manse families were typical middle-class families, there were certain things they could not do. Those included dancing and playing bridge, two activities which were popular in the time when Anna Buchan was writing.

The lives of Anna Buchan's women of the manse are relatively ordinary by Scottish middle-class standards. Shields rightly argues that: "When Douglas's characters learn to appreciate and to create instances of everyday beauty, they become reconciled to the ordinariness of middle-class, evangelical Scottish society, which they realize is not so ordinary after all."[557] However, this chapter has revealed the ways in which Anna Buchan's women of the manse resist the ordinariness of their lives. This is particularly the case with the younger generation who found escape in the arts: reading decadent novels, attending theatre performances and making friends with artists.

[556] Sly, 'Pink Sugary Pleasures', 2001, 7.
[557] Shields, 'Scottish Modernism and Middlebrow Aesthetics', July 2021.

Conclusion

This thesis represents a worked example of the use of literature as source material for the understanding of the private lives of women of the manse in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. I have built a case for the significance of Anna Buchan's novels as a source for those working in the field of Scottish church history. She offers the most extensive collection of fictional texts which feature women of the manse by a single female writer. Other novelists who have written texts portraying the lives of women of the manse have only included them in one or two works in their corpus or have only published one or two works in total. The large number, range, depth and breadth of Anna Buchan's novels has allowed for a detailed cross-comparison of the lives of women of the manse as depicted by a single author about whom there is a substantial amount of biographical information available for them and their family. Her novels depict a large variety of different women closely associated with this aspect of church life; daughters, mothers, sisters and servants of the manse. A wide range of different manses are depicted in both urban Gorbals Glasgow and the rural Borders. This thesis has taken seriously the significance of the details of Anna Buchan's depiction of the church activities which her women of the manse participated in including worship, parish visiting, and, in particular, the role of women in fundraising.

The examination of Anna Buchan's depiction of the range of activities women of the manse carried out and their attitudes towards those activities has enabled a new understanding of the breadth of the history of women's ministry. As has been observed in this thesis, Anna Buchan portrays some of her women of the manse viewing the work they did for the church (in support of their minister relatives) as a form of ministry. This is a distinguishing feature of women of the manse of Anna Buchan's time, in contrast with wives and daughters of men of other professions. Buchan, throughout her novels, depicts the younger generation as resisting this expectation. Anna Buchan throughout her daughter-of-the-manse novels, develops the idea of the ministry of women of the manse at sacrament times as being a complementary ministry linked with middle class ideals of hospitality. This is the ministry meant by Elizabeth Seton when she comments to her minister father:

> I smile and smile, and I have that craving for knowledge of the welfare of absent members of families that is so distinguishing a feature of the female clergy. And I don't in the least want to be a typical 'minister's daughter.'"[558]

This quotation comes near the beginning of Anna Buchan's first daughter-of-the-manse novel, *The Setons* (1917). It occurs during an early morning conversation in which Elizabeth Seton is discussing with her minister father a party she went to the previous evening. The contradiction in this quotation is reflective of the tension in Anna Buchan's portrayal of all her women of the manse but, in particular, her daughters of the manse. I have argued throughout this thesis for the significance of Elizabeth's use of the term "female clergy" in light of the date of publication of the novel. Anna Buchan uses this term before the debates to open ordination to the Ministry of Word and Sacrament to women commenced in the presbyterian churches, with the United Free Church not considering the matter until 1926. Elizabeth's use of "female clergy" in Anna Buchan's 1917 novel, suggests that at least some women of the manse had claimed this term for themselves prior to the official debates. However, as I have argued, the ministry Anna Buchan's women of the manse provided as "female clergy" was a complementary pseudo-ministry, which was carried out in support of ordained male relatives.

More broadly in terms of worship, Anna Buchan gives her readers insight into the prayer and devotional lives of women both in the private and public sphere. As well as their involvement in worship, the vast amount of work undertaken by Anna Buchan's women of the manse in their parishes has been examined. One key task Anna Buchan depicts them carrying out is fundraising and, with respect to this activity, this thesis has built on the work of Breitenbach and Orr Macdonald.[559] This thesis has revealed the extent to which the responsibility for fundraising efforts for the local church fell to the women of the manse. Examining Anna Buchan's novels has allowed for a more fleshed-out understanding of what these women might have felt about that responsibility.

Anna Buchan's novels depict a range of financial experiences of manse families and, particularly, the impact of these financial circumstances on women of the manse. While the

[558] Douglas, *The Setons*, 1917, 42.
[559] Breitenbach, *Empire and Scottish Society*; Macdonald, *A Unique and Glorious Mission*.

disparity of stipends has been discussed by Scottish economic historians (in particular John Sawkins), this thesis has revealed the overlooked experiences of women of the manse in managing the household accounts where the manse income was from a variable stipend.[560] It is in this respect that I have argued that Anna Buchan's novels function as propaganda. Written largely for women like herself – middle to upper class women who were either in positions of influence themselves or had male relatives who were, Anna Buchan's novels show the struggles women of the manse faced in maintaining a middle-class lifestyle on stipends which were often insufficient. This is particularly true of her characterisation of Rebecca Brand and Mrs Macdonald in the *Priorsford* series - both, as I have argued, have been depicted in such a way as to engender sympathy for their plight. To a slightly lesser extent, Anna Buchan's characterisation of Eliza and her mother in *Eliza for Common* also serves this function. This thesis has argued that the depiction of this struggle was an attempt on the part of Anna Buchan to raise awareness of the plight of women of the manse in the hope that there might be some improvement in the standards of stipends. By publishing her novels in the early to mid-1920s her novels represent a literary contribution to the debates that were taking place particularly within the United Free Church to introduce standardisation of stipends.

In the field of Scottish literature, this thesis has brought a new understanding of the historical church context which Anna Buchan was inspired by and wrote about. As well as the new understanding of one of the functions of Anna Buchan's novels being propaganda, this thesis has deepened the understanding of the church experiences of Buchan's women of the manse. Chapters three and four have shown the significance of Anna Buchan's depiction of the experiences, attitudes and tasks of women of the manse in the church context. This thesis has drawn out the denominational nuances, which have largely been overlooked until now. It has shown how firmly rooted Anna Buchan's women of the manse are in their Free Church and United Free Church context. I have demonstrated the importance of reading Anna Buchan's work as a writer who was also a daughter of the manse, on her own merit. It has proved that Anna Buchan's novels have a depth and richness of description that invites focussed study and not simply as a comparison with the work of other novelists, including her brother, John Buchan, as well as others, such as Annie

[560] Sawkins, 'Ministerial Stipends in the Free Church of Scotland'.

Swan and Catherine Carswell. This thesis has also, to an extent, recovered other women-of-the-manse novels and novelists. In particular, the works of Jane Findlater, Emma L. Menzies, Marion Lochhead and Lavinia Derwent have been brought into conversation with those of Anna Buchan. All of these female authors were writing about the church but, like Anna Buchan, have been undervalued and underexplored both by literary scholars and church historians.

This thesis has also revealed the details of Anna Buchan's treatment of servants in her literary work. It is the first study to have taken seriously the servants of the manse as characters in her novels. It is widely recognised that Anna Buchan routinely inserted characters from real life into her fictional novels but they were usually afforded a degree of pseudonymity. I have shown that this was not the case with the Buchan family servants, who were inserted without a pseudonym. This thesis has argued for the significance of Buchan's decision not to give her servants a pseudonym when she gives that to all other people, especially given the irony of her depiction of discretion and confidentiality as a highly valued attribute of manse servants in her novels.

This thesis has opened up many new areas of research. Methodologically, this thesis has shown how important works of fiction are in uncovering often overlooked voices in Scottish church history, especially those of women. Women of the manse, as characters in other literary works from different periods, deserve more attention. The lesser-known female authors that I have mentioned throughout this thesis would merit further critical examination – several of which have never received scholarly attention. Jane Findlater and Marion Lochhead's novels in particular would merit studies with a similar approach to this thesis.

Eliza and all Anna Buchan's women of the manse had "something…that made people aware of them, that made what they said matter."[561] Their voices matter at least in part because they offer historians a glimpse into the lives of women in the church, who carried out much of the work of the church - women whose stories have largely only been preserved in fiction.

[561] Douglas, *Eliza For Common*, 111–12.

Appendix I – Chronology of Anna Buchan's life and work

1877	Anna Buchan born at Pathhead Fife on 24 March
1880	William Buchan born.
1882	James (Walter) Buchan born.
1888	Violet Buchan born
1888	Rev John Buchan and family move to John Knox Church (Free Church) Gorbals, Glasgow.
1888-90	Attended Queen's Park Academy.
1890-93	Attended Hutchesons' Girls School
1893	Violet Buchan dies
1893	Move to Edinburgh to attend private school and live with the Walker family.
1894	Alasdair Buchan Born
1894	Move back to Glasgow.
1894	At Queen Margaret College
1899	First visit to Oxford to see John and go to the O.U.D.S. performance of *Midsummer Night's Dream*
1901	Trip with John Buchan to Zermatt Switzerland
1901-02	Stay in Bank House Peebles with relatives. Rest of the Buchan family in South Africa or away from home.
1906	Move to Bank House Peebles with Walter Buchan.
1907	Trip to visit William Buchan in Calcutta India.
1907	John Buchan marries Susan Grosvenor
1911	Rev John Buchan (father) dies. John Buchan nephew born.
1912	Trip to Stratford-on-Avon
1912	William Buchan dies
1912	*Olivia in India* *
1916	Alastair Buchan dies
1917	*The Setons*
1920	*Penny Plain*

1922	*Ann and her Mother*
1924	*Pink Sugar*
1926	*The Proper Place*
1928	*Eliza for Common*
1930	*The Day of Small Things*
1932	*Priorsford*
1933 & 34	Lady in Waiting to Susan Buchan (John Buchan is Lord High Commissioner at Church of Scotland General Assembly)
1935	*Taken by the Hand*
1936	Visited John Buchan in Canada
1937	*Jane's Parlour*
1937	Helen Buchan (mother) dies
1938	*People Like Ourselves* [Omnibus of *Penny Plain*, *Pink Sugar* and *Priorsford*]
1938	Visit to Canada
1940	*The House That Is Our Own*
1940	John Buchan dies in Canada
1945	*Unforgettable, Unforgotten* (Autobiography written under the name Anna Buchan)
1948	Anna Buchan dies in Peebles on 24 November
1950	*Farewell to Priorsford* (posthumous collection of unpublished works and tributes from friends and family)

*Works unless otherwise noted published under the pseudonym O. Douglas.

Bibliography

Works by Anna Buchan

Buchan, Anna. *Farewell to Priorsford: A Book by and about Anna Buchan (O. Douglas).* London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1950.

———. *Olivia in India*. London Hodder and Stoughton, 1922.

———. *Unforgettable, Unforgotten*. London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1945.

Douglas, O. *Ann and Her Mother*. London: Thomas Nelson and Sons, Ltd, 1922.

———. *Eliza For Common*. 5th ed. London ; New York: Hodder and Stoughton, 1930.

———. *Jane's Parlour*. London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1937.

———. 'Penny Plain'. In *People Like Ourselves*, 1st ed., 9–353. London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1938.

———. 'Pink Sugar'. In *People Like Ourselves*, 1st ed., 355–694. London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1938.

———. 'Priorsford'. In *People Like Ourselves*, 1st ed., 695–1055. London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1938.

———. *Taken by the Hand: Scottish Novel*. e-artnow, 2020.

———. *The Day of Small Things*. Greyladies. Edinburgh: Greyladies, 2012.

———. *The House That Is Our Own*. Thomas Nelson and Sons, Ltd, 1951.

———. *The Proper Place*. London ; Edinburgh: Thomas Nelson and Sons, Ltd, 1929.

———. *The Setons*. London ; Edinburgh: Thomas Nelson and Sons, Ltd, 1917.

Manuscripts, Correspondence, Archive Materials

National Library of Scotland

Buchan Papers

Acc.11627/117. Lectures and addresses: 'Dorcas, Acts, ix, 36:43'. 'Christ and the Common People'. 'Gallio' [ie. L. Junius Gallio, Acts 18:12]. 'Experiences in India, Oct 07 – May 08'. 'Hannah More'. 'Mrs Oliphant'. 'Religion and the Drama'. 'Christina Rossetti'. 'Women Philanthropists'.

Acc.11627/118. Short stories and other writings: 'A Talk About Books'. 'The Destruction of the Poor'. 'An Echo'. 'Penny Plain' – one-act comedy play. 'Sardines'. 'Writers and Readers'. 'To be a Pilgrim', probably a review of a Scots play. 'Marigold'. Copy of AB's address as Warden of Neidpath (Peebles Common Riding).

Acc.11627/119. Letter, 4 Sep. 1937, of Edith Baldwin to AB; with various incomplete or unidentified short articles, reviews or lectures, and printed ephemera.

Acc.11627/120. Workbooks of AB (in 11 volumes).

Acc.6893. Urquhart, William Spence. ‘Corrected Typescript, circa 1948, of the Reverend Dr William S Urquhart, “Some Memories of O Douglas”’, 1948.

Correspondence and literary papers of the author, Marion C Lochhead (1902-1985).

MS.26190.49. Buchan, Anna. ‘Letter from Anna Buchan to Marion Lochhead Dated August 3 30’, 3 August 1930.

MS.26190.164. ‘Letter from Anna Buchan to Marion Lochhead Dated Jan 24 38’, 24 January 1938.

MS.26190.46. ‘Letter from Anna Buchan to Marion Lochhead Dated June 8 30’, 8 June 1930.

Correspondence, sketches, notebooks and other papers of and concerning Sir David Young Cameron, Katharine Cameron Kay, and her husband Arthur Kay.

Acc.8950/19. NLS. Buchan Anna. ‘“Album Amicorum - V A Heylinger 1787”, a Friendship Book of Katharine Cameron Kay Containing Dedications, Mainly in Verse, from Various People, with a Frontispiece by David Young Cameron.’, n.d.

Centre for Research Collections, University of Edinburgh

Thomas Nelson

Coll-25 B/12/204 Letter from W. S. Graham to John Buchan about publication of "Penny Plain" and "The Setons".

Mitchell Library

‘John Knox United Free Church Deacons Court Minute Book’. Glasgow: John Knox United Free Church, n.d.

Pre 1948 Primary Sources

A Minister’s Wife. ‘Our Sunday Fireside - The Blessing of a Sickbed’. *Life and Work*, April 1896.
‘A Woman Essayist• | Musselburgh News | Friday 10 August 1906 | British Newspaper Archive’. Accessed 27 March 2023. https://www.britishnewspaperarchive.co.uk/viewer/bl/0002692/19060810/086/0005.
Aberdeen Journal. ‘0. Douglas on Scots Poets’. 9 December 1924. Gale Primary Sources.
Aberdeen Journal. ‘Fiction’. 14 December 1917. British Library Newspapers.
An Elderly Minister’s Wife. ‘Elders, but Not Ministers’. *Life and Work The Record of The Church of Scotland*, April 1931.
Anonymous. ‘Parish Grievances’. *Woman’s Guild Life and Work*, August 1906.
Anonymous. ‘What of the Dance Hall?’ *Record of the United Free Church of Scotland*, May 1925.

Buchan, John. *John Buchan, April 23, 1847 - November 19, 1911. [His Literary Remains, with a Biographical Sketch and Appreciations. With a Portrait.]*. Peebles: Privately printed, 1912.
———. 'John Buchan Fonds, 2110-1-11-5', 3 October 1902. Queen's University Archives. https://www.fromthepage.com/qua/john-buchan-fonds/2110-1-11-5/display/1761641.
———. 'Letter to G. Graham (Thomas Nelson and Sons Ltd. Publisher)', 5 November 1929. B/14/149. Records of Thomas Nelson & Sons Ltd, Coll-25. University of Edinburgh Library Heritage Collections.
———. *Memory Hold-the-Door*. London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1940.
———. 'The Shorter Catechism'. In *The Moon Endureth: Tales and Fancies*, 83–84. Edinburgh ; London: William Blackwood and Sons, 1912.
———. *Witch Wood*. Boston ; New York : Houghton Mifflin Company, 1927.
Campbell, John Lorne. *Gaelic in Scottish Education and Life: Past, Present and Future / by John Lorne Campbell.* Edinburgh: Pub. for the Saltire Society by W. & A.K. Johnston, 1945.
Chadwick, G. A. *The Gospel According to St. Mark by G.A. Chadwick.* Seventh edition. The Expositor's Bible. London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1899.
Charteris, Archibald Hamilton. 'Women's Work: And Its Possible Organisation. A Woman's Guild.' *Life and Work A Parish Magazine*, March 1884.
Church of Scotland General Assembly. *Reports on the Schemes of the Church of Scotland. Reports on the Schemes of the Church of Scotland.* Edinburgh: William Blackwood and Sons, 1920.
Dundee Courier. 'Annie S. Swan Honoured'. 10 January 1935. Gale Primary Sources.
Edinburgh Evening News. 'The Press and Sabbath Desecration'. 1 March 1897.
Evening Telegraph. '1,918,863 Surplus Women'. 29 May 1922. Gale Primary Sources.
Fergusson, Adam Wightman. *Sons of the Manse*. Dundee: JPMatthew, 1923.
Findlater, Jane H. *Rachel*. London: Methuen, 1899.
Findlater, Jane Helen. *The Story of a Mother*. London: J. Nisbet, 1902. http://digital.nls.uk/128693600.
Findlater, Jane Helen and James Nisbet and Co. *Stones from a glass house.* Edinburgh: National Library of Scotland, 2005. http://digital.nls.uk/128693602.
Gage, James. *Great Hamilton Street Free Church Glasgow. Historical Sketch of the Congregation and Bazaar Guide.* Glasgow: Carter & Pratt, 1890.
Gibberd, K. 'Domestic Service'. *The Woman's Leader*, 1 April 1920. https://digital.library.lse.ac.uk/objects/lse:rag239cuy/read/single#page/1/mode/1up.
Gibbon, Lewis Grassic. *A Scots Quair*. London: Penguin Books for Lomond Books, 1998.
Gibson, W. *'Not Weary in Well-Doing'; or The Life and Work of Mrs. Helen Lockhart Gibson*. Edinburgh, 1888.
Glasgow Herald. 'The Union Question'. 15 March 1899.
Hill, Octavia. *Homes of the London Poor*. Macmillan, 1875.
Hull Daily Mail. 'Ministers' Stipends'. 17 July 1920. British Library Newspapers.
Julian, John. *A Dictionary of Hymnology*. New York : Scribner's, 1891.
J.lewis May. *John Lane And The Nineties*. John Lane The Bodley Head, 1936.
Katharine Burrill. *Corner Stones: "That Our Daughters May Be as Corner Stones, Polished After the Similitude of a ...* J.M. Dent & Co., 1907.
Lee, H. O., and H. O. Lee. 'Penny Plain'. *The Times Literary Supplement*, 19 August 1920. Gale Primary Sources.
Lendrum, Anna. 'Deaconesses in the Free Church'. *Youth*, January 1897.
Mackay, Charles. *A Dictionary of Lowland Scotch :With an Introductory Chapter Onthe Poetry, Humour, and Literary History of the Scottish Language and an Appendix of Scottish Proverbs /*. Boston :, 1888. http://hdl.handle.net/2027/nyp.33433069243495.
Mackay, James. 'The Passing of Marget'. *The Record of the Home and Foreign Mission Work of the United Free Church of Scotland.*, January 1925.
Menzies, Emma L. *Achachlacher / by Emma L. Menzies.* Edinburgh: R. & R. Clark, 1936.

'Methods and Work of the Soldiers' and Sailors' Families Association'. *Charity Organisation Review* 38, no. 223 (1915): 6–20.
Millar, J. H. 'The Literature of the Kailyard'. Edited by William Ernest Henley. *The New Review; London* 12, no. 71 (April 1895): 384–94.
Milroy, William. *A Scottish Communion / by William Milroy.* Paisley: Alexander Gardner, 1882.
Minister's Wife. 'More about Life in the Manse'. *The Record of the Home and Foreign Mission Work of the United Free Church of Scotland.*, February 1928.
Morgan, Charles Langbridge, C. Morgan, J. G. Wilson, J. G. Wilson, Michael Roberts, Janet Roberts, W. Alexander Knox, Walter Elliot, D. N. Dalglish, and D. N. Dalglish. 'NOVELS ON THE SOCIAL SCENE'. *The Times Literary Supplement*, 30 April 1938. The Times Literary Supplement Historical Archive.
Muir, Willa. *Mrs Grundy in Scotland*. Voice of Scotland Series. London: George Routledge and Sons, 1936.
Oliphant, Mrs (Margaret). *The Minister's Wife*. London : Hurst and Blackett, 1869.
'Olivia In India | Pall Mall Gazette | Thursday 08 May 1913 | British Newspaper Archive'. Accessed 15 November 2022. https://www.britishnewspaperarchive.co.uk/viewer/bl/0000098/19130508/059/0005.
Orr, Christine. *The Glorious Thing*. 2nd ed. Edinburgh: Merchiston Publishing, 2013.
Pember Reeves, Mrs. *Round about a Pound a Week*. London : G. Bell, 1913.
Philip, Adam. *The Evangel in Gowrie: Sketches of Men and Movements*. Edinburgh: Oliphant Anderson & Ferrier, 1911.
Punch. *Cyril (Whose Father Has Just Had the Telephone Installed). 'And Bless Father and Mother, and Make Me a Good Boy - and Keep Away All Zeppelins (Pause). Watkins Junior Is Speaking.'* 1916. https://www.europeana.eu/en/item/206/item_X75GZD2IIME2OI7LDGCIDIW4WO5LR4EA.
Reid, James. *In Quest of Reality : Being the Warrack Lectures on Preaching Delivered in the Theological Colleges of the United Free Church of Scotland, Session 1923-24*. New York : George H. Doran Co., 1924.
Reith, G. M. (George Murray). *Reminiscences of the United Free Church General Assembly, 1900-1929*. Edinburgh: Moray Press, 1933.
Shettleston Parish Church Bazaar Guidebook and Timetable 3rd, 4th-5th Novr 1898. Glasgow: Carter & Pratt Printers, 1898.
Smellie, Alexander. *In the Hour of Silence: A Book of Daily Meditations for a Year.* London: Andrew Melrose, 1906.
St Stephen's Parish Magazine. 'Sabbath Schools'. March 1882.
Stryker, Melancthon Woolsey, and Hubert P. Main. *The New Alleluia : A Collection of Hymns and Tunes for the Church School, and the Mid-Week Meeting*. New York : Biglow & Main, 1886.
Swan, Annie S. *Seed Time and Harvest: The Story of the Hundred Years' Work of the Women's Foreign Mission of the Church of Scotland.* London ; New York: TNelson, 1937.
The Spectator. 'VALERIE UPTON (Book Review)'. London, United Kingdom: The Spectator (1828) Ltd., 16 November 1907.
The Times. 'A Lame Dog's Diary'. 2 March 1906. Gale Primary Sources.
United Free Church of Scotland. 'Overtures Anent Eligibility of Women for Ordination'. United Free Church of Scotland Proceedings and Debates of the General Assembly Held at Ednburgh, May-June, 1926. Edinburgh: United Free Church of Scotland, 4 June 1926.
United Free Church of Scotland General Assembly. 'Report of the Committee on the Recognition of the Place of Women in the Church's Life and Work'. *Reports to the General Assembly of the United Free Church of Scotland.* Reports to the General Assembly of the United Free Church of Scotland. Edinburgh: United Free Church of Scotland, 1915.
Walford, Lucy Bethia. *Recollections of a Scottish Novelist*. Waddesdon: Kylin Press, 1984.

Watson, William. ‘What the Sabbath School Expects from the Church’. *The Sabbath School Magazine*, January 1888.
Webster, Lucy. ‘The Trials and Joys of a Collector’. *The Record of the Home and Foreign Mission Work of the United Free Church of Scotland.*, February 1925.

Secondary Scholarship

A. C. Cheyne. *The Transforming of the Kirk: Victorian Scotland’s Religious Revolution*. Edinburgh: Saint Andrew Press, 1983.
Abrams, Lynn, and Linda Fleming. ‘From Scullery to Conservatory:: Everyday Life in the Scottish Home’. In *A History of Everyday Life in Twentieth-Century Scotland*, edited by Lynn Abrams and Callum G. Brown, 48–75. Edinburgh University Press, 2010. https://www.jstor.org/stable/10.3366/j.ctt1g09x99.8.
Attenborough, John. *A Living Memory : Hodder and Stoughton Publishers, 1868-1975*. London : Hodder and Stoughton, 1975.
Baillie, D. M. *The Theology of the Sacraments, and Other Papers / Donald M. Baillie ; with a Biographical Essay by John Baillie.* London: Faber, 1957.
Barnaby, Paul. ‘Scott and the Nineteenth Century Child Reader’. In *The Land of Story-Books: Scottish Children’s Literature in the Long Nineteenth Century : Scottish Children’s Literature in the Long Nineteenth Century*, edited by Sarah Dunnigan and Shu-Fang Lai. Glasgow, UNITED KINGDOM: Association for Scottish Literary Studies, 2019. http://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/ed/detail.action?docID=5826402.
Beauman, Nicola. *A Very Great Profession : The Woman’s Novel 1914-39*. London : Virago, 1983.
Bebbington, David W. *Evangelicalism in Modern Britain: A History from the 1730s to The 1980s*. London, UNITED KINGDOM: Taylor & Francis Group, 1989. http://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/ed/detail.action?docID=179445.
Beddoe, Deirdre. *Back to Home and Duty: Women between the Wars, 1918-1939*. London ; San Francisco: Pandora, 1989.
Billcliffe, Roger. ‘Glasgow Boys (Act. 1875–1895)’. Oxford University Press, October 2009. https://doi.org/10.1093/ref:odnb/64500.
Breitenbach, Esther. *Empire and Scottish Society: The Impact of Foreign Missions at Home, c. 1790 to c. 1914*. Edinburgh, UNITED KINGDOM: Edinburgh University Press, 2009. http://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/ed/detail.action?docID=475759.
Breitenbach, Esther, and Eleanor Gordon, eds. *Out of Bounds: Women in Scottish Society 1800-1945*. Edinburgh Education and Society Series. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1992.
Brown, Callum G. ‘Angels: Women In Discourse And Narrative 1800–1950’. In *The Death of Christian Britain*. Routledge, 2000.
———. *Religion and Society in Scotland since 1707*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1997.
———. ‘Rotavating the Kailyard: Re-Imagining the Scottish “Meenister” in Discourse and the Parish State since 1707’. In *Anticlericalism in Britain c. 1500-1914*, edited by Nigel Aston and Matthew Cragoe, 138–58. Gloucestershire: Sutton Publishing, 2000.
———. ‘The Sunday-School Movement in Scotland 1780-1914’. *Scottish Church History Society* 21 (1981): 3–26.
Brown, Callum G., and Callum G. Brown. *Religion and Society in Scotland since 1707*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1997.

Brown, Callum G., and Jayne D. Stephenson. '"Sprouting Wings?" : Women and Religion in Scotland c. 1890-1950'. In *Out of Bounds: Women in Scottish Society 1800-1945*, edited by Esther Breitenbach and Eleanor Gordon. Edinburgh Education and Society Series. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1992.

Brown, Ian, Alan Riach, and Alan Riach. *The Edinburgh Companion to Twentieth-Century Scottish Literature*. Edinburgh, UNITED KINGDOM: Edinburgh University Press, 2009. http://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/ed/detail.action?docID=1961970.

Brown, S. J. 'Reform, Reconstruction, Reaction: The Social Vision of Scottish Presbyterianism c. 1830-c. 1930'. *Scottish Journal of Theology* 44, no. 4 (1991): 489–518. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0036930600025977.

Brown, Stewart. 'Beliefs and Religions'. In *A History of Everyday Life in Scotland, 1800 to 1900*, edited by Graeme Morton and Trevor Griffiths. Edinburgh University Press, 2010. https://doi.org/10.1515/9780748629534.

Brown, Stewart J. '"A Solemn Purification by Fire": Responses to the Great War in the Scottish Presbyterian Churches, 1914–19'. *The Journal of Ecclesiastical History* 45, no. 1 (January 1994): 82–104. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022046900016444.

———. *Providence and Empire: Religion, Politics and Society in the United Kingdon, 1815-1914*. Religion, Politics and Society in Britain. Harlow: Pearson Longman, 2008.

Buchan, Alice. *A Scrap Screen*. London: H. Hamilton, 1979.

Buchan, William. *The Rags of Time: A Fragment of Autobiography*. Southampton: Ashford, Buchan & Enright, 1990.

Burgess, Moira. *Imagine a City: Glasgow in Fiction*. Glendaruel: Argyll Publishing, 1998.

Burleigh, John H. S. *A Church History of Scotland*. Fourth impression.. Edinburgh: Hope Trust, 1983.

Burman, Barbara. 'Made at Home by Clever Fingers: Home Dressmaking in Edwardian England'. In *The Culture of Sewing Gender, Consumption and Home Dressmaking*, edited by Barbara Burman. Dress, Body, Culture. New York: Berg, 1999.

Caine, Barbara, and Marc Brodie. 'Class, Sex and Friendship: The Long Nineteenth Century'. In *Friendship : A History*, edited by Barbara Caine. London ; Oakville, CT : Equinox Pub., 2008.

Calder, Angus. 'The Disruption in Fiction'. In *Scotland in the Age of the Disruption*, edited by Stewart J. Brown and Michael Fry. Edinburgh: University Press, 1993.

Campbell, Ian. '"A Thin and Tattered Veil": Lewis Grassic Gibbon and the Church of Scotland'. *Studies in Scottish Literature* 43, no. 1 (1 May 2017): 115–23.

———. *Kailyard*. New Assessments. Edinburgh: Ramsay Head, 1981.

Colpus, Eve. *Female Philanthropy in the Interwar World: Between Self and Other*. London: Bloomsbury Academic, 2018. https://nls.ldls.org.uk/welcome.html?ark:/81055/vdc_100052020056.0x000001.

Cormack, Michael J. *The Stirling Tract Enterprise and the Drummonds*. Occasional Publications (University of Stirling. Bibliographical Society) 3. Stirling: University of Stirling Bibliographical Society, 1984.

Cosslett, Tess. *Woman to Woman : Female Friendship in Victorian Fiction*. Atlantic Highlands, NJ : Humanities Press International, 1988.

Crawford, Robert. *Scotland's Books: The Penguin History of Scottish Literature*. London ; New York: Penguin Books, 2007.

Currie, Robert. *Churches and Churchgoers : Patterns of Church Growth in the British Isles since 1700*. Oxford [Eng.] : Clarendon Press, 1977.

Delap, Lucy. 'Servant-Keepers and the Management of Servants'. In *Knowing Their Place*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011. https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780199572946.003.0003.

Derwent, Lavinia. *Lady of the Manse / Lavinia Derwent; Illustrations by Elizabeth Haines.* London: Arrow, 1985.

Dickson, Beth. 'Annie S Swan and O Douglas: Legacies of the Kailyard'. In *A History of Scottish Women's Writing*, edited by Gifford, Douglas and Dorothy McMillan. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1997.

'Dictionaries of the Scots Language:: SND :: Manse'. Accessed 10 January 2023. https://dsl.ac.uk/entry/snd/manse.

Ellis, Alec. *A History of Children's Reading and Literature*. Elsevier, 1963. https://doi.org/10.1016/C2013-0-02105-6.

Finlayson, Alexander. *Unity and Diversity : The Founders of the Free Church of Scotland*. Fearn, Ross-shire, Great Britain : Christian Focus, 2010.

Forrester, Wendy. *Anna Buchan and O. Douglas*. London: Maitland Press, 1995.

Fyfe, Aileen. 'A Short History of the Religious Tract Society'. In *From The Dairyman's Daughter to Worrals of the WAAF: The Religious Tract Society, Lutterworth Press and Children's Literature*, edited by Dennis Butts, Pat Garrett, and Children's Books History Society, 12–35. Cambridge: Lutterworth Press, 2006.

Gibbon, Lewis Grassic. *A Scots Quair*. London: Penguin Books for Lomond Books, 1998.

Giles, Judy. *Women, Identity, and Private Life in Britain, 1900-50*. New York : St. Martin's Press, 1995.

Gordon, Eleanor, and Esther Breitenbach. *The World Is Ill-Divided: Women's Work in Scotland in the Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries / Edited by Eleanor Gordon and Esther Breitenbach.* Edinburgh Education and Society Series. Edinburgh: University Press, 1990.

Green, Martin. *A Biography of John Buchan and His Sister Anna: The Personal Background of Their Literary Work*. Studies in British Literature, v. 8. Lewiston, N.Y., USA: E. Mellen Press, 1990.

Groot, Gerard de. '9 "We Are Safe Whatever Happens" - Douglas Haig, The Reverend George Duncan, and the Conduct of War, 1916-1918'. In *Scotland and War AD 79-1918*, 193–211. Edinburgh: John Donald Publishers, 1991.

Hansen, Caitlin. '14. Betwixt-and-Between: Barrie, Shakespeare, and Playing at Childhood'. In *The Land of Story-Books: Scottish Children's Literature in the Long Nineteenth Century*, edited by Sarah Dunnigan and Shu-Fang Lai. Glasgow, UNITED KINGDOM: Association for Scottish Literary Studies, 2019. http://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/ed/detail.action?docID=5826402.

Houlihan, Marjory, Roy Shipperbottom, and Lynda Brown. *Tripe: A Most Excellent Dish*. Blackawton, Totnes, Devon: Prospect Books, 2011.

Humble, Nicola. *The Feminine Middlebrow Novel, 1920s to 1950s : Class, Domesticity, and Bohemianism*. Oxford ; New York : Oxford University Press, 2001.

International P.E.N. Club, Scottish Centre. 'About Scottish P.E.N. – National Library of Scotland', 1953.

Jones, Andrew Michael. *The Revival of Evangelicalism: Mission and Piety in the Victorian Church of Scotland*. *The Revival of Evangelicalism*. Edinburgh University Press, 2022. https://doi.org/10.1515/9781474491686.

Kelley, Victoria. *Soap and Water: Cleanliness, Dirt and the Working Classes in Victorian and Edwardian Britain / Victoria Kelley.* London: I B Taurus, 2010.

Lawrence, Sarah. *A Rite on the Edge: Baptism and Christening in the Church of England*. London: SCM Press, 2019.

Lennie, Tom. *Glory in the Glen: A History of Evangelical Revivals in Scotland, 1880-1940*, 2013.

Lomas, Janis. '"Delicate Duties": Issues of Class and Respectability in Government Policy towards the Wives and Widows of British Soldiers in the Era of the Great War'. *Women's History Review* 9, no. 1 (1 March 2000): 123–47. https://doi.org/10.1080/09612020000200233.

Lownie, Andrew. *John Buchan: The Presbyterian Cavalier*. Edinburgh: Canongate, 1995.

Macdonald, Finlay. *From Reform to Renewal: Scotland's Kirk Century by Century*. Edinburgh: Saint Andrew Press, 2017.

Macdonald, Kate. 'Achachlacher, by Emma L Menzies'. *Kate Macdonald* (blog), 6 February 2019. https://katemacdonald.net/2019/02/06/achachlacher-by-emma-l-menzies/.

Macdonald, Lesley Orr. *A Unique and Glorious Mission: Women and Presbyterianism in Scotland 1830 to 1930*. Edinburgh: John Donald Publishers, 2000.
———. 'Barr, Elizabeth Brown (1905–1995), Minister of the United Free Church of Scotland'. In *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*. Oxford University Press, 2004. http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/10.1093/ref:odnb/9780198614128.001.0001/odnb-9780198614128-e-48834.
Mackay, Charles. *A Dictionary of Lowland Scotch :With an Introductory Chapter Onthe Poetry, Humour, and Literary History of the Scottish Language and an Appendix of Scottish Proverbs /*. Boston :, 1888. http://hdl.handle.net/2027/nyp.33433069243495.
MacKenzie, Eileen. *The Findlater Sisters: Literature & Friendship.* London: JMurray, 1964.
Mackenzie, Lorna. 'Bogus Banking: The Failure of the City of Glasgow Bank'. *The Hunterian Blog* (blog), 18 September 2017. http://hunterian.academicblogs.co.uk/bogus-banking-the-failure-of-the-city-of-glasgow-bank/.
MacKinnon, Kenneth. *Gaelic: A Past and Future Prospect*. Edinburgh: Saltire, 1991.
Maltz, Diana. *British Aestheticism and the Urban Working Classes, 1870-1900: Beauty for the People*. Palgrave Studies in Nineteenth-Century Writing and Culture. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2006.
Marshall, Rosalind K. *Virgins and Viragos: A History of Women in Scotland from 1080 to 1980*. London: Collins, 1983.
McLeod, Hugh. 'White Collar Values and the Role of Religion'. In *The Lower Middle Class in Britain, 1870-1914 / Edited by Geoffrey Crossick.*, edited by Geoffrey Crossick. London: Croom Helm, 1977.
McMillan, Dorothy. 'Allusive Spark: The Prime of Miss Jean Brodie and O. Douglas'. *Notes and Queries* 65, no. 3 (1 September 2018): 431–431. https://doi.org/10.1093/notesj/gjy081.
Menzies, Emma L. *Achachlacher / by Emma L. Menzies.* Edinburgh: R. & R. Clark, 1936.
Mix, Katherine Lyon. *A Study in Yellow: The Yellow Book and Its Contributors.* Lawrence: University of Kansas Press, 1960.
Morgan, Charles Langbridge, C. Morgan, J. G. Wilson, J. G. Wilson, Michael Roberts, Janet Roberts, W. Alexander Knox, Walter Elliot, D. N. Dalglish, and D. N. Dalglish. 'NOVELS ON THE SOCIAL SCENE'. *The Times Literary Supplement*, 30 April 1938. The Times Literary Supplement Historical Archive.
Murray, Douglas M. 'Chapter 6 From Disruption to Union'. In *Studies in the History of Worship in Scotland*, edited by Duncan B. Forrester. Edinburgh: T& TClark, 1984.
Orr, Christine. *The Glorious Thing*. 2nd ed. Edinburgh: Merchiston Publishing, 2013.
Orr, Lesley. 'HEWAT, Elizabeth Glendinning Kirkwood'. In *The New Biographical Dictionary of Scottish Women*, edited by Elizabeth Ewan and Rose Pipes, 2nd ed. Edinburgh University Press, 2017. https://www.cambridge.org/core/books/new-biographical-dictionary-of-scottish-women/E7407E5276D61ED07E2A9EBA962D9BE5.
Oxford Dictionary of National Biography. 'Bonar, Andrew Alexander (1810–1892), Free Church of Scotland Minister'. Accessed 9 September 2022. https://doi.org/10.1093/ref:odnb/2812.
Oxford Dictionary of National Biography. 'Findlater, Mary Williamina (1865–1963), Novelist'. Accessed 31 March 2020. https://doi.org/10.1093/ref:odnb/58784.
Paton, D. C. 'Drink and the Temperance Movement in Nineteenth Century Scotland', 1977. https://era.ed.ac.uk/handle/1842/17777.
Peel, Mark. 'New Worlds of Friendship: The Early Twentieth Century'. In *Friendship : A History*, edited by Barbara Caine. London ; Oakville, CT : Equinox Pub., 2008.
Read, David. 'The Scottish Tradition of Preaching'. In *Studies in the History of Worship in Scotland*, edited by Duncan B. Forrester and Douglas M. Murray, 132–40. Edinburgh: T& TClark, 1984.
Rehfeldt, Richard. 'The Relationship between Preaching and Other Ministerial Functions as Viewed in the Warrack Lectures on Preaching, 1921-1971 : Plus a Comparison of These Views with Selected Writings by British Authors of Homiletical and Pastoral Literature in the Fifty Years

Prior to the Warrack Lectureship', 1975. https://research-repository.st-andrews.ac.uk/handle/10023/14076.
Reid, Harry. *Outside Verdict : An Old Kirk in a New Scotland*. Edinburgh : Saint Andrew Press, 2002.
Riach, Alan. 'Chapter 4 Arcades – The 1920s and 1930s'. In *The Edinburgh Companion to Twentieth-Century Scottish Literature*, edited by Ian Brown and Alan Riach. Edinburgh, UNITED KINGDOM: Edinburgh University Press, 2009. http://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/ed/detail.action?docID=1961970.
Riches, Christopher, and Jan Palmowski. 'British Empire'. In *A Dictionary of Contemporary World History*. Oxford University Press, 2019.
Sawkins, John W. 'Ministerial Stipends in the Free Church of Scotland: Edinburgh 1843–1900'. *Scottish Church History* 41, no. 1 (1 June 2012): 71–112. https://doi.org/10.3366/sch.2012.41.1.5.
Sawkins, John W., and Em Bailey. 'Ministerial Stipend Cross Subsidy in the United Free Church of Scotland'. *Scottish Church History* 50, no. 1 (1 April 2021): 1–27. https://doi.org/10.3366/sch.2021.0041.
Scott, Sheila. *'O. Douglas': The Story of Anna Buchan*. Biggar: Sheila Scott, 1996.
Senelick, Lawrence. 'Sexuality and Gender'. In *A Cultural History of Theatre in the Age of Empire*, edited by Peter Marx. London, UNITED KINGDOM: Bloomsbury Publishing Plc, 2019. http://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/ed/detail.action?docID=5846548.
Shields, Juliet. 'O. Douglas and the Aesthetics of the Ordinary'. *Scottish Literary Review* 8, no. 2 (2016): 113–31.
———. *Scottish Women's Writing in the Long Nineteenth Century: The Romance of Everyday Life*. Cambridge, UNITED KINGDOM: University of Cambridge ESOL Examinations, 2021. http://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/ed/detail.action?docID=6685013.
Sly, Debbie. 'Pink Sugary Pleasures: Reading the Novels of O. Douglas'. *Journal of Popular Culture* 35, no. 1 (2001): 5–20.
Smith, Robert. 'Religion, the Scottish Work Ethic and the Spirit of Enterprise'. *International Journal of Entrepreneurship and Innovation* 10, no. 2 (2009): 111–24. https://doi.org/10.5367/000000009788161299.
Spinks, Bryan D. *Scottish Presbyterian Worship: Proposals for Organic Change, 1843 to the Present Day*. Edinburgh: Saint Andrew Press, 2020.
Springhall, John. *Youth, Empire and Society: British Youth movements 1883-1940*. London Hamden, Conn: Croom Helm Archon books, 1977.
Stevenson, John. *British Society, 1914-45*. Reprint. The Pelican Social History of Britain. Harmondsworth: Penguin Books, 1986.
Stewartby, Deborah. 'Walter Buchan - Who He?' *The John Buchan Journal*, no. 55 (2022): 17–25.
Streatfeild, Noel. *Parson's Nine*. Edinburgh: Greyladies, 2014.
Swan, Annie S. *Seed Time and Harvest: The Story of the Hundred Years' Work of the Women's Foreign Mission of the Church of Scotland.* London ; New York: TNelson, 1937.
Tanner, Ailsa. 'Glasgow Girls (Act. 1880–1920)'. Oxford University Press, January 2010. https://doi.org/10.1093/ref:odnb/73660.
Team, National Records of Scotland Web. 'National Records of Scotland'. Document. National Records of Scotland. National Records of Scotland, 31 May 2013. /research/learning/first-world-war/scotlands-people-and-the-first-world-war.
Telford, Andrena. 'Gone but Not Forgotten: O. Douglas and the Great War"'. In *Hail to Priorsford*. Peebles: The John Buchan Story, 2021.
The Bottle Imp. 'Scott's Legacy to Scottish Historical Fiction', 1 November 2014. https://www.thebottleimp.org.uk/2014/11/scotts-legacy-to-scottish-historical-fiction/.
The Independent. 'Elizabeth von Arnim: The Forgotten Feminist Who's Flowering Again', 8 November 2011. https://www.independent.co.uk/arts-

entertainment/books/features/elizabeth-von-arnim-the-forgotten-feminist-who-s-flowering-again-6258398.html.
Wallace, Valerie, and Colin Kidd. 'Between Nationhood and Nonconformity: The Scottish Whig–Presbyterian Novel and the Denominational Press'. In *Literature and Union*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2018. https://doi.org/10.1093/oso/9780198736233.003.0009.
Walton, Samantha. 'Scottish Modernism, Kailyard Fiction and the Woman at Home'. In *Transitions in Middlebrow Writing, 1880–1930*, edited by Kate Macdonald and Christoph Singer, 141–60. London: Palgrave Macmillan UK, 2015. https://doi.org/10.1057/9781137486776_8.
Weekes, David. 'John Buchan (1875-1940) : A Reassessment of His Christian Faith and Practice'. University of St Andrews, 2017.