

Chinese Protestant Theologies of Social Ministry  
in Nationalist Taiwan,  
with Special Emphasis on  
the Eden Social Welfare Foundation and Liu Hsia.

by  
Maurice Alwyn Sween, III



A thesis presented for the degree of  
Doctor of Philosophy  
University of Edinburgh  
2006



## DECLARATION

The thesis has been composed by the author, is the author's own work, and has not been submitted for any other degree program.

## ABSTRACT

This thesis examines theologies of social ministry among Taiwan's Chinese Protestant communities between 1945 and 2000. This covers the period the nationalist Kuomintang Party governed Taiwan and includes the rise of the democratization movement. The Eden Social Welfare Foundation and its founder, Liu Hsia, are featured as representatives of an innovative contextual theology of social ministry generated on the margins of the Protestant churches. The main argument of the thesis is that Eden and Liu represent an approach to social ministry that draws from local cultural resources in developing a holistic theology that combines spiritual and social dimensions of social ministry, and thus offers an alternative to the emphasis on either individual evangelism or social action that characterizes the Protestant churches.

This argument is based on the hypothesis that the ecclesiastical and political context of Taiwan has affected the theologies of social ministry of the Protestant churches with the result that these theologies have been divided into two distinct factions: those of the churches with origins in China and those of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan. This thesis will subject the theologies of social ministry prevalent in each of these entities to critical analysis, assessing their differences and evaluating their respective strengths and weaknesses. It will be demonstrated that the divisiveness inherent in differing contexts has limited the perspectives of the churches and made it difficult for one group to appreciate the contributions of the other. In this context it will be argued that the *shuangfu* or "double-blessing" theology of the Eden Social Welfare Foundation and Liu Hsia offers a creative synthesis in a culturally dynamic social ministry.

This thesis has been built on primary sources that include interviews with leaders from the Chinese Protestant Community and published and unpublished materials in the Chinese language. The research has therefore followed qualitative, archival, and literary methods with special attention to the previously unresearched miscellaneous writings of Liu Hsia in the Chinese genre *sanwen* (essays).

The thesis belongs to the fields of practical theology, cultural anthropology, and history of missions. It is presented in six chapters. An introduction to the contexts relevant to the development of Protestant theologies of social ministry in Taiwan will be followed by discussion of the respective views of mainland-originating churches and the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan. The heart of the thesis, however, are the two chapters dealing with the Eden Social Welfare Foundation and Liu Hsia. This leads to a concluding discussion that appraises the different approaches to social ministry and argues that the mission statement of the Eden Social Welfare Foundation as elaborated in the theological writings of Liu Hsia lays the foundations for a more thoroughly contextual approach to the continuing development of theologies of social ministry in Taiwan.

To my wife

Wu Lan-shiang (吳蘭香)

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

In the course of researching and writing this thesis the author gained a different perspective of the blessings of social ministry than was afforded during his many years serving at a home for children with cerebral palsy. His wife was diagnosed with bone cancer, and a year later with breast cancer. In the midst of intense stress and pain the Chinese Evangelical Church of Edinburgh offered tangible physical, emotional, and spiritual support. Each night for two months after her first surgery church members would bring a home-cooked Chinese meal to his family. Moreover his wife was the subject of constant encouragement and prayer. She describes the experience in terms of falling into a safety net. Acknowledgements have to begin with thanks for this ministry.

They must also begin with an expression of gratitude to the author's supervisor, David Kerr. It was at his invitation that the thesis was begun and because of his guidance that it was able to progress. The thesis would not have been written were it not for his many contributions. While any flaws are the responsibility of the author, all achievements bear the mark of his exacting standards of professionalism, his careful and intelligent attention to detail, and his encyclopedic knowledge. The author also wishes to thank his supervisor for honoring him with more than a professional relationship.

A perusal of the Bibliography reveals a long list of those who have been interviewed for the study. The author was surprised to discover that the busiest and most influential leaders generally offered the most in terms of time, quality of information, and even friendship. To list each name individually would be taxing for the reader. The author is greatly appreciative to all those who provided interviews and access to their personnel and archives. The author is also grateful to the many friends who helped this study by introducing these leaders and helping him to identify important materials to support this study, in particular Fan Yi-shih (范義士), Wu Chien-te (吳建德), Zhang Yi (張熠), and Tsai Kuang-chung (蔡匡忠). Moreover he wishes thank the Ho Ping Presbyterian Church (和平基督長老教會) in Taipei for providing a dormitory during the year the author conducted field research and the National Library of Taiwan for supplying a private study space.

Finally the author thanks his wife. To study at the University of Edinburgh is a privilege not many can enjoy, not least because of the costs involved. A fellow researcher calculated that each word in her thesis had cost one British pound. Because of delays to studies due to the illnesses described above this thesis has been more expensive. The author's wife has met all of these expenses herself. Moreover she has made significant sacrifices in terms of absence from her family and career in Taiwan. He is grateful to her for providing this opportunity to learn and to compose a thesis we hope will bless the churches in Taiwan.

# CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	vi
CONTENTS.....	viii
TRANSLATION AND TRANSLITERATION.....	xi
INTRODUCTION.....	1

## Chapter

1. PROTESTANT SOCIAL MINISTRY IN NATIONALIST TAIWAN: THEOLOGICAL AND POLITICAL CONTEXT.....	14
Introduction.....	14
Theological Context.....	14
The Social Gospel and Western Protestantism.....	15
The Social Gospel and Chinese Protestantism.....	17
Political Context.....	31
The Nationalist Government in Taiwan.....	31
Relations between Church and State.....	35
Conclusion.....	40
2. MAINLAND-ORIGINATING PROTESTANTISM.....	41
Introduction.....	41
Social Service as a Consequence of Evangelism: 1945-1987.....	41
Missionaries and the Nationalist Agenda.....	41
Missionary Methods.....	48
From Foreign to Nationalized Ministry: Shared Aspirations for Church Growth.....	50
Social Service as a Bridge to Evangelism: 1987-2000.....	53
The Impact of Social Change on Social Ministry.....	53
The Emergence of the Bridge Paradigm.....	55
Nascent Theology.....	70
Conclusion.....	73

3. THE PRESBYTERIAN CHURCH IN TAIWAN.....	74
Introduction.....	74
Social Ministry Under Martial Law: 1945-1987.....	74
Presbyterian Traditions.....	74
Reforming Presbyterian Mission.....	77
Public Statements.....	87
People's Theologies.....	101
Social Ministry After Martial Law: 1987-2000.....	105
People's Theologies (Continued).....	106
A Paradigm of Partnership.....	113
Conclusion.....	116
4. THE EDEN SOCIAL WELFARE FOUNDATION.....	117
Introduction.....	117
The Eden Social Welfare Foundation.....	117
Mission Statement.....	121
Serve Weak.....	123
Witness Christ.....	132
Promote Shuangfu.....	138
Lead People Turn (to) Lord.....	144
Conclusion.....	148
5. LIU HSIA.....	150
Introduction.....	150
Liu Hsia.....	150
Sanwen: A Genre Appropriate to Christian Theology in Taiwan...	152
Sanwen.....	152
C. S. Song: A Case for Sanwen in Christian Theology.....	158
Liu Hsia: Writing an Indigenous Christian Theology in Sanwen...	165
Liu Hsia's Method.....	165
Liu Hsia's Message.....	171
Liu Hsia's Theology in Context.....	181
Confucian Society.....	181
Liu Hsia.....	184
Conclusion.....	187

6. TOWARD A MORE CONTEXTUAL THEOLOGY.....	189
Introduction.....	189
Mainland-Originating and Presbyterian Churches:	
Ministry in Different Contexts.....	189
Political Heritage.....	190
Ecclesial Heritage.....	193
Liu Hsia and the Eden Social Welfare Foundation:	
New Perspectives on Social Ministry.....	201
Liu Hsia and Incarnational Ministry.....	201
The Eden Social Welfare Foundation and	
Christian Witness.....	204
Conclusion.....	208
CONCLUSION.....	210
NOTES.....	220
APPENDIX.....	265
“Live Well, Die Well,” by Xing Lin Zi.....	266
“Remodeling Hell,” by Xing Lin Zi.....	273
“The World of Love,” by Xing Lin Zi.....	275
“Passing Through the Valley of Weeping,” by Xing Lin Zi.....	279
BIBLIOGRAPHY.....	280

## TRANSLATION AND TRANSLITERATION

Unless otherwise noted the author is responsible for all translations included in this dissertation. When authoritative sources have not indicated a particular preference this thesis has used the Wade-Giles system of transliteration.

Liu Hsia's penname Xing Lin Zi has been transliterated according to the Pinyin method in order to be consistent with the only available English language publication of a Liu *sanwen*.<sup>1</sup> The translation of the publisher was used for the title of all Xing Lin Zi books except: *Another Kind of Love*, *Apricot Forest Essays*, *Victory Song Series*, *True Love is a Lifelong Promise*, *The First Family in the North Pole*, and *The Song of Life*.

Endnotes contain translations and transliterations of Chinese sources. The Chinese characters for these citations are located in the bibliography.

# INTRODUCTION

## Parameters of Research

The thesis is entitled, “Chinese Protestant Theologies of Social Ministry in Nationalist Taiwan: with Special Emphasis on the Eden Social Welfare Foundation and Liu Hsia.” It is a thesis about the Chinese Protestant community in Taiwan. Aboriginal churches are a significant part of Taiwan Protestantism. The Roman Catholic Church also has an important presence in Taiwan. However the traditions upon which these churches draw, and the contexts in which they have developed and operate, are different from those of Chinese Protestantism. They are therefore excluded from this thesis.

This thesis concentrates on Chinese Protestant theologies of social ministry. “Social Ministry” is here used as a broad category inclusive of services offered to individuals and the community. It therefore includes ministries that address the immediate needs of an individual or group, as well as efforts to affect social structures. The thesis is not primarily concerned with describing or evaluating Protestant social ministries. These will be discussed to the degree necessary in order to identify and analyze operative theologies of social ministry. The focus of the thesis is the thinking that motivates and supports social ministry among Chinese Protestants in Taiwan.

The thesis concentrates on Taiwan’s Nationalist era. This encompasses the fifty-five years from 1945 to 2000; a period that stretches from the time that the Nationalist government of China sent an occupying force to govern the island of Taiwan until the first election of a President from an opposition party.<sup>1</sup> The political period is of particular relevance to this study because attitudes toward the Nationalist government are one of the essential components that divided the churches over questions of Christian social responsibility. After exploring the different theological approaches to social ministry among the churches, the thesis will examine the Eden Social Welfare Foundation and its founder, the eminent author Liu Hsia. Eden and Liu will be the subject of special emphasis for their innovative contextual approach to a theology of social ministry.

## Précis

The thesis introduces the theologies of social ministry in Protestant Taiwan in relation to the ecclesiastical and political contexts that influence the churches. It argues that different contexts have resulted in two distinct perspectives of Christian social responsibility. It demonstrates that churches with roots in China valued social service only inasmuch as it facilitated evangelism. By contrast the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan accepted social ministry as valuable in its own right. The thesis, however, notes that despite theologies that encouraged social service for different reasons, the majority of congregations in Taiwan were not responsive to community needs. It is in this culture of Protestant neglect that the Eden Social Welfare Foundation and Liu Hsia find their significance. The thesis seeks to demonstrate that Eden and Liu offer a perspective on the relationship between evangelism and social responsibility that anchors service in Christian life in ways that are acceptable across the spectrum of Taiwan Protestantism.

In the lingua franca of Taiwan the Nationalist migrants, their descendents, and their particular perspectives are often referred to with the fairly neutral nomenclature, “mainland.”<sup>2</sup> During the fifty-five years of Nationalist rule there were dramatic social changes in Taiwan society. Changes are also apparent in the churches. At the end of the era many churches with roots in mainland theology and politics, for example, were being led by and ministering among people without a mainland background.<sup>3</sup> Nevertheless at the end of the Nationalist era the heritage of these churches remained vitally important to their theology of social ministry. Because the term “mainland” finds a common usage in Taiwan, and because “originating” makes the definition flexible enough to describe diverse traditions that share a common theological and political heritage, the thesis will describe this Christianity with the adjective “mainland-originating.”<sup>4</sup>

The analysis begins with a detailed investigation into the theologies that informed both mainland-originating and Presbyterian churches during the Nationalist era. It argues that churches with origins in China were greatly affected by the debate over the social gospel. Most of them adopted a theology that understood social ailments as an expression of the corrupted human soul. It followed that social improvement could only be brought about by means of individual repentance and acceptance of the

substitutionary atonement. Most of the churches that adhered to this theology were also affiliated with the Nationalist political movement. This meant that the pessimistic view of human social potential was often associated with a patriotic commitment to the Nationalist cause and to Christian politicians who promised to usher in a better age. Social ministry was therefore subordinated to quantitative objectives of church growth and to the political culture imposed by the government.

It will be shown that the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan had quite another heritage from these mainland-originating churches. This Presbyterian denomination developed in Taiwan rather than on the mainland. Church members generally experienced the Nationalists as an oppressive rather than a liberating force. This experience prompted Presbyterians to re-think a longstanding missionary understanding of social ministry as auxiliary to evangelism. The initiative was first taken by the Presbyterian theologian Shoki Coe, who developed contextualization as a means of overcoming dependency on traditions of theology received from foreign missionaries, and suggested new understandings of Christian ministry that responded to Taiwanese conditions. A series of political crises in the 1970s prompted the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan to voice its political concerns. This led to the view that social ministry should not be understood merely as a consequence of, or a bridge to facilitate, evangelism. Rather it should be valued as a valid ministry alongside and in partnership with evangelism. During the Nationalist period the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan began to think beyond quantitative methods of church growth and to construct reasoned theological foundations designed to empower the denomination to critically assess and respond to cultural needs.

The different theological and political orientations of the mainland-originating Chinese churches and the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan resulted in an emotionally charged environment. Throughout the Nationalist era they seldom engaged in formal dialogue regarding their differences. The Eden Social Welfare Foundation included members of both Protestant traditions. Although it was not involved in arguments between the two churches, its innovative practice of social service among Taiwan's disabled community gave rise to a heightened awareness of the ramifications of churches neglecting their social responsibilities. In 1995 the foundation released a mission statement that was itself the result of extended discussion among the board of directors. The statement is a Chinese construct that dissociates social ministry from evangelism yet affirms and,

indeed, elevates evangelistic ministry. The statement maintains that welfare work and gospel work, when held together, bring blessing and health to the body and soul in the present and in the future. This mission statement was designed to speak beyond its immediate context, and to encourage holistic ministry among Protestant churches.

The Eden Social Welfare Foundation was founded by one of the most respected and influential Christian women in Taiwan, the popular author Liu Hsia. The issues with which Liu's writings are concerned are as broad as the category "Serve the Weak," which serves as the first clause of Eden's mission statement. Liu used her literary genre to address social needs through building a relationship with her readers. This is done not from a position of authority but as the member of the community who could interact at a deeply personal level with the problems that cause malaise among the population. Her writings are open about both her Christian faith and her history as an immigrant from the mainland. Yet Liu refuses to let these categories isolate her from the community at large. She demonstrated that it is entirely possible to maintain an identity as a Christian and fully engage society on its own terms, to serve as the voice of the community and offer a social vision that draws on the same resources that inform the population.

The final chapter of this thesis subjects the theologies of social ministry prevalent in each of the above entities to critical analysis, assessing their differences and evaluating their respective strengths and weaknesses. It demonstrates that the divisiveness inherent in differing contexts has restricted the development of inclusive theologies of social ministry and made it difficult for churches to dialogue on their respective positions. The ministry of Eden and Liu are, however, presented as models of contextually dynamic social ministries that cross the borders that generally divide churches from each other and from the community at large. The thesis argues that the two demonstrate the way forward, a means by which churches can develop more thoroughly contextual theologies of social ministry in Taiwan.

## Arguments

The main argument of the thesis is that Eden and Liu represent an approach to social ministry that draws from local cultural resources in developing a holistic theology that combines spiritual and social dimensions of social ministry, and thus offers an

alternative to the emphasis on either individual evangelism or social action that characterizes the Protestant churches. The argument is based on the hypothesis that the ecclesiastical and political context of Taiwan has affected the theologies of social ministry of the Protestant churches with the result that these theologies have been divided into two distinct factions: those of the churches with origins in China and those of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan. It will be demonstrated that the divisiveness inherent in differing contexts has limited the perspectives of the churches and made it difficult for one group to appreciate the contributions of the other. In this context it will be argued that the *shuangfu* or “double-blessing” theology of the Eden Social Welfare Foundation and Liu Hsia offers a creative synthesis in a culturally dynamic social ministry, thus laying the foundations for a more thoroughly contextual approach to the continuing development of theologies of social ministry in Taiwan.

## Structure

The thesis is presented in six chapters. The opening chapter discusses the ecclesiastical and political heritage of the Chinese Protestants, providing a framework in which their theologies can be understood. The following two chapters offer detailed descriptions of the theologies of mainland-originating churches and of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan. Each of these chapters is organized in chronological order. Attention is given to the affect of political change, such as the lifting of martial law and the rise of the democratization movement, on theologies of social ministry.

Having explained the different theologies of social ministry that divide the Protestant churches in Taiwan into two distinct factions, the fourth and fifth chapters introduce the theology of social ministry that is represented by the Eden Social Welfare Foundation, and the writings of the founder of the Eden institution, Liu Hsia. The final chapter of the thesis compares the different approaches to social ministry and argues the Eden Social Welfare Foundation and Liu Hsia provide a theology that is genuinely contextual, innovative, and in principle agreeable to the mainland-originating and Presbyterian churches in that it embraces concerns that have been fundamental to both.

## Methodology

The thesis is designed as a discussion of theology in the context in which it was developed. The intent is to offer a perspective that reflects and critiques theologies of ministry that arise from the living experiences of Taiwan Protestants. In terms of method, this approach entails the generation and testing of hypotheses by means of qualitative data collection and analysis.<sup>5</sup> The researcher's experience as a missionary in Taiwan has brought advantages, yet also introduced risks to the project. Communication with Protestant leaders was facilitated by the author's network of relationships and ministry experiences, and by his ability to conduct all the discussions in Chinese. Information could be gathered in candid discussion of authentic events.<sup>6</sup> Yet there was also the possibility that the interviewer's preconceptions might influence the gathering and interpretation of data. In order to minimize this risk the interviewer encouraged the interviewees to generate theories to explain the issues under discussion.<sup>7</sup>

Ian Dey, who teaches social sciences at the University of Edinburgh, suggests investigating a phenomenon by means of a cyclical process of description, analysis, refined description, new analysis, and so on.<sup>8</sup> To this end each interview was followed by an analysis of the data gathered, reading in related fields, and a re-formulation of hypotheses. These were then explored by means of interviews with new specialists. The process was repeated over a one-year period and involved over 80 separate interviews. These were continued until saturation began to occur, when it became increasingly uncommon to discover new information.

All interviews were conducted with individuals in a private space. The author conducted the vast majority of interviews in Chinese. These were taped, translated, transcribed and, coded with the help of the NUD\*IST Vivo software for qualitative research. After the interviews all contributors signed releases allowing the interview to be published, and all were given the option of signing a clause restricting the release of any information with which they were uncomfortable. Interviews were conducted in a semi-structured format with individuals encouraged to explore a given subject at length, to introduce additional subjects that they considered relevant to the research, and to suggest readings or additional sources of information that might prove helpful to the project.

Preliminary interviews were necessarily broad, generating theories with regard to observable phenomenon in society. These led to the hypothesis that there are three basic understandings of social ministry in Taiwan: those of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, churches other than the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, and Christian institutions. These became broad categories for coding and analyzing the data that emerged. In order to provide for variations of interpretation, interviews were conducted not only with those who could provide an overview of trends, but with individuals affiliated with each perspective. These participants were asked to comment not only on their own theology but also on that of others. Because the research focused on theologies of social ministry during the Nationalist period, sampling was done among individuals with a high degree of theological competence and broad experience or knowledge of the period in question. In the case of Christian institutions interviews were sought with representatives who had both experience and position.

Preliminary interviews resulted in the author learning, for example, that the theologies of social ministry of non-Presbyterian churches were greatly influenced by Wang Ming-tao and Watchman Nee. This led to further reading and scheduling interviews with theologians who were aware of this kind of theology and its bearing on churches in Taiwan. Research was thus advanced and eventually supported by both published and unpublished information that is located in the libraries and archives of Taiwan's churches, seminaries, mission societies, and Christian institutions.

Of particular importance to this study are the many *sanwen* (essays) written by the author Liu Hsia. These have not been the subject of previous analysis. The author's interpretation was supported by two formal interviews with the author, as well as by a conversation after she read a translation of the chapter in this thesis that reviews her literary contribution. The only objection Liu raised was that she had not knowingly introduced Confucian ideas into her writings, but she seemed prepared to accept that this may have occurred unconsciously as the member of a community deeply influenced by Confucian culture.

This thesis has sought to give an accurate account of theologies of social ministry among Chinese Protestants in Taiwan during the Nationalist period. While it is based on

information generated by individuals who are highly aware of these theologies, the construct is entirely that of the researcher. In developing this construct the researcher has engaged critically with Steven B. Bevans' *Models of Contextual Theology*. Bevans argues that a carefully produced generality can offer a valid perspective of a case in question, without mirroring the reality in all its intricacy.<sup>9</sup> The principle has enabled the researcher to present Taiwan's many mainland-originating churches as representative of one model of contextual theology. It has also facilitated the descriptions of the theologies of social ministry in the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, the Eden Social Welfare Foundation, and Liu Hsia. The concluding chapter will present each as conforming to a distinct approach to contextual theology.

### Merit of Subject for Research

Protestantism in Taiwan has been the subject of considerable research. From the 1960s many who were influenced by Fuller Theological Seminary's program for church growth published studies describing ministry among the churches in Taiwan.<sup>10</sup> The most prolific of these authors was Allen J. Swanson, whose numerous quantitative studies provide essential information about many facets of Protestant Christianity in Taiwan.<sup>11</sup> In 1991 Murray Rubinstein published a thorough historical introduction that evaluates the various Protestant churches and institutions in terms of their indigeneity.<sup>12</sup> Swanson and Rubinstein remain the most comprehensive accounts of Protestantism in Taiwan. During the Nationalist period several theses were also produced that explore Protestantism in Taiwan as it relates to a particular church or segment of society. In regards to the Church and social problems two of the most important are Tsai Kuo-shan's thesis at Fuller Theological Seminary entitled, "The Evangelization of the Urban Industrial Workers in Taiwan Missiological Perspectives," and Wong Chong-gyiau's Boston University thesis, entitled "The Emergence of Political Statements and Political Theology in the History of the Taiwanese Presbyterian Church."<sup>13</sup>

In the last decade of the Nationalist era three Masters dissertations from Taiwan universities also examined social ministry in Taiwan's Protestant churches during the Nationalist era. In 1991 Jen Wei-xuan (鄭維瑄) wrote, "The Role of Christian Social Care and the Development of Welfare in the Taiwan Community," a study that offers a historical overview of social ministry as it developed in relation to the changing

government and economy. In 1998 Hsu Ming-hsiung (徐敏雄) produced “The Development of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan’s Social Service Ministry.” This dissertation provides an excellent introduction to both the social ministries offered by the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan and the theologies that have motivated these services. It is particularly valuable for moving beyond this, however, and explaining the meaning of social ministry at the level of the congregation. Finally, in 2000 Hsu Te-ling (徐德齡) composed, “The Communal Life and Individualism in Independent Churches.” Though the research is not primarily about social ministry it includes a brief overview of the development of social ministry in Taiwan and offers a helpful perspective on the community services mainland-originating churches began to offer in the 1990s.<sup>14</sup>

In addition to these, numerous articles and books have been produced both in international journals and within Taiwan that present or analyze particular theologies of social ministry. These have served as resources for this thesis. No previous research, however, has attempted to offer a comprehensive overview of the theologies of social ministry that were operative in Chinese Protestantism throughout the Nationalist period of Taiwan’s history. In this respect the present research can claim to make a distinctive contribution to a field of growing scholarly interest.

Furthermore there have been no previous studies of the theology of the Eden Social Welfare Foundation and Liu Hsia. As this thesis seeks to show, the theology of the Eden Social Welfare Foundation and Liu Hsia are valuable subjects for research in their own right, both as genuinely contextual expressions of Christian social ministry and as contributions to an area of theology that has been polarized between the positions of the mainland-originating churches and the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan. The thesis will argue that, even though the churches in Taiwan have not given serious attention to theologies developed in Christian institutions, the Eden Welfare Foundation and Liu Hsia provide a perspective on indigenous social ministry in Taiwan that is valuable for offering a critique of social ministry among Protestant churches. More importantly, however, they are worthy of consideration for having responded to needs by drawing from local cultural resources to develop a holistic theology that combines spiritual and social dimensions of social ministry.

## Relevance to Existing Scholarship

This thesis situates itself in the fields of history of Christian missions, cultural anthropology, and practical theology. In regard of the history of Christian missions, it offers a more detailed perspective of Protestant social ministry in Taiwan than is available in the work of Swanson and Rubinstein, and a more comprehensive account than is represented by theologians such as Huang Po-Ho and Wong Chong-gyiau, whose discussion of theologies of social ministry is confined to the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan.<sup>15</sup> The thesis contributes also to the well-documented history of the development theologies of social ministry in China. Numerous writers have explored how the debate over the social gospel affected missionaries and Chinese theologians.<sup>16</sup> This thesis moves the discussion forward. It demonstrates that the schism influenced the development of social ministry in Taiwan, thus providing new information for those interested in this aspect of Chinese Church history.

Though the thesis does not focus on the effect of Protestant social ministry on the people of Taiwan *per se*, it contributes to the field of cultural anthropology in that it addresses the impact of political culture on Protestant churches. In the 1970s anthropologists such as Arthur P. Wolf and David K. Jordan began to publish studies that demonstrated how Chinese politics have affected the cosmology of folk religion in Taiwan.<sup>17</sup> While this thesis does not suggest politics have influenced Christian cosmology, it does demonstrate that the Nationalist party has affected Christian views of social responsibility. The thesis also briefly mentions the impact of Buddhist social initiatives and Confucian philosophy on Christian social service. Constraints of time and space, however, have not allowed for as thorough an exploration into the impact of these or other cultural factors on the social ministries on the churches in Taiwan as has been given to politics.

The thesis is also relevant to the subject of practical theology. In this respect the discussion of the literary contribution of Liu Hsia is of particular interest. Bearing in mind C. S. Song's critique of Protestant communication in Taiwan, Liu is presented as engaging in a ministry that corresponds to the methods recommended by Song, using a widely popular Chinese form of narrative to address the very problems Song identifies as causing concern among islanders. Also of relevance to social ministry is the issue of

contextualization, a theme first developed by the Taiwanese theologian Shoki Coe. Protestantism in Taiwan can be said to showcase different approaches to contextual mission. Individual chapters of the thesis analyze the relationship of changing social conditions to the emergence of Protestant theologies. Taken together they offer an opportunity to examine a wide variety of methods of mission. This is made especially clear in the final chapter of the thesis where divergent approaches are compared and contrasted according to models generated by Steven B. Bevans in his book, *Models of Contextual Theology*.

### Researcher's Perspective

Without engaging in a full discussion of the relationship between subjectivity and objectivity in research, the author wishes to acknowledge that he cannot consider himself as an entirely neutral observer or analyst of Protestant theologies of social ministry in Taiwan. The research is part of his own journey as a missionary who has long been engaged in a struggle to develop a theology that defines the relationship between evangelism and social responsibility in Christian ministry. The researcher completed a Master of Divinity degree from Fuller Theological Seminary during the years when there was great enthusiasm over principles of church growth. Interest in both evangelism and church history led to a research thesis at the Yale University School of Divinity on evangelism in pre-Christian Rome. While writing the thesis the researcher became aware that the social services offered by early churches were an important component in the spread of the gospel. Upon graduating the author entered missionary service in Taiwan with a theology that suggested social ministry was a helpful bridge to facilitate evangelistic enterprise.

The first term of missionary service was in the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan's Yu Shan Theological Seminary. C. M. Kao, the General Secretary of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, had recently been released from prison. Students and staff were passionately concerned with the necessity of political reform, to the extent that class attendance was often low because students had traveled to the capital to participate in protests. Enthusiasm for this method of problem solving spilled over into the seminary with students walking out of class or holding sit-ins over the fact that Greek was a required subject or the principal was not of aboriginal descent. It was an uncomfortable

experience for a missionary accustomed to a faith that focused on introspective spirituality and thought of social work in terms of charitable services that would commend the gospel.

While in Taiwan the missionary developed friendships with evangelical Norwegian missionaries who had established several respected clinics, hospitals, and homes for the physically disabled. Service among these missionaries seemed more appropriate to his own theological disposition. The relationship led to ten years of ministry in a home for children with cerebral palsy. This experience led to dissatisfaction with the bridge model of social service. The author recognized and indeed took advantage of the fact that service provided an opportunity to introduce the gospel. Yet relationships with students led to the feeling that the model lacked depth. The author began to be aware that churches who saw social service as a bridge to evangelism could quickly discard such ministry, indeed neglect the needs of the troublesome disabled, when another more effective means to minister appeared.

In the author's experiences in his community, neither the congregations whose ministries originated in China nor Presbyterian churches offered a theology that rooted compassionate service in their ministries. Though individual pastors could be helpful, in general churches in the community showed little interest in the work of the home. Indeed the author found it difficult to inspire churches to welcome disabled students into their congregations. The Presbyterians would speak about the need for social justice, yet the author was not aware of this translating into visible services in the city in which this researcher lived. Nor did they address the needs of the mainlander community. To be sure the author heard tragic accounts of what mainlanders had done to the relatives of Taiwanese friends. Yet the author also had conversations with bullet scarred soldiers in air-force barracks who spoke of forced separation from parents, wives, and children. Both immigrants from the mainland and Taiwanese were clearly traumatized peoples looking for a homeland. Neither mainland-originating nor Presbyterian churches in the community seemed interested in addressing the suffering of the other, nor were they concerned with the needs of their disabled neighbors.

It is against this existential background that the research for this thesis was undertaken. This should not be seen as detracting from the value of the research, however. The

author's experiences can be seen as contributing to a nuanced description of ministry in Protestant Taiwan. The thesis has taken great pains to offer a balanced and sympathetic view of each of the theologies that are here presented. While the author is responsible for everything contained in the thesis, no positions have been advanced that have not been thoroughly discussed with Protestant leaders who are immensely more informed about social ministry in Protestant Taiwan than the author.

## CHAPTER ONE

# PROTESTANT SOCIAL MINISTRY IN NATIONALIST TAIWAN: THEOLOGICAL AND POLITICAL CONTEXT

### INTRODUCTION

Before launching into a discussion of Protestant social ministry in Nationalist Taiwan it is necessary to describe the context in which the churches operated. This chapter will explain two of the essential dynamics that contributed to church culture: the theological teachings that were inherited from missionaries and Chinese theologians, and the political ideology imposed by the Nationalist government. The chapter will therefore be divided into two sections with the first explaining the theology and the second describing the politics that would affect Chinese churches in Taiwan.

The chapter will demonstrate that the Christians who immigrated to Taiwan from China were part of a theological tradition that emphasized the spiritual transformation of individuals, yet minimized the importance of service in society at large. The chapter will also establish that this community of Christians from China belonged to a political movement that supported their faith, but were not disposed to consider the social aspirations of the original inhabitants of the island. It will be explained that the Taiwanese, including the island's longstanding Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, experienced the immigrants from the mainland as an oppressive force.

### Theological Context

Mr. Chris Su (蘇南洲), the editor of *Wilderness Magazine* (曠野雜誌), a journal that seeks to critically examine Protestant theology in Taiwan, states that in society there generally exists a central consensus of opinion, with small groups of extremists on both ends of the spectrum. However in the late 1940s Protestants in China were divided into two extremes with no center. Su believes this discord is fundamental to the character of Christianity as it has developed in Taiwan.<sup>1</sup>

The civil war that was raging is an obvious factor in the friction that occurred in the churches of China. The nation was divided by different political ideologies. This was not, however, the principal cause of the fracture in the churches. C. William Mensendiek, in a Ph.D. dissertation on Protestant missions in China from 1890 to 1911, argues that by the 1890s missionaries in China were already polarizing into two camps over questions related to a theology he identifies as the “social gospel”.<sup>2</sup> Katharine Kennedy Reist’s Ph.D. dissertation on the Church in China between 1919-1937 moves the date forward, arguing that after 1919 much Protestant attention in China was devoted to “healing cracks in their own communal structure.”<sup>3</sup> The thesis asserts, “The issue, which tended to split the mission brethren along modernist/fundamentalist lines was called the social gospel.”<sup>4</sup>

### The Social Gospel and Western Protestantism

The social gospel was a many faceted movement that arose in the aftermath of the American Civil War (1861-1865) when corrupt politics, industrialization, urbanization, and both widespread poverty and ostentatious materialism caused many to feel a sense of anxiety.<sup>5</sup> Before the war Protestants in both America and Britain were experiencing a spirit of unity over common Christian ethics.<sup>6</sup> At the time both parishes and para-church organizations offered a considerable array of social services.<sup>7</sup> The era also found Christians in general agreement over four pillars of faith, namely a belief in an inspired and authoritative Bible, salvation by grace through faith, a distinct conversion experience, and a corresponding transformation of character evidenced in a pious life.<sup>8</sup>

The third and fourth pillars were fundamental to the theology of social service that dominated the age. Social service was seen to be a consequence of evangelism. Conversion leads to a changed life. This new life involves perfecting the character by turning from vice to virtue. An important aspect of the virtue entails using one’s resources to help those who are in need. By means of sharing both material and spiritual blessings others are lifted out of bad circumstances and themselves become participants in the holy calling. Thus evangelism resulted in an upward spiral of spiritual and social improvement. Christian social service included charity and efforts to change the social order. However conversion was consistently held to be the most effective means to social reform.<sup>9</sup> The predominant eschatology of the age was postmillennialism, the

belief that the millennium was continuous with existing Christian activities. By means of the spread of Christianity a thousand year period of peace would in due course commence, after which Christ would return.<sup>10</sup>

In the traumatic period after the war the premillennialism of John Nelson Darby's Plymouth Brethren began to take root. One of its most important advocates was the eminent revivalist Dwight L. Moody (1837-1899). Moody preached, "I look upon this world as a wrecked vessel. God has given me a lifeboat and said to me, 'Moody, save all you can.'"<sup>11</sup> His message offered no hope for society. Instead Moody warned that the return of Christ could be imminent.<sup>12</sup> This negative world-view, when combined with the individualism that had long been part of the American ethos and the insistence on a distinct conversion experience that was a pillar of the revival tradition, developed into ministry that was primarily verbal in nature. People were called to be saved from personal sins, meaning from immoral lifestyles and an eternal hell to the promise of heaven, and indeed to middle-class values such as "materialism, capitalism, patriotism, and respectability."<sup>13</sup>

Those who retained postmillennial eschatology took a different approach. Theologians like Washington Gladden (1836-1918) and Walter Rauschenbusch (1861-1918) argued the solution was not to focus merely on the spiritual life of individuals but on the needs of the social organism. To this end Gladden and Rauschenbusch did not only develop theological treatise but became advocates of maltreated members of society, lobbying for concrete methods by which to resolve their complex needs. Their goal was to "bring the truths and powers of the spiritual world, the eternal world," to bear on politics, economics, and sociology.<sup>14</sup> By the 1890s individuals who saw the value of the approach began to coalesce over a theology entitled the social gospel.<sup>15</sup>

Theologian J. Neal Hughley describes the social gospel as "a unique type of religion with ... a distinctive theological outlook."<sup>16</sup> Modern scientific advances such as historical criticism and Darwin's theories of evolution were welcomed and appropriated.<sup>17</sup> Proponents held a positive view of both the human and divine natures, believing the benevolent God is imminent and working together with humanity to cause an ideal world to evolve out of the present age.<sup>18</sup> Indeed God's purposes are being worked out on the world stage rather than only through the ministry of churches.<sup>19</sup> Sin

was understood as the selfish behavior of both individuals and social bodies. Salvation came to be understood as being educated by the historical Jesus.<sup>20</sup> Social gossellers believed that when the values of Jesus are understood a “reverence for personalities”<sup>21</sup> takes root and gradually infects the entire group, again leading to the evolution of the ideal state, a harmonious fellowship of siblings under the father God.<sup>22</sup> The goal of ministry was not to help others prepare for another level of existence. The focus was on ministry here and now and for the community.<sup>23</sup>

A “rift,”<sup>24</sup> “profound split,”<sup>25</sup> or “schism”<sup>26</sup> opened up in western Protestantism. The premillennialist party came to be known as an alliance of anti-modernists embroiled in battle against modernizing trends. They called themselves fundamentalist, evangelical, or conservative, titles that until the late 1940s applied to the same group.<sup>27</sup> From the 1920s to at least the 1970s their primary concern was the defense of orthodox faith.<sup>28</sup> Using an illustration from the settler-native conflicts on the American frontier Professor W. F. Storrar, former professor of Christian Ethics and Practical Theology at the University of Edinburgh, says that the conservatives “circled their wagons” to protect what was vital.<sup>29</sup> Their efforts have been described as a hardening of traditional 19<sup>th</sup> century evangelical values in light of a modern scientific assault.<sup>30</sup>

However in seeking to reassert the 19<sup>th</sup> century orthodoxy from which they had emerged many conservatives confused the faith of the period with its cultural values and focused on the individualistic sins that were once a problem in small-town America. In so doing they became blind to emerging social evils and, therefore, engaged in ministry that was irrelevant to 20<sup>th</sup> century urban dilemmas.<sup>31</sup> Though the faction desired to retain the pillars of faith advocated by their 19<sup>th</sup> century forbears there was a departure from the social ministries that were part of that heritage.<sup>32</sup> Modern scholars have described the change as a “great reversal.”<sup>33</sup>

### The Social Gospel and Chinese Protestantism

The debate over the social gospel moved quickly to China where it proved even more disruptive than in the west.<sup>34</sup> A perusal of the *Chinese Recorder* indicates that in the 1920s the controversy reached a boiling point.<sup>35</sup> The troubles as missionaries experienced them are described in a pair of letters the journal published in July and

August 1924. In the first the son of a missionary who has just returned after finishing medical school writes to his father, "When I came back to China I very soon found that many people were talking as if the whole Christian Church were divided into two opposing armies named conservative and liberal or fundamentalist and modernist or old and new according to taste."<sup>36</sup> He reports that upon arriving he was approached by each side in turn and asked by each to make a commitment to their respective camps. The young physician found both positions wanting and defended modernists to fundamentalists and vice-versa. He writes to his more theologically trained father for advice, "Am I wrong in thinking that the hope of unity in the Chinese Churches depends on a lot of us staying somewhere near the middle and refusing to be rushed into either camp?"<sup>37</sup>

In response the father explains that the controversy emerged in China when new missionaries coming from schools teaching modernist ideas arrived and found themselves "... out of sympathy, -- in faith and often in policy and method, -- with those of us who have established and for many years carried on the mission work."<sup>38</sup> Bolstered by an increasing number of new missionaries, the newcomers made a "distinct and determined effort ... to introduce the modernist teaching into all departments of mission work, to decry the old teaching as 'mediaeval,' and above all to secure the control of institutions of higher education, both denominational and union."<sup>39</sup> In light of these efforts the older missionaries began to defend themselves and their work from what they perceived was an attempt at nothing less than the "destruction of the foundation"<sup>40</sup> which they had laid for the church in China. The father concludes that his son's desire to hold middle-ground and maintain fellowship with both sides is very difficult and suggests that his son, like many with a traditional Christian upbringing, holds convictions that leaders among the modernists and those Chinese without a Christian background have long abandoned.<sup>41</sup>

The intensity of the argument was evident in a 1926 executive committee meeting of the National Christian Council, an assembly of 120 leading Chinese and foreign representatives of the missions and churches that was widely seen as "the institutional culmination of cooperative/ecumenical ventures."<sup>42</sup> C. Y. Cheng, the General Secretary of the National Christian Council,<sup>43</sup> opened the meeting with a description of the state of the Church in China. One of Cheng's primary concerns was the need for tolerance.

Lack of unity would greatly retard Christian work. Cheng argued, "To be tolerant is not to surrender one's convictions but is to recognize the infinite depth of truth which is far greater than one's conception of it."<sup>44</sup> The director in China for the China Inland Mission, D. E. Hoste, was quick to respond. Hoste insisted intolerance is at times "a Christian duty and a Christian virtue." He went on to detail the doctrines he felt were at risk; namely that "Jesus Christ as the Son of God and the Son of Man: that He died for sin and gave Himself as a sacrifice to God for sin; and that He was raised from the dead; that He is now in Heaven and to those who unreservedly commit themselves to Him, in faithful surrender, He imparts a new life, and that until that life is imparted men are dead in trespass and sin."<sup>45</sup> The feelings with which he made his case can be seen in his quoting, "If any man preach any other gospel ... let him be accursed."<sup>46</sup>

Agreement among Protestants on any issue of substance was impossible. The question of creating a union church that was later raised, for example, was bound to failure; not so much because the two sides did not agree that cooperation or nationalizing the leadership was a valuable endeavor but because of conservative refusal to entrust the faith to a leadership they believed would compromise fundamental positions.<sup>47</sup> When Francis Wei, noted scholar and President of the Central China University,<sup>48</sup> argued for nationalizing church leadership yet kindly said that missionaries with "all their politics, all their creeds and all their rituals" will continue to be welcomed, "so long as it is not dogmatically asserted that any of them is final," conservatives must have heard alarm bells ringing.<sup>49</sup> The problem was not so much with who would lead, but with the doctrines the leaders would promote. We have seen that Hoste could see no way ahead for a group whose members disagreed on issues as basic as Christology and the atonement. Shortly after the meeting the China Inland Mission withdrew its membership from the National Christian Council.<sup>50</sup>

Conservatives in China were circling their wagons to protect that which was vital. It appears that in so doing a great reversal took place just as it had in the west. This can be detected in the many critiques of conservative ministry that pepper the articles of an issue of the *Chinese Recorder* published in January 1937. T. C. Chao, the Dean of the Yenching University School of Religion (the stronghold for YMCA theology in China<sup>51</sup>), depicts revivalists as preaching an "escape theology that plucks human beings from the ground to place them in an imaginary other world."<sup>52</sup> P. C. Hsu, a YMCA affiliated

Yenching professor, complains the rural church is “suffering from a narrow conception of its task.”<sup>53</sup> Y. T. Wu, who at this time was in charge of the literature department of the YMCA’s National Committee, writes “we witness also religious tendencies which are extremely individualistic. ... Their advocates would insist that Christianity should not concern itself with social reconstruction.”<sup>54</sup> T. T. Lew’s article, a lengthy piece by a Yenching professor who is remembered as “the centre of a circle of much younger YMCA ... Christians who looked upon him as a kind of sage,”<sup>55</sup> states “It seems to be the presumption of church workers in general that a sufficient amount of ‘preaching’ and ‘hearing’ will naturally ‘bear fruit.’ But the question is; Is this presumption justified?”<sup>56</sup> The writers in this issue think it is not. They argue against conservative neglect and endorse Christian efforts to influence the social order.

If nothing else the January 1937 issue of the *Chinese Recorder* proves that the question of the social gospel had become an important issue for Chinese Christians. Y. T. Wu, quoted above, explains,

Chinese Christian tradition is primarily British and American. At present its relations with America are especially close. Most of its missionaries are American, and most of its leaders have been trained in America. Its institutions depend upon American support. Because of these relationships in faith and thinking the Chinese Christian Church is practically a copy of American Christianity.<sup>57</sup>

If the Chinese churches were so closely aligned with American Christianity it is natural that the debate over the social gospel that was dividing western churches and missionaries would also prove divisive among the Chinese. Indeed there is evidence that such was the case.<sup>58</sup> It has been noted, for example, that many of the contributors to the January 1937 issue of the *Chinese Recorder* had a relationship with the Young Men’s Christian Association. In China the YMCA was known for taking a decided stand for the social gospel.<sup>59</sup> In the articles cited above YMCA associated theologians wrote in a polemic tone, arguing against a narrow conception of the faith that stressed only the salvation of individuals for the afterlife. While the theologies these scholars developed contribute much to the discussion on Christian social responsibility they are not as important to this thesis as those who took the other side of the dispute. Like the YMCA affiliates Chinese theologians such as Wang Ming-Tao and Watchman Nee

developed their theologies in the context of heated debate over the social gospel. These two theologians are of particular importance to this study as they laid the foundation for ministry as it was carried out among Nationalist Christians in Taiwan.

*Wang Ming-Tao*<sup>60</sup> (王明道, 1900-1991)

In the 1920s and 1930s there were a number of “fundamentalist”<sup>61</sup> Chinese evangelists preaching the primacy of evangelism. In an introduction to some of the most important a contributor to the *Chinese Recorder* who had made first-hand observations of their ministries, writes, “I presume all those evangelists are interested only in things spiritual and promote no social program.”<sup>62</sup> The most influential of these was a “winsome”<sup>63</sup> “firebrand”<sup>64</sup> named Wang Ming-Tao.<sup>65</sup> Wang took a non-sectarian stance that made his preaching and writing acceptable across denominational lines.<sup>66</sup>

The cornerstone of Wang’s message is his understanding of an inerrant Bible.<sup>67</sup> Wang had an anti-intellectual approach. Indeed he took pride in the fact that he had not received formal theological training, seldom read theological texts or commentaries, and developed his teaching in relative isolation.<sup>68</sup> The resulting hermeneutic was simple in the extreme. Wang wrote, “... you must not study the Bible in the same way that you study history, geography, and biology. Theological students are prone to study the Bible in this way. When we read the Bible we ought to adopt the attitude of a son who is reading a letter from his Father.”<sup>69</sup> Wang also wrote, “What I found in the Bible I received. What I did not find in the Bible I rejected. The truths of the Bible I believed; doctrines not in the Bible I was not prepared to believe. ... In my preaching and my teaching today the Bible is my only standard. Church traditions and man-made regulations were not my authority.”<sup>70</sup>

Wang is not simply giving his audience positive instruction regarding Bible study. He is writing reactionary pieces that oppose both the way seminaries teach and doctrines that were common in the churches. This reactionary flavor permeates Wang’s writing. He contributes little constructive theology,<sup>71</sup> choosing instead to highlight problems in society and the churches. Though Wang was known as an evangelist, it appears most of his attention was focused within the Christian community.<sup>72</sup> With Christians he argued that by means of Bible reading and prayer the will of God is easily ascertained.

Knowing God's will is not difficult. The problem is doing God's will. Precious few Christians have the courage to stand up and fight for what they know is right in a society, and even in a church, that is lamentably corrupt.<sup>73</sup>

At the beginning of his public ministry Wang changed his name from *Tie-Ze* (鐵子) meaning "Son-of-Iron" to Ming-Tao, "revealing the Word/truth." His prayer was that God would use him, "in this world of darkness and depravity to testify to his truth."<sup>74</sup> Wang saw himself as a modern-day Jeremiah<sup>75</sup> and describes his calling as follows,

He (God) saw that the darkness and corruption of the church was not greatly different from the darkness and corruption of the world. So He sent me on the one hand to be a trumpet call to the world and on the other hand to be a trumpet call to the church. He sent me to expose the darkness, corruption, depravity and unrighteousness both of the world and of the church. He sent me to summon men without delay to repent.<sup>76</sup> (Parenthesis mine.)

From the time Wang was a child he appears to have had a remarkably pessimistic view of society. In his autobiography he describes his neighbors, his primary and secondary school classmates, his teachers, and the world at large in the darkest of terms. His adult descriptions of society are similar. People are utterly sinful and corrupt.<sup>77</sup> Wang does not therefore urge Christians to withdraw from the world. Rather he encourages them to excel in their careers, be exemplary citizens, and also insists on compassionate care toward those who suffer in society. The care, however, tends to weigh heavily in favor of what an individual Christian can do for other individuals rather than suggestions for organized Christian efforts to relieve the suffering of a particular target group. Moreover social concern is closely related to effective evangelism.<sup>78</sup> While this kind of social concern is found throughout Wang's writing, it is important to note that it is a peripheral point. Wang's teaching is primarily concerned with a condemnation of sin and a summons to holiness.

Wang believed that New Testament preaching includes two essential elements, a call to repentance and faith in the substitutionary atonement of Christ. One must repent of sin before believing in Christ. One cannot be a Christian without having taken the initial first step of repentance. Wang was convinced that many who called themselves "Christian" had neglected the necessary first step and were simply following Jesus' way

of life, or respecting his personality, without having truly called on the living Christ for salvation. Thus Wang's preaching always started with a condemnation of evil.<sup>79</sup> Witnesses of his ministry consistently describe it as exhibiting, "great fearlessness and frankness in dealing with many faults, weaknesses, and sins of God's children and especially of those engaged in Christian work."<sup>80</sup>

By aggressively confronting sin Wang was also stressing the importance of Christian holiness. Wang was unimpressed by ministries that made either a notable social impression, or evangelistic efforts that resulted in many converts. He emphasized quality over quantity, with Christian purity as the only acceptable sign of authentic spiritual experience.<sup>81</sup> Those who wished to join Wang's church were required to demonstrate that their conversion had resulted in a corresponding character transformation. The process could take up to three years.<sup>82</sup>

One of the hallmarks of Christian holiness was honesty. Wang harshly criticized his own culture's concept of face and flattery. The Christian must deal with others in a forthright manner, showing no fear or favoritism even to those in exalted positions. Only in such a way could others be disciplined to maturity.<sup>83</sup> Wang was dismayed that many pastors cultivated relationships with social elites. These Christian leaders gave respect where it was not due and even promoted those who responded to their ministry to leading positions in church administration. As the influential, like all people, need to repent and grow in spirituality, such flattery would impede their spiritual growth.<sup>84</sup>

Thus Wang felt that leadership positions in the Church were filled with individuals of questionable faith and maturity. Many who believed themselves Christian had not, in fact, had an authentic conversion experience and therefore lacked a genuine relationship with the divine. Others had been promoted to positions too early and did not have sufficient experience to guide the Church. Wang also criticized missionaries for naively placing questionable characters in positions of leadership.<sup>85</sup> Moreover the faithful few who entered ministry often received a traditional theological education that offered a plethora of theological knowledge but very little of what the congregations truly needed – pastors who could demonstrate practical holy living.<sup>86</sup> Thus Wang believed the church was in dire straits. It was becoming more and more unfaithful to the Word of God.<sup>87</sup>

Wang felt liberal Christianity was among of the greatest threats to the well-being of the church and therefore “waged a lifelong crusade”<sup>88</sup> against modernist theology, especially condemning those who advocated the social gospel.<sup>89</sup> He argued that the social gospel is appropriately called *social gospel* because it is in fact a “different gospel” from the Christian gospel. It fails to understand human sinfulness, the atoning work of Christ, the doctrine of the resurrection, and the promises of eternal life. It replaces these vital Christian tenets with a God who was only a moral force, a Savior who was merely a personality to be emulated, and goals of character improvement, social reformation, public service, and a spirit of sacrifice.<sup>90</sup>

Wang was not against improving character or society. However he didn’t feel these efforts reached the depths of the human predicament. He argued, “... these things may indeed have a modicum of usefulness; but for the basic needs of the human heart they are but chaff and dust.”<sup>91</sup> Wang appears to have been especially aggravated by the social gospel accusation that the fundamentalist message about atonement and eternal life was a narrow and selfish gospel of individual happiness. He answered that social transformation must begin with inner transformation. He also argued that preaching individual eternal life was anything but selfish: “How can they say that when you seek people’s happiness for a few decades you are showing your love for them but when you seek their happiness for eternity you are seeking personal gain?”<sup>92</sup>

Physical resurrection and eternal life were fundamental to Wang’s message.<sup>93</sup> Herein he found the courage to wage war with the worldly authorities. The world may have many troubles but there is a “glory beyond.”<sup>94</sup> Wang was courageous. During the Japanese occupation, despite intense pressure, he refused official orders to participate in an ecumenical body. He believed that when churches relate with political authorities, “The church and the gospel of Christ are thereby degraded and put on a lower plane than compliance to men’s rules and submitting to human authority.”<sup>95</sup> Another reason he did not participate was his conviction that the ecumenical leaders had compromised the faith and “merged with the world.”<sup>96</sup> Wang wanted no fellowship with this sort.

Wang saw the social gospel as exceedingly dangerous and issued repeated warnings that Christians not be taken in by those who claim to be Christian but are in fact unfaithful to the Word of God. Tolerance was out of the question. The social gossellers practiced

duplicity in allowing simple Christians to believe they were preaching the authentic gospel when in fact they were offering distortions. They are akin to “a quack medicine seller”<sup>97</sup> offering a product that is useless against a prevalent disease. These “Judases,” these unrighteous “hypocrites” who preach good works,<sup>98</sup> this “Sadducee-style Party of Unbelief,”<sup>99</sup> with its “apostate teaching”<sup>100</sup> these “unbelieving preachers,”<sup>101</sup> and “false prophets”<sup>102</sup> are hindering the true gospel and are therefore guilty of causing spiritual death. Wang saw the social gospel as a serious problem and believed it was his responsibility to protect the churches.<sup>103</sup>

#### *Watchman Nee (聚會所, 1903-1972)*

Historian Jonathan Chao writes that together with Wang Ming-Tao, Watchman Nee was among the principal leaders of an evangelical revival that took place in the 1920s and 30s over against the formalism and liberalism of many churches in China.<sup>104</sup> Watchman Nee was deeply influenced by the Brethren tradition.<sup>105</sup> Yet in an age when nationalism was rife he desired a strong self-supporting, self-governing, and self-propagating Church and disliked many of the divisive and tiresome doctrines and forms of the western denominations. Nee wrote extensively on the Church, rooting his theology of service in the ecclesiastical community. In this Watchman Nee found affinity with the likes of theologian T. C. Chao (趙紫辰), who was cited above as being critical of those who preached what he believed was an escape theology.<sup>106</sup>

In fact T. C. Chao was suspicious of Nee’s efforts and refused to dignify the churches founded by Nee with the title “Church,” instead referring to them as gatherings, spiritual movements or sects.<sup>107</sup> For his part Nee would not have considered Chao’s faith in a Jesus whose enlightenment allowed him to align himself with God in an unparalleled fashion as Christian.<sup>108</sup> Nevertheless Nee was not reactive like Wang Ming-Tao. His writings are not diatribes, but a proactive setting forth of a theology. Yet beyond broad lines of agreement on points such as the need for a Church that was authentically Chinese, his theology was different in the extreme from those who advanced the social gospel.

Watchman Nee contended,

The hindrance in each of us constitutes a hindrance to God. Why is the discipline of the Holy Spirit so important? Why is the dividing of spirit and soul so urgent? It is because God must have a way through us. Let no one think that we are only interested in individual spiritual experience. Our concern is God's way and His work. Is God free in our lives? Unless we are dealt with and broken through discipline, we shall restrict God. Without the breaking of the outward man, the Church cannot be a way for God.<sup>109</sup>

In this short paragraph a connection can be seen between Nee's doctrines of human nature, salvation, the Church, and Christian responsibility. A review of each concept in turn is necessary to explain Nee's beliefs regarding Christian social service.

Nee's theology emerges from his understanding of human nature. Nee believed that humans are made up of three distinct parts -- the body, the soul, and the spirit.<sup>110</sup> After God created the body out of the dust of the earth he breathed the spirit into the body. In touching the body the spirit created the human soul. The soul is the mind and emotions of the human. The soul is therefore the personality of an individual. The soul of the properly functioning human being should be under the control of the spirit. The spirit is that part of the human with which the divine can directly communicate. The spirit in communion with the divine guides the soul, which in turn directs the body.<sup>111</sup>

Sin first entered through intellectual enticement. The woman succumbed to Satan's ploy of stimulating her knowledge and ate from the tree of the knowledge of good and evil. Adam participated with Eve in eating the fruit for emotional rather than intellectual reasons. In both cases the soul, the seat of intellect and emotion, presided over, or declared independence from, the spirit. At that time spiritual death, the cessation of communion between the spirit and soul that led to the cessation of communion between the soul and body that is physical death, began to work its power. The spirit was silenced by the soul. The soul and body began to rule the human being, responding to the external influence of the world rather than to the inner compulsion of the spirit. The present world order is the domain of Satan. When the voice of God is thus blocked the will of Satan is easily accomplished. Physical, emotional, and intellectual desires now run rampant in each member of the corrupted race.<sup>112</sup>

Salvation comes by regenerating the spirit. Though Nee is a premillennialist who does not shy away from writing about salvation in a cosmic sense his main concern is with

salvation here and now.<sup>113</sup> His desire is to stop worldly influence and to bring the soul and body back under the control of the spirit. The only means by which this can be accomplished is the cross of Christ. Nee emphasizes the substitutionary aspect of Christ's death. The punishment due an individual falls on the innocent Christ. Nee writes, "The hands must be nailed, for they love to sin. The brow must be crowned with a thorny crown, for it too loves to sin. All that the human body needed to suffer was executed upon His body."<sup>114</sup> In like manner the cross is punishment on the soul and spirit. The human soul that responds by humbly uniting or identifying itself with Christ (accepting His death and resurrection as its own) makes way for the Holy Spirit to enter and quicken the human spirit, thus restoring the broken communion with God and enabling the human spirit to again guide the soul and body. Only after regeneration can the human possibly know the will of God.<sup>115</sup>

Nee argues that many who have not been spiritually reborn attempt to do good, believing they are doing God's will. However failure is certain when efforts are guided by the intellect and emotions in a Satan controlled world. Nee believed that world systems are so under Satan's control that medical personnel, educators, those involved in commerce, the arts, and even agricultural workers are in fact serving Satan.<sup>116</sup> Nee writes,

That realm ... has many strange facets. Sin of course has its prior place there, and worldly lusts; but not less part of it are our more estimable human standards and ways of doing things. The human mind, its culture and its philosophies, all are included, together with all the very best of humanity's social and political ideologies. Alongside these too we should doubtless place the world's religions, and among them these speckled birds, worldly Christianity and its 'world Church.' Wherever the power of natural man dominates, there you have an element in that system which is under the direct inspiration of Satan.<sup>117</sup>

"Soulish" endeavors wherein the "whole life takes on the character and expression of the soul," in a worldly system cannot result in good.<sup>118</sup> Nevertheless the regenerate Christian, who has been saved from the world, can offer positive service.<sup>119</sup>

Nee argued correct service must begin with knowing the will of God. Knowing the divine will requires prayer. Like the YMCA affiliated theologian Y. T. Wu (吳耀宗), Nee argued for prayer that aligns one's will with the divine.<sup>120</sup> However Nee took the concept in a different direction from Wu. In Wu's model the individual must enter

society and serve, indeed it is in service that one meets God.<sup>121</sup> Nee differed in that he believed that knowing God's will should not immediately translate into physical service, but to further spiritual communion. Prayer to understand the divine will leads to further prayer that that will be done. Yet Nee's understanding of prayer does not stop here. In addition he maintains that God will not act in the world unless his people pray. God has chosen to limit his actions. Though God certainly has a will and a plan, he will not put them into effect until his people discover that will and urge the action. Thus the will of God will not be done until people whose spirits have been awakened discern God's will and pray according to that will.<sup>122</sup> The Church has an immense responsibility.

Nee defined the Church simply as Christians in a corporate sense. His understanding of a local church follows the same line of thought. A church is those whose spirits have been awakened by the Holy Spirit who live in a particular geographic location. Indeed Nee tries to offer an inclusive definition of Church wherein believers tolerate doctrinal differences.<sup>123</sup> Nee laments that many in the churches do not live the life to which they are called and prove a hindrance to the quick accomplishment of God's design. Nevertheless they remain the church.<sup>124</sup> However those who do not fall under Nee's definition of Christian, that is those who are not in fellowship with the Holy Spirit, are simply not Church and therefore fall outside of Nee's instructions regarding appropriate Christian ministry.<sup>125</sup>

Nee understands the ministry of the Church in terms of incarnation. He writes, "The measure of the Church is the measure of God in the earth to-day."<sup>126</sup> When God became incarnate revelation was restricted to Jesus. Jesus, "God Himself," was the perfect human in whom God could fully be manifest. The same position, power, and responsibility have now been given to the Church, the vessel or body in which the personality of Christ, or God, is now expressed.<sup>127</sup> Furthermore Nee insists that the Church is nothing less than the realized Kingdom of God. To be sure Nee anticipates a coming parousia. However he was less concerned with saving people from the world to heaven as in saving them from the world into the Church. The Church, in fact, is "the heavenly life in earthly expression."<sup>128</sup> Nee therefore sees Christian ministry as about churches living in accord with their high calling and maintaining an effective witness that brings many into the kingdom of God, the Church.<sup>129</sup>

Nee insisted that Church ministry is centered in prayer. The method can be described as tending toward monasticism.<sup>130</sup> Nee did not, however, urge withdrawal from the world. With regenerated spirits Christians now perceive the world's snares and can thus safely operate in enemy territory. As active participants in public affairs they are well positioned for evangelistic witness. In Nee's writing ministry appears to have only one end, the critical need of awakening spirits. To be sure Nee was adamant that Christians have genuine love, and never make others impersonal targets of evangelism. Nevertheless simply improving health, education and welfare was criticized as a worldly endeavor. Jesus did heal human bodies. In this we see the natural result of Jesus on the whole person. A healthy spirit leads to a healthy soul and a healthy body. Therefore evangelism is the quintessential Christian ministry.<sup>131</sup>

Individual Christians can however be called to social ministries such as healing and education. However these are callings of the Holy Spirit to certain Christians for a specific and temporary purpose and the resulting organizations do not fall under the rubric of church. The Church proper ministers only by offering "meetings for breaking of bread, for the exercise of spiritual gifts, for the study of the Word, for prayer," and "for fellowship and Gospel preaching."<sup>132</sup> Beyond this any ministry, even evangelistic outreach, is to be carried on by select individuals who represent the church, but do not serve as the church. One of the fruits of this thought is that nationalization never becomes a problem. The evangelized in an area immediately form their own church. The ministry of the missionary runs parallel, but never controls, this body. Thus Nee defines social ministries as "valuable social and charitable by-products that are thrown off by it" (the Church) "from time to time through the faith and vision of its members."<sup>133</sup> These charitable endeavors facilitate evangelism, but as they are part of a worldly system they will inevitably drift towards secularism.<sup>134</sup>

Thus Norman Howard Cliff's M. Phil. dissertation concludes, "... Nee, though in a social and political situation in China which cried out for ... corporate service from the church, has no place for it in his detailed ecclesiology. His message could justifiably be charged with being 'pie in the sky by and by.'"<sup>135</sup> The judgment is valid for those who reject the tenets of Nee's faith. If, however, the theology is evaluated from within one finds a coherent system that aims to get at the very root of the human problem. Adherents believe that those who are first healed at the very center of their being also

experience emotional, intellectual, physical, and social health in *this world*. Though health is necessarily restricted to members of the Church, the Church makes every effort to extend the blessing to the community. Hence Nee's followers engage in social service by means of evangelism.

### *Conclusion*

In 1947 Carl F. H. Henry, an evangelical from the United States who like his fellow conservatives was trying to reassert traditional 19<sup>th</sup> century American Protestant orthodoxy wrote, "Whereas once the redemptive gospel was a world-changing message, now it was narrowed to a world resisting message."<sup>136</sup> Henry had become aware that evangelicals were neglecting the social ministries that belonged to their history. He explained that they were finding it difficult to reconcile the "Gospel of hope" and the "prophetic despair" that were essential to their theology. In a previous era they had been able to proclaim "redemptive regeneration" as the solution for world problems and yet maintain a "social passion".<sup>137</sup> Now they were busy preaching that the many liberal plans for social uplift would certainly fail. Henry lamented that theirs had become a narrow message of salvation from the world.<sup>138</sup>

Wang and Nee demonstrate that the Chinese churches were experiencing the same predicament. This is not to say that their respective theologies were not influenced by other factors such as their Chinese culture. Yet it also seems clear that both Chinese theologians were concerned with defending the pillars of 19<sup>th</sup> century western evangelicalism. They upheld the first pillar, that of an inspired and authoritative Bible, with arguments based on inerrancy and anti-intellectualism. The second pillar of salvation by grace through faith was interpreted in terms of substitutionary atonement. The necessity of a distinct conversion experience, the third pillar, was integral to a preaching that emphasized individual repentance and the need for salvation from the world rather than saving the world. The fourth pillar, the need for a transformation of character evidenced by a pious life, was also stressed; however not as it would have been before the great reversal. Showing social concern was not portrayed as a hallmark of Christian life. Transformation seemed to be marked by an introspective spirituality. To be sure Christians were allowed to enter and serve in society. Yet such ministry was

peripheral to the essential task of the church, which was to save souls from a corrupt world for which there was no hope.

## Political Context

### The Nationalist Government (國民黨) in Taiwan

In the 1940s the churches in China were divided over the question of social responsibility. The nation was also divided along political lines. Like the debate over theology, one side of the debate over politics would become important to the peoples of Taiwan, and indeed to the churches on the island. Chow Lien-hwa (周聯華), widely regarded as the “senior statesman”<sup>139</sup> and the “honorary grandfather”<sup>140</sup> of Taiwan Protestants, goes so far as to maintain that in the churches of Taiwan differences over politics would become more divisive than theology. Moreover Chow insists that there is a political dynamic behind the theologies of social ministry that have emerged among the churches.<sup>141</sup> A brief historical overview is necessary to explain the bearing of politics on the development of Protestant theology in Taiwan.

In November 1943 Roosevelt, Churchill, and Chiang Kai-shek met in Cairo and signed an agreement of intent that the Japanese colony Taiwan should return to Chinese control. On October 25, 1945 the United States followed through and oversaw the surrender of Formosa to China’s Nationalist government, ending fifty years of colonization.<sup>142</sup> Chiang sent a governor, civil servants, and a small number of troops to administer the territory. Little care was given to the preparations for managing the outpost as at that time it “counted for little.”<sup>143</sup> People of Han descent who inhabited Taiwan (hereafter called “Taiwanese”<sup>144</sup>) initially welcomed the new government. However they quickly began to see the administration as corrupt, heavy handed, and unrefined.<sup>145</sup> The large number of dissidents on the island troubled the government.<sup>146</sup> Ill feeling between the Nationalists and islanders became entrenched in an episode remembered as “2-2-8,” numerals which marked the date February 28, 1947. This was the occasion of a massive protest, sparked by Monopoly Bureau agents beating a woman street vendor for selling cigarettes without a license. The Nationalists responded with brutal force. Fresh troops were deployed and as many as 35,000 local residents, notably many of Taiwan’s urban intelligentsia, lost their lives.<sup>147</sup> Thereafter the relationship between mainlanders and the residents of Taiwan, even in Christian fellowship, would be tenuous.<sup>148</sup>

In 1949 the Nationalist army and government relocated to Taiwan.<sup>149</sup> The influx involved as many as three million mainlanders and the population swelled to over ten million.<sup>150</sup> These refugees declared Taiwan the only remaining free territory of China and vowed to return and “reclaim China from its present black night.”<sup>151</sup> Though the Nationalist language was defiant this was a difficult time. The humiliating defeat, the very real threat of a Communist assault, a lack of resources with which to care for the large numbers of migrants, the emotional trauma of separation from families left behind, and the difficulties of adjusting to a new environment were among mainlander concerns.<sup>152</sup> Help came with the United States entering into the Korean conflict. Breakdown in relations with the People’s Republic of China meant support for Chiang Kai Shek’s Republic. The United States began to patrol the Taiwan Straits. This military protection, together with the many millions of dollars in American aid and technical assistance that followed, greatly strengthened the Nationalist government.<sup>153</sup>

If the Nationalist party was prepared to vigorously oppose the Communist threat in China it was also disposed to quash any dissent that might rise within Taiwan. Sociologist Thomas B. Gold writes,

They combined hegemony in the economic and political spheres with cultural hegemony through their control over education, the media, language, much of cultural production and official ideology. ... The mainlanders looked down on Taiwanese culture as a hybrid of the Chinese outback and Japanese imperialism, marginalizing it as something of value only to foreign anthropologists.”<sup>154</sup>

From the time of the relocation of the Nationalist government to Taiwan in 1949 until 1987 the island was placed under martial law, giving the military authority over civil, administrative, and judicial officers. In 1950 the system was institutionalized with the creation of the Taiwan Garrison Command. This body was charged with overseeing entry and exit visas, approving public meetings, censoring all published material, and maintaining social order.<sup>155</sup> All schools were required to teach against both Communism and Taiwan independence. A vast network of secret police and informants existed, curtailing any attempts to establish civic organizations outside of Nationalist control.<sup>156</sup> Gold writes that the methods were extremely effective and that the first three decades of Nationalist rule saw almost no popular opposition.<sup>157</sup>

The Taiwanese found the Nationalist government to be an authoritative entity that would sanction no dissent from its agenda. Indeed they speak of the forty years between the 2-2-8 tragedy and the lifting of martial law in 1987 as an “extended nightmare called the White Terror.”<sup>158</sup> “White Terror” was first used to describe the Nationalist suppression of Communist insurgents from the 1920s whereas “Red Terror” was used of the same tactics when employed by the Communist party. In Taiwan the term is not so much used to describe a method as a protracted era when as many as 140,000 individuals who were perceived to threaten Nationalist ideology were imprisoned, tortured, or worse.<sup>159</sup>

In time physical proximity and collective education and employment experiences would serve to erode the estrangement, at least on a personal level, between the mainland immigrants and the Taiwanese population. The passing of time also tempered patriotic feelings among the mainlanders. Though the second and third generation of mainlanders in Taiwan did not necessarily feel that Taiwan was their homeland, neither did they identify with the yearning of the first generation to return to China. On July 15, 1987 the government, having recognized their totalitarian regime was unacceptable to both international powers and among a populace that was informed in regards to global political trends, lifted martial law.<sup>160</sup>

The end of martial law resulted in the emergence of new political parties and the formation of a variety of social movements for issues as diverse as environmental protection, labor laws, and the rights of mainlanders to visit their birthplace. Gold’s research on Taiwan’s civil society notes that the government appeared to take each issue seriously. In thus legitimizing the new parties and movements the Nationalists were operating with a different ideology than earlier. A relentless democratization was taking place that the party had little ability to halt.<sup>161</sup> The process of liberalization, however, was slow.<sup>162</sup> From 1945 to 2000, even after the lifting of martial law, the government remained under Nationalist control.<sup>163</sup>

At the turn of the century the government of Taiwan would boast,

... successful shifts from subsistence agriculture to export manufacturing and then to capital-intensive industry have made the ROC one of the world’s most important suppliers of information and high-tech products.... An effective

universal educational system has cultivated a wealth of professional talent, facilitated the steady development of the nation, and promoted the international competitiveness of the ROC.<sup>164</sup>

In the fifty-five years that the Nationalists governed Taiwan society changed dramatically. A democratic system had emerged. The population had more than doubled, rising to almost 22.5 million. Massive urbanization had located 60 percent of the population in four cities (the capital, Taipei, has 9,200 people per square kilometer) and industrialization had enabled the state to claim the third highest average per capita income in Asia (£12,000). Watching television and shopping had become the favorite leisure activities of the populace. The development is remarkable given that the island has comparatively few natural resources and the second highest population density in the world (590 per square kilometer).<sup>165</sup>

Urbanization, education, consumerism, and a certain kind of political stability have transformed Taiwan. Yet it would be a mistake to conclude that the people think of the changes simply in terms of progress. Koarnhak Tarn, a respected Taiwanese writer, expresses a theme common in late 20<sup>th</sup> century literature<sup>166</sup> when he reminisces about what has been lost to his culture:

Now just because one's body size only requires a bed space six feet long by three feet wide, you should not make beds of only those proportions. There must be room to spare for you to get pleasure and relief from anything. The thing one misses about the countryside of old is that the untouched wilderness used to stretch out among the ploughed fields, giving room to spare. ... It was a place the eye could rove over, the ear could delight in.... It gave you an infinite feeling of spaciousness and ease.<sup>167</sup>

Throughout the Nationalist era the peoples of Taiwan have experienced dramatic changes in their culture. There has been tension between the benefits of the traditional and modern, the native and the foreign, as well as difficult questions about their identity as Taiwanese, Chinese, and as members of the global community. The situation has been described as one in which "chaos and hope are mingled together."<sup>168</sup> At the end of the Nationalist era the anxiety remains high. Questions over the political and cultural future of Taiwan remain unresolved.<sup>169</sup>

## Relations Between Church and State

Allen J. Swanson, noted researcher of Protestantism in Taiwan, writes that there appears to have been a larger percentage of Christians among those who migrated to Taiwan than there was in the general mainland population.<sup>170</sup> While this may well be there is no reason to doubt the estimate of Stephen Chen (陳鐳), President of the Mandarin speaking Tao Shen Theological Seminary (道生神學院), that these comprised no more than one percent of the migrant community.<sup>171</sup> Swanson conjectures that the number of Christians may have been relatively high because Christians feared Communism. Yet the migration was a political, not a religious, phenomenon. Those who came were closely allied with the Nationalist regime and had political reasons for fearing the new government in China. Those not associated with the Nationalist government continued their ministries in China. Among the immigrants were few theologians or Christian leaders of stature.<sup>172</sup> Nevertheless the Christians among the mainlanders gathered together for informal Bible study and prayer. Their meetings attracted many who were suffering the stresses of the period and the numbers of Christians began to increase.<sup>173</sup>

The writings of Wang Ming-Tao and Watchman Nee were popular reading among these Christians. In the 1950s there were not many Christian books available in Chinese. Thus works by Wang and Nee were the mainstay of most Christian bookstores.<sup>174</sup> Their influence became so great that Stephen Chen suggests every adult Christian in a Mandarin speaking church has read at least one of Wang's books.<sup>175</sup> Kuo Ming-Chang (郭明璋), Consultant of the Chinese Rhenish Church in Taipei, explains that the theology of Wang and Nee permeated theological education in all mainland-originating seminaries. Denominations as diverse as Wesleyan, Baptist, and the Independent churches have all been deeply influenced by the two theologians.<sup>176</sup> Their positions would be so lasting that in 2002 Chow Lien-hwa, the aforementioned "grandfather" of the churches who had been a YMCA secretary, served as chaplain to Chiang Kai-shek, and remains one of the most influential Christian leaders in Taiwan, declared them to be the "heroes" of the mainland-originating churches.<sup>177</sup>

By contrast the refugee Christians would not have been amenable to theologies espoused by the likes of Y. T. Wu, a YMCA affiliated Chinese theologian quoted earlier who was

respected in China for developing a theology of Christian social responsibility, especially when Wu commended Communists for their “social passion,” “sacrificial spirit,” and “methodical efficiency.”<sup>178</sup> The Nationalist government produced a constant stream of anti-communist propaganda that hardened mainlander attitudes.<sup>179</sup> Moreover, the writings of theologians conciliatory to the Communist Party were simply unavailable. Nationalists censored not only leftist publications, but were very careful about publishing any writers who had remained in China.<sup>180</sup> Even in Taiwan’s seminaries it was only in 1987, after the lifting of martial law, that it would be possible to study the theology of Y. T. Wu.<sup>181</sup> Wang and Nee, however, were allowed. Their bold stance in the face of the Communist regime was applauded.<sup>182</sup> Moreover their focus on inner spirituality was amenable to Nationalists who did not encourage meddling in social affairs.<sup>183</sup>

The early Christians from the mainland were a people in exile whose primary concern was returning home.<sup>184</sup> They had no roots on the island upon which they found themselves and were fairly unaware of the concerns or needs of the local populace. For the most part they resided in ethnically segregated urban neighborhoods.<sup>185</sup> Their emotional needs were met in fellowship with people of a similar background while the government attempted to provide for their physical needs.<sup>186</sup> They had little by way of material goods to share with others.<sup>187</sup> For these refugees Christian ministry simply meant inviting others to experience the blessings of a spiritual life. In as far as the crucial need of these people was emotional this was a powerful social service in itself.<sup>188</sup> However a ministry that gave little attention to the physical and material needs would become the pattern among mainland-originating churches.

A celebrated initiative in ministering to the emotional needs of the mainlanders was begun in 1950 by Madame Chiang Kai-shek. Madame Chiang gathered a select group of wives of highly placed officials into a Chinese Women’s Christian Prayer Group. The group met on a weekly basis for prayer, testimony, Bible study, and also for organizing public Christian witness. Madame Chiang’s yearly Easter broadcast was among the most recognized of the Prayer Group’s evangelistic activities. Early on the group divided into small teams and visited hospitals to sing and share with the sick and wounded. They learned that a large number of the injured and disabled were suicidal. The Group responded by raising support for and placing Christian chaplains in Taiwan

military hospitals. They were also known for ministry to dependents of military personnel, soldiers in frontline positions, and prison inmates. Though Ambassador Hollington Tong, whose wife was a member, writes that the Prayer Group also provided for the physical needs of orphans and victims of natural disasters, his history of Christianity in Taiwan shows that the principle object was evangelism among mainland immigrants. In ten years more than 10,000 converted and half a million heard the gospel.<sup>189</sup>

It is significant that authorities within the Nationalist government advocated Christianity. In Chinese history politicians have traditionally had authority over religious practice. The role was akin to that of a father in deciding the religious observances of the family.<sup>190</sup> A favorable response could be expected when patriotic mainlanders who idolized their leaders found individuals in the highest levels of government (including the four Nationalist Presidents, Sun Yat-sen, Chiang Kai-shek, and later Chiang Ching-wo and Li Teng-hui)<sup>191</sup> not only claimed Christian faith for themselves but also, as in the case of President and Madame Chiang, recommended conversion.<sup>192</sup> Once pastors and foreign missionaries became available the Christians joined the newly forming denominations.<sup>193</sup> Yet religious specialists had always had a relatively low social status in Chinese society.<sup>194</sup> The phenomenal growth of Christianity in Taiwan between the years 1950 and 1960 has much to do with the commendation of esteemed Nationalist leaders. To date mainland-originating churches find their common origins more binding than the denominational doctrines or international affiliations they inherited from missionaries.<sup>195</sup>

That Nationalist leaders supported Christian endeavors should not be taken to indicate churches were in a position to influence government policy. Quite the opposite was the case. The government had a clear agenda and could inhibit a religious body that was out of favor. Government permission was required for holding religious assemblies and constructing buildings for religious use. Limitations were imposed on the amount of property an organization could hold. Management methods, including the use of funds, were subject to government scrutiny. Religious organizations found it to their advantage to invite officials to sit on their board of directors. This enabled authorities to influence organizational activities from both within and without. The government was keenly

aware of the potential for religious bodies to become bases for political action and therefore endeavored to regulate religious activity.<sup>196</sup>

The Nationalists were particularly concerned with the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan. In 1945 the Presbyterian Church was by far the oldest, largest, and most influential Protestant denomination on the island. The church was established in 1865 and until 1926 remained Taiwan's only denomination.<sup>197</sup> It exerted such an influence that as late as 1983 a doctoral dissertation would argue, "Few cultures in the world are as synonymous with one denomination as is Taiwanese with Presbyterian."<sup>198</sup> Indeed, statistics at the end of the Nationalist era show that 28 percent of all Protestants are affiliated with the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan.<sup>199</sup>

In 1945 the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan was not the only denomination in Taiwan. Between 1926 and 1945 several small denominations had begun ministering on the island. One of these, the True Jesus Church, would take root among the island's Taiwanese populace and grow into a significant presence. Yet its theology emerged from the same movements in China that spawned Wang Ming-tao and Watchman Nee's efforts, and like them tended to focus on well-being in a spiritual sense. Indeed it was brought to Taiwan when students opposing the Japanese government traveled to China to try to organize a resistance movement. Some of these met members of the True Jesus Church and became convinced that what was needed was spiritual renewal and not political resistance. In 1926 they invited Barnabas Chang and other leaders of the movement to have a crusade in Taiwan. From 1945 immigrants from China began to swell the ranks of the denomination. The True Jesus Church did not represent the same threat to the Nationalist government as the Presbyterians, who were concerned with the general welfare of the Taiwanese community.<sup>200</sup>

This is not to say Presbyterians ever numbered significantly among the general populace. In 1945 Presbyterians comprised only 1.1 percent of the population. Nevertheless the Nationalists recognized the Presbyterian Church as a force with which to reckon.<sup>201</sup> The denomination was autonomous, Taiwanese governed, well organized, and both deeply rooted in and widely dispersed throughout the island.<sup>202</sup> Throughout most of the Nationalist era the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan represented the largest and most structured organization on the island over which the party had no control.<sup>203</sup>

William J. K. Lo (羅榮光), who served as the General Secretary of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan during the last years of the Nationalist era, reports that when he was a parish minister it was well known that there was at least one infiltrator in every congregation and that many seminary students were in fact government informers.<sup>204</sup>

The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan ministered in a significantly different context from that of mainland-originating churches and therefore had a perspective of the Nationalist regime that was different from mainland-originating churches. C. S. Yang (楊啓壽), a former General Secretary of the denomination, explains that mainland-originating churches did not understand the suffering of the Taiwanese.<sup>205</sup> The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, by contrast, shared not only the history and language, but also the suffering of the islanders. Indeed memories of the White Terror remain fresh in the minds of Presbyterian leaders, among whom there are tales of horrific suffering.<sup>206</sup> It is not surprising, therefore, that after the Nationalists arrived the Presbyterians would begin to search for theologies that could speak to their dilemma. Jonathan Chao, a noted historian of the Church in China, explains,

... the existential concern of Taiwanese Christians is a political one: how to gain independence from the ruling party which came from the Mainland. They might have a wider Chinese identity with people from China mainland in terms of common culture and history, but their recent conflict with the Mainlanders as represented by the ruling Kuomintang party has been essentially a political one. Hence, for many Taiwanese Presbyterians, their contextual theology is political theology.<sup>207</sup>

The theology of social ministry that developed within the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan during the Nationalist era is directly related to politics. A more detailed description of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan and the political context in which its theology emerged will be presented in Chapter Three. At this point it can, however, be seen that the denomination operated in a different context from mainland-originating churches. Christians from the mainland experienced the Nationalists as supportive of both their faith and their vision of political liberation. By contrast Presbyterians experienced the regime as a force intent on suppressing their freedoms.

## CONCLUSION

This chapter has set the stage for a discussion of the theologies of social service that developed among the Protestant churches of Taiwan during the Nationalist period. It has been demonstrated that the Christians who immigrated to Taiwan from China were engrained in a longstanding theological tradition that emphasized the spiritual transformation of individuals at the expense of service in society at large. It has also been established that these mainland-originating Christians enjoyed affiliation with a government that supported both their faith and their political aspirations. It has been shown that the Taiwanese did not have the benefit of the same freedoms. Before the lifting of martial law the political rights of the islanders were suppressed and Taiwan's most influential denomination, the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, was regarded with suspicion. The Taiwanese, including Presbyterians, experienced the Nationalists to be an oppressive force.

## CHAPTER TWO

### *MAINLAND-ORIGINATING PROTESTANTISM*

#### INTRODUCTION

In 1982 the Lausanne Committee for World Evangelization and the World Evangelical Fellowship published a paper that describes evangelism and social responsibility as having three equally valid relationships: social responsibility as a consequence of evangelism, as a bridge to evangelism, and as a partner with evangelism.<sup>1</sup> This chapter will be organized by applying these definitions to two distinct periods in the political history of Taiwan. It will be demonstrated that, from 1945 until the lifting of martial law in 1987, mainland-originating churches thought of social service as a consequence of evangelism and afterward began to think of service as a bridge to evangelism.

Correlating ministry paradigms with political developments in Taiwan allows the chapter to introduce the changes in the way mainland-originating churches minister in relation to the changing context. It will be argued that mainland-originating churches in Taiwan have been reluctant to develop the practice and theology of social ministry that would constitute a Christian witness independent of the political culture imposed by the central government; and that such initiatives in social ministry as have been taken tend to be subordinated to quantitative objectives of church growth. Attention will be given to notable exceptions to these generalizations, but it will be shown that the social ministries that have arisen among mainland-originating churches in Taiwan lack a reasoned theological foundation.

#### Social Service as a Consequence of Evangelism: 1945-1987

##### Missionaries and the Nationalist Agenda

By the time missionaries began arriving on Taiwan's shores the Nationalists were well aware that they were useful in securing military and economic assistance.<sup>2</sup> George Kerr,

a former diplomat in Taiwan, reports that at the 1943 meeting in Cairo Roosevelt was especially eager to be conciliatory to Chiang:

As a shrewd politician soon entering an election year, the President knew that an affront to the Chiangs would be taken to heart by every American missionary society in every parish in the United States, whereas a reward to China's Christian leaders would receive the widest possible publicity and everyone would be pleased.<sup>3</sup>

Neither the faith of Christian Nationalist leaders nor the genuineness of their interest in missionary endeavors needs to be called into question in order to make the observation that the government on Taiwan understood it was politically expedient to honor individuals who could influence American policy. Indeed when missionaries began to arrive in Taiwan the Nationalist government took pains to ensure they felt welcomed.<sup>4</sup> In 1951 President Chiang and his wife invited the forty participants of the island's first interdenominational missionary conference to tea.<sup>5</sup> Missionaries, however, quickly became a large community to accommodate. In 1947 the only foreign missionaries in Taiwan were members of the island's oldest and strongest denominations, Presbyterian and Catholic. By 1954, however, more than 300 missionaries representing 25 new denominations had arrived. By 1960 this number had doubled to more than 600 missionaries from seventy different Protestant groups.<sup>6</sup> Murray A. Rubinstein, an eminent historian of Christianity in Taiwan, describes the period as one of "missionary invasion."<sup>7</sup>

Though welcome, limits were imposed on this invading force. The activities the government desired of the missionaries are apparent in a seminal speech made by President Chiang's Secretary Hollington Tong (董顯光, 1887-1971). In 1959 this former Director General of the Government Information Office and ambassador to both Japan and the United States addressed the annual Taiwan Missionary Fellowship conference.<sup>8</sup> President Chiang himself attended the meeting. The address will be examined in detail because it helps explain the affect political ideology could have on both mainland-originating Christians and missionaries and the agenda of both government officials and missionaries.

Tong framed his presentation around five responses to the rhetorical question, "If I were a missionary in Taiwan, for what would I strive?"<sup>9</sup> Tong began,

If I were a missionary in Taiwan, firstly, I would preach strictly according to the Apostle's Creed. ... The reason for this reaffirmation of the Apostle's Creed is partly to counteract modernism which has begun to creep into the Christian teachings in Taiwan. ... I am afraid such modernistic tendencies would reduce Christianity to the equivalent of an ethic code of life. I am a fundamentalist, believing in the authenticity of the Scriptures, Biblical miracles, the virgin birth of Jesus, His physical resurrection, and His ascension to Heaven.<sup>10</sup>

There is no reason to doubt the sincerity of Tong's Christian faith. However this politician would not likely have made such a statement to an audience that differed in their convictions. The Taiwan Missionary Fellowship, which Tong was here addressing, was a loose confederation of missionaries that would admit only those holding an "evangelical Christian faith."<sup>11</sup> Tong began by establishing common ground with these conservatives. By declaring he held the central tenets, or fundamentals, of their faith he assured them they were on the same side in the theological divide. Moreover Tong invited the missionaries to preach their fundamentalist doctrines, and the Apostles Creed -- the use of which a Chinese theologian cited earlier, T. C. Chao, had objected to because it dealt with metaphysical problems but failed to reflect on Christian character and social responsibility.<sup>12</sup>

Tong disagreed with Chao's opinion. He held the view that social service is a consequence of evangelism, arguing, "If one believes in the Apostle's Creed, one is bound to be a moral man."<sup>13</sup> Tong asserted modernism, by contrast, does not necessarily result in good ethical behavior. Tong supported this position by citing a case in which modernists failed to condemn polygamy, a topic discussed at the conference that found most missionaries restricting baptism to those with only one wife.<sup>14</sup> Tong's opposition to modernism shows that in 1959 the battle lines between conservatives and liberals remained sharply drawn. However one must question if modernist theology itself was a real threat in Taiwan. By Tong's own admission, "... the overwhelming majority of missionaries in Taiwan are fundamentalists in their beliefs...."<sup>15</sup> It appears that Tong's stand against modernism, often repeated throughout his speech, was not so much about the theological or ethical dangers inherent in their theology as about politics.

Tong was worried that “well meaning but misled liberals” belonging to the National Council of Churches of Christ in the U.S.A. had made gestures of friendship with “Red China” that threatened the very existence of “Free China.”<sup>16</sup> Less than a year before the National Council had held a World Order Study Conference. That the Study Conference had far reaching political influence is evident in letters written to the Conference by Secretary-General of the United Nations, the President of the United States, and by the active participation of the President of the U.N. General Assembly and the United States Secretary of State.<sup>17</sup> The following was among the resolutions adopted by the Conference:

With reference to China, Christians should urge reconsideration by our government of its policy in regard to the People’s Republic of China. While the rights of the people of Taiwan and of Korea should be safeguarded, steps should be taken toward the inclusion of the People’s Republic of China in the United Nations and for its recognition by our government. ... We have a strong hope that the resumption of relationships between the peoples of China and of the United States may make possible also a restoration of the relationships between their churches and ours.<sup>18</sup>

Thus after a second point in which Tong suggested missionaries show sympathy for the Chinese Christian desire for independence from foreign control he asked missionaries to try to understand the threat posed by the “ruthless Chinese Communist dictators on the mainland.”<sup>19</sup> Tong argued, “... Communism is an enemy of God. As such Communism must be destroyed. Communism flourishes where Christianity recedes, withers where Christianity advances.”<sup>20</sup> Missionaries were being exhorted to stand with the Nationalists in their struggle against their enemies. This spokesman for President Chiang wanted missionaries to preach a message that centered on the Apostle’s Creed and Christian fundamentals. Their message could also include a political facet, provided it was political in the way the Nationalist wanted it to be. Missionaries were most welcome to join in preaching against Communism, the “enemy of God.”

Missionaries were also invited to assist the Nationalists with charitable endeavors. Tong’s fourth point was to request missionaries to assist the government by offering charitable services for the needy.<sup>21</sup> Tong, however, knew the hearts of these conservative missionaries was primarily for evangelism. He therefore supported his appeal by alluding to the bridge paradigm, that charity would facilitate gospel

proclamation. However this had not been the preferred method by which evangelical missionaries had ministered in China. They had long preferred a method known as “direct evangelism.”<sup>22</sup> By means of public addresses, conversations, posters, and tracts audiences were sought and told, “The One True God loves you and has given a demonstration of His love. He sent His Son to die on a cruel cross to save you from your sins.”<sup>23</sup> Thus the final point of this former Information Minister was to suggest missionaries use mass media to actively propagate their message.<sup>24</sup>

The missionaries must have felt elated about their prospects in Taiwan, and the respect with which they were being treated. More than two thirds of those attending the meeting had been forced to withdraw from their service in China.<sup>25</sup> There, like a “slow, relentless tide which moved steadily in, pushing, squeezing, pressing,” they were increasingly treated as ignoble and unwelcome.<sup>26</sup> Here they were encouraged to disseminate their message, and told their faith was shared by many members in the highest echelons of State.<sup>27</sup> Tong’s concluding remarks might have awakened sentiments akin to patriotism.

In the difficult years that are ahead, I know that you will be with us in all our Christian battles. It is reassuring that, in the dark night of despair in China, there is one place of refuge where true Christianity is still honored and is still marching forward and onward. ... If I were a missionary in Taiwan, I would simply follow your leadership and exert my best to help bring the kingdom of heaven to earth.<sup>28</sup>

It is telling that in the last line of the speech Tong emphasized his vision of the kingdom of heaven on earth. The terminology is surprising given the fact that the majority of Christians in Taiwan, be they missionary or members of Taiwan’s mainland originating churches, shared a premillennialist pessimism about the future of society. The rhetoric demonstrates that Tong believed the Nationalist cause would usher in a better age, which he relates to the Kingdom of Heaven. Indeed numerous statements throughout Tong’s speech closely equate the kingdom of God and the Nationalist cause. Tong described the Nationalist struggle in terms of “Christian work”<sup>29</sup> and “Christian battles”<sup>30</sup> against an enemy that wanted to destroy democracy, a system he linked with Christianity. He argued the Christian faith of Nationalist leaders and missionaries would help in the goal of overthrowing Communism.<sup>31</sup> Tong criticized those missionaries who taught that

Christians should merely trust Jesus and wait for his second coming. He argued such teaching “can have no other effect than to dampen the determination of the people to keep themselves strong and alert to repel the ever-present danger of invasion.”<sup>32</sup>

If ever religion was mixed with politics it was being done in this speech. Given the background of missionaries from China and their struggle over the social gospel one would expect some opposition to Tong’s theology. Yet Tong’s position appears to have found support. The chair of the conference, Carl Hunker, was a Baptist who would later publish a book calling for Christian action on behalf of Taiwan.<sup>33</sup> Hunker’s book, like Tong’s speech, mixes religious and political agendas. Though evangelism is important much of the writing is given over to lauding the godly General Chiang and his government in their attempts to free China. Hunker, who would become the President of Taiwan’s Baptist Theological Seminary, testified, “Chinese Christians have in President and Madame Chiang an inspiring example of devotion to Christ.”<sup>34</sup> Ambassador Tong would have been pleased that Hunker also wrote, “To the millions of people in developing nations in the Far East, living fearfully under the shadow of Communist aggression, the island is a sign of well-kept promises for protection by peace-loving nations.”<sup>35</sup> Hunker appears to have been lobbying Americans to help Taiwan’s “Christian battles.” Among the conservative missionaries there were a number who accepted Tong’s position and sought to create the image of Taiwan as a bastion of holy freedom.<sup>36</sup>

Some of the missionaries may not have questioned Tong’s theology because of their own political views. Many of the missionaries who served in Taiwan were American. It has been noted that the fundamentalists among these traditionally placed little hope in social reform. Yet this did not always lead to an apolitical stance. Separation from worldly systems was often interpreted as inward separation. Management of the churches certainly paralleled modern business methods. American middle-class values were highly regarded among such missionaries. Communism seemed to threaten these values. After the Second World War a “hyper-American patriotic anti-communism”<sup>37</sup> arose among some Christians. The feeling must have been intensified among those who were forced to leave their ministries on the mainland. When Ambassador Tong confessed their Fundamentalist faith, encouraged their efforts to propagate that faith, and championed their vision of returning to minister in China, such missionaries had found

an eloquent spokesman for their own theology. They must have felt optimistic about ministry opportunities when President Chiang later welcomed Carl McIntyre, the leader of the movement in the United States, as an honored guest.<sup>38</sup>

Missionaries belonging to the Taiwan Missionary Fellowship commonly wrote about effective evangelistic techniques. Their articles find them occasionally praising, but never condemning, the government.<sup>39</sup> Those who did not share McIntyre's view, or who were more pessimistic about government policy, may have refused to critique Tong's theology of Kingdom in order to attend to higher matters. After describing the Nationalist execution of the husband of one of his colleagues for helping young Taiwanese students avoid the draft, pioneering medical missionary Olav Bjorgaas reports,

Mostly we were involved in a work that the KMT approved of and we found they respected us. ... Of course I knew that I was not totally free to say anything I thought regarding politics. But, I was raised during the German occupation of Norway, so that was something that was built into my awareness.<sup>40</sup>

From the government perspective missionaries, if properly controlled, provided desirable services. Some few championed the Nationalist cause and thus helped secure military and economic aid. Others, it will be shown, offered charitable services that supplemented government programs.<sup>41</sup> Missionaries knew and appear to have accepted the tacit contract with the government that was outlined by Tong. While he indicated they could share their faith and even join in a critique of Communism it was clear to the missionaries that this did not include the right to question Nationalist policies. H. Dan Beeby, a missionary who served among the Taiwanese, would one day challenge convention and help leaders of his denomination draft a statement arguing the Taiwanese should have a say in determining the island's political future. This document, entitled "Statement on our National Fate by the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan," will be discussed in the following chapter. It was released in December 1971. Three months later Beeby was deported.<sup>42</sup> No records have been found of missionaries among mainland-originating churches engaging in such activity. Had they done so these missionaries would certainly have found themselves out of sympathy with their patriotic congregations.

## Missionary Methods

It has been explained that the vast majority of Protestant missionaries who served in Taiwan were evangelical. Swanson writes that ecumenical churches sent few missionaries because,

These churches generally reflect a different theological or missiological stance.... Some believe that the day of the missionary is over and that the responsibility for world evangelism now lies with the national churches of each country. Others find themselves unable to attract sufficient missionary candidates, due in part to a theology that has vitiated the evangelistic thrust of the Gospel and reduced, if not eliminated, the imperative of world missions. Missionaries of this tradition peaked in the late 1960s and appear to have been in numerical decline ever since.<sup>43</sup>

The well-known historian of the Chinese Church, Jonathan Chao (趙天恩) writes that few of the theologically liberal missionaries who had ministered in China ever came to Taiwan. The pattern was for their sending bodies to dispatch funds, or a few highly trained experts, to assist churches in specialized ministries. Most of the missionaries who came to Taiwan were heirs of conservative mission practices that had emerged in China. They tended to follow the thinking of Hudson Taylor, which was to send a large number of missionaries to facilitate direct evangelism.<sup>44</sup>

The first mainland-originating churches had little experience and therefore naturally looked to the missionaries as their religious experts. Stephen Chen explains that in the early 1950s, when the small groups of mainland Christians met the missionaries who had served in China, the relationship was immediately intimate, almost like meeting a lost family member. These experienced missionaries gathered mainlanders who had in some way been affiliated with their denominational work in China and established the same denomination in Taiwan. The missionary influence continued until about 1965, when mainlanders began to graduate from seminaries. The transition from missionary leadership, not always smooth, was not completed until the missionaries who had served on the mainland began to retire in the mid-1970s.<sup>45</sup>

The early 1950s was a period of expansion for mainland-originating churches. According to the statistics of Taiwan missionary and church growth expert Dorothy A.

Raber, the number of Christians (Protestant and Catholic) in Taiwan in 1945 totaled 1 percent of the population while in 1965 Christians comprised 5 percent of the population.<sup>46</sup> Historians attribute the dramatic increase to a number of factors. With few clergy an enthusiastic laity were deeply involved in ministry. When missionaries became available the Chinese Christian community welcomed them. These foreigners had lived in China. They spoke the language of the mainlanders and were able to apply evangelistic methods that had already proven effective. The mainlanders tended to live in close proximity to each other, thus facilitating ministry. Indeed the missionary body was sufficiently large as to make an impact. In the beginning it appears this warm relationship between missionaries and mainlanders, the cooperation between foreign and local church workers, and again, the favor of the government contributed to the mainland community being receptive to Christian faith.<sup>47</sup> Evangelistic techniques included a heavy dependence on rallies held in church halls and also drew on evangelistic crusades, lay witnessing, home worship, English Bible classes, and radio evangelism.<sup>48</sup>

This does not mean Christians lacked effective social ministries. In 1980 Swanson recorded that there was one institutional agency for every 7.2 congregations. Among these were 12 hospitals, 18 schools, 16 orphanages, and 15 social service centers.<sup>49</sup> Rubinstein reports the numerous agencies the missionaries founded served to supplement the system the government was constructing and explains they made a significant contribution toward improving the welfare of the people of Taiwan.<sup>50</sup>

It is important to note, however, that these were primarily para-church ministries. Stephen Chen explains that the trend had long been for individual Christians who were moved by a particular need to form a group to minister to that need. However churches often neither encouraged nor supported such efforts. Indeed Swanson's statistics should not be interpreted to suggest there is a relationship between Christian institutions and congregations. He is careful to explain that the existence of numerous agencies is indicative only of the concern of missionaries and a few local Christians, but that it does not demonstrate that there is an interest in social ministry among the congregations. Swanson observed that, "Local churches, often neither involved in the establishing nor the maintenance of such programs, appear to feel little kinship with these ministries."<sup>51</sup>

An exception to detachment from social service among the congregations occurred between 1954 and 1968 when the US government provided surplus goods to churches for distribution. Local churches became centers where milk powder, flour, corn meal, clothing, vitamins, medicines, soap, cooking oil, and various other products and services were offered. This was a large program with Protestant statistics for 1959 showing 3.3 million US dollars worth of goods being offered through almost 600 local churches.<sup>52</sup> Thus in the height of the missionary era congregations in Taiwan were occupied with charitable endeavors. There was, however, considerable uncertainty about the value of the programs. The fundamental goal of the churches was to evangelize the populace. Church leaders were concerned individuals might convert not in order to receive the spiritual, but merely the material benefits the churches were offering.<sup>53</sup> Leaders were also uncomfortable with ministry that varied from the conventional preaching service.<sup>54</sup>

#### From Foreign to Nationalized Ministry: Shared Aspirations for Church Growth

By the early 1960s the evangelistic endeavors of mainland-originating churches were bearing little fruit. The new immigrants were settled and, with their emotional and physical needs now no longer such a concern, their interest in Christianity, though not religion, began to wane.<sup>55</sup> The churches of Taiwan were entering a period that historians would describe as stagnant.<sup>56</sup> In the mid-1960s three missionaries studying at Fuller Theological Seminary published dissertations that examined the reasons for a decline in numbers of converts. By applying the principles of the church growth movement these Fuller students and those who would follow in their footsteps would attempt to bring about greater evangelistic success. Their influence was considerable. In early 1971 they had formed the Taiwan Church Growth Society. These growth specialists promoted their theology by holding a number of seminars (including visits by the “Father of Church Growth,” Fuller Seminary’s Donald MacGavran),<sup>57</sup> writing numerous books and articles, translating and promoting standard church growth texts, and publishing a quarterly bulletin.<sup>58</sup> Rubinstein notes that most of their suggestions were quickly acted upon in the churches. As a result the denominations began to cooperate in theological education and evangelistic campaigns.<sup>59</sup>

Allen Swanson, the most prolific of the church growth specialists, was from a younger generation of missionaries who had not served in China. He saw the need for nationalizing church leadership and censured missionaries for many of the problems he found in the churches.<sup>60</sup> The picture Swanson painted of missionary influence is bleak. Swanson announced, "It is precisely among those Mandarin churches with the highest missionary concentration that the greatest growth difficulties exist!"<sup>61</sup> It has been noted that Chinese Christians had first welcomed the missionaries and allowed these religious experts to shape their ministry. Not surprisingly the churches had developed a foreign flavor. Chinese visitors to worship services found them both unexciting and unintelligible. If the churches were to grow they would have to become more authentically Chinese.<sup>62</sup>

The task would not be easy. The Christians had been impacted by the "denominational imperialism" of the missionaries.<sup>63</sup> Missionaries had been aware of the need for training leadership for their new churches and established western style schools for the study of theology. As ministry became a matter for trained clergy the laity lost their enthusiasm. They felt the pastor was a paid professional and therefore should be responsible for all church work.<sup>64</sup> However the new ministers could be a matter of concern for the churches. Missionaries had failed to understand that many of the seminary applicants were unemployed soldiers looking for free education and the security of a job in the church after graduation.<sup>65</sup> This, combined with the reticence in Chinese culture to critique one's teacher, meant graduates were equipped to follow missionary traditions but neither motivated nor enabled to offer inventive ministry in a changing context.<sup>66</sup> It would not be until a second generation of national leaders began to lead the churches that innovative thinking on subjects such as Christian social concern would emerge.<sup>67</sup> However the second generation, though free from missionary control, would continue to be influenced by foreign ministries. Fuller's program for church growth appears to be the first such trend to affect the churches in Taiwan.

In 1985 Tsai Kuo-shan (蔡國山), director of the Taiwan Industrial Evangelical Fellowship, completed a doctoral dissertation at Fuller that repeated the charge that churches in Taiwan were mere imitations of western models of ministry. Tsai noted that though western visitors feel at home in most worship services, the people of the island have quite another experience. Most are unwilling to become Christian because they

have to cross too many cultural barriers. They have no desire to reject traditional customs and be westernized. Later Tsai would modify his views to argue that visitors to churches did not find them so western as simply different, perhaps because Christians had formed a sort of subculture. In either case becoming a Christian means dissonance with traditional ethnic identities and heritage.<sup>68</sup> The dilemma, as Tsai and other church growth specialists in Taiwan understood it, was not the fundamental question of *why* the gospel should be shared. Nor was there much interest in the content of the Christian message; *what* should be proclaimed. The concern was simply *how* to better translate the message Christians were already proclaiming into the culture.

Tsai's answer was different from the other specialists. Where they are overwhelmingly focused on verbal evangelism, he developed the idea that churches must also include social services. The others suggest targeting homogeneous units and seeking to influence the unit by strategically ministering to those who are likely to be both responsive and influential. This would involve witnessing along natural webs of relationship. They also advocated a spiritual power encounter that opposes the demonic and satisfies the needs of those used to the supernatural experiences in traditional religions. This did not mean disparaging belief systems. Indeed they argued for sensitivity to the deeply felt need for veneration of ancestors.<sup>69</sup> Tsai agrees with these points<sup>70</sup> yet also argues that the churches must have a holistic ministry that pays attention to social responsibility.<sup>71</sup>

Tsai explains that among the working classes in particular the "eye gate" is more important than the "ear gate," meaning churches should communicate by deeds and not only by words.<sup>72</sup> To this end Tsai suggests that the churches not only minister along the traditional cultural networks but by creating functional substitutes for associations the rural population loses in a move to an urban environment. Tsai explains that it has long been common for the people of Taiwan to form associations to help with financial, education, employment, and a wide variety of other needs.<sup>73</sup> He urges individual Christians to form such associations. Moreover Tsai explains that social needs in Taiwan are often met in conjunction with voluntary organizations centered in small temples that are open 24 hours a day. Tsai argues that churches, like temples, should seek to be community centers wherein social needs can be met.<sup>74</sup>

Heretofore theologians involved in the church growth movement had been focused on program-oriented evangelism.<sup>75</sup> Social service seemed to be thought of as belonging to para-church rather than church ministry. Indeed it is common to find these writers advising against involvement in such work because it detracts from the urgent task of evangelism.<sup>76</sup> Even Swanson, whose quantitative research was beginning to demonstrate that evangelistic crusades were not leading to an increase in baptisms and that the churches that were growing the best were those that offered social services,<sup>77</sup> continued to present large-scale public events such as crusades organized by Billy Graham, Chow Lien-hwa, and Campus Crusade for Christ as the most impressive Christian ministries in Taiwan.<sup>78</sup>

It was only in the 1980s, and most notably in Tsai, that theologians involved in the church growth program began to consider the value of evangelization by means of churches in community service.<sup>79</sup> Heretofore when the churches thought of social service they saw it as following, as consequential to, evangelism. Nee and Wang had taught that after conversion individuals learn to love others, and that some few would be called to engage in social ministries.<sup>80</sup> To suggest that social service should go before, could be offered by churches as a bridge to facilitate evangelism, was to advance a theory that had not been tried, and indeed would not be tested until the late 1990s when churches, frustrated with the traditional modes of ministry and spurred on by social developments, would begin to experiment with new forms of outreach.

### Social Service as a Bridge to Evangelism: 1987-2000

#### The Impact of Social Change on Social Ministry

Martial law was lifted in the summer of 1987.<sup>81</sup> Political change, however, came slowly. From 1945 to 2000 the government remained under Nationalist control. On a personal level the passing of time had resulted in a relatively peaceful coming together of mainlander and Taiwanese cultures. It would be wrong to assume, however, that mainlanders, even Christians, welcomed the emergence of new parties.<sup>82</sup> Thirteen years after the lifting of martial law, on the Sunday following the election of the first opposition party president, it is reported that many mainland-originating churches sang songs of suffering.<sup>83</sup> The following year members attending the annual meeting of the

United Methodist Church in Taiwan expressed annoyance over the use of green colored banners because the color corresponded to that used by the party of the new president.<sup>84</sup> However right through to the end of the century the party remained Nationalist and longstanding presidents were considered Christian. Mainland-originating churches had little need to rethink their political theology, which is said to have gone no further than the principle that because the Bible tells Christians to respect authorities they should obey the government.<sup>85</sup>

This conciliatory attitude toward their government would serve as a component leading to a change in ministry patterns among mainland-originating churches. Though these churches were not predisposed to opposing their government they were willing to cut *with* rather than against the grain, so to speak, of Nationalist policies. Thus when a new political initiative was advanced in the mid-1990s mainland-originating churches embraced it, allowing it to affect their practice of social ministry. The program began in 1993 when Chen Chi-nan (陳其南), the Chairman of the National Culture and Arts Foundation, was appointed by President Lee Teng-hui to spearhead a movement to help democratize the nation by empowering local communities. In the past the central government would, for example, decide where a bridge should be built, finance the project, and employ the necessary professionals to execute the task. Now representatives in a community would themselves make plans for improvement and apply for government resources when necessary. Empowering local communities involved raising community consciousness. Residents were encouraged to learn their history and organize activities that would create a sense of cohesion. Chen explains that in the past Taiwan was a poor nation and community development meant providing for the physical needs of the populace. However Taiwan had become a fairly wealthy country and community needs had changed. The issue had become creating a quality living environment.<sup>86</sup>

In the 1990s the practice of social ministry among mainland-originating churches would also be stimulated by the rise of a socially active Buddhist movement. Economic development had not naturally resulted in a good living environment. As the economy improved many turned to traditional religions for the spiritual values that seemed lacking in the consumer society, resulting in a revival, for example, of Buddhism. It is reported that from 1983 to 1995 the number of Buddhist adherents grew from 80,000 to

4.9 million, an increase of 600 percent.<sup>87</sup> The emergence of one Buddhist organization in particular, the Buddhist Compassion Relief Tzu Chi Association (佛教克難慈濟功德會),<sup>88</sup> a social ministry that desires to “bring the Pure Land into our world and deliver all creatures from suffering,”<sup>89</sup> was particularly important in causing Christians to reappraise their views on social service. By the mid-1980s this Taiwan agency had captured the attention of the nation with more than 20 percent of the island’s population contributing to the ministry. A decade later the foundation was even more popular, having established a large medical center, medical school, and numerous highly visible relief programs on behalf of the poor and those suffering from natural disasters.<sup>90</sup>

To suggest that the heirs of Wang and Nee would allow political and religious developments to influence Christian ministry seems implausible given their dark view of society and their willingness to serve lengthy prison terms rather than degrade their churches by involvement in worldly political machinations.<sup>91</sup> Yet the ministries of mainland-originating churches that were initiated after the lifting of martial law will demonstrate that such was the case. In regards to politics, Wang did advocate obeying the authorities as long as their activities did not interfere with Christian fellowship, doctrine, or witness.<sup>92</sup> Evidently patriotic Christians would not consider nationalist policy regarding community development as a threat to any of these. In regards to Buddhism, Christians would reason the Buddhists were simply reminding them of ministries they had neglected, but are essential to their faith.<sup>93</sup> Indeed the leader of the Tzu Chi Association herself is candid in explaining the foundation had been established because of a conviction that Buddhists, like Christians, should have a social component to their ministry.<sup>94</sup>

## The Emergence of the Bridge Paradigm

### *The Year 2000 Gospel Movement*

In 1986 the Chinese Coordination Center of World Evangelism, which developed in relation to the Lausanne Committee for World Evangelization, held a Chinese Congress on World Evangelization in Taipei. Thousands of Christians listened to motivational sermons like that given by Philip Teng, the CCCOWE chairman, on Abraham being led from a self-centered, mediocre, limited way of thinking to a life of dedication and

ministry. Church leaders heard Teng describe the purpose of the CCCOWE as being not a para-church agency, but a movement that sought to help churches coordinate their efforts and fulfill their mission.<sup>95</sup> Protestants were inspired to redouble their evangelistic efforts. The following year church leaders met to discuss ministry in the last decade of the twentieth century. The decision was taken to instigate a Year 2000 Gospel Movement.<sup>96</sup> A board of directors representing almost all of Taiwan's Protestant denominations and a team of administrative officers were appointed to coordinate Protestant efforts toward three specific goals: that between the years 1990 and 2000 the number of Christians should reach 2 million (approximately 10 percent of the population), the number of churches would increase to ten thousand, and two hundred individuals from Taiwan would become missionaries to foreign lands.<sup>97</sup>

During the inauguration of Year 2000 Gospel Movement Sheldon Sawatzky, a Mennonite missionary and scholar from Fuller who had been involved in the ministry Taiwan Church Growth Society from its beginning, presented a paper that called on the churches to begin to think of new methods of ministry. Sawatzky believed traditional evangelism methods were no longer effective in Taiwan.<sup>98</sup> He explained,

At one time, mass evangelistic crusades and other types of blanket saturation campaigns appeared to be effective in reaching people for Christ. We live in a new era of mass media communication in which people filter the overload of informational bombardment. The church lost out long ago in the fierce competition of the mass media industry and needs only to recognize the fact. Theological reflection on New Testament methods of evangelism can alert us to the importance of primary relationships in the spreading of the good news – that inexpensive, non-electronic person-to-person, holy gossip.<sup>99</sup>

Sawatzky's paper seems out of place at a rally that sought to create enthusiasm over Year 2000 Gospel Movement plans, plans that over the next year included holding four large crusades, 400 smaller campaigns, publishing a large amount of evangelistic literature, and training volunteers in evangelistic methods. The old program evangelism was running at full steam in a movement envisioned, organized, and carried out without the help of foreign agencies.<sup>100</sup> Yet here was a foreigner, a representative of the church growth school, advising against the campaigns that the foreigners had earlier promoted and the Movement was now planning with such enthusiasm.

Sawatzky openly accused the churches of “copy evangelism”<sup>101</sup> and asserted that what they needed was to contextualize their message. Like Tsai, Sawatzky believed that ministry in the local context requires deeds and not just words, “a visible expression of religious values.”<sup>102</sup> To this end he argued that churches should not focus on ministries that result in a *come* mentality. Sawatzky believed the theology of the New Testament is *go* and urged the churches to respond to the needs that surround them. He stated, “Principles related to social concern, care for the poor and exploited, the value of community, and the breaking of racial and class barriers in Christ are a few principles derived from Scripture.”<sup>103</sup> Moreover Sawatzky maintained churches should offer a message that addresses the anxieties felt by the people of the island in regards to politics, overcrowded living conditions, pollution, breakdowns in morality, materialism, and etcetera. Churches, Sawatzky contended, need “a theology that enunciates the hope found in Christ, a hope that gives authentic purpose for living and working to transform the present circumstances, as well as hope for eternal life.”<sup>104</sup>

At first it seemed that Sawatzky’s call fell on deaf ears. The many Protestant denominations of Taiwan united as never before and exerted themselves in a spirit of evangelistic fervor. By the mid-1990s movement leaders were in a position to evaluate the efforts. Church leaders were finding it difficult to maintain enthusiastic support for a continual series of evangelistic programs. Regulating the quality of meetings held by Movement affiliates was also proving problematic. Moreover it became clear that those to whom the gospel was preached were not converting quickly, but taking their time to consider the Christian faith. Thus the numerical gains that were the Movement’s *raison d’être* were not being achieved. Changes would have to be implemented. It has been explained that developments in the island’s political and religious culture suggested new directions. James Shia (夏忠堅), the Director of Year 2000 Gospel Movement, was quick to respond and formulate plans that would challenge the churches of Taiwan to rethink traditional evangelistic methods. The Movement soon began to urge the churches to minister in a fashion surprisingly close to that expressed by Sawatzky.<sup>105</sup>

Shia once claimed to know the churches in Taiwan better than any other living individual. Indeed his long tenure at the helm of the Year 2000 Gospel Movement has afforded him an unparalleled experience of contemporary Protestantism. His theology begins with an interpretation of the history of ministry in Taiwan that will be discussed

in the concluding chapter. Shia believes that the churches in Taiwan have lost the balance between ministries of word and deed. He explains that before the mainland influx churches had both proclaimed and served. However as succeeding generations of converts received good educations and became skilled professionals an upper class mentality emerged that distanced the churches from the suffering of others. He maintains that this does not mean Christians completely neglected social service. Rather they tended to approach the problems in an organized, structural way, forming organizations to meet specific needs. Tsai states that such activities reflect the acts of a privileged class downward to the disadvantaged rather than ministry that is incarnational in nature.<sup>106</sup> Shia notes that social ministry came to mean little to the average churchgoer. Service was understood to be the work of specialized professionals in Christian institutions. Thus para-church organizations became the center of Christian service while churches focused on preaching. Churches were thought of as a place for focusing solely on God.<sup>107</sup>

Shia desires to move social ministry back into the churches or, more accurately, to open the churches to their communities. He accuses the churches of caring for only what goes on inside the walls of the sanctuary and urges them to consider both the commands and personal example of Jesus. Jesus commanded love of God and love of people. He demonstrated his meaning by showing interest in the daily lives of those to whom he ministered rather than in their religious observances. Shia accordingly draws a sharp distinction between the terms *religion* and *faith*. He argues religion involves activities, programs, rituals, traditions, policies, and organization whereas faith brings a person to Jesus. Faith relates to the essence of life; the place where love and power emerge. The difference between those who attend church services out of a sense of religious duty and those who attend because of faith is that faith involves a sincere desire to experience the presence of God and fellowship with other believers. The person with faith in Jesus will carry that faith outside the walls of the church. There, doing good deeds, Christians should witness to their faith, not religion, as it is belief in the teaching and example of Christ, not religious observance, that motivates.<sup>108</sup>

Shia may be thinking of the association between service and merit that is common to Chinese culture when he explains that good works do not save.<sup>109</sup> Rather he insists they are simply integral to faith. One has faith in Jesus and is therefore saved. One has faith

in Jesus and therefore serves. Shia finds it distressing that in Taiwan Christians remember the fundamental truth of salvation by faith alone, but fail to realize works are essential to that faith. Shia states that in Taiwan Christians understand Ephesians 2:8-9, that they are saved by grace through faith and not by works, but fail to connect this with verse 10, that they are “created in Christ Jesus to do good works.”<sup>110</sup>

Shia rejected the view that social service is simply a natural consequence of evangelistic proclamation. He states that while the premise seems credible in reality it has not proved successful. Shia also refuses to encourage churches to think of social service as a bridge, or means, to facilitate evangelism. Shia argues that though social service certainly helps evangelism such activities must not be treated as an evangelistic method. Christians do good deeds because they are essential to their faith. Shia simply insists that word and deed belong together. Proclamation and service are two sides of the same coin, the gospel. This, according to Shia, is “Great Commandment Theology.” Shia attributes his ideas to Bible study and reflection on Taiwan’s culture. However he is also aware that he is advocating the partnership paradigm published by the Lausanne Committee in 1982.<sup>111</sup>

Shia did not consider himself a theologian, but a church worker. His gifts are said to be in the area of conceiving, planning and promoting church ministries.<sup>112</sup> To this end he worked out detailed plans regarding how churches might participate in their communities, plans that Shia openly explains were influenced by Chen Chi-nan’s political efforts at community development. He envisions churches improving their neighborhood’s physical environment, promoting constructive cultural activities, and helping with local welfare, security, and economic needs. He suggests they might, for example, start recycling programs, create a feeling of community by displaying local cultural artifacts or sponsoring sporting events, provide daycare for children or the elderly, arrange for crossing guards near schools, help with public safety by supplying lighting in dangerous areas, or hold seminars and discussion groups on matters of concern to local residents. Shia was distressed that the churches meant much less to the average person in any community than the local convenience store and openly accused congregations of being more like lampshades than lamps. He urged them to shine their light, arguing they should not only think of glorifying God as something done through prayer and praise in a church service, but that God can be glorified through their good

deeds in the community. Shia believes if Christians hold a church service for an hour and a half each week they should spend the same amount of time in community service.<sup>113</sup>

This is a radical message in a country where a survey once showed that 90 percent of the average pastor's time was spent ministering to church members.<sup>114</sup> Shia argues that pastors should not think in terms of ministering only to their congregation but to the entire community in which the church is located. Churches are to consider their work in the community as building the kingdom of God. They should endeavor to "upgrade the quality of community life, to rebuild love, respect, and harmony in human nature and build harmonious relations between people and their environment so the community can continue to develop."<sup>115</sup> Yet Shia maintains achieving these goals does not indicate the kingdom of God has come.

Shia believes social transformation requires gospel proclamation. He states that it is only when the relationship between humans and God is restored that the kingdom of God descends into the world and the goal of community service is reached. Thus preaching plays an important part in Shia's theology of service. He insists Christian ministry should not be content with good works. There is a gospel to share. However it has been stated that Shia maintains community service should not be thought of as pre-evangelism. Nevertheless such service does create opportunities for evangelistic witness. Shia encourages Christians to pray and serve in their communities in honest relationships of friendship and trust. He believes that to facilitate these relationships they should not be too eager to preach their message. Yet when neighbors indicate an interest Christians should be ready to share their faith.<sup>116</sup> In this way the inexpensive personal "holy gossip" for which Sawatzky had argued could occur.

Both James Shia and Grace Cheng, the manager of the Year 2000 Gospel Movement,<sup>117</sup> are forthright in explaining that their initiatives were not only inspired by the Nationalist community movement, but that Buddhist ministries also caused them to reflect on and move into ministries of a social nature. Both admire not only the services the Buddhists offer, but the way the works of Tzu Chi in particular are broadcast and thereby influence society.<sup>118</sup> One of the areas where the Tzu Chi Foundation has been active is in disaster relief. Indeed whenever there was a disaster the blue-shirted Tzu Chi volunteers would

be seen on television news reports assisting survivors, offering comfort to families of victims, and chanting sutras to the deceased.<sup>119</sup> Leaders of the Year 2000 Gospel Movement felt Christians should also be involved in this kind of work and in 1998 organized a Chinese Christian Relief Association. The Christian community now had a body that was able to coordinate Protestant resources to meet emergency needs.<sup>120</sup>

The fact that Nationalists and Buddhists served to awaken the leaders of the Year 2000 Gospel Movement to their social responsibility generated criticism from Chris Su, who censures those churches that have become involved in the community movement for being focused only on winning public appreciation rather than offering what is often needed, a confrontation against social evil.<sup>121</sup> Nevertheless Shia's message has proved a significant influence among mainland-originating churches.<sup>122</sup> However this does not indicate that Shia's advocating social ministry as corollary, a partner, with evangelism has been accepted. While Shia reports that churches do not disagree with his explanation of the partner paradigm he also states that old ways of thinking prevail. Most churches continue to operate with a view that evangelistic proclamation is the most important task of the church and therefore can only go so far as to think of social service as an aid or a bridge to facilitate evangelistic endeavor.<sup>123</sup>

#### *Daniel Lee (李智華)*

Shortly after Chen's community movement began, Shia held a series of conferences throughout the island to promote the idea of church participation in their communities. Though the seminars were poorly attended a young evangelist, Daniel Lee, who was just graduating from China Evangelical Seminary (中華福音神學院), was well prepared to accept Shia's ideas. In seminary he had been influenced by Peter K. Chow (周功和), a Professor of Systematic Theology and Ethics, who appears to have been the only theologian in a mainland-originating seminary who lectured on the topic of Christian social service.<sup>124</sup>

Chow, who previously ministered in a church in Philadelphia that had grown out of a community service center, became convinced that it would not have been possible to reach the working class in Chinatown without social service. He gave interested students information about the running of the U.S. based center and taught them a

Reformed theology of service that argues the cultural mandate of Genesis 1:28 is included in the evangelical mandate of Matthew 28:18-20. This theology brings evangelistic proclamation and social service together by explaining that the Great Commission is about both evangelizing and teaching the nations. The theology maintains the ultimate goal is not saving people out of the world but participation in bringing about God's original design for the world, namely that God will be glorified through human cultures. Chow explains that the early Jerusalem church as described in the Book of Acts is a model of sound Christian ministry. The Jerusalem Church structured its community so as to provide economic support for those in need and, by the power of the Holy Spirit, offer healing to those who suffered physical ailments. All the while the church remained centered on preaching repentance and faith in the resurrected Christ. Chow directed his students toward "holistic evangelism," evangelism that keeps in mind the declaration of jubilee in Luke 4:18-19 and thus remembers Christ's bias for the poor.<sup>125</sup>

Upon graduating Daniel Lee began working in a Baptist church in the heart of Taipei. He quickly found that this urban work was significantly different from the villages in which he had ministered before attending seminary. In the villages he found people approachable. He could visit with children in the park, was welcomed when he visited homes, and could even arrange for evangelistic drama presentations in the local temple. Urban Taipei was an entirely different experience. Meeting people was exceedingly difficult. However if the church could become a community center where activities were organized for neighborhood youth and residents were able to meet and discuss community matters Lee would at least have a chance to become acquainted with his neighbors. Therefore, with the support of the senior pastor, he began implementing the ideas. The church became a center for children's art classes, various youth activities, an assortment of study meetings, and a place to organize projects to improve local parks and streets. Lee's efforts were the first of their kind in Taiwan and emerged just as Chen Chi-nan's community movement was starting. The news of a church active in the program made for good press and the church's activities were highly publicized.<sup>126</sup>

However Lee reports that many church members believed their church, like the temple in Jerusalem that Jesus said should be a place of prayer,<sup>127</sup> should not be used for secular activities. They felt the holy, quiet, feeling they had enjoyed in previous years

had been lost. Thus when the senior pastor left his position Lee's support was weakened. In 1999 he was forced to take his ministry to another church in the same community.<sup>128</sup>

Financial constraints had served to make the new church, the Nan King East Road Christian Church (台北基督徒南京東路禮拜堂), amenable to community service. Mainlanders who believed they would soon be returning to China had established the church. They had therefore rented rather than purchased the land on which the sanctuary was built. By the early 1990s the rent had risen to the point where it was necessary for the church to let out their facilities for public use. Yu Yong (吳勇), the acclaimed founder of the denomination to which the church belonged, made the decision that a church need not be treated as a holy temple, a place for only prayer and worship. The decision seemed appropriate after it was noted that some who had attended non-religious seminars held in the sanctuary were turning up for Sunday services.

In 1999 there was another financial crisis. The government notified the church that it must move because a subway station would be built on the site of their building. After purchasing a nearby property the church was informed there would be a delay before the subway construction would begin. The church became financially responsible for two properties. It was at this time that Lee approached the church about moving the community program to their facilities. He was offered the second property. Those who might oppose the church being used for more community projects would at least not have to see them held in the main sanctuary. Lee's services in the new property expanded to include offering seminars on community life, a community newspaper, education programs for the elderly, and a number of new classes for neighborhood children and youth.<sup>129</sup>

Lee claims that if he was able to declare that social service results in church growth all the churches would begin serving. However Lee maintains that involvement in the community should not be thought of as merely a means to church growth. Churches that do community service for this reason will meet resistance. Neighbors will sense their purpose is evangelistic rather than legitimate concern for community problems and the relationships will be strained. Lee makes the rather startling observation that Christians need to be trained in how to converse about non-religious, commonplace, subjects. This

is not to say that he is not interested in evangelism. Like Professor Chow he speaks of “holistic evangelism.” Sincere loving concern by Christians who know how to share the gospel in a sensitive manner, and realize that evangelism is a long process, can result in achieving the desired church growth.<sup>130</sup>

It is too early to evaluate the community movement from the perspective of church growth. Swanson’s data showed that in Taiwan the average Christian takes 8.2 years to reach the point of conversion.<sup>131</sup> Lee’s efforts were the first of their kind in Taiwan. They only began in 1994 and were interrupted in 1999. Though many churches have since followed the lead and become involved in their communities, few became as involved as those with whom Lee has ministered. Most only offer one or two limited services. Lee, nevertheless, believes the churches must persist. He does not argue, however, like Shia that this is because service is integral to Christianity. He simply argues the bridge paradigm, that service is effective pre-evangelism. As John the Baptist prepared the way for Jesus, or as building a good road makes for easy travel, so community service smoothes the progress of the gospel. Though it is not at present possible to quantify Lee’s method his experiences in the impersonal environment of urban Taipei find him recommending community service as the way forward for the churches in Taiwan.<sup>132</sup>

### *The Cell Group Movement*

Social service is but one of the schemes for growth vying for the attention of the churches in Taiwan. The charismatic movement, for example, has attracted members through offering an impassioned spirituality.<sup>133</sup> Another enormously popular effort for church growth has come from the cell group movement.<sup>134</sup> The cell group movement is important to this study because ministry of a social nature is integral to its theory, as well as to the way it is practiced in Taiwan.

The concept of growing the church by cells was promoted from 1980 when Paul Yung-Chi Cho of Korea presented the first of a series of lectures on the subject. However the movement only became influential in Taiwan after church leaders began studying a model developed in Singapore’s Faith Community Baptist Church.<sup>135</sup> In 1990 Ralph W. Neighbor, Jr., an Associate Senior Pastor at the Faith Community Baptist Church in

Singapore, published a methodology for church growth. Neighbor's book, described as the "first comprehensive and practical guide to cell group churches,"<sup>136</sup> finds him asserting that if the churches would follow his method they would quickly grow. The church with which he was affiliated in Singapore, for example, grew to 4,500 members in its first four years. In Neighbor's model a local church should consist of numerous small cells of seven to fifteen lay members that divide into two groups when additional members join.<sup>137</sup> In 1994 roughly 300 pastors, missionaries and church leaders traveled from Taiwan to Singapore to study under Neighbor and his colleagues.<sup>138</sup>

The leadership of an independent Chinese denomination called The Bread of Life Church (靈糧堂) were so impressed by the Faith Community Baptist Church that in 1996 they completely restructured their ministry according to a cell group structure. The experience of the denomination is particularly important to this study because the church, which boasts an average attendance of 8,000 in their downtown Taipei congregation alone, exercises considerable influence among mainland-originating churches.<sup>139</sup> The Bread of Life has a tradition of assimilating and promoting methods that have proved effective in the growth of the world's largest congregations. Indeed Leo Ip (葉嶺楠), the director of social services at this mainland-originating church, explains that the practices of churches in Korea, Singapore, the United States, Canada, Colombia, and Thailand have, after being evaluated and modified so as to fit the Taiwan context, offered much to the ministry of his church.<sup>140</sup> Tom Liao, a pastor in the Bread of Life, describes the appropriation of the cell model in similar terms. The denomination studied cell groups in both Korea and Singapore before deciding the Singapore method could be adapted so as to benefit ministry in Taiwan.<sup>141</sup>

Leo Ip explains ministry by means of cell groups has proven an effective means for reaching into the community. While pastors are primarily active in enriching the faith of church members the cell groups are instructed to look beyond the internal functions of the group and minister to community needs; not only to the spiritual and emotional needs of neighbors but physical and social needs as well. Most cells are community based and members are therefore aware of the needs within their community. Leo Ip lists taking local elderly on picnics and shopping trips, telling stories to the disabled, organizing Mothers' Day programs, and making displays for Taipei's yearly lantern festival as examples of the kinds of services offered by Bread of Life cell groups.<sup>142</sup>

It is notable that each of Leo Ip's examples conclude with an explanation of their spiritual consequence. The efforts of the cell that ministered to the elderly resulted in over 30 conversions and the creation of a new cell group made up of senior citizens. The services provided to the disabled led to the creation of a cell group for family members and a Sunday morning fellowship for over 30 disabled and their families. Community programs enabled a good witness. The most recent contribution to the lantern festival was a manger scene that communicated the essential meaning of Christmas.<sup>143</sup>

These explanations demonstrate the theology of the Bread of Life Church. Ministries of word and deed are integrally bound up in one cause, converting people to the Christian faith. To be sure Leo Ip insists people must be served without condition, advocates respecting the views of others, and teaches that church members should not explain their faith until an individual expresses an interest. Yet he also explains that in a culture where Christians are a minority it is important others learn, "Christianity is not that horrible. ... We are not a tiger hiding to grab you, or a shark to bite you." In this Liu Ip reveals that unconditional service that respects an individual's integrity is itself a strategy to more effectively propagate the faith. In fact Liu Ip describes social ministry as effective "pre-evangelism." Social ministry in the Bread of Life Church is understood in terms of the bridge paradigm.<sup>144</sup>

### *Social Ministry in the Aftermath of the 1999 Earthquake*

It is helpful to explain developments in theologies of social ministry at the very end of the Nationalist period by examining changes that occurred in the Bread of Life Church after a devastating earthquake in 1999. When asked what brought the need to offer ministry of a social nature to the attention of his church Leo Ip follows an explanation of international developments in cell group methodology with the story of a late night earthquake, explaining the event shook his church awake not only to the needs of the earthquake victims but also to others who suffer in society at large.<sup>145</sup> In a separate interview the President of World Vision Taiwan, Tim Shao, concurs, mentioning the Bread of Life by name when he explains that it was only in the aftermath of the

earthquake that many mainland-originating churches began to show an interest in ministry of a social nature.<sup>146</sup>

This earthquake, known in Taiwan as “9-2-1” because it occurred on September 21, had the same effect on churches throughout the island.<sup>147</sup> As the news spread that in the remote Nantou County more than 2,000 had lost their lives, some 8,500 were injured, and 100,000 were left homeless churches from around the island spontaneously responded by sending volunteers and supplies to offer whatever help might be needed.<sup>148</sup> The Year 2000 Gospel Movement’s recently founded emergency response team was on hand to offer specialized assistance as well as to coordinate Christian efforts.<sup>149</sup> For most of the churches there was no time to think through why they should respond. There was simply a massive need that demanded immediate attention and the churches went.<sup>150</sup>

At first most volunteers were unable to offer any skilled assistance. They merely contributed needed supplies. Though Lin Li-chin, the head chaplain of the area’s only medical center, complains that many of these efforts were poorly organized and did not offer what the residents most needed, she also observed that many mainland-originating churches were for the first time becoming involved in ministry of a social nature.<sup>151</sup> Lee Chi-hung, Academic Dean of the Methodist Graduate School of Theology, explains the 1999 earthquake had the effect on his denomination. Lee further notes that Methodists applied for government funding for some of the welfare projects they initiated in the aftermath of the earthquake.<sup>152</sup> Indeed at this time it was becoming common for churches to finance social projects with funds available through the government’s community movement.<sup>153</sup>

In the aftermath of the earthquake the Bread of Life Church also started social ministries that drew on government support. One of these was I-link (台灣愛鄰社區服務協會), an organization founded in the year 2000 to address problems in the family. The ministry was modeled after TOUCH Community Services, a foundation created by the Faith Community Baptist Church of Singapore in 1992 to provide for the disadvantaged with a network of services designed to strengthen the family.<sup>154</sup> An important difference between I-link and TOUCH was that the Bread of Life’s foundation not only applied for funds to support its services but lobbied the government with the intent of influencing a

Family Education Act. Leo Ip explains that church leaders felt traditional morals were being eroded by little understood global trends. The church desired to introduce Christian family values into laws that were being formulated. When queried about the close relations with political authorities Leo Ip simply stated that something needed to be done before society falls apart.<sup>155</sup>

This sentiment, expressed as it was in a mainland-originating church, seems a dramatic departure from Wang and Nee who focused on the transformation of individuals rather than the world.<sup>156</sup> It has been noted that mainland-originating churches traditionally regarded their political responsibility as to support the authorities rather than to themselves address the structural causes of a problem. Indeed James Shia, who once served as a pastor in the Bread of Life Church, believes that though churches can encourage their members to be politically active they should be very cautious about doing the same as a church.<sup>157</sup>

The Bread of Life's political activity means a different direction in ministry. This does not, however, indicate the emergence of a new theology. In Taiwan premillennialist pessimism had long been moderated by a hope that a better society would emerge in relation to the Nationalist government. Before the lifting of martial law it would not have been acceptable to seek to influence the government. However in the late 1990s the Bread of Life began to offer what the Nationalist community movement was encouraging, that entities would see social needs and seek to affect a better living environment. The lobbying efforts of the Bread of Life were not in opposition to government principles. Indeed they can be seen as belonging to the long tradition of cooperation with the authorities. There is therefore no indication that the church's political activities involve a change from the traditional mainland-originating theology of obedience.

Nor is there any indication that the Bread of Life Church believes the acceptance of Christian morals will cure social ills. Leo Ip describes his church's lobbying efforts as an attempt to influence "core values." He uses the same term when describing a retreat the church offers for the newly baptized. There new members are encouraged to "clean out" the "very strong hope in our traditional religions."<sup>158</sup> Though Leo Ip states his church's lobbying efforts involve advancing Christian morals and not explaining the

Christian faith the Bread of life clearly believes wellness will come only when there is a turning from other values.<sup>159</sup>

The reason the church is offering services that are seemingly unrelated to evangelism can be explained in terms of an observation made by Huang Po-Ho (黃伯和), President of the Tainan Theological Seminary. Huang notes that after the earthquake churches began to learn that aid offered with conditions attached causes resistance among those being served.<sup>160</sup> Thus when Leo Ip states that the services his church offers involves promoting values without pressing the gospel he is not indicating the goal of his church has changed. He is simply explaining that the church has learned the presentation must be more sensitive. Indeed Leo Ip is forthright in explaining that the church would like to change the attitude about Christianity in society.<sup>161</sup> Here again Chris Su's explanation of the community movement as being about winning approval is applicable. The efforts of the Bread of Life Church to influence society are a means to give the gospel a fair hearing. Again, social service is a bridge to evangelism.

Though churches are offering new ministries that focus on social needs it does not appear that the Bread of Life or any mainland-originating churches are operating with a sincere desire to transform the social structure. Peter K. Chow provides an excellent summation of social ministry in mainland-originating churches at the end of the Nationalist period when he writes,

Most Mandarin churches (not that many) that are engaged in social service do it for pragmatic reasons. "Pragmatic" means "whatever works" to bring people into the church. It is a bridge to the community. It is a way of getting to know people and being accepted. It is also being referred to as pre-evangelism. Of course, everyone is aware of the Good Samaritan parable and the commandment to love one's neighbor. There is also Galatians 6:10. I doubt that, beyond these passages, Mandarin churches have formulated any theology for social service. There is also an evangelical missions tradition of caring for the sick and poor, of relief and development, and of helping drug addicts. This tradition comes into play, at least serving as example. Finally, there is the Sept 21, 1999 earthquake. The churches responded dramatically and quickly with no time to do any theological reflection. There was no questioning at that time with regard to whether we should do social service. Social service was done concurrently with evangelism.<sup>162</sup>

Social service in the immediate aftermath of the earthquake can be described as operating according to the partnership paradigm. Services were offered on the basis of Christian compassion alone without regard to spiritual consequence. However the question arose whether help given without the gospel can truly save and ministries began to be organized according to the bridge paradigm. Though their experiences would teach them that the witness must be measured and the service sincere, for most mainland-originating churches social service remained focused on providing an opportunity to offer the gospel.<sup>163</sup>

### Nascent Theology

Lin Chung-hsiung (林忠雄), the pastor of a church that sponsors a variety of programs for the homeless and elderly in the city of Hsinchu (新竹) is concerned that though community work is beginning to be emphasized in Taiwan, “Nothing makes the Christians feel doing social concern is something we really should do; something every believer should do, that every believer should care for others.”<sup>164</sup> Lin has attempted to address the problem by creating a brief list of ten reasons Christians should do good: good deeds are in accord with the great commandment,<sup>165</sup> are one of the reasons Christians are saved,<sup>166</sup> are an expression of religiosity,<sup>167</sup> conform to the model of Jesus,<sup>168</sup> are a form of worship that pleases God,<sup>169</sup> are a condition of prayer being heard,<sup>170</sup> are a program of spiritual fitness,<sup>171</sup> are the means to a happy life,<sup>172</sup> are a way to be blessed by God,<sup>173</sup> and result in an eternal reward.<sup>174</sup> Though Lin’s thinking is as of yet little more than an outline it demonstrates an innovative response to a deficiency among mainland originating churches.

In a similar manner Paul Chen (陳仰恩), who has established a foundation that arranges seminars for churches interested in social ministry, is struggling to find a Biblical basis for Christian social service. Chen teaches that the four gospels demonstrate God’s love in four different ways. Matthew, which teaches that God sends the rain on both the good and the bad, emphasizes God’s unconditional love toward all creation. Mark, a book that emphasizes healing and spiritual encounter, stresses love toward those with special needs. Luke emphasizes mercy and service over against traditional divisions of race. John emphasizes the intimate love Jesus shows to his own disciples. Chen teaches that the Matthew and Luke kinds of love are missing in the churches of Taiwan.<sup>175</sup>

There may be much to question in the thinking of Lin and Chen. To be sure neither seems positioned to offer a far-reaching or systematic theology of social ministry. Yet at the very end of the Nationalist era a very few ministers have begun to feel the need for a theology to support social ministry. Indeed Tsai Kuo-shan complains ministries are often planned in the manner of businesses employing a marketing strategy but incorporate little substantive theological thought.<sup>176</sup> Samuel Chiow, (周學信), who teaches Systematic Theology at China Evangelical Seminary, explains that in Taiwan Church leaders have been so involved in evangelistic efforts that they have not had time to think. In Chiow's estimation, "We just don't have anything that comes from deep within us, from our own reading of Scripture."<sup>177</sup>

The shift from viewing social ministry as a consequence of evangelism to accepting that social ministry might be an effective bridge to evangelism has not involved reflection of a theological nature. Peter K. Chow noted the thinking went no deeper than to find ways to bring people into the church. To be sure this is in line with Wang and Nee's stress on spiritual redemption. So long as saving individual souls remained the goal both were open to efforts wherein social care was employed to facilitate reaching the human spirit. Furthermore when carrying out such ministry both recommended building honest relationships that did not treat people as objects. In this way they allowed for the tempering of evangelistic passion that became common among those who employ service as a means to evangelism.<sup>178</sup>

The change in ministry paradigms is not due to theology, but to changes in the context. Though James Shia was aware of the Lausanne definitions regarding the valid relationships between evangelism and social responsibility he reports his motivation for asking the churches to become involved in community service as arising from frustration with extant methods of evangelism, political developments, and the example of Buddhists. Daniel Lee admits to being influenced by James Shia and by Professor Chow of China Evangelical Seminary. However he attributes his pioneering efforts as being sparked by the simple desire to meet his neighbors and reports that the Nan King East Road Christian Church became active for financial reasons. Though churches in Taiwan were influenced by theologies underlying Fuller's church growth program and theories

of cell groups that were developed in Singapore, extensive involvement with social needs only began with the trauma of the 9-2-1 Earthquake.

It has been noted that the churches exist in a state of tension between their theology and their political context, with the first offering a negative assessment of society and the other insisting on a more positive view of its endeavors. The chapter explained some conservative missionaries have coped by internalizing the meaning of separation from the world. Such missionaries were able to employ modern business methods in running their agencies, promote western middle class values, and support the Nationalist vision of recovering the mainland from communist rule. That churches are willing to adopt the principles of the community movement to the extent of holding social activities in the churches (which is a step away from Watchman Nee, in particular, who saw the local church as a sanctuary from the world)<sup>179</sup> and apply for funding from their government suggests mainland-originating churches have also internalized the meaning of separation.

To be sure the theology of Nee allows for internalizing the meaning of separation from the world.<sup>180</sup> Yet Jonathan Chao argues no such efforts have been made. Instead he describes the separation in terms of Watchman Nee's anti-intellectualism. Chao illustrates his point by means of an example. Chao explains that in Taiwan an important educator who was a member of a mainland-originating church once stated Christian teachers should not bring theology into their education work. Chao argues the teacher was able to make such a statement because his anti-intellectual theology did not require an effort to relate his faith and career. Chao suggests this kind of thinking is common among mainland-originating churches where spirituality is emphasized over intellect.<sup>181</sup> Indeed for mainland-originating churches spirituality and intellect seem to belong to two different worlds. It was only at the very end of the Nationalist period that individuals involved in ministries of a social nature began to realize the need for a theology to support their social services.

## CONCLUSION

Before the lifting of martial law it was believed that personal morality and the occasional Christian ministries that would focus on meeting social needs arose as a consequence of conversion. In reality, however, little attention was given to the subject of social ministry. In keeping with the teaching of Watchman Nee, Wang Ming-tao, and most western missionaries, the first-generation of mainland-originating churches in Taiwan focused almost exclusively on spiritual matters. However a second-generation of church leaders became aware that traditional evangelistic methods were no longer working. Inspired by Nationalist policies, and challenged by the success of Buddhist ministries, they began to experiment with the theory that social ministry might serve as an effective bridge to achieve their evangelistic goals.

Though there were notable voices urging the churches to think beyond the bridge paradigm, the new social ministries initiated by mainland-originating churches continued to be subordinated to quantitative objectives of church growth and to culture, particularly that as imposed by the Nationalist government. It was only at the very end of the Nationalist era that a third-generation of socially active ministers began to suggest there was a need for a reasoned theological foundation to support Christian social ministry.

## CHAPTER THREE

### THE PRESBYTERIAN CHURCH IN TAIWAN

#### INTRODUCTION

This chapter will introduce the theologies of social ministry that informed the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan during the Nationalist era. Like the previous chapter it will be divided into two sections, with Presbyterian social ministry being examined both before and after the lifting of martial law in 1987. By correlating theology and political developments the study is, again, drawing attention to the importance of context.

It will be argued that constructing a reasoned theological foundation to support social ministry was important to the denomination, and that Presbyterian theologians considered Taiwan's political context fundamental to these efforts. It will be demonstrated that the contextual theologies that emerged within the denomination argued for a different approach to social ministry from mainland-originating churches. Presbyterians were encouraged to act in critical engagement with the culture imposed by the central government. Moreover they refused to subordinate social ministry to quantitative objectives of church growth. Rather the relationship between evangelism and social ministry came to be understood according to the partnership paradigm.

#### Social Ministry Under Martial Law: 1945-1987

##### Presbyterian Traditions

At the time of the Nationalist influx the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan was a self-supporting, self-governing, and self-propagating entity. However in matters of theology the denomination was dependent on missionary traditions.<sup>1</sup> Those Presbyterian missionaries who had served in Taiwan before the Nationalists arrived had shared little of the theology that was circulating in ecumenical circles. Moreover the denomination's Taiwanese leaders had not participated in the theological debates raging across the straits.<sup>2</sup> When that controversy occurred the island had been a colony of Japan and the

churches were operating in a significantly different context from those in China.<sup>3</sup> Presbyterian missionaries familiar with the China debates would have been reticent to explain the merits of any theology associated with the social gospel. Confessional doctrines had made Presbyterian churches less open to the social gospel than, for example, Baptists and Congregationalists.<sup>4</sup> These Presbyterian missionaries were conservatives whose primary concern was conversion.<sup>5</sup>

What set their methods of mission apart from mainland-originating ministries was a more pronounced emphasis on charitable service. In order to facilitate their evangelistic efforts early missionaries in Taiwan established hospitals and schools. Medicine provided a means by which to approach the populace. Education was designed with the primary intention of developing church leadership. Though the missionaries offered these services, they did not set a precedent for contending with the structural causes of social needs. Their primary interest was to establish a stable church.<sup>6</sup> Hsu Ming-hsiung, in a thesis on the social ministry of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, notes the services that were offered were successful inasmuch as they effectively communicated Christian ethics, particularly that Christianity involves loving others as oneself.<sup>7</sup>

Huang Po-Ho (黃伯和), the president of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan's Tainan Theological Seminary, describes the understanding of mission of his church as developing in three distinct phases that correspond to Calvin's Christology regarding Christ's offices of priest, prophet, and king.<sup>8</sup> Huang explains the model of mission that predominated until approximately 1970 was one of priesthood. He explains that during these years the church was focused on meeting religious needs. This meant serving as an intermediary between God and the people of God with the primary goal of preparing individuals for the next world.<sup>9</sup> Thus from the time the Presbyterian Church was established in Taiwan through to the first 25 years of the Nationalist era Presbyterians thought of charitable service in terms of the bridge paradigm.

Though charitable services were part of Presbyterian ministry, individual Presbyterian congregations did not generally attend to the social needs of the communities to which they belonged. Social service was the realm of foreign missionaries and extant institutions.<sup>10</sup> C. S. Yang, a former General Secretary and current Ecumenical

Ambassador of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, explains why local church leaders were not as enthusiastic for social service as missionaries:

We didn't have any power to show concern about anything. We had to survive. The pressure from outside was too great. You become a Christian -- in the past it was not an easy thing. You are like an outcast in your family and society. ... society at large was originally biased against the Church. They used sunglasses, so to speak, to look at the church. The church has a different culture and a different faith. Like the church is the bad guy. Special. Different. It's not that you don't want the people to come into the church. It's that they will refuse you. It's that kind of history. This gives the church difficulties. To protect yourself requires quite enough energy.<sup>11</sup>

Though the churches were not fully integrated in their communities, members were Taiwanese. Like the other islanders they experienced the Nationalist government as an oppressive force.<sup>12</sup> The early missionaries had not equipped the denomination to address political problems. Nevertheless there were resources within Reformed tradition upon which the denomination could draw that spoke to their needs. Where the verse that guided mainland-originating churches in their political theology was Romans 13:1, "Everyone must submit himself to the governing authorities"<sup>13</sup> the Presbyterians came to be<sup>14</sup> inspired by Acts 4:19-20, a verse in which Peter and John told authorities who sought to prohibit their ministry, "Whether it is right in God's sight to listen to you rather than to God, you must judge; for we cannot keep from speaking about what we have seen and heard."<sup>15</sup> In this the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan was upholding Calvin's teaching that Christians should submit to civil authorities except when such obedience means disobedience to God.<sup>16</sup>

Paradoxically Presbyterians have a higher view of the authorities than mainland-originating churches. Where mainland-originating churches separate the sacred and secular traditional Presbyterian theology maintains a doctrine of providence that insists God directs all things toward their highest good. The wisdom of God is so great that even bad instruments are used to fulfill God's purposes. Thus Presbyterian theology holds civil authorities in high regard and is emphatic on obedience to the establishment.<sup>17</sup> Yet in an article on the Presbyterian understanding of government W. Fred Graham writes that there is also a strong doctrine of lay empowerment in Reformed tradition. The theology allowed the lay to critically evaluate whether governing

authorities were upholding the high standards of their office and assume strong opposition roles when hereditary rulers failed in their responsibilities.<sup>18</sup> Graham also notes the Church proper was to take part in affairs of state. In Calvin's model the Church was to work closely with civil leaders to facilitate the common goal of a peaceful and charitable society.<sup>19</sup>

It will be shown that these doctrines are foundational to the theologies of social ministry that would emerge in the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan during the Nationalist era.

## Reforming Presbyterian Mission

### *Shoki Coe (黃彰輝, 1914-1988)*

Soon after the Nationalists began to govern Taiwan the eminent Presbyterian theologian, Shoki Coe, would begin to introduce the Presbyterian Church to theologies regarding Christian social responsibility that differed from that which had been inherited from missionaries.<sup>20</sup> He also began to develop a formula, so to speak, that would enable the church to analyze its position and develop its own theology. These contributions would greatly impact the social ministries carried out by the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan during the Nationalist era.

Coe returned to his home in Tainan, Taiwan, in 1947 after completing theological studies at Overdale College in Selly Oak, Birmingham, and Westminster College, Cambridge.<sup>21</sup> The denomination, recognizing the contributions the informed young scholar could make, appointed him to direct the church's influential Tainan Theological Seminary.<sup>22</sup> Here Coe would argue a theology that saw the Church as having a responsibility to the world. Coe would maintain the seminary, for example, should not merely train clergy, but "provide for a more flexible ministry of a 'pilgrim people' in a largely non-Christian context."<sup>23</sup> The goal was ensuring "Christ is formed" (Gal. 4:19) in the Christian community. Theological education must attend to "Christian Formation," that is that Christians live like Christ who lived for others, "Theological Formation," that the Christians think like Christ who humbled himself and served others, and "Ministerial Formation," that the ministry of Christ in and for the world is accomplished through the many gifts God has given to the Christian community.<sup>24</sup>

Coe's arguments in support of Christian social ministry draw on Christology and ecclesiology. To be sure, Coe utilizes a basic eschatological scheme when he affirms the kingdom of God has already come, but that it is also yet to come, to frame his arguments for Christian social service. Yet from the outset such arguments are rooted in Christ, who is the *kairos* or "fullness of time" who enables Christians to live in *kairoi*, or "times fulfilled" and thus "go forth to meet the promised time – the end-time, when He will come again to make all things new."<sup>25</sup> Thus because "Christ is the Reality and in Him there is a new world" Coe is optimistic that "a new world is emerging," that "a New Asia is coming," and that "in spite of the tragic event in our nation, we believe it will be renewed."<sup>26</sup>

The Church is to participate in this work of world renewal. Coe maintains Christ and Church share the same mission; that Christians are sent into the world as God "sent his Son to the world." He explains that Christians exist in a special relationship with Christ. They participate in the *koinonia* of Christ with the Father, and by the power of the Holy Spirit are united into one body. This relationship means that the churches can be described as the body of Christ in the world. As such they share the mission of Christ. Christ is the "New Creation and New Humanity," as well as having the mission of establishing a "new creation and new humanity."<sup>27</sup> The mission was directed at "the world" and the Church comprises the "first-fruits of this new creation." But the Church is just the beginning. The full harvest is nothing less than the salvation of the world.<sup>28</sup>

Coe thus understands Christ's mission as accomplished. Though there is evil in the world the final result is determined. The world belongs to God. Because Christians are of God, the world is therefore theirs. This does not mean it is theirs for the taking, but that it is theirs for the serving. Coe insists, "The Church exists to participate in the reconciling ministry of Christ *in* and *for* the world."<sup>29</sup> (Italics mine.) The Church is therefore to have a singular mission, though it is made up of a wide variety of individuals with many different abilities. Each Christian is to use these abilities within their particular sphere of influence in the mission of Christ. The Church proper is to encourage and coordinate these many ministries. Hence the Church does not exist for the Christians, but for the world. As Christ's ministry was missionary in nature so the

Church, so each Christian with his or her unique gifts and position in society, must be *for* not just in the world.<sup>30</sup>

Yet the Church is *in* the world. Coe also argues Christians should engage the world because Christians and non-Christians are fundamentally alike. All are under the blessing of Jesus. Coe argues, “Wherever He goes, He comes to His own, for in Him the blessing of Abraham promised to all nations ... has been fulfilled.”<sup>31</sup> The real difference is that non-Christians have not yet acknowledged that blessing.<sup>32</sup> For their part Christians share the same history, are struggling with the same problems, and have the same hope as those who have not yet heard the gospel. To be sure, Christians also enjoy fellowship both with God and with a worldwide community, and are able to actively participate in the mission of Christ. Thus they are distinct from the world. Yet they also belong to the particular society in which they live. The Church is thus in a state of tension. It identifies with the world, and yet finds its identity in Christ. It is of a particular *oikos*, or locale. Yet it is *par-oikos*, a parish within the community. A healthy church is thus to be a “missionary community existing in this creative tension.” Coe laments, however, that many churches have emphasized only the Christian fellowship and are therefore no longer a missionary community<sup>33</sup>.

Coe’s theology of ministry is summed up in his sentence, “He calls us out of the world, so that He may send us to the world, as He sent his Son to the world.”<sup>34</sup> The Church, to begin with, is a people called “out of the world.” Thus evangelism and participation in church life were essential components of his theology. In 1954 Coe described a vision for an evangelistic thrust whereby the Presbyterian Church might double in size.<sup>35</sup> Numbers were important to Coe, who maintained, “Population statistics are not just ciphers; they stand for persons for whom Christ died. And the Church exists to tell them what God in Christ has done and is doing for them. Our concern for church growth in the midst of population growth is motivated by this mission of the church.”<sup>36</sup> The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan adopted Coe’s plan and in 1954 launched a “Double the Church” movement. The movement concluded with Centenary celebrations in 1965. Between these years the Presbyterian membership grew from 86,064 to 176,255 while the number of churches increased from 410 to 839.<sup>37</sup>

A New Century Mission Movement quickly followed the Double the Church Movement. Though Coe was compelled to leave Taiwan when the program was beginning his theology of being sent into the world lay behind New Century Mission Movement initiatives.<sup>38</sup> Moreover the seminary in which Coe had just completed his tenure orchestrated many of the movement's activities.<sup>39</sup> Allan Swanson introduced the project with, "The Presbyterians, having faithfully responded to Christ's call to 'come,' are now struggling with the equally imperative mandate to 'go.'"<sup>40</sup> The New Century Mission Movement was a five-year program wherein the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan would begin its new Century with concerted efforts to study and address many of the needs found in aboriginal, agricultural, and industrial communities. They would, for example, familiarize aboriginal communities with the newest agricultural technology, offer rural communities seminars on credit unions, and counsel industrial workers on urban life.<sup>41</sup> Swanson reports the movement was not successful.<sup>42</sup>

The success of the Double the Church Movement and the subsequent failure of the New Century Mission Movement indicates that while the Presbyterian churches understood the mandate to call people out of the world they did not understand Coe's thinking about being sent into the world as Christ was sent into the world. To be sure the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan had a long history of orchestrating charitable services. However Coe suggested the churches had "inherited them without grasping the spirit behind them."<sup>43</sup> He stated,

Christian service will never grow into a deeply-rooted element in the life of the Church in Taiwan until it becomes an immediate part of the experience of all Christians in their day to day living. Too often Christian service is thought of only in terms of institutional and organizational work, operating through the upper echelons of church bureaucracy. We must help each local congregation to catch the vision of service as related to its own particular community and carried out within the limitations of its own resources. ... although service must be rendered for its own sake, when offered in full integrity it becomes a powerful witness; and no witness through service is more powerful than that which comes from a group of Christians doing all they can do to meet the needs of neighbours in their immediate community, as an offering of thanksgiving in service to their Servant Lord.<sup>44</sup>

Coe offers a theology of service that incorporates all three of the Lausanne definitions of the relationship between evangelism and social service. Service is a consequence of

evangelism in that it is integral to Christian life and worship, is a bridge to evangelism in that it generates a powerful witness, and is a partner with evangelism in that it must be offered for its own sake.

Coe was not reticent about sharing his theological convictions. Nor was he restrained in regards to expressing his political belief that Taiwan should be an independent country. Because of Coe's political activities, which included his seminary sponsoring discussions on Taiwan's political condition, in 1965 Coe was forced to leave Taiwan.<sup>45</sup> However his concern was not primarily with advancing either his theological or political beliefs, but to free his Church to think for itself, that the denomination would no longer be tied to staid traditions but be able to respond to the Gospel and formulate dynamic theologies and ministries appropriate to the ever-changing culture of Taiwan.<sup>46</sup> Coe described the task at hand in terms of "double wrestle." By this he meant, "wrestling with the Text from which all texts are derived and to which they point in order to be faithful to it in the context; and wrestling with the context in which the reality of the Text is at work, in order to be relevant to it."<sup>47</sup> The task is daunting. It involves a profound understanding of both the text and the context. Yet the task would also be liberating. Taiwanese Christians should no longer blindly adhere to outdated traditions, but themselves ascertain the meaning of the text and correctly apply it to their context.

Coe settled in England where from 1965 to 1978 he would serve as the Associate and later as the overall Director of the World Council of Churches' Theological Education Fund. In this position he would flesh out his thinking on "contextualization," the term he there coined for the theology he had begun to develop in Taiwan. Hitherto the watchword for missions had been "indigenization," referring to the effort to translate the gospel into a traditional culture.<sup>48</sup> Huang Po-Ho reports that in Asia indigenization would later be referred to as "Banana theology" because as it was often practiced it meant simply cloaking inherently western ideas with Asian forms. The outside may appear Chinese, for example a church building, however the gospel preached remained essentially western.<sup>49</sup> Coe critiqued indigenization for having a static concept of culture. His experiences in Taiwan taught him that culture changes, and can change very rapidly. What is needed is a continual reinterpretation and reapplication of text in the changing context. Thus by means of "contextualization" or, better, "contextualizing," Christians

within a particular context are able to discern both the message that should be shared and the form that message would best take.<sup>50</sup>

Contextualization was not designed to support any particular theology, but was a means for formulating theologies to meet the needs of a particular environment.<sup>51</sup> William Russell, in a dissertation that explores Coe's understanding of contextualization, writes, "Programmes of contextualization are determined, not by ideologies, but by the Gospel itself and by the reality of each situation. Only when the local church attends to both of these does she gain a true insight into what the Lord is calling her to do at that specific moment of history."<sup>52</sup> Thus Coe taught that theological education must not be about teaching any particular theology. Instead theological education must be about training Christians to evaluate the text and their context and form a theology appropriate to the historical moment.<sup>53</sup>

Shoki Coe's ability to encourage the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan to develop theology appropriate to the moment and ministries that are responsive to the changing context is grounded in the Presbyterian doctrine of providence.<sup>54</sup> Coe's belief that God is involved in world affairs, continually directing all things toward their highest good, enabled him to argue, " ... we serve the Lord, not only of the Church, but of the whole world and of all times, and we know that in all change He is working out His purposes."<sup>55</sup> The extent to which this thinking would become engrained in the denomination's ethos is evidenced in a General Assembly publication at the end of the Nationalist period that is required reading for all Assembly employees. The document states, "We ... emphasize the encounter between the Christian gospel and Taiwan culture. Only through the knowing of our local culture, the understanding and recognition of our land and people, can we construct a local theology which can deeply plant the gospel in our place ...."<sup>56</sup>

### *C. S. Song (宋泉盛, 1929 - )*

Shoki Coe's successor as principal of Tainan Theological Seminary was the prolific writer, C. S. Song.<sup>57</sup> Song held Coe in high esteem for formulating a method that allowed for dynamic, forward-looking, theology.<sup>58</sup> Song, like Coe, wanted to free the text to speak to the context; to liberate the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan from extraneous traditions so as to discover for itself God's will in particular circumstances.<sup>59</sup>

Like Coe he also wanted theology to lead to concrete action.<sup>60</sup> Yet Song did not merely re-express Coe's positions. Huang Po-Ho, who did his Ph.D. under Song,<sup>61</sup> explains that Song had two problems with Coe's model of contextualization. First, Song argued the Biblical record itself is a text in a context. The very vehicles, literature and languages, used to convey the text, are context.<sup>62</sup> In Christian Scriptures it is therefore impossible to separate text from context. Second, Song believed that in Asian contexts there is already a text. These two points caused Song to conclude churches should not try to do contextualization. It is impossible to import pure text into context and efforts to do so only succeed in bringing a foreign context into a context that already has a text. Instead Christians should do *contextual theology*, by which Song meant doing theology with one's own resources; theology built on the text within, rather than merely outside of, the context.<sup>63</sup>

While serving in Tainan Song, like Coe, argued that theological education should not be about equipping the clergy to minister to a congregation so much as about enabling the church to become relevant to the world.<sup>64</sup> Song, however, explained that the mission of the church should not be understood as standing between God and the world, mediating God's word. Song argued that God relates directly to the world and that the church is part of the world.<sup>65</sup> The mission of the church is to associate with others and witness to God's activity. Song saw the witness as necessarily involving ministries of word and deed. The church is to identify God's work and will. It is also to model the new humanity generated by God in Christ.<sup>66</sup> Christian mission is thus to be "word in action."<sup>67</sup> Vocal proselytism by itself was poor evangelism.<sup>68</sup>

Regarding evangelism, Song advocated ministry directed to different ends than were prevalent in Taiwan churches. Song argued that the churches often called people out of their context, that their message was one of escapism.<sup>69</sup> He explained that the churches had become a culture unto themselves, isolated entities that did not share the needs or desires of the communities in which they lived.<sup>70</sup> Christianity, he believed, had come to mean breaking with one's past and submission to an alien culture.<sup>71</sup> Song was opposed to ministry that entailed calling people out of their culture. Therefore he was also critical of endeavors to Christianize, by which he meant imposing Church culture on a particular society.<sup>72</sup> In Song's view the mission of the Church was not about extending Christendom but identifying and demonstrating how the many truths within a culture are

God's Truth. The goal is not so much to call people into Christian fellowship, but to enable people to encounter the God whose reconciling love is at work in their world.<sup>73</sup>

Where Coe drew on Christology for his ecclesiology, that the Church minister by participating in the mission of Christ, Song based his theology of Church mission on a creation/redemption motif. Song saw the Biblical creation narrative as a Babylonian story appropriated by Jews in exile to enable their people to overcome provincialism and yet protect their own identity, that is to appreciate others and regain a perspective of their own mission in the world. Song argued the story of creation presents the world as fundamentally good. Although corruption is rife this is, nevertheless, God's creation. It can never totally come under the dominion of evil. It cannot be so corrupted as to necessitate destruction. Indeed the Creator is working to redeem the world which, when accomplished, will end in humanity having right relations with each other, with the natural world, and with God.<sup>74</sup>

By orienting his theology around creation Song was able to consider God's work apart from Judeo/Christian history, to expand his resources and consider how other stories might bring God's redemptive work among differing cultures to light.<sup>75</sup> Song nevertheless uses the Biblical narrative as a paradigm wherein what God had done in one context can be analyzed and compared with what God is doing in another. Song explains, "The people of Israel were singled out, under a divine providence ... to be a symbol of how God would also deal redemptively with other nations."<sup>76</sup> God's nature and will had been revealed to Israel, for example, in the Exodus experience. As the people of any nation go through a similar experience, such as suffering oppression at the hand of a foreign power, they can learn from the experience of Israel how to interpret their situation in light of God's redemptive activity.<sup>77</sup>

Jesus is Song's pre-eminent paradigm for Christian mission.<sup>78</sup> Though his theology pivots around creation rather than Christology his writings are nevertheless "Jesus oriented."<sup>79</sup> Song maintains that God's efforts find their zenith in Jesus Christ, where "the divine-human drama is intensified almost to a breaking point" and where "the whole wealth and richness of God's love is disclosed fully."<sup>80</sup> Where Song could be critical of leaders in the Judeo/Christian tradition, like Moses, whom Song accuses of having a callous attitude toward the hungry in the desert, Jesus is portrayed as one who

understood human needs. Jesus would have, Song conjectures, supported grievances against Moses.<sup>81</sup> Jesus was for the common people.<sup>82</sup> Song taught that religion can, and indeed the Judaism of Jesus' day had, become a force that divides society into the spiritual have and have-nots. Jesus' ministry was an attempt to reform such religion.<sup>83</sup> Jesus taught the reign of God was about love and demonstrated the teaching by providing for and associating with the needy and outcast.<sup>84</sup>

Song argued that the incarnation itself makes plain God's refusal to stand aloof from sinful people.<sup>85</sup> Incarnation for Song, however, does not involve equating God and Jesus. Incarnation is God, by means of the Spirit, permeating creation. Jesus is incarnate insofar as he has the Spirit of God, which Song relates to ethical awareness.<sup>86</sup> Jesus is thus God incarnate in that he was particularly attuned to God's will; so close, in fact, that Song is able to write, "In the person of Jesus Christ we have the demonstration of God's denial of his own self to the point of death on the cross."<sup>87</sup> Song explains,

He (Jesus) loved them (his followers) so much that he was not afraid to offend the political and religious authorities. He loved to the extent that he was willing to defend their rights and dignity as human beings. He loved them in such a way that he was for them the presence of God who so loved the world.<sup>88</sup> (Parenthesis mine.)

In Jesus the disciples, indeed all Christians, know God.<sup>89</sup> The cross, though not a vicarious suffering for humanity,<sup>90</sup> is a suffering with humanity. It is a lesson in love. The corresponding resurrection is primarily about love.<sup>91</sup> Jesus' ministry resurrects love. It restores right relations between humans, creation, and God. Because of Jesus Christians can begin to see God not only in Jesus, but also in each other and in creation.<sup>92</sup>

Song contended mission informed by Christ must be incarnational in nature. Like Christ it recognizes the present closeness of God with all people.<sup>93</sup> In Song's understanding such mission means more than inviting others to attend church programs. It involves going into the community and participating in cultural activities and even religious services. In this way Christians become "... the symbol of the incarnation, saying that God accepts them just as they are in the same way God accepts Christians."<sup>94</sup>

Song insisted the salvation of individual souls is not the key to Christian mission. He believed such theology, based on the Great Commission, was rooted in the militant faith of the early Church but not Jesus.<sup>95</sup> Song thus critiqued Paul's identification of the kingdom of God with eternal life as a doctrine that muted Jesus' meaning and would lead to salvation as a Christian privilege.<sup>96</sup> Again, Song believed the reign of God, for Jesus, was primarily about love for outcasts.<sup>97</sup> Song wanted a "secularization of the Christian mission," a mission in which distinctions between Christian and non-Christian, between the sacred and profane are meaningless, a mission in which the goal is simply love, a society marked by right relations.<sup>98</sup> He argues, "What is of supreme importance is that the Christian community becomes the source of the healing of the world."<sup>99</sup>

Ministry that accepts others does not preclude judgment.<sup>100</sup> That the incarnation was necessary speaks in judgment of human efforts at righteousness. Song indicates it is necessary for Christians to speak against even those elements of Asian religions that aim only to secure the self-contentment and security of their followers.<sup>101</sup> The churches are to make critical judgments that commend that which is in accord with God's desire and condemn actions that are opposed to God's will.<sup>102</sup> They are to be "prophetic."<sup>103</sup>

This means the church must address politics. The creation story reveals that God gave humanity authority to manage the world. The means by which this authority is organized and brought to bear on the world is via politics. In Song's words, "Christians, who are citizens of this world and partners in God's politics of making all things new, have no reason to give up their political rights or to avoid their political duties. For our God is a political God."<sup>104</sup> Song insisted the Church, which is part of a political world, cannot avoid political responsibility.<sup>105</sup> In keeping with his view that the mission of the churches is to identify and demonstrate God's will Song argues the churches should critically examine the activities of any regime in light of the dynamics of God. However to have an authentic witness the Church must avoid partisan politics. Though Song argued Christians promote self-determination he believed churches should neither endorse nor condemn any particular form of government. Song insisted that those who have preached an anti-communist message have in fact failed in their duty.<sup>106</sup>

Song's political critique led to a condemnation of Nationalist politics.<sup>107</sup> Nevertheless his writings generally present an optimistic view of society that stresses the Presbyterian

doctrine of providence; that God directs all things toward their highest good. Song complains social problems lead many evangelists to pronounce an imminent end of the world. However Song argues because “God so loved the world that he gave his only son”<sup>108</sup> Christians cannot but be optimistic about the future. He asserts that in the midst of trouble, despite appearances, God reigns. Christians who hope in this God recognize that “misfortune and poverty have causes deeply rooted in society, politics, and religion, and have nothing to do with ... God.”<sup>109</sup> Their goal is that God’s will, which will surely be done, is done.<sup>110</sup>

### *Conclusion*

In 1970 C. S. Song, like Shoki Coe, was constrained to leave Taiwan.<sup>111</sup> The two theologians continued their political activities in exile through a society Coe established to promote the Taiwanese right of self-determination. Church historian Jonathan Chao believes the political interests of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan originated with Coe and Song, and that this eventually moved out of the church to secular circles. Indeed Chao credits the two as being the father’s of Taiwan’s independence movement.<sup>112</sup>

Both Shoki Coe and C. S. Song served at Tainan Theological Seminary at a time the Presbyterian Church thought of mission in terms of priestly service. There they advanced theologies that laid the foundations for a new model of mission, a model that Huang Po-Ho identifies as “prophetic.”<sup>113</sup> Huang explains that the new theology did not depose the priestly, but supplemented the former model with a theology that empowered the church to contend with the structural causes that lay behind social problems.<sup>114</sup> The following sections will demonstrate that though neither Coe nor Song themselves produced a theology that directly addressed Taiwan’s political dilemmas their contributions helped their denomination assess and develop responses to Taiwan’s political culture.

### **Public Statements**

When a series of crises arose in the international arena regarding the future of Taiwan the denomination, under the leadership of Coe’s student C. M. Kao (高俊明), was able to promptly produce relevant and authoritative public statements.<sup>115</sup> According to Kao

the denomination had never before been involved in affairs of state. General Secretary William Lo adds that before 1971 the denomination had neither the awareness nor the courage needed to address Nationalist policy. The public statements marked a new, prophetic, direction in Presbyterian mission.<sup>116</sup> Four of the most important of these will here be discussed in turn.

### *Statement on our National Fate*

The first public statement of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan was released on the 29<sup>th</sup> of December 1971. The United Nations had just recognized the Communist Party as the rightful government in China and U.S. president Nixon was in the process of normalizing relations with that government.<sup>117</sup> According to Presbyterian historian John Jyigiokk Tin (鄭兒玉), “there was near-panic in Taiwan that the President might sell out the Island to Peking as the price for diplomatic relations.”<sup>118</sup> Representatives of several denominations that had formed an Ecumenical Cooperative Committee had been working on a manuscript that would offer a unified Christian position regarding the state of political affairs in Taiwan. Though individual members of the Council supported the draft of this “mild statement ... about political reform not political revolution,”<sup>119</sup> none of their churches were yet in a position to ratify the document.<sup>120</sup> C. M. Kao, however, recognized the urgency of issuing the statement. Quietly, so as not to arouse the antagonism of the Nationalist government, Kao together with twenty some Presbyterian leaders<sup>121</sup> redrafted and released the document as the “Statement on our National Fate by the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan.”<sup>122</sup>

The Statement begins with a prologue that details the authority of the document. It is said to accurately represent the views of the 200,000 members of the denomination and to be based on the Presbyterian theology of providence, that “Jesus Christ is Lord of all men, the righteous Judge and Savior of the world.” The prologue further states that these Christians are “convinced” they are, in fact, speaking for all the Taiwanese (defined broadly as those who “love this island”). Thus the document begins in the boldest of manners, laying claim to nothing less than the authority of heaven and earth for the declaration it is about to make.<sup>123</sup>

The Statement then divides into two sections, addressing two distinct audiences. To “All Nations Concerned,” it asserts, “... we do not wish to be governed by Peiping.” The church then preaches powerful nations should not disregard the wishes of the island’s fifteen million people, “because God has ordained, and the United Nations Charter has affirmed, that every people has the right to determine its own destiny.”<sup>124</sup> The denomination is arguing the island’s 15 million residents, not the citizens of greater China, should decide the future of Taiwan. The phrase seems to challenge the Nationalist claim that Taiwan is part of China proper. Shoki Coe explained that the document indeed calls for the Taiwanese to determine their own future, but that it is not a declaration of independence from China. He argued the government should face the fact that the United Nations and the United States were formally recognizing and establishing relations with the People’s Republic of China. Taiwan’s government could thus no longer claim to be the rightful government of China. Because Nationalists were unwilling to submit to the recognized government of China they were, de-facto, a new and independent entity with a responsibility of determining a future, which may or may not involve reunification with China.<sup>125</sup>

The second half of the document, written to the Nationalist government, is more of an appeal than declaration. It suggests the best way to protect government interests is by securing a good reputation in the international community. This can be done by means of upholding justice and freedom and by pursuing internal renewal. The document then makes a specific recommendation, that democratic elections should be held.<sup>126</sup> The Nationalist government did not, in fact, represent the island’s populace. The majority of legislators had last been elected in China in 1947.<sup>127</sup> Again, the denomination was not here opposing the party’s goal of reunification. The example of East and West Germany was suggested. The two sides could form separate governments yet have reunification as their ultimate goal.<sup>128</sup>

Coe argued the Nationalists should have been grateful for this and ensuing Presbyterian statements. They are not anti-government but, to the contrary, offered the best proposals available if the Party wishes to resolve its problems.<sup>129</sup> However Kao reports that calling for an election, a new item added by the Presbyterians to the ECC draft, was seen by the Chiang regime as a serious threat.<sup>130</sup> Given that “torture, jailings, censorship ... were the reality of the martial law police state that the U.S. called ‘Free China’ in the

1950s and 1960s” and that demonstrations and the formation of new political parties were capital offenses, the Presbyterian Statement was indeed brave.<sup>131</sup> From 1971 relations between Presbyterians and Nationalists became “very tense.”<sup>132</sup> One response was that the government began to enforce language laws and confiscated non-Mandarin language Bibles.<sup>133</sup>

The year before the release of the Statement discord between the church and its government had already begun to escalate in regards to the denomination’s relationship with the World Council of Churches, an organization wherein Shoki Coe held an influential position and that C. S. Yang credits with raising awareness of the need for the Statement on our National Fate.<sup>134</sup> Carl McIntyre, an acerbic leader of fundamentalists in America who aggressively censured ecumenical bodies, had met with President Chiang and raised questions regarding the conciliatory attitude in the World Council of Churches regarding China’s Communist Party.<sup>135</sup> The International Affairs Committee of the World Council of Churches had followed the example of the National Council of Churches of Christ in the U.S.A. and sent a recommendation to the United Nations supporting China’s entry into that body.<sup>136</sup> In 1970 the Nationalist government was successful in pressuring the Presbyterian Church to withdraw<sup>137</sup> its membership from the World Council of Churches.<sup>138</sup>

Though Presbyterians were troubled by Nationalist politics C. M. Kao asserts that the Statement “is essentially a confession of faith rather than a political action.”<sup>139</sup> In interviews Kao, a surprisingly unassuming individual who has been described as embodying the “calm faith and resolute prophetic witness of Taiwanese Christians,”<sup>140</sup> explained that when composing the Statement the denomination did not draw on any well thought out political theory or theology so much as on the simple conviction that humans, created in God’s image, had inalienable rights that were being contravened.<sup>141</sup> Publications from the period, however, also found Kao arguing the statement was warranted because of longstanding Presbyterian theology, namely that Presbyterians believe the Church should obey political authorities except when obedience means disobedience to God. Kao insisted that to obey a government that hindered the Church’s mission of affirming the “dignity of human existence” and violated God-given human rights would indeed mean disobeying God.<sup>142</sup> The Statement, then, was based on Christian doctrine and a longstanding Presbyterian policy regarding Church/state

relations. To be sure the Statement has political overtones, such as Kao's assertion that only when the people have the right to vote will the government be reformed, the respect of the nations be won, and God's intended blessings be obtained.<sup>143</sup> However the Statement is fundamentally an action based on Presbyterian faith.

### *Our Appeal*

In 1975 the Executive Committee of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan unanimously approved a second statement entitled, "Our Appeal by the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan: Concerning the Bible, the Church and the Nation."<sup>144</sup> The Appeal differs from the earlier Statement in that it is a more carefully constructed and more conciliatory piece of literature. It is, however, also a forceful document in that the positions it takes are not open to debate. The Appeal begins by affirming the 1971 Statement and makes clear that its position regarding self-determination remains firm. It further explains the new release is necessary because the church believes that at this juncture in history the survival of the nation is in jeopardy. The church therefore feels constrained to continue taking the "role of a prophet."<sup>145</sup>

Like the 1971 Statement the Appeal addresses two distinct audiences, first the government and then its own membership. The Appeal raised two specific grievances with the government, the confiscation of Bibles and the pressure to remain isolated from the World Council of Churches. Both matters had caused considerable consternation within the church.<sup>146</sup> Yet the Presbyterians make a temperate and concise case that provides few details regarding the disputes. The church simply argues that by restricting church activities the Nationalists are contradicting their own policy and harming their own interests. Nevertheless as the church describes the two issues the reader becomes aware that the Presbyterian Church is finding the Nationalists to be a reactionary and oppressive regime. The first sentence of the section begins, "The people in the free world enjoy full religious liberty."<sup>147</sup> The Appeal makes it clear that by contrast the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan does not have the freedom to use its own language nor does it enjoy freedom of association.<sup>148</sup>

After raising the two personal matters the church becomes rather more forceful. Presbyterians had long understood one of the ministries of the church was to counsel

political authorities.<sup>149</sup> The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan now requests just this. It suggests the government open formal lines of communication with the denomination so that the two sides can share their vision and develop a relationship of “mutual trust and confidence.”<sup>150</sup> In so doing the church reminds its government that the denomination is a “powerful force” interested in the well-being of the nation.<sup>151</sup>

Such a request, and indeed assertion, must have been rather shocking for the Nationalists, who promoted Confucian ideals; a system under which religious organizations were traditionally subordinate to the state.<sup>152</sup> Most religious organizations in Taiwan shared the philosophy and did not address political problems.<sup>153</sup> The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan rejected this culture and advanced Calvinism over Confucianism. General Secretary William Lo explains that abstract ideas about a will of heaven that became concrete only in the person of the emperor’s rule over commoners were less helpful than what the Presbyterians offered; a theology of a sovereign yet personal God, a view of the humanity that dignifies each individual with equal rights, and a church that is empowered to participate in social development.<sup>154</sup> C. S. Song argues the Presbyterian message was sorely needed. Society was in transition and there was a conflict between the “triumphant and self-asserting power of modernization, and the apologetic, defensive, and yet militant, guardians of traditional religious, cultural, and ethical values.”<sup>155</sup> Song believed that in such a state the church should offer a contextual theology that seeks not to supplement Confucianism but to interpret contemporary cultural phenomenon in terms of Jesus Christ.<sup>156</sup> In calling for dialogue the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan was negotiating a new contract between a political and a religious organization.

The timing for the proposal could not have been better. The regime was in transition. Chiang Kai-shek had passed away seven months earlier and his son, Chiang Ching-kuo, was made head of the Nationalist party.<sup>157</sup> Chiang Kai-shek’s funeral had been unmistakably Christian and very public. Just a month before the Appeal was released a Billy Graham crusade was held that had been approved and even financially supported by the government. Madame Chiang served as the crusade’s chairperson and Chiang Ching-kuo had taken a seat on the preaching platform.<sup>158</sup> Nationalist respect for and even allegiance with the Christian faith was exceedingly clear. This was a good time for the church to assert itself and forge a new relationship with the authorities.

Taking the first step in the relationship, the Appeal counseled the party regarding matters of import to society at large that required immediate attention. Authorities should develop a more democratic system where everyone would enjoy equal opportunities and responsibilities. Differences in origins and politics should not be allowed to divide society.<sup>159</sup> The Appeal also noted that though rapid economic development had produced affluence it had also resulted in numerous social problems.<sup>160</sup> It concluded its message to the government with,

The church, on the basis of its mission to protect human rights and preserve human dignity, appeals to the government to strengthen the development of society, to focus its attention on the problems of the atmosphere of corruption in society, of unequal distribution of wealth, of avarice, public peace and order and pollution, and to adopt effective measures to safeguard human rights and the welfare of the people.”<sup>161</sup>

The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan here states that its mission includes the protection of human rights and the preservation of human dignity. There were those within the denomination, however, who, like mainland-originating churches, desired the denomination to be concerned with spiritual over social needs.<sup>162</sup> Indeed the funeral of the president, the Graham crusades, and the church growth movement that was then at its height, aroused considerable enthusiasm for evangelism among Presbyterians. In 1975 the denomination was in the fourth year of a five year “Faithful Servant Movement,” a program focused on cultivating Christian character.<sup>163</sup> This would soon give way to a “Ten Plus One Movement.” Leaders within the denomination who were inspired by crusades style ministry and theologically indebted to the church growth movement organized the Ten Plus One Movement in order to affect a 10 percent yearly growth in Presbyterian membership.<sup>164</sup>

The Appeal makes it clear that the question of appropriate Presbyterian mission had become a divisive issue within the denomination. Such is to be expected in a denomination as large and diverse as the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan. Indeed some congregations have elders and deacons who belong to the Nationalist party.<sup>165</sup> Therefore in the second section of the Appeal the Presbyterians explained their political initiatives to their own membership. The church asserted that it must not be concerned only with its own interests, but also with social justice. It held that such ministry must sometimes

mean giving offense. The church, it reasoned, must submit itself to the standard of Christ, a ministry that was selfless and created considerable controversy. The denomination also defended its Reformed heritage, suggesting that while mutuality has benefits Presbyterians should not simply follow other churches but draw on their own theological sources. The Appeal maintained the ultimate aim of the church is to communicate the message of God's love. Therefore the church must stand together and demonstrate love in a world where sin is quite real. The argument concluded with a statement that took aim at the theology prevalent in mainland-originating churches, a theology that in Moody's lifeboat analogy was expressed as saving people out of a shipwrecked world.<sup>166</sup> The church argued,

The church cannot, here and now, keep silence, sitting by and watching the world sink into ruin; besides participating in spreading the gospel and leading men to repent and believe in the Lord, it must express concern for the whole nation, for society, and for the whole of mankind. Only in this way will it not fail to live up to the mission entrusted to it by God.<sup>167</sup>

In this conclusion the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan declares the importance of both evangelistic and social ministry. It is clear that the church sees the relationship in terms of partnership. The Appeal does not argue for improving social conditions by means of evangelism, or using service to facilitate evangelism. It simply says both are necessary components of the mission that God has given the church. To be sure maintaining a proper balance would prove difficult. C. S. Yang admits that it is rare to have strong evangelistic and social ministries operating in the same congregation. Most choose one over the other and emphasize that ministry.<sup>168</sup> However the official position of the Presbyterian Church, reflected in the Appeal, is that its ministry is concerned with both the spiritual and social needs of the community. In regards to ministering to the social, the Appeal itself was an eloquent and potent social ministry. It presented both the government and its own members with a direction it argued was in accord with the will of God.

### *A Declaration on Human Rights*

Two years later, as President Carter of the United States was shifting diplomatic recognition from Taipei to Beijing, the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan issued a third

statement concentrating on affairs of state. The document was entitled, “A Declaration on Human Rights by the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan.” The Declaration was a short open letter to President Carter, and secondarily to the international community and world churches.<sup>169</sup> The Declaration begins, much like the earlier Statement and Appeal, by insisting that Jesus is Lord of humanity and by expressing its belief that human rights are divinely ordained.<sup>170</sup> It extends beyond both, however, in maintaining that “a land in which each one of us has a stake” is also a gift from God.<sup>171</sup> Thus the church binds the declaration with three strands: providence, God-given human rights, and the conviction that the island itself is a divinely allocated haven. Providence and human rights have been important in the earlier political statements. Land, however, was at this time a new concept in the denomination.<sup>172</sup> It will be discussed in turn. Of the three strands the Declaration develops only the idea of human rights, a cornerstone in Carter’s foreign policy.<sup>173</sup> The document requests Carter to uphold the rights of the island people as he normalizes relationships with China, thereby guaranteeing the “security, independence, and freedom of the people of Taiwan.”<sup>174</sup>

The Declaration is written with a sense of urgency in the face of imminent danger when the church feels there is a real possibility of an invasion from China.<sup>175</sup> Thus after addressing a personal appeal to Carter the Declaration asks concerned countries, the people and government of the United States, and world churches to support its cause.<sup>176</sup> A subtle change occurs in this paragraph when the subject of self-determination is raised. The placid terms “request” and “appeal” are intensified to “insist.”<sup>177</sup> With language that parallels the 1971 Statement, and is defended in the 1975 Appeal, the Presbyterian Church cites both its faith and United Nations policy to “insist” the future of Taiwan be determined by island residents.<sup>178</sup> The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan had thoroughly thought through its position and was taking a decided stand for self-determination.

Before concluding with a prayer for the island’s future well-being the Declaration inserts a one-sentence plea to its own government, that it “face reality and ... take effective measures whereby Taiwan may become a new and independent country.”<sup>179</sup> C. M. Kao, the General Secretary who signed both this and the 1971 Statement, reports that the terms “new and independent country” ignited a firestorm. The government wanted the denomination to reject the phrase. Intense coercion in the form of both threatened

persecution and promised reward was brought to bear on the participants of the following General Assembly. So as to help the leaders understand the thinking behind the Declaration a theologian from Tainan Theological Seminary, Wang Hsien-chih (王憲治), was invited to attend the meeting and introduce a contextual theology he would later call "Homeland Theology."<sup>180</sup> The General Assembly voted 235 to 49 in support of the Declaration. As a result, according to Kao, the government began to look for a pretext to arrest him.<sup>181</sup>

Coe argues that the term "independent" can mean many things and that the government did not need to interpret the term as seditious.<sup>182</sup> Independence can, but does not necessarily, imply rejecting reunification. Indeed there were differences of opinion in the Presbyterian Church regarding its meaning. C. S. Yang argues that in the context of the 1977 Declaration independence meant urging the government to accept the political reality of being autonomous from China, and notes that the common theme running through all three statements is simply that the people of Taiwan have the right to decide their own future.<sup>183</sup> One researcher sees the question of unification, however, as peripheral to the Presbyterian argument:

... the problem of unification or independence, for which they are being accused of being separatist by both the government of Beijing and Taipei, is secondary; it is a question of political expediency. The primary question is the idea of a homeland, a place people can call their own and build their life in peace and freedom, and no other nation or power can exploit and manipulate without deference to their wishes.<sup>184</sup>

While this is undoubtedly true both the Communists in China and the Nationalists in Taiwan would have known that there was little desire among the populace for either party to govern the island.<sup>185</sup> To them "independence," be it a description of a political fact or a synonym for "self-determination," would have been taken as a Declaration of Independence from their rule. The fact that the term "independence" is located in a sentence that does not demand or declare but uses the term "urge," that it is a plea to the government, may soften the connotation.<sup>186</sup> Nevertheless the statement does "insist" on self-determination.<sup>187</sup>

In the late 1970s several nascent groups began to agitate for political change. In 1979 a demonstration held in the southern city of Kaohsiung turned violent. A fleeing leader sought refuge in the home of a Presbyterian pastor. Because the police were later able to prove that General Secretary Kao knew but failed to report the whereabouts of the dissident, he was sentenced under martial law by a military court to a lengthy prison term of which he served 4 years, 3 months, and 21 days. Other pastors, the dean of a women's Bible college, some of the denomination's lay members, and Kao's secretary were also indicted in the case and served prison sentences.<sup>188</sup> Presbyterian church growth specialist, Lin Jung-chi, reports, "overwhelming hostility due to misunderstanding ... brought about persecutions of many sorts."<sup>189</sup> Lin tells of being investigated by the secret police, his telephone being tapped, strangers in his church collecting printouts, and a sense of fear among the congregation that hindered church growth.<sup>190</sup> Indeed the police were on the case before the Declaration was mailed. None of the copies sent to the denomination's pastors arrived. Many pastors only learned of the document when the police arrived to question them.<sup>191</sup> Presbyterian leaders experienced censure, exile, and imprisonment.<sup>192</sup> The church was paying a price for its public statements.

### *Confession of Faith*

The public statements of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan produced such a strong reaction that the denomination determined a carefully thought through Confession was needed to explain the faith and unite the church. Thus in 1985, after five drafts and six formal debates at annual General Assembly meetings, the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan published a Confession of Faith.<sup>193</sup> C. S. Song notes that understanding the Confession requires "theological exegesis informed by recent historical realities in Taiwan."<sup>194</sup> He argues the weight of the document cannot be felt unless the political environment in which it was written is understood. It was drafted, Song reminds his readers, while the church's General Secretary languished in prison. Song asserts, "These were the years of darkness for the Church."<sup>195</sup>

The Confession begins,

We believe in God, the only true God, the Creator and Ruler of human beings and all things. He is the Lord of history and of the world. He judges and saves.<sup>196</sup>

Space will not allow a thorough examination of the Confession. However there are numerous themes in the document that are of importance for understanding Presbyterian social ministry. These opening lines, for example, demonstrate that despite severe trials the church continues to hold the orthodox Presbyterian doctrine of providence. Things are not as they seem. The God of the Presbyterians, the only God, the God who created the world, maintains authority. The Presbyterians are resolute in the face of a corrupt government. The party is not as strong as it may seem. It is God who “judges and saves.”

The Confession states the means by which God does this is Jesus Christ, the “Saviour of humankind,” who “was conceived by the Holy Spirit, born a man of the virgin Mary and became our brother.”<sup>197</sup> The sentence shows a progression from power to intimacy and equality. The one who can save all humanity, who is clearly divine, becomes a sibling. This is a stark contrast to the colonizers who marginalized the Taiwanese and denied them positions of influence in their political hierarchy. Where the Nationalists used their powers to dominate the Confession asserts Jesus serves, that God’s love is manifested in Jesus’ “suffering, crucifixion, death and resurrection.”<sup>198</sup> This method of reconciliation serves as a paradigm for Presbyterian service. The Confession affirms that the Holy Spirit empowers Christians to also bear witness.<sup>199</sup> The Presbyterians see their task as a divinely ordained and sustained mission that focuses not on their own needs but on others. It is important to note that here the Confession describes the mission to others not as priestly mediation, a witness over others, but as an incarnational witness “among all peoples.”<sup>200</sup>

When the Confession defines Church it begins, “We believe that the Church is the fellowship of God’s people...”<sup>201</sup> The terminology indicates that while the Presbyterians understand ministry in terms of incarnational witness “among all peoples,” the Church itself remains an exclusive entity in society. This is not, “a fellowship among God’s people” but, “the fellowship of God’s people.” The following sentence follows suit and states the Church is to be “the sign,” not “a sign” of hope on the island.<sup>202</sup> C. S. Song thinks this reading is “audacious” and translates the article as “a”

rather than “the.”<sup>203</sup> As the original Chinese does not define the article either translation is acceptable.<sup>204</sup> However the fact that the denomination’s official English translation chooses “the” may be a sign that Song’s views on the secularization of Christian mission were not widely accepted. Indeed this is evidenced by Song’s critique of the Confession in which he complained, “The Church’s social concern does not lead it to identify itself with the people religiously.”<sup>205</sup>

The Confession completes the sentence, “We believe that the Church is the fellowship of God’s people ...” with, “... called to proclaim the salvation of Jesus Christ and to be ambassador of reconciliation.”<sup>206</sup> The Church seems to be advancing Shoki Coe’s definition of the relationship between community of faith and society, namely that the church is a community called out of the world, yet also sent into the world. The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, it will be remembered, was at one time a fairly ingrown entity that “didn’t have any power to show concern about anything,”<sup>207</sup> By 1985 a significant change had occurred. Presbyterians were defining themselves in terms of powerful outreach to others. That mission of the church is lofty, to “proclaim salvation” and “be ambassador of reconciliation” demonstrates that the church understands itself as God’s representative to the people. The phraseology calls to mind the traditional Presbyterian model of Church/state relations wherein the church counsels the government. The terms also support the ministry of prophecy that the denomination has repeatedly explained is central to its political task.

The relationship between Church and society continues to be defined in the following sentence, which reads, “It is both universal and rooted in this land, identifying with all its inhabitants, and through love and suffering becoming the sign of hope.”<sup>208</sup> This, according to Song, is the climactic sentence of the Confession and the main reason it was written. The Church, he explains, is not historically rooted in the land. However the suffering and love the church has shown society validates their claim to belong. Their ministry overcomes their foreignness. Moreover the text again indicates they no longer define their ministry in terms of priestly mediation. Their mission is not to lord over and be the sign of hope, but to serve among “becoming” the sign of hope. Song describes the sentence as marking a new self-understanding of the church.<sup>209</sup> Theirs is an incarnational mission that involves intimacy and sacrifice within the community.

The Confession also asserts that God has endowed humans with “dignity, talents, and a homeland.”<sup>210</sup> The first point was in Kao’s mind when he composed the 1971 Statement. Kao maintained humans are made in the image of God and therefore have inalienable rights and, the church here expands, inherent creativity. It will be shown that the term “homeland,” belongs to a theology that teaches the land belongs to the people rather than vice versa. The Confession is arguing that humans share in God’s creation and in responsibility for taking care of what has been created. Among other things they are empowered to construct political systems. Yet the Confession explains that sin has resulted in misuse of the gifts and the destruction of good relationships.<sup>211</sup> Given the context in which the document was composed, that is the disdain with which the Presbyterians were treated, the limitations imposed on their creativity, and the lack of freedoms to influence their environment the sin must have seemed especially oppressive.

Yet there is hope. The Confession concludes by mentioning the saving grace of Christ who will “deliver humankind from sin, will set the oppressed free and make them equal, that all may become new creatures in Christ, and the world his kingdom, full of justice, peace, and joy.”<sup>212</sup> Here again the theology of providence comes to the fore. The world is being directed toward God’s desired end, a state marked by “justice, peace, and joy.” These terms also appear in the public statements. The 1971 Statement contains the tragic plea, “We long to live here in peace, freedom and justice. And we do not wish to be governed by Peiping.”<sup>213</sup> Later the same document takes another tone when it makes a demand “for justice and freedom, and for thorough internal renewal.”<sup>214</sup> The 1975 Appeal repeatedly defends its ministry as being in the interests of justice and peace.<sup>215</sup> The idea of joy also appears in the Appeal, both in a petition to return confiscated Bibles so that it can “enjoy the freedom to use his own language to worship God”<sup>216</sup> and in a request that the authorities allow a more representative government because, “everybody should enjoy the opportunities of equal privilege and responsibility.”<sup>217</sup> These quotes demonstrate that when the Confession was being drafted there was little social justice, peace, or joy. However Presbyterian faith empowered the church to endure, and indeed offer proactive ministry in an era they describe as “years of darkness.”

## People's Theologies

Chen Nan-jou (陳南州), a Presbyterian theologian whose initiatives will be discussed in turn, maintains his church's public statements were written in critical moments before well thought-out theologies were constructed to support their declarations.<sup>218</sup> Presbyterian leaders were aware of the need for a theology to support the public statements and theologians were anxious to develop these. Indeed Shoki Coe, through his ministry with the Theological Education Foundation, had instilled awareness among seminaries throughout Asia of the need to generate contextual theologies.<sup>219</sup> The three principal theologies that emerged in these circumstances will here be presented.

### *Homeland Theology*

The theology entitled Homeland is attributed to Wang Hsien-chih, an Episcopalian whose bishop had sent him to the Graduate School of the Association of Theological Schools in South East Asia in the hopes he would help contribute a Chinese theology, a theology that is in the bishop's words, "relevant in the context of our traditional religion and culture as well as our present social, economic and political realities."<sup>220</sup> After graduation Wang was seconded to Tainan Theological Seminary where he would orchestrate the development of the contextual theology called Homeland.<sup>221</sup> Wang, who also served as the chairperson of the Christian Conference of Asia's Commission on Theological Concerns, participated in consultations on contextual theology in a number of Asian countries, most notably the 1978 Commission meeting in Korea where theologians introduced Minjung Theology.<sup>222</sup> In 1979 the Commission on Theological Concerns met at the YMCA in Taipei, Taiwan. There international theologians became acquainted with Wang's Homeland Theology.<sup>223</sup>

If contextual theology must relate to contemporary culture it is appropriate that Wang Hsien-chih chose the name "Homeland" to represent his theological endeavors.<sup>224</sup> Chapter Five will explain that in Taiwan literature is a popular and even powerful medium that can effect social change. In the early 1970s a widely publicized debate arose over the nativist literature that was then beginning to appear. Local authors were writing not as Chinese but as Taiwanese, expressing feelings and experiences that were

unique to island residents. Those who preferred writing from the established Chinese perspective disparaged the genre, known as Homeland Literature. As a result the question of defining “homeland” became an issue for the general public.<sup>225</sup> Homeland Theology was a natural name for a theology written from the perspective of a church that chose to identify with the experiences of the Taiwanese over against the mainlanders, to identify with a people who, according to Huang Po-Ho, “are homeless people; though they live in their own land, they remain aliens.”<sup>226</sup>

Homeland Theology uses the biblical covenants as a means to reflect on four themes: people, land, power, and God.<sup>227</sup> This was no academic exercise, however. Wang described the theology as ‘theopraxis’ rather than ‘theologos.’<sup>228</sup> For Wang the covenants were paradigms that would help the church interpret God’s will in their own context.<sup>229</sup> Huang Po-Ho explains that Homeland Theology maintained “different kinds of covenant manifest the covenant of the Taiwanese people with God.”<sup>230</sup> Thus an article in which Wang introduces the essence of Homeland Theology finds him interlacing his interpretation of the covenants with an application of their meaning for Taiwan. Wang portrays the Abrahamic Covenant, for example, as a paradigm of an immigrant community who have fled a “demonic superpower,”<sup>231</sup> and been divinely blessed with land, nationhood, and the promise of blessing other peoples. One of the lessons from this covenant, like the Noachic Covenant before it, is that land belongs to the people and not people to the land. Wang argues this teaching “is crucially important for solving the political problem of national unification/separation.”<sup>232</sup> Though China can claim Taiwan was once its province, it has no claim over the people of the island. They are not objects on a piece of land. In the past the islanders had referred to themselves as “water buffaloes,” a derogatory name that refers to seeing themselves as cattle that work the land for colonial masters.<sup>233</sup> Wang’s theology would enable him to contradict this and argue the people of Taiwan, like the ancient Israelites, are entitled to manage their land. Abraham thus becomes an example to the people of Taiwan. Like him, the Taiwanese have every right to cut a relationship marked by “imperialism and chauvinism.”<sup>234</sup>

Wang, who saw the Exodus as a “liberation event par excellence,”<sup>235</sup> drew on the interpretations of Old Testament scholar Norman Gottwald for his analysis of the Israelite experience.<sup>236</sup> Wang contends that the Mosaic covenant is a theo-ideology,

“Yahwism,” that served to unite a loose configuration of peoples in an egalitarian society. The “essential meaning” of their exodus experience, as reflected in the Decalogue, was the prohibition of submission to theocratic rulers, such as the pharaonic theocracy from which they had been delivered.<sup>237</sup> Tragically, Wang argues, this and the other covenants were misunderstood. Their meaning was narrowed to justify nationalism. They developed into “a one-sided story based on Israel’s self-concern.” Thus for the original inhabitants of the land where they would settle the promised land of milk and honey became a “conquered land of blood and tears.” Wang saw the Taiwanese as having an experience similar to that of the Canaanites. Thus he writes, “From this contextual experience, I believe we have to ask Old Testament scholars to rewrite theology from the perspective of this truth, that is, the perspective of the powerless, the oppressed, and even the nonidentifiable peoples among nations.”<sup>238</sup>

Wang does just this when he interprets the Davidic Covenant. He considers the Davidic Covenant a controversial device used by southern tribes to justify a dynastic monarchy that claimed a divine mandate to rule the nation. This covenant reminded Wang of “the political mythology of the ‘Son of Heaven’ in Chinese history” which Wang maintains had resulted in five thousand years of bondage, “until now.”<sup>239</sup> Chiang, whose presidency was passed on to his son, could certainly be portrayed as such a dynastic ruler.<sup>240</sup> Wang saw the struggle of the Chiang’s Nationalist party for control of China as similar to the struggle between the northern and southern tribes in Israel. In Israel’s case both fell victim to international powers. Wang concludes, “Here we learn the historical lesson that without justice, freedom and equality, there is no consolidation of people or possibility of reunification.”<sup>241</sup> According to Wang it would take another exile experience for the people of Israel to begin to interpret the covenants in terms of service to rather than domineering patriotism.

Second Isaiah, written from exile, recognizes that the power politics of nations such as Assyria, Babylonia, and Persia come to nothing. Thus Isaiah redefines the earlier covenants, including the Davidic covenant’s interpretation of the monarchy, in terms of service.<sup>242</sup> However this interpretation was not widely accepted and a strong nationalism would remain predominant right through the time of the New Covenant. Wang compares the attitude of these nationalistic Israelites to that of the mainlanders in Taiwan who “uphold political messianism and dream of the recovery of Peking” while

failing to listen to the voice of God's prophets.<sup>243</sup> The prophetic voice in Taiwan was the Presbyterian Church, a voice that was able to explain the "new world order"<sup>244</sup> that had been revealed in the New Covenant.<sup>245</sup> Jesus confirmed the message of Second Isaiah and gave new insight into the meaning of the earlier covenants. The power to dominate became power to serve.<sup>246</sup> God was no longer seen as an avenging personality, but as a creator/redeemer who loves, suffers, serves, and recreates.<sup>247</sup>

Wong, Chong-gyiau's 1992 Boston University Th.D. dissertation on Presbyterian political theology convincingly demonstrates that Wang Hsien-chih's Homeland Theology was heavily indebted to C.S. Song, so much so that Wong Chong-gyiau suggests that Wang's writings were the contextual application of Song's ideas in Taiwan.<sup>248</sup> Wong notes that from 1973 Wang Hsien-chih set out to develop a "liberation theology for Taiwanese people."<sup>249</sup> Indeed Wang, like many theologians who stressed liberation, was particularly taken with the Exodus event where themes of liberation and land could be applied to the struggle between the dominant and marginalized.<sup>250</sup> Mark C. Thelin, a missionary who taught Sociology at Tainan Theological Seminary for fifteen years,<sup>251</sup> notes that Latin American Liberation Theology informed Homeland Theology.<sup>252</sup> However where Liberation Theology was concerned with class struggle and economics Homeland Theology took up questions of the identity of an oppressed nation. An unsigned article in *Pro Mundi Vita Studies* argues such theologies are more correctly entitled People's Theologies.<sup>253</sup> Chen Nan-jou maintains that though diverse theologies influenced Homeland Theology, Homeland is nevertheless an authentic contextual theology, as is evidenced by its ability to affirm the identity of the islanders as Taiwanese rather than Chinese.<sup>254</sup>

The influence of the theology was such that the 1977 Declaration asserted, "Our church confesses ... a land in which each one of us has a stake" is a gift from God.<sup>255</sup> The level of acceptance of the concept in the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan can also be seen in the denomination's Confession of Faith, a document that went through numerous revisions between its first draft in 1979 and its conclusion in 1985.<sup>256</sup> Again, the church confesses, "We believe that God has given human beings dignity, talents and a homeland, so that they may share in God's creation, and have responsibility with Him for taking care of the world."<sup>257</sup>

## Social Ministry after Martial Law: 1987-2000

Huang Po-Ho reports the relaxation of the harsh dominion that existed under martial law, which had caged people's minds toward "every dimension of their life," resulted in a feeling of release and the emergence of a pluralistic society. The change, he notes, created "a new and more complicated atmosphere for the Christian Church to do its mission."<sup>258</sup> He explains there was no longer so much need for the Church to take a stand on right versus wrong. The questions were now about how to actualize accepted policies and how to respond in a society where genuine political, ethnic, and religious differences exist. Huang was in agreement with Song on the matter. In Song's critique of the Confession, written in the year martial law was lifted, he argued the denomination should not focus only on political identification but also on cultural identification.<sup>259</sup> Moreover Song argued there is a need to begin to think in terms of the difficult and important task of reconciliation.<sup>260</sup> Huang concluded the priestly and prophetic ministries of the church are inadequate to the task. The church needed a new "role of mission," a kingly model.<sup>261</sup>

The term "king", Huang explains, was not to be understood as triumphal, but in terms of Christ's servanthood. The God of creation and incarnation communicates through self-giving. If the church will follow the example and communicate by means of a life style that is in harmony with the kingly model demonstrated by Christ, the church will be able to solidify relations rather than quarrel with people of differing convictions. As the church takes on the kingly mission, Huang argues, it will demonstrate the kingdom of God and lead to the creation of a compassionate community.<sup>262</sup> This is not to say the roles of priest and prophet became obsolete. Christ manifested all three offices and so, Huang argues, must the Church. However the church only slowly developed an awareness of the necessity of three tasks.<sup>263</sup> Indeed the people's theologies written after the lifting of martial law continue to encourage the prophetic mission of the church. This is because political constraints remained. Though martial law was lifted in 1987 direct elections of the President were not allowed until 1996,<sup>264</sup> the People's Republic of China still has designs on Taiwan, and international powers continue to deny the Taiwanese their rights. There are even now clear rights and wrongs for which the church feels the need to speak. Yet after martial law the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan began to think in terms of a new model, a mission that is kingly in nature.

## People's Theologies (CONTINUED)

### *Self-Determination*

The public statements of the Presbyterian Church argue that the Taiwanese be allowed to determine their own future.<sup>265</sup> Homeland Theology was the first among several people's theologies produced that defended the Presbyterian position. Others include *Chhut Thau Thi*, Self-Determination, and Identification.<sup>266</sup> Huang Po-Ho writes that policies that negate the will of island residents are "anti-gospel," and "anti-Christ."<sup>267</sup> He has supported his view by developing a rudimentary theology entitled *Chhut Thau Thi* into a more systematic theology he calls Self-Determination.

*Chhut Thau Thi*, a phrase that Huang interprets as meaning, "to raise one's head out of darkness to see the blue sky and breathe the spring air"<sup>268</sup> is a Taiwanese proverb that refers to a longing for deliverance from oppression.<sup>269</sup> On occasion Huang would more succinctly translate the term "liberation."<sup>270</sup> Tainan Theological Seminary's John Jyigiokk Tin, a professor of Church History and prolific hymn writer, included the aphorism in many of his compositions. Wang Hsien-chih was better able to pool the resources of the seminary, however, and Homeland Theology was developed into the earliest of Presbyterian people's theologies.<sup>271</sup> Nevertheless the phrase *Chhut Thau Thi* continued to influence the denomination. The term was introduced in the 1979 consultation of the Commission on Theological Concerns in Taipei and from 1979 to 1985 was included in all drafts of the Confession, which originally read, "God enables the oppressed to gain freedom and achieve chhut-thau-thi." Because, however, of concerns that the colloquial phrase was not sufficiently dignified to be included in a formal document, the final draft was changed to, "God will set the oppressed free and make them equal."<sup>272</sup>

Huang Po-Ho selected *Chhut Thau Thi* as the basis of his Ph.D. under C. S. Song, who had lamented the removal of the phrase from the Confession.<sup>273</sup> Huang recounts preferring *Chhut Thau Thi* to Homeland because Barth and Moltmann had led him to believe theology should be forward looking. God is a God of promise. Humanity should live in hope of future fulfillment. Huang felt Homeland seemed to be

approaching the theology the wrong way round, whereas *Chhut Thau Thi* offered that which the people truly needed, a promised land rather than a homeland. Huang, it must be noted, was not arguing against Homeland as it had developed in Taiwan. The theology of promise is important to Wang Hsien-chih's theology.<sup>274</sup> However Huang worried that the designation Homeland, itself, was not as satisfactory as *Chhut Thau Thi*. Moreover though Homeland was a contextual theology Huang felt it was rather static in nature; that is, it was not able to interact with the new as Shoki Coe had taught a contextual theology should. The land, Huang argued, does not belong to humanity. It belongs to God. People must be able to change, to make way, for example, for new immigrants. The future must be open to new developments. Mission must be open to change, to respond to changing needs. Where Homeland was a noun that suggested settlement, *Chhut Thau Thi*, Huang argued, was a verbal phrase about becoming. Huang therefore concluded the appellation *Chhut Thau Thi* would enable him to construct a more comprehensive theology than a theology that by its very name was backward looking and static. Furthermore Huang felt *Chhut Thau Thi*, a proverb that was deeply engrained in the Taiwan consciousness, was more appropriate for a contextual theology than a term that arose in regards to a literary debate in the 1970s.<sup>275</sup>

*Chhut Thau Thi* is about liberation, about salvation. Huang believed the main theme of the Bible and therefore the essential mission of the Church is salvation.<sup>276</sup> However he had a considerably different understanding of salvation both from the missionary traditions of his denomination and from that which was common in mainland-originating churches. Like Song, he argues that a narrow understanding of the mission of the Church as conversion has resulted in a theology of "cultural invasion and conquest" that destroys native religions and cultures.<sup>277</sup> Huang grated against western theological impositions that presumed to offer a pure gospel that should take a culture captive. He countered by arguing there is no gospel without culture. Indeed Huang goes further and states there is no culture without gospel.<sup>278</sup> He argues the point by referring to the incarnation and to the Presbyterian theology of providence. The creator God who became incarnate in Christ and is working to recreate should not be thought of as above or outside the world. Indeed God can rightly be considered as the creator of human culture, an intimate who is revealed in and understood through culture, and who is guiding culture according to his desire. This is not to say Huang identifies culture and gospel. There must be a critical evaluation regarding what is in accordance with God's

will in any given culture. Huang is arguing that culture has serious consequences for gospel and that it is necessary for the traditional message and methods to be assessed.<sup>279</sup>

Huang's theology, it has been stated, was forward looking, a theology of promise. Such theology, Huang argues, allows for change. It does not accept the imposition of a static system but is open to unexpected revelation. The mission is God's and the Church should be discovering and witnessing to what God is doing in a particular culture.<sup>280</sup> Huang goes so far as to say that Christians should not claim their truth is the only truth for the world.<sup>281</sup> Huang saw mission as about an incarnational encounter with others who are also created in the image of God; about finding an ethic that can help people to live together in harmony and find hope in suffering.<sup>282</sup> Huang asserts,

Salvation in the biblical sense has nothing to do with the desire for proselytes or their conversion. The concept of Christendom does not exist in the Bible. ... Mission from Jesus' perspective is much broader than conversion or evangelization. It is a mission for liberation and humanization.<sup>283</sup>

For Huang, salvation meant liberation from inhuman situations. Huang therefore believed human suffering should determine the mission of the Church. Huang saw *Chhut Thau Thi* as a proverb that reflected the common suffering and hope of the people of Taiwan. It can thus facilitate mission from within the culture, serving as a tool both for understanding needs and also for awakening the hope of salvation that the people already possess. Huang's analysis of *Chhut Thau Thi* led him to conclude that in Taiwan mission should be specifically concerned with liberation in a historical, cultural, and religious sense.<sup>284</sup>

When Huang examined the way the *Chhut Thau Thi* had been used in the historical sense he found it involved an aspiration for liberation from the colonial powers. As suffering related to political abuses was acute, the church must struggle against political oppression.<sup>285</sup> Yet the church's social task could not be complete with political reformation. There must be a liberation that affects culture. *Chhut Thau Thi*, Huang concluded, requires self-awareness and responsible action. A colonized people can be passive regarding their culture. A liberated people, by contrast, must be aware of their potential and take responsible action to construct a worthy society. Huang therefore

argued the mission of the Church entails facilitating liberation by making people aware of who they are and their responsibility toward others.<sup>286</sup>

Huang also reflected on *Chhut Thau Thi* in a religious sense. He credits the hymns of John Jyigiokk Tin, which consistently employed phrases such as, “Your kingdom come so that we will enjoy *Chhut Thau Thi*.”<sup>287</sup> as awakening him to the close relationship between *Chhut Thau Thi* and the Kingdom of God. Huang argued, “If we are not looking for the Kingdom of God somewhere outside of our world, then that means we are responsible to realize this world becomes the Kingdom of God.”<sup>288</sup> Huang saw the Kingdom of God as a state, or a stream, that must be accepted and entered. For Christians this means repentance, obedience, and submission to the will of God. For others, who Huang notes live in a materialistic, utilitarian, selfish, and individualistic society, this means attempting to influence their values, to focus awareness beyond the material to the spiritual dimensions of life.<sup>289</sup> The key, Huang argued, is that people accept the reign of God. “If they accept the reign of God then that is their personal repentance, personal change, personal conversion. Conversion happens when that happens.”<sup>290</sup>

This chapter has shown that Huang found a correlation between a mission that brought political, cultural, and religious liberation with the mission of Christ in the world, a mission that entailed serving as prophet, king, and priest. His denomination’s political ministry, a ministry designed to strike at the root of social problems, can be classified as prophetic. The kingly ministry, a ministry that Christ demonstrated in terms of service, relates to the humble example of Christian life that ends in a compassionate culture. The priestly office referred to the religious and spiritual mission with which the church had long been concerned. Huang therefore argues *Chhut Thau Thi* is a helpful model for mission. It is both derived from Christ and relevant to the culture.<sup>291</sup>

Huang, it has been explained, believes people must be liberated *from* suffering. When he describes what people need to be liberated *to* he uses the term “self-determination.” Huang defines “self” as referring to the need for the people to know who they are, to be rooted in the history and culture that has nourished and shaped them. However merely understanding one’s past does not liberate. People must be made free to determine their own course. There must be a freedom to change. There is, Huang notes, a contradiction

inherent in “self-determination.” Terms that suggest a static-state and movement are bound together. Yet both are needed if a person is to be fully human, to be liberated from forces that enslave. Huang explains that self-determination both preserves a people’s identity and promotes freedom. Self-determination is analogous to the problem of culture and gospel. Culture roots and gospel frees. A healthy society needs both. Huang believes self-determination is the key to help Taiwan, a society whose identity and freedom have been denied, to a better future.<sup>292</sup> Huang explains,

The assertion of self-determination, taken as the essential political and theological element in the effort to solve the crisis that the people in Taiwan face and related to all spiritual, cultural, and socio-political aspects, is an assertion that can fulfill the need to achieve freedom and, at the same time, preserve identity in the context of Taiwan. Self-determination is a way to reach liberation for all Taiwanese people through a reconstruction of their Taiwanese identity. Therefore, self-determination is also a way for Christian churches in Taiwan to perceive the real meaning of the interaction between gospel and culture.<sup>293</sup>

The term self-determination had been central to the mission of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan ever since the releasing of the first public statement in 1971.<sup>294</sup> Huang looked at the objective carefully and developed a theology to facilitate the effort, a theology he found fitting to describe as, “A Theology of Self-Determination.”<sup>295</sup>

## Identification

Another people’s theology in Taiwan that is worth noting is Chen Nan-jou’s Theology of Identification. Huang Po-Ho explains that, like Homeland and *Chhut Thau Thi*/Self-Determination, it emerged in response to the public declarations of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan. He points out that the three contextual theologies do not differ so much in terms of content as in terms of emphasis.<sup>296</sup> To be sure Chen, a contemporary of Huang’s, drew on the same sources and developed many of the same points as both Wang and Huang, but to a slightly different end. Chen believed that the most fundamental conviction expressed in the denomination’s public statements is that God identifies with those who suffer. Chen worked to develop a theology to support the concept.<sup>297</sup>

Chen's Theology of Identification begins with the same description of society as Wang and Huang. The Taiwanese have been oppressed and are alienated from their own culture. Those who do understand their identity find international bodies unwilling to recognize the same. There is a crisis of identity.<sup>298</sup> Like both Wang and Huang, Chen finds that given the context, the conventional understanding of Christian responsibility is incomplete. The interest in personal salvation, Chen argues, must be widened to include concern for the whole person, whole society, and whole creation.<sup>299</sup> Chen explains that there is a strong pietistic vein that runs through traditional Chinese religions and that churches have followed suit, so to speak, emphasizing a religion that is private and centered on the self. Chen asserts, "The Christian faith should be deprivatized."<sup>300</sup> The way forward, according to Chen, is a renewed study of the Bible, a study that takes the experiences of the readers seriously. Chen maintains, "As Christians we reflect and interpret our reality through the Bible, and the Christians in Taiwan are inevitably to study the Bible through our experience of the crisis of identity."<sup>301</sup>

Chen particularly emphasizes two Biblical motifs to support his theology, the liberation of the Israelites from Egypt and the incarnational ministry of Christ. Where Wang speaks of the Exodus as a unification of diverse tribes Chen emphasizes God's identifying with a marginalized people. God, who is a God of love and justice, knows their suffering and sends Moses, an individual who like God had identified with the oppressed over against their oppressors, to help the people. Chen's description of Moses parallels the ministry he envisions for churches in Taiwan. Moses, the servant of God, understands God's compassionate nature and is willing to identify with the tribes in order to facilitate God's desire to liberate these oppressed people. The goal is to help them forge a new identity, an identity that enables them to build a new nation and also to worship God. The story of the Exodus helps Chen conclude that God is particularly interested in the liberation of those who suffer, here demonstrated in terms of liberation from political and cultural and religious bondage.<sup>302</sup>

Chen also supported his Theology of Identification by referring to the ministry of Christ, with particular attention given to the fact of the incarnation itself and Jesus' willingness to endure crucifixion. Chen saw the two events as linked, writing, "Jesus' death on the Cross manifested his ultimate purpose of incarnation, namely identifying himself with all humanity by sacrificing himself."<sup>303</sup> Jesus' life, teaching, and death pointed to a

willingness to identify with those who suffer thus giving the marginalized a sense of dignity and challenging a hierarchical social system. Moreover it generated the hope of a coming Kingdom of God, a reign of justice, peace, dignity, freedom, and love.<sup>304</sup> The meaning for the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, Huang argued, was mission in God's way, sacrificial service that identifies with the marginalized and helps them find a new identity.<sup>305</sup>

Though Chen recognizes God "liberates from the slavery of personal sin"<sup>306</sup> his Theology of Identification focuses on salvation in terms of community. Chen is interested in the reign of God being actualized, that God "establish His/Her Lordship over the world and history."<sup>307</sup> Chen accepts the doctrine of providence, maintaining that God is working in and through each age, culture, and even government.<sup>308</sup> Chen's desire is that Christians identify with God's work, which means that like Moses and Jesus they identify with those who suffer. Chen states he believes that this will result in effective evangelism, that an intimacy between the Christian community and the people of Taiwan will be created that results in mutual respect and the possibility that the people "may in turn identify themselves with the God who reveals himself in the Christian's identification."<sup>309</sup>

Chen believes his Theology of Identification can help the churches overcome their foreign stigma and their social isolation.<sup>310</sup> Like both Wang and Huang, Chen accepts the theology of Coe and argues for "people centered" rather than Christian oriented ministry.<sup>311</sup> Theology, Chen explains, must be done in relation to people's actual needs. It is not a theoretical exercise but something that should emerge in relation to an existent struggle. Therefore different contexts cause theology and mission to take on a different emphasis.<sup>312</sup> In the context of Nationalist Taiwan Chen's Theology of Identification was able to conclude the church should join the struggle for autonomy and work for a society of justice and peace.<sup>313</sup> Though Chen did not use the same language as Huang his Theology of Identification supported a prophetic and kingly mission that would result in corresponding political, cultural, and even religious liberation.

Though Chen took many of the same positions as the earlier theologians who constructed people's theologies his was not a simple reworking of their ideas. Chen believes that identity is a crucial contextual issue that the churches in Taiwan need to

consider as they formulate their mission. Huang explains that though Chen's contribution to the debate is known as a Theology of Identification he was not attempting to write a comprehensive theology. Rather, like John Jyigiokk Tin in regards to *Chhut Thau Thi*, Chen proposed a concept rather than a theology with a great deal of content.<sup>314</sup> Huang found Chen's efforts a valuable contribution to the contextual theologies that emerged in response to the public statements.<sup>315</sup>

### A Paradigm of Partnership

The previous chapter explained that in the 1990s the mission efforts of the churches in Taiwan were consolidated in the Year 2000 Gospel Movement. The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan also participated in the movement.<sup>316</sup> Yet there was friction within the denomination regarding the theology of a ministry where success was measured in quantitative terms. In 1994 several hundreds of Presbyterians gathered in Tainan to discuss their frustration and to explore possible alternatives. Huang Po-Ho was among the theologians assigned to the consultation. There he began working out a theology based on the concept of the Kingdom of God, a theme wherein numerical goals could remain yet objectives would also include themes such as justice, ethnic harmony, and ecological protection. When the decade drew to a close the Presbyterians chose to discontinue their association with the ongoing activities of Year 2000 Gospel Movement and concentrate on an initiative that was more in line with their predilections.<sup>317</sup>

In 1998 Huang was offered the enviable opportunity to actualize his theology through a new department in the General Assembly, the Research and Development Center. There he would initiate a program for Presbyterian mission entitled the 21<sup>st</sup> Century New Taiwan Mission Movement. Though the 21<sup>st</sup> Century Movement was not launched until 2001 and is therefore beyond the scope of this study, by the year 2000 the planning was in place. A brief overview of its theology demonstrates that at the end of the century the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan was emphasizing the partner paradigm.<sup>318</sup>

The theme of the 21<sup>st</sup> Century New Taiwan Mission Movement is "To Actualize the Kingdom of God through Building Koinonia." The Movement targeted two communities, the community of faith and the community of life. Renewal in the faith community (Church) would be encouraged by emphasizing spiritual formation, the most

clearly defined aspect of which is a program for Bible reading that stresses the reader's context. The denomination's vision for the life community is to encourage the believers to serve in their local communities and thereby both transform the image of the Church in society and nurture the character of a people who have yet to find their self identity and who are motivated by "power and profit."<sup>319</sup>

A booklet published by the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan to introduce The 21<sup>st</sup> Century New Taiwan Mission Movement declares, "The ultimate goal is to be a witness to the gospel of God's Kingdom actualized in the midst of Taiwan's society."<sup>320</sup> The statement is later explained in terms of Reformed theology:

The bywords of reformed tradition find expression in the Lordship of God, which is the lordship of the resurrected Christ, which reaches all aspects of human reality. Therefore, its ultimate concern is beyond individuals and their salvation and also beyond the church itself. Its concern is God's will fulfilled in the nation, the culture, nature and the cosmos; reformed theology truly is the theology of the 'Kingdom of God.'<sup>321</sup>

When the paragraph cited above states the "ultimate concern is beyond individuals and their salvation and also beyond the church itself" it is possible to sense a dramatic difference between the goals of the Year 2000 Gospel Movement and the 21<sup>st</sup> Century New Taiwan Mission Movement. Indeed Presbyterian historian Cheng Yang-en (鄭仰恩) explains that within the Presbyterian Church itself there has been longstanding disagreement between those who emphasize evangelism and those who embrace the principle of *missio Dei*.<sup>322</sup> Yet ministry beyond the salvation of individuals does not need to be read as minimizing the importance of evangelism. It can be taken to mean the church thinks beyond one indispensable ministry to include another. It will be remembered that Shoki Coe emphasized both evangelism and social ministry. The Confession of Faith seems to support his view that the church is both called out of and sent into the world. To be sure the 1975 Appeal, which specifically addressed this issue, maintained that evangelism and service are both essential to Presbyterian mission.

In advancing the partner paradigm the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan is by no means negating the importance of evangelistic ministry. Yet Presbyterian initiatives in Taiwan are often misunderstood. It is not uncommon to hear leaders in mainland-originating

churches dismiss theologies advanced in Presbyterian circles for believing the Kingdom of God can be built by human effort or as simply devised in order to provide justification for independence from China. It is also common to hear that theologies mainland-originating churches define as liberal have caused Presbyterians to depart from orthodox Christianity.<sup>323</sup>

On this last point mainland-originating churches have been over-sensitive. Historian Lin Chi-ping (林治平) explains, “From the perspective of Chinese Church history social work meant liberal.”<sup>324</sup> Missionaries and leaders of churches that originated in China were well versed in the conservative-liberal debates and could have easily confused the theologies that supported Presbyterian social initiatives with the social gospel. This study has demonstrated, however, that the Presbyterian theologians never simply appropriated an outside theology. Nor did any claim their theologies were of permanent relevance to Presbyterian ministry. Coe’s principles of contextualization are too deeply engrained. Theologians are aware of the need to continually reassess their ministry in light of the changing context. This includes ongoing reflection on whether the text has been correctly understood and applied to the context and whether the context has been correctly evaluated.<sup>325</sup>

While it might be difficult for mainland-originating churches to appreciate the contextual experiences of the Presbyterians, in regards to text it can be argued that Presbyterian social services are rooted in a faith many from mainland-originating churches would recognize as orthodox. This chapter has tried to draw attention to a string of thought that runs right through every contextual theology that has been studied. The theologies here introduced developed sequentially and each carries the marks of those that came before. Providence however is a fundamental Presbyterian doctrine that predates all and is a cornerstone of each. The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, as is evidenced in all contextual theologies, public statements, confessions, and mission initiatives, interprets the doctrine of providence, that God directs all things toward their highest good, in terms of a positive lordship over “all aspects of human reality.” Providence is a fundamental doctrine of a denomination that produced theologians like John Gresham Machen, who opposed the social gospel yet also insisted that Christians must minister to social needs.<sup>326</sup> Reflection on providence has led the denomination to conclude that its mission is to religious, political and cultural needs.

Chow Lien-hwa argues that the contention between mainland-originating and Presbyterian churches actually has little to do with theology and much to do with politics, that differences are not due so much to differing interpretations of the text, but divergent understandings of the Taiwan context.<sup>327</sup> The concluding chapter will demonstrate that Chow is correct, yet also argue that different approaches to text have also served to polarize Protestantism and hindered attempts at constructive dialogue. It will therefore become apparent that different political and ecclesiastical contexts have made it difficult for the mainland-originating churches to appreciate what the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan has to offer, which is what some few leaders at the end of the Nationalist era were beginning to recognize they needed, a theology that roots social service in the Christian life.

## CONCLUSION

During the Nationalist era the task of constructing a reasoned theological foundation to support social ministry became an important activity of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan. The contextual theologies that emerged within the denomination supported a different approach from what had been inherited from missionaries and from the ideas of ministry advanced among mainland-originating churches. These theologies encouraged the denomination to think beyond quantitative objectives of church growth. Moreover they empowered the denomination to critically assess and respond to cultural needs. This does not mean that evangelism was denigrated. It remained an essential component of Presbyterian mission in Taiwan along with social ministry. Yet we have argued that, by the turn of the century, the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan was offering Protestantism in Taiwan something that was missing among mainland-originating churches, theologies that did not deny the validity of paradigms of consequence or bridge, but that propounded the relationship between evangelism and social responsibility as one of partnership.

# CHAPTER FOUR

## THE EDEN SOCIAL WELFARE FOUNDATION

### INTRODUCTION

Our analysis of the development of Protestant theologies of social ministry in Taiwan so far has examined the evidence that is available among the denominations themselves. Some of the most important initiatives in social ministry, however, are to be found in independent Protestant institutions, rather than in the churches *per se*. In Taiwan there are a great number of such institutions. Indeed in 1980 Swanson recorded there was one for every 7.2 congregations.<sup>1</sup> Most of these were established and operate independently of churches and each other.<sup>2</sup> This chapter will not attempt to examine the theologies that have developed in Taiwan's many institutions. Rather it will offer a detailed description of one indigenous Protestant organization that is distinguished by its holistic approach to Christian ministry, namely the Eden Social Welfare Foundation.

The Eden Social Welfare Foundation demonstrates that theology is important to Taiwan's Protestant institutions, and also that in Nationalist Taiwan such entities were able to generate theologies that spoke both to their particular context, and to questions that concerned Protestantism as a whole. Eden is particularly important to this study because it addresses the question of the appropriate relationship between evangelism and social responsibility and develops an argument that anchors social ministry in Christian life. An examination of Eden's theology is also important to the following chapters, where the theology of Eden's founder, Liu Hsia, will be explored in some detail and where it will be argued that the context in which Eden and Liu minister has brought about creative and relevant thinking about social service that is helpful to both mainland-originating and Presbyterian churches.

#### The Eden Social Welfare Foundation (伊甸社會福利基金會)

The Eden Social Welfare Foundation was founded by Liu Hsia (劉俠), a celebrated author whose theology will be the subject of the following chapter.<sup>3</sup> In 1979 Liu

received a commission from the police authority to write a series of articles on juvenile delinquency that would serve as a resource for social education. Liu turned to an indigenous Christian ministry to troubled youth, called the Good Friend Mission (台北市基督教勵友中心), for case studies and advice regarding the needs of these adolescents. The director of the agency, Jacob Chen (陳俊良), was a theologically informed Presbyterian who had at one time served his denomination as an assistant youth secretary.<sup>4</sup> Chen, an individual motivated by deep compassion for those who suffer physical disabilities,<sup>5</sup> in turn called on Liu when in 1981 he formed a new organization, the Sunshine Social Welfare Foundation (陽光福利基金會), designed to help those who had been facially disfigured. Chen hoped Liu would write articles that would raise public awareness to the plight of a group who at that time were not classified by the government as disabled and therefore entitled to no social benefits.<sup>6</sup>

Thus began a partnership between a mainlander and a Taiwanese that from its very outset was not afraid of entering into relationship with political authorities on behalf of positive projects yet also maintained the right to critique and demand political change on behalf of those who suffer.<sup>7</sup> In 1981 Liu was nominated for a “10 Most Outstanding Women Award.”<sup>8</sup> As Liu considered how to best use the publicity and funds that came with the honor she became convinced that this was an answer to a longstanding prayer, that she could start a foundation to help with the needs of those, who like her, struggled with disabilities. Liu called on Chen for advice on how to proceed. Chen assembled a group of Christian leaders to pray with and advise Liu. Though all members were active in their own churches, they established the new institution without consulting or involving any church or denomination. On the first of December 1982, Liu, together with two new employees formally launched Eden.<sup>9</sup> Their first project was teaching a group of 8 mildly disabled students how to tie decorative Chinese knots.<sup>10</sup>

When Jacob Chen describes the agency’s educational work he uses the familiar adage about teaching to fish rather than giving a fish.<sup>11</sup> Eden’s earliest projects, and indeed those for which the Foundation continues to be best known, involved vocational education for individuals suffering physical disabilities.<sup>12</sup> From the first Liu wrote about the positive transformation of character she saw among the students.<sup>13</sup> Yet this was only the beginning of Liu’s vision for an agency she had named “Eden.” She envisioned a self-sustaining rural community where the physically and developmentally disabled

commune with each other and nature. This “Garden of Eden” would be a place where the disabled would learn their value and demonstrate to society at large their dignity and abilities.<sup>14</sup> During its second year the Foundation went so far as to purchase a piece of land where Liu’s experiment could be initiated.<sup>15</sup>

Liu’s vision, however, was never actualized. Jacob Chen explains that because many types of disabilities are not suited to farm work, because a substantial piece of land would be necessary to sustain the community in question, and because of current economic factors related to the price of produce, it would be most difficult to establish a self-sustaining agricultural community<sup>16</sup>. One of Eden’s early chaplains, Chen Mei-ju (陳美如), further explains that Liu dreamed of a society where all would be equal in both position and income, but that the ideals did not fit the mood of a society that was engaged in opposing Chinese communism.<sup>17</sup> Though Liu’s dreams in these regards were never accomplished Eden was able act on her principles and, for example, establish factories in urban centers that produced goods suitable for manufacture by those with differing disabilities.<sup>18</sup>

The change in direction was possible because, from almost the beginning, Liu and her team worked to distill the essence of her vision into goals that could be achieved by diverse methods. The underlying objective of all projects was to offer services to Taiwan’s disabled community that would make possible the welfare of the whole person; that is to design systematic means whereby the physical, emotional, social, and indeed spiritual needs of those suffering disabilities would be met. The social aspect of this care meant not only providing for the educational and employment needs of individuals, but transforming society itself on behalf of Eden’s clients.<sup>19</sup>

Liu’s desire to offer comprehensive services for the disabled that would go so far as to transform society itself seems impossibly large. This seems particularly true given her personal limitations. Since the age of 12 Liu suffered atrophic arthritis, a rare disease that left her in a state of constant pain, confined to a wheelchair, and also to long periods of isolation in bed. This physical condition limited her formal education to primary school.<sup>20</sup> Yet she stated her efforts were prompted by her belief in God and the love she believed was present among the people of Taiwan.<sup>21</sup>

Though it is beyond the timeline for this study it is useful to note that an article published by Taiwan's Government Information Office shortly after Eden celebrated its 20<sup>th</sup> anniversary introduces Eden as Taiwan's largest non-governmental organization and argues the Foundation is the "epitome of social welfare groups for Taiwan's disabled." At the time of writing the Foundation was employing 800 full-time staff (of which nearly 40 percent were disabled) in 45 centers located in 16 different cities. The article describes Eden as having offered "physical, emotional, and spiritual support" to more than 200,000 of Taiwan's nearly one million registered disabled, people of differing ages who suffered from a wide variety of physical and developmental disabilities. The piece also notes Eden had successfully lobbied to amend the nation's laws on behalf of the disabled.<sup>22</sup> Liu and her Eden Social Welfare Foundation have been remarkably successful in achieving their goals.

In the year 2000 Liu's increasingly poor health and the recognition that administering a large and complex foundation was beyond her ability prompted her to turn her managerial responsibilities over to a board of directors and Jacob Chen, who continues to serve as the Foundation's Chief Executive Officer.<sup>23</sup> Liu was satisfied that Eden was in capable hands and that it was continuing to offer a more impressive array of services than ever could have been achieved under her leadership.<sup>24</sup> Yet there was a dimension to the work with which she was not fully satisfied. While the material aspects of Eden's work were being completed at a remarkable pace, Liu was concerned about the progress of the spiritual components of the work.<sup>25</sup> Indeed this researcher witnessed Liu urging Eden's board chair to be more aggressive in promoting ministry of a spiritual nature.<sup>26</sup> Liu explained,

It's not saying the board doesn't value this. It's saying, because of the market requests ... because too many people are making requests ... so welfare work is running far ahead. The gospel work is lagging behind, bitterly trying to catch up. I, comparatively sorrowfully, say it hasn't achieved what I envisioned when I founded Eden, that gospel and service would equally develop, can be equally balanced, that kind of goal.<sup>27</sup>

## Mission Statement

Liu's concern that the aspects of the ministry specifically related to the Christian faith are developing in a less satisfactory manner than social services is common among Eden's senior staff.<sup>28</sup> This is a concern because Eden is fundamentally a religious organization. The fact is reflected in the agency's mission statement, where three of the four clauses are entirely concerned with Christian faith.<sup>29</sup> Nevertheless social needs, available resources, compassionate leaders motivated to resolve immediate problems, and indeed a lack of interest among many clients in regards to the spiritual dimension of Eden's service, have resulted in an inordinate amount of attention being focused on the social.<sup>30</sup> Eden's leadership has given considerable attention to the problem and developed a contextual theology wherein, in theory at least, the social and spiritual aspects of the ministry are bound into one balanced whole.

The theology is set forth in a mission statement that, by its very mode of expression, shows itself to be a product of Chinese minds. Prof. Zhu Yin-puo (朱蔭坡), who teaches literature at Beijing's Capital City Economics and Business University (首都經絡貿易大學), writes that Eden's mission statement is expressed in a Chinese literary form known as *pai bi* (排比). Chu explains *pai bi* is a construction wherein three or more phrases or sentences with a similar grammatical structure, related meanings, and an equal number of words are placed side by side so as to lead a reader into deepening layers of thought that make a strong and memorable impression. In literature *pai bi* has often appeared as a rhythmic, even poetic, arrangement wherein objective descriptions are artistically entwined with subjective feelings, where reason and emotions are combined, to create an affective atmosphere. According to Chu, "When you have abundant thoughts, and a very full emotion in your heart, then you use *pai bi* style to express -- then you can really pour out your deep thoughts and your full feelings."<sup>31</sup>

Eden's statement of mission is without a doubt a product of "abundant thoughts" and "full emotion." In 1994 the decision was taken to register Eden as a national rather than regional foundation. A mission statement would have to be submitted with the application.<sup>32</sup> This brought to a head a debate that had been occupying the board of directors since 1992 when Liu Mei-hsia (劉美夏), one of Eden's first employees, was

appointed as a member of the board. Liu recalls that at every board meeting she and Yu Li-cheng (俞禮正), another board member who like Liu Mei-hsia was both physically disabled and a member of a mainland-originating church, worked to convince Jacob Chen, the board chair, to completely *gospelize* (全面福音化) the work. Liu Mei-hsia explains that Chen was reticent to accept the proposal because he was concerned about public response to a Social Welfare Foundation that defined itself only in terms of religious mission. However Liu and Yu argued that if the spiritual essence was not maintained as the Foundation grew the new staff would fail to understand the organization and Eden would slowly become nothing more than a social institution.<sup>33</sup>

Liu Mei-hsia recalls the issue was finally resolved on the twelfth of November 1995 as Liu Hsia and Eden's board members completed a two-day retreat where Chen made proposals and the board debated and reworked these into the mission statement that now stands.<sup>34</sup> It is made up of a series of four phrases with four characters, in each phrase of which the first three consist of a verb followed by a noun with a fourth phrase that twice repeats the same verb/noun arrangement.<sup>35</sup> In English the statement can be translated: Serve Weak (服務弱勢), Witness Christ (見證基督), Promote *Shuangfu* (推動雙福), Lead People Turn (to) Lord (領人歸主).<sup>36</sup> These simple phrases provide readers with a memorable and easily comprehensible means to understand the Foundation. Within the organization the statement has become a focal point known, and even memorized, by all employees.<sup>37</sup>



Mission-statement handwritten on pillars at the entrance of Eden's temporary headquarters after a flood forced relocation.

The ministry, and corresponding theology of ministry, that has emerged in the Eden Social Welfare Foundation will be introduced by examining each phrase of the mission statement in turn. It is apparent that Eden's statement presents only a skeletal outline wherein content is not spelled out; that it is an artistic, suggestive, document wherein meanings and the relationship between elements are left to the imagination. This thesis has sought to explore the intended meanings with the help of the Foundation's most senior and longstanding members of staff, many of whom were involved in constructing the statement. Eden is, however, an activist group and not a theological seminar. It will be made clear that the document is pregnant with, in Chu's words, "deep thoughts" and "full feelings" and that despite its brevity the *pai bi* is a mature and contextually relevant statement that could be produced only after years of service and reflection upon that service in Taiwan. Yet it will also become evident that Eden's theology is more implicit than explicit. Therefore after explaining each component of Eden's mission statement a brief conclusion will offer a reflection on the theology that supports Eden's programs. A more detailed presentation of this theology in relation to its context will be provided in the following chapters.

## Serve Weak (服務弱勢)

### *Person Centered Holistic Service*

While interviewing Eden staff regarding the Foundation's mission statement two Buddhist employees were queried. Both stated they were willing to tolerate the organization's Christian stance so as to have an opportunity to serve with the Foundation in caring for the weak.<sup>38</sup> One of Eden's chaplains explains that Eden's work is valued in society and workers are held in high regard.<sup>39</sup> The human and, indeed, financial resources on which Eden is able to draw to support its undertakings demonstrate that the services the Foundation offers its clients are indeed widely appreciated. Regarding finance, Eden receives approximately one third of its income from the government, one third from sales of products and services, and the remainder from private donations. Leaders estimate only five to ten percent of donations come from Christian sources. By contrast as much as eighty percent of contributions, of a list that contains as many as twenty thousand names, are from individuals who do not hold the Christian faith. Corporate sponsors make up the remainder of donations. Managing Director Robert Lin

(林錦川) states companies such as Seven Eleven and I.B.M. find affiliation with Eden, an organization that is publicly recognized as being beneficial to society, to be good advertising.<sup>40</sup>

The support provided by government, corporations, clients, and individuals not affiliated with the Christian faith, validate Eden as a foundation that successfully offers quality services. Chiu Kung-ming (邱光明), a longstanding Eden board member who currently works in the Foundation's central offices, explains that these services are different from those common in society at large. Chiu maintains that in Taiwan social services usually emerge in the form of programs, movements, or activities designed on behalf of the weak. By contrast the services Eden offers are person centered and holistic in nature, services that begin with respect for the intelligence and capability of clients.<sup>41</sup> The custom is not to offer charitable gifts but a wide variety of services such as counseling, education, medical, employment, and leisure activities that will conspire together to benefit the individual, their family, and society.<sup>42</sup> Eden argues that by helping the individual toward self-sufficiency they lessen the burden on both family and society by freeing caregivers for employment and making the disabled themselves productive members of the community.<sup>43</sup>

The difference between Eden's service and that of others becomes clear when Chiu, who for twenty-four years served as a Baptist pastor, compares the services organized by mainland-originating churches with those of Eden. Chiu explains these churches tend to follow the same program oriented approach common in society in that they offer only broad stroke services aimed at particular needs in their communities. These program and activity oriented efforts are clearly not intended to themselves bring comprehensive health to those among whom they minister. Liu Mei-hsia, who currently serves as Eden's general manager for the island's central regions, repeats this point of view. Liu explains that the churches rely on untrained volunteers who do not evaluate a situation in a professional manner so as to determine the right mixture of medical, educational, and social resources that need to be applied to resolve a particular problem.<sup>44</sup> For many churches, service, as Chapter Two has demonstrated, is auxiliary to evangelism. Thus Chiu describes service in Taiwan as commonly offered from above, *for* rather than *among* the needy. Chiu, himself disabled, argues that this is in marked contrast to Eden where, again, service is person centered and holistic.<sup>45</sup>

Offering holistic services means that political advocacy is also an activity important to Eden. To this end Eden has been instrumental in organizing a union of foundations that serve the disabled. The union's first offices were located in Eden facilities and its first president was Liu Hsia. In this position Liu led numerous demonstrations that were instrumental in winning education and employment rights, as well as rights of access for the disabled. In 1989 the union also asked Liu to run for legislative office, not with any intent to win but in order to focus media attention on the obstacles facing those with disabilities. After just over six weeks into a very public campaign Liu was forced to withdraw because of laws barring those with only a primary school education from holding office. Though political activities were often organized by the union, media attention tended to focus on Liu Hsia and Jacob Chen. Therefore union programs have been popularly perceived to be Eden activities.<sup>46</sup> In the late 1990s Eden also became the Taiwan representative of the International Campaign to Ban Landmines, raising awareness and donating over 3,000 wheelchairs to those disabled by landmines. Taiwan's government referred to these activities in arguments against prohibiting their progressive country from joining the United Nations and the World Health Organization.<sup>47</sup>

In articles published on the occasion of Eden's 10<sup>th</sup> anniversary Liu Hsia and Liu Meishia celebrate Eden's approach. Both are enthusiastic that Eden has not simply offered charitable services on behalf of the disabled but helps those so suffering to emerge from what had heretofore been a very narrow existence to discover their own particular potential in society. To this end they explained that Eden had not simply focused on the disabled themselves, but had engaged in a broader vision of educating society. What the disabled needed was for society to treat them with dignity, to offer them opportunities of employment for example, where the disabled could interact as equals among others.<sup>48</sup> This person centered ministry, a service by the disabled among the disabled, a service that is able to understand social needs from the perspective of the disabled,<sup>49</sup> can be defined as contextual.

## *Contextual Mission*

It has been suggested that Chen's Presbyterian faith may have influenced Eden's activities, and that Liu, with little experience in matters of theology or ministry, depended on him for the direction the ministry would take.<sup>50</sup> To be sure Chen, who reports admiring the medical ministries of the earliest Presbyterian missionaries and who explains that he has read and been influenced by the teachings of C. S. Song, is aware of Presbyterian history and theology.<sup>51</sup> Indeed interviews reveal that Chen's thinking is in accord with his denomination's Confession of Faith. When, for example, he repeatedly asserts that the direction Eden has taken is fundamentally due to the activity of the Holy Spirit he is drawing on a theology of providence that, in the words of the Confession, asserts God is "Lord of history and of the world," that "His Spirit, which is the Holy Spirit, dwells among us and grants us power."<sup>52</sup> Likewise, when Chen argues, as he does, that those suffering disabilities have the same fundamental rights and equalities as others, and that therefore the government must remove the barriers to education and employment, he is working for the hope expressed in the Confession, that God "will set the oppressed free and make them equal, that all may become new creatures in Christ and the world His Kingdom, full of justice, peace, and joy,"<sup>53</sup>

It must be noted, however, that Chen explains that he is by no means an intransigent Presbyterian. He indicates that an early conversion experience in a non-Presbyterian setting, the writings of Bonhoeffer, and fellowship with mainland originating Christians have also shaped his thinking.<sup>54</sup> Indeed acquaintances like theologian Tsai Kuo-shan, suggest Liu Hsia has influenced Chen as much as vice versa.<sup>55</sup> To describe Liu as passive in regards to the working philosophy of the organization is to disregard that she was a capable thinker in her own right, able to, as the following chapter will demonstrate, draw on innate Chinese philosophy for a model of Christian social responsibility. Thus, while there is little doubt that in the give and take of ideas Chen's Presbyterian thinking has influenced Eden a number of other sources, among which Liu's thinking would have been significant, worked together to determine the direction the ministry would take.

However in Eden Liu is not so much revered for her intellectual contributions as for the emotion she arouses. In Eden she has become a greatly respected figure who by means

of her very person elicits an understanding of both the need for and potential of holistic ministry.<sup>56</sup> Thus by her person at least, if not by her words, Liu has ensured that Eden's ministry is both contextual and holistic. From the very beginning Eden has been a ministry by (or for able-bodied employees, a ministry in partnership with and among) those suffering disabilities. The staff is intimately aware of the needs of the weak. It is thus not necessary to untangle the many lines of thought, such as Chen's Presbyterian background or Liu's philosophy, to describe the influences that inform Eden's ministry. It is much more simple to show that contextual ministry has led to the conviction that service must be holistic.

The influence contextual ministry has on theology is demonstrated in illustrations provided by two of Eden's chaplains. Chen Mei-ju, one of Eden's earliest chaplains, states that when she first began to do home visitations for those suffering disabilities she used traditional evangelistic techniques. Mentioning Jesus, however, resulted in closed doors whereas reference to Liu Hsia prompted a warm welcome. As a chaplain it was her expressed desire to share her faith. However Chen learned the disabled are not interested in what Christians traditionally share, namely a message about eternal life. What is important to them is what can be done to help their present needs. Focusing on the desires of the individual forced Chen Mei-ju into the role of an advocate, one who would help locate available resources. Chen recalls that as she took the role, demonstrating sincere concern for the needs of the person to whom she ministered, the relationship developed and opportunities to share her faith quite naturally arose.<sup>57</sup>

Chiu Kung-ming, who is responsible for Eden's ministry to earthquake victims, has reached much the same conclusion. He argues that those churches that preached eternal life among those who suffered the effects of the 1999 earthquake simply confused a people whose interest was wholly taken up with survival, with present rather than future needs. Eternal life, Chiu maintains, is related to quality of life in both the present and the future. Therefore Chiu led Eden to establish a factory training and employing local women as seamstresses, a work that Chiu argues resulted in openness to his sharing about the other blessings Jesus offers.<sup>58</sup>

For both Chen Mei-ju and Chiu Kung-ming contextual ministry led to the conviction that service must be holistic. Eden's theology emerged from ministry. Indeed when

questioned about the theology of the Foundation the chaplain of Eden's Central Office, Peng Shu-fan (彭舒凡) replied by describing Eden's theology as related to the unique problems encountered in the course of ministry, and stated "... theology is probably from life experiences ... problems are touched and made into a research discussion."<sup>59</sup> Peng theorizes that the theology of Eden is different from that of the churches because the majority of churches serve healthy middle to upper class parishioners with few material needs, a group that is in stark contrast to those served by Eden. In Eden, Peng explains, staff "converse together with disabled friends ... go through life together with them."<sup>60</sup>

Like Chen and Chiu, Peng, and indeed chaplain Chang Lai-hao (張來好), report that ministry experiences have convinced them that those in need of material assistance are not receptive if spiritual care is separated from a wider response to their need.<sup>61</sup> It is expedient to note that these, the four most experienced and senior chaplains in the Eden Social Welfare Foundation, are all members of mainland-originating churches.<sup>62</sup> Interviews with these individuals have shown that their contextual ministry has affected their theology. Chen Mei-ju, who is among Eden's most sophisticated theological thinkers, explains that working with those who are physically disabled made her appreciate the human body. Observing physical limitations has showed her the importance of caring for God-created organs that enable people to do good. The conviction has caused Chen to offer rather acerbic responses when she encounters individuals who speak negatively about the flesh, suggesting that they offer one of their hands or shoulders to her friends who need them.<sup>63</sup> The simple observation has caused Chen also to critique traditional ministry methods. Those social institutions that serve the body, like restaurants for example, are greatly appreciated whereas churches that minister only to the spirit offer little of substance to their neighbors. These are the beginnings of a radical change in theology, a change that originates in contextual ministry.<sup>64</sup> Other chaplains appear to be undergoing a similar change in their thinking.

The four chaplains, for example, do not take the stance that society is utterly corrupt. Their message to the disabled includes the point that the reason the disabled are not appreciated is because society is not looking at them in the way God does, does not see their inner beauty. Yet the chaplains do not ask clients to retreat from society. Rather there is an appreciation that Eden's political engagement has resulted in social

improvement. Moreover the urgency to evangelize, so common in mainland-originating churches, has been tempered. Eden chaplains argue that holistic service and related relationship building, time consuming activities, are necessary to evangelistic endeavor.<sup>65</sup> These changes, among chaplains who belong to mainland-originating churches, reflect theological development. Eden's chaplains are taking positions that differ from what is commonly advanced among their churches.

### *A Convinced Position*

A concept of Christian responsibility that is different from that which is accepted by many churches in Taiwan has indeed emerged in Eden. The article Liu wrote on the occasion of Eden's 10<sup>th</sup> anniversary explained that ill health was forcing her to consider retirement. Nevertheless she also wrote, "I ask God for another ten years to preach the gospel for the disabled, and that I can knock on the gate of the church and let the brothers and sisters be concerned about society and use the love that they have for God on the littlest brothers."<sup>66</sup> To "knock on the gate" are the words of an outsider longing that closed doors be opened, that sincere concern be shown for society, particularly the "littlest brothers," that is the weak.

Jacob Chen explains, "Some churches only proclaim a hurried gospel. This makes people feel that they only care about the spirit but you don't see ... present difficulties."<sup>67</sup> Chen clarified "hurried gospel" by means of an illustration. In the earthquake zone both he and James Shia perceived there was a negative response to Christian service. Residents were complaining that the social services Christians offered were conditioned by response to the faith. This led to Shia requesting that Chen explain his thinking to pastors serving in the area. Chen urged the clergy not to have a "hurried gospel," by which he meant they should not be in a hurry to get people into church. Rather they should simply care for people. Quoting a Taiwanese proverb Chen explains, "If you eat too quickly you will break the bowl."<sup>68</sup>

Both Liu Hsia and her colleague Jacob Chen accepted the evangelistic mandate, with Liu desiring another ten years "to preach the gospel" and Chen clearly wanting the gospel to be proclaimed, just not in a hurried manner. Where the two seem to be at odds with the churches is in regards to the sense of evangelistic urgency common in Taiwan,

an urgency that, in the words of C. S. Song, stemmed from eagerness to “to pronounce the imminent end of the world because of social disorder, moral confusion and religious relativism.”<sup>69</sup> Though aware of social ills, the contextual experiences of both Liu and Chen lead them to disagree with this pessimistic view of society. Liu, whose optimism has been described as related to the fact that from childhood she has lived in a fairly isolated environment where she was the center of much care and encouragement,<sup>70</sup> established Eden by insisting, “We believe this society is still warm, and people still have love, so ... we step bravely out and don’t look back.”<sup>71</sup> Chen, in an article that shows him aware of a tendency to corruption even among those who market charitable services, nevertheless argues that the services are possible because of an “original love resource that was given by God.”<sup>72</sup>

The relationship Eden’s administrators and chaplains have with the disabled has affected their thinking. It has made them aware of and responsive to corporeal needs. According to Chen Mei-ju this experience goes so far as to influence the way the Bible is studied. The Biblical narrative is read in much the same way as a social worker would analyze a case. Jesus’ ministry, for example, is examined from the perspective of the client so as to understand the meaning for an individual’s physical, emotional, social and religious environment.<sup>73</sup> If the context has indeed influenced Bible reading, it cannot be argued that Eden’s direction in service is due simply to the imposition of any outside system of thought. Indeed the person centered holistic ministry that the foundation is advancing is in contradiction to certain traditions.

### *Conclusion*

Eden’s statement of mission was formed by means of a process Stephen B. Bevans defines as “praxis.” Bevans explains that whereas in traditional theology faith seeks understanding, in this model faith seeks intelligent action. As Christians act they reflect on the Bible, tradition and culture. This in turn initiates renewed action, which in turn generates new reflection.<sup>74</sup> Where theology is formed in praxis there tends to be agreement on at least two fundamental points: that the poor offer valuable insights and must be considered partners in mission rather than the objects of charity, and that service not only addresses spiritual, but social needs. Indeed it is argued that mission should not

only work with those who suffer to facilitate relief from particular problems, but seek wide ranging and permanent improvement by seeking to transform the community.<sup>75</sup>

It cannot be argued that Eden knowingly conformed to any model of contextual theology. Nevertheless their ministry among the disabled resulted in a theology that resonates with that which has emerged from praxis in other contexts. When Eden describes their mission as “serve weak” the Foundation is stating that recipients of aid must not be treated as objects of mission. The point is made particularly clear in the terminology that was chosen to express “serve.” Eden’s board consciously chose the term *fu wu* (服務) rather than the similar term *gwan hwai* (關懷), as the second term had the connotation of service from up to down, or from a position of power to the powerless.<sup>76</sup> The churches might use *gwan hwai* and develop programs for the weak. Eden, however, concluded service should be done among rather than for the weak.

The phrase “serve weak” also indicates Eden’s mission should be holistic in nature. The vagueness of the term “weak,” like the broad term “poor” among those groups that emphasize a preferential option for the poor, was an intentional effort to ensure Eden’s ministry remained responsive to a wide variety of human needs.<sup>77</sup> When the mission statement was drafted the Eden board refused to narrow its definition of what services it would offer or who would be served. The board desired to be free to respond to new needs as they would arise and even to new groups of “weak” that could benefit from their service.<sup>78</sup>

Eden’s ability to formulate a statement that is designed to ensure mission remains contextual is due to the fact that the Foundation started out on the right foot, so to speak. Ministry was initiated by Liu Hsia and has been carried on by a staff with a large percentage of disabled members. This was not the application of thoughts that emerged in the hierarchy of the churches, but the presentation of conclusions reached by a community who were interpreting their faith from the perspective of the marginalized. In settings where theology has thus been formed it has provided a robust perspective that informs traditional thinking.<sup>79</sup>

## Witness Christ (見證基督)

### *Witness Internalized*

To witness Christ means quite another thing from doing evangelism. Evangelism is focused on the other, on facilitating the transformation of the other. Jacob Chen explains that before thinking in terms of evangelism Eden's ministry must first involve witness. By this he means that Eden must begin by directing attention to the self, on living "the way we should with the Lord."<sup>80</sup> This entails selfless service on behalf of others. Such ministry incorporates offering spiritual resources. Yet Chen maintains the response to the message is in the hands of the Holy Spirit, not Eden. Eden's first responsibility is to concentrate on witnessing Christ, living as Christ would have them live.<sup>81</sup>

To succeed in witnessing Christ means that within the agency itself there must be a particular quality of life. All of Eden's staff and clients are required to attend a daily period of Christian devotions. It is widely reported that singing is among the most popular parts of this time. Music has a central place in the Eden ministry, with songs being consciously used to affect the work ambiance and teach the faith.<sup>82</sup> To this end a song has been composed for the Foundation, the lyrics of which begin:

We have a happy family, this God-blessed Eden.  
We are hand in hand, shoulder to shoulder;  
supporting each other, serving with one heart.  
We love each other, not complaining;  
Even though the body is disabled, the heart and will are strong.  
In Jesus' love, the unfortunate in the earth become a glorious crown.<sup>83</sup>

The song teaches that because of God's blessing the Eden Social Welfare Foundation should be a joyful community marked by closely-knit relationships wherein staff unite in working for the cosmic purpose. The ideal is not always achieved.<sup>84</sup> Nevertheless Eden strives for an organizational culture marked by Christ-like character.<sup>85</sup>

## *Witness for Others*

An examination of Eden's services reveals that "Witness Christ" also has an external dimension; that Eden desires to introduce its services to clients and society at large in terms of Christ. When Taiwan's President Chen Shui-bian, who had vowed to counter longstanding Nationalist practices by creating a free press, was accused of owning shares in a private television station he quickly and publicly donated his holdings to the Eden Social Welfare Foundation. When Eden was questioned about how the proceeds would be used the Foundation did not simply publicize its many social projects. Rather, in a guileless manner, an agency leader reported the shares would be used in a fund that had been created to support seminary students who were preparing to minister among those with disabilities.<sup>86</sup> The brochure that was published to explain this need requested that donors check a box indicating whether they were Christian, Buddhist or other. The first paragraph explains that when Jesus was alive he provided for the physical, emotional, and spiritual needs of his listeners. The paragraph continues that Eden wants to follow the example of Jesus, that Jesus' method is what lies behind Eden's ministry.<sup>87</sup>

This idea of learning from Christ was used by World Vision in Taiwan when it changed the wording of its mission statement regarding its identity. It should not be defined as a Christian organization, but as an organization that follows Jesus' example. The terminology enables both World Vision and Eden to minister in a way that is recommended by James Shia, to avoid highlighting religious differences such as operating as a "Christian" in a Buddhist context.<sup>88</sup> Eden's mission is not to witness Christianity, but to witness Christ. In using the concept of learning from Christ Eden's brochure makes itself amenable to potential non-Christian donors. Yet this is not an erratic effort to learn about Christ or an unconvicted effort at dialogue. The brochure is clear as to the Foundation's faith. In as open and approachable a way as possible Eden is sharing that its welfare services are based those of Christ.

A closer inspection in regards to the content of the witness reveals that apart from introducing their welfare work a conviction commonly shared is the value of Eden's clients in God's eyes. Liu Hsia and Chang Lai-hao report this point is emphasized so as to counter the low self-esteem common among those who have suffered the discrimination experienced by those with disabilities.<sup>89</sup> Chen Mei-ju explains that the

worth of the disabled is sometimes so strongly emphasized that those disabled who accept the message tend to become exclusive in their relationships, seeing themselves as of higher value than those who are physically healthy.<sup>90</sup> It is perhaps natural to overemphasize the point, given the obstacles that the disabled have faced in Taiwan. Chen notes that when Eden first started its ministry there was a stigma attached to having a disabled child, and such children were often hidden away.<sup>91</sup> Indeed in society at large many continue to see the disabled as objects of pity and as beggars of sorts who are desirous of charity.

Sadly discrimination seems commonplace even in the churches. Peng Shu-fan explains that in the churches there can be confusion regarding those with disabilities, with some regarding Old Testament instructions about ritual purity as meaning the disabled are in some way unclean.<sup>92</sup> Chen Mei-ju, who has designed a curriculum teaching Eden's theology in two of Taiwan's leading seminaries, adds that while faculties of theology commonly teach subjects such as liberation and feminist theology, there has heretofore been no thinking about the disabled.<sup>93</sup> Eden makes no pretence at offering a highly developed theology regarding suffering or disability. However their service has enabled the Foundation to articulate one Christian tenet extremely well, that the disabled are valuable. If the point is overemphasized it is because a great deal of force is needed to transform deeply entrenched and hostile beliefs.

Eden's public testimony would mean little if their projects did not demonstrate their convictions. Eden's social services must therefore be done well.<sup>94</sup> Though in the first years Eden's work was largely carried out by a staff without credentials changes in social law and expanding services to care for more difficult clientele resulted in an increased need for professionally trained employees. It has been difficult for Eden to find large numbers of qualified Christians to fill the posts. Nevertheless it is possible to argue that the proficient services the Foundation offers are necessary to Eden's Christian witness.<sup>95</sup> That the Foundation serves in an exemplary manner, looking for and developing responses to needs, rather than following popular trends or allowing available funds to determine the work that will be undertaken, further commends the witness of the organization.<sup>96</sup>

According to Chang Lai-hao, long-term Eden employee and confidant of Liu Hsia, Liu held the view that if the services the Foundation offered were equivalent to those available in other social welfare agencies there was no reason for Eden to exist. For Liu the key difference, Chang maintains, is that Eden has the gospel.<sup>97</sup> Robert Lin argues exactly the same point more bluntly, that what sets Eden apart from other welfare foundations is that Eden has God.<sup>98</sup> Chen Mei-ju notes that clients, however, are often not interested in gospel or God. Nevertheless Chen explains that regardless of their response to the gospel Eden is willing to help them with their needs. Chen states that in so doing Eden believes it is upholding the gospel, that it is following the example of Christ who had compassion and fed the 5000 hungry souls without regard to their response to his message. Moreover Eden perceives their service as extending beyond the individual to the community. Regardless of whether Eden's faith is accepted or rejected, the social services Eden offers means that in society at large there is witness to Christ.<sup>99</sup>

Eden has never been reticent about witnessing its Christian faith. Chen himself introduces Eden by explaining that the Foundation offers both social welfare and the gospel in the hope that those served will have the resources to live with dignity in the present and have hope for the future. Eden makes it a priority to offer all visitors such an explanation. Chen does not, however, see this as evangelism.<sup>100</sup> Nor can it be described as pre-evangelism; a term that suggests Eden's services are a bridge to facilitate evangelism. To be sure it is not uncommon in Eden to hear staff explain that their many services result in effective evangelism.<sup>101</sup> Yet Jacob Chen is adamant that "Witness Christ" is limited to a commentary on the first phrase of the mission statement, that it is a commentary on "Serve Weak." Chen maintains that by writing the mission statement in a way that places testimony before evangelism Eden is explaining that social service is more than a desire to convert. It emerges from a faith in Christ, a belief that holds every individual as valuable and sees service to the weak as an act of worship. Thus in Eden mission is seen as wider than evangelism.<sup>102</sup> The placement suggests that services offered would remain even if evangelism were not successful.

### *Addressing the Danger of Dislocation*

To offer a clear witness to Christ is increasingly difficult in an organization that is growing exponentially. In 1982 the ministry started with two employees. By the year 2000 the Foundation had grown to employ approximately four hundred individuals. Over the next three years the number of staff would double.<sup>103</sup> Liu Mei-hsia, explains that new employees do not understand the Christian nature of the work and therefore worries about continuity. Liu attempts to resolve the problem by hiring as many Christians as possible, ensuring those non-Christians who are offered employment understand the nature of the organization before making a commitment to join the staff, placing Christians in the positions where interaction with clients takes place, and by creating a work culture that facilitates Christian conversation, daily Bible study, and communal prayer.<sup>104</sup>

Liu's method cannot be said to be that of Eden, however.<sup>105</sup> Though Eden has central offices that oversee the affairs of the organization, Eden's general managers have a large degree of autonomy in regards to their regional services.<sup>106</sup> Ministry of a spiritual nature, in particular, is under no central authority as, according to Jacob Chen, it must relate to the local context.<sup>107</sup> As a result Christian witness takes on a different character in each station, with managers in one area sometimes critiquing the method and therefore the resulting witness that is offered in another region.<sup>108</sup> While the predilections of managers, and therefore the content of religious instruction, varies the Foundation as a whole commonly employs pre-employment interviews, orientation for new staff, daily devotions, seminars, and internal publications to ensure the staff understand the Christian nature of the organization in which they serve.<sup>109</sup>

That all those queried, Christian and non-Christian alike, quickly and accurately recited the mission statement indicates remarkable success in inculcating the ideals of the Foundation. Though one employee of another faith did not internalize the statement, speaking of the mission as that of the organization rather than her personal mission,<sup>110</sup> services undertaken on behalf of the organization are, nevertheless, supervised by leaders like Jacob Chen, with whom the personal ideals are hard to separate from those of the organization.<sup>111</sup> Moreover so as to optimize the Christian witness administrators

report placing staff that understand the purpose of the organization in positions where they can influence the attitudes of other employees.<sup>112</sup>

### *Conclusion*

Chen Mei-ju describes Eden's theology as rooted in *Luke* 4:18, a verse where Jesus describes his mission in terms of good news for the poor and oppressed.<sup>113</sup> Liberation theologian Gustavo Gutierrez argues the verse should be taken literally and maintains Christian mission is veritably about transforming the conditions of the marginalized.<sup>114</sup> David J. Bosch agrees with the refusal to spiritualize the meaning of poor. He argues from *Luke*, maintaining the book both supports a preferential option for the poor and understands mission in terms of holistic service.<sup>115</sup> He notes that in conciliar circles *Luke* 4:18 has begun to supplant *Matthew's* Great Commission as the basic text for understanding the mission of the church, and maintains that mission should be understood as wider than evangelism.<sup>116</sup>

Bosch further notes that in *Luke-Acts* the community of believers had a "bipolar,"<sup>117</sup> or inward and outward orientation. Inward efforts were directed at creating a holy fellowship, whereas the outward mission consists of efforts on behalf of those who have not understood the gospel.<sup>118</sup> This same inward and outward orientation is evident in Eden. The Eden Social Welfare Foundation understands its mission to "witness Christ" as beginning with inward holiness. The aspiration is to live an authentic Christ-like life. The center of attention is on Christ rather than Christian tradition. This focus on the ministry of Christ as described in *Luke* has also enabled the Foundation to offer an outward witness that explains and demonstrates that the gospel means good news for everybody, regardless of whether it is accepted. This is not to say Eden fails to emphasize conversion. Yet on the question of evangelism Jacob Chen argues in a similar manner to Bosch, who explains that in *Luke* evangelistic success is a matter for the Holy Spirit.<sup>119</sup> Indeed in describing its mission as witnessing Christ Eden makes the same point as Bosch, that though mission includes addressing spiritual needs it must be understood as wider than evangelism.

## Promote Shuangfu (推動雙福)

### *Binding Service and Faith*

When Liu Mei-hsia campaigned in regards to the mission statement her hope was to “completely gospelize” Eden’s work, by which she appears to have meant that Eden should be like the Christian Cosmic Light Holistic Care Organization (宇宙光全人關懷機構), an agency that equates social service and gospel work.<sup>120</sup> Jacob Chen, she notes, had difficulty accepting the proposal. Support might not be forthcoming for an institution that was perceived to only offer service of a religious nature. Therefore the board developed a mission statement that would distinguish between social and spiritual service, yet satisfy Liu with a statement that would bind the two elements together into a whole.<sup>121</sup> In this way society would clearly understand the goal of the agency was to help the needy. Yet the religious essence of the Foundation would also be safeguarded.

In dividing the mission into ministries of a social and spiritual nature the board was responding to the context in which Eden operated. Eden was ministering in a society and among churches that thought in terms of service being either secular or sacred. Different branches of the government, for example, regulate social welfare and religious foundations.<sup>122</sup> Churches, for their part, also make a clear distinction. Eden leaders explain that Taiwan churches have commonly understood their Foundation to be a welfare and not a gospel organization.<sup>123</sup>

Eden’s response has not been to argue, like the Presbyterians, from a theology of providence, that God is directing world affairs and that their social service is itself a sacred ministry. Indeed apart from Eden’s most experienced pastor, Chiu Kung-ming, suggesting that eternal life is related to quality of life in both the present and the future, there is little evidence that Eden employees apprehend the concept that social services might be considered sacred.<sup>124</sup> Instead it is common to hear social and spiritual work spoken of as two distinct enterprises.<sup>125</sup> Therefore the Foundation has chosen to describe itself as both/and, both as a welfare and as a gospel organization. Given the common either/or perception of social and spiritual work this is the more contextually acceptable definition.

## *New Terminology*

To this end the third clause of the mission statement reads that Eden is to promote *shuangfu*. The first part of the term *shuangfu* is *shuang* (雙), which simply means “twofold” or “double.”<sup>126</sup> The second syllable, *fu* (福), by itself means “blessing” or “happiness.” *Fu*, however, is also the shared component of the two words (*fu-li*, 福利), which means “social welfare,” and (*fu-yin*, 福音), the Chinese word for “gospel.”<sup>127</sup> The term *shuangfu*, or “double blessing,”<sup>128</sup> is a means whereby the terms welfare and gospel are brought together. Liu Hsia’s brother Liu Kan (劉侃), who as the chair of two Christian social welfare institutions has long been thinking through the relationship of social and spiritual in Christian ministry, suggests *shuangfu* could be translated as “two welfares.”<sup>129</sup> The terms welfare and gospel do not naturally connect in the English language, however. Thus this study will use a transliteration rather than a translation of the term.

Though the term itself requires introduction the concept is easy to understand. The blessing of social welfare and the blessing of the gospel belong together. Together they bring happiness. An Eden publication explains,

*Shuangfu* means gospel and welfare. Through welfare you can solve the problems and difficulties of daily life, to bring the physically and developmentally disabled peace and joy in this life, and through the gospel you can give comfort and help to people’s hearts and spirits, bring them hope and assurance of eternal life. That is to say through *shuangfu* service we can give whole person service to the human body, heart and soul.<sup>130</sup>

*Shuangfu* thus brings out the fact that Eden’s ministry is holistic. It integrates the physical and the spiritual, and also the temporal and the eternal. Because the term enables integration the Eden Social Welfare Foundation believes it has found an answer to a problem that plagues island churches.

## *A Mission to the Churches*

The realization that churches have a problem with integrating welfare and gospel emerges from painful contextual experience among the disabled. Chen Mei-ju explains

that when Eden began its ministry the disabled were a fairly invisible part of the population. Parents, it has been noted, often felt a sense of shame and hid their disabled children.<sup>131</sup> The population was interested in upward mobility; a way of thinking that affected many in the churches. Because most church members were well off many leaders were not confronted with other than spiritual needs.<sup>132</sup> Service to the disabled simply did not enter into their consciousness. Chen notes that when those clients who converted in conjunction with Eden's ministry were asked to attend their neighborhood churches it became clear that the churches did not know how to welcome the new visitors and many felt uncared for. Chen does not mince words, stating the church "throws those people away."<sup>133</sup> Because of this in Taipei Eden established an Eden Church, which would serve as a halfway house of sorts. When the disabled were built up in the faith they would be encouraged to move on to a local congregation.<sup>134</sup>

Not all Eden employees are so willing to censure the churches. Chang Lai-hao, for example, explains how confusing and difficult it can be to care for disabled friends. However Chang does not easily dismiss churches from responsibility. To profess to care means the necessity of following through and providing for the one in ninety-nine who has special needs.<sup>135</sup> Peng Shu-fan offers a similar response. She admits the disabled, with their many physical and emotional needs, are a difficulty for churches. She adds that they are a drain on the church resources as helping them requires considerable time and energy. Yet she reveals an underlying frustration when she questions whether the lack of care given to the disabled relates to their inability to contribute financially to church ministry. Peng further notes that the pastorate is pulpit oriented and are thus ill equipped to assist the physically challenged with their many social needs.<sup>136</sup>

Chen Mei-ju also states that pastors in Taiwan serve in a pulpit oriented and authoritative manner.<sup>137</sup> When Chiu Kung-ming explains that sin and suffering are two topics the churches in Taiwan have long neglected it might rightly be assumed that the ministry that the churches can offer, namely the preaching prevalent in most churches, fails to address even the spiritual needs of the disabled.<sup>138</sup> Grace Cheng, whose many years as manager of the Year 2000 Gospel Movement makes her an authority on the subject, concurs with Chiu and explains that the themes most common to the churches are love and joy.<sup>139</sup>

That little care is offered to the disabled raises questions about what is being preached in regards to love. However Eden staff are quick to point out that churches are slowly becoming more responsive to the needs of the disabled.<sup>140</sup> To facilitate this Eden has sought to promote its theology of *shuangfu* among the churches. It also presents the concept of *shuangfu* in society at large. The brochure raising funds for seminary students illustrates, and Jacob Chen confirms, that Eden finds it important to explain that they believe service must include both social and spiritual care.<sup>141</sup> Yet for Eden it is essential that churches understand *shuangfu*. Chen Mei-ju states, "If society's acceptance of the disabled is relatively slow the Church should be quicker because this is how Jesus did it."<sup>142</sup> Eden's leaders tend to form their argument for *shuangfu* around this simple Christology.<sup>143</sup> Liu Hsia puts their argument nicely when she explains that spiritual and social care find their balance in the ministry of Christ who served both as a theologian and a social worker; one who taught religion to help people to faith in a heavenly father and also healed the sick and cared for outcasts.<sup>144</sup>

In the hope that future church leaders would better understand and accept the disabled Eden has asked Chen Mei-ju to design a course on Eden's *Shuangfu* Theology for Taiwan seminaries. At the time this research was being carried out Eden had already taught the elective course as many as four times in two separate faculties in Taiwan Theological College, a Presbyterian center of learning whose welcome is related to a longstanding interest in social ministry and also to the standing of Jacob Chen, who is a respected advisor to the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan on questions related to social service.<sup>145</sup>

The classes taught in the Education Department were entitled, *Practicalities of Social Work among the Physically and Developmentally Disabled* while those designed for the Department of Church and Society were given the somewhat more theological title, *Shuangfu Work among the Physically and Developmentally Disabled*. Chen Mei-ju states the courses were designed to lead students along the same journey of discovery as Eden experienced. The classes are team taught with Eden employees lecturing on their practical work among those suffering disabilities. Lectures cover the experiences of the disabled in different life stages, the social and physical problems of individuals with disabilities, and efforts to transform society on behalf of the disabled. As Eden's

contextual experiences are explained students are given a chance to critique Eden's conclusions and discuss the theological meaning of these encounters.<sup>146</sup>

Eden was encouraged by their experience with the Presbyterians and has asked Chen Mei-ju to design a similar course for the seminary most influential among mainland-originating churches, China Evangelical Seminary.<sup>147</sup> In addition Eden leaders sometimes offer courses for local pastors and parishioners that teach about disabilities and how to serve and converse with those so suffering.<sup>148</sup> Jacob Chen argues that when welfare and gospel are combined a life that is very bad can be changed. He and Liu Hsia argue that the key to success is balance between word and deed.<sup>149</sup> Striking a balance, however, has proven difficult for the Foundation itself. Eden has been critiqued for being more social than spiritual.<sup>150</sup> Indeed it has already been shown that Eden's leadership is conscious of and dissatisfied by the fact.

To remedy the situation Eden concedes that it needs the help of the churches. Thus Eden not only seeks to change the churches, but the help of the churches in transforming the Foundation itself. Yu Li-cheng, a disabled pastor who was part of Eden's founding board, states that in the beginning relationships with churches were not important to the organization. Welfare and gospel needs could be balanced using internal resources. However as the organization developed Eden began to turn to local congregations for help with the gospel aspects of their ministry. Though a few general managers were able to successfully develop relationships with local churches it is reported that much remains to be done in this regard.<sup>151</sup> At the turn of the century Eden was commonly calling on local churches to counsel and receive those who expressed a desire to convert and inviting local pastors to speak at daily devotions. In addition the relationship sometimes involved requesting pastors to serve as advisors in local stations, recruiting volunteers from the churches, and holding Eden activities in church facilities.<sup>152</sup>

What Eden appears to be hoping for as it promotes its theology of *shuangfu* among the churches is that a mutual relationship will emerge that benefits the disabled. At the end of the Nationalist period Eden was only at the point of raising awareness among the churches regarding this neglected minority group. Eden hopes the churches will provide effective social and spiritual care, that through ministries of word and deed the churches will foster value and create hope among the disabled. To this end there is a vision that

Eden might serve as a resource center, offering churches advice regarding the specific needs of disabled members.<sup>153</sup> In addition Eden hopes that the churches will help its spiritual ministry. For those churches that are willing to help, Eden promises a ready audience of the disabled and their families.<sup>154</sup>

### *Conclusion*

In developing the term *shuangfu* Eden has sought to translate the Christian message into Chinese terms. Andrew Walls argues such efforts are basic to Christian mission. He explains that the incarnation, which was “the Word spoken all at once in the Son,”<sup>155</sup> was first translated in terms that were meaningful in a specific context, and that translating this same event into other cultures is essential to Christian mission. Walls states the goal of the endeavor is,

... releasing the word about Christ so that it can reach all aspects of a specific linguistic and cultural context, so that Christ can live within that context, in the persons of his followers, as thoroughly at home as he once did in the culture of first-century Jewish Palestine.<sup>156</sup>

*Shuangfu* does not represent Biblical terminology. It is theological construct that translates essential meanings into Chinese. It is an expression that helps explain, for example, the incarnation and kingdom of God in terms of holistic ministry and realized eschatology. Walls argues translation can have a powerful impact. It can reshape and expand Christianity, as it is understood in a particular context. Moreover it has the potential of turning the very language of a people toward Christ.<sup>157</sup>

A western theologian might object to *shuangfu* because it translates Christian mission in terms of two separate elements. Bosch, for example, critiques the *Lausanne Covenant* for separating evangelism and social action. In his estimation both are integral to mission. He argues against one component being given “a life of its own in isolation from the rest of the life and ministry of the church.”<sup>158</sup> It has been noted that the Presbyterian theology of providence could be used to support this same conclusion. Yet C. M. Kao explains that in Taiwan his denomination has also spoken of social concern and evangelism as two components of mission; as two legs and later, out of respect for the disabled, as the two wings that are needed for flight.<sup>159</sup> In a context where sacred

and secular are traditionally separated Presbyterians and Eden have chosen to explain mission in terms that can be readily understood, in terms of two entities inextricably bound together. Eden's argument is presented in a word that makes little sense in English. Yet in its context *shuangfu* explains that as a person is both physical and spiritual and as life is both temporal and eternal, so ministry that follows Christ must serve the whole person and be geared toward their whole existence.<sup>160</sup> Eden's goal in promoting a theology of *Shuangfu* is to help clients toward holistic health, to reshape and expand the understanding of Christian mission among Taiwan churches, and indeed to turn society at large toward Christ.

Lead People Turn (to) Lord (領人歸主)

### *Evangelism, Transformation for the Present*

Eden has not been hesitant to witness its Christian faith in society at large. Yet it has been shown that Eden does not see this as the equivalent of evangelism, the concerted effort to, in the words of Eden's mission statement, lead people to turn to the Lord. That Eden lists that which is the foremost concern of most churches as the last component of its mission statement is by no means a method of suggesting to the public that Eden is first and foremost an organization intent on serving the weak, and that its interest in converting others is of less importance. Nor does it suggest that Eden has appended the evangelistic ideal as an afterthought, as a means to appease board members like Liu Mei-shia. Professor Zhu Yin-po states that Eden's mission statement is *pai bi*, a form of expression that involves deepening layers of thought and rising emotions. By this definition Eden's final phrase can properly be defined as a crescendo, the deepest and most emotionally potent aspect of the Foundation's mission.

Liu Hsia explains,

The central goal is to offer them the gospel. Our hope is not that they just eat their fill. After getting warm clothing we want their spirits to receive a sense of belonging, and that they know their lives. And afterwards that their lives, when they have ups and downs or when they have difficulties, that they can ask God to be their God, to be their best support and strength. And, of course our hope is that one day when we are all in heaven we can be together for eternal life.<sup>161</sup>

Liu here reveals that evangelism for the disabled is not simply about ensuring salvation in the next world, though heaven and eternal life are a vital part of Eden's evangelistic message. The goal of evangelism begins with the present, with a relationship that offers support in the difficulties of this life. Robert Lin, a disabled general manager in Eden's Taipei offices, explains that those the Foundation ministers to are often distraught to the point of suicide.<sup>162</sup> Chen Mei-ju suggests immediately sharing about the joys of eternal life with such a group might turn their thoughts in the wrong direction. What those suffering disability first need to hear is what the gospel can do for them now.<sup>163</sup>

In an early publication the Foundation explained the present benefits of turning to the Lord as encouraging and making courageous. The disabled experience an immense amount of frustration and disappointment. Knowing God leads to an affirmation of the preciousness of life and, to again mention a theme common in Eden's ministry, the value of the individual. These comforting truths facilitate social encounter.<sup>164</sup> When Chang Lai-hao was asked what she shares with clients she summed up her message in almost the same terms. She teaches clients that each of them is valuable and that with God they can find peace and self-confidence.<sup>165</sup> Chen Mei-ju explains the peace,

I won't tell them if you believe in Jesus you will be successful. But I will tell them the most important thing, you will know there is one who will be with you, will love you, won't leave you, will help you face many things.<sup>166</sup>

The peace that Eden commends appears to mean an inner sense of well-being rooted in God's caring presence.<sup>167</sup> The meaning of self-confidence is clearly explained by Jacob Chen. Receiving charitable assistance without accepting the gospel can be like gaining the whole world but losing the soul. Such individuals can continually be poor in their own eyes, and thus become dependent personalities. When the gospel is received, however, a sense of self worth is imparted and the individual becomes less content to continually be an object of charity.<sup>168</sup>

### *Evangelism, Transformation in the Future*

The present benefits of turning to the Lord, then, are a relationship that provides comfort in times of trial and also the impartation of a sense of self worth that gives courage to

engage society. Eden, however, does not neglect the eternal aspects of salvation. One year after a first interview Chang was again queried regarding her message to clients. She added that she informs the disabled that when they depart to be with God they will be free from their disability.<sup>169</sup> This message is dramatized in the ministry of Lin Meichuang (林美專), the dynamic general manager of the southern districts. When Lin organizes memorial services for the families of Eden clients who have died in childhood she asks a member of the staff to offer a speech that the child would say, if able; a speech that thanks the family for their years of love and informs them of his or her well-being in heaven, where he or she can now enjoy health and where the child is waiting to welcome their parents. Lin does this, she says, because in traditional thinking a person who has died in childhood is blamed for having no filial piety, for giving nothing back to parents who have cared for the child. Relatives, Lin maintains, reject the afterlife of such a child. In such moments of crisis Lin finds it important to strongly affirm Christian faith in heaven.<sup>170</sup>

### *Evangelistic Methods*

Interviews with Eden's senior leaders reveal evangelistic service involves commending a Lord who brings peace, teaches self-value, and promises eternal blessings. Yet apart from broad guidelines about developing a respectful relationship when visiting the disabled, and suggestions regarding Bible verses that might be offered, Eden does not instruct new staff in what or how they should share.<sup>171</sup> Jacob Chen believes in respecting different styles and is hesitant to critique any out of belief that the Holy Spirit is orchestrating Eden's ministry. His only point is that individual Christians must themselves find a balance between word and deed.<sup>172</sup> This said, non-Christian staff report that some fellow employees can be overbearing. However the same note a different tone pervades the agency as a whole.<sup>173</sup> Among senior staff there seems to be an ethos regarding evangelism that stresses deeds before words, that when there is loving service the faith will naturally spread.<sup>174</sup>

Chang Lai-hao explains this in terms of Liu Hsia. Liu did not share her faith by means of careful reasoning. Rather she was honest about her own shortcomings yet also effectively demonstrated the love and power of God in her life to such an extent that her listeners felt envious.<sup>175</sup> Chen Mei-ju learned much the same strategy while serving in

Eden. When Chen began her ministry in Eden she followed techniques that originated in western churches, such as inquiring regarding assurance of eternal salvation. She later rejected this in favor of slow and sincere relationship building. When the chance for verbal sharing comes she explains to clients that she is learning to see the beauty in people that God sees. The reason there is so little love in society is that few look at others from God's perspective. Like Liu, Chen has learned to be open about her failures and admits her ministry is not perfect. Yet she explains that she is learning to love as God loves, and God never gives up on her. She then asks those she serves if they want this God.<sup>176</sup> According to chaplains Chang, Chen, and Peng Shu-fan, effective evangelism begins with loving each other well, that is living in such a way that others envy their lives and covet their God.<sup>177</sup>

### *Conclusion*

Eden's mission statement exhibits a marked enthusiasm for evangelism. James A. Scherer and William R. Burrows, theologians who examine the meaning of evangelism in mission, explain that in the west Christians commonly have feelings of guilt or embarrassment over efforts to convert others. Burrows suggests one of the reasons is that in western Christianity evangelism has been understood in terms of conquest. In Christian history missionary ministry has often been affiliated with efforts to colonize and Christianize. He believes that because of this legacy a certain distasteful militancy continues to pervade western evangelistic endeavors.<sup>178</sup> That evangelistic meetings are commonly referred to as "crusades," substantiates Burrows thesis.

The Eden Social Welfare Foundation differs in that it presents evangelism in terms of welfare rather than crusade. Leading people to turn to the Lord is not described as subjugation to the Lordship of Christ. The Eden staff see their efforts as facilitating well-being. This stress on conversion as bringing wellness sustains efforts for evangelism. Liu Yu-hsiu (劉玉琇), a Buddhist employee, notes that though some clients do not enjoy hearing about the Christian faith, every person who is a subject of Eden's ministry does hear the gospel. She explains the importance of the evangelistic ministry to Eden by way of illustration. Eden is willing to accept donations to their ministry from non-Christian religious groups.<sup>179</sup> However on one occasion an offering

was made by a Buddhist organization that requested the money be used only to serve the needy, but that there be no attempt to proselytize. Eden returned the funds.<sup>180</sup>

The fact that clients are not always receptive has not dampened Eden's enthusiasm. Early in Eden's ministry students wrote a letter to the government that protested being required to attend a period of daily devotions. They argued that public funds should not be used to promote religious activities. Eden's board met to discuss the matter and decided that if the government sought to limit their religious services they would reject government funds and continue as best they could.<sup>181</sup> In the words of Liu Hsia, "The central goal is to offer them the gospel."<sup>182</sup> Eden leaders are motivated by the conviction that clients who turn to Christ will secure a comforting relationship and a sense of self-worth in the present and eternal blessings in the future.

## CONCLUSION

The Eden Social Welfare Foundation demonstrates that Christian organizations are able to generate theologies that speak both to their particular context and to questions that concern Protestantism as a whole. To be sure their theology is not expressed in terms familiar in the seminaries. There is no mention of praxis, preferential option for the poor, or the need for a postcolonial reconstruction of Christian theology. Christian institutions are not theological seminaries. Nevertheless they are able to present the churches with theological insights relevant to their context.

The contribution Eden offers the churches can be entitled, *Shuangfu* Theology. This is a construct that defines mission in terms of "double blessing," or "double welfare." It affirms that welfare and gospel, when held together, bring blessing and health to body and soul in the present and in the future. It is in this sense that it understands Christian ministry as holistic. The term has particular relevance to its context, to an environment where many churches have long separated the social and spiritual and where social service has been considered an inferior, even unnecessary, enterprise. It is a significant message in churches where preaching is focused on the afterlife and where love is a theme commonly discussed yet the disabled who attend those churches feel neglected. *Shuangfu* Theology provides the churches of Taiwan with an innovative and

contextually dynamic understanding of their faith that anchors social ministry in Christian life.

## CHAPTER FIVE

### LIU HSIA

#### INTRODUCTION

A presentation of the theology of Liu Hsia, the founder of the Eden Social Welfare Foundation, is valuable in its own right for introducing the work of an important Chinese author whose writings have yet to be translated into English and, to this researcher's knowledge, have not been the subject of theological analysis. Yet it is also important to the final chapter of the thesis which will argue that though Eden and Liu have ministered on the margins of church life they have been able to generate innovative theologies with the potential of uniting churches long divided over text and context, theologies that root social service in Christian ministry.

After a brief introduction of Liu Hsia, the chapter will be divided into three sections. The first will present the literary genre by which Liu conveys her theology. It will be argued that this is entirely appropriate to a model endorsed by C. S. Song, who writes extensively about the method by which Christians should communicate in the Taiwan context. The second and third sections will introduce and analyze Liu's theology. It will be demonstrated that Liu offers an appropriate response to the needs of society and advances a contextual theology that integrates evangelism and social service.

#### Liu Hsia (劉俠, 1942 – 2003)

Liu Hsia was intimately acquainted with the problem of suffering. This is not only because of her work with the Eden Social Welfare Foundation. The previous chapter explained that since the age of 12 she suffered atrophic arthritis, a rare disease that left her in a state of constant pain, confined to a wheelchair, and also to long periods of isolation in bed. It also noted that this physical condition had limited her formal education to primary school.<sup>1</sup> However Liu was able to overcome, indeed utilize, her impediments. Among her contributions to society is a large body of literature published under the penname Xing Lin Zi (杏林子). Nineteen volumes of her prose have been used to support this study. Each of these can contain as many as 70 *sanwen*, a genre that

will be introduced in the following pages. These short stand-alone pieces vary in length from approximately 200 to 1200 words. Most of Liu's *sanwen* first reached their audience through publication in the literary pages of Taiwan newspapers and journals before being collected and published in book form.<sup>2</sup>

Though she is a successful author, Liu thought of herself as a social worker. She wrote:

What I write doesn't necessarily have more depth than the books of other authors. The difference is that the reader knows that I am setting myself as an example. So it is easy for them to accept my encouragement. ... I suffer their pain. I weep their tears. They identify with me. They have emotional resonance. I think I should not be called a writer. My writing is still far from the standard of good literature. My depth of thought and broadness of knowledge are not enough. I can only be called a social worker. Through the use of my pen I hope to spread a message that expresses the hope I have. By my lifestyle and life experiences I hope to tell the reader how to face suffering, how to overcome pain, how to be reassured that life is perfect among the shattered pieces, how to make yourself a sun when there is cloudiness all around.<sup>3</sup>

Liu is being humble when she denigrates her literary skill. In 1982 one of her books won the Republic of China's prestigious National Literature and Art Award.<sup>4</sup> Her *sanwen* are included in the nation's primary and junior high school Mandarin language textbooks. The Hong Kong and Singapore governments have also used her writings in their junior high school textbooks.<sup>5</sup>

This researcher has found Liu to be a profoundly eloquent author who engaged in an intense personal struggle to unite text and context, that is her Christian faith and a life in which suffering is constant. Though entertaining, Liu's literary contributions are purposeful pieces meant to teach. Liu explained they are modeled on Jesus who used "every sort of parable to lead people to believe in the Lord, to meet heaven's Father."<sup>6</sup> Clearly social ministry and evangelism were both part of Liu's agenda.

Sanwen:  
A Genre Appropriate to  
Christian Theology in Taiwan

Sanwen (散文)

*An Overlooked Genre*

Liu Hsia has written screenplays, poetry, and short stories. However she is primarily known for her *sanwen*, a form of literature closely related to the western essay that sinologists have only recently begun to examine. Over the last century there have been many anthologies of Chinese poetry and short stories published in English.<sup>7</sup> Yet there has not been one single volume devoted to Liu's chosen genre.<sup>8</sup> According to David Pollard, who in 2000 produced the first significant western study on the subject, there are two reasons for the oversight:

The first cause is that it is inherently difficult to talk about essay writing if the writing is in another language. Chinese critics are able to talk ... about characteristics and idiosyncrasies of style ... but to those who have ... only superficial knowledge of the Chinese language, such talk is not more than 'wind around the ears'. Given that personal style is so important to the essay, that is a major obstacle. If the commentator's intention is to commend the compositional merit of how an argument is put, that too is normally very difficult: there is nothing drier than a description of logical progression. The second, probably more basic, cause is the decline in the prestige of the essay in the Western world, a perception that it belongs more to journalism than literature.<sup>9</sup>

*The Development of the Genre*

The term *sanwen*<sup>10</sup> was originally used in the Chinese language to indicate any literature that was not verse. However in the early part of the 20<sup>th</sup> century the literati became aware of foreign writing and began to use the word for western essays. Western essays were different from most forms of traditional Chinese literature. Writing in China had predominantly adhered to strict rules of style that has been described as dignified,

impersonal, economical with words, and in a language that was distant from the vernacular. At the time of the transition from a dynastic to a republican form of government (1912), however, Chinese writers began to experiment with the western style. Some reacted against the colloquial language, familiar personal tone, and humor of the western essay. Others appreciated the form, finding similarities with transitory techniques that arose at intermittent periods in Chinese history. A sixteenth century style that prized folk stories and songs was especially valued. Thus the *sanwen* that developed at the beginning of the twentieth century seems to be a combination of an appropriated foreign form and a revival of dormant Chinese literary styles.<sup>1</sup>

The trend has continued in Taiwan, where writers continue to be responsive to literary developments in the west yet write as indigenous authors to a Chinese audience.<sup>2</sup> That the genre resonates with Taiwan readers can be seen in reports indicating it is at present the most popular form of literature in Taiwan.<sup>3</sup> An article in *The Free China Review* enthusiastically reports, "Ask seniors in high school to name three of Taiwan's best short story writers or essayists, and a lively discussion of numerous writers and their abilities will ensue."<sup>4</sup> The popularity of *sanwen* can be attributed to three factors. First, *sanwen* are easily accessible. Second, *sanwen* are written in a form appropriate to the contemporary lifestyle. Finally, Taiwan is a country in transition where the young and old alike are highly interested in the same topics.

### *An Accessible Genre*

From the time *sanwen* emerged in the early 20<sup>th</sup> century newspapers and magazines have been the vehicle by which *sanwen* have usually first reached their audience. Newspapers and magazines began to appear in China in the 1910s. Prior to that the written word was quite different from the spoken and those who read belonged to an intellectual elite. However in the early years of the century the education of citizens and a shift to writing in colloquial language made it possible for a large audience to enjoy the creative efforts of writers. From the very beginning newspapers in China followed then common western trends and carried literary pages devoted to short stories, poetry, and *sanwen*. The tradition has been carried on in Taiwan with literary pages being as indispensable to the public as sports pages are now in western nations.<sup>5</sup> As *sanwen* are short, stand-alone, pieces that can be printed in a single issue they are perfectly suited to

the medium. A western, modern-day, equivalent is the appearance of Bill Bryson essays in Britain's *Mail on Sunday*, which were eventually collected into the book *Notes from a Big Country*.<sup>6</sup> These short essays are similar to Taiwan *sanwen*, being first-person comments on Bryson's observations.

### *An Appropriate Genre*

Wang Chang-lin, an editor of a Taiwan daily with a circulation approaching 1.5 million, explains that the literature his newspaper publishes is an appropriate genre for the Taiwan readership because articles provide a "mental stopover" and an "intellectual oasis" for readers coping in a stressful urban environment.<sup>7</sup> Wang asserts that though the articles are necessarily short, they are good literature:

We wish to carry on a tradition of having a place where people can read beautiful written expressions of deep human sentiments.... Literary Chinese is a traditional style of expressing one's sentiments; it is a sophisticated style of narrative, and one that I believe readers want to see in our page.<sup>8</sup>

The style of writing that the people of Taiwan prefer fits their lifestyle. Brief, to the point, but carefully composed narrative is appropriate to an audience that Bo Yang, one of the most influential Chinese *sanwen* writers, describes as, "... having no time to delve into the realm of belles-lettres, no time to absorb revelations slowly or to accept transformation of character by example or to digest an author's meanings." Bo Yang insists that his audience demands "ideas that can be quickly translated into reality, allowing them to penetrate to the heart of visible problems instantaneously and find quick solutions."<sup>9</sup>

### *A Relevant Genre*

Popular *sanwen* have been closely related to developments in Taiwan society because of audience desire for discussion of specific themes.<sup>10</sup> In examining the relationship between literature and culture Chu Yen, a writer from Taiwan, describes some of the topics addressed during the 1970s and 1980s:

While other nations eyed Taiwan with admiration, people in Taiwan were worried by the deterioration of its quality of life. ... Success stories lured farmers into the city jungle.... Material comforts and carnal pleasures distracted youngsters from their duty and turned them into a debauched and lost generation.... All the cities were anxious over burglaries and sexual attacks. Dismaying traffic jams in the streets of big cities and excruciating industrial pollution everywhere symbolized the price Taiwan people had paid for the enviable economic success.... An insightful person would see that the family system and human relations in general were undergoing an even more radical change.<sup>11</sup>

Realistic writing that championed the cause of the poor and oppressed became popular in the 1970s. In the 1980s the trend continued with writers focusing on specific problems related to the social transition produced by urbanization. Women, who for the first time produced the majority of best-selling books, and native Taiwanese wrote with "sympathy for the underprivileged local elements"<sup>12</sup> and also addressed ecological and environmental issues, arguing for social justice and political reform.<sup>13</sup>

Reader concerns have forced Taiwan authors to make "lightning adjustments to economic and social modernization."<sup>14</sup> The result has been a great deal of quality literary output over the years. However David Pollard believes that through the 1990s *sanwen* became increasingly vapid with sketches about experiences and travels being common while quality "think pieces" were relatively few in number. He argues that in Taiwan there is a feeling that most of the important issues have already been discussed. Contemporary readers want simply to enjoy the skillful use of language in narrative and dialogue.<sup>15</sup>

Feminist writers disagree. An article published in 1999 on literary contributions by Taiwan women reports that many pieces relating to marital relationships, sexuality, careers for women, and child rearing are currently being produced.<sup>16</sup> An example is a *sanwen* in which a grieving grandmother writes that for forty years she had relied on her husband's leadership in the family and "missed out on the opportunity to develop her intellect and experience personal growth." The *sanwen* concludes, "I have written these words to remind my grandchildren's generation to learn to become independent as soon as they can, and to make good use of every opportunity to improve themselves."<sup>17</sup>

Though feminism remains an issue, critics agree that in general the writers of Liu Hsia's generation shared a mission that is not universally held today. Authors were serious about bringing about social change.<sup>18</sup> Liu's female contemporaries, for the first time having an education equal to that of male writers, struggled in a "stagnant, suffocating, cultural climate" that afforded them "only a conditional freedom of expression."<sup>19</sup> Incorporating elements of other literary devices such as folktales, poetry, proverbs, and drama into the traditional "heart to heart" of *sanwen*, they critiqued their culture and introduced a vision for a new society.<sup>20</sup>

### *A Political Genre*

The influence of stories on the ideology of a people becomes abundantly clear when examining the political manipulation of literature on both sides of the Taiwan Strait. A short political and polemical style of essay called *tsawen* (雜文) that was becoming popular in the early 1950's all but disappeared as parties became increasingly authoritarian. In its place a form of essay called "reportage" (*pao kao wen shui*, 報告文學) was used to spread propaganda.<sup>21</sup> In Taiwan the government urged writers to combat literature produced in the People's Republic.<sup>22</sup> Between 1956 and 1957, in a period known as the Hundred Flowers Campaign (百花運動), writers in the People's Republic were encouraged to openly express their ideas. Stories that were critical of the government were, however, quickly labeled "poisonous weeds" (毒草) and banned. One commentator responded: "Even if we ... see them as the cries of an owl, traditionally a bird of ill-omen in China, then could we expect to escape the misfortunes its cries augured by doing away with the owl?"<sup>23</sup> Yet it is the cry of the owl that alerts a people to a problem and affects change. Governments, realizing the power of literature, have tried to control the medium.

### *A Religious Genre*

In presenting their convictions about society, Chinese *sanwen* writers necessarily expose much about their personal philosophic and religious beliefs.<sup>24</sup> Chu Yen's article on the relationship between literature and culture in Taiwan, quoted above, reveals an author whom her editors portray as expressing "a cry from the heart: Where is the anchor?" to

which she has no answer. Editors explain that she is an individual who believes her contemporaries ...

... are caught up in what seems like a rudderless boat awash in cultural change and uncertainty, and whether they cling desperately to an outmoded tradition or follow the lure of an untested modernity, they do not resolve the crisis, because the society as a whole, while aware of the problem, has not come to any consensus about the resolution.<sup>25</sup>

Shi Tiesheng, a wheelchair-bound writer from China who is a contemporary of Liu Hsia, discusses the faith of *sanwen* writers as follows:

There is an element of religion in literature. A person writes when he wants to seek his way out of a predicament. ... Conventional people seek things related to the physical – longevity, family, or posterity. But, modern man seeks something spiritual, such as freedom. If I would characterize Chinese culture today, I would say that it is the search for a new ‘religious spirit,’ new ideals, and a new philosophy.<sup>26</sup>

Though the Chinese culture in which Shi is writing is different from that of Taiwan, the attempt by writers to resolve social issues by formulating a new philosophy or cultivating a new ‘religious spirit’ seems the same. Proposed solutions, of course, correspond to an individual’s personality and beliefs and can vary greatly. Liu Hsia explains:

The kind of life attitudes you have, the kind of ideas you have, the kind of faith you have, are all very easy to discover from your articles. ... I think that from reading an article you can recognize who the writer is. I have my own style. Other writers have their style. Of course ... some newspaper editors who are not Christian, or are against Christians, will request, “Can you write less about religion?” I will usually tell him, “I won’t deliberately write this. But, if you want me not to write about this it’s not likely, because my faith is a part of my life. I will naturally express it. I won’t especially emphasize this. But, I can’t reject that.”<sup>27</sup>

The power of the literature to transform the religious values of the Chinese has long been recognized. Wang Chong (王充),<sup>28</sup> who lived between 27 and 101 AD, wrote 87 essays in which he explicitly “set out to refute accepted myths, falsehoods and superstitions, using plain words, common sense and the evidence of experience.”<sup>29</sup>

Towards the beginning of the last century Liang Ch'i-ch'ao (梁辰魚),<sup>30</sup> who was scornful of many religious practices in China, wrote:

... to renovate morality, we must renovate fiction; to renovate religion we must first renovate fiction; to renovate manners, we must first renovate fiction; and even to renew people's hearts and remold their character, we must first renovate fiction. Why? It is because fiction exercises a power of incalculable magnitude over mankind.<sup>31</sup>

### *Conclusion*

This section has demonstrated that *sanwen* is a popular indigenous literary genre in Taiwan, where the population has been experiencing considerable social change. In its modern expression it has been a significant element in the rise of the newspaper as a vehicle of social and political discourse. The issues that have been addressed have echoed the concerns of the populace about urbanization, poverty, and gender. The intimate conversational style makes it appropriate for authors to communicate the religious principles that inform their opinions. The creative way storytelling, poetry, and drama have been integrated into the discussion have factored in its enthusiastic acceptance. While it is difficult to measure the extent to which literary commentary affects socio-political change, there are convincing arguments that *sanwen* have contributed to developments in Taiwan.

### C. S. Song: A Case for *Sanwen* in Christian Theology

#### *The Setting: A People in Need*

C. S. Song does not believe that Christians have responded appropriately to the anxiety that plagues his island. He censures Christian congregations in his homeland for their displays of wealth that supposedly reflect God's blessing in their lives. In large and beautifully constructed buildings, prosperous Christians testify about the success that God brings to the faithful.<sup>32</sup> To Song, those who advocate this lifestyle are "anything but holy."<sup>33</sup> Their messages and comfortable lives are an atrocity when living among a people who "need to be liberated at the very root of their being."<sup>34</sup>

A cornerstone problem in Asia, repeatedly addressed by Song, is for liberation from feelings of anxiety. Song relates the emotion to urbanization and politics.<sup>35</sup> He explains that there can be anxiety related to pollution, crime, economics, and distance from loved ones.<sup>36</sup> He also notes that authoritarian governments encourage anxiety so as to pacify the populace. To support this argument Song gives a case study from Taiwan where an employer intimidated a subordinate, manipulating the relationship to his advantage.<sup>37</sup> Song writes:

Once seized with fear and anxiety like that young factory worker, you become an easy target of manipulation by those who have power over you. You become socially inactive, politically compromising, or religiously submissive and reactionary. Unquestioned obedience to the political power and authority is taken for one's civil duty by citizens .... It is little wonder that those in power use fear and anxiety as their political instruments to keep themselves in power and keep people in their place.<sup>38</sup>

Song appeals for a dynamic Christian response, a response that begins with effective communication.

#### *A Relevant Response: Story Theology*

Song believes that story telling is a particularly effective method by which Christians can engage both those who cause and those who experience anxiety. An individual who attended a conference organized by C. S. Song stated:

There I realized the potential power of popular cultural—literary products as tools for crystallizing and articulating the most profound ideals, aspirations and longings of the common Asian who is often powerless, voiceless, exploited and oppressed. I saw that even the most seemingly harmless folklore stories can in fact be the vehicles of popular protest movement and, therefore, function as an object of theological exploration on the very theme of liberation in the Asia setting.<sup>39</sup>

Though Song advocates communication by means of story, he never mentions *sanwen*. Nor does he identify any specific literary genre as related to his task. Writing in general terms, Song simply argues that stories, whether they be folktales, drama, proverbs, or poetry, are helpful for “study on the nature of God, exploration into the mystery of God,

and reflection on God's activities in the world."<sup>40</sup> Song names the endeavor "story theology."<sup>41</sup> He recommends that Christians both study stories so as to understand God and use stories to express their convictions.

The reason Song draws attention to the subject of communication in Taiwan, a topic that would seem superfluous if writing to individuals who are part of the culture, is that he believes Christian communication has become dependent on artificial methods. Song maintains Christians have forgotten how to listen and interact in their own society. He attributes the problem to foreign influence.<sup>42</sup> Song advocates story theology as a means of redressing the foreignness of Christianity in Asia. His corrective begins by recommending Christians to formulate their theology in relation to indigenous stories. Understanding the theology inherent in these stories is important because, as Song eloquently expresses:

Theology is the poetry of God in the prose of the people. It is God's hymn in the songs of men, women, and children. It is God's story in the parables and folktales of our brothers and sisters.<sup>43</sup>

Stories thus enable Christians to better understand their world and their God. Song believes that stories contain theology because humans, regardless of the age or culture in which they live, have sought answers to the same cosmological questions.<sup>44</sup> More importantly however, stories contain theologically significant meanings because God is at work in people's experiences. Turning to the parables of the New Testament Song notes how Jesus carefully chooses commonplace topics in order to make his audience aware of the reality of God's presence in their lives. The result of Jesus' stories is the overcoming of anxiety and the creation of hope for people struggling in adverse circumstances.<sup>45</sup> Song finds the same principles at work in many stories from his own culture. Warning that these must be carefully thought through so as to avoid imposing foreign meanings on profound messages, Song finds that stories reveal that God has long been at work in Asia.<sup>46</sup>

Refusing to identify any specific culture, religious affiliation, period, or genre, Song asserts that the stories of Asia's past have implications for the present.<sup>47</sup> By carefully exploring these stories one can "search for and appreciate different shapes which the cultural dynamic of God's creation takes in different cultural and historical contexts."<sup>48</sup>

As Christians carefully listen to the stories, they should endeavor to participate by identifying themselves with their story's characters. When this has been accomplished, they have, so to speak, become part of a story and are thus empowered to retell the tale with Christian words.<sup>49</sup> Song believes this will enable the Christian message to seem less alien.<sup>50</sup>

Thus Christians in Asia should familiarize themselves with the stories of their culture and interpret these from the perspective of their faith. Song believes Christians ought also to create new stories. In doing this, they should refer to the images they encounter in daily life. Song writes that physical objects, daily necessities, social customs, even religious traditions and teachings, must be transformed into images and symbols before communication can take place."<sup>51</sup> By means of interpreting and creating stories then, Christians can effectively communicate their faith.

Song believes that unfortunately the Christians in Taiwan have not learned to communicate by means of images. He laments that many Christians have in fact withdrawn from society and are acting as a clique with a terminology and agenda that is unintelligible and irrelevant to their fellow citizens.<sup>52</sup> The challenge, he argues, is to be "relevant and viable," fulfilling a ministry to "relate the destiny of Asia to the message of the Gospel."<sup>53</sup> This is particularly challenging as it involves "reading meaning out of no-meaning, by making sense out of no-sense, and by giving witness to the presence and act of God in the midst of change."<sup>54</sup>

#### *A Relevant Response: Marketplace Language*

Song's challenge may seem a daunting task. Yet he suggests a starting point: the marketplace. The marketplace was the center of social life in Taiwan's recent past and had many parallels with the markets where Jesus would have formed his theology. According to Song it is there where:

... the most spontaneous selves of women, men, and children are found, where these selves expose who they are and what they think. ... It is where dramas of life are played, the moral strength of society is tried, and the ethical sensibility of one's faith is put to the test. In other words, it is a world in which human beings face the rigor of living in not always friendly company. ... It is also there that a

believer is confronted with naked forms of questions about God and humanity which are not packaged in the familiar language of faith....<sup>55</sup>

Effective interactions in this environment do not permit a Christian to give rote responses to challenging problems. Rather Christians braving the marketplace must reform their theology in relation to the realities they there encounter.<sup>56</sup> When successful, the Christian message is expressed in an indigenous idiom, and a gospel that at present seems foreign becomes vitally relevant.<sup>57</sup>

Christians, aware of both Biblical text and the stories of the cultures in which they live, have a unique knowledge of and responsibility to “make explicit the will and purpose of God in the powers of this world.”<sup>58</sup> Song argues, “... dialogues on social and political issues are fundamentally theological issues. In such dialogues the rulers and the ruled, the oppressors and the oppressed, all find themselves in the presence of God, their Judge and Redeemer.”<sup>59</sup>

#### *A Relevant Response: Social Action*

Song realizes the liberation of peoples will not come through dialogue with political parties alone. Action must accompany interpretation. Noting that there is often a disparity between the two, Song laments, “The separation of word from action or action from word is one of the greatest tragedies that has ever befallen man, for the health and truthfulness of his being depends essentially on the unity of word and action.”<sup>60</sup> In calling for Christians to physically respond to social problems, however, Song is not merely urging Christians to induce their governments to create a more just community. He encourages Christians themselves to form communities around perceived problems.

Inspired by Jesus’ story of the Good Samaritan,<sup>61</sup> Song critiques churches that respond to social needs as did the priest and the Levite of Jesus’ story. He urges Christians to be open and responsive to the needs of those who suffer. As the Samaritan’s reaction to the injury of the Jew led to something of a relationship between the two, so churches should take action on behalf of those who suffer, creating communities that welcome the needy.<sup>62</sup> The Church is not an institution but a people who demonstrate the reign of God. Their members, and those with whom they minister, are to be regarded with dignity and deserving of freedom and justice.<sup>63</sup>

When a community with these values is created, the community itself becomes a story that illustrates what God is doing in the world.<sup>64</sup> According to Song, this is not simply a good strategy for ministry but something that is integral to Christianity. Song believes, “The reign of God is down-to-earth. ... It is something that we act out in life and history ...”.<sup>65</sup>

### *Song's Rationale: The Power of Imaging*

C. S. Song's insistence that theologians concentrate on stories that are relevant to the people of the marketplace is an intentional corrective to the vestiges of western mission practice he finds in Taiwan.<sup>66</sup> Protestant Christianity took root on the island as a result of the efforts of missionaries who were influenced by the Scottish theologian Alexander Duff.<sup>67</sup> Duff, a missionary to India who espoused ideas developed during the Scottish Enlightenment, believed that when civil society develops to a certain point, people become responsive to the Christian faith. Accordingly, he offered a European education to Indian students in the hopes that they would hasten the transformation of Indian society.<sup>68</sup> His ideas seem to have been confirmed by frustrating early attempts at rational discourse in the Indian marketplace, about which he concluded:

Having thus found that you have no common ground, you are again driven to extremities and ready to exclaim, “O that I had the power of communicating the first principles of inductive reasoning – the elemental principles of experimental knowledge – that from these I might rise to higher results, and on them rear a nobler superstructure!”<sup>69</sup>

Song responds by urging theologians to ground their methods in Asian rather than foreign culture and identifies story as the most appropriate and powerful tool available, writing:

Ours is a culture shaped by the power of imaging, not by the capacity to conceptualize. It is a culture vibrant with the rhythms of life that cannot be abstracted into definitions, logic, and formulas. Such culture must lend itself to theological imaging.<sup>70</sup>

Song traces his methods to the ministry of Jesus, whose parables “deal with the things in life and nature, and not with concepts and ideas.”<sup>71</sup> Fully aware of the heartfelt concerns of those to whom he sought to minister, Jesus searched for symbols and created stories whose potency was in direct proportion to their relevance to life.<sup>72</sup> The success of Jesus’ approach has much to do with human nature. Made in God’s image, humans are endowed with “an imagination of the soul and the facility of words to tell over and over God’s story of creation as part of our stories and to integrate our stories into God’s story.” Song continues, “God’s image in human beings is thus the power to tell stories – the power of imagination and the power of words.”<sup>73</sup>

According to Song, human beings, and Asians in particular, have a God-given fondness for stories. In them God reveals God’s self. Song believes that, skillfully used, they are an effective means for both learning about and presenting Christian faith. Song writes:

The deeper we live our life, wrestling with it in agony and hope, the more thoughtfully we experience our own life and the life of others, struggling with ambiguity and tension, and the further we reach into fear and longing in the depth of the human spirit in our own life and the life of others, the more we live and experience parables of God’s reign in that life of ours and of others.<sup>74</sup>

### *Conclusion*

Song would have those who minister in Asia relate to their audience by story. According to Song, stories are a particularly powerful tool for Christian ministry in Taiwan. Listened to, they reveal God’s work. Correctly presented, they communicate God’s will. Faithfully lived, they demonstrate God’s reign. Properly used, they enable Christians to demonstrate that their religion is relevant in a country that has long perceived the faith as alien. Utilizing the language and logic of the marketplace, they can create hope in a people who, according to Song, are experiencing severe anxiety.<sup>75</sup>

However this cannot be done from a distance. As Jesus entered into the life situations of those who suffered and experienced the pain of those with whom he ministered, the Christian church must enter into and endure suffering.<sup>76</sup> No church that honestly relates with those who suffer can advocate a theology of physical comfort. Rather the congregation must also create a community that responds to the particular needs of those

in their area of influence. The result will be a powerful and culturally appropriate story that clearly communicates the gospel.

Song's method is helpful to this study as it verifies the appropriateness of *sanwen* for Christian ministry. *Sanwen* are authentically indigenous, responsive to the needs of the audience, socially concerned, used to prompt socio-political change, amenable to the application of folktales to contemporary problems, intimate, candid about religious faith, and attractive to a large audience. Thus, though Song does not actually mention *sanwen*, they are a form of story-telling that meets his criteria, and therefore have considerable potential as a means of communicating Christian theology in the language and style of the marketplace that western missionaries, following Duff, generally eschewed.

Liu Hsia:  
Writing an Indigenous  
Christian Theology in *Sanwen*

There is no indication that Liu Hsia's *sanwen* are written to examine pre-conceived subjects. Rather they seem to be created in spontaneous reaction to incidents that arise from her daily experiences. Suffering, for example, is a theme that underlies much of Liu's writing. Yet she makes no attempt to systematize her thoughts on the topic. It is, therefore, a challenging task to identify and integrate Liu's theology into a cohesive system. This chapter explains the interpretation and construction of this researcher. Others might develop different constructs.

#### Liu Hsia's Method

##### *An Intimate Exchange*

Liu Hsia's *sanwen* are concise, carefully composed, expositions on one visible or easily comprehensible problem that is relevant to the reader. Her corresponding thesis advocates a particular solution in which the reader can, should he/she so choose, participate. What makes Liu's *sanwen* interesting to the audience are the relevance of the topics analyzed, the brevity of the presentation, the beautiful or humorous

expression, the deep sentiments and informative insights, the interesting tales and the relationship that is created that seem to draw the reader into an intimate conversation with the author.

Though the structures of Liu's *sanwen* vary, stories and illustrations serve as the focal point of each exposition. These are typically ancient folktales, historical events from China and other nations, proverbs, poems, modern literature, movies, television programs, scenes from Taiwan's countryside, or events that Liu has herself experienced. From these, Liu develops her questions, frames her arguments, and presents her theses.

The stories Liu chooses to tell touching on Chinese culture show that she has read widely and thought deeply about the meanings in Chinese history and literature. Her stories include ancient folktales that relate the foibles and exploits of kings and sages,<sup>77</sup> verses from Chinese poets,<sup>78</sup> and Chinese proverbs.<sup>79</sup> Accounts of international events also prove that Liu is an informed writer. She is able to recount stories related to the experiences of Alexander the Great, Francis of Assisi, Beethoven, Abraham Lincoln, Helen Keller, and even the actor Ronald Reagan in the film *Elmer Gantry*.<sup>80</sup>

This said, it is important to note that the largest part of Liu's stories consist of uncomplicated, and even mundane, recollections of personal experiences and accounts of current events. Descriptions of encounters with small children, soldiers, and farmers, her thoughts after reading an article in the newspaper, looking over a scenic vista, enduring long journeys in heavy traffic, and having conversations with friends are commonly used. By means of these illustrations Liu builds a relationship with an audience who have had similar experiences.

When Liu's illustrations involve describing her personal behavior in a given situation, she portrays herself in a somewhat negative light. A journey to a speaking engagement in a broken down old truck with no windows at first makes her angry. But good experiences follow and teach her that pessimism should have no place in her life.<sup>81</sup> She does not notice beautiful flowers lining the road in her hurry to get to work in the morning. She notices them on the way home and contemplates the many joys she has been too busy to appreciate.<sup>82</sup> Friendly and joyful little children serve as correctives to her cold and dark moods.<sup>83</sup> When she writes of her illness and the severe pain she has

experienced, Liu carefully explains the lessons she has learned with the reader without concealing the angst she has experienced in the process.<sup>84</sup>

Liu adopts this modest tone in order to develop a relationship with the reader. *Sanwen* have been defined as a type of literature that involves having a “heart-to-heart” with the audience.<sup>85</sup> Liu accomplishes this by writing as a humble, imperfect, individual. She avoids expostulating on her theories from any position of authority. Rather she strives to create a bond by explaining what she has learned in stories that she has found personally helpful.

### *Christian Intent*

Liu’s *sanwen* assign symbolic meaning to her encounters. Rugged mountain peaks represent her life before discipline formed her into the nicely rounded stones found by the mouth of the river.<sup>86</sup> The disjointed poetry that a mentally disabled man writes signifies the genius that lies in each soul.<sup>87</sup> A precious bracelet can symbolize the handcuffs of slavery.<sup>88</sup> Liu’s gift is, in the words of C. S. Song, in “reading meaning out of no-meaning”.<sup>89</sup> Some of her observations seem innovative. Others, at least to a Christian, appear to be obvious retellings of parables and Biblical concepts. In each she seeks to offer relevant and instructive insights into Christian faith in a culturally appropriate idiom.

Though Liu’s writings are rooted in her Christian faith, there is no indication that she approaches the Biblical text in a scholarly fashion. References to Biblical sources do not appear to be systematic studies of a given passage. Her *sanwen* often make both explicit and implicit reference to Biblical material, yet they usually do not seem to have their origins in Biblical reflection. Rather Liu Hsia’s *sanwen* seem to be created in spontaneous reaction to the stories that illustrate her writings. These tend to flow from life to the Bible rather than vice-versa. The titles she gives her *sanwen* make it difficult to determine the lesson that will follow. The writings that directly discuss her beliefs appear to be written in relation to her personal piety rather than to provide intentional support of any theological treatise.

Those collections of *sanwen* that have been published by Christian publication houses contain pieces in which her faith is candidly expressed. However only 2 of the 19 volumes of Liu's *sanwen* in this researcher's possession are by Christian publishers, and even in these volumes Liu is careful to involve readers who do not share her religious views. God is referred to as "Creator" (造物主), as was sometimes the case in pre-Christian China.<sup>90</sup> In this way, God is depicted as being in relationship with all creation and thereby with the audience.

Moreover, Liu is an optimist who finds every situation infused with meaning.<sup>91</sup> All of her readers are included in the good intentions and hope she delineates in her *sanwen*. Those readers who do not share her Christian faith will find that Liu is complimentary of those aspects of other faiths that she finds admirable. She writes of her gratitude when a Buddhist nun brought an offering to help the Eden students.<sup>92</sup> She openly praises the efforts of another Buddhist nun for founding the Buddhist Compassion Relief Tzu Chi Association, a ministry Chapter Two noted caused many Christians to reappraise their views on social service.<sup>93</sup> Yet Liu can be critical when religious beliefs lead to a withdrawal from social interaction.<sup>94</sup>

Her stories are not a transparent attempt at converting others. Nor do they uncritically espouse standard Christian doctrines. Rather Liu's *sanwen* demonstrate an individual who struggles to find authentic solutions to complex problems and shares her findings with her friend, the reader. She does not, for example, avoid the question of why there is physical suffering in the world. However, the answers she gives to the dilemma vary. Each time she struggles with the question her conclusions add a different shade of meaning.<sup>95</sup>

### *Community*

Liu's writings are grounded in life experiences through the communities that have been fundamental to her formation. For Liu, socialization began with family, school, and long periods of hospitalization. However during her literary career Liu's marketplace experience was in relation to her Eden Social Welfare Foundation. Many of Liu's *sanwen* address the particular problems of the foundation's clients and staff. Others attend to external relationships in which she defends the policies of the agency to society

as a whole, challenging outsiders to come to terms with the needs of those suffering disabilities. Liu's message shows clear marks of being formed in response to the realities she there encountered.

The importance of family and hospital can be attested to by the many episodes Liu recounts in order to illustrate and substantiate her arguments.<sup>96</sup> She has produced an entire volume of *sanwen* in honor of each of these.<sup>97</sup> Liu's pen name, "Xing Lin Zi," further indicates the importance of these communities for her writing. The name means "Apricot Forest." Her family village in China, near Xian, was called "Apricot Forest."<sup>98</sup> "Apricot Forest" is also a widely used term in Chinese to refer to good physicians and clinics, having origins in an ancient legend of a physician who treated patients free of charge if they would plant apricot trees.<sup>99</sup> By means of her pseudonym Liu seeks to honor both her family and those who have cared for her health.

The influence of communities in Liu's life can be seen in the way she organizes "Live Well, Die Well," a piece that it is also helpful as it demonstrates the structure of a *sanwen*. The text begins with Liu introducing her topic by recounting a conversation with a friend. She then clarifies and expands the theme by reminiscing about her childhood experiences in a hospital. Next she intensifies the discussion by showing how the matter personally affected her, explaining that her father's attitude caused her considerable anxiety. After this Liu's ministry at her Eden Social Welfare Foundation is mentioned. This serves to both illustrate that Liu's problem is relevant to a large number of people and to make a transition, demonstrating that a solution is possible. The *sanwen* continues with Liu resolving the dilemma in precisely the same way as she presented the problem. By means of a conversation with friends, an incident with her mother, an occurrence related to ministry with Eden, and an episode in her family Liu progressively elucidates her thesis. In a manner common in Liu's *sanwen* the thesis is expounded in a climactic poem.<sup>100</sup>

Here Liu uses her characteristic method of developing and resolving her theme by alternating between illustration and application. At each stage of this particular piece Liu presents her arguments by means of illustrations rooted in her community experiences. Not all of Liu's *sanwen* directly mention family, hospital, or Eden. Yet in

order to create a relationship with the audience and to ground her philosophy in real life experiences, Liu does often utilize a community, the most important being Eden.

The topics of Liu's *sanwen* usually correspond to Eden ministry. However Liu's writings are not simply promotional materials for her foundation. Though her *sanwen* often mention those suffering physical and mental disabilities, Liu also addresses difficulties faced by a wide variety of disadvantaged individuals. Thus her stories can refer to the frustrations of individuals struggling in crowded urban environments, those experiencing depression, the elderly, unwed mothers, convicted criminals, juvenile delinquents, etc.<sup>101</sup> In each case Liu proposes solutions designed to facilitate both the emotional and physical well-being of all Taiwan citizens.

### *Conclusion*

Liu Hsia writes in the tradition of *sanwen* writers of her culture and generation. By means of well-crafted pieces of literature incorporating elements of folktale, poetry, proverb and drama, these authors critiqued and presented a vision for improvements in the socio-political culture of Taiwan. Liu's *sanwen*, like those of her contemporaries, are short pieces of literature that are accessible, entertaining, relevant, personal, and convey (as will be seen) a scheme for a healthy society.

Like other writers of *sanwen*, Liu makes clear her philosophic and religious beliefs. Though she has not studied theology and is in no sense a systematic theologian like Song, her writings indicate an understanding of Christian ministry that has much in common with Song's system. Liu both reflects on the stories of her culture and tells new stories in response to her experiences. Christian meanings seem drawn out of these in a way that would enable an audience whose culture is "shaped by the power of imaging"<sup>102</sup> to appreciate her faith. Moreover writing in close relationship to the communities to which she belongs gives Liu an authentic "marketplace" voice, grounding her writings in relevant issues. Liu Hsia has found a culturally appropriate method for communicating her Christian convictions.

## Liu Hsia's Message

### *Suffering*

Suffering is a pervasive theme throughout Liu Hsia's *sanwen*. Her writings reveal an individual who is intimate to the subject. She has herself long lived in a state of severe and constant physical pain.<sup>103</sup> She has experience with the emotional suffering that accompanies disability in Taiwan.<sup>104</sup> She is sensitive to the anguish that accompanies grief.<sup>105</sup> She is conscious of social travail, addressing problems such as the negative effects of urbanization on her island.<sup>106</sup> Her many *sanwen* detail the painful realities with which the people of Taiwan struggle.

Nevertheless, Liu's *sanwen* are optimistic. She opens one collection with a piece extolling the glory of nature. A world made over long periods of time and with such wisdom, she concludes, demonstrates God is love. That humans are created in such a way as to be able to enjoy this beauty further proves her point. People are meant to take pleasure in life.<sup>107</sup> Liu criticizes an artist who bought a house with a view, yet complained the interior was not as large as he hoped. She argues that the whole vista was his. In fact the whole world belongs to all humanity and is a gift given for their delight.<sup>108</sup>

Liu writes to advise her readers on how to find the happiness they are meant to enjoy in a world where suffering can be intense. Yet collections of Liu's *sanwen* systematically examine neither joy nor pain. Rather they predominantly contain pieces written over a particular period of time. A wide variety of issues related to environmental, social, and individual problems can be discussed in any one volume. A careful reading of these, however, reveals that the response Liu encourages is consistent. The reader is to seek both emotional and physical health. In this case, "physical" is used in the widest possible sense, including both the body and the environment.

### *Emotional Health*

Liu relates the means by which she attained emotional health in a *sanwen* that begins by describing the hopeless feeling she had when she first became sick. She had been an

active child. With the advent of her painful illness, however, she was forced to drop out of school and was confined to home and hospital. She felt she could find few reasons to live and considered suicide.<sup>109</sup> But after she became a Christian, there was a very real change in her life.<sup>110</sup> Liu's faith led her to accept the classic conundrum that God is simultaneously all-powerful, benevolent, and lets good people suffer.<sup>111</sup> A process was begun that ended in Liu being convinced that life is good and has a rational meaning.<sup>112</sup>

This conviction naturally led Liu to explore possible explanations for suffering. She most often concludes that suffering is related to education. Liu typically presents her theories by means of vivid illustrations. Boatmen stabilize their vessels to face high seas by filling the hull of their ships with stones.<sup>113</sup> Straight and fast highways are the most dangerous. People get sleepy and accidents are common. Winding and hilly roads, however, make one alert.<sup>114</sup> Military recruits do tasks that they do not understand. The result is disciplined and well-trained soldiers.<sup>115</sup> Flowers bloom best after being trimmed.<sup>116</sup> The rushing river makes sharp but fragile rocks smooth and hard.<sup>117</sup> In each of these examples difficulties lead to an improved character.

Liu is conscious that in attempting to find the good in suffering she is countering the anxiety that accompanies pain. She credits Abraham Lincoln as expressing that the best way to defeat an enemy is to make him your friend and applies this principle to suffering.<sup>118</sup> Though there is often nothing that can be done to change one's circumstances, one is able to develop an attitude that rises above the difficulties. She has succeeded to the point of being able to write that her illness has awakened her to the many blessings she has and has also helped her develop courage. She declares, "Life is a school and suffering is a class I'm glad I took."<sup>119</sup>

This is not to say that Liu believes suffering itself is good. It is an enemy. Though suffering can bring good Liu insists that it is not a gift from God. However, God allows it for special purposes.<sup>120</sup> Illness has brought good to Liu, but it is not a friend. She does not try to make light of suffering or provide answers for all the pain people experience. When writing of a woman who lost everything, her whole family and all her possessions in a devastating earthquake, Liu does not suggest the blessings that might come to the woman in her loss. She clearly describes the horror and simply teaches that sometimes all one can do is not give in.<sup>121</sup>

One cannot always understand the reason for suffering. Yet one's emotional state can make a great difference.<sup>122</sup> Liu argues that even with severe limitations one can find real joy. One of Liu's fables relates a conversation between a bird and a flower. The bird boasts that he can fly. The flower says that he can too. The bird wonders how, as the flower is anchored to the ground. The flower replies, "You use your wings to fly. I use my heart to fly."<sup>123</sup> Liu rejects the idea that one must wait until the next life to find happiness. She believes that the peace and joy of heaven can be experienced here and that all individuals should make an effort to acquire these while they are still alive.<sup>124</sup> To this end Liu advises both active and passive responses to suffering.

### *Active and Passive Responses*

Liu's message is important in a country where, she informs us, many with disabilities feel certain they are useless and thus have no ambition.<sup>125</sup> The feeling is often enhanced by the popular belief in fate. People are certain their luck is bad and there is little they can do to change their condition.<sup>126</sup> Fortunetellers often confirm the prognosis. When Liu herself was very young a relative who practiced fortune telling predicted she would be a failure.<sup>127</sup> Liu strongly opposes the notion and argues that the things some people call good luck, like health and wealth, do not necessarily bring happiness.<sup>128</sup> One can be both joyful and productive with what some would call "bad luck."

Liu counsels those with "bad luck" to think of the term in new ways, to overlook the ignorance of others, and to work hard to have a productive life.<sup>129</sup> Liu herself learned of the individual's power over emotions when she was young. In Taiwan one's personality is believed to be linked to one's type of blood. A friend who knew her guessed she had type "O" blood because she seemed emotionally strong. The friend guessed correctly and Liu consciously changed her personality by acting brave when she felt weak. She now sees the episode as a sort of training that affected her future life.<sup>130</sup>

Liu believes in self-determination.<sup>131</sup> Yet, she also believes in fate of a certain type; events are under the control of a divine power. Liu's belief that this power is friendly gives further impetus for encouraging a positive attitude. One should live aware of the many blessings that have already been given.<sup>132</sup> Furthermore, one can experience divine

comfort in present difficulties and anticipate help in future endeavors.<sup>133</sup> Life itself is a gift from God and those to whom it is given are valuable and have dignity.<sup>134</sup> This is a novel message in a society where the majority not only believes in “bad luck,” but also in a cosmology that teaches suffering is related to punishment.<sup>135</sup>

Liu tells several fables that elucidate her ideas regarding the attitude that an individual who suffers should maintain. In one she presents a flower who complains on sunny days because the weather is too hot and on rainy days because the humidity makes it uncomfortable.<sup>136</sup> In another tale a flower complains to the Creator that people smell its fragrance, delight in its beauty, and eat its stem. “What else do you want from me?” questions the agitated flower. The Creator responds, “I want you to stop complaining!”<sup>137</sup> These transparent stories of blessed flowers are especially enlightening when one sets them beside two of Liu’s fables about weeds. A weed that, unlike the flowers faces serious problems, has struggled to live despite being beaten down by wind and rain. It uses its dying breath to assert, “You have taken my life but I keep my dignity!”<sup>138</sup> A story that follows immediately after tells that in the spring the weed returns, amazing those who had tried to kill it the previous year.<sup>139</sup>

Here one sees parallel thoughts about coping with suffering. One should live contentedly, whatever the circumstances. Yet the individual must also struggle to overcome. One must be determined and oppose false meanings imposed by society, yet should also refuse to entertain the anxiety that can arise when facing difficult circumstances. One must open oneself to the goodness that surrounds and receive the blessings that Liu testifies have transformed her life.<sup>140</sup>

Liu presents the concept in a different way when writing for a strictly Christian audience. Writing a humorous parody of the kind of martial arts’ novels that young Chinese teenagers like to read, Liu teaches four explicitly Christian *kung-fu* moves, or lessons, that can help one “blow away troubles as the wind blows away dry leaves.”<sup>141</sup> The first two of these apply to the internal life of the individual facing difficulties.

Lesson one is obedience. Obedience means accepting God’s will even when it is difficult. Jesus suffered to complete God’s plan. Paul knew his “thorn in the flesh” was from Satan, but after praying three times for it to be removed, this man of faith found

God's blessing could be even more greatly seen in his weakness and submitted himself to God's purpose.<sup>142</sup> Liu, with less faith than Paul, took longer to learn the same lesson. She has finally stopped praying for healing and now focuses on obeying God even when she doesn't understand God's purpose.<sup>143</sup> Liu concludes, "God wants us to obey, not to surrender, feel self-pity, be hopeless, be bitter, or give up. Since we believe in the love of God we must have faith in God's plan in our lives and God's work through us."<sup>144</sup>

The second Christian martial arts' lesson involves offering oneself to God. When praying for a sick person, for example, it is better to offer the patient to God than to ask for healing. The same should be done regarding one's own burdens. This implies complete trust in a God who has a plan and is able and willing to help the individual who suffers.<sup>145</sup>

Lesson one corresponds to Liu's ideas regarding self-determination. An individual can decide to accept and obey God's will, however difficult. This requires effort and may lead one into an interpretation of experiences that is in opposition to the status quo. Lesson two relates to the acceptance of God's divine and friendly power and leads to a sort of release. One can enjoy the many blessings that are given.

In a fable, entitled "Eden on Earth," Liu describes a conversation between a bird and a fish over the polluted environment in which they live. Each would enjoy life more if the air and the water were clean. They ask when heaven will come. The Creator tells them that heaven is in their hearts.<sup>146</sup> Liu believes that individuals are empowered with an ability to overcome negative experiences. When facing problems people should not resign themselves to the predicament, but adjust their attitudes so as to live full and joyful lives.<sup>147</sup>

### *Physical Health*

The response to suffering that Liu recommends involves not only seeking emotional health, but also physical wellness. That one should not give up but continue to struggle against illness is an important part of Liu's message. She criticizes a woman for valuing a scholarship to study in the United States over her health when she disregarded doctor's orders to remain in a Taiwan hospital.<sup>148</sup> She is also upset with a man who had a

disease that was similar to hers. Because of his pessimistic attitude he isolated himself from all activities. This resulted in total physical paralysis about which Liu had warned him.<sup>149</sup> Thus when there are possibilities to improve one's physical health one should make every effort to do so.

When writing about physical well-being, however, Liu most often asks the reader to be responsive to the needs of others. She would have her readers work to improve social and environmental ills.<sup>150</sup> A *sanwen* in which Liu tells about her feelings after meeting wounded soldiers helps explain her attitude. She considered the soldiers to be heroes for sacrificing themselves to repel an attack from the People's Republic of China. She argues that, like these soldiers, her readers can be heroes. In many ways life is a war. One should fight for what is right.<sup>151</sup> Liu writes:

I suddenly discovered that I also could be a hero; not just me, every person can -- for life, for environment, for ideals. We can contribute our blood and tears and never give up. We can fight to the end. We can become our own hero in the battles in our life. To be a hero doesn't mean not having any moments of fear, it involves not being conquered by fear. To be a hero doesn't mean there is no time of failure, it means never to be defeated by failure. ... Life is process of challenges. We don't ask that the sufferings go away, but that we can overcome suffering. It's not important whether we win or lose but that there is a heart willing to fight.<sup>152</sup>

In this short paragraph the two fronts on which one must struggle are apparent. Internal, emotional, battles related to anxiety, cynicism, and hopelessness can be won. External, physical, battles must also be fought. One should struggle for the welfare of others. Liu believes that heaven starts in the heart. But she also encourages her readers to exert themselves to make the world a "garden of joy" as she has tried to do in founding the Eden Social Welfare Foundation.<sup>153</sup>

### *Social Objectives*

In urging her readers to struggle for the well-being of others Liu is careful to explain her objectives. Certainly not every group agrees as to the composition of the ideal society. In one *sanwen* she describes a friend who believes it is better to die rather than live with a serious disability like cerebral palsy. In this way one will not be a burden to others.

Liu rejects the idea arguing that a world that supported such a concept would quickly develop into an abysmal place with increasingly demanding standards regarding who has the right to live. Once people under a certain IQ score would be eliminated, for example, a new low would be determined and there would be a need to dispose of still others.<sup>154</sup>

The healthy society that Liu envisions involves not culling but serving the disadvantaged. It entails sacrificing oneself for the good of others. Liu is unhappy that many give up on Taiwan and immigrate to the west.<sup>155</sup> She urges them to remain and work for the good of society.<sup>156</sup> Liu's ideology has led to her using her own expertise to care for people suffering disabilities. In so doing much of her energy is spent on advocating a proper social response to the needs of this specific group.<sup>157</sup>

Liu's patronage goes beyond requesting acts of charity so that the disadvantaged receive proper physical care. She urges communities to allow them to participate in social life and be treated as equal citizens.<sup>158</sup> Liu has successfully lobbied for the employment rights of those suffering disabilities.<sup>159</sup> Yet, in demanding equal treatment, Liu commends those who justly hold persons with disabilities responsible, praising one employer for dismissing a disabled woman because he both gave her an opportunity and held her accountable.<sup>160</sup> Thus in Liu's model, both those who help the disadvantaged and those who are being served have responsibilities to each other.

One of Liu's fables describes an encounter between a kangaroo and a beggar. The kangaroo apologizes for not being able to offer money, as he is equally poor. The beggar shook the kangaroo's hand and said, "Thank you." The Creator explains to the confused kangaroo that the kangaroo had given the most valuable gift: fellowship and dignity.<sup>161</sup> In another piece she commends the slogan that the Seven-Eleven convenience store chain adopted to raise money for her foundation: "Lead You, Be with You, Go Forward Together" is much better than giving out of pity as it entails building a relationship with the disadvantaged.<sup>162</sup>

Developing meaningful relationships in modern Taiwan, however, is not easy. Liu believes that urbanization has made the process especially difficult. Urban dwellers tend to be afraid of strangers and, image conscious, reticent about revealing their weaknesses.

Yet Liu asserts that if an individual is willing to enter into an honest reciprocal relationship, helping and being helped, many blessings will follow.<sup>163</sup>

In one of her *sanwen* Liu shares a letter written to her by a woman who was pretty, had a good education, had enough money, and was happily married with healthy children. However the woman felt that something was missing in her life. What she is missing, Liu confidently asserts, is service. Liu advised her to open her heart and leave her safe world. If she would “rejoice with those who rejoice and weep with those who weep”<sup>164</sup> in an imperfect world, her life would become meaningful.<sup>165</sup>

Liu encourages involvement by recounting the blessings she has received through her service. On one occasion she visited a girl with disabilities who taught Liu about joy in trials.<sup>166</sup> In two different *sanwen* Liu explains how she was moved by the concern of a young man with developmental disabilities whom Eden had helped with vocational training. After getting a job at a McDonalds restaurant he tried to offer his salary to the foundation. At another time, seeing how tired she was, he asked her to rest and innocently offered to take over leading Eden until she recovered her strength.<sup>167</sup> Liu also describes the enjoyment she had in fellowship with blind students who would seriously ask her questions like the color of the wind.<sup>168</sup>

It is significant that in this case Liu uses herself in examples of the blessings that come to those who serve others. Liu asks those who suffer to serve. Christian martial arts’ lessons one and two, introduced above, apply to a person’s internal life. When Liu introduces lessons three and four she focus on externals. Number three teaches that the reader is to witness and number four that the individual is to glorify God. One should live a life that both positively impacts the community and brings glory to God.<sup>169</sup> Liu expounds upon what she means by “witness” with a short poem,

If we call God light, but walk in darkness;  
If we call God the way, but are far from righteous way;  
If we call God love, but are selfish and envious;  
If we call God fair, but cheat and act craftily;  
If we say, “Peace and joy,” but have a downcast face;  
If we say, “God gives encouragement and power, but hesitate and doubt;  
If we say, “God is all powerful,” but don’t have full faith in God;  
If we do these things, how can we show others to help them trust in God?<sup>170</sup>

It is important to note that Liu's poem was not written to a general audience of Christians, but specifically to those who are suffering. The first segment of each line touches upon what the Christian believes. This is immediately followed by a corresponding action that would negate the faith. Stated in positive terms, the Christian who suffers should walk in light, live righteously, focus on the needs of others, be generous, smile, act with courage and confidence, and live in hope.

Liu's *sanwen* to audiences that do not share the faith indicate that she encourages much the same response from them.<sup>171</sup> Thinking perhaps of the Chinese concept that one who receives a gift is obliged to give something in return, Liu argues that love comes to those who suffer from family, friends, and society. Those who receive are also obliged to give.<sup>172</sup> The contribution one is able to make to others varies greatly according to one's condition. Liu tells the disabled that what one has to offer is not so important as what one does with what one has.<sup>173</sup>

Liu encourages her readers to exert themselves for a healthy society. In regards to those who suffer her objective involves improving society by offering not charity but relationships between the healthy and the disadvantaged. She is concerned that many in her culture have misplaced values, writing that babies laugh and cry for themselves but her readers should laugh and cry for others.<sup>174</sup> In one case she censures popular culture by describing her youthful delight in finding a beautiful butterfly. On being told it was actually a moth she threw it away. Her childhood prejudices are then compared with those who judge others by their appearance and position.<sup>175</sup> Liu finds no value in the struggle to achieve an elevated social status. She warns her readers that life is short and one can take nothing to the other side.<sup>176</sup>

One can, however, leave something behind. Liu compares the Buddha and Jesus to the many powerful figures in history and notices that the powerful leave only ruins while the Buddha and Jesus have left something significant that lasts to the present day. The difference, Liu contends, was that the two had love.<sup>177</sup> In one of her fables, Liu tells of a conversation between river water and rocks. The water asks the rocks why they are in the way. The rocks respond, "To make you beautiful. To make your life feel exhilarating and vibrant."<sup>178</sup>

This story suggests that one of the reasons for suffering may be for the good of society. Problems bring people together.<sup>179</sup> The negative effects of urbanization, like the alienation and anxiety mentioned by Song, can be overcome when people enter into meaningful fellowship with others.<sup>180</sup> Thus a proper response to a need achieves Liu's ends of both improving the environment and the emotional health of activists. When this happens Liu's martial arts' lesson number four is achieved. God is glorified.<sup>181</sup>

### *Conclusion*

Liu clearly writes in the tradition of Taiwan *sanwen*. She speaks in a personal and intimate way with her audience. She struggles with the issues that concern them and offers a vision for a better life that is based in her religious convictions. According to C. S. Song's criteria, Liu has developed her theology in a contextually dynamic manner. She addresses the very issues that Song identifies as crucial in Taiwan. Her solutions incorporate the stories of China and are, in turn, told in a way that can be accepted by those responsive to imaging. Her ideas are by no means rote responses to problems encountered at a distance. Rather Liu is intimately aware of her subject and wrestles to find an authentic meaning. That Liu's approach is authentically Asian cannot be doubted.

The message that Liu offers sets the human reality of suffering, based in her own experience, within a belief in the omnipotence and essential goodness of God. Suffering is not good in itself and may be experienced as the enemy of well-being, but she does not allow the reality of suffering to distort her essentially optimistic view of life. Even one who suffers intensely can enjoy a life that is full and meaningful. To this end Liu encourages her readers to emotional and physical well-being. These can be achieved through a combination of passive acceptance of suffering and active overcoming of its impediments. Her passive acceptance is not a negative resignation but a positive embracing of God's will in suffering, a will that Liu tries to explain but essentially remains a mystery. Activity involves endeavoring to carry out what is known about the will of God. To this end Liu defines society as it should be, a society in which the healthy and suffering serve each other, thereby creating a healthy physical and emotional environment.

## Liu Hsia's Theology in Context

To a trained theologian Liu's ideas may seem threadbare. The fundamental starting points for discussions of theodicy are affirmed in Liu's writing. God is omnipotent and good. Evil is a real force in conflict with these affirmations.<sup>182</sup> Yet Liu does not grapple with the paradox. She merely affirms that suffering is an enemy that one is to actively overcome and also that suffering be understood as *permitted* by God for good ends. Liu simply does not seek to explain suffering in origin and nature.

To dismiss Liu's theology as superficial, however, would be to fail to interpret Liu in context. She writes as a Chinese author to a Chinese audience, assuming a common worldview. As C. S. Song emphasizes, hers is "a society dominated by Confucian culture."<sup>183</sup> When one examines Liu's theology in terms of Confucian thought it becomes apparent that there is a corresponding relationship. On the subject of suffering Liu appears to have appropriated Confucian culture, and extended it to incorporate her Christian understanding.

### Confucian Society

#### *Suffering*

Throughout Chinese history there have been differing theories regarding the question of suffering. Some philosophies, like that found in the *Shu Ching* (書經),<sup>184</sup> have stressed self-determination, associating one's condition with merit.<sup>185</sup> Other teachings, like those found in the Taoist classic *Tao Te Ching* (道德經),<sup>186</sup> propound forms of fatalism in which behavior is inconsequential to circumstances.<sup>187</sup> Confucius (孔子, 551-479 BC), avoiding extremes, incorporated both self-determinism and fate into his philosophy. He believed in a heaven (天) that is both powerful and good.<sup>188</sup> Heaven is also personal. According to Julia Ching, a Chinese Christian scholar who compares Confucianism with Christianity, the classic Confucian texts portray heaven in a way that "resembles the Christian God."<sup>189</sup> Yet heaven was not particularly close to any individual, save the emperor. The emperor was divinely ordained to carry out heaven's work in the human sphere, and was the only person permitted to worship.<sup>190</sup>

Ordinary people had a much more tenuous relationship with the divine. On the question of suffering, when a seemingly innocent individual experienced a problem that seemed unjust there was no direct recourse to heaven. Confucius allowed prayers and offerings to be made to the ancestors and even to the evil spirits that were believed to be behind natural disasters.<sup>191</sup> It came to be believed that these could intercede for the petitioner or provide some level of assistance.<sup>192</sup> Yet Confucius himself refused to speculate about the ability of spiritual beings to help an individual. His focus was firmly on human relationships and he approved of ceremonies for the deceased primarily because they reflected proper social values. Confucius gave his full attention to earthy matters and would not conjecture about the spiritual, saying, “To foster right among the people; to honour ghosts and spirits and yet keep aloof from them, may be called wisdom.”<sup>193</sup>

Confucius seems not to have questioned that suffering can indeed come upon an innocent individual. In such cases the sufferer was encouraged to bear with pain in a virtuous way, with courage and without complaint.<sup>194</sup> When Confucius was himself in difficulties a disciple questioned why the sage must suffer so. Confucius answered, “A gentleman can withstand hardships; it is only the small man who, when submitted to them, is swept off his feet.”<sup>195</sup> Again, when Confucius and his followers were short of food a disciple asked why he seemed happy. He answered: “I have tried to avoid being reduced to such a strait for a long time; and that I have not escaped shows that it was so appointed for me.”<sup>196</sup> Confucius’ ability to cope comes from a belief in fate. This positive fatalism is possible because of a belief in a just heaven.

Confucius believed in a just heaven, but seems not to have developed a theology pertaining to the question of innocent suffering. Mencius (孟子, 371-289 BC), who refined Confucian thought,<sup>197</sup> did take steps in this direction, suggesting that heaven may allow suffering as a discipline to develop character. He wrote:

For God, when about to charge a man with a great trust, will try his soul with bitterness, subject his bones and sinews to toil and his body to hunger, reduce him to nakedness and want, and bring his enterprises to naught. Thus his mind is made active, his character tempered, and his weakness made good.”<sup>198</sup>

## Sageliness

However it was clear to Confucius that heaven desired just rule on earth and he focused his efforts on teaching earthly rather than heavenly ethics. The focus of human endeavor was sageliness (*sheng*, 聖), which Julia Ching defines as the “Chinese equivalent to the English word holiness.”<sup>199</sup> Evil arises when the individual is not acting in accord with the harmonious universe.<sup>200</sup> One should transcend this evil.<sup>201</sup> This can be accomplished by cultivating the seed of sageliness that Confucians came to believe lies in every human. One should endeavor to become a sage.<sup>202</sup> As Confucian thought developed Confucius himself, and other remarkable individuals, were held out as examples to verify it was possible to become a sage.<sup>203</sup>

Confucius, however, did not consider himself a sage. A sage was an exalted title indeed. The more common virtuous individual was a gentleman (*jwen dz*, 君子).<sup>204</sup> The *Analects* of Confucius use the term 107 times. Wing-tsit Chan summarizes the attributes of the gentleman presented in the *Analects* as follows:

... one who is wise, loving, courageous; who studies the Way and loves people; who stands in awe of heaven; who understands the mandate of heaven ... who does not seek to gratify his appetite or seek comfort in his dwelling place but is earnest in deeds and careful in speech; who is not a “utensil” that is useful only for a specific function; who does not set his mind for or against anything but follows only what is right; who practices respect, reverence, generosity and righteousness; who studies extensively but restrains himself with ceremonies; who meets with friends on the basis of culture and helps himself with their friendship.<sup>205</sup>

Confucius summed up all these virtues in one word, *jen* (仁). *The Dictionary of World Religions* calls this Confucius’ central doctrine and translates the term as “goodness,” “benevolence,” and “human-heartedness.”<sup>206</sup> The sage has *jen*. The gentleman pursues *jen*.<sup>207</sup>

### *Active and Passive Responses*

It is important to note that the individual who cultivates the seed of sageliness, who seeks *jen*, does not strive for his own benefit but for others.<sup>208</sup> As Confucian ideas

developed, adherents often censured Buddhists for their monastic way of life.<sup>209</sup> One must not neglect social responsibility. There were three types of sages: kings, ministers, and hermits.<sup>210</sup> The meaning of sage in all three examples relates to social service. Hermits were individuals who renounced their positions for reasons related to the good of society, not to escape from social responsibility.<sup>211</sup> According to Julia Ching, their best efforts resulted in ...

... a dynamic discovery of the worth of the human person, of the possibilities of moral greatness and even sagehood, of one's fundamental relationship to others in a society based on ethical values, of an interpretation of reality and a metaphysics of the self that remain open to the transcendent ....<sup>212</sup>

As regards suffering, the disciples of Confucius dealt with the problem in two ways. Emotionally, the will of heaven was to be courageously accepted. Physically, every effort was to be made to bring about the well-being of society.<sup>213</sup> By means of proper passive and active responses the sage would conduct himself in a cultivated manner. The reward of such service was not based in a belief in the afterlife, but in living in harmony with nature.<sup>214</sup> Julia Ching describes the motivation as follows:

The Confucian finds his joy in his harmony with nature, and in his own humanity.... He does not seek to abound in good works in this life to save himself in the next. He has rather a realized view of eschatology. Here on earth, the future life is not his primary concern. It will take care of itself.<sup>215</sup>

Liu Hsia

### *Extending Confucian Principles*

It is quite clear that Liu's writing resonates Confucian thought. Rather than developing a new system to explain her faith, Liu seems to explain suffering in essentially Confucian terms. The difference between Liu's ideas and those of Confucian thinkers seems to be one of extension. Liu extends basic Confucian thought to include principles developed in relation to the contemporary culture of Taiwan and her Christian faith.

As Confucius' teachings are based in a belief in the will of heaven, so Liu's starting-point is her understanding of that will. Liu extends the thought of an omnipotent and

good God to include a God who is in relationship not just with the emperor, but also every individual. God is personal. God allows suffering. God also comforts. Liu applies this to herself, a woman with disabilities.

Liu's view of the value of women and those with disabilities is different from that of Confucius, who wrote, "Only women and common persons are difficult to care for. Be familiar with them, and they lose their modesty; avoid them, and they become resentful."<sup>216</sup> Women certainly did not have an esteemed position in Confucius' social model.<sup>217</sup> Yet Confucius' ideas are purported to have led to "a dynamic discovery of the worth of the human person."<sup>218</sup> Liu extends this view to women and those with disabilities.

The advice Liu offers her readers is essentially the same as that of Confucian teaching. One should not complain, but seek emotional health by courageously accepting the will of heaven. Suffering may actually be God's blessing. One should passively (not pessimistically) accept that will. Liu writes, "The obedience that God wants is not a 'submission' that entails feeling sorry or wronged with no recourse.... It's that we believe in God's love, in his plan for us, and the work he is going to achieve for us."<sup>219</sup>

In accordance with Confucian philosophy one should also be active, working for the well-being of others. That Liu applies this advice to herself and includes those suffering disabilities is significant. All, even women and those who traditionally have no place in society, are to pursue *jen*. Each person is to cultivate the seed of sageliness that is in their souls.

Liu uses herself as an example of the emotional health and social consequences that can come when one cultivates oneself.<sup>220</sup> However, the humble tone with which she writes proves she does not consider herself to have attained the status of a sage. Yet, like the Confucian writers, she indicates it is possible by pointing to Jesus. Jesus is Liu's sage. In Liu's writings Jesus is not so much portrayed as a Savior from sin, but as an example that should be emulated. He suffered well, accepting the will of heaven. He lived well, devoting himself to the well-being of others.

When Liu wrote about obedience in her article on *kung-fu* she used Jesus as her example. Though it was extremely difficult for Jesus to submit himself to God's will and suffer in a completely unjust way, he was willing to do so.<sup>221</sup> The fact that Jesus also suffered unjustly gives encouragement to those who themselves suffer. Liu writes, "When we are stuck in our dark deep pit and cannot pull ourselves up out of despair ... we know someone (Jesus) has been through it."<sup>222</sup> The depth of Confucian *jen* can clearly be seen in the ends for which Jesus suffered. When arguing against culling those with disabilities Liu points to Jesus as the sagely example, writing:

Jesus Christ, in order to be close to the poor, was born into a poor carpenter's home. In order to be close to lonely, helpless, blind, lame, worried and tormented souls he was willing to be driven away, persecuted, humiliated and live in a homeless state without even a pillow....<sup>223</sup>

### *Conclusion*

Liu extends the teaching of Confucius by arguing for a relationship between God and each person, insisting that women and those with disabilities are part of the sagely calling, and presenting Jesus as a sage to be emulated. Moreover when Liu instructs her readers to passively accept the will of heaven while at the same time actively serving the disadvantaged she is reiterating basic Confucian teaching. Liu is also in harmony with Confucian thinking in that she does not believe service should come out of a desire for a better afterlife. One should endeavor simply to live in accord with the will of a benevolent heaven.<sup>224</sup>

Liu works out her theology in much the same way as Confucius, keeping the same tension between fate and self-determination and presenting a way that results in both the emotional and physical well-being of the self and society. In doing this it is doubtful that Liu has made a conscious attempt at inculturation. She has not formally studied theology. Her writings neither mention theologians nor discuss the theological issues considered central to questions on theodicy. According to C. S. Song, Liu would have had little chance to hear a contextually appropriate theology in a local church. This paper has portrayed Liu as one whose writings "tend to flow from life to the Bible rather than vice-versa." This being the case it appears that Liu simply writes as a Chinese Christian who works out her faith in terms of her own culture.

## CONCLUSION

If C. S. Song is correct in criticizing churches in Taiwan for seeming foreign in their own country, Liu Hsia's writings serve as an important evidence that this situation is changing. She has shown a means by which theology can be presented in indigenous terms. Her method indicates the way Song's "theological imaging"<sup>225</sup> can be accomplished. If her corresponding message results in less than a theological explanation of the nature of suffering, its value lies in generating a system that responds to the culture and needs in Taiwan. It deals with the very problems Song identifies as endemic, taking seriously the anxiety and even the corresponding socio-political problems in which the distress is rooted. Specifically, it enables the disadvantaged to take a positive approach to life and their contribution to society, and at the same time challenges healthy people to treat those who suffer on a basis of equality.

Liu's theology has immediate implications for the way ministry in Taiwan is done. C. S. Song has argued that Christians in Taiwan have not been socially engaged. Withdrawing from society is not possible in Liu's way of thinking. The passive response that Liu advocates may be related to an individual's private spiritual life. Emotional health comes, in part, by accepting the will of God. The rest of Liu's theology is active. One must oppose those teachings that destroy one's emotional health, and work for a healthy physical/social world. Those who accept Liu's principles will necessarily be both evangelistically and socially active; will think of mission in terms of *shuangfu*, or "double blessing."

Liu applies the theology to her own life and testifies:

I have already conquered this illness. ... Nobody knows if I can be cured or if I will get worse. This is not important to me. It is important that I know life, and know the Lord who created life. I will live, and live vibrantly and with strength.<sup>226</sup>

Liu did live well. Sadly in February 2003 a domestic assistant suffered a psychotic episode and pulled Liu from her bed, resulting in her death.<sup>227</sup> For the two years prior to her death she served as a formal advisor to President Chen Shui-bian.<sup>228</sup> At her memorial service President Chen eulogized her as the force behind government

initiatives such as creating barrier free environments.<sup>229</sup> At the same service one of Liu's friends read a piece of her writing that included the words, "When I pass away, please don't bury me with tears. I have departed for a mysterious meeting. How I wish you could be joyous just as I am."<sup>230</sup> Her brother recalls that she wanted to share her faith experience, the source of her ability to endure, even to be joyful, in severe difficulties.<sup>231</sup> This she did, in a manner that in her context proved most effective.

## CHAPTER SIX

### TOWARD A MORE CONTEXTUAL THEOLOGY

#### INTRODUCTION

To entitle the final chapter “Toward a More Contextual Theology” is to imply that the theologies prevalent in Taiwan could be more relevant to their context. This chapter will make the argument by appraising the divergent approaches to social ministry in Taiwan’s mainland-originating and Presbyterian churches. It will demonstrate that though both seek to offer ministries that are contextual, the divisiveness inherent in differing contexts has restricted the development of inclusive theologies. The chapter will then reflect on these differences in light of the mission statement of the Eden Social Welfare Foundation as elaborated in the writings of Liu Hsia. It will be argued that Liu and Eden offer a perspective that is missing in the churches, and that the two lay the foundation for a more thoroughly contextual approach to the continuing development of theologies of social ministry in Taiwan.

#### Mainland-Originating and Presbyterian Churches: Ministry in Different Contexts

Andrew Walls explains the relationship of context and text with the example of an audience watching a production in a theater with a restricted view of the stage. Different seats (contexts) enable different views of the drama (text).<sup>1</sup> The divergent attitudes toward social ministry in Nationalist Taiwan are in great part due to differences in context between mainland-originating and Presbyterian churches. This thesis has called attention to two important differences, namely their political and ecclesial heritage. The effect of each of these on social ministry in the Protestant churches of Taiwan will be discussed in turn.

## Political Heritage

During the Nationalist era mainland-originating and Presbyterian churches found politics a more divisive issue than theology.<sup>2</sup> The differences were so severe as to hinder formal debate over divergent perspectives. C. M. Kao and James Shia report that the two groups were able to maintain relationships in the Ecumenical Cooperative Committee and the Year 2000 Gospel Movement only by avoiding discussion of deep-seated differences.<sup>3</sup>

The fact that there was little dialogue between churches may have contributed to misunderstandings such as those evident in Jonathan Chao's published response to a Presbyterian explanation of the denomination's public statements. Chao drew attention to the fact that the existential concern of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan during the Nationalist era has been political. He then indicated it would be good if the Presbyterians would not try to take history into their own hands, but focus on the unambiguous directive to proclaim the gospel, by which he meant evangelism. He made the case by arguing the paradigm of consequence: if the churches would focus on evangelism there would be an upward spiral that would lead to social betterment.<sup>4</sup>

Chao's response indicts Presbyterians for not being adequately concerned with evangelistic ministry. He appears to believe that if the Presbyterians would only be more like mainland-originating churches, that is if they would focus on evangelism rather than politics, all would be well. To argue thus is to advance a distorted view of Protestantism in Taiwan. Chapter Three has demonstrated that evangelism is important to Presbyterians.<sup>5</sup> Chao's argument also fails to note that in Taiwan the political crisis had tempered theological aspirations in many mainland-originating churches.

To be sure, mainland-originating churches operate with a principle that their work is essentially spiritual, and that there should be a separation of religion and politics. Indeed there are many who desire to keep the churches untainted by political controversy. The pessimistic views of social potential that were inherited from Nee, Wang and many missionaries support this view.<sup>6</sup> Because of this mainland-originating churches have refused to make political proclamations in the same manner as Presbyterians.<sup>7</sup> However there is also evidence that during the Nationalist era members

of mainland-originating churches were as much concerned with island politics as Presbyterians. Chao's article draws attention to the contextual experiences of the Presbyterian author to whom he is responding, explaining: "one's identity often determines one's perception as well as position."<sup>8</sup> Yet he ignores that fact that mainlanders have also been concerned with their identity.

Such concern is part of an elemental human need. According to sociologist Abraham Maslow after basic human requirements of survival and safety, human behavior is motivated by the need for identity, or "belongingness," and that when these are lacking, action will be taken to assert them.<sup>9</sup> In Taiwan both the Mainlanders and Taiwanese have felt their interpretation of history, their present culture (i.e. language), and their future as a society to be threatened. Much has been said of the Taiwanese in this regard. Yet a wider perspective shows the Nationalists were also a displaced people striving for a homeland.<sup>10</sup> It might be argued that what the Taiwanese experienced as repression was, from the point of view of mainlanders, an effort to assert their identity.

The focus on quantitative growth among mainland-originating churches creates the impression that these bodies were apolitical. Yet Chow Lien-hwa maintains the influential Bread of Life Church thinks of the first president elected after the Nationalists lost power as "the devil."<sup>11</sup> Chow uses the figure of speech to describe the depth of feeling among many mainland-originating churches. Hollington Tong, however, did not appear to be speaking metaphorically when he described the vision of liberating the mainland in terms of Christian mission.<sup>12</sup> In a similar manner Madame Chiang could use Christian language to describe those who fight against Communism, the "anti-Christ," as martyrs willing to die for their faith.<sup>13</sup> Madame Chiang's speeches were noted for their powerful Christian witness, yet no criticism has been made of her for blurring the distinction between religious and political service.<sup>14</sup> That mainland-originating churches continued to subordinate their ministries to the culture imposed by the Nationalist government demonstrates the effect of politics on theology.<sup>15</sup>

In Walls' analogy the audience is watching the same performance, but their different seats result in different perceptions. That the churches in Taiwan were viewing the same production is evidenced by the two traditions drawing on the same scriptural sources for a correct response to the political situation. Churches affiliated with both blocs taught

obedience to the government, except when political authorities interfere with God's will.<sup>16</sup> The Presbyterian perspective on the context led the denomination to perceive Nationalist policies as a threat to God-given human rights. Mainland-originating churches, as Hollington Tong and Madame Chiang so eloquently expressed, saw the threat as being from Communism in China, the "enemy of God."<sup>17</sup> Both groups took natural steps to safeguard their identity. Like Presbyterians, mainland-originating churches have taken history into their own hands. The difference is that where the Presbyterians were forced to mount an opposition to the government, members of mainland-originating churches sought to achieve their objectives by maintaining the status quo.<sup>18</sup> For one the response was active protest, and for the other passive support of the Nationalist agenda.

Both Nationalists and Taiwanese saw each other as a threat. Yet there seems to have been little appreciation that each faction was experiencing trauma of a similar nature. Shoki Coe expressed his convictions in personal terms: "deep down in my inner being there is a refusal to be put in any other category (than Taiwanese) and a refusal to accept the treatment that has been meted out to us."<sup>19</sup> (parenthesis mine.) Coe's political activities, and indeed those of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, were expressions of this intense struggle for identity.<sup>20</sup> Much has been said of the inability of mainlanders to appreciate the Taiwanese. Indeed their churches failed to support the Taiwanese in their suffering.<sup>21</sup> Yet a similar charge is occasionally voiced against the Presbyterians. Peter Chen-Main Wang, for example, has published a paper on theologies of contextualization in Taiwan that depicts the denomination as having "a narrow-minded 'Taiwan first' or 'Taiwan only' mentality."<sup>22</sup> He argues Presbyterians have difficulty sympathizing with those who hold different political aspirations, to the extent that "people who do not share their identity are not even the subject for Presbyterian evangelization."<sup>23</sup>

The theme of reconciliation is at the heart of Presbyterian mission. However Wang's charge that Presbyterians have little regard for those who do not share their political identity is not unfounded. The Presbyterian Confession makes it clear that mission must not be focused on one's own needs but on others.<sup>24</sup> Yet when Presbyterian theologians suggest dialogue, their invitations often exclude those who struggle with the same patriotic feelings as Coe, who refuse to be put in any other category than Chinese. Huang Po-Ho, for example, writes there is an urgent need for denominations to come

together and form a theology to address the complex political crisis. Yet he defines the agenda for such dialogue as a meeting of minds to reject the idea that Taiwan is part of China.<sup>25</sup> In a similar manner Chen Nan-jou, who thought of Christian mission in terms of identifying with those who suffer, is unable to appreciate the distress of those who see themselves as Chinese.<sup>26</sup> His plea for Christian unity includes a call to reconciliation with the “people and the history of Taiwan.”<sup>27</sup>

Presbyterians have also been faulted for expending an inordinate amount of their limited resources on addressing political issues, thus detracting from creative ministry in other areas.<sup>28</sup> This might be true, but from the perspective of social ministry they have been no less creative than mainland-originating churches, churches that subordinated their ministries to what was in accord with the Nationalist agenda. During the Nationalist era the political crisis was such that the attention of all Protestant churches was taken up with politics. Passions were aroused that restricted fellowship with each other, and likely limited the development of new and imaginative ministries.

### Ecclesial Heritage

During the Nationalist era mainland-originating and Presbyterian churches found politics a more immediately divisive matter than theology. Yet theology also divided the denominations. Chapter Two showed that the social ministries offered by mainland-originating churches were associated with evangelism. Their theology did not provide a means for understanding social ministry in its own right, as a partner with evangelism. The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, by contrast, was able to develop the paradigm of partnership.<sup>29</sup> Yet their arguments were not helpful to mainland-originating churches. This is not only because they emerged in a debate over Nationalist policy where the churches were already ill disposed to communicate with each other. It is also because mainland-originating churches perceived the Presbyterians to be supporting their ministries with theologies they could not accept.

The reason relates to the ecclesial heritage of mainland-originating churches. Chapter Two argued that the social services offered by mainland-originating churches lacked a reasoned theological foundation.<sup>30</sup> The same cannot be said of their evangelistic ministries. Chapter One demonstrated that both the missionaries and Chinese Christians

who belonged to mainland-originating churches were significantly affected by the debate over the social gospel. Their common objective was to defend the pillars of 19<sup>th</sup> century evangelicalism, that is belief in an inspired and authoritative Bible, salvation by grace through faith, the necessity of a distinct conversion experience, and a corresponding transformation of character evidenced in a pious life.<sup>31</sup> To this end Watchman Nee, for example, developed a detailed and influential theology in support of the evangelistic mandate.<sup>32</sup> Encouraged by such theology, and by the majority of foreign missionaries who served in Taiwan, mainland-originating churches instigated a wide range of evangelistic programs.<sup>33</sup>

The heritage of mainland-originating churches enabled them to affirm that social ministry is both a consequence of and a bridge to evangelism.<sup>34</sup> However an approach that was almost wholly concerned with introducing Christ offered little insight into social ministry as distinct from evangelism. This is not to say mainland-originating churches were unable to appreciate the need for theology that spoke to the context, even the political context. The church growth movement taught them to work along natural webs of relationship and to consider offering dynamic equivalents to spiritual and social needs.<sup>35</sup> The instigation of programs in the late 1990s that were designed to meet community needs demonstrates that these churches were responsive to political and religious culture.<sup>36</sup> Yet Chapter Two has shown that their overarching concern was with how to best share their faith evangelistically.

That mainland-originating churches came to think of social ministry as a bridge to evangelism demonstrates they were operating according to a model of contextual theology Stephen B. Bevans defines as “translation.”<sup>37</sup> Bevans explains, “... the person who uses the translation model basically sees himself or herself as bringing a saving message into the culture and making sure that it is presented in a relevant and attractive way.”<sup>38</sup> He describes the approach as emphasizing the commonality of peoples and the unchanging and supra-cultural nature of the gospel. The goal is to strip the gospel of cultural accretions and effectively translate its meaning into forms that the recipients find relevant. When the essential truths are accepted a new, transforming, power becomes operational.<sup>39</sup>

Though the translation model is present in Presbyterian ministry, it is not the only model that informed the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan. The paradigm that Bevans describes as “synthetic” corresponds most closely with the Presbyterian approach. This incorporates the translation model. Yet it is also able to learn from other models.<sup>40</sup> Bevans entitles one of these the “anthropological model.” The approach begins with human culture rather than the divine message. It stresses both the uniqueness of culture and the imminence of God. Rather than promoting doctrines informed by other cultures, it searches for an encounter with God in a particular context.<sup>41</sup> When Song argues Christian mission should not be about extending Christendom but identifying and demonstrating how the many truths within a culture are God’s Truth, or when Huang Po-Ho explains there is no culture without gospel, an “anthropological model” of contextual theology is being advanced.<sup>42</sup>

The synthetic approach also includes the praxis model, a model that Chapter Four has shown to be operative in Eden’s *Shuangfu* Theology. Where the translation and anthropological models stress discovering God in transcendent truths and in cultural phenomenon, the praxis model suggests that God is experienced in the lives of human beings and communities. Thus theology is a never-ending process of action and reflection. Bevans notes that the praxis model has much in common with the prophetic tradition of the Old Testament, wherein faith demands an ethical response.<sup>43</sup> It is also the model to which C. S. Song conforms when he argues that Christian mission must be “word in action,” and again when Wang Hsien-chih emphasizes that Homeland Theology should be thought of as “theopraxis,” rather than “theologos.”<sup>44</sup>

The three models are all components of the synthetic model. Bevans explains this approach as accepting that each culture is unique, yet also holding that peoples share much in common. This commonality does not detract from individuality. There is freedom to draw on traditions and insights that have emerged in the international arena, yet also respect for new ideas that arise in the local setting. The model also refuses to assign permanent value to customs. Some phenomena are neutral while other aspects can either be seen as good or bad, depending on the circumstances. Theology is therefore flexible. At times it will emphasize a particular premise or call for adherence to a tradition, while at other times it will focus on cultural identity and oppose traditions.<sup>45</sup>

Offering a synthesis of divergent models can be difficult. To expand upon an example offered by Bevans, those that conform to the synthetic model must decide whether mission means offering a treasure, a map to help in the search for treasure, or believe treasure will materialize as the journey progresses.<sup>46</sup> To work with the synthetic model does not indicate a simple attempt to affirm all three, to seek to maintain a loose configuration of ideals. It is to accept a serious conversation between convinced theologies operating in creative tension. Dialogue between parties is integral to the model.<sup>47</sup>

Bevans notes that those who engage in contextual theology generally have one of two basic orientations. Their theologies are either redemption or creation-centered. The first of these sees society as fundamentally corrupt and argues that improvement can only come about when Christ is introduced into the community. The second understands society as essentially good and looks for God in the commonplace rather than in a set-apart community.<sup>48</sup>

Both orientations are present and debated within the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan.<sup>49</sup> The People's Theologies articulate the anthropological model with its basic creation-centered orientation, a model Bevans describes as being at the "opposite end of the spectrum from the translation model."<sup>50</sup> Wang Hsien-chih advanced a theology that is in harmony with the anthropological model when he suggested viewing the Biblical covenants as local theologies that contemporary human experience has every right to evaluate. Hence Homeland Theology critiqued the Davidic Covenant for being analogous to the mythology of a divine mandate that enabled China's emperors to keep their people in bondage.<sup>51</sup> Huang Po-Ho also argues in accordance with the anthropological model when he insists that Christian mission should not be about conversion, or about alignment with a particular message, but about respect for the self and freedom to determine a future.<sup>52</sup>

Mainland-originating churches, with a redemption-centered translation theology that was honed in the debate over the social gospel, simply rejected the tenets that supported the People's Theologies. Those steeped in the hermeneutics of Wang Ming-tao and Watchman Nee, who maintained God is revealed in an inerrant Bible that was easily understood across cultures, had no sympathy with Wang Hsien-chih's interpretation of

the Davidic Covenant. Nor could those whose theologies had been constructed over against the social gospel appreciate any theology that failed to emphasize evangelism. These churches saw the basic problem as a corrupted human soul. No improvement could come without individual repentance and acceptance of the substitutionary atonement.<sup>53</sup>

As a result the mainland-originating churches rarely engaged Presbyterian theologies of service. Samuel Chiow maintains that most reject them without ever reading the theology or participating in constructive dialogue with Presbyterians.<sup>54</sup> One explanation is Nee's profound distrust of the intellect.<sup>55</sup> Chapter Three noted that it was common to simply dismiss Presbyterian theologies as "liberal," by which mainland-originating churches meant unorthodox.<sup>56</sup> Such a response, however, is to misunderstand the nature of theology in the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan.

Among those who understand theology as synthesis the People's Theologies are not seen as a Confession of Faith. They are the reflection of informed individuals on the mission of the church in a particular context. The purpose of such contextual theologies is not to establish a set of propositions but to approach the truth through dialogue.<sup>57</sup> Daniel Cheng, the Secretary for Church and Society in the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, calls attention to the fact these theologies do not serve as foundations for the denomination's social services, that indeed most theologies were developed as reflections on services that were already begun. While he finds them helpful, he also is candid that denomination leaders can find them somewhat difficult to understand.<sup>58</sup> William Lo explains that the Reformed tradition was more important to the denomination's social initiatives than People's Theologies. Doctrines such as providence enabled a concept of mission that was not limited to evangelism, but extended to every facet of human life.<sup>59</sup>

### *Presbyterian Incongruity*

By contrast with mainland-originating churches Presbyterians were able to develop numerous statements and programs to encourage social ministries. However in Taiwan the Presbyterian churches also found themselves limited by their ecclesial history. As there was a discrepancy between mainland-originating theology and practice, so there was an incongruity between the theology and practice in the Presbyterian Church in

Taiwan. Mainland-originating churches had no theology to support political action, yet they were immensely concerned with island politics. The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan had well thought through theologies, yet there was a disparity between what is accepted in the hierarchy and what is carried out in the congregations.<sup>60</sup> An article published by the *Asian Journal of Theology* maintains that the political efforts of the General Assembly are not understood among local churches. It further describes Presbyterian congregations as parochial bodies with an inferiority complex that do not understand the meaning of incarnational mission.<sup>61</sup>

While the Presbyterian Church has always been the largest, and for many years was the only, denomination in Taiwan, in relation to the population it has been a small and marginalized body.<sup>62</sup> As a result the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan has developed into a subculture. Tsai Kuo-shan, who directs a ministry focusing on the needs of industrial workers, argues that though his denomination claims connection with grassroots society it has, in fact, lost the association and developed into an upper middle-class culture that does not understand the needs of the average Taiwanese.<sup>63</sup> James Shia concurs with this critique. He maintains that though the denomination itself, and its many institutions, has offered commendable services, the average Presbyterian congregation does not respond to problems in their community.<sup>64</sup> C. M. Kao laments the situation, writing:

... the Lord has blessed those early Christians and enabled many of their children and grandchildren to become doctors, professors, and successful businessmen. But now we are neglecting the poor, the laborers and the lower class people.<sup>65</sup>

These statements make it clear that C. S. Song's criticism of Protestants in Taiwan for having withdrawn from society and formed into cliques with a terminology and agenda that is irrelevant to fellow citizens includes his own Presbyterian Church in Taiwan.<sup>66</sup> Presbyterian historian Cheng Yang-en describes the majority of congregations as so insular that there is little activity of either a social or evangelistic nature. He notes that those who are motivated to address political concerns may have attended protest movements or social organizations, but that this was done as individuals and did not involve the parish as such.<sup>67</sup> Longstanding missionaries David Alexander and Mark Thelin report Presbyterian congregations indeed tend to expend relatively little energy on the needs of those outside the community of faith.<sup>68</sup> Their colleague, E. L. Senner,

suggests that in the churches relationships with members takes precedence over those with outsiders.<sup>69</sup>

It will be remembered that Chapter Two introduced James Shia's interpretation of the history of social ministry in Taiwan. Shia believed that at one period churches integrated both evangelistic and social services, but that as succeeding generations of converts received good education an upper class mentality emerged that distanced the churches from community needs. Shia maintains that by the time the mainlanders arrived social ministry was considered a matter for institutions.<sup>70</sup> Shia's views are open to debate. C. S. Yang believes that the churches were always a marginalized presence in the community and were never in a position to offer services.<sup>71</sup> Shoki Coe explains that foreign missionaries established most institutions.<sup>72</sup> Nevertheless Shia's assertion that during the Nationalist era congregations were not involved in meeting community needs, and that service was understood to be a matter for institutions, seems accurate. In 1968 Coe described this very situation and endeavored to help congregations extend their ministries into the community.<sup>73</sup> More than thirty years later the denomination's 21<sup>st</sup> Century New Taiwan Mission Movement was working toward much the same ends.<sup>74</sup> Throughout the Nationalist era Presbyterian congregations were not socially involved in their communities.

Cheng Yang-en comments on the problem from the point of view of a theological educator. Seminary graduates often report the theology they have learned in seminary does not relate to their pastoral ministry. They fail to apply what they have learned, and they begin to feel theology is useless.<sup>75</sup> In a 1998 Masters thesis that demonstrates familiarity with the history of social service in the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan and the theologies that supported these, Hsu Ming-hsuing makes the rather startling statement, "Social service lacks theological thinking."<sup>76</sup> Hsu is here speaking of local congregations rather than General Assembly initiatives. He argues the congregations demonstrate no understanding of, or interest in, Christian social responsibility. Though he notes there is some concern with matters of political import, he reiterates what others argue; that congregations are not motivated to respond to the needs of those in their communities nor are they concerned with the activities of the social welfare institutions founded by their denomination.<sup>77</sup> Such arguments support James Shia's observation that despite having a theology that promotes social service, Presbyterian congregations do

not have a better record of social ministry than mainland-originating churches. In his estimation both do it poorly.<sup>78</sup>

## Conclusion

Though contextualization was a concept developed within the rubric of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, the evidence reviewed in this thesis leads us to conclude that Presbyterian churches have not succeeded any better in developing social ministries than mainland-originating churches. Both are subject to different political and ecclesial contexts and therefore offer divergent perspectives. Their differences are directly related to conflicting views of political identity. Dialogue is thus difficult. The problem is exacerbated by differences that emerge in regard to ecclesial heritage. The mainland-originating churches validate only those ministries that explicitly serve evangelistic enterprise. This tends to mask their own political agenda, and also results in misunderstandings about the theologies developed in the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan.

For their part the Presbyterians have also experienced inconsistencies between theology and ministry. While their many theologies encourage ministry that is socially relevant, during the Nationalist era Presbyterian congregations were not involved in resolving needs in their local communities. This raises questions about how well they actually understand the changing communities with whom they purport to identify.<sup>79</sup> There is also little evidence that Presbyterians have sought a sympathetic understanding of the needs of the mainlander community. There is no question that in Taiwan both mainland-originating and Presbyterian churches expended tremendous efforts to minister in a contextually relevant manner. Yet both have done so imperfectly. The divisions inherent in differing contexts have limited the perspectives of the churches, and made it difficult for one group to appreciate the needs and contributions of the other.

## Liu Hsia and the Eden Social Welfare Foundation: New Perspectives on Social Ministry

### Liu Hsia and Incarnational Ministry

The first clause of Eden's mission statement, "Serve Weak," is essential to the theological foundation of its social ministry. Chapter Four explained that the brief phrase was carefully designed so as to incorporate the principle that service must be among, rather than on behalf of, others.<sup>80</sup> This is not an original contribution to theology in Taiwan. Many theologians have argued the need for ministry that was incarnational and contextual.<sup>81</sup> Yet Eden staff maintain the churches continue to organize programs rather than client-centered ministries.<sup>82</sup> One of the factors in Eden's approach was the presence of Liu Hsia, who ensured its ministry was a service of the disabled among the disabled.<sup>83</sup> Yet her contribution to the principle that Christian ministry must both be incarnational and contextually relevant stretches far beyond their immediate application in Eden.

Through her *sanwen* Liu spoke to the nation. It is important to note that her compositions were not written as a strategy for communicating her faith. They were an authentic searching for meaning in her subjective experience. Hers was not a communication from a position of authority. Rather she spoke as a self-critical individual in conversation with her reader. Though her religious faith set her apart from the average citizen, she wrote as a member of the community who was struggling to discover meaning in light of her religious experiences. Liu's theology emerged from reflection on herself in her context. She did not expound on the meaning of text as an object. Rather her theology was subjective, a meditation that flows from life to the Bible. The very subjects she chose to discuss were not pre-conceived. Though the theme of suffering recurs in her writing, she did not seek to develop it into a systematic theology. Her writing reflects her personal piety. It was not a theological treatise. She succeeded in couching her insights in forms and symbols that are intimate to the experiences of her readers, and offered what readers desired of her genre: an evocative vision for a better society.<sup>84</sup>

There is little affinity in Liu's writings with the translation, anthropological, or praxis models of contextual theology. These think of revelation as an objective reality that is located in Scripture, hidden in culture, or emerging in social change.<sup>85</sup> Liu's approach is more aligned with a model Bevans entitles "transcendental." This method is not primarily about investigating and applying truth as an object. Her theological method illustrates what Bevans has described as "the affective and cognitive operations in the self-transcending subject."<sup>86</sup> This sees God as revealed in those who reflect on the words of Scripture, and are open to the events of daily life and the ideals embedded within a culture. How much one knows is not so important as how responsibly one attempts to articulate and extend one's faith. The transcendental model is concerned with authentically expressing the self as a subject with a particular religious experience.<sup>87</sup>

The theology that emerges from the transcendental model should not be seen as only relating to the private experiences of the subject. The subject is an integral member of a community. Therefore Bevans insists theology produced by the transcendental model is "extremely contextual and communal."<sup>88</sup> Bevans explains,

Because of this inevitably contextual nature of the subject, one could easily speak of starting from one's own *community's* religious experience and from one's own *community's* experience of itself. From this transcendental starting point, therefore, theology is conceived as the process of 'bringing to speech' who I am or who we are – as a person or persons of faith who are in every possible respect a product of a historical, geographical, social, and cultural environment.<sup>89</sup>

Liu's identity as a person of faith in Taiwan is not dependent on traditional denominational loyalties, or partisanship in the Christian versus non-Christian or Taiwanese versus mainlander polarities. She makes no secret about being both a Christian and a mainlander.<sup>90</sup> Yet her *sanwen* are not aimed to win people to the Christian community or to identify with the politically marginalized. The division raised by her, and by Eden, can be expressed simply in terms of the weak and the strong. This relates to her experience among the disabled, yet also touches fundamental problems with well-being that occur within every individual and group in society.<sup>91</sup> This enables her to offer a message that crosses divisions within Taiwanese society, and addresses disparities that are relevant to a wide variety of situations.

The previous chapter introduced Liu's two-fold solution to the dilemmas confronting the weak. She advocated active and passive responses. The passive response is similar to that which is advanced in mainland-originating churches. In a world where much that causes suffering cannot be changed, the individual is to draw near to God, offer problems over to God, accept that God is working, and appreciate the good one experiences as evidence that things will be better. Heaven is in the heart and in the future. Yet this does not preclude action. Like Presbyterian theologians Liu also insists on fighting against wrong ideas in the self and in society, refusing to surrender to oppressive powers, and seeking to solve problems in society.<sup>92</sup>

These solutions are similar to those offered by the churches. Yet Liu also accentuates an element that has not been greatly stressed among churches, concerned as they are with defending their respective positions. Hers is a theology that stresses relationship rather than rights, mutual service rather than charity. In Liu's model even the weak have social responsibilities. The mature individual, she insists, does not cry for him- or herself, but for others. She argues that differences, indeed problems, can be seen as beneficial. Overcoming them brings people together and makes life interesting and meaningful.<sup>93</sup>

To reiterate, Liu does not contribute her ideas about resolving the problems she identifies from a position of authority. Her writings never refer to well-known personalities with whom she was acquainted, or the immense amount of money that her foundation raises. She is not concerned with her own success as much as with the anxiety of the reader. She does not shy away from self-criticism. Indeed, she often highlights her own shortcomings. She also speaks at length about commonplace experiences. This thesis has used the adjective "mundane" to describe the stories that most commonly appear in Liu's writings. Her narratives recount conversations with small children, soldiers, and farmers, articles printed in daily newspapers, her feelings looking over a scenic vista, or her annoyance with long journeys in heavy traffic. It is through these shared frustrations and joys that Liu develops a relationship with her audience, through which she communicates a message that relates to their shared context. Hers is an approach that seeks to facilitate a meeting of minds.<sup>94</sup>

In the division between the weak and strong, Liu takes the position of the weak, not so much to defend others who are weak, but to share her weakness in terms of her pain and her sense of sin, in simple ways that enable others to find personal strength. This is different from the normal procedure in Taiwan's churches that simply emphasize love and joy over suffering and sin,<sup>95</sup> where there is an emphasis on dynamic spiritual experiences,<sup>96</sup> where God's blessing is demonstrated in large and beautiful buildings,<sup>97</sup> and where weeping is for others of one's own political persuasion. By contrast Liu offers a ministry that involves not only defending the needs of the weak to the powerful, but engages in a self-critical dialogue offered to enlighten and help the other who is also weak. Liu's is a ministry that is intentionally offered from the margins. Yet hers is also a voice from within, an authentic search for identity by a member of the community. From this position she crosses the boundaries that traditionally divide, and includes all those who are marginalized in one way or another in a dialogue about how to create a healthy society.

#### The Eden Social Welfare Foundation and Christian Witness

It has been suggested that one of the reasons most congregations are not very involved in meeting community needs is that they are caught up in the same frenetic urban lifestyle as everyone else in society.<sup>98</sup> Indeed the complaint about being overly busy is not only heard among churches, but among those who minister the Eden Social Welfare Foundation. Employees complain there is inadequate time to pursue protracted activities of a spiritual nature or to reflect upon their work.<sup>99</sup> The advantage Eden has over a church, however, is that members are occupied with community needs. There may be little time for Eden staff to reflect at the level of Liu Hsia, but there is an immediate testing of what is offered. The praxis model has served well to enable Eden to develop a theology of service that is responsive to the needs of the weak.<sup>100</sup>

The model has forced the agency beyond limits imposed by their heritage. Theirs is what C. S. Song describes as a marketplace experience, where rote responses and religious language is unacceptable and where theology must be reformed in relation to the realities that are there encountered.<sup>101</sup> Though as members of the churches employees share the same political and ecclesial culture as their denominations, their work among the disabled compels them to analyze and refine their traditional views.

For example, Chaplain Chang Lai-hao says that it is only after witnessing the effect of discriminatory laws on clients that many employees became willing to address government policy.<sup>102</sup> For chaplain Chen Mei-ju ministry among the physically disabled meant a re-evaluation of Watchman Nee's teaching about the human body, as a result of which she began to understand the body as an agent of, rather than obstacle to, blessing.<sup>103</sup>

Eden's experiences provide a new perspective on the theater stage, to recall Professor Wall's metaphor. The dialogue that occurs among staff with different backgrounds also influences Eden's vision. It will be recalled that Eden's mission statement was only produced after years of discussion on a board with both mainland-originating and Presbyterian members. Despite the political and ecclesial tensions that we have discussed, a commitment among board members to serve the weak not only held the board together, but enabled debate about the relationship between evangelism and social responsibility.<sup>104</sup> The result was a mission statement that is able to accommodate all three of Lausanne's definitions, yet ultimately define its ministry in terms of partnership.

The mission statement was not designed with Lausanne's definition in mind. There is therefore no direct reference to social ministry as consequence, bridge, or partner of evangelism. Yet all three are inherent in Eden's understanding of its mission. That the staff accepts the argument of consequence is clear from comments on the meaning of the final phrase in the mission statement, the mission to lead people to turn to the Lord. Employees maintain that conversion results in individuals discovering their self-worth, and moving from being an object of charity to a courageous subject able to participate in society.<sup>105</sup> If the bridge model is not espoused institutionally, it is evident that staff members are aware that their social work presents an opportunity to evangelize.<sup>106</sup> Consequence and bridge can therefore be said to be part of the ethos of Eden, although it formally defines its mission in terms of the partner paradigm.

This becomes especially clear in the second stanza of Eden's mission statement. Jacob Chen explains that "Witness Christ" was intentionally placed after "Serve Weak" so as to provide a commentary on the service that is offered.<sup>107</sup> By "Witness Christ" the agency means it is a community whose goal is to follow the example of Christ, to love the Lord, each other, and others in the wider community. Eden's service is the

manifestation of the effort of a community to live the Christ-like life. Chen is careful to note that the phrase “Witness Christ” is focused on the self rather than the other. The phrase therefore dissociates Eden’s mission to serve the weak from its mission to evangelize.<sup>108</sup> In “Witness Christ” it defines its ministry as a partner with evangelism.

Eden was able to commend the partner paradigm in terms that were acceptable to board members with diverse agendas. Indeed Eden’s argument is in harmony with the objectives of mainland-originating churches. There is no conflict with the pillars of evangelicalism. Nor is there disagreement with Wang Ming-tao’s insistence that Christians confess sin and demonstrate a transformed character. Indeed Eden’s mission statement guards the centrality of evangelism. In regards to social ministry it simply adds that social service is a hallmark of the transformed community. While it does not espouse Watchman Nee’s emphasis on service as cloistered prayer, it shows some affinity with Nee’s teaching that the church is to be the manifestation of Christ in the community. Eden merely adds that Christ served emotional and physical needs.<sup>109</sup>

Eden chaplains report that when they began to serve in Eden their ministries brought new insights into both social needs and the blessings of the gospel. The praxis model facilitated exploring social needs and faith. It enabled members of Eden’s board with different political and ecclesial heritages to produce a mission statement that demonstrates creative thinking about Christian social ministry in Taiwan. Eden’s statement is, for example, markedly different from the Presbyterian Confession of Faith, which C. S. Song criticizes for its foreign design. Song states that though the Confession is in line with ancient and international modes of expression, it fails to offer an effective witness in contemporary Taiwan. He is also displeased with the terminology used to reflect the denomination’s theology, particularly with the omission of the Taiwanese folk phrase *chhut thau thi*.<sup>110</sup> Eden, however, has expressed its mission in the form of a *pai bi* that includes the very Chinese construct *shuangfu*.

It cannot be argued, however, that “Witness Christ” is a unique concept among Protestant churches. By the end of the Nationalist era James Shia had begun to encourage churches to model their ministry on that of Christ, who loved both God and people, and to urge churches to think of service as integral to their faith.<sup>111</sup> For their part Presbyterians had developed elaborate arguments for social services that were

dissociated from evangelism. Nevertheless by means of praxis Eden gained a perspective on their context and their faith that recognized social ministry as a consequence of and a bridge to evangelism, yet advanced the partner paradigm as the most helpful for its Christian service. Eden's experience marked a way ahead for constructing a foundation for social ministry on which both mainland-originating and Presbyterian churches could agree.

## Conclusion

"Serve Weak," explained that service is to be incarnational and contextual, among rather than on behalf of the people it serves, and responsive to weakness in whatever forms it appears. "Witness Christ" meant dissociating service and evangelism, without denying the importance of evangelism that is enunciated in the fourth stanza of Eden's statement. The third phrase, "Promote *Shuangfu*," reflects Eden's belief that Christian service involves both welfare and gospel work. Service is to bring a "double blessing" into the lives of the weak. Christians are to help solve the problems of daily life so as to bring happiness in the present, and also to offer spiritual resources that will result in peace and the assurance of eternal life. Christian mission, Eden insists, is about bringing "whole person service to the human body, heart and soul."<sup>112</sup>

The *Shuangfu* Theology of the Eden Social Welfare Foundation offers a creative synthesis in a culturally dynamic social ministry. This is in accord with what Shoki Coe desired of Christians in Taiwan. Coe developed the concept of contextualization in order to free the churches from settled traditions, to enable a world directed ministry that was able to respond to the rapidly changing environment. To this end he argued that theological education must not be focused only on developing effective clergy, but on Christian formation in the churches. The goal was for all Christians to be engaged in Christ-like service in their day-to-day lives. His desire was for Christians to be equipped to offer a relevant response within their particular sphere of influence appropriate to the needs of the moment.<sup>113</sup> Liu Hsia and the members of the Eden Social Welfare Foundation not only argue for such an understanding of ministry, but demonstrate it in their daily lives among Taiwan's weakest citizens.

Eden offered just what some socially active members of mainland-originating churches at the end of the Nationalist period were beginning to acknowledge they needed, a theology that thought beyond the bridge paradigm by building a reasoned theological foundation to support social ministry.<sup>114</sup> Chapter Three concluded that the Presbyterians could offer this.<sup>115</sup> Yet this chapter has demonstrated that different contexts made dialogue difficult. Eden, by contrast, offered a theology written in a culturally relevant form that churches could readily understand and upon which churches divided over political and ecclesial identities could find common ground.

## CONCLUSION

This chapter has compared the theologies of social ministry of mainland-originating and Presbyterian churches in Taiwan and demonstrated that each was limited by their political and ecclesial heritage. Though both mainland-originating and Presbyterian churches sought to offer ministries that were contextual, their theologies were unable to accommodate the views of the other. Indeed it might be argued that mainlanders saw the theologies developed by Presbyterians as irrelevant to either the political or the spiritual needs of the moment, and vice versa. Groups were unwilling to dialogue with each other and neither group was able to produce a theology relevant to the context in its entirety.

In this environment Eden and Liu represent a third perspective, a perspective that is informed by needs other than the political and theological problems that occupied the churches. Yet it is also a perspective that speaks to the fundamental concerns of both mainland-originating and Presbyterian churches. The result was the creation of a theology that offers contextually relevant response to social needs, and also anchors this service in Christian life in ways that are acceptable across the spectrum of Taiwan Protestantism. In the process Eden and Liu laid the foundation for a more thoroughly contextual approach to the continuing development of theologies of social ministry in Taiwan.

Eden and Liu help the churches toward developing more thoroughly contextual theologies in two ways, by themselves producing a theology of social ministry that is

more comprehensive in its scope than was otherwise available during the Nationalist era, and by serving as a model for further forming such theologies. To produce a contextually relevant theology that resolves longstanding questions about the relationship between evangelism and social concern is no small accomplishment. Yet *Shuangfu* Theology is not only important for what it teaches but how it was formed. It demonstrates that when Protestants join together over the needs of others constructive dialogue can take place that is capable of producing creative solutions to difficult issues.

# Conclusion

## Synopsis

This thesis has focused on the prevailing theologies of social ministry in Taiwan's Chinese Protestant churches during the Nationalist era, with special attention on the ideas and practice of the Eden Social Welfare Foundation and Liu Hsia. The research has entailed detailed investigations into the theologies of social ministry in mainland-originating churches, the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, the mission statement of the Eden Social Welfare Foundation, and the writings of Liu Hsia. It has been argued that the political and ecclesial contexts in which the Protestant churches operate has influenced their respective theologies of social ministry, and that the Eden Foundation and Liu Hsia represent an original, contextual alternative that merits positive attention by the churches.

This thesis began by demonstrating that mainland-originating churches were influenced both by the debate over the social gospel and by Nationalist politics. Social ministry was peripheral to the urgent task of saving souls. However the pessimistic view of human social potential that prioritized spiritual salvation over social regeneration was tempered by loyalty to the political vision of the Nationalist government. In the mid-1990s the Nationalist government began to encourage community service, and the mainland-originating churches accordingly started to think of service in terms of a bridge to facilitate salvation-based evangelism. At an institutional level social ministries were subordinated to quantitative objectives of church growth within the political culture imposed by the Nationalist government.

The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan operated in another context. This indigenous Taiwanese denomination generally experienced Nationalist immigrants to be an oppressive force. Shoki Coe assumed leadership of the denomination's Tainan Theological Seminary in 1949,<sup>1</sup> and from this platform began to teach that theology should not speak only to spiritual needs, but to the whole of life. Coe worked to empower Presbyterians to formulate theologies relevant to the changing context, rather than simply following traditions inherited from the missionary past. When a series of

political crises threatened the future of the islanders, the denomination, under the leadership of Coe's student C. M. Kao, began to issue public statements urging political reform. Several People's Theologies were formed to support these initiatives. The Reformed theology of providence allowed the denomination to argue that social service is valuable in its own right, as a partner with evangelism, not merely its means or consequence. Ministries of social service began to be encouraged as part of Presbyterian policy.

The theology of the Eden Social Welfare Foundation emerged from praxis wherein staff from both mainland-originating and Presbyterian churches reflected on their experiences of serving among those who suffered disabilities. This context brought the distinctive perspectives of the churches into the Foundation, and created the opportunity to test and evaluate theologies of social service. Protestant ministries were seen as being orchestrated from above, on behalf of rather than among the disabled, as a result of which they were perceived as being often irrelevant to, and sometimes even unconcerned with, the needs of their clients. By contrast, the experiences of the Eden staff in serving with many of the weakest members of society also resulted in the generation of a contextual expression of mission that affirms evangelism yet roots service in Christian life. The Eden mission hopes to influence the churches with a theology that argues welfare and gospel, when held together, bring blessing and health to body and soul in the present and in the future.

The mission statement of the Eden Social Welfare Foundation is constructed in such a way as to ensure its ministry is incarnational and contextual. The thesis has argued that these hermeneutical categories can also be applied to the writings of Eden's founder, the celebrated author Liu Hsia. Her *sanwen* are incarnational in that they enflesh Gospel values in real-life human situations. They are not written from above, offering the advice of a Presidential advisor. They are written from the perspective of the weak, from a member of the community who reflects on mundane experiences and personal struggles with her friend, the reader. They are contextual in that they communicate in a medium, language and thought form that resonate in the community. They are not written to entertain, but to facilitate spiritual, physical, and emotional health for the individual reader and in the community at large. Liu's *sanwen* have been central to the discussion because they represent an innovative, holistic approach to social ministry that crosses the

boundaries of politics and religion that have heretofore limited and divided the Protestant churches in Taiwan.

The final chapter of the thesis has brought these different approaches to social ministry together for analysis. It argues that the political and ecclesial heritage of Protestant churches has limited their theologies of social ministry. Both groups tend to see themselves as a minority people, and are concerned about asserting their political identity. Theology, like politics, also proves divisive. Mainland-originating churches do not have a reasoned theology to support social service. On the other hand, while the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan has developed detailed theologies of social ministry, they advance premises that are unacceptable to mainland-originating churches. Indeed they have had little influence in their own congregations, which tended to be insular fellowships. In contrast to these ecclesial approaches to social ministry, our discussion of Eden and Liu has indicated that they articulate a contextual theology that integrates social ministry into Christian mission, yet also affirms the values that are fundamental to each faction. The dialogical way in which this theology was formed has been highlighted as a model for the future development of contextual theologies of social ministry in Protestant Taiwan.

### Arguments and Evidence

This research was based on the hypothesis that in regards to theologies of social ministry during the Nationalist era Protestant churches in Taiwan were divided into two distinct factions that correspond to their respective political and ecclesial contexts. This was confirmed by examining the churches in relation to their historical development and by comparing their respective theologies. It was established that those churches with roots in China tended to associate with the Nationalist political vision whereas the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan identified with the people of the island. Different experiences with the Nationalist government resulted in divergent political identities. The thesis demonstrated that the ecclesial heritage of the churches resulted in dissimilar approaches to mission. The mainland-originating churches were influenced by the theologies of Wang Ming-tao and Watchman Nee, foreign missionaries who emphasized ministries of an evangelistic nature, and politicians who were willing to endorse evangelical theologies of service provided they did not criticize their political agenda.

In marked contrast the conflictual relationship that developed between the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan and the Nationalist government prompted the formation of theologies in support of social reform that were directly critical of the government.

The thesis argued that the divisiveness inherent in these different political and theological positions not only served to divide, but limited perspectives of Christian social responsibility among the churches. It demonstrated that though each faction was active in forming contextual theologies to resolve the needs with which they were concerned, there was no attempt to develop theologies that were sympathetic to the experiences of the other. It was in this context that the theology of the Eden Social Welfare Foundation, as elaborated in the writings of Liu Hsia, was presented as laying the foundations for more fully contextual theologies of social ministry. It was determined that *Shuangfu* Theology was helpful for providing an easily understandable construct that integrates spiritual and social service in a contextually dynamic ministry while affirming doctrines fundamental to both mainland-originating and Presbyterian churches. It was also argued that Eden's ability to propose a helpful solution to the longstanding debate over the relationship between evangelism and social service demonstrates the value of dialogue in constructing theologies that speak to the needs of the wider context.

### Contribution to Scholarship

The Introduction to the thesis indicates that this research project has situated itself in the fields of history of mission and practical theology. Dealing firstly with history, the thesis offers a continuation of the examination of the historical debate over social ministry as it has affected the Church in China, explaining the effects of this debate on Protestant ministry in Taiwan throughout the Nationalist era. The findings of the thesis also have value for a more general audience of historians who are interested in the effects of the social gospel on the world stage, in particular those from non-Western nations who are arguing for a return to evangelicalism as it was before the great reversal.<sup>2</sup>

As Chapter One argued, Protestant thought in pre-Civil War America and in Britain were united not only in agreement over the four pillars,<sup>3</sup> but also in shared understanding of Christian ethics. The dominant view of the relationship between evangelism and

social ministry was one of consequence: upon conversion Christians were expected to demonstrate their new character with a virtuous life that would express itself in social service. There was no retreat into a private spirituality. Personal holiness and helping others who were in need were two sides of the same coin. This holistic understanding of evangelism and social service bifurcated with the great reversal, and produced sharp polarization in Chinese Protestantism that has been continued in Taiwan. Eden's *Shuangfu* Theology represents a contextually motivated return to holistic thinking by arguing that the division between individual and social ministry is a false polarity at variance with the original view of the evangelical movement.<sup>4</sup>

Turning to the field of practical theology, this thesis has argued that the key concept in Eden's approach is expressed in its *Shuangfu* Theology. While this was examined in detail in Chapter Four, it is helpful in this Conclusion to assess it in relation to the thought of Thomas H. Groome, a leading theorist in the fields of religious education and pastoral ministry. Groome rejects the dualism that separates knowing from being that has been common in western philosophy, arguing instead for an "epistemic ontology"<sup>5</sup> that emphasizes the importance of reason without allowing for an "epistemic privilege of a few over the rest."<sup>6</sup> Like Paulo Freire, Groome argues that education does not occur when a teacher simply delivers information to students. Like Shoki Coe, he maintains the goal of religious education is not only to impart intellectual knowledge but to affect the entire life of the learner. He believes that Christian faith is essentially communal and Christian education therefore entails introducing a communal identity.<sup>7</sup> Education itself must emerge in communal interaction that engages the "critical reason, analytical memory, and creative imagination"<sup>8</sup> of both the students and teacher. To this end he encourages education through dialogue with oneself, others, and God.<sup>9</sup>

It was in exactly this way that the theology of the Eden Foundation and its founder Liu Hsia emerged from among, in relationship with, rather than on behalf of, their community. This was in direct contrast to other contextual theologies in Taiwan that exhibit Groome's "epistemic privilege." This is not to dispute that they represent the needs of their community, or that they have failed to accurately relate the gospel message to those needs. Yet the fact that even the leaders of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan find People's Theologies difficult to understand indicates they have not emerged in communal interaction in the same manner as those of Eden and Liu.

Eden staff describe the ministries of churches as marked by authoritarian preaching and program-oriented services. The Eden Social Welfare Foundation and Liu Hsia, by contrast, demonstrate Groome's theories in practice. Their ministry has succeeded in drawing from local cultural resources to develop a holistic theology to support a ministry that has transformed the community. Eden has been so successful in serving among the disabled that the nation's businesses and political leaders find it advantageous to be seen as affiliated with their ministry.<sup>10</sup> Liu's social views are printed in the nation's newspapers, and are valued to the extent the President invited her into his inner circle of advisors. It might be argued that *Shuangfu* Theology validates the effectiveness of Groome's theories and thereby contributes to the field of practical theology, in particular in Taiwan, where it represents an innovative method for forming theology.

### Unresolved Issues

If social ministry in Protestant Taiwan was assessed in quantitative terms of numbers of institutions,<sup>11</sup> a superficial analysis might conclude that the churches are deeply concerned with society, and that their work is sustained by robust theologies of social service. The qualitative analysis that has been developed in this thesis comes to a quite different conclusion. As Stephen Chen has argued, the fact that the profusion of Christian welfare institutions work independently of the churches points to deep inadequacies in the churches themselves in respect of social ministry. He shows that when churches have not taken action regarding a particular need, individual Christians have been moved to form ministries that address the problem. Chen urges churches to appreciate the blessings that such institutions bring, for they contribute much to Protestantism in Taiwan. He explains that the churches by themselves have been unable to develop holistic ministries of both spiritual and social service.<sup>12</sup>

The Eden Foundation and Liu Hsia have had a deep desire to redress this problem by promoting *Shuangfu* Theology among the churches as a force for change. Liu once published a prayer in which she asked for ten more years to "knock on the gate of the church and let the brothers and sisters be concerned about society and use the love they have for God on the littlest brothers."<sup>13</sup>

Why, then, have Protestant churches in Taiwan been unwilling to consider the contribution of the Eden Social Welfare Foundation? The problem is rooted in the relationship between churches and Christian institutions that generally characterized Protestantism in Taiwan. Tim Chau, the president of World Vision in Taiwan, recalls surprise upon discovering how strained the relationship could be. After a long career in social ministry in Australia he returned to Taiwan in 1998 and was surprised to find the rapport between the churches and his organization to be only “luke warm.”<sup>14</sup> Missionary Paul Buttrey more frankly describes the relationship between Church and para-Church organizations in Taiwan as “fragmented.” He notes they tend to “operate without reference to one another.”<sup>15</sup>

Stephen Chen and Allen Swanson explain that most churches are small and have difficulty funding and staffing their own ministries. Institutions can draw both financial and human resources away from the churches.<sup>16</sup> Moreover they are generally perceived as being ineffective agents for church growth.<sup>17</sup> Swanson, like Coe before him, further explains that the majority of institutions were established either by foreign missionaries or Christians who acted independently from churches. He notes that churches have never been consulted as to the running of such organizations, and that churches have thus never felt affinity with these bodies. Swanson describes the dissociation as so severe that churches would probably refuse to support institutions even if funds were available.<sup>18</sup>

The same political and ecclesial factors that polarized Taiwan’s Protestant community are also responsible for the fractured relationships. Chris Su explains that in authoritarian Taiwan even members of mainland-originating churches were fearful of running afoul of government policy, and therefore refused to undertake any social initiatives without knowing whether these had the approval of the Nationalist party.<sup>19</sup> This deference to government was compounded by the views of Watchman Nee, who taught that welfare institutions could be organized by individual Christians and noted they were helpful in facilitating evangelism for a time. Yet his insistence that they were part of a worldly system and would inevitably drift toward secularism demonstrates that he did not consider them able to contribute anything of lasting value, or of theological consequence.<sup>20</sup>

The relationship is even problematic for those institutions and congregations that belong to the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan. To be sure in the General Assembly and in the Presbyterian seminaries, where training in social work has a long history, there is support for the denomination's welfare foundations. Indeed after the lifting of martial law the denomination demonstrated a renewed interest in responding to particular social needs by establishing institutions to provide specialized services.<sup>21</sup> However Hsu Ming-hsiung's research reveals congregations are generally not supportive of such ministries.<sup>22</sup> C. S. Yang argues that churches do value the work of the institutions established by the denomination. Yet he also concurs that funding has not been forthcoming.<sup>23</sup>

It seems reasonable to conclude, therefore, that the reason *Shuangfu* Theology has received less than enthusiastic attention among the Taiwanese churches has not been due to the theology itself, but because of the poor relationship that generally exists between churches and welfare institutions. Eden is not alone in feeling frustration over this situation. Anthony H. Su (蘇希三), the Deputy Executive Officer of Taiwan's Garden of Hope Foundation (勵馨社會福利事業基金會), a ministry that serves young women who have experienced sexual abuse, expresses a desire to work together with the churches to develop theology. He maintains that attitudes in the churches are often irrelevant or even harmful to the young women whom his organization seeks to assist. He believes the experiences of his foundation have enabled them to develop a much-needed perspective on Jesus' ministry to women and prostitutes and that this information could serve as correctives in the churches. Yet with theological power located in the churches, and seminary and churches being unwilling to interact with welfare agencies, he finds that his theological approach to social ministry is, like Eden's, largely ignored.<sup>24</sup>

This thesis has shown how Protestants in Taiwan have been active in importing theories of church growth, cell group movements, Reformed traditions, and theologies of liberation. Such theologies can prove beneficial. The faith is both global and local, and it is advantageous to interact with new ideas.<sup>25</sup> Yet this must be done with care. William Russell warns that appropriating a theology that works in one context requires careful attention to both the meaning of gospel and the reality of the new situation.<sup>26</sup> That the churches in Taiwan are often critiqued for their foreign flavor raises questions about how well this has been done.<sup>27</sup> By contrast Christian institutions can offer

theologies that have been developed in context. For the churches to seek more eagerly to learn from foreign movements than from what has emerged from and proven effective within the culture is a gross oversight. Indeed this represents a tragic state of affairs in a country where, to quote a study of the theology of Shoki Coe, "Coe's search for God in unexpected events provided the theological bedrock for his formulation of the concept of contextualization."<sup>1</sup>

### Issues for Further Research

This thesis has investigated the bearing of political and ecclesial contexts upon the theologies of social service in Chinese Protestantism during the Nationalist era. Other contextual factors that have been mentioned only in passing need also to be explored. For example, it was noted that Buddhist social services sparked a renewed interest in social service among Protestant churches. The influence of Confucian thought upon Liu's theology was described in some detail. It would be helpful to investigate the impact of religion and other cultural factors in a more comprehensive manner. The Chinese concept of relationship, of "us" versus "them," also emerged in many of the interviews undertaken as part of this research. If this in part explains the reluctance of churches to become involved in services of a social nature, it calls for deeper cultural and psychological analysis that has been possible in this thesis.

### Postscript

Recognizing that the motivation of a researcher has bearing upon content and outcome of the research, a final word should be added about the value of this project for the author. The research has indeed been a journey of discovery. The individuals and ideas with whom the author has interacted have changed his thinking in many ways. The research demanded that he give a fair and sympathetic hearing to each perspective here represented. The author's background predisposed him to approaching some positions with apprehension. When he came to understand these in their context, however, he invariably gained a new appreciation for their thoughtfulness and relevance. As a result of this study approaches to which the author was initially supportive began to seem less beneficial, while those he was predisposed to reject became infused with new and valuable meaning.

The author hopes this study will have the same effect on the churches in Taiwan, that new insights into perspectives that have not heretofore been considered will prove helpful, and that this will facilitate the development of theologies of social ministry that will fully bless the weak. On a smaller scale, it appears that when the author returns to Taiwan he will teach in a theological seminary. It is hoped that in this capacity he will be able to help students in the manner suggested by Shoki Coe, who believed theological education was not a matter of presenting information, but of enabling students to learn to wrestle with both text and context to form theologies appropriate to the moment. In so doing he desires to present the Eden Social Welfare Foundation and Liu Hsia as models of holistic social ministry. Despite limitations, they undertook their task with both honesty and humility, and their achievements have been remarkable.

## NOTES

### TRANSLATION AND TRANSLITERATION

<sup>1</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Live Well, Die Well," trans. Caroline Mason, *Renditions*, Spring & Autumn 1991, 42-43.

### INTRODUCTION

<sup>1</sup> John Gettings and Beth Rowen, "Timeline Taiwan: Key Events in Taiwanese History from WWII to the Present," Pearson Education, 2005, <<http://www.infoplease.com/spot/taiwantime1.html>> (14 February 2006).

<sup>2</sup> Maysing H. Yang, ed., *Give Taiwan a Chance*, (Taipei: The Democratic Progressive Party, 1996), 137-141; Hill Gates, "Ethnicity and Social Class," in *The Anthropology of Taiwanese Society*, ed. Emily Martin Ahern and Hill Gates (Taipei: SMC Publishing, Inc. 1981), 242; David C. E. Liao, *The Unresponsive: Resistant or Neglected* (Chicago: Moody Press, 1972), 18; "President Chen's Top Aide Says Playing Ethnic Politics 'Immoral,'" *China Post* (Taipei), 26 April 2002, 1.

<sup>3</sup> Lin Chung-hsiung, interview by author, tape recording, Hsinchu Taiwan, 25 August 2002; Chow Lien-hwa, interview by author, tape recording, Taipei Taiwan, 12 August 2002; Jim Courson, "Taiwan's Independent Churches: A Study in Contrasts," *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 6, no. 2 (1997): 34.

<sup>4</sup> Christianity in Taiwan has been examined from many different perspectives. When emphasizing Chinese historical and cultural continuity some have used the rather limited and static term "Mandarin" of mainland-originating churches. This can be confusing, however, because some such churches minister in languages other than Mandarin, because there is a denomination in Taiwan called the "Mandarin Church" (國語禮拜堂), and because some use the term to indicate Chinese independent churches. Murray A. Rubinstein *The Protestant Community on Modern Taiwan: Mission, Seminary, and Church* (London: M.E. Sharpe, 1991), 54-58, 59; Allen J. Swanson, *The Church in Taiwan: Profile 1980* (Pasadena: William Carey Library, 1981), 26, 59, 210-211; Allen J. Swanson, *Mending the Nets: Taiwan Church Growth and Loss in the 1980s*, (Pasadena: William Carey Press, 1986), 200.

<sup>5</sup> Anselm Strauss and Juliet Corbin, *Basics of Qualitative Research: Techniques and Procedures for Developing Grounded Theory* (London: Sage Publications, 1998), 11.

<sup>6</sup> Robert G. Burgess, "Some Role Problems in Field Research," in *Field Research: a Sourcebook and Field Manual*, ed. Robert G. Burgess (London: George Allen & Unwin, 1982), 48.

<sup>7</sup> Strauss and Corbin, 12.

<sup>8</sup> Ian Dey, *Qualitative Data Analysis: A User-Friendly Guide for Social Scientists* (London: Routledge, 1993), 30, 53-54.

<sup>9</sup> Stephen B. Bevans, *Models of Contextual Theology* (Maryknoll: Orbis Books, 2002), 29-31

<sup>10</sup> A review of five of these can be found in Dorothy A. Raber, *Protestantism in Changing Taiwan: A Call to Creative Response* (Pasadena: William Carey Library, 1978), 233-242.

<sup>11</sup> Allen J. Swanson, *Taiwan: Mainline versus Independent Church Growth, a Study in Contrasts* (Pasadena: William Carey Library, 1970); Allen J. Swanson, *I Will Build My Church: Ten Case Studies of Church Growth in Taiwan*, (Pasadena: William Carey Library, 1977); Swanson, *The Church*; Swanson, *Mending*.

<sup>12</sup> Rubinstein, *Protestant Community*, 56-58.

<sup>13</sup> Tsai Kuo-shan, "The Evangelization of the Urban Industrial Workers in Taiwan Missiological Perspectives" (D.Miss. thesis, Fuller Theological Seminary, 1985); Wong Chong-gyiau, "The Emergence

of Political Statements and Political Theology in the History of the Taiwanese Presbyterian Church” (Th.D. thesis, Boston University, 1992).

<sup>14</sup> Jen Wei-xuan, “The Role of Christian Social Care and the Development of Welfare in the Taiwan Community” (M.A. diss., National Taiwan University, 1991); Hsu Ming-hsiung, “The Development of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan’s Social Service Ministry” (M.A. diss., National Chung Jen University, 1998); Hsu Te-ling, “The Communal Life and Individualism in Independent Churches” (M.A. diss., National Taiwan University, 2000).

<sup>15</sup> Huang Po-Ho, “Searching for a Compassionate Human Community: A Taiwanese Perspective on Doing Mission in a Pluralistic Society,” *Asian Journal of Theology* 7, no. 1 (1993); Wong Chong-gyiau.

<sup>16</sup> Jun Xing, *Baptized in the Fire of Revolution: The American Social Gospel and the Y.M.C.A. in China: 1919-1937* (London: Associated University Presses, 1996); Gary Christopher Crownover, “Institutional Schism and Variant Christologies in the China Christian Establishment: A Case Study of the China Inland Mission and the Chinese Young Men’s Christian Association: 1920-1929” (M.A. diss., University of Kansas, 2000); Lee Ming Ng, “Christianity and Social Change: The Case in China, 1920-1950 (Ph.D. thesis, Princeton Theological Seminary, 1970).

<sup>17</sup> Arthur P. Wolf, “Gods, Ghosts, and Ancestors”, in *Studies in Chinese Society*, ed. by Arthur P. Wolf (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1978), 133-141; David K. Jordan, *Gods, Ghosts, and Ancestors: The Folk Religion of a Taiwanese Village* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1972), 40.

## CHAPTER ONE

<sup>1</sup> Chris Su, interview by author, tape recording, Taipei Taiwan, 10 April 2002.

<sup>2</sup> C. William Mensendiek, "The Protestant Missionary Understanding of the Chinese Situation and the Christian Task from 1890 to 1911" (Ph.D. thesis, Columbia University, 1958), 97-98, 104-105, 114.

<sup>3</sup> Katherine Kennedy Reist, "A Church for China: A Problem in Self Identification, 1919-1937" (Ph.D. thesis, Ohio State University, 1983), 94.

<sup>4</sup> *Ibid.*, 120-121.

<sup>5</sup> David J. Bosch, *Transforming Mission: Paradigm Shifts in Theology of Mission* (New York: Orbis Books, 1991), 320, 283; Jean Miller Schmidt, *Souls or the Social Order: The Two Party System in American Protestantism* (New York: Carlson Publishing, Inc., 1991), 32-33, 52-56.

<sup>6</sup> Ronald C. White, Jr. and C. Howard Hopkins, *The Social Gospel: Religion and Reform in Changing America* (Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1976), 5-6; Timothy L. Smith, *Revivalism and Social Reform: American Protestantism on the Eve of the Civil War* (Massachusetts: Peter Smith, 1976), 80, 93-94; Schmidt, 51.

<sup>7</sup> D. W. Bebbington, *Evangelicalism in Modern Britain: A History from the 1730s to the 1980s* (London: Unwin Hyman, 1989), 106, 120-122; George M. Marsden, "Evangelical and Fundamental Christianity," in *The Encyclopedia of Religion*, 1987 ed., 191; David O. Moberg, *The Great Reversal: Evangelism versus Social Concern* (London: Scripture Union, 1972), 29-30; Timothy L. Smith, 165-167, 171, 173, 177; Schmidt, 20-22.

<sup>8</sup> Marsden, "Evangelical," 190; Orlando E. Costas, "Evangelical Theology in the Two-Thirds World," in *Earthen Vessels: American Evangelicals and Foreign Missions, 1880-1890*, ed. Joel A. Carpenter and Wilbert R. Shenk (Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1990), 237; Martin E. Marty, "Editor's Preface," in Jean Miller Schmidt, *Souls or the Social Order: The Two Party System in American Protestantism* (New York: Carlson Publishing, Inc., 1991), xiii; Bebbington, 2-3; Timothy L. Smith, 8.

<sup>9</sup> Dickey, 44; Charles Howard Hopkins, *The Rise of the Social Gospel in American Protestantism: 1865-1915* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1967), 15, 16; Timothy L. Smith, 8; Marty, "Editor's Preface," xiii; Schmidt, 23; Bebbington, 69; White and Hopkins, 5; James Barr, *Explorations in Theology*, vol. 7, *The Scope and Authority of the Bible* (London: SCM Press Ltd, 1980), 66.

<sup>10</sup> Bosch, 283, 315; Schmidt, 9-10, 45-48.

<sup>11</sup> Dwight L. Moody, in William G. McLoughlin Jr., *Modern Revivalism: Charles Grandison Finney to Billy Graham* (New York: The Ronald Press Company, 1959), 257.

<sup>12</sup> Schmidt, 43-44, 46-48.

<sup>13</sup> "Bosch, 318, 317-318.

<sup>14</sup> Washington Gladden, *Social Salvation* (London: James Clarke and Company, 1902), 26, 6-8; Walter Rauschenbusch, *Christianity and the Social Crisis* (New York: The MacMillan Company, 1912), 55, 65-66; Henry F. May, *Protestant Churches and Industrial America* (New York: Octagon Books, 1977), 173-175, 203; Schmidt, 52-56.

<sup>15</sup> Bosch, 283, 322; May, 170; Schmidt, 77; Hopkins, 122.

<sup>16</sup> Hughley, 141.

<sup>17</sup> Bosch, 320-321.

<sup>18</sup> Hughley, 140-143; Rauschenbusch, 59.

<sup>19</sup> Hughley, 141-143.

<sup>20</sup> Gladden, 9-11; Hopkins, 231-232.

<sup>21</sup> Hopkins, 209.

<sup>22</sup> *Ibid.*, 207-219; Rauschenbusch, 62.

<sup>23</sup> Hughley, 141-143; Rauschenbusch, 65.

<sup>24</sup> Bosch, 297.

<sup>25</sup> Marsden, "Evangelical," 192.

- <sup>26</sup> Marty, "Editor's Preface," xiii.
- <sup>27</sup> George Marsden, *Reforming Fundamentalism: Fuller Seminary and the New Evangelicalism* (William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company: Grand Rapids, 1987), 4, 10.
- <sup>28</sup> Jon R. Stone, *On the Boundaries of American Evangelicalism* (London: MacMillan Press Ltd., 1997), 63-64; John Stott, *Issues Facing Christians Today* (Hants, U.K.: Marshall Morgan & Scott, 1984), xi.
- <sup>29</sup> W. F. Storrar, interview by author, Edinburgh Scotland, November 2002.
- <sup>30</sup> Moberg, 31; Marsden, *Fundamentalism*, 10, 22, 36; Schmidt, 76, 118, 127, 197, 199-200; James Barr, *Fundamentalism* (London: SCM Press, 1977), 2; Bob E. Patterson, *Carl F. H. Henry*, (Waco, Texas: Word Books, 1983), 38.
- <sup>31</sup> Moberg, 35-36.
- <sup>32</sup> Barr, *Fundamentalism*, 116.
- <sup>33</sup> Carl F. H. Henry, *The Uneasy Conscience of Modern Fundamentalism* (Grand Rapids: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1947), 30; Bebbington, 213-214; Moberg, 11, 30.
- <sup>34</sup> Kenneth Scott Latourette, *A History of Christian Missions in China* (London: Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge, 1929), 794.
- <sup>35</sup> L. Newton Hayes, "The Reading of Missionaries," *Chinese Recorder* 52 (December 1921): 814; "Editorial," *Chinese Recorder* 51 (September 1920): 598-599; "Editorial: Question of Fundamentals," *Chinese Recorder* 63 (July 1932): 405; T. Ekeland, "To the Editor of the *Chinese Recorder*," *Chinese Recorder* 52 (October 1921): 720; F. E. A. Shepherd, "The Modernist Position: To the Editor of the *Chinese Recorder*," *Chinese Recorder* 52 (June 1921): 436; C. G. S. Baronsfeather, "Old and New Theology: To the Editor of The *Chinese Recorder*," *Chinese Recorder* 52 (August 1921): 576.
- <sup>36</sup> "Puzzled: A Letter from a Missionary Son to his Father," *Chinese Recorder* 55 (July 1924): 473.
- <sup>37</sup> *Ibid.*, 474, 472-474.
- <sup>38</sup> "Puzzled: A Letter from a Missionary Father to his Son," *Chinese Recorder* 55 (August 1924): 539.
- <sup>39</sup> *Ibid.*
- <sup>40</sup> *Ibid.*
- <sup>41</sup> *Ibid.*, 538-541.
- <sup>42</sup> Crownover, 4; Reist, 154, 159; Samuel D. Ling, "The Other May Fourth Movement: The Chinese Christian Renaissance, 1919-1937" (Ph.D. thesis, Temple University, 1980), 102-103.
- <sup>43</sup> Daniel H. Bays, "Ch'eng Ching-Yi (Cheng Jingyi)," in *Biographical Dictionary of Christian Missions*, 1998 ed..
- <sup>44</sup> C. Y. Cheng, "Spiritual Preparedness of the Christian Church in China to Meet the Present Situation," in *Report of Conference on The Church in China Today: The Report of a Conference of Christian Workers with Dr. John R. Mott, Chairman of the International Missionary Council, January 5-7, 1926* (Shanghai: National Christian Council of China, 1926), 16.
- <sup>45</sup> D. E. Hoste in *Report of Conference on The Church in China Today: The Report of a Conference of Christian Workers with Dr. John R. Mott, Chairman of the International Missionary Council, January 5-7, 1926* (Shanghai: National Christian Council of China, 1926), 20.
- <sup>46</sup> Galatians 1:8; Hoste, *Report*, 20.
- <sup>47</sup> C. G. Sparham, "Principles which should Govern the Policy of Christian Missions in China in the Years Ahead," in *Report of Conference on The Church in China Today: The Report of a Conference of Christian Workers with Dr. John R. Mott, Chairman of the International Missionary Council, January 5-7, 1926* (Shanghai: National Christian Council of China, 1926), 65-69; Crownover, 27-34.
- <sup>48</sup> Min Ma, "Wei, Francis C(ho) M(in)," in *Biographical Dictionary of Christian Missions*, 1998 ed..
- <sup>49</sup> Francis Wei, "Making Christianity Indigenous in China," in *Report of Conference on The Church in China Today: The Report of a Conference of Christian Workers with Dr. John R. Mott, Chairman of the International Missionary Council, January 5-7, 1926* (Shanghai: National Christian Council of China, 1926), 33.

- <sup>50</sup> Crownover, 17-18.
- <sup>51</sup> Xing, 74-75.
- <sup>52</sup> T.C. Chao, "Christianity and the National Crisis," *Chinese Recorder* 68 (January 1937): 8.
- <sup>53</sup> P.C. Hsu, "Can the Church help in Rural Reconstruction?" *Chinese Recorder* 68 (January 1937): 20; Xing 181.
- <sup>54</sup> Y.T. Wu, "Should Christianity Concern Itself in Social Reconstruction," *Chinese Recorder* 68 (January 1937): 24.
- <sup>55</sup> Bob Whyte, *Unfinished Encounter: China and Christianity* (Glasgow: William Collins Son and Co. Ltd., 1988), 180.
- <sup>56</sup> T. T. Lew, "What the Young Men's Christian Association has Contributed to the Chinese Church," trans. T.K. Wong, *Chinese Recorder* 68 (February 1937), 103.
- <sup>57</sup> Y. T. Wu, "The Present-Day Tragedy of Christianity," in *Documents of the Three-Self Movement: Source Materials for the Study of the Protestant Church in Communist China*, ed. Wallace C. Merwin and Francis P. Jones (National Council of the Church of Christ in The USA, Far Eastern Office Division of Foreign Missions, 1963), 3-4.
- <sup>58</sup> "A New Missionary Looks Around," *Chinese Recorder* 63 (March 1932): 152; Reist, 129, 164.
- <sup>59</sup> Xing, 42-43, 61.
- <sup>60</sup> Brother David explains this is the spelling Wang desired in *Walking the Hard Road: Wang Ming-Tao* (London: Marshall Pickering, 1989), 6.
- <sup>61</sup> Lee Ming Ng, "Christianity," 1.
- <sup>62</sup> Z. K. Zia, "Chinese Evangelists in Modern China," *Chinese Recorder* 66 (Jan. 1935): 47.
- <sup>63</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>64</sup> Leslie Lyall, *Three of China's Mighty Men* (Kent, England: OMF International, 2000), 108.
- <sup>65</sup> Tony Lambert, "Wang Mingdao: A Christian in Conflict with the State," *The Answer of a Good Conscience: Papers Read at the 1997 Westminster Conference* (London: The Westminster Conference, 1997), 119; Lambert, *Resurrection*, 158; Lyall, 140, 143;
- <sup>66</sup> Whyte, 177-178; Norman Howard Cliff, "The Life and Theology of Watchman Nee, Including a Study of the Little Flock Movement which He Founded" (M.Phil. diss., Open University, 1983), 77.
- <sup>67</sup> Lee Ming Ng, "Wang Ming-Tao: An Evaluation of His Thought and Action," *Ching Feng* 16, no. 2 (1973): 59-61.
- <sup>68</sup> Wong Ming-dao, *A Stone Made Smooth* (Southampton, England: Mayflower Christian Books, 1981), 83-84, 106, 110-111.
- <sup>69</sup> Wong Ming-dao, "Understanding and Doing the Will of God," in *Spiritual Food*, trans. Arthur Reynolds (Southampton, England: Mayflower Christian Books, 1983), 108-109.
- <sup>70</sup> Wong Ming-dao, *Stone*, 83-84.
- <sup>71</sup> Ng, "Wang Ming-Tao," 51.
- <sup>72</sup> "Work and Workers," *Chinese Recorder* 63 (April 1932): 259-260.
- <sup>73</sup> Wang Ming-dao, "Touchstone of Obedience," in *A Call to the Church*, trans. Theodore Choy, ed. Leona F. Choy (Pennsylvania: Christian Literature Crusade, 1983), 78-79; Wong Ming-dao, "Understanding," 102-108, 111.
- <sup>74</sup> Theodore Choy and Leona Francis Choy, "Wang Ming-dao: The Man Iron Turned to Steel," in *Wang Ming-dao, A Call to the Church*, trans. Theodore Choy, ed. Leona F. Choy (Pennsylvania: Christian Literature Crusade, 1983), 7; Wong Ming-dao, *Stone*, 48-49.
- <sup>75</sup> Wong Ming-dao, *Stone*, 86; Lyall, 111.
- <sup>76</sup> Wong Ming-dao, *Stone*, 86-87.
- <sup>77</sup> Ibid., 13, 15, 23, 48-49, 108.
- <sup>78</sup> Wang Ming-dao, "Obey God or Men?," in *A Call to the Church*, trans. Theodore Choy, ed. Leona F. Choy (Pennsylvania: Christian Literature Crusade, 1983), 25-26; Wong Ming-dao, *Day by Day*, trans. Arthur Reynolds (Crowborough, England: Highland Books, 1989), 13, 17, 23, 29, 30, 66.
- <sup>79</sup> Wong Ming-dao, "Repenting and Believing," in *Spiritual Food*, trans. Arthur Reynolds (Southampton, England: Mayflower Christian Books, 1983), 22-26.

- <sup>80</sup> "Chinese Christian Workers Conference at Peitaiho and Kuling," *Chinese Recorder* 63 (Oct 1932): 651; J. McWhirter, "Revival Movements in Manchuria," *Chinese Recorder* 64 (Dec. 1933): 774; "Revival Movements in Manchuria: Harbin," *Chinese Recorder* 64, (Dec. 1933): 781.
- <sup>81</sup> Wang Ming-dao, "Success and Embroidered Pillows," in *A Call to the Church*, trans. Theodore Choy, ed. Leona F. Choy (Pennsylvania: Christian Literature Crusade, 1983), 56; Wong Ming-dao, "The Distinctive Colour of Heaven," in *Spiritual Food*, trans. Arthur Reynolds (Southampton, England: Mayflower Christian Books, 1983), 3-4.
- <sup>82</sup> Lyall, 114.
- <sup>83</sup> Wang Ming-dao, "A Young Opportunist," in *A Call to the Church*, trans. Theodore Choy, ed. Leona F. Choy (Pennsylvania: Christian Literature Crusade, 1983), 61; Wang Ming-dao, "The Missing Voice," in *A Call to the Church*, trans. Theodore Choy, ed. Leona F. Choy (Pennsylvania: Christian Literature Crusade, 1983), 40-42; Lyall, 116; Wong Ming-dao, "Dangers in the Present Day Church" in *Spiritual Food*, trans. Arthur Reynolds (Southampton, England: Mayflower Christian Books, 1983), 36-37.
- <sup>84</sup> Wong Ming-dao, "A Great Prophet and a Self-Abasing Commander," in *Spiritual Food*, trans. Arthur Reynolds (Southampton, England: Mayflower Christian Books, 1983), 31-34; Wong Ming-dao, "Dangers," 39-42.
- <sup>85</sup> Wong Ming-dao, *Stone*, 94-96; Wong Ming-dao, "A Wise Leader," in *Spiritual Food*, trans. Arthur Reynolds (Southampton, England: Mayflower Christian Books, 1983), 163-165.
- <sup>86</sup> Wang Ming-dao, "Look at God's Servant," in *A Call to the Church*, trans. Theodore Choy, ed. Leona F. Choy (Pennsylvania: Christian Literature Crusade, 1983), 48; Wong Ming-dao, *Day by Day*, 22.
- <sup>87</sup> Wang Ming-dao, "They Had No Fear of Death," in *The Voice of China's Christians: Pathway to Glory*, ed. Arthur Reynolds (London: Overseas Missionary Fellowship, 1972), 21.
- <sup>88</sup> Lyall, 116-117; Donald E. MacInnis, "Wang, Ming-tao (Wang Mingdao)," in *Biographical Dictionary of Christian Missions*, 1998 ed..
- <sup>89</sup> Peter Chi Ping Lin, interview by author, tape recording, Taipei Taiwan, 6 May 2002; Stephen Chen, interview by author, tape recording, Taipei Taiwan, 26 April, 2002.
- <sup>90</sup> Wong Ming-dao, "Those Who Deserve to be Accursed," in *Spiritual Food*, trans. Arthur Reynolds (Southampton, England: Mayflower Christian Books, 1983), 115, 119-128; Wong Ming-dao, "Repenting," 24; Wong Ming-dao, *Stone*, 97, 149; Wang Ming-tao, in Tony Lambert, "Wang Mingdao: A Christian in Conflict with the State," in *The Answer of a Good Conscience: Papers Read at the 1997 Westminster Conference* (London: The Westminster Conference, 1997), 124-125.
- <sup>91</sup> Wong Ming-dao, *Stone*, 149.
- <sup>92</sup> Wong Ming-dao, "Accursed," 122, 119-125; Wang Ming-dao, "Looking at One who Cared for the Poor," in *Chinese Church Iron-Man Wang Ming-Dao Looks at These People*, trans. Evelyn B. Solomon (Taiwan: Conservative Baptist Press, 1988), 74.
- <sup>93</sup> Wong Ming-dao, *Stone*, 69-70; Wang Ming-dao, "Death," 17-21.
- <sup>94</sup> Wang Ming-dao, "Death," 18; Ng, "Wang Ming-Tao," 55.
- <sup>95</sup> Wang, "God or Men?," 28.
- <sup>96</sup> Wong Ming-dao, *Stone*, 216, 214-216; Jamie Taylor, "A Tribute to Wang Ming-Dao," *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 1, no 2 (October 1991): 37; Choy and Choy, 8.
- <sup>97</sup> Wong Ming-dao, "Accursed," 126-127.
- <sup>98</sup> Wang Ming-dao, "Poor," 73-75.
- <sup>99</sup> Wong Ming-dao, *Stone*, 97.
- <sup>100</sup> *Ibid.*, 111.
- <sup>101</sup> *Ibid.*, 97.
- <sup>102</sup> Wang Ming-dao, "Missing Voice," 40.
- <sup>103</sup> Wong Ming-dao, *Stone*, 97; Wong Ming-dao, *Day by Day*, 60; Lyall, 127-128; Lambert, "Wang Mingdao," 126-128.
- <sup>104</sup> Jonathan Chao, "Major Movements," 139.
- <sup>105</sup> Lam, 589; Lyall, 71, 74-76; James Chen, *Meet Brother Nee*, trans. G. K. Leung (Hong Kong: The Christian Publishers, 1976), 38-40.

<sup>106</sup> Watchman Nee, *The Normal Christian Church Life* (Colorado Springs, International Students Press, 1969), 70, 79; Watchman Nee, *What Shall This Man Do* (London: Victory Press, 1965), 92, 135; T. C. Chao, "The Indigenous Church," *Chinese Recorder* 56 (August 1925): 497, 500-502; T. C. Chao, "The Chinese Student and the Christian Church," in *The China Mission Yearbook, 1923*, ed. Frank Rawlinson (Shanghai, Christian Literature Society, 1923), 80; Swanson, *Mainline*, 36; Courson, "Independent Churches," 36.

<sup>107</sup> T. C. Chao, "The Meaning of the Church," *Chinese Recorder* 66 (October 1935): 590; T. C. Chao, "Religious Situation in China," *Chinese Recorder* 61 (November 1930): 679.

<sup>108</sup> Nee, *Church Life*, 62; T. C. Chao, "Life of Christ," trans. D. Willard Lyon, in "D. Willard Lyon, "Professor T. C. Chao on Jesus' Sense of His Own Mission," *Chinese Recorder* 71 (February 1940): 76-7; C. Stanley Smith, "The Authority of The Faith," *Chinese Recorder* 71 (February 1940): 108-109.

<sup>109</sup> Watchman Nee, *Release of the Spirit* (Chichester, England: New Wine Press, 1965), 55.

<sup>110</sup> The doctrine does not appear to have emerged from any movement. However Nee notes that the writings individuals such as Andrew Murray, F.B. Meyer, Otto Stockmayer, Jessie Penn-Lewis, Evan Roberts and Madame Guyon raised his awareness to the tripartite nature of humans. Watchman Nee, *The Spiritual Man*, vol. 1 (New York: Christian Fellowship Publishers Inc., 1977), 11.

<sup>111</sup> Nee, *Spiritual Man*, 1:22-27.

<sup>112</sup> *Ibid.*, 1:44-54, 70; Watchman Nee, *Love Not the World* (London: Victory Press, 1968), 16-17; Nee, *Normal Christian Life*, 27.

<sup>113</sup> James Chen, 69-73; Watchman Nee, *Sit, Walk, Stand* (London: Victory Press, 1971), 23; Nee, *Love Not*, 27-28.

<sup>114</sup> Nee, *Spiritual Man*, 1:57.

<sup>115</sup> Nee, *Spiritual Man*, 1:55-67, 77, 95-97; 2:9-15; Nee, *Normal Christian Life*, 9-11, 32.

<sup>116</sup> Nee, *Spiritual Man*, 1:12; Nee, *Love Not*, 13-21.

<sup>117</sup> Nee, *Love Not*, 28-29.

<sup>118</sup> "Explanatory Notes," in Watchman Nee, *The Spiritual Man*, vol. 1 (New York: Christian Fellowship Publishers Inc., 1977), 1:6; Nee, *Spiritual Man*, 1:52; Lyall, 80-81.

<sup>119</sup> Nee, *Love Not*, 40-41, 48-49, 52.

<sup>120</sup> Y. T. Wu in K. H. Ting, "What Can We Learn from Y. T. Wu Today?," trans. Theresa Chu, *Chinese Theological Review*, 1989, <[http://www.christianityinchina.org/download/\\_Toc23518281](http://www.christianityinchina.org/download/_Toc23518281)> (10 December 2003).

<sup>121</sup> Y. T. Wu, "How one Christian Looks at the Five Year Movement," *Chinese Recorder* 61 (March 1930): 146-148.

<sup>122</sup> Watchman Nee, *The Ministry of God's Word* (Nigeria: International Pulpit Aid Ministries), 132. Nee, *Spiritual Man*, 2:52-53; Nee, *What Shall*, 146-148.

<sup>123</sup> Nee, *Church Life*, 62, 58-72.

<sup>124</sup> Nee, *Love Not*, 21; Nee, *What Shall*, 109-111, 172-180.

<sup>125</sup> Nee, *Church Life*, 62; Nee, *Love Not*, 23; Nee, *What Shall*, 92-94.

<sup>126</sup> Nee, *What Shall*, 148-149.

<sup>127</sup> Nee, *Release*, 53-54; Nee, *What Shall*, 91, 125-126.

<sup>128</sup> Nee, *What Shall*, 102.

<sup>129</sup> Watchman Nee, *Through the Year with Watchman Nee* (Eastbourne, England: Victory Press, 1977), February 19<sup>th</sup>; Nee, *Love Not*, 13, 27-28, 42-43; Nee, *What Shall*, 102, 172-174; James Chen, 55.

<sup>130</sup> Courson, "Independent Churches," 39-40.

<sup>131</sup> Nee, *Sit, Walk, Stand*, 22-23; Nee, *Spiritual Man*, 2:41, 44; 3:158-161, 163; Nee, *Love Not*, 24, 40-41, 47-52; Watchman Nee, *The Character of the Lord's Worker* (Anaheim, California: Living Stream Ministry, 1994), 15-20; Whyte, 175.

<sup>132</sup> Nee, *Church Life*, 75.

<sup>133</sup> Nee, *Love Not*, 23.

<sup>134</sup> *Ibid.*, 22-23; Nee, *Church Life*, 75-84.

<sup>135</sup> Cliff, 152.

<sup>136</sup> Henry, 30; Patterson, back cover.

- <sup>137</sup> Ibid., 29.
- <sup>138</sup> Ibid., 30, 27.
- <sup>139</sup> Swanson, *The Church*, 30-34.
- <sup>140</sup> Angela Symonds in "Towards the Year 2000 Conference: Reflections," *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 1, no. 1 (1991): 14-15.
- <sup>141</sup> Chow Lien-hwa, interview, 12 August 2002; John Chu, interview by author, tape recording, Taichung Taiwan, 29 July 2002.
- <sup>142</sup> Marc J. Cohen, *The Unknown Taiwan* (Taipei: The Coalition for Democracy and the North American Taiwanese Women's Association, 1992), 20-22; George H. Kerr, "Formosa Betrayed," *North American Taiwanese Professor's Association*, 1997, <<http://www.formosa.org/~taiwanpg/kerr.pdf>> (13 February 2004), 23-26, 43-45, 71-79.
- <sup>143</sup> Ding Kuo, "Inspection of the Taiwan 2-28 Incident – Centering Around Chen Yi and Taiwan Provincial Commanding Office," trans. Chen Li-fu and Hsia Jung-ho, in Siau-fong Lee, "Chiang Kia-shek and the 2-28 Incident: Who Should be Held Accountable?," in *An Introduction to the 2-28 Tragedy in Taiwan: For World Citizens*, ed. Tsung-yi Lin (Taipei: Taiwan Renaissance Foundation Press, 1998), 60-61.
- <sup>144</sup> The term "Taiwanese" is political rather than cultural. It can be used of the largest of the four people groups who inhabit the island (Minnan immigrants from Fuchien province) as in the way Monte R. Bullard speaks of the Taiwanese language in *The Soldier and the Citizen: The Role of the Military in Taiwan's Development* (London: M.E. Sharpe, 1997), 37; of all who think of Taiwan rather than China as their homeland as in "The DPP's Position on Ethnic Policy," in *Give Taiwan A Chance*, ed. Maysing H. Yang (Taipei: the Democratic Progressive Party, 1996), 140; and to differentiate between the pre-1945 and post-1945 Chinese migrants as in Stevan Harrell and Huang Chun-Chieh, "Introduction: Change and Contention in Taiwan's Cultural Scene," in *Cultural Change in Postwar Taiwan*, ed. Stevan Harrell and Huang Chun-chieh (Taipei, SMC Publishing, Inc., 1994), 14.
- <sup>145</sup> Murray A. Rubinstein, "The Taiwan Miracle," in *The Other Taiwan: 1945 to the Present*, ed. Murray A. Rubinstein (London: M.E. Sharpe, 1994), 4; Wu Yung, *Fire Within: An Autobiography by Wu Yong*, ed. by Fay Goddard (Taipei: A & D Publishing House, Ltd., 1999), 58-62; Kenneth L. Wilson, *Angel at Her Shoulder: Lillian Dickson and her Taiwan Mission* (London: Harper & Row, Publishers, 1964), 72.
- <sup>146</sup> Edwin A. Winckler, "National, Regional, and Local Politics," in *The Anthropology of Taiwanese Society*, ed. Emily Martin Ahern and Hill Gates (Taipei: SMC Publishing, 1981), 15.
- <sup>147</sup> Tsung-yi Lin, "An Editor's Prologue," in *An Introduction to 2-28 Tragedy in Taiwan: For World Citizens*, ed. Tsung-yi Lin (Taipei: Taiwan Renaissance Foundation Press, 1998), xv; "28 February 1947: Taiwan's Holocaust Remembered," *New Taiwan, Ilha Formosa*, n.d., <<http://www.taiwandc.org/228-intr.htm>> (13 Feb. 2004); Kerr, 254-263; 291; Cohen, 22; Rubinstein, *Protestant Community*, 27.
- <sup>148</sup> "President Chen's Top Aide," 1; Stephen Chen, "Renewal Strategies for the Mandarin-Speaking Churches in Taiwan," (D.Miss. thesis, Fuller Theological Seminary, 1987), 16.
- <sup>149</sup> Thomas B. Gold, "Civil Society and Taiwan's Quest for Identity," in *Cultural Change in Postwar Taiwan*, ed. Stevan Harrell and Huang Chun-chieh (Taipei: SMC Publishing, Inc., 1994), 48.
- <sup>150</sup> Tong, *Christianity*, 13; Stephen Chen, "Renewal Strategies," 14-15.
- <sup>151</sup> Hollington K. Tong, "If I Were a Missionary: An Address by Mr. Hollington K. Tong, Secretary to President Chiang, to the TMF Conference at the Sun Moon Lake Hotel on July 31, 1959 (Abridged)," *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 11, no. 1 (2001): 46; Gold, 52.
- <sup>152</sup> Stephen Chen, interview, 26 April 2002; Tong, *Christianity*, 85; Swanson, *Mainline*, 126; Jen Wei-xuan, 94-96.
- <sup>153</sup> Rubinstein, "Taiwan Miracle," 5; Tong, *Christianity*, 84.
- <sup>154</sup> Gold, 60.
- <sup>155</sup> Timothy Ka-ying Wong, "The Impact of State Development in Taiwan on Cross-Straights Relations," *Asian Perspective* 21, no. 1, (1997): 175-177.
- <sup>156</sup> Cohen, 32-33.

- <sup>157</sup> Gold, 49.
- <sup>158</sup> "Taiwan, Stable Ally to US, Free World," *China Post* (Taipei), 8 October 2001.
- <sup>159</sup> Reist, 208; Chris Su, interview, 10 April 2002; Cody Yiu, "Chen Apologizes for White Terror Era," *Taipei Times*, 18 January 2004; "February 28 Incident," *Word IQ*, n.d., <[http://www.wordiq.com/definition/February\\_28\\_Incident](http://www.wordiq.com/definition/February_28_Incident)> (6 June 2004); "A Look Back on the Road to Democracy," *Taiwan Security Research*, n.d., <<http://taiwansecurity.org/TT/TT-991209-Road-to-Democracy.htm>> (6 June 2004); "228 Massacre: Taiwan's Tragedy Remembered," *University of Saskatchewan Taiwanese Student Association*, n.d., <[http://duke.usask.ca/~ss\\_tsa/228/intro.html](http://duke.usask.ca/~ss_tsa/228/intro.html)> (6 June 2004); Huang Tai-lin, "White Terror Exhibit Unveils Part of the Truth," *Taipei Times*, 20 May 2005, <[www.taipeitimes.com/News/taiwan/archives/2005/05/20/2003255840](http://www.taipeitimes.com/News/taiwan/archives/2005/05/20/2003255840)> (21 September 2005), 2.
- <sup>160</sup> Harrell and Huang, 3, 14-15; Gold, 54-55; Stephen Chen, "Renewal Strategies," 13, 18-19; "Taiwan History: Chronology of Important Events," China Taiwan Information Center, 26 June 2003, <<http://www.chinataiwan.org/web/webportal/W5026683/A5113526.html>> (2 February 2005).
- <sup>161</sup> Gold, 57-58, 65-66; Chu Yen, "Sociocultural Change in Taiwan as Reflected in Short Fiction, 1979-1989," in *Cultural Change in Postwar Taiwan*, ed. Stevan Harrell and Huang Chun-chieh (Taipei: SMC Publishing, 1994), 218.
- <sup>162</sup> "US Report on ROC Human Rights Says Political System Still Authoritarian," *China Post* (Taipei), 4 February 1991, 11.
- <sup>163</sup> "Taiwan History."
- <sup>164</sup> "The Republic of China: Five Decades on Taiwan," Taipei Economic and Cultural Office in Toronto, n.d., <[http://www.rocinfo.org/govt\\_position/891110-b.htm](http://www.rocinfo.org/govt_position/891110-b.htm)> (3 March 2001).
- <sup>165</sup> "Taiwan's Population Distribution," *Taiwan News*, n.d., <<http://www.taiwannews.com/indexpeople.htm>> (3 March 2001); "Consumer Patterns, Preferences, and Shopping Habits in Taiwan," Team Canada Market Research Centre and the Canadian Trade Commissioner Service, September 1999, <<http://atn-riac.agr.ca/public/htmldocs/e2775.htm>> (3 March 2001); Patrick Johnstone, Robyn Johnstone, and Jason Mandryk, *Operation World: 21<sup>st</sup> Century Edition* (Carlisle U.K.: Paternoster Publishing, 2001), 186.
- <sup>166</sup> Chu Yen, 221.
- <sup>167</sup> Koarnhak Tarn, "The Countryside of the Past," *The Chinese Essay*, ed. David Pollard (London: Hurst and Company, 2000), 21.
- <sup>168</sup> Choan-Seng Song, "Theology of the Incarnation," in *Asian Voices in Christian Theology*, ed. Gerald H. Anderson (Maryknoll: Orbis Books, 1976), 149, 147-149.
- <sup>169</sup> Harrell and Huang, 4-18; Team Canada, <http://atn-riac.agr.ca/public/htmldocs/e2775.htm>; David Pollard, *The Chinese Essay* (London: Hurst and Company, 2000), 21; H.T. Ellis, "New Life in the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan," *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 1, no. 1 (1991): 28; Andrew Perrin, "What Taiwan Wants," *Time Asia on the Web*, 8 March 2004, <<http://www.time.com/time/asia/covers/501040315/story.html?cnn=yes>> (21 January 2005).
- <sup>170</sup> Swanson, *Mainline*, 135.
- <sup>171</sup> Stephen Chen, interview, 26 April 2002.
- <sup>172</sup> Ibid.; Chow Lien-hwa, interview, 12 August 2002; Chris Su, interview, 10 April 2002.
- <sup>173</sup> Stephen Chen, interview, 26 April 2002; Leslie Barnard, "Last Fifty Years Events of Significance in Taiwan" *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 11, no. 1 (2001): 31; Rubinstein, *Protestant Community*, 126.
- <sup>174</sup> Stephen Chen, interview, 26 April 2002; David B. Woodward, "The Written Word," in *Taiwan Christian Yearbook, 1968: A Survey of the Christian Movement in Taiwan 1965-1968* (Taiwan: Taiwan Missionary Fellowship, 1968), 196-198.
- <sup>175</sup> Stephen Chen, interview, 26 April 2002.
- <sup>176</sup> Kuo Ming-chang, interview by author, tape recording, Taipei Taiwan, 10 April 2002.
- <sup>177</sup> Chow Lien-hwa, interview, 12 August 2002; Symonds, 14-15.
- <sup>178</sup> Y. T. Wu, "Make Christianity Socially Dynamic," *Chinese Recorder* 65 (January 1934): 11, 10-11.
- <sup>179</sup> Bullard, 77, 118.

- <sup>180</sup> Gold, 60.
- <sup>181</sup> Robert C. P. Lee, interview by author, tape recording, Taipei Taiwan, 29 April 2002.
- <sup>182</sup> Kuo Ming-chang, interview, 10 April 2002.
- <sup>183</sup> Chris Su, interview, 10 April 2002.
- <sup>184</sup> Swanson, *Mainline*, 129; Olav Bjorgaas, interview by author, Pingtung Taiwan, 16 June 2002.
- <sup>185</sup> Gates, "Ethnicity," 262-263.
- <sup>186</sup> Bullard, 32.
- <sup>187</sup> Jonathan Chao, "Social Service in Taiwan Protestant Churches," 28 April 2002, personal email (29 April 2002).
- <sup>188</sup> Stephen Chen, interview, 26 April 2002.
- <sup>189</sup> Hollington K. Tong, *Christianity in Taiwan: A History* (Taipei: China Post, 1961), 124-130; Robert C. P. Lee, interview, 29 April 2002.
- <sup>190</sup> Stephen Chen, "Renewal Strategies," 39-40.
- <sup>191</sup> Harrell and Huang, "Introduction," 11.
- <sup>192</sup> Tong, *Christianity*, 131-132; Bullard, 119; Chu Hai-yuan, "Taiwanese Society in Transition: Reconciling Confucianism and Pluralism," in *The Other Taiwan: 1945 to the Present*, ed. Murray A. Rubinstein (London: M.E. Sharpe, 1994), 94.
- <sup>193</sup> Stephen Chen, interview, 26 April 2002.
- <sup>194</sup> John Ky Branner, "Chinese Leadership Patterns and their Relationship to Pastoral Ministry Among Taiwan's Urban Masses" (D.Miss. thesis, Fuller Theological Seminary, 1983), 74-75, 135-137; Stephen Chen, "Renewal Strategies," 40.
- <sup>195</sup> Stephen Chen, interview, 26 April 2002; John Chu, interview, 29 July 2002; Robert C. P. Lee, interview, 29 April 2002.
- <sup>196</sup> Stephen Feuchtwang, "City Temples in Taipei Under Three Regimes," in *The Chinese City Between Two Worlds*, ed. Mark Elvin and G. William Skinner (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1974), 282-287; Rubinstein, *Protestant Community*, 41.
- <sup>197</sup> John Preston Maxwell, *Untitled Biography*, Author's Library, 2; Edward Band, *Working His Purpose Out: The History of the English Presbyterian Mission, 1847-1947* (London: Presbyterian Church of England Publishing Office, 1948), 75-76; Raber, 60; Swanson, *The Church*, 23; Wong Chong-gyiau, 59.
- <sup>198</sup> Branner, 119.
- <sup>199</sup> Johnstone, Johnstone, and Mandryk, 186-187.
- <sup>200</sup> Courson, "Independent Churches," 32-35; Rubinstein, *Protestant Community*, 21, 26, 28-32, 36, 126-127; Tony Lambert, *The Resurrection of the Chinese Church* (Wheaton: Harold Shaw Publishers, 1994), 14; Raber, 60.
- <sup>201</sup> Wong Chong-gyiau, 36.
- <sup>202</sup> Lin Jung-chi, "The Church Growth of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan" (D.Min. thesis, Fuller Theological Seminary, 1988), 68, 83-84; Rubinstein, *Protestant Community*, 21.
- <sup>203</sup> "The Protestant Church of Taiwan Confronts the KMT," in Marc J. Cohen, *The Unknown Taiwan* (Taipei: The Coalition for Democracy and the North American Taiwanese Women's Association, 1992), 84; Mark C. Thelin, "Propagation of the Gospel, Prophecy, and Prosperity: Some Sociological Reflections on the Role of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan," *Theology and the Church* 21, no. 1 (January 1996): 178.
- <sup>204</sup> William Lo, interview by author, tape recording, Taipei Taiwan, 23 July 2002; Beeby, 27.
- <sup>205</sup> C. S. Yang, interview by author, tape recording, Taipei Taiwan, 10 June 2002.
- <sup>206</sup> Chang Yun-ping, "White Terror Survivor Finds Peace in Music, Religion," *Taipei Times*, 9 November 2003, <<http://www.taipetimes.com/News/taiwan/archives/2003/11/09/2003075167>> (21 September 2005), 3; "Missionary Honored for Human Rights Work in Taiwan," *Reformed Church in America*, 27 January 2004, <<http://www.rca.org/today/darsen.php>> (6 June 2004).
- <sup>207</sup> Jonathan Chao, "A Response to Dr. Ingram S. Seah's Article: 'Christian Faith in Recent Taiwan Experience,'" in *Taiwan Journal of Theology* 13 (March 1991): 154.

## CHAPTER TWO

- <sup>1</sup> “Evangelism and Social Responsibility: An Evangelical Commitment,” Lausanne Committee for World Evangelization, 1982, <<http://www.lausanne.org/Brix?pageID=14749>> (6 June 2005).
- <sup>2</sup> Rubinstein, *Protestant Community*, 37.
- <sup>3</sup> Kerr, 24.
- <sup>4</sup> Rubinstein, *Protestant Community*, 34, 37.
- <sup>5</sup> Barnard, “Fifty Years,” 32; Paul Buttrey, “Missionaries of TMF,” 2001, <<http://members.aol.com/WELSTAI2/memories.htm>> (2 March 2004).
- <sup>6</sup> Rubinstein, *Protestant Community*, 35; Tong, *Christianity*, ii, 169-170.
- <sup>7</sup> Rubinstein, *Protestant Community*, 34.
- <sup>8</sup> Tong, “If I Were,” 45-47; Tong, *Christianity*, i; “Mr. Hollington K. Tong,” Kwang Hwa Information and Culture Center, 2003, <[http://www.taiwaninfo.org/info/ngio/e\\_tong.html](http://www.taiwaninfo.org/info/ngio/e_tong.html)> (4 March 2004).
- <sup>9</sup> Hollington K. Tong, “If I Were a Missionary, for What Would I Strive?” (An address by Mr. Hollington K. Tong at the Missionary Conference at the Sun Moon Lake Hotel on July 31, 1959), Taiwan Missionary Fellowship Archives, Taiwan. (Hereafter cited as “Missionary.”)
- <sup>10</sup> Tong, “Missionary,” 1.
- <sup>11</sup> Laura E. Trachsel, “The Taiwan Missionary Fellowship,” in *Taiwan Christian Yearbook 1964: A Survey of the Christian Movement in Taiwan from 1961-1964* (Taiwan: The Taiwan Missionary Fellowship, 1964): 98-99.
- <sup>12</sup> T. C. Chao, “What the Chinese are Thinking About Christianity,” *Chinese Recorder* 51 (November 1920): 768.
- <sup>13</sup> Tong, “Missionary,” 1.
- <sup>14</sup> *Ibid.*; Tong, *Christianity*, 170-171.
- <sup>15</sup> Tong, “Missionary,” 2.
- <sup>16</sup> Tong, *Christianity*, 167; Gold, 52.
- <sup>17</sup> *Christian Responsibility on a Changing Planet: Report of the Fifth World Order Study Conference, Cleveland Ohio, November 18-21, 1958* (New York: The Department of International Affairs of the National Council of Churches of Christ in the U.S.A., 1958), 8, 11-12, 14-15.
- <sup>18</sup> *Ibid.*, 22-23.
- <sup>19</sup> Tong, “Missionary,” 3, 2; Tong, *Christianity*, 106.
- <sup>20</sup> Tong, “Missionary,” 2.
- <sup>21</sup> Tong, “If I Were,” 46.
- <sup>22</sup> Gary B. McGee, “Evangelical Movement,” in *Evangelical Dictionary of World Missions*, 2000 ed..
- <sup>23</sup> A. Mair, “Preaching Tour in Anhwei,” in Marshall Broomhall, *The Jubilee Story of the China Inland Mission* (London: Morgan & Scott, Ltd., MCMXV), 338-339.
- <sup>24</sup> Tong, “If I Were,” 46.
- <sup>25</sup> Tong, *Christianity*, 84.
- <sup>26</sup> Anne Hazelton, *Come Wind, Come Weather: The Story of the Year 1950* (London: China Inland Mission, 1951), 9.
- <sup>27</sup> Tong, “If I Were,” 46-47.
- <sup>28</sup> Tong, *Christianity*, 47.
- <sup>29</sup> Tong, “Missionary,” 3.
- <sup>30</sup> *Ibid.*, 6.
- <sup>31</sup> *Ibid.*, 3, 6.
- <sup>32</sup> *Ibid.*, 3.
- <sup>33</sup> Tong, *Christianity*, 170.
- <sup>34</sup> W. Carl Hunker, *Taiwan: Unfinished Revolution* (Nashville: Convention Press, 1970), 40.
- <sup>35</sup> *Ibid.*, 99.

- <sup>36</sup> Rubinstein, *Protestant Community*, 34, 37.
- <sup>37</sup> Bosch, 319.
- <sup>38</sup> *Ibid.*, 318-319; Rubinstein, *Protestant Community*, 65; *Taiwan Missionary Directory: 1960* (Taiwan: Taiwan Missionary Fellowship, 1960) 1-4; Cheng Yang-en, interview by author, tape recording, Taipei Taiwan, 20 August 2002; Chow Lien-hwa, interview, 12 August 2002; Samuel H. H. Chiow, interview by author, tape recording, Taipei Taiwan, 6 August 2002.
- <sup>39</sup> G.T. Dunn, *Formosa: Fields for Reaping* (London: China Inland Mission, 1954), 9-10; Raber, 158-177.
- <sup>40</sup> Olav Bjorgaas, interview, 16 June 2002.
- <sup>41</sup> Rubinstein, *Protestant Community*, 33; Jen Wei-xuan, 94-96, 123-124.
- <sup>42</sup> Wong Chong-gyiau, 58-59; Cheng Yang-en, "A Missionary Marching the Unknown Journey – A Small Memoir of Reverend H. Dan Beeby," *New Messenger*, no. 67 (2001): 24-29.
- <sup>43</sup> Swanson, *The Church*, 58-59.
- <sup>44</sup> Jonathan Chao, interview by author, Taipei Taiwan, 31 August 2002; Latourette, 382; Guinness, 1:217-219, 235.
- <sup>45</sup> Stephen Chen, interview, 26 April 2002.
- <sup>46</sup> Raber, 72.
- <sup>47</sup> *Ibid.*, 77-80; Rubinstein, *Protestant Community*, 41-44; Swanson, *Mainline*, 134-135, 160.
- <sup>48</sup> Swanson, *Mainline*, 144-147.
- <sup>49</sup> Swanson, *The Church*, 89, 83.
- <sup>50</sup> Rubinstein, *Protestant Community*, 33.
- <sup>51</sup> Swanson, *The Church*, 90; Stephen Chen, interview, 26 April 2002.
- <sup>52</sup> "Church World Service/Lutheran World Relief Report," in *Taiwan Christian Yearbook, 1960: A Survey of the Christian Movement in Taiwan During 1959 with Special Attention to the Ten Years from 1949-1959* (Taiwan: Taiwan Missionary Fellowship, 1960), 68-72; Edwin W. Medley, "Taiwan Christian Service," in *Taiwan Christian Yearbook, 1968: A Survey of the Christian Movement in Taiwan 1965-1968* (Taiwan: Taiwan Missionary Fellowship, 1968), 118-123.
- <sup>53</sup> Kuo Ming-chang, interview, 10 April 2002; Liu Kan, interview by author, tape recording, Pingtung Taiwan, 27 July 2000.
- <sup>54</sup> Swanson, *Mainline*, 148.
- <sup>55</sup> *Ibid.* 110; Rubinstein, *Protestant Community*, 46-47.
- <sup>56</sup> Swanson, *The Church*, 26-27; Allen J. Swanson, "Lessons from Taiwan Church History," *Taiwan Church Growth Bulletin* 4, no. 3 (1976): 5; Rubinstein, *Protestant Community*, 51-52.
- <sup>57</sup> Swanson, *The Church*, 27; Stephen Chen, "Renewal Strategies," 30.
- <sup>58</sup> Swanson, *The Church*, 24-30; *Taiwan Church Growth Bulletin* 1, no. 1 (1972): 1; *Taiwan Church Growth Bulletin* 1, no. 3 (1973): 1.
- <sup>59</sup> Rubinstein, *Protestant Community*, 51-52.
- <sup>60</sup> Swanson, *Mainline*, 128; Raber, 237.
- <sup>61</sup> Swanson, *The Church*, 59.
- <sup>62</sup> Allen J. Swanson, "24 Obstacles to Church Growth in Taiwan," *Taiwan Church Growth Bulletin* 6, no. 1 (1978): 5-6; Peyton G. Craighill, "Worship and Christian Mission in Taiwan," *Taiwan Church Growth Bulletin* 3, no. 1 (1975): 1-2.
- <sup>63</sup> Swanson, *Mainline*, 89.
- <sup>64</sup> Branner, "Chinese Leadership," 123, 128-129; Swanson, *The Church*, 26; Swanson, *Mainline*, 152-155, 161-164.
- <sup>65</sup> Swanson, *The Church*, 26; Swanson, *Mainline*, 114, 127.
- <sup>66</sup> Swanson, *Mainline*, 14, 140-141.
- <sup>67</sup> Stephen Chen, interview, 26 April 2002; Peter Chi Ping Lin, interview, 6 May 2002.
- <sup>68</sup> Tsai Kuo-shan, "Evangelization," 318-319, 320, 312, 12-13, 290-291; Daniel K. S. Tsai, interview by author, tape recording, Taipei Taiwan, 29 May 2002.
- <sup>69</sup> Raber, 82-83, 178, 230-231 233-235; Allen Swanson, "Group Decisions and Church Growth in Taiwan," *Taiwan Church Growth Bulletin* 1, no. 4 (1974): 2-5; Swanson, *Mending*, 217-218; Allen J.

Swanson, "24 Reasons Why Some Churches Grow," *Taiwan Church Growth Bulletin* 6, no. 2 (1978): 2-4. Ernest Boehr, "The Work of God in the Hakka Near Tungshih," *Taiwan Church Growth Bulletin* 2, no. 2 (1974): 1-2; Robert J. Bolton, *Treasure Island: Church Growth Among Taiwan's Urban Minnan Chinese* (Pasadena: William Carey Library, 1976), 292-306.

<sup>70</sup> Tsai, "Evangelization," 44, 143-147, 202-203, 232-233, 245-246, 254, 291, 310.

<sup>71</sup> *Ibid.*, 141.

<sup>72</sup> *Ibid.*, 232-233.

<sup>73</sup> *Ibid.*, 108-114, 119, 140-141.

<sup>74</sup> *Ibid.*, 247-250, 147-151.

<sup>75</sup> Paul L. King, "A New Church in Youchang," *Taiwan Church Growth Bulletin* 2, no. 3 (1974): 6-7; John Branner, "A Chronicle of Failure," *Taiwan Church Growth Bulletin* 3, no. 2 (1975): 2-3; Andrew Fredricksen, "Receptivity to the Gospel in Rural Taiwan," *Taiwan Church Growth Bulletin* 3, no. 2 (1975): 5-6; Bolton, 294-295; Raber, 173-176, 249-250.

<sup>76</sup> Swanson, *Mainline*, 125; Allen J. Swanson, *I Will Build*, 172; Bolton, 287; Raber, 178, 209-212, 221, 231-232, 233-235.

<sup>77</sup> Swanson, *The Church*, 111, 211.

<sup>78</sup> *Ibid.*, 30-34; In Swanson *Mending* (127-128) the author reveals that of the 25,000 decision cards signed during the Billy Graham and Chow Lien-hwa crusades only 1 in 25 found their way into baptized church membership. Moreover the retention rate for baptized church members was only forty percent.

<sup>79</sup> Stephen Chen, "Renewal Strategies," 35-36; Branner, "Chinese Leadership," 235; Swanson, *The Church*, 210-211.

<sup>80</sup> Wang, "Poor," 74; Nee, *Character*, 15-20; Nee, *Love Not*, 23-24.

<sup>81</sup> "Taiwan History."

<sup>82</sup> Gold, 58; Chow Lien-hwa, interview, 12 August 2002.

<sup>83</sup> Chen Nan-jou, "The Challenges and Mission of the Christian Churches in the Changing Society of Taiwan Today," *Yu Shan Theological Journal* 8 (May 2001): 158-159; Chou Hsiang-hsiung, in *Christian Tribune*, no. 1783 (21 March 2000): 1.

<sup>84</sup> Wu Meng-chung, interview by author, tape recording, Taipei Taiwan, 15 May 2002.

<sup>85</sup> Chu Hai-yuan, "Taiwanese Society," 94; "Taiwan History."; Peter Chi Ping Lin, interview, 6 May 2002.

<sup>86</sup> Chen Chi-nan, interview by author, tape recording, Taipei Taiwan, 24 June 2002.

<sup>87</sup> Chu Yen, 206; Cohen, 61; Robert P. Weller, "Identity and Social Change in Taiwanese Religion," in *Taiwan a New History*, ed. Murray A. Rubenstein, London: M.E. Sharpe, 1999), 352, 356, 358; Rubenstein, *Protestant Community*, 49-51; Nan Sugg, "Buddhism – Taiwan Style," in *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 6, no. 4 (1997): 16.

<sup>88</sup> Charles Brewer Jones, *Buddhism in Taiwan: Religion and State 1660-1990* (Honolulu, University of Hawaii Press, 1999), 198.

<sup>89</sup> *Ten Thousand Lotus Blossoms of the Heart: Dharma Master Cheng Yen and the Tzu Chi World*, ed. Douglas Shaw (Taipei: Shih Cheng Yen, 2001), 44.

<sup>90</sup> *Lotus Flower of the Heart: Thirty Years of Tzu Chi Photographs*, ed. Douglas Shaw, trans. Lin Shen-shou (Taipei: Still Thoughts Cultural Mission Co., Ltd., 1997), 2, 53-84; "About Master Cheng Yen," in Cheng Yen, *Still Thoughts*, vol. 1, ed. Douglas Shaw, trans. Lin Chia-hui (Taipei: Tzu Chi Cultural Publishing Co., 1996), x-xii; *Ten Thousand Lotus Blossoms*, 18-30; Weller, 357; Chu Hai-yuan, "Taiwanese Society," 93-94; Jones, 208; Weller, 358.

<sup>91</sup> Cliff, 73-75.

<sup>92</sup> Wang Ming-dao, "God or Men?," 25-28.

<sup>93</sup> James Shia, interview by author, tape recording, Taipei Taiwan, 27 July 2002; Leo Ip, interview by author, tape recording, Taipei Taiwan, 23 May 2002; Peter Chi Ping Lin, interview, 6 May 2002.

<sup>94</sup> *Ten Thousand Lotus Blossoms*, 13-14.

<sup>95</sup> “Over 8000 attend CCCOWE Night Rally,” *Daily News: Chinese Congress on World Evangelization*, 11 August 1986, 8; “The Third CCCOWE Congress Begins Today,” *Daily News: Chinese Congress on World Evangelization*, 6 August 1986, 5.

<sup>96</sup> The movement was envisioned and created wholly by Chinese in Taiwan and was unrelated to the AD 2000 and Beyond Movement, which was an international effort at evangelism organized at a later date. “The Year 2000 Movement in Taiwan: A Synopsis of the Beginning and Hope,” *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 5, no. 3 (1996): 10; “AD2000 and Beyond Movement Overview,” AD2000 & Beyond Movement, 30 July 1999, <<http://www.ad2000.org/ad2kbroc.htm>> (5 August 2005).

<sup>97</sup> “What is the ‘Year 2000 Gospel Movement?’,” *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 1, no. 1, (1991): 5-8.

<sup>98</sup> Sheldon V. Sawatzky, “The Body of Christ Metaphor: An Interpretation to Stimulate Taiwanese Mennonite Reflection on the Nature and task of the Church w/in Chinese Society” (Ph.D. thesis, Fuller Theological Seminary, 1980); Taiwan Church Growth Society, *Taiwan Church Growth Bulletin* 1, no. 1 (1972): 2.

<sup>99</sup> Sheldon Sawatzky, “Outline for a Chinese Theology of Evangelism, A Missionary’s Perspective” *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 1, no. 1 (1991): 21.

<sup>100</sup> Rahn Strickler, “An Interview with James Shia,” *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 1, no. 1 (1991): 9-11.

<sup>101</sup> Sawatzky, “Outline,” 20.

<sup>102</sup> *Ibid.*, 23.

<sup>103</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>104</sup> *Ibid.*, 24; 20-24.

<sup>105</sup> Strickler, 9; James Shia in Paul Buttrey, “The Year 2000 Gospel Movement: A Mid-decade Review,” *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 5, no. 3 (1996): 13-15; James Shia, interview by author, tape recording, Pingtung Taiwan, 21 October 2001; Grace Cheng, interview by author, tape recording, Taipei Taiwan, 18 July 2002; Jim Courson notes that even the fiercely independent True Jesus Church cooperated with the goals of the Year 2000 Gospel Movement in “Independent Churches,” 34.

<sup>106</sup> Daniel K. S. Tsai, interview, 29 May 2002.

<sup>107</sup> James Shia, sermon, Da Lian Street Mandarin Church, Pingtung Taiwan, 21 October 2001; James Shia, interview, 27 July 2002; James Shia, interview, 21 October 2001.

<sup>108</sup> James Shia, interview, 27 July 2002; James Shia, sermon, 8<sup>th</sup> Annual Mission Conference, Da Lian Street Mandarin Church, Pingtung Taiwan, 20 October 2001; James Shia, sermon, 21 October 2001.

<sup>109</sup> Samuel H. H. Chiow, interview, 6 August 2002.

<sup>110</sup> James Shia, interview, 27 July 2002.

<sup>111</sup> James Shia, interview, 27 July 2002; James Shia, interview, 21 October 2001; James Shia, *Everybody Come and Work: A Manual for Church Involvement in Building up a Community* (Taipei: Chinese Christian Evangelistic Association, 1998), 25-27.

<sup>112</sup> Buttrey, “Year 2000,” 12; Daniel K. S. Tsai, interview, 29 May 2002.

<sup>113</sup> James Shia, interview, 27 July 2002; James Shia, interview, 21 October 2001; James Shia, *Everybody Come*, 60, 65, 107-124.

<sup>114</sup> Swanson, *Mainline*, 112.

<sup>115</sup> James Shia, *Everybody Come*, 28.

<sup>116</sup> *Ibid.*, 27, 28, 31, 133; James Shia, interview, 27 July 2002; James Shia, interview, 21 October 2001; James Shia, sermon, 20 October 2001; James Shia, sermon, 21 October 2001; James Shia, “Continue to Sail,” *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 10, no. 2 & 3 (2000, 2001): 13-14.

<sup>117</sup> James Hsia, “Sail,” 13.

<sup>118</sup> James Shia, interview, 21 October 2001; James Shia, interview, 27 July 2002; Grace Cheng, interview, 18 July 2002.

<sup>119</sup> Thomas T. F. Jane, interview by author, 13 August 2002; *Lotus Flower of the Heart*, 66-75; *Ten Thousand Lotus Blossoms*, 19-21; Grace Cheng, interview, 18 July 2002.

<sup>120</sup> Grace Cheng, interview, 18 July 2002.

<sup>121</sup> Chris Su, interview, 10 April 2002.

- <sup>122</sup> Buttrey, "Year 2000," 12, 16-17; Cheng Yang-en, interview, 20 August 2002; Daniel Lee, interview by author, tape recording, Taipei Taiwan, 13 May 2002.
- <sup>123</sup> James Shia, interview, 27 July 2002.
- <sup>124</sup> Daniel Lee, interview, 13 May 2002; Peter K. Chow, 6 December 2002, personal email (7 December, 2002).
- <sup>125</sup> Peter K. Chow, 6 December 2002, personal email; Daniel Lee, interview, 13 May 2002; Joel Carpenter, "Agents of the Great Commission: Keynote Address, Fall Faculty/Staff Conference, Calvin College, Grand Rapids, Michigan, September 4, 2002," Calvin College, 27 July 2005, <<http://www.calvin.edu/admin/provost/pubs/agents.htm>> (9 August 2005); "Human Beings in God's Image: Who Am I," in *NIV Spirit of the Reformation Study Bible*, Zondervan Books, n.d., <[www.zondervan.com/media/pdfs/0310923603.pdf](http://www.zondervan.com/media/pdfs/0310923603.pdf)> (9 August 9, 2005), 9.
- <sup>126</sup> Daniel Lee, interview, 13 May 2002.
- <sup>127</sup> Matthew 21:13; Mark 11:17.
- <sup>128</sup> Daniel Lee, interview, 13 May 2002.
- <sup>129</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>130</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>131</sup> Swanson, *Mending*, 160.
- <sup>132</sup> Daniel Lee, interview, 13 May 2002.
- <sup>133</sup> Barnard, "Fifty Years," 36.
- <sup>134</sup> Nan Sugg, "The Cell Group Church," *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 5, no. 2 (1995): 3.
- <sup>135</sup> Swanson, *The Church*, 33; Lin Chung-hsiung, interview, 25 August 2002; Nan Sugg, "Cell," 3.
- <sup>136</sup> Nan Sugg, "Cell," 3.
- <sup>137</sup> Ralph W. Neighbour, Jr, *Where Do we Go From Here?: A Guidebook for the Cell Group Church* (Houston: Touch Publications, Inc., 1990), Back cover, 13, 23, 27, 68-69, 94, 200, 204.
- <sup>138</sup> Sugg, "Cell," 3.
- <sup>139</sup> Leo Ip, interview, 21 May 2002; Kuo Ming-chang, interview, 10 April 2002; Lin Chung-hsiung, interview, 25 August 2002; Hsu Te-ling, 125-126.
- <sup>140</sup> Leo Ip, interview, 21 May 2002.
- <sup>141</sup> Tom Liau in Barry Owen, "Transition: One Church's Journey into Cell Groups," *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 5, No. 2 (1995): 26-27.
- <sup>142</sup> Leo Ip, interview, 21 May 2002; Leo Ip, interview, 23 May 2002.
- <sup>143</sup> Leo Ip, interview, 21 May 2002; Leo Ip, interview, 23 May 2002.
- <sup>144</sup> Leo Ip, interview, 23 May 2002.
- <sup>145</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>146</sup> Tim Shao, interview by author, tape recording, Taipei Taiwan, 8 January 2002.
- <sup>147</sup> Ibid.; Lee Chi-hung, interview by author, Taipei Taiwan, 15 May 2002; Lin Chung-hsiung, interview, 25 August 2002; Wu Meng-chung, interview, 15 May 2002.
- <sup>148</sup> "World: Asia-Pacific Taiwan Quake Rescue Criticized," *BBC News on the Web*, 28 September 1999, <<http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/world/askai-pacific/460170.stm>> (22 April 2004).
- <sup>149</sup> Grace Cheng, interview, 18 July 2002.
- <sup>150</sup> Max and Waltraud Graf, "Personal Accounts of the 921 Earthquake," comp. Donna MacLean *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 9, no. 2 (1999): 47-48; C. M. Kao, interview by author, tape recording, Taipei Taiwan, 19 June 2002.
- <sup>151</sup> Lin Li-chin, interview by author, tape recording, Puli Taiwan, 16 May 2002.
- <sup>152</sup> Lee Chi-hung, interview, 15 May 2002.
- <sup>153</sup> Peter K. Chow, 26 October 2001, personal email (27 October 2001); Peter K. Chow, 6 December 2002, personal email; Daniel Lee, interview, 13 May 2002; Chris Su, interview, 10 April 2002.
- <sup>154</sup> "TOUCH Community Services," Faith Community Baptist Church, 2004, <[http://www.fcbs.org.sg/min\\_touch\\_comsvc.htm](http://www.fcbs.org.sg/min_touch_comsvc.htm)> (19 April 2004).
- <sup>155</sup> Leo Ip, interview, 21 May 2002; Leo Ip, interview, 23 May 2002; Anita Lo, 11 July 2005, personal email (12 July 2005).
- <sup>156</sup> Wong Ming-dao, *A Stone Made Smooth*, 149; Nee, *Spiritual Man*, 1:55.

- <sup>157</sup> Leo Ip, interview, 21 May 2002; James Shia, interview, 27 July 2002.
- <sup>158</sup> Leo Ip, interview, 21 May 2002.
- <sup>159</sup> Chow Lien-hwa, interview, 12 August 2002.
- <sup>160</sup> Huang Po-Ho, interview by author, tape recording, Tainan Taiwan, 26 August, 2002.
- <sup>161</sup> Leo Ip, interview, 21 May 2002. Leo Ip, interview, 23 May 2002.
- <sup>162</sup> Peter K. Chow, 26 October 2001, personal email.
- <sup>163</sup> Peter Chi Ping Lin, *God's Servant in the 21<sup>st</sup> Century*, (Taipei: Cosmic Light, 2002), 14; Jacob Chen, interview by author, tape recording, Taipei Taiwan, 3 January 2002; Daniel Cheng, interview by author, tape recording, Taipei Taiwan, 2 August 2002; Huang Po-Ho, interview, 26 August 2002.
- <sup>164</sup> Lin Chung-hsiung, interview, 25 August 2002.
- <sup>165</sup> Mark 12:30-31.
- <sup>166</sup> Ephesians 2:10.
- <sup>167</sup> James 1:27.
- <sup>168</sup> Mark 10:45.
- <sup>169</sup> Hebrews 13:15-16.
- <sup>170</sup> Isaiah 58: 6-7, 9.
- <sup>171</sup> Galatians 6:8-9.
- <sup>172</sup> Acts 20:35; Proverbs 11:25.
- <sup>173</sup> 2 Corinthians 9:8.
- <sup>174</sup> Matthew 25:31-40; Lin Chung-hsiung, "Ten Reasons Why Christians Do Good," Unpublished Paper.
- <sup>175</sup> Paul Chen, interview by author, tape recording, 6 September 2002.
- <sup>176</sup> Daniel K. S. Tsai, interview, 29 May 2002.
- <sup>177</sup> Samuel H. H. Chiow, interview, 6 August 2002.
- <sup>178</sup> Wong Ming-dao, "Do Not Only Seek Your Own Interests," *Spiritual Food*, trans. Arthur Reynolds (Southampton, England: Mayflower Christian Books, 1983), 130-135; Wong Ming-dao, *Day by Day*, 13, 17, 23, 29, 30, 66, 183; Nee, *Character*, 15-20; Nee, *Love Not*, 23.
- <sup>179</sup> Nee, *Church Life*, 75.
- <sup>180</sup> Nee, *Love Not*, 40.
- <sup>181</sup> Jonathan Chao, interview, Taipei Taiwan, 31 August 2002; Jonathan Chao, 28 April 2002, personal email.

## CHAPTER THREE

<sup>1</sup> Lin Jung-chi, 82-84; *Knowing the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan* (Taipei: General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, 2000), 112; Hsu Ming-hsiung, 40-41, 45, 140.

<sup>2</sup> Kuo Ming-chang, interview, 10 April 2002; John Jyigiokk Tin, interview by author, tape recording, Tainan Taiwan 15 September 2000; William Lo, interview, 23 July 2002; Hsu Ming-hsiung, 138.

<sup>3</sup> John Jyigiokk Tin, *Christianity in Taiwan*, ed. T.K. Thomas (Singapore: Christian Conference of Asia, 1979), 102-105.

<sup>4</sup> Janet F. Fishburn, "Social Gospel," in *Encyclopedia of the Reformed Faith*, 1992 ed., 354-355.

<sup>5</sup> E. Bruce Copland, "The Presbyterian Church of Formosa," in *Taiwan Christian Yearbook, 1960: A Survey of the Christian Movement in Taiwan During 1959 with Special Attention to the Ten Years from 1949-1959* (Taiwan: Taiwan Missionary Fellowship, 1960), 13-14.

<sup>6</sup> H. Dan Beeby, "Memories of the College in Memory of Shoki," in *Theology and the Church* 21, no. 2 (June 1996): 27; Hsu Ming-hsiung, 36, 39-40, 46, 57-58, 61, 138, 140; Chen Huei Hung, "A Study on Exodus," in *Yu Shan Theological Journal*, no. 6 (May 1999): 123.

<sup>7</sup> Hsu Ming-hsiung, 40.

<sup>8</sup> Peter Toon, "Christology," in *Encyclopedia of the Reformed Faith*, 1992 ed., 65; Huang Po-Ho, "Searching," 53-58.

<sup>9</sup> Huang Po-Ho, "Searching," 53-54.

<sup>10</sup> C. H. Hwang, *Joint Action for Mission in Formosa: A Call for Advance into a New Era* (Geneva: World Council of Churches, 1968), 65.

<sup>11</sup> C. S. Yang, interview, 10 June 2002.

<sup>12</sup> Chang Yun-ping, 3; "Missionary Honored for Human Rights Work in Taiwan," *Reformed Church in America*, 27 January 2004, <<http://www.rca.org/today/darsen.php>> (6 June 2004); Jonathan Chao, "Response," 154.

<sup>13</sup> New International Version.

<sup>14</sup> Beeby, 27, reports that during the first years of the Nationalist government the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan also held a political theology based on Romans 13.

<sup>15</sup> New Revised Standard Version; Peter Chi Ping Lin, interview, 6 May 2002; C. M. Kao, interview, 19 June 2002.

<sup>16</sup> W. Fred Graham, "Government, Civil," in *Encyclopedia of the Reformed Faith*, 1992 ed., 159.

<sup>17</sup> Benjamin Wirt Farley, "Providence of God," in *Encyclopedia of the Reformed Faith*, 1992 ed., 306-307; Graham, 159.

<sup>18</sup> Graham, 159.

<sup>19</sup> *Ibid.*, 158-160.

<sup>20</sup> William Lo, interview; 23 July 2002.

<sup>21</sup> Shoki Coe, *Recollections and Reflections*, ed. Boris Anderson (Taiwan: The Rev. Dr. Shoki Coe's Memorial Fund, 1993), 97-98, 107.

<sup>22</sup> Ray Wheeler, "The Legacy of Shoki Coe," in *International Bulletin of Missionary Research* 26, no. 2 (April 2002): 78.

<sup>23</sup> Coe, *Recollections*, 180, 158-160, 120-121; William P. Russell, "Contextualization: Origins, Meaning, and Implications. A Study of what the Theological Education Fund of the World Council of Churches Originally Understood by the Term 'Contextualization', with Special Reference to the Period 1970-1972" (thesis, Facultate S. Theologiae apud Pontificiam Universitaem S. Thomae in Urbe, 1995), 444-445.

<sup>24</sup> Shoki Coe, "Contextualization as the Way Toward Reform," in *Recollections and Reflections*, ed. Boris Anderson (Taiwan: The Rev. Dr. Shoki Coe's Memorial Fund, 1993), 268-269; Shoki Coe, "What is Theological Education all About?: 3rd August 1987 at Tainan Theological College," *Asian Journal of Theology* 2, no. 2 (1988): 546-547.

<sup>25</sup> Hwang, *Joint Action*, 9.

- <sup>26</sup> Ibid., 10.
- <sup>27</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>28</sup> Ibid., 10, 9-10 118-123.
- <sup>29</sup> Ibid., 119.
- <sup>30</sup> Ibid., 118-122;
- <sup>31</sup> Ibid., 121.
- <sup>32</sup> Ibid., 10, 121-122.
- <sup>33</sup> Ibid., 120-122, 10.
- <sup>34</sup> Ibid., 10.
- <sup>35</sup> Hsu Ming-hsiung, 55; Swanson, *Mainline*, 93-94.
- <sup>36</sup> Hwang, *Joint Action*, 14.
- <sup>37</sup> Chen Hsien-ping, 28; Peter Chen-Main Wang, "Christianity in Modern Taiwan: Struggling over the Path of Contextualization," in *China and Christianity: Burdened Past, Hopeful Future*, ed. Stephen Uhalley, Jr. and Xiaoxin Wu (London: M. E. Sharpe, 2001), 330; Swanson, *Mainline*, 93-98.
- <sup>38</sup> Victor E. W. Hayward, "Editorial Preface," in C. H. Hwang, *Joint Action for Mission in Formosa: A Call for Advance into a New Era*, (New York: Friendship Press, 1968), 7; Chen Hsien-ping, 29.
- <sup>39</sup> Allen J. Swanson, *Mainline*, 147-148; Wheeler, 78.
- <sup>40</sup> Swanson, *Mainline*, 102.
- <sup>41</sup> Chen Hsien-ping, 29-30; Lin Jung-chi, 70-74; M. C. Chong, "The Presbyterian Church of Formosa," *Taiwan Christian Yearbook, 1968: A Survey of the Christian Movement in Taiwan 1965-1968* (Taiwan: Taiwan Missionary Fellowship, 1968), 93-95.
- <sup>42</sup> Swanson, *Mainline*, 102-104, 147-149.
- <sup>43</sup> Hwang, *Joint Action*, 65.
- <sup>44</sup> Ibid., 67.
- <sup>45</sup> Coe, *Recollections*, 173-174; Boris Anderson, "The First Taiwanese Principal of Tainan Theological College: Dr. Shoki Coe," in *Theology and the Church* 21, no. 2 (June 1996), 13-14; Wheeler, 78.
- <sup>46</sup> Russell, 456-457, 483; Wong Chong-giao, 46, 74.
- <sup>47</sup> Coe, "Contextualization," 268; Russell, 460-461.
- <sup>48</sup> Coe, "Contextualization," 270-271; Wong Chong-gyiau, 46, 76;; Wei Ben Jui-Ming, "Preface to the Second Edition," in Shoki Coe, *Recollections and Reflections*, ed. Boris Anderson (Taiwan: The Rev. Dr. Shoki Coe's Memorial Fund, 1993), iii.
- <sup>49</sup> Huang Po-Ho, interview, 26 August 2002.
- <sup>50</sup> Coe, "Contextualization," 267-275; Coe, *Recollections*, 159-160; C. H. Hwang in *Theological Education in North-East Asia: Report of the Seoul Consultation 28<sup>th</sup> November – 2<sup>nd</sup> December 1966* (Geneva: Theological Education Fund, World Council of Churches, 1967), 41.
- <sup>51</sup> Russell, 439-440, 454-455, 464, 487-488.
- <sup>52</sup> Ibid., 455.
- <sup>53</sup> Shoki Coe, "Contextualization," 267; Russell, 455, 470-471; Edmond Tang, "Context and Contextualization," in *Pro Mundi Vita Studies*, no. 4 (July 1988): 10.
- <sup>54</sup> Hwang, *Joint Action*, 80, 105.
- <sup>55</sup> Ibid., 90-91.
- <sup>56</sup> *Knowing the Presbyterian Church*, 112.
- <sup>57</sup> Wong Chong-gyiau, 54.
- <sup>58</sup> Song, "Incarnation," 153-154.
- <sup>59</sup> Choan-Seng Song, *Theology from the Womb of Asia* (London: SCM Press Ltd., 1988), 2-3, 14, 17.
- <sup>60</sup> Choan-Seng Song, *Christian Mission in Reconstruction: An Asian Attempt* (Madras: The Christian Literature Society, 1975), 97-98, 150.
- <sup>61</sup> Huang Po-Ho, interview, 26 August 2002.

- <sup>62</sup> Choan-Seng Song, *The Believing Heart: An Invitation to Story Theology* (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1999), 28.
- <sup>63</sup> Choan-Seng Song, "Let Us Do Theology with Asian Resources!," *East Asia Journal of Theology* 3, no. 2 (1985):207-208; Song, *Womb*, 16-17; Huang Po-Ho, interview, 26 August 2002; Kenneth Fleming, "Asian Christian Theologians in Dialogue with Buddhism: A Study of the Writings of Kosuke Koyama, Choan-Seng Song, and Aloysius Pieris" (Ph.D. thesis, University of Edinburgh Centre for the Study of Christianity in the Non-Western World, 2000), 107-108, 110-112.
- <sup>64</sup> Choan-Seng Song, "Theological Education: A Search for A New Break Through," in *South East Asian Journal of Theology* 9, no. 4 (April 1968): 5.
- <sup>65</sup> Song, "Education," 12; Choan-Seng Song, "Wither Protestantism in Asia Today?," *South East Asia Journal of Theology* 11 (Spring 1970): 72.
- <sup>66</sup> Song, "Education," 16, 8, 10, 12; Choan-Seng Song, "Election for Mission," *South East Asia Journal of Theology* 13 (no. 2 (1972), 44; Choan-Seng Song, "Witnessing to the Power of Resurrection," in *Asian Journal of Theology* 1, no. 1 (1987): 6-7; Fleming, 127.
- <sup>67</sup> Song, *Reconstruction*, 97.
- <sup>68</sup> *Ibid.*, 97-98.
- <sup>69</sup> Song, "Wither Protestantism," 68-69.
- <sup>70</sup> *Ibid.*, 73.
- <sup>71</sup> *Ibid.*; Song, *Reconstruction*, 48
- <sup>72</sup> Song, *Reconstruction*, 31-32.
- <sup>73</sup> Song, "Incarnation," 157-158.
- <sup>74</sup> Song, *Reconstruction*, 20, 19-30, ix-x, 35; Song, "Witnessing," 12; Song, "Wither Protestantism," 72; Huang Po-Ho, interview, 26 August 2002; Fleming, 111; Wong Chong-gyiau, 79.
- <sup>75</sup> Song, *Reconstruction*, 22-23, 28, 32; Huang Po-Ho, interview, 26 August 2002; Fleming, 157.
- <sup>76</sup> Choan-Sheng Song, "From Israel to Asia – A Theological Leap," in *Mission Trends No. 3: Third World Theologies*, ed. Gerald H. Anderson and Thomas F. Stransky (New York: Paulist Press, 1976), 216; Gerald H. Anderson and Thomas F. Stransky, in "From Israel to Asia – A Theological Leap," in *Mission Trends No. 3: Third World Theologies*, ed. Gerald H. Anderson and Thomas F. Stransky (New York: Paulist Press, 1976), 211-212.
- <sup>77</sup> Choan-Seng Song, *The Compassionate God* (New York: Orbis Books, 1982), 168. Song, "Israel," 216; Fleming, 111-112; Wong Chong-gyiau, 91-93.
- <sup>78</sup> Choan Seng Song, "What is Christian Theology?," *PCTA Bulletin* 3, no. 2, (January 1990), 6.
- <sup>79</sup> Song, *Believing*, 63-64; Song, *Reconstruction*, 28-29, 60-61.
- <sup>80</sup> Song, *Reconstruction*, 10; Fleming, 111, 151.
- <sup>81</sup> Song, *Believing*, 146-147.
- <sup>82</sup> *Ibid.*, 144-147, 194-195.
- <sup>83</sup> *Ibid.*, 159, 172-173, 179-181; Song, *Womb*, 165-166; Song, "Education," 15.
- <sup>84</sup> Song, *Womb*, 17-18; C. S. Song, "A Foreword: Pre-Confessional, Confessing, and Post-Confessional," in *Confessing Our Faith Around the World, Faith and Order Paper No. 104* (Geneva: World Council of Churches, 1980), 5; Fleming, 126.
- <sup>85</sup> Song, *Womb*, 152.
- <sup>86</sup> C. S. Song, *Jesus in the Power of the Spirit*, (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1994), 292-293; Song, "Incarnation," 156; Song, *Reconstruction*, 272; Song, *Believing*, 63; Fleming 125-126, 151-152.
- <sup>87</sup> Song, *Reconstruction*, 60.
- <sup>88</sup> Song, *Believing*, 314.
- <sup>89</sup> Choan-Seng Song, "The Role of Christology in the Christian Encounter with Other Religions," in *South East Asia Journal of Theology* 5, no. 3 (January 1964): 26; Choan-seng Song, "The Decisiveness of Christ," in *Asians and Blacks, Theological Challenges: Joseph Cook Memorial Lectures - Sixth Series, Spring 1972* (Bangkok: East Asia Christian Conference, 1972), 17, 23-25.
- <sup>90</sup> C. S. Song, *Third Eye Theology: Theology in Formation in Asian Settings* (London: Lutterworth Press, 1980), 197, 199; Fleming, 125-126.
- <sup>91</sup> Song, *Believing*, 314.

- <sup>92</sup> Song, *Believing*, 314-315; Fleming, 141.
- <sup>93</sup> Song, "Incarnation," 154-159; Song, *Reconstruction*, 59-60, 272.
- <sup>94</sup> Song, "Wither Protestantism," 74-75.
- <sup>95</sup> Song, *Power*, 260-291; Fleming, 127, 140.
- <sup>96</sup> Song, *Believing*, 60.
- <sup>97</sup> C. S. Song, *Jesus and the Reign of God* (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1993), 269.
- <sup>98</sup> Song, *Reconstruction*, 35, 28; Song, "Election," 48; Song, "Incarnation," 158.
- <sup>99</sup> Song, "Election," 44, 40-44; Huang Po-Ho, interview, 26 August 2002; Fleming, 142.
- <sup>100</sup> Song, *Believing*, 309.
- <sup>101</sup> Song, "Wither Protestantism," 75.
- <sup>102</sup> Song, *Reconstruction*, 45-47.
- <sup>103</sup> *Ibid.*, 47; Song, "Education," 6, 15; Song, "Wither Protestantism," 70, 72.
- <sup>104</sup> Choan-Seng Song, "God's Politics of Construction," in *Living Theology in Asia*, ed. John C. England, London: SCM Press, Ltd, 1981), 75.
- <sup>105</sup> Song, *Reconstruction*, 42; Song, *Third Eye*, 173.
- <sup>106</sup> Song, *Reconstruction*, 41-48, 130-131.
- <sup>107</sup> Song, *Compassionate*, 216; Song, *Womb*, 102-106.
- <sup>108</sup> Song, "Election," 46; John 3:16.
- <sup>109</sup> Song, *Believing*, 187.
- <sup>110</sup> *Ibid.*, 103, 182-187; Song, "Election," 46-48; Song, *Reign*, 2, 44.
- <sup>111</sup> Fleming, 105.
- <sup>112</sup> Jonathan Chao, interview, 31 August 2002; William Lo, interview, 23 July 2002.
- <sup>113</sup> Huang Po-Ho, "Searching," 55.
- <sup>114</sup> *Ibid.*, 55-56.
- <sup>115</sup> Wong Chong-gyiau, 54.
- <sup>116</sup> C. M. Kao, interview by author, tape recording, Taipei Taiwan, 31 May 2002; William Lo, interview, 23 July 2002.
- <sup>117</sup> "Statement on Our National Fate by The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan," in *Public Statements* (Taipei: *The General Assembly, Presbyterian Church in Taiwan*, 2002), 7; *A Brief Introduction to the Republic of China* (Taipei: Republic of China Government Information Office, 1998), 68; "Timeline of U.S. - China Relations: 1971," *PBS Online*, 1999, <<http://www.pbs.org/wgbh/amex/china/timeline/timeline6nf.html#1971>> (10 January 2005), 1971.
- <sup>118</sup> Tin, *Christianity*, 110.
- <sup>119</sup> Cheng Yang-en, interview, 20 August 2002.
- <sup>120</sup> Shang Cheng-chung, interview by author, Taipei Taiwan, June 13, 2002; Chow Lien-hwa, interview, 12 August 2002; C. M. Kao, interview, 19 June 2002.
- <sup>121</sup> C. M. Kao states that the Moderator, Vice-Moderator, General Assembly Secretaries, Theologians from denomination Seminaries, and other influential leaders worked on the document over a period of time. C. M. Kao, interview, 31 May 2002.
- <sup>122</sup> "National Fate," 7-8; C. M. Kao, interview, 31 May, 2002; C. M. Kao, interview, 19 June 2002; 8.
- <sup>123</sup> "National Fate," 7.
- <sup>124</sup> *Ibid.*
- <sup>125</sup> Coe, *Recollections*, 254-261.
- <sup>126</sup> "National Fate," 7-8.
- <sup>127</sup> Wong Chong-gyiau, 48; "National Fate," 8.
- <sup>128</sup> "National Fate," 8; Coe, *Recollections*, 259.
- <sup>129</sup> Coe, *Recollections*, 256.
- <sup>130</sup> C. M. Kao, interview, 19 June 2002.
- <sup>131</sup> Wong Chong-gyiau, 44, 48.
- <sup>132</sup> Peter Chen-Main Wang, 332.
- <sup>133</sup> Lin Jung-chi, 106, Peter Chen-Main Wang, 332.

- <sup>134</sup> C. S. Yang, interview, 10 June 2002.
- <sup>135</sup> Stone, 74-79, 85, 109-111, 117; Schmidt, 204-206. Marsden, *Fundamentalism*, 48-49; Samuel H. H. Chiow, interview, 6 August 2002; Chow Lien-hwa, interview, 12 August 2002; Cheng Yang-en, interview, 20 August 2002; Tin, *Christianity*, 109; Carl McIntyre, "The Redeemed of the Lord Say So," International Council of Christian Churches, n.d., <<http://www.iccc.org.sg/>> (10 January 2005).
- <sup>136</sup> Victor W. C. Hsu, in Taiwan – Its International and Ecumenical Status and Role: A Report of the International Forum, 22-25 February 1994 (Taipei: The General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, 1994), 93.
- <sup>137</sup> Many within the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan believed they had withdrawn from the World Council of Churches. In fact they had been listed as inactive members. Therefore a certain level of support was available in times of crisis, such as when General Secretary Kao was imprisoned. Cheng Yang-en, interview, 20 August 2002.
- <sup>138</sup> *Knowing the Presbyterian Church*, 99-107.
- <sup>139</sup> C. M. Kao, "Statement," 10.
- <sup>140</sup> John C. England, *Living Theology in Asia*, ed. John C. England (London: SCM Press, Ltd, 1981), 63.
- <sup>141</sup> C. M. Kao, interview, 31 May 2002; C. M. Kao, interview, 19 June 2002.
- <sup>142</sup> C. M. Kao, "Statement," 9-10.
- <sup>143</sup> Kao, "Statement," 10.
- <sup>144</sup> Sam S. C. Tsai, "Revised English translation of the Report of the Conference on Church and Society sponsored by the Committee on World Church Relations of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan," 11 July 1995, <<http://www.geocities.com/Tokyo/Temple/3307/stat0007.html>> (15 September 2005); "Our Appeal by the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, Concerning the Bible, the Church and the Nation." in *Public Statements (Taipei: The General Assembly, Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, 2002)*, 11.
- <sup>145</sup> "Appeal," 12, 11-12; C. M. Kao states his denomination was never so arrogant as to claim to be a prophet. Kao explains the church simply recognizes God is the supreme authority over governments and seeks to understand and act in accordance with God's will. Thus the Appeal should be taken as taking the "role of" a prophet, rather than claiming to be the voice of God. C. M. Kao, interview, 19 June 2002.
- <sup>146</sup> "Appeal," 12-13; Tin, *Christianity*, 110-111; Chen Nan-jou, interview by author, tape recording, Kaohsiung Taiwan, 9 August 2002; Chen Nan-jou, interview, 9 August 2002.
- <sup>147</sup> "Appeal," 12.
- <sup>148</sup> *Ibid.*, 12-13.
- <sup>149</sup> Graham, 158-160.
- <sup>150</sup> "Appeal," 13.
- <sup>151</sup> *Ibid.*
- <sup>152</sup> Wong Chong-gyiau, 135, 140-142, 149; Stephen Chen, "Renewal Strategies, 39-40; Hsiu-Lien Annette Lu, "Women's Liberation: The Taiwanese Experience," in *The Other Taiwan: 1945 to the Present*, ed. by Murray A. Rubinstein (London: M.E. Sharpe, 1994), 290.
- <sup>153</sup> Chen Nan-jou, interview, 9 August 2002; C. S. Yang reports that because of Confucian influence many Presbyterians are uncomfortable defying political authority. C. S. Yang, interview, 10 June 2002.
- <sup>154</sup> William Lo, interview, 23 July 2002.
- <sup>155</sup> Song, "Incarnation," 149.
- <sup>156</sup> *Ibid.*, 158.
- <sup>157</sup> Rubinstein, *Protestant Community*, 48; "Chiang Ching-kuo," *Wikipedia*, 14 September 2005, <[http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Chiang\\_Ching\\_Kuo](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Chiang_Ching_Kuo)> (15 September 2005).
- <sup>158</sup> Wong Chong-gyiau, 140-141; Raber, 172-175; Barnard, "Fifty Years," 34-35; Swanson, *The Church*, 30-32.
- <sup>159</sup> "Appeal," 13-14.
- <sup>160</sup> *Ibid.*, 14.
- <sup>161</sup> *Ibid.*
- <sup>162</sup> *Ibid.*, 12, 15; Cheng Yang-en, interview, 20 August 2002; C. S. Yang, interview, 10 June 2002.

<sup>163</sup> Chen Hsien-ping, 31-32; Hugh D. Sprunger, "Presbyterians' Hard, Bold Plans for Church Growth," *Taiwan Church Growth Bulletin* 3, no. 3, (September 1975): 4-6.

<sup>164</sup> Chen Hsien-ping, 33-36, 48-50; C. M. Kao, "A Forward Look," in C. M. Kao and Edward Senner, *Growth and Non Growth* (Taipei: The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, 1986), 48; Lin Jung-chi, 74-76.

<sup>165</sup> C. S. Yang, interview, 10 June 2002; William Lo, interview, 23 July 2002.

<sup>166</sup> "Appeal," 14-16.

<sup>167</sup> *Ibid.*, 16.

<sup>168</sup> C. S. Yang, interview, 10 June 2002.

<sup>169</sup> "A Declaration on Human Rights by The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan," in *Public Statements* (Taipei: *The General Assembly, Presbyterian Church in Taiwan*, 2002), 17-18; "Timeline of U.S. – China Relations," *PBS Online*, 1999, <<http://www.pbs.org/wgbh/amex/china/timeline/timeline7nf.html#1977>> (10 January 2005), 1977.

<sup>170</sup> "Declaration," 17.

<sup>171</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>172</sup> Wang Hsien-chih, "Some Perspectives on Homeland Theology in the Taiwanese Context," in *Frontiers in Asian Christian Theology: Emerging Trends*, ed. R. S. Sugirtharajah (Maryknoll: Orbis Books, 1994), 187.

<sup>173</sup> Jeane J. Kirkpatrick, "Establishing a Viable Human Rights Policy," *Third World Traveler*, 4 April 1981, <[http://www.thirdworldtraveler.com/Human%20Rights%20Documents/Kirkpatrick\\_HRPolicy.html](http://www.thirdworldtraveler.com/Human%20Rights%20Documents/Kirkpatrick_HRPolicy.html)> (10 January 2005).

<sup>174</sup> "Declaration," 17.

<sup>175</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>176</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>177</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>178</sup> *Ibid.*; "Statement," 7; "Appeal," 11.

<sup>179</sup> "Declaration," 17.

<sup>180</sup> Chen Nan-jou, interview, 9 August 2002.

<sup>181</sup> C. M. Kao, interview, 19 June 2002; Coe, *Recollections*, 255-256.

<sup>182</sup> Coe, *Recollections*, 261, 254-261.

<sup>183</sup> C. S. Yang, interview, 10 June 2002.

<sup>184</sup> "Theological Education and Homeland Theology in Taiwan," *Pro Mundi Vita Studies*, no. 4 (July 1988): 23.

<sup>185</sup> Jonathan Chao, "Response," 154; Russell, 454; Chen Nan-jou, interview, 9 August 2002.

<sup>186</sup> Coe, *Recollections*, 257.

<sup>187</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>188</sup> Chen Huei Hung, 118-119, 138; Wong Chong-gyiau, 50-52, 64-65.

<sup>189</sup> Lin Jung-chi, 107.

<sup>190</sup> *Ibid.*, 107-108.

<sup>191</sup> Wong Chong-gyiau, 63.

<sup>192</sup> Kho Syau-pheng and David Alexander, "Thirty Years On, Reflecting on the Social Mission of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan," *Worldwide Faith News*, 19 August 2001, <<http://www.wfn.org/2001/08/msg00213.html>> (14 May 2002).

<sup>193</sup> Huang Po-Ho, interview, 26 August 2002; Song, "Witnessing," 3; "Confession of Faith of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan," in *Public Statements* (Taipei: *The General Assembly, Presbyterian Church in Taiwan*, 2002), 19.

<sup>194</sup> Song, "Witnessing," 3.

<sup>195</sup> *Ibid.*, 4.

<sup>196</sup> "Confession," 19.

<sup>197</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>198</sup> *Ibid.*

- <sup>199</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>200</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>201</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>202</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>203</sup> Song, "Witnessing," 6, 7, 10.
- <sup>204</sup> "Confession of Faith of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan" ("台灣基督長老教會信仰告白"), in *Knowing the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan* (Taipei: General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, 2000), 135.
- <sup>205</sup> Song, "Witnessing," 8.
- <sup>206</sup> "Confession," 19.
- <sup>207</sup> C. S. Yang, interview, 10 June 2002.
- <sup>208</sup> "Confession," 19.
- <sup>209</sup> Song, "Witnessing," 7.
- <sup>210</sup> "Confession," 19.
- <sup>211</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>212</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>213</sup> "National Fate," 7.
- <sup>214</sup> Ibid. 8.
- <sup>215</sup> "Appeal," 12, 14, 15, 16.
- <sup>216</sup> Ibid., 12.
- <sup>217</sup> Ibid., 13.
- <sup>218</sup> Chen Nan-jou, interview, 9 August 2002.
- <sup>219</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>220</sup> James T. M. Pong, *Worldly Ambition versus Christian Vocation: Autobiography of a Chinese Bishop* (Taipei: Taiwan Episcopal Church, n.d.), 55.
- <sup>221</sup> "Homeland Theology in Taiwan," 23; Huang Po-Ho, interview, 26 August 2002.
- <sup>222</sup> Huang Po-Ho, interview, 26 August 2002.
- <sup>223</sup> Wang Hsien-chih, "Perspectives," 186; Chen Nan-jou, interview, 9 August 2002; "Homeland Theology in Taiwan," 23.
- <sup>224</sup> Wong Chong-gyiau, 55, 114.
- <sup>225</sup> Gold, 61; Chen Nan-jou, interview, 9 August 2002; Chow Lien-hwa, interview, 12 August 2002.
- <sup>226</sup> Wang Hsien-chih argues for doing theology from the perspective of, "the powerless, the oppressed, and even the nonidentifiable peoples among nations." Wang Hsien-chih "Perspectives," 189-190; Huang Po-Ho, *A Theology of Self-Determination: Responding to the Hope for "Chhut Thau Thi" of the People in Taiwan* (Tainan Taiwan: Chhut Thau Thi Theological Study Center, 1996), 66.
- <sup>227</sup> Wang Hsien-chih, "Perspectives," 188; "Homeland Theology in Taiwan," 23; Wong Chong-gyiau, 115.
- <sup>228</sup> Wang Hsien-chih, "Perspectives," 195.
- <sup>229</sup> Ibid., 188-189; Wong Chong-gyiau, 115-116, 117-118, 167.
- <sup>230</sup> Huang Po-Ho, interview, 26 August 2002.
- <sup>231</sup> Wang Hsien-chih, "Perspectives," 188.
- <sup>232</sup> Ibid., 189.
- <sup>233</sup> Ibid., 188; Wong Chong-gyiau, 112.
- <sup>234</sup> Wang Hsien-chih, "Perspectives," 188-189; Wong Chong-gyiau, 115-117.
- <sup>235</sup> Wang Hsien-chih, "Perspectives," 189.
- <sup>236</sup> Ibid., 189; Wong Chong-gyiau, 101-103.
- <sup>237</sup> Wang Hsien-chih, "Perspectives," 189-190; Wong Chong-gyiau, 101-104.
- <sup>238</sup> Wang Hsien-chih, "Perspectives," 189-190; Wong Chong-gyiau, 119.
- <sup>239</sup> Wang Hsien-chih, "Perspectives," 190-191; Wong Chong-gyiau, 104, 119-120.
- <sup>240</sup> William Lo, interview, 23 July 2002.
- <sup>241</sup> Wang Hsien-chih, "Perspectives," 190-191.

- <sup>242</sup> Ibid., 191-193; Wong Chong-gyiau, 120-122.
- <sup>243</sup> Wang Hsien-chih, "Perspectives," 193; 191-193.
- <sup>244</sup> Ibid., 194.
- <sup>245</sup> Hsu Ming-hsiung, 139.
- <sup>246</sup> Wang, Hsien-chih, "Perspectives," 193.
- <sup>247</sup> Wong Chong-gyiau, 105, 123-125.
- <sup>248</sup> Ibid., 100, 55, 117, 121, 124.
- <sup>249</sup> Ibid., 167.
- <sup>250</sup> Chen Hwei Hung, 114, 119; Wang Hsien-chih, "Perspectives," 189-190; Wong Chong-gyiau, 60-61, 100-103.
- <sup>251</sup> Mark Thelin, interview by author, tape recording, Taipei Taiwan, 21 June 2002.
- <sup>252</sup> Thelin, "Propagation," 178.
- <sup>253</sup> "Homeland Theology in Taiwan," 22.
- <sup>254</sup> Chen Nan-jou, interview, 9 August 2002; Wang Hsien-chih, "Perspectives," 186-187.
- <sup>255</sup> *Declaration*, 17; Wang Hsien-chih, "Perspectives," 187; Chen Nan-jou, interview, 9 August 2002.
- <sup>256</sup> Huang Po-Ho, interview, 26 August 2002; Wang, Hsien-chih, "Perspectives," 187.
- <sup>257</sup> "Confession," 19.
- <sup>258</sup> Huang Po-Ho, "Searching," 56.
- <sup>259</sup> Song, "Witnessing," 7-8.
- <sup>260</sup> Ibid., 12-13.
- <sup>261</sup> Huang Po-Ho, "Searching," 57, 56-59.
- <sup>262</sup> Ibid., 57-59.
- <sup>263</sup> Ibid., 58, 52-59.
- <sup>264</sup> "Taiwan History."
- <sup>265</sup> Huang Po-Ho, *Self-Determination*, 108.
- <sup>266</sup> Huang Po-Ho, interview, 26 August 2002.
- <sup>267</sup> Huang Po-Ho, "A Presbyterian Perspective on Doing Theology in Taiwan," *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 10, no. 2-3 (Fall/Winter 2000/2001): 36-37.
- <sup>268</sup> Huang Po-Ho, *Self-Determination*, 10.
- <sup>269</sup> Song, "Witnessing," 5; Huang Po-Ho, interview, 26 August 2002.
- <sup>270</sup> Huang Po-Ho, *Self-Determination*, 8, 110.
- <sup>271</sup> Huang Po-Ho, interview, 26 August 2002.
- <sup>272</sup> Song, "Witnessing," 5; Huang Po-Ho, interview, 26 August 2002; "Confession," 19.
- <sup>273</sup> Chen Nan-jou, interview, 9 August 2002; Huang Po-Ho, interview, 26 August 2002; Song, "Witnessing," 5.
- <sup>274</sup> Wang Hsien-chih, "Perspectives," 194.
- <sup>275</sup> Huang Po-Ho, interview, 26 August 2002; Huang Po-Ho, *Self-Determination*, 49-50.
- <sup>276</sup> Huang Po-Ho, *Self-Determination*, 79.
- <sup>277</sup> Ibid., 106, 25.
- <sup>278</sup> Ibid., 112, 53.
- <sup>279</sup> Ibid., 56, 41-59, 64; Huang Po-Ho, interview, 26 August 2002.
- <sup>280</sup> Huang Po-Ho, *Self-Determination*, 109.
- <sup>281</sup> Ibid., 47-48.
- <sup>282</sup> Ibid., 58, 41-59.
- <sup>283</sup> Ibid., 106-107.
- <sup>284</sup> Ibid., 79, 109, 113, 129; Huang Po-Ho, interview, 26 August 2002.
- <sup>285</sup> Huang Po-Ho, interview, 26 August 2002; Huang Po-Ho, *Self-Determination*, 10-11, 18, 109-112.
- <sup>286</sup> Huang Po-Ho, interview, 26 August 2002; Huang Po-Ho, *Self-Determination*, 118.
- <sup>287</sup> Huang Po-Ho, interview, 26 August 2002.
- <sup>288</sup> Ibid.

- <sup>289</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>290</sup> Ibid.; Huang Po-Ho, *Self-Determination*, 10, 113.
- <sup>291</sup> Huang Po-Ho, *Self-Determination*, 133, 129-137.
- <sup>292</sup> Huang Po-Ho, interview, 26 August 2002; Huang Po-Ho, *Self-Determination*, 68, 112-113.
- <sup>293</sup> Huang Po-Ho, *Self-Determination*, 68.
- <sup>294</sup> Ibid., 8; Chen Nan-jou, interview, 9 August 2002; C. S. Yang, interview, 10 June 2002.
- <sup>295</sup> Huang Po-Ho, *Self-Determination*, cover.
- <sup>296</sup> Huang Po-Ho, interview, 26 August 2002.
- <sup>297</sup> Chen Nan-jou, interview, 9 August 2002; Chen Nan-jou, "Challenges," 158-159.
- <sup>298</sup> Chen Nan-jou, interview, 9 August 2002; Chen Nan-jou, "Challenges," 154; Chen Nan-jou, "Involvement of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan on the Issue of the Future of Taiwan – A Theological Reflection," *Asain Journal of Theology* 9, no. 2 (1995): 256-258.
- <sup>299</sup> Chen, Nan-jou, "Challenges," 158-159.
- <sup>300</sup> Paul N. J. Chen, "Deprivatizing the Christian Faith: Service and Participation," (CWM East Asia Regional Consultation, Bible Study Number 4, 31 July 1990, photocopied).
- <sup>301</sup> Chen Nan-jou, "Involvement," 258; Paul N. J. Chen, "Deprivatizing."
- <sup>302</sup> Chen Nan-jou, "Involvement," 258-260; Chen Nan-jou, interview, 9 August 2002.
- <sup>303</sup> Chen Nan-jou, "Involvement," 260.
- <sup>304</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>305</sup> Ibid., 261; Chen Nan-jou, interview, 9 August 2002.
- <sup>306</sup> Paul N. J. Chen "Deprivatizing."
- <sup>307</sup> Chen Nan-jou, "Human Rights, Human Dignity, and the Mission of the Churches Amidst a Changing Asia," *Taiwan Journal of Theology*, no. 21 (1999): 175; Chen Nan-jou, "Challenges," 156, 164.
- <sup>308</sup> Chen Nan-jou, "Challenges," 161-162; Chen Nan-jou, "Human Rights." 173.
- <sup>309</sup> Chen Nan-jou, "Involvement," 261-262; Chen Nan-jou, interview, 9 August 2002; Chen, Nan-jou, "Challenges," 156, 164-165.
- <sup>310</sup> Chen Nan-jou, "Involvement," 261-262; Chen Nan-jou, "Challenges," 161.
- <sup>311</sup> Chen Nan-jou, "Challenges," 160-161.
- <sup>312</sup> Chen Nan-jou, interview, 9 August 2002; Chen Nan-jou, "Involvement," 256-257.
- <sup>313</sup> Chen Nan-jou, "Challenges," 160.
- <sup>314</sup> Huang Po-Ho, interview, 26 August 2002.
- <sup>315</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>316</sup> Chow Lien-hwa, interview, 12 August 2002; "What is the 'Year 2000,'" 7.
- <sup>317</sup> C. S. Yang, interview, 10 June 2002; Huang Po-Ho, interview, 26 August 2002; Thelma Lang Barnard, "Editorial," *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 10, no. 2 & 3 (Fall/Winter 2000, 2001): 14.
- <sup>318</sup> Huang Po-Ho, interview, 26 August 2002; "Trends and Developments in the Presbyterian Church of Taiwan," *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 9, no. 1 (Summer 1999) 33; William Lo, interview, 23 July 2002.
- <sup>319</sup> *21<sup>st</sup> Century New Taiwan Mission Movement Project* (Taipei: The General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, n.d.), 13, 1, 6-7, 10-14; Huang Po-Ho, interview, 26 August 2002.
- <sup>320</sup> *21<sup>st</sup> Century*, 6.
- <sup>321</sup> Ibid., 9.
- <sup>322</sup> Cheng Yang-en, "Review," 132.
- <sup>323</sup> References to provocative statements in interviews withheld; Raber, 178, 182, 208; Chen Hsien-ping, "The Growth History and the Ten Plus One Church Growth Movement of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan" (D.Min. thesis, Fuller Theological Seminary 1986), 47; Allen J. Swanson, *The Church*, 211; David Woodward, "Taiwan," in *The Church in Asia*, ed. Donald e. Hoke (Chicago: Moody Press, 1975), 612; Stephen Chen, interview, 26 April 2002; Cheng Yang-en, interview, 20 August 2002; Samuel Chiow, interview, 6 August 2002; Chow Lien-hwa, interview, 12 August 2002; David G. Gelzer, "Some Reminiscences about Shoki Coe," *Theology and the Church* 21, no. 2 (June 1996): 54.
- <sup>324</sup> Peter Chi Ping Lin, interview, 6 May 2002.

<sup>325</sup> Paul Chu Ching Su, "The Interaction of Society and Religion in the Light of Social Change in Taiwan: The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan – Retrospect and Prospect," *Asian Journal of Theology* 3, no. 1 (1989): 353; Peter Chen-Main Wang, 333-334; Hsu Ming-hsiung, 133-134; Tsai Kuo-shan, "Evangelization," 285-287; 320, 325; Daniel K. S. Tsai, interview, 29 May 2002; Hu Hong-chih, interview by author, Edinburgh Scotland, April 30, 2003; Cheng Yang-en, interview, 20 August 2002; William Lo, Interview, 23 July 2002; C. S. Yang, interview, 10 June 2002.

<sup>326</sup> J. Gresham Machen, *What is Faith?* (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1925), 183-218, 212; Marsden, *Reforming Fundamentalism*, 22, 32-37; "John Gresham Machen," *Wikipedia*, 5 September 2005, <[http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/John\\_Gresham\\_Machen](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/John_Gresham_Machen)> (15 September 2005).

<sup>327</sup> Chow Lien-hwa, interview, 12 August 2002.

## CHAPTER FOUR

<sup>1</sup> Swanson defines these ministries broadly. Their relationships with a local church or denomination can vary, their objective can be to serve Christians, non-Christians, or both, and their ministries can range from pure evangelism to service that is predominantly social in nature. By the same standard recent data suggests that in 1999 the institution/congregation ratio was approximately 1/9. Swanson, *The Church*, 89, 82; Chu San-tsai, *Taiwan Ming Area Christian Church, Association, and Mission Overview Tables* (Taichung: Christian Information Center, 2000), iii, 237-265.

<sup>2</sup> Swanson, *The Church*, 90-93. Hwang, *Joint Action*, 65-67.

<sup>3</sup> Liu Hsia, "Ten Years of Stormy Journey," in *Looking Back Over the Ten Year Journey: Eden Tenth Year Anniversary Special Publication* (Taipei: Eden Disabled Welfare Foundation, 1994), 3.

<sup>4</sup> Jacob Chen, interview, 3 January 2002; Chen Nan-jou, interview, 9 August 2002.

<sup>5</sup> Chen Mei-ju, interview by author, tape recording, Taipei Taiwan, 29 November 2001.

<sup>6</sup> Jacob Chen, interview by author, tape recording, Taipei Taiwan, 9 August 2000.

<sup>7</sup> Jacob Chen, interview, 3 January 2002.

<sup>8</sup> Jacob Chen, interview, 9 August 2000; Liu Hsia, "Ten Years," 2.

<sup>9</sup> Liu Hsia, "Ten Years," 3; Jacob Chen, interview, 9 August 2000; Yu Li-cheng, interview by author, tape recording, Taipei Taiwan, 25 September 2003.

<sup>10</sup> Liu Mei-hsia, interview by author, tape recording, Taipei Taiwan, 11 December 2001.

<sup>11</sup> Cecilia Fanchiang, "Reflecting on 20 Years of Helping the Disabled by Taiwan's Eden Social Welfare Foundation," *Taiwan Government Information Office*, 9 May 2003, <<http://www.publish.gov.tw/past/03050921.html>> (11 April 2005).

<sup>12</sup> Liu Hsia, interview by author, tape recording, May 2001.

<sup>13</sup> Liu Hsia, "The First Stone," in *Eden Bimonthly* 1 (July 1983): 1.

<sup>14</sup> Ibid.

<sup>15</sup> Jacob Chen, interview, 9 August 2000; Jacob Chen, interview, 3 January 2002.

<sup>16</sup> Jacob Chen, interview, 3 January 2002.

<sup>17</sup> Chen Mei-ju, interview, 29 November 2001.

<sup>18</sup> Jacob Chen, interview, 3 January 2002; Fanchiang, "Reflecting."

<sup>19</sup> "Complete Service" in *Eden Bimonthly* 1 (July 1983): 2.

<sup>20</sup> "Advisor to the President Dies after Assault," New Zealand Commerce and Industry Office, February-March 2003, <<http://www.mfat.govt.nz/foreign/regions/northasia/news/news03/nzcio/nzciofebmar03.html#Advisor%20to%20the%20President%20dies%20after%20assault>> (11 April 2005); Liu Hsia (劉俠), "The Challenged as the Challenger," interviewed by Kelly Her, *Free China Review*, January 1999, 41.

<sup>21</sup> Liu Hsia, "First Stone," 1.

<sup>22</sup> Fanchiang, "Reflecting."

<sup>23</sup> Chang Lai-hao, interview by author, tape recording; Chen Mei-ju, interview, 29 November 2001; Taipei Taiwan, 29 November 2001; "Liu Hsia," *Eden Social Welfare Foundation*, n.d. <<http://www.eden.org.tw/eng/au-f2.htm>> (11 April 2005).

<sup>24</sup> Chen Mei-ju, interview, 29 November 2001; Chang Lai-hao, interview, 29 November 2001.

<sup>25</sup> Ibid.

<sup>26</sup> Taipei Taiwan, February 28, 2002.

<sup>27</sup> Liu Hsia, interview, May 2001.

<sup>28</sup> Liu Mei-hsia, interview, 11 December 2001; Chang Lai-hao, interview, 29 November 2001; Chen Mei-ju, interview, 29 November 2001; Jacob Chen, interview, 3 January 2002.

<sup>29</sup> "Mission," *Eden Social Welfare Foundation*, n.d. <<http://www.eden.org.tw/eng/au-b2.htm>> (12 April 2005).

<sup>30</sup> Encore Pai, interview by author, Taipei Taiwan, 5 December 2001; Liu Mei-hsia, interview, 11 December 2001; Chen Mei-ju, interview, 29 November 2001; Jacob Chen, interview, 3 January 2002; Chang Lai-hao, interview, 29 November 2001.

- <sup>31</sup> Zhu Yin-puo, Beijing, to author, 15 March 2005; "Pai Bi," in *Hanyu Da Cidian*, vol. 6 (Shanghai: Hanyu Da Cidian Chubanshe, 1994), 654; "Pai Bi," in *Chihai Dictionary* (Shanghai: Chishu Chubanshe, 1989), 1833.
- <sup>32</sup> Jacob Chen, interview, 9 August 2000; Jacob Chen, interview, 3 January 2002.
- <sup>33</sup> Liu Mei-hsia, interview, 11 December 2001; Yu Li-cheng, interview, 25 September 2003.
- <sup>34</sup> Liu Mei-hsia, interview, 11 December 2001.
- <sup>35</sup> Zhu Yin-puo, to author, 15 March 2005.
- <sup>36</sup> "Eden Shuangfu Strategy," (Taipei: Eden Social Welfare Foundation, 16 February 1998, photocopied), 1; "The Promotion and Establishment of Shuangfu Ministry, an Investigation," (Taipei: Eden Social Welfare Foundation, 15 April 1998, photocopied), 3.
- <sup>37</sup> Liu Mei-hsia, interview, 11 December 2001; Chang Lai-hao, interview, 29 November 2001.
- <sup>38</sup> Liu, Yu-hsiu, interview by author, 20 November 2001; Cheng Lan-hsin, interview by author, tape recording, Taipei Taiwan, 20 November 2001.
- <sup>39</sup> Peng Shu-fan, interview by author, tape recording, 6 November 2001.
- <sup>40</sup> Jacob Chen, interview, 9 August 2000; Robert Lin, interview by author, tape recording, Taipei Taiwan, 15 August 2000.
- <sup>41</sup> Chiu Kung-ming, interview by author, tape recording, Taipei Taiwan, 8 September 2000.
- <sup>42</sup> "1999 Eden Yearly Service Report" (Taipei: Eden Social Welfare Foundation, 1999, photocopied).
- <sup>43</sup> Chiu Kung-ming, interview, 8 September 2000; Chen Mei-ju, interview by author, tape recording, Taipei Taiwan, 12 December 2001; Liu Hsia, "First Stone," 1.
- <sup>44</sup> Liu Mei-hsia, interview, 11 December 2001.
- <sup>45</sup> Chiu Kung-ming, interview, 8 September 2000.
- <sup>46</sup> Diao Huei-mei, "Research on the Effect on Disabled Welfare in the Campaign to Elect Liu Hsia by the Disability Union" (Research Report: National Taiwan University Graduate School of Sociology, 1991), 1, 2, 5, 6, 8, 11; Jacob Chen, interview, 3 January 2002; Robert Lin, interview, 15 August 2000; Margaret Tsui, interview by author, Taipei Taiwan, 4 December 2001.
- <sup>47</sup> "1999 Love Without Frontiers," (Taipei: Eden Social Welfare Foundation, 1999), 27; "Landmine Report 2001," *International Campaign to Ban Landmines*, n.d. <<http://www.icbl.org/lm/2001/taiwan>> (28 December 2001); "Taiwan and International Healthcare since 1995," *Taipei Economic and Cultural Office, Canada*, 2 May 2004 <http://www.canada-taiwan.org/english/who/who002.html>> (6 June 2005).
- <sup>48</sup> Liu Hsia, "Ten Years," 3; Liu Mei-hsia: "To Hold Hands on the Ten Year Journey," in *Looking Back Over the Ten Year Journey: Eden Tenth Year Anniversary Special Publication* (Taipei: Eden Disabled Welfare Foundation, 1994), 6.
- <sup>49</sup> Liu Hsia, interview, May 2001.
- <sup>50</sup> Name withheld.
- <sup>51</sup> Jacob Chen, interview, 3 January 2002.
- <sup>52</sup> "Confession," 19; Jacob Chen, interview, 9 August 2000; Jacob Chen, interview, 3 January 2002.
- <sup>53</sup> "Confession," 19; Jacob Chen, interview, 9 August 2000.
- <sup>54</sup> Jacob Chen, interview, 9 August 2000; Jacob Chen, interview, 3 January 2002.
- <sup>55</sup> Tsai Gwo-shan, interview, 29 May 2002; Chen Mei-ju, interview, 12 December 2001.
- <sup>56</sup> Peng Shu-fan, interview, 6 November 2001; Liu Mei-hsia, interview, 11 December 2001; Chen Mei-ju, interview, 29 November 2001; Liu Yu-hsiu, interview, 20 November 2001; Lin, Mei-chuang, interview by author, tape recording, Taipei Taiwan, 13 November 2001.
- <sup>57</sup> Chen Mei-ju, interview, 29 November 2001.
- <sup>58</sup> Chiu Kung-ming, interview, 8 September 2000.
- <sup>59</sup> Peng Shu-fan, interview, 6 November 2001.
- <sup>60</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>61</sup> Ibid.; Chang Lai-hao, interview by author, tape recording, Taipei Taiwan, 8 September 2000.
- <sup>62</sup> Chen Mei-ju, interview, 12 December 2001.

- <sup>63</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>64</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>65</sup> Chiu Kung-ming, interview, 8 September 2000; Chen Mei-ju, interview, 29 November 2001; Chen Mei-ju, interview, 12 December 2001; Chang Lai-hao, interview, 29 November 2001; Peng Shu-fan, interview, 8 November 2001.
- <sup>66</sup> Liu Hsia, "Ten Years," 3.
- <sup>67</sup> Jacob Chen, interview, 3 January 2002.
- <sup>68</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>69</sup> Song, "Election for Mission," 46.
- <sup>70</sup> Chen Mei-ju, interview, 29 November 2001.
- <sup>71</sup> Liu Hsia, "First Stone," 1.
- <sup>72</sup> Jacob Chen, "Holding the Plow and Looking Forward: Eden's Transformation Difficulties," in *Looking Back Over the Ten Year Journey: Eden Tenth Year Anniversary Special Publication* (Taipei: Eden Disabled Welfare Foundation, 1994), 4.
- <sup>73</sup> Chen Mei-ju, interview, 29 November 2001.
- <sup>74</sup> Bevens, 70-76.
- <sup>75</sup> Daniel H. Levine, *Popular Voices in Latin American Catholicism* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1992), 31, 40-41, 45-46, 49; Oscar Romero, "The Political Dimension of the Faith from the Perspective of the Option for the Poor," in *Liberation Theology: a Documentary History*, ed. Alfred T. Hennelly (Maryknoll: Orbis Books, 1995), 299-300; Leonardo Boff and Clodovis Boff, *Introducing Liberation Theology*, trans. Paul Burns (Tunbridge Wells, Kent: Burns and Oates, 1987), 4-5; 12; Madeleine R. Cousineau, "Preferential Option for the Poor," in *Encyclopedia of Religion and Society*, ed. William H. Swatos, Jr. (London: Altamira Press, 1998), 375; Jorge Pixley and Clodovis Boff, *The Bible, the Church and the Poor: Biblical, Theological and Pastoral Aspects of the Option for the Poor*, trans. Paul Burns (Tunbridge Wells, Kent: Burns & Oates, 1989), 202-205, 207; Douglas Paterson, "Praxis," in *Evangelical Dictionary of World Missions*, ed. Scott Moreau (Grand Rapids: Baker Books, 2000), 780-781; David S. Walker, "Preferential Option for the Poor in Evangelical Theology: Assessments and Proposals," *Journal of Theology for Southern Africa* 79 (June 1992): 59-60; Bosch, 423-424
- <sup>76</sup> Jacob Chen, interview, 3 January 2002.
- <sup>77</sup> Pixley and Boff, 8; Boff and Boff, 3; Gustavo Gutierrez, *Essential Writings*, ed. James B. Nickoloff (Maryknoll: Orbis Books, 2003), 144; A. Scott Moreau, "Option for the Poor," in *Evangelical Dictionary of World Missions*, ed. Scott Moreau (Grand Rapids: Baker Books, 2000), 711-712.
- <sup>78</sup> Jacob Chen, interview, 9 August 2000; Chang Lai-hao, interview, 8 September 2000; Peng Shu-fan, interview, 6 November 2001.
- <sup>79</sup> Henri J. M. Nouwen, in Gustavo Gutierrez, *We Drink from Our Own Wells: The Spiritual Journey of a People*, trans. Matthew J. O'Connell (London: SCM Press Ltd., 1984), xiv-xv; Walker, 54, 56; Bosch, 424-426.
- <sup>80</sup> Jacob Chen, interview, 9 August 2000.
- <sup>81</sup> Ibid.; Jacob Chen, interview, 3 January 2002.
- <sup>82</sup> Hsiao Ta-hsing, Kuo Cheng-hsiung, and Chang Li-mei, interview by author, Mu-cha Taiwan, 10 December 2001; Liu, Yu-hsiu, interview, 20 November 2001; Chang Lai-hao, interview, 8 September 2000; Lin, Mei-chuang, interview, 13 November 2001; Liu Mei-hsia, interview, 11 December 2001.
- <sup>83</sup> Liu Ming-yi, "Eden's Song" ed. Liu Hsia in *Looking Back Over the Ten Year Journey: Eden Tenth Year Anniversary Special Publication* (Taipei: Eden Disabled Welfare Foundation, 1994), 77.
- <sup>84</sup> Liu Yu-hsiu, interview, 20 November 2001.
- <sup>85</sup> Lin Mei-chuang, interview, 13 November 2001; Liu Mei-hsia, interview, 11 December 2001; Peng Shu-fan, interview, 6 November 2001.
- <sup>86</sup> Tsai Ting-I, "President Donates his Shares in FTV to Disabled Charity," *Taipei Times*, 14 February 2003 <<http://www.taipetimes.com/News/taiwan/archives/2003/02/14/194498>> (13 April 2005).
- <sup>87</sup> "Evangelism Funds for Bible Seminary Students and Mission," (Taipei: Eden Social Welfare Foundation, n.d.).
- <sup>88</sup> Tim Shao, interview, 8 January 2002; James Shia, Sermon, 20 October 2001.

- <sup>89</sup> Liu Hsia, interview, May 2001; Chang Lai-hao, interview, 29 November 2001.
- <sup>90</sup> Chen Mei-ju, interview, 29 November 2001.
- <sup>91</sup> Chen Mei-ju, interview, 12 December 2001.
- <sup>92</sup> Peng Shu-fan, interview, 6 November 2001.
- <sup>93</sup> Chen Mei-ju, interview, 29 November 2001.
- <sup>94</sup> Jacob Chen, interview, 9 August 2000.
- <sup>95</sup> Liu Mei-hsia, interview, 11 December 2001; Liu Mei-hsia, "To Hold Hands," 7.
- <sup>96</sup> Chen Mei-ju, interview, 12 December 2001; Chang Lai-hao, interview, 8 September 2000.
- <sup>97</sup> Chang Lai-hao, interview, 8 September 2000; Chang Lai-hao, interview, 29 November 2001; Lin, Mei-chuang, interview, 13 November 2001.
- <sup>98</sup> Robert Lin, interview, 15 August 2000.
- <sup>99</sup> Chen Mei-ju, interview, 12 December 2001.
- <sup>100</sup> Lin Mei-chuang, interview, 13 November 2001; Jacob Chen, interview, 9 August 2000; Jacob Chen, interview, 3 January 2002.
- <sup>101</sup> Liu Hsia, interview, May 2001; Lin Mei-chuang, interview, 13 November 2001; Liu Mei-hsia, interview, 11 December 2001; Chang Lai-hao, interview, 8 September 2000; Robert Lin, interview, 15 August 2000; Yu Li-cheng, interview, 25 September 2003.
- <sup>102</sup> Jacob Chen, 15 December 2005, personal email (15 December 2005); Jacob Chen, interview, 9 August 2000; Jacob Chen, interview, 3 January 2002; Liu Hsia, interview, May 2001.
- <sup>103</sup> Jacob Chen, interview, 9 August 2000; Fanchiang; "Reflecting."
- <sup>104</sup> Liu Mei-hsia, interview, 11 December 2001.
- <sup>105</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>106</sup> Ibid.; Lin, Mei-chuang, interview, 13 November 2001; Encore Pai, interview, 5 December 2001.
- <sup>107</sup> Jacob Chen, interview, 3 January 2002.
- <sup>108</sup> Lin, Mei-chuang, interview, 13 November 2001; Liu Hsia, interview, May 2001.
- <sup>109</sup> Liu Hsia, interview, May 2001; Lin, Mei-chuang, interview, 13 November 2001; Liu Mei-hsia, interview, 11 December 2001; Chen Mei-ju, interview, 29 November 2001; Robert Lin, interview, 15 August 2000; Margaret Tsui, interview, 4 December 2001.
- <sup>110</sup> Cheng Lan-hsin, interview, 20 November 2001.
- <sup>111</sup> Jacob Chen, interview, 9 August 2000.
- <sup>112</sup> Liu Hsia, interview, May 2001; Lin, Mei-chuang, interview, 13 November 2001; Robert Lin, interview, 15 August 2000; Liu Mei-hsia, interview, 11 December 2001.
- <sup>113</sup> Chen Mei-ju, interview, 12 December 2001.
- <sup>114</sup> Gustavo Gutierrez, "Toward a Theology of Liberation," in *Liberation Theology: A Documentary History*, trans. Alfred T. Hennelly (Maryknoll: Orbis Books, 1995), 72-73.
- <sup>115</sup> Bosch, 86, 89, 98, 99, 101, 104, 118, 393.
- <sup>116</sup> Ibid., 84, 117, 411-412.
- <sup>117</sup> Ibid., 119.
- <sup>118</sup> Ibid., 119-120.
- <sup>119</sup> Ibid., 91, 113-115.
- <sup>120</sup> Peter Chi Ping Lin, interview, 6 May 2002.
- <sup>121</sup> Liu Mei-hsia, interview, 11 December 2001.
- <sup>122</sup> Jacob Chen, interview, 3 January 2002.
- <sup>123</sup> Ibid.; Liu Mei-hsia, interview, 11 December 2001; Chiu Kung-ming, interview, 8 September 2000.
- <sup>124</sup> Chiu Kung-ming, interview, 8 September 2000.
- <sup>125</sup> Liu Hsia, interview, May 2001; Jacob Chen, interview, 9 August 2000; Jacob Chen, interview, 3 January 2002; Chang Lai-hao, interview, 8 September 2000; Robert Lin, interview, 15 August 2000.
- <sup>126</sup> "Shuang," in *Oxford Pocket Chinese Dictionary* (Hong Kong: Oxford University Press China Ltd., 1999), 421.

<sup>127</sup> “Fu,” in *Oxford Pocket Chinese Dictionary* (Hong Kong: Oxford University Press China Ltd., 1999), 133; “The Eden Social Welfare Foundation,” in *Directory of 300 Major Foundations in Taiwan* (Taipei: Himalaya Foundation, 1999), 76.

<sup>128</sup> “Evangelism Funds.”

<sup>129</sup> Liu Kan, interview, 27 July 2000.

<sup>130</sup> “Shuangfu Development and Pastoral Group,” (Taipei: Eden Social Welfare Foundation, n.d., photocopied).

<sup>131</sup> Chen Mei-ju, interview, 12 December 2001.

<sup>132</sup> Peng Shu-fan, interview, 6 November 2001; Swanson, *The Church*, 102.

<sup>133</sup> Chen Mei-ju, interview, 12 December 2001; Chen Mei-ju, interview, 29 November 2001.

<sup>134</sup> Chen Mei-ju, interview, 12 December 2001; Chang Lai-hao, interview, 8 September 2000; Chang Lai-hao, interview, 29 November 2001.

<sup>135</sup> Chang Lai-hao, interview, 8 September 2000; Chang Lai-hao, interview, 29 November 2001.

<sup>136</sup> Peng Shu-fan, interview, 6 November 2001.

<sup>137</sup> Chen Mei-ju, interview, 29 November 2001.

<sup>138</sup> Chiu Kung-ming, “Pursuing Peace among Suffering,” in *Shuangfu Weekly Bulletin* 2 (8 October 2001): 2.

<sup>139</sup> Grace Cheng, interview, 18 July 2002.

<sup>140</sup> Jacob Chen, interview, 3 January 2002; Robert Lin, interview, 15 August 2000; Peng Shu-fan, interview, 6 November 2001.

<sup>141</sup> Jacob Chen, interview, 9 August 2000.

<sup>142</sup> Chen Mei-ju, interview, 12 December 2001.

<sup>143</sup> Ibid.; Jacob Chen, interview, 3 January 2002; Chang Lai-hao, interview, 29 November 2001; Liu Mei-hsia, interview, 11 December 2001; “Evangelism Funds.”

<sup>144</sup> Liu Hsia, interview, May 2001.

<sup>145</sup> Chen Mei-ju, interview, 29 November 2001; Chen Mei-ju, interview, 12 December 2001; Daniel Cheng, interview, Taipei Taiwan, 2 August, 2002.

<sup>146</sup> Chen Mei-ju, interview, 12 December 2001.

<sup>147</sup> Ibid.

<sup>148</sup> Chang Lai-hao, interview, 8 September 2000; Liu Mei-hsia, interview, 11 December 2001.

<sup>149</sup> Liu Hsia, interview, May 2001; Jacob Chen, interview, 3 January 2002.

<sup>150</sup> John Chu, interview, 29 July 2002.

<sup>151</sup> Yu Li-cheng, interview, 25 September 2003; Leo Ip, interview, May 23, 2002; Chiu Kung-ming, interview, 8 September 2000.

<sup>152</sup> Yu Li-cheng, interview, 25 September 2003; Chang Lai-hao, interview, 8 September 2000; Chang Lai-hao, interview, 29 November 2001; Liu Mei-hsia, interview, 11 December 2001; Lin Mei-chuang, interview, 13 November 2001.

<sup>153</sup> Peng Shu-fan, interview, 6 November 2001.

<sup>154</sup> Chang Lai-hao, interview, 8 September 2000; Chang Lai-hao, interview, 29 November 2001.

<sup>155</sup> Andrew F. Walls, *The Missionary Movement in Christian History: Studies in the Transmission of the Faith* (Maryknoll: Orbis Books, 1997), 29.

<sup>156</sup> Ibid.

<sup>157</sup> Ibid.

<sup>158</sup> Bosch, 412.

<sup>159</sup> C. M. Kao, interview, 31 May 2002.

<sup>160</sup> Liu Hsia, interview, May 2001.

<sup>161</sup> Ibid.; Liu Hsia, “Ten Years,” 3.

<sup>162</sup> Robert Lin, interview, 15 August 2000.

<sup>163</sup> Chen Mei-ju, interview, 29 November 2001.

<sup>164</sup> “Complete Service,” 7.

<sup>165</sup> Chang Lai-hao, interview, 8 September 2000.

<sup>166</sup> Chen Mei-ju, interview, 29 November 2001.

- <sup>167</sup> Chiu Kung-ming, "The Worst Disaster the Best Outcome," in *Shuangfu Weekly Bulletin* 1 (1 Oct. 2001): 2; Chiu Kung-ming, "Pursuing Peace," 2; Robert Lin, interview, 15 August 2000.
- <sup>168</sup> Jacob Chen, interview, 3 January 2002.
- <sup>169</sup> Chang Lai-hao, interview, 29 November 2001.
- <sup>170</sup> Lin Mei-chuang, interview, 13 November 2001.
- <sup>171</sup> "Eden Instructions for Visiting the Disabled," (Taipei: Eden Social Welfare Foundation, n.d., photocopied); "Verses for Those with Different Kinds of Disability," (Taipei: Eden Social Welfare Foundation, n.d., photocopied).
- <sup>172</sup> Jacob Chen, interview, 3 January 2002.
- <sup>173</sup> Cheng Lan-hsin, interview, 20 November 2001; Liu Yu-hsiu, interview, 20 November 2001.
- <sup>174</sup> Liu Mei-hsia, interview, 11 December 2001; Lin Mei-chuang, interview, 3 January 2002; Robert Lin, interview, 15 August 2000.
- <sup>175</sup> Chang Lai-hao, interview, 29 November 2001.
- <sup>176</sup> Chen Mei-ju, interview, 29 November 2001.
- <sup>177</sup> *Ibid.*; Chang Lai-hao, interview, 29 November 2001; Peng Shu-fan, interview, 6 November 2001.
- <sup>178</sup> James A. Scherer, *Gospel Church & Kingdom: Comparative Studies in World Mission Theology* (Minneapolis: Augsburg Publishing House, 1987), 242; William R. Burrows, *Redemption and Dialogue: Reading Redeptoris Missio and Dialogue and Proclamation* (Maryknoll: Orbis Books, 1994), 244.
- <sup>179</sup> Chang Lai-hao, interview, 8 September 2000.
- <sup>180</sup> Liu Yu-hsiu, interview, 20 November 2001.
- <sup>181</sup> Yu Li-cheng, interview, 25 September 2003; Chang Lai-hao, interview, 29 November 2001.
- <sup>182</sup> Liu Hsia, interview, May 2001.

## CHAPTER FIVE

<sup>1</sup> "Advisor to the President Dies after Assault," New Zealand Commerce and Industry Office, February-March 2003, <<http://www.mfat.govt.nz/foreign/regions/northasia/news/news03/nzcio/nzciofebmar03.html#Advisor%20to%20the%20President%20dies%20after%20assault>> (11 April 2005); Liu Hsia, in Kelly Her, "The Challenged as the Challenger," *Free China Review* (January 1999): 41.

<sup>2</sup> Encore Pai, Taipei, to author, 5 July 2001.

<sup>3</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Book," in *Psalm of Life* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1995), 165.

<sup>4</sup> *Psalm of Life*, back cover.

<sup>5</sup> Xing, Lin Zi, "Addendum," in *Sing the Song of Life* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1995), 208.

<sup>6</sup> Liu Hsia, interview, May 2001.

<sup>7</sup> Dominic Cheung, ed., *The Isle Full of Noises: Modern Chinese Poetry from Taiwan*, trans.

Dominic Cheung (New York: Columbia University Press, 1987); Michelle Yeh, ed., *Anthology of Modern Chinese Poetry* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1992); Ann Carver and Sung Sheng Yvonne Chang, ed., *Bamboo Shoots After the Rain: Contemporary Stories by Women Writers of Taiwan* (New York: The Feminist Press, 1990); Michael S. Duke, ed., *Worlds of Chinese Fiction: Short Stories and Novellas from the People's Republic, Taiwan, and Hong Kong* (London, M.E. Sharpe, 1991).

<sup>8</sup> David Pollard, *The Chinese Essay* (London: Hurst and Company, 2000), 23.

<sup>9</sup> *Ibid.*, 23-24.

<sup>10</sup> The term *san* (散) denotes *loose, not being held together, and scattered*. *Wen* (文) means *language, literature, and composition*. *A Modern English-Chinese Dictionary* (Beijing: Foreign Language and Teaching Press, 1989), 757, 929.

<sup>1</sup> Pollard, 1-19.

<sup>2</sup> *Ibid.*, 20-21; Wilt Idema and Lloyd Haft, *A Guide to Chinese Literature* (Ann Arbor: Center for Chinese at the University of Michigan, 1977), 298.

<sup>3</sup> Pollard, 21.

<sup>4</sup> "Editorial: Frustrating Inaccessibility," *Free China Review*, April 1991, not numbered.

<sup>5</sup> Winnie Chang, "Daily Source of Good Writing," *Free China Review*, April 1991, 38-40; Pollard, 13-14.

<sup>6</sup> Bill Bryson, "January Interview: Billy Bryson," *January Magazine*, July 2000, <<http://www.januarymagazine.com/profiles/bryson.html>> (August 29, 2001).

<sup>7</sup> Chang, 43.

<sup>8</sup> Wang Chang-lin, in Winnie Chang, "Daily Source of Good Writing," *The Free China Review*, April 1991, 41.

<sup>9</sup> Bo Yang, "Reportage and I," *Modern Chinese Literature* 1, no. 2 (Spring 1985): 220-221.

<sup>10</sup> Lu Cheng-hui, "Reflections on Reality: Interview with Taiwan Writers," *Free China Review*, April 1991, 21.

<sup>11</sup> Chu Yen, 206-207.

<sup>12</sup> Idema and Haft, 298.

<sup>13</sup> Emma Wu, "Mirrors of the Soul and Spirit," *Free China Review*, April 1991, 8-11; "Reflections on Reality: Interview with Taiwan Writers," *Free China Review*, April 1991, 21; Pang-Yuen Chi, "Taiwan Literature, 1945-1999," in *Chinese Literature in the Second Half of a Modern Century*, ed. Pang Yuen Chi and David Der-Wei Wang (Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2000), 14; Chu Yen, 218, 221.

<sup>14</sup> Idema and Haft, 296-297.

<sup>15</sup> Pollard, 21-22.

<sup>16</sup> Rosemary Haddon, "Engendering Women: Taiwan's Recent Fiction by Women," in *Dress, Sex, and Text in Chinese Culture*, ed. Antonia Finnane and Anne McLaren (Australia: Monash Asia Institute, 1999), 214; Carver and Chang, xxi.

<sup>17</sup> Liu Mu-Sha, "The Days of Looking at the MRT Trains," trans. Michelle Min-Chia Wu, *The Chinese Pen* 27, no. 109 (25 September 1999): 17, 19.

<sup>18</sup> Emma Wu, 9.

<sup>19</sup> Carver and Chang, xxi.

<sup>20</sup> Pollard, 19, 22; David Der-Wei Wang, "Introduction," in *Chinese Literature in the Second Half of a Modern Century*, ed. Pang Yuan Chi and David Der-Wei Wang (Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2000), xxx-xxxii.

<sup>21</sup> Pollard, 19-21; Idema and Haft, 286, 296-297.

<sup>22</sup> *Exiles and Native Sons: Modern Chinese Short Stories from Taiwan*, ed. Dominic Cheung and Michelle Yeh (Taipei: National Institute for Compilation and Translation, 1992), 6.

<sup>23</sup> Wang Meng, "Preface," in *Fragrant Weeds: Chinese Short Stories Once Labeled as "Poisonous Weeds,"* trans. By Geremie Barme and Bennett Lee, ed. W.J.F. Jenner (Hong Kong: Joint Publishing Company, 1983), vii.

<sup>24</sup> Feng Yuan-Chun, *A Short History of Classical Chinese Literature*, trans. Yang Hsien-Yi and Gladys Yang (Peking: Foreign Languages Press, 1958), 9.

<sup>25</sup> Stevan Harrell and Huang Chun-Chieh, "Culture with a Big C: Literature and the Arts," in *Cultural Change in Postwar Taiwan*, ed. Stevan Harrell and Huang Chun-Chieh (Oxford: Westview Press, 1994), 203.

<sup>26</sup> Shi Tiesheng, "Shi Tiesheng: Wheelchair Humanist," interviewed by Laifong Leung, *Morning Sun: Interviews with Chinese Writers of the Lost Generation* (London: M. E. Sharp, 1994), 163.

<sup>27</sup> Liu Hsia, interview, May 2001.

<sup>28</sup> Wang Chong was an essayist who wrote to combat superstition. Among other things he argued against the divine nature of the Han emperors. David Pollard, 4; Feng Yuan-Chun, *A Short History of Classical Chinese Literature* (Peking: Foreign Languages Press, 1958), 39.

<sup>29</sup> Pollard, 4.

<sup>30</sup> At the end of the imperial era Liang Chi-chao (1873-1929) was one of the most influential Chinese prose writers. He is known for having rejected western imperialism and yet used what he found helpful in western culture to invigorate Chinese civilization. In the beginning of the 20<sup>th</sup> century he published two newspapers, arguing for a free press as a forum for both informing the community and expressing its views. Feng Yuen-Chun, *A Short History of Classical Chinese Literature*, 118-119; Joseph R. Levenson, *Liang Ch'i-ch'ao and the Mind of Modern China* (London: Thames and Hudson, 1953), 47-49; Xiaobing Tang, *Global Space and the Nationalist of Modernity: The Historical Thinking of Liang Qichao* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1996), 49.

<sup>31</sup> C. T. Hsia, "Yen Fu and Liang Ch'i-ch'ao as Advocates of New Fiction," in *Chinese Approaches to Literature from Confucius to Liang Ch'i-ch'ao*, ed. Adele Austin Rickett (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1978), 222-223.

<sup>32</sup> Song, *Believing*, 34.

<sup>33</sup> *Ibid.*, 40.

<sup>34</sup> Song, *Reconstruction*, x.

<sup>35</sup> Song, *Believing*, 32, 104; Song, *Womb*, 94.

<sup>36</sup> Song, *Believing*, 34.

<sup>37</sup> Song, *Womb*, 84, 100-109; Song, *Reign*, 121-123.

<sup>38</sup> Song, *Reign*, 123.

<sup>39</sup> Choan-Seng Song, "Freedom of Christian Theology for Asian Cultures," *PCTA Bulletin* 1, no. 1 (January 1988): 6.

<sup>40</sup> C. S. Song, "Story Theology of Birth and Rebirth," *PCTA Bulletin* 6, no. 1 (January 1993): 4; Song, *Believing*, xi, 23.

<sup>41</sup> *Ibid.*, xi.

<sup>42</sup> *Ibid.*, 21.

<sup>43</sup> Song, *Womb*, 227.

<sup>44</sup> Song, *Believing*, 31; Song, "What is Christian Theology?," 5.

<sup>45</sup> Song, *Womb*, 46.

<sup>46</sup> Song, "Birth and Rebirth," 3-4; Song, "What is Christian Theology?," 5; Choan-Seng Song, "Asian Theologies Developing out of Asian Resources," *PTCA Bulletin* 4, no. 2 (October 1991): 5; C. S. Song, *The Tears of Lady Meng: A Parable of a People's Political Theology* (Geneva: World Council of Churches, 1981), 29; Song, *Womb*, 18.

<sup>47</sup> Song, "Birth and Rebirth," 4; Song, *Lady Meng*, 29.

<sup>48</sup> Song, *Reconstruction*, 28.

<sup>49</sup> Song, "Birth and Rebirth," 4.

<sup>50</sup> Song, "What is Christian Theology," 5.

<sup>51</sup> Song, *Power*, 109-110.

<sup>52</sup> Song, *Reconstruction*, 1; Song, *Believing*, 13, 21.

<sup>53</sup> Song, *Reconstruction*, ix.

<sup>54</sup> *Ibid.*, 41.

<sup>55</sup> Song, *Believing*, 12.

<sup>56</sup> *Ibid.*, 10-12.

<sup>57</sup> Song, *Third Eye*, 22.

<sup>58</sup> Song, *Reconstruction*, 47.

<sup>59</sup> Song, *Third Eye*, 173.

<sup>60</sup> Song, *Reconstruction*, 97.

<sup>61</sup> Luke 10:29-37.

<sup>62</sup> Song, *Believing*, 37-41.

<sup>63</sup> Song, *Reign*, 44.

<sup>64</sup> Song, *Power*, 125.

<sup>65</sup> Song, *Believing*, 44.

<sup>66</sup> Song, *Womb*, 2-3.

<sup>67</sup> Most of the earliest missionaries to Taiwan were Scottish Presbyterians. S. Piggin discusses Duff's influence over early Scottish missions in "Duff, Alexander," in *Dictionary of Scottish Church History*, ed. Nigel M. de S. Cameron (Edinburgh, T & T Clark, 1993), 259-260. Lauren Pfister mentions Duff's influence on the most well known early Taiwan missionary in "Mackay, George Leslie," in *Evangelical Dictionary of World Missions*, ed. A. Scott Moreau (Grand Rapids: Baker Books, 2000), 589.

<sup>68</sup> Ian Maxwell, "Alexander Duff and the Theological and Philosophical Background to the General Assembly Mission in Calcutta to 1840" (Ph. D. thesis, University of Edinburgh, 1995), 109-146; Alexander Duff, *The Church of Scotland's India Mission; or a Brief Exposition of the Principles on which that Mission has been Conducted in Calcutta, Being the Substance of an Address Delivered Before the General Assembly of the Church, on Monday, May 25<sup>th</sup> 1835*, (Edinburgh: Waugh and Innes, 1835), 1-10.

<sup>69</sup> *Ibid.*, 5.

<sup>70</sup> Song, *Womb*, 61.

<sup>71</sup> Song, *Power*, 125.

<sup>72</sup> Song, "What is Christian Theology," 6; Song, *Believing*, 11, 30; Song, *Womb*, 18, 46, 54; Song, *Power*, 109-110.

<sup>73</sup> Song, *Believing*, 65.

<sup>74</sup> Song, *Womb*, 45.

<sup>75</sup> Song, *Believing*, 36-37; Song, *Womb*, 14, 20-21, 23, 26, 76-77.

<sup>76</sup> Song, *Believing*, 38-40, 47; Song, *Reconstruction*, 13; Song, *Third Eye*, 72, 101, 158, 160, 167.

<sup>77</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Long Life". in *Victory Song Series* (Taipei: China Christian Mission, 1983), 124-125.

<sup>78</sup> Xing Lin Zi, *Thinking of You* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1993), 5-6; Xing Lin Zi, "Walking Willingly on this Path," in *The Song of Life*, (Taipei: Eurasian Press, 1997), 187.

<sup>79</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Filial Piety," in *Victory Song Series* (Taipei: China Christian Mission, 1983), 101.

<sup>80</sup> Xing, Lin Zi, "The Song of Life," in *The Song of Life* (Taipei: Eurasian Press, 1997), 22-23; Xing Lin Zi, "Is Life Just this Pair of Legs?," in *The Song of Life* (Taipei: Eurasian Press, 1997), 25-26; Xing Lin Zi, "Prayer," in *The Song of Life* (Taipei: Eurasian Press, 1997), 69-70; Xing Lin Zi, "The Best Way to Annihilate an Enemy," in *The Song of Life* (Taipei: Eurasian Press, 1997), 349; Xing Lin Zi,

"Light the Lamp of Life," in *Watch Your Soul* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1997), 21; Xing Lin Zi, "Everlasting Love," in *Watch Your Soul* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1997), 26; Xing Lin Zi, "Open the Eyes of the Heart," in *Thinking of You* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1993), 199.

<sup>81</sup>Xing Lin Zi, "Looking at Life from a Different Angle," in *The Song of Life* (Taipei: Eurasian Press, 1997), 89-90.

<sup>82</sup>Xing Lin Zi, "The Invisible Cherry Blossom," in *The Song of Life* (Taipei: Eurasian Press, 1997), 147-148.

<sup>83</sup>Xing Lin Zi, "The World of Love," in *Always Joyful* (Taipei: Chinese Sunday School Association, 1976), 2-6.

<sup>84</sup>Xing Lin Zi, "Knowing Life," in *Sing the Song of Life* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1995), 144; Xing Lin Zi, "The Smiling Life," in *The Song of Life* (Taipei: Eurasian Press, 1997), 213-214; Xing Lin Zi, "Bad Horse," in *Always Joyful* (Taipei: Chinese Sunday School Association, 1976), 30-36; Xing Lin Zi, "A Prayer in the Night," in *Always Joyful* (Taipei: Chinese Sunday School Association, 1976), 40-41.

<sup>85</sup>Pollard, 22.

<sup>86</sup>Xing Lin Zi, "Li Wu River Stones," in *The Song of Life* (Taipei: Eurasian Press, 1997), 128-129.

<sup>87</sup>Xing Lin Zi, "Grandfather Du's Poetry," in *Meet You at the Harbor of Life* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1999), 127-140.

<sup>88</sup>Xing Lin Zi, "The Bracelet of Mrs. Raccoon," in *Fables of Our Time* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1994), 81.

<sup>89</sup>Song, "Reconstruction," 41.

<sup>90</sup>Xing Lin Zi uses the word most often throughout the book *Fables of Our Time* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1994). However, Xing Lin Zi also uses the term in her sanwen, as in Xing Lin Zi, "Everything You See is Yours," in *The Song of Life* (Taipei: Eurasian Press, 1997), 124; Monica Lai and T.C. Lai record poems from early Chinese literature in which the term is used in *Rhapsodic Essays from the Chinese* (Hong Kong: Kelly & Walsch Ltd., 1979), 105, 112, 88-89; See also "Ballad of the Old Cypress," and "Gazing at Mount Tai," in "Du Fu Poetry," *China the Beautiful: Classical Chinese Art Calligraphy, Poetry, History, Literature, Painting, and Philosophy*, n.d., <<http://www.chinapage.com/poet-e/dufu2e.html> (7 August 2006).

<sup>91</sup>Xing Lin Zi, "Knowing Life," 146-147; Xing Lin Zi, "Unexpected Meeting," in *Thinking of You* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1993), 10-11.

<sup>92</sup>Xing Lin Zi, "Unforgettable True Love," in *True Love is a Lifelong Promise* (Taipei: Eurasian Press, 2000), 42.

<sup>93</sup>Xing Lin Zi, "The Miracle of Five Loaves and Two Fish," in *The Song of Life* (Taipei: Eurasian Press, 1997), 77.

<sup>94</sup>Xing Lin Zi, "Great Enlightenment Great Compassion" *Thinking of You* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1993), 87-88; Xing Lin Zi, "Filial Piety," 100.

<sup>95</sup>Xing Lin Zi, "Burdens," in *Sing the Song of Life* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1995), 153; Xing Lin Zi, "Love and Faith," in *Watch Your Soul* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1997), 58-59; Xing Lin Zi, "Facing Challenges Unperturbed," in *Watch Your Soul* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1997), 105; Xing Lin Zi, "Different Angle," 97; Xing Lin Zi, "The Weak Help Each Other," in *The Song of Life*, 台北: (Taipei: Eurasian Press, 1997), 111-112; Xing Lin Zi, "Defect is the Only Way to Bring Love Out," in *The Song of Life*, (Taipei: Eurasian Press, 1997), 228-229.

<sup>96</sup>Xing Lin Zi "Smiling Life," 213; Xing Lin Zi, "Bad Horse," 35; Xing Lin Zi, "Mrs. Lin," in *Apricot Forest Essays* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1979), 32-33; Xing Lin Zi, "Five Past Twelve," in *Apricot Forest Essays* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1979), 40-41; Xing Lin Zi, "The Doctor's Smile," in *Apricot Forest Essays* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1979), 44-45; Xing Lin Zi, "The Laboratory of Human Nature," in *Apricot Forest Essays* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1979), 50-51; Xing Lin Zi, "Live Well, Die Well," 42-43.

<sup>97</sup>Xing, Lin Zi, *The First Family in the North Pole* (Taipei: Crown, 1995); Xing, Lin Zi, *Apricot Forest Essays* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1979).

<sup>98</sup>Hsiao Ming, "The Sound of the Nightingale," in *Always Joyful* (Taipei: Chinese Sunday School Association, 1976), not numbered.

- <sup>99</sup> Ibid.; Liu Hsia, interview by author, tape recording, Taipei Taiwan, 9 August 2000.
- <sup>100</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Live Well, Die Well," 42-47.
- <sup>101</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Joy in the Traffic Jam," in *The Song of Life* (Taipei: Eurasian Press, 1997), 279-281; Xing Lin Zi, "The Seal's Worry," in *Fables of Our Time* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1994), 118; Xing Lin Zi, "Romeo and Juliet," in *Love Stories* (Taipei: Crown, 1998), 27-39; Xing Lin Zi, "Run Away," in *Watch Your Soul* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1997), 28-29; Xing Lin Zi, "Respect Elders," in *Watch Your Soul* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1997), 68-69; Xing Lin Zi, *Why I Didn't Kill Myself?* (Taipei: Chien-Hsing Publishing, 2000) is an entire volume devoted to suicide prevention; Xing Lin Zi, *When I was Young* (Taipei: Chien-Hsing Publishing, 1994) is a volume written at the request of the Taipei police to raise awareness of the plight of juvenile delinquents.
- <sup>102</sup> Song, *Womb*, 61.
- <sup>103</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Prayer in the Night," 38; Xing Lin Zi, "Cherish Life," in *Why I Didn't Kill Myself?* (Taipei: Chien-Hsing Publishing, 2000), 7-8; Xing Lin Zi, "Song of Life," 19-24; Xing Lin Zi, "Fortunately," in *Always Joyful* (Taipei: Chinese Sunday School Association, 1976), 14; Xing Lin Zi, "Sing the Song of Life," in *Reentering the Mundane World* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1985), 190.
- <sup>104</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "What Can We Do," in *Reentering the Mundane World* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1985), 69; Xing Lin Zi, "Murky World," in *Reentering the Mundane World* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1985), 162; Xing Lin Zi, "Human Effort can Achieve Everything," in *Psalm of Life* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1995), 62-63.
- <sup>105</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "The River Li after the Disaster," in *The Song of Life* (Taipei: Eurasian Press, 1997), 35-37.
- <sup>106</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "The View from the Little House," in *Always Joyful* (Taipei: Chinese Sunday School Association, 1976), 25-28.
- <sup>107</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "The World of Love," in *Sing the Song of Life* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1995), 10; Xing Lin Zi, "Contentment," in *Watch Your Soul* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1997), 76-77; Xing Lin Zi, "Walking with Grace and Ease," in *Thinking of You* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1993), 81.
- <sup>108</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Everything You See," 123-124.
- <sup>109</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Surviving the Catastrophe," in *The First Family in the North Pole* (Taipei: Crown, 1995), 105; Xing Lin Zi, "Breaking Through the Difficulties of Life," in *The Song of Life* (Taipei: Eurasian Press, 1997), 326-327; Xing Lin Zi, "Cherish Life," in *Why I Didn't Kill Myself?* (Taipei: Chien-Hsing Publishing, 2000), 7-8.
- <sup>110</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "The Parent's Heart," in *The First Family in the North Pole* (Taipei: Crown, 1995), 10.
- <sup>111</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "The Four Spiritual Moves," in *Victory Song Series* (Taipei: China Christian Mission, 1983), 161-162; David Van Biema, "When God Hides His Face," *Time Magazine*, 13 August 2001, 56-58; D. W. Amundson, "Suffering," in *New Dictionary of Theology*, ed. Sinclair B. Ferguson and David F. Wright (Leicester: Intervarsity Press, 1988), 667.
- <sup>112</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Knowing Life," 145.
- <sup>113</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Burdens," 152.
- <sup>114</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Road," in *Sing the Song of Life* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1995), 195.
- <sup>115</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Training and Discipline," in *Psalm of Life* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1995), 21; Xing Lin Zi, "Different Angle," 92.
- <sup>116</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "New Life," in *Sing the Song of Life* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1995), 167.
- <sup>117</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "River Stones," 129.
- <sup>118</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Enemy," 348.
- <sup>119</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Fortunately," 14.
- <sup>120</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Spiritual Moves," 162.
- <sup>121</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "River Li," 35-37.
- <sup>122</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Choice," in *Apricot Forest Essays* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1979), 77-78.
- <sup>123</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Able to Fly," in *Fables of Our Time* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1994), 26.
- <sup>124</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Eternal Eden," in *The Song of Life* (Taipei: Eurasian Press, 1997), 324.

- <sup>125</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "The Limit of Life," in *Psalm of Life* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1995), 51.
- <sup>126</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Spiritual Moves," 163.
- <sup>127</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Fortune Telling," in *Watch Your Soul* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1997), 196.
- <sup>128</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Fate – Fate," in *Psalm of Life* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1995), 160-161.
- <sup>129</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Distributing Pears and Sending Books," in *The Song of Life* (Taipei: Eurasian Press, 1997), 256-257; Xing Lin Zi, "The Unlucky Crow," in *Fables of Our Time* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1994), 28; Xing Lin Zi, "Fashion," in *Fables of Our Time* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1994), 17.
- <sup>130</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "'O' Blood-type Personality," in *Apricot Forest Essays* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1979), 38-39.
- <sup>131</sup> Xing Lin Zi illustrates her belief that God wants humans to actively overcome negative emotions in, Xing Lin Zi, "Is the Moon Full?," in *Fables of Our Time* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1994), 126.
- <sup>132</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Unexpected Meeting," 10-11, 25.
- <sup>133</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "The Long Night," in *Psalm of Life* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1995), 47; Xing Lin Zi, "I Want to Live," in *Always Joyful* (Taipei: Chinese Sunday School Association, 1976), 121; Xing Lin Zi, "Bad Horse," 36.
- <sup>134</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Want to Live," 122-123.
- <sup>135</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Great Enlightenment," 89; Wolf, 153; Stevan Harrell, *Ploughshare Village: Culture and Context in Taiwan* (Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1982), 205.
- <sup>136</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Neither Clear nor Rainy Days are Fun," in *Fables of Our Time* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1994), 102-103.
- <sup>137</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "No Complaining," in *Fables of Our Time* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1994), 30.
- <sup>138</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "The Weed That Will Not Surrender," in *Fables of Our Time* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1994), 44.
- <sup>139</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "The Weed's Life," in *Fables of Our Time* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1994), 45.
- <sup>140</sup> Xing Lin "Want to Live," 124.
- <sup>141</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Spiritual Moves," 171.
- <sup>142</sup> 2 Corinthians 12:7-10.
- <sup>143</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Spiritual Moves," 163.
- <sup>144</sup> *Ibid.*, 163.
- <sup>145</sup> *Ibid.*, 164-166.
- <sup>146</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "The Garden of Eden on Earth," in *Fables of Our Time* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1994), 147.
- <sup>147</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Directionless," in Xing Lin Zi, *Victory Song Series* (Taipei: China Christian Mission, 1983), 88-89.
- <sup>148</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Life and the World," in *Apricot Forest Essays* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1979), 102.
- <sup>149</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Human Effort," 62-63.
- <sup>150</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Hold Up the Light," in *Sing the Song of Life* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1995), 204.
- <sup>151</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Hero," *Sing the Song of Life* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1995), 205-206.
- <sup>152</sup> *Ibid.*, 206.
- <sup>153</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Eden," in *Watch Your Soul* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1997), 64.
- <sup>154</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Walking Willingly," 181.
- <sup>155</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "The Love that Never Gives Up," in *Watch Your Soul* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1997), 46-47.
- <sup>156</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "This Piece of Land," in *Watch Your Soul* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1997), 147; Xing Lin Zi, "Addendum," in *Meet You at the Harbor of Life* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1999), 207.

- <sup>157</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "It is Beautiful to Live Splendidly," in *Give Thanks to the Thorny Rose* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1989), 63.
- <sup>158</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Angel Without Legs," in *Meet You at the Harbor of Life*, (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1999), 177.
- <sup>159</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Equality," in *Watch Your Soul* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1997), 168.
- <sup>160</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Martial Artist Tsai Jr-Jong," in *Meet You at the Harbor of Life* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1999), 35-41.
- <sup>161</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "The Kangaroo and the Beggar," in *Fables of Our Time* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1994), 140-141.
- <sup>162</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Lead You, Be with You, Go Forward Together," in *True Love is a Lifelong Promise* (Taipei: Eurasian Press, 2000), 128.
- <sup>163</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Knocking at the Door," in *Watch Your Soul* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1997), 50-51.
- <sup>164</sup> Romans 12:15 NASB; Xing Lin Zi, "Defect," 230.
- <sup>165</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Defect," 227-231.
- <sup>166</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Strong Person," in *Always Joyful* (Taipei: Chinese Sunday School Association, 1976), 8-11.
- <sup>167</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Angel in Disguise," in *Watch Your Soul* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1997), 66; Xing Lin Zi, "General Wang Ru-Kai," in *Meet You at the Harbor of Life* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1999), 81-81.
- <sup>168</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "There is Still Blue Sky out the Window," in *The Song of Life*, (Taipei: Eurasian Press, 1997), 315-317.
- <sup>169</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Spiritual Moves," 166-171.
- <sup>170</sup> *Ibid.*, 168.
- <sup>171</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Christ's Messengers," *Sing the Song of Life* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1995), 117; Xing Lin Zi, "Lamp," 20; Xing Lin Zi, "The Melody of Life," in *The Song of Life* (Taipei: Eurasian Press, 1997), 395.
- <sup>172</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "The Treasure of Life," in *Watch Your Soul* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1997), 22-23.
- <sup>173</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Knowing Life," 145.
- <sup>174</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Tears and Laughter," in *Watch Your Soul* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1997), 92-92.
- <sup>175</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Looking Down on People," in *The Song of Life* (Taipei: Eurasian Press, 1997), 135-137.
- <sup>176</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "The Camel is Sick," in *Fables of Our Time* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1994), 148; Xing Lin Zi, "Don't Rub Salt in Someone's Wound," in *The Song of Life* (Taipei: Eurasian Press, 1997), 207; Xing Lin Zi, "The History of the Changing World," in *Thinking of You* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1993), 90-98.
- <sup>177</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Everlasting," 27.
- <sup>178</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "The Stream and the Hidden Stones," in *Fables of Our Time* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1994), 158.
- <sup>179</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Weak Help," 111.
- <sup>180</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Reading the List of Donors," in *True Love is a Lifelong Promise* (Taipei: Eurasian Press, 2000), 68; Xing Lin Zi, "Beautiful to Live," 63; Xing Lin Zi, "The Long Road," in *Sing the Song of Life* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1995), 15.
- <sup>181</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Spiritual Moves," 170.
- <sup>182</sup> Harold A. Netland, "The Problem of Evil in Mission," in *The Evangelical Dictionary of World Mission*, ed. A. Scott Moreau (Grand Rapids: Baker Books, 2000), 789.
- <sup>183</sup> Song, *Power*, 72-73.
- <sup>184</sup> The Shu Ching, or Book of History, is the oldest of the five classics of Chinese antiquity. The majority of material contained therein is pre 4<sup>th</sup> century BC. It is a foundational book for subsequent Chinese philosophy and would have been known to Confucius. *The New Encyclopaedia Britannica*, 1991

ed., s.v. "Shu Ching;" Clae Waltham, *Shu Ching, Book of History: A Modernized Edition of the Translations of James Legge* (London: George Allen & Unwin, 1972), x; "Chinese Cultural Studies: The Mandate of Heaven, Selections from the *Shu Jing*," Brooklyn College of the City University of New York, n.d., <<http://acc6.its.brooklyn.cuny.edu/~phalsall/texts/shu-jing.html>> (5 September 2001).

<sup>185</sup> H. H. Rowley, *Submission in Suffering and other Essays on Eastern Thought* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 1951), 4-5.

<sup>186</sup> Translated the "Classic of the Way of Power." Scholarly opinions place the composition of the book between the 8<sup>th</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> centuries BC. "Tao-te Ching," *Encyclopaedia Britannica* <<http://www.britannica.com/eb/article?eu=73071&tocid=0&query=tao%20te%20ching>> (5 September 2001).

<sup>187</sup> Rowley, 40-45.

<sup>188</sup> Julia Ching, *Confucianism and Christianity: A Comparative Study* (Tokyo: Kodansha International, 1977), 10, 77-78; Karl Ludvig Reichelt, *Religion in Chinese Garment*, trans. by Joseph Tetlie (London: Lutterworth Press, 1951), 44.

<sup>189</sup> Ching, *Confucianism and Christianity*, 10.

<sup>190</sup> Ching, *Confucianism and Christianity*, 9, 84; Reichelt, 44.

<sup>191</sup> Reichelt, 47-48.

<sup>192</sup> Evelyn S. Rawski, "A Historians Approach to Death Ritual," in *Death Ritual in Late Imperial and Modern China*, ed. James Watson and Evelyn S. Rawski (Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1988), 23; Emily M. Ahern, *The Cult of the Dead in a Chinese Village* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1973), 91; James L. Watson, "The Structure of Chinese Funerary Rites: Elementary Forms, Ritual Sequence, and the Primacy of Performance," in *Death Ritual in Late Imperial and Modern China*, ed. James Watson and Evelyn S. Rawski (Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1988), 9; Stuart E. Thompson, "Death, Food, and Fertility," in *Death Ritual in Late Imperial and Modern China*, ed. James L. Watson and Evelyn S. Rawski (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1988), 73; Jordan, 92.

<sup>193</sup> Rowley, 93; Confucius (孔子), *Analects 6.20*, trans. Leonard A. Lyall, *The Sayings of Confucius* (London: Longmans, Green & Company, 1935). 25.

<sup>194</sup> Rowley, 36-37.

<sup>195</sup> Rowley, 35; Confucius, *Analects 15:1*, trans. Arthur Waley, *The Analects of Confucius* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd., 1949), 192.

<sup>196</sup> Rowley, 38; Chuang-tzu (莊子), *The Writings of Kwang-zze: XVII, ii. 9*, trans. James Legge, *Sacred Books of the East*, Vol. 39 (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1891), 386.

<sup>197</sup> Chung-ying Chen, "Mencius (Mengzi, Mengtzu)," in *The Encyclopedia of Chinese Philosophy*, Antonio S. Cua (London: Routledge, 2003), 440; "Confucianism," in *The Encyclopedia of Eastern Philosophy and Religion*, ed. Stephen Schumacher and Gert Woermer (Boston: Shambhala, 1989), 79.

<sup>198</sup> Mencius (孟子). *Book Six*, trans. Lionel Giles, *The Book of Mencius* (London: John Murray, 1942), 106.

<sup>199</sup> Ching, *Confucianism and Christianity*, 80.

<sup>200</sup> *Ibid.*, 10, 73-75, 77-78, 88, 103.

<sup>201</sup> *Ibid.*, 79; "Sages," in *Oxford Dictionary of World Religions*, ed. John Bowker (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997), 836.

<sup>202</sup> Ching, *Confucianism and Christianity*, 10.

<sup>203</sup> *Ibid.*, 88.

<sup>204</sup> *Ibid.*, 79-81.

<sup>205</sup> Wing-tsit Chan, "Confucian Thought," in *The Encyclopedia of Religion*, ed. Mircea Eliade (New York: MacMillan Publishing Company, 1987), 107.

<sup>206</sup> "Confucius," in *The Oxford Dictionary of World Religions*, ed. John Bowker (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997), 233.

<sup>207</sup> Ching, *Confucianism and Christianity*, 94.

<sup>208</sup> *Ibid.*, 88.

<sup>209</sup> *Ibid.*, 77.

- <sup>210</sup> Ibid., 80.
- <sup>211</sup> Ibid., 80.
- <sup>212</sup> Ching, "Confucianism: Ethical Humanism and Religion," in *Christianity and Chinese Religions* Hans Kung and Julia Ching (London:Doubleday, 1988), 90.
- <sup>213</sup> Ching, *Confucianism and Christianity*, 87.
- <sup>214</sup> Ibid., 87-88.
- <sup>215</sup> Ibid., 10.
- <sup>216</sup> Confucius, *Analects 17:25*, ed. John B. Khu and others, *The Confucian Bible*. (Philippines: Granhill Corporation, 1991), 290.
- <sup>217</sup> James Legge, *Christianity and Confucianism Compared for their Teaching on the Whole Duty of Man* (London: Religious Tract Society, n.d.), 29; Hans Kung, "Confucianism: Ethical Humanism and Religion," in *Christianity and Chinese Religions* Hans Kung and Julia Ching (London:Doubleday, 1988), 121.
- <sup>218</sup> Ching, "Confucianism: Ethical Humanism and Religion," 90.
- <sup>219</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Spiritual Moves," 163.
- <sup>220</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Live Well, Die Well," 44.
- <sup>221</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Spiritual Moves," 162.
- <sup>222</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Give Thanks to the Thorny Rose," in *Give Thanks to the Thorny Rose* (Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing, 1989), 69-70.
- <sup>223</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Walking Willingly," 186.
- <sup>224</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Live Well, Die Well," 46.
- <sup>225</sup> Song, *Womb*, 61.
- <sup>226</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Want to Live," 124.
- <sup>227</sup> "Top Taiwanese Author Liu Hsia Dies at 61 after Alleged Assault by Maid," *Yehey! Corporation*, 8 February 2003 <<http://www.yehey.com/lifestyle/jpeople.aspx?artid=836>> (11 April 2005).
- <sup>228</sup> China Post, "President Appoints New Team of Advisors," *Taiwan Government Information Office*, 21 May 2001 <[http://th.gio.gov.tw/show.cfm?news\\_id=8756](http://th.gio.gov.tw/show.cfm?news_id=8756)> (11 April 2005).
- <sup>229</sup> Melody Chen, "President Promises Disabled Pension Help at Activist's Memorial Service," *Taipei Times*, 23 February 2003, <<http://www.taipetimes.com/News/Taiwan/archives/2003/02/23/195596>> (11 April 2005).
- <sup>230</sup> Ibid.; "Top Taiwanese Author Liu Hsia Dies at 61 after Alleged Assault by Maid," *Yehey! Corporation*, 8 February 2003 <<http://www.yehey.com/lifestyle/jpeople.aspx?artid=836>> (11 April 2005).
- <sup>231</sup> Liu Kan, interview, 27 July 2000.

## CHAPTER SIX

- <sup>1</sup> Walls, *Missionary Movement*, 46.
- <sup>2</sup> Chow Lien-hwa, interview, 12 August 2002; Kuo Ming-chang, interview, 10 April 2002.
- <sup>3</sup> Jonathan Chao, 28 April 2002, personal email; C. M. Kao, interview, 19 June 2002; James Shia, interview, 27 July 2002.
- <sup>4</sup> Jonathan Chao, "Response," 154-155.
- <sup>5</sup> See pp. 114-116 above.
- <sup>6</sup> See p. 72 above.
- <sup>7</sup> Peter Chi Ping Lin, interview, 6 May 2002.
- <sup>8</sup> Jonathan Chao, "Response," 154.
- <sup>9</sup> W. Huitt, "Maslow's Hierarchy of Needs," Valdosta State University, 2004, <<http://www.valdosta.edu?whuitt/col/regsys/maslow.html>> (26 October 2005).
- <sup>10</sup> See p. 32 above; Cohen, 102; Rubinstein, "Taiwan Miracle," 3; Rubinstein, *Protestant Community*, 34; Cheng Yang-en, "Building a Harmonious Society in Taiwan – An Analysis from the Ideological Perspective," in *Taiwan Journal of Theology*, 18 (1996): 125-128; Robert L. Cheng, "Language Unification in Taiwan: Present and Future," in *The Other Taiwan: 1945 to the Present*, ed. by Murray A. Rubinstein (London: M.E. Sharpe, 1994), 361, 367-368.
- <sup>11</sup> Chow Lien-hwa, interview, 12 August 2002.
- <sup>12</sup> See p. 45 above.
- <sup>13</sup> Madame Chiang Kai-shek, "Easter Meditation," in *Selected Speeches: 1958-1959* (Taipei: The Office of the President, 1959), 13.
- <sup>14</sup> Clara J. Jones, *Christ Calls the Chinese* (Taipei: Dixon Press, n.d.), 17; Raber, Protestantism, 175; Robert C. P. Lee, interview, 29 April 2002.
- <sup>15</sup> See p. 73 above.
- <sup>16</sup> See pp. 55, 76 above; C. M. Kao, interview, 19 June 2002.
- <sup>17</sup> See pp. 44, 90 above.
- <sup>18</sup> William Lo, interview, 23 July 2002; C. S. Yang, interview, 10 June 2002.
- <sup>19</sup> Coe, *Recollections*, 234.
- <sup>20</sup> Ibid., 233; "The Presbyterian Church's Vision for a New Century," *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 10, no 2-3 (Fall/Winter 2000, 2001): 21; Chen Nan-jou, "Challenges," 154-155, 158.
- <sup>21</sup> Chris Su, interview, 10 April 2002.
- <sup>22</sup> Peter Chen-Main Wang, 333.
- <sup>23</sup> Ibid., 334; Lin Chung hsiung, interview, 25 August 2002.
- <sup>24</sup> See p. 98 above.
- <sup>25</sup> Huang Po-Ho, "Presbyterian Perspective," 36-37.
- <sup>26</sup> See pp. 111-112 above.
- <sup>27</sup> Chen, Nan-jou, "Challenges," 163-164.
- <sup>28</sup> Peter Chi Ping Lin, interview, 6 May 2002; Daniel K. S. Tsai, interview, 29 May 2002.
- <sup>29</sup> See pp. 61, 73, 80-81, 94, 116 above.
- <sup>30</sup> See pp. 72-73 above.
- <sup>31</sup> See pp. 15, 30 above.
- <sup>32</sup> See pp. 25-30 above.
- <sup>33</sup> See pp. 48-49, 56-57 above.
- <sup>34</sup> See pp. 53, 71-73 above.
- <sup>35</sup> See p. 52 above.
- <sup>36</sup> See p. 54-55, 60-61 above.
- <sup>37</sup> Bevans, 37.
- <sup>38</sup> Ibid., 56.
- <sup>39</sup> Ibid., 37-42.
- <sup>40</sup> Ibid., 88.

- <sup>41</sup> Ibid., 54-59.
- <sup>42</sup> See pp. 83-84, 107 above.
- <sup>43</sup> Bevans, 70-76.
- <sup>44</sup> See pp. 83, 102 above.
- <sup>45</sup> Bevans, 88-93
- <sup>46</sup> Ibid., 56-57.
- <sup>47</sup> Ibid., 93-94; Paul Chu Ching Su, "Interaction," 353.
- <sup>48</sup> Bevans, 21-22.
- <sup>49</sup> William J. K. Lo, interview, 23 July 2002; C. S. Yang, interview, 10 June 2002; "Our Appeal," 14-15; Cheng Yang-en, "Historical Review," 132; Dan Beeby, in Hwa Yung, *Mangoes or Bananas: The Quest for an Authentic Asian Christian Theology* (Oxford: Regnum, 1997), 176.
- <sup>50</sup> Bevans, 47, 57.
- <sup>51</sup> Ibid. 56, 57, 59, 60; See pp. 102-104 above.
- <sup>52</sup> Bevans, 55; See pp. 108-110 above.
- <sup>53</sup> See pp. 21-27 above; Chen Nan-jou, interview, 9 August 2002.
- <sup>54</sup> Samuel H. H. Chiow, interview, 6 August 2002.
- <sup>55</sup> See pp. 26-27 above; Jonathan Chao, 28 April 2002, personal email.
- <sup>56</sup> See p. 115 above.
- <sup>57</sup> Bevans, 93-95; Huang Po-Ho, "Searching," 58-59.
- <sup>58</sup> Daniel Cheng, interview, 2 August, 2002.
- <sup>59</sup> William J. K. Lo, interview, 23 July 2002.
- <sup>60</sup> Daniel K. S. Tsai, interview, 29 May 2002; Cheng Yang-en, interview, 20 August, 2002.
- <sup>61</sup> Paul Chu Ching Su, "Interaction," 352-353.
- <sup>62</sup> "The Presbyterian Church's Vision," 21; Huang Po-Ho, "Presbyterian Perspective," 35-36.
- <sup>63</sup> Daniel K. S. Tsai, interview, 29 May 2002; Tsai Kuo-shan, "Evangelization," 44, 320.
- <sup>64</sup> James Shia, interview, 21 October 2001; James Shia, interview, 27 July 2002.
- <sup>65</sup> C. M. Kao, "Forward Look," 50.
- <sup>66</sup> See pp. 158, 160-161 above.
- <sup>67</sup> Cheng Yang-en, interview, 20 August 2002.
- <sup>68</sup> Kho and Alexander, "Thirty Years."; Thelin, "Propagation," 177-178; Mark C. Thelin, "The Church on Taiwan: Challenge of the 1990's," in *Tainan Theological Review* 2, no 1 (December 1994): 181.
- <sup>69</sup> E. L. Senner and C. M. Kao, *Growth and Non Growth*, (Taipei: Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, 1986), 15.
- <sup>70</sup> See p. 58 above.
- <sup>71</sup> See p. 76 above.
- <sup>72</sup> Hwang, "Joint Action," 65.
- <sup>73</sup> Ibid., 64-68; See p. 79 above.
- <sup>74</sup> See p. 114 above.
- <sup>75</sup> Cheng Yang-en, interview, 20 August, 2002.
- <sup>76</sup> Hsu Ming-Hsiung, 133.
- <sup>77</sup> Ibid., 133-135.
- <sup>78</sup> James Shia, interview, 27 July 2002.
- <sup>79</sup> See pp. 160-161 above; Daniel K. S. Tsai, interview, 29 May 2002.
- <sup>80</sup> See p. 131 above.
- <sup>81</sup> See pp. 57, 81-82, 83, 85, 98-99, 101, 102, 106-108 above.
- <sup>82</sup> See p. 124 above.
- <sup>83</sup> See pp. 127, 131 above.
- <sup>84</sup> See pp. 165-170 above.
- <sup>85</sup> Bevans, 105.
- <sup>86</sup> Ibid., 103.
- <sup>87</sup> Ibid., 104-108.

- <sup>88</sup> Ibid., 104.
- <sup>89</sup> Ibid.
- <sup>90</sup> See pp. 157, 169 above.
- <sup>91</sup> See pp. 170-171 above.
- <sup>92</sup> See pp. 171-176 above.
- <sup>93</sup> See pp. 176-180 above.
- <sup>94</sup> See pp. 166-167 above.
- <sup>95</sup> See p. 140 above.
- <sup>96</sup> Rubinstein, *Protestant Community*, 112-114; Barnard, "Fifty Years," 36; Franklin, 18, 22.
- <sup>97</sup> See p. 158 above; Thelin, "Propagation," 177; Sawatzky, "Outline," 23.
- <sup>98</sup> Allen J. Swanson, *The Church*, 27; Kho and Alexander, "Thirty Years."
- <sup>99</sup> Encore Pai, interview, 5 December 2001; Chang Lai-hao, interview, 29 November 2001.
- <sup>100</sup> See pp. 123-131 above.
- <sup>101</sup> See pp. 161-162 above.
- <sup>102</sup> Chang Lai-hao, interview, 8 September 2000.
- <sup>103</sup> See p. 128 above.
- <sup>104</sup> See pp. 121-122, 138 above.
- <sup>105</sup> See p. 145 above.
- <sup>106</sup> See p. 135 above.
- <sup>107</sup> See p. 135 above.
- <sup>108</sup> See p. 132 above.
- <sup>109</sup> See pp. 15, 23, 28 above; Hughley, 2.
- <sup>110</sup> Song, "Witnessing, 5, 15.
- <sup>111</sup> See pp. 58-59 above.
- <sup>112</sup> "Shuangfu Development and Pastoral Group," (Taipei: Eden Social Welfare Foundation, n.d., photocopied); See p. 139 above.
- <sup>113</sup> See pp. 77-82 above.
- <sup>114</sup> See p. 71 above.
- <sup>115</sup> See p. 116 above.

## CONCLUSION

<sup>1</sup> Coe, *Recollections*, 121.

<sup>2</sup> See p. 17 above; Walker, 53-56.

<sup>3</sup> See p. 15 above.

<sup>4</sup> Walker, 55.

<sup>5</sup> Thomas H. Groome, *Sharing Faith: A Comprehensive Approach to Religious Education and Pastoral Ministry* (San Francisco: HarperCollins Publishers, 1991), 8, 80-81.

<sup>6</sup> *Ibid.*, 80.

<sup>7</sup> *Ibid.*, 143.

<sup>8</sup> *Ibid.*, 145.

<sup>9</sup> *Ibid.*, 7-8, 136, 142-144; Paulo Freire, *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*, trans. Myra Bergman Ramos (Middlesex: Penguin Books, 1972), 46, 66; See p. 77 above.

<sup>10</sup> See pp. 123-124, 133 above.

<sup>11</sup> See p. 117 above.

<sup>12</sup> Stephen Chen, interview, 26 April 2002.

<sup>13</sup> Liu Hsia, "Ten Years," 3; See p. 129 above.

<sup>14</sup> Tim Shao, interview, 8 January 2002.

<sup>15</sup> Buttrey, "Year 2000," 12.

<sup>16</sup> Stephen Chen, interview, 26 April 2002; Swanson, *The Church*, 81-82; C. S. Yang, interview, 10 June 2002.

<sup>17</sup> Swanson, *The Church*, 92.

<sup>18</sup> Swanson, *The Church*, 80, 90-93; Hwang, *Joint Action*, 65-67.

<sup>19</sup> Chris Su, interview, 10 April 2002.

<sup>20</sup> See p. 29 above.

<sup>21</sup> Hsu Ming-hsiung, 37, 78-88, 92, 139, 176; "Annual Report for the Year 2000," *Presbyterian Church in Taiwan*, n.d., <<http://www.pct.org.tw/english/ann2000.htm>> (6 June 2005); C. M. Kao, "Forward Look," 50; Cheng Yang-en, interview, 20 August 2002; C. S. Yang, interview, 10 June 2002.

<sup>22</sup> Hsu Ming-hsiung, 133-135.

<sup>23</sup> C. S. Yang, interview, 10 June 2002.

<sup>24</sup> Anthony H. Su, interview by author, Taipei Taiwan, 15 January 2002.

<sup>25</sup> "Confession," 19; Chow Lien-hwa, interview, 12 August 2002.

<sup>26</sup> Russell, 455.

<sup>27</sup> See pp. 51-52, 83, 160-161 above; Barnard, *Fifty Years*, 36.

<sup>1</sup> Wheeler, 77.

## Appendix

### Translations of Four *Sanwen* by Xing Lin Zi

To date only one English translation of a *sanwen* by Xing Lin Zi has been published. The author here reproduces this, and offers three additional translations. Translators have added all footnotes to the text in order to aid the foreign reader.

In each of the following essays Liu considers how individuals can find emotional well-being. The first composition to be included is Caroline Mason's translation of *Live Well, Die Well*. This piece illustrates how Liu draws from experiences in her community to reflect on how to find peace in a world where much is beyond the control of the individual.

The second *sanwen*, entitled *Remodeling Hell*, shows how Liu typically focus' on one clear problem and proposes a solution to the same. In this case Liu argues against tolerating negative feelings by arguing individuals have power over their emotions.

*The World of Love*, published by a Christian publishing house, demonstrates Liu's self-effacing attitude and her essential optimism. That Liu's optimism is rooted in a positive fatalism, a belief that the world is under the control of a good God, implied here, becomes clearer in the final *sanwen* included in the appendix.

*Passing Through the Valley of Weeping* reveals that Liu is aware of the severity of the suffering her readers can experience yet encourages a passive (not pessimistic) acceptance of the will of God that is based in a belief that suffering is not without purpose.



Author congratulating Liu Hsia on the occasion of her 60<sup>th</sup> birthday.

## Live Well, Die Well<sup>1</sup>

San Mao said she liked my piece “The Universe and Time”, and the New Year couplets I composed for myself:

*The Universe stretches on without limit*

*Don't fret that time is infinite*

I told her that there was actually a horizontal scroll as well, but that I'd been afraid it might offend people at New Year, so I hadn't written it out. It consisted of only these words:

*Live well, die well*

Having been ill for most of my life, and in hospital many times, I'm constantly seeing people being born, people dying, and people struggling as they hover between life and death.

The first time I saw someone die, I wept. I wept for the girl who died, for her youth, and for all the human affection she was so loath to part with.

Only over time, as I saw more, did I realize that the people I ought to shed tears for are the living. For it is they who still have to struggle to stay afloat in the sea of humanity, till their faces are bathed in sweat.

They still have to endure the inevitable progression of birth, old age, sickness and death, and the intertwining of love and hate, gratitude and resentment. Truly, living takes even more courage than dying!

The first time I was in hospital, I was next door to the maternity ward, and when I had nothing else to do I used to peer through the big glass window of the nursery and look at the little people in all those wooden cots, lined up next to one another like so many cabbage rolls. At times you would almost think they were products turned out by some factory, they were so uniform, so methodically arranged.

What is life, after all? How come you can't see it or touch it, but it can still all too clearly make you laugh and make you cry, make you love and make you hate?

The few dozen babies were a few dozen question marks.

---

<sup>1</sup> Xing, Lin Zi, “Live Well, Die Well.” Translated by Caroline Mason. *Renditions*, Spring & Autumn 1991.

Who were they? Where did they come from?

Were they just formed by two cells coming together and then constantly dividing and developing?

Before they were given a name, and identity and any privileges, would they know who they were?

What kind of faces would their uniformly bright red little features grow into?

Were those tiny heads intelligent or stupid? Would their tiny hearts be big enough to hold the whole world, or so small and cramped that there wouldn't be room even for themselves?

What sort of path would each of them take? Would it be smooth or rough? Would it be lucky or unlucky? Would they be aristocrats or paupers?

And what do we mean by "smooth" and "rough"? Where is the dividing line between "lucky" and "unlucky"? And what is the difference between being an aristocrat and being a pauper?

How much of all this comes from the will of Heaven, and how much from the will of Man?

If I had never had that serious illness in the first place, what would I have been like today?

Would I have been a highly-trained scholar, returned from overseas, or a contented little housewife, or in one of a hundred different jobs?

How many different solutions can be worked out to the equation of human life, after all? It's like holding a kaleidoscope in your hand – you only have to move it very slightly, and it takes on a completely different appearance. The question is, who is it that triggers the movement?

When I was little, my father always used to say to me, "Don't worry, sweetie, Daddy will take care of you all your life, and when you grow up, he'll find you a husband!"

I knew very well that my father loved me dearly and was trying to comfort me, but even so I could not help hating this. Who wants to be taken care of by her father all her life, and to have some ghastly husband found for her?

Had my father made up his mind that I would be a useless cripple all my life? He probably had no idea how easily a remark like that could hurt a child who was so terribly eager to do well!

The only answer I could give was silence.

Now, however, looking back, I have to be grateful to my father for this unintended stimulus, for it was only because of what he said that I resolved to make my own way in life.

It is very easy for a child such as I was to become unbalanced and embittered and to write herself off.

Sometimes I wonder what things would be like now if I hadn't ever been spurred into action like that. Would I be a barely literate middle-aged matron?

When we who work at the Eden Foundation visit the families of the disabled we find that there are far, far too many severely disabled people who have never once stepped outside the gates of their own homes, but have stayed huddled all their lives in small, dark rooms. They have no past, and no future.

Between their births and their deaths there is nothing but blankness, and more blankness.

When I start thinking about this, I can't help feeling very scared, and a cold sweat breaks out on my forehead.

What have *I* proved? I'm no stronger than other people, and no taller than they are, but I have proved that if you are really willing to live life to the full, you can.

I have proved it to myself, my father, to society, and to all those millions of disabled children who don't know why they are alive, or what to do with their lives.

And I finally understand why it says in the Bible that God's great might will be made manifest in the weakness of men.

Because God makes us see that even a person who is afflicted by every kind of suffering, with a sick and broken body, can still enjoy what is finest in life.

No more struggling, no more tears – just the steady, wide sweep of the Yangtze and the Yellow River, which can contain even strong winds and great waves.

In late spring, several friends and I were holed up in Xiaofeng's<sup>2</sup> den, chatting, and somehow the conversation turned to "enjoying oneself". Everyone was talking at once about how to enjoy oneself, and who know how to, and who didn't.

I was so intimidated that I kept my mouth shut. All the things they called "enjoying oneself" would never have anything to do with me.

---

<sup>2</sup> Zhang Xiaofeng 張曉風, a well-known woman essayist.

I've never been to Nepal or crossed the Sahara, I don't listen to music or look at paintings; I know nothing about food and I'm not fussy about clothes. I don't fall in love, or like to have casual liaisons with men – how strange then that even someone like me can still get so much enjoyment out of life.

My friends don't realize that life itself is a pleasure, and something to enjoy. I'm actually quite an expert at enjoying myself.

It's just like Xiaofeng's house, which is full of rather peculiar things like withered roses, a feeding trough for pigs, and bits of rotting wood full of holes bored by sea creatures: other people look on them as rubbish, but to her they are all precious.

Life is like that, too.

It does not matter what other people think or how they see things – what you should care about is what you yourself love and value.

It is said that 'for those who survive catastrophe, there will be blessings later on'. And the "blessings" may well take the form of insights into life and death.

Mother often used to watch me smiling unconsciously as I went about my business. She couldn't help being puzzled:

"What are you smiling at?"

"Nothing."

"If you're not smiling at anything, why are you smiling?"

"I'm smiling *because* there isn't any reason for smiling."

This exchange had more than a touch of Zen about it.

What a young life craves is tragic heroes. People who live spectacularly and die spectacularly – how moving and tragic they are, their light illuminating the world!

It was only as I grew older that I realized it is easy to be the famous heroic general. What is not easy is to be just one dry bone among the many.

What the world will always see is Jesus dying on the cross, His sacrifice made out of universal love, and our redemption through His precious blood. How many people remember the man who carried His cross for Him on that agonizing road to Golgotha?

And do you think this was the only man to sink without trace in history?

Since starting up the Eden Foundation, I've come across many friends, some known personally and others not, and I always seem to end up hearing them say things like "You're truly great."

And I invariably think of Jesus' precious disciples, arguing among themselves as to who was the greatest. And what did Jesus have to say?

"Whosoever would be great among you shall be servant of all. And whosoever of you will be the chiefest shall be your slave. For even the Son of Man came not to be ministered unto, but to minister, and to give His life as a ransom for many."

There are no great people in this world, only great works. We should devote ourselves to a great task and live out God's goodness, so that others may see in us the image of God.

But if these efforts are made only for the sake of earning a heavenly crown, and grabbing a good seat next to God's throne, then that is just another form of utilitarianism, isn't it?

We do these things only in order to carry out our duty as best we can, and for no other reason.

A life unperturbed, a death unafraid. No striving to pursue anything, no striving to create anything – life's joy is its natural simplicity, unadorned.

Once my little nephew was chewing gum and fidgeting around in front of me like a monkey. I warned him, "Mind you don't swallow your chewing-gum!"

He was at the stage where he was always contradicting people, and he immediately retorted, "What'll happen if I do?"

It'll stick all your intestines together!"

"And what if it sticks them all together?"

"If they're all stuck together you won't be able to do poohs."

"And what'll happen if I can't do poohs?"

"Why", I said, trying to scare him, "You'll end up stone dead".

He thought for a moment. "When people are stone dead do they get buried in the ground?"

I wondered where he could have heard that. "Yes! Would you like that?"

He stuck out his tongue and made a face, as if that was something he'd rather not experience. "Hmm ... All dark, that's scary."

"Teasing him, I said, "What's scary about it? Look at the little flowers – they're buried in the ground, aren't they? And one day, when you've been buried in the ground, you'll be able to grow a beautiful flower too! Yes, and we'll call it the Hanwei flower ..."

He began gurgling with laughter.

“Granny will water you every morning, and you’ll smile and say to her, ‘Good morning, could I have just a bit more water to drink, please ...?’”

“Then Granny will be really scared,” he said, starting to use his imagination too, “Eek! How come this flower can smile and ask me for water to drink?” and then ... and then ...”

He was laughing so much he could hardly breathe.

I prompted him with a kick: “And then, what?”

“Then ... then ... then Granny will drop her watering-can and she’ll run away ...”

His imitation of this sounded so life-like that I couldn’t stop laughing.

However Granny, nearby, frowned when she heard this. “Going crazy over nothing, haven’t you got anything better to talk about?”

Aunt and nephew made funny faces at each other, enjoying it all hugely.

Where there is life, there is death, and where there is death, there is life. That is a fundamental law of the world, and there’s no point in getting into a panic about it. There are just too many misgivings and restrictions in the adult world – it’s much better to see things naturally and joyfully, in the way a four-year old child does.

So I wrote this prayer:

### **One day**

When I depart

Let me be transformed into fragrance in the mud

Waiting for the next spring

When I shall be the first daisy to emerge from the earth

Or into a breeze blowing over the corn in May

In the green wheat fields

Bringing you the sweet smell of the ripening grain

When I depart

Please don’t set up a headstone for me

If possible

I’d rather be set up in your hearts

That’s better than being engulfed by weeds

One day  
When I depart  
Please don't surround me with funeral scrolls  
Please don't pile fresh flowers on top of me  
Please don't mourn me with words of praise  
Please don't bury me with tears and wailing  
I shall already have gone to a mystic meeting  
Oh  
How I wish you every happiness  
Like my own

I've reached the end of my road  
And my strength is already exhausted  
If I have left nothing behind  
Let me go quietly  
Back to the place I came from

## Remodeling Hell<sup>1</sup>

My mother is composed and rational. She is rather strict and has a strong sense of propriety. Unfortunately it happened that she gave birth to an insane dingbat of a daughter, and that is me!

In the years since my brothers and sisters left home my mother and I have resided together. She is now quite used to my zany banter and quirky ways; indeed she has begun to see this as normal.

Of course a zest of playfulness between an old spoiled pet-daughter and her elderly mother marks our relationship. In public I'm the Xing Lin Zi that everyone knows; every gesture and word conforms to social expectations and demands. But in front of my mother I'm just a common and ordinary daughter.

I'm always talking brazen nonsense with my mother. One time I said, "If I die one day I'll certainly want God to dispatch angels to receive me. Only then will I willingly consent to go. Otherwise I'll gripe all the way there."

My mother looked hard at me and coldly replied, "Do you think it is certain that you will go to heaven?"

"If I can't go up, then forget it. I will go to hell and lead a revolt." I postulated, letting my fantasy go wild.

"Even better, I'll be the female Chung Kuei (鍾馗).<sup>2</sup> I'll certainly catch so many ghosts that when they see me they will all scatter in panic!"

As I talked I felt increasingly elated. I couldn't contain exuberant laughter.

Mother grunted and poured cold water on me by saying, "You are so ferocious. I think the King of Hell (閻王) should concede to your rule!"

I felt even more euphoric and shamelessly boasted, "That's even better. I will remodel hell and turn it into heaven!"

---

<sup>1</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Remodeling Hell" (改造地獄). *The Song of Life* (生命之歌). Taipei: Eurasian Press (台北: 圓神), 1997; Translated by Maurie and Lan-shiang Sween.

<sup>2</sup> A figure in Chinese mythology who is seen as a guardian spirit, particularly revered for vanquishing evil spirits; "Zhong Kui," *Wikipedia*, 26 May 2006, <[http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Zhong\\_Kui](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Zhong_Kui)> (5 August 2006).

Maybe some people would feel that I was being absurd, daydreaming about reconstructing hell. In truth, however, if you think about it, this can be an attitude toward life.

Do not think that hell is where people go after they die. A lot of people live in hell while they are alive. Their hearts are engulfed by pain, despair, rage, hate, maliciousness, greed, and discontent. Everyday it's as if they are being tortured in hell and there is no escape.

Their lives are torn apart. Day after day their tormented hearts drip blood; life becomes a heavy burden, dreary labor, out-and-out darkness; it feels like it would be better to die than to live. Even though there is still breathing their hearts are dead.

When we find ourselves sinking into a deep valley of despair we need to wake up before it is too late. We must understand this as a spiritual war. At that moment we need to have courage, to be decisive. We need to chase out all the big and small ghosts from our hearts, and not let ourselves be afflicted or infected by their poison. Then we can receive peace, joy, tenderness, kindness, grace, mercy ... these angels into our hearts, and can transform the hell that is there into heaven.

When the Pharisees asked Jesus "When will the kingdom of heaven come?" Jesus answered in a straightforward manner, "The kingdom of heaven is within you."

Heaven and hell are divided by but a thin line. Only our state of mind separates whether we inhabit heaven or hell.

Let's aspire to be our own Chung Kuei, to continually search our hearts and refuse to allow Satan any opportunity to achieve his purpose, so that our life may be filled with a sunny peace, that everyday be a good day and every year a good year.

## The World of Love<sup>1</sup>

Sunday morning. Mother, brothers, and sisters had already changed clothes and were ready to go to church. The doorbell rang. More than ten children surged into the house with a gust of noise.

“Teacher Liu, Good morning.”

“Teacher, we have come to see you. Are you better?”

“We have learned another song. Would you like us to sing it for you?”

“Lets play a game, Teacher!”

They were like a group of happy small sparrows on a summer morning surrounding me with a continuous noisy chirping. It was as if they brought the sun and wind inside. The atmosphere in the house suddenly became light and joyous.

They were all Sunday School students from the neighborhood church. A year earlier I had taught them. I couldn't go after my leg illness recurred. But they never forgot to make occasional visits. We sang together, played games, and let the laughter overflow from this house, as well as my heart, like soap bubbles overflowing from a basin. They came with no other motive but to visit me, just to share their happiness with me. Their love always generates enduring warmth in my heart that makes me feel I am rich beyond comparison.

I am truly lucky! Even though I have experienced disaster and disease, pain and misfortune, misery and tears, God gives me love. My parents love me, my brothers and sisters love me, my friends love me, and now even these lovely children are not sparing their little loving hearts. Because of love, pain becomes easier to endure, disaster becomes easier to bear, and tears become easier to melt away. Because of love I have hope, have joy, have courage to live.

An ordinary person like myself, a poor and deficient person like myself, a weak and ugly person like myself, how do I qualify to have all this? I do not deserve this! I am not a good Christian. My love for the Lord is not enough. I am not enthusiastic or energetically involved in the Lord's work. I am often lazy and don't go to church services. I often forget to read the Bible and pray. (Sometimes because I'm tired, or for

---

<sup>1</sup> Xing Lin Zi, “The World of Love” (“愛的世界”). *Always Joyful* (喜樂年年). Taipei: Chinese Sunday School Association (台北: 中國主日學協會), 1976; Translated by Maurie and Lan-shiang Sween.

other reasons. People always find a good excuse for themselves, don't they?) I often have weak faith, no patience, put God behind during happy times, and when disaster comes have a lot of complaints. In many things it is not only that I cannot glorify God, I become a stumbling stone for other people. But even though I am unable to conform to God's aspiration the Lord has not forsaken me. The Lord watches over me in disaster, sustains me in weakness, leads me in confusion, and comforts me in sorrow. The Lord loves me because the Lord loves me. I can almost hear God sighing and feel God looking at me with sorrow and mercy. The Lord really has a *hate that iron does not become steel* (恨鐵不成鋼)<sup>2</sup> heartache!

I am also not a good daughter. I am obstinate with my parents and make them angry. Neither am I a good sister. I have temper explosions and glower at my brothers and sisters. (Because of this they secretly gave me the nickname, *Old Aunt Tiger* (虎姑婆).)<sup>3</sup> Moreover I am not a good friend. I am condescending, am dismissive of concerns, am proud and arrogant, play witty games, and belittle others. I am the kind of girl who has a bad temper, gets jealous, am vain, and am often judgmental of others behind their backs. Why is it that they are all so broadminded? They love me, spoil me, forgive me, and accept me with all my failings. They never treat my faults as they deserve. Love compensates for all my insufficiencies, fills all my emptiness, makes up for all my inadequacies, and covers all my defects.

However besides these there are also many many unfamiliar and unknown friends who share warmhearted kindnesses, even if it is just a caring look, a softly spoken exhortation to take care, or a well-meant smile. All these present me with a harvest of happiness. I still remember one summer night coming home from visiting a friend. I took a three-wheeled bicycle taxi near Yong Kang Street. The friend who peddled saw that I couldn't move well and asked what was the matter. I told him, and he told me a story – how a disabled youth worked incessantly, strove intensely, and at the end succeeded. (That young person had been chosen as one of the ten most outstanding youth of the nation. He was the former head of the Department of History at the Taiwan National University, Mr. Hsu Tso-yun (許倬雲).) The night was very thick. He peddled slowly and talked tirelessly. Why would he want to speak about all this to a

---

<sup>2</sup> Chinese phrase expressing disappointment others feel when one has not reached one's potential.

<sup>3</sup> Referring to fearful Taiwanese folk-stories about an ancient tigress that eats children.

girl he had never met? It was only that he wanted to encourage me with a model so that my misfortune would not result in my losing the joy of being human and the courage to fight on. I still ponder this unfamiliar friendship.

I don't remember which time it was when I was residing in the hospital that an old neurological doctor chanced to notice my difficulties with walking and asked others about my illness. Afterwards someone told me the doctor had cried, and said: "Why let this young girl have this kind of a strange disease? Why not let me have it? I am already old ...." If these words were said to my face maybe I would not be as moved. I never knew the name of that old doctor, or what he looked like. But that pouring out of true feeling makes me feel the world is so warm and loving.

Last spring when coming home it suddenly began to rain. I was almost home. But my legs couldn't walk fast so I didn't bother trying. Just at that time an umbrella appeared from behind. When I turned my head I saw a pleasant smiling face. She looked like a college student. She softly said, "Where do you live? I'll walk you!" I was quickly at home, but I have never forgotten this lovely girl. I don't know who she is. She also doesn't want people to know. That is not important. The important thing is that she has an ever ready, giving, loving heart. To have that kind of fullness of love she must be someone who knows about living. Because of love we have mercy, grace, humility, tenderness, and patient hearts.

That time! I took two letters to mail at the corner. Two kids, I don't know whose family, were standing by the roadside. The little girl was at most four or five years old and the little boy was even younger. I passed by them. Suddenly the little girl looked at me, smiled sweetly, and exclaimed, "Auntie." The little boy could hardly speak. He only smiled and exposed a few small white milk-teeth. I was flattered and looked at them, looked at the four black and shining eyes, how pure, such a lack of wickedness, so innocent, so holy. You love so much that it is indescribable, an indescribable pleasing surprise, an indescribable happiness and comfort, and indescribable closeness and satisfaction. There were a few early stars in the sky. I took a deep breath. These children must be little angels sent from God. That night I emptied my pockets, bought a package of candy, and gave it to them as a little return. In comparison to their gift it seemed paltry and pitiful.

You see I am especially favored by nature. During these ten years suffering sick legs many people have given me care, encouragement, and comfort. Many people have

prayed for me and introduced doctors for me. They have braved the hot sun, rain, and wind to see me. And so my life is linked with others in a chain of love. They are like small lights shining and warming my heart, and also lighting my path so that I am not feeling alone and afraid during those long lonely days that are hard to bear, so that I do not withdraw and hesitate on a journey through life that is fraught with ups and downs. Because of love this world becomes bright, more beautiful, and better.

What else can I ask for? In this world of love what reason do I have for not living life abundantly and happily?

## Passing Through the Valley of Weeping<sup>1</sup>

Nine years ago Professor Li Liang-hsiu (李良修) of the Chemistry faculty in Kaohsiung's Chung Shan University contracted Parkinson's disease. This is a motor function failure caused by pathological changes of the cranial nerves. Unfortunately Professor Li is a sports lover who was adept at all sorts of ball games. Now this disease has trapped him. If he were to stop taking his medicine the muscles and joints of his whole body would become stiff, as if secured by an unseen lock.

There is still no cure for Parkinson's disease. While struggling with this wasting illness Professor Li sometimes thinks about how his agile body once graced the courts. This is very hard to bear. Fortunately he is a Christian. After a short depression he faced reality and accepted the challenge of his harsh fate. He wrote about his journey in a book entitled, *Walking through the Deep Valley of Parkinson's Disease* (走過帕金森幽谷).

As for life, it changes and we feel powerless. We can't help but ask "Why? Can it be that heaven is so unfeeling as to treat all beings as worthless animals?"

When suffering occurs we feel sadness, pain, anger, and confusion about why we have such bad luck. We want to escape but there is nowhere to flee. We have to give in but are unwilling to do so. Heaven and humans wage against each other. Sometimes we despair, loose our will to fight, and discard our armor. Sometimes we have a pugnacious spirit and struggle untiringly. But as we grope along trying to find a way to break free we often come to understand something, discover and harvest something.

In suffering we perceive the finite and infinite, the fragile and tenacious, the humble and lowly as well as the sublime aspects of life. When bound under layers of pressure life's latent potential and surprising power is roused.

King Solomon said, "The crucible for silver and the furnace for gold, but the Lord tests the heart." Through the trial of suffering we learn humility, thankfulness, and to cherish and respect life.

Suffering is a necessary part of life's journey of learning.

"So pass through the valley of weeping and make it a place of springs; the autumn rains also cover it with pools."<sup>2</sup> This is the promise of God. As we walk through suffering God also allows us to become a help and blessing to others who suffer.

---

<sup>1</sup> Xing Lin Zi, "Passing Through the Valley of Weeping, (經過流淚谷). *Looking Into the Well of Life* (探索生命的深井). Taipei: Chiu-ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 2000; Translated by Maurie and Lan-shiang Sween.

<sup>2</sup> Psalm 84:6

# BIBLIOGRAPHY

## UNPUBLISHED SOURCES

### Interviews

Bjorgaas, Olav, retired missionary of Den Norske Misjonsallianse. Pingtung, Taiwan. 16 June 2002.

Chang Lai-hao (張來好), chaplain of Eden Social Welfare Foundation (伊甸社會福利基金會). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 8 September 2000.

Chang Lai-hao (張來好), director of Severe Disability Nursing Center, Eden Social Welfare Foundation (伊甸社會福利基金會). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 29 November 2001.

Chang Li-mei (張麗美), client of Eden Social Welfare Foundation (伊甸社會福利基金會). Mu-cha Taiwan. 10 December 2001.

Chang Te-chien (張德謙), clergy of The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan (台灣基督長老教會). Tape recording. 25 August 2002.

Chao, Jonathan (趙天恩), director of the China Gospel Association (中國福音會). Taipei Taiwan. 31 August 2002.

\_\_\_\_\_. 28 April 2002. Personal email. (29 April 2002).

Chen Chi-nan (陳其南), chairman of National Culture and Arts Foundation (國家文化藝術基金). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 24 June 2002.

Chen, Jacob (陳俊良), chief executive officer of Eden Social Welfare Foundation (伊甸社會福利基金會). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 9 August 2000.

\_\_\_\_\_. Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 3 January 2002.

\_\_\_\_\_. 15 December 2005. Personal email (15 December 2005).

Chen, Jonathan C. (陳進昌), professor of Methodist Graduate School of Theology (衛理神學研究所). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 4 June 2002.

Chen Mei-ju (陳美如), vice director of Theological Education by Extension, China Evangelical Seminary (中華福音神學院). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 29 November 2001.

\_\_\_\_\_. Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 12 December 2001.

Chen Nan-jou (陳南州), professor of Theology of Mission, Yu-Shan Theological College and Seminary (玉山神學院). Tape recording. Kaohsiung Taiwan. 9 August 2002.

- Chen, Paul (陳仰恩), director of Salt and Light Foundation (光鹽文教基金會). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 6 September 2002.
- Chen, Stephen L. (陳鏞), president of Tao Shen Theological Seminary (道生神學院). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 26 April 2002.
- Cheng, Daniel (鄭英兒), secretary of Church and Society, The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan (台灣基督長老教會總會). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 2 August 2002.
- Cheng, Grace (鄭夙珺), manager of Chinese Christian Relief Association and Chinese Christian Evangelistic Association (中華基督教救助協會, 中華基督教福音協進會). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 18 July 2002.
- Cheng Lan-hsin (鄭嵐心), director of Finance and Personnel, Eden Social Welfare Foundation (伊甸社會福利基金會). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 20 November 2001.
- Cheng, Simon (鄭國忠), legislator (立法委員). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 11 June 2002.
- Cheng Sin-jen (鄭信真), chief operating officer of World Vision Taiwan (台灣世界展望會). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 23 January 2002.
- Cheng Yang-en (鄭仰恩), associate professor of Church History, Taiwan Theological Seminary (台灣神學院). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 20 August 2002.
- Chi Hui-jung (紀惠容), chief executive director of The Garden of Hope Foundation (勵馨社會福利事業基金會). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 16 January 2000.
- Chio, Samuel H. H. (周學信), teacher of Systematic Theology China Evangelical Seminary (中華福音神學院). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 6 August 2002.
- Chiu Kung-ming (邱光明), director of Shuangfu Development Eden Social Welfare Foundation (伊甸社會福利基金會). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 8 September 2000.
- Chow Lien-hwa (周聯華). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 12 August 2002.
- Chow, Peter K (周功和), teacher of Theology and Ethics China Evangelical Seminary (中華福音神學院). 26 October 2001. Personal email (27 October 2001).
- \_\_\_\_\_. 6 December 2002. Personal email (7 December, 2002).
- Chu, John (朱三才), director of Christian Data Center (基督教資料中心). Tape recording. Taichung Taiwan. 29 July 2002.
- Fan Cheng-hui (范振蕙), executive director of Born Anew Youth Caring Association (中華民國更生少年關懷協會). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 30 August 2000.
- Fan, Yi-shih (范義士), clergy of Taiwan Lutheran Church, Pingtung (中華民國台灣基督教信義會屏東教會). Tape recording. Pingtung Taiwan. 29 July 2000.

- Geddes, John, retired missionary of Presbyterian Church in Taiwan. Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 18 June 2002.
- Hsiao Da-hsin (蕭大興), client of Eden Social Welfare Foundation (伊甸社會福利基金會). Mu-cha Taiwan. 10 December 2001.
- Hu Hong-chih (胡宏志), clergy of The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan (台灣基督教長老教會). Edinburgh Scotland. April 30, 2003.
- Huang Po-Ho, director of Research and Development Center Presbyterian Church in Taiwan(台灣基督長老教會總會研發中心). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 28 May 2002.
- \_\_\_\_\_, (黃伯和), president of Tainan Theological Seminary (台南神學院). Tape recording. Tainan Taiwan. 26 August, 2002.
- Ip, Leo (葉嶺楠), director of I-link Community Services Association, Bread of Life Church (台灣愛鄰社區服務協會, 靈糧堂). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 21 May 2002.
- \_\_\_\_\_. Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 23 May 2002.
- Jane, T. F. Thomas (簡添富), commissioner of Buddhist Compassion Relief Tzu Chi Association (佛教克難慈濟功德會). Taipei Taiwan. 13 August 2002.
- Kao, C. M. (高俊明), former general secretary of The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan (台灣基督長老教會總會). Tape Recording. Taipei Taiwan. 19 June 2002.
- \_\_\_\_\_. Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 31 May 2002.
- Kao, Ruth (高李麗珍), chairperson of Extermination of Child Pornography Association Taiwan (台灣終止童妓協會). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 25 July 2002.
- Kuo Cheng-hsiung (郭正雄), client of Eden Social Welfare Foundation (伊甸社會福利基金會). Mu-cha Taiwan. 10 December 2001.
- Kuo, Jack (郭光輝), administrator of Chinese Children's Fund (財團法人中華兒童暨家庭扶助基金會). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 29 January 2002.
- Kuo Ming-chang (郭明璋), consultant of Chinese Rhenish Church Taipei (中華基督教禮賢會台北堂). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 10 April 2002.
- Lee Chi-hung (李基宏), academic dean of Methodist Graduate School of Theology (衛理神學研究所). Taipei Taiwan. 15 May 2002.
- Lee, Daniel (李智華), director of Holistic Growth Center of Nan King East Road Christian Church (祥寧全人成長中心, 台北基督徒南京東路禮拜堂). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 13 May 2002.
- Lee, Robert C. P. (李靖波), clergy of Chung-ho Free Methodist Church (中華循理會中和教會). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 29 April 2002.

- Lin, Albert J. F. (林哲夫), chairman of Research Association, National Peace-security in Taiwan (台灣國家和平安全研究協會(台安會)). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 11 June 2002.
- Lin Chung-sung (林忠雄), chairman of China Alliance Church (基督教中華協力會). Tape recording. Hsinchu Taiwan. 25 August 2002.
- Lin Li-chin (林麗琴), assistant to administrator of Puli Christian Hospital (埔里基督教醫院). Tape recording. Puli Taiwan. 16 May 2002.
- Lin Mei-chuang (林美專), managing director of Eden Social Welfare Foundation (伊甸社會福利基金會). Tape recording. Kaohsiung Taiwan. 13 November 2001.
- Lin, Peter Chi Ping (林治平), chairman of Christian Cosmic Light Holistic Care Organization (宇宙光全人關懷機構). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 6 May 2002.
- Lin, Robert (林錦川), resource development director of Eden Social Welfare Foundation (伊甸社會福利基金會). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 15 August 2000.
- Lin Te-chang (林德昌), evangelist of Eden Social Welfare Foundation (伊甸社會福利基金會). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 16 October 2000.
- Liu Hsia (劉俠). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. May 2001.
- Liu, Kan (劉侃), chairman of Pingtung Christian Hospital(屏東基督教醫院). Tape recording. Pingtung Taiwan. 27 July 2000.
- Liu Mei-hsia (劉美夏), managing director of Eden Social Welfare Foundation (伊甸社會福利基金會). Tape recording. Taichung Taiwan. 11 December 2001.
- Liu Yu-hsiu (劉玉琇), employee of Shuangfu Department, Eden Social Welfare Foundation (伊甸社會福利基金會). Taipei Taiwan. 20 November 2001.
- Lo, Anita, manager of Community Relations TOUCH Community Services. 11 July 2005. Personal email (12 July 2005).
- Lo, William J. K. (羅榮光), general secretary of The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan (台灣基督長老教會總會). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 23 July 2002.
- Pai, Encore (白啓仲), director of Public Relations of Eden Social Welfare Foundation (伊甸社會福利基金會). Letter to the author. 5 July 2001.  
\_\_\_\_\_. Taipei Taiwan. 5 December 2001.
- Pan, Joshua (潘稀祺), chaplain of Sinlau Hospital (新樓醫院). Tape recording. Tainan Taiwan. 11 May 2002.
- Peng Shu-fan (彭舒凡), head chaplain of Eden Social Welfare Foundation Taipei Office (伊甸社會福利基金會). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 6 November 2001.  
\_\_\_\_\_. Tape recording. 8 November 2001.

Senner, E. L., retired missionary of Presbyterian Church in Taiwan. Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 31 May 2002.

Shang Cheng-Chung (蔣正宗), director of National Council of Churches of Taiwan (教會合作委員會). Taipei Taiwan. June 13, 2002.

Shao, Tim (邵慶明), president of World Vision Taiwan (台灣世界展望會). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 8 January 2002.

Shia, James (夏忠堅), director of Chinese Christian Relief Association and Chinese Christian Evangelistic Association (中華基督教救助協會, 中華基督教福音協進會). Tape recording. Pingtung Taiwan. 21 October 2001.

\_\_\_\_\_. Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 27 July 2002.

\_\_\_\_\_. Sermon. 8<sup>th</sup> Annual Mission Conference, Da Lian Street Mandarin Church (屏東大連路國語禮拜堂), Pingtung Taiwan, 20 October 2001.

\_\_\_\_\_. Sermon. Da Lian Street Mandarin Church (屏東大連路國語禮拜堂), Pingtung Taiwan, 21 October 2001.

Shih Ta-chun (施大俊), chaplain of Pingtung Christian Hospital(屏東基督教醫院). Tape recording. Pingtung Taiwan. 17 May 2002.

Storrar, W. F., professor of Christian Ethics and Practical Theology University of Edinburgh. Edinburgh Scotland. November 2002.

Su, Anthony H. (蘇希三), deputy executive officer of Garden of Hope Foundation (勵馨社會福利事業基金會). Taipei Taiwan. 15 January 2002.

Su, Chris (蘇南洲), president of Christian Arts Press (基文社). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 10 April 2002.

Tai Fu-chao (戴富嬌), staff member of Kaohsiung branch Eden Social Welfare Foundation (伊甸社會福利基金). Tape Recording. Kaohsiung Taiwan. 13 November 2001.

Thelin, Mark C., retired missionary of Presbyterian Church in Taiwan. Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 21 June 2002.

Tin, John Jyigiokk (鄭兒玉), director of Christian Institute for Social Transformation, Tainan Theological Seminary (基督教社會研究所, 台南神學院). Tape recording. Tainan Taiwan. 15 September 2000.

Tsai, Daniel K. S. (蔡國山), general director of Taiwan Industrial Evangelical Fellowship (台灣工業福音團契). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 29 May 2002.

Tsai, Matthew (蔡茂堂), clergy of Ho-ping Presbyterian Church in Taiwan (台灣基督長老教會). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 18 April 2002.

- Tsui, Margaret (崔彬), director of Public Relations of Eden Social Welfare Foundation (伊甸社會福利基金會). Taipei Taiwan. 4 December 2001.
- Wang Chien-shien (王建煊), director of Renewal Foundation (愛心第二春文教基金會). Tape Recording. Taipei Taiwan. 6 February 2002.
- Wang Tsyrfen (汪慈芬), chaplain of MacKay Memorial Hospital (馬偕紀念醫院). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 23 May 2002.
- Wu Meng-chung (吳孟中), former bishop's assistant of United Methodist Church in Taiwan (中華基督理會). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 15 May 2002.
- Wu, Takah H. L. (吳和隆), clergy of Changhua Church Presbyterian Church in Taiwan (台灣基督長老教會彰化教會). Tape recording. Changhua Taiwan. 20 May 2002.
- Yang, C. S. (楊啓壽), ecumenical ambassador of The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan (台灣基督長老教會總會). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 10 June 2002.
- Yang I-hsien (楊意賢), special education teacher of Eden Social Welfare Foundation Kaohsiung (伊甸社會福利基金會). Tape recording. Kaohsiung Taiwan. 13 November 2001.
- Yu Li-cheng (俞禮正), board member of Eden Social Welfare Foundation (伊甸社會福利基金會). Tape recording. Taipei Taiwan. 25 September 2003.
- Zhu Yin-puo (朱蔭坡), professor of literature, Beijing Capital City Economics and Business University, Beijing China (首都經絡貿易大學). Letter to the author. 15 March 2005.

### Archival Sources

- Eden Social Welfare Foundation, Taipei Administrative Offices
- "1999 Eden Yearly Service Report." ("88年度服務成果報告") Taipei: Eden Social Welfare Foundation (伊甸社會福利基金會), 1999. Photocopied.
- "1999 Love Without Frontiers." ("1999年愛無國界.") Taipei: Eden Social Welfare Foundation (伊甸社會福利基金會), 1999.
- Chen, Jacob (陳俊良). "Holding the Plow and Looking Forward: Eden's Transformation Difficulties." ("扶犁向前，伊甸轉型中的難題.") In *Looking Back Over the Ten Year Journey: Eden Tenth Year Anniversary Special Publication (回首十年路: 伊甸十週年專刊)*. Taipei: Eden Disabled Welfare Foundation (伊甸社會福利基金會), 1994.
- Chiu Kung-ming (邱光明). "Pursuing Peace among Suffering." ("追求苦難中平安.") In *Shuangfu Weekly Bulletin 2 (雙福週報)* (8 October 2001). Photocopied.
- Chiu Kung-ming (邱光明). "The Worst Disaster the Best Outcome." ("最壞的災害，最好的結局.") In *Shuangfu Weekly Bulletin 1 (雙福週報)* (1 Oct. 2001). Photocopied.

"Complete Service." ("完整的服務.") in *Eden Bimonthly 1 (伊甸雙月刊)* (July 1983). Photocopied.

Diao Hwei-mei (刁惠美). "Research on the Effect on Disabled Welfare in the Campaign to Elect Liu Hsia by the Disability Union." ("殘障聯盟運用劉俠參選事件對殘障福利影響之研究.") Research Report: Graduate Institute of Sociology, National Taiwan University (國立台灣大學社會學研究所), 1991. Photocopied.

"Eden Instructions for Visiting the Disabled." ("伊甸探訪身心障礙者說明表.") Taipei: Eden Social Welfare Foundation (伊甸社會福利基金會), n.d.. Photocopied.

"Eden Shuangfu Strategy." ("伊甸雙福發展策略.") Taipei: Eden Social Welfare Foundation (伊甸社會福利基金會), 16 February 1998. Photocopied.

"Evangelism Funds for Bible Seminary Students and Mission." ("雙福傳道基金.") Taipei: Eden Social Welfare Foundation (伊甸社會福利基金會), n.d..

Liu Hsia (劉俠). "Ten Years of Stormy Journey." ("十年風雨來時路.") In *Looking Back Over the Ten Year Journey: Eden Tenth Year Anniversary Special Publication (回首十年路: 伊甸十週年專刊)*. Taipei: Eden Disabled Welfare Foundation (伊甸社會福利基金會), 1994.

Liu Mei-hsia (劉美夏). "To Hold Hands on the Ten Year Journey." ("牽手十年路.") In *Looking Back Over the Ten Year Journey: Eden Tenth Year Anniversary Special Publication (回首十年路: 伊甸十週年專刊)*. Taipei: Eden Disabled Welfare Foundation (伊甸社會福利基金會), 1994.

Liu Ming-yi(劉明義). "Eden's Song" ("伊甸之歌"). Edited by Liu Hsia In *Looking Back Over the Ten Year Journey: Eden Tenth Year Anniversary Special Publication (回首十年路: 伊甸十週年專刊)*. Taipei: Eden Disabled Welfare Foundation (伊甸社會福利基金會), 1994.

"Promotion and Establishment of Shuangfu Ministry, an Investigation." ("推展雙福事工初探.") Taipei: Eden Social Welfare Foundation (伊甸社會福利基金會), 15 April 1998. Photocopied.

Serving the Disadvantaged, Witnessing for Christ, Spreading the Gospel, and Leading People Back to God (服務弱勢，見證基督，推動雙福，領人歸主). Taipei: Eden Social Welfare Foundation (伊甸社會福利基金會), n.d..

"Shuangfu Development and Pastoral Group." ("雙福發展處會牧組.") Taipei: Eden Social Welfare Foundation (伊甸社會福利基金會), n.d. Photocopied.

"Verses for Those with Different Kinds of Disability." ("不同障別的經文.") Taipei: Eden Social Welfare Foundation (伊甸社會福利基金會), n.d. Photocopied.

## 2. China Evangelical Seminary

Boehr, Ernest. "Work of God in the Hakka Near Tungshih." *Taiwan Church Growth Bulletin* 2, no. 2 (1974).

Branner, John Ky. "Chronicle of Failure." *Taiwan Church Growth Bulletin* 3, no. 2 (1975).

- Craighill, Peyton G. "Worship and Christian Mission in Taiwan." *Taiwan Church Growth Bulletin* 3, no. 1 (1975).
- Dickinson, Art. "Present Thinking on Local Rural Evangelism." *Taiwan Church Growth Bulletin* 3, no. 2 (1975).
- "Editorial." *Taiwan Church Growth Bulletin* 3, no. 3 (1975).
- Fredricksen, Andrew. "Receptivity to the Gospel in Rural Taiwan." *Taiwan Church Growth Bulletin* 3, no. 2 (1975): 5-6.
- King, Paul L. "New Church in Youchang." *Taiwan Church Growth Bulletin* 2, no. 3 (1974).
- Sawatzky, Sheldon. "Contextualization." In *Taiwan Church Growth Bulletin* 12, no. 1 & 2 (May 1984).
- Sprunger, Hugh D. "Presbyterians' Hard, Bold Plans for Church Growth." *Taiwan Church Growth Bulletin* 3, no. 3 (September 1975).
- Swanson, Allen J. "24 Obstacles to Church Growth in Taiwan." *Taiwan Church Growth Bulletin* 6, no. 1 (1978).
- \_\_\_\_\_. "24 Reasons Why Some Churches Grow." *Taiwan Church Growth Bulletin* 6, no. 2 (1978).
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Group Decisions and Church Growth in Taiwan." *Taiwan Church Growth Bulletin* 1, no. 4 (1974).
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Lessons from Taiwan Church History." *Taiwan Church Growth Bulletin* 4, no. 3 (1976).
- "Taiwan Church Growth Society," *Taiwan Church Growth Bulletin* 1, no. 1 (1972).
3. The General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, Taipei
- Chen, Paul N. J. "Deprivatizing the Christian Faith: Service and Participation." CWM East Asia Regional Consultation, Bible Study Number 4, 31 July 1990. Photocopied.
- Hsu, Victor W. C. In *Taiwan – Its International and Ecumenical Status and Role: A Report of the International Forum, 22-25 February 1994*. Taipei: The General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan (台灣基督長老教會總會), 1994.
- "Joint Statement from the Taiwan Mission Consultation." Taipei: Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, 31 July 1987. Photocopied.
- Pong, James T. M. *Worldly Ambition versus Christian Vocation: Autobiography of a Chinese Bishop*. Taipei: Taiwan Episcopal Church, n.d..

4. Taiwan Missionary Fellowship, Taichung

Tong, Hollington K. "If I Were a Missionary in Taiwan, for What Would I Strive?." (An address by Mr. Hollington K. Tong at the Missionary Conference at the Sun Moon Lake Hotel on July 31, 1959). Taiwan Missionary Fellowship Archives, Taiwan. Photocopied.

*Taiwan Missionary Directory: 1960*. Taiwan: Taiwan Missionary Fellowship, 1960.

5. University of London, School of Oriental and African Studies

Maxwell, James Laidlaw. "The Old Instructions and Modern Methods." *Medical Missions at Home and Abroad*, no. 5 (October, 1879).

Urwick, W. "An Independent Testimony." *Medical Missions at Home and Abroad* 10 (October 1880).

6. Author's Library

Maxwell, John Preston. Untitled Biography. Author's Library. Photocopied.

Lin Chung-sung (林忠雄). "Ten Reasons Why Christians Do Good." ("基督徒行善的十大理由.") Author's Library. Photocopied.

*Theses*

Branner, John Ky. "Chinese Leadership Patterns and their Relationship to Pastoral Ministry Among Taiwan's Urban Masses." D.Miss. thesis, Fuller Theological Seminary, 1983.

Chen Hsien-ping. "The Growth History and the Ten Plus One Church Growth Movement of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan." D.Min. thesis, Fuller Theological Seminary 1986.

Chen, Stephen L. "Renewal Strategies for the Mandarin-Speaking Churches in Taiwan." D.Miss. thesis, Fuller Theological Seminary, 1987.

Cliff, Norman Howard. "The Life and Theology of Watchman Nee, Including a Study of the Little Flock Movement which He Founded." M.Phil. diss., Open University, 1983.

Crownover, Gary Christopher. "Institutional Schism and Variant Christologies in the China Christian Establishment: A Case Study of the China Inland Mission and the Chinese Young Men's Christian Association: 1920-1929." M.A. diss., University of Kansas, 2000.

Fleming, Kenneth. "Asian Christian Theologians in Dialogue with Buddhism: A Study of the Writings of Kosuke Koyama, Choan-Seng Song, and Aloysius Pieris." Ph.D. thesis, University of Edinburgh Centre for the Study of Christianity in the Non-Western World, 2000.

Hsu Ming-hsiung (徐敏雄). "The Development of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan's Social Service Ministry." ("台灣基督教長老教會社會服務事工的發展.") M.A. diss., Institute of Social Welfare, National Chung Jen University (國立中正大學社會福利研究所), 1998.

- Hsu Te-ling (徐德齡). "The Communal Life and Individualism in Independent Churches." ("一個獨立教會之集體性與個人性.") M.A. diss., National Taiwan University (國立台灣大學社會學研究所), 2000.
- Jen Wei-xuan (鄭維瑄). "The Role of Christian Social Care and the Development of Welfare in the Taiwan Community." ("基督教社會關懷在台灣社會福利發展中角色之探討.") M.A. diss., Graduate Institute of Sociology, National Taiwan University (國立台灣大學社會學研究所), 1991.
- Lam, Timothy Loi Wai. "A Historical Study of the CCCOWE Movement: The First Ten Years (1976-1986)." Th.M. diss., Fuller Theological Seminary, 1988.
- Lin Jung-chi. "The Church Growth of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan." D.Min. thesis, Fuller Theological Seminary, 1988.
- Ling, Samuel D. "The Other May Fourth Movement: The Chinese 'Christian Renaissance,' 1919-1937." Ph.D. thesis, Temple University, 1980.
- Luh Wei-Liang. "Wu Yao-Tsung and the Three-Self Patriotic Church." M.A. diss., Fu Hsing Kang College, 1986.
- Maxwell, Ian. "Alexander Duff and the Theological and Philosophical Background to the General Assembly Mission in Calcutta to 1840." Ph.D. thesis, University of Edinburgh, 1995.
- Mensendiek, C. William. "The Protestant Missionary Understanding of the Chinese Situation and the Christian Task from 1890 to 1911." Ph.D. thesis, Columbia University, 1958.
- Ng Lee Ming. "Christianity and Social Change: The Case in China, 1920-1950." Ph.D. thesis, Princeton Theological Seminary, 1970.
- Reist, Katherine Kennedy. "A Church for China: A Problem in Self Identification, 1919-1937." Ph.D. thesis, Ohio State University, 1983.
- Russell, William P. "Contextualization: Origins, Meaning, and Implications. A Study of what the Theological Education Fund of the World Council of Churches Originally Understood by the Term 'Contextualization', with Special Reference to the Period 1970-1972." Thesis, Facultate S. Theologiae apud Pontificiam Universitaem S. Thomae in Urbe, 1995.
- Sawatzky, Sheldon V. "The Body of Christ Metaphor: An Interpretation to Stimulate Taiwanese Mennonite Reflection on the Nature and task of the Church w/in Chinese Society." Ph.D. thesis, Fuller Theological Seminary, 1980.
- Smythe, Lewis Strong Casey. "Changes in the Christian Message for China by Protestant Missionaries." Ph.D. thesis, University of Chicago, 1928.
- Tsai Kuo-shan. "The Evangelization of the Urban Industrial Workers in Taiwan Missiological Perspectives." D.Miss. thesis, Fuller Theological Seminary, 1985.
- Wong Chong-gyiau. "The Emergence of Political Statements and Political Theology in the History of the Taiwanese Presbyterian Church." Th.D. thesis, Boston University, 1992.

## PUBLISHED SOURCES

### Chinese Language

#### 1. Books

Chu San-tsai (朱三才). 2001, 2002 Taiwan Ming Area Christian Church, Association, and Mission Overview Tables (2001, 2002年台閩地區堂會、宗教、宣教、機構一覽表). Taichung: Christian Information Center(基督教資料中心.台中), 2000.

*Knowing the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan* (認識台灣基督長老教會). Taipei: General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan (台灣基督長老教會總會), 2000.

Lin Peter Chi ping (林治平). *God's Servant in the 21<sup>st</sup> Century* (二十一世紀的事奉者). Taipei: Cosmic Light (宇宙光), 2002.

Shia, James (夏忠堅). *Everybody Come and Work: A Manual for Church Involvement in Building up a Community* (教會參與社區營造手冊: 大家來打拼). Taipei: Chinese Christian Evangelistic Association (中華基督教福音協進會), 1998.

#### 2. Articles

Cheng Yang-en (鄭仰恩). "A Missionary Marching the Unknown Journey – a Small Memior of Reverend H. Dan Beeby" ("邁向未知旅程的宣教師 – 彌迪理牧師小傳"). *New Messenger* (新使者雜誌), no. 67 (10 December 2001).

Chou Hsiang-hsiung (周湘雄) In *Christian Tribune* (基督教論壇報), no. 1783 (21 March 2000).

"Confession of Faith of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan" ("台灣基督長老教會信仰告白"). In *Knowing the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan* (認識台灣基督長老教會). Taipei: General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan (台灣基督長老教會總會), 2000.

Hsiao Ming (曉民). "The Sound of the Nightingale" ("夜鶯曲"). *Always Joyful* (喜樂年年). Chinese Sunday School Association (台北: 中國主日學協會), 1976.

"Pai Bi" (排比). In *Hanyu Da Cidian* (漢語大詞典). Vol. 6. Shanghai: Hanyu Da Cidian Chubanshe (漢語大詞典出版社), 1994.

"Pai Bi" (排比). In *Chihai Dictionary* (辭海). Vol. 1. Shanghai: Shanghai Chishu Chubanshe (上海辭書出版社), 1989.

Xing, Lin Zi (杏林子). "Able to Fly" ("會飛"). *Fables of Our Time* (現代寓言). Taipei: Chiu-ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1994.

- Xing, Lin Zi. "Addendum" ("後記"). *Meet You at the Harbor of Life (在生命的渡口與你相遇)*. Taipei: Chiu-ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1999.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Addendum" ("後記"). *Psalm of Life (生之頌)*. Taipei: Chiu-ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1995.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Addendum" ("後記"). *Sing the Song of Life (生之歌)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1995.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Always Joyful (喜樂年年)*. Taipei: China Sunday School Association (台北: 中國主日學協會), 1976.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Angel in Disguise" ("喬裝的天使"). *Watch Your Soul (心靈品管)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Angel Without Legs" ("無腳天使"). *Meet You at the Harbor of Life (在生命的渡口與你相遇)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1999.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Another Kind of Love (另一種愛情)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1982.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Apricot Forest Essays (杏林小記)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1979.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Bad Horse" ("劣馬"). *Always Joyful (喜樂年年)*. Taipei: China Sunday School Association (台北: 中國主日學協會), 1976.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Be a Person" ("做人"). *Watch Your Soul (心靈品管)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Best Way to Annihilate an Enemy" ("消滅敵人最好的方法"). *The Song of Life (生命之歌)*. Taipei: Eurasian Press (台北: 圓神), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Book" ("書"). *Psalm of Life (生之頌)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1995.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Boy who Grew Roses" ("種玫瑰花的男孩"). *Meet You at the Harbor of Life (在生命的渡口與你相遇)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1999.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Bracelet of Mrs. Raccoon" ("浣熊太太的手鐲"). *Fables of Our Time (現代寓言)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1994.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Breaking Through the Difficulties of Life" ("突破生命的困境"). *The Song of Life (生命之歌)*. Taipei: Eurasian Press (台北: 圓神), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Burdens" ("重擔"). *Sing the Song of Life (生之歌)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1995.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Camel is Sick" ("駱駝病了"). *Fables of Our Time (現代寓言)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1994.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Cherish Life" ("珍惜生命"). *Why I Didn't Kill Myself? (為什麼我沒有自殺?)*. Taipei: Chien-Hsing Publishing (台北: 健行文化), 2000.

- Xing, Lin Zi. "Choice" ("選擇"). *Apricot Forest Essays* (杏林小記). Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1979.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Christ's Messengers" ("基督使者"). *Sing the Song of Life* (生之歌). Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1995.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Contentment" ("知足"). *Watch Your Soul* (心靈品管). Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Creator's Question" ("天問"). *Fables of Our Time*(現代寓言). Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1994.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Defect is the Only Way to Bring Love Out" ("缺陷是愛的唯一出口"). *The Song of Life* (生命之歌). Taipei: Eurasian Press (台北: 圓神), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Directionless" ("何去何從"). *Victory Song Series* (凱歌集). Taipei: China Christian Mission (台北: 中國信徒佈道會), 1983.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Distributing Pears and Sending Books" ("分梨與送書"). *The Song of Life* (生命之歌). Taipei: Eurasian Press (台北: 圓神), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Doctor's Smile" ("大夫的笑臉"). *Apricot Forest Essays* (杏林小記). Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1979.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Doing Good" ("行善"). *Watch Your Soul* (心靈品管). Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Don't Rub Salt in Someone's Wound" ("不要在別人的傷口上抹鹽"). *The Song of Life* (生命之歌). Taipei: Eurasian Press (台北: 圓神), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Eden" ("伊甸"). *Watch Your Soul* (心靈品管). Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Equality." ("公平"). *Watch Your Soul* (心靈品管). Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Eternal Eden" ("永遠的伊甸"). *The Song of Life* (生命之歌). Taipei: Eurasian Press (台北: 圓神), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Everlasting Love" ("恆久的愛"). *Watch Your Soul* (心靈品管). Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Everything You See is Yours" ("看得到的都是你的"). *The Song of Life* (生命之歌). Taipei: Eurasian Press (台北: 圓神), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Fables of Our Time* (現代寓言). Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1994.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Facing Challenges Unperturbed" ("坦然面對"). *Watch Your Soul* (心靈品管). Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1997.

- Xing Lin Zi. "Fate – Fate" ("命運 · 命運"). *Psalm of Life (生之頌)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1995.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Fashion" ("流行風"). *Fables of Our Time (現代寓言)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1994.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Filial Piety" ("孝"). *Victory Song Series (凱歌集)*. Taipei: China Christian Mission (台北: 中國信徒佈道會), 1983.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *The First Family in the North Pole (北極第一家)*. Taipei: Crown (台北: 皇冠), 1995.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Five Past Twelve" ("十二點五分"). *Apricot Forest Essays (杏林小記)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1979.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Fortunately" ("幸好"). *Always Joyful (喜樂年年)*. Taipei: Chinese Sunday School (台北: 中國主日學協會), 1976.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Fortune Telling" ("問卜"). *Watch Your Soul (心靈品管)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Four Spiritual Moves" ("武"靈"四招"). *Victory Song Series (凱歌集)*. Taipei: China Christian Mission (台北: 中國信徒佈道會), 1983.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Garden of Eden on Earth" ("地上的伊甸園"). *Fables of Our Time (現代寓言)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1994.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "General Wang Ru-Kai" ("大帥王汝楷"). *Meet You at the Harbor of Life (在生命的渡口與你相遇)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1999.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Give Thanks to the Thorny Rose (感謝玫瑰有刺)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1989.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Grandfather Du's Poetry" ("杜阿公的詩"). *Meet You at the Harbor of Life (在生命的渡口與你相遇)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1999.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Great Enlightenment Great Compassion" ("大悟大愛"). *Thinking of You (相思深不深)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1993.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Hero" ("英雄"). *Sing the Song of Life (生之歌)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1995.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The History of the Changing World" ("滄桑髮史"). *Thinking of You (相思深不深)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1993.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Hold Up the Light" ("將燈提起"). *Sing the Song of Life (生之歌)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1995.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Human Effort can Achieve Everything" ("事在人為"). *Psalm of Life (生之頌)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1995.

- Xing Lin Zi. "I Want to Live" ("我要活下去"). *Always Joyful* (喜樂年年). Taipei: Chinese Sunday School Association (台北: 中國主日學協會), 1976.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Invisible Cherry Blossom" ("看不見的櫻花"). *The Song of Life* (生命之歌). Taipei: Eurasian Press (台北: 圓神), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Is Life Just this Pair of Legs?" ("生命只有這一雙腿嗎?"). *The Song of Life* (生命之歌). Taipei: Eurasian Press (台北: 圓神), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Is the Moon Full?" ("月亮圓不圓?"). *Fables of Our Time* (現代寓言). Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1994.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "It is Beautiful to Live Splendidly" ("活得精采就是美"). *Give Thanks to the Thorny Rose* (感謝玫瑰有刺). Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1989.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Joy in the Traffic Jam" ("塞車樂"). *The Song of Life* (生命之歌). Taipei: Eurasian Press (台北: 圓神), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Kangaroo and the Beggar" ("袋鼠和乞丐"). *Fables of Our Time* (現代寓言). Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1994.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Knocking at the Door" ("叩門"). *Watch Your Soul* (心靈品管). Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Knowing Life" ("認識生命"). *Sing the Song of Life* (生之歌). Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1995.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Laboratory of Human Nature" ("人性實驗室"). *Apricot Forest Essays* (杏林小記). Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1979.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Lead You, Be with You, Go Forward Together" ("牽你, 陪你, 一起向前走"). *True Love is a Lifelong Promise* (真情是一生的承諾). Taipei: Eurasian Press (台北: 圓神), 2000.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Life and the World" ("生命與世界"). *Apricot Forest Essays* (杏林小記). Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1979.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Life Life" ("生命生命"). *Sing the Song of Life* (生之歌). Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1995.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Light the Lamp of Life" ("點一盞生命的燈"). *Watch Your Soul* (心靈品管). Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Limit of Life" ("生命的極限"). *Psalm of Life* (生之頌). Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1995.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Li Wu River Stones" ("立霧溪的石頭"). *The Song of Life* (生命之歌). Taipei: Eurasian Press (台北: 圓神), 1997.

- Xing Lin Zi. "Long Life" ("萬壽無疆"). *Victory Song Series (凱歌集)*. Taipei: China Christian Mission (台北: 中國信徒佈道會), 1983.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Long Road" ("遙遠的路"). *Sing the Song of Life (生之歌)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1995.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Long Night" ("長夜漫漫"). *Psalm of Life (生之頌)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1995.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Look at Life From a Different Angle" ("換一個角度看人生"). *The Song of Life (生命之歌)*. Taipei: Eurasian Press (台北: 圓神), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Looking Down on People" ("人" 眼看人低). *The Song of Life (生命之歌)*. Taipei: Eurasian Press (台北: 圓神), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Love and Faith" ("愛與信心"). *Watch Your Soul (心靈品管)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Love Stories (身邊的愛情故事)*. Taipei: Crown (台北: 皇冠), 1998.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Love that Never Gives Up" ("不放棄的愛"). *Watch Your Soul (心靈品管)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Martial Artist Tsai Jr-Jong" ("大俠蔡志忠"). *Meet You at the Harbor of Life (在生命的渡口與你相遇)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1999.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Meet You at the Harbor of Life (在生命的渡口與你相遇)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1999.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Melody of Life" ("生命的旋律"). *The Song of Life (生命之歌)*. Taipei: Eurasian Press (台北: 圓神), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Miracle of Five Loaves and Two Fish" ("五餅二魚的神蹟"). *The Song of Life (生命之歌)*. Taipei: Eurasian Press (台北: 圓神), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Mountain Legend" ("山中傳奇"). *Meet You at the Harbor of Life (在生命的渡口與你相遇)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1999.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Mrs. Lin" ("林太太"). *Apricot Forest Essays (杏林小記)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1979.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Murky World" ("濁世"). *Reentering the Mundane World (重入紅塵)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1985.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Needle Scars" ("針痕"). *Apricot Forest Essays (杏林小記)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1979.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Neither Clear nor Rainy Days are Fun" ("晴天雨天都不好玩"). *Fables of Our Time (現代寓言)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1994.

- Xing Lin Zi. "New Life" ("新生"). *Sing the Song of Life (生之歌)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1995.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "No Complaining" ("無怨"). *Fables of Our Time (現代寓言)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1994.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "'O' Blood-type Personality" ("O" 型人). *Apricot Forest Essays (杏林小記)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1979.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Old Soldiers Never Die" ("老兵不死"). *Apricot Forest Essays (杏林小記)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1979.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Open the Eyes of the Heart" ("開啓心靈的眼睛"). *Thinking of You (相思深不深)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1993.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Parents Heart" ("天下父母心"). *The First Family in the North Pole (北極第一家)*. Taipei: Crown (台北: 皇冠), 1995.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Prayer" ("禱告"). *The Song of Life (生命之歌)*. Taipei: Eurasian Press (台北: 圓神), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "A Prayer in the Night" ("深夜的祈禱"). *Always Joyful (喜樂年年)*. Taipei: Chinese Sunday School Association (台北: 中國主日學協會), 1976.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Psalm of Life (生之頌)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1995.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Reading the List of Donors" ("解讀捐款名單"). *True Love is a Lifelong Promise (真情是一生的承諾)*. Taipei: Eurasian Press (台北: 圓神), 2000.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Reentering the Mundane World (重入紅塵)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1985.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Reflecting on the Cross" ("十字架的省思"). *Thinking of You (相思深不深)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1993.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Respect Elders" ("敬老"). *Watch Your Soul (心靈品管)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The River Li after the Disaster" ("劫後麗江"). *The Song of Life (生命之歌)*. Taipei: Eurasian Press (台北: 圓神), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Road" ("路"). *Sing the Song of Life (生之歌)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1995.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Romeo and Juliet" ("羅密歐與茱麗葉"). *Love Stories (身邊的愛情故事)*. Taipei: Crown (台北: 皇冠), 1998.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Run Away" ("逃城"). *Watch Your Soul (心靈品管)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1997.

- Xing, Lin Zi. "The Seal's Worry" ("海狗的憂慮"). *Fables of Our Time (現代寓言)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1994.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Sing the Song of Life (生之歌)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1995.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Sing the Song of Life" ("生之歌"). *Reentering the Mundane World (重入紅塵)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1985.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Smiling Life" ("微笑人生"). *The Song of Life (生命之歌)*. Taipei: Eurasian Press (台北: 圓神), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *The Song of Life 生命之歌*. Taipei: Eurasian Press (台北: 圓神), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Song of Life" ("生命之歌"). *The Song of Life (生命之歌)*. Taipei: Eurasian Press (台北: 圓神), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Song of Life is One Kind of Gospel ..... Jang Tuo Wu" ("生命的歌唱就是一種福音.....張拓蕪"). *Apricot Forest Essays (杏林小記)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1979.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Stream and the Hidden Stones" ("溪水與礁石"). *Fables of Our Time (現代寓言)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1994.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Strong Person" ("強者"). *Always Joyful (喜樂年年)*. Taipei: Chinese Sunday School Association (台北: 中國主日學協會), 1976.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Surviving the Catastrophe" ("大難不死"). *The First Family in the North Pole (北極第一家)*. Taipei: Crown (台北: 皇冠), 1995.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Tears and Laughter" ("眼淚歡笑"). *Watch Your Soul (心靈品管)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "There is Still Blue Sky out the Window" ("窗外依舊有藍天"). *The Song of Life (生命之歌)*. Taipei: Eurasian Press (台北: 圓神), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Thinking of You (相思深不深)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1993.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Thinking of You" ("相思深不深"). *Thinking of You (相思深不深)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1993.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "This Piece of Land" ("這塊土地"). *Watch Your Soul (心靈品管)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Training and Discipline" ("訓練與磨練"). *Psalm of Life (生之頌)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1995.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Treasure of Life" ("生命珍寶"). *Watch Your Soul (心靈品管)*. Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1997.

- Xing Lin Zi. *True Love is a Lifelong Promise* (真情是一生的承諾). Taipei: Eurasian Press (台北: 圓神), 2000.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Trust the Lord for Strength" ("靠主剛強"). *Psalm of Life* (生之頌). Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1995.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Unexpected Meeting" ("邂逅"). *Thinking of You* (相思深不深). Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1993.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Unforgettable True Love" ("念不完的真情"). *True Love is a Lifelong Promise* (真情是一生的承諾). Taipei: Eurasian Press (台北: 圓神), 2000.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Universe and Time" ("天地歲月"). *Reentering the Mundane World* (重入紅塵). Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1985.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Unlucky Crow" ("倒楣的烏鴉"). *Fables of Our Time* (現代寓言). Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1994.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Victory Song Series* (凱歌集). Taipei: China Christian Mission (台北: 中國信徒佈道會), 1983.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The View From the Little House" ("小樓窗景"). *Always Joyful* (喜樂年年). Taipei: Chinese Sunday School Association (台北: 中國主日學協會), 1976.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Walking as Far as the Stream Head* (行到水窮處). Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1986.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Walking Through with Grace and Ease" ("瀟灑走一回"). *Thinking of You* (相思深不深). Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1993.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Walking Willingly on this Path" ("甘心走了這樣的一條路"). *The Song of Life* (生命之歌). Taipei: Eurasian Press (台北: 圓神), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Watch Your Soul* (心靈品管). Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Weak Help Each Other" ("相濡以沫"). *The Song of Life* (生命之歌). Taipei: Eurasian Press (台北: 圓神), 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Weed's Life" ("小草的生命"). *Fables of Our Time* (現代寓言). Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1994.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "The Weed That Will Not Surrender" ("不肯投降的小草"). *Fables of Our Time* (現代寓言). Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1994.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "What Can We Do" ("我們能做什麼"). *Reentering the Mundane World* (重入紅塵). Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1985.

Xing Lin Zi. *When I was Young* (留白的青春·叛逆的歲月). Taipei: Chien-Hsing Publishing (台北: 健行文化), 1994.

\_\_\_\_\_. *Why I Didn't Kill Myself?* (為什麼我沒有自殺?). Taipei: Chien-Hsing Publishing (台北: 健行文化), 2000.

\_\_\_\_\_. "The World of the Heart" ("心的世界"). *The Song of Life* (生命之歌). Taipei: Eurasian Press (台北: 圓神), 1997.

\_\_\_\_\_. "The World of Love" ("愛的世界"). *Always Joyful* (喜樂年年). Taipei: Chinese Sunday School Association (台北: 中國主日學協會), 1976.

\_\_\_\_\_. "The World of Love" ("愛的世界"). *Sing the Song of Life* (生之歌). Taipei: Chiu-Ko Publishing (台北: 九歌文庫), 1995.

## English Language

### 1. Books

21<sup>st</sup> Century New Taiwan Mission Movement Project. Taipei: The General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, n.d..

Ahern, Emily M. *The Cult of the Dead in a Chinese Village*. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1973.

Band, Edward. *Working His Purpose Out: The History of the English Presbyterian Mission, 1847-1947*. London: Presbyterian Church of England Publishing Office, 1948.

Barr, James. *Explorations in Theology*. Vol. 7, *The Scope and Authority of the Bible*. London: SCM Press Ltd, 1980.

\_\_\_\_\_. *Fundamentalism*. London: SCM Press, 1977.

Bebbington, D. W. *Evangelicalism in Modern Britain: A History from the 1730s to the 1980s*. London: Unwin Hyman, 1989.

Bevans, Stephen B. *Models of Contextual Theology*. Maryknoll: Orbis Books, 2002.

Boff, Leonardo and Clodovis Boff. *Introducing Liberation Theology*. Translated by Paul Burns. Tunbridge Wells, Kent: Burns and Oates, 1987.

Bolton, Robert J. *Treasure Island: Church Growth Among Taiwan's Urban Minnan Chinese*. Pasadena: William Carey Library, 1976.

Bosch, David J. *Transforming Mission: Paradigm Shifts in Theology of Mission*. New York: Orbis Books, 1991.

Bowker, John. *Problems of Suffering in the Religions of the World*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1970.

- Brief Introduction to the Republic of China*. Taipei: Republic of China Government Information Office, 1998.
- Broomhall, Marshall. *The Jubilee Story of the China Inland Mission*. London: Morgan & Scott, Ltd., MCMXV.
- Bullard, Monte R. *The Soldier and the Citizen: The Role of the Military in Taiwan's Development*. London: M.E. Sharpe, 1997.
- Burrows, William R. *Redemption and Dialogue: Reading Redeptoris Missio and Dialogue and Proclamation*. Maryknoll: Orbis Books, 1994.
- Carter, Paul A. *The Decline and Revival of the Social Gospel: Social and Political Liberalism in American Protestant Churches, 1920-1940*. Connecticut: Archon Books, 1971.
- Carver, Ann and Sung Sheng Yvonne Chang. *Bamboo Shoots After the Rain: Contemporary Stories by Women Writers of Taiwan*. New York: The Feminist Press, 1990.
- Chen, James. *Meet Brother Nee*. Translated by G. K. Leung. Hong Kong: The Christian Publishers, 1976.
- Cheung, Dominic and Michelle Yeh, ed. *Exiles and Native Sons: Modern Chinese Short Stories from Taiwan*. Taipei: National Institute for Compilation and Translation, 1992.
- Cheung, Dominic, ed. *The Isle Full of Noises: Modern Chinese Poetry from Taiwan*. Translated by Dominic Cheung. New York: Columbia University Press, 1987.
- Ching, Julia. *Confucianism and Christianity: A Comparative Study*. Tokyo: Kodansha International, 1977.
- Christian Responsibility on a Changing Planet: Report of the Fifth World Order Study Conference, Cleveland Ohio, November 18-21, 1958*. New York: The Department of International Affairs of the National Council of Churches of Christ in the U.S.A., 1958.
- Chuang-tzu (莊子). *The Writings of Kwang-zze: XVII, ii. 9*. Translated by James Legge. In *Sacred Books of the East*. Vol. 39. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1891.
- Coe, Shoki. *Recollections and Reflections*. Edited by Boris Anderson. Taiwan: The Rev. Dr. Shoki Coe's Memorial Fund, 1993.
- Cohen, Marc J. *The Unknown Taiwan*. Taipei: The Coalition for Democracy and the North American Taiwanese Women's Association, 1992.
- Confucius (孔子). *Analects 6.20*. Translated by Leonard A. Lyall. In *The Sayings of Confucius*. London: Longmans, Green & Company, 1935.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Analects 15:1*. Translated by Arthur Waley. In *The Analects of Confucius*. London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd., 1949.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Analects 17:25*. ed. John B. Khu and others. In *The Confucian Bible*. Philippines: Granhill Corporation, 1991.

- David, Brother. *Walking the Hard Road: Wang Ming-Tao*. London: Marshall Pickering, 1989.
- Duff, Alexander. *The Church of Scotland's India Mission: or a Brief Exposition of the Principles on which that Mission has been Conducted in Calcutta, Being the Substance of an Address Delivered Before the General Assembly of the Church, on Monday, May 25<sup>th</sup> 1835*. Edinburgh: Waugh and Innes, 1835.
- Duke, Michael S. *Worlds of Chinese Fiction: Short Stories and Novella's from the People's Republic, Taiwan, and Hong Kong*. London: M.E. Sharpe, 1991.
- Dunn, G.T. *Formosa: Fields for Reaping*. London: China Inland Mission, 1954.
- England, John C. *Living Theology in Asia*. Edited by John C. England. London: SCM Press, Ltd, 1981.
- Evans, E. W. Price. *Timothy Richard: A Narrative of Christian Enterprise and Statesmanship in China*. London: The Carey Press, 1945.
- Feng, Yuan-Chun. *A Short History of Classical Chinese Literature*. Translated by Yang Hsien-Yi and Gladys Yang. Peking: Foreign Languages Press, 1958.
- Freytag, Justus. *The Church in Villages of Taiwan: The Impact of Modern Society and Folk Religion on Rural Churches*. Tainan: Tainan Theological College Research Center, 1969.
- Garrett, Shirley S. *Social Reformers in Urban China: The Chinese YMCA, 1895-1926*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1970.
- Gladden, Washington. *Social Salvation*. London: James Clarke and Company, 1902.
- Guinness, M. Geraldine. *The Story of the China Inland Mission*. Vol. 1. London: Morgan and Scott, 1893.
- Gutierrez, Gustavo. *Gustavo Gutierrez Essential Writings*. Edited by James B. Nickoloff. Maryknoll: Orbis Books, 2003.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *We Drink from Our Own Wells: The Spiritual Journey of a People*. Translated by Matthew J. O'Connell. London: SCM Press Ltd., 1984.
- Harrell, Stevan. *Ploughshare Village: Culture and Context in Taiwan*. Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1982.
- Hazelton, Anne. *Come Wind, Come Weather: The Story of the Year 1950*. London: China Inland Mission, 1951.
- Henry, Carl F. H. *The Uneasy Conscience of Modern Fundamentalism*. Grand Rapids: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1947.
- Hopkins, Charles Howard. *The Rise of the Social Gospel in American Protestantism: 1865-1915*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1967.
- Huang Po-Ho. *A Theology of Self-Determination: Responding to the Hope for "Chhut Thau Thi" of the People in Taiwan*. Tainan Taiwan: Chhut Thau Thi Theological Study Center, 1996.

- Hughes, Christopher. *Taiwan and Chinese Nationalism: National Identity and Status in an International Setting*. London: Routledge, 1997.
- Hughes, E. R. *Religion in China*. London: Hutchinson House, 1950.
- Hughley, J. Neal. *Trends in Protestant Social Idealism*. New York: King's Crown Press, 1948.
- Hunker, W. Carl. *Taiwan: Unfinished Revolution*. Nashville: Convention Press, 1970.
- Hwang, C. H. *Joint Action for Mission in Formosa: A Call for Advance into a New Era*. Geneva: World Council of Churches, 1968.
- Jean Miller Schmidt, *Souls or the Social Order: The Two Party System in American Protestantism*. New York: Carlson Publishing, Inc., 1991.
- Johnston, James. *The Story of the Mission of the Presbyterian Church of England*. London: Hazell, Watson, & Viney, 1897.
- Johnstone, Patrick. *Operation World*. Carlisle: O.M. Publishing, 1993.
- Johnstone, Patrick, Robyn Johnstone and Jason Mandryk. *Operation World: 21<sup>st</sup> Century Edition*. Carlisle U.K.: Paternoster Publishing, 2001.
- Jones, Charles Brewer *Buddhism in Taiwan: Religion and State 1660-1990*. Honolulu, University of Hawaii Press, 1999.
- Jones, Clara J. *Christ Calls the Chinese*. Taipei: Dixon Press, n.d..
- Jordan, David K. *Gods, Ghosts, and Ancestors: The Folk Religion of a Taiwanese Village*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1972.
- Kinnear, Angus I. *Against the Tide: The Story of Watchman Nee*. Eastbourne, U.K.: Victory Press, 1973.
- Lai, Monica and T.C. Lai, ed. *Rhapsodic Essays from the Chinese*. Hong Kong: Kelly & Walsch Ltd., 1979.
- Lambert, Tony. *The Resurrection of the Chinese Church*. Wheaton: Harold Shaw Publishers, 1994.
- Latourette, Kenneth Scott. *A History of Christian Missions in China*. London: Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge, 1929.
- Legge, James. *Christianity and Confucianism Compared for their Teaching on the Whole Duty of Man*. London: Religious Tract Society, n.d..
- Levenson, Joseph R. *Liang Ch'i-ch'ao and the Mind of Modern China*. London: Thames and Hudson, 1953.
- Levine Daniel H. *Popular Voices in Latin American Catholicism*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1992.

- Liao, David C. E. *The Unresponsive: Resistant or Neglected*. Chicago: Moody Press, 1972.
- Lotus Flower of the Heart: Thirty Years of Tzu Chi Photographs*. Edited by Douglas Shaw. Translated by Lin Shen-shou. Taipei: Still Thoughts Cultural Mission Co., Ltd., 1997.
- Lyall, Leslie. *Three of China's Mighty Men*. Kent, England: OMF International, 2000.
- Machen, J. Gresham. *What is Faith?*. London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1925.
- Marsden, George. *Reforming Fundamentalism: Fuller Seminary and the New Evangelicalism*. William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company: Grand Rapids, 1987.
- Marty Martin E. *The Modern Schism: Three Paths to the Secular*. London: SCM Press Ltd., 1969.
- May, Henry F. *Protestant Churches and Industrial America*. New York: Octagon Books, 1977.
- Mencius (孟子). *Book Six*. Translated by Lionel Giles. In *The Book of Mencius*. London: John Murray, 1942.
- Moberg, David O. *The Great Reversal: Evangelism versus Social Concern*. London: Scripture Union, 1972.
- Nee, Watchman. *Character of the Lord's Worker*. Anaheim, California: Living Stream Ministry, 1994.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Love Not the World*. London: Victory Press, 1968.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Ministry of God's Word*. Nigeria: International Pulpit Aid Ministries, n.d..
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Normal Christian Church Life*. Colorado Springs, International Students Press, 1969.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Release of the Spirit*. Chichester, England: New Wine Press, 1965.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Sit, Walk, Stand*. London: Victory Press, 1971.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Song of Songs*. Translated by Elizabeth K. Mei and Daniel Smith. London: Christian Literature Society, 1965.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Spiritual Man*. Vol. 1. New York: Christian Fellowship Publishers Inc., 1977.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Through the Year with Watchman Nee*. Eastbourne, England: Victory Press, 1977.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *What Shall This Man Do*. London: Victory Press, 1965.
- Neighbour, Ralph W. Jr. *Where Do we Go From Here?: A Guidebook for the Cell Group Church*. Houston: Touch Publications, Inc., 1990.
- Patterson, Bob E. *Carl F. H. Henry*. Waco, Texas: Word Books, 1983.
- Pixley, Jorge and Clodovis Boff. *The Bible, the Church and the Poor: Biblical, Theological and Pastoral Aspects of the Option for the Poor*. Translated by Paul Burns. Tunbridge Wells, Kent: Burns & Oates, 1989.

- Pollard, David. *The Chinese Essay*. London: Hurst and Company, 2000.
- Raber, Dorothy A. *Protestantism in Changing Taiwan: A Call to Creative Response*. Pasadena: William Carey Library, 1978.
- Rauschenbusch, Walter. *Christianity and the Social Crisis*. New York: The MacMillan Company, 1912.
- Reichelt, Karl Ludvig. *Religion in Chinese Garment*. Translated by Joseph Tetlie. London: Lutterworth Press, 1951.
- Report of Conference on The Church in China Today: The Report of a Conference of Christian Workers with Dr. John R. Mott, Chairman of the International Missionary Council, January 5-7, 1926*. Shanghai: National Christian Council of China, 1926.
- Richard, Timothy. *Conversion by the Million in China: Being Biographies and Articles by Rev. Timothy Richard, Litt.D., Member of the English Baptist Mission, Secretary of the Christian Literature Society, Mandarin Rank First Button*. Vol. 2. Shanghai: Christian Literature Society, 1907.
- Rowley H. H. *Submission in Suffering and other Essays on Eastern Thought*. Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 1951.
- Rubinstein, Murray. *The Protestant Community on Modern Taiwan: Mission, Seminary, and Church*. London: M.E. Sharpe, 1991.
- Scherer, James A. *Gospel Church & Kingdom: Comparative Studies in World Mission Theology*. Minneapolis: Augsburg Publishing House, 1987.
- Schmidt, Jean Miller. *Souls or the Social Order: The Two Party System in American Protestantism*. New York: Carlson Publishing, Inc., 1991.
- Senner, E. L. and C. M. Kao. *Growth and Non Growth*. Taipei: Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, 1986.
- Smith, H. Shelton, Handy, Robert T. Handy and Lefferts A. Loetscher. *American Christianity: An Historical Interpretation with Representative Documents, 1820-1960*. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1963.
- Smith, Timothy L. *Revivalism and Social Reform: American Protestantism on the Eve of the Civil War*. Massachusetts: Peter Smith, 1976.
- Song, C. S. *Believing Heart*. Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1999.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Christian Mission in Reconstruction: An Asian Attempt*. Madras: The Christian Literature Society, 1975.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Compassionate God*. New York: Orbis Books, 1982.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Jesus and the Reign of God*. Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1993.

- \_\_\_\_\_. *Jesus in the Power of the Spirit*. Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1994.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Tears of Lady Meng: A Parable of a People's Political Theology*. Geneva: World Council of Churches, 1981.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Theology from the Womb of Asia of Asia*. London: SCM Press Ltd., 1988.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Third Eye Theology: Theology in Formation in Asian Settings*. London: Lutterworth Press, 1980.
- Stone, Jon R. *On the Boundaries of American Evangelicalism*. London: MacMillan Press Ltd., 1997.
- Stott, John. *Issues Facing Christians Today*. Hants, U.K.: Marshal Morgan & Scott, 1984.
- Swanson, Allen J. *Church in Taiwan: Profile 1980*. Pasadena: William Carey Library, 1981.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *I Will Build My Church: Ten Case Studies of Church Growth in Taiwan*. Pasadena: William Carey Library, 1977.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Mending the Nets: Taiwan Church Growth and Loss in the 1980s*. Pasadena: William Carey Press, 1986.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Taiwan: Mainline versus Independent Church Growth, a Study in Contrasts*. Pasadena: William Carey Library, n.d..
- Tang, Xiaobing. *Global Space and the Nationalist of Modernity: The Historical Thinking of Liang Qichao*. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1996.
- Ten Thousand Lotus Blossoms of the Heart: Dharma Master Cheng Yen and the Tzu Chi World*. Edited by Douglas Shaw. Taipei: Shih Cheng Yen, 2001.
- Theological Education in North-East Asia: Report of the Seoul Consultation 28<sup>th</sup> November – 2<sup>nd</sup> December 1966*. Geneva: Theological Education Fund, World Council of Churches, 1967.
- Thompson, Phyllis. *Sent to Heal: The Medical Missionary Association, 1878-1978*. London: Medical Missionary Association, 1978.
- Tin, John Jyigiokk. *Christianity in Taiwan*. Edited by T.K. Thomas. Singapore: Christian Conference of Asia, 1979.
- Tong, Hollington K. *Christianity in Taiwan: A History*. Taipei: China Post, 1961.
- Walls, Andrew F. *The Missionary Movement in Christian History: Studies in the Transmission of the Faith*. Maryknoll: Orbis Books, 1997.
- White, Ronald C., Jr. and Hopkins, C. Howard. *The Social Gospel: Religion and Reform in Changing America*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1976.
- Whyte, Bob. *Unfinished Encounter: China and Christianity*. Glasgow: William Collins Son and Co. Ltd., 1988.

- William G. McLoughlin Jr., *Modern Revivalism: Charles Grandison Finney to Billy Graham*. New York: The Ronald Press Company, 1959.
- Wilson, Kenneth L. *Angel at Her Shoulder: Lillian Dickson and her Taiwan Mission*. London: Harper & Row, Publishers, 1964.
- Wilt, Idema and Lloyd Haft. *A Guide to Chinese Literature*. Ann Arbor: Center for Chinese at the University of Michigan, 1977.
- Wong Ming-dao. *Day by Day*. Translated by Arthur Reynolds. Crowborough, England: Highland Books, 1989.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Stone Made Smooth*. Southampton, England: Mayflower Christian Books, 1981.
- Wu Yung. *Fire Within: An Autobiography by Wu Yong*. Edited by Fay Goddard. Taipei: A & D Publishing House, Ltd., 1999.
- Xing, Jun. *Baptized in the Fire of Revolution: The American Social Gospel and the YMCA in China: 1919-1937*. London: Associated University Presses, 1996.
- Yang, Maysing H. ed. *Give Taiwan a Chance*. Taipei: The Democratic Progressive Party, 1996.
- Yeh, Michelle. *Anthology of Modern Chinese Poetry*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1992.

## 2. Articles

- "About Master Cheng Yen." In Cheng Yen. *Still Thoughts*. Vol. 1. Edited by Douglas Shaw. Translated by Lin Chia-hui. Taipei: Tzu Chi Cultural Publishing Co., 1996.
- Adams, Richard. "Charismatic Influence in Taiwan: A Pentecostal Perspective." *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 5, no. 4 (1996).
- Amundson, D. W. "Suffering." In *New Dictionary of Theology*. Edited by Sinclear B. Ferguson and David F. Wright. Leicester: Intervarsity Press, 1988.
- Anderson, Boris. "First Taiwanese Principal of Tainan Theological College: Dr. Shoki Coe." In *Theology and the Church* 21, no. 2 (June 1996).
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Introduction." in Shoki Coe, *Recollections and Reflections*. Edited by Boris Anderson. Taiwan: The Rev. Dr. Shoki Coe's Memorial Fund, 1993.
- Anderson, Gerald H. and Thomas F. Stransky. In "From Israel to Asia – A Theological Leap." *Mission Trends No. 3: Third World Theologies*. Edited by Gerald H. Anderson and Thomas F. Stransky. New York: Paulist Press, 1976.
- Arndt, Thomas M. "Taiwan Christian Service." In *Taiwan Christian Yearbook 1964: A Survey of the Christian Movement in Taiwan from 1961-1964*. Taiwan: The Taiwan Missionary Fellowship, 1964.
- Barnard, Leslie. "Last Fifty Years Events of Significance in Taiwan." *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 11, no. 1 (2001).

Barnard, Thelma Lang "Editorial." *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 10, no. 2 & 3 (Fall/Winter 2000, 2001).

Baronsfeather, C. G. S. "Old and New Theology: To the Editor of The *Chinese Recorder*." *Chinese Recorder* 52 (August 1921).

Bays, Daniel H. "Ch'eng Ching-Yi (Cheng Jingyi)." In *Biographical Dictionary of Christian Missions*, 1998 ed..

\_\_\_\_\_. "Nee, (Henry) Watchman (or Ni To-sheng; Ni Tuo-sheng)." In *Biographical Dictionary of Christian Missions*, 1998 ed..

Beeby, H. Dan. "Memories of the College in Memory of Shoki." In *Theology and the Church* 21, no. 2 (June 1996).

Buttrey, Paul. "Year 2000 Gospel Movement: A Mid-decade Review." *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 5, no. 3 (1996).

Chan, Wing-tsit. "Confucian Thought." *The Encyclopedia of Religion*. Edited by Mircea Eliade. New York: MacMillan Publishing Company, 1987.

Chang, Winnie. "Daily Source of Good Writing." *The Free China Review*, April 1991.

Chao, T. C. "Chinese Student and the Christian Church." In *The China Mission Yearbook, 1923*. Edited by Frank Rawlinson. Shanghai, Christian Literature Society, 1923.

\_\_\_\_\_. "Christianity and the National Crisis." *Chinese Recorder* 68 (January 1937).

\_\_\_\_\_. "Church." In *As it Looks to Young China*. Edited by William Hung. London: Student Christian Movement Press, 1932.

\_\_\_\_\_. "Future of the Church in Social and Economic Thought and Action." In *The Christian Movement in China in a Period of National Transition: Three Papers Prepared at the Request of the Department of Social and Industrial Research for the Tambaram Meeting of the International Missionary Council*. India: The Wesley Press and Publishing House, 1938.

\_\_\_\_\_. "Have We Done Justice to the Church?." *Chinese Recorder* 72 (October 1941).

\_\_\_\_\_. "Indigenous Church." *Chinese Recorder* 56 (August 1925).

\_\_\_\_\_. "Life of Christ." Translated by D. Willard Lyon. In "D. Willard Lyon, "Professor T. C. Chao on Jesus' Sense of His Own Mission." *Chinese Recorder* 71 (February 1940).

\_\_\_\_\_. "Meaning of the Church." *Chinese Recorder* 66 (October 1935).

\_\_\_\_\_. "Religious Situation in China." *Chinese Recorder* 61 (November 1930).

\_\_\_\_\_. "What the Chinese are Thinking About Christianity." *Chinese Recorder* 51 (November 1920).

- Chao, Jonathan. "Response to Dr. Ingram S. Seah's Article: 'Christian Faith in Recent Taiwan Experience.'" In *Taiwan Journal of Theology* 13 (March 1991).
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Ten Major Movements in Chinese Church History, 1900-2000." *China and the Gospel Quarterly* 1, no. 2 (April-June 2001).
- Chen Chung-ying, "Mencius (Mengzi, Mengtzu)." In *The Encyclopedia of Chinese Philosophy*. Edited by Antonio S. Cua. London: Routledge, 2003.
- Chen Hwei Hung. "Study on Exodus." In *Yu Shan Theological Journal*, no. 6 (May 1999).
- Chen Nan-jou. "Challenges and Mission of the Christian Churches in the Changing Society of Taiwan Today." In *Yu Shan Theological Journal* 8, May 2001.
- Chen Nan-jou. "Human Rights, Human Dignity, and the Mission of the Churches Amidst a Changing Asia." *Taiwan Journal of Theology*, no. 21 (1999).
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Involvement of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan on the Issue of the Future of Taiwan – A Theological Reflection." *Asian Journal of Theology* 9, no. 2 (1995).
- Cheng, C. Y. "Spiritual Preparedness of the Christian Church in China to Meet the Present Situation." In *Report of Conference on The Church in China Today: The Report of a Conference of Christian Workers with Dr. John R. Mott, Chairman of the International Missionary Council, January 5-7, 1926*. Shanghai: National Christian Council of China, 1926.
- "Cheng Jingyi." In *A Dictionary of Asian Christianity*, 2001 ed..
- Cheng, Robert L. "Language Unification in Taiwan: Present and Future." In *The Other Taiwan: 1945 to the Present*. Edited by Murray A. Rubinstein. London: M.E. Sharpe, 1994.
- Cheng Yang-en. "Building a Harmonious Society in Taiwan – An Analysis from the Ideological Perspective." *Taiwan Journal of Theology* 18 (1996).
- Cheng Yang-en. "Historical Review of Christianity in Taiwan at the Turn of the Century." *Taiwan Journal of Theology* 20 (1998).
- Chi, Pang-Yuen. "Taiwan Literature, 1945-1999." In *Chinese Literature in the Second Half of a Modern Century*. Edited by Pang Yuen Chi and David Der-Wei Wang. Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2000.
- Chiang, Madame Kai-shek. "Easter Meditation." In *Selected Speeches: 1958-1959*. Taipei: The Office of the President, 1959.
- "China Inland Mission." In *A Century of Protestant Missions in China, 1807-1907: The Centenary Conference Historical Volume*. Edited by D. MacGillivray. Shanghai: The American Presbyterian Mission Press, 1907.
- "Chinese Christian Workers Conference at Peitaiho and Kuling." *Chinese Recorder* 63 (Oct 1932).
- Ching, Julia. "Confucianism: Ethical Humanism and Religion." In *Christianity and Chinese Religions*. Edited by Hans Kung and Julia Ching. London: Doubleday, 1988.

- Chiu Milton M. "Taiwanese Religions." *The Encyclopedia of Religion*. Edited by Mircea Eliade. New York: MacMillan Publishing Company, 1987.
- Chong, M. C. "Presbyterian Church of Formosa." In *Taiwan Christian Yearbook, 1968: A Survey of the Christian Movement in Taiwan 1965-1968*. Taiwan: Taiwan Missionary Fellowship, 1968.
- Choy, Theodore and Choy, Leona Francis. "Wang Ming-dao: The Man Iron Turned to Steel." In *Wang Ming-dao, A Call to the Church*. Translated by Theodore Choy. Edited by Leona F. Choy. Pennsylvania: Christian Literature Crusade, 1983.
- Chu Hai-yuan. "Taiwanese Society in Transition: Reconciling Confucianism and Pluralism." In *The Other Taiwan: 1945 to the Present*. Edited by Murray A. Rubinstein. London: M.E. Sharpe, 1994.
- Chu, Yen. "Sociocultural Change in Taiwan as Reflected in Short Fiction." In *Cultural Change in Postwar Taiwan*. Edited by Stevan Harrell and Huang Chun-Chieh. Oxford: Westview Press, 1994.
- Chuang, Tsu-Kung. "China (Taiwan)." *Evangelical Dictionary of World Missions*. Edited by Scott Moreau. Grand Rapids: Baker Books, 2000.
- "Church World Service/Lutheran World Relief Report." In *Taiwan Christian Yearbook, 1960: A Survey of the Christian Movement in Taiwan During 1959 with Special Attention to the Ten Years from 1949-1959*. Taiwan: Taiwan Missionary Fellowship, 1960.
- Coe, Shoki. "Contextualization as the Way Toward Reform." In *Recollections and Reflections*. Edited by Boris Anderson. Taiwan: The Rev. Dr. Shoki Coe's Memorial Fund, 1993.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Contextualizing Theology." In *Mission Trends No. 3: Third World Theologies*. Edited by Gerald H. Anderson and Thomas F. Stransky. New York: Paulist Press, 1976.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "What is Theological Education all About?: 3rd August 1987 at Tainan Theological College." *Asian Journal of Theology* 2, no. 2 (1988).
- Collignon, James A. "Catholic Church in Taiwan, an Interpretive Essay." In Allen J. Swanson, *The Church in Taiwan: Profile 1980*. Pasadena: William Carey Library, 1981.
- "Confession of Faith of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan." In *Public Statements*. Taipei: The General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, 2002.
- "Confucianism." In *Encyclopedia of Eastern Philosophy and Religion*. Edited by Stephen Schumacher and Gert Woermer. Boston: Shambhala, 1989.
- Copland, E. Bruce. "Presbyterian Church of Formosa." In *Taiwan Christian Yearbook, 1960: A Survey of the Christian Movement in Taiwan During 1959 with Special Attention to the Ten Years from 1949-1959*. Taiwan: Taiwan Missionary Fellowship, 1960.
- Costas, Orlando E. "Evangelical Theology In the Two-Thirds World." In *Earthen Vessels: American Evangelicals and Foreign Missions, 1880-1890*. Edited by Joel A. Carpenter and Wilbert R. Shenk. Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1990.

- Courson, Jim. "Taiwan's Independent Churches: A Study in Contrasts." *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 6, no. 2 (Winter 1997).
- Cousineau, Madeleine R. "Preferential Option for the Poor." In *Encyclopedia of Religion and Society*. Edited by William H. Swatos, Jr. London: Altamira Press, 1998.
- Covell, Ralph. "Richard, Timothy." In *A Dictionary of Asian Christianity*, 2001 ed..
- \_\_\_\_\_. *Pentecost in the Hills of Taiwan*. Pasadena: Hope Publishing House, 1998.
- "Declaration on Human Rights by The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan." In *Public Statements. Taipei: The General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan*, 2002.
- Dickey, Brian. "Going About Doing Good: Evangelicals and Poverty." In *Evangelical Faith and Public Zeal: Evangelicals and Society in Britain, 1780-1890*. Edited by John Wolffe. London: SPCK, 1995.
- Dolan, Dave. "Chinese Christian Prayer Mountain." *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 5, no. 4 (1996).
- "DPP's Position on Ethnic Policy." In *Give Taiwan A Chance*. Edited by Maysing H. Yang. Taipei: the Democratic Progressive Party, 1996.
- "Eden Social Welfare Foundation." In *Directory of 300 Major Foundations in Taiwan*. Taipei: Himalaya Foundation, 1999.
- "Editorial," *Chinese Recorder* 51 (September 1920).
- "Editorial: Question of Fundamentals." *Chinese Recorder* 63 (July 1932).
- Ekeland, T. "To the Editor of the *Chinese Recorder*." *Chinese Recorder* 52 (October 1921).
- Ellis, H.T. "New Life in the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan." *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 1, no. (1991).
- "Explanatory Notes." In Watchman Nee, *The Spiritual Man*, Vol. 1. New York: Christian Fellowship Publishers Inc., 1977.
- Fairbank, John K. "Introduction." In *Christianity in China: Early Protestant Missionary Writings*. Edited by Suzanne Wilson Barnett and John King Fairbank. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1985.
- Farley, Benjamin Wirt. "Providence of God." In *Encyclopedia of the Reformed Faith*, 1992 ed..
- Feuchtwang, Stephen. "City Temples in Taipei Under Three Regimes." In *The Chinese City Between Two Worlds*. Edited by Mark Elvin and G. William Skinner. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1974.
- Fishburn, Janet F. "Social Gospel." In *Encyclopedia of the Reformed Faith*, 1992 ed..
- Franklin, Bill. "Charismatic Influence in Taiwan: A Conservative Evangelical Perspective." *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 5, no. 4 (1996).

- Friest, Wendell. "Cell Groups and Renewal at Truth Lutheran Church." *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 5, no. 2 (1995).
- "Fu." In *Oxford Pocket Chinese Dictionary*. Hong Kong: Oxford University Press China Ltd., 1999.
- Gates, Hill and Emily Martin Ahern. "Introduction." In *The Anthropology of Taiwanese Society*. Edited by Emily Martin Ahern and Hill Gates. Taipei: SMC Publishing, 1981.
- Gates, Hill. "Ethnicity and Social Class." In *The Anthropology of Taiwanese Society*. Edited by Emily Martin Ahern and Hill Gates. Taipei: SMC Publishing, Inc. 1981.
- Gelzer, David G. "Some Reminiscences about Shoki Coe." *Theology and the Church* 21, no. 2 (June 1996).
- "Gilded Age" In *The New Encyclopedia Britannica*. 1978 ed..
- Gold, Thomas B. "Civil Society and Taiwan's Quest for Identity." In *Cultural Change in Postwar Taiwan*. Edited by Stevan Harrell and Huang Chun-chieh. Taipei: SMC Publishing, Inc., 1994.
- Graf, Max and Waltraud. "Personal Accounts of the 921 Earthquake." Compiled by Donna MacLean. *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 9, no. 2 (1999).
- Graham, W. Fred. "Government, Civil." In *Encyclopedia of the Reformed Faith*, 1992 ed..
- Gutierrez, Gustavo. "Toward a Theology of Liberation." In *Liberation Theology: A Documentary History*. Translated by Alfred T. Hennelly. Maryknoll: Orbis Books, 1995.
- Gutman, Herbert G. "Protestantism and the American Labor Movement: The Christian Spirit In the Gilded Age." In *Modern American Protestantism and Its World: Protestantism and Social Christianity*. New York: K. G. Saur, 1992.
- Haddon, Rosemary. "Engendering Women: Taiwan's Recent Fiction by Women." In *Dress, Sex, and Text in Chinese Culture*. Edited by Antonia Finnane and Anne McLaren. Australia: Monash Asia Institute, 1999.
- Harrell, Stevan and Huang Chun-Chieh. "Introduction: Change and Contention in Taiwan's Cultural Scene." In *Cultural Change in Postwar Taiwan*. Edited by Stevan Harrell and Huang Chun-chieh. Taipei, SMC Publishing, Inc., 1994.
- Harrell, Stevan. "Culture with a Big C: Literature and the Arts." In *Cultural Change in Postwar Taiwan*. Edited by Stevan Harrell and Huang Chun-Chieh. Oxford: Westview Press, 1994.
- Hayes L. Newton. "Reading of Missionaries." *Chinese Recorder* 52 (December 1921).
- Hayward, Victor E. W. "Editorial Preface." In C. H. Hwang, *Joint Action for Mission in Formosa: A Call for Advance into a New Era*. New York: Friendship Press, 1968.
- Her, Kelly. "Challenged as the Challenger." *Free China Review*, January 1999.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Paradise Regained: Taiwan's Garden of Eden." *Free China Review*, January 1999.

- Hoste, D. E. "Why I have Joined the Bible Union of China." *Chinese Recorder* 52 (July 1921).
- Hsia, C. T. "Yen Fu and Liang Ch'i-ch'ao as Advocates of New Fiction." In *Chinese Approaches to Literature from Confucius to Liang Ch'i-ch'ao*. Edited by Adele Austin Rickett. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1978.
- Hsu, P.C. "Can the Church help in Rural Reconstruction?" *Chinese Recorder* 68 (January 1937).
- Huang Po Ho. "Presbyterian Perspective on Doing Theology in Taiwan." *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 10, no. 2-3 (Fall/Winter 2000/2001).
- Huang Po-Ho. "Searching for a Compassionate Human Community: A Taiwanese Perspective on Doing Mission in a Pluralistic Society." *Asian Journal of Theology* 7, no. 1 (1993).
- Kao, C. M. "Forward Look." In C. M. Kao and Edward Senner, *Growth and Non Growth*. Taipei: The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, 1986.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Statement on Our National Fate: Motivation Based on Faith and Theology, March 1972." In *Public Statements*. Taipei: The General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, 2002.
- Kung, Hans. "Confucianism: Ethical Humanism and Religion." In *Christianity and Chinese Religions*. Edited by Hans Kung and Julia Ching. London: Doubleday, 1988.
- Lam Wing-hung. "Nee, Watchman." In *A Dictionary of Asian Christianity*, 2001 ed..
- Lambert, Tony. "Wang Mingdao: A Christian in Conflict with the State." In *The Answer of a Good Conscience: Papers Read at the 1997 Westminster Conference*. London: The Westminster Conference, 1997.
- Lew, T. T. "What the Young Men's Christian Association has Contributed to the Chinese Church." Translated by T.K. Wong. *Chinese Recorder* 68 (February 1937).
- Liau, Tom. In Barry Owen, "Transition: One Church's Journey into Cell Groups." *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 5, No. 2 (1995).
- Lin Tsung-yi. "An Editor's Prologue." In *An Introduction to 2-28 Tragedy in Taiwan: For World Citizens*. Edited by Tsung-yi Lin. Taipei: Taiwan Renaissance Foundation Press, 1998.
- Lindsell, Harold. "Faith Missions." in *Concise Dictionary of Christian World Mission*, 1970 ed..
- Liu Mu-Sha (劉慕沙). "Days of Looking at the MRT Trains." Translated by Michelle Min-Chia Wu. *The Chinese Pen*, 25 September 1999.
- Lu, Annette Hsiu-Lien. "Women's Liberation: The Taiwanese Experience." In *The Other Taiwan: 1945 to the Present*. Edited by Murray A. Rubinstein. London: M.E. Sharpe, 1994.
- Lu Cheng-hui. "Reflections on Reality: Interview with Taiwan Writers." *Free China Review*, April 1991.
- Ma Min. "Wei, Francis C(ho) M(in)." In *Biographical Dictionary of Christian Missions*, 1998 ed..

- MacInnis, Donald E. "Wang, Ming-tao (Wang Mingdao)." In *Biographical Dictionary of Christian Missions*, 1998 ed..
- Mair, A. "Preaching Tour in Anhwei." In Marshall Broomhall, *The Jubilee Story of the China Inland Mission*. London: Morgan & Scott, Ltd., MCMXV.
- Marsden, George M. "Evangelical and Fundamental Christianity." In *The Encyclopedia of Religion*. 1987 ed..
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Gospel of Wealth, the Social Gospel, and the Salvation of Souls in Nineteenth Century America." In *Modern American Protestantism and Its World: Protestantism and Social Christianity*. New York: K. G. Saur, 1992.
- Marty, Martin E. "Editor's Preface." In Jean Miller Schmidt, *Souls or the Social Order: The Two Party System in American Protestantism*. New York: Carlson Publishing, Inc., 1991.
- McGee, Gary B. "Evangelical Movement." In *Evangelical Dictionary of World Missions*, 2000 ed..
- McWhirter, J. "Revival Movements in Manchuria." *Chinese Recorder* 64 (Dec. 1933).
- Medley, Edwin W. "Taiwan Christian Service." In *Taiwan Christian Yearbook, 1968: A Survey of the Christian Movement in Taiwan 1965-1968*. Taiwan: Taiwan Missionary Fellowship, 1968.
- Netland Harold A. "Problem of Evil in Mission." *The Evangelical Dictionary of World Mission*. Edited by A. Scott Moreau. Grand Rapids: Baker Books, 2000.
- "New Missionary Looks Around." *Chinese Recorder* 63 (March 1932).
- Ng Lee-ming. "Study of Y.T. Wu." *Ching Feng* 15, no. 1 (1972).
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Wang Ming-Tao: An Evaluation of His Thought and Action." *Ching Feng* 16, no. 2 (1973).
- "Our Appeal by the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, Concerning the Bible, the Church and the Nation." In *Public Statements*. Taipei: *The General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan*, 2002.
- "Over 8000 attend CCCOWE Night Rally." *Daily News: Chinese Congress on World Evangelization*. 11 August 1986, 8.
- Owen, Barry. "Transition: One Church's Journey into Cell Groups." *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 5, No. 2 (1995).
- Pfister, Lauren. "Mackay, George Leslie." *Evangelical Dictionary of World Missions*. Edited by A. Scott Moreau. Grand Rapids: Baker Books, 2000.
- Piggin, S. "Duff, Alexander." *Dictionary of Scottish Church History*. Edited by Nigel M. de. S. Cameron. Edinburgh, T & T Clark, 1993.
- Powell, Scott. In "Towards the Year 2000 Conference: Reflections." *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 1, no. 1 (1991).

- "Presbyterian Church's Vision for a New Century." In *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 10, no. 2-3 (Fall/Winter 2000, 2001).
- "President Chen's Top Aide Says Playing Ethnic Politics 'Immoral.'" *China Post*, 26 April 2002.
- "Protestant Church of Taiwan Confronts the KMT." In Marc J. Cohen, *The Unknown Taiwan. Taipei: The Coalition for Democracy and the North American Taiwanese Women's Association*, 1992.
- Puckett, Thad. "Birth of a Cell Group Church." *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 5, no. 2 (1995).
- "Puzzled: A Letter from a Missionary Father to his Son." *Chinese Recorder* 55 (August 1924).
- "Puzzled: A Letter from a Missionary Son to his Father." *Chinese Recorder* 55 (July 1924).
- Rawski, Evelyn S. "Historians Approach to Death Ritual." In *Death Ritual in Late Imperial and Modern China*. Edited by James Watson and Evelyn S. Rawski. Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1988.
- "Revival Movements in Manchuria: Harbin." *Chinese Recorder* 64 (Dec. 1933).
- Ro, Bong Rin, "Preface." In *In Word and Deed: Evangelism and Social Responsibility*. Edited by Bruce Nicholls. Australia: Paternoster Press, 1985.
- Romero Oscar. "Political Dimension of the Faith from the Perspective of the Option for the Poor." In *Liberation Theology: a Documentary History*. Edited by Alfred T. Hennelly. Maryknoll: Orbis Books, 1995.
- Rubinstein, Murray A. "Taiwan Miracle." In *The Other Taiwan: 1945 to the Present*. Edited by Murray A. Rubinstein. London: M.E. Sharpe, 1994.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Outline for a Chinese Theology of Evangelism, A Missionary's Perspective." *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 1, no. 1 (1991).
- Shepherd, F. E. A. "Modernist Position: To the Editor of the *Chinese Recorder*." *Chinese Recorder* 52 (June 1921).
- Shi, Tiesheng. "Shi Tiesheng: Wheelchair Humanist." Interview with Laifong Leung. *Morning Sun: Interviews with Chinese Writers of the Lost Generation*. London: M. E. Sharp, 1994.
- Shia, James. "Continue to Sail." *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 10, no. 2 & 3 (2000, 2001).
- "Shuang." In *Oxford Pocket Chinese Dictionary*. Hong Kong: Oxford University Press China Ltd., 1999.
- Smith, C. Stanley. "Authority of The Faith." *Chinese Recorder* 71 (February 1940).
- Song, C. S. "Asian Theologies Developing out of Asian Resources." *PTCA Bulletin* Vol. 4, No. 2 (October 1991).

- \_\_\_\_\_. "Decisiveness of Christ." In *Asians and Blacks, Theological Challenges: Joseph Cook Memorial Lectures - Sixth Series, Spring 1972*. Bangkok: East Asia Christian Conference, 1972.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Election for Mission." *South East Asia Journal of Theology* 13, no. 2 (1972).
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Foreword: Pre-Confessional, Confessing, and Post-Confessional." In *Confessing Our Faith Around the World, Faith and Order Paper No. 104*. Geneva: World Council of Churches, 1980.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Freedom of Christian Theology for Asian Cultures." *PCTA Bulletin* Vol 1, No. 1 (Jan. 1988).
- \_\_\_\_\_. "From Israel to Asia – A Theological Leap." In *Mission Trends No. 3: Third World Theologies*. Edited by Gerald H. Anderson and Thomas F. Stransky. New York Paulist Press, 1976.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "God's Politics of Construction." In *Living Theology in Asia*. Edited by John C. England, London: SCM Press, Ltd, 1981.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Let Us Do Theology with Asian Resources!" *East Asia Journal of Theology* 3. no. 2 (1985).
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Role of Christology in the Christian Encounter with Other Religions." In *South East Asia Journal of Theology* 5, no. 3 (January 1964).
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Story Theology of Birth and Rebirth." *PCTA Bulletin* Vol. 6, No. 1 (Jan. 1993).
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Theological Education: A Search for A New Break Through." In *South East Asian Journal of Theology* 9, no. 4 (April 1968).
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Theology of the Incarnation." In *Asian Voices in Christian Theology*. Edited by Gerald H. Anderson. Maryknoll: Orbis Books, 1976.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "What is Christian Theology." *PCTA Bulletin* Vol. 3, No. 2 (Jan. 1990).
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Wither Protestantism in Asia Today?." *South East Asia Journal of Theology* 11 (Spring 1970).
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Witnessing to the Power of Resurrection." *Asian Journal of Theology* 1, no. 1 (1987).
- Sparham, C. G., "Principles which should Govern the Policy of Christian Missions in china in the Years Ahead." In *Report of Conference on The Church in China Today: The Report of a Conference of Christian Workers with Dr. John R. Mott, Chairman of the International Missionary Council, January 5-7, 1926*. Shanghai: National Christian Council of China, 1926.
- "Statement on Our National Fate by The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan." In *Public Statements*. Taipei: The General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, 2002.
- Stowe, David M. "Wu, Y.T. (Wu Yao-tsung)." In *Biographical Dictionary of Christian Missions*. 1998 ed..

- Strickler, Rahn. "An Interview with James Shia." *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 1, no. 1 (1991).
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Towards the Year 2000 Conference: Reflections." *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 1, no. 1 (1991).
- Su, Paul Chu Ching. "Interaction of Society and Religion in the Light of Social Change in Taiwan: The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan – Retrospect and Prospect." *Asian Journal of Theology*, 3.1. 1989.
- Sugg, Nan. "Buddhism – Taiwan Style." In *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 6, no. 4 (1997).
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Cell Group Church." *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 5, no. 2 (1995).
- "Sunday School Times and the National Christian Conference," *Chinese Recorder* 53 (September 1922).
- Syat, Yabu and William J. K. Lo. "Look at Taiwan in 2001: The Annual Report of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan." *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 11, no. 4 (2002).
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Presbyterian Church Responds to President Chen's Statement on Political Integration." *Taiwan Church News* 18, no. 1 (January-February 2001).
- Symonds, Angela. In "Towards the Year 2000 Conference: Reflections." *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 1, no. 1 (1991).
- "Taiwan, Stable Ally to US, Free World." *China Post* (Taiwan), 8 October 2001.
- Tan Khun-seng, "Prayer Mountain: Galilee Mission Center." *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 5, no. 4 (1996).
- Tang, Edmond. "Context and Contextualization." In *Pro Mundi Vita Studies*, no. 4 (July 1988).
- Tarn, Koarnhak. "Countryside of the Past." In *The Chinese Essay*. Edited by David Pollard. London: Hurst and Company, 2000.
- Taylor, Jamie. "Tribute to Wang Ming-Dao." *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 1, no 2 (October 1991).
- Thelin, Mark C. "Church on Taiwan: Challenge of the 1990's." In *Tainan Theological Review* 2, no. 1 (December 1994).
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Propagation of the Gospel, Prophesy, and Prosperity: Some Sociological Reflections on the Role of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan." *Theology and the Church* 21, no. 1 (January 1996).
- "Theological Education and Homeland Theology in Taiwan." *Pro Mundi Vita Studies*, no. 4 (July 1988).
- "Third CCCOWE Congress Begins Today." *Daily News: Chinese Congress on World Evangelization*, 6 August 1986.

- Thompson, Stuart E. "Death, Food, and Fertility." In *Death Ritual in Late Imperial and Modern China*. Edited by James L. Watson and Evelyn S. Rawski. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1988.
- Ting Kuo, "Inspection of the Taiwan 2-28 Incident – Centering Around Chen Yi and Taiwan Provincial Commanding Office." Translated by Chen Li-fu and Hsia Jung-ho. In Siau fong Lee, "Chiang Kia-shek and the 2-28 Incident: Who Should be Held Accountable?." *An Introduction to the 2-28 Tragedy in Taiwan: For World Citizens*. Edited by Tsung yi Lin. Taipei: Taiwan Renaissance Foundation Press, 1998.
- Tong, Hollington K. "If I Were a Missionary: An Address by Mr. Hollington K. Tong, Secretary to President Chiang, to the TMF Conference at the Sun Moon Lake Hotel on July 31, 1959. (Abridged)," *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 11, no. 1 (2001).
- Tony Lambert. "Wang Mingdao: A Christian in Conflict with the State." In *The Answer of a Good Conscience: Papers Read at the 1997 Westminster Conference*. London: The Westminster Conference, 1997.
- Toon, Peter. "Christology." In *Encyclopedia of the Reformed Faith*, 1992 ed..
- Trachsel, Laura E. "Taiwan Missionary Fellowship." In *Taiwan Christian Yearbook 1964: A Survey of the Christian Movement in Taiwan from 1961-1964*. Taiwan: The Taiwan Missionary Fellowship, 1964.
- "Trends and Developments in the Presbyterian Church of Taiwan." *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 9, no. 1 (Summer 1999).
- "U.S. Report on ROC Human Rights Says Political System Still Authoritarian." *China Post*, 4 February 1991.
- Van Biema, David. "When God Hides His Face" *Time Magazine*, 13 August 2001.
- Van Engen, Charles E. "Broadening Vision: Forty Years of Evangelical Theology of Mission, 1946-1986." In *Earthen Vessels: American Evangelicals and Foreign Missions, 1880-1980*. Edited by Joel A. Carpenter and Wilbert R. Shenk. Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1990.
- Walls, Andrew F. "American Dimension in the History of the Missionary Movement." In *Earthen Vessels: American Evangelicals and Foreign Missions, 1880-1980*. Edited by Joel A. Carpenter and Wilbert R. Shenk. Grand Rapids: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1990.
- Wang Hsien-chih. "Some Perspectives on Homeland Theology in the Taiwanese Context." In *Frontiers in Asian Christian Theology: Emerging Trends*. Edited by R. S. Sugirtharajah. Maryknoll: Orbis Books, 1994.
- Wang Ming-dao. "Determination." In *A Call to the Church*. Translated by Theodore Choy. Edited by Leona F. Choy. Pennsylvania: Christian Literature Crusade, 1983.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Look at God's Servant." In *A Call to the Church*. Translated by Theodore Choy. Edited by Leona F. Choy. Pennsylvania: Christian Literature Crusade, 1983.

- \_\_\_\_\_. "Looking at One who Cared for the Poor." In *Chinese Church Iron-Man Wang Ming-Dao Looks at These People*. Translated by Evelyn B. Solomon. Taiwan: Conservative Baptist Press, 1988.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Missing Voice." In *A Call to the Church*. Translated by Theodore Choy. Edited by Leona F. Choy. Pennsylvania: Christian Literature Crusade, 1983.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Obey God or Men?" In *A Call to the Church*. Translated by Theodore Choy. Edited by Leona F. Choy. Pennsylvania: Christian Literature Crusade, 1983.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Silent Witness." In *Chinese Church Iron-Man Wang Ming-Dao Looks at These People*. Translated by Evelyn B. Solomon. Taiwan: Conservative Baptist Press, 1988.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Strange Men and Amazing Miracles." In *A Call to the Church*. Translated by Theodore Choy. Edited by Leona F. Choy. Pennsylvania: Christian Literature Crusade, 1983.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Success and Embroidered Pillows" In *A Call to the Church*. Translated by Theodore Choy. Edited by Leona F. Choy. Pennsylvania: Christian Literature Crusade, 1983.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "They Had No Fear of Death." In *The Voice of China's Christians: Pathway to Glory*. Edited by Arthur Reynolds. London: Overseas Missionary Fellowship, 1972.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Touchstone of Obedience." In *A Call to the Church*. Translated by Theodore Choy. Edited by Leona F. Choy. Pennsylvania: Christian Literature Crusade, 1983.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "When Christ Stands Up." In *A Call to the Church*. Translated by Theodore Choy. Edited by Leona F. Choy. Pennsylvania: Christian Literature Crusade, 1983.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Young Opportunist." In *A Call to the Church*. Translated by Theodore Choy. Edited by Leona F. Choy. Pennsylvania: Christian Literature Crusade, 1983.
- Wang, Chang-lin. "Daily Source of Good Writing." Interviewed by Winnie Chang. *The Free China Review*, April 1991.
- Wang, David Der-Wei. "Introduction." In *Chinese Literature in the Second Half of a Modern Century*. Edited by Pang Yuan Chi and David Der-Wei Wang. Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2000.
- Wang, Meng. "Preface." In *Fragrant Weeds: Chinese Short Stories Once Labeled as "Poisonous Weeds"*. Translated by Geremie Barme and Bennett Lee. Edited by W.J.F. Jenner. Hong Kong: Joint Publishing Company, 1983.
- Wang, Peter Chen-Main. "Christianity in Modern Taiwan: Struggling over the Path of Contextualization." In *China and Christianity: Burdened Past, Hopeful Future*. Edited by Stephen Uhalley, Jr. and Xiaoxin Wu. London: M. E. Sharpe, 2001.
- Watson, James L. "Structure of Chinese Funerary Rites: Elementary Forms, Ritual Sequence, and the Primacy of Performance." In *Death Ritual in Late Imperial and Modern China*. Edited by James Watson and Evelyn S. Rawski. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1988.

- Wei, Ben Jui-Ming. "Preface to the Second Edition." in Shoki Coe, *Recollections and Reflections*. Edited by Boris Anderson. Taiwan: The Rev. Dr. Shoki Coe's Memorial Fund, 1993.
- Wei, Francis. "Making Christianity Indigenous in China." In *Report of Conference on The Church in China Today: The Report of a Conference of Christian Workers with Dr. John R. Mott, Chairman of the International Missionary Council, January 5-7, 1926*. Shanghai: National Christian Council of China, 1926.
- Weller, Robert P. "Identity and Social Change in Taiwanese Religion." In *Taiwan a New History*. Edited by Murray A. Rubenstein. London: M.E. Sharpe, 1999.
- "What is the 'Year 2000 Gospel Movement?'" *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 1, no. 1, (1991).
- Wheeler, Ray "Legacy of Shoki Coe." In *International Bulletin of Missionary Research* 26, no. 2 (April 2002).
- Winckler, Edwin A. "Cultural Policy on Postwar Taiwan." In *Cultural Change in Postwar Taiwan*. Edited by Stevan Harrell and Huang Chun-chieh. Taipei: SMC Publishing, Inc., 1994.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "National, Regional, and Local Politics." In *The Anthropology of Taiwanese Society*. Edited by Emily Martin Ahern and Hill Gates. Taipei: SMC Publishing, 1981.
- Wolf, Arthur P. "God's, Ghosts, and Ancestors." In *Studies in Chinese Society*. Edited by Arthur P. Wolf. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1978.
- Wong Ming-dao. "Dangers in the Present Day Church." In *Spiritual Food*. Translated by Arthur Reynolds. Southampton, England: Mayflower Christian Books, 1983.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Distinctive Colour of Heaven." In *Spiritual Food*. Translated by Arthur Reynolds. Southampton, England: Mayflower Christian Books, 1983.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Do Not Only Seek Your Own Interests." In *Spiritual Food*. Translated by Arthur Reynolds. Southampton, England: Mayflower Christian Books, 1983.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Great Prophet and a Self-Abasing Commander." In *Spiritual Food*. Translated by Arthur Reynolds. Southampton, England: Mayflower Christian Books, 1983.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Light of the World." In *Spiritual Food*. Translated by Arthur Reynolds. Southampton, England: Mayflower Christian Books, 1983.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Repenting and Believing." In *Spiritual Food*. Translated by Arthur Reynolds. Southampton, England: Mayflower Christian Books, 1983.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Temptation after Success." In *Spiritual Food*. Translated by Arthur Reynolds. Southampton, England: Mayflower Christian Books, 1983.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Those Who Deserve to be Accursed." In *Spiritual Food*. Translated by Arthur Reynolds. Southampton, England: Mayflower Christian Books, 1983.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Understanding and Doing the Will of God." In *Spiritual Food*. Translated by Arthur Reynolds. Southampton, England: Mayflower Christian Books, 1983.

- \_\_\_\_\_. "Wise Leader." In *Spiritual Food*. Translated by Arthur Reynolds. Southampton, England: Mayflower Christian Books, 1983.
- Wong, Timothy Ka-ying. "Impact of State Development in Taiwan on Cross-Straits Relations." *Asian Perspective* 21, no. 1, (1997).
- Woodward, David B. "Taiwan." In *The Church in Asia*. Edited by Donald e. Hoke. Chicago: Moody Press, 1975.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Written Word." In *Taiwan Christian Yearbook, 1968: A Survey of the Christian Movement in Taiwan 1965-1968*. Taiwan: Taiwan Missionary Fellowship, 1968.
- "Work and Workers." *Chinese Recorder* 63 (April 1932).
- Wu, Emma. "Mirrors of the Soul and Spirit." *Free China Review* (April 1991).
- Wu, Y. T. "Christianity and China's Reconstruction." *Chinese Recorder* 67 (April 1936).
- \_\_\_\_\_. "How One Christian Looks at the Five Year Movement." *Chinese Recorder* 61 (March 1930).
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Jesus As I Know Him: Chapter III, My Conception of the Universe and of Life Since I Knew Jesus." *Chinese Recorder* 61 (March 1930).
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Make Christianity Socially Dynamic." *Chinese Recorder* 65 (January 1934).
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Present-Day Tragedy of Christianity." In *Documents of the Three-Self Movement: Source Materials for the Study of the Protestant Church in Communist China*. Edited by Wallace C. Merwin and Francis P. Jones. National Council of the Church of Christ in The USA, Far Eastern Office Division of Foreign Missions, 1963.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Should Christianity Concern Itself in Social Reconstruction." *Chinese Recorder* 68 (January 1937).
- \_\_\_\_\_. "Wither the Chinese Church?." *Chinese Recorder* 67 (February 1936).
- Xing, Lin Zi, "Live Well, Die Well." Translated by Caroline Mason. *Renditions*, Spring & Autumn 1991.
- Yang, Bo. "Reportage and I." *Modern Chinese Literature* Vol 1, No. 2 (Spring 1985).
- "Year 2000 Movement in Taiwan: A Synopsis of the Beginning and Hope." *Taiwan Mission Quarterly* 5, no. 3 (1996).
- Yiu, Cody. "Chen Apologizes for White Terror Era." *Taipei Times* (Taiwan), 18 January 2004.
- Zia, Z. K. "Chinese Evangelists in Modern China." *Chinese Recorder* 66 (Jan. 1935).

### 3. Websites

- "228 Massacre: Taiwan's Tragedy Remembered." University of Saskatchewan Taiwanese Student Association, n.d.. <[http://duke.usask.ca/~ss\\_tsa/228/intro.html](http://duke.usask.ca/~ss_tsa/228/intro.html)> (6 June 2004).
- "28 February 1947: Taiwan's Holocaust Remembered." *New Taiwan, Ilha Formosa*, n.d.. <<http://www.taiwandc.org/228-intr.htm>> (13 Feb. 2004).
- "AD 2000 and Beyond Movement Overview." AD 2000 & Beyond Movement, 30 July 1999. <<http://www.ad2000.org/ad2kbroc.htm>> (5 August 2005).
- "Annual Report for the Year 2000." Presbyterian Church in Taiwan, n.d.. <<http://www.pct.org.tw/english/ann2000.htm>> (6 June 2005).
- Bryson, Bill. "January Interview: Billy Bryson." *January Magazine*, July 2000. <<http://www.januarymagazine.com/profiles/bryson.html>> (29 August 2001).
- Buttrey, Paul. "Missionaries of TMF." 2001. <<http://members.aol.com/WELSTAI2/memories.htm>> (2 March 2004).
- Carpenter, Joel. "Agents of the Great Commission: Keynote Address, Fall Faculty/Staff Conference, Calvin College, Grand Rapids, Michigan, September 4, 2002." Calvin College, 27 July 2005. <<http://www.calvin.edu/admin/provost/pubs/agents.htm>> (9 August 2005).
- Chang Yun-ping. "White Terror Survivor Finds Peace in Music, Religion." *Taipei Times on the Web*, 9 November 2003. <<http://www.taipeitimes.com/News/taiwan/archives/2003/11/09/2003075167>> (21 September 2005).
- "Chiang Ching-kuo." *Wikipedia*, 14 September 2005. <[http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Chiang\\_Ching\\_Kuo](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Chiang_Ching_Kuo)> (15 September 2005).
- "Chinese Cultural Studies: The Mandate of Heaven, Selections from the *Shu Jing*." Brooklyn College of the City University of New York, n.d.. <<http://acc6.its.brooklyn.cuny.edu/~phalsall/texts/shu-jing.html>> (5 September 2001).
- "Consumer Patterns, Preferences, and Shopping Habits in Taiwan." Team Canada Market Research Centre and the Canadian Trade Commissioner Service, September 1999. <<http://atn-riac.agr.ca/public/htmldocs/e2775.htm>> (3 March 2001).
- "Eden Social Welfare Foundation Continues Mission." *MyEgov*, 14 May 2005. <<http://www.taiwanheadlines.gov.tw/20030514/20030513fl.html>> (11 April 2005).
- "Evangelism and Social Responsibility: An Evangelical Commitment." Lausanne Committee for World Evangelization, 1982. <<http://www.lausanne.org/Brix?pageID=14749>> (6 June 2005).
- Fanchiang, Cecilia. "Reflecting on 20 Years of Helping the Disabled by Taiwan's Eden Social Welfare Foundation." Taiwan Government Information Office, 9 May 2003. <<http://www.publish/gio.gov.tw/past/03050921.html>> (11 April 2005).
- "February 28 Incident." *Word IQ*, n.d.. <[http://www.wordiq.com/definition/February\\_28\\_Incident](http://www.wordiq.com/definition/February_28_Incident)> (6 June 2004).

- Gettings, John and Beth Rowen, "Timeline Taiwan: Key Events in Taiwanese History from WWII to the Present." Pearson Education, 2005.  
<<http://www.infoplease.com/spot/taiwantime1.html>> (14 February 2006).
- Huang Tai-lin. "White Terror Exhibit Unveils Part of the Truth." *Taipei Times on the Web*, 20 May 2005. <[www.taipeitimes.com/News/taiwan/archives/2005/05/20/2003255840](http://www.taipeitimes.com/News/taiwan/archives/2005/05/20/2003255840)> (21 September 2005).
- Huitt, W. "Maslow's Hierarchy of Needs." Valdosta State University, 2004.  
<<http://www.valdosta.edu?whuitt/col/regsys/maslow.html>> (26 October 2005).
- "Human Beings in God's Image: Who Am I." In *NIV Spirit of the Reformation Study Bible*, Zondervan Books, n.d.. <[www.zondervan.com/media/pdfs/0310923603.pdf](http://www.zondervan.com/media/pdfs/0310923603.pdf)> (9 August 9, 2005).
- "John Gresham Machen," *Wikipedia*, 5 September 2005.  
<[http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/John\\_Gresham\\_Machen](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/John_Gresham_Machen)> (15 September 2005).
- Kerr, George H. "Formosa Betrayed." North American Taiwanese Professor's Association, 1997.  
<<http://www.formosa.org/~taiwanpg/kerr.pdf>> (13 February 2004).
- Kho Syau-pheng and David Alexander. "Thirty Years On, Reflecting on the Social Mission of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan." *Worldwide Faith News*, 19 August 2001.  
<<http://www.wfn.org/2001/08/msg00213.html>> (14 May 2002).
- Kirkpatrick, Jeane J. "Establishing a Viable Human Rights Policy." *Third World Traveler*, 4 April 1981. <[http://www.thirdworldtraveler.com/Human%20Rights%20Documents/Kirkpatrick\\_HRP\\_olicy.html](http://www.thirdworldtraveler.com/Human%20Rights%20Documents/Kirkpatrick_HRP_olicy.html)> (10 January 2005).
- Kraft, Charles H. "Contextualization Theory in Euro-American Missiology." n.d..  
<<http://www.lausanne.gospelcom.net/wemag/9709kraf.html>> (15 September 2005).
- "Landmine Report 2001." International Campaign to Ban Landmines, n.d..  
<<http://www.icbl.org/lm/2001/taiwan>> (28 December 2001).
- "Look Back on the Road to Democracy." Taiwan Security Research, n.d..  
<<http://taiwansecurity.org/TT/TT-991209-Road-to-Democracy.htm>> (6 June 2004).
- Lin Mei-chun. "Presidential Office Names Advisors." *Taipei Times on the Web*, 21 May 2001.  
<<http://www.taipeitimes.com/news/2001/05/21/story/0000086611>> (7 September 2001).
- "Liu Hsia." Eden Social Welfare Foundation, n.d..  
<<http://www.eden.org.tw/eng/au-f2.htm>> (11 April 2005).
- McIntyre, Carl. "The Redeemed of the Lord Say So." International Council of Christian Churches, n.d..  
<<http://www.iccc.org.sg/>> (10 January 2005).
- "Mission." Eden Social Welfare Foundation, n.d..  
<<http://www.eden.org.tw/eng/au-b2.htm>> (12 April 2005).

- "Missionary Honored for Human Rights Work in Taiwan." Reformed Church in America, 27 January 2004. <<http://www.rca.org/today/darsen.php>> (6 June 2004).
- "Mr. Hollington K. Tong." Kwang Hwa Information and Culture Center, 2003. <[http://www.taiwaninfo.org/info/ngio/e\\_tong.html](http://www.taiwaninfo.org/info/ngio/e_tong.html)> (4 March 2004).
- "Ordinary Citizens March in Largest Ever Demonstrations." *Presbyterian Church in Taiwan Press* xiv, no. 3, May/June 1997 <<http://www.pctpress.com.tw/obdir/May97.htm#bm10>> (29 August 2001).
- Perrin, Andrew. "What Taiwan Wants." *Time Asia on the Web*, 8 March 2004. <<http://www.time.com/time/asia/covers/501040315/story.html?cnn=yes>> (21 January 2005).
- "Republic of China: Five Decades on Taiwan." Taipei Economic and Cultural Office in Toronto, n.d. <[http://www.rocinfo.org/govt\\_position/891110-b.htm](http://www.rocinfo.org/govt_position/891110-b.htm)> (3 March 2001).
- "Taiwan and International Healthcare since 1995." Taipei Economic and Cultural Office, Canada, 2 May 2004. <<http://www.canada.taiwan.org/english/who/who002.html>> (6 June 2005).
- "Taiwan and International Healthcare since 1995." Taipei Economic and Cultural Office Information Division, n.d. <<http://www.taipei.org/who/who.1.htm>> (28 December 2001).
- "Taiwan History: Chronology of Important Events." China Taiwan Information Center, 26 June 2003. <<http://www.chinataiwan.org/web/webportal/W5026683/A5113526.html>> (2 February 2005).
- "Taiwan's Population Distribution." *Taiwan News*, n.d.. <<http://www.taiwannews.com/indexpeople.htm>> (3 March 2001).
- "Timeline of U.S. – China Relations." *PBS Online*, 1999. <<http://www.pbs.org/wgbh/amex/china/timeline/timeline7nf.html#1977>> (10 January 2005).
- "Timeline of U.S. – China Relations: 1971." *PBS Online*, 1999. <<http://www.pbs.org/wgbh/amex/china/timeline/timeline6nf.html#1971>> (10 January 2005).
- Ting, K. H. "What Can We Learn from Y. T. Wu Today?." Translated by Theresa Chu. *Chinese Theological Review*. 1989, <[http://www.christianityinchina.org/download/\\_Toc23518281](http://www.christianityinchina.org/download/_Toc23518281)> (10 December 2003).
- "TOUCH Community Services." Faith Community Baptist Church, 2004. <[http://www.fcbc.org.sg/min\\_touch\\_comsvc.htm](http://www.fcbc.org.sg/min_touch_comsvc.htm)> (19 April 2004).
- Tsai, Sam S. C. "Revised English translation of the Report of the Conference on Church and Society sponsored by the Committee on World Church Relations of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan." 11 July 1995. <<http://www.geocities.com/Tokyo/Temple/3307/stat0007.html>> (15 September 2005).
- Tsai Ting-I. "President Donates his Shares in FTV to Disabled Charity." *Taipei Times*, 14 February 2003. <<http://www.taipeitimes.com/News/taiwan/archives/2003/02/14/194498>> (13 April 2005).
- "World: Asia-Pacific Taiwan Quake Rescue Criticized." *BBC News on the Web*, 28 September 1999. <<http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/world/askai-pacific/460170.stm>> (22 April 2004).