



# THE UNIVERSITY *of* EDINBURGH

This thesis has been submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for a postgraduate degree (e. g. PhD, MPhil, DClinPsychol) at the University of Edinburgh. Please note the following terms and conditions of use:

- This work is protected by copyright and other intellectual property rights, which are retained by the thesis author, unless otherwise stated.
- A copy can be downloaded for personal non-commercial research or study, without prior permission or charge.
- This thesis cannot be reproduced or quoted extensively from without first obtaining permission in writing from the author.
- The content must not be changed in any way or sold commercially in any format or medium without the formal permission of the author.
- When referring to this work, full bibliographic details including the author, title, awarding institution and date of the thesis must be given.

# **The Orange Order in Belfast and Glasgow, 1910 - 1914**

Dexter Henry Govan

Doctor of Philosophy  
University of Edinburgh  
2022

## **Abstract**

This PhD thesis examines the Orange Order in Belfast and Glasgow during the years of the third Home Rule crisis, 1910 to 1914. It argues that Orangeism was a remarkably flexible construction and that during this period the Orange Order adapted to its differing contexts in the two cities. Indeed, Orangeism proved capable of remarkable dynamism in these years, seizing new opportunities brought about by changes in Edwardian society. The thesis examines Orangeism using a range of significant new materials from both the Irish and Scottish Orange Order archives. From the minutes of Orange meetings to the initiation ceremonies and rules of the Orange Order, these resources reveal a wealth of new detail about Orange culture and the distinctive features of Orangeism which have allowed it to survive across the globe for two centuries. In addition, this thesis argues for the existence of a temperate, respectable and religiously devout Orangeism which sat comfortably amidst a context of Edwardian popular conservatism and intense religious belief. This tendency was as much a part of Orangeism in the period as sectarianism or disorderly public conduct. As such, this thesis offers a new interpretation of Orangeism and modifies our understanding of associational cultures and civil society in Ireland and Britain before the First World War.

## Lay Summary

The Orange Order remains a prominent feature of Northern Irish and Scottish society today, but while one might encounter the Order marching to celebrate the Twelfth of July in Belfast or Glasgow, few know very much about the Loyal Orange Institution itself. Orangeism remains shrouded in secrecy, with rumour and satire informing us every bit as much as academic study. This thesis addresses this issue. It examines the Orange Order in Belfast and Glasgow during the years of the third Home Rule crisis, that is 1910 to 1914, when Ireland stood on the brink of civil strife. By examining the Orange Order in these two cities, the thesis argues that beyond its reputation for sectarianism, Orangeism is a complex phenomenon: a mixture of intense religious belief, working-class conservatism and ritual and material culture. While many members of the Orange Order were conservative in the years from 1910 to 1914, the Order moved quickly and effectively to capitalise on the new opportunities offered up by the Edwardian era. Women's and juvenile lodges and new Orange societies evolved at this time, highlighting the diversity of Orangeism before the First World War. Through the use of a range of newly available materials and by comparing the Orange Order in Belfast and Glasgow in these years, this thesis demonstrates how Orangeism has been able to adapt and survive not just in Ireland and Scotland but across the globe over its two hundred year history.

## Acknowledgements

This study has been made possible by the generosity of the Justin Arbuthnott Scholarship in Modern Irish History at the University of Edinburgh. For this, Vanessa and Hugh Arbuthnott have my lasting gratitude. From conception through execution, the sage counsel of my supervisors, Professor Alvin Jackson and Dr Michael Rosie, has been invaluable. Their engagement, warmth and candour have been appreciated in equal measure. This project has relied on access to the archives of the Loyal Orange Institution in Ireland and Scotland and I hope the trust and friendliness with which I was welcomed has been repaid in this thesis. While I am sure there will be areas of debate, discussion and disagreement, I am confident that this will continue on in the same spirit of respectful, serious enquiry with which this project began. I must also thank the Scottish Conservative and Unionist Party for access to their archival materials at the National Library of Scotland, and the staff at the Public Records Office of Northern Ireland for their assistance. Beyond this, the members of the Irish History Group at Edinburgh have been a source of inspiration and advice throughout the duration of my studies, as have the members of the University and College Union. I am grateful, too, to Professor Enda Delany for his interest and encouragement. Outside of Edinburgh, Dr Alex Campsie and Dr Ewan Gibbs have done far more for me than friends might be expected to, helping me with good humour and sympathy to navigate often treacherous waters. My parents' enduring belief in me means more than I can express, but I thank them anyway.

## Contents

<b>Abstract</b> .....	<b>2</b>
<b>Lay Summary</b> .....	<b>3</b>
<b>Acknowledgements</b> .....	<b>4</b>
<b>Introduction</b> .....	<b>8</b>
A brief history of the Orange Order .....	11
Literature .....	17
Methodology .....	27
Belfast and Glasgow.....	33
Chapters and argument.....	39
<b>Chapter one: class, temperance and respectability</b> .....	<b>47</b>
Class composition .....	50
Respectability and temperance .....	60
A new context.....	76
Concluding notes.....	88
<b>Chapter two: public procession and the Ulster Volunteer Force</b> .....	<b>90</b>
Orangeism and the Ulster Volunteer Force .....	97
Public procession and the Orange economy.....	112
<b>Chapter three: the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society and Ulsterization</b> .....	<b>133</b>
The National Insurance Act and the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society.....	134

Ulster reorientation .....	169
Concluding notes.....	177
<b>Chapter four: towards a religious understanding of the Orange Order</b> .....	<b>179</b>
Belfast and the Orange Order .....	181
Orange religiosity.....	186
Orange theology .....	197
Orange anti-Catholicism .....	205
Concluding notes.....	211
<b>Chapter five: Scottish exceptionalism .....</b>	<b>215</b>
Orange politics and the Home Rule crisis .....	224
Presbyterianism and Scots law .....	235
Ritual practice.....	246
Concluding notes.....	253
<b>Chapter six: migration .....</b>	<b>257</b>
Class and immigration .....	260
An Orange diaspora? .....	280
Concluding notes.....	293
<b>Chapter seven: women and children first.....</b>	<b>296</b>
Juvenile Orangeism: religion and reproduction .....	297
The juvenile order: social activity.....	309
The juvenile order: education .....	314

The female order and popular conservatism .....	320
Women’s liberation .....	333
Concluding notes .....	348
<b>Conclusion.....</b>	<b>350</b>
<b>Appendix I: Royal Arch Purple District, Belfast and the 1911 Census</b>	<b>360</b>
<b>Bibliography .....</b>	<b>366</b>
Primary sources:.....	366
Secondary sources:.....	373

## Introduction

Since its foundation in 1795 the Loyal Orange Institution, or the Orange Order as it is more commonly known, has stood as a symbol. To its members and supporters, this is as a symbol of Protestantism, of loyalty, of civil and religious liberty under constitutional monarchy. For its opponents, and these are many, it is as a symbol of sectarianism, of religious intolerance, of political intransigence. Whatever else the Orange Order is, it is controversial.

Indeed, comparatively few institutions in Irish or Scottish society have endured so long or with such prominence as the Orange Order. It has outlived several iterations of its original nationalist paramilitary opponents and of the Whig Party which sought its destruction in the early part of the nineteenth century. It long predates the phenomena of mass political parties and association football.

Yet, despite this, there is a remarkable lack of curiosity about the Loyal Orange Institution among scholars and the public at large. To be sure, many find tales of the quasi-masonic rituals attributed to the Order titillating. Tales of goats and carrots in the dark rarely fail to be so. But this curiosity is of a different kind to that which leads to the serious enquiry which Orangeism deserves. This thesis is an effort at the latter. It analyses the Orange Order in Belfast and Glasgow during the years of the third Home Rule crisis, that is,

1910 to 1914.<sup>1</sup> These years and locations provide new insight into the Loyal Orange Institution, which is enough to change understanding of Orangeism as a movement.

In essence, the Orange Order is a mass-member, Protestant, fraternal order. The organisation is strongest in Northern Ireland but enjoys considerable support in Scotland also. Beyond this, Orange lodges can be found scattered around the globe, most commonly in areas once a part of the British empire. Lodges themselves are the local presence of the Orange Order, made up of around five to thirty members and meeting regularly, often in purpose built Orange halls. There, members perform the rites and rituals of the Orange Order and socialise. These local lodges come under the jurisdiction of county and district lodges and finally under the jurisdiction of the Grand Orange Lodge of a country, though the authority of these bodies is far from absolute. The Order exists to commemorate William of Orange and his legacy, namely the endurance of Protestantism and civil and religious liberty. Indeed, the wider legacy of the Glorious Revolution, perceived or accurate, forms part of a celebratory culture within Orangeism. On the anniversary of the Battle of Boyne, the Twelfth of July, and at other times throughout the year, Orangemen and women can be found marching. It is for this practice that the Order is most widely known, but it also retains a reputation for secrecy, with

---

<sup>1</sup> As Alvin Jackson has convincingly demonstrated, Orangemen began drilling in November of 1910, which may thus be considered the start of the crisis: Alvin Jackson, *The Ulster Party: Irish Unionists in the House of Commons, 1884-1991* (Oxford, 1989), p. 314.

widespread rumours of bizarre practices carried out under cover of darkness in lodge halls. All of this, together, is reducible to 'the Orange Order' and today the organisation retains a reputation for conservatism and obstinacy. Many consider it to be a sectarian remnant of the bygone days of yore which are hailed in Orange culture.

This thesis reveals another side to Orangeism, though. Rather than an intransigent monolith, the similarities and discontinuities of the Order in Belfast and Glasgow during the Home Rule crisis demonstrate Orangeism's remarkable diversity and flexibility. Beyond drunken, violent demonstrations of Protestant supremacy, this thesis examines the significant portion of Orange Order members who subscribed to a temperate and respectable form of Orangeism. Rather than conventional portrayals of the Order as an irreligious band of skilled workers, bent on excluding Roman Catholics from the labour market, this thesis demonstrates that in the Edwardian era, religion and theology indelibly influenced Orange practice, itself conducted by a mixture of skilled and unskilled Protestant workers. At the turn of the twentieth century the Orange Order was indeed a broad church; home to skilled artisans, the temperate and respectable working class, the unskilled, and, yes, to those less respectable, less temperate elements with which the Order is most associated. Before exploring these 'Orangeisms' in greater detail, though, it is perhaps useful to briefly consider the history of the Orange Order up to the present.

## A brief history of the Orange Order

In one sense at least Orangeism began in 1690, as the dead of the war between William of Orange and King James II returned to the soil and became peat for future fires. More strictly and accurately, though, the Orange Order began in 1795.<sup>2</sup> In particular, at the Battle of the Diamond, fought between Loughgall and Portadown on 29 September 1795. The Battle was little more than a skirmish between the Catholic 'Defenders' and the Protestant 'Peep O'Day Boys' - part of a wider conflict between these ad-hoc militias which had been simmering for a decade. At the Diamond, a 'lesser number' of Peep O'Day boys repelled 300 Defenders, killing six of them, and successfully defending Dan Winter's Cottage, now a site of Orange pilgrimage.<sup>3</sup> Of more consequence than the fray, though, was that the victors resolved they should form a new society to enable a more formal mobilisation of Armagh's Protestants, under the leadership of James Sloan, a local innkeeper.<sup>4</sup>

Expressing their devotion to the enduring principles of civil and religious liberty, two years later in 1797, James Sloan outlined the principles of the Orange Order, or 'Orange Society' as it was known to begin with. First was to defend Protestants and the King and constitution against the 'wicked

---

<sup>2</sup> Hereward Senior, *Orangeism in Ireland and Britain 1795-1836* (London, 1966), p. 1.

<sup>3</sup> Patrick Tohall, 'The Diamond fight of 1795 and the resultant expulsions', in *Seanchas Ardmhacha: Journal of the Armagh Diocesan Historical Society* III, no. 1 (1958), p. 17.

<sup>4</sup> Senior, *Orangeism*, p. 19.

schemes of rebels'.<sup>5</sup> Second, Sloan and the Orange Society 'openly denied and disavowed' claims they sought to destroy or extirpate the Roman Catholics of Ireland as the Society was sworn to obey the laws of the land. Additionally, they beseeched members of the gentry and the public to support their aims and the Society in general, as they would not find more loyal subjects of the government of the empire. They went as far as to ask 'gentlemen of property to reside in the country', that they might take command of the Society.<sup>6</sup>

This militancy and deference to authority proved popular and Orangeism grew rapidly, modelling itself on the masonic system of lodges and adopting or adapting some of those customs and rituals.<sup>7</sup> Indeed, by 1798 the Argyll Fencibles Regiment received permission from the newly created Grand Orange Lodge of Armagh to return to Scotland: planting the seed of Orangeism in this country, a process replicated in England.<sup>8</sup> Similar seeds were scattered to the winds, and took root across the British Empire over the

---

<sup>5</sup> *Belfast Newsletter* (29 May 1797).

<sup>6</sup> *Belfast Newsletter* (29 May 1797).

<sup>7</sup> Tony Grey, *The Orange Order* (London, 1972), p. 56.

<sup>8</sup> David Hume, Jonathan Mattison, David Scott, *Beyond the banners: the story of the Orange Order* (Co. Down, 2009), p. 47;

Ronnie Michael Booker Jr., 'Orange Alba: the civil religion of loyalism in the southwestern Lowlands of Scotland since 1798', (Unpublished PhD Thesis, University of Tennessee Knoxville), p.33.

Note: Elaine McFarland argues it is more likely that Orangeism arrived in Ayrshire a year earlier, though her argument has failed to gain traction: Elaine McFarland, 'The Loyal Orange Institution in Scotland, 1799 to 1900', (Unpublished PhD Thesis, University of Glasgow, 1986), p. 88.

next century.<sup>9</sup> In particular, military lodges flourished during their deployment in Ireland against the United Irishmen's rebellion of 1798. Four decades later, these lodges would provide the justification for the suppression of Orangeism.

While the Orange Order achieved much in the years between 1798 and 1835, not least attracting the membership of the dukes of York and Cumberland, these years also saw the passage of Catholic emancipation, a defeat for the Order. Such events brought the Order into closer alliance with the Tories, but the advance of radical and anti-Orange members in the Commons meant that by 1835 an enquiry was called into Orangeism.<sup>10</sup> The Enquiry produced a report which made clear that 'Orangemen controlled the Irish yeomanry, had lodges in the army, enjoyed a certain immunity from justice in Ulster and were frequently engaged in civil disturbances.'<sup>11</sup> The Enquiry grossly exaggerated the scale and influence of the Orange Order in the military, but it provided Radicals, and particularly Joseph Hume MP, with the ammunition required to push for the Order's prohibition, which was duly granted in February of 1836.<sup>12</sup>

---

<sup>9</sup> See: D.A. Wilson (ed.), *The Orange Order in Canada* (Dublin, 2007); Cecil Houston and William Smyth, *The sash Canada wore, a historical geography of the Orange Order in Canada* (Toronto, 1980); David Fitzpatrick, 'Exporting brotherhood: Orangeism in South Australia', in *Immigrants and Minorities* XXIII, no. 2/3 (2005), pp 277-310.

<sup>10</sup> Senior, *Orangeism*, p. 267.

<sup>11</sup> Senior, *Orangeism*, p. 269.

<sup>12</sup> *Hansard*, Third Series, Vol. XXXI, Col. 780-800.

Whatever its strength before this, the prohibition of the Order had disastrous consequences for Orangeism in Ireland and Britain. In the decades between 1836 and 1880 the ban was lifted and re-imposed in different forms, most often affecting Orange parades, and this lack of security hampered both recruitment and the efforts of various grand lodges to impose structure onto Orangeism. In Scotland, it led to an especially harmful fracturing of authority, with rival, competing orders even running in Glasgow School Board elections against one another.<sup>13</sup> This schism was resolved amicably in 1877, though, and the Orange Order in Scotland was then able to expand, capitalising on the growing support for Orangeism among Protestants and unionists in response to the first Home Rule crisis.

Three decades of growth later, by November of 1910, Ulster was in the grip of the third Home Rule crisis, with Orangemen commencing drilling and preparing to resist by force the imposition of Home Rule under the Asquith administration.<sup>14</sup> This thesis is devoted to these years of the third Home Rule crisis, from 1910 to 1914, in Belfast and Glasgow, specifically. These years of crisis saw an increase in Orange membership and reveal much about the nature of the Institution at the turn of the twentieth century. Before such constitutional tensions could burst into all-out civil war, though, they were effectively side-lined by the beginning of the First World War.

---

<sup>13</sup> McFarland, 'The Loyal Orange Institution', p. 160.

<sup>14</sup> Jackson, *The Ulster Party*, p. 314.

The War retains an important position in unionist historical memory, but especially so within the Orange Order.<sup>15</sup> This is perhaps unsurprising: in Scotland around one in four of the Order's membership had enlisted in the armed services by 1915.<sup>16</sup> In Ulster, the appalling casualties suffered by the 36<sup>th</sup> (Ulster) Division amounted to a blood sacrifice for the Union in the eyes of members of the Loyal Orange Institution, and images of the Somme are now common on Orange banners.<sup>17</sup>

Irish partition when it came after the war changed the nature of Orangeism as it came to operate in Northern Ireland, though as we shall see in chapter four, this was not a surprise to Ulster's Orangemen. In the new state, and with James Craig proud to proclaim himself 'an Orangeman first and a politician second', the Order benefited from a close association with the new administration.<sup>18</sup> After recovering somewhat in the interwar years, the Order's membership suffered again as a result of the Second World War, the impact of which was such that in Scotland after 1945 there were more women than

---

<sup>15</sup> See Jonathan Evershed, *Ghosts of the Somme: commemoration and culture war in Northern Ireland* (Notre Dame, 2018).

<sup>16</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report of proceedings of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland 1914-1915* (Glasgow, 1915), accessible at the offices of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, Olympia House, Glasgow, p. 94.

<sup>17</sup> Neil Jarman, *Displaying faith: Orange, Green and trade union banners in Northern Ireland* (Belfast, 1999), p. 1.

<sup>18</sup> T.P. Daly, 'James Craig and Orangeism, 1903-1910', in *Irish Historical Studies* XXXIV, no. 136 (Nov. 2005), p. 448.

men in the Orange Order.<sup>19</sup> The post-war period then saw a gradual recovery in Orangeism, to the point where the Order saw its largest membership in Northern Ireland and Scotland as well as its greatest as a share of population. These years were prosperous for the Order and continued on to the outbreak of the modern 'Troubles' in Northern Ireland.<sup>20</sup>

The Orange Order's position in the conflict itself was complex, though. At an institutional level the Order was opposed to loyalist violence, siding, as it so often had, with the unionist establishment in Ulster.<sup>21</sup> However, in part owing to its large membership, a great many individuals involved in loyalist paramilitary groups were themselves Orangemen.<sup>22</sup> Frequently this has bled out into flute bands displaying support for such groups, or members of Orange lodges publicly supporting them, and such issues persist to this day.<sup>23</sup> In addition, the firm commitment of the Order to public demonstration

---

<sup>19</sup> D.A.J. MacPherson, 'The emergence of women's Orange lodges in Scotland: gender, ethnicity and women's activism, 1909–1940', in *Women's History Review* XXII, no.1 (2013), p. 52.

<sup>20</sup> Eric Kaufmann, 'The dynamics of Orangeism in Scotland: social sources of political influence in a mass- member organization, 1860–2001', in *Social Science History* XXX, no. 2 (Summer, 2006), p. 271; Eric Kaufmann, *The Orange Order: a contemporary Northern Irish history* (Oxford, 2007), p. 227.

<sup>21</sup> Kaufmann, *The Orange Order*, p. 81.

<sup>22</sup> There are many such examples including Gusty Spence and David Ervine, though neither maintained their membership for a significant duration: Ed Moloney, *Paisley: from demagogue to democrat?* (Dublin, 2008), p. 130; Ed Moloney, *Voices from the grave: two men's war in Ireland* (London, 2011), p. 315.

<sup>23</sup> See for example: *New York Times* (online) (13 July 2021), <https://www.nytimes.com/2021/07/13/world/europe/northern-ireland-march-brexit.html> [Accessed 15 September 2021]; *The Guardian* (online) (30 May 2021), <https://www.theguardian.com/artanddesign/2021/may/30/marching-on-young-loyalist-bands-northern-ireland-gareth-mcconnell-photography> [Accessed 15 September 2021]; *Daily Record* (online) (10 July 2009), <https://www.dailyrecord.co.uk/news/local-news/kilmarnock-orangeman-battles-council-over-2434536> [Accessed 15 September 2021].

frequently brought the institution into conflict with Nationalist communities and the Royal Ulster Constabulary. Many Orangemen were also the victims of nationalist paramilitary violence, with the Order recording that 338 members of the Institution lost their lives in the conflict.<sup>24</sup>

During the peace process which followed, and into the present day, the Order in Scotland and Ireland remained a prominent voice and trenchant supporter of the Union. While the Order is less numerically strong now than it once was, it compares favourably to the decline of political parties and church attendance over the same period. While many in Scotland and Northern Ireland consider the Orange Order to be a sectarian and archaic institution, it seems likely it will continue to occupy a prominent place in society and politics in Northern Ireland and Scotland for decades to come.

## **Literature**

While it is true to say that there has, in general, been a lack of curiosity about the history of the Loyal Orange Institution, this rule is not without exceptions. Indeed, over the last 50 years there have been some specific accounts of Orangeism from historians, as well as from scholars working in other

---

<sup>24</sup> *Belfast Telegraph* (online) (30 August 2019), <https://www.belfasttelegraph.co.uk/news/northern-ireland/orange-order-to-remember-its-victims-of-the-troubles-38448413.html> [Accessed 15 September 2021].

disciplines, and journalists.<sup>25</sup> It is useful to provide an explicit overview of some of these works before describing the methods by which this thesis contributes to them in advancing understanding of the Orange Order.

The natural place to start with this is the work of Hereward Senior, whose monograph on the Order, *Orangeism in Ireland and Britain, 1795-1836*, published in 1966, remains the standard point of reference when approaching Orangeism in this era.<sup>26</sup> Senior also published an essay on the Order spanning a slightly longer period seven years later, though a good deal of the content was the same.<sup>27</sup> Senior was hampered by a lack of access to Orange source materials, but his thorough account of the Order's relationship to high politics in the period nonetheless marks the first serious academic investigation of Orangeism.

Less scholarly, though published in the same period, was a book on the Order written by *Irish Times* journalist, Tony Grey. Grey provides a narrative account of the Institution's history until the modern Troubles and relays many of the supposedly secret customs and rituals of Orangeism. Unfortunately, while the work offers much in terms of detail, it also contains much which is

---

<sup>25</sup> Only works expressly concerned with the Orange Order are considered here. Useful cognate works such as D.W. Miller, *Queen's rebels: Ulster loyalism in historical perspective* (Dublin, 2007) or Alvin Jackson, *Colonel Edward Saunderson* (Oxford, 1995) are left to the body of the thesis.

<sup>26</sup> Senior, *Orangeism*.

<sup>27</sup> Hereward Senior, 'The early Orange Order, 1795-1870', in T.D. Williams (ed.), *Secret societies in Ireland* (Dublin, 1973), pp 36-46.

unsubstantiated or simply incorrect. To take one example, Grey suggests that the 'Unionist Party in Ulster became the political arm of the semi-secret Orange Order'.<sup>28</sup> Such sweeping generalisations or attempts to credit the Order with a significant controlling influence on politics in Northern Ireland or Scotland are symptomatic of non-academic accounts of the Orange Order. Similar and more recent works are available from the likes of Mervyn Jess, Kevin Haddick-Flynn and Ruth Dudley-Edwards, which vary in their degree of sympathy for their subject.<sup>29</sup>

Academic accounts of the Orange Order in Ireland are surprisingly sparse by comparison. Indeed, the only monograph dealing explicitly with the Order in Northern Ireland was published by Eric Kaufmann in 2009.<sup>30</sup> *The Orange Order: a contemporary Northern Irish history* was something of a landmark publication in this regard. A political scientist by training, Kaufmann brought a rigour to his study which had not been seen up to that point. Focused primarily on the period after the third Home Rule crisis, the work is not considered in especially great length in this thesis, with the exception of Kaufmann's efforts at plotting the membership of the Order over time.

---

<sup>28</sup> Grey, *The Orange Order*, p. 173.

<sup>29</sup> Mervyn Jess, *The Orange Order* (Dublin, 2007);

Kevin Haddick-Flynn, *Orangeism: the making of a tradition* (Dublin, 1999);

Ruth Dudley-Edwards, *The faithful tribe: an intimate portrait of the loyal institutions* (London, 2000).

<sup>30</sup> Kaufmann, *The Orange Order*.

Much of Kaufmann's contemporary history of the Order appears in a different guise in his collaborative volume with Henry Patterson on Unionism and Orangeism.<sup>31</sup> Again focused on the post 1945 period, the work ties together Orangeism and the Unionist Party and considers their relationship. In this instance, it seems Patterson's expertise was employed in analysing the Unionist Party, but almost 30 years before, he had written authoritatively on the Independent Orange Order at the turn of the twentieth century.<sup>32</sup> This work in particular is utilised in this thesis to help disprove the common association of Orangeism with the theory of the labour aristocracy, rebutting a number of works, such as Peter Gibbon's *The origin of Ulster Unionism* or Tom Gallagher's *Glasgow: the uneasy peace*.<sup>33</sup>

Alongside Kaufmann's work, scholars of other disciplines have taken an interest in the Orange Order in contemporary Northern Ireland and have occasionally sought to contribute to the historiography of the Loyal Orange Institution more broadly. Two noteworthy examples of this are Dominic Bryan and Neil Jarman, both interested in the material culture and parading tradition of the Orange Order. Bryan argues that Orange parades, considered

---

<sup>31</sup> Henry Patterson and Eric Kaufmann, *Unionism and Orangeism in Northern Ireland since 1945: the decline of the loyal family* (Manchester, 2007).

<sup>32</sup> Henry Patterson, *Class conflict and sectarianism: the Protestant working class and the Belfast labour movement, 1868-1920* (Belfast, 1980).

Note, the Independent Orange Order was also the subject of work by J.W. Boyle. See: J.W. Boyle, 'The Belfast Protestant Association and the Independent Orange Order, 1901-10' in *Irish Historical Studies* XIII, no. 50 (Sept., 1962), pp 117-152.

<sup>33</sup> Peter Gibbon, *The origins of Ulster Unionism: the formation of popular Protestant politics and ideology in nineteenth century Ireland* (Manchester, 1975); Tom Gallagher, *Glasgow: the uneasy peace* (Manchester, 1987); Similar accounts include: Frank Neal, *Sectarian violence – the Liverpool experience 1819-1914* (Manchester, 1998).

at greater length in the second chapter of this thesis, could act as sites of resistance by the lay membership of the Order against the authority of the Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland.<sup>34</sup> Neil Jarman addresses the Order's material culture directly in a series of short books and articles, charting the development of this culture in Northern Ireland.<sup>35</sup> But while both draw from or chart aspects of Orange history, in truth neither are concerned directly with explaining the nature of the Orange Institution itself in a historical period. Additionally, many articles on the contemporary Order have focused on Orange parades after the peace process, and again have relatively little to say about Orangeism as a historical phenomenon.<sup>36</sup>

The Order in Scotland is perhaps better studied. Here, of particular influence is the pioneering work of Elaine McFarland; indeed, her monograph, *Protestant's first: Orangeism in nineteenth century Scotland*, remains the definitive account of the Scottish Order.<sup>37</sup> Predating Eric Kaufmann's work in Ireland, McFarland's thorough study provides by far the most comprehensive overview and analysis of the Orange Institution in Scotland, and in particular argues that it was sustained by Irish immigration. Moving on to calculate

---

<sup>34</sup> Dominic Bryan, *Orange Parades: the politics of ritual, tradition and control* (London, 2000), p. 8.

<sup>35</sup> Neil Jarman, *Material conflicts: parades and visual displays in Northern Ireland* (Oxford, 1997);

Jarman, *Displaying faith*;

Neil Jarman, 'The Orange arch: creating tradition in Ulster', in *Folklore* CXII (2001), pp 1-21.

<sup>36</sup> See for example: Jennifer Edwards and J.D. Knottnerus, 'The Orange Order: parades, other rituals and their outcomes', in *Sociological Focus* XLIII, no. 1 (Feb., 2010), pp 1-23.

<sup>37</sup> Elaine McFarland, *Protestant's first: Orangeism in nineteenth century Scotland* (Edinburgh, 1990).

Orange membership and its predictors in Scotland, Eric Kaufmann's subsequent work has since reinforced many McFarland's original claims.<sup>38</sup> These are considered in greater length, and further refined, in chapters five and six of this thesis.

Building on the work of both McFarland and Kaufmann, Jim MacPherson then pioneered research into the role of women within the Orange Order, particularly in Scotland.<sup>39</sup> Most intriguing, MacPherson's ability to use women's involvement as a case study in discussing wider themes of women's empowerment in the period provides a guide for future historians of the topic; particularly in relation to women's political autonomy within Orangeism, which is considered at length in the final chapter of this thesis.<sup>40</sup> More recently, Deborah Butcher has produced an important doctoral thesis, charting the development of the female order from its creation in 1909 to the present day.<sup>41</sup> Both Butcher and MacPherson's work spans the period of the

---

<sup>38</sup> Kaufmann, 'The dynamics of Orangeism in Scotland', pp 263–292; Eric Kaufmann, 'The Orange Order in Ontario, Newfoundland, Scotland and Northern Ireland: a macro-social analysis', in D. A. Wilson (ed.), *The Orange Order in Canada* (Dublin, 2007), pp 42–68.

Eric Kaufmann, 'The Orange Order in Scotland since 1860: A social analysis', in M. J. Mitchell (ed.), *New perspectives on the Irish in Scotland* (Edinburgh, 2008), pp 159-191.

<sup>39</sup> MacPherson, 'The emergence of women's Orange lodges in Scotland'.

<sup>40</sup> D.A.J. MacPherson, *Women and the Orange Order: female activism, diaspora and empire in the British world, 1850-1940* (Manchester, 2016), p. 1.

<sup>41</sup> Deborah Butcher, 'Ladies of the lodge: a history of Scottish Orangewomen, c. 1909-2013' (Unpublished PhD Thesis, London Metropolitan University, 2014). Note: throughout this thesis neither the female order nor the juvenile order are capitalised. This is because while they are useful terms in describing the collective involvement of women and boys, they were not in fact organisational bodies or official titles from 1910 to 1914.

third Home Rule crisis, but owing to the extensive chronological span of their studies, a level of detail is necessarily sacrificed.

Beyond these significant works, the history of the Order in Scotland is left to non-academic contributions and the occasional scholarly article. Of the latter, Graham Walker's article on the Orange Order in Scotland between the Wars offers the most persuasive arguments for interpretation, where again he stresses the importance of the 'cultural bonds between Scotland and Ulster' to the Scottish Order.<sup>42</sup> Less valuable though more frequently cited, W.S. Marshall's *'The Billy Boys': a concise history of Orangeism in Scotland* offers an overview of the development of Orangeism in Scotland. Unfortunately, Marshall's work falls easily into popular stereotypes, including over-emphasising the significance of skilled workers in the Scottish Order.<sup>43</sup> More recently, Joseph Webster has written with great controversy about the Order in contemporary Scotland.<sup>44</sup> His contribution is considered in greater detail in chapter five.

In the north of the England the Orange Order has been studied in detail by Donald MacRaild, who has done much to develop ideas of the Orange

---

<sup>42</sup> Graham Walker, 'The Orange Order in Scotland between the Wars', in *International Review of Social History* XXXVII (1992), pp 177-206.

<sup>43</sup> W.S. Marshall, *'The Billy Boys', a concise history of the Orange Order in Scotland* (Edinburgh, 1996).

<sup>44</sup> Joseph Webster, *The religion of Orange politics: Protestantism and fraternity in contemporary Scotland* (Manchester, 2020).

diaspora, and in so doing, has added depth and variety to the study of the Irish diaspora more generally. His monograph on the topic, *Faith, fraternity & fighting* was published in 2005, and details the history of the Order in Northern England from 1850 to 1920.<sup>45</sup> It should be noted that this study, while pioneering, focused on reports from smaller, less urban lodges and as a result speaks mostly to towns and rural areas rather than cities. MacRaild has also authored shorter works dealing with different aspects of the Order, including co-authoring work on women's Orangeism with Jim MacPherson.<sup>46</sup> Otherwise, accounts of the Order in England have not made use of Orange sources, instead providing overviews of sectarianism, often in Liverpool.<sup>47</sup>

Outside of Ireland and Britain, Canada's Orange Order is by far the best studied, indeed it might well be argued that Orangeism has received fuller attention in Canada than it has in Ireland or Britain. The two most significant works herein are C.J. Houston and W.J. Smyth's *The sash Canada wore: a historical geography of the Orange Order in Canada* and D.A. Wilson's edited collection, *The Orange Order in Canada*.<sup>48</sup> Houston and Smyth's 1980 volume pioneered the demographic study of Orangeism in Canada, providing

---

<sup>45</sup> D.M. MacRaild, *Faith, fraternity & fighting: the Orange Order and Irish migrants in Northern England, c.1850-1920* (Liverpool, 2005).

<sup>46</sup> D.A.J. MacPherson and D.M. MacRaild, 'Sisters of the brotherhood: female Orangeism on Tyneside in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries', in *Irish Historical Studies* XXXV, no. 137 (May, 2006), pp 40-60.

<sup>47</sup> P.J. Waller, *Democracy and sectarianism: a political and social history of Liverpool, 1868-1939* (Liverpool, 1981); Neal, *Sectarian violence*.

<sup>48</sup> Houston and Smyth, *The sash Canada wore*; Wilson, *The Orange Order in Canada*.

a level of detail which has only recently been equalled in Ireland and Scotland by Eric Kaufmann. Kaufmann in fact went on to contribute to D.A. Wilson's later collection of essays which, published in 2007, provide analysis on a range of topics related to Orangeism in Canada, demonstrating not just the Order's popularity, but the reasons for its decline across the twentieth century.

Elsewhere, scattered articles deal with the Order in Australasia and across the rest of the globe. Among these, David Fitzpatrick's article 'Exporting brotherhood: Orangeism in South Australia' is especially illuminating.<sup>49</sup> Fitzpatrick neatly uses the Orange Order as a case study in demonstrating that 'the idea of fraternity, and how to organise it, was one of nineteenth century Europe's invisible exports to the 'New World'.<sup>50</sup> Beyond this though, Fitzpatrick wrote other articles and essays concerned with the Order, culminating in a third of his 2014 monograph, *Descendancy*, being devoted to the subject in Ireland.<sup>51</sup> Many of the arguments of this work are fruitfully explored and contested throughout this thesis, but by bringing his characteristic rigour and insight to the Orange Order, Fitzpatrick opened up new avenues of exploration.

---

<sup>49</sup> Fitzpatrick, 'Exporting brotherhood'.

<sup>50</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 277.

<sup>51</sup> David Fitzpatrick, 'The Orange Order and the Border', in *Irish Historical Studies* XXXIII, no. 129 (March, 2002), pp 52-67; David Fitzpatrick, *Descendancy: Irish Protestant histories since 1795* (Cambridge, 2014); David Fitzpatrick, 'Ernest Blythe – Orangeman and Fenian', *History Ireland* XXV, no. 3 (2017), pp 34-37.

Thus the academic literature on the Order remains limited, even if there has been an increase in interest in the last twenty years. This thesis seeks to contribute to this emerging stream, but in particular to add to it by utilising the private source materials held by the Grand Lodges of Ireland and Scotland. To some extent, these resources have been used previously in writing histories of the Order, though most often by members of the Loyal Orange Institution itself.<sup>52</sup> Frequently such works are useful, often providing rich and detailed accounts of Orangeism in a particular time or place, and informed by records which were not previously available to historians outside the Institution. This thesis is an effort to combine access to such materials with the outside perspective, or objectivity, which these internal histories of the Orange Order have lacked. And it is to these materials that attention may now turn.

---

<sup>52</sup> R.M. Sibbett, *Orangeism in Ireland and throughout the Empire*, 2 vols. (Belfast, 1915). William Blacker and R.H. Wallace, *The formation of the Orange Order, 1795-1798: the edited papers of Colonel William Blacker and Colonel Robert H. Wallace*, Cecil Kilpatrick, (ed.), (Belfast, 1994); David Bryce, *The undaunted: a history of the Orange Order in Scotland from 1799 to 1899* (Self-published, 2012); Rev. M.W. Dewar, Rev. John Brown, Rev. S E. Long, *Orangeism: a new historical appreciation* (Belfast, 1969); Hume, Mattison, Scott, *Beyond the banners*; Rev. Gordon McCracken, *Bygone Days of Yore: the Story of Orangeism in Glasgow* (Glasgow, 1990).

## Methodology

Studying the years from 1910 to 1914 has advantages for the historian of the Orange Order. In particular, aside from the importance of these years to the Loyal Orange Institution and to the development of unionism in Ireland and the United Kingdom more broadly, studying Orangeism as it was over a century ago places useful distance between that study and the contemporary Order. This offers access to the archives of the Grand Orange Lodges of Ireland and Scotland, access which might have conditions attached to it if the project ran into the present day. This does not seem unreasonable; while the Order is increasingly willing to allow academics access to historical records, the day when we can expect full access to the contemporary holdings of what is at least notionally still a 'society with secrets' may be some way off.<sup>53</sup>

That scholars have had increasing access over the last two decades points to the phenomenon which Donald MacRaild has called the 'Orange thaw'.<sup>54</sup> Put simply, post-Belfast/ Good Friday Agreement, as part of its effort to become fully a part of civic society, the Order has become more willing to engage with the outside world. One need only look to the impressive new Museum of Orange Heritage in Belfast, supported by the European Union's PEACE III Programme as part of the EU's Regional Development Fund, to see the results. Matched with this, it seems, is a recognition that the records

---

<sup>53</sup> Webster, *The religion of Orange politics*, p. 94.

<sup>54</sup> MacRaild, *Faith, fraternity & fighting*, p. 13.

of the Orange Order are an important part of the historical record of the development of Irish and Scottish society. It is important that such documents are read and understood.

This is not necessarily to say that such documents are filled with revelations. More often, the records of the Orange Order contain the same minutes one might expect to find within any long-standing association: names and dues are taken, business is discussed, the date of the next meeting is set. Indeed, these records rarely contain the descriptions of pagan ritual or sensational ceremony which the Order's more vociferous critics might imagine them to. With this, though, comes a note of caution. In relying on the internal documents of the Orange Order, it is possible that an unreasonably sanitised account of Orangeism might emerge. If a private lodge retired to a public house after its meeting, consumed drink and went on to be part of a sectarian disturbance, there is no reason that this would appear in the minutes of that lodge. Where appropriate then, external sources, including from the contemporary press, are used in this thesis to mitigate such gaps. Such considerations aside, this thesis utilises an unprecedented range of Orange Order archival materials. Notably, it combines materials held by the Grand Lodges of Ireland and Scotland.

In Belfast, the Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland's archives are held in the Museum of Orange Heritage. This thesis draws on the reports of the Grand

Orange Lodge of Ireland, the County Grand Lodge of Belfast, the Belfast district of the Royal Arch Purple, the Grand Orange Council of the World and of Imperial Temperance Loyal Orange Lodge Number 929 contained there.<sup>55</sup> Each of these covers the Orange Order in Belfast during the third Home Rule crisis, and together they provide invaluable detail in reconstructing the nature of Orangeism in the Edwardian era. In addition to the Museum of Orange Heritage, the Public Records Office of Northern Ireland has a wealth of resources which inform this thesis. In many cases, these materials are even more revealing than those of the Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, though they have often been neglected in accounts of the Order. In particular, materials including the laws and ordinances of the Orange Order, the rituals and forms of ceremonies, the collected papers of Colonel Robert H. Wallace and the minutes of the executive committee of the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society reveal the vibrancy of Orange life, such as it was, immediately prior to the First World War.<sup>56</sup>

---

<sup>55</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report of proceedings of the Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, June 1914* (Dublin, 1914), accessible at the Museum of Orange Heritage, Belfast; County Grand Lodge of Belfast, *Report of the proceedings of the County Grand Lodge of Belfast, 1912* (Belfast, 1912), accessible at the Museum of Orange Heritage, Belfast; Royal Arch Purple District Chapter Number 1, Belfast, *Reports 1913-1914* (Unpublished), accessible at the Museum of Orange Heritage, Belfast; Grand Orange Council of the World, *Triennial Report, 1912* (Toronto, 1912), accessible at the Museum of Orange Heritage, Belfast; Imperial Temperance Loyal Orange Lodge Number 929, *Minutebook of Imperial Temperance Loyal Orange Lodge Number 929* (Unpublished), accessible at Museum of Orange Heritage, Belfast.

<sup>56</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Laws and ordinances of the Orange Institution* (Belfast, 1916), (PRONI: D3019/2/5/a). Despite being published in 1916 it is clear these were unaltered through 1910 to 1916; Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Ritual and forms of ceremonies of the Orange Institution of Ireland* (Belfast, 1923), (PRONI: LIB/1373). Note that despite being published in 1923, the history of amendments demonstrates the same version was in use 1910 to 1914; Colonel R.H. Wallace, *Letterbook* (PRONI: D/1889/1/2/3);

In Glasgow, rather than the Museum of Orange Heritage, the records of the Scottish Orange Order are held by the Grand Lodge at their headquarters. For the first three years of this PhD project that was to be found at Olympia House, Glasgow. In 2021, though, that building was sold by the Grand Lodge, which is currently in the process of relocating, along with its archive. That archive contains a selection of important records. In particular, the reports of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland are utilised in this thesis, along with the membership rolls and minutes of 'private' (local) lodges such as the Star of Temple Loyal Orange Lodge Number 365, Blantyre Bluebell Female Loyal Orange Lodge Number 7 and Juvenile Loyal Orange Lodge Number 1.<sup>57</sup> In addition, documents including the ritual of introduction to the Scottish Order and the bye-laws of the Coatbridge district of the Order from

---

Orange and Protestant Friendly Society, *Minutes of the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society, 1911-1921* (PRONI: LAB/1/25/1).

<sup>57</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Monthly reports of the executive of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland* (Unpublished), accessible at the offices of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, Olympia House, Glasgow;

Star of Temple Loyal Orange Lodge Number 365, *Membership roll book* (Unpublished) accessible at the offices of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, Olympia House, Glasgow;

Star of Temple Loyal Orange Lodge Number 365, *Minutebook* (Unpublished) accessible at the offices of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, Olympia House, Glasgow;

Blantyre Bluebell Female Loyal Orange Lodge Number 7, *Minutebook* (Unpublished) accessible at the offices of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, Olympia House, Glasgow;

Blantyre Bluebell Female Loyal Orange Lodge Number 7, *Membership roll book* (Unpublished) accessible at the offices of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, Olympia House, Glasgow;

Juvenile Loyal Orange Lodge Number 1, *Bi-monthly reports* (Unpublished), accessible at the offices of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, Olympia House, Glasgow;

1912 offer a previously unavailable level of detail to this investigation of Scottish Orangeism before the First World War.<sup>58</sup>

These resources are combined with the accounts of Orange activity from the period in the *Belfast Weekly News*, whose Orange column provided a space for members of the Institution to keep up with its activity. What distinguished the *Belfast Weekly News* from the *Belfast Newsletter* was that the weekly Orange column gave space for members of the Institution to write to one another and report expressly on Orange events. While other papers are frequently used to provide detail, this thesis' focus on the *Belfast Weekly News* and the resources held by the Grand Orange Lodges of Ireland and Scotland and the Public Records Office of Northern Ireland is deliberate. Above all, rather than provide an account of Glasgow and Belfast during the third Home Rule crisis, this thesis is an effort to tell the inside-story of Orangeism during this period.

---

<sup>58</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Ritual of introduction to the Orange Order* (Glasgow, 1902), accessible at the offices of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, Olympia House, Glasgow;  
Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Coatbridge District Loyal Orange Lodge Number 22: Bye-laws* (Glasgow, 1912), accessible at the offices of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, Olympia House, Glasgow;  
Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *The laws and constitutions of the Loyal Orange Institution of Scotland* (Glasgow, 1907), accessible at the offices of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, Olympia House, Glasgow (A later edition from 1928 reveals that no significant changes were made between 1907 and 1928).

These resources make the years of 1910 to 1914 profitable for the historian. Indeed, no other similar span in the first half of the twentieth century has the same wealth of resources in either the Glasgow or Belfast archives. Certainly, no other period has a significant number of Orange sources in *both* archives. Beyond the practical considerations, though, this period was selected because it affords insight into Orangeism at a time of great tension. By analysing the Order in a period of constitutional strain, this thesis can examine how external factors impacted members of the Loyal Orange Institution. At a time of flux, consistencies and changes within Orangeism become especially visible. Beyond this, by focusing on a narrow span of years, this thesis is able to examine events and figures in a level of detail which would not be possible over a greater chronology. The limited timescale also permits the sustained comparison of Belfast and Glasgow adopted in this thesis.

Here, by considering the Order in these two cities, insight is gained into the similarities and discontinuities of Orangeism across different locations. This is the true utility of adopting a comparative approach in two similar cities, for it allows some consideration of what was essential in Orangeism, and what could be adapted to fit its local circumstance. Indeed, it is this flexibility which has ensured Orangeism's survival across the centuries.

## Belfast and Glasgow

It is to these cities in particular to which we now turn, as well as to the numerical strength of the Orange Order therein during the years of the third Home Rule crisis.

Belfast's growth across the nineteenth century is well known. So rapid, in fact, was its expansion that its population increased from 20,000 at the beginning of the century to 387,000 by the time of the census in 1911.<sup>59</sup> In the two decades before 1911 the city grew by 36.4 percent between 1891 and 1901, followed by a slower period of expansion at the still considerable rate of 10.8 percent between 1901 and 1911.<sup>60</sup> This swell had been sustained by a thriving economy in the city, built on linen, shipbuilding and engineering. Such was the predominance of industry that soon 74 percent of the city's workers were industrial workers, and by 1912, over half of these were employed in linen, shipbuilding or engineering.<sup>61</sup> While the linen industry employed largely women, some 53,000 workers were involved in the trade in all in 1911, and this despite a slump in US demand a year earlier.<sup>62</sup>

---

<sup>59</sup> *Census of Ireland, 1911: province of Ulster: city of Belfast* (Dublin: HM's Stationary Official, 1912), p. vii.

<sup>60</sup> Emrys Jones, *A social geography of Belfast* (London, 1960), p. 58.

<sup>61</sup> A.C. Hepburn, *A past apart: studies in the history of Catholic Belfast, 1850-1950* (Belfast, 1996), p.70;

Maurice Goldring, *Belfast: from loyalty to rebellion* (London, 1991), p. 36.

<sup>62</sup> Liam Kennedy, Lucia Pozzi, Matteo Manfredini, 'Edwardian Belfast: Marriage, fertility and religion in 1911' in Olwen Purdue (ed.), *Belfast: the emerging city 1850-1914* (Dublin, 2013), p. 184.

E.J. Aiken and S.A. Royle, 'Market and messages: Linenopolis meets the world', in Olwen Purdue (ed.), *Belfast: the emerging city 1850-1914* (Dublin, 2013), pp 7-8;

As Belfast's port expanded also, three million tons came to pass through it by 1914, with a substantial increase in the number and size of ships entering the port.<sup>63</sup>

The prosperity these industries brought appears to have translated into wage growth too. By 1906, wages in the city were as much as 25 percent higher than in the rest of Ulster.<sup>64</sup> Maurice Goldring uses this to suggest that Belfast was more akin to Leeds than Dublin at the turn of the century, though building on its economic boom, A.C. Hepburn argues that Belfast succeeded in avoiding the 'slums of Glasgow or Dublin and the jerry-built back-to-backs of Manchester or Leeds.'<sup>65</sup> All of which contributes to the popular image of Belfast as city at the peak of her powers in 1914, even amid the tumult of the third Home Rule crisis.

Among others, though, Stephen Royle is keen to emphasise that certainly by the outbreak of the First World War, 'behind the façade', Belfast possessed many of the latent characteristics which would come to define its history for much of the twentieth century.<sup>66</sup> Among many social issues, sectarianism dominated the urban landscape. Religion was, as Hepburn has argued, 'a

---

<sup>63</sup> S.A. Royle, 'Workshop of the Empire, 1820-1914' in S.J. Connolly (ed.), *Belfast 400: people place and history* (Liverpool, 2012), pp 203-204.

<sup>64</sup> Goldring, *Belfast*, p. 35.

<sup>65</sup> Hepburn, *A past apart*, p. 69.

<sup>66</sup> S.A. Royle, *Portrait of an industrial city: 'clanging Belfast, 1750-1914'* (Belfast, 2011), p. 231.

considerably more potent force for residential segregation than social class.<sup>67</sup> The *Irish News* argued in 1914 that the city's municipal authority had been transformed into 'the sacred temple of Toryism and Orangeism', and whatever the extent to which this was in fact a transformation, by the outbreak of the First World War, Protestant supremacy in Belfast's civic structures was absolute.<sup>68</sup>

Certainly the Orange Order were thriving in the city. As was mentioned above, access to the records of the Order from this period inform this thesis, and in particular allow for an estimate of Orange membership in Belfast during the crisis to be proffered. This is principally drawn from the County Grand Lodge of Belfast, whose reports from the years 1910 to 1912 remain intact. These suggest that in the city the Order had somewhere between 9,500 and 10,000 members in 1911.<sup>69</sup> Remarkably, and almost certainly as a result of the escalating crisis, this figure rose to between 12,700 and 13,000 in 1912.<sup>70</sup> These reports were not to be circulated beyond the membership of the Order and so may be regarded as accurate at least as far as the County Grand Lodge of Belfast was concerned. In reality, it is likely that the figures provide a low estimate of membership. As is covered in far greater detail with regard to Glasgow in chapter five, private lodges frequently underreported

---

<sup>67</sup> Hepburn, *A past apart*, p. 72.

<sup>68</sup> *Irish News* (30 September 1912).

<sup>69</sup> County Grand Lodge of Belfast, *Report of the proceedings of the County Grand Lodge of Belfast, 1911* (Belfast, 1911), accessible at the Museum of Orange Heritage, Belfast, pp 13-39;

<sup>70</sup> County Grand Lodge of Belfast, *Report, 1912*, pp 13-40.

their memberships to the county, district or grand lodge authority so that they might avoid paying a portion of their dues, which were fixed at around 2d per member. The reports of the Order in Ulster and Belfast, though, do not suggest this practice was as widespread as it was in Scotland.

For this and other reasons besides, calculating the membership of the Orange Order in Glasgow, 1910 to 1914, is far more challenging.

Unfortunately, the reports of the Glasgow district of the Orange Order have been lost, and as a result, no record of the number of members of each lodge therein has been preserved. One must instead attempt to calculate the membership based on the dues taken in by the Order in a given year. This complex and rather arduous task was completed by Eric Kaufmann, and, as is detailed in chapter five, without taking account of the likely under-reporting of membership, Kaufmann suggests the Order's membership in Glasgow was somewhere between 4,300 and 4,500.<sup>71</sup> When the evidence of Scottish under-reporting is accounted for, it might be reasonably assumed there were between 4,500 and 6,500 members of the Loyal Orange Institution residing in the city. In Scotland as a whole, there were likely between 12,000 and 16,000 members of the Institution in 1914, close to the membership of the Order in Belfast.<sup>72</sup>

---

<sup>71</sup> Eric Kaufmann, 'Orange Order membership data, with a focus on Ireland, Canada, and Scotland, 1852-2002' [computer file, accessible at: Colchester, U.K. Data Archive [distributor], SN 1007, [www.data-archive.ac.uk](http://www.data-archive.ac.uk)].

<sup>72</sup> Kaufmann, *Orange Order Data*, SN 1007.

However, as with Orange Order membership, defining the boundaries of Glasgow is more complex than for Belfast in the years from 1910 to 1914. In particular, the Glasgow Boundaries Act of 1912 increased city's population by around 224,000 absorbing areas like Partick and Govan into the city.<sup>73</sup> The act took Glasgow's population to over one million and so is a significant advent in the city's history.<sup>74</sup> However, given Govan, Partick and Pollokshield's absorption was already *de facto* if not yet *de jure* by 1910, for the ease of language, unless it is otherwise specified, throughout this thesis it may be assumed that 'Glasgow' refers to its expanded, post-1912 state.

As in Belfast so too in Glasgow, the end of the nineteenth century had seen a dramatic increase to trade on the city's river. The Clyde had seen annual tonnage rise from 200,000 tons before 1870 to 757,000 tons by 1913.<sup>75</sup> The same period saw a monumental increase in steel production and the city became the most densely populated urban centre in Europe by 1911.<sup>76</sup> Unlike in Belfast, though, in Glasgow the cloth industry had been replaced. While textile workers in the nineteenth century had been gainfully employed in the city's cotton industry, by the twentieth they had been replaced by shipyards and steel. Andrew Gibb highlights that in 1911, 60,000 workers

---

<sup>73</sup> *Glasgow Boundaries Act, 1911.*

<sup>74</sup> Andrew Gibb, *Glasgow: the making of a city* (London, 1983), pp 124-125.

<sup>75</sup> S.G. Checkland, *The upas tree: Glasgow, 1875-1975* (Glasgow, 1976), p. 6.

<sup>76</sup> Checkland, *The upas tree*, p. 5;  
Gallagher, *Glasgow: the uneasy peace*, p. 37.

were employed in Glasgow by shipyards and engineering, as opposed to only 24,500 employed in textiles.<sup>77</sup> This relationship was the opposite of that which had been the case fifty years before.

With these seismic changes to Glasgow's industry, the city entered the twentieth century as a contradiction. Accounts of the Glasgow of this period often glow with civic pride and the fact that there were three international exhibitions held in the city between 1888 and 1911 goes some way to explaining why.<sup>78</sup> This sense of progress has led J.M. Reid to argue that 'all the fruits of the Victorian age were ripe' by the years of the third Home Rule crisis as Glasgow's economy flourished.<sup>79</sup> Unsurprisingly, though, in truth, while Glasgow's economy boomed, the living conditions of its poorer inhabitants did not.<sup>80</sup> As Fraser and Maver have pointed out of the period, 'a plethora of official investigations made pointed reference to the squalid circumstances of daily life', especially for those residents confined to the city's slum tenements.<sup>81</sup>

All of which together paints the chaotic and contradictory picture which one would imagine of two rapidly expanding industrial cities on the eve of the

---

<sup>77</sup> Gibb, *Glasgow: the making of a city*, p. 116.

<sup>78</sup> J.M. Reid, *Glasgow* (London, 1956), p. 127.

<sup>79</sup> Reid, *Glasgow*, p. 138.

<sup>80</sup> W.H. Fraser and Irene Maver, 'The social problems of the city', in W.H. Fraser and Irene Maver (eds), *Glasgow Vol. 2, 1830-1912* (Manchester, 1996), p. 355.

<sup>81</sup> Fraser and Maver, 'The social problems of the city', p. 352.

First World War. The specifics of their citizens' background and professions are considered in greater depth in chapters one, four, five and six, but it is enough for now to have sketched this rough image of where the Orange Order was situated. While Belfast had a considerably stronger Orange presence than Glasgow, the latter was still Orangeism's second city, and the similarities of these environments allows for a fruitful comparison of the fate of the Orange Order in the years from 1910 to 1914.

### **Chapters and argument**

This thesis is divided across seven chapters, each considering a different aspect of the Orange Order in Belfast or Glasgow. The first four chapters focus on Belfast, covering the prevalence of temperance and respectability, the Order's relationship to the Ulster Volunteer Force (U.V.F.) and public procession, the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society and Ulsterization and the religious practice and theology of the Order. The final three chapters consider Glasgow, covering the importance of the Scottish identity of the Order in Glasgow, the significance of Irish immigration and lastly the role of women and children in Orangeism. Together they combine to highlight the multivalent character of Orangeism in these two cities in the Edwardian era, but beyond this, demonstrate the surprising adaptability of Orangeism.

More specifically, chapter one seeks to explore and ultimately disprove the enduring misconception that Irish Orangeism was sustained as a labour aristocracy, or else otherwise existed to facilitate craft exclusion. It charts some of the history of this misconception through the literature, before relying on a cross comparison of the Royal Arch Purple Chapter of Belfast to highlight that while skilled workers were present within Orangeism in this period, so too were an equal number of unskilled Protestants. The chapter then moves on to consider the importance of notions of working-class respectability to the Order and highlights this important and much overlooked aspect of Orangeism. This leads to a consideration of the widespread phenomenon of temperance within the Loyal Orange Institution in Belfast, where over half of Orange lodges either abstained from alcohol at Orange events or were composed of entirely temperate members. Considering these aspects of the Order serves two purposes: at once it changes our understanding of Orangeism in the Edwardian era, moving it away from riotous scenes of the Twelfth of July, but it also goes some way to altering perception of the phenomena of working-class respectability and temperance more generally. If the Orange Order may be established within discussions of these, then so too must it come to alter these contexts.

Chapter two examines the relationship between the Orange Order and the Ulster Volunteer Force and considers the relationship of violence to Orange parading. Here it seems that while the connections between the Order and the U.V.F. have frequently been overstated - many have suggested the two

were all but analogous - the organisations did come to rely on one another during the years of the third Home Rule crisis. In particular, the Orange Order provided space for the U.V.F. to organise and the U.V.F. brought a modicum of respectability and discipline to members of the Loyal Orange Institution. This perhaps goes some way to explaining why Orange rioting subsided in Belfast in the years of the crisis. Beyond this, the chapter also considers those aspects of Orange culture related to public procession. It examines the regalia of the Order and argues that the increasing professionalization of the production of sashes and banners led to a greater degree of uniformity. Lastly, it considers the role of music within the Orange tradition, highlighting that beyond sectarian tunes and “blood and thunder” bands, the Order’s songbook contained a number of songs which highlight the theological bent of the Institution.

The third chapter of this thesis opens with an overview of the size and significance of the National Insurance Act of 1911. A liberal precursor to the welfare state, it afforded associations of the size and organisational capacity of the Orange Order the ability to administer medical insurance to the working class. Across Ulster and Britain 80,000 Protestants took up this offer and signed on with the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society, making it the most populous expression of Orangeism in Ireland and Britain in history. In particular, the chapter examines how the Orange Order came to administer medical insurance in Ulster, effectively cutting off southern Protestants and unionists from membership. This leads to the second section of the chapter

which considers the process of Ulsterization more generally which occurred in this period. The chapter examines the creation of the Provincial Grand Orange Lodge of Ulster and other examples, which, combined with the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society, highlight the Order's abandonment of an all-Ireland unionism in the period of the third Home Rule crisis. Indeed, this chapter demonstrates that by the beginning of the First World War, the unionist vanguard that was the Orange Order had in effect reconciled itself to partition.

Chapter four considers the religiosity and theology of the Orange Order. It uses a range of Orange documents to highlight the theological complexity of the ideas behind much Orange practice and ritual, and demonstrates that through a serious analysis of such material insight can be gained into the nature of Orangeism itself. It stresses that at least for the period of the third Home Rule crisis, the Order's theology and politics were essentially inseparable, contributing to what we might call its 'muscular Protestantism', as strength in faith was equated to strength in arms. The last section of the chapter considers the sectarianism of the Orange Order at this time, especially in relation to the *Ne Temere* decree and the Coronation Oath, where the psyche of Orangeism becomes clear. However fantastical or fanatical the Order's beliefs about the advance of the Church of Rome may seem, it is argued this must be separated from the widespread view that these beliefs are disingenuous, or otherwise serve as cover for some underlying rationale. Thus, the chapter serves to highlight the utility of

adopting a religious understanding of the Orange Order and in the process demonstrates the significance of religious intolerance to sectarianism even on into the twentieth century. As a result, it offers an alternative view to accounts of sectarianism which under-play the significance of religion.

After chapter four, attention turns to Glasgow, and the fifth chapter of this thesis considers the uniquely Scottish characteristics of Glaswegian Orangeism. In much of the academic literature on the Order in Scotland, extensively reviewed at the beginning of the chapter, there is an effort to highlight the significance of Irish immigration to the Orange Order and Scotland. While this is true, this focus has been at the expense of analysing the dimensions of Scottish Orangeism which made it distinct from its Irish roots. The chapter opens with a consideration of Orange numbers in Glasgow in the Home Rule period, and highlights why these have been so difficult to pin down, before offering a revised estimate based on the work of Eric Kaufmann, but better taking into account the widespread phenomenon of under-reporting. Attention then turns to consider the reaction of Glaswegian Orangemen and women to the third Home Rule crisis. Therein, it seems the response to the crisis was limited to some fundraising activity and oration at pre-existing Orange events. This leads to the final section of the chapter which highlights the prominent and distinctive characteristics of the Scottish Order, including the influence of Presbyterianism on Orangeism in Scotland.

Having established the distinctiveness of Scottish Orangeism, chapter six then looks at the impact of Irish immigration. The first section of the chapter considers the Order's class composition, again serving to dispel popular myths about the Order as an organisation associated with the labour aristocracy. Relatedly, the impact of Ulster immigration is then considered, and highlights that while it contributed to the mixture of skilled, semi-skilled and petit bourgeois individuals involved in Glaswegian Orangeism, a lack of elite migration led to distinctions between the upper echelons of the Order in Scotland and Ireland. The chapter also considers the impact of the Order on support for the Conservative and Unionist Party during the crisis and examines Scottish Orangeism as part of the wider Orange diaspora.<sup>82</sup> Concluding with an account of the Grand Orange Council of the World's triennial meeting, held in Glasgow in 1912, it argues that by understanding Irish immigrants in Scotland as part of this Orange diaspora, it is possible to reconcile the apparent contradictions of an organisation born of, and sustained by, Irish immigrants, but which maintained a distinctive national identity.

The final chapter of this thesis considers the involvement of women and boys in Orangeism in Scotland. Unlike in Ireland, in the period of the third Home Rule crisis, a juvenile and female order thrived in Scotland, and particularly in

---

<sup>82</sup> In Scotland this was the Scottish Unionist Party from 1912.

Glasgow which enjoyed a disproportionate density of these members. The first section of the chapter offers the first ever study of juvenile Orangeism. It considers its importance to the Order, and argues that mirroring many emerging youth movements, the juvenile order enabled the leaders of Scottish Orangeism to foster a new generation of Orangemen and instil in them the desired qualities and characteristics of an Orangeman. In the process, intergenerational tensions are revealed while highlighting once again the Order's ability to adapt to changing circumstances. Likewise, the second section of chapter seven considers female Orangeism in Scotland and Glasgow. Building particularly on the work D.A.J. MacPherson, it argues that Orangewomen possessed a remarkable degree of political autonomy within Orangeism, though this was always reliant on the beneficence of their male counterparts. That these branches of the Orange tree flourished in Scotland before they grew in Ireland again serves to highlight the important distinctions which existed between the Order in Glasgow and Belfast and thus demonstrates the remarkable flexibility of Orangeism.

Across these seven chapters the vibrancy and depth of Orangeism as a movement is revealed. Despite a general a lack of curiosity on the part of scholars, this thesis demonstrates the multivalent nature of Orangeism in two cities and highlights how comfortably it sat within a context of popular Edwardian Conservatism. This thesis extensively covers previously unexplored dimensions of the Order's character, of temperance and respectability, of religiosity, even of female empowerment within certain

limitations. Far from an archaic relic, the Order's adaptability across Belfast and Glasgow in these years of crisis highlights part of the reason that the Loyal Orange Institution continues to endure in Northern Ireland and Scotland to this day.

## Chapter one: class, temperance and respectability

This thesis seeks, among other things, to demystify the Orange Order and to re-contextualise it. Orange exceptionalism, or the idea that Orangeism is devoid of comparators, serves to stress some uniquely unpleasant or else violent character trait within the Irish, or Northern Irish populace. This is clearly false. Instead, the Orange Order is better understood, in the period of Home Rule at least, in relation to the popular conservative movements which existed within Edwardian Britain and Ireland. British historians have long sought to understand the composition and motivations of a conservative or reactionary working class, and particularly so after E.P. Thompson's concession that 'he had paid insufficient attention to 'the flag-saluting, foreigner-hating, peer-respecting' side of the plebeian mind'.<sup>83</sup> Yet while Irish historians have frequently drawn from British history's waters to explain class in Ulster, it is regrettable that British labour historians have generally failed to reciprocate: failing to reconcile Ireland and Ulster with Britain, and almost always stopping short of the unpalatable Orange working class, a theme which will be returned to later.

One of the most salient accounts of that Orange working class is given by Peter Gibbon, and is done with reference to Thompson, the construction of

---

<sup>83</sup> Jim Smyth, 'The men of no Popery: the origins of the Orange Order', in *History Ireland* III, no.3 (Autumn, 1995), p. 48.

an “artisanate” and the wider scholarship of the “labour aristocracy”. Gibbon’s thesis, published in *The origins of Ulster Unionism*, suggested that Orangeism functioned as a method of craft exclusion whereby skilled Protestant workers were able to distance themselves from an unskilled Catholic mass.<sup>84</sup> Almost fifty years later, this argument has retained surprising influence. Surprising because, among others, Henry Patterson convincingly disproved Gibbon’s view in his own work *Class conflict and sectarianism*, published only five years after *Ulster Unionism*.<sup>85</sup> That Gibbon’s theory still attracts attention and penetrates the popular consciousness is perhaps a consequence of the historiographical phenomenon mentioned above, with Gibbon’s artisanate effectively interchangeable with the labour aristocracy. Because Gibbon’s artisan walks and talks like a labour aristocrat, his idea has somehow attached itself retrospectively to many of the foundational works of British labour history including that of E.P. Thompson and Eric Hobsbawm, gaining strength by the association.<sup>86</sup>

In *The making of the English working class*, Thompson suggests that the labour aristocracy should be understood as a strata of those skilled workers

---

<sup>84</sup> Gibbon, *The origins of Ulster Unionism*, pp 94-95.

<sup>85</sup> Patterson, *Class conflict and sectarianism*. While Patterson’s work is generally well regarded by historians, it is surprising that it has not had more influence. This might be due to a reluctance to wade into the Marxian waters of the period in which it was written, but more likely is that *Class conflict and sectarianism* complicates portrayal of the Order beyond the few explanatory sentences usually afforded to the subject in general histories of Ireland. D.M. MacRaild has also highlighted the issues with this approach:

D.M. MacRaild, *Irish migrants in modern Britain, 1750-1922* (Basingstoke, 1999), p. 103.

<sup>86</sup> See Eric Hobsbawm, *Labouring men: studies in the history of labour* (London, 1964).

who employed and benefited from exclusionary labour practices to defend their own privileged position within the economy.<sup>87</sup> But, as this chapter will demonstrate, if Gibbon's theory of the artisanate and the concept of the labour aristocracy more widely has any validity with regard to the Orange Order, it is not with reference to Belfast in 1910 to 1914. By investigating the true class characteristics of Orangeism in Belfast at the turn of the Home Rule crisis, it is hoped that not just a better understanding of the Order can be reached, but that this might also serve to contribute to traditional debates within labour histories.

This thesis addresses with new clarity the position and class composition of the Order in Belfast during the third Home Rule crisis. Central to the approach of this is a cross-comparison made of the membership roll of Belfast's Royal Arch Purple (R.A.P.) District Chapter with the 1911 Census. The chapter then moves on to discuss some of the characteristics of the Orange working class, including the importance of working-class "respectability" within the Order. Finally, and for the first time, the immense popularity of temperance within the Orange Order is considered. Through this, this thesis sheds new light on the nature of Orangeism, problematizes Anglo-centric accounts of labour history in this period, and re-contextualises the often misunderstood Orange working-class.

---

<sup>87</sup> E.P. Thompson, *The making of the English working class* (London, 1991), pp 266-274.

## Class composition

Across Ireland and Britain, the Orange Order continues to be understood as a primarily working-class movement often associated with loutish or otherwise aggressive behaviour. While this is not without basis, a substantial amount of scholarship is predicated on such “common knowledge”. This is not to suggest that such works lack quality. Frequently the opposite is true. For example, in the first volume of his *A Treatise on Northern Ireland* Brendan O’Leary attributes the formation of the Orange Order to an act of settler colonialism, where the social contract bound ‘Protestant proletarians and small farmers’ to their upper-class fellows.<sup>88</sup> O’Leary’s analysis of the Order contributes to a serious and provocative investigation into the lasting impacts of British colonialism in Ireland, but the basis for representing Orangeism as a working-class movement never appears. This lack of specificity can be attributed to the primarily political focus of O’Leary’s *Treatise*, but it is nonetheless symptomatic of a wide-spread assumption in academia and beyond.<sup>89</sup>

Even for those authors more specifically concerned with class, locating the materials by which the class composition of the Order might be assessed is challenging. As has been discussed at greater length in the introduction of

---

<sup>88</sup> Brendan O’Leary, *A Treatise on Northern Ireland* Vol. I, Colonialism (Oxford, 2019), p. 203.

<sup>89</sup> This includes popular histories, see: Haddick-Flynn, *Orangeism* and Grey, *The Orange Order*.

this thesis, the Orange source base is limited. The secretive nature of the Institution means that records have not generally been allowed to fall into the hands of outsiders or national archives. More commonly, historians including, Peter Gibbon, would gain access to a single private lodge book, the analysis of which would form the basis of their arguments, or to the list of officers of the Grand Lodge of Ireland.<sup>90</sup> Indeed, in *The origins of Ulster Unionism* Gibbon relies primarily on the records of the Enniskillen Royal Black Preceptory Chapter for his conclusion that tradesmen were predominant in the Orange Order.<sup>91</sup> Gibbon's limited access to source materials should have contributed to limited conclusions, but he instead suggested they had wider applicability.<sup>92</sup>

This thesis encounters similar difficulties with the evidence base. Even with the unprecedented level of primary source material which informs this work, the ability to accurately reconstruct the class composition of the Order remains limited in some respects. However, where others have used either individual lodges' records, or officer lists from the Grand Lodge of Ireland, this thesis draws from a comparison of Belfast's 1913 Royal Arch Purple (R.A.P.) District and cross references this with the 1911 census.<sup>93</sup>

---

<sup>90</sup> Gibbon, *The origins of Ulster Unionism*, pp 94-95; Fitzpatrick, *Descendancy*, p. 85; McFarland, *Protestants first*, p. 54.

<sup>91</sup> Gibbon, *The origins of Ulster Unionism*, pp 94-95.

<sup>92</sup> Gibbon, *The origins of Ulster Unionism*, p. 119.

<sup>93</sup> Royal Arch Purple, Belfast, *Reports 1913-1914*.

This sample avoids certain problems. While a single private lodge in this period may have been unrepresentative in any number of scarcely predictable ways, the Belfast Royal Arch Purple was composed of a small number of officers from each local group. Conversely, unlike the Grand Lodge of Ireland, the Belfast R.A.P. was close enough to the Order's regular membership in democratic terms that the effect of 'deference', whereby middle or upper-class Orangemen rose to prominence at each level of the organisation, had limited effect when compared with the distinctly unrepresentative Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland.<sup>94</sup>

That said, there are of course difficulties with aspects of this approach. The Royal Arch Purple is largely absent elsewhere in this thesis because, much like the Royal Black Preceptory of Gibbon's analysis, it is not a recognised degree in the Orange Order in Ireland. Rather, it is an associated loyal order not under the control of the Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, but closely related to the practice of Orangeism. All members of the Royal Arch Purple must themselves first be members of the Orange Order.<sup>95</sup> Beyond this, so closely associated is the Orange Order with the Royal Arch Purple, that in Scotland, the R.A.P. forms the second degree of Orangeism, with Orangemen who stay in the Order for more than three months nearly always progressing to R.A.P. membership.<sup>96</sup> While, confusingly, in Ireland the

---

<sup>94</sup> Kaufmann, *The Orange Order*, p. 9. Kaufmann, among others, has done more detailed census comparisons, but these focus on the Order in the latter half twentieth century.

<sup>95</sup> Royal Arch Purple, Belfast, *Reports 1913-1914*, 13 March 1913.

<sup>96</sup> Webster, *The religion of Orange politics*, pp 20-21.

second degree is simply called 'the Purple', Orangemen continue to join the Royal Arch Purple in large numbers. Similarly evidencing their close relationship, the minutes of the Belfast District Lodge of the Royal Arch Purple are kept at the Museum of Orange Heritage. While the membership of the Royal Arch Purple is not an exact replica of the Orange Order, it is certainly a representative sample of committed Orangemen in Ireland. In addition, the minutes of Belfast District's R.A.P. are of special importance because they provide an unparalleled level of detail about a cross section of the Orange Order's membership in Belfast during the third Home Rule crisis.

The most acute danger in utilising this source is that members of the Belfast District R.A.P. may have been disproportionately skilled working-class Orangemen or that they were in some other way socially elevated when compared with the average membership of the Order in Belfast. It is true, after all, that the requirements for membership of the R.A.P. implied an additional devotion to the tenets of Orangeism. When considering the class background and profession of members, then, it is prudent to assume that a level of deference existed in the election of Orangemen to officers of their local Purple chapters. But while the membership roll of the Belfast Royal Arch Purple may depict a slightly socially elevated sample of the Orangemen of Belfast, this source nonetheless reveals a more representative cross

section of the Order's membership than the other sources which have been utilised by historians up to this point.<sup>97</sup>

Moving, then, to cross compare those Orangemen who appear in the roll with the 1911 census, from a list of over 110 men, it is possible to accurately identify a majority. A considerable minority, 46 in fact, are unidentifiable in the census, though. This may be for any number of reasons including either a change of address in the intervening two years or, more likely, the poor transcription of the officer's names and/or addresses in either the minutes of Belfast R.A.P. District Chapter, the individual's census forms or in their digitisation. Nonetheless, there remain 65 identifiable officers in Belfast. The age of these men varied from 18 to 65, with the lower end of the age spectrum again emphasising the limited effect of deference on this sample. Of these, 29 were what might broadly be defined as skilled workers, though of these only one, John Sinclair, appears to have definitely worked in Belfast's shipyards.<sup>98</sup> Of the remaining 37 officers, the majority worked as some form of labourer, though many of these may have been connected with Belfast's port or shipwrights.<sup>99</sup> As Stephen Royle has described, Belfast was Ireland's premier port after 1752, and between 1860 and 1914 annual tonnage passing through the port rose from 800,000 to three million tons.<sup>100</sup> The growth of the port, as well as the huge expansion of the linen industry in

---

<sup>97</sup> Royal Arch Purple, Belfast, *Reports 1913-1914*, 31 March 1913.

<sup>98</sup> See Appendix I.

<sup>99</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>100</sup> Royle, 'Workshop of the Empire', pp 203-204.

second half of the nineteenth century saw Belfast become the fastest growing city in the United Kingdom in these years: 'an industrial city, but with Irish inflections' in the words of Mike Mecham.<sup>101</sup> This expansion required the labour of a variety of skilled workers, and so it is unsurprising to find a concentration of skilled workers within the membership roll of the Royal Arch Purple.

It appears that an almost equal number of skilled and unskilled workers made up the officers of the Belfast District Royal Arch Purple Chapter. But extreme caution must be taken here. This high number of skilled workers does not vindicate Gibbon's thesis that the Order facilitated the creation of an artisanate in Belfast. Significantly, the broad categorisation of skilled and unskilled labour risks creating a pattern which in truth seems not to have existed. The skilled workers of the Royal Arch Purple in Edwardian Belfast were joiners, saddlers, an 'inspector SPC of animals', tailors and bricklayers among a multitude of other professions. Skilled they may have been, but there was no predominance of industry.

Nor does there have appear to have been a concentration of Orangemen working in linen, the other of Belfast's boom industries. While linen had failed

---

<sup>101</sup> Austen Morgan, *Labour and partition: the Belfast working class, 1905-23* (London, 1991), p. 3;  
Mike Mecham, *William Walker: social activist and Belfast labourist, 1870-1918* (Dublin, 2019), p. 22.

to grow at the same rate as ship building in the years immediately prior to the third Home Rule crisis, there were over 21,000 power looms in Belfast in 1912, compared with only 2,000 in the south of the island.<sup>102</sup> Indeed, as Kennedy, Pozzi and Manfredini have argued, in 1911, some 53,000 people in Belfast were employed in textiles and clothing.<sup>103</sup> That such a large industry is largely absent from the Royal Arch Purple roll is likely the result of the majority female workforce, three out of every four employees were female, and the rapid slump in the linen industry as US demand plummeted in 1910.<sup>104</sup>

Further absent in the R.A.P.'s membership is the pattern of artisan strength in industry one might expect if the Order more broadly was built to facilitate craft exclusion. To retreat to the orthodoxy of Eric Hobsbawm and Vladimir Lenin on the subject, the labour aristocracy arises:

when the economic circumstances of capitalism make it possible to grant significant concessions to its proletariat, within which a certain strata of workers manage by means of their special scarcity, skill, strategic position, organisational strength, etc., to establish notably better conditions for themselves than the rest.<sup>105</sup>

The equal presence of unskilled Orangemen across these numerous same industries, then, surely disproves Gibbon's argument. Indeed, the argument appears to only hold true in so far as that there were skilled workers in the

---

<sup>102</sup> Morgan, *Labour and partition*, p. 5.

<sup>103</sup> Kennedy, Pozzi, Manfredini, 'Edwardian Belfast', p. 184.

<sup>104</sup> *Ibid.* and Aiken and Royle, 'Market and messages', pp 7-8.

<sup>105</sup> Eric Hobsbawm, 'Lenin and the aristocracy of labour', in *Marxism Today* (July, 1970), p. 208.

Order at all. On closer inspection it appears that Gibbon is guilty of a similar encompassing laxity with regard to the Orange artisanate that Gareth Stedman Jones has criticised among other historians in regard to the labour aristocracy.<sup>106</sup> In addition to this, if deference did have a significant effect on the composition of the R.A.P. in Belfast, then it would have been to enhance the appearance of an artisanate/labour aristocracy beyond that which might have been evident at the private lodge level within the Orange Order. That accounting for this, there still appears little evidence of such a pattern, suggests that Gibbon's thesis does not hold true in Belfast from 1910 to 1914.

But if there was no observable concentration of industrial or shipyard workers from the R.A.P. in Belfast, there is, at least, a popular perception that a sectarian monopoly existed in such industries. Austen Morgan suggests that by 1889 there were six Orange lodges in Belfast which were specifically tied to trades or places of employment, with a total membership of 259 – this out of 5,316 members in Belfast.<sup>107</sup> Evidence of such lodges in the period of the third Home Rule crisis is even scantier. A former president of the Belfast trades association, Peter Hoey, giving information to the Belfast Riot Commission in 1864, said he believed that there was 'no Orangeism in the

---

<sup>106</sup> Gareth Stedman Jones, 'Class struggle and the Industrial Revolution', in *New Left Review* XC (March-April, 1975), p. 61. For discussion of the debate see the entertaining: H.F. Moorhouse, 'The significance of the labour aristocracy', in *Social History* VI, no. 2 (May, 1981), pp 229-233.

<sup>107</sup> Morgan, *Labour and partition*, p. 9.

societies, except so far as the individual members were concerned, of which the society does not take cognizance.<sup>108</sup> The same seems to broadly hold true in the years from 1910 to 1914, but in such an explanation one can easily become lost. Systems of sectarian exclusion in the shipyards functioned effectively for much of the early twentieth century. Whether such systems were driven by the related and mutually supportive patterns of apprentice employment, membership of the Orange Order, or trade union sectionalism is perhaps less important than their cumulative effect.

Across the third Home Rule crisis, sectarian labour practices were most clearly manifest the expulsion of 2,000 to 3,000 Catholic employees from Belfast's shipyards in 1912. Speaking in the House of Commons, Labour M.P. James O'Grady, whose parents were Irish, asked the Chief Secretary of Ireland 'whether it is not a fact that the foremen of Workman & Clark's yard took round books to the benches of men and asked if they were prepared to join Orange Clubs, and whether every man who did not sign was marked down for ill-treatment'. Unionist M.P. for the brief lived St Augustine's Constituency, Kent, Ronald McNeill was himself an Ulsterman and responded by asking 'if it were a more serious offence to ask a man to join an Orange Lodge than to ask him to join a trade union'.<sup>109</sup>

---

<sup>108</sup> Quoted in Morgan, *Labour and partition*, p. 9.

<sup>109</sup> *The Scotsman* (31 July 1912).

As the arguments about sectarian exclusion in Belfast's shipyards continued, Colonel Robert Wallace, Grand Master of the County Grand Lodge of Belfast, was forced to issue a statement to Orangemen calling for an end to the wider disturbances that the scandal had caused. Wallace argued that 'Orangemen had nothing to do with these disturbances, but having been asked to use his influence to end them, he would request members to endeavour to restrain those irresponsible lads, whose impulsive thoughtlessness is calculated to do a lot of harm.'<sup>110</sup> Whether this statement had the intended effect or not, public attention soon moved on to other matters in Ulster in 1912. The scandal, though, speaks to the enduring and popular association of the Orange Order in Belfast with the city's skilled and industrialised working class. That such anxieties about sectarianism surfaced amid the heightened political tension of the third Home Rule crisis is perhaps unsurprising, but over one hundred years later, these perceptions remain.

It would be a mistake on the basis of the limited source material available to suggest that the Orange Order did not have a significant and perhaps influential presence in Belfast's shipyards and other large workplaces. The detail of sectarian labour practices in each of these workplaces is unlikely to be recovered by future historians in any depth beyond what was written in newspapers at the time or passed down through the generations, but regardless, it is not the focus of this thesis. What may be said, though, is that

---

<sup>110</sup> *The Scotsman* (2 August 1912) and *The Times* (2 August 1912).

there is not the evidence to suggest that the Orange Order functioned to create or otherwise maintain an artisanate or labour aristocracy in Belfast in the period from 1910 to 1914. In this sense, this research has vindicated the argument laid out by Henry Patterson in 1980. Rather than suggest the Order was the cause of sectarian labour practices, Patterson argued:

It would be more accurate to say that although the presence of Orangemen amongst the artisan elite ensured that where possible they would discriminate, they were able to do this not because of Orangeism, but because of the structure of craft unionism. [...] To this end, the Order was more useful to the unskilled than to members of the craft elite.<sup>111</sup>

Thus it may be said with some confidence that, in accordance with popular perception, the Orange Order in Belfast was a predominantly working-class organisation and that additionally it seems to have functioned to ally different sections of the Protestant working class. Beyond this, such alliances could be employed in sectarian labour practices, even if the perpetrators didn't happen to be wearing Orange sashes. Having secured this footing, it is now possible to consider in greater detail how class shaped and defined the Order in the city during the Home Rule crisis.

### **Respectability and temperance**

At an Orange rally in Ulster in June of 1914, Edward Carson spoke to the desires which arose from the Order's working-class identity and

---

<sup>111</sup> Paterson, *Class conflict and sectarianism*, p. xv.

conservatism. In the process, he affirmed the Order's self-perception. Carson opined that 'during the days of difficulty and strife, when other people were negligent of the elementary principles which go to the root of good citizenship, the Orange Order in the north of Ireland had always kept the old flag flying'.<sup>112</sup> Carson's speech was greeted with the customary rapturous applause, but what caused the working-class men of the Order to respond so positively to the call of good citizenship? In part it seems its members yearned for the social standing and privileges that were associated with what has been termed working-class "respectability".

Like the related idea of the labour aristocracy, working-class respectability has a strong historical literature. The concept speaks to the desire of predominantly working-class men to hold themselves to a higher social standard than their peers, often through an emphasis on education or self-improvement.<sup>113</sup> Historian Peter Bailey, writing in 1979, was at pains to stress that respectability was a flexible construct, but one which, to that point, had been understood as a rigid identity within the academic literature.<sup>114</sup> Respectability, he argues, is 'a choice of role rather than a universal normative mode', but in so doing Bailey surely fails to acknowledge a large part of the power which respectability held.<sup>115</sup> In advocating for his model, he

---

<sup>112</sup> *The Scotsman* (22 June 1914).

<sup>113</sup> Martin Pugh, *The Tories and the people, 1880-1935* (Oxford, 1985), pp 153-156.

<sup>114</sup> Peter Bailey, "Will the real Bill Banks please stand up?' Towards a role analysis of mid-Victorian working-class respectability', in *Journal of Social History* XII, no. 3 (Spring, 1979), p. 337.

<sup>115</sup> Bailey, "Will the real Bill Banks please stand up?", p. 343.

neglects that responsibilities were attendant with any privileges gained by being “respectable” and could not easily be eschewed. By framing it in such a fashion, Bailey implies respectability was a coat, to be worn or discarded at will. Instead, we should understand that the pursuit of respectability had a significant hold over many in the working class.

In a more recent and convincing definition, Simon Cordery suggests that ‘respectability represented a social code, a moving and contextually defined set of material or behavioural signs of distinction. Respectable values served as a means to judge others and as personal and collective markers by which to be judged.’<sup>116</sup> Importantly, Cordery stresses that ‘religious, educational, and self-help organisations inculcated and reinforced respectable behaviour.’<sup>117</sup> Beyond simply being a role which was inhabited and abandoned at will, respectability when taught through existing social institutions had the capacity to create quite powerful social norms and expectations, as was the case with the Orange Order.

This respectability was in turn likely concomitant with conservatism and a respect for the existing social order. Discussing it explicitly in relation to

---

<sup>116</sup> Simon Cordery, *British Friendly Societies, 1750-1914* (Basingstoke, 2003), p. 180.

<sup>117</sup> Simon Cordery, ‘Friendly societies and the discourse of Respectability in Britain, 1825-1875’, in *Journal of British Studies* XXXIV, no. 1 (Jan., 1995), p. 37.

Edwardian Conservative Clubs, Jon Lawrence's work offers a remarkable parallel with the Orange Order:

Thus despite their association with working-class drinking culture, Conservative working-men's clubs were usually anything but rough drinking dens. Most demanded a membership subscription considerably higher than that for ordinary working-men's clubs, and provided, in return, a higher standard of facilities for both entertainment and education.<sup>118</sup>

While the price of membership to an Orange Lodge was not excessive, it nonetheless represented a similar binding financial commitment to the Institution.<sup>119</sup> These fees would frequently be used to pay for social events and lectures, again paralleling the facilities which Lawrence highlights. Such a comparator demonstrates how Orangeism may be fruitfully examined in relation to respectability and working-class conservatism. In the process, it reveals an often overlooked facet of the Order's character. For, in fact, the Orange Order provides a significant example of this phenomenon of working-class respectability. This at once serves to challenge popular perception of the Institution and to reframe arguments about what respectability itself entailed.

One popular Orange song during the third Home Rule crisis was *The Orangemen of Belfast*. Sung to the tune of *Brennan on the Moor* the song recounts a visitor to the city and his first experience of the Twelfth of July:

---

<sup>118</sup> Jon Lawrence, 'Class and gender in the making of urban toryism, 1880-1914', in *The English Historical Review* CVIII, no. 428 (1993), p. 641.

<sup>119</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Laws and ordinances*, p. 29.

There were shouts of “No Surrender,” and they cursed the Pope  
galore,  
And howled for blood of “Papishes” till they could howl no more.  
What’s “Papishes?” I asked my friend – he looked again at me,  
And shouted, “You’ve a Papish face, as I can plainly see!”  
He called the Orangemen standing round –  
“A Tague, boys, here he is!”  
And with a rush the Orangemen came –  
there was an awful fiz;  
But I escaped, I fled the town, I reached my home at last,  
And never more will wish to meet the Orangemen of Belfast.’<sup>120</sup>

This song was beloved by Orangemen themselves to the extent that it was circulated as part of an ‘Orange Songsheet’ in the Home Rule period. Consequently one may conclude at least some of Belfast’s Orangemen revelled in their reputation for street violence. The nature of public procession, Orange song and militancy is covered in the next chapter, but suffice it to say that the behaviour of a great many Orangemen on parade did not meet the standards set by either the Grand Lodge of Ireland or the framework of respectability.

Following such disturbances, though, it was not uncommon for Orangemen or their sympathisers to write to national publications in defence of the Institution. In December of 1910, Orangeman Alford Pickering was at pains to explain to the readers of *The Times* that the Order was in fact a reputable and respectable institution.

Quite a lot of people are under the impression, fostered of course by our detractors, that Orangemen over here do nothing but run about all day cursing the Pope and wanting to assault every Papist who comes

---

<sup>120</sup> *Orange Songsheet* (1912), (PRONI: D3815/J/375).

in our way – I can assure you that we are quite ordinary peaceable citizens wishing to fight with nobody.<sup>121</sup>

Such declarations were made not just by officers of the Order, but rather its lay membership who were eager to ensure that their own reputation did not suffer as a result of misbehaviour on the Twelfth of July and at other public demonstrations.

Pickering's assertions sit uneasily with common understanding of the Order and of the Home Rule crisis, but they were also supported by Frankfort Moore, who, in his 1914 work *The truth about Ulster* 'recalled how it was the rising threat of Home Rule that had given the Orange Institution, formerly regarded as 'an unmitigated nuisance', a new level of respectability in the eyes of middle-class Protestants.'<sup>122</sup> While it is true that Home Rule may have had Orangemen on their best behaviour for fear of beginning a civil war at the wrong moment, the roots of respectability are deeper in the Institution than Moore suggested.

An essential facet of Orangeism is the desire *from below* to be seen as respectable. Despite this, autonomous movement toward respectability has rarely been reflected in the historiography. This is perhaps because it neither fits with the class conscious Independent Orangeism of Henry Patterson's

---

<sup>121</sup> *The Times* (29 December 1910).

<sup>122</sup> Quoted in S.J. Connolly and Gillian McIntosh, 'Whose city? Belonging and exclusion in the nineteenth century urban world', in S.J. Connolly (ed.), *Belfast 400: people, place and history* (Liverpool, 2012), p. 252.

study, nor with the rough and ready portrayal of other historians.<sup>123</sup> Likewise in detailed studies of the Order in Scotland, this dimension of its character has been eclipsed by a model which holds there to be a division, or even a dialectic, between a domineering Grand Lodge and the unruly or less respectable private lodges below it.<sup>124</sup> In these models, only those attempting to climb the Orange hierarchy are portrayed as respectable, with non-office holders generally labelled “rough”. This is an unfortunate simplification which either erases working-class, respectable Orangemen, or suggests they simply followed the instructions of those in positions of authority. The ability of Orangemen to embrace or defy instruction from the Grand Lodge of Scotland or Ireland should not be underestimated. Even acquiescence can still involve an exercise of autonomy.

None of this is to suggest that there were not sustained efforts by the Grand Lodge of Ireland to impose standards of behaviour upon working-class members. In the *Laws and ordinances of the Orange Institution in Ireland*, the disciplinary codes of the Order make quite clear that ‘offences against religion or morality’, which included disreputable behaviour, were the most serious offenses, and were alone punishable by expulsion.<sup>125</sup> Similarly during the third Home Rule crisis, the Grand Lodge of Ireland was at pains to

---

<sup>123</sup> Patterson, *Class conflict and sectarianism*, p. 11.

<sup>124</sup> See chapters five and six for more on class in Scotland. McFarland, *Protestants first*, p. 140;

Webster, *The religion of Orange politics*, pp 58-64.

<sup>125</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Laws and ordinances*, p. 10.

emphasise the respectability and discipline of the Order, and to ensure private lodges lived up to the standards it set. In another example from the period, the Grand Lodge was active in pursuing disciplinary procedures through the County Grand Lodge of Antrim against two members who had been expelled from the Ulster Volunteer Force for disreputable behaviour.<sup>126</sup> Such cases demonstrate the clear role of the Grand Lodge in enforcing respectable behaviour and attempting to exert control over private lodges. So, rather than suggesting that such dynamics did not exist, it is important to problematise what is an overly simplistic model of the Order's behaviour which suggests that discipline in the Institution was preserved only by the efforts of the Grand Lodge and those seeking election to it.

In *Class conflict and sectarianism*, Patterson argues that Orangeism 'derived its significance not simply as a pliant instrument in the hands of the bourgeoisie, but as a relatively autonomous institution with practices and demands that could and did bring it, or sections of its members, into conflict with the leaders of Belfast Conservatism.'<sup>127</sup> In this effort to delineate the Grand Lodge of Ireland from the class conscious strain of Independent Orangeism which was his focus, Patterson rightly diagnoses the autonomy of working-class members of the Order. But, in the process, he fails to adequately address the significant body within the Order who used that autonomy to adhere to the existent social and religious order. In

---

<sup>126</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report, June 1914*, p. 10.

<sup>127</sup> Patterson, *Class conflict and sectarianism*, p. xii.

demonstrating the significance of this body within the Orange working class, and to understand how it shaped their behaviour, it is useful to make a case study of the phenomenon of temperance within the Institution.

While no one has yet sought to make a case study of temperance within the Order explicitly, its relationship with dissenting denominations attracted the attention of David Fitzpatrick in his account of Protestant descendancy in Ireland. Fitzpatrick writes, almost as an aside, that the 'returns of just over 200 Belfast lodges in 1910 reveal that 2,934 brethren belonged to 60 Temperance lodges and 1,474 to 30 Total Abstinence lodges, together representing 47.9% of total returned membership (9,195).'<sup>128</sup> It is surely remarkable that at the beginning of the third Home Rule crisis half the Orangemen in Belfast at least attempted to refrain from alcohol either at Orange events or completely.<sup>129</sup>

Given this preponderance, it is also surprising that such temperance has not had a greater impact on scholarship or public perception of the Orange Order. Indeed, at every level of the Order it seems efforts were made to deter drunkenness and violence and to promote respectable behaviour and abstinence. The rules of the Institution itself demanded that every master and

---

<sup>128</sup> Fitzpatrick, *Descendancy*, p. 85.

<sup>129</sup> Geraldine Vaughan has also highlighted that in Scotland in latter half of the nineteenth century the Orange Order frequently contested local elections by campaigning on the temperance issue. See: Geraldine Vaughan, *The 'local' Irish in the West of Scotland, 1851-1921* (Basingstoke, 2013), pp 97-100.

deputy-master in the Order 'maintain sobriety and good order in his lodge.'<sup>130</sup> Drinking, where it was tolerated, was permitted only once formal proceedings had finished.<sup>131</sup> Publicans were banned from holding office within the Order, and longstanding rules dictated that lodges could not meet within a public house unless the district and county lodges had approved it.<sup>132</sup> That public processions and lodge meetings sometimes descended into drunken disorder might show that many of its members ignored these rules, but it is not evidence that the Order was unconcerned with such behaviour or that it did not make an effort to promote alternatives.

Indeed, in 1912, the special correspondent of *The Times* was eager to highlight that a remarkable change had occurred in Belfast since the turn of the twentieth century and attributed it to an increase in abstinence: 'In Belfast, too, the feeling in favour of temperance has greatly developed among Orangemen [...]. No wonder there has been a great improvement in the behaviour of Belfast Orangemen, dating from about 12 years ago.'<sup>133</sup> This outside view reveals the way in which abstinence and respectable behaviour were commonly associated in the Edwardian era and demonstrates how, through abstinence, the Order gained respectability. In their resistance of temptation, those members of the Order who had foregone alcohol could be held up as respectable working-class men, and thus the

---

<sup>130</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Laws and ordinances*, p. 3.

<sup>131</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 11.

<sup>132</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 5.

<sup>133</sup> *The Times* (4 October 1912).

bedrock of a respectable Ulster unionism during the third Home Rule crisis. Their sobriety was then juxtaposed with the drunken reputation of southern nationalists, despite the latter drinking proportionately less than the rest of the United Kingdom.<sup>134</sup>

Within private lodges themselves, the effects of temperance were perhaps less grandiose. The minutes of the large and long-titled 'Imperial Temperance Murphy Memorial Loyal Orange Lodge Number 929' in this period give some indication of this. The Lodge was based in a dedicated Orange hall located on Clifton Street in Belfast and had over one hundred members from 1910 to 1914.<sup>135</sup> The prohibition of alcohol during all Orange Order meetings which was mentioned above meant that temperance did not drastically affect the formal business of Lodge Number 929. Rather, its effects manifested in the cultures and practices surrounding the Lodge.

The social activities outside formal lodge business formed an important part of the Orange Order's appeal. Social events and lectures spoke to a greater or lesser extent to self-improvement, but beyond the relatively stale agenda of process and prayer, such activity was the lifeblood of the Institution. These

---

<sup>134</sup> Diarmaid Ferriter, 'Drink and society in twentieth-century Ireland', in *Proceedings of the Royal Irish Academy: Archaeology, Culture, History, Literature, CXC*, no. 100, 'Food and Drink in Ireland' (2015), p. 352.

<sup>135</sup> Lodge Number 929, *Minutebook*, 6 January 1910.

Note: Imperial Temperance Loyal Orange Lodge Number 929 voted to change its name in 1912 after the death of the worshipful master, and so became Imperial Temperance Murphy Memorial Loyal Orange Lodge Number 929.

events differed in a temperance lodge mainly in the fare on offer, which was made up of non-alcoholic refreshments, tea and fruit. Orange songs would then be sung, making for a 'most enjoyable programme'.<sup>136</sup> A quite astonishing amount of the business of Lodge 929 was taken up with the planning of these dry social events, further highlighting their significance. Motions and debates about the nature of refreshments and the purchase of tablecloths in some cases spanned months before eventually being resolved. Gratifyingly, by 1913 it had finally been decided that where appropriate 'minerals' and white tablecloths would be purchased for their social events.<sup>137</sup>

Elsewhere in the Order the benefits of this temperance were extolled by the temperate. At the Earl of Roden's Total Abstinence Loyal Orange Lodge Number 246 in 1910, members agreed that 'nothing had done their Institution more harm than that accursed drink' and praised that they 'were now banded together as total abstainers'.<sup>138</sup> Even more explicit, speaking at an Orange social event connected to the Britannia Total Abstinence Loyal Orange Lodge Number 1201 in April of the same year, Br. Thomas McEvoy confirmed the importance of respectability and temperance to the Order in Belfast:

Looking back upon his childhood, he recalled that the Twelfth of July was not spent in the manner which it was now spent. Strong drink had almost disappeared from the majority of the lodges. (applause.) "Righteousness exalteth a nation," said the Bible, and surely

---

<sup>136</sup> Lodge Number 929, *Minutebook*, 6 January 1910.

<sup>137</sup> *Ibid.*, 7 August 1913.

<sup>138</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (31 March 1910).

righteousness was exalting the Orange Order. The bad old days had forever passed, and he looked forward to the time when every Orange lodge would be run on exclusively total abstinence principles.<sup>139</sup>

The passage illustrates a number of the key themes of this chapter and of this thesis more widely. In the first instance it highlights that drink and disreputable behaviour were closely associated in the minds of many Orangemen. To finish the passage which Br. Thomas quoted, 'Righteousness exalteth a nation: but sin is a reproach to any people.'<sup>140</sup> Thus drunkenness, rough behaviour and ultimately sin were associated in the minds of Belfast's Orangemen and, conversely, temperance, respectability and righteousness were seen as intimately related concepts.

Beyond such examples, a more direct manifestation of respectability and its links to temperance are visible in the strict disciplinary practices of Lodge Number 929. It appears that the punishment for members who succumbed to temptation was relatively mild, with Lodge Number 929's minutebook suggesting a fine of 5s. But, crucially, it appears that such punishments were reserved for those whose crimes were committed in private. More serious was the case of Brothers Thompson and Gordon who, on demonstration in Carrickfergus in 1910, became drunk. Detail of their behaviour afterwards is limited in the report, but their unbecoming conduct and drunkenness was castigated by members of the Lodge's executive. Eventually Thompson and

---

<sup>139</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (14 April 1910).

<sup>140</sup> *Proverbs 14:34*.

Gordon were each suspended from membership for two years.<sup>141</sup> This sentence was significantly more draconian than the relatively minor fines which were awarded to members who took drink in private, indeed the two-year membership ban was among the most severe punishments available. The psyche behind such punishment clearly existed in stark contrast to the behaviour of many Orangemen on the Twelfth of July, but highlights the very different attitudes towards alcohol and respectability which existed within the Order, speaking to the differing identities within the Institution in Belfast at this time.

Lodge Number 929's distaste for alcohol manifested itself again in their response to the "Castledawson affair" where the Lodge's staunch aversion to drunkenness and poor behaviour caused them to reject the requests of their brethren for funds. Throughout the third Home Rule crisis Lodge Number 929 was frequently willing to contribute to a variety of different funds which it encountered through circulars from other lodges. Whether it was in charitable donations or contributions to the raising of Orange halls, Lodge Number 929's healthy balance sheet afforded it a level of largesse.<sup>142</sup> Indeed, across a four year period, one of the only funds which it refused to contribute to was in defraying the legal expenses for seven Orangemen 'sent for trial in connection with the Castledawson affair'.<sup>143</sup>

---

<sup>141</sup> Lodge Number 929, *Minutebook*, 1 July 1910; *Ibid.*, 4 August 1910.

<sup>142</sup> *Ibid.*, 26 June 1910.

<sup>143</sup> *Ibid.*, 5 September 1912

The affair in question referred to an attack by members of the Ancient Order of Hibernians on Protestant Sunday school children on parade. The attack by the Hibernians and their efforts to seize a union flag neatly melded the twin anxieties of Protestants and unionists about the likely consequences of Home Rule. Roused by the violence, Orangemen from the town of Castledawson joined the fray, and they and the Hibernians engaged in a violent and increasingly drunken melee, which came to spill out across Ulster.<sup>144</sup> The response of Protestant workers in Belfast was to expel Catholic workers from Belfast's shipyards. Expulsions had happened sporadically over the three Home Rule crises, and in 1886 had led to the expulsion of 190 of the 225 Catholic workers in Harland and Wolfe shipyard. It should be noted here that at the time Harland and Wolfe had a total workforce of around 3,000.<sup>145</sup> Importantly, though, Austen Morgan has argued that this expulsion was not the work of labour aristocrats: that, 'Protestant rivet-heaters, unskilled workers who assisted riveters, were largely responsible'.<sup>146</sup> Morgan's formidable account of the expulsions casts further doubt on the utility of the labour aristocracy for understanding sectarian tensions in this period, but for the purposes of this thesis it is enough to note that the negative attention the affair drew on Protestants and labour practices in Belfast caused alarm among the Orangemen of Lodge

---

<sup>144</sup> *Freeman's Journal* (23 July 1912); Jane McGaughey, *Ulster's Men: Protestant Unionist Masculinities and Militarization in the North of Ireland, 1912-1923* (Belfast, 2012), pp 53-54.

<sup>145</sup> Royle, *Portrait of an industrial city*, p. 153.

<sup>146</sup> Morgan, *Labour and partition*, p. 16.

Number 929. Amid an escalating scandal, they refused to aid the brethren involved in the original affray, perhaps because of its resonance. In contradistinction to their usual generosity, this lodge of temperate and respectable Orangemen were unwilling to support their brothers in need. This, then, was a reflection of the moral and social code of Lodge Number 929, which frowned upon any transgression of respectability through drunken behaviour.

Where possible, Lodge 929 used its influence to punish transgressions of its social and moral code by members of the Order both within and outwith their own lodge, and in particular, rowdy behaviour associated with alcohol. As a result, their temperance provides a clear example of the ways in which respectability and its pursuit modified the behaviour of working-class Orangemen. It seems that in the Orange Order, structures of religious and moral authority supported rather than overrode working-class autonomy. Such evidence helps to correct the slight misunderstanding of working-class respectability as working-class acquiescence. Indeed, perhaps the key to understanding respectability as a construct is to recognise its ability to ally a section of the working class with the middle and upper classes. As the exercises of autonomy in this chapter demonstrate, though, this was an alliance in the true sense of the word, not a vassalage.

Just as Simon Cordery argues that such features define working-class respectability, so the rules and structure of the Orange Institution proved sympathetic to those members of the working class who sought to make themselves respectable, including through temperance. Indeed, the very 'qualifications of candidates' for the Order made a virtue of 'temperance and sobriety' and linked these traits with the proper worship of God in the Reformed Faith.<sup>147</sup> Care must be taken to highlight the distinctions between the Order's temperance and the 'temperance movement', but as this chapter will now demonstrate, including Orangeism within the histories of respectability and temperance affords us a new and intriguing perspective of the phenomena.

### **A new context**

Discussing the historiography of the temperance movement, A.E. Dingle has written that the historian faces difficulty in recapturing the beliefs and ideals of their subject:

*This problem is particularly acute with the prohibitionist because he appears to be such an alien and unsympathetic figure to later generations. The problem is compounded because the American experience with prohibition has demonstrated to modern eyes the futility of this approach to social reform and clothed it in a faint aura of ridicule.*<sup>148</sup>

---

<sup>147</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Laws and ordinances*, p. 2.

<sup>148</sup> A.E. Dingle, *The campaign for prohibition in Victorian London* (London, 1980), pp 7-8.

Additionally, a good deal of confusion exists within British and Irish historiography about temperance movements and their relationships in Ulster. Even generally thorough and admirable works of history such as Mike Mecham's recent biography of William Walker tend to confuse different strains of temperance, combining them such that the resultant brew is often muddled and unsatisfying.<sup>149</sup>

There were distinct temperance movements in Britain and Ireland in the Victorian and Edwardian eras, and there has been much confusion about which of these influenced Ulster Protestants. Additionally, in the decades prior to the third Home Rule crisis, the Ulster Revival had breathed new religious fervour into Ulster and also into the Orange Order from 1859 onwards.<sup>150</sup> Despite this fervour though, Elizabeth Malcolm has argued convincingly that the Revival had only a modest impact on the general trend of decreasing spirit consumption in the Ulster.<sup>151</sup> Thus, while of course plausible, it seems unlikely that the prevalence of temperance in the Orange Order is directly attributable to the Revival of 1859.

---

<sup>149</sup> Specifically Mecham attributes all temperance in Ulster to the spread of teetotalism from England, likely because of his own focus on the Rechabites, who are discussed more extensively below: Mecham, *William Walker*, p. 102.

<sup>150</sup> Andrew Holmes, 'The experience and understanding of religious Revival in Ulster Presbyterianism, c. 1800-1930', in *Irish Historical Studies* XXXIV, no. 136 (2005), p. 372.

<sup>151</sup> Elizabeth Malcolm, *'Ireland sober, Ireland free': drink and temperance in nineteenth century Ireland* (Dublin, 1986), p. 167.

Perhaps more influential was the larger movement across Britain for the limitation and prohibition of the sale of alcohol which was gathering speed, especially among dissenting churches and organisations on the fringes of the Liberal Party.<sup>152</sup> The historiography of this movement is discussed shortly, but it is worth stating here that while this movement may have had some influence on temperance culture within Ulster and the Orange Order, its place in the story has been over-emphasised up this point. Indeed, correlation has often wrongfully been considered causation.

Another strain was the huge temperance movement associated with Father Mathew and the Cork Total Abstinence Society which had reportedly attracted 'millions of followers all over Ireland' in the years from 1840 to 1842.<sup>153</sup> Paul Townend argues that by 1843 'at least half of the adult population of Ireland had 'taken the pledge', while public drunkenness had virtually disappeared in many areas.'<sup>154</sup> Colm Kerrigan suggests that this extended even unto the Orange Order in Ulster, where Father Mathew's success was 'a tribute to his ability to avoid political or religious subjects in the course of his crusade.'<sup>155</sup> However, one should be sceptical about what Kerrigan defines as success in this regard. J.F. Quinn has argued convincingly that while Protestants in Ulster did not show hostility to

---

<sup>152</sup> J.R. Greenway, 'Bishops, brewers and the liquor question in England 1890-1914', *Historical Magazine of the Protestant Episcopal Church*, LIII, no. 1 (March, 1984), p. 64.

<sup>153</sup> Paul Townend, *Father Mathew, Temperance and Irish Identity* (Dublin, 2002), p. 5.

<sup>154</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>155</sup> Colm Kerrigan, *Father Mathew and the Irish Temperance Movement 1838-1849* (Cork, 1992), p. 113.

Mathew's crusade, they did not join in large numbers either.<sup>156</sup> Indeed, despite meeting with Colonel William Blacker, a former leader of the Orange Order in Newry in August of 1841, there is little evidence to suggest Mathew found many converts within the Order for his crusade.<sup>157</sup>

Beyond this, though, Quinn also provides the most reasonable explanation for the emergence of temperance in Ulster, tracing it back to the activity of the American Temperance Society in 1829. In fact, 'John Edgar along with four other ministers and one lay-man, founded the Ulster Temperance Society in Belfast' in September of that year.<sup>158</sup> As Quinn goes on to detail, the Ulster Temperance Society had links to the Orange Order, including Colonel William Blacker:

When the Orange Order dissolved itself in 1836, Blacker, a temperance enthusiast, urged the ex-Orangemen to join the new temperance associations. He believed that the Orange Lodges, when functioning properly, fostered discipline, self-control, and other virtues among the members and the temperance societies could exercise a similar influence. Many former Orangemen evidently took Blacker's advice. George Bretherton notes that the Ulster temperance societies expanded dramatically in the months after the Orange Order closed and believes this was no coincidence.<sup>159</sup>

Elizabeth Malcom has cautioned against assuming that such temperance societies were Orange Lodges by another name, but suggests instead that

---

<sup>156</sup> J.F. Quinn, *Father Mathew's crusade: temperance in nineteenth-century Ireland and Irish America* (Amherst, 2002), p. 89.

<sup>157</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 88.

<sup>158</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 47.

<sup>159</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 49.

they may have served to 'detach former Orangemen from their old allies, the publicans, and give them a more respectable image.'<sup>160</sup> That such members brought a renewed commitment to temperance back to the Loyal Orange Institution after its prohibition seems quite reasonable. Thus, while the other three potential origins of temperance within the Order, that is, the British temperance movement, Father Mathew's crusade and the Ulster Revival, all likely contributed something to the success of temperance within the Institution, the Ulster Temperance Society seems the most likely forbear.

This explanation also conforms to Alvin Jackson's argument that within Ulster in this period such organisations and movements were almost always divided along sectarian lines; best understood as existing in a 'hermetically sealed' Protestant society whether overtly or 'merely as an unquestioned feature of a movement's values'.<sup>161</sup> While there were exceptions to this, including the construction of Belfast Working Men's Institute and Temperance Hall, they remain notable as exceptions.<sup>162</sup> Recently the focus of an excellent study by Alice Johnson, the Belfast Working Men's Institute and Temperance Hall seems nearly anomalous as a Belfast institution which functioned under the ethos and rationale of the British temperance movement transposed onto a Belfast context.<sup>163</sup> In this respect, it stood in stark contrast to the exclusively

---

<sup>160</sup> Malcolm, *Ireland sober*, p. 80.

<sup>161</sup> Alvin Jackson, 'Unionist politics and Protestant society in Edwardian Ireland', in *The Historical Journal* XXXIII, no. 4 (Dec., 1990), p. 858.

<sup>162</sup> Alice Johnson "Some hidden purpose'? Class conflict and co-operation in Belfast's Working Men's Institute and Temperance Hall 1865-1900', in *Social History* XLII, no. 3 (2017), pp 399-419.

<sup>163</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 412 and p. 418.

sectarian formations of temperance and respectability elsewhere in the city and Ulster, and was, numerically speaking, far less significant than the temperance of the Orange Order. With this in mind, it is necessary to consider why the temperance of members of the Orange Order has generally fallen outside the parameters of temperance historians' study.

Outside of Father Mathew's crusade in Ireland which is generally considered in isolation, most scholarship on British and Irish temperance has focused on what was essentially a campaign to exert parliamentary pressure to implement legal reform. While some scholarship has considered those aspects of temperance which were associated with working-class respectability, the Orange Order and Ulster seem to have fallen outwith these boundaries.<sup>164</sup> In Britain, temperance was driven by an activist base inspired by a combination of liberal reform and disestablishmentarianism, it was distinct from that of the Orange Order and the Ulster Temperance Society.<sup>165</sup> Indeed, for the most part temperance remained a partisan issue in Britain to 1908 and beyond.<sup>166</sup> But too often in considering temperance as a phenomenon in Britain and Ireland, the subject has been narrowed to this essentially Liberal and English temperance movement.

---

<sup>164</sup> More has been written on the subject of Ireland and alcohol, but this is clearly distinct.

<sup>165</sup> Greenway, 'Bishops, brewers and the liquor question', p. 72.

<sup>166</sup> D.M. Fahey, 'The politics of drink: pressure groups and the British Liberal Party, 1883-1908', in *Social Science* LIV, no. 2 (Spring, 1979), p. 76.

Brian Harrison in his work *Drink and the Victorians* describes well the movement as it developed in England in the middle of the nineteenth century, as ‘the teetotallers and the prohibitionists directed attention away from an other-worldly paradise towards an earthly utopia, which would be realized after moral suasion or prohibition had teetotalized the world.’<sup>167</sup> He has convincingly argued that ‘temperance reformers were at all times mobilized into a ‘movement’’, however, this definition again excludes the temperance lodges of the Orange Order, even in Liverpool, a location within his study.<sup>168</sup> This is perhaps a methodological problem, then, that the phenomenon of temperance in Britain and Ireland and the English temperance movement are too often amalgamated.

Indeed, the pan-denominational Protestantism of the Order and its temperance offers a challenge to this portrayal, where Presbyterians, Anglicans and to a lesser extent Methodists were present in temperance lodges.<sup>169</sup> The inclusion of dissenting churches in the Order is considered elsewhere, and while significant, it is clear that temperance within the Orange Order in Belfast was not so driven by non-conformist members as it was in Britain.

---

<sup>167</sup> Brian Harrison, *Drink and the Victorians: the temperance question in England 1815-1872* (London, 1971), p. 31.

<sup>168</sup> Harrison, *Drink and the Victorians*, p. 19.

<sup>169</sup> Lodge Number 929, *Minutebook*, *passim*.

Another mark of distinction between the two was in the temperance movement's support of Liberalism. Having failed to make ground with the general populace in Britain up to 1871, the movement effectively abandoned mass politics in favour of parliamentary campaigning. As A.E. Dingle argues, their work was not that 'of a mass popular movement, but of a relatively small group of well organised and dedicated political activists.'<sup>170</sup> This was a consequence of the requirement for legislation, and that prohibitionists were political outsiders.<sup>171</sup> That they were drawn to the opposition, the Liberal Party, in advocating reform is therefore unsurprising.<sup>172</sup> However, despite some prominent examples of Liberal unionists within the Orange Order, the association of temperance with the Liberal Party proved alienating for many Belfast Orangemen.

Writing in the *Belfast Weekly News* in November of 1914, one Orangeman was quick to attack the government for its failure on the issue of temperance:

The great temperance government – those models of Nonconformity and the Nonconformist conscience – instead of shutting up the beer houses and the gin palaces which are poisoning the men who are to fight the battles of the country, are going to make money out of the meanest business that ever cursed the country. Why does not this Government of all the virtues do as the brave Czar of Russia has done? He has prohibited the sale of alcohol throughout his vast dominions.<sup>173</sup>

---

<sup>170</sup> Dingle, *The campaign for prohibition*, p. 222.

<sup>171</sup> Dingle, *The campaign for prohibition*, p. 9.

<sup>172</sup> Greenway, 'Bishops, brewers and the liquor question', p. 72.

<sup>173</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (26 November 1914).

The passage is notable because it attacks the Liberal administration from the position that they had not been radical enough on the issue of temperance. While many temperance activists were dissatisfied with the reforms introduced, the critique of this temperate Orangeman seems designed to dissuade other temperance activists from supporting the government. Likewise, the reference to Tsarist Russia is interesting and highlights the transnational dimension of such activism, though it does not appear to have been a popular comparison among Orangemen. The article went on to extol the virtues of the Order in its campaign for temperance, and also suggested that temperate Orangemen enlisted in the army were having a positive influence on their brothers in arms.<sup>174</sup>

In Scotland, where temperance was also popular within the Order, some members were clearly concerned that the temperance issue might lead to Orangemen supporting the Liberal Party. A.C. Hardie, addressing an Orange gathering in Bishopbriggs, declared the duty of Orangemen in no uncertain terms:

Who would be found to trust such a pack of men [the Liberal Party], sworn enemies to their country, and men who cheered when their brave soldiers met with reverses? But what was to be said about those people in their own district and all over Scotland, whom they found lending themselves to support the Roman Catholic following, in anything and everything, for the sake of their support in probably carrying a Temperance Bill, men who would sacrifice their country and their kith and kin in Ulster, so that their little parochial ideas might be

---

<sup>174</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (26 November 1914).

passed. Nobody wanted to be more temperate than he, but he wanted temperance carried out with justice.<sup>175</sup>

The speech sets out a number of the tensions which temperance brought to the Order. Again, the speaker is eager to emphasise his own commitment to temperance but goes on to directly criticise other Orangemen for supporting the Liberal Party on the basis of temperance. This is couched in terms of the greater betrayal of their brethren in Ulster. Ultimately, Hepburn argues that support for the Liberal Party on the 'parochial' issue of temperance was unconscionable for Orangemen.

This opposition to the Liberal Party, but still with a devout commitment to temperance, also accords with the work of David Fahey, who has argued that 'few voters made temperance reform the sole criterion in casting their ballots.'<sup>176</sup> That around 5,000 Orangemen in Belfast and more across Ulster, Scotland and the north of England have been excluded from temperance histories suggests an over-emphasis on parliamentary manoeuvring within the historiography. Alongside the Order, a glaring omission has been the Independent Order of Rechabites.

The Rechabites had many similarities to the Orange Order, and while English in origin, represent a popular associationalism often absent in the literature on temperance. Its name is taken from *Jeremiah 35:8*: 'Thus we have

---

<sup>175</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (20 February 1913).

<sup>176</sup> Fahey, 'The politics of drink', p. 80.

obeyed the voice of Jonadab the son of Rechab our father in all that he hath charges us, to drink no wine all our days, we, our wives, our sons, nor our daughters.<sup>177</sup> Like the Order, the Rechabites adopted a federated structure of lodges or ‘tents’ as they were known. They had a variety of officer roles with elaborate titles and ceremonial regalia, further echoing the masonic origins of such practices within the Orange Order.<sup>178</sup> Despite originating in the north of England, Rechabism quickly proved popular in Scotland and Ulster, with particular strength among skilled and respectable Presbyterian shipyard workers in Glasgow and Belfast.<sup>179</sup> Indeed, there appears to have been some overlap between the Order and the Rechabites at least in terms of members, as well as with the Independent Orange Order.

Mike Mecham has, in particular, charted the association of Thomas Sloan with Belfast trade unionist William Walker and the Rechabites.<sup>180</sup> In Scotland, Norma Davies argues there were strong links between the two organisations in what she labels ‘Tory Rechabism’, identified with Orange elements and particularly strong in Maryhill and Motherwell.<sup>181</sup> This ability to entice a broad range of Protestants into the Rechabites led to a large membership, which went on to include juveniles and women. Indeed, Davies estimates that by

---

<sup>177</sup> *Jeremiah 35:8*. See also: *1 Chronicles 2:55*. One Orange lodge in Portadown at this time was also named after Rechab, as was another in Partick.

<sup>178</sup> Mecham, *William Walker*, p. 107.

<sup>179</sup> Norma Davies Logan, *Drink and society: Scotland 1870-1914* (Unpublished PhD thesis, University of Glasgow, October 1983), p. 189; Mecham, *William Walker*, p. 108.

<sup>180</sup> Mecham, *William Walker*, p. 112.

<sup>181</sup> Logan, *Drink and society*, p. 193.

1886 there were as many as 30,000 juvenile Rechabites in the United Kingdom.<sup>182</sup> Davies and Mechem together provide the only real studies of Rechabitism in Britain and Ireland, and its omission from classic accounts of the temperance movement highlights the same phenomenon by which Orangeism is excluded.

That mass popular support for temperance through associations such as the Rechabites and the Orange Order has been neglected in traditional accounts of temperance is surely a weakness in the literature. By neglecting such organisations and their associated geographies from consideration, an overly simplified account of non-conformist, English and Liberal temperance in Victorian and Edwardian Britain and Ireland is presented. The Rechabites and the Orange Order provide a useful foil to this, especially in Belfast.

As with respectability, so too with temperance, situating the Orange Order within this new context achieves two things. First, it highlights the error in viewing the Order as somehow exceptional. Clearly the Orange Order was part of a wider temperance phenomenon in Ulster, but in abstaining from alcohol, its members joined many thousands of men, women and children across Ireland and Britain. Second, it also problematises existing histories of temperance. While the Order's temperance was of a different strain to both the Crusade of Father Mathew and the English temperance movement, its

---

<sup>182</sup> Logan, *Drink and society*, p. 199.

sheer prevalence, and the prevalence of similar orders including the Rechabites, demands consideration. As with working-class respectability, more comprehensive and inclusive histories of temperance are required if the true influence of temperance on the lives of Victorian and Edwardian men, women and children is to be recovered.

### **Concluding notes**

In this chapter on class, temperance and respectability in Belfast Orangeism during the third Home Rule crisis five arguments have been made. First, this analysis of the class composition of the Order refutes the widespread belief, stemming from Peter Gibbon's thesis, that the Orange Order in Ireland existed to facilitate or otherwise maintain a labour aristocracy or artisanate. Instead, from the limited information available it seems more likely that the Order, at least in Belfast, more likely acted to unite skilled and unskilled working-class Protestants. Second, in the Orange Order in Belfast from 1910 to 1914 a substantial part of its working-class membership exercised autonomy and promoted respectable behaviour, accounts of which have been largely absent from existing scholarship. Recognising this and recalibrating understanding of the Order is important not simply for providing a more accurate portrayal of the Orange Institution, but in how it alters our understanding of other respectable working-class institutions and groups in this period. Third, and as evidenced above, it is clear that this section of the Order's membership had a significant impact on the behaviour and nature of

the Institution. Through such behaviour, many working-class members of the Order supported the rules and ordinances of the Institution and promoted internal class collaboration therein. But more than this, they defined their own roles in support of existing social structures within Ulster more widely. Fourth, the widespread temperance movement within the Order evidences a serious commitment on the part of many members which undermines, or at least recontextualises, popular beliefs about the Institution's relationship with alcohol. While the Institution's reputation for drunkenness is not wholly-earned, the level of temperance is not only striking, but surely demonstrates the ease with which stereotyping and popular perception still influence non-specialist historical scholarship on the Orange Order. Lastly, it is clear that the Order's temperance was of a different strain to that which has dominated historical accounts of temperance in the Victorian and Edwardian eras. Consequently, in situating the Order within accounts of Victorian and Edwardian popular movements, it is possible to challenge Anglocentric representations of such movements and to develop a fuller understanding of the various motivations and influences which affected their development in Britain and Ireland in this period.

## **Chapter two: public procession and the Ulster Volunteer Force**

On the morning of 12 July 1910, 220 years after the Battle of the Boyne, up to 40,000 Orangemen gathered in Belfast to celebrate the enduring legacy of King William III.<sup>183</sup> With as many as three times that number observing the procession, Belfast was swallowed by the fervour and pageantry which comes with Orange demonstrations. Indeed, such was the event's appeal that men and women had travelled from across the world to participate. Months before, Orange lodges in Belfast had engaged bands to accompany them as they walked, and the County Grand Lodge of Belfast had issued extensive instructions on the behaviour it expected from its members.<sup>184</sup> The County Grand Lodge of Belfast had invested considerably in the event, and the Twelfth demonstrations remained by far the largest portion of the Lodge's remarkably modest outgoings each year, totalling almost £53 in 1910.<sup>185</sup> While this figure might seem small, the federated structure of the Orange Order meant that most expenses were incurred at a private lodge level, and frequently 'walking dues', the fees paid by members to participate in parades, were raised in lodges to help pay such expenses.<sup>186</sup> This is to say that there

---

<sup>183</sup> *The Times* reported that 40,000 Orangemen attended, while the *Irish Times* did not give a figure, but suggested that it took over two hours for the procession to pass a given point. While we cannot be sure about the exact number, the figure serves as a useful general indicator of the size of the procession. *The Times* (13 July 1910) and *Irish Times* (13 July 1910).

<sup>184</sup> Lodge Number 929, *Minutebook*, 5 March 1910;

*Program for the Belfast 12<sup>th</sup> July celebrations 1910* (PRONI: D3815/H/3).

<sup>185</sup> County Grand Lodge of Belfast, *Report of proceedings of the County Grand Lodge of Belfast, 1910* (Belfast, 1910), accessible at the Museum of Orange Heritage, Belfast, p. 49.

<sup>186</sup> Lodge Number 929, *Minutebook*, 1 July 1910.

were longstanding preparations for the most important date in the Orange calendar.

The march began from Carlisle Circus at '9.30 a.m. prompt.'<sup>187</sup> From there, the Orangemen walked along Clifton Street through the centre of Belfast, across the Lagan and out of the city under glorious sunshine. Through streets bedecked with Orange paraphernalia, marshalled by members holding small white flags and accompanied by the din of flute and drum the Orange Order marched.<sup>188</sup> The processionists themselves dressed in respectable clothes, wore orange and purple sashes, carried sticks, umbrellas and banners. Their route was different to that taken by Orangemen today, with their longer walk ending at Ballymenoch at 1.30 p.m. As they went, they passed under Orange arches; elaborate displays of dyed linen and timber which showcased the emerging industrial craftsmanship of Belfast's skilled workers.<sup>189</sup> This assault on the senses dominated the urban throng of the city as the parade took over the streets.

Leaving a calm of sorts behind them, the Orangemen made their way towards the parade ground at Ballymenoch where the leaders of Irish unionism, the Orange Order and the Ulster Volunteer Force would address

---

<sup>187</sup> *Program for the Belfast 12<sup>th</sup> July celebrations 1910.*

<sup>188</sup> *Ibid* and *Irish Times* (13 July 1910).

<sup>189</sup> Elizabeth Tonkin and Dominic Bryan, 'Political ritual: time and temporality' in Alice Bonholm, (ed.), *Political rituals* (Gothenburg, 1997), p. 20; Jarman, 'The Orange Arch', p. 9.

the rally. The speeches were opened by the Reverend J.B. Crozier, Lord Primate of All Ireland.<sup>190</sup> Resolutions in favour of the Unionist Party and against Home Rule followed, along with the more overtly anti-Catholic denouncements of any proposed change to the Coronation Oath.<sup>191</sup> Far from detracting from the celebratory atmosphere of the Twelfth day rally, though, these speeches and their sectarian content added to the fervour of the crowd.

After the rally and the long walk back to Belfast, and unlike many anniversaries before 1910, the celebrations which followed did not descend into violence. Indeed, members were instructed to do their utmost to prevent damage to the field itself and to take their glass with them when they left.<sup>192</sup> While at odds with a deserved reputation for drunken violence, this muted and orderly behaviour characterised Twelfth celebrations during the Home Rule crisis and speaks to the Order's quest for respectability covered in the previous chapter.

Over a century since that day, the Order has continued to mark and march upon the "Twelfth", and the celebrations have become synonymous with the Loyal Orange Institution, if not with Northern Ireland itself. Consequently,

---

<sup>190</sup> *Irish Times* (16 July 1910).

<sup>191</sup> John Wolffe, 'Protestantism, monarchy and the deference of Christian Britain, 1837-2005', in C.G. Brown and Michael Snape (eds), *Secularisation in the Christian World: essays in honour of Hugh McLeod* (Oxford, 2016), pp 62-64.

<sup>192</sup> *Program for the Belfast 12<sup>th</sup> July celebrations 1910*.

Orange demonstrations have received some academic attention and are more commonly studied than other aspects of the Order. Dominic Bryan has paid particular attention to Orange parades and argued that they act not only as the expression of a dominant culture within Ulster, but are also sites of class tension within the Orange Order and unionism more widely. Bryan further suggests that the 'ability to utilise ritual events by providing them with a dominant meaning rarely goes unopposed and that even within parades there is resistance to these processes.'<sup>193</sup> Bryan argues that in resisting the instructions of the Grand Lodge on parade day by behaving badly, working-class members of the Order were able to display their dissatisfaction.

Without directly contradicting Bryan, this thesis demonstrates that the resistance of such expectations occurred with ebbs and flows over the life of the Institution. Indeed, while Henry Patterson's detailed study of the Independent Orange Order up to 1910 considers the high point of such class conflict, the third Home Rule crisis itself saw the opposite. In it, Unionism and unionists were bound together more closely than in the years immediately prior to it. Throughout the crisis, as will be shown, there remained an Orange contingent who helped maintain order on parade.<sup>194</sup> This perhaps explains why Belfast remained relatively quiet on the night of the Twelfth in 1910.

---

<sup>193</sup> Bryan, *Orange parades*, p. 8.

<sup>194</sup> Patterson, *Class conflict and sectarianism*.

Neglecting the ebbs and flows of the history of the Institution, much of the recent scholarship of Orange parades has been highly context dependent - specifically in relation to the Good Friday/Belfast Agreement.<sup>195</sup> In particular, sociologists and those academics otherwise interested in the Northern Ireland peace process have written extensively on the contemporary protests at Drumcree.<sup>196</sup> As a result, many such works on contemporary Orangeism are locked in the cognitive vice of the peace process; the dangers to it, and the effect the Order might have on the balance of power sharing at any given moment.

Perhaps of more utility when seeking to understand the phenomenon of Orange parading are those publications which have recently considered the dynamics of urban space in Belfast and its consequences. Late arrivals to the “spatial turn”, many of these works offer new insight into the ways in which the Orange Order used space and public processions to further their aims. In one example, S.J. Connolly demonstrates that the right to public space and procession was not a universal one during the Home Rule crises:

Orange parades, from the end of the 1870s, enjoyed an absolute right to take over the streets of the city centre and their choice among the main arteries leading out of town. Their nationalist equivalents were at times granted access to the centre, but at others were confined to their

---

<sup>195</sup> See for example: Edwards and Knottnerus, ‘The Orange Order’, pp 1-23.

<sup>196</sup> See for example: John Lloyd, ‘Ireland’s uncertain peace’, in *Foreign Affairs* LXXVII, no. 5 (Sep.-Oct., 1998), pp 109-122;

T.G. Fraser, ‘Orangeism, parading, and the Northern Ireland peace process’, in *New Hibernia Review / Iris Éireannach Nua* II, no. 2 (Summer, 1998), pp 71-84;

Christine Kinealy and Christine Grosse, ‘Les marches orangistes en Irlande du Nord. Histoire d’un droit’, in *Le Mouvement social* CCII (Jan.–Mar., 2003), pp 165-181.

own main residential area in west Belfast and the adjacent meeting place at Hannahstown.<sup>197</sup>

Connolly details the complexity of aligning liberal conceptions of public space in the late nineteenth century with the realities of the “Orange state” such as it existed in local government in Belfast at the time. This same theme is also developed by R.J. Morris with regards to the commission which followed the 1857 Belfast riots.<sup>198</sup>

These more explicit studies of urban space usefully contribute to the earlier work of historians including Donald MacRaild.<sup>199</sup> The maxim that ‘where you could walk you could control’ is popular in histories of the Orange Order, explaining part of the significance of Orange walks, but new studies emerging from the spatial turn provide more detail of the interaction between such behaviour and the relative hegemony of Orangeism in Belfast’s civic structures in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. The distinctly Protestant nature of the state in Belfast and also Glasgow during the Home Rule crisis perhaps allowed for this process in a way not seen in more contested territories including Liverpool.<sup>200</sup> Similarly, Elaine McFarland has demonstrated that over time Orangemen became conscious that their

---

<sup>197</sup> S.J. Connolly, ‘Public space and civil conflict’, in Dominic Bryan, S.J. Connolly and John Nagle (eds), *Civic identity and public space: Belfast since 1780* (Manchester, 2019), p. 122.

<sup>198</sup> R.J. Morris, ‘Reading the riot commission: Belfast, 1857’ in *Irish Historical Studies* XLIII no. 164 (Nov., 2019), p. 219.

<sup>199</sup> MacRaild, *Irish migrants in modern Britain*, p. 104.

<sup>200</sup> Waller, *Democracy and sectarianism*, p. 26 and p. 175.

parading claimed political and ideological space as well as physical space.<sup>201</sup> Useful and pioneering though many of these accounts have been, this thesis seeks to go beyond them and to analyse the public procession of the Order and its attendant culture specifically during the third Home Rule crisis. Here it departs from much of the existing scholarship on Orange parades, and in the process makes a number of new arguments.

This chapter is divided into two sections, with the first focusing on the relationship between the Orange Order and the Ulster Volunteer Force. It demonstrates that despite a significant overlap in membership, neither was the U.V.F. created out of the Orange Order as some have argued, and nor was their relationship as all-encompassing as one might imagine. Beyond this, the section also considers the distinct absence of violence associated with Orange parading in Belfast from 1910 to 1914 and speaks to the theme of Orange violence and public procession more broadly. The second section looks more specifically at the culture which attends the Order on parade. It examines the increasingly professionalised nature of Orange cultural production at the turn of the twentieth century and the emergence of a specialist 'Orange economy'. Despite an increasing uniformity in Orange material culture, the chapter also highlights the importance of such culture

---

<sup>201</sup> Elaine McFarland, 'Marching from the margins: Twelfth July parades in Scotland, 1820-1914', in T.G. Fraser (ed.), *Following the drum: the Irish parading tradition* (Basingstoke, 2000), p. 60.

and in analysing a variety of Orange songs from the period, demonstrates the adaptability Orange culture as a whole.

### **Orangeism and the Ulster Volunteer Force**

Paramilitary forces have been a defining feature of Irish history and so it is perhaps unsurprising that amid the third Home Rule crisis unionists turned to the gun for their protection. The Ulster Volunteer Force was formed as a result and retains an important place in unionist consciousness to this day, not least because of the appalling casualties it suffered at the Battle of the Somme. But, founded during the crisis, it attracted as many as 110,000 members before the outbreak of the First World War.<sup>202</sup>

Despite its important position within unionist and loyalist historical memory, though, the Ulster Volunteer Force has been surprisingly neglected by Irish historians over the decades. As a result, A.T.Q. Stewart's *The Ulster Crisis* has retained a disproportionate influence over interpretation, particularly given the serious problems which exist with the account and its reliance on the 'McNeill Hypothesis'.<sup>203</sup> The 'Hypothesis' suggested that unionist or U.V.F. mobilisation occurred only after the Parliament Act of 1911, and was

---

<sup>202</sup> Timothy Bowman, *Carson's army: The Ulster Volunteer Force, 1910-22* (Manchester, 2007), p. 1.

<sup>203</sup> Alvin Jackson, 'Unionist history', in Ciaran Brady (ed.), *Interpreting Irish history: the debate on historical revisionism 1938-94* (Dublin, 1994), p. 260; Jackson, *The Ulster Party*, pp 284-286.

therefore justified by Liberal efforts to circumvent the constitution. Similarly, the implied physical force of the U.V.F.'s unionism and an overlap of personnel has led many, reliant on Stewart, to make fleeting reference to the Ulster Volunteer Force as some direct extension of the Orange Order.<sup>204</sup> Fortunately, Timothy Bowman has done much to correct these misapprehensions, though scholarship on the U.V.F. itself still pales in comparison to its nationalist counterparts.<sup>205</sup> This thesis seeks to expand on some of Bowman's work on the Ulster Volunteer Force from the perspective of the Orange Order during the crisis, and to disentangle these entities. With this in mind then, it is useful to begin at the end of 1910, some months before the formalisation of the Ulster Volunteer Force.

The Order's own mobilisation during the third Home Rule crisis began swiftly, with the Order encouraging its members to enrol themselves 'as in the year 1893' in December of 1910.<sup>206</sup> Colonel Robert Wallace's personal papers from the time reveal that the Orange Order had even begun drilling men by this point, which was, as Alvin Jackson has pointed out, before the passage of the Parliament Act so often credited with beginning the crisis.<sup>207</sup> The speed with which this mobilisation began is perhaps less surprising, though, given the 'unmistakable traces of martial culture' within the Loyal Orange

---

<sup>204</sup> See for example: Gibbon, *The origins of Ulster Unionism*, p. 9.

<sup>205</sup> Bowman, *Carson's army*, pp 1-14.

<sup>206</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report of proceedings of the Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, December 1910* (Dublin, 1911), accessible at the Museum of Orange Heritage, Belfast, p. 26.

<sup>207</sup> Jackson, *The Ulster Party*, p. 314.

Institution, which were the result of the Order's long and enduring association with military and paramilitary forces in Ireland and Britain.<sup>208</sup> While the Order had always enjoyed a relationship with such forces, including in so-called 'military lodges' formed within the armed services, such associations had frequently contributed to the Order's reputation for violence rather than martial order. These military lodges helped to spread Orangeism across the empire and varied in popularity throughout the nineteenth and early twentieth century. Sometimes tacitly permitted, often banned by military authorities, their existence had added fuel to the fire which saw the Orange Order outlawed in 1835.<sup>209</sup>

It is curious, then, that during the third Home Rule crisis and the First World War the Order's militarism alongside the Ulster Volunteer Force led to altogether more positive associations. Increasingly in the decade from 1910 to 1920 the Orangemen on procession represented an 'inspiring, charismatic model for military and other institutional management' to borrow the phrase of military historian S.H. Myerly in describing British troops during the Napoleonic Wars.<sup>210</sup> If the U.V.F. had legitimacy in unionist consciousness, then in turn the Order gained a modicum of respectability in its wake. Indeed, perhaps part of the reason that Orange Order demonstrations proved less riotous over the period of the Home Rule crisis was the Order's increasing

---

<sup>208</sup> Fitzpatrick, *Descendancy*, p. 21.

<sup>209</sup> Senior, *Orangeism*, pp 254-274.

<sup>210</sup> S.H. Myerly, *British military spectacle: from the Napoleonic Wars through the Crimea* (Massachusetts, 1996), p. 18.

association with the U.V.F.. Certainly both organisations found admirers in the British popular press, and *The Times*' special correspondent for Belfast was eager to stress that 'the energy of Ulster politics had been contained and disciplined, and, whatever the future may hold, will be directed into regular channels.'<sup>211</sup>

In return for the benefits to its reputation offered by U.V.F., the Order was able to provide the Ulster Volunteer Force with readymade networks and existing facilities in the years from 1912 to 1914. The Order was able to let out its property in the form of Orange halls to the U.V.F. for shooting practice, charging the Volunteers the modest sum of six shillings per use.<sup>212</sup> More than this, various Orangemen including Captain James Craig were able to don a number of hats and to act to facilitate such practice; at different times acting as U.V.F. commanders, justices of the peace, and grand masters of the Orange Order.<sup>213</sup> Indeed, Colonel Robert Wallace is sometimes attributed with discovering the legal loophole which supposedly permitted the public organisation of the U.V.F., though the veracity of this claim is doubtful.<sup>214</sup> Such examples demonstrate, though, the fluid connections and associations which permeated unionism during the third Home Rule crisis. Even in cases where the Orange Order might not directly be involved, it often acted in the

---

<sup>211</sup> *The Times* (16 May 1913).

<sup>212</sup> *Orange Hall receipts for 6 shillings shooting practice*, (PRONI: D1540/3/65A and B).

<sup>213</sup> These relationships are explored in greater depth in chapter three;

*Letter regarding Orange Halls and drilling 1*, (PRONI: D1889/4/2/1).

<sup>214</sup> Grey, *The Orange Order*, p. 166.

background providing common experience and a series of informal connections.

These existed not just in a high social stratum, though, and members of most private lodges contributed to the organisation of Ulster's fight against Home Rule. The members of Imperial Temperance Lodge Number 929 agreed to pay two pence each per night to drill in order to cover such expenses as arose and seem to have engaged eagerly in such training.<sup>215</sup> This, combined with regular and enduring circulars from the Grand Lodge of Ireland encouraging enrolment in the U.V.F. demonstrates the close association of the two bodies.<sup>216</sup>

This has led some historians, including David Fitzpatrick, to suggest that the U.V.F. was more or less born of the Orange Order.<sup>217</sup> But while there was undoubtedly a strong relationship between the two, this is to overstate it. Rather, as Timothy Bowman has shown, the family tree is more complicated and the U.V.F. was able to emerge from a great variety of different formal and informal Protestant associations, including seemingly unlikely ones such as the 'Catch My Pal Temperance Society in Londonderry.'<sup>218</sup> In some areas Bowman's research even suggests that 'Orange commitment to military action was much slower to manifest itself than previous works have

---

<sup>215</sup> Lodge Number 929, *Minutebook*, n.d. March 1912.

<sup>216</sup> *Ibid.*, 1 January 1914.

<sup>217</sup> Fitzpatrick, *Descendancy*, p. 34.

<sup>218</sup> Bowman, *Carson's army*, p. 5.

allowed'.<sup>219</sup> Similarly, though the reports of the Royal Irish Constabulary are vague in the detail of the training that was undertaken at Orange halls during the crisis, they frequently suggest the ramshackle nature of drilling.<sup>220</sup> Care must be taken, then, not to attribute more professionalism to the drilling Orangemen than they in fact possessed. Further still, while local lodges like Imperial Temperance 929 were enthusiastic about participating, drilling rarely took priority in lodge business over preparations for the Twelfth of July and similar important events and was frequently left over for future meetings.<sup>221</sup> All of which contributes to Bowman's argument that while in some areas Orangeism and the U.V.F. were jointly preparing to resist Home Rule through strength of arms, in others such preparations were ill-advanced and fragmentary.<sup>222</sup>

Elsewhere, considerable efforts were made to delineate the Orange Order and the U.V.F. during the crisis. As Paul Bew and others have argued, some unionists 'insisted on the limited role of Orangeism within the Irish unionist coalition.'<sup>223</sup> Indeed, the U.V.F. did not participate in Orange walks such as those on the Twelfth of July.<sup>224</sup> In part this was to avoid alienating "softer"

---

<sup>219</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 18.

<sup>220</sup> RIC Crime Special Branch, *Importation of arms and secret drilling in Ulster* (The National Archives, CO904/182), 8 September 1911.

<sup>221</sup> Lodge Number 929, *Minutebook*, 18 January 1911; Bowman, *Carson's army*, p. 118.

<sup>222</sup> In this Bowman expanded on earlier work by Charles Townsend, see: Charles Townsend, *Political violence in Ireland: government and resistance since 1848* (Oxford, 1983), pp 246-255.

<sup>223</sup> Paul Bew, *Ideology and the Irish question: Ulster unionism and Irish nationalism, 1912-1916* (Oxford, 1994), p. 44.

<sup>224</sup> Bowman, *Carson's army*, p. 118.

unionists within and outside of Ireland. A reputation for disreputable behaviour and street violence may have been eased by the Order's association with the U.V.F., but it was not wholly erased.

But if violence was disparaged by those in the Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, then neither were they content to end or substantially alter Orange public demonstrations over the period in order to cement a new and more respectable image for the Institution alongside the U.V.F.. Even in 1914 at the summit of the crisis, the future Grand Master of All Ireland, Sir James Stronge, was eager to ensure 'that all processions at the July celebrations should be of a distinctly Orange character, and that the usual procedure should be adhered to'.<sup>225</sup> Nor does there appear to have been an effort or ambition to co-opt the wider struggle. As Colonel Wallace explained at the beginning of the crisis:

Although there are a considerable number of Orangemen in these [Ulster Unionist] Clubs, by far the bulk of the members were not members of our Institution. The new movement is not an Orange one. We are merely taking our part in it. Men who never would identify themselves with the Order are now talking the stand which we have done all along, and when the time comes – if ever it does, - we shall be in a position to make ourselves felt.<sup>226</sup>

Thus, the Order understood itself as existing within but distinct from the wider unionist movement. It neither claimed nor desired to represent all those

---

<sup>225</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report, June 1914*, p. 14.

<sup>226</sup> Wallace, *Letterbook*, 22 December 1910.

within it. Rather, it seems those within the Order merely wished to be distinguished contributors.

From this it is increasingly apparent that the relationship between the Orange Order in Belfast and the U.V.F. was complex. It was not directly maternal nor the all-encompassing relationship which some have argued. In this sense, the aim in demonstrating this has been modest. As Alvin Jackson argued in his article 'Unionist politics and Protestant society in Edwardian Ireland', the homogeneity of unionism has frequently been overstated.<sup>227</sup> Instead, unionism was composed of variety of different strands including the Order, which interlocked and overlapped in various fashions. From the U.V.F. the Order gained a degree of respectability. In turn, the U.V.F. gained access to a series of formal and informal networks and resources which facilitated its own growth. Beyond this, though, the Order was keen that its identity and culture should not be subsumed into the movement of which it was a part.

Despite this association and the drilling of Orangemen across Ulster many members during the crisis continued to 'straggle along' on demonstrations in the way that they were accustomed to, much to the chagrin of Colonel Wallace.<sup>228</sup> Wallace's concerns about ill-discipline did not end at the poor formations on display during Orange walks, though. Beyond this came the

---

<sup>227</sup> Jackson, 'Unionist politics', p. 866.

<sup>228</sup> Wallace, *Letterbooks*, 18 April 1911.

ubiquitous warning against rioting and drunkenness. In 1911 *The Times* explained to unfamiliar readers how this warning took effect:

It is stated on good authority that the “hard word” has gone forth that there is to be no breach of the peace over to-morrow’s anniversary celebrations in Belfast. The hard word is a kind of unwritten authority that is understood by and is comparatively binding on both factions. It does not, however, ensure against the chance spark that may set this mass of tinder aflame. Nor does its mysterious legislation reach the brawlers of the public houses, whose wanton tempers will be sure to run amok on Saturday night.<sup>229</sup>

This passage does well in revealing the often informal processes by which communication across Orange and wider unionist networks might occur, but it also suggests that there were limits on the discipline which could be imposed on individual members by the upper echelons of the Orange Order in Belfast. The report concluded that ‘the atmosphere here is charged with some abnormal and impelling force. Although the stranger cannot put his finger upon it, yet he is conscious of it. It is not so much a question of probabilities as of possibilities.’<sup>230</sup> From 1910 to 1914 the possibilities usually remained only that, and the discipline of the Order generally held firm. As one anonymous correspondent to the *Belfast Weekly News* argued, ‘drill and discipline have ended for ever the days of desultory riots. When the time comes there will be sterner work to do, and men to do it.’<sup>231</sup> This prediction was a remarkably explicit acknowledgment of the interaction between Orange discipline and the increasingly militarised context of Ulster during the

---

<sup>229</sup> *The Times* (12 July 1912).

<sup>230</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>231</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (12 March 1914).

third Home Rule crisis, where heightened tensions seem to have served to cool tempers.

This is not to say that rioting and conflict did not occur in connection with the Orange Order in Ulster in this period at all, though. Not least among this was the violence associated with the Castledawson affair which was discussed previously, but beyond this small *fracas* were relatively commonplace outside of Belfast during the crisis. In one instance on 24 September 1910, in the village of Derrymore near Portadown, two men were assaulted by an Orange parade of around 50 after blocking the latter's path and insisting the road through their village was closed to the Orangemen.<sup>232</sup> After the two men retreated into the shelter of nearby houses, the Orangemen set about throwing stones at the buildings and were quickly joined by others so that by the time the local police arrived around 100 individuals were present. Despite this, it seems as though little damage was done.<sup>233</sup> Such instances, while doubtless upsetting for those sheltering in the houses, were typical of the form of rioting or violence which occurred in connection with small Orange marches in the years from 1910 to 1914.

This class of violence in rural Ulster continued at a low hum throughout the crisis, but in Belfast it abated, with a few notable exceptions. Just as

---

<sup>232</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (10 November 1910).

<sup>233</sup> *Ibid.*

Bowman argues that the U.V.F. and the Orange Order's relationship was complex, so too were their breaches of discipline, which add to the generally restrained picture of Orange demonstrations in Belfast during the third Home Rule crisis. Similarly, some care must be taken to distinguish between the Orange Order and that violence which occurred around it. When the *Dublin Evening Telegraph* reported 'Orange riots in Belfast. Mob "like wild Indians"', it did not necessarily refer to members of the Orange Institution, and yet even using a broad definition of Orange rioting, instances of violence inside the city were relatively rare.<sup>234</sup> Another such remarkable instance, like the one reported in the *Dublin Evening Telegraph*, occurred in 1913 with a violent clash between unionists and nationalists following the Twelfth of July celebrations. 'Party songs and jeers were at length exchanged for missiles, and showers of stones were hurled between the opponents', leading to a police baton charge and several injuries, with two men hospitalised.<sup>235</sup> That these incidents stand out in Belfast in these years is significant, though. Had they occurred in the 1880s or the 1920s they would scarcely have merited newspaper coverage when compared to the violence and rioting that was so much a part of city life in those decades. Indeed, the relative stability of Belfast in the years of the third Home Rule crisis was remarkable, if not anomalous.

---

<sup>234</sup> *Dublin Evening Telegraph* (21 July 1911).

<sup>235</sup> *The Scotsman* (14 July 1913).

Writing from the comparative stability of 1914, the journalist Frankfort Moore suggested the Belfast riots of 1886 had been ‘closely akin to actual warfare’, wherein thirty-two people had died, hundreds were injured and some £90,000 worth of damage was caused.<sup>236</sup> The rioting, stoked by the defeat of the Home Rule Bill in 1886, occurred in three phases but peaked around the Twelfth of July, and is easily juxtaposed to the relatively minor scale of urban violence in the city during the third Home Rule crisis. After the First World War, the riots surrounding the partition of Ireland from 1920-1922 amounted to what Ian Budge and Cornelius O’Leary have called ‘a sustained attack on the Catholic population of Belfast [...] far more terrifying than all the disturbances of the nineteenth century’.<sup>237</sup> With likely almost 500 dead, again these riots highlight the comparative calm of the third Home Rule crisis in Belfast, though Fearghal McGarry has argued, in line with Timothy Wilson, that the ‘levels of violence in Belfast [from 1920 to 1922] matched the worst years of the recent Troubles but Ulster did not experience anything like the scale of violence that marked other contemporaneous ethnic border conflicts.’<sup>238</sup>

But if the levels of rioting in the third Home Rule crisis remained low in comparison to the years surrounding it, as has been shown, some level of

---

<sup>236</sup> Mark Radford, ‘Closely akin to actual warfare’, in *History Ireland* (Winter, 1999), p. 28.

<sup>237</sup> Ian Budge and Cornelius O’Leary, *Belfast: approach to crisis – a study of Belfast politics, 1613-1970* (London, 1973), p. 143.

<sup>238</sup> Fearghal McGarry, ‘Revolution, 1916-1923’, in Thomas Bartlett (ed.), *The Cambridge History of Ireland IV* (Cambridge, 2018), pp 283-284  
Timothy Wilson, *Frontiers of violence: conflict and identity in Ulster and Silesia 1918-1922* (Oxford, 2010).

violence remained a shadow behind the Order on procession. Émile Durkheim famously argued that religious life necessitated public ceremony which at regular intervals could demonstrate and reaffirm 'the collective sentiments and collective ideas which made its unity and personality'.<sup>239</sup> It is in a similar vein we might try to understand the phenomenon of Orange violence during this period. While care must be taken to distinguish between all "Orange" violence and that associated directly with Orange Order parading, it does appear that for many, rioting represented a ritual conclusion to the Twelfth of July festivities.

In this there are parallels with the more modern advent of what Jarman and O'Halloran have termed 'recreational rioting' – that is, violence as a social activity undertaken through boredom and bravado.<sup>240</sup> Regrettably, though, while there is much scholarship in sociology and psychology on the phenomenon of rioting, including Jarman and O'Halloran's conception, its purpose has not been to engage in the emotional history of such events. Dating back to Gustave Le Bon's *The Crowd*, first published in 1895, one strand seeks to identify the psychology behind crowd behaviour.<sup>241</sup> A second

---

<sup>239</sup> Émile Durkheim, *Elementary forms of religious life*, J.W. Swain (trs.), (London, 1915), p. 427.

<sup>240</sup> Neil Jarman and Chris O'Halloran, 'Recreational rioting: young people, interface areas and violence' in *Child Care in Practice* XII, no. 1 (2008), p. 3. Jarman and O'Halloran have been criticised, perhaps unfairly, by Madeleine Leonard, who believes the 'recreational rioting' framework de-politicises rioting. See: Madeleine Leonard, 'What's recreational about 'recreational rioting'? Children on the streets in Belfast' in *Children and Society* XXIV (2010), p. 44.

<sup>241</sup> Gustave Le Bon, *The crowd: a study of the popular mind* (London, 1947). For a fuller survey of the literature see Sam Wright, *Crowds and riots: a study in social organization* (London, 1978), pp 13-25.

strand of analysis seeks to explain the more material factors behind a riot or to consider strategies for preventing future riots. As Paul Rock has argued, 'very few have considered the possibility that some riots may be modelled on the carnival or Saturnalia, that they might be fun. [...] people have strained to avoid defining rule-breaking as pleasurable.'<sup>242</sup>

This is raised here because without creating an emotional history of the riot, it is unlikely that the historian will be able to capture, much less explain, the vibrancy and energy of these events. Catherine Hirst has detailed well that 'triumphalism' was an important component of Twelfth of July rioting before the first Home Rule crisis, but she stops some way short of interrogating the feelings associated with this violence.<sup>243</sup> Necessarily ignoring the morality of sectarian rioting, the excitement of such events and their consequent ability to draw in predisposed participants has too rarely been discussed in the academic literature. In 1941 Lucien Febvre called for a history of emotions, highlighting that while un-rational emotion might be scorned by the historian, 'tomorrow it might have turned the universe into a fetid pit of corpses.'<sup>244</sup>

Barbara Rosenwein has since convincingly argued that, writing in response to Nazism, Febvre's fear of emotion led to an evangelism for self-restraint among historians concerned with the subject.<sup>245</sup> But Febvre's striking image

---

<sup>242</sup> Paul Rock, 'Rioting', in *London Review of Books* (17–30 September, 1981), p. 25.

<sup>243</sup> Catherine Hirst, *Religion, politics and violence in nineteenth-century Belfast: the Pound and Sandy Row* (Dublin, 2002), p. 156.

<sup>244</sup> Lucien Febvre *A new kind of history: from the writings of Febvre*, Peter Burke (ed.), K. Folca, (trs.), (London, 1973), p. 26.

<sup>245</sup> B.H. Rosenwein, 'Worrying about emotions in history', in *The American Historical Review* CVII, no. 3 (June, 2002), pp 821-845.

is nonetheless useful in reminding us of the supreme motivational power of emotion, in the process highlighting its remarkable continued absence from histories of rioting. There might be many causes of rioting from the psychological to the socio-economic, but the thrill of participation should not be ignored.

While, perhaps because of the Order's association with the U.V.F. and a wider-felt need for restraint during the third Home Rule crisis, Orange parades rarely descended into riot, that some still did is unsurprising. The Twelfth of July still necessitated the demonstration of a physical force unionism and the concomitant attempt to exert a physical superiority over the Catholic community of the city. While the Grand Lodge of Belfast could exert a degree of authority over its members, in 1913 and outside of Belfast, it seems the nature of the Twelfth of July celebrations briefly overcame this restraint.

This section has sought to chart the relationship between the Orange Order and the Ulster Volunteer Force during the third Home Rule crisis.

Contributing to the work of Timothy Bowman, it demonstrates the distinct identities of these organisations and complicates the unfortunately reductive picture often presented which suggests they were essentially interchangeable. In fact, both gained from their association, with the U.V.F. profiting through access to men and resources, and the Order gaining

respectability. This, combined with the acute political tension of the period, saw a reduction in rioting associated with Orange parades, at least in Belfast. When compared with the decades surrounding the third Home Rule crisis, this abatement is all the more remarkable. While there were some minor incidents of Orange violence in Ulster in this period, these were minor exceptions and speak to the contradictions within Orangeism during this period, where temperance, respectability and sectarianism converged. It would be a mistake, then, to reduce Orange parades to the violence with which they are associated. In fact, they were also important sites of discipline and of culture, and it is to the latter and to the growth of an “Orange economy” to which this chapter now turns.

### **Public procession and the Orange economy**

In this section the public facing aspects of Orange parades and performance are examined in greater detail, including the importance of sashes, banners, the flag of King William of Orange and Orange songs. Throughout, an argument is made that these often-derided aspects of Orange culture reveal much about Orange identity and indicate a vibrant Orange culture. Attendant to this, the increasing uniformity of Orange regalia and materials across the years of the Home Rule crises evidences an increasing professionalization and homogenisation of Orange material cultural production in Belfast.

Perhaps the most recognisable symbol of the Orange Order is the sash worn by its members at lodge meetings and on demonstration. The bright orange colour which serves to clearly mark its wearer as a member of the Loyal Orange Institution has remained the same in the century between the present day and the third Home Rule crisis, but the nature of the garment itself has changed considerably. Members now don a collarette which in the past had been reserved for officers of the lodge.<sup>246</sup> The difference between the two is that a collarette is worn over both shoulders meeting at the chest and back, while the sash is worn over only one shoulder and across the body, meeting at the hip. But regardless of such technicalities, 'sash' and 'collarette' are now used interchangeably and the garment remains the item most closely associated with membership of the Orange Order.

It is surely significant, then, that at the time of the third Home Rule crisis a debate raged within the Institution over the particulars of the garment. A new dress code for the Order had been proposed several years earlier and, having made its way through committee, was to regulate Orangemen's sashes. Ranks and offices in the Order were to be defined by the most minute of details; a gold thread here, 'half an inch of purple fabric positioned half an inch from the selvedge of an Orange sash, itself no more than four and half inches wide', there, to delineate an ordinary member from one who

---

<sup>246</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report of proceedings of the Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, December 1913* (Dublin, 1914), accessible at the Museum of Orange Heritage, Belfast, p. 16.

had achieved the Purple Degree, and so on.<sup>247</sup> These minor details would not have been understood by the on-looking public, but to those within the Order they denoted the hierarchy of the Institution. As a result of this change and in conjunction with the class hierarchy that existed within the Order, minor aristocrats and labourers may have appeared to wear the same sash to an outsider, but they would not have mistaken one another.<sup>248</sup>

While some resisted the imposition of the new, more uniform dress code, after it was enacted all members of the Order on demonstration were expected to follow it.<sup>249</sup> The discussion surrounding the new code suggests that it was driven largely by a desire to make the Orange Order appear more uniform and regulated during marches, though it paralleled the increasing militarization of Ulster society more broadly at this time.<sup>250</sup> But caution should be exercised here lest this correlation be mistaken for causation. Indeed, driven by the Order's desire to appear presentable on demonstration, it might be more accurate to say that the new uniform regulations of the Order were as much a contributor to Ulster's militarization as it was a consequence of it. While the surface area of an Orange sash was relatively small, the garment was more of a uniform than many members of the Ulster

---

<sup>247</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>248</sup> The class dynamics of the Order have already discussed in greater length in the previous chapter.

<sup>249</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Laws and ordinances*, p. 35.

<sup>250</sup> McGaughey, *Ulster's men*, pp 7-10.

Volunteer Force received in the same period, and photographs from the period convey the impact of the new dress code.<sup>251</sup>

Somewhat more varied, though, was the iconography of Orange banners. Historically, as Neil Jarman has demonstrated, Orange banners have contained a wide mixture of messaging and images. 'Historic events mixed with Biblical events, real people with mythic, kings with commoners and saints with warriors.'<sup>252</sup> Some lodges chose to commemorate figures they held in great regard, but in 1906, the Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland had introduced new by-laws which ensured that only deceased persons could be depicted on banners.<sup>253</sup> This did not mean that such figures were taken from the distant past alone, though. Indeed such was the reverence with which Imperial Temperance Lodge Number 929 held their Worshipful Master, that on his passing they not only added 'Murphy Memorial' to their title, but also commissioned a new banner which would bear his image.<sup>254</sup> Several amendments on which colour scheme should be used followed, with the Lodge eventually settling on a blue banner with an orange border.<sup>255</sup> This design was typical of the period, as Neil Jarman explains:

The standard size of a banner is seven feet long by six feet wide and they are usually made of pure silk. The central image is enclosed within a frame, which varies from circular to shield-like in shape. [...]

---

<sup>251</sup> Bowman, *Carson's army*, p. 125.

<sup>252</sup> Jarman, *Material conflicts*, p. 17.

<sup>253</sup> These by-laws were stressed throughout the crisis, see: Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report of proceedings of the Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, December 1914* (Dublin, 1915), accessible at the Museum of Orange Heritage, Belfast, p. 27.

<sup>254</sup> Lodge Number 929, *Minutebook*, 3 October 1912.

<sup>255</sup> *Ibid.*

Across the top of the banner is the name of the lodge [...] along the bottom may be an appropriate motto or quotation.<sup>256</sup>

Standardised over generations, it is worth considering why these banners bear such a resemblance to their trade union and Ancient Order of Hibernians counterparts.

In fact this speaks to the emergence of an artisan industry of banner making in the latter part of the nineteenth century. This began with George Tutill 'who professionalised and monopolised the commercial banner industry in nineteenth century England', before this mantle was then taken on by William Bridgett, and sons, of Belfast.<sup>257</sup> Himself an Orangeman, Bridgett commercialised banner production in Belfast and Ireland as a whole, and was doubtlessly aided in doing so by his Orange credentials.<sup>258</sup> He advertised in the pages of the *Belfast Weekly News*, tapping in to the readers' community of Orangemen across Ireland and the globe which bought the paper. In 1910, the weekly Bridgett & Sons advert spoke of their expanded premises, now able to 'keep pace with our ever increasing trade'.<sup>259</sup> The firm continued to advertise in the *Belfast Weekly News* until the newspaper was wound down, but they were not without competitors.

---

<sup>256</sup> Jarman, *Displaying faith*, p. 1.

<sup>257</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>258</sup> Neil Jarman, 'Material culture, fabric of identity', in D.W. Miller (ed.), *Material cultures: why some things matter* (London, 1998), p. 131.

<sup>259</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (6 January 1910).

James Thompson & Son of the Shankill Road also advertised their banners, flags, sashes, collars and emblems in the paper. Thompson & Son were the proprietors of the 'famous invention 'nevercrack'' - a form of paint which they claimed preserved banners in a good condition, immune from the cracks which commonly appear with wear in painted fabric.<sup>260</sup> Thompson & Son also boasted that the artwork of their banners had led them to receive 'first prize in Canada 1908 and 1909'. The advert does not provide details about the exact nature of the competition, but it serves as a reminder of the strength of the Order's transatlantic connections. Clearly Bridgett & Sons and Thompson & Son were competing for the same market, but this international component, combined with their continuing to advertise throughout the Home Rule crisis and beyond, suggests there was enough demand for both firms' services. Their success, though, marked a departure from the home-made Orange regalia of 50 years prior. In essence the production of Orange materials became professionalised in the years between the first and third Home Rule crises, and this professionalisation led to something of a standardisation in banner making and design, itself emblematic of wider trends in Orangeism. Neil Jarman argues that banners continued to have varied imagery, but while this true, care must be taken not to over-emphasise their diversity.<sup>261</sup>

---

<sup>260</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (13 January 1910).

<sup>261</sup> Jarman, 'Material culture, fabric of identity', p. 131.

As in most Orange imagery, King William dominates the front of Orange banners. Until 1840, the most common representation of William was in the classical mould of the Roman conqueror, epitomised by his statue on College Green at Trinity College Dublin.<sup>262</sup> After 1840, though, this changed, and the classical representation was replaced by a mounted King William set at the Battle of the Boyne. This more dynamic image, based upon the 1778 painting by Benjamin West, rapidly came to predominate not just images of William, but among all Orange images continuing into and beyond the third Home Rule crisis.<sup>263</sup> Alongside this shift, the standardisation of banners as a consequence of professionalisation reduced the diversity of Orange imagery on display. Jarman records that of 126 banners announced in newspapers from 1904-1914, 77 depicted either a Westian William or another Williamite scene.<sup>264</sup> To take a similar, illustrative example; in the largest remaining collection of Orange Lodge stamps from the period, held at the Public Records Office of Northern Ireland, 38 of 50 Orange Lodge stamps depicted a Westian William.<sup>265</sup>

This predominance is indicative of the effects of the increasingly centralised production of the “Orange economy” which existed in Ireland at this time. A greater sense of what this economy was comprised of can be recovered by looking at the program for the Twelfth of July ‘Grand Concert’ of 1913, which

---

<sup>262</sup> Belinda Loftus, *Mirrors: William III and mother Ireland* (Dundrum, 1990), p. 18.

<sup>263</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 25.

<sup>264</sup> Jarman, *Material conflicts*, p. 68.

<sup>265</sup> Collection of Orange stamps (PRONI: D3815/J).

accompanied the day's Orange walk. Tickets for the concert were available to men for four shillings and six pence and to women for three shillings. Upon entry attendees would enjoy speeches, including from the Mayor of Belfast, 'orchestral selections', recitations, and Orange songs.<sup>266</sup> The latter will be returned to in due course, but for now it is the advertisements which ran alongside this bill which are of particular interest.

While there were a number of non-Orange advertisements, including for 'The Original Pie Shop' and 'The Carbine Vacuum Cleaner', there were also a myriad of Orange Order-specific advertisements. These varied from drapery to banners, certificate frames and other specific paraphernalia such as Loyal Orange Lodge or Royal Black Preceptory "Jewels".<sup>267</sup> What these advertisements reveal, though, is a specialised industry catering to a specific market. The materials necessary for Orange practice and the practice of associated loyal orders and freemasonry were wide ranging. Those catering to them doubtless benefited from their variety and ornateness, but the existence of the industry as a whole speaks to an important point beyond this diversity. While the Order may be understood in part as a reactionary anti-Catholic formation, one can hardly sustain the argument this Orange economy existed exclusively for the purpose of oppressing Catholics or Home Rulers in Belfast. Rather, the complex identity of Orangeism in this period is revealed in the variety of its material culture, which while

---

<sup>266</sup> *Program for 12<sup>th</sup> July grand concert 1913* (PRONI: D3815/H/132).

<sup>267</sup> *Ibid.*

undoubtedly sectarian, necessarily evolved with Orange culture and practices independent of the Order's wider sectarian commitments.

Perhaps the most significant single artefact of Orangeism during the third Home Rule crisis was the flag of King William of Orange which was presented by the Order to Sir Edward Carson on the eve of the signing of the Ulster Covenant on 27 September 1912. Made of 'beautifully woven silk', a black five-pointed star sewn on its centre and with the cross of St. George in its top left corner, it had supposedly gone before King William at the battle of Boyne in 1690.<sup>268</sup> It had been carried by the King's standard bearer, a young ensign named Watson, and had since passed through the generations of the Watson family to Rear Admiral Burges Watson, whose widow had offered the flag up for Ulster Day.<sup>269</sup> It made two appearances during the crisis, the first in a large ceremony in Belfast City Hall on the eve of the Covenant, and the next on the day itself, where it was paraded in front of Edward Carson before the assembled crowds.

*The Daily News and Leader* described well some of the theatre involved in the ceremony in Belfast City Hall on the evening of the 27<sup>th</sup>, as Colonel Wallace held the flag before Carson in front of a silent crowd and said what it was. But when Wallace 'came to say what the flag meant, he laid his hand

---

<sup>268</sup> *Belfast Morning News* (30 September 1912).

<sup>269</sup> St. John Ervine, *Craigavon – Ulsterman* (London, 1949), p. 234.

with simple reverence on its staff and failed in his utterance.<sup>270</sup> This was a scene of acute drama, as the distinguished old soldier was brought into silent reverence by the supposed artefact. The flag was more than just a piece of ephemera, it was a physical link to an imagined past.

A.T.Q. Stewart concludes the story of the presentation as Carson took the flag from Wallace, unfurled it, 'and holding it aloft exclaimed 'may this flag ever float over a people that can boast of civil and religious liberty''.<sup>271</sup> The ceremony then drew to a close inside the Hall. Not all those present were as moved as Carson or Stewart by the flag and its history, though.<sup>272</sup> Just as its presentation was an act of theatre, the *Irish News* was quick to suggest that Carson 'aimed at mimicking some great pose of history; he had set himself a part which was a mixture of Cromwell and King William III, with just a suggestion of Charles I on the way to execution.'<sup>273</sup>

But setting aside the obvious and humorous scorn of the *Irish News*, the passage inadvertently speaks to the rich historical, or even mythical, heritage which was drawn upon by the Order during the Home Rule crisis. The flag has since become an important myth in Orange culture, and it was an effective symbol for the Order because it spoke to and rallied unionists more

---

<sup>270</sup> *Daily News and Leader* (30 September 1912).

<sup>271</sup> A.T.Q. Stewart, *The Ulster Crisis* (Glasgow, 1967), p. 63.

<sup>272</sup> *The Irish News* (30 September 1912).

<sup>273</sup> *Ibid.*

widely, representing a gloriously successful martial tradition which stretched back across the ages in direct line to William himself. Consequently, it is unsurprising that few sympathetic eyes saw past its long shadow to the carefully staged choreography behind the spectacle.

We should, however, avoid being rendered similarly blind. Indeed, there are many anomalies surrounding the flag which call into question its legitimacy. First, and aside from the lineage recounted earlier, it is remarkable that in the 222 intervening years between the Battle of the Boyne and its re-emergence in 1912, no trace of the flag can be found in the historical record. Second, and as was observed in newspapers at the time, the flag bore no obvious signs of ageing.<sup>274</sup> As a consequence, A.P. Ryan was forced to concede that the flag 'was probably the personal emblem of the family and not the flag of an army in the old wars.'<sup>275</sup> Perhaps as a result of such criticisms, the flag did not appear again during third Home Rule crisis. Its job done, it was allowed to again disappear.

More important than its legitimacy, though, the flag allowed the Order through public demonstration to situate itself in the heart of unionist historical memory during the crisis, inventing historical continuity between the crisis and the Battle of the Boyne. Its appearance harkened back to bygone days

---

<sup>274</sup> *Belfast Morning News* (30 September 1912);  
*The Irish News* (30 September 1912).

<sup>275</sup> A.P. Ryan, *Mutiny at the Curragh* (London, 1956), p. 61.

of yore; in which Protestantism was ascendant and in which the menace of Rome had been defeated. In presenting it to Carson, the Order attempted to canonise him as a new William for their times, and in understanding these events as an example of the very creation of Orange culture and heritage, one can better understand how Orange culture adapted to the context of the third Home Rule crisis.

Every bit as complex as the material culture of the Order, though, was the music which accompanied it on Twelfth of July parades. One of the main expenses faced by private lodges on the Twelfth of July was hiring a band to accompany a lodge on their walk, and contrary to popular assumption, these bands are not themselves part of the Institution. In practice, though, the line between the two has often been blurred, with overlapping memberships and interests. In Belfast from 1910 to 1914, Imperial Temperance Lodge Number 929 appears to have exercised a controlling influence over the Sirocco Band, despite the Institution's laws forbidding this. The Sirocco Band was fairly active throughout the crisis, with the Band's membership comprised largely of members of Lodge 929.<sup>276</sup> This led to a series of conflicts of interest between the Lodge and the Band over the course of 1914, though, and in March of that year band members demanded the Lodge pay for new instruments. Upon the inspection of the treasurer the Lodge refused the request and in fact suggested the Band seemed to have 'a substantial

---

<sup>276</sup> Bowman, *Carson's army*, p. 125.

balance in hand'.<sup>277</sup> The Band were thus instructed to meet their own expenses; justified on the basis that the Lodge continued to pay them a hefty fixed-sum for all demonstrations.

Alongside local tensions such as this, many bands also enjoyed a fraught relationship with the hierarchy of the Orange Order. In particular, so called “blood and thunder bands” were (and are) known to prize volume above tonality, ably assisted by the Lambeg Drum. This drum, which is traditionally almost a meter in diameter, has a taught skin producing a distinctive “crack” when struck by reeds in the drummer’s hands. The drum continues to occupy a prominent place in the cultural consciousness of loyalism and Ireland, reflected in 1914 by its central and symbolic role in St John Ervine’s play ‘The Orangeman’.<sup>278</sup> Considering its merits, though, Colonel Wallace described the contraptions as ‘infernal’, and made every effort to silence them at Orange marches.<sup>279</sup> He was ultimately defeated, and his struggle hints at the tension which existed between the Grand Lodge of Ireland and the lay membership of the Order and their bands. Wallace’s efforts combined with numerous similar failed endeavours toward regulation hints that the creation or adaptation of Orange culture involved a dialectic between institutional management and the activity and participation of the mass membership.

---

<sup>277</sup> Lodge Number 929, *Minutebook*, 5 March 1914.

<sup>278</sup> Alvin Jackson, ‘Mrs Foster and the rebels: Irish unionist approaches to the Easter Rising, 1916–2016’, in *Irish Historical Studies* XLII, no. 161 (2018), p. 159.

<sup>279</sup> Wallace, *Letterbook*, 24 May 1912.

Working-class Orangemen were not passive receivers of culture, even if that culture did eventually come to modify their behaviour, as with the Order's new dress code in 1913. Instead, they often rejected, modified or otherwise contributed to a dialogue through which Orange culture was formed between the divergent wills of the upper echelons of the Institution and the working-class membership, as was the case with the Lambeg Drum during the crisis.

As Dominic Bryan has argued of Orange parades:

Not only did the Twelfth have a carnivalesque and sectarian aspect that could always embarrass those seeking political control, but Orangeism itself could be utilised for limited class confrontation and resistance to the Orange elite.<sup>280</sup>

There was thus tension between the hierarchy of the Orange Order, the “respectable” working-class members of the Order discussed in chapter one, and the disreputable elements associated with Orange parading. Indeed, during the Home Rule crisis, the Grand Lodge and respectable Orangemen were particularly keen to ensure orderly processions as expressions of Orange culture. Across the period an inordinate amount of effort and literature was devoted to ensuring that music ceased as demonstrations passed by hospitals.<sup>281</sup> This proved successful and in 1911 the County Grand Lodge of Belfast devoted two pages of their relatively short annual report to relaying an appreciative letter which had been sent to the *Belfast Telegraph* on the subject.<sup>282</sup> The letter was undoubtedly prized because the

---

<sup>280</sup> Bryan, *Orange Parades*, p. 59.

<sup>281</sup> *Program for the Belfast 12<sup>th</sup> July celebrations 1910*.

<sup>282</sup> County Grand Lodge of Belfast, *Report, 1911*, pp 53-54.

hospital in question was the Mater, which, as the letter stressed, was in the charge of the Sisters of Mercy:

This year men wearing Orange sashes carried large cards on which were printed the words 'sickness – stop music.' With these cards they met all bands approaching the hospital, and the music was accordingly stopped.<sup>283</sup>

Rosamond Stephan praised the 'kindness shown by the Orangemen' in these actions, but the later publication of the letter suggests the Order was quite prepared to use this good grace to emphasise their own respectable and even communitarian credentials. Seemingly at odds with their usually bullish unionism, the Order was acutely concerned with its own public presentation during marches.

Similar in this regard was the employment of Orange songs themselves. Many Orange songs popular in this period including the likes of Dolly's Brae held a justified reputation for their anti-Catholic sentiment. Dolly's Brae told the story of a skirmish between Orange Order and Ribbonmen, near Rathfriland, Co. Down, in 1849, where the 'Papish' foe was vanquished, with various other offensive lyrics typical of the genre.<sup>284</sup> But while popular among some of the less reputable bands, at more respectable and public unionist events, other tunes could be played from an eclectic songbook. In the Ulster Hall on 27 September 1912, attendant to the signing of the Ulster Covenant,

---

<sup>283</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>284</sup> *Orange songsheet* (1912).

the only overtly Orange song on the program was 'The Orange Tree', sang by Miss May Crommelin:

In Orange glow bright suns shall set,  
Good sign of days to be,  
And green the Shamrock shelter yet  
Beneath the grand Oak tree,  
And we'll unite to hold these right,  
Faith, Hope, and Charity.<sup>285</sup>

Unlike the songs of battle, blood and glory which often accompanied the Order on parade, The Orange Tree strikes a conciliatory tone likely to be more popular among respectable unionists while still stressing Orange supremacy. Indeed, it goes as far as suggesting that the Orange sun gives life to the shamrock of all Ireland. In many ways this song and its performance at the unionist demonstration in the Ulster Hall is typical of the flexibility of Orangeism, where tone was often modulated to suit the audience.

Less respectable songs like Dolly's Brae and numbers like The Orange Tree, though, are among the simpler songs of Orangeism. As Jane McGaughey has demonstrated, during the time of the Home Rule crisis there was also a range of songs with more complex imagery, with many evoking the Old Testament and Reformation spirituality. Taking the example of the 'The Orange ABC' McGaughey demonstrates the often complicated distillation of Orange history, mythology and culture present in a single song. The Orange

---

<sup>285</sup> *Demonstration, Ulster Hall Program 27<sup>th</sup> Sept. 1912* (PRONI: D1556/23/8).

ABC 'focused on leaders who delivered their people from perceived danger, with references to Aughrim and the Boyne alongside Joshua and Noah, and Knox and Luther's religious reformations of the sixteenth century.'<sup>286</sup>

McGaughey is interested primarily in how such cultural phenomena contributed to the increasing militarisation and distinct masculinity of Ulster at this time and the Orange ABC proves convincing evidence in this regard.

Given the Orange ABC's gentle tone, it was scarcely a song to be performed on the Twelfth of July, and as a result, its popularity speaks to the variety of Orange songs in circulation in this period. Orangemen could employ a range of tunes depending upon their environment and audience.

By analysing another popular Orange song of the time, 'Daniel O'Connell in Purgatory', a different but no less useful perspective is gained. The song is in the popular Orange theme of satirising Catholic practice and nationalist heroes, and in it Daniel O'Connell is said to be trapped in Purgatory.<sup>287</sup>

Particularly significant though is that through satire, this popular Orange song expresses relatively sophisticated doctrinal distinctions between Protestantism and Catholicism. Devotional aids, celibacy, Purgatory and indulgence prayers on All Saint's Day all come under the lens of the Orange microscope in different verses.<sup>288</sup> This suggests that Protestant theology was a quintessential aspect of Orange culture and song, perhaps serving to

---

<sup>286</sup> McGaughey, *Ulster's men*, p. 38.

<sup>287</sup> *Orange songsheet* (1912).

<sup>288</sup> Marianne Elliott, *When God took sides: religion and identity in Ireland – unfinished history* (Oxford, 2009), p. 62.

undermine claims about the peripheral influence of religion in Orangeism.<sup>289</sup>

In understanding the Order, it is essential that the Institution's religious devotion is properly recognised, and while the Order was indeed a multifaceted body, too often the presence and considerable influence of religious faith is overlooked in the course of its analysis.

Aside from a smattering of examples quoted in this thesis, though, it can be challenging to recapture exactly when and where specific Orange songs were performed. A program for a concert might detail what is to be performed, or a newspaper report might incidentally highlight a tune being played on a Twelfth of July parade, but it is likely impossible to approach the Orange songbook in a meaningfully systematic fashion. It is possible, though, to surmise from the popularity and numerous reprints of texts including Robert Young's *Orange minstrel*, originally published in 1832, that there was an audience for these songs. Indeed, the original issue of Young's work was made possible by contributions from over 800 subscribers. Even in this, though, ascertaining precisely which of the 50 songs contained in the Orange minstrel were popular and which were neglected remains regrettably unfeasible.<sup>290</sup>

---

<sup>289</sup> For one recent account, see: Webster, *The religion of Orange politics*.

<sup>290</sup> Robert Young, *The Orange minstrel, or Ulster melodist: consisting of historical songs and poems* (Londonderry, 1832).

Regardless, it is striking that in his introduction to the Orange minstrel, Robert Young was eager to stress the religious credentials of the work. Young suggested that while many songs were not included in his book, this was because they were either 'sinful' in nature, or else related to drinking.<sup>291</sup> It seems likely such numbers would attract the attention of the "Blood and Thunder" bands, but particularly interesting is Young's aversion to 'others, idolizing King William, proceeding so far as to give to this favoured instrument of heaven the title of 'Saviour,' which inalienably belongs to the redeemer of mankind.'<sup>292</sup> Again it is worth stressing here the profound religious concerns expressed by the most prominent recorder of Orange culture in the nineteenth century.

In perhaps the most authoritative scholarly account of such music, Georges-Denis Zimmermann suggests that Orange songs could be divided into five categories: 'ballads commemorating past victories or persecutions of the Protestant cause – convivial songs – sentimental texts – descriptions of party fights – songs concerned with the ritual and mysteries of the Orange Institution and of other Orders.'<sup>293</sup> That Zimmermann entirely neglects those songs concerned with the Protestant tradition perhaps highlights the limits of his model and demonstrates the difficulties associated with such study. As a result, there has been a paucity of study of Orange music and its variety, as

---

<sup>291</sup> Young, *The Orange minstrel*, p. vi.

<sup>292</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>293</sup> Georges-Denis Zimmermann, *Songs of Irish rebellion - political street ballads and rebel songs 1780-1900* (Dublin, 1967), p. 300.

is highlighted by this thesis. This thesis has not sought to fill this gap in the literature, though, which requires far longer and more specialised study than may be afforded in this chapter.<sup>294</sup> Instead it has merely looked to highlight the variety of the music associated with the Orange Order on demonstration and at public concerts. While many of the songs for which the Order is most known feature therein, what is perhaps surprising is the complexity and theological or historical inflection of much of the Orange songbook. At the very least this serves again to expose the complexity of Orange culture.

More broadly, the second section of this chapter has considered the Order's culture as it relates to public procession and performance in Belfast from 1910 to 1914. As elsewhere, when examined in detail, this period reveals the complexity of Orange life and what it entailed for members of the Institution. Public cultural displays utilised an Orange economy which catered to the specialised requirements of the Institution, but which in itself served to homogenise Orange material culture. While there was an increasing desire for uniformity in this visual culture, though, its music and bands retained a degree of flexibility, where different songs could be employed depending on the audience and environment.

---

<sup>294</sup> In particular, recent work by Stephen Millar on songs in the Irish Republican tradition perhaps offers avenues forward, see: S.R. Millar, *Sounding dissent: rebel songs, resistance, and Irish republicanism* (Michigan, 2020).

These dimensions of Orange culture support the evidence laid out in the first section of this chapter and together they present a view of Orange parades which is different from the common perception. The lack of violence and the promotion of respectable values was especially noteworthy in this period and highlights the multivalence of Orangeism at the turn of the twentieth century. While the Orange Order should not be divorced from the violence and rioting which frequently attended its marches, portrayals of the Order which neglect its 'respectable' association with the U.V.F. and the comparative absence of Orange riots during the third Home Rule crisis fail to accurately represent Orangeism at this time. The next chapter moves on to consider yet another complex dimension of Orangeism. It explores the Order's interaction with an emergent proto-welfare state, and how the Institution itself came to have a profound impact on the nature of unionism and the Union during the third Home Rule crisis. From unlikely beginnings in the National Insurance Act of 1911, in fact the Orange Order came to shape Northern Ireland as we know it today.

## Chapter three: the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society and Ulsterization

In May of 1911 Asquith's government introduced the National Insurance Bill in the House of Commons. The National Insurance Act 1911, as it became, was one of the great achievements of the Liberal administration and is a foundation of the welfare state which emerged in Britain and Northern Ireland after the Second World War. For, at a stroke, working people across Britain and Ireland were given access to medical insurance for the first time.<sup>295</sup> Administered through a combination of insurance companies and friendly societies, by 1912 the Orange Order had got in on the Act. By 1914, the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society (O.P.F.S.) had recruited over 80,000 members. In this sense at least, the O.P.F.S. represents the greatest success of the Orange Institution on these isles. Yet despite this, it has remained entirely neglected by historians.

It is considered here for the first time, and through it, another complex dimension of Orange associational life is revealed. Beyond this, the Society's abandonment of southern Ireland's Protestants affords unique insight into the changing nature of the Order's unionism before the First World War. This chapter is divided between two themes, then. The first is the creation and

---

<sup>295</sup> The Act also contained a second part on unemployment insurance which, while significant, is not of consequence here.

maintenance of the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society, its scale and function. Enabled by the autopsy of this Orange organ, the second is the significance of the Society's partitionism. This combined with other examples from across the Institution are then used to demonstrate that by the third Home Rule crisis, Orangemen in Belfast and the north of Ireland had abandoned an all-Ireland unionism – a decade ahead of Ireland's eventual partition.

### **The National Insurance Act and the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society**

Friendly societies were not alien terrain to all within the Order in 1911. In Scotland, one had been operating for over a decade before the Insurance Act: The Loyal Orange Institution of Scotland Friendly Society.<sup>296</sup> At a meeting of the Paisley branch of the Scottish society in 1905, the honorary president Br. McMannas explained its origins:

Oddfellows, Foresters, Druids, Gardeners, and other friendly societies would take them back to the Garden of Eden for the origin of their societies, but he thought they had the great foundation of the friendly society movement in the land of Egypt. Joseph laid past the surplus grain of the seven years of plenty to provide for the seven lean years.<sup>297</sup>

McMannas' speech is interesting in many ways. As is argued extensively elsewhere in this thesis, it demonstrates the biblical inflection of much of the

---

<sup>296</sup> Bryce, *The undaunted*, p. 99.

<sup>297</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (16 February 1905).

Order's self-perception. This is not to suggest McMannas believed the Scottish Society was a literal descendant of Joseph, but rather that McMannas saw the Society as a moral exercise within a small, pious community. McMannas' example is taken from *Genesis* 41, 47:57 and as such further emphasises the Old Testament focus of the Order's theology. Other articles on the Scottish Society from *Belfast Weekly News* confirm the modest size of its membership and benefits programme.<sup>298</sup> These help to distinguish between the small Scottish Orange Society, based on ideas of biblical prudence and mutual support, and the industrial juggernaut which swallowed it in 1912. The importance of the Scottish society should not be overstated, then. It is enough simply to note its existence as an early precursor to the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society, and to move on.<sup>299</sup> In contrast, Orangeism in Ireland could not even boast a small friendly society such as Scotland had at the beginning of the third Home Rule crisis. This was in part a reflection of Ireland itself where such societies tended not to prosper before the 1911 Act. Antony Buckley attributes this to the enduring impact of the Famine, which destroyed whatever rural base of whichever nascent rural friendly societies had existed before the 1830s.<sup>300</sup> But if the Order in Ireland lacked a model for the Orange and Protestant Friendly

---

<sup>298</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (6 January 1910); *Belfast Weekly News* (26 May 1910) and *Belfast Weekly News* (25 August 1910).

<sup>299</sup> Jonathan Macdonald, *To greet my Glasgow brethren: a history of Orangeism in Glasgow* (Glasgow, 2020), p. 23.

<sup>300</sup> A.D. Buckley, "On the club': friendly societies in Ireland", in *Irish Economic and Social History* XIV (1987), p. 46.

Society which they created in 1912, they at least had a charitable network from which to draw inspiration.

The Lord Enniskillen Memorial Orphan Fund (L.E.M.O.F.) had been established in 1887, and by 1910, lodges whose members', or ex-members', children were supported by L.E.M.O.F. were required to donate at least five shillings annually.<sup>301</sup> In this sense, while the Memorial Orphan Fund was materially quite different from the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society which would emerge later, L.E.M.O.F. demonstrates that there was a culture of mandatory financial investment in charitable acts across the Order in Ireland before the third Home Rule crisis. This experience and the administrative network it created likely contributed to the rapid expansion of the O.P.F.S. when it emerged after the National Insurance Act. In a sense, the blueprint for the successful administration of a subscription society and its attendant possibilities was already in place by 1911. By 1913, L.E.M.O.F. was supporting some 350 orphans and subscriptions had risen to the substantial sum of £2,113.<sup>302</sup> As will be seen, though, by that same year the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society had far surpassed this. Like the Scottish society, L.E.M.O.F. would also be drawn into the Orange and

---

<sup>301</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report of proceedings of the Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, June 1910* (Dublin, 1910), p. 11. Accessible at the Museum of Orange Heritage, Belfast.

<sup>302</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report, December 1913*, p. 46.

Protestant Friendly Society's gravity after 1912, such that it too would eventually go on to become a friendly society.<sup>303</sup>

The Scottish Society and the Lord Enniskillen Memorial Orphan Fund were to prove modest antecedents for the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society. They were much smaller concerns, addressed to smaller issues. They were also distinct from what was, as will be shown, the lumbering professionalised bureaucracy which was attached to the later Society. But they are mentioned here because they demonstrate why the Order was perhaps better placed than other organisations to exploit the opportunities which came to be offered by the National Insurance Act, to which attention may now turn.

Delivering his Budget speech in Parliament in 1909 the Chancellor of the Exchequer, David Lloyd George, had announced the government's reforming credentials and intent. Amid an arms race with Germany, the government would aspire to emulate that nation not only in armaments but in social welfare.<sup>304</sup> In Britain, and Ireland too, the Liberal government would take steps to ensure that working men and women would be supported in times of ill health through a system of national insurance. Two years later, this became the National Insurance Act, 1911. Watching its development closely,

---

<sup>303</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report of proceedings of the Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, June 1913* (Dublin, 1913), p. 12. Accessible at the Museum of Orange Heritage, Belfast.

<sup>304</sup> Maggie Craig, *When the Clyde ran red* (Edinburgh, 2011), p. 26.

had been the Orange Order. Indeed, in June of 1911, six months before it became law, the Grand Lodge of Ireland had nominated a small committee 'to watch the progress of the Bill, and to consider to what extent, and in what way the Institution can act for its Members'.<sup>305</sup>

*The Quarterly Journal of Economics* reflected on the profound significance of the Act shortly after its passage, and as such is worth quoting at some length:

Probably no other act of social legislation yet passed by the British Parliament, except the act for compulsory education, has promised such general and far-reaching consequences as the act of December 16<sup>th</sup> last. No other act, except the cognate Old Age Pensions Act of 1908, has provided so prodigally for a taxpayers' gift to the poor as a class. And no other recent act, except the still young Workmen's Compensation Act, has broken so widely into the contractual regulations of employer and employee.<sup>306</sup>

The class character of the Act and its significance to the Orange Order is considered in greater length below, but for now it is enough to consider that this near unprecedented level of state intervention into the economy held great potential for associations of the size and with the organisational capacity of the Orange Order. With workers compelled or else heavily incentivised to join up to the insurance scheme, societies came to act as

---

<sup>305</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report of proceedings of the Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, June 1911* (Dublin, 1911), p. 10. Accessible at the Museum of Orange Heritage, Belfast.

<sup>306</sup> R.F. Foerster, 'The British National Insurance Act', in *The Quarterly Journal of Economics* XXVI, no. 2 (1912), p. 275.

administrators of their benefits, and by so doing, brought members into their sphere of influence.

Recognising this, the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society (O.P.F.S.) was formed by the Order and circulars sent 'through the County and District Lodges in Ireland setting the case of Compulsory Insurance before them'.<sup>307</sup> The Act compelled all regularly employed male workers over the age of 16 to contribute 4d. per week towards medical insurance, from there, their employer would contribute an additional 3d. and the state 2d.<sup>308</sup> 'These contributions would together add up to 9d. a week for a man, of which he himself would be paying only 4d. – hence Lloyd George's famous phrase 'ninepence for fourpence'.<sup>309</sup> These contributions would allow for a fixed sum to be withdrawn in insurance monies in an unfortunate event. Administered by friendly societies and insurance companies across Britain and Ireland, the Act represented a novel intervention by the state, but also a new opportunity for societies, associations and companies to attract members.

As G.R. Searle has argued, the act served to blur the distinctions between the state and civil society, with friendly societies including the O.P.F.S. taking

---

<sup>307</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, Report of proceedings of the Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, December 1911 (Dublin, 1912), p. 28. Accessible at the Museum of Orange Heritage, Belfast.

<sup>308</sup> For women workers the contribution was only 3d.

<sup>309</sup> John Grigg, *Lloyd George: the people's champion 1902-1911* (London, 1978), p. 325.

on an increased role.<sup>310</sup> The subsuming of these societies into the administration of health insurance had not been entirely by choice, and similarly, the Insurance Act was not greeted with universal enthusiasm.<sup>311</sup> David Brooks points out that immediately after the implementation of national insurance, the Liberals went through 'one of their deepest troughs of unpopularity, thanks in part to working-class resentment at bearing what appeared to be a disproportionately large share of the costs' of insurance.<sup>312</sup> Belfast trade unionist William Walker went as far as to suggest, before the Act's implementation, that the government had found the one issue which could 'unite Orange and Green, Tory and Nationalist' together in opposition.<sup>313</sup> Despite this widespread discontentment, some in the Orange Order suggested the Act might be a 'blessing in disguise'.<sup>314</sup> Writing in the *Belfast Weekly News*, one Orangeman argued that the Act provided 'an opportunity to gather into the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society not only members, but their fathers, brothers, sisters, uncles, aunts, and friends of every relationship, and so make one grand, solid, Protestant phalanx'.<sup>315</sup>

This chimes with what Martin Pugh has argued, that in complementing the social attractions of clubs and societies, national insurance 'had the advantage of attracting the politically uncommitted into the conservative

---

<sup>310</sup> G.R. Searle, *A new England?: peace and war 1886-1918* (Oxford, 2005), p. 391.

<sup>311</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 387.

<sup>312</sup> David Brooks, *The age of upheaval: Edwardian politics 1899-1914* (Manchester, 1995), p. 140.

<sup>313</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (24 August 1911).

<sup>314</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (13 June 1912).

<sup>315</sup> *Ibid.*

sphere and reinforcing purely political loyalty with certain material considerations.<sup>316</sup> Such would undoubtedly prove the case with the Orange Order and the 80,000 individuals who went on to join the Orange and Protestant Friendly society in the years from 1912 to 1914.<sup>317</sup> Despite such significant investment on the part of the state, it is worth stressing that the Act did not encompass the casually employed, or day labourers. This reflected the ideological underpinnings of this Liberal reform, which sought to ameliorate 'unnatural life events' for the populace, chief among them, industrial injury and sickness.<sup>318</sup>

Despite these noble aspirations, though, the Order's own motives in creating the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society were more reactionary.

Reflecting on the strides made by the Society over its first six months,

Secretary R.S.H. Noble reported to the Grand Lodge of Ireland:

that in forming the Society they were not committed to any approval of the Insurance Act. They merely felt that as their political opponents were taking advantage of the Act to organize, they should do the same. They had met with a very gratifying response, and they had a very large membership.<sup>319</sup>

---

<sup>316</sup> Pugh, *The Tories and the people*, p. 8.

<sup>317</sup> In addition to the 70,000 members in the north of Ireland the Society successfully recruited 10,000 members in Scotland and England.

<sup>318</sup> Richard Titmuss, 'Commentary', in W.J. Braithwaite, *Lloyd George's Ambulance Wagon: being the memoirs of William J. Braithwaite, 1911-1912*, H.N. Bunbury (ed.), (London, 1957), p. 50.

<sup>319</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report of proceedings of the Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, June 1912* (Dublin, 1912), p. 11. Accessible at the Museum of Orange Heritage, Belfast.

Clearly perturbed by the formation of a similar society attached to the Ancient Order of Hibernians, the report offers a rare glimpse at the relative symbiosis of unionist and nationalist organisational cultures and tactics. Frequently their contributions to one another are difficult to identify in records, but here it is clear that the Order learned from their adversary.

The Ancient Order of Hibernian's own society was considerably larger than the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society, with approximately 130,000 members.<sup>320</sup> But unlike the O.P.F.S., the Ancient Order of Hibernians' society operated across the whole of Ireland under the jurisdiction of the Irish insurance commission, a devolved administration.<sup>321</sup> Little information is available about the Friendly Society of the Hibernians, indeed the organisation as whole remains understudied, but it is noteworthy that the organisation's density among the Catholic population of Ireland was far inferior to the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society's among Ulster Protestants.<sup>322</sup> This likely reflects the industrial thrust of the National Insurance Act and its application in Ireland.<sup>323</sup>

---

<sup>320</sup> Mel Cousins, 'The creation of association: the National Insurance Act, 1911 and approved societies in Ireland', in Jennifer Kelly and R.V. Comerford (eds), *Associational culture in Ireland and abroad* (Dublin, 2010), p. 159.

<sup>321</sup> Grigg, *Lloyd George*, p. 345.

<sup>322</sup> For perhaps the best of limited accounts of the Ancient Order of Hibernians see: A.C. Hepburn, *Catholic Belfast and nationalist Ireland in the era of Joe Devlin, 1871-1934* (Oxford, 2008).

<sup>323</sup> Braithwaite, *Lloyd George's ambulance wagon*, p. 222.

The Ancient Order of Hibernians was not the only opponent that the Order faced in the new insurance market, though. In March of 1912, Colonel Robert Wallace stressed that 'we ought to lose no time in getting the Brethren and as many Protestants as possible who are employed by the city council to insure' as the Municipal Employees' Friendly Society, a 'Socialistic association', might otherwise attract their subscription.<sup>324</sup> Thus, perhaps surprisingly, the realm of insurance became an important political and organisational battleground for the Order. Over the two years from 1912 to 1914 the Order expended significant time, energy and financial resources in running the Society and administering medical insurance to Protestants in Ulster, Scotland and England. In understanding why, it is useful to take a wider view of the significance of clubs and associations.

In his magnum opus on the subject of associational culture, *British clubs and societies, 1580-1800*, Peter Clark argues that while for much of the seventeenth and eighteenth century, friendly societies had facilitated and enabled non-intervention from government, by the early twentieth century the situation had changed. Increasingly the state would come to use friendly societies to administer welfare and education reforms, before it came to subsume their role entirely. This included the work of the Workers' Educational Association, founded in 1903, which came to use 'public grants

---

<sup>324</sup> Wallace, *Letterbook*, 13 March 1912.

to treble the number of courses and nearly quadruple its enrolments in the inter-war period.<sup>325</sup>

Clark's scholarship serves to transform understanding of the topic in Britain, but there has been relatively little attempt to apply this to the island of Ireland.<sup>326</sup> Nonetheless, it can shed important light on the Orange Order and its history during the third Home Rule crisis. Clark argues that clubs and societies in Britain were 'promoters of new social processes, new social alignments and definitions of urban identity away from narrow local particularism towards a more outward-looking, modernising vision of society'.<sup>327</sup> In one sense it can be challenging to think of the Orange Order, so steeped in archaism, as innovative, but in engaging with the National Insurance Act, it certainly was. In administering a new system of health insurance, organisations like the Orange Order and the Ancient Order of Hibernians 'took the British State into an entirely new field of activity and although by no means solving the problem of the condition of the people, they settled the lines upon which the eventual solution would be found', in the words of Bentley Gilbert.<sup>328</sup> In the process they demonstrated Clark's thesis

---

<sup>325</sup> Peter Clark, *British clubs and societies 1580-1800: the origins of an associational world* (Oxford, 2000), p. 476.

<sup>326</sup> The notable exception is Kelly and Commerford (eds), *Associational culture in Ireland and abroad*.

<sup>327</sup> Clark, *British clubs and societies*, p. 6.

<sup>328</sup> B.B. Gilbert, *The evolution of National Insurance in Great Britain: the origins of the welfare state* (London, 1973), p. 452.

on the increasing role of clubs and societies in the early twentieth century and their increasing entanglement with the state.

Participants in the Orange Order and the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society at this time engaged in an associationalism with extended significance beyond that which other clubs and collective self-help organisations provided, though.<sup>329</sup> Instead, partially through their influence, a reimagined unionism would emerge in these years; away from a united Ireland towards an Ulster-orientated society. In this sense, the Society and the Order were promoters of new social processes and alignments.

By the turn of the twentieth century, clubs and societies came to take on increasing responsibility in the administration of welfare and education alongside more interventionist governments. In one example, Clark cites George Newman, the Chief Medical Officer who in 1925 argued that health education needed to be implemented by 'local authorities and above all, [...] voluntary bodies and an enlightened body of public opinion.'<sup>330</sup> This example is symptomatic of a new approach to welfare and administration adopted by successive British governments at the beginning of the twentieth century who were more willing to directly engage with welfare issues, albeit through associational surrogates. In an admittedly gushing reflection on the Liberals'

---

<sup>329</sup> Cordery, *British friendly societies*, p. 1.

<sup>330</sup> Clark, *British clubs and societies*, p. 486.

legacy in government, Colin Cross argues that 'more than any other measures [...], the twin creations of health and unemployment insurance formed the hinge on which the door to the conditions of the mid-twentieth century could be opened in a smooth and orderly manner'.<sup>331</sup>

Providing a rather more level headed analysis of the legacy of the National Insurance Act of 1911 on Irish associationalism, Mel Cousins concludes that: 'one might suggest that the national insurance legislation was, in terms of governmentality, an interesting experiment by the new Liberal government to develop a form of welfarism in which individuals played an active part.'<sup>332</sup> If by governmentality one understands the organised practices, mentalities, rationalities and techniques through which subjects are governed, then those involved in the Society were necessarily involved in the state at a time of new expansion. Throughout the period the Orange Order through the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society came to administer 'the process of setting, testing and altering boundaries' which came to define the modern state.<sup>333</sup> Through the National Insurance Act, the Orange Order was able to embed itself into the operation of a new and expanding welfare state in the north of Ireland.

Though taking a slightly different form, a similar argument has been made succinctly by Emmet Larkin in regard to the Irish Republic and the Catholic

---

<sup>331</sup> Colin Cross, *The Liberals in power (1905-1914)* (London, 1963), p.155.

<sup>332</sup> Cousins, 'The creation of association', p. 162.

<sup>333</sup> Cordery, *British friendly societies*, p. 180.

Church. Throughout the 1970s at the University of Chicago, Larkin explored the significance of the Church in the development of the Irish Republic, his thesis being that in the decades prior to the resurgence of Irish nationalism and the creation of the state, it was necessary to prefigure the future independent Ireland within the existent institutions of the nation.<sup>334</sup> This is to say, that thirty years prior to the Easter Rising, the state in Ireland was beginning to reshape its relationship with the church to reflect the politics of the Irish Parliamentary Party. Larkin continued, that 'after 1878, it [the Church] would not only have to take up its political and social responsibilities in the state, but it would also have to declare that the state was Irish and *not* British.'<sup>335</sup>

In turn, Larkin demonstrates that the Church began to structure an independent national consciousness among the class that would come to manage an independent Ireland. The Church allied with Irish nationalism and through this, helped to ensure its security within the new state. While the role of the Roman Catholic Church was more influential in this regard than the smaller Orange and Protestant Friendly Society, the latter would play a similar part in paving the way for partition and a Northern Irish state.

---

<sup>334</sup> Emmet Larkin, *The Roman Catholic Church and the creation of the modern Irish state, 1878-1886* (Dublin, 1975), p. XXI.

<sup>335</sup> *Ibid.*

It was with less grand intentions, though, that in 1912 the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society first rented premises at 42 Clifton Street in Belfast.<sup>336</sup> From this base of operations the executive committee would control most of the affairs of the Society, though in principle it was modelled on the federated structure of the Orange Order itself.<sup>337</sup> While the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society was a separate entity to the Orange Order, the two had links which were in no way secretive. Indeed, alongside its name, local meetings took place in Orange halls.<sup>338</sup> If the Society provided insurance to those in need of it, no one could suggest its members were unaware of its relationship to the Orange Institution.

As it grew, a year after its creation the Society was providing an attractive offer to working-class Protestants. In exchange for their four pence per week, workers insured with the Society would receive the following benefits: 'certain allowances during sickness', 'medical attendance and medicine', 'entry into a subsidiary fund for assisting in paying members' contributions when in distressed circumstances, and for relieving widows and orphans of members in distressed circumstances', 'life assurance for members not exceeding £150', a 'funeral allowance to members, their wives and legitimate children', and a 'sum of money on the death of a deceased member's widow, or for

---

<sup>336</sup> *Registration of Orange and Protestant Friendly Society branch: rules of the Ballynahinch District Branch* (Belfast, 1912), (PRONI: COM/41/1/23/7), p. i; Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report, June 1912*, p. 11.

<sup>337</sup> See below.

<sup>338</sup> Orange and Protestant Friendly Society, *Rules of the Ballynahinch District Branch*, p. 4.

paying the burial expenses of such widow.<sup>339</sup> Thus the insurance provided for a number of different benefits in the event of sickness, industrial accident and death among the working-class Protestants registered with the Society. While the responsibility for administering some of this range occasionally lay with the local branches, the extensive rules and bylaws of the Society meant the most significant aspects were left to the executive committee.<sup>340</sup> So it came to be that by the outbreak of the First World War, upwards of 70,000 Protestants in the north of Ireland were to some degree reliant on an extension of the Orange Order and its officers for the administration of their healthcare and insurance. An unprecedented extension of the state into an individual's day-to-day life, this arrangement prefigured the administration of the wider Northern Irish state post-partition.

Beyond the north, though, the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society sought to extend into Britain. From its inception the Society would be registered with the British commission rather than its Irish counterpart, and the Society would be open to 'to all Loyal Protestants, both men and women', transacting its business in England and Scotland as well as Ireland.<sup>341</sup> Despite this, by the end of 1912, only 10,000 Protestants had joined up in Scotland and England, seven times fewer than their counterparts in the north

---

<sup>339</sup> *Ibid.* p. 1.

<sup>340</sup> *Ibid.* p. 5.

<sup>341</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report, June 1912*, p. 21.

of Ireland.<sup>342</sup> While some discrepancy is to be expected in the figures based on the varying membership of the Orange Order across these locations, such disproportionate figures perhaps speak to the varying reputation of the Order among the wider public in this period. In the north of Ireland where the Order permeated much of civic life, members of the public who were not members of the Order were perhaps more willing to sign on with the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society than their equivalents in Scotland and the north of England.

This would explain why the Grand Lodge of Ireland, far from being displeased with the recruiting efforts of their Scottish brethren were delighted with the progress which had been made. In his report, one R.S.H. Noble suggested that 'the Grand Master of Scotland had thrown himself very strongly into the work, and it was largely due to him that the Society succeeded so well in Scotland.'<sup>343</sup> Beyond this, Noble praised the cooperation between members in Scotland and officials in Ulster and 'hoped that the Society would be the means of furthering Protestant interests in the future and especially that in time a travelling fund should be set up to assist Protestants in search of work.'<sup>344</sup>

---

<sup>342</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report of proceedings of the Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, December 1912* (Dublin, 1913), p. 27. Accessible at the Museum of Orange Heritage, Belfast.

<sup>343</sup> *Ibid.* p. 28.

<sup>344</sup> *Ibid.*

Indeed, building on this aspiration, the Society sought to establish itself and its benefits across the “Orange diaspora”. At the Triennial Imperial Grand Orange Council of the World, held in Glasgow in 1912, delegates from across Britain’s colonial territories heard of the good the Society was doing; that all Protestants were eligible for membership, ‘but as the committees have absolute power to accept whom they like, only those are accepted who are in sympathy with the aims of the Orange Institution.’<sup>345</sup> The report given went on to advise members to take the Society with them when they left Glasgow as it was ‘believed that the Society will greatly strengthen the Orange and Protestant cause as necessarily many will be brought in touch with the Order who were not influenced by it before’.<sup>346</sup> If the Society had been founded in Ulster in response to the Ancient Order of Hibernians efforts, very quickly those within the Order were realising its national and international potential.

The National Insurance Act of 1911 enabled the reserve value of each member’s contributions to the Society to be transferred abroad should the member emigrate, and it appears that this was of significant interest to delegates at the Triennial Council. Provided that ‘the society in the colonies or abroad’ were of the same kind as that in Britain or Ireland, Orangemen who emigrated to the United States or Canada would neither lose their investment, nor their attachment to the Society. Beyond this, it was even

---

<sup>345</sup> Grand Orange Council of the World, *Triennial Report, 1912*, p. 18.

<sup>346</sup> *Ibid.*

hoped that ‘in regard to others who were not Orangemen, it would prevent them straying away from Protestantism, and would keep them under supervision when they were away from home.’<sup>347</sup>

Frightening as the prospect of a Protestant Big Brother is, no other mention is made of the correctional or surveillance properties of a global Orange and Protestant Friendly Society, and it must be stressed that when considering this global application, it was proposed in the spirit of brotherhood. As D.M. MacRaild has argued:

Associational togetherness took on the role of social glue for binding the membership to a world-view – a religious-political principle transcending all others. Associational unity through financial mutualism was aimed at strengthening, not removing, the core beliefs of the Orangemen.<sup>348</sup>

Thus, there was a very real effort to expand the benefits of the Society outwith national borders to ensure that a community prone to emigration would remain connected with their Orange roots. In order to ensure that the Society continued to function and to be administered effectively, this effort at Orange internationalism would be led by the Grand Lodge of Ireland.<sup>349</sup> What stands out as remarkable, then, is that despite the emphasis placed on Scotland, England and the Orange diaspora, no effort was made to recruit in the south of Ireland after 1912.

---

<sup>347</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>348</sup> D.M. MacRaild, ‘The associationalism of the Orange diaspora’, in D.A. Wilson (ed.), *The Orange Order in Canada* (Dublin, 2007), p. 27.

<sup>349</sup> Orange Council of the World, *Triennial Report, 1912*, p. 18.

Explaining this decision in his report of that year, R.H.S. Noble stressed that ‘in order to save the Society being under the Irish Commissioners the Grand Lodge of Scotland had joined’, and that expanding membership southwards might put this in jeopardy.<sup>350</sup> By this, ‘the position was that come what might the word ORANGE was established by law, and they had the guarantee of British Administration for its continuance.’<sup>351</sup> Addressing a different meeting in Portadown in May, Noble expanded on his fears about the Irish Commissioners:

After the bill was passed, and the Government made a lot of appointments, the Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland came to the conclusion that they would not entrust their funds to officials in Dublin. The insurance commissioners had been given most extraordinary powers. They had power to approve a society, or to withhold their approval. They had also power to withdraw their approval, and there was no appeal from their decision. The Grand Lodge did not like the idea of having their society under the domination of Mr Joseph Devlin and his friends in Dublin.<sup>352</sup>

In addition, the Commissioners oversaw the accounts of the Society and its appeals process. It seems unlikely, though, that the Order would have suffered unusually at their hands.

While the Order’s anxiety about their treatment by the state may now read as a little paranoid, it is important to stress that at the time of the Act, members of the Irish Parliamentary Party were citing the establishment of Irish

---

<sup>350</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report, June 1912*, p. 11.

<sup>351</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>352</sup> *Portadown News* (11 May 1912)

Commissioners as a great victory. Indeed, in December of 1911, Joseph Devlin had addressed a meeting of the Ancient Order of Hibernians at which he had emphasised the influence which the Irish Commissioners would have over what he termed as a 'separate Insurance Fund for this country'.<sup>353</sup> Thus while there appears little evidence that the Irish Commissioners had any special interest, malign or otherwise, in the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society, it seems again that nationalist achievements made for unionist anxieties.

Returning to Noble's report to the Grand Lodge, the Secretary concluded by stating that 'they did not want to interfere with the scattered Protestants in the south of Ireland, and they therefore agreed with the Union Friendly Society of Dublin, that neither Society would interfere with the other. Also that the two Societies would make arrangements as to transfers between the two.'<sup>354</sup> Thus, in effect, anxieties about the jurisdiction of Irish Commissioners and the numerical weakness of Protestants in the south of Ireland caused the Society to withdraw from the south of the island. While it is unlikely the proposed exchange of memberships was entirely completed before the First World War, suffice it to say, that by 17 December 1914, Noble was able to confirm that the Society's membership in Ireland 'was almost exclusively

---

<sup>353</sup> *The Irish News* (20 December 1911) and *Belfast Morning News* (20 December 1911).

<sup>354</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report, June 1912*, p. 11

confined to Ulster.<sup>355</sup> Such statements reveal quite clearly the psyche of the Grand Lodge of Ireland in the years from 1910 to 1914.

The Protestants in the south so far as being numerically weak were also made up of a demographic less likely to be affected by the industrial thrust of the National Insurance Act, just as Alvin Jackson demonstrated with his investigation of Orangeism in Dublin at the turn of the twentieth century.<sup>356</sup> This is not to suggest that such figures were the preserve of Trinity College Dublin, far from it, but they were largely artisans and members of the lower-middle class, with a large fraction of the membership being employed as clerks. In an already small population, Dublin's working-class industrial Orange base commanded little attention or influence by 1912, a decline paralleled in the city's Conservative Workingmen's Club.<sup>357</sup>

This is also perhaps the reason that such Protestants as were in Dublin tended to register with the much smaller Union Friendly Society (Ireland).

The Union Friendly Society was formed from various parish and congressional benefit societies in Dublin on 16 January 1912.<sup>358</sup> By 1914 the

---

<sup>355</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (17 December 1914).

<sup>356</sup> Alvin Jackson, 'The failure of Unionism in Dublin, 1900', in *Irish Historical Studies* XXVI, no. 104 (Nov., 1989), pp 387-388.

<sup>357</sup> Martin Maguire, 'The organisation and activism of Dublin's Protestant working class, 1883-1935', in *Irish Historical Studies* XXXIX, no. 113 (May, 1994), p. 86.

Scottish associational life also thrived in Dublin at this time, see Stuart Clark, 'The Scots in Ireland under the Union: the boundaries of Britishness c.1800-1925', (Unpublished PhD Thesis, University of Edinburgh, 2020), pp 221-252.

<sup>358</sup> *Dublin Daily Express* (18 January 1912).

Society had 11,500 members, and benefited from the patronage of various churchmen and the *Dublin Daily Express*.<sup>359</sup> The paper upon which Karl Marx had heaped such contempt in an 1859 contribution to the *New-York Daily Tribune* was itself much diminished by the third Home Rule crisis, but it continued to advertise the Union Friendly Society to its readership and serves as the best record of that society's activities.<sup>360</sup>

Far from being held as a seat of Protestant and Unionist power in Ireland, Dublin was already considered a lost cause by many in the Order in 1912. Its 'scattered Protestants' were devoid of both numerical and institutional power within the Order, such that even a new initiative which proved incredibly successful in recruiting members in the north of the Ireland was closed to them. It was in the bureaucratic processes of the Order that its shifting intentions were realised and by which they may now be understood. Throughout the Home Rule crisis, in the north of Ireland the Order was determined to retain its identity and not to lose itself among popular unionism. In the south, it was content for its members' interests to be subsumed as part of the 'Union Friendly Society'.<sup>361</sup>

So, if the National Insurance Act served to 'create the machinery for the operation' of an expanded state at the beginning of the twentieth century,

---

<sup>359</sup> *Dublin Daily Express* (1 May 1914).

<sup>360</sup> *New-York Daily Tribune* (11 January 1859).

<sup>361</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report, June 1912*, p. 11.

through their operation of that machine, the executive of the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society ensured its benefits were not felt in the south of Ireland.<sup>362</sup> By so doing, in their administration of a partitioned Society they had laid the basis of a partitioned but 'stable fabric of central and local government capable of undertaking their own comprehensive [...] measures.'<sup>363</sup> In this expansion of the sphere of the state, the Society had excluded the south of Ireland, partly because of its lack of Protestants, but at least in part because the industrial thrust and character of the National Insurance Act itself had led it to do so.

In Parliament Lloyd George championed the Bill and, seeking the support of members of the Labour Party, argued:

I would remind them that this Bill benefits the poorer classes and that it will do greater things for them than any Bill introduced for a great many years in this House. [...] It will do more than that, because it will give them a new weapon which will enable them to organize, and the most valuable and vital thing is that the working class will be organized – 15,000,000 of them – for the first time for their own purposes.<sup>364</sup>

While a great many workers would be excluded from the Act on the basis of their casual employment status, the appeal to organise the working class was always likely to fall on sympathetic ears on the Labour benches.

Concerned frequently with the condition of the working class in urban areas, the Labour Party would have been reassured that 'the Government was,

---

<sup>362</sup> H.N. Bunbury, 'Foreword', p. 41.

<sup>363</sup> Thomas Jones, *David Lloyd George* (Oxford, 1951), p. 39.

<sup>364</sup> *Hansard Fifth Series*, Vol. XXVIII, Col. 1239.

therefore, proposing that virtually every industrial worker would be able to command the services of a competent doctor in the knowledge that he could pay, and with the doctor also knowing that he would be paid.<sup>365</sup>

As the *British Medical Journal* explained, before the Act, 'industrial insurance was in existence [in Ireland] only to a very limited extent, and in the case of many classes of workers was unknown.'<sup>366</sup> In part at least, this was surely a reflection of the already uneven industrial development in the island of Ireland. The O.P.F.S's exclusion of the limited number of southern Protestants helped to formalise such division. When partition came, 'like most of them, it was on crude surgery' as Tom Nairn describes it, but it nonetheless:

corresponded, albeit approximately, to the 'development gap' that had generated the whole problem. As a result of the earlier Scottish settlement in the North-East and the dramatic industrialization of the 19<sup>th</sup> century [...] Uneven development had long ago potentially divided Ireland in two, along a ragged fissure at once, ethnic, religious, and socio-economic.<sup>367</sup>

The Act and the Order's partitioned administration of it, then, was to some extent a product of the conditions of working life brought about by industrialisation. That same industrialisation in the north of Ireland led the Society to break with Protestants in the south of the island, and in so doing

---

<sup>365</sup> Grigg, *Lloyd George*, p. 328.

<sup>366</sup> The *British Medical Journal* (editorial), 'National Insurance Act. First Report of the Commissioners (1912-1913)', in *The British Medical Journal* II, no. 2741, (12 July 1913), p. 69.

<sup>367</sup> Tom Nairn, *The break-up of Britain: crisis and neo-nationalism*, 2nd Edn. (London, 1981), p. 229.

helped to prefigure the northern state. This evokes the argument of Paul Bew and Henry Patterson that ‘the role of sectarianism was less in *founding* the state than in influencing the *form* that it took.’<sup>368</sup> The Orange and Protestant Friendly Society’s exclusion of the south of Ireland in this sense prefigured partition not simply in a sectarian administration extending the state, but by entrenching the pre-existing divide on the island.

Despite neglecting the south of Ireland, by 1913 the Society boasted over 80,000 members across the Britain and Ireland.<sup>369</sup> Across the whole of that year, the Society paid out £17,969 in sickness benefit to men and £14,259 in sickness benefit to women in the north of Ireland.<sup>370</sup> By the beginning of the First World War, the Society had invested over £20,000 of savings into various stock options, and as the Society itself grew, the executive committee in Belfast found itself with an ever expanding list of responsibilities.<sup>371</sup> All this is to say that the by the outbreak of the First World War, the Society was a significant part of the substantial expansion of insurance under the Liberal government.

It is difficult to verify exactly which stocks were purchased by the Society and the extent of their investments because of the partial survival of records, but

---

<sup>368</sup> Paul Bew and Henry Patterson, *The British state and the Ulster crisis: from Wilson to Thatcher* (London, 1984), p. 4

<sup>369</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report, December 1913*, p. 45.

<sup>370</sup> Orange and Protestant Friendly Society, *Minutes*, p. 75.

<sup>371</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report, June 1914*, p. 19..

there are some patterns visible in the companies considered for investment. While some was made in local concerns, including £100 in 'Belfast Water Commissioners stock at £73, this stock not being quotable on the London Stock Exchange', larger sums were mooted for investment and spread over colonial stocks, a reminder of the Orange Order's imperial links and context in 1914.<sup>372</sup> Investments of a different sort also took up the time of the executive committee of the Society, and in April of 1914 a long and spirited debate was concluded with the authorisation to purchase a motor bicycle for one of the constituent branches of the Society so that medical investigations could be better carried out at the homes of members.<sup>373</sup>

A typical meeting of the executive would begin with formalities including apologies and the approval of minutes, which would be followed by the hearing of appeals, after which the committee would deal with matters arising from branches, before concluding with the expenses. In this sense the business of the executive was much the same as would be found in a great many other associations of the time. While Edwardian associational culture was large and varied, it was frequently dull. So how do these minutes inform understanding not just of the mundanities of the daily business of the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society, but of its significance?

---

<sup>372</sup> Orange and Protestant Friendly Society, *Minutes*, p. 67; *Ibid.*, pp 61-63.

<sup>373</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 63.

One part is the membership of the executive committee and its organisational culture. In a committee of less than 20, senior Orangemen and figures of influence in unionism more widely managed the affairs of a proto-welfare state for many Protestants in the north of Ireland. The overlap of Orangeism and unionism at this time is well in evidence therein. The chair of the Society was Sir James Stronge, who would take up the position of Grand Master of the Order in Ireland in December of 1914; committee members included W.H.H. Lyons and R.H. Wallace, who doggedly appear in a number of guises throughout this thesis, and the Reverend E.F. Campbell, a Grand Chaplain of the Orange Order.<sup>374</sup> It is, of course, unsurprising that senior Orangemen from the north of Ireland dominated the executive of the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society, but what is perhaps more interesting is the way in which the Society could be used to further the interests of this cadre of influential unionists in Ulster. Of the 13 members of the original committee established by the Grand Lodge to investigate the setting up the Society, outside the six counties, two had come from Dublin, one from County Cavan and one from County Monaghan. Already weighted heavily in favour of the north, none of these four members would continue on to the executive committee of the Society. In effect, between being envisaged and created, northern members of the Grand Lodge had ensured the exclusion of southern unionists by 1912.<sup>375</sup>

---

<sup>374</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report, June 1914*, p. 1.

<sup>375</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report, June 1911*, p. 10.

The minutes of the Society are littered with examples of such political manoeuvring and also of nepotism. Frequently this included channelling the Society's business through the concerns of members of the executive, such as the engagement of Messrs R.H. Wallace of County Downpatrick as the solicitors of the Society.<sup>376</sup> In Scotland, the Grand Secretary of the Order was able to abandon his work as a house painter and take up the supposedly full-time position of Society secretary, though as newspapers from the time make clear, in reality his time was split between the Society and the Order itself.<sup>377</sup> Likewise, at an extraordinary general meeting of the Society's executive in April of 1913, Mrs Mercier Clements and her fellow committee members resolved that Dr Mercier Clements formalise his employment within the Society.<sup>378</sup> The next month he had his wage raised to £250 per annum.<sup>379</sup> By the end of the year, he appeared before the committee to suggest that he would be happy to oversee the medical business of the Society for 'a salary of £500 a year with first class travelling and out of pocket expenses', which was unanimously agreed to.<sup>380</sup> This example was neatly symptomatic of the fate of many doctors practicing on the working class with the enactment of the Insurance Act, where salaries nearly doubled and the 'value of practices increased by about 50 percent.'<sup>381</sup>

---

<sup>376</sup> Orange and Protestant Friendly Society, *Minutes*, p. 15.

<sup>377</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (27 June 1912).

<sup>378</sup> Orange and Protestant Friendly Society, *Minutes*, p. 21.

<sup>379</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 25.

<sup>380</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 53.

<sup>381</sup> Grigg, *Lloyd George*, p. 349.

There is no evidence to suggest that Dr Mercier Clements was anything other than rigorous in the discharge of his duties, nor would there necessarily have been any objection from the working-class membership of the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society at the appointment of Mrs Mercier Clements' husband as the chief medical advisor. Not wishing to impugn his reputation as a doctor, rather, this case is illustrative of the culture of the executive committee which, while representing 80,000 working-class Protestants, rarely consulted them. Instead the executive committee was an insular group drawn from across the Protestant middle and lower-upper classes, influential in unionist politics in the north of Ireland at this time. Through the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society such men, and infrequently women, engaged in politics of the kind which would become essential to the operation of the Northern Irish state a decade later. Indeed, many of the executive committee of the Society were also members of the Ulster Unionist Council (U.C.C.).<sup>382</sup>

Founded in 1905, the Ulster Unionist Council represented unionist clubs across Ulster and rapidly became the seat of unionist power in the north of Ireland.<sup>383</sup> The council consisted of not more than 200 members, of whom 50 were nominees of the Orange Order.<sup>384</sup> By the period of the third Home Rule crisis its members included Colonel R.H. Wallace, W.H.H. Lyons and Sir

---

<sup>382</sup> Ronald McNeill, *Ulster's stand for union* (London, 1922), p 35.

<sup>383</sup> For a more detailed account of the emergence of U.U.C. and its relationship to the Ulster Unionist Party, see:

Jackson, *The Ulster Party*, pp 285-336.

<sup>384</sup> J.F. Harbinson, *The Ulster Unionist Party, 1882-1973: its development and organisation* (Belfast, 1973), pp 23-24.

James Stronge; key members of the Orange Order who through the U.U.C. went on to help 'direct the policy of Ulster Unionism' during the crisis.<sup>385</sup> Of special interest here is the monster unionist demonstration held at James Craig's home, Craigavon, in September of 1911. Himself a prominent Orangeman, Craig was instrumental in planning the demonstration which reportedly gathered a crowd of 50,000, including Belfast's Orange lodges.<sup>386</sup> Speaking at the rally, Edward Carson signalled the changing position of northern unionism by declaring the necessity of a provisional government for Ulster.<sup>387</sup> As Alvin Jackson has argued, this process of Ulsterization does not suggest:

that there was any systematic rejection of parliament before 1911 (or indeed before 1914); but it is true that the relative significance of parliament was being decisively reduced through the more intensive local political activity of Unionist politicians.<sup>388</sup>

If the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society helped shape partition within its own structures, then, as Alvin Jackson and others have demonstrated, it was by no means unique as a precursor to partition and devolved government in the north.<sup>389</sup>

Offering a similar degree of self-governance within a British system, affiliations with British associations like the 'Conference of Friendly Societies' enabled the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society to bind itself to the

---

<sup>385</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>386</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 60.

<sup>387</sup> McNeill, *Ulster's stand for union*, p. 51.

<sup>388</sup> Jackson, *The Ulster Party*, p. 309.

<sup>389</sup> Jackson, *The Ulster Party*, p. 314.

emerging framework of an extended British state and administrative system. In practice such affiliations meant that representatives of the Society enjoyed expenses paid trips across the United Kingdom to attend meetings of these overarching quasi-governmental organisations.<sup>390</sup> But aside from such luxuries, these associations meant that at a time when the Orange Order and the Ulster Unionist Council were defying the will of Parliament, the executive committee of the Society was still participating in Britain's proto-welfare state.

Such associations perhaps divided the loyalty of the executive committee. Loyal Protestants and brethren the Society's members may have been, but these ties were rarely strong enough to overcome the committee's prejudices. For the bourgeois elite in control of the Society's affairs, working-class idleness and sloth remained an acute concern. Across the executive's meetings an entrenched suspicion greeted any member who came to appeal their case.<sup>391</sup> At its height this led the committee to consider employing a medical investigator, though this was eventually dismissed.<sup>392</sup> In a typical discussion, the committee also considered how the issue of malingering might be dealt with in west Belfast, concluding that the medical officer and nurse needed to take 'special steps' to reduce the phenomenon.<sup>393</sup> All those who had their case for sickness benefit rejected on the grounds of malingering at the branch or local level had a right to appeal to the

---

<sup>390</sup> Orange and Protestant Friendly Society, *Minutes*, p. 19.

<sup>391</sup> *Ibid.*, *passim*.

<sup>392</sup> Orange and Protestant Friendly Society, *Minutes*, p. 41.

<sup>393</sup> *Ibid.*

committee, but they were unlikely to find sympathy there.

Despite these concerns, examples of attempted fraud against the Society are vanishingly rare in the period before the First World War. While in Glasgow Sheriff Court in June of 1914, one John M. Macdonald was fined £2 5s and sentenced to 60 days imprisonment with hard labour for defrauding the Society, his case is almost unique.<sup>394</sup> What is striking here is that given the booming finances of the Society and the near complete absence of fraud and malignancy from the Society's records, such issues can have been of little practical concern to the members of the executive committee. Rather, a bourgeois fixation on the undeserving poor contributed to a committee culture which sought to limit, where possible, the number of claims. As Jose Harris has written, despite the efforts of reformers, including Beatrice Webb, Victorian fixations with the idle poor continued well up to 1914.<sup>395</sup> Indeed, these concerns were mirrored throughout the National Insurance scheme itself, though as a paradigm shift in the Edwardian state, perhaps some Victorian hang-ups were to be expected.<sup>396</sup>

As a result of such mentalities, at the next meeting of the committee after special steps were imposed on west Belfast, the committee found themselves under question by the Insurance Commissioners over what they

---

<sup>394</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (4 June 1914).

<sup>395</sup> Jose Harris, *Private lives, public spirit: Britain 1870-1914* (Oxford, 1993), pp 237-240.

<sup>396</sup> Gilbert, *The evolution of National Insurance*, p. 9.

termed 'excessive sickness'.<sup>397</sup> Sadly, the precise details of these questions are lost, but the zealotry with which the executive committee of the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society prosecuted the interests of the Commissioners over the claims of their own members surely reveals the level of conservatism in the body. Nor was the loyalty of the committee to the British Insurance Commissioners and that institution more widely shown to Orangemen and Protestants in the south of the island.

As was discussed above, at birth, the rationale to exclude southern Protestants from the Society had been that by so doing, the Society guaranteed it would be placed under British, and not Irish administration. In April of 1913 as the Home Rule crisis continued the Society again considered whether it should extend its reach south to Dublin. However, after much discussion it was resolved that the committee 'offer opposition to the extension of medical benefit to Ireland if such medical benefit is to be administered otherwise than through the Society.'<sup>398</sup> Here two points seem of special relevance. The first is that the Society was wholly unwilling to risk including Orangemen and Protestants from the south of the island in the Society. So determined were the Order for it to remain a part of the British apparatus, that they would exclude Protestants from their insurance if they were supervised by a devolved commission. Perhaps of more significance than this, even, is the way this opposition is phrased. Here the interests of

---

<sup>397</sup> Orange and Protestant Friendly Society, *Minutes*, p. 43.

<sup>398</sup> *Ibid.* p. 19.

Protestants in Britain and Ulster were placed in direct contradistinction to 'Ireland'. Within this is visible a mentality in which those Protestants who are members of the Society and supported by the British state in the north of Ireland are more of Britain than they are of Ireland. Already, their fellows in the south are considered a lost cause. This semi-conscious division of Ireland and its northern Protestants existed in sharp contrast to the rhetoric of the Order through much of the crisis, but it suggests that many of the most vociferous unionists and those in the vanguard of unionist organising had begun to countenance partition well before the First World War.

Thus, in the years from 1912 to 1914, the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society had made considerable progress and come to reflect the changing alignment of unionists in the north of Ireland. Beginning with little more than a desire to match the Ancient Order of Hibernians, after two years the Society was able to boast of 80,000 members across Britain and the north of Ireland. Paying out benefits of tens of thousands of pounds and investing surpluses into colonial stocks, through its affiliation with the British National insurance commission, consciously or otherwise, the Society was becoming a part of an expanding British state and in the process isolating southern Protestants and members of the Orange Order from its benefits. The figures at the head of the powerful executive committee of the Society moved easily between their roles as administrators of this proto-welfare state, leaders of the Orange Order, and the Ulster Unionist Council. These same figures would go on to manage the Northern Irish state post-partition.

## Ulster reorientation

Alongside the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society, across the Edwardian period in advance of partition other factors within Orangeism contributed to an ideological realignment in unionism allowing the abandonment of southern Protestants, an act which had been unconscionable some decades earlier. As the seat of Protestant and unionist organisational power shifted from Dublin Castle to Belfast, and later to Stormont, there came a parallel shift in the ideas of the Orange Order.

One of the most significant factors in this realignment was the creation in December of 1911 of the Provincial Grand Lodge of Ulster. At the biannual meeting of the Grand Lodge of Ireland, Orangemen from Belfast argued that ‘during this present Crisis there should be established at once a Provincial Grand Lodge having headquarters in Belfast, by which the Emergency work in connection with the resistance to Home Rule and all matters relating thereto should be transacted.’<sup>399</sup> The unprecedented resolution provoked much debate but eventually on the motion of James Craig it was resolved that the Lodge should be established on a temporary basis under the control of Colonel Wallace.<sup>400</sup> It is this moment that David Fitzpatrick has argued signed the death sentence of southern Orangeism, which soon fell into ‘terminal decline’ as ‘the futility of conventional unionism outside Ulster

---

<sup>399</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report, December 1911*, p. 26.

<sup>400</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 27.

became apparent.<sup>401</sup> In this, the Order followed the 'Ulsterization' of the Unionist Party described by Jackson.<sup>402</sup> Motivated by the 'mutual gradual repulsion' of the Unionist Party from Westminster, where the latter retreated from London, the Order retreated from Dublin and into the strength it possessed in the north of Ireland.<sup>403</sup> While the focus of this thesis is not to analyse the whole of unionist politics during the eras of Home Rule and partition, it is nonetheless important to stress that this period saw a wider, fundamental cultural and organisational realignment in which the Orange Order played a part. Given the significance of the Belfast Provincial Grand Lodge, it is regrettable that neither the minutes nor reports of the Lodge have survived. Instead, in order to reconstruct its activities, it is necessary to look to the records of its Grand Secretary, Robert Wallace in greater detail.

Colonel Robert H. Wallace, frequently referenced in this thesis, was a Downpatrick solicitor based at Myra Castle. Already the Grand Master of the County Grand Lodge of Belfast in 1911, he had served as Grand Secretary to the Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland two years previously. A product of Harrow and Oxford, he went on to command the 5<sup>th</sup> Battalion, Royal Irish Rifles, and served with distinction during the Boer War from which he received a mention in Despatches and was made a Companion of the Order of the Bath.<sup>404</sup> Unsurprisingly, he went on to a command in the Ulster

---

<sup>401</sup> Fitzpatrick, *Descendency*, p. 54.

<sup>402</sup> Jackson, *The Ulster Party*, pp 325-326.

<sup>403</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 307.

<sup>404</sup> Blacker and Wallace, *The formation of the Orange Order, 1795-1798*, pp 21-22.

Volunteer Force. Beyond this, in later life Wallace contributed to a history of the formation of the Orange Order, and recorded his own life in great detail, with his extensive records now available in the Public Records Office of Northern Ireland. All this is to say that Wallace was among the most crucial individuals in Irish Orangeism in the years of the Home Rule crisis, and his efforts and leadership of the Provincial Grand Lodge of Ulster had a tangible impact on the reorientation of the Institution towards Belfast.

While the Provincial Grand Lodge of Ulster was not, in Wallace's words, 'in any way a substitution for the work of the Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland', it none the less went on to possess 'full Grand Lodge powers'.<sup>405</sup> It exercised these primarily in assisting resolutions passed by the Ulster Unionist Council, on which representatives from the County Grand Lodge of Belfast already sat. However, repeated references to 'confidential' matters which could not be dealt with in letters by post, and the occasional use of a form of code in Wallace's related correspondence, hint at the possibility the Provincial Lodge was more actively involved in military organising.<sup>406</sup> While the Canadian Order had long been arranged into provincial sections, and it is possible this was the inspiration for the idea, no mention of such is recorded in the motions establishing the otherwise unprecedented Provincial Grand Lodge.<sup>407</sup> This said, the influence of diasporic Orangewomen in the

---

<sup>405</sup> Wallace, *Letterbook*, 23 February 1912.

<sup>406</sup> *Ibid.*, 31 October 1912.

<sup>407</sup> Houston and Smyth, *The sash Canada wore*, pp 57-83.

foundation of the female Orange Order and the global Triennial meetings discussed in chapter six of this thesis demonstrate the free flow of communication between Orange colonies and the Belfast metropole, so it is possible the Irish Order took inspiration from their Canadian brethren.<sup>408</sup>

Throughout its existence those involved in the Provincial Grand Lodge of Ulster were at pains to emphasise that it was only a temporary formation, and that at the conclusion of the crisis 'said Provincial Grand Lodge of Ulster shall cease to exist.'<sup>409</sup> In a letter to the Grand Master of Ireland, Wallace claimed the Provincial Lodge was not attempting to replace the Grand Lodge of Ireland:

We were asked on more than one occasion to do certain things which we considered to be outside the realm of our duties and informed the parties that the provincial had no judicial powers whatever so your Lordship can rely on our keeping absolutely clear from infringing on those duties of the Grand Lodge of Ireland.<sup>410</sup>

The effort Wallace makes here demonstrates that even if the pressure applied by the Provincial Grand Lodge was not intentional, it was nonetheless felt by those within the Order. This aside, Wallace informed the Grand Master that the Provincial Lodge was fulfilling its purpose well, and ensuring the 'Brethren acted in harmony with the Unionist Clubs.'<sup>411</sup> But if the Provincial Grand Lodge of Ulster had been intended to act in concert with

---

<sup>408</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, Report of proceedings of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland 1909-10 (Glasgow, 1910), p. 13. Accessible at Olympia House, Glasgow.

<sup>409</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report, December 1912*, p. 27.

<sup>410</sup> Wallace, *Letterbook*, 23 February 1912.

<sup>411</sup> *Ibid.*

wider unionism in Ulster, and in practice infringed on many of the functions of the Grand Lodge of Ireland, neither was it immune from the wider symptoms of Orange organisation.

Across all levels of the Orange Order in this period one is struck by the hyper-bureaucratic performance of internal democracy. Taken to near fetishistic levels, the first report of the progress of the Provincial Grand Lodge of Ulster was symptomatic. The meeting began with a question raised 'as to the constitution of Provincial Grand Lodge, by reason of the fact that all the Members of the Grand Lodge of Ireland in Ulster had not been summoned. A resolution was passed calling upon the Grand Lodge at its next meeting to definitely decide this point'.<sup>412</sup> After questioning its own composition, the Provincial Lodge turned to the question of its own structure, rejecting a proposal for its organisation. This was followed by a spirited debate about the powers it possessed, 'and it was decided to refer this to the next meeting of the Grand Lodge of Ireland'.<sup>413</sup> While the Provincial Lodge facilitated organising in Ulster, much of its activity was inward facing. It is not necessarily that such questions were unimportant, but rather that the obligatory votes and democratic impulses of Orange lodges contributed to the rhythm of their gatherings. Beyond cluttering meetings and preventing the

---

<sup>412</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report, December 1912*, p. 25.

<sup>413</sup> *Ibid.*

discussion of other matters, these votes and procedural and organisational questions were an essential characteristic of Orange activity.

At a more local level, the same phenomenon replicated itself in the minutes of Imperial Temperance Murphy Memorial Lodge when its members considered their route to attend the 1914 Twelfth of July demonstration:

Proposal by Bro Woods, seconded by Bro Brown that we march via York Street and Donegall Street to Clifton Street. Amendment proposed by Bro Logan seconded by Bro F. Halliday that we march via Duncairn Gardens and Antrim Road. On a vote being taken the proposition was declared carried.<sup>414</sup>

That such a minor choice was put to a vote is significant and symptomatic. Indeed, all matters, seemingly no matter how minor, were subject to these processes. This has led Patrick Coleman to suggest that 'the apparent dullness of the lodge meetings provided a sense of order, which is symptomatic of reformation Protestantism. It meant members learnt as much about meeting procedures as they did about ritual.'<sup>415</sup> But this seems a slight misdiagnosis. The procedures of the meeting were in fact an essential and valued aspect of Orange ritual, with the Institution's lodges performing a twisted version of the 'civil and religious liberty' which had become the Orange mantra. The sheer prevalence of procedural business in lodge minutes indicate its significance, and process and action were blended in lodge ritual where few motions were rejected, but were rather amended and

---

<sup>414</sup> Lodge Number 929, *Minutebook*, 2 July 1914.

<sup>415</sup> Patrick Coleman, 'In harmony': a comparative view of female Orangeism, 1887-2000', in A. McCarthy (ed.), *Ireland in the world: comparative, transnational and personal perspectives* (London, 2015), p. 126.

voted upon in an effort to form consensus. The performance of democracy in Orange halls may usefully be compared to trade unions at this time, then. In some sense at least both aspired to respectability but beyond this the practice of democracy, artificial or otherwise, was essential to the world view of both organisations. Just as an Orange utopia could not be brought into being without the exercise of civil and religious liberty, neither could a socialist world be made without the democracy of trade union branches. Processes within the branches or lodges therefore are not simply a method of transacting business efficiently, they constitute and are constituted from the loftier ideals of Orangeism and trade unionism.<sup>416</sup>

Beyond voting, it is clear that the Provincial Grand Lodge of Ulster was active in other ways throughout the Home Rule crisis, including in soliciting subscriptions from local lodges to the Ulster Defence Fund.<sup>417</sup> This was in stark contrast to the 'Provincial Grand Lodge of Dublin and the South of Ireland', which had been proposed to run alongside the Ulster Lodge, but which failed to hold so much as a single meeting.<sup>418</sup> The anxiety involved in the mirrored creation of a Dublin Provincial Lodge, combined with its failure, does much to reveal the tensions, anxieties and dynamics which existed in this period of Ulsterization within the Orange Order. Far from being a harmonious organisation, those in Ulster were relatively disdainful of their

---

<sup>416</sup> For trade union democracy see the still influential: Sidney Webb and Beatrice Webb, *Industrial Democracy* 2 vols. (London, 1897).

<sup>417</sup> Lodge Number 929, *Minutebook*, n.d. April 1913.

<sup>418</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report, December 1911*, pp 26-27.

southern counterparts. In another letter Wallace explained to Brother Major T.P. McCammon that Trinity College Lodge was 'absolutely useless', and suggested its members be made to assume a lesser position on demonstration with the rest of their Dublin Brethren.<sup>419</sup> This was perhaps partially as a result of feeling that southern Orangemen contributed little to the life of the Order. Certainly there was frustration within the Grand Lodge of Ireland that southern brethren failed to contribute enough to the Lord Enniskillen Memorial Orphan Fund, and a similar animosity can be found in the efforts of the Grand Lodge to purchase the so called "Boyne Obelisk" at this time.<sup>420</sup>

The Boyne Obelisk itself made no pretence to subtlety and stood at around 170 feet high. Purportedly visible for miles around, it had been originally constructed on the banks of the Boyne in 1736 as a testament to the famous victory.<sup>421</sup> It is surely significant that it was not until the third Home Rule crisis that the Order made efforts to purchase the land and the Obelisk.<sup>422</sup> At a time of unprecedented crisis, some members of the Order, and particularly those in the south of Ireland, strove to own a physical symbol of past military prowess and supremacy.

---

<sup>419</sup> Wallace, *Letterbook*, 23 March 1912.

<sup>420</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report, December 1910*, pp 42-43.

<sup>421</sup> *Irish Times* (25 May 2009).

<sup>422</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report, December 1911*, p. 29.

Their brethren in the north of Ireland were less impressed with the idea, though, and communications between Wallace and W.H.H. Lyons reveal both considered it at best a distraction from more important work. Wallace confided to Lyons, 'I cannot help thinking that as soon as we do get possession the other side will probably put a charge of dynamite under the concern and blow it up.'<sup>423</sup> The saga of the purchase ran on for another two years before eventually collapsing and in the process further irritated many northern Orangemen.<sup>424</sup> While Wallace's prediction came true, with the Obelisk itself dynamited in 1923, the frustrations over its attempted purchase further reveal the tension between northern and southern Orangemen at this time.<sup>425</sup> Short of effective organising strategies, southern brethren increasingly became isolated from the fast moving events in Ulster. That isolation would come to mirror their effective abandonment by Orangeism in the negotiations over partition a decade later.

### **Concluding notes**

It has been 100 years since Ireland's partition. Now, in a decade of centenaries, the anniversary of the border and partition has proved particularly difficult to commemorate. Little if anything has been done in Britain to celebrate the foundation of Northern Ireland and the creation of the

---

<sup>423</sup> Wallace, *Letterbook*, 4 July 1912.

<sup>424</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report, June 1914*, p. 8.

<sup>425</sup> *Irish Times* (25 May 2009).

United Kingdom in its present form. Perhaps this is fitting. The National Insurance Act 1911 saw a near unprecedented expansion of the state. In the process, friendly societies came to administer medical insurance in a proto-welfare state, dividing the population between memberships in whichever way the societies deemed most appropriate. The Orange and Protestant Friendly Society thrived, but, as has been argued, it did so to the exclusion of Protestants and unionists in the south of Ireland. The egalitarian Liberal reform in fact served to cement division on the island, as 70,000 members of the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society in the north found themselves pulled into a British, not Irish, system of administration.

The Orange and Protestant Friendly Society's mind-set is inseparable, though, from the wider psyche of Unionism during the third Home Rule crisis. Organs such as the Ulster Unionist Council quickly realised that an all-Ireland unionism was unsustainable, indeed they contributed to making it so. The Orange Order followed suit, and the crisis saw its powerbase definitively shift from Dublin to Belfast through the creation of the Ulster Provincial Grand Lodge. It is the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society, the most populous expression of Orangeism in Britain and the north of Ireland, which is especially significant, though. Its influence shaped the interaction of Ulster society and the British state in advance of partition. In this, it offers a glimpse of how the Orange Order would come to influence the nature of the Northern Irish state post-partition.

## Chapter four: towards a religious understanding of the Orange Order

The Orange Order describes itself as a religious brotherhood, and whatever else it might be – imperialist, violent, gauche – it is ultimately sectarian. Yet pervasive within academic scholarship is the belief that religion serves as cover for some underlying impulse.

In 1913 James Connolly suggested Orangeism was a symptom of the false consciousness of a section of the Irish working class.<sup>426</sup> In opposition to this lumpenproletarian model, and as was discussed in chapter one, Henry Patterson stressed the class consciousness of the Independent Orange Order in his 1980 work *Class Conflict and Sectarianism*.<sup>427</sup> Around the same time, Tom Nairn revived Connolly's notion of an 'atavistic survival' in his writings on Ireland, with the Orange Order and loyalism acting as a mutated surrogate for nationalism in the north of the island.<sup>428</sup> More recently, in 2019, Brendan O'Leary's *A Treatise on Northern Ireland* argues that Orangemen are but useful foot soldiers in the defence of Ascendancy property rights.<sup>429</sup> All have in common the belief that the religious aspect of the Orange Order is a façade or is at the least subordinate to some higher purpose.

---

<sup>426</sup> James Connolly, *Forward* (2 August 1913).

<sup>427</sup> Patterson, *Class conflict and sectarianism*.

<sup>428</sup> Nairn, *The break-up of Britain*, pp 216-255.

<sup>429</sup> Brendan O'Leary, *A treatise on Northern Ireland*, p. 203.

This chapter challenges such accounts. It addresses the general absence of a religious understanding of the Orange Order and, utilising a range of previously unexamined materials, argues that only through understanding the religious impulses and characteristics of the Order can the Loyal Orange Institution itself be fully understood. First, this chapter takes a brief look at the denominational breakdown of Belfast during the crisis, before attention turns to the faith of the Order specifically. Herein the importance of religious devotion in Orange practice is revealed in the once-secret records and rituals of the Order. Through these sources, it becomes clear that religious activity made up a significant portion of the day-to-day activities and tenets of Orangeism before the First World War.

Having established this religiosity, attention may then turn to exploring the makeup of Orange theology itself. Using a collage of scriptural passages, the Order shaped a form of Protestantism which emphasised martial traits, stressing the relationship between defending the Reformed Faith and the physical security of Protestants on the island of Ireland. Finally, the impact of this theology on the Order's sectarianism is explored. In the years from 1910 to 1914 even in the midst of the third Home Rule crisis it is evident much of the Order's opposition to Irish nationalism was theologically rooted in anti-Catholicism and was explicitly expressed in the same terms. Despite its neglect, then, it seems that a religious understanding of the Orange Order can explain a great deal not just about the Loyal Orange Institution, but about its wider role within the history of sectarianism. In this, this chapter hopes to

contribute to an emerging and welcome trend in recent decades which re-stresses the significant role of religious institutions and influences in Irish history.<sup>430</sup>

### **Belfast and the Orange Order**

Before coming to the Order specifically, it is perhaps useful to provide an outline of the size and strength of Belfast's Christian denominations from 1910 to 1914. The city had of course grown tremendously in the century before, with its population rising from roughly 20,000 at the beginning of the nineteenth century to 387,000 by 1911.<sup>431</sup> In Belfast, Presbyterians were the largest denomination, with the census recording 131,000 resident in the city, amounting to 33.7 percent of the population.<sup>432</sup> Alongside this, the city was also home to 118,000 Episcopalians, almost treble the number there had been 40 years before.<sup>433</sup> It is also worth mentioning the small but not insignificant Methodist population of the city, who comprised 6.2 percent of its population by 1911.<sup>434</sup> Methodists punched – theologically speaking – above their weight in Ulster, spearheading both the Revival of 1859, and the

---

<sup>430</sup> See: S.J. Connolly, 'The moving statue and the turtle dove: approaches to the history of Irish religion', in *Irish Economic and Social History XXXI* (2004), pp 1-22; Andrew Holmes, *The Irish Presbyterian mind: conservative theology, evangelical experience, and modern criticism, 1830-1930* (Oxford, 2018); Margret Scull *The Catholic Church and the Northern Ireland Troubles, 1968-1998* (Oxford, 2019); Colin Barr, *Ireland's empire: the Roman Catholic Church in the English-speaking world, 1829–1914* (Cambridge, 2020).

<sup>431</sup> *Census of Ireland, 1911*, p. vii.

<sup>432</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>433</sup> R.B. McDowell, *The Church of Ireland 1869-1969* (Abingdon, 1975), p. 121.

<sup>434</sup> *Census of Ireland, 1911*, p. vii.

less studied but still significant Welsh Calvinist Methodist Revival of 1904-1905.<sup>435</sup> Andrew Holmes has convincingly argued, though, that the effects of such revivals were much reduced by the beginning of the First World War and so care must be taken not to exaggerate their influence in this period.<sup>436</sup> Lastly, the Roman Catholic population of Belfast had increased in line with the city's growth to 93,000 by 1911.<sup>437</sup> It is worth highlighting, though, that that increase masks a decline in the percentage share of the Catholic population of Belfast, from around '10 percent at the end of the eighteenth century to at least a third in the mid-nineteenth century, and then declined to less than a quarter in 1911', as A.C. Hepburn has observed.<sup>438</sup> The health of the Catholic Church in Ireland over time has been the subject of much excellent scholarship over the decades and does not need to be repeated here.<sup>439</sup> What is perhaps interesting, though, is that in contradiction to Eric Kaufmann's work on the Orange Order in Scotland, it seems that during the Home Rule crises Orange Order membership grew in Belfast as the percentage share of the Catholic population in the city decreased.<sup>440</sup> This may speak either to the distinctions between the Order in Ireland and

---

<sup>435</sup> E.J. Gitre, 'The 1904-05 Welsh Revival: modernisation, technologies, and techniques of the self', in *Church History* LXXII, no. 4 (2004), p. 794; C.R. Williams, 'The Welsh Religious Revival 1904-5' in *The British Journal of Sociology* III, no. 3 (1952), p. 242.

<sup>436</sup> Holmes, 'Religious revival in Ulster Presbyterianism', p. 380.

<sup>437</sup> *Census of Ireland, 1911*, p. vii.

<sup>438</sup> A.C. Hepburn, 'Work, class and religion in Belfast, 1871-1911', in *Irish Economic and Social History* X (1983), p. 34.

<sup>439</sup> See: Emmet Larkin, 'The Devotional Revolution in Ireland', in *The American Historical Review* VXXII (1972), pp 625-52;

D.W. Miller, 'Mass attendance in Ireland in 1834', in S.J. Brown and D.W. Miller (eds), *Piety and power in Ireland 1760-1960* (Belfast, 2000), pp 158-179;

Colin Barr and Daithí Ó Corráin, 'Catholic Ireland, 1740-2016', in Eugenio Biagini and Mary Daly (eds), *The Cambridge Social History of Modern Ireland*, (Cambridge, 2017), pp 68-87.

<sup>440</sup> Kaufmann, 'The dynamics of Orangeism in Scotland', p. 279. This is discussed further in chapter six.

Scotland, or perhaps simply to the magnetism of the third Home Rule crisis in pulling new members into the Order.

What the tracing of these denominational figures and their attendant histories demonstrate, though, is that by 1911 Belfast was a city in relatively rude religious health, and an auspicious environment for a religious adjacent popular movement like the Orange Order. But while the 1911 census offers an easy denominational breakdown of Belfast, unfortunately calculating a denominational breakdown of the Orange Order in the city is more challenging. As has already been covered, the reports of the County Grand Lodge of Belfast from 1910 to 1912 suggest that in 1911 the Order likely had between 9,500 and 10,000 members in the city, rising significantly in 1912 between around 12,700 and 13,000 as the Home Rule crisis accelerated.<sup>441</sup> Regrettably, though, the reports do not contain the level of detail required to allow a reasonable estimate of the denominational breakdown of Orange Order membership during this period.

As in the first chapter of this thesis, then, it is useful to approach the roll book of the Orange-adjacent Royal Arch Purple for Belfast in this period. This shows an almost equal distribution of Presbyterians and Episcopalians across the 136 elected members.<sup>442</sup> It is also clear from the records of county and local lodges at this time that the churches which played host to Orange

---

<sup>441</sup> County Grand Lodge of Belfast, *Report, 1911*, pp 13-39; County Grand Lodge of Belfast, *Report 1912*, pp 13-40.

<sup>442</sup> Royal Arch Purple, *Report, Belfast, 1913-1914*.

functions varied in their denomination.<sup>443</sup> Similarly, looking through the obituaries of Orangemen printed in *Belfast Weekly News* it is clear that, across Ulster at least, the Order attracted members from various different congregations.<sup>444</sup> In Scotland the Order was far more Presbyterian in character, in line with the relative dominance of the Kirk. This influence is discussed at greater length in the next chapter.

Focusing on the religious denominations of chaplains within the Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, David Fitzpatrick has demonstrated that throughout the history of the Order, Episcopalian clergy have dominated the highest ranks of the Orange chaplaincy.<sup>445</sup> By 1916, 116 of the 126 chaplains associated with the Grand Lodge were Episcopalians. Clearly this near uniform Anglican presence was not representative of the wider membership.<sup>446</sup> What it does demonstrate, though, is that at the top of the Order in Ireland, Church of Ireland chaplains maintained a virtual monopoly over religious office. In fact, the Bro. Most Rev. J.B. Crozier, D.D., Lord Primate of All Ireland, acted as a Grand Chaplain for the Order in the County Grand Lodge of Belfast and the Grand Lodge of Ireland during the crisis.<sup>447</sup>

Despite the prevalence of senior members of the Church of Ireland in the Orange hierarchy, though, the Order was fundamentally a pan-

---

<sup>443</sup> Lodge Number 929, *Minutebook*, passim.

<sup>444</sup> See for example: *Belfast Weekly News* (31 October 1912)

<sup>445</sup> Fitzpatrick, *Descendancy*, p. 88.

<sup>446</sup> Fitzpatrick argues that chaplains at a local and county level were also more likely to be diverse.

<sup>447</sup> County Grand Lodge of Belfast, *Report 1910*, p. 11.

denominational enterprise. Consequently, the Order had no formal links with any of its other constituent denominations, instead relying on a network of informal relationships. As Earl Storey has written with regards to the contemporary relationship between the Order and the Church of Ireland, these relationships are reducible to an often considerable overlap of membership between clergy and attendants and the Orange Order, and the sharing of premises.<sup>448</sup> Beyond this, the Order has historically held so called “Orange services” at different churches under the permission of the local rector or minister. Into the present day even these unofficial links have been brought under increasing strain in Northern Ireland and abroad.<sup>449</sup>

In sum, in Belfast in the years from 1910 to 1914, the Orange Order operated in a Protestant majority city, but under the threat of an external Catholic majority on the island of Ireland as a whole. The Order thrived in the city in these years, and despite having no formal links to the Protestant churches, had a significant religious influence on the lives of its 13,000 members in the city. This overview complete, attention may turn to the religiosity of the Loyal Orange Institution itself at this time.

---

<sup>448</sup> Earl Storey, *Traditional roots: towards an appropriate relationship between the Church of Ireland and the Orange Order* (Dublin, 2002), pp 53-54.

<sup>449</sup> Kaufmann, *The Orange Order*, p. 2.

## Orange religiosity

Few sources are able to speak to the personal religiosity of the 13,000 Orangemen in Belfast in 1912, and consequently, it is necessary to focus analysis on the institutional records of the Order which exist from this period. In particular, to recover the religious practice of the Order it is useful to look to the rules of Orange ceremonies from this time. These resources have historically been neglected by historians, though. In particular in his otherwise pioneering work on Protestant “descendancy” in Ireland, David Fitzpatrick argues that we should be careful not to give such sources too much weight, that:

Sermons and addresses to Orangemen, when reported, were almost invariably formulaic, an incantation of familiar precepts and commemorative pieties which brethren had learnt to expect and endure, along with meat teas and damp afternoons with the lodge at the field.<sup>450</sup>

But this seems altogether too hasty a judgement. When examining sermons, rituals and other Orange documents which cover the Institution’s religious life, repetition surely underlines their significance. All religious services are formulaic to some extent. Further, in assuming that Edwardian Orangemen ‘endured’ religious practice, Fitzpatrick risks falling into the trap which Andrew Holmes has called the ‘the secularising and modernising world-view that automatically assumes the subservience of religion to culture in the modern world.’<sup>451</sup> Instead, given the extent to which prayer and scripture

---

<sup>450</sup> Fitzpatrick, *Descendancy*, p. 99.

<sup>451</sup> Andrew Holmes, *The shaping of Ulster Presbyterian belief and practice, 1770-1840* (Oxford, 2006), p. 20.

shaped Orange practice, it is more reasonable to assume a degree of religious devotion than it is to dismiss it entirely.

The 'Qualifications of an Orangeman', the guiding doctrine for Orange behaviour, stressed the importance of religious devotion. Indeed, the first qualification was a 'sincere love and veneration of the Heavenly Father', the document as a whole refers all but exclusively to religious observance or the defence of Protestantism.<sup>452</sup> Likewise in the initiation ceremony into the Order, scriptural quotation abounds and is used to illustrate the various rules associated with membership. In one passage, Romans XIII, 1 and 3 are combined to emphasise the importance of rendering service to God through the Order: 'Let every soul be subject unto the highest powers. For there is no power but of God: the powers that be are ordained of God. For rulers are not a terror to good works, but to evil.'<sup>453</sup> Later in the same ceremony, other passages including from Proverbs XXIV and Peter II are used to further stress the importance of obedience to the civil authority.

Stressing obedience to the civil authority may seem ironic in the midst of the armed rebellion of the third Home Rule crisis and it perhaps emphasises that caution is required before taking too literal a reading of such documents. However, it should also be noted that within Orangeism, obedience to the civil authority has been historically predicated on that authority maintaining

---

<sup>452</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *12th July church service*, (PRONI: D3815/4/119), p. 4.

<sup>453</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Ritual and forms of ceremonies*, p. 7.

Protestant supremacy in Ireland and later Northern Ireland.<sup>454</sup> In a letter on behalf of the Imperial Grand Orange Council in 1911, Robert Wallace demonstrated this by framing Home Rule first and foremost as a struggle for religious liberty and against Roman dogmatism.<sup>455</sup> In so doing, he preemptively justified rebellion against the government to protect religious freedom. Despite his Anglicanism, Wallace followed the Presbyterian ethos subsequently emphasised by David Miller and his theory of 'conditional loyalty'.<sup>456</sup> This was stated even more explicitly in the Presbyterian dominated Scottish Orange Order. In a similar example illustrating the relationship between faith and politics in Glasgow, in a speech to the Thistle Loyal Orange Lodge Number 72 in June of 1910, the Brother Reverend John Wipers took to the stage to express his opposition to constitutional reform:

He was a Second Chamber man. He would tell them why. He was a Protestant Presbyterian. They settled their business in presbytery. They considered that they needed revisionary courts if not satisfied, and so there was the Synod and the General Assembly, and the moment he ceased to be a Second Chamber man he would be consistent and cease to be a Protestant Presbyterian.<sup>457</sup>

His speech is revealing for it demonstrates the weight which Wipers' Presbyterianism had upon his politics, but beyond this it also suggests that he believed that this would be well received among his audience. Despite the Pan-protestant orientation of the Order, opposition to the removal of the House of Lords veto was here phrased in specifically Presbyterian terms,

---

<sup>454</sup> D.W. Miller, *Queen's rebels: Ulster loyalism in historical perspective* (Dublin, 2007).

<sup>455</sup> Imperial Grand Orange Council, *Letter from R.H. Wallace, October 1911* (PRONI: D3815/A/76).

<sup>456</sup> See: D.W. Miller, 'Presbyterianism and 'modernisation' in Ulster', in *Past and Present* LXXX (1980), pp 66-90.

<sup>457</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (3 March 1910).

exclusionary to the other Protestant denominations within the Order. For Wipers, his defence of the British constitution was inalienably connected with being a Presbyterian.

Similarly, at a celebration of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, the Rev. J.M. Brisby, always a fiery orator, was keen to emphasise that 'with him, his politics and his religion were one, and he believed firmly that one of the great errors they were liable to make was when they tried to divide religion and politics. He was a Protestant first and a politician afterwards.'<sup>458</sup> Brisby's articulation of the inseparability of religion and politics within Orangeism is a clear expression of the points made above, and combined, the examples serve to highlight the religious rationale of the Order's leadership during the third Home Rule crisis, standing testament to the religiosity of the Orange Institution more widely at this time.

It should be stressed that arguments about the religiosity of the Order are not immune from criticism, though. In particular, chaplains associated with the County Grand Lodge of Belfast were notoriously poor attendees of Order events, with over two thirds regularly failing to attend at single meeting per year.<sup>459</sup> As a result one must be careful not to exaggerate the influence of such chaplains on the lay membership of the Orange Order. This said, in examining the *Laws of the Institution*, it is also clear that chaplains were

---

<sup>458</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (10 February 1910).

<sup>459</sup> Fitzpatrick, *Descendancy*, p. 86.

given pride of place in most lodges; indeed all clergymen admitted to the Order were automatically elected members of their district lodge, the first rung up on the Orange representational hierarchy.<sup>460</sup> This law at least partially suggests why there may have been such a poor culture of activity among chaplains who may have only been *de jure* members of such lodges. Regardless, the rule reveals the eagerness of the Order at an institutional level to engage with these same clergymen.

Though chaplains appear to have been immune, in most Orange lodges discipline played an important role in shaping the ritual and behaviour of members of the Order. With an elaborate code of punishment, members would have been acutely aware of the rules and regulations of the Orange Institution. In practice, the Order had six classes of offence, ranging from the non-payment of dues or non-attendance of lodge, class one, to class six: 'aggravated offences'.<sup>461</sup> What is significant here with regard to the Order's religiosity is that offences against religion, morality and sobriety were a class five offence punishable by expulsion from the Order or suspension for a period of up to seven years.<sup>462</sup> These rules have already been mentioned with regard to temperance and respectability in the first chapter of this thesis, but again highlight how various aspects of Orange culture were entwined with religious devotion. Indeed, these punishments were more severe than those which members would have received for breaking the standard rules of

---

<sup>460</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Laws and ordinances*, p. 27.

<sup>461</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 9.

<sup>462</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 10.

the Institution and thus illustrate the way in which respectable behaviour and religious practice were merged and prioritised by many within the Institution. It seems that the Order was willing to place religion and its practice above whatever customs and rituals it had developed alongside its Protestantism. With outside accounts of the Order frequently eager to highlight the existence of arcane or ritualistic practice, it is worth remembering that even if local lodges did perform their own extra-curricular ceremonies, institutionally these had little standing in comparison with the Order's devotion to the Reformed Faith. On this point, Anthony Buckley has stressed that the masonic-style rituals of the Orange Order and associated bodies such as the Royal Arch Purple are not written down and are learned by heart by lecturers.<sup>463</sup> This makes their accurate recovery by non-members challenging. In any case, as Buckley has written:

it is clear that at least some of the rites are great fun, and that part of this fun lies in the ignorance of the initiate as to what will happen next. It is said, for example, that the initiate in the Royal Arch Purple degree must 'ride a goat'. This is not strictly true, but it is not very far from the spirit of what actually happens. It is not for a researcher to publicize what little he knows of these amusing mysteries and thus spoil the fun. Suffice it to say that the opening and closing ceremonies in the Orange, Royal Arch Purple, and Black degrees, and also the initiation ceremonies, have a broadly similar structure to those found in published accounts of Masonic ritual.<sup>464</sup>

Far from spoiling the fun, the inability to investigate the extent to which such practices might have changed over the last hundred years means that any analysis of these Orange-adjacent rituals must be left for investigations

---

<sup>463</sup> A.D. Buckley, 'The chosen few: Biblical texts in the regalia of an Ulster secret society', in *Folk Life* XXIV, no. 1 (1985), p. 11.

<sup>464</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 12.

outside this thesis, tied as it is to the Order in Belfast and Glasgow from 1910 to 1914. Instead it is better to focus on such recorded materials as illuminate Orange practice in these years.

As has been shown in the first chapter of this thesis, sobriety was also accorded significant status and was regularly equated with leading a truly Christian life such that over half the Orange lodges in Belfast abstained from alcohol to some degree during the third Home Rule crisis.<sup>465</sup> The processes enforcing temperance therein provide another illustrative example of the relationship between the Order's culture and theology, though. When examining the disciplinary procedures of one temperance lodge, David Fitzpatrick describes that:

Nearly a quarter of those on the roll between 1911 and 1914 were punished for pledge violations, and a third of offenders repeated the offence and retook the pledge, sometimes two or three times. The atmosphere at lodge meetings must have resembled that of the Confessional, acts of contrition being rapidly followed by further lapses.<sup>466</sup>

In characteristically provocative style, Fitzpatrick invites the reader to consider the parallels between the Order and the more performance heavy or ornate aspects of Catholic ritual. But one need not look to the Church of Rome to find a doctrinal basis for such performance. Indeed, the Westminster Confession, the guiding doctrine of the Scottish and Irish Presbyterian tradition, provides ample evidence.<sup>467</sup>

---

<sup>465</sup> County Grand Lodge of Belfast, *Report, 1912*, pp 13-40.

<sup>466</sup> Fitzpatrick, *Descendancy*, p. 86.

<sup>467</sup> Holmes, *Shaping of Ulster*, p. 3.

On the subject of Repentance unto Life, the Westminster Confession

suggested:

As every man is bound to make private confession of his sins to God, praying for pardon thereof; upon which, and the forsaking of them, he shall find mercy; so, he that scandalizeth his brother, or the church of Christ, ought to be willing, by private or public confession, and sorrow for his sin, to declare his repentance to those that are offended, who are thereupon to be reconciled to him, and in love to receive him.<sup>468</sup>

Far from echoing the Confessional, the repentance and retaking of pledges of sobriety was well within the Presbyterian tradition as outlined in the Westminster Confession. Declaring sorrow for his sin, and a commitment to abstain from alcohol, the sinner could make public apology to his brethren. Such brethren, those that were 'offended' in the language of the Confession, would thereupon be reconciled to him, and in love receive him. Such an example serves to highlight the almost symbiotic relationship between often seemingly disparate ceremonies and ritual in the Order and the Institution's religiosity, again stressing the importance of the latter to understanding Orangeism as a phenomenon. If there was more of the Confession than the Confessional about this ritual, beyond this example of the social practice of religion, it must also be noted that the agenda of meetings within the Orange Order was dominated by prayer and biblical recitation.<sup>469</sup> While consistency rarely equates to enthusiasm, in considering the features of Orangeism,

---

<sup>468</sup> Westminster Assembly, *Westminster Confession*, Chap. XV. – 'Of Repentance unto Life', vi.

<sup>469</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Laws and ordinances*, p. 39.

prayer and scriptural recitation were far more common features of Orange life than the parading for which it is so known.

This is not to suggest that members of the Orange Order were immune to the pressures of external perception, though. At the beginning of 1911 the Order was rocked when its leader, the Earl of Erne offered to resign his post as Grand Master. Erne feared that a scandal was developing around him and his erstwhile Chaplain. *The Times* reported:

The Rev. J.H. Steele, incumbent of Holy Trinity, Com, in the diocese of Kilmore, and chaplain to Lord Erne, the Grand Master of the Orangemen since 1883, has been received into the Roman Catholic Church and has gone to Rome to study for the priesthood.<sup>470</sup>

Clearly a chaplain turning to Rome under the nose of the Grand Master of the Orange Order in Ireland was an alarming development for members of the Institution. Correspondence between Robert Wallace, Erne, and W.H.H. Lyons reflects this, though Lyons and Wallace seemed eager to reassure Erne his resignation was not required.<sup>471</sup> Evidently his stature, combined with the worry that his resignation might throw fuel on the fire, meant he was better left in post.

This difficulty lasted until December of 1914 when the Earl passed away. Erne would be succeeded by James Stronge as Grand Master, but the Earl's funeral provides another example of the importance of ritual and religious

---

<sup>470</sup> *The Times* (30 December 1910).

<sup>471</sup> Wallace, *Letterbook*, 3 January 1911.

practice within Orangeism. *Belfast Weekly News* reported the ceremony from Crom Castle, as Erne was carried by boat to Crom church where his remains were passed 'into the charge of the Orange brethren at the water's edge and conveyed between two files of them, standing with uncovered heads, up to the church entrance.'<sup>472</sup> In the church itself J.B. Crozier conducted the service and led mourners in 'Now the labourer's task is o'er'. After the service Orangemen carried the coffin to the vault.

Less grand was the funeral of an Orangeman in Fermanagh in 1913, which was reported by *The Times*' special correspondent. Here as the remains were brought towards the church, the correspondent was struck by the solemnity of the occasion as 'it came slowly down the steep lane through the wind and rain to the gates of the graveyard, the men composing it, two abreast, with their orange scarves and other insignia of the Order, introducing a strange effect into the desolate beauty of the evening.'<sup>473</sup> Inside the church the correspondent describes a typical Church of Ireland ceremony, though Orange funeral arrangements were also made for Presbyterian brethren.<sup>474</sup>

For the most part Orange funerals centred around this public procession, clearly identifying the deceased as a member of the Order and a man respected by his brethren. The content of the service itself was rather more

---

<sup>472</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (10 December 1914).

<sup>473</sup> *The Times* (09 May 1913),

<sup>474</sup> Lodge Number 929, *Minutebook*, (n.d.) June 1911.

demure, though. The chaplain's prayer addressed the Heavenly Father and asked for his grace ending: 'May the solemnity of the present occasion bind us still closer together in the ties of brotherly love.'<sup>475</sup> While there is little which is distinctive in the prayer, it is significant that Orangemen gathered together as Orangemen to mark the death of members of the Institution, and that there they sought comfort from God in their brethren. At the very least, Orange funeral ritual suggests that Orange religiosity was maintained from entrance into the Institution until the very end.

The examples discussed so far in this chapter combine to highlight the significance and extent of religious practice in the Orange Order. While some members may have been less devout than others in their adherence to Orange and Protestant tenets, it seems wrong to disregard the religiosity of the Loyal Orange Institution wholesale. Indeed, such records as do exist strongly evidence that the Order had an institutional commitment to the practice of religion. By treating this with a degree of sincerity, valuable insight into Orange theology and practice may then be gained. It is to the content of this theology which this chapter now turns.

---

<sup>475</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Laws and ordinances*, p. 19.

## Orange theology

Spanning Protestant denominations as the Order's approach to theology did, it nonetheless possessed some prominent characteristics. This included a biblical literalism which emphasised the necessity of a close and unmediated reading of the Bible. In the induction ceremony into the Order, the chaplain would read the combined message of 2 Tim. iii. 16-17, John V., 39 and John xx., 31., encouraging members to 'search the scriptures' as they were 'given by inspiration of God' and would lead to salvation.<sup>476</sup> Clearly the passage also sought to infer that the mediation of Catholic priests was contrary to the word of God. Explicit opposition to the Catholic Church is considered shortly, but it is difficult to disentangle from the rest of the Order's theology.

Above all, the defining characteristic of the Order's biblical interpretation and religious evocation was the association of religious strength and martial biblical imagery with the strength and security of Protestants in Ireland. This combined into what might usefully be called a "muscular Protestantism". Clearly, the term is evocative of the likes of Thomas Hughes, Charles Kingsley and the "muscular Christianity" of English boarding schools, but it nonetheless conveys an important idea. The 'association between physical strength, religious certainty, and the ability to shape and control the world around oneself' appears a common tenet, and beyond this the necessity of a

---

<sup>476</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Ritual and forms of ceremonies*, p. 9.

secure religious faith in the maintenance of empire.<sup>477</sup> While there are discontinuities between the ideas, not least their comparative duration, they usefully evoke the importance of religious practice in shaping the life of the individual. The Order's interpretation of the Bible and its commitment to Protestantism was theologically anchored by texts and passages which extolled the virtues of strength and order. In turn it was expected that members of the Orange Order embody such virtues in their own lives to maintain Protestant supremacy in Ireland and Britain.

Alongside this, Orange chaplains' militaristic language in prayer shaped the form of the Order's Christianity. God was beseeched to 'defend' and 'protect' the 'righteous Kings and States [...] against the designs of its enemies'.<sup>478</sup> Attendant with the increasing militarisation of Ulster society during the third Home Rule crisis, it would be easy to regard the two as linked, but the Order's ceremonies remained largely unchanged across the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.<sup>479</sup> As was described in chapter two, despite the militarisation of Ulster at this time, the Order's martial traits spoke to a longer running tradition of positional strength secured through faith, more closely aligned to the mythology surrounding the Siege of Derry.<sup>480</sup>

---

<sup>477</sup> Donald Hall, 'Muscular Christianity: reading and writing the male social body', in Donald Hall (ed.), *Muscular Christianity: embodying the Victorian age* (Cambridge, 1994), p. 7.

<sup>478</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Laws and ordinances*, p. 38.

<sup>479</sup> For militarization see: McGaughey, *Ulster's men*.

<sup>480</sup> See: Ian McBride, *The Siege of Derry in Ulster Protestant mythology* (Dublin, 1997).

At the closing of every lodge meeting the chaplain would lead prayer as follows:

O Almighty God! Who art a strong tower of defence unto Thy servants against the face of their enemies, we humbly beseech Thee of Thy mercy, to deliver us from those great and imminent dangers by which we are now encompassed. O Lord, give us not up as a prey to our enemies; but continue to protect Thy true religion against the designs of those who seek to overthrow it, so that all the world may know that Thou are our Saviour and mighty Deliverer: through Jesus Christ our Lord. Amen.<sup>481</sup>

In the context of a divided Ireland during the Home Rule crises, there could have been little doubt about which enemies such passages referred to. Again in the ceremony Order members were encouraged to defend themselves through devotion to God. More than that, the initiation ceremony stressed that it was only through that devotion that Orangemen might stand against 'the wile of the devil'.<sup>482</sup> Moving to cite Ephesians, candidates were told to 'put on the whole armour of God', for they wrestled 'not against flesh and blood, but against principalities, against powers, against rulers of the darkness of the world, against spiritual wickedness in high places'.<sup>483</sup> Such evocation compared the struggle against the Catholic Church in Ireland with a Crusade. Orangemen were knights of the true faith, defended by their devotion to Protestantism and the Orange Order. Such images were of course salient across the Home Rule crises, but they always spoke to the existential threat Protestants were under in Ireland at the hands of the Catholic majority. Their defence, as in Ephesians, was in the armour of the

---

<sup>481</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Ritual and forms of ceremonies*, p. 3.

<sup>482</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 10.

<sup>483</sup> *Ibid.*

Lord, highlighting the need for religious devotion but also serving to endorse more practical forms of armament.

Elsewhere in the initiation ritual, new members were reminded that ‘the only proper object of worship is God Himself – Father, Son, and Holy Ghost; and prayer is to be made to God alone’, ‘all prayer to the Virgin, to saints, angels, and the like, with all veneration to images and relics, are to be abhorred as idolatrous’.<sup>484</sup> Again, there is an emphasis on Catholicism as a perversion of true faith, where the Virgin Mary is singled out as a false idol.

It is strange, then, that King William seems to have been venerated by the Order to the extent that he was portrayed as a vessel for divine intervention. In the laws and ordinances of the Order, William was exalted as the servant and tool of God: ‘We praise Thee for raising up our deliverance from tyranny and arbitrary power, Thy servant, King William III., Prince of Orange, and we beseech Thee, for Thy honour and Thy Name’s sake, for ever to frustrate all the designs of wicked men against Thy Holy religion’.<sup>485</sup> This is a prayer to god which thanks him for his servant William, but beyond this, William is praised as the champion who, through strength of arms, saved the Protestant people from the Catholic perversions mentioned above. The image of William III as conqueror, and the martial traits of the Order more generally, were

---

<sup>484</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>485</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Laws and ordinances*, p. 36.

discussed in chapter two, but they combined with the Order's theology to help shape its muscular Protestantism.

Indeed, this muscular Protestantism speaks to the essentially masculine characteristics of the Orange Order, but what of the women involved in the Institution? While chapter seven addresses Scottish Orangewomen in more depth, it is worth briefly outlining the way in which theology influenced female Orangeism. In Belfast in 1912 the female order was made up of only a handful of women, largely the spouses of senior figures within Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland. It would be a number of decades before it began to flourish in Ulster, but by contrast, Scottish female Orangeism was enjoying remarkable success during the third Home Rule crisis, despite having only been established north of the Tweed in 1909. The practicalities of this expansion are considered in far greater depth in chapter seven, but in reaching towards a religious understanding of the Orange Order, it is useful to consider the Scottish sisters' theology.

Of particular interest here is the esteem in which the Old Testament figure of Ruth is held. Indeed, from female Orangeism's beginning, Ruth seems to have been popular. In late April of 1910, Glasgow Female Loyal Orange Lodge Number One commissioned their first banner, which depicted Ruth gleaning on one side and a painting of a Bible and crown on the other.<sup>486</sup> The general popularity of the image over the centuries aside, it tells us much

---

<sup>486</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (21 April 1910).

about how Orangewomen wished to present themselves. The scene in the book of Ruth is one of sacrifice as Ruth gleanes the field of Boaz for her mother-in-law Naomi. The image which is evoked, then, is one of sacrifice and motherhood, of feminine virtues which avoided the Marian devotion to which the Order was so opposed.

Beyond taking her image for banners, though, women who came to join the Order would quickly come to embody Ruth herself in the rite of introduction, as Deborah Butcher has explained in her PhD thesis on the subject. 'The rite positions the candidate as the protagonist within the performative re-enactment of the biblical story of Ruth and celebrates her unflinching devotion to her widowed mother-in-law Naomi', Butcher argues.<sup>487</sup> As the rite continues, another Orangewoman comes to take on the role of Boaz, who instructs the lodge to 'let fall, also, some of the handfuls of purpose for her to glean.'<sup>488</sup> The physical performance of biblical stories is intriguing in and of itself, but clearly the message of the story is also important. Through faith and devotion, Ruth comes to be nurtured and protected by Boaz and his labourers. In fact, after laying at his feet, Boaz eventually takes Ruth as his wife.<sup>489</sup> A conventional feminist interpretation might reasonably highlight that only through sacrificing her independence to Boaz does Ruth come to marry him and save herself from the ardour of gleaning. Beyond this though, by taking on the role of Boaz, the mistress of the lodge rather subverts this

---

<sup>487</sup> Butcher, 'Ladies of the lodge', p.117.

<sup>488</sup> *Ibid.* The speech itself is derived from Ruth 2: 16.

<sup>489</sup> Ruth, 3:6-11; Ruth 4:13.

gendered performance. Boaz ceases to be the masculine Orange Order and instead becomes the female order and the local lodge in particular. Thus, through devotion to the female order, a woman might come to be protected and nurtured by her sisters in the lodge.

That the women's order would jump so quickly to Old Testament imagery is also unsurprising. As elsewhere, it speaks to the fierce Presbyterianism so influential in the Order's theology and identity, especially in Scotland. Beyond this, though, finding a biblical figure of female sacrifice to represent the Order was also challenging. John Calvin's scorn of Marian relics was reflected by the Order, but beyond this, Marianism's strength in Catholic Ireland would also have been cause for concern.<sup>490</sup> Ruth allowed a similar depiction of feminine virtue without such worrying connotations.

Alongside the piety implied by this theology, though, Deborah Butcher argues convincingly that there existed strong overlaps in female participation in both the Order and the Church of Scotland because of what she terms the shared 'charitable, Christian ideology' of both organisations. Beyond this, Butcher suggests 'it is likely that the Kirk would afford an opportunity for informal scrutiny of the character, commitment and abilities of prospective candidates

---

<sup>490</sup> John Calvin, *A treatise on relics: translated from the French original with an introductory dissertation on the miraculous images, as well as other superstitions of the Roman Catholic and Russo-Greek Churches*, Valerian Krasinski (tr.), (Edinburgh, 1870), pp 248-249; Scarcely 30 years prior Mary had apparently appeared to witnesses at the church at Knock, County Mayo. See Paul Carpenter, 'Mimesis, memory and the magic lantern: what did the knock witnesses see?' in *New Hibernia Review / Iris Éireannach Nua* XV, no. 2 (2011), pp 102-120.

by an experienced Orangewomen.<sup>491</sup> The communion of church and Orange Order means similar possibilities were afforded to Orangemen in Scotland and Ulster, though, as was mentioned above, no formal links between the two existed.

As with the Order's muscular Protestant theology, though, much of this devotion was carried out away from church and the public gaze in the privacy of lodge halls. If either were a justification for the Order's militancy or the female order's very existence outside those halls, then they were privately expressed too. Consequently, such rituals and their religious content offer a glimpse into the inner workings of the Order and the importance of religion therein. They reveal the extent to which Orange practice was based in theology and biblical interpretation. While this was often unconventional, it was surely devout.

The final section of this chapter explores the sectarianism present in the Order's theology. It is not focused on violence committed by members of the Order, nor truly on the consequences of the Order's sectarianism, but rather examines its religious basis. Orangeism perceives itself as under threat from the inter-related forces of Irish nationalism and Romanism. Examining the Order's theology at the time of the third Home Rule crisis demonstrates just how substantially religious anxieties influenced political concerns.

---

<sup>491</sup> Butcher, 'Ladies of the lodge', p. 51.

## Orange anti-Catholicism

Alongside the political turmoil which engulfed Ulster in the years of the third Home Rule crisis, the papal decree *Ne temere*, enacted in 1908, continued to have a profound impact on Protestant psyches.<sup>492</sup> Graham Walker has argued that the Irish Presbyterian Anti-Home Rule Convention of 1912 treated the issue without 'crude bigotry; critical arguments about perceived Catholic Church aspirations and policy were expressed without sectarian sloganeering.'<sup>493</sup> Members of the Order were less restrained. Despite their own laws forbidding marriage between an Orangeman and a 'Papist', the Order believed that *Ne temere* in practice forbade the marriage of Protestants and Catholics and therefore undermined the civil authority.<sup>494</sup> Grand Chaplain J.B. Crozier gave a speech in Belfast on the issue 'worthy of the Reverend Fred Hanna' in the words of Eoin De Bhaldraithe.<sup>495</sup> *The Irish News* of 4 November 1910 was even more scathing:

It is unlikely his lordship will live in ecclesiastical history as a combination of Columbus and Sherlock Holmes – the intrepid discoverer and foiler of a startling "plot" on the part of knavish "Romans." At first glance it might appear that the Bishop had been intellectually hibernating.

---

<sup>492</sup> N.K. Morris, 'Traitors to their faith? Protestant clergy and the Ulster Covenant of 1912', in *New Hibernia Review / Iris Éireannach Nua* XV, no. 3 (2011), p. 24.

<sup>493</sup> Graham Walker, 'The Irish Presbyterian Anti-Home Rule Convention of 1912' in *Studies: An Irish Quarterly Review* LXXXVI, no. 341 (1997), p.75.

<sup>494</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Ritual and forms of ceremonies*, p. 4.

<sup>495</sup> Eoin De Bhaldraithe, 'Mixed marriages and Irish politics: the effect of 'Ne Temere'', in *Studies: An Irish Quarterly Review* LXXVII, no. 307 (1988), p. 290.

In his speech, two years after *Ne temere* had been enacted, Crozier had claimed he'd discovered a Papal plot, that the sacred vows of marriage were to be 'repudiated at the bidding of a foreign Pontiff'.<sup>496</sup>

The anxieties of the Order and other Protestants in Ulster were further compounded by the "McCann Case" in 1911. The facts of the case were that after consulting a priest on *Ne temere* and finding the Catholic Church did not recognise his marriage, Alexander McCann had abandoned his wife Agnes, and taken their children with him.<sup>497</sup> Such was the subsequent scandal among Protestants that Raymond Lee has suggested that the McCann Case constituted a failed attempt to create a 'moral panic' in Protestant Ulster.<sup>498</sup> Certainly the Orange Order considered the case significant. When the Lord Lieutenant of Ireland refused to investigate the case, the Order openly criticised his reluctance to condemn 'the outrageous interference of a priest and others in the marriage laws of our country, and setting them aside for a law made by the Pope'.<sup>499</sup> In this case, the Lord Lieutenant had indicated he was unwilling to investigate the issue as it was a private matter, which the Order then compared unfavourably to his 'sending misleading political telegrams to Scotland to induce the electors there to return Home Rule members to Parliament'.<sup>500</sup> Regardless of the veracity of these claims, the Order's equation of religious betrayal with political betrayal is again indicative

---

<sup>496</sup> R.M. Lee, 'Intermarriage, conflict and social control in Ireland: the decree 'Ne temere'', in *The Economic and Social Review* XVII, no. 1 (1985), p. 20.

<sup>497</sup> Rev. William Corkey, *Glad Did I Live* (Belfast, 1961), p. 151.

<sup>498</sup> Lee, 'Intermarriage, conflict and social control', p. 24.

<sup>499</sup> County Grand Lodge of Belfast, *Report, 1911*, p. 55.

<sup>500</sup> *Ibid.*

of the alignment of the religious and the political in the minds of its members. There could be no clear separation between Home Rule, *Ne temere* and Catholicism, just as there could be no separation of Protestantism and unionism. While in one sense this association is unsurprising, it is important to recognise such beliefs as serious on the part of Orangemen.

The Order's enduring distrust and opposition to the Roman Catholic Church and Roman influence was also expressed in this period through their opposition to the alteration of the King's Declaration, and important section within the Coronation Oath. In advance of the accession of King George V, in 1910 the Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland passed a resolution demanding there be no alteration to the Declaration. Throughout, the Order argued that 'Papal Bulls and Anathemas against Protestants and Protestant Rulers' justified the maintenance of an oath laden with anti-Catholicism.<sup>501</sup> The County Grand Lodge of Belfast also released a resolution on the issue in which it declared the King's Declaration 'as a landmark' in Protestantism, and professed it to be paramount to the security of Protestants, even in 1911:

[The Declaration] emphasises for us, at the beginning of each reign, the tyranny and abhorred principles from which we escaped; and we protest against any weakening of this bulwark of our liberties, and of the Protestant character of the throne and Succession.<sup>502</sup>

The Order may have exaggerated the threat posed by a change in the King's Declaration, but its opposition again highlights the profound anxiety which

---

<sup>501</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report, June 1910*, p. 8.

<sup>502</sup> County Grand Lodge of Belfast, *Report, 1910*, p. 52.

Order members felt about the threat posed by the Roman Catholic Church.

Speaking to an Orange gathering in Glasgow, one brother reported that:

He observed that the Pope himself had written to King George V. asking him not to use the words in the oath [...] he thought if there was no stronger reason for resisting any alteration in the wording of the oath this would be quite strong enough, and therefore, he hoped that every loyal Protestant would declare 'hands off' to the Pope and all his satellites who would attempt to influence or interfere with a sovereign whose first declaration was to maintain the Protestant religion intact.<sup>503</sup>

Brother Elliot stressed that he had read the declaration through many times and not found anything offensive, which is in itself revealing of the beliefs of Orangemen at this time. The offence caused by the Pope and his satellites' alleged interference on the other hand is clear to see. It reveals the degree to which members of the Order in this period felt the weight of the Catholic Church pressing upon Ireland and Britain, with the pontiff able to reach out with influence through his supporters in Ireland.

Equal parts fantastical and fanatical, this is not to say the Order's fears were insincere. Nor were they exclusive to the Orange Order at this time. As G.I.T. Machin has demonstrated, in fact, there was a degree of opposition to the proposed changes to the King's Declaration from some Liberal and Conservative MPs, with a Liverpool by-election in Kirkdale allegedly decided by the issue.<sup>504</sup> Despite the opposition of the Order and a minority of such

---

<sup>503</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (26 May 1910).

<sup>504</sup> G.I.T. Machin, *Politics and the churches in Great Britain 1869-1921* (Oxford, 1987), p. 295;

Protestants, the Declaration was eventually altered to remove its anti-Catholic sentiment, though there remained a commitment to Protestantism.

The Order's anti-Catholicism was not always so public, though. Despite claiming to abstain from 'all uncharitable words, actions, or sentiments towards their Roman Catholic brethren' in reality there is ample evidence of sectarianism within the Order's private records at this time.<sup>505</sup> The Order claimed to oppose Catholicism rather than their Catholic brothers, to hate the sin and not the sinner, but in practice such distinctions were rhetorical only. Alongside requirements which forbade marriage to a 'Papist', the laws of the Institution prevented former Catholics from joining.<sup>506</sup> The impossibility of repentance from the sin of membership of the Catholic Church therefore necessarily changes the inflection of the Order's anti-Catholicism. Here the sin is transposed irrevocably onto the sinner, and the Order's objection becomes not just to the Catholic Church, but to all those who have been Catholic. Were the Order's anti-Catholicism to be directed *exclusively* at the Church of Rome, then the meaningful renunciation of Roman theology in favour of the Reformed Faith would surely be enough to qualify one for membership of the Orange Order.

Those who could prove no such connection to the Catholic Church would pass through the initiation ceremony, during which they were beseeched to

---

Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Ritual and forms of ceremonies*, p. 4.

<sup>506</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 5.

give no countenance to the 'superstitious or idolatrous worship of the Church of Rome'.<sup>507</sup> What is perhaps most interesting though is that after the member had sworn they would not, the chaplain of the local lodge would invoke a collage of scripture, evoking and further condemning the Catholic Church:

Chaplain:- "In vain do they worship me, teaching for doctrines the commandments of men." – Mark vii., 7. "But continue thou in the things which thou hast been assured of, knowing that from a child thou hast known the Holy Scriptures, which are able to make thee wise unto salvation through faith which is in Christ Jesus.' – 2 Tim. iii., 14-15. "In meekness instructing those that oppose themselves" – 2 Tim. ii. 25.<sup>508</sup>

Here Mark vii., 7 is invoked to again stress the fallibility of the Catholic Church and 2 Tim. iii., 14-15 to suggest the open Bible and its importance to pure religious faith and eventual salvation. A recurrent theme here, it seems it was scarcely possible to expound Orange theology without juxtaposing it to the failings of Roman Catholicism. While the collaging of scriptural passages in the assertion of the Protestant faith is far from unprecedented, what is revealing about this passage is that even in the inner sanctum of Orange ritual, its anti-Catholicism was drawn from a theological base. Thus, while the Order's anti-Catholicism and sectarianism did extend beyond the theological, it would be foolish to dismiss the very real basis of much of the Order's bigotry, at least in the period of the third Home Rule crisis.

---

<sup>507</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 9.

<sup>508</sup> *Ibid.*

This is further evidenced by the fact that even towards the height of the Home Rule crisis in June of 1913, the Grand Lodge of Ireland was still concerned with financing the widespread publication of a pamphlet entitled 'Roman Intolerance', by the Reverend J. Warren. After some amendment, the Grand Lodge of Ireland would eventually contribute £20 to its circulation across Ulster, Scotland and England.<sup>509</sup> While this is not an especially remarkable amount of money in and of itself, in fact, it was only £5 less than the Grand Lodge donated in total to the Carson Defence Fund in 1914.<sup>510</sup> Thus it seems that the Order retained a vision or understanding of itself as a guardian of the faith even during the third Home Rule crisis, where the publication of anti-Catholic literature remained high on its list of priorities. Above all, sources taken from the Orange Order in Belfast during the third Home Rule crisis stress the religious nature of both the Institution and its sectarianism.

### **Concluding notes**

This chapter has sought to make three relatively modest points about the nature of the Orange Order in Belfast from 1910 to 1914. Examining a range of previously neglected Orange sources, it stresses the profound importance of religion to the Loyal Orange Institution. Indeed, any close reading of Orange documents from this period demonstrates the earnest religiosity of

---

<sup>509</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report, June 1913*, p. 14.

<sup>510</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report, December 1914*, p. 39.

the Order, at least at an institutional level. Whether through the disciplinary structures which encouraged religious practice, or in prayers and rituals stressing the importance of an open Bible, Protestantism effected almost all aspects of Orangeism to some extent during the third Home Rule crisis. While perhaps less clearly visible than Orange sashes on the Twelfth of July, the religiosity of the Orange Institution was present all year round.

The second purpose has been to begin to diagnose, for the first time, the historic composition of Orange theology. Even before the First World War it appears this was shaped by martial imagery and language. The muscular Protestantism of the Orange Order emphasised that physical security could only be maintained through religious devotion. Cloaking themselves in the armour of the Lord, Orangemen would then be free to defend Protestantism from the encroachment of the Catholic Church. While highlighting the anxieties of Order members, Orange theology invoked a martial mentality associated with the Siege of Derry, and likewise stressed Orangemen's route to salvation through strength and faith.

The final section of this chapter expanded on this sentiment and explored the religious basis of much of the Order's sectarianism at this time. Whether in reaction to *Ne temere*, the McCann case, or in opposition to the alteration of the King's Declaration, even in the midst of the third Home Rule crisis the Order opposed any perceived advance by the Church of Rome. While such opposition frequently drew in opposition to Irish nationalism or Home Rule, it

is important to stress it was most often framed as a religious issue. Beyond this, the Order's sectarianism was also consistently expressed in its private rituals and rules. These were most often tied to biblical passages, and however objectionable or arcane they might appear to a contemporary observer, they appear the product of a sincere biblical interpretation. Tenets of the Order were thus imbued with a religious quality, and by so doing, the Order's sectarianism was justified as part of a developed theology.

These points combine to emphasise the significance and utility of a religious understanding of the Orange Order. Yet despite the evidence presented here, historians have long failed to engage with the religiosity and theology of the Institution. If we are willing to embrace the significance of religion across the centuries to men and women outside the Loyal Orange Institution, why has there been such reluctance to acknowledge it within an avowedly religious association? A desire for grand narratives and a lack of source materials has contributed to this neglect, but as this chapter has demonstrated, such challenges may be overcome. The Order's anti-Catholicism and its theological underpinnings pose troubling questions for those who seek to explain the wider phenomenon of sectarianism with minimal reference to religion. The Orange Order remains a symbol of sectarian animosity for many, and yet as has been shown, in its history it has been an avowedly religious institution. Without reconciling these aspects of the Loyal Orange Institution, our understanding of sectarianism in Ireland and Britain will remain, quintessentially, limited.

This chapter has also made brief reference to the overlaps in theology between Orangeism in Ulster and Scotland. Having covered Belfast in the preceding chapters this thesis now re-orientates itself to Scotland, and to Glasgow in particular. The next three chapters examine Orangeism in that city and establish important threads of harmony and discontinuity. Indeed, it is only by considering the Orange Order in two locations that the Loyal Institution as a whole may be properly understood.

## Chapter five: Scottish exceptionalism

Sure I'm an Ulster Orangeman, from Erin's Isle I came  
To see my Glasgow brethren all of honour and of fame  
And to tell them of my forefathers who fought in days of yore  
All on the twelfth day of July in The Sash My Father Wore.<sup>511</sup>

Scotland and Ireland's Orange links go back to near the beginning of the Loyal Institution itself. Indeed, so fundamental has this relationship been to Orangeism that it takes pride of place in the first verse of Orangeism's great anthem. *The Sash My Father Wore* describes the high esteem in which the Glasgow brethren of Orange Order are held, but despite such brethren's prominent and controversial place in contemporary society, as with Ireland, it seems little study has been made of them.<sup>512</sup>

According to Orange sources, the Order first migrated to Scotland in 1798, a mere three years after its foundation in County Armagh. A 'lodge warrant' having been issued to John Gibson of the Argyllshire Fencibles, Loyal Orange Lodge Number 421 was certified.<sup>513</sup> The regiment then returned to Scotland, bringing Orangeism with them.<sup>514</sup> From this martial base, the Order

---

<sup>511</sup> The first verse of *The Sash My Father Wore*, contemporary Orangeism's main anthem, popularised some years after the Home Rule crisis.

<sup>512</sup> Among a continual presence in the popular press, see: *Scottish Sun* (17 June 2021); *Glasgow Times* (5 June 2021); *The Herald* (13 August 2021).

<sup>513</sup> McCracken, *Bygone days of yore*, p. 3.

<sup>514</sup> This is the generally accepted account of the Order's introduction to Scotland, though it should be mentioned that in her doctoral thesis Elaine McFarland argues it is more likely that the Ayrshire and Wigtonshire Militia were the regiment responsible: McFarland, 'The Loyal Orange Institution', p. 88.

grew slowly in Scotland in the years until the Institution was banned by the 1835 Select Committee Enquiry.<sup>515</sup> The Enquiry, and the resultant prohibition of the Orange Order in Britain and Ireland, sent Scottish brethren into disarray. Divided into various strands of organisation, it was not until 1876 that these unified to form the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, heralding more auspicious times for the Institution in this country.<sup>516</sup>

Despite its initial challenges, by 1910 the Order was a significant political and social force in Scotland, though not without its critics. Many considered it to be a malign, violent organisation. Such perceptions were driven in part by the secrecy of Orange ceremonies and the privacy of Orange halls, which the uninitiated were unable to penetrate. As with Belfast, so too with Glasgow, this secretive nature means that quantifying the Order's membership in Scotland has proven difficult, to the extent that even fairly basic questions about the Order's size have remained unanswered.

Of the limited scholarship which exists on the Order in Scotland, only one account offers a systematic or methodical contribution to such questions. In an article in *Social Science History* in 2006, Eric Kaufmann charted membership trends within the Orange Order in Scotland from 1860 to 2001.<sup>517</sup> However, given his contemporary focus, Kaufmann was given

---

<sup>515</sup> Senior, *Orangeism*, pp 254-272.

<sup>516</sup> Marshall, *The Billy Boys*, p. 53.

<sup>517</sup> Eric Kaufmann, 'The dynamics of Orangeism in Scotland', pp 263-292.

access to the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland's membership data on the condition that he not publish the membership figures of the present-day Order. Consequently, Kaufmann's article demonstrates changes in the Order's membership over time, but it does not provide numerical estimates of the Order's strength at a given point, with that data held instead at the U.K. Data Archive, and accessible only with the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland's consent.<sup>518</sup>

However, given that this thesis focuses on the Order in Scotland from 1910 to 1914, it meets with no such frustrations. Calculating the Order's membership in Scotland from 1910 to 1914 is still not a simple task, though. With a large organisation stretching across the country, it is doubtful that the Order knew its own strength in this period. With no centralised roll of membership, the membership rolls of private lodges are the only reliable source for the membership of any given lodge. However, as in Ulster, these rolls have generally remained in private hands, often lost to carelessness or decay. A small sample only remains accessible under the care of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland.<sup>519</sup>

To attempt to gauge the Scottish Order's membership, then, it is instead necessary to derive it from the membership dues paid to either district lodges

---

<sup>518</sup> Kaufmann, *Orange Order Data*, SN 1007.

<sup>519</sup> These were previously kept in the Order's archive at Olympia House, Glasgow, though the Order is currently relocating having sold that building.

or to the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland during this period.<sup>520</sup> Eric Kaufmann was able to rely on the former in his judicious calculations and it is extremely unfortunate that the district rolls held on micro-fiche seem to have been lost by the Grand Lodge in the years between Kaufmann's study and this thesis.

Kaufmann's calculations regarding Orange Order membership in Scotland over time rely on these district rolls and while his working is sound, the inaccessibility of these rolls raises an issue. Regrettably, the figures in these rolls and Kaufmann's working do not tally with the figures reported by the district lodges to the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland. Nor do the membership rolls of those private lodges held by the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland tally with what is quoted for the district rolls.<sup>521</sup> These discrepancies do not speak to an inaccuracy in Kaufmann's calculations. Rather, it seems that private lodges significantly underreported their membership to avoid paying some of their dues to the district lodge. The district lodges would then repeat the trick and underreport their memberships to the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, syphoning off a portion of the proceeds. In fact, throughout its history, the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland has believed that

---

<sup>520</sup> Dues being the fee paid by a lodge to the district or grand lodge derived from the total membership reported.

<sup>521</sup> Kaufmann, *Orange Order Data*, SN 1007;  
Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report, 1911-1912*;  
Lodge Number 365, *Membership roll book*;  
Female Loyal Orange Lodge Number 7, *Membership roll book*.

local lodges engaged in the systematic underreporting of membership for this purpose.

In his secretary's report of 1909-1910, James Rice opened by decrying the practice, suggesting it was clear 'that lodges in some cases just return some of their members, in order to escape band dues and other levies, which are always fixed at so much per head per members returned.'<sup>522</sup> He complained of the practice again in his 1913-14 report, this time with greater ire, declaring:

Such conduct is contemptible, and unworthy of the name of Orangemen. In fact, the men, or the lodge, who would be so mean as to keep back part of their returns should study the history of Annanias and Sapphira, and should be asked to surrender their warrant.<sup>523</sup>

It is surely significant that in this analogy the Grand Lodge is equated with the early Church; James Rice with Saint Peter; and the Order's membership with Annanias and Sapphira who withheld money from the Church.<sup>524</sup> The previous chapters of this thesis have illustrated the significance of religion within the Order; the invocation of Annanias and Sapphira, then, should not be taken lightly.

---

<sup>522</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report, 1909-1910*, p. 57.

<sup>523</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report of proceedings of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland 1913-1914* (Glasgow, 1914), accessible at the offices of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, Olympia House, Glasgow, p. 61.

<sup>524</sup> *Book of Acts*, 5:1-11.

Given the severity of the Grand Lodge's suspicions, while the fraction of under-reporting at any given point is difficult to estimate, it is likely significant. In the three Scottish lodges whose roll books remain accessible through the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland for the Home Rule period, the under-reporting therein appears to have affected between 20 and 50 percent of members, though the higher figure occurred in a lodge with only 10 members, and so represents only 5 members being withheld.<sup>525</sup> Clearly there is nothing to suggest that the practice remained consistent across the 140-year period taken by Kaufmann. Indeed, it would be remarkable if the prevalence of under-reporting remained consistent under a number of different leaderships and across the varied fortunes of the Order in Scotland over its history. Consequently, one must treat attempts to estimate the Order's membership on the basis of dues paid with a degree of caution.

It would be foolish to dismiss Kaufmann's numbers on the basis of this under-reporting, though. The extensive and detailed work is without a doubt the best estimate which exists for the Order's numbers in Scotland and given the lack of roll books across the Institution, is based on the best evidence available. Kaufmann estimates that there were 11,865 members of the Scottish Order in 1914.<sup>526</sup> While contemporary newspaper reports and Elaine

---

<sup>525</sup> Female Loyal Orange Lodge Number 7, *Membership roll book*, 1910; Lodge Number 365, *roll book*, 1911; Lily of Scotland Female Loyal Orange Lodge, *Membership roll book* (Unpublished) accessible at the offices of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, Olympia House, Glasgow, 1910.

<sup>526</sup> Kaufmann, *Orange Order Data*, SN1007.

McFarland put the figure much higher, with McFarland suggesting it might have been 25,000 at the turn of the century, Kaufmann's estimate seems closer to the mark.<sup>527</sup> Even if we are to assume that it underestimates membership by as much as a third, that still puts the Order's strength in Scotland at between 11,800 and 15,800 in the years of the crisis, or roughly comparable with Belfast.<sup>528</sup> Of this, a substantial proportion were located in Glasgow, and working by the same process, the city's Orange Order may have been as strong as 6,500 members in these years.<sup>529</sup>

But while it is important to be as accurate as is possible regarding the Order's membership in this period, the reality of that membership is so varied that its significance should not be over-emphasised. In demonstrating this, it is useful to turn to the example of The Star of Temple Total Abstainers Loyal Orange Lodge Number 365 which was active throughout the period of the Home Rule crisis. Once a month, usually at around 7pm in the Conservative Hall in Paisley, Lodge Number 365's members would gather for prayer and to carry out the business of the Lodge. Its recorded membership in the years from 1910 to 1914 varied between 36 at its height in 1912/13 and a low of 28 two years later.<sup>530</sup> As was mentioned above, of these, only around two thirds of the membership were declared and paid for.

---

<sup>527</sup> *The Scotsman* (13 July 1914); McFarland, 'The Loyal Orange Institution', p. 120.

<sup>528</sup> It is likely a degree of under-reporting also existed in Belfast, but there is little evidence left of this phenomenon in the Irish Order's records for this period.

<sup>529</sup> Kaufmann, *Orange Order Data*, SN 1007.

<sup>530</sup> Lodge Number 365, *Membership roll book*, 1910-1915.

In the rolls of the Lodge, any attendee was recorded provided that they paid and attended at least one of the monthly meetings each year. In the year 1910/11, of 33 recorded members, 19 members attended less than half of the meetings of the Lodge, though five of these joined in the months from September to December.<sup>531</sup> This poor attendance level continued in 1911/12 where, of 32 members, 11 attended less than half of the meetings.<sup>532</sup> Of the 36 members in 1912/13, 19 attended less than half of the meetings, with four of these joining the Lodge or transferring out midway through the year.<sup>533</sup> In 1913/14, it seems 15 out of 30 attended less than half of the year's meetings.<sup>534</sup> Lastly in 1914/15, of 28 members, 15 members attended less than half of the meetings, of whom three members were marked 'not returned', three members entered into the army, and one member resigning due to ill health.<sup>535</sup>

Taking these figures together over the course of the Home Rule crisis it is clear members' attendance of the Lodge was frequently poor. While there is some ambiguity in these records, with a multitude of inconsistently applied symbols used for non-attendance or non-payment of dues, what they reflect is not necessarily that all lodges had similarly inconsistent attendances, but

---

<sup>531</sup> *Ibid.*, 1910-1911.

<sup>532</sup> *Ibid.*, 1911-1912.

<sup>533</sup> *Ibid.*, 1912-1913.

<sup>534</sup> *Ibid.*, 1913-1914.

<sup>535</sup> *Ibid.*, 1914-15.

rather that care must be taken over the meaning of membership. With a sizeable section of the membership dropping in and out of attendance, overly fixating on a yearly figure may mask considerable variation. Similarly, large numbers of participants (bandsmen etc.) and spectators at Twelfth of July parades are not considered in the membership statistics but are surely a part of Orangeism as it is experienced by outsiders. Extrapolating this further still, a small membership may belie a great influence, as in the case of the Independent Labour Party at this time.<sup>536</sup> All of which is to say that while placing Orange membership at 6,500 in Glasgow during the crisis is a useful marker, quantitative data around participation can mask the reality of Orange participation from 1910 to 1914.

Having outlined the size and nature of Orange membership, then, attention can turn to examine the extent to which the Scottish Order possessed a unique and distinct Scottish identity. This begins by examining the Scottish Order's reaction to the third Home Rule crisis, highlighting the limits of Ulster-Scots solidarity within this supposed unionist vanguard. With this established, it then moves to consider the comparatively disproportionate impact of Presbyterianism and of the Scots legal system on Orangeism in Scotland and reveals the extent to which this differed from the Order in Ireland. Lastly, brief consideration is given to the differing ritual practice of the Order in Glasgow and Belfast, wherein discussion of the complexity of recapturing

---

<sup>536</sup> Deian Hopkin, 'The membership of the Independent Labour Party, 1904-1910: a spatial and occupational analysis', in *International Review of Social History* XX, no. 2 (1975), p.181.

such ritual is discussed. These areas combined contribute to one of the major arguments of this thesis, which is that by the third Home Rule crisis, Scotland possessed a distinct form of Orangeism. This is important because it challenges accounts which relegate Orangeism, and by association sectarianism, as the preserve of Ulster or Irish immigrants. When the Order is portrayed as exclusively an Irish construction, its associated controversies are themselves made into a foreign object, imported into Scotland and tarnishing an otherwise benign and enlightened nation.

### **Orange politics and the Home Rule crisis**

In the previous chapters of this thesis, focus was directed towards the Orange Order in Belfast. There, the shadow the third Home Rule crisis cast was inescapable. Attention now moves to the extent to which it existed in Glasgow from 1910 to 1914. Whether as a consequence of a form of Scottish exceptionalism or a lazy reading of the existing literature on the subject, there is an enduring perception in Scottish civic society that sectarianism is in essence an Irish issue transported to our shores.<sup>537</sup> Indeed, Scotland's longstanding failure to come to terms with our own sectarian history has resulted in considerable recent scholarship on the topic, but despite this, we

---

<sup>537</sup> See for example anti-sectarian charity Nil By Mouth: Nil By Mouth, *History of Sectarianism* (2018), accessible at: <https://nilbymouth.org/history> [Accessed 27 August 2019].

appear no closer to any kind of consensus regarding its continuing existence.<sup>538</sup>

At least part of this popular misdiagnosis of sectarianism as a whole stems from its reduction to the Orange Order alone, and the preponderance of Irish, and particularly Ulster, immigrants therein. As both Elaine McFarland and Eric Kaufmann have demonstrated, Irish immigration did have a significant impact on the Order in Scotland, discussed in greater length in the next chapter. While McFarland concedes it is difficult to provide figures for the impact of Irish immigration upon the Order in Scotland, she does conclude it was 'a vital process in providing a future constituency' for Orangeism.<sup>539</sup> Kaufmann, taking a broader view of the Institution in Scotland, has convincingly argued that the proportion of Orange Order membership in Scottish counties tends to be in line with high Irish Protestant immigration. In particular, a high Roman Catholic population consistently spurred high Order membership across place and time.<sup>540</sup> The work of both these scholars confirms the significant role of immigrants in shaping the Order in Scotland, but this thesis seeks to refine their argument by stressing the distinctiveness

---

<sup>538</sup> T.M. Devine (ed.), *Scotland's shame? Bigotry and sectarianism in modern Scotland* (Edinburgh, 2000); D.M. Wright, Michael Rosato, Gillian Raab, Chris Dibben, Paul Boyle, Dermot O'Reilly, 'Does equality legislation reduce intergroup differences? Religious affiliation, socio-economic status and morality in Scotland and Northern Ireland: a cohort study of 400,000 people', in *Health and Place* XLV (2017), pp 32-38. For recent sectarian violence in Glasgow see for example: *Daily Record* (1 September 2019).

<sup>539</sup> McFarland, *Protestants first*, p. 106.

<sup>540</sup> Kaufmann, 'The dynamics of Orangeism', p. 279.

of the Scottish Order's identity. Indeed, it is only through Scottish Orangeism's distinctions to the Irish Order that it is possible to understand the relatively muted response of Scotland to the third Home Rule crisis. This is not to suggest bonds of kin and kith between Orange Order members in Glasgow and Belfast were entirely superficial, though. To take one example, in December of 1913 the Scottish Order had raised £500 for the Ulster Unionist Council, a tenth of the cost of building their new headquarters in Glasgow.<sup>541</sup>

The headquarters in question were erected in May of 1914 at a cost of around £5000. The building, which remains standing on the corner of Cathedral and North Frederick Street, is five storeys with an additional tower, and formerly boasted a balcony with 'a sculptured representation of William, Prince of Orange', since removed.<sup>542</sup> It was the product of various fundraising efforts by the Order, including a now famous friendly between Partick Thistle Football Club and Rangers.<sup>543</sup> It is interesting to note, though, that it was Partick Thistle who were first recruited to play in the fundraiser, with Rangers only secured as the opposing team later on.<sup>544</sup>

---

<sup>541</sup> *The Scotsman* (30 December 1913).

<sup>542</sup> *The Scotsman* (11 May 1914).

<sup>543</sup> McCracken, *Bygone days of yore*, p. 33;

See also: Booker Jr., 'Orange Alba', pp 110-186.

<sup>544</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Monthly reports*, 4 October 1914.

At its opening, a well-attended ceremony was addressed by the Grand Master of the Scottish Order, the Rev. David Ness, who gave a speech which included a warning against Home Rule, declaring that 'Ulster would fight and Ulster would be right'.<sup>545</sup> The same sentiment was expressed endlessly at Orange events in Scotland throughout the crisis, as articles in the Orange column of the *Belfast Weekly News* from the crisis demonstrate.<sup>546</sup> Prior to the General Election of January 1910, the Grand Lodge urged their members to support unionist candidates to preserve the interests of the empire. Such candidates included liberal unionists, who were strong in west of Scotland, prior to 1912. Again, the message from Orangemen in the *Belfast Weekly News* was clear enough:

While strictly speaking, the Orangemen belong to none of the great parties in the state, yet, having votes, it is our duty to use these votes to the best advantage in the interest of Protestantism (for which we primarily stand) and in the interest of the great British Empire of which we are so justly proud.<sup>547</sup>

Throughout these years the Scottish Order's leadership walked a tightrope, balancing their support for, and association with, the Conservative and Unionist Party and the realities of Scottish politics, which was dominated by the Liberal Party. The Order's manifesto for that election continued by invoking an Orangeman's duty to vote to defend Protestantism and the union even if "we be temperance reformers (and very many of us are), whether we be Tariff Reformers or Free Traders, whether we believe in "ending" or

---

<sup>545</sup> *The Scotsman* (11 May 1914).

<sup>546</sup> See for example: *Belfast Weekly News* (5 October 1911).

<sup>547</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (13 January 1910).

“mending” the House of Lords – all these things can be fought out later.”<sup>548</sup>

The prospect of a Liberal victory was clearly worrying, bringing as it did the prospect of Home Rule for Ireland. This filtered down to the local level, and in Lodge Number 365 on 3 September 1910, one brother was summoned to defend himself against the charges of supporting the election of a Liberal ‘Home Ruler’, and of suggesting that the maintenance of the King James Bible in schools was offensive to Catholics.<sup>549</sup> While on this occasion the brother in question presented a satisfactory defence, it highlights the anxiety of the Orange Order in Glasgow regarding their membership’s loyalty over Home Rule.

Beyond support for the Conservative and Unionist Party, the Grand Lodge of Scotland regularly visited Ulster along with lay members of the Institution for Twelfth of July celebrations throughout the crisis.<sup>550</sup> When Sir Edward Carson spoke in Glasgow at the ‘monster unionist rally’, he suggested that ‘the manhood of Belfast is still being strengthened by recruits from Glasgow, and there is a bond of kinship between the two cities which has before exercised a notable influence on the course of British politics.’<sup>551</sup> That manhood self-evidently included the Orange Order in the city. Additionally, it was calculated that up to 102,000 people in the West of Scotland signed the

---

<sup>548</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>549</sup> *Lodge Number 365, Minutebook*, 3 September 1910.

<sup>550</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Monthly reports*, 1 August 1914.

<sup>551</sup> *The Times* (13 June 1913).

British Covenant in Support of Ulster, though Alvin Jackson has highlighted many were sceptical of it.<sup>552</sup>

Indeed, it seems that many within the Orange Order in Glasgow, and Scotland more widely proved unsympathetic to Carson and Ulster's call. The most direct scholarly treatment of Scotland's reaction to the Home Rule crisis is Peter Dunn's article "Own flesh and blood'? Ulster unionism, Scotland and Home Rule, 1886-1914'.<sup>553</sup> Dunn's central premise is that despite significant activity from those in Ulster, Liberal Party hegemony in Scotland prevented more than aesthetic appeals to 'kin and kith'.<sup>554</sup> Similarly, Graham Walker has highlighted how popular association of the Unionist campaign with the Orange Order prevented the wider engagement of Scots.<sup>555</sup> As Walker has also argued, though, this association worked in both directions and perhaps served to make closer allies of the Orange Order and the Conservative Party in Scotland than might otherwise have been the case. This, despite the fact that post-merger the Conservative and Unionist Party represented 'to a significant extent a liberal Unionist Party'.<sup>556</sup>

---

<sup>552</sup> Alvin Jackson, *The two unions: Ireland, Scotland, and the survival of the United Kingdom* (Oxford, 2012), p. 222.

<sup>553</sup> Peter Dunn, "Own flesh and blood'? Ulster unionism, Scotland and home rule, 1886-1914', in *Irish Historical Studies* XXXVII, no. 146 (November, 2010), pp 203-220.

<sup>554</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 218.

<sup>555</sup> Walker, 'The Irish Presbyterian Anti-Home Rule Convention', p. 73.

<sup>556</sup> Graham Walker, *Intimate strangers: political and cultural interaction between Scotland and Ulster in modern times* (Edinburgh, 1995), p. 32.

The Liberal Party enjoyed a dominant electoral position in Scotland throughout the years of the third Home Rule crisis, Scotland's 'Liberal hegemony', as it has been termed.<sup>557</sup> It is as a consequence of this that Ewen Cameron has argued that even though 'Bonar Law, by now leader of the Unionist party, took up the cause of the land of his forbears with vehemence, the Ulster question was not an important factor in Scottish politics.'<sup>558</sup> As evidence for this, Cameron cites the poor attendance at Carson's address of the monster rally mentioned earlier, where fewer than 10,000 people came to hear him speak - around a tenth of those in attendance at the Liverpool event.<sup>559</sup>

The Glasgow rally was carried out under the auspices of the Unionist Party, but included a procession of Orange lodges. The Order did not feature heavily in the event's publicity, but such involvement was typical of the relationship between the Institution and Conservative and Unionist Party in Scotland.<sup>560</sup> Such political activity relating to Home Rule as the Orange Order did engage in, though, appears to have been concentrated in public demonstrations. On marches throughout 1912 to 1914 the topic of Home Rule was central to many speeches, with declarations condemning the Liberal administration a common occurrence.<sup>561</sup> However, looking in more

---

<sup>557</sup> For further details see: I.G.C. Hutchinson, *A political history of Scotland, 1832-1924* (Edinburgh, 1986).

<sup>558</sup> E.A. Cameron, *Impaled upon a thistle: Scotland since 1880* (Edinburgh, 2010), p. 99.

<sup>559</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>560</sup> See chapter six.

<sup>561</sup> See for example: *The Times* (1 October 1912) and *The Scotsman* (14 July 1913).

depth at these occasions, Home Rule was rarely the sole purpose for the gathering. More often it was simply attached to an annual commemoration of the Battle of the Boyne, or some smaller local event. There, the fare on offer and the behaviour of Orangemen appears to have been little affected by the climate of the third Home Rule crisis.

To take one example, *The Scotsman's* coverage of the 1914 commemoration of the Battle of the Boyne reported that 20,000 Orangemen including 8,000 from Glasgow and '37 pipe, flute, and brass bands' attended the demonstration at Blantyre.<sup>562</sup> Speeches covered a variety of topics, though Home Rule dominated the agenda. The reporting also mentions that a 'slight disturbance' took place, at which four spectators were arrested.<sup>563</sup> From this report one might assume that Home Rule had changed the order of business during the crisis. However, Twelfth of July parades from before the crisis followed much the same pattern. In 1908 *The Scotsman* gave a near identical report of a Twelfth demonstration by Orangemen from Lanarkshire and West Lothian which 14,000 people attended, with speeches on the empire and motions passed by acclamation. In truth, while Home Rule might have dominated the agenda of demonstrations during the crisis, in fact it did not substantially alter their form or function.<sup>564</sup>

---

<sup>562</sup> As was covered in the introduction to this chapter, this figure was likely a considerable exaggeration. *The Scotsman* (13 July 1914).

<sup>563</sup> *The Scotsman* (13 July 1914).

<sup>564</sup> *The Scotsman* (13 July 1908).

Despite this, popular scholarship including W.S. Marshall's *'The Billy Boys': a concise history of Orangeism in Scotland*, argues that Glasgow produced a disproportionate number of volunteers for the Ulster Volunteer Force.

Marshall even credits Scotland with a significant role in the 'elaborate gun-running operation' of the U.V.F. during the crisis.<sup>565</sup> This is mistaken, though.

Of Orange involvement in the Scottish U.V.F., contemporary newspapers were unsurprisingly eager to sensationalise the 'athletics clubs' under which Orangemen and other Scottish loyalists came to drill during the Home Rule crisis.<sup>566</sup> By 1914 *The Scotsman* reported that 500 men were drilling under the watchful eye of a 'Captain Webb', and in their 'first combined drill, the men made a creditable appearance, walking in column and quarter and taking part in skirmishing exercise.'<sup>567</sup> But this reporting should not be taken at face value, and more recently, convincing scholarship has suggested that 'despite the close ties between Ulster and Scotland, the Orange Order could raise only seven U.V.F. units, totalling no more than 1,000 men.'<sup>568</sup> If this is accurate, taking Kaufmann's low estimate of the Order's strength, and even assuming that the U.V.F. was entirely populated by the Order, it would suggest that only around one in ten members of the Orange Order

---

<sup>565</sup> Marshall, *'The Billy Boys'*, pp 100-101.

<sup>566</sup> *Glasgow Herald* (30 March 1914).

<sup>567</sup> *The Scotsman* (18 May 1914).

<sup>568</sup> Steve Bruce, Tony Glennding, Ian Paterson and Michael Rosie, *Sectarianism in Scotland* (Edinburgh, 2004), p. 37.

volunteered in Scotland. Even accounting for the number excluded by age or other circumstances, this surely highlights something of a lack of enthusiasm among Orangemen. By contrast, around a quarter of Scotland's Orangemen actually enlisted in the armed services, two years later.<sup>569</sup> In seeking to further understand why Orangemen in Scotland were reluctant to rally to the call of Ulster, then, it is useful to again look at the reports of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland.

When the idea of athletic clubs was first raised in December of 1912, the Grand Lodge raised concerns about the appropriateness of the Order demanding its members participate, but:

after discussion, on the motion of Bro. Dr McFarlane it was resolved to write an order from Grand Lodge, to every District intimating that an opportunity to drill should be given to such members as wanted to learn. But that it be not compulsory on individual members to learn to drill but that it be compulsory for District to arrange facilities for those of their members who were willing to learn.<sup>570</sup>

In its reluctance to compel members to drill, we see the disjuncture between the Irish identity of the Orange Order in Scotland, as brothers in arms to their Irish counterparts, and the material reality of preparing to enter a civil war to assist them. Symptomatic of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland's inability to exert authority over the membership of the Order, protest was quickly put up by the district lodges of Scotland against orders to facilitate drilling, with Number 46 District, Maryhill, 'stating that they would take nothing to do with

---

<sup>569</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report, 1914-5*, p. 94.

<sup>570</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Monthly reports*, 2 December 1912.

Athletic Clubs unless Grand Lodge paid the expenses.<sup>571</sup> What is clear, then, is that appeals to the Scottish Order's Irish roots had limits.

Graham Walker suggests in his article 'The Orange Order in Scotland between the Wars' that the 'cultural bonds between Scotland and Ulster were constantly affirmed and celebrated in Orange rhetoric and oratory' and this statement holds true during the period of the Home Rule crisis.<sup>572</sup> But, it is nonetheless surprising that the Orange Order in Scotland were either unwilling or unable to better lead an anti-Home Rule campaign. That at best one in ten members of the Order volunteered for the Scottish division of the U.V.F. also suggests limited engagement. If, as scholars following McFarland hold, the Scottish Order was successful and sustained on the strength of Irish immigration and familial links across the Irish Sea, then it is also true to say that these Irish roots were not strong enough to grow a militant opposition to Home Rule in Scotland. While, as Walker argues, the bonds between Scottish and Irish Orangemen were regularly celebrated in rhetoric and oratory, it seems clear also that there were significant distinctions between the Order in Scotland and Ireland.

---

<sup>571</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Monthly reports*, 1 February 1913.

<sup>572</sup> Walker, 'The Orange Order in Scotland between the Wars', p. 179.

## Presbyterianism and Scots law

If, as has been argued above, there were limits on the influence of the Ulster-Scots or Irish identity in the Scottish Order such that mobilisation against Home Rule was limited, the next step is to examine other ways in which the Scottish Order differed from its Irish counterpart. Graham Walker has argued that appealing to Presbyterianism was an essential facet of the Ulster-Scots identity, and this was truer still of the Orange Order in Scotland.<sup>573</sup>

Looking back to 1879, the Grand Master of the time Chalmers Izett Paton illustrated well the theology of the Orange Institution in Scotland in a pamphlet on the principles of Protestantism:

[Protestantism is] pure Scriptural Christianity... the very religion brought by our Lord Jesus Christ and by his apostles... the Bible alone is the Protestant rule of faith from which nothing can be taken away and nothing added. Absolute and supreme authority belongs to the Bible because it is the Word of God. The whole Word of God is contained in the Scriptures... which are the very word of God and nothing else and we have no other revelation of the Truth or the Word of God.<sup>574</sup>

Paton's words provide an insight into a deeply evangelical and fundamentalist Protestantism. Biblical literalism abounds and as will be demonstrated, a near exclusively Presbyterian ethos distinguishes the Scottish Order from its Irish, and more Anglican, counterpart. Considering

---

<sup>573</sup> Graham Walker, *A history of the Ulster Unionist Party: protest, pragmatism and pessimism* (Manchester, 2004), p.32.

<sup>574</sup> C.I. Paton, *Catechism of the principles of Protestantism* (1879), pp 1-2. [Quoted in McFarland, 'The Loyal Orange Institution', p. 7.]

Paton's writing, Elaine McFarland in her PhD thesis suggested that the Scottish Order's theology was a 'combination of both Lutheran and Calvinist strains'.<sup>575</sup> While her precise diagnosis is open to debate, it illustrates a degree of distinctiveness from the Order in Ireland. These differences expressed themselves in a variety of ways including in how meetings were conducted. Where the Grand Lodge of Ireland was dominated by its central committee, whose motions were almost always passed unanimously; debate, dissent and the defeat of the motions brought by office-bearers in Scotland was far more common.<sup>576</sup>

One such dispute between the wider membership of the Grand Lodge, between 150 and 250 members at any given point, and its executive officers during the third Home Rule crisis occurred on the issue of its size. The Grand Lodge was composed of elected delegates from each of Scotland's district lodges, themselves comprised of officials from local lodges. In 1910, the executive officers of the Grand Lodge sought to reduce the number of delegates, with the motion seconded by the Grand Secretary, James Rice. It sought to reduce their numbers by around one half, a fairly drastic cull in the level of representation offered to the Order's lay membership. Despite the official backing this motion received from the executive, though, the membership of the Grand Lodge appears to have been reluctant to sacrifice

---

<sup>575</sup> McFarland, 'The Loyal Orange Institution', p. 7.

<sup>576</sup> See for example Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report, June 1910*, pp 11-17.

themselves in the name of efficiency. They rejected the motion by a large majority.<sup>577</sup>

One must be careful about the extent to which this represented a gallant defence of lay democracy, though, as another motion seeking to make delegations from district lodges proportionate to their membership was also defeated.<sup>578</sup> Indeed, it seems self-interest had as much to do with the Grand Lodge's voting habits as any egalitarian spirit. In another example, its members were left unconvinced by a motion suggesting the Grand Lodge's lunch should be discontinued and the proceeds put toward the relief of brethren who were out of employment.<sup>579</sup> If such votes do not demonstrate a wholly democratic or egalitarian character, their reception does at least show the willingness and ability of the Grand Lodge's membership to defy the wishes or expectations of their executive officers, in stark contrast to the Grand Lodge of Ireland.

In another example, at the monthly meeting of the executive committee of the Scottish Grand Lodge in March of 1914, Bathgate Loyal Orange Lodge Number 224 had written asking whether they were entitled to admit a deaf man to membership of the Order. After some debate the executive committee made up of 26 senior Orangemen were divided equally on the

---

<sup>577</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report 1909-1910*, p. 13.

<sup>578</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>579</sup> *Ibid.*

issue, with the casting vote of the Grand Master eventually denying the man membership.<sup>580</sup> While one is left to speculate on why the Order was unwilling to admit a deaf man, again a clear culture of debate and disagreement, even among the executive of Scotland's Grand Lodge is present. This discrepancy in organisational cultures between the Scottish and Irish Orders was likely influenced by two factors. The first is a level of socio-economic similarity across the Order's membership in Scotland which was in contrast with a level of class distinction present in Ireland.<sup>581</sup> As was discussed in the first chapter of this thesis, in Belfast a culture of deference ensured the dominance of the Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland's officers.<sup>582</sup> The second factor is the influence of Presbyterianism. Fundamentally, the lay character and hegemony of the Presbytery in Scotland cross-fertilised Orange organisational culture in a way not seen in Ireland. Peter Dunn has discussed this in relation to Scotland and Home Rule, but the influence of Presbyterianism on the Order in Scotland is perhaps subtler.<sup>583</sup>

To take another example of the differences between the Order in Glasgow and Belfast, at the elections for Loyal Orange Lodge Number 304 in Glasgow, a Brother Pearson announced his credentials for election. He stressed that 'it was their aim and objective to overcome Romanism. In Scotland there was an attempt to introduce a fearful amount of ritual in the

---

<sup>580</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Monthly reports*, 7 March 1914.

<sup>581</sup> McFarland, *Protestants first*, p. 54.

<sup>582</sup> See chapter six for more on class composition in Scotland and Glasgow.

<sup>583</sup> Dunn, 'Own flesh and blood?', p. 214.

Episcopal Church. Candles were put on the altar and crosses were set up, which were highly offensive to the brotherhood, and he petitioned and stood by the brethren to have those things removed, which was eventually done.<sup>584</sup> This hostility towards a kind of high Anglicanism (as it was seen) within the Order might seem surprising for an organisation which prides itself on its pan-Protestant credentials, but it chimes with the hostility displayed towards High Anglicanism and ritualism within the Church of England during the nineteenth century.<sup>585</sup> It highlights the seriousness of the Presbyterian or low church attitudes of Order members in Glasgow at this time. This religious commitment existed throughout the Scottish Order, though, where even into the First World War the Grand Lodge was attempting to engage its members in attending Sabbath evening services.<sup>586</sup> Similarly, it is surely significant that the Scottish Order's opposition to the supposed alteration of the King's Declaration in 1910 was voiced without a single mention of Ireland, or of an effort to placate rebels therein.<sup>587</sup> The 230 delegates to that year's Grand Lodge passed a motion on the subject, celebrating William III and calling on the Catholic Church 'first to withdraw, and having on her part obliterated everything which might give offense to Protestants', after which point they might consider an alteration to the declaration acceptable.<sup>588</sup>

---

<sup>584</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (24 March 1910).

<sup>585</sup> See: Nigel Yates, *Anglican ritualism in Victorian Britain, 1830-1910* (Oxford, 1999), pp. 150-212.

<sup>586</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Monthly reports*, 3 October 1914.

<sup>587</sup> *The Scotsman* (22 June 1910).

<sup>588</sup> *Ibid.*

Unlike in Ireland where there was a reasonable prospect of increasing nationalist, and thus Catholic, influence over the nature of the state, no such threat existed in Scotland. Despite a substantial Protestant majority in the country, there was nonetheless a clear belief in the malign power of the Catholic Church. The Order in Scotland looked not to Ireland and the amassing of support for Home Rule as the threat to Protestant supremacy, but instead retained a kind of mythologised memory of Catholic rule dating back to the Restoration, though Orange histories remain vague on the specifics of that period. The threat to the King's Declaration had only a limited relationship to the rebels in Ireland, but rather demonstrated the continuing power of the Church of Rome.

The Order's distinct character in Scotland is further demonstrated by the language of its disciplinary process. Rather than relying on English law for its basis, the rules of the Order in Scotland contained considerable traces of Scots law. Notably, the possible verdicts of 'proven', 'not proven', 'proven only in certain particulars' and 'proven only to an extent', speak to a Scots legal lexicon where 'not proven' holds a unique place.<sup>589</sup> It is interesting to note that decades later Scottish legal distinctiveness went on to become a basis of support for Scottish independence for many intellectuals.<sup>590</sup> Beyond

---

<sup>589</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Laws and constitutions*, p. 32;

S.A. Bennett, 'Not proven: the verdict', in *Scots Law Times* XII (2002), pp 97-98.

<sup>590</sup> Ben Jackson, *The case for Scottish independence: a history of nationalist political thought in modern Scotland* (Cambridge, 2020), p. 37. Jackson argues few legal theorists, with the exception of Andrew Dewar Gibb, were themselves in favour of independence but rather that their work became used by supporters of independence.

this though, the distinction in the Order's disciplinary procedures is important because it demonstrates that the cultural differences between the organisations did have significant practical effects. The Scottish Order's disciplinary process, unique as it was, was far from lenient, and was certainly hierarchical. In fact, one of the most common cases of appeal brought to the Grand Lodge was on the charge of insubordination. In the case of brethren Hugh M. Ferguson and Robert Pyper, both were expelled from the Order. Whatever the nature of their original crime, their raucous conduct in a Grand Lodge appeal itself fell afoul of the same charge of insubordination. As a result, their appeal was dismissed unanimously.<sup>591</sup> This case was emblematic of a great many others where the Grand Lodge appears to have taken a dim view of anyone brought up on the charge of insubordination, but no case was quite so drastic as the expulsion of the entire district lodge of Irvine.

Originating in a dispute about the non-payment of dues, in 1911 Irvine District Lodge so displeased the Grand Lodge of Scotland that the entire district was expelled by a vote, again on the grounds of insubordination. The minutes record that this was only after the Grand Lodge's 'lenient' treatment of the district for some months, but in voting to expel many hundreds of members, the Grand Lodge demonstrated a remarkable level of authoritarianism, deeply at odds with any supposed democratic rationale.<sup>592</sup>

---

<sup>591</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report 1911-1912*, p. 14.

<sup>592</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 18.

It further demanded that all its property, namely any Orange materials in the possession of any lodge in the Irvine District, be seized and returned to the Grand Lodge.<sup>593</sup> The scale of this decision should not be underestimated, but it appears that when the Grand Lodge was confronted with a potential rupture in the organisation, it reacted in draconian fashion. A similar incident even occurred with another district in Maryhill, though on that occasion the dispute was resolved amicably.<sup>594</sup> Likewise, when asked at a monthly meeting of the Grand Lodge's executive what the response of Greenock District should be to those lodges who refused to pay an increase in Grand Lodge dues, 'the district officials were instructed by unanimous vote to collect the warrants, and return them to the Grand Lodge if the members refused to pay'.<sup>595</sup>

While such responses appear to contradict an organisational culture influenced by Presbyterian conceptions of disagreement and dissent, this is not the same as suggesting that members were free to do as willed. It is important to note that the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland was still a relatively new formation in the years of the Home Rule crisis, having existed for just over a generation following the 1876 merger. Indeed, perhaps it considered its authority tenuous enough that such organised defiance from Irvine District Lodge, alongside insubordination from lay members, could not

---

<sup>593</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>594</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Monthly reports*, 14 June 1913.

<sup>595</sup> *Ibid.*, 5 July 1913.

be tolerated. These fears were likely exacerbated by the disastrous impact that such conflict had had on the Scottish Order's development in the malaise after the 1835 Enquiry and by the recent and costly split in Ireland between the Orange Order and the Independent Orange Order.<sup>596</sup>

In one sense, the distinction between the Presbyterian or democratic impulses of the Order in Scotland and its authoritarian disciplinary procedures might appear a juxtaposition, but, as Elaine McFarland acutely observed:

[O]ne should note the more basic potential for disjuncture between Orangeism's structure and ideology. If, for example, in any particular period Orangeism had organisationally assumed a markedly hierarchical and authoritarian form, this is no reason to rule out a priori the existence of an ideology capable even of a measure of militant populism.<sup>597</sup>

Understanding this apparent, though resolvable, inconsistency of position is important in understanding the character of the Orange Order, and again speaks to the multivalence of the Orangeism as a wider phenomenon. It appears that when the Grand Lodge felt genuinely threatened, as it did by Irvine District Lodge, it was capable of drastic action. Perhaps as a result of this, the independence which private lodges coveted was retained through careful balance. Treading carefully, it was occasionally necessary to comply

---

<sup>596</sup> Marshall, *The Billy Boys*, pp 46-49; Patterson, *Class conflict and sectarianism*, p. 58.

<sup>597</sup> McFarland, *Protestants first*, p. 13.

with or to refuse the orders of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland as the situation demanded to ensure that such independence was preserved.

One such negotiation took place in October of 1912, where several private lodges attempted to form a new district. This district would have afforded the lodges more autonomy and influence within the Grand Lodge, but in order for it to be formed, the Grand Lodge demanded the roll books and minutes of the private lodges. These lodges refused to hand over their minutes for inspection, perhaps because of an under-reporting of membership, and in so doing exercised their right to function independently of Grand Lodge supervision.<sup>598</sup> As a result, their request was turned down, but they retained their right to privacy from Grand Lodge inspection, demonstrating well the tension between private lodges right to dissent and the occasionally authoritarian impulses of Scotland's Grand Lodge.

To examine how these dynamics played out inside private lodges, it is useful to return to the Star of Temple Total Abstainers, Loyal Orange Lodge Number 365, of Partick. Those members who attended that lodge could expect a regular agenda. Meetings would begin with a welcome, prayer and a scripture reading. With the minutes of the previous meeting then being ratified, any new initiates were proposed and admitted before attention turned to motions. After these were debated and voted upon, roll was called

---

<sup>598</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Monthly reports*, 5 October 1912.

and dues taken, before a closing prayer was said. At this point the official lodge meeting was closed, and frequently, social events were held afterwards.<sup>599</sup>

The motions which Lodge Number 365 discussed varied in importance across the years of the third Home Rule crisis. One which attracted particular attention, though, was on the subject of whether chewing tobacco would be allowed in the lodge hall, which was eventually passed as 'long as they used the spittoons'.<sup>600</sup> By way of contrast, one of the significant motions to the members of Lodge Number 365 regarded the renaming of the Lodge and the resultant changing of its position on 'total abstinence'. The prevalence and importance of temperance to the Order was discussed in the first chapter of this thesis, but here on 1 June 1912, there was a concerted effort by some members of Lodge Number 365 to remove the principle of abstinence from the Lodge's name and ordinances.<sup>601</sup> The campaign was eventually successful and on the 9 March 1914, the name of the Lodge was changed from the 'Star of Temple Total Abstainers' to simply the 'Star of Temple'.<sup>602</sup> But beyond debates around temperance, this move is more usefully considered as evidence of the democratic nature of private lodges. Even though the motion was opposed by the Grand Master of the Lodge, the name and very function of it came to be changed on the basis of a vote. Speaking

---

<sup>599</sup> Lodge Number 365, *Minutebook*, passim.

<sup>600</sup> *Ibid.*, 3 February 1912.

<sup>601</sup> *Ibid.*, 1 June 1912.

<sup>602</sup> *Ibid.*, 9 March 1914.

to the democratic impulses in the Order's character, once again it seems that frequently derided aspects of the Order's self-conception – democracy and religious devotion – did find expression within the federated structures of the Institution.

### **Ritual practice**

The last section of the chapter examines the distinctions in ritual between the Orange Order in Scotland and Ireland. Where in Irish Orangeism the Royal Arch Purple exists as a separate organisation, though one closely aligned with the Orange Order, in Scotland it forms the Orange Institution's second degree. Orangemen may attain membership of this degree after three months membership of the Order.<sup>603</sup> Before becoming part of the Royal Arch Purple, certain activities and rituals are denied to members of the Order. Once initiated, Orangemen have full access to all aspects of the Loyal Orange Institution in Scotland.

The distinction between the two degrees is important because the rituals involved in passing into the Royal Arch Purple are those often labelled as 'Orange'. In Scotland, but not in Ireland, it is reasonable to describe such

---

<sup>603</sup> Webster, *The religion of Orange politics*, p. 109.

rituals as Orange. In his recent book on the subject, the anthropologist Joseph Webster detailed these rituals with regard to the Scottish Order.<sup>604</sup> Webster took his information from a work published in Ireland by W.P. Malcolmsen in 1999.<sup>605</sup> Malcolmsen is a disaffected former member and evangelical who believes the Royal Arch Purple in Ireland is becoming increasingly sacrilegious.<sup>606</sup> Where possible, Webster confirms that such rituals are identical in Scotland with Scottish Orangemen, though because of the secret nature of the Institution, these members will not divulge explicitly the contents of such material. From Malcolmsen, Webster outlines a series of rituals closely resembling many associated with freemasonry.<sup>607</sup> Indeed, these are the same rituals highlighted by Buckley in chapter four. At the initiation ceremony into the Royal Arch Purple, for example, one is blindfolded, has a shoe removed and exposes one's chest, a practice Malcolmsen describes as both 'heathen' and 'pagan' in his account.<sup>608</sup> Other trials and tribulations follow this but will not be discussed at greater length in this thesis because Malcolmsen's original claims, and Webster's translation of them into the Order in Scotland, remain contested. The former's status as a discontented ex-member and the language he uses is far from objective, making it challenging to separate fact from hyperbole. Additionally, various members of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland have condemned

---

<sup>604</sup> Webster, *The religion of Orange politics*.

<sup>605</sup> W.P. Malcolmsen, *Behind closed doors: the hidden structure within the Orange camp [the Royal Arch Purple Order] examined from an evangelical perspective* (Banbridge, 1999).

<sup>606</sup> Malcolmsen, *Behind closed doors*, p. 124.

<sup>607</sup> A.E. Waite, *A new encyclopaedia of freemasonry* (New York, 1994), p. 155.

<sup>608</sup> Malcolmsen, *Behind closed doors*, p. 38.

Webster's recent work, and the fact remains that these rituals are not recorded in paper form by the Orange Order.

While the Royal Arch Purple has been the second degree of Scottish Orangeism since 1902, because these rituals are learned by heart and passed on from member to member, no sources exist to verify the nature of these rituals in a historical context.<sup>609</sup> Thus there is limited use in conducting the level of textual analysis present elsewhere in this thesis with reference to these practices because it would rely on the assumption that they have remained essentially unchanged in the oral tradition for over a century. Instead, it seems better to acknowledge that there were, and remain, secret ceremonies involved in Scottish Orange practice, likely drawing inspiration from freemasonry and Irish Orangeism, but the performance of which occurred under distinct conditions from the Orange Order in Ireland.<sup>610</sup>

Beyond the differing position of the Royal Arch Purple within Scotland and Ireland, the secret rituals associated with the Orange Order afforded it a level of glamour important to the Institution's endurance. The written *Ritual of Introduction* to the Scottish Order for the period of the third Home Rule crisis details that each officer position within an Orange lodge was associated with its own symbol. For the worshipful master of a private lodge in Glasgow this

---

<sup>609</sup> Malcolmson, *Behind closed doors*, p. 20.

<sup>610</sup> D.A. Roberts, 'The Orange Order in Ireland: a religious Institution?' in *The British Journal of Sociology* XXII, no. 2 (1971), p. 272.

was an equilateral triangle, 'the three sides of which represent Order, Truth and Love; within the triangle is an open bible, and above it an inscription, the words of which are KING AND CONSTITUTION.'<sup>611</sup> More direct, the chief marshal of a private lodge's symbol was a crossed sword and baton.<sup>612</sup> These symbols had a similar effect to that of ritual in the Order more generally by endowing these offices with a degree of mystique. Members were expected to wear their regalia, and officers the badges which possessed these symbols, at all meetings, which contributed to a level of pageantry.<sup>613</sup> Indeed, the Home Rule crisis played witness to an escalation of such ceremony, as was recorded in the 1914 report of the Grand Lodge: 'The Chair was occupied by the M.W.G.M. Bro. Ness, M.A., who was conducted from his retiring room to the platform in the new and approved manner, escorted by Marshals and Stewards bearing wands, and by Sword-bearers, in solemn procession.'<sup>614</sup> Brother David Ness, a minister with a small church in Glasgow, was clearly in no danger of attack at the Grand Lodge's biannual meeting, but the symbolic procession perhaps speaks to the martial roots of the Order. Likewise, it was during the summer of 1913 that the Grand Lodge received a letter from the Chief Constable of Linlithgowshire asking the Lodge to prevent Orangemen carrying swords on parade. Reluctant to deprive Orangemen of any of the pomp and circumstance associated with Twelfth of July, the Grand Secretary replied that it was too late to

---

<sup>611</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Ritual of introduction*, p. 23.

<sup>612</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 30.

<sup>613</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Laws and constitutions*, p. 15.

<sup>614</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report 1913-1914*, p. 15.

communicate this message to their members, and 'that at any rate the swords were carried not for use but as an emblem of the Order.'<sup>615</sup> As with secret ritual, the martial accoutrements of the Orange Order helped to construct a culture within Orangeism which was appealing to members, helping to define the edges of their community and ensure engagement.

If a man wished to be admitted to the Scottish Order during the Home Rule crisis, he required first to find two sponsors in a lodge who would vouch for him. Much as with the Order in Ireland, at a ritual of introduction he would be presented to the worshipful master of the lodge, questioned on his faith and commitment to the principles of liberty and constitutional monarchy, and would then be sworn in on a bible by the lodge's chaplain. Here much of the ceremony would be identical to the theological content outlined in Belfast in chapter four of this thesis. The ceremony suggests once again, though, that the Order's anti-Catholicism had private and devout theological roots, in contradiction of the arguments of many scholars including Joan Smith who have argued it was driven by craft exclusion.<sup>616</sup> Rather, private ritual and religiosity was a necessary glue for members of the Order which legitimised, in their own eyes, their behaviour. Once initiated into the Orange Order, many members would go on to serve as officers; while some like the worshipful master and the treasurer might serve functions common to most

---

<sup>615</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Monthly report*, 5 July 1913.

<sup>616</sup> Joan Smith, 'Class, skill and sectarianism in Glasgow and Liverpool, 1880-1914, in R.J. Morris, (ed.), *Class, power and social structure in British nineteenth-century towns* (Leicester, 1986), pp 158-215.

other associations in the Edwardian era, other roles were less conventional. In examining the officers of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, for instance, one is struck by the often inverse relationship between title and duties. For example, the only role of the grand heralds of the Grand Orange Lodge appears to have been to 'sound the trumpets' at the beginning of a meeting.<sup>617</sup> Likewise, grand stewards were expected to attend all ceremonies with their 'wands of office', the grand organist was to perform music for the Order, and the grand regaliaist was expected to maintain and repair the banners and regalia of Scotland's Grand Lodge.<sup>618</sup> Indeed the longer the title the less work it appears was expected, and much of such ritual remained distinct from that of the Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland. Clearly, though, such offices served to instil in members a feeling of importance and value within the Institution.

With ceremonies draped in allegory and religious significance, Orange traditions were endowed with an identity forging power. Indeed, the effects of such traditions were well known, and in August of 1910, Blantyre Bluebell Lodge resolved to simply add new rituals to the Lodge's standing selection, quite literally inventing their own traditions.<sup>619</sup> While details on these rituals were not recorded in the minutes, the decision to consciously add to existing rituals surely suggests an awareness of their power and effectiveness in this

---

<sup>617</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Laws and constitutions*, p. 26.

<sup>618</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>619</sup> Female Loyal Orange Lodge Number 7, *Minutebook*, 31 August 1910.

period. As in Belfast, such practice also created a market for Orange regalia, with advertisements in the Coatbridge District Bye-Laws of 1912 demonstrating a quite mercenary approach the creation of Orange materials, which were advertised alongside items for Masonic practice or near identical documents arranged as in one case for 'the Scottish Free Gardeners'.<sup>620</sup>

The expansion and creation of ritual within Scottish Orangeism to forge identity and bind members to the Institution brings to mind the classic analysis Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger in *The invention of tradition*. Here, Eric Hobsbawm expounded the 'broad if not imprecise' concept of an 'invented tradition'; cultural practices which were manufactured by states and institutions to strengthen identity.<sup>621</sup> In this case, it might be said that Orange ceremonies and their ritualistic content served the same function. As Hobsbawm argued, though, the exercise of such purposeful ceremony was most effective when it was predicated on 'a felt – not necessarily a clearly understood – need.'<sup>622</sup> The comparative lack of ritual practice and elaborate ceremony in the Presbyterian churches of Scotland perhaps created such a need. While Presbyterianism clearly had an impact on the religious make up and aspects of the culture of the Order, its predominance in Scotland also provided the Orange Order with an opportunity. It was able to offer a glut of

---

<sup>620</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Coatbridge Bye-laws*, p. 12.

<sup>621</sup> Eric Hobsbawm, 'Introduction', in Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger (eds), *The invention of tradition* (Cambridge, 1993), p. 1.

<sup>622</sup> Eric Hobsbawm, 'Mass-producing traditions: Europe, 1870-1914', in Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Ranger (eds), *The invention of tradition* (Cambridge, 1993), p. 307.

ceremony and ritual on which its members might feast within a theologically safe space, regulated by hierarchy and the involvement of many ministers.<sup>623</sup>

In essence the Order afforded a religious space outside of church where passions could be indulged, and it is through this that the elaborate rituals associated with Scottish Orangeism and the Institution's Presbyterian characteristics may be reconciled.

Above all, the distinctive ritual practice of the Orange Order in Scotland and Glasgow appealed to members and prospective members of the Loyal Orange Institution. They were at least part of the attraction of the Institution in the years of the Home Rule crisis and once again highlight the remarkable flexibility of Orangeism as a whole across the two locations considered in this thesis, where the ritual practice of the Order varied.

### **Concluding notes**

This chapter has provided a survey of the Orange Order's membership in Scotland and Glasgow. Relying on the detailed statistics of Eric Kaufmann, it appears that at least for the period of 1910 to 1914 these figures are an underestimate of the Order's strength. While accurately relaying the number of members reported to the hierarchy of the Order, closer analysis of private

---

<sup>623</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report of proceedings of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland 1912-1913* (Glasgow, 1913), accessible at the offices of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, Olympia House, Glasgow, pp 1-6.

lodge's membership rolls suggests a significant level of under-reporting. Decried at the time by the Grand Secretary of the Order, James Rice, when this under-reporting is taken into account it appears that the Order had somewhere between 11,800 and 15,800 members in Scotland, or roughly equivalent to the Order's strength in Belfast at this time. In Glasgow it may have had as many as 6,500 members. Despite this, the inconsistency of lodge attendance and the exclusion of various participant groups in Twelfth of July parades should serve as a reminder that one should not over-emphasise the significance of such figures.

More important was evidence that despite the large contingent of first- and second-generation Irish immigrants in the Order, highlighted by the likes of Kaufmann and McFarland, the Order failed to provide significant material support for their Irish kin during the third Home Rule crisis. Despite many speeches and publications condemning Home Rule, the Scottish Order failed to lead a militant movement against it in Scotland. Indeed, it seems that at most one in ten of the Order's members volunteered with the Scottish division of the U.V.F., going a long way to explaining the latter's failure in this country. This relative lack of enthusiasm may in part be explained by the quite distinct identity of the Order in Scotland. Predicated on the strength of Presbyterianism in Scotland, this distinctiveness manifested itself in the culture and disciplinary practices of the Scottish Order. With a culture of dissent and debate, albeit subject to the occasionally authoritarian tendencies of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, such distinctions serve

to emphasise that however strong shared Protestant identities were between Orange Order members in Ireland and Scotland, they were far from unlimited.<sup>624</sup>

Finally, this chapter analysed some of the ritual associated with the Order in Scotland, much of which was also distinct from Irish Orangeism. It briefly considered the role of rites from the Royal Arch Purple, but beyond this stressed the role of Orangeism in providing a space for tradition and ritual within a safely Presbyterian environment. Here, as in Ireland, ritual and pageantry doubtless helped to attract members to the Order, and to retain their membership afterwards.

Above all this chapter has sought to make one particular point. It is not to deny or otherwise minimise the impact of Ulster and wider Irish immigration on the composition and success of the Orange Order in Scotland, indeed, this is considered in the next chapter. Rather, it seeks to refine understanding of the Scottish Institution in order to demonstrate that it was possessed of a quite distinct character influenced by its environment. Not only did this allow the Order to succeed in Scotland, but it also serves as a sharp rebuttal to characterisations of the Orange Order and sectarianism more widely as an import onto our shores. By suggesting the Order is a

---

<sup>624</sup> Graham Walker, 'The Protestant Irish in Scotland', in T.M. Devine, *Irish immigrants and Scottish society in the 19th and 20th centuries* (Edinburgh, 1991), p. 52.

quintessentially Irish problem which has bled over into Scotland, not only does one deny Scotland's unique and long-standing relationship with sectarianism, but it simply mischaracterises the history of the Loyal Orange Institution in this country. Having outlined this distinctiveness, the next chapter of this thesis considers the impact of Irish migration on the Order in Glasgow and of the Scottish Order more broadly as a part of an Orange diaspora.

## Chapter six: migration

On 15 April 1910, the Brother Most Reverend David Rollo found himself in a most unusual position. A grand chaplain of the Orange Order in Scotland, that nor much else could have prepared him as he entered the lions' den at the Bostock Jungle, Glasgow. The den was not metaphorical.

Once inside, Rollo began to officiate a rather unconventional wedding. As Miss Mary Mackie and Mr Alexander Gaston walked down the makeshift aisle, they were flanked on either side by three to five lions.<sup>625</sup> The lions had proved a popular tourist attraction in Glasgow for eight weeks up to that point and acted as the bridesmaids and groomsmen for the happy couple. The wedding was the grand finale of the beasts' visit to Scotland, and was the first wedding of its kind in Europe – Americans being an innovative people.<sup>626</sup> As he stood facing the lions, the Rev. Rollo's thoughts doubtless turned to enquire how recently the creatures had been fed, and it is a relief to learn that the wedding came off without a hitch, ending without a single fatality or maiming.

---

<sup>625</sup> *Scottish Referee* (15 April 1910).

<sup>626</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (14 April 1910).

This extravagant and jocular scene sits slightly at odds with the image conjured by Orange chaplains, generally austere figures. Rollo was an interesting example, though, who had joined the Order in 1909 and quickly rose through the ranks of the Institution. This was a consequence of his talent for public oration and his position within the Church of Scotland, as minister of the Springburn parish in Glasgow.<sup>627</sup> As Elaine McFarland has demonstrated, only a limited number of Church of Scotland ministers actually joined the Orange Order in this period.<sup>628</sup> Rollo sat well within the Order, though. He was a vocal critic of Catholicism and his sermons and lectures at Springburn church attracted large crowds, often reinforced by members of the Institution. At one Orange social in Glasgow in May of 1912, over 300 members of the Order and their friends listened to Rollo's account of Irish history, and the would-be ruinous consequences of Home Rule for that country. He argued:

There was an Ireland long ago when a high civilisation did prevail, but after the introduction of Romanism at the synod of Cashel in the year 1172, things began to change and all down the centuries since then the power of the priesthood had been prevailing and the native Irish, the Celts or Gaels of Ireland, had been in a sorely backward condition, and what had been the result of centuries going backward, it would take a very long time indeed to see them going forward.<sup>629</sup>

Rollo was not himself an Irish immigrant and his reasons for joining the Order were not directly related to Home Rule. His interest in Irish history, which is to say nothing for its veracity, appears to have been theologically rooted, but in

---

<sup>627</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (16 June 1910).

<sup>628</sup> McFarland 'The Loyal Orange Institution', pp 209-210.

<sup>629</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (7 March 1912).

it there is also a level of disdain for the supposed backwardness which Catholicism had inflicted on the Irish population. In another sermon, Rollo suggested that while there had been a time when Scotland had looked upon Orangeism as 'a kind of alien institution, as an institution to the North of Ireland' now it was 'beginning to see it was one of the best possible things for the preservation of their material liberties and national life.'<sup>630</sup> Rollo's words and the evidence of the previous chapter highlight the distinctions of Scottish Orangeism and perhaps the tensions and complexities that Irish immigration brought to it. And yet these do not change the fact that Irish immigration, and particularly the immigration of Ulster Protestants, had a profound impact on the strength and nature of Scottish Orangeism.

This chapter principally examines two aspects of Orangeism in Glasgow. The first section addresses class and immigration within Scottish Orangeism and attempts, as in the first chapter of this thesis, to dispel popular misconceptions about the Order's class composition and to clarify the state of the existing literature on it. It examines a range of literature on the Order in Scotland and demonstrates that for at least the Edwardian era, as in Belfast, in Glasgow, Orangeism thrived as an association of the skilled and unskilled Protestant working class. The second section of the chapter moves on to consider Orangeism in Glasgow as part of an Orange diaspora, to use Donald MacRaid's term, and considers how Irish immigration has shaped the

---

<sup>630</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (16 December 1909).

Order and its historiography in Scotland.<sup>631</sup> It should be emphasised here that the impact of Irish immigration on Scottish Orangeism is not a countervailing force to the Scottish identity argued for in the last chapter, but rather is a necessary component for Orangeism to thrive outside of Ireland. This chapter also builds on MacRaild and MacPherson's arguments relating to *Belfast Weekly News* and suggests that beyond a means of staying in touch, the paper provided a readers' community for members of the Order outside of Ireland.<sup>632</sup> Lastly, attention turns to the Triennial meeting of the Imperial Orange Grand Council of the World, which was held in Glasgow in 1912. It considers how the Order attempted to create an international, or even transnational, framework for Orangeism across the globe. Together these parts inform understanding of Scottish Orangeism as a migrant association, and highlight some of the reasons Orangeism proved so successful outside of Ireland.

### **Class and immigration**

Having discussed the topic of class and Orangeism with regard to Belfast in the first chapter of this thesis, it is necessary to consider it now with regard to Glasgow and Scotland. Once again, as in Belfast, it seems that popular assumptions about the class make-up of the Orange Order have intruded into

---

<sup>631</sup> MacRaild, 'The associationalism of the Orange diaspora', pp 25-42.

<sup>632</sup> Lucy Delap, 'The *Freewoman*, periodical communities, and the feminist reading public', in *The Princeton University Library Chronicle* LXI, no. 2 (2000), pp 233-276.

scholarship. In particular, the myth of the labour aristocracy again rears its head. To take one example, J.W. McAuley has written that as Orangeism became rooted in the industrialized Lowlands of Scotland, 'its primary task was one of social closure, excluding Irish Catholics on the grounds of religion and ethnicity, and allowing the protection of economic privilege by excluding less skilled workers.'<sup>633</sup> McAuley goes on to compare the Order's role here to freemasonry and craft unionism. While Tom Devine has elsewhere acknowledged the work of scholars including Eric Kaufmann and Elaine McFarland, he too has suggested that the Orange Order functioned to exclude unskilled Catholic workers from industrial workplaces, at least before 1960.<sup>634</sup> Similarly, in the introduction to his oft cited *Glasgow: the uneasy peace*, Tom Gallagher describes Orangeism as 'a dangerous but never absolutely dominant force in the skilled working class'.<sup>635</sup> In practice the process described is the same as the processes of exclusion practiced by the labour aristocracy, most notably written on in Scotland by Robert Gray.<sup>636</sup> But though much worthy scholarship has been produced on the backs of such labour aristocrats, the term has since fallen out of popularity. As Trevor

---

<sup>633</sup> J.W. McAuley, 'Under an Orange banner: reflections on the northern Protestant experiences of emigration', in Patrick O'Sullivan (ed.), *The Irish world wide: history, heritage, identity*, Vol. 5, Religion and Identity (London, 1996), p. 51.

<sup>634</sup> Tom Devine, 'The sixties in Scotland: a historical context' in *Scottish Cultural Review of Language and Literature*, XX (2013), p.30.

<sup>635</sup> Tom Gallagher, *Glasgow: the uneasy peace, religious tension in modern Scotland* (Manchester, 1987), p. 3.

See also: Mairtin O' Cathain, ' 'For we are the Brigeton Derry Boys': social and political linkages between Derry and Glasgow in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries', in William Kelly and John R. Young (eds), *Ulster and Scotland, 1600-2000* (Dublin, 2004), pp 47-48;

Chris Bambery, *A people's history of Scotland* (London, 2014), p. 129.

<sup>636</sup> Robert Gray, *The labour aristocracy in Victorian Edinburgh* (Oxford, 1976).

Lummis has argued, too often a focus on the labour aristocracy has led to a constrained focus onto a small section of the working class.<sup>637</sup>

Much of this constrained focus was exercised in an effort to explain the absence of a British revolution.<sup>638</sup> Some have also argued that the lack of a revolutionary movement or mass party of labour in the north of Ireland is attributable to Orangeism.<sup>639</sup> Perhaps, then, the association between the Order and the labour aristocracy is in part a coalescing of counter-revolutionary agents in the eyes of socialist critics. Whatever the case, the association has also proved strong in Scotland. Even in more sophisticated accounts of the Scottish Order, the language of the labour aristocracy, extending on into craft unionism, is pervasive. Joan Smith's otherwise impressive and extensive consideration of class consciousness in Glasgow and Liverpool, for example, argues that in Glasgow: 'Liberal commonsense isolated and controlled the Orange Order, not because it had fewer hard-core supporters than in Liverpool, but because it denied the Orange Order

---

<sup>637</sup> Trevor Lummis, *The labour aristocracy 1851-1914* (Aldershot, 1994), p. 159.

<sup>638</sup> A useful summary of the debate is available in: John Field, 'British historians and the concept of the labour aristocracy', in *Radical History Review* no. 19 (Winter, 1979), pp 68-76. Outside of British history the debate continues, see: Timothy Kerswell, 'A conceptual history of the labour aristocracy: a critical review', in *Socialism and Democracy* XXXIII, no. 1 (2019), pp 70-87;

Charles Post, 'Exploring working-class consciousness: a critique of the theory of the labour-aristocracy' in *Historical Materialism* XVIII, no. 4 (2010), pp 3-38.

<sup>639</sup> James Connolly, 'Sweatshops behind the Orange flag', *Forward* (11 March 1911); Townsend, *Political violence in Ireland*, p. 39.

A recent alternative thesis highlighting an example of Orange/Green collaboration is offered in: Fearghal Mac Bhloscaidh, 'The Caledon Lockout: revolution and counter-revolution in rural Ulster, 1918-1922', in *International Labor and Working Class History* XCVIII (Fall, 2020), pp 216-236.

exclusive organisational routes into the mass of the skilled working class.<sup>640</sup>

Here Smith assumes that in order to thrive in an urban environment, Orangeism was reliant on skilled workers for its membership. Therein, Orangeism provided the superstructure to the existent economic base for the exclusion of unskilled Catholic workers.

More opaque, in her work *Protestants first*, when assessing the membership of the Orange Order in Scotland, Elaine McFarland chooses to compare it with the Amalgamated Society of Engineers and the Society of Boilermakers and Iron Shipbuilders.<sup>641</sup> Elsewhere, McFarland argued that the 'historical evidence, in fact, strongly militates against assimilating the LOI [Loyal Orange Institution] into the labour aristocracy', and yet, perhaps unconsciously, she relies on comparisons which are securely embedded in it. In calling on a bank of skilled industrial imagery, historians in Scotland have consistently placed the Order alongside or within a context of skilled workers rather than with their unskilled or rural counterparts.

Thus, parallels between the Order and skilled urban workers have calcified in Scotland over time, or, as McFarland herself has written:

From anecdote and folklore, the strongest impression is that the LOI found its constituency among skilled workers, in the West of Scotland

---

<sup>640</sup> Joan Smith, 'Commonsense thought and working class consciousness: some aspects of the Glasgow and Liverpool labour movements in the early years of the twentieth century', (Unpublished PhD Thesis, University of Edinburgh, 1980), p. 430.

<sup>641</sup> McFarland, *Protestants first*, p. 72.

acting as a major lever to recruitment and advancement in the shipyards and engineering works. Superimpose on this an acquaintance with much of the sociological theory on working class sectionalism and the LOI becomes hypostatized as a labour aristocracy movement, albeit of some vaguely 'deviant' nature.<sup>642</sup>

Clearly it is easy to fall into this trap, then. Yet, when considering such evidence as does exist about the composition of Orange membership, there is little, if any, to suggest that it was disproportionately made up of skilled workers – even in Glasgow. In particular, it appears that such assumptions have often rested on the immigration of skilled Protestant shipyard workers from Belfast to Glasgow as the prime carriers of Orangeism.<sup>643</sup>

Even where the myth of Orangemen as labour aristocrats is not present, at various times throughout the history of the Institution in Scotland, the researcher is left with either a general statement from a historian which, while plausible, lacks a firm evidentiary base, or else is forced to rely on very specific data to make broader claims. In her doctoral thesis at the University of Glasgow, Elaine McFarland provided the first kind, suggesting that: 'the LOI in Scotland, therefore, was a diverse and complex phenomenon, drawing for its membership in the District and Private lodges, on both skilled and unskilled workers and on the petty bourgeoisie.'<sup>644</sup> She proved to be right, but her source base for the statement was unreliable, as will be shown. Of the other variety, Callum Brown's work on the social history of religion in

---

<sup>642</sup> McFarland, *Protestants first*, p. 76.

<sup>643</sup> Walker, 'The Protestant Irish in Scotland' p. 58. Note: while Walker suggests 'easy equations' should be 'guarded against', he nonetheless stresses the quintessential importance of Protestant skilled worker migration to Glasgow from Belfast.

<sup>644</sup> McFarland, 'The Loyal Orange Institution', p. 143.

Scotland relies on William Baird & Co., ironmasters in Coatbridge in the nineteenth century. Baird was an Orangeman and employed sectarian practices alongside his Orangeism, this example is considered emblematic by Brown of the constitution of all lodges, where industrialists and their workers mixed.<sup>645</sup> Similarly, when alighting in Scotland in his book focused on the Orange Order in the north of England, Donald MacRaild focuses on Paisley, Greenock and Glasgow, areas surveyed by McFarland, to argue that Orangeism was a mixture of skilled and unskilled Protestant workers in Scotland.<sup>646</sup> Essentially, very partial records are combined or otherwise taken to represent the entirety of the Institution in Scotland, frequently across significant timescales.

Perhaps this imprecision is inevitable. When confronted with the sparse records of the Order in Scotland for much of the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, it is doubtless better to utilise what limited evidence does exist than to remain in near-total ignorance of the subject. However, in seeking to justify their arguments, historians concerned with the Orange Order in Scotland have perhaps failed to do enough to highlight the limitations of this evidentiary base. To take one example, examining the roll book of the Star of Temple, Loyal Orange Lodge Number 365 which featured in the previous chapter, it is nearly impossible to identify the professions of its members. Using a similar methodology employed by other historians, cross

---

<sup>645</sup> C.G. Brown, *The social history of religion in Scotland since 1750* (London, 1987), p. 164.

<sup>646</sup> MacRaild, *Faith, fraternity & fighting*, p. 114.

referencing the names which appear with census data and the post office directory for the period, it is possible to identify with a degree of certainty only six of the Lodge's 33 members.<sup>647</sup> Of these six, three worked as tailors, but it is highly unlikely that half of the membership of Lodge Number 365 found employment in the garment trade. Unlike the roll book of the Royal Arch Purple District for Belfast which was utilised in the first chapter, such documents are lacking for Glasgow.

Instead, in Glasgow in the period of the third Home Rule crisis it is possible to gain a limited impression of the composition of the Order from the concerns of reports to the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland. For example, in his 1910 report James Rice stressed that the Order had suffered a slight decrease in membership, 'due no doubt, to the very trying times of so much unemployment'.<sup>648</sup> Rice trusted that membership would increase in line with an improving economy, but his statement offers insight into a perceived relationship between Orange membership and fluctuations in Scotland's employment rate. Similarly, the next year, Rice attempted to promote the Scottish Orange Friendly Society. He emphasised an otherwise relatively modest improvement in the sick and funeral benefits offered by the Scottish Society, suggesting they addressed a 'long-felt want'.<sup>649</sup> But while such

---

<sup>647</sup> Lodge Number 365, *Membership roll book*.

<sup>648</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *1909-1910*, p. 68.

<sup>649</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report of proceedings of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland 1910-1911* (Glasgow, 1911), accessible at the offices of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, Olympia House, Glasgow, p. 64.

messages give an impression of an Orangeism which catered to working-class men, it is hardly a firm basis from which to advance accounts of Scottish Orangeism.

It is fortunate then that in a series of articles and chapters Eric Kaufmann has offered a more secure basis from which the class composition, and Irish immigrant influence therein, is assessed. While there are limitations in Kaufmann's work, it provides by far the best estimate of Scottish Orangeism, particularly for the Edwardian era. Kaufmann's ability to access the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland's records was indispensable in this regard and for 1911 he was able to examine the office bearers of the Glasgow's lodges. Of 212 office-bearers Kaufmann was able to accurately identify 92 in the census and Post Office Directory.<sup>650</sup> While a minority, the 92 individuals may in this case be said to at least provide a reasonably representative sample of Orangeism in Glasgow, as opposed to the microstudies of individual private lodges which had predated Kaufmann's work. Of these individuals, Kaufmann demonstrates that 1.1 percent fell into the 'Professional' category, 27 percent into the bourgeois or petty bourgeois, 34 percent into the skilled category, and 38 percent of the Lodge officers were unskilled workers.<sup>651</sup> While these categories belie a great deal of complexity within large workplaces, they provide important evidence in demonstrating that in Glasgow in this period the Order was essentially a pan-working-class

---

<sup>650</sup> Kaufmann, 'The Orange Order in Scotland', p. 174.

<sup>651</sup> Kaufmann, 'The Orange Order in Scotland', p. 174.

enterprise. This was also the case in Belfast and Toronto in the same period. Indeed, despite Toronto's difference in demography, again a mixture of skilled and unskilled workers made up the Order in the city.<sup>652</sup> Though Orangeism in Canada was less reliant on Irish immigration than the Scottish Order, such patterns of mixed association provide a tantalising glimpse that, rather than craft unionism, global Orangeism at the turn of the twentieth century is better defined by its ability to reconcile skilled and unskilled Protestant workers.

Additionally, Kaufmann has argued that Glasgow possessed a disproportionately petit bourgeois membership when compared with the rest of Scotland. These were mostly shopkeepers and clerks, and Kaufmann argues this was essentially reflective of the geography of the city, which had 'a higher proportion of non-manual occupations than surrounding west-central belt towns'.<sup>653</sup> As the previous chapter of this thesis demonstrated, though, in 1911 a significant portion of the Order's membership in Scotland was female. Examining the large Glasgow Primrose Ladies Lodge, Kaufmann was able to identify the professions of the husbands of that lodge's membership for 1921. Notable here was a decrease in 20 percent of bourgeois or petit bourgeois occupations when compared to the Glasgow rolls discussed earlier, with members distributed instead more or less evenly

---

<sup>652</sup> Houston and Smyth, *The sash Canada wore*, pp 101-111.

<sup>653</sup> Eric Kaufmann, 'The Orange Order in Ontario, Newfoundland, Scotland and Northern Ireland', p. 57.

among the skilled and unskilled working class.<sup>654</sup> This goes a large way in helping to confirm Jim MacPherson's argument that the female order in Scotland was a working-class endeavour.<sup>655</sup>

In examining how geography might have influenced the success of Orangeism in different areas, Kaufmann concluded that 'population density, infant mortality, illiteracy and proportion in manufacturing' were insignificant in predicting areas of Orange strength in Scotland.<sup>656</sup> His detailed work provides not only the best employment estimates for the Order at the turn of the twentieth century, but beyond this it surely puts the final nail in the coffin of the Orange labour aristocracy. Kaufmann's work has been related here at length because despite this, the idea of the labour aristocracy retains salience and Kaufmann's work goes ignored. Despite the best efforts of Kaufmann and others, it seems Scotland is still unwilling to depart from its preconceptions about the nature of Orangeism.<sup>657</sup> This is not to say that contemporary Scottish history is itself still in the thrall of the labour aristocracy. Rather it is that synthetical literature and general histories have failed to keep up with the specialist literature on the Order. Brief references to Orangeism are often more reliant on Gallagher, Hutchinson or McAuley than

---

<sup>654</sup> Kaufmann, 'The Orange Order in Scotland', p. 174.

<sup>655</sup> MacPherson, *Women and the Orange Order*, p. 1

<sup>656</sup> Kaufmann, 'The Orange Order in Scotland', p. 171.

<sup>657</sup> MacRaild, *Irish migrants in modern Britain*, p. 103 and McFarland, 'The Loyal Orange Institution', p. 143.

they are on Kaufmann or McFarland, and so the aura of the labour aristocracy still surrounds Orangeism in Scotland.<sup>658</sup>

In fact, more influential than class in predicting Orange membership in Scotland is the proportion of Irish immigrants in an area.<sup>659</sup> In 1881 it seems that fully 72 percent of office holders in the Orange directory of Scotland were Irish-born.<sup>660</sup> Anecdotally, accounts of Orange socials from the period of the third Home Rule crisis also emphasise the Irish or Ulster character of the Institution in Scotland. To take one example, during a speech in Glasgow in March of 1910, Gerald Brunskill, the Unionist MP for Mid Tyrone, addressed the crowd by saying 'he was very proud to be present at the magnificent meeting of Glasgow Orangemen, most of whom were born and bred in Ulster, and all of them united by relationship and ties of friendship with the Unionists of Ireland.'<sup>661</sup> Clearly Brunskill played up such links to elicit support from the gathered Orangemen, but it remains true to say that Irish or Ulster immigration had a profound impact on the Scottish Order. Indeed, Elaine McFarland has argued that it is possible that the Order's perception as an 'Ulster institution, and a violent and drunken one at that,' discouraged Scottish Protestants from joining.<sup>662</sup> Additionally, she argues that the Order

---

<sup>658</sup> See for example: M.L. McDowell, *A cultural history of association football in Scotland, 1865-1902* (New York, 2013), p. 92.

<sup>659</sup> Kaufmann, 'The Orange Order in Scotland', p. 170.

Scholarship tends to drift interchangeably between Irish and Ulster immigration with regard to the Order. This is doubtless because of a lack of specificity in the data combined with Ulster's predominance as a centre of Orangeism in Ireland.

<sup>660</sup> Kaufmann, 'The Orange Order in Scotland', p. 173.

<sup>661</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (24 March 1910).

<sup>662</sup> McFarland, *Protestants first*, p. 111.

was unlikely to act as a mechanism for skilled, indigenous workers to exclude unskilled Irish Catholics from employment given their 'exclusion was already *a fait accompli*'.<sup>663</sup>

Instead it seems that unskilled and skilled migration from Ulster helped fuel Orangeism in Scotland. Indeed, Kaufmann has also argued that Irish-Protestant, and particularly Ulster, migration into the central belt had more effect on membership patterns than even seismic events like Home Rule.<sup>664</sup> This was not the case in Canada where 'the Irish were important in varying degrees [...], but an overwhelming presence of the Irish in a community was not a necessary condition for the operation of a lodge.'<sup>665</sup> Thus when considering the importance of Irish immigration to the Orange Order globally it is important that one does not fall into the trap of applying a "one-size-fits-all" framework. But, for Glasgow and Scotland at least, Irish immigration remained significant. This flow combined with Scotland's increasingly urbanised society, where almost half of the population lived in towns of above 20,000 people, and ensured that migrant workers to Scotland were channelled into industrial work.<sup>666</sup> Glasgow specifically was perhaps the most densely populated space in Europe by 1911 with 700,000 people resident within three square miles.<sup>667</sup> In areas like Govan and Kinning Park,

---

<sup>663</sup> McFarland, *Protestants first*, p. 11.

<sup>664</sup> Kaufmann, 'The Orange Order in Scotland', p. 190.

<sup>665</sup> Houston and Smyth, *The sash Canada wore*, p. 93.

<sup>666</sup> Cameron, *Impaled upon a thistle*, p. 18.

<sup>667</sup> Gallagher, *Glasgow: the uneasy peace*, p. 37.

immigrants from the north of Ireland found employment in booming shipyards. Before 1870, the Clyde River had seen a completed annual tonnage of around 200,000, but by 1913 this was raised to 757,000 tons.<sup>668</sup> The immigration of Irish workers, both Protestant and Catholic, in turn led to a geographic, sectarian segregation in these areas, though unlike in Belfast this was lessening by the period of Home Rule.<sup>669</sup> These immigrants also found employment in the steel industry which supplied the yards, and since 1879, towns surrounding Glasgow had increased their production from 50,000 tons to 1,250,000 tons by 1911.<sup>670</sup> As with Belfast then, this burgeoning industry created ample work for the skilled and unskilled labour of Scots, but also of immigrants from Ulster and Belfast in particular, who had experience of the industry.

While immigration continued in the years of the third Home Rule crisis, though, so did emigration and the growth of Scotland's population had slowed in the years from 1901 to 1911, down to 6.5 percent from 11.1 percent twenty years before.<sup>671</sup> Understanding how patterns of immigration and employment were inter-related phenomena in Orange Order membership in Glasgow is important, then. As Donald MacRaild has written with regard to the north of England, 'we must add to the labels 'proletarian'

---

<sup>668</sup> Checkland, *The upas tree*, p. 6

<sup>669</sup> John Foster, Muir Houston and Chris Madigan, 'Sectarianism, segregation and politics on Clydeside in the latter nineteenth century', in M.J. Mitchell (ed.), *New perspectives on the Irish in Scotland* (Edinburgh, 2008), p. 66.

<sup>670</sup> Checkland, *The upas tree*, p. 5.

<sup>671</sup> Olive and Sydney Checkland, *Industry and ethos: Scotland, 1832-1914* (Edinburgh, 1989), p. 184.

and 'Protestant' another one: 'Irish'. It is only when we bring these three elements together that the true nature of the Order comes to light.<sup>672</sup> These character aspects taken together do provide a more accurate general picture of Orangeism in Glasgow than the images of skilled workers with which this chapter began. But, care must also be taken to differentiate the class structure of Orange migrants to Scotland from the Institution in Ireland itself. 'The class structure of Ulster was not fully reproduced' in Scotland, Elaine McFarland has argued, 'for the Irish gentry who had been traditional patrons of the institution were not part of the migration.'<sup>673</sup>

Earlier in this chapter it was argued that McFarland's methodology in investigating the class composition of the Order was flawed, or at least risked being unrepresentative. However, one area where her work remains useful is her examination of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland in the latter part of the nineteenth century, which still has the power to inform on the topic of elite migration, or lack thereof, into Scottish Orangeism. While the Grand Lodge of Scotland is unlikely to be fully representative of Scottish Orangeism as a whole, the prevalence of Ulster migrants and the absence of the lower gentry and bourgeoisie which dominated the Grand Lodge of Ireland highlights an important area of distinction.<sup>674</sup> Two examples from the period of 1910 to 1914 are perhaps illustrative in this regard. While in Ireland the Order was led

---

<sup>672</sup> MacRaild, *Faith, fraternity & fighting*, p. 69.

<sup>673</sup> McFarland, 'The Loyal Orange Institution', p. 246.

<sup>674</sup> McFarland, 'The Loyal Orange Institution', p. 246.

by the Earl of Erne, in Scotland it was headed by the Rev. David Ness. Born in Fifeshire, Ness had studied at St. Andrews and became the minister of Whiteinch Parish Church which, while a part of the Church of Scotland, was not a prestigious appointment.<sup>675</sup> While Ness was evidently a popular and zealous minister, his position within the Orange Order was essentially the pinnacle of his career and influence. Likewise in a second example, in Ireland at the turn of the twentieth century the grand secretaryship had been taken by both Colonel Robert Wallace and Colonel H.W. Maxwell.<sup>676</sup> In Scotland, the role was taken by James Rice, who, prior to gaining full time employment through the position, had been a housepainter in Glasgow.<sup>677</sup> Irish, and the leader of the Rechabites in Glasgow, it seems highly unlikely that Rice would have achieved election to the Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland.<sup>678</sup> This is, of course, not to suggest either man was without the skills or ability necessary to see out their duties. Both seem to have been highly competent organisers for the Orange Order, but their social standing was doubtless lower than their equivalents in Ireland. This in part contributes to the argument made in the last chapter, that, while there may have been a significant preponderance of Irish immigrants in the Scottish Order, it was a not a mirror image of Ireland. Elaine McFarland has gone as far as to argue that:

The Grand Lodge of Scotland, indeed, had more in common in its petty bourgeois class composition with the dissident and populist

---

<sup>675</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (25 July 1912).

<sup>676</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report, December 1910*, p. 7 and p. 11.

<sup>677</sup> McFarland, 'The Loyal Orange Institution', p. 244.

<sup>678</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (15 December 1910).

Orange and Protestant Workers' Association, led by William Johnstone of Ballykillbeg, than with the Irish Grand Lodge.<sup>679</sup>

This may have been true of its composition, and as such is reflective of the nature of immigrants into Scotland from Ulster, but the comparison falls short when considering the Order's politics in Scotland.

In Scotland, as was covered briefly in the last chapter, the Order enjoyed a relatively secure relationship with the Unionist Party, as it became, during the third Home Rule crisis. McFarland correctly associates this alliance with the attempted construction a viable electoral framework in Scotland for Conservatism in the latter half of the nineteenth century, and in particular with the development of the Glasgow Working Men's Conservative Association.<sup>680</sup> This link became institutionalised in the early 1880s, and the cross attendance of senior Conservatives and Orange figures at events became increasingly common. At this time the Order also received a representative on the city's Conservative Association executive.<sup>681</sup> The ties between the Conservatives and Scottish Orangemen became stronger as a result, such that by 1910 a motion seeking to sever any connection between the Grand Lodge of Scotland and 'all political parties' was defeated convincingly at the annual meeting of the Grand Lodge.<sup>682</sup> Two years later, the Order in Scotland received two seats on the Western Divisional Council

---

<sup>679</sup> McFarland, 'The Loyal Orange Institution', p. 247.

<sup>680</sup> McFarland, 'The Loyal Orange Institution', p. 301.

<sup>681</sup> Hutchinson, *A political history of Scotland*, p. 123.

<sup>682</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report, 1910*, p. 18.

of the National Union of Conservative Associations for Scotland. The seats were awarded in recognition of 'the valuable services rendered to the Party by the members of the Orange Institution.'<sup>683</sup>

In the same year, and due to the advance of the Home Rule crisis, the Conservatives merged with Liberal unionists which, in the words of Alvin Jackson 'forged an electoral machine with astonishingly sturdy and complex cultural roots and reach.'<sup>684</sup> Certainly the Order proved a complex cultural root for the Party in Glasgow, and one which was more deeply embedded in the Glaswegian working-class and Ulster immigrant communities than other Conservative organs. But while, as was argued in chapter five, the Order's association with the Conservatives and its exclusion from Scotland's Liberal hegemony likely caused greater hostility to Liberal unionism than among their Irish counterparts, this union was not enough to break the bonds of the Order and the Party, which remained in place until the creation of the Orange and Protestant Party in December of 1921.<sup>685</sup> That these remained strong before the First World War speaks to similar notions of working-class conservatism and respectability as were discussed with regard to Belfast. As Jon Lawrence has demonstrated, urban Toryism tended to rely on activists like those in the

---

<sup>683</sup> Annual reports 1895, 1912-61, of: the National Union of Conservative Associations for Scotland (i-ii); the Scottish Unionist Association (iii-vii); and of the Western Division, SUA (viii-x): 1912. Report of the western Divisional Council of the National Union of Conservative Association's for Scotland for the Year 1911-1912, accessible at the National Library of Scotland: Acc. 10424/27 (ii), p. 35.

<sup>684</sup> Jackson, *The two unions*, p. 222.

<sup>685</sup> The creation of the Party is attributed by Graham Walker to the 'byzantine political flux' of the interwar period and as a reaction to the advance of socialism in Glasgow, see: Walker, 'The Orange Order between the Wars', pp 185-186.

Orange Order to evangelise for it, whether these were to be found in Friendly Societies, the Primrose League, or the Orange Order. In this sense, ‘they performed exactly the same job, in the same factories, as their working-class Liberal or Socialist opponents.’<sup>686</sup>

These similarities have frequently led to comparisons with the Primrose League, particularly appropriate, as will be shown in the next chapter, with regard to female Orangeism in Scotland. While Donald MacRaild has cautioned against exaggerating their similarity, stressing that ‘Orangeism was not Chartism or the Primrose League: neither an articulation of mass nor of cross-class populism’, the comparison does seem apt in other ways.<sup>687</sup> Just as in Belfast, respectability played an important role in Orange identity, with the Laws of the Institution forbidding, on pain of fine or suspension, ‘that any Brother use improper or offensive language in the Lodge-room’.<sup>688</sup> Similarly, the Order in Scotland employed a degree of self-policing which helped maintain support for the Conservative Party among its working-class membership.<sup>689</sup> Indeed both organisations were regulated in part through the working-class respectability discussed in chapter one. In Glasgow, the Order certainly strove to perform a similar role to that of the Primrose League for the Conservative Party, and in fact the decline of the League across the beginning of the twentieth century likely contributed to the Order’s improving

---

<sup>686</sup> Lawrence, ‘Class and gender in the making of urban Toryism’, p. 641.

<sup>687</sup> MacRaild, *Faith, fraternity & fighting*, p. 117.

<sup>688</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Laws and constitutions*, p. 63.

<sup>689</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (28 April 1910).

fortunes in this regard. In essence, Orangeism provided working-class conservatism with an activist base, but also, as Alvin Jackson has written with regard to Armagh, added 'a social and ceremonial dimension to dry party debate'.<sup>690</sup> This was the case, even if, as has been shown, in Scotland unlike in Armagh, it failed to provide the same space 'for the mixing of the classes'.<sup>691</sup>

But what were the consequences of this working-class Orange conservatism? Ewen Cameron argues that the sectarian overtones of Edward Carson's speech in Glasgow in 1912 failed to appeal to the 'Liberal skilled working class of the west of Scotland' and so, it seems, did the Orange Order. Even despite Unionist success in 1900, by the general elections of 1906 and 1910, Liberalism had been revived in Glasgow.<sup>692</sup> All of which speaks to a weakness in the high political impact of Orangeism in Scotland. And yet, despite this, much of the historiography in Scotland maintains that there existed a substantial 'Orange vote' among the Protestant working class in Scotland. Indeed, I.G.C. Hutchison argues that Orangeism remained effective in mobilising working-class Tory voters 'down to the start of the First World War'.<sup>693</sup>

---

<sup>690</sup> Alvin Jackson, 'Unionist politics', p. 859.

<sup>691</sup> Jackson, 'Unionist politics', p. 859.

<sup>692</sup> Cameron, *Impaled on a thistle*, p. 99.

<sup>693</sup> I.G.C. Hutchison, 'Glasgow working class politics' in R.A. Cage (ed.), *The working class in Glasgow* (Beckenham, 1987), p. 130.

Again, here, Eric Kaufmann has done much to improve understanding of the issue, this time by examining the electoral results at local levels in areas of high Orange Order membership. Kaufmann concludes that Orange membership density in these areas is an 'insignificant predictor' in the performance of political parties.<sup>694</sup> Beyond this, he has also argued that where elected, the actions of Orangemen frequently stood in opposition to the views and beliefs of the bulk of the Order's membership in Scotland. Where elected, such figures often disregarded the stated position of the Order and voted instead along party-political lines, or with their own conscience<sup>695</sup> He concludes that while 'many have marvelled at the shadowy nature of the so-called Orange vote', in fact, 'the real question is how the Order managed to provide as many political figures as it did and to acquire such an aura of influence despite possessing limited electoral clout.'<sup>696</sup> Kaufmann accepts that given the Order had relatively limited numbers in Glasgow that the Institution 'punched considerably above' its weight politically, but is clear this was not enough to justify the reputation it retains in the historiography.<sup>697</sup>

It seems that some scholarship of the Order continues to have an impact on public perception in Scotland, lagging behind much of the work carried out by Eric Kaufmann or even the work of Elaine McFarland some thirty years

---

<sup>694</sup> Kaufmann, 'The dynamics of Orangeism', p. 284.

<sup>695</sup> Kaufmann, 'The Orange Order in Scotland', pp 188-189.

<sup>696</sup> Kaufmann, 'The dynamics of Orangeism', p. 287.

<sup>697</sup> Kaufmann, 'The dynamics of Orangeism', p. 285.

ago.<sup>698</sup> Despite these efforts, it seems that myths based on the labour aristocracy, or around the malign influence of an ‘Orange vote’ still resonate in Glasgow and Scotland more broadly.<sup>699</sup> But for all that, it seems instead that the Order in Scotland was an alliance among the Protestant working class, and often among Ulster immigrants therein. Moving beyond this, this chapter next turns to examine the phenomenon of Orange migration from Ulster to Scotland more specifically.

### **An Orange diaspora?**

While the significance of Irish immigration to the fortunes of the Orange Order in Scotland has rarely been disputed, much can be gained from analysing these migrants as part of what has been termed an ‘Orange diaspora’.<sup>700</sup> Analysing how Ulster migrants maintained a sense of identity through the Institution in Scotland - with its quite Scottish characteristics – can go some way to explaining why Orangeism flourished not just in Scotland, but in other locations around the world. Beyond this, it can also resolve some of the apparent contradictions of what was an Irish institution in Scotland with Scottish characteristics. Central to this at the turn of the twentieth century, was the *Belfast Weekly News*.

---

<sup>698</sup> See for example: Steve Bruce, *No Pope of Rome: anti-Catholicism in modern Scotland* (Edinburgh, 1985) and the previously cited: Gallagher, *Glasgow: the uneasy peace*.

<sup>699</sup> *The Herald* (7 May 2017) and *The National* (2 February 2019).

<sup>700</sup> MacRaid, *Faith, fraternity & fighting*, p. 289.

Speaking to just this point, Jim Macpherson in his analysis of women's Orangeism in Scotland in the twentieth century has stressed that by the period from 1922 to 1957, only 9.82 percent of applicants to the female order were Irish-born women.<sup>701</sup> Instead it appears second generation Orangewomen made up a substantial portion of the activist base. Despite this, these women maintained Irish identity within the Institution. The *Belfast Weekly News* profiled one such activist, the most worthy mistress of Scotland's first female lodge, Harriet Wilson whose father was from Lurgan.<sup>702</sup> Similar profiles from the period stressed the Irish credentials of members in the Order. Such figures also often contributed letters to the newspaper themselves, with migrants occasionally making contact with old lodges from their new homes in America or Australasia.<sup>703</sup> In another example, David Fitzpatrick singles out an Orangeman in South Australia whose 'decision to 'stick to the Loyal Orange Institution as long as he had breath in his body' was influenced by 'getting Belfast Weekly [News] and seeing cases in it'.<sup>704</sup>

Running from 1857 to 1914 as a weekly addition to the *Belfast News Letter*, the paper played an important role in linking members of the Loyal Orange

---

<sup>701</sup> D.A.J. MacPherson, 'Migration and the female Orange Order: Irish Protestant identity, diaspora and empire in Scotland, 1909-40', in *The Journal of Imperial and Commonwealth History* XL, no. 4 (2012), p. 624.

<sup>702</sup> Quoted in MacPherson, 'Migration and the female Orange Order', p. 624.

<sup>703</sup> MacPherson, 'Migration and the female Orange Order', p. 629.

<sup>704</sup> Fitzpatrick, 'Exporting brotherhood', p. 294.

Institution across the globe. Donald MacRaild was the first historian to utilise this source to provide a rich level of detail about the lives and activities of those who were a part of the Orange Order in this period. MacRaild describes the paper itself as ‘an important conduit for information flowing out to Orangemen beyond Ulster, many of whom subscribed to it through their lodges.’<sup>705</sup> Beyond this, even, it provided a weekly update of current events with an editorial voice which helped reinforce ideas and enabled ‘fellow travellers to maintain their sense of connection’ with events in Ulster.<sup>706</sup> To this, Jim MacPherson makes an important addition when he argues:

Orangewomen in Scotland and across the British empire were just as adept as men in utilising the *Belfast Weekly News* to communicate with their Orange sisters across the globe, suggesting that MacRaild’s characterisation of the act of reading the newspaper in the later Victorian world as a distinctly masculinist act is not as applicable in the first half of the twentieth century.<sup>707</sup>

Certainly given the numerical strength of the Order in Scotland it would be a mistake to exclude Orangewomen from the conversation which took place in the pages of the *Belfast Weekly News*. Indeed, so vibrant was the dialogue created in the paper that MacRaild has suggested it functioned as a kind of Orange ‘chatroom’.<sup>708</sup> This is not to diminish its importance, though. ‘We are left with the impression of Orangemen overseas avidly poring over the pages of the *Belfast Weekly News*’ writes MacRaild, ‘and, crucially, looking for their own names to appear in print. Vanity necessity, habit, politics, culture or some vaguer transnational identification – all of these things, in unequal

---

<sup>705</sup> MacRaild, *Faith, fraternity & fighting*, p. 12.

<sup>706</sup> MacRaild, *Faith, fraternity & fighting*, p. 12.

<sup>707</sup> MacPherson, ‘Migration and the female Orange Order’, p. 621.

<sup>708</sup> MacRaild, *Faith, fraternity & fighting*, p. 308.

measure, explain something of the nature of the Order.’<sup>709</sup> MacRaild and MacPherson’s evangelism for the *Belfast Weekly News* as a source base for historians interested in the Order is not misplaced, and it heavily informs this thesis. Their description of it as a means of building community, though, is evocative of the argument made by Lucy Delap regarding transatlantic feminist literature in the same period, where communities were nurtured through magazine correspondence and consumption.<sup>710</sup>

It is in this sense that there might be said to have been an Orange ‘periodical community’ across the globe in the Victorian and Edwardian era. Delap argues that a periodical community speaks to the ‘material, cultural and intellectual milieu of a periodical or group of related periodicals’, and the same may be said of the members of the Orange Institution who read the *Belfast Weekly News*.<sup>711</sup> While more numerous than the readers of the journals at the heart of Delap’s study, the setting of the lodge provided a no less intimate environment for these readers to gather and form community.

Particularly illuminating in this regard is an Orange social event held for Female Loyal Orange Lodge Number 19, also covered by MacPherson, in Glasgow in September of 1913.<sup>712</sup> Amid a host of musical performances, a

---

<sup>709</sup> MacRaild, *Faith, fraternity & fighting*, p. 308.

<sup>710</sup> Lucy DeLap, *The feminist avant-garde: transatlantic encounters of the early twentieth century* (Cambridge, 2007).

<sup>711</sup> Delap, ‘The Freewoman, periodical communities, and the feminist reading public’, p. 234.

<sup>712</sup> MacPherson, ‘Migration and the female Orange Order’, p. 633.

Sister Beattie 'set the ball a-rolling' by singing a song based on the *Belfast*

*Weekly News*. It ran:

Come all you loyal Orangemen,  
I hope you won't refuse  
To listen to a verse that's new  
About the "Weekly News."  
It is my Orange newspaper,  
In it I take delight.  
I never feel contented till  
I get it on a Thursday night.

I got it when I was in Tyrone,  
And I'll get it to the last,  
I've got it here in Glasgow,  
And I've got it in Belfast.  
You may talk about your sport games,  
Or anything you choose,  
But each Thursday night sure I delight  
In my "Belfast Weekly News"<sup>713</sup>

For MacPherson, this song illustrates the 'function played by the *Belfast Weekly News* in forging a sense of connection to their Orange sisters outside Scotland.'<sup>714</sup> Doubtless true, but it goes rather beyond that too. The second verse focuses on the ability of Orangemen and women to get the *Belfast Weekly News* not only when in Tyrone, but then when 'here' in Glasgow. This speaks to the movement of members of the Institution across the Irish Sea, and highlights that within that migration, the *Belfast Weekly News* was an item of cultural significance, itself worthy of a song performed in an Orange hall. That the paper had such a strong cultural resonance in the hall also speaks to the strength of the association between the paper and its reading community therein.

---

<sup>713</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (11 September 1913).

<sup>714</sup> MacPherson, 'Migration and the female Orange Order', p. 633.

In addition to the lodge halls acting to strengthen the readers' community of the *Belfast Weekly News*, the paper's 'missing friends' section also reveals the interconnectedness of the orange diaspora and the importance of the paper's place within it. Most often, adverts placed in the paper aimed at locating Orangemen who had moved abroad or had otherwise been encountered on their travels. Such adverts usually mentioned the individual's connection with an Orange lodge including any positions they held within the Institution and dozens of such requests for information appeared across the third Home Rule crisis.<sup>715</sup> The missing advertisements contribute to the idea that there existed a very physical community behind the pages of the *Belfast Weekly News* and that that community was seeking to maintain connections across the globe.

Beyond simply providing a useful label, Delap's periodical community also adds an important dimension to understanding the power such communities could foster. Delap argues that 'the periodical community provided readers and contributors with a context that dominated their interpretation of *The Freewoman*' and the same is true with the *Belfast Weekly News*.<sup>716</sup> A useful illustrative example for this is the Coronation Oath, covered at length in previous chapters. In June of 1910 alone, the Oath was mentioned 47 times

---

<sup>715</sup> See for example: *Belfast Weekly News* (8 September 1910).

<sup>716</sup> Delap, *The Freewoman*, periodical communities, and the feminist reading public', p. 268.

in different articles across the five issues of the paper.<sup>717</sup> In articles coming from Glasgow and as far afield as Winnipeg, the *Belfast Weekly News* helped to establish a tone of discussion which tended to the hysterical. Across such articles a context through which the changing of the Coronation Oath came to represent a frontal assault on Protestantism itself developed, refracting and strengthening the resolve of members of the Order to oppose it. This is not to suggest that the paper was the only aspect of Orange culture which served this function, and of course the pressure and support of a fraternal organisation such as the Order as a whole had a similar effect. But it is to highlight that, as with the feminist journals of Delap's study, the readers' community which developed around the *Belfast Weekly News* did more than simply provide a space to discuss Orange events or strengthen migrant ties to Ireland. Rather, it invested power into the goings on of the Orange Institution and provided an interpretive framework with which members might approach current events.

Crucially, as has been argued, that framework was accessible to those in Glasgow. Jim Macpherson has already done much excellent work in highlighting the diasporic networks of Orangeism extending from, but more importantly *into*, Scotland.<sup>718</sup> Indeed, it is clear from the evidence already presented here and the work of other scholars including McFarland and MacRaild that members, and particularly migrant members, of the Orange

---

<sup>717</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (2 June 1910) to *Belfast Weekly News* (30 June 1910).

<sup>718</sup> MacPherson, *Women and the Orange Order*, p. 100.

Order in Scotland retained a sense of themselves as part of an Orange diasporic community.<sup>719</sup> Graham Walker in his article on the Order in Scotland between the First and Second World War suggests migrants and their descendants in the Order maintained a Protestant Irish identity in the first decades of the twentieth century.<sup>720</sup> MacPherson even goes beyond migrants and suggests that Orangeism as a phenomenon requires the modification of the idea of diaspora to include those who were actively culturally connected to such communities, in this case through their membership of the Orange Order.<sup>721</sup> Even if this goes too far, the Orange Order in Scotland can usefully inform debates about the nature of Britain at the turn of the twentieth century, though. In particular, if Orange migrants from Ulster to Scotland, the vanguard of a United Kingdom, still considered themselves to be part of a diaspora, separated from the metropole of Belfast, it raises certain questions about unifying theories of British history.

In particular the recent revival of a 'four-nations' approach has suggested that there is a 'disjuncture between modern 'British' and 'national' narratives [which] is alive and well, with too few bodies of work concerned with both their multifaceted interplays and distinctive experiences.'<sup>722</sup> There is little in this to disagree with, and one might well seek to rebuff criticism by

---

<sup>719</sup> McFarland, 'The Loyal Orange Institution', p. 178.

<sup>720</sup> Graham Walker, 'The Orange Order in Scotland between the Wars', p. 178.

<sup>721</sup> MacPherson, *Women and the Orange Order*, p. 8.

<sup>722</sup> Naomi Lloyd-Jones and Margret Scull, 'Introduction', in Naomi Lloyd-Jones and Margret Scull (eds), *Four nations approaches to modern "British" history: a (dis)united kingdom?* (London, 2018), p. 5.

suggesting that such an approach does not seek to dispense with national distinctions. But it is nonetheless surely a rebuke to the hoped-for unifying undercurrents of such an approach that within an explicitly unionist construction like the Order, internal migrants within these isle maintained a diasporic identity. As Raphael Samuel noted of a similar trend of 1995, four-nations approaches to British history, where an increased focus and comparative methodology is utilised in examining Scotland, Ireland, and Wales alongside England, has often found its basis in constitutional disquiet rather than an urgently felt need for reform within the discipline.<sup>723</sup> The years after Samuel's editorial saw the creation of the Scottish Parliament at Holyrood, and an abatement in public interest saw the four-nations approach recede in prominence. Given the relatively recent campaign for Scottish independence, chaos over Brexit and the Irish Sea border and the promise of much future constitutional turmoil, it is perhaps unsurprising that four-nations history is experiencing something of a renaissance.<sup>724</sup>

Outside the scope of such debates, what is clear from examining the *Belfast Weekly News* and its readers during the third Home Rule crisis is that the

---

<sup>723</sup> Raphael Samuel, 'British dimensions: 'four nations history'' in *The Historical Workshop Journal* XL (1995), pp iii-xxii.

<sup>724</sup> Naomi Lloyd-Jones, 'Yes? Or no? Four nations or one?' in *History Today* LXV, no. 2 (2015), pp 22-25;

Daniel Travers and Paul Ward, 'Narrating Britain's war: a four nations and more approach to the people's war' in Manuel Braganca and P. D. Tame (eds), *The long aftermath: cultural legacies of Europe at war, 1936-2016* (New York, 2016), pp 77-95; Martin Mansergh, 'Home Rule in Ireland, an historical and political perspective on devolution' in Susan Finding, Philippe Cauvet and Moya Jones (eds), *"Unfinished business": governance and the four nations* (Bordeaux, 2011), pp 62-83.

paper acted as an artery for the flow of Orange culture. The paper drew in members of the Orange Order from across the globe and allowed them to connect with the events and people which made up the Institution. Together, these readers formed a kind of periodical or readers' community, which, as Delap has argued, extended beyond just a network of connectivity, but itself came to shape Orange identity, providing a framework for interpretation contained within the *Belfast Weekly News*. This in turn helped to foster and maintain the Orange diaspora, which itself existed within Scotland.

More than a centre for Orangeism in Scotland, in July of 1912, Glasgow became the centre of the Orange world. From 16 to 19 July, the city played host to the Sixteenth Triennial Council of Orangemen, where delegates from 'all parts of the British Empire and also from the United States' travelled to renew acquaintances and reaffirm the bonds of global solidarity within the Loyal Orange Institution.<sup>725</sup> The Triennial began with a banquet, where the Rev. David Ness welcomed delegates and assured Irish brethren of the Scottish Order's opposition to Home Rule. Various speeches followed, including an address by Robert Wallace, this time acting as the Grand President of the Triennial Council. In his speech the distinctions between the jurisdictions of the Grand Lodges of Ireland and Scotland are also evident. Wallace announced himself as a guest of the Scottish Order, and, in focusing

---

<sup>725</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report of proceedings of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland 1911-1912* (Glasgow, 1912), accessible at the offices of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, Olympia House, Glasgow, p. 66.

on the bonds of brotherhood between Ulster and Scotland, he necessarily separated the Order in those locations, highlighting their distinct national identities.

It is also interesting that the Triennial Council was received by the Glasgow Corporation during its session.<sup>726</sup> The Provost of Glasgow had agreed to host the Orangemen in recognition of their influence as a friendly society. Though in the event, the chairman, Bailie Paxton, gave rather lukewarm welcome in the Provost's absence, saying:

As a Corporation they never recognised anything in the way of party politics. (Hear, hear.) Personally, he believed that every well organised body that did something for the benefit of the people was entitled to recognition by the Corporation when within its gates.<sup>727</sup>

Reports suggest the Orangemen were nonetheless treated to a fine luncheon in the dining hall, but the absence of the Lord Provost himself from the event is conspicuous.<sup>728</sup> Perhaps he was unwilling to be personally associated with this 'Orange pow-wow' as the *Freeman's Journal* called it, even if the political weight of the Order in Glasgow made their invitation inevitable.<sup>729</sup> The event neatly encapsulates the complex social dynamics of Orangeism in Glasgow in this period, where the Order was welcomed into the halls of local government but its members were still kept at something of a distance, a nod to the still disreputable nature of Orangeism in Edwardian Scotland.

---

<sup>726</sup> Imperial Grand Orange Council of the World, *Report of the sixteenth triennial*, p. 9.

<sup>727</sup> *The Scotsman* (18 July 1912).

<sup>728</sup> *Belfast News-Letter* (18 July 1912).

<sup>729</sup> *Freeman's Journal* (18 July 1912).

Banquets appear to have been a substantial part of the business of the Triennial Council, but there was some time to discuss matters relating to the movement of Orangemen across the jurisdictions represented at the Council. In particular, Brother R.S.H. Noble was keen to impress on attendees the importance of facilitating the transfer of benefits from the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society to those emigrating from Ulster or Scotland. Eventually, the resolution of the issue was left to a committee formed of Bro. Holden of Liverpool, Bro. Woods of Glasgow and Sir James Stronge of Ireland.<sup>730</sup> That no one from outside Britain and Ireland volunteered for the sub-committee may be an indicator of their enthusiasm for the scheme, but there was no such reluctance from overseas members to stand for election. Six out of the 13 office-bearers elected that year came from outside Scotland or Ireland.<sup>731</sup> This and a substantial contribution to proceedings from the large Canadian delegation highlight that the Triennial at least attempted to function as a global enterprise. While its ability to oversee the day-to-day activity of Orangemen was understandably limited in this period, it represented, at the highest level, a commitment among Orangemen to enfranchise members of the Orange diaspora. To take one example, while the Council was unable to ensure the universal adoption of the lecture for Orange degrees, that is, progressing from the Orange to the Purple degree,

---

<sup>730</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report, 1911-1912*, p. 69.

<sup>731</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report, 1911-1912*, p. 69.

this was quickly passed over to discuss the grand achievements of the Order and its growing success as a global institution.<sup>732</sup>

David Fitzpatrick has argued that an inability to install international frameworks of management within the Order was 'characteristic of the intrinsic instability of fraternal networks'.<sup>733</sup> Indeed he goes as far as to say that the weakness of the central authority of Orangeism 'remains the most eloquent vindication of its democratic character.'<sup>734</sup> While this might be true, it perhaps misconstrues the real purpose of the Triennial Councils. Reading the accounts, banquets and sociability take far higher priority within the agenda than actual business, which was frequently left over to sub-committees. In Glasgow in 1912, for example, in the throes of the third Home Rule crisis, the entirety of Friday was given over to a cruise down the Clyde.<sup>735</sup> Visitors were treated to lunch and tea on the boat, a fine steamer, and the expenses of the excursion were paid for by the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland. The impression from the Triennial is not of an incompetent bureaucracy attempting to impose its will onto the rather disparate delegations of Orangemen, but rather of an extended social event which paid necessary lip service to the international administration of Orange affairs. At the Council, members of the Orange diaspora were welcomed into the fold as

---

<sup>732</sup> Imperial Grand Orange Council of the World, *Report of the sixteenth triennial*, p. 11.

<sup>733</sup> David Fitzpatrick, 'Exporting brotherhood', p. 279.

<sup>734</sup> Fitzpatrick, 'Exporting brotherhood', p. 279.

<sup>735</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report, 1911-1912*, p. 71.

familial relations, kept on good terms through an agenda packed with dining and socialising.

Such events were an important part of building the Orange community internationally. Like the *Belfast Weekly News*, the Council provided the Orange diaspora, or at least its leadership, with a space to gather and reinforce identity.

### **Concluding notes**

This chapter has again focused on the nature of the Orange Order in Glasgow and in Scotland more broadly. The first section focused specifically on the class composition of the Order in Scotland. Here, summarising and refining the arguments of several historians of Orangeism, it is clear that popular, and sometimes scholarly, representations of Orangeism as a labour aristocracy, or a vessel of marginal privilege, are incorrect. In particular, Eric Kaufmann's work on the Order convincingly demonstrates that even in Glasgow where petit-bourgeois and skilled workers were more present than in rural areas, Orangeism functioned to ally sections of the Protestant working class. This is surely significant. It combines with much of the research of this thesis, and in particular of chapter one, to suggest that in Britain and Ireland in the twentieth century, lay Orangeism was composed of a mixture of skilled and unskilled workers. When this is combined with

research on the Order in Canada of the same period, and what limited research as exists on Australasia, it hints that this cross-working-class alliance may be a universal feature of Orangeism. More research on the Orange Order across the globe will be required to verify this hypothesis, but it serves to highlight the utility of the comparative approach adopted in this thesis.

The second section of this chapter examined the phenomenon of Ulster or Irish immigration into the Scottish Order. Beyond this, it sought to highlight the utility of understanding the Order in Scotland as part of an Orange diaspora. Certainly immigration into the Order had a considerable effect on its composition and activity in Scotland. While patterns of migration meant that the leadership of Scottish Orangeism remained a more plebeian affair than its Irish counterpart, it is clear that the Irish identity these of migrants remained prominent. These bonds were maintained in Orange culture, but particularly through vessels like the *Belfast Weekly News*. The paper enabled the construction of a readers' community in Scotland and abroad which served to govern interpretation of current events of interest to Orangemen and women. Similarly, the sixteenth Triennial Meeting of the Grand Orange Council of the World which took place in Glasgow in 1912 allowed the Orange diaspora to gather, socialise and renew links of fellowship. Principally a social affair, any efforts to harmonise Orangeism across the globe proved unsuccessful. And it is in resolving this apparent contradiction between the identity of Irish migrants in Scotland and the distinctiveness and

independence of the Scottish Order discussed in the previous chapter that the idea of an Orange diaspora becomes especially useful. It is clear from the work of many scholars and from the evidence presented here that Scottish Orangeism was indelibly effected by Irish immigration at least until the Second World War. Those migrants brought with them links and traditions from Ulster and Belfast, but in Scotland joined a distinct culture within the Order. Together, they forged an identity which was both of Ulster and Scotland, and an Orangeism familiar but distinct from their counterparts across the Irish Sea. The final chapter of this thesis examines an especially important area of distinction between Scottish and Irish Orangeism in the Edwardian era, the prominence of women and children.

## **Chapter seven: women and children first**

This chapter addresses the prevalence of female and juvenile Orange lodges in Glasgow from 1910 to 1914. While they were relatively new formations, both emerging in 1909, the years of the third Home Rule crisis saw rapid growth.<sup>736</sup> The Orange Order itself has such masculine (macho, even) connotations that one might well ask why membership was extended to women and boys. This chapter uses a variety of evidence, including previously unpublished materials from the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland's archive, to explain their unexpected presence. The chapter also highlights what investigations of gender and childhood can tell us about Orangeism and popular conservative movements more widely in Scotland in the Edwardian era.<sup>737</sup>

This is the first academic study of the juvenile lodges of the Orange Order and through it much new ground is broken. It seems the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland sought not just to spread Orange ideology among a younger generation through the foundation of juvenile lodges, but beyond this, sought to raise young Orangemen in that tradition. By so doing, they hoped a new generation would come to respect the hierarchy of the Order, cementing the authority of the Grand Lodge following decades of damaging

---

<sup>736</sup> MacDonald, *To greet my Glasgow brethren*, p. 26.

<sup>737</sup> MacPherson, *Women and the Orange* (Manchester, 2016); MacPherson and MacRaid, 'Sisters of the brotherhood', pp 40-60.

schism. To do this, it was necessary to invest in the education of these young men and in these efforts the inter-generational tensions of the Edwardian era are revealed. The female order in Scotland is better studied than juvenile lodges, though this is not to say it has received a great deal of scholarly attention. Jim MacPherson has done much to provide an overview of the nature of women's Orangeism in Scotland across several essays and in his monograph dealing with female Orangeism across the British empire. This thesis builds on such work but focuses on the years immediately after the foundation of the female order. By so doing, detailed study is given to an emerging popular conservative organ for women in the years immediately prior to suffrage. In these years, Orangewomen were forced to tread a careful line between asserting their right to autonomy and alienating the men who held ultimate authority over their destiny within the Orange Institution. The prevalence and operation of both juvenile and female Orange lodges in Glasgow, then, reveals a great deal not just about Orangeism, but also about important and perhaps understudied aspects of Scottish society before the First World War.

### **Juvenile Orangeism: religion and reproduction**

Founded around a year before the beginning of the third Home Rule crisis, juvenile lodges in Scotland proved popular. By 1910, there were 46 in

operation across the country, rising to 65 by 1914.<sup>738</sup> Juvenile lodges varied significantly in size, but were generally composed of around 30 boys from eight to 16 years of age.<sup>739</sup> This juvenile order, such as it was, was remarkably concentrated in Glasgow, and in fact just under half of all the juvenile lodges operating in Scotland were in the Glasgow conurbation. This is significantly above what might be expected given the geographic distribution of adult lodges at the time.<sup>740</sup>

In chapter five the differing estimates of Orange membership were considered in greater detail. It was demonstrated that Kaufmann's detailed statistical analysis likely provides a low estimate of membership, but even utilising his work, it seems that by the end of 1913 there were almost 2000 juvenile members of the Orange Order in Scotland.<sup>741</sup> Previous chapters of this thesis have also considered the tensions between respectability and the often riotous heart of Orangeism. Frequently this manifested itself in a struggle between local private lodges and the Grand Lodge of the Order.<sup>742</sup> In Scotland, the desire for local autonomy and agency among members competed against the efforts of the Grand Lodge of Scotland to impose an organisation-wide culture of discipline. Fresh after a decades-long schism beginning in 1857 and caused by the secession of various lodges across

---

<sup>738</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (6 January 1910) and (29 January 1914).

<sup>739</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report, 1911-1912*, p. 18.

<sup>740</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report, 1914-1915*, pp 23-57.

<sup>741</sup> Kaufmann, *Orange Order Data*, SN 1007.

<sup>742</sup> This tension persists into the present. See: Webster, *The religion of Orange politics*, pp 58-64.

'Glasgow, Partick, Greenock and Ayrshire' from the Grand Lodge of Scotland, it led the Grand Lodge to prioritise expanding its influence and sphere of control from the end of the nineteenth century. Elaine McFarland concludes the episode likely had more to do with the politics of personality than some deeper rooted division, but that said, the challenge it posed to the authority of the Grand Lodge and the failure to resolve the schism for two decades surely weighed on the minds of those within the Orange hierarchy.<sup>743</sup> Perhaps, then, it was partially as a result of this wider struggle that the Grand Lodge created the juvenile order.

Through the juvenile order, the Grand Lodge could ensure the forthcoming generation of Orangemen were better brought up to respect and replicate the systems of authority within the Institution. At its heart, this was the same process which sociologist Pierre Bourdieu has observed in the French education system. 'Education was, he suggested, a field which reproduced itself more than others and those social agents who occupied dominant positions were deeply imbued with its practices and discourses.'<sup>744</sup> Beyond the realms of formal education, the Grand Lodge sought to produce a scheme of Orange education in which members of the juvenile order would be taught, and would then come to reproduce, systems of internal discipline and authority. This would thus resolve one of the major tensions at the heart

---

<sup>743</sup> McFarland, 'The Loyal Orange Institution', p. 109.

<sup>744</sup> Patricia Thomson, 'Field', in Michael Grenfell (ed.), *Pierre Bourdieu, key concepts* (Stocksfield, 2008), p. 76.

of Orangeism as they saw it: the tension between respectability and hooliganism.

This respect for authority, sorely lacking among some adult lodges, was to be grown from, and sustained by, the Christian canon. Juvenile members would be taught the virtue of respect in the rules of the Institution, rules which were themselves 'founded on the Bible'.<sup>745</sup> Addressing Number 26 Juvenile Lodge in Glasgow, Worshipful Master Dawson was a pains to stress that 'the future welfare of the Order' was in the hands of the juveniles, and that only through taking to heart their motto, 'fear God, honour the King, love the Brotherhood', would it be secure. Putting to one side the admonishing tone of this motto, throughout Dawson's address, and in innumerable similar speeches given at the social events of juvenile lodges, the themes of respect and discipline are emphasised.<sup>746</sup> Respect for the father, however defined, was paramount in the instruction of young Orangemen.

Looking more closely at the structure of juvenile lodges from the period, one is struck by the way in which it almost exactly mirrored the form of their senior counterparts. Within the lodge, each position; worshipful master, secretary, etc., was identical to senior lodges, and would be filled by one of

---

<sup>745</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (29 January 1914).

<sup>746</sup> *Ibid.*

the juvenile members.<sup>747</sup> The only differences were an adult 'superintendent', a title hinting at the Presbyterian influences which weighed upon the Order in Scotland, and an additional external treasurer to ensure proper accounts were maintained. By so duplicating the structure of the senior Order, juvenile lodges ensured that through repetitive practice boys were ingratiated into Orange culture. When the time came at 16 to move to an adult lodge, each boy would be familiar with the customs and practices of the Order, indeed these practices would have become a part of their own cultural identity.<sup>748</sup> Additionally, many of the boys would have been trained in the positions of the lodge, those of master, secretary, chaplain etc., thus providing a reservoir of experience, and discipline, for adult lodges. In this there are obvious and important parallels with the role of Sunday Schools in shaping religious and political education in Britain across the nineteenth and early twentieth century. In the religious sense, Callum Brown has stressed that Sunday School attendance serves as an important metric for measuring the religiosity of British society. Brown emphasises their place within the routine of the working-class week at the beginning of the twentieth century, using Stirling as an example.<sup>749</sup> Beyond this, though, he demonstrates that in the years of the third Home Rule crisis around 75 percent of Scottish children attended a

---

<sup>747</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report, 1909-1910*, p. 66;  
Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Juvenile lodge ritual, 1905* (Glasgow, 1905), accessible at the offices of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, Olympia House, Glasgow, p. 7.

<sup>748</sup> K.D.M. Snell, 'The Sunday-School movement in England and Wales: child labour, denominational control and working-class culture', in *Past and Present* CLXIV, no. 1 (1999), pp 122-167.

<sup>749</sup> C.G. Brown, *The death of Christian Britain: understanding secularisation 1800-2000* (London, 2001), p. 140.

Presbyterian Sunday School.<sup>750</sup> This leads to three important points. The first is that Scottish children and particularly those who came to join the juvenile order had a significant and sustained religious education. Secondly, and resultantly, the function of juvenile lodges was consequently familiar to the participants and the organisers of such lodges. Third, it functioned to cement Presbyterian faith and culture into these young men. As K.D.M. Snell puts it: ‘without entering into the more cynical interpretations, it is possible to draw lessons from this on the role of religion in inculcating values’ among participants.<sup>751</sup> With spiritual roots (‘train up a child in the way he should go: and when he is old, he will not depart from it’) it is perhaps unsurprising that churches began Sunday Schools, but their activity also had unintended consequences.<sup>752</sup> Notably, the creation of a network of so called Socialist Sunday Schools at the beginning of the twentieth century.<sup>753</sup> At the height of their popularity in the mid-1920s, an estimated 6000 children were in regular attendance at Socialist Sunday Schools across Britain.<sup>754</sup> Jessica Gerrard argues convincingly that such schools were able to ‘co-opt religious culture in the enactment of the ideals and ethics of socialism for children.’<sup>755</sup> It seems reasonable to suggest, then, that juvenile lodges performed a similar function in this period, albeit with a focus on Orange theology and practice.

---

<sup>750</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 168.

<sup>751</sup> Snell, ‘The Sunday-School movement in England and Wales’, p. 168.

<sup>752</sup> *Proverbs* 22/6.

<sup>753</sup> Fred Reid, ‘Socialist Sunday Schools in Britain, 1892–1939’, *International Review of Social History* XI, no. 1 (1966), pp 18–47.

<sup>754</sup> Jessica Gerrard, ‘Little soldiers’ for socialism: childhood and socialist politics in the British socialist Sunday school movement’, in *International Review of Social History* LVIII, no. 1 (2013), p. 72.

<sup>755</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 93.

More than simply serving a reproductive function, though, the creation of a system of Orange education allowed the Grand Lodge of Scotland to emphasise its own position at the top of Scottish Orangeism. As with Bourdieu's analysis, an education of this kind was also an effort at control. Through the inculcation of Orange doctrine, through ceremony and ritual at meetings, the Grand Lodge attempted to exert influence over the boys and preserve familial and organisational hierarchies in an effort to ensure that senior figures in the Order were afforded suitable respect from their juniors. Thus, in the absorption, repetition and performance of Orange identity, juveniles were able to be reared into Orangeism and instilled with the characteristics which were prized by the Grand Lodge of Scotland, even at a time of generational social upheaval.<sup>756</sup> In further illustrating this, it is useful to take the case of Mathew Muldoon who, aged eight, entered into the Orange Hall at 11 Causeyside Street, Paisley, on 9 April 1912, and was initiated into Juvenile Loyal Orange Lodge Number 1.

---

<sup>756</sup> There seems to be a relative paucity of academic literature on childhood in Scotland in the years preceding the First World War. Janay Nugent and Elizabeth Ewan (eds), *Children and youth in premodern Scotland* (Woodbridge, Boydell & Brewer, 2015), does an admirable job for an earlier period and some oral history works including Lynn Jaimeson and Claire Toynbee (eds), *Country bairns: growing up 1900-1930* (Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1992) offer insightful case studies into particular aspects of childhood, but for wider accounts of the period and its tensions it is necessary to turn to a distinctly English historiography, see: James Walvin, *A child's world: a social history of English childhood, 1800-1914* (London, 1982) and Thea Vigne, *Edwardian childhoods* (Routledge, London, 1977).

To gain membership of the Lodge, Muldoon was made to repeat and swear to a 'covenant'.<sup>757</sup> Clearly evoking the Scottish Covenanters of three centuries before, the words and act evidences the level of solemnity involved in this ceremony.<sup>758</sup> In their covenant, Mathew and his brethren pledged to uphold the duties to the Order, to obey the instructions of the Superintendent, and to 'promote friendship and love among members.'<sup>759</sup> After which, the Superintendent would summon each boy to him, and would list their duties, before the candidates would accept. While it is easy to cast aspersions at images of reverent children in Orange sashes, instead the ceremony should be taken earnestly. Such oaths exist after all in the scouting movement, often swearing to the same flag.

The duties and the roles filled by boys like Mathew inside of a lodge were wide ranging. The inner door guard was given responsibility for ensuring non-members were not allowed to intrude; the worthy chaplain was charged with 'the devotional exercises' of the lodge and to see to it that these were 'performed in a becoming manner, as Christian boys should perform their devotions.'<sup>760</sup> While the secretary or worthy master perhaps had more demanding roles inside the juvenile lodge system, it is the elevation of a boy

---

<sup>757</sup> Juvenile Loyal Orange Lodge Number 1, *Bi-monthly reports*, 9 April 1912; Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Juvenile lodge ritual*, 1905, p. 13.

<sup>758</sup> James Coleman, 'The Scottish Covenanters', in Gareth Atkins (ed.), *Making and remaking saints in nineteenth-century Britain* (Manchester, 2016), p. 189; I.B. Cowan, 'The Covenanters: a revision article', in *The Scottish Historical Review* XLVII, no. 143 (1968), pp 35-52. For Covenanters in contemporary Scottish Orangeism see: Webster, *The religion of Orange politics*, pp 42-43.

<sup>759</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Juvenile lodge ritual*, 1905, p. 13.

<sup>760</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 14.

to a chaplain which is most striking.<sup>761</sup> Without exaggerating their responsibilities, by investing any level of religious authority onto a child, one begins to understand that there existed within the Scottish Order a lay-led approach to theology and a palpable desire to ensure that this Protestant ethos was imbued by the next generation of Orangemen.

It is interesting to note, too, that the existence of juvenile lodges marks a point of distinction between the Order in Ireland and in England and Scotland in this period. In addition to this, when examining records of scripture readings in juvenile lodges in Scotland, there is a clear emphasis on the Old Testament, and on the Book of Judges therein. Without more specific details and a wider primary source base, it is not possible to wholly assess the significance of such readings, but when contextualised within the fierce biblical literalism of the senior Order in Scotland, they contribute to the argument that there were theological distinctions between the Order in Scotland and in Ireland. Yet, as with the older generations of the Order in both areas, this theology was aggressive in its opposition to the Roman Catholic Church.

Nearing the end of the initiation, Muldoon along with all new members of a juvenile lodge received the same speech from a worthy past master of the

---

<sup>761</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 15.

lodge. They were instructed to learn from the Bible, but to be especially wary of 'false teachers'.<sup>762</sup> It continued:

The Church of Rome stands forth as an institution which has in the past done more mischief in the persecuting of God's children and in destroying doctrines of the Bible than all other agencies combined. It has caused Bibles to be burned by thousands, and has tortured and persecuted in all ages those who have stood for an open Bible and liberty of conscience and of worship. Against this inquisitous [sic] system our fathers protested, and because of their so doing were called Protestants.<sup>763</sup>

Aside from its anti-Catholic content, this quotation, repeated at every new induction, speaks to a theology instilled into the next generation of Orangemen. It describes liberty and Protestantism as beset by forces which seek to pervert or destroy it. More than that, it would have fallen long ago to the persecution of the Catholic Church were it not for the strength of their fathers. In so doing, the deeds of Protestant resistance are mythologised, as in the case of the Siege of Derry, in order to reinforce a militant Protestant religiosity among young members of the Order.<sup>764</sup> Orange religiosity in Belfast was discussed extensively in chapter four, but it is perhaps worth emphasising some small but significant distinctions in theology between Belfast and Glasgow. For unlike Belfast, in Glasgow and Scotland there was no external majority to threaten Protestant supremacy.

---

<sup>762</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 7.

<sup>763</sup> *Ibid.*, pp 7-8.

<sup>764</sup> McBride, *The siege of Derry*, p. 70.

If an Ulster unionist siege mentality was forged in the distorted retelling of history, but was based upon the presence of a very real Catholic majority on the island of Ireland, then it is clear this mentality would need some adaptation in its application in Scotland.<sup>765</sup> Ergo, rather than an imminent Roman threat of disloyalty to the crown, or the imposition of Home Rule, the Order's sectarianism in Scotland was directed almost exclusively toward Catholicism as representative of an external and existential theological threat, but one which was at least being held at bay in the country. What is remarkable here is that Orange sources from the period are devoid of the anti-Irish immigrant sentiment of the Presbyterian Church in Scotland.<sup>766</sup> Clearly the targets of Orange anti-Catholicism in Scotland were likely to be part of the Irish-Catholic diaspora, but it seems likely too that the Order's own immigrant roots in the country ensured that at the turn of the century the Orange Order as a body could not condemn immigration from Ireland.<sup>767</sup> In this sense the anti-Catholicism of the Order and juvenile order at this point fits neatly within what Claire Gheeraert-Graffeulle and Geraldine Vaughan

---

<sup>765</sup> O'Leary, *A Treatise on Northern Ireland*, Vol. I, pp 143-144.

<sup>766</sup> John Wolffe, *God and Greater Britain: religion and national life in Britain and Ireland, 1843-1945* (London, 1994), p. 144;

S.J. Brown, 'Outside the Covenant': the Scottish Presbyterian churches and Irish immigration, 1922-1938', in *The Innes Review* XLII, no. 1 (Spring, 1991), pp 19-45;

D.L. Ritchie, 'They do not become good Scotsmen': a political history of the anti-Irish campaign in Scotland, 1919-1939', (Unpublished PhD Thesis, University of Glasgow, 1986), pp 7-9.

<sup>767</sup> Of a slightly different form, a similar disjuncture between anti-Irish sentiment and anti-Popery occurred with the Protestant Action party in Edinburgh in the interwar period. See: Michael Rosie, 'Protestant Action and the Edinburgh Irish', in M.J. Mitchell (ed.), *New Perspectives on the Irish in Scotland* (Edinburgh, 2008), pp 145-158.

Enda Delaney has also highlighted that anti-Irish sentiment in Scotland intensified in the inter-war period amidst a context of economic depression, which might go some way to explaining its absence in Orange sources immediately before the First World War. See: Enda Delaney, *Demography, state and society: Irish migration to Britain, 1921-1971* (Liverpool, 2000), p. 85.

have termed anti-Popery Catholicism.<sup>768</sup> Regrettably, it fits rather less well into Jonathan Wolffe's popular quadrupedal model, though Wolffe himself highlights that his distinctions are analytically useful tools rather than immovable boundaries.<sup>769</sup>

Whatever the case, if members of the Orange Order were engaged in a daily and often physical struggle against Catholicism and Irish nationalism in Ulster, this was not the same in Glasgow.<sup>770</sup> While tenets were shared, much of the Scottish Order's work was simply in maintaining rather than defending Protestant supremacy. Indeed, and as Elaine McFarland observed, the Order stressed that through a strong commitment to Protestantism and the hierarchy of the Order, continued political security in Scotland would be guaranteed.<sup>771</sup> The utility in reproducing this mentality through the Orange Order's juvenile lodges then becomes clear. Mathew Muldoon was invited into a site of reproduction which also served to fortify identity and bind young Protestant men into Orangeism.

---

<sup>768</sup> Claire Gheeraert-Graffeuille and Geraldine Vaughan, 'The Catholic "Other"', in Claire Gheeraert-Graffeuille and Geraldine Vaughan (eds), *Anti-Catholicism in Britain and Ireland, 1600–2000* (Basingstoke, 2020), p. 3.

<sup>769</sup> John Wolffe, 'A comparative historical categorisation of anti-Catholicism', in *Journal of Religious History* XXXIX, no. 2 (2015), pp 182-202.

<sup>770</sup> Geraldine Vaughan, following Donald MacRaild, has argued that the anti-Catholic violence involving the Order decreased from the end of the nineteenth century up until the interwar period. See: Vaughan, *The 'local' Irish*, p. 47.

<sup>771</sup> In its political manifestation with Conservative Party, see: McFarland, *Protestants first*, p. 200.

## The juvenile order: social activity

To serve this function, though, it was necessary for the juvenile order to attract members to its events. A work in progress for much of the early twentieth century, even by 1910 members of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland were aware of the need to incorporate a social element into otherwise dry proceedings. The capacity of juvenile lodges to work in this way was enhanced by the rapid creation of wider Orange youth networks inside Scotland, with social visits to other juvenile lodges a common feature, and by the visit and leading of activities by Orange elders at the close of meetings.<sup>772</sup> Most often a deputation from a female lodge would lead such activities, and doubtless song, story and cake provided much of the initial motivation for juvenile attendance.<sup>773</sup> This, mixed with a healthy supply of different prizes awarded to regular attendees, helped ensure participation.<sup>774</sup> Similarly, the monthly reports of the Grand Lodge detail that across Scotland juvenile lodges held gala days at which entertainment was laid on to attract new members.<sup>775</sup> Other popular social events included ceremonies such as the unfurling of a new juvenile lodge banner. Neil Jarman has written extensively on such events in Ireland, but it is worth noting that they occurred for Scottish juvenile lodges too.<sup>776</sup> One such ceremony was held by Parker Memorial Juvenile Loyal Orange Lodge Number 43 who in July of 1914

---

<sup>772</sup> An element of competition was also introduced with prizes given for the largest lodge in each section, and the largest growth in membership

<sup>773</sup> Juvenile Loyal Orange Lodge Number 1, *Bi-monthly minutes* (16 October 1912).

<sup>774</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (20 January 1910).

<sup>775</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Monthly reports*, 5 October 1910.

<sup>776</sup> Jarman, *Displaying faith*, p. 6.

unveiled their new banner. The celebration was led by a Mrs Elliot, wife of the District Secretary, who received a pair of silver scissors from the boys by way of thanks.<sup>777</sup> A robust attendance and prompt payment of membership dues had allowed the boys to purchase their banner, and by so doing to participate in Orangeism's most public ritual, the Twelfth of July parade. Following the unfurling, 37 members of the Lodge were presented with book prizes in recognition of the regular attendance which had allowed this feat.

The Twelfth of July parade, usually held a week before the actual day in Scotland, is an enduring and prominent feature of Orangeism to this day. The ability of juvenile lodges to participate in this parade was important not just because it allowed young members to feel a part of wider Orangeism, but because it helped translate participation in the Orange Order, and the adoption of its attendant identity, into something physical. As juvenile lodges marched alongside senior brethren, they were able to participate in Orangeism's most visible expression and become accustomed to the practice of dominating public space.<sup>778</sup> In this junior parading, these lodges merit comparison with the Boys' Brigades which was popular in Scotland at this time. Ewen Cameron has argued William Smith created the Boys' Brigade in 1883 as 'a youth organisation with Protestant, muscular and militaristic overtones with the objective of inculcating discipline, orderliness and

---

<sup>777</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (2 July 1914).

<sup>778</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Juvenile lodge ritual*, 1905, p. 14.

neatness in unruly boys'.<sup>779</sup> Here there are clear parallels with the juvenile order. Alongside similar martial features in their parading traditions, it seems that in social activities both organisations also promoted sports and a general vitality in boys and young men. These traits were key in developing a physical and youthful commitment to imperialism.<sup>780</sup> Indeed, the Boy's Brigade and the juvenile order were a part of a wider flourishing of youth movements in Scotland at the turn of the twentieth century which often came with ideological components attached. As Sarah-Anne Buckley and Susannah Riordan have written with regard to Ireland: 'Certainly, by the beginning of the twentieth century, children's leisure had become highly politicised. The comic a boy (in particular) read, like the sport he played or the youth movement he joined, defined him as a nationalist or an imperialist'.<sup>781</sup>

In a clear example of this commitment, in January of 1910 the Kinning Park Protestant Boys Juvenile Loyal Orange Lodge were treated to lecture by a Captain O'Wyatt on the 'South African War'. Open to members and non-members alike, the lecture spanned most of the evening, with O'Wyatt running through a series of slides and explaining the pictures. Without a more detailed description of the event, it is not possible to reconstruct exactly the ground which would have been covered.<sup>782</sup> Despite this, though, the lecture

---

<sup>779</sup> Cameron, *Impaled upon a thistle*, p. 146.

<sup>780</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (30 July 1914).

<sup>781</sup> Sarah-Anne Buckley and Susannah Riordan, 'Childhood since 1740', in Eugenio Biagini and Mary Daly (eds), *The Cambridge social history of modern Ireland* (Cambridge, 2017), p. 335.

<sup>782</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (20 January 1910).

spoke not just to the imperialist yearnings of the Orange Order, but also to its ties with Conservatism. Despite wide social divide on the issue of the Boer War, it seems the Order were happy to promote its glories.<sup>783</sup> This valorisation of martial prowess and empire was common in the Order but was by no means exclusive to it in the years of the third Home Rule crisis. Where the juvenile order perhaps differed from institutions like the Boys' Brigade, and indeed Baden-Powell's Scouting movement, was that, despite its militaristic connotations, the juveniles retained a reputation for public disorder.<sup>784</sup> Nonetheless, it is surely not a coincidence that the juvenile order enjoyed increasing success in Scotland alongside the Boys' Brigade and a 'plethora of ad hoc youth clubs and organisations' more generally which were devoted to the 'proper', however defined, education of the young.<sup>785</sup> Indeed, a great many popular conservative organisations also made efforts to expand or create youth networks at this time, reaping the rewards of this organising after the First World War.<sup>786</sup> In what I.G.C. Hutchinson termed 'the two master strokes of Unionist organisation', in Scotland unionists and conservatives began to take advantage of the potential offered by women and children as activists.<sup>787</sup> Hutchinson points to the interwar period as the

---

<sup>783</sup> For a summary of the war's reception in Britain up to the present, see: Peter Donaldson, *Remembering the South African War: Britain and the memory of the Anglo-Boer War, from 1899 to present* (Liverpool, 2013), pp 1-10.

<sup>784</sup> *Glasgow Herald* (8 July 1912);

Sam Pryke, 'The popularity of nationalism in the early British boy scout movement', in *Social History* XXIII, no. 3 (1998), p. 323.

<sup>785</sup> Cameron, *Impaled upon a thistle*, p. 146.

<sup>786</sup> Jackson, *The two unions*, pp 246-247.

<sup>787</sup> I.G.C. Hutchinson, 'Scottish Unionism between the two world wars', in C.M.M. MacDonald (ed.), *Unionist Scotland, 1800-1997* (Edinburgh, 1998), p. 74.

crucial era of this organising, but it seems reasonable to suggest it had a successful beginning before the outbreak of the First World War.<sup>788</sup>

The minutes of the Primrose League in Scotland during this period recorded that 'the various Junior Branches as they are to be called in future, in Scotland have attained a marked measure of success.'<sup>789</sup> The Junior Imperialist League likewise enjoyed a similar expansion at this time, though they addressed a slightly older age group.<sup>790</sup> The collective movement of these organs towards youth engagement during the Edwardian era speaks to the generational changes which British and Irish society underwent at this time. But more specifically, they show an interconnectedness between organisations involved in Scottish popular conservative politics. The Orange Order did not stand themselves alone in Scotland, and rather, existed as one strand in a veritable spider's web of popular pro-empire, conservative and Protestant organisations. Even if this did not translate into mass support for the Conservative and Unionist Party, such networks challenge sweeping portrayals of Liberal hegemony in Scotland. Their shared objective in cultivating youth wings was motivated by the function of social reproduction of which Bourdieu spoke, but also derived from a desire to ensure stability across the generations. Amongst a generational realignment, it was essential

---

<sup>788</sup> Ibid., pp 75-76.

<sup>789</sup> Primrose League, Scottish Branch, 1885-1920: Grand Council (Scotland), *Minutebook*, no. 2. 1913, accessible at the National Library of Scotland: Acc. 10424/2, p. 386.

<sup>790</sup> Glasgow Conservative and Glasgow Unionist Associations, a series of unbound reports, 1888-1941, *Report 1911*, accessible at the National Library of Scotland, Acc. 10424/26 (ii), p. 3.

that religious and conservative organisations imbedded young men into their own organisational cultures and hierarchies.

### **The juvenile order: education**

To achieve their aim the Grand Lodge of Scotland had to ensure that the juvenile order could keep pace with the increasing standards of literacy among a new generation of state educated boys. In this, it seems the Order had difficulty in attracting superintendents of sufficient quality to implement their vision. As James Rice implored his brethren in his annual report:

Let me urge upon you the necessity for appointing good, earnest, intelligent superintendents for the juvenile lodges. Let it not be thought that any adult brother is good enough as superintendent. The boys of to-day are better educated than the average men of to-day, and you require in order to train the boys properly, to appoint your best and most intelligent workers as Superintendents. [...] I feel strongly on this matter.<sup>791</sup>

Rice here speaks of the context in which the juvenile lodges operated in Edwardian Scotland, as increasing education levels among young people had a profound influence on the dynamics of youth association and on their interaction with the older and less educated generation above them. But he further speaks to the class-composition of Orange activists in Scotland and Glasgow, through implication, when he assesses the poor levels of education which most Orange Order members possessed. Perhaps this shift in the power between generations, between educated and uneducated working-

---

<sup>791</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report, 1909-10*, p. 66.

class men is part of the reason that the Order was compelled to improve and expand its own educational systems at this time. Rice returns to the theme in later reports, but we should also be wary of exaggerating these differences into a site of conflict, and so misunderstand the issue as some kind of profound crisis for the juvenile order.<sup>792</sup>

Far from disparaging the educational achievements of Orangeism, throughout the years of the third Home Rule crisis, the Order made an active effort to associate itself with learning, be it, as has been shown, in contesting school board elections, or in sponsoring prizes. As Elaine McFarland has noted, the Order sponsored a series of 'Orange essay prizes' in schools which were awarded for the best essays written on the subject of Protestantism.<sup>793</sup> Clearly speaking to the longstanding association of Presbyterianism and education in Scotland, the Order also routinely gave out books as prizes to juvenile lodge participants. At one event in Paisley in 1910, members of Juvenile Lodge Number 15 received no less than 140 books and bibles.<sup>794</sup>

In the same year as Rice made his complaint, C.L. Bryon, Chief Superintendent, suggested that the juvenile order's progress was 'very satisfactory'. He went on to detail that in his visits to lodge meetings, he had

---

<sup>792</sup> See below.

<sup>793</sup> McFarland, 'The Loyal Orange Institution', p. 248.

<sup>794</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (10 March 1910).

been 'deeply impressed by the manner in which the juveniles conduct their own affairs, (always under the personal supervision of their adult superintendent.)'<sup>795</sup> This he attributed not simply to the calibre of the boys involved, but also to the 'superintendents' conferences.'<sup>796</sup> These events were used to educate and improve the function of superintendents and illustrate that the juvenile lodge system was, at times, well supported by the Order in Scotland. Bryon pointed to clearer indications of the juveniles' success, too, as in the same year they had organised a separate 'church parade' for their members. Though officiated by an older member of the Order and facilitated by superintendents, it shows a significant level of autonomy and self-organisation was exercised by the juvenile order in these years.<sup>797</sup> In closing his report, Bryon suggested more resources be devoted to the training of superintendents and advocated for the creation of a subcommittee of the Grand Lodge, which might greatly extend the 'usefulness' of the juveniles. This was granted, and its results quickly materialised, with one lodge in Rutherglen growing by 88 members from 1910 to 1911.<sup>798</sup>

However, it appears that this success was short lived. In each report for the next three years James Rice complained about progress, repeatedly linking supposed stagnation with the lack of education of the Order's

---

<sup>795</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report, 1909-10*, p. 69.

<sup>796</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>797</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>798</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report of proceedings, 1911-1912*, p. 61.

superintendents.<sup>799</sup> In his report of 1912-1913, Rice criticised the inactivity of the Grand Lodge of Scotland on the issue, and in particular the grand superintendents.<sup>800</sup> He suggested it was not the quality of the candidate but their application which was at fault and hoped for 'better and more energetic work from the newly appointed superintendent, Bro. Grant' in 1913.<sup>801</sup> His only thinly veiled criticism of fellow senior officers in the Grand Lodge, including C.L. Bryon, reveals the extent of Rice's commitment to the cause of juvenile lodges, but it also speaks to a culture of disagreement in the Scottish Order which is absent in records of the Grand Lodge of Ireland. Continuing in the same vein, in his report for 1914-1915, Rice suggested that most lodges were 'mere skeletons of what they ought to be'.<sup>802</sup> This time in his reasoning he argued that juvenile meetings were failing to attract boys as a result of their repetitive nature. He argued instead that they must be made fun 'as there are so many places of amusement, picture houses, etc., open to boys at a nominal cost.'<sup>803</sup> Despite the efforts of lodges mentioned above to include social events into their would-be curricula, Rice still felt that there was more to be done. If juvenile lodges were to become better attended then they needed to offer something to compete with such amenities. But by so doing, would this not undermine their purpose?

---

<sup>799</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report of proceeding, 1911-1912*, p. 64;  
Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report, 1912-1913*, p. 68;  
Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report, 1913-1914*, p. 16.

<sup>800</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report, 1912-1913*, p. 68.

<sup>801</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>802</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report, 1914-1915*, p. 96.

<sup>803</sup> *Ibid.*

In a limited sense, perhaps. But in reality, their senior counterparts had long understood the necessity of merging sociable practices, including drinking, with the business of the lodge in order to keep their membership engaged. In this, the juveniles were merely following suit and adapting to the rapidly changing context of youth activity in the Edwardian era as new forms of entertainment began to emerge and encroach upon their recruitment. In Rice's proposals the flexibility of the Order in adapting its practices and culture to changing circumstances is again visible. Increasingly, it seems clear that Orangeism should be understood not simply as a reactionary and obstinate social construction but as an, admittedly conservative, association capable of remarkable flexibility.

Rice's suggestions for reforming juvenile lodge meetings included a far reaching program of entertainment, employing musicians and other entertainers.<sup>804</sup> Above all, though, Rice was determined that the skills of female members should be better employed. Illustrating this point in his 1914/15 report, he gave the example of one juvenile lodge which had been languishing:

The Lodge was dormant when the district officials appealed to the members of their female lodges. The result was very gratifying. The Sisters were glad to be asked, they threw themselves heartily into the work, and a splendid, flourishing juvenile lodge is now looking forward to lifting the Challenge Shield next year.<sup>805</sup>

---

<sup>804</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>805</sup> *Ibid.*

This transformation is revealing. It highlights that Orangewomen made a contribution which extended beyond the lazy stereotype of Orangewomen as 'tea-ladies'.<sup>806</sup> But beyond this, it is important to note that such involvement as they had with the juvenile order was still contained within the respectably feminine domains of childcare and, more restrictedly, education. In as much as any contribution to the male dominated space of the Order is significant, the areas in which women were allowed to contribute were still often curtailed by gender norms.<sup>807</sup> Indeed, despite the involvement of women in the juvenile program, a delineation of gender roles within the Order remained significant. In 1912, a motion to the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland to incorporate girls into the juvenile system, 'making them mixed, same as Bands of Hope, or Juvenile Templars, or Sons of Rechab', was defeated by a margin of two to one.<sup>808</sup> Despite the importance of the juvenile order in promoting the next generation of Orangeism, some lines it appears could not be crossed.

In sum, if, despite their rapid growth, juvenile lodges had mixed fortunes from 1910 to 1914, then at least their purpose was clear. The significance of the venture is apparent in the repeated efforts of James Rice and others within the Grand Lodge to ensure their success. For if the juvenile lodges proved fruitful, they would guarantee the future of Orangeism in Scotland. Beyond

---

<sup>806</sup> See: Rachel Ward, *Women, unionism and loyalty in Northern Ireland: from tea-makers to political actors* (Dublin, 2006).

<sup>807</sup> See below.

<sup>808</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report, 1911-1912*, p. 18.

this, though, their educative function also served as a method by which the Grand Lodge sought to enforce and reproduce their world view among an increasingly educated youth exposed to a new and emerging youth culture. But what of the women of the Orange Order, who were employed to facilitate this process? Beyond their aiding juvenile lodges, in the years from 1910 to 1914, the female order, such as it was, thrived and in the process redefined the very nature of Scottish Orangeism.

### **The female order and popular conservatism**

From their inception in 1909 female lodges became increasingly important to Scottish Orangeism.<sup>809</sup> Throughout the rest of this chapter, these lodges together are referred to as the women's order, or female order, but it is worth stressing at this stage that there existed no formal female infrastructure between lodges during the third Home Rule crisis. In practice, this meant each lodge came under the jurisdiction of a district lodge or the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, a point which will be returned to later. In the beginning, though, that same Grand Lodge was hesitant about women's involvement and on the principle of women's Orangeism more generally. It took a Mrs Dorothy Wilson and her daughter Harriot being initiated in the

---

<sup>809</sup> MacPherson stresses the first female lodges existed in Scotland forty years before this, but it was only in 1909 that a stable and continual presence was created: MacPherson, 'The emergence of women's Orange lodges in Scotland', pp 53-54.

north of England and returning to Glasgow in 1908 to kick-start female lodges north of the Tweed.<sup>810</sup>

Indeed, as Jim MacPherson and Donald MacRaild have demonstrated, women's Orangeism in the north of England significantly predates its counterpart in Scotland, with 49 female lodges in operation in the north of England in 1910.<sup>811</sup> By comparison, after establishing the first female lodge in 1909, there were 18 in Scotland by 1910, with at least 224 members between them.<sup>812</sup> This rapid growth continued such that the Scottish Order had eclipsed the north of England by 1914. While only four new lodges were founded in the latter locale across the whole of the third Home Rule crisis, in Scotland, 37 new lodges had been formed in that time. This meant that by the beginning of the First World War, female membership had risen to at least 1761 in Scotland and thus held a significant stake in Scottish Orangeism.<sup>813</sup> This expansion continued after the war, and coupled with waning male membership, meant that by 1931 there were more female members than male members in the Scottish Order.<sup>814</sup> While this surprising state of affairs existed only briefly, the work of Eric Kaufmann and Jim MacPherson in bringing it to light highlights not simply the importance of the

---

<sup>810</sup> Macpherson and MacRaild, 'Sisters of the brotherhood', p. 59.

<sup>811</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 47.

<sup>812</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report, 1910-1911*, pp 25-56.

<sup>814</sup> Kaufmann, *Orange Order Data*, SN 1007.

<sup>814</sup> Kaufmann, *Orange Order Data*, SN 1007.

women's order, but also the relative poverty of the historiography up to that point, which had all but ignored the existence of Orangewomen.<sup>815</sup>

In his 1973 article, Brian Harrison put out a call for a labour history which included popular conservatism. In it he declared:

labour history would be a mere exercise in wishful thinking if it failed to give due attention to the agencies making for stability as well as change, or if it failed to make the moral and intellectual effort involved in understanding the values which opponents of the labour movement claimed to be upholding.<sup>816</sup>

Almost fifty years later, too few have taken up this challenge. Harrison's own article went on to discuss the 'Girls' Friendly Society, 1874-1920', and so it seems appropriate to credit his vision on the issue of working-class conservative women and their role in Edwardian society, and its impact on this study of the Orange Order. For, as has previously been established, the women involved in the Scottish Order were broadly working-class.<sup>817</sup>

Analysing this understudied phenomenon, though, gives insight into the motivation of such women and perhaps goes some way to explaining why women's conservative political activity in the Edwardian era so eclipsed that of their more radical sistren. Popular accounts of the latter, especially in Ireland, led to a mistaken consensus that by comparison Protestant or conservative women were engaged primarily in making the tea, and little

---

<sup>815</sup> Booker Jr., 'Orange Alba', pp 110-186; Marshall, *The Billy Boys*.

<sup>816</sup> Brian Harrison, 'For church, queen and family: the Girls' Friendly Society, 1874-1920', in *Past and Present* LXI, no. 1 (1973), p. 107.

<sup>817</sup> MacPherson, *Women and the Orange Order*, p. 1.

else. Work from scholars such as Rachel Ward and Diane Urquhart has convincingly disproved this narrative in recent years and, as may be seen from the Grand Lodge of Scotland's monthly reports, it proves just as unconvincing in Scotland.<sup>818</sup>

On 4 January 1913, in fact, the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland received a report from Sister Mitchelson about the opening of a new female lodge in Edinburgh at which: 'surprise was expressed at the fact that this District allowed two female delegates to remain with them all afternoon doing their work; while they had to hurry for the last train, only arriving in Glasgow shortly before midnight, without offering them a cup of tea'.<sup>819</sup> Should the tea go amiss in future, it was resolved that those working for the Grand Lodge should purchase their own at the Institution's expense. Beyond tea-ladies, it appears tea-less Glaswegian Orangewomen were engaged in Grand Lodge work across the rest of Scotland during the Home Rule period. In this sense the female order communes with a number of other conservative organisations in the period.

Indeed, a fruitful comparison may be made between the Orange Order and the Primrose League, the subject of Martin Pugh's 1985 work *The Tories and*

---

<sup>818</sup> Ward, *Women, unionism and loyalty*;

Diane Urquhart, *Women in Ulster politics 1890-1940* (Dublin, 2000).

<sup>819</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Monthly reports*, 4 January 1913.

*the people*.<sup>820</sup> Not only does Pugh demonstrate that membership of the League vastly outnumbered that of radical institutions including the Independent Labour Party, in fact the League's membership in Bolton was roughly equal to that of the entire I.L.P., but he demonstrates that through the League, women were able to achieve a level of political emancipation even within a sphere of conservative politics.<sup>821</sup>

This same thesis is applicable to women's organisation in the Orange Order in Glasgow, as is demonstrated here, but the comparison between these organisations is apt in another sense too. It appears that beyond a chronological overlap between the two organisations, the two communicated and informed each other's development. This was evident in the very foundation of the Primrose League where Lord Randolph Churchill had sought to create a new form of Conservative organisation, whose structure and practice would be inspired by successful bodies including the Orange Order and the Freemasons.<sup>822</sup> The founders of the Primrose League had considered modelling its structure more explicitly on the Order, but eventually decided against this, as they worried it might alienate Catholics from joining the pan-denominational organisation.<sup>823</sup> This influence worked in both directions, though, and the Scottish Order's largest female lodge in 1912 was Female Lodge Orange Lodge Number 11, 'Primrose', located in Anderston,

---

<sup>820</sup> Pugh, *The Tories and the people*.

<sup>821</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 56.

<sup>822</sup> Sir Henry Drummond Wolff, *Rambling recollections*, Vol. II (London, 1908), p. 270.

<sup>823</sup> Pugh, *The Tories and the people*, p. 22.

Glasgow.<sup>824</sup> Beyond similarities in the way in which both organisations engaged women, this communication surely speaks not simply to the influence of the Orange Order, but to disprove notions of the Institution's insularity. Indeed, meetings of Conservative organisations were frequently held in Glasgow in Orange halls, and vice versa.<sup>825</sup> As MacRaild and MacPherson have demonstrated, Orangewomen also populated multiple Conservative organisations alongside the Order.<sup>826</sup> In essence, then, the Orange Order reacted and adapted to its circumstance, thriving alongside other organisations and associations, and beyond this, to some extent shaped their development.

Consequently, the female order quickly proved itself 'very useful' to the Grand Lodge of Scotland during the crisis by allowing the Order access to these women's Conservative networks.<sup>827</sup> MacPherson has suggested that this may have been part of the wider growth of a 'women's imperialist movement' in Edwardian Britain resulting from the Second South African War, but he also warns against casting women's lodges primarily as sites of political struggle.<sup>828</sup> While it is true that Home Rule appeared in various guises on the agenda of women's lodge meetings, it is also true that the social events after such meetings often took priority. This included, for

---

<sup>824</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report, 1912-1913*, p. 63.

<sup>825</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (20 January 1910).

<sup>826</sup> MacPherson and MacRaild, 'Sisters of the brotherhood', p. 54.

<sup>827</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report, 1912-1913*, p. 68.

<sup>828</sup> MacPherson, 'Migration and the female Orange Order', p. 623.

example, the meetings of Female Loyal Orange Lodge Number 19 in Bridgeton, which regularly provided attendees with communal social activity, in this case song and tea, as well as with political stimulation.<sup>829</sup> As was the case with juvenile lodges, and indeed also in the Primrose League, such a mix proved important in the successful cultivation of this new branch of Orangeism in Scotland.<sup>830</sup>

The rules and regulations for the development of the female lodges were drawn up steadily over the course of the third Home Rule crisis, but one contribution is worth explicit consideration. A Miss McCullum, the Worshipful Mistress of the Ladies' Orange Association of British America, who in 1910 was awarded a gift to the value of two guineas for her assistance in establishing the laws and rituals of the female order in Scotland.<sup>831</sup> For not only does Miss McCullum's involvement demonstrate the very real transatlantic connections of the Order, but it also reveals the considerable influence which Orangewomen had in the creation of their institution. It must be stressed that despite its constrictions, the women's order in Scotland was not the product of male engineering. Rather, women were involved in every stage of the process. Clearly the ability of women to engage politically in this period should not surprise us, but it is none the less remarkable that such agency was exercised in the masculine space of the Order. Indeed, in

---

<sup>829</sup> MacPherson, *Women and the Orange Order*, p. 100.

<sup>830</sup> Pugh, *The Tories and people*, p. 33.

<sup>831</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report, 1909-1910*, p. 13.

drawing up further rules for the female lodges, the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland was adamant in the necessity of a gender-balanced committee, well outstripping many present-day academic conferences.<sup>832</sup> This said, whether such men were there to support their activities, or oversee them, remains unclear. The ability of women in Scotland to contribute to the Orange Order may have been conditional on male support, but women's Orangeism was none the less a female initiative.

In providing a space for political activity and agency, the female order mirrored women's conservative activism in the Primrose League, as women in both organisations retained a level of autonomy while operating within a broader male-led structure. As Jon Lawrence has argued:

Although the Primrose League was open to both men and women, and was careful not to pose a direct challenge to male political authority, the League's recognition of female partisanship gave its 'Habitations' a different character from that of working-men's Conservative Clubs or local Conservative Associations.<sup>833</sup>

These habitations existed across Scotland, and though well in decline by the period of 1910 to 1914, in locations as remote as the village of Salen on the Isle of Mull in the Inner Hebrides, women like a Mrs McGillivray were still attempting to expand the reach of popular conservative organisations.<sup>834</sup>

---

<sup>832</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report, 1913-1914*, p. 18.

<sup>833</sup> Lawrence, 'Class and gender in the making of urban Toryism', p. 645.

<sup>834</sup> Primrose League Scottish Branch, *Minutebook, no. 2, 1910*, p. 274

In Glasgow the Primrose League attempted to combat the Liberal Party's electoral hold on the city through the production and distribution of a large volume of Conservative Party material during the 1910 General Election.<sup>835</sup> The network of habitations across the city facilitated this distribution, but beyond the Election and its failure for the Conservative Party, it becomes increasingly clear from the minutes of the organisation that the Primrose League was beginning to falter. Soon it came to be replaced by other conservative vessels including the Women's Unionist Council, and to a lesser extent the female order, mirroring the process occurring with the juveniles.<sup>836</sup> While this eventual eclipse is significant in the long term development of the Unionist Party in Scotland, the vibrancy of the Primrose League and other female facing conservative associations at this time is also important.

They demonstrate that particularly within urban areas in Scotland, including Glasgow, there existed established conservative women's networks which were capable of acting politically in support of their ideals. While at times this occurred within a gendered space, Orangewomen were called upon to contribute to the political struggle in non-delineated spaces too. In March of 1910, Sister Bryon, the worshipful mistress of Kirkintilloch Female Orange Lodge was called upon for just such a contribution.<sup>837</sup> Speaking to a packed audience at an Orange social in Glasgow, Bryon relayed her experiences of

---

<sup>835</sup> Primrose League Scottish Branch, *Minutebook*, no. 2, 1910, p. 256.

<sup>836</sup> Primrose League Scottish Branch, *Minutebook*, no. 2, 1912, p. 355.

<sup>837</sup> It is unclear if Mrs. Byron was a relation of the Chief Superintendent discussed earlier.

visiting Ireland to the assembled crowd. As a highland Scot with little connection to Orangeism at the time of her visit she had been astonished by the influence of the Catholic Church in the country:

Before she first went to Ireland she used to wonder why it was that so many said 'Give the people of Ireland Home Rule', and she used to say 'Why not?'. She thought it would be splendid. But she had not been two months in Ireland until she quite changed her mind about that, and realised that for Ireland it would not be Home Rule, but Priest Rule.<sup>838</sup>

Bryon's account was well received and highlights that women within the Orange Order were able to contribute in a quite orthodox way to the promotion of Orange politics. If much of the female order's contribution was made within gendered confines, other aspects were more egalitarian. While not going as far as to challenge MacPherson's arguments about the social nature of women's Orangeism, it is nonetheless important to recognise the efforts of Orangewomen to engage politically during the years for the third Home Rule crisis.

Beneath the Liberal Party's dominance of Scotland, then, there were active Conservative women, and the benefits of such activity were indeed often welcomed by the Grand Lodge.<sup>839</sup> In another example of the developing political autonomy of women within the Order, the Grand Lodge took the unusual step of granting the free use of the new Grand Hall on Cathedral Street to Sisters Mickelson and Salmond to conduct a class to train lecturers

---

<sup>838</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (24 March 1910).

<sup>839</sup> See also: Hutchinson, *A political history of Scotland*, p. 222.

for female lodges in October of 1914.<sup>840</sup> This contributed to a wider project of education within the Order, and a year before the Grand Lodge had voted by a large majority to authorise a diploma for proficiency in lecturing for those taking part in the female lecture class.<sup>841</sup> Such decisions show how highly the efforts of women in expanding and maintaining the female Orange Order were valued by the male Orange hierarchy.

Before speaking to the relationship between the Grand Lodge and the female order more directly, though, it is worth reflecting briefly on the impact, or lack thereof, of the campaign for women's suffrage upon the Orange Order. Mo Moulton has demonstrated how the suffrage movement and eventual enfranchisement of women would lead activists in Britain to take an interest in Irish affairs.<sup>842</sup> But predating this, as has been demonstrated, Orangewomen in Scotland were already engaged in debates about Home Rule for Ireland. In fact, in the years from 1910 to 1914, such politics as was formally discussed in female lodges seems to have revolved around the Irish Question. Much like the Primrose League, it appears the Order did not take an official stance on the issue of suffrage. Despite this, it is worth noting that both David Ness, Grand Master of the Order in Scotland, and future Northern Ireland Prime Minister James Craig vocally supported votes for women

---

<sup>840</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Monthly reports*, 4 October 1914.

<sup>841</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Monthly reports*, 1 February 1913.

<sup>842</sup> Mo Moulton, "You have votes and power': women's political engagement with the Irish Question in Britain, 1919-23', in *Journal of British Studies* LII (January 2013), pp 179-204.

alongside other prominent Orangemen in Scotland and Ireland.<sup>843</sup> For his part, Ness believed women should receive the vote because they would 'always be on the side of purity, holiness, and righteousness'.<sup>844</sup> Expanding on this view at the social event of a female lodge in October of 1910, Ness argued:

There were many questions which were looming on the horizon of public life which their women would help very greatly to settle, [...]. One of these was the temperance question. If their women possessed the vote he was perfectly sure that the majority, if not all of them, would certainly vote against the public house.<sup>845</sup>

Met by applause, Ness believed women's suffrage would mean the enfranchisement of a section of a moral electorate. Women were seen as more temperate than their male peers and so could be trusted to vote virtuously, and this association of women and virtue was central to the understanding of progressive Orangemen in their patronage of the female order. The emancipation of women was not supported by male Orangemen because of some conception of inalienable rights, but instead it was a practical measure by which the theology and politics of the Order might be advanced. Commenting on the same event and Ness' membership of the West of Scotland Women's Suffrage Union, a regular correspondent in the *Belfast Weekly News* suggested: 'The Grand Master, we know, was always popular with all sections of the Order, but after his speech at Temple on Friday last he will, if that were possible, be more popular with the sisters than

---

<sup>843</sup> Urquhart, *Women in Ulster politics, 1890-1940*, p. 23

<sup>844</sup> MacPherson, 'The emergence of women's Orange lodges in Scotland', p. 56.

<sup>845</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (27 October 1910).

ever.<sup>846</sup> It seems, then, that Ness' support was not anomalous, and he met with an appreciative audience within the female order in the Temple district of Glasgow. Clearly some of the support for women's suffrage within the Order was predicated on stereotypes of womanly virtue or religiosity, but this is not to say it was less ardently felt.

Similarly, James Craig was a consistent and vocal supporter of votes for women, his wife Cecile recording that: 'J. [James] supported them [suffragists] consistently in the beginning, though he did not like the ultra-militant methods of the most extreme of them'.<sup>847</sup> Here there is a certain irony given Craig helped lead a militant insurrection against the government in opposition to Home Rule. But aside from this, as Diane Urquhart has noted, Craig was responsible for opening the Westminster public galleries to women, demonstrating his very real commitment to some women's rights as an M.P..<sup>848</sup> Indeed, the provisional government of Ulster of which Craig was a part in 1913 established plans for votes for women, reflecting the active role of the Ulster Women's Unionist Council.<sup>849</sup>

The somewhat unexpected support of many prominent Orangemen for women's suffrage in this period perhaps speaks to the Order's professed

---

<sup>846</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>847</sup> Urquhart, *Women in Ulster politics, 1890-1940*, p. 23

<sup>848</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>849</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 25.

devotion to civil and religious liberty, or indeed to the related and oft neglected influence of Liberal unionism on the Orange Order in Ireland and Scotland.<sup>850</sup> But even if the topic of women's suffrage was not high on the agendas of most lodges or universally supported, the evidence presented here suggests that at the least Orangewomen benefited from a political climate where gender roles were being debated and reconstituted. The final section of this chapter explores how Orangewomen negotiated gender boundaries and asserted their right to autonomy in this time of flux in more detail.

### **Women's liberation**

While key figures in the movement were supportive of women's engagement, this support was not uniform. In the letters section of *Belfast Weekly News*, a Glaswegian Orangeman outlined his concerns about allowing women to participate in Orange church parades. William McLean stressed that he was not criticising the value of female Orange lodges, before doing just that, and argued that the presence of women 'spoiled the look of a procession'.<sup>851</sup>

McLean continued:

I would also like to draw the attention of those responsible that there are a considerable number of Orangemen who will not demonstrate on 9<sup>th</sup> July in consequence of the feeling they have that the Orange

---

<sup>850</sup> Alvin Jackson, *Colonel Edward Saunderson: Land and Loyalty in Victorian Ireland* (Oxford, 1995), pp 243-248.

<sup>851</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (30 June 1910).

regalia should not be publicly worn by women. Moreover, I hold that the Orange Institution was never intended for women.<sup>852</sup>

It is difficult to assess how widespread McLean's feelings were inside the Order in Glasgow at this time. Certainly press reports of the 1910 July parades do not seem to indicate any drop-off in attendance.<sup>853</sup> McLean's fixation with regalia is also worth considering, though. As was discussed previously with relation to Belfast, the regalia of the Order served as a uniform for Orangemen and the inclusion of women within that uniform might be read as a challenge to whatever martial properties the Order possessed. In this sense at least, women in the Order represented a challenge to Order's martial character and masculinity. McLean's letter continued, 'What our Order wants is young men, not young women. By attending to their domestic duties women have enough to do without identifying themselves with the Orange Order.'<sup>854</sup> With this, McLean ended his criticism of female lodges by highlighting that their existence jeopardised the security of the domestic sphere. In short, women could not be trusted to decide for themselves whether they had time to devote to the Order. While other letters to the *Belfast Weekly News* criticised female lodges, few expressed with such clarity the tensions at the heart of women's increasing involvement with the Order and popular conservatism more generally.<sup>855</sup>

---

<sup>852</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>853</sup> The *Northern Whig* suggested 50,000 people attended. *Northern Whig* (11 July 1910).

<sup>854</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (30 June 1910).

<sup>855</sup> MacPherson, 'The emergence of women's Orange lodges in Scotland', p. 54.

In the face of such criticism, James Rice, Secretary of the Grand Lodge of Scotland, in his annual report for 1911 stressed the numerical and reputational advantage which women's lodges brought to the Order. In it, he chided those district lodges in Scotland which had failed to establish women's sections.<sup>856</sup> He wrote:

The female Order has made satisfactory progress, but some districts are still fighting shy of it. Why? Can our wives and our daughters and our sisters be of no use in the fight? The most progressive societies are those which utilise every influence for good that presents itself to them. Those districts which have not yet organised a female lodge should bring themselves up to date.<sup>857</sup>

Rice's commentary demonstrates the level of official support which the venture received, but it also hints at the problems which the Order and its female branch encountered when attempting to expand their enterprise. While there may have been a level of political emancipation for the women involved in the Order, this was never immune from the supervision or interference of their Brethren. Such challenges to female empowerment reveal much not simply about the internal struggle of women in the Orange Order in Scotland, but also further reveal the quite fragile masculinity existent in the Institution.

Patterns of such behaviour were on display throughout the years from 1910 to 1914, and that section of the Order's membership who rejected outright the legitimacy of female lodges continued to try to hamper their progress. As

---

<sup>856</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 55.

<sup>857</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report, 1911-1912*, p. 65.

becomes clear from the Grand Lodge's monthly reports, in Glasgow there was tension about what representation local female lodges should receive at the Glasgow district level. In fact, in 1912 the job of representing a female lodge fell to men who had no connection to the female lodge they were expected to represent. This unsatisfactory state of affairs led to a number of petitions to the Grand Lodge.<sup>858</sup> By 1914, the issue had been clarified somewhat, and female lodges were entitled to be represented at the district level by a male superintendent tied directly to their lodge. This was hardly a perfect solution though. Given such a position did not exist outside juvenile and female lodges, it clear that a level of paternalism if not outright infantilisation was exercised within these new lodge structures.<sup>859</sup>

Unsurprisingly, some such measures were opposed by Orangewomen, and in examining the activity and autonomy of women's lodges in Glasgow more generally in this period, it is useful to consider the case of Blantyre Bluebell Female Loyal Orange Lodge Number 6.

After being founded in November of 1909, Blantyre Bluebell Lodge met between once and twice a month in the Masonic Hall, Blantyre, for the duration of the third Home Rule crisis.<sup>860</sup> Smaller than most male lodges, in the years from 1910 to 1914 Blantyre Bluebell had between 20 and 26 members, of whom around half were in regular attendance, replicating the

---

<sup>858</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Monthly reports*, 7 September 1912.

<sup>859</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Monthly reports*, 2 May 1914.

<sup>860</sup> There appears to have been little significance in this choice of hall beyond its general accessibility.

Star of Temple (male) Lodge discussed in chapters five and six.<sup>861</sup> Blantyre Bluebell's records from the period show that despite having been formed for only a short while, it was comfortable challenging the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland during the Home Rule crisis. As early as 25 May 1910, a mere six months after its founding, 'the acting secretary brought forward a motion to alter the rules so that the members of the female order would have more control over their own lodges. The motion was unanimously passed and sent on to the Grand Lodge', where it unfortunately disappeared.<sup>862</sup> Two things are made clear by the action of these sisters. First, despite ostensibly Conservative political leanings, women inside the Scottish Order were unwilling to submit wholly to the central authority of the Order's executive, just as male private lodges refused to in this period. The second, is that while members felt it was reasonable to challenge the rulings or dictates of the Grand Lodge, ultimately the power to reject such challenges still lay with the Grand Lodge. Men's power at the head the hierarchical and patriarchal structure of the Orange Order was secure.

Three years later, the members of Blantyre Bluebell again found objection with the executive. In a report by their male District Secretary, Blantyre Bluebell was accused of underpaying Grand Lodge dues. By way of resolution, 'the sisters agreed to pay no more than they had paid before but

---

<sup>861</sup> Female Loyal Orange Lodge Number 7, *Membership roll book*, 1910-1914.

<sup>862</sup> Female Loyal Orange Lodge Number 7, *Minutebook*, 25 May 1910.

they would pay the same as the next when they received instructions'.<sup>863</sup>

While in practice this meant the Lodge paid only half that of male counterparts, in principle its female members were only willing to submit to the authority of the Grand Lodge so long as they believed its rulings to be equitable.<sup>864</sup> Through such implicit negotiations, the boundaries of female emancipation within the Order were established. Like their male counterparts, though, women in the Order engaged in a balancing act, with their desire for autonomy on the one hand and the ultimate authority of the Grand Lodge on the other.

As with the juvenile lodges, inside these women's lodges the role of chaplain is striking. In the case of Blantyre Bluebell Lodge, a 'sister Collins' acted as chaplain throughout the years from 1910 to 1914.<sup>865</sup> Just as with the juvenile order, her promotion to the position represents an interesting commitment on the part of the Order to the priesthood of all believers, but also to the fundamental privacy of lodges. While it is clear the Grand Lodge of Scotland were happy for women to lecture or preach the gospel to one another, with no records of women ever addressing such lectures to a male audience, it seems clear that the invested power of a female chaplain had sharply defined and gendered boundaries. While the minutes of Blantyre Bluebell reveal little of the religious life of the Lodge, Sister Collins appears to have been among

---

<sup>863</sup> Female Loyal Orange Lodge Number 7, *Minutebook*, 25 June 1913.

<sup>864</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Monthly reports*, 3 May 1913.

<sup>865</sup> Female Loyal Orange Lodge Number 7, *Minutebook*, 23 March 1910.

its most important and influential members. In September of 1910, she was involved in passing a motion which stated that the Lodge should engage in social activities after meetings, including in tea.<sup>866</sup> Frequently such social hours after the close of a meeting would involve song, with Sister Collins leading the charge, and were most often brought to a close with the singing of the national anthem.<sup>867</sup> The most interesting of such records relates to one such evening on 26 November 1913, where it was recorded: 'The Lodge was then closed in the usual manner and all the sisters adjourned for a cup of tea and a song. Songs were sung by Sister Elder, Sister Turnbull, Sister Collins [...] Bro. McGladdey gave us Carson's Cat, which brought an enjoyable evening to a close.'<sup>868</sup>

The singing of Carson's Orange Cat perhaps has underlying significance. While it remains unclear whether Sister Collins' theology matched the rest of the Scottish Order's in its anti-Catholic tendencies, Carson's Orange Cat is unquestionably a sectarian song. In the song, after the 'traitors', in this case Home Rule supporters, hang Carson's Cat, rather than die, the cat instead yells 'Hell roast the Pope!'.<sup>869</sup> Sang to the tune of Yankie Doodle Dandy, the song is one of many popular Orange numbers which circulated during the Home Rule crisis, but it is rare to find these mentioned by name in lodge

---

<sup>866</sup> *Ibid.*, 28 September 1910.

<sup>867</sup> *Ibid.*, 26 October 1910.

<sup>868</sup> *Ibid.*, 26 November 1913.

<sup>869</sup> *Broadsheet containing a number Orange and anti-Home Rule songs, c.1912* (PRONI: D1477/1).

minutes. Its inclusion here, though, gives valuable insight into where these songs found their audience. Its performance is even more significant given the general absence of Home Rule elsewhere in the minutes of Blantyre Bluebell Lodge. Through its recital, the fast-moving cultural exchanges between Orange Order members in Glasgow and Belfast during the crisis are revealed.

While this appears to be the only tangible link to the Home Rule crisis and Ulster in the records of Blantyre Bluebell, there are traces of other forms of political activity. Most commonly this would take the form of the lectures which were referenced earlier: on the 29 June 1910, 'there were present Sister Brown and Sister Pritchard from Motherwell Female Lodge, who went through the lecture in a most excellent manner for which they received a hearty vote of thanks.'<sup>870</sup> Likewise on 30 January 1912, members were invited to attend a lecture class in Candleriggs in Glasgow.<sup>871</sup> These examples, among many similar, suggest the existence of communicative and largely informal networks of Orange women's organisation in and around Glasgow during the Home Rule crisis, and while their intensity is difficult to judge, their very existence is significant.

---

<sup>870</sup> Female Loyal Orange Lodge Number 7, *Minutebook*, 29 June 1910.

<sup>871</sup> *Ibid.*, 30 January 1912.

Alongside more overt political involvement and the struggle for autonomy, Jim MacPherson argues that much of women's activity in the Order at this time and beyond was carried out in typically gendered fashion. Arguing for an extended 'feminine public sphere', in particular, MacPherson highlights that a substantial amount of women's political activity which occurred was through fundraising through bazaars and cake sales.<sup>872</sup> Certainly these activities were a substantial part of the day-to-day lives of those women involved in the Order, and indeed it would be naive to suggest such activity was not in any way political. But, it is clear from the continued resistance of some actors within the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland that many Orangemen at the time considered even these activities to transgress gender divides, and through their arguments against the very existence of a female order, such actors could still influence even the more mundane facets of a female lodge's activity. This is evident in the Grand Lodge's discussions of female members wearing a red cross alongside other Orange regalia.<sup>873</sup> The tone of these debates comes through in the minutes, and it appears that the issue was raised repeatedly by discontent members in an effort to filibuster or otherwise push aside female participation in Orange walks. Through such behaviour, and the bureaucratic maze of process connected with the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, men in the Order who were uncomfortable with women's presence in their previously exclusively masculine space could frustrate the efforts of the female order to expand in size and involvement.

---

<sup>872</sup> MacPherson, 'The emergence of Women's Orange lodges in Scotland', p. 60.

<sup>873</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report, 1909-1910*, p. 15;  
Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report, 1911-1912*, p. 15.

Considering such behaviour, James Rice argued, 'I know there are members in our Order who are so conservative that they believe in keeping the Order the same as our fathers started it over a hundred years ago. These Brethren are just one hundred years behind the times.'<sup>874</sup> While provocative, Rice's frustrations speak to the internal struggle over the female order which occurred in the Grand Lodge. Even without those who actively opposed women's inclusion, though, the male Grand Lodge ultimately held power over Orangewomen in the Institution; able to define their morality, their religiosity, their very character through the arbitration of membership appeals. This was the case with a Mrs. Black who sought to be admitted to the Order despite having been a Roman Catholic in her 'early womanhood'.<sup>875</sup> Fortunately, in this case the Grand Secretary was able to exhibit marriage and baptismal lines showing her long-standing commitment to the Protestant faith and she was admitted by a unanimous vote of the Grand Lodge. It is interesting to note too that Black's admittance to the Order appears to be the only on-record example of a former Catholic joining the Order in Belfast or Glasgow in these years. As was discussed in chapter four, it was notionally against the laws of the Institution in Ireland, and it seems significant, then, that Mrs. Black was able to pass through into Orange membership in Scotland in the years from 1910 to 1914.

---

<sup>874</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report, 1909-1910*, p. 66.

<sup>875</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report, 1911-1912*, p. 14.

Care must be taken not to put too much weight onto what is the only example of such practice, but it is perhaps possible that Black's gender afforded her sympathetic treatment or else otherwise made her immune to aspects of the Order's system of justice. Whatever the case, this clearly illustrates the very real authority which this entirely male body had over women in Scotland. If the very legitimacy of one's faith or Orangeism was open to dispute and resolved in the hands of a male superior, we must understand that any emancipatory effect which Orangeism had for women was nonetheless closely controlled by men. While women might indeed find a sense of place or space within Orange structures, their existence within them was still fundamentally dependent on male consent.

Local lodges did have the power to expel members themselves, though. Indeed, Blantyre Bluebell Lodge did so to Sister Georgia Beveridge on 27 March 1912 on the charge of 'conduct unbecoming of a member of the Order'.<sup>876</sup> Thus, in discussions of women's political activity and their surprising autonomy in the Orange Order during the Home Rule crisis, one cannot lose sight of the fact this was frequently employed for sectarian ends. In June of 1913, Female Lodge Number Seven similarly demonstrated that it was quite as capable of enforcing a sectarian admissions policy as its male counterparts when it rejected the application of a Mrs Robertson on the basis

---

<sup>876</sup> Female Loyal Orange Lodge Number 7, *Minutebook*, 27 March 1912.

of 'her known connection with Roman Catholicism.'<sup>877</sup> By using new-found liberties in the pursuit of sectarian ends, though, Scottish women in the Orange Order illustrate the phenomenon which Brian Harrison spoke to in his book *Separate Spheres*.<sup>878</sup> While the work attracted a degree of controversy around its publication, this has since receded and the quality of the work remains.<sup>879</sup> The quite simple point is that Harrison's depiction of conservative women's engagement with politics demonstrated how, in spite of liberal or Whiggish interpretations of history, new found liberties or carved out spheres of influence were frequently used by reactionary or conservative actors to promote their own brand of politics.<sup>880</sup>

Yet despite demonstrating their ability to enforce the laws of the Institution, the ability to resolve disputes and appeals still lay, not with female lodges, but with the Grand Lodge of Scotland. In October of 1913, the Grand Orange Lodge listened with displeasure to the report of Brothers Munn, Dickson and Rice, who had been unable to resolve one such dispute among a female lodge. The brethren reported that 'the two sisters who had been quarrelling had been asked to shake hands, but the other members of the female lodge would not have it and they would refuse to attend the female lodge at next meeting.'<sup>881</sup> Here the brethren had been unable to resolve the dispute

---

<sup>877</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Monthly reports*, 7 June 1913.

<sup>878</sup> Brian Harrison, *Separate spheres: the opposition to women's suffrage in Britain* (London, 1978).

<sup>879</sup> Brian Harrison and James McMillan, 'Some feminist betrayals of women's history', in *The Historical Journal* XXVI, no.2 (1983), pp 375-389.

<sup>880</sup> Harrison, *Separate spheres*, pp 14-23.

<sup>881</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Monthly reports*, 5 October 1913.

between the members of the lodge, which again demonstrates that the Grand Lodge's presence was not always welcome in private business. Despite this, it was a vote of the Grand Lodge which ultimately resolved the issue, and transferred one party to another lodge, again illustrating its position of ultimate authority.

This was sometimes to the benefit of women within the Order, though. The appeal of Mrs McIntyre against the finding of Edinburgh District Lodge expelling her from the Order was heard by a committee of the Grand Lodge, which reported back on 6 June 1914:

After a lengthy hearing at which the district was not represented – they had found that the whole proceedings arose out of a social at which there was evidently a good deal of drink – that Mrs McIntyre had apologised for taking even a very little drink, and that owing to her previous hard work for the Order they recommended that her appeal be sustained and that she be restored to the Order and her certificate transferred to a lodge outside number five district.<sup>882</sup>

While in this case a happy resolution was found for Mrs McIntyre's drunken mistake, it demonstrates that even when beneficent, women in the Order were still fundamentally reliant on the goodwill of men for their continuing existence within it. Some figures like James Rice and David Ness might support women against the charges of their less tolerant colleagues, but in all meaningful senses women were excluded from this process of arbitration and were denied agency.

---

<sup>882</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Monthly reports*, 6 June 1914.

It would not be until 1929 that women inside the Order gained their own structure and executive.<sup>883</sup> Even from the beginning of the twentieth century and into the First World War as women cemented their role in the economy, it appears conservative forces in the Grand Lodge were still unwilling to embrace the female order.<sup>884</sup> Indeed, despite their contribution to the Carson Defence Fund and Grand Master David Ness's support for women's suffrage, some in the Order continued to frustrate the development of women's lodges.<sup>885</sup> James Rice again singled such figures out for comment in his report of 1914-1915. With remarkable prescience, he suggested:

Some of these Districts would not be pleased if we told them that they were getting behind the times, but we would just point out to them that in every walk in life women are coming to the front, and proving themselves in almost every sphere the equal of men. This will be more and more evident after the war is over.<sup>886</sup>

What is clear, then, is even at the beginning of the First World War the Scottish Order had yet to fully embrace its female lodges. In those early months of the conflict, Orangewomen engaged in knitting socks and collecting supplies to be sent to soldiers on the front, but despite the commitment of senior figures within the movement and of Orangewomen themselves to the goals of the Institution, the latter's presence within the Order would not be fully secured until a decade after the conflict.<sup>887</sup>

---

<sup>883</sup> McCracken, *Bygone days of yore*, p. 38.

<sup>884</sup> Susan Pyecroft, 'British working women and the First World War', in *The Historian* LVI, no. 4 (Summer, 1994), pp 699-710.

<sup>885</sup> MacPherson, *Women and the Orange Order*, pp 105-110.

<sup>886</sup> Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report, 1914-1915*, p. 95.

<sup>887</sup> *Belfast Weekly News* (3 December 1914).

Thus, Orangewomen during the Home Rule crisis existed in a state of contradiction. On one side, as has been demonstrated and paralleled in the Primrose League, women inside the Order possessed a degree of political influence and autonomy. Their inclusion in committees establishing their rules suggests a genuine commitment on the part of at least some within the Order to afford Orangewomen a degree of self-governance. A mixture of social, communal, and political activity inside private female lodges ensured that increasing numbers of women joined the Order from 1909 and found therein a limited degree of emancipation. As was seen with the case of Blantyre Bluebell Lodge, the participation and nature of lodge meetings in Glasgow varied, but despite the level of political activity and autonomy among such women, it would be a mistake to understand their position as a wholly liberated one. The continuing frustrations of the Order's executive with reactionary members, as well as the Grand Lodge's continued direct oversight of even the most mundane of activities, serves as a reminder that whatever autonomy women enjoyed within the Orange Institution was conditional and contingent upon the agreement of their male counterparts. A useful addition to the Order in Scotland and Glasgow, Orangewomen's participation was always subject to the permission of men, the former's activity dependent upon the latter's benevolence.

## Concluding notes

This chapter has explored the role of women and boys within the Scottish Order. Despite the anxious machismo of the Order on parade, it seems the Edwardian era sparked a transformation in Scottish Orangeism. By recruiting and educating young men the Grand Lodge of Scotland tried to ensure the survival of the Institution, but also tried to guide the next generation to better respect its hierarchy. They were aided in this task by an emergent women's Orangeism. In their educative function and other similarly gendered activities including fundraising, these women made a substantial contribution to the Orange movement in Glasgow in the years from 1910 to 1914. Beyond this, though, women in the Order participated in a range of activities and contested for increased autonomy, redefining the boundaries of what was acceptable for women within the walls of this conservative association. Much, then, can be learned about Orangeism through the study of women and children.

The evidence presented in this chapter makes another broader point, though. The Orange Order is an important example of the development of women's rights and the emergence of youth culture because it defies the largely charitable terms in which the debate of such issues has been confined. Sunday Schools and the Boys Brigade, suffragists and their respectable opponents allow for a discussion of progress. While such progress might be contested or halted and so avoid the trap of whiggish interpretation, serious

academic consideration of reactionary elements within increasing women's autonomy and youth culture is altogether less appealing. The Orange Order in the Edwardian era may be contextualised within these wider phenomena, but by so doing, our understanding of this context is surely altered too. If the Orange Order, *ipso facto* 'immoral', can sit comfortably alongside a range of different popular conservative or imperialist movements at this time, then what does that tell us about such movements? Studying the participation of women and boys in the Orange Order in Glasgow from 1910 to 1914 allows for a greater understanding of the diversity of Orangeism. But beyond this, it complicates the picture of popular conservative forces and of emergent social change in Edwardian Britain and Ireland.

## Conclusion

The introduction of this thesis suggested that the Orange Order can be subject to two kinds of curiosity. The first, and most common, is a morbid titillation directed at the rumours, secrecy and violence of the Loyal Orange Institution.<sup>888</sup> Building upon it, and partially as a result of the United Kingdom's decision to leave the European Union in 2016, the attention of many commentators has come to focus on Northern Ireland in the last five years. When the Orange Order or the unionist and loyalist community more broadly is discussed, there is now an added element of catastrophizing attached to these discussions. Attendant is an often scarcely concealed desire to hear that we are on the brink of returning to the violence of the modern Troubles. Whether this stems simply from a desire to be proven right over Brexit, whatever that might mean, or is instead just the nauseating excitement of those with no experience of sectarian violence is unclear. Inevitably the Orange Order is dragged into such discussions. Its prominence in Northern Ireland and the ease with which it is identified makes the Order a useful shorthand for discussions of sectarianism in contemporary society, whether that is focused on Northern Ireland or Scotland. Indeed, it seems that beyond being a symbol of sectarianism, too often sectarianism itself is reduced to the Orange Order.

---

<sup>888</sup> See: 'Satanic secrets of the Orange Order', *The Observer* (24 October 1999); 'Whipping and coffins at lodge ritual', *The Times* (18 June 2020); 'Riding the goat' Orange Order ritual revealed', *Irish News* (14 July 2020).

In one sense at least, this thesis has been a rejection of this first kind of thinking. While the history of the Orange Order can doubtless tell us something of Northern Irish or Scottish society today, this thesis has sought to demonstrate that Orangeism is a historical subject worthy of serious study in and of itself. By focusing on the Order in two cities during the third Home Rule crisis, it has attempted to provoke, and perhaps even satiate, a second, better kind of curiosity: one that hopefully leads beyond sensationalism or reductive explanations, toward a more complete understanding of what is a complex social and political phenomenon. Over seven chapters the depth and intricacy of Orangeism in the Edwardian era has been explored. That the Order proved to be a complex and multivalent organisation should not be a surprise, though. Orangeism is, after all, a mass membership movement which has survived across the world for over two centuries. Indeed, it would have been more remarkable if its nature was as simple as is often supposed. So, while this thesis has sought to demonstrate the remarkable complexity of the Loyal Orange Institution during the third Home Rule crisis, it has also gone beyond this to make a number of key arguments.

In the first chapter of this thesis, the class composition of the Order in Belfast was considered, along with the influence of temperance and respectability. Here, the aim was to correct a relatively widespread misconception, pioneered by the likes of Peter Gibbon, that the Order in Ireland existed to

facilitate craft exclusion. The idea that the Orange Order functioned as a kind of labour aristocracy or artisanate is not confined to Belfast, though. As the sixth chapter of this thesis demonstrated, in fact similar errors have permeated much of the historiography of the Order in Scotland too. In order to disprove this, it was necessary to examine the membership of the Order in Belfast and Glasgow in the years from 1910 to 1914. In Belfast, this was done by analysing the roll of members of the Belfast district of the Royal Arch Purple and cross referencing this with the 1911 Irish census, wherein, the even distribution of skilled and unskilled Protestant workers clarifies that the Order at this time was not driven by protecting skilled jobs. In chapter six, due to the lack of records of the Scottish Order from this period, it was necessary to rely instead on the broader conclusions put forward by Eric Kaufmann and, to a lesser extent, Elaine McFarland, and to combine these with those other materials which were available. In fact, through this, it seems that the composition of the Order in Belfast was essentially replicated in Glasgow in the years from 1910 to 1914. While the Scottish Order was more proletarian in its leadership than it was in Ireland, the important detail is that Glaswegian Orange lodges were the same mixture of skilled and unskilled Protestant workers. Indeed, this was perhaps in part due to the influx of Irish Protestant immigrants to the Scottish Order which was also discussed in chapter six. As a consequence of this, it seems increasingly clear that suggestions that the Order existed to exclude unskilled labour from the workplace are unfounded, and rather it is more likely that systems of exclusion simply functioned alongside, but ultimately independent of,

Orangeism.<sup>1</sup> Thus, this thesis has gone beyond much of the existing literature on Orangeism and usefully sustained a comparison between two locations. As a result, this thesis might also afford insight into the Order outside Glasgow and Belfast by providing a broader hypothesis about the very nature of Orangeism itself as an alliance of class interests, though one undoubtedly populated by the working class.

This class in Belfast and Glasgow was also not as it has been portrayed. While, as chapter two demonstrated, there were certainly martial traces about the organisation and culture of the Orange Order in Belfast during the third Home Rule crisis, along with sporadic episodes of sectarian violence, these have to be weighed against the temperate and respectable sensibilities of those members of the Order in the city described in chapter one. Indeed, no depiction of the Orange Order can be complete without reconciling the widespread adherence of its members to these types of behaviour, many of which were also present in Glasgow and discussed in chapter five. Here, this thesis has departed from common perceptions of the Orange Order and demonstrated that Orangeism itself in this period can be placed into useful conversation with popular conservatism and other such phenomena. By providing a new frame of analysis for Orangeism, this thesis opens further avenues of research into popular sectarianism more broadly in Scotland and Northern Ireland.

By moving beyond monolithic depictions of Orangemen as unthinking and violent we are also able to consider the religiosity of the Loyal Orange Institution. This theme was emphasised throughout this thesis, but most clearly in chapter four, where the extent of religious influence upon Orangeism was considered specifically. Here, this thesis disagreed with David Fitzpatrick and other historians who have sought to downplay the significance of religion within the Orange Order. Instead, by examining the prayers and rituals of the Institution, one becomes aware of the way in which Protestant practice and theology influenced the day-to-day activity of members of the Order. Here this thesis broke new ground by providing the first sustained analysis of Orange theology which emphasises its central role in dictating Orange practice. Nor was such religiosity contained to Belfast. In Glasgow, Presbyterianism had more of an influence than in the Anglican dominated hierarchy of the Order in Ireland, and such distinctions between the two jurisdictions highlight the importance of religious practice in the construction of Orangeism. Across both, variations on Protestant theology influenced behaviour and practice, particularly with the collaging of scriptural passages in the creation of what this thesis called a 'muscular Protestantism'. The close association among Orangemen of strength of faith and strength of arms in turn explains much of Orangeism's violent sectarianism around this period, and, importantly, its theological roots. By treating Orangeism's claim to religious belief with sincerity, beyond gaining insight into its motivations, it also puts the Orange Order into communication with other sectarian institutions of the Edwardian era. If the Order's anti-Catholicism in this period

was theologically rooted, then it is surely comparable with churches across Ireland and Scotland at the same point and indeed with other anti-Catholic elements of British society. Rather than excuse the beliefs or behaviour of the Orange Order, it instead highlights that similar beliefs motivated these actors, albeit with the Order often providing foot soldiers for the cause. As a result, this thesis and its exploration of Orange theology might prove a useful jumping off point in examining the shared tenets of anti-Catholic institutions across Britain and Ireland at the turn of the twentieth century. That the Order sits neatly within a context of popular conservatism during the Edwardian era might also prompt a re-evaluation of the supposed respectability of many of these institutions with their shared beliefs and rationales, though with different tactics to, the Orange Order. This point was further emphasised in chapter seven with regard to the Primrose League and the emerging youth movements of the Edwardian era with which Scottish Orangeism communed.

This thesis has also emphasised the remarkable flexibility of Orangeism. Indeed, it has been argued that essential to the success of the Orange Order in the Edwardian era was the remarkable adaptability which characterised Orangeism in Belfast and Glasgow. Focusing particularly on the years of the third Home Rule crisis demonstrated this. By considering such a short period of time, but one in which there was great deal of flux, a level of detail about the Order's ability to react to events was extracted. In particular, the Order's embrace of the National Insurance Act, discussed in chapter three, along with its increasing Ulsterization in these years, highlighted that even the

Order's unionism, an essential facet of Orange identity, could be altered or shaped to fit the changing realities of Irish politics. Consequently, this thesis was able to challenge popular assumptions about Orangeism which regard it as an essentially unchanging institution, helping to change our understanding of an institution which is itself synonymous both unionism and sectarianism in the north of Ireland.

This adaptability was of course also present in Scotland. Chapter six of this thesis highlighted how adept the Orange Order was at acclimatising to its surroundings. Understanding the Order in Scotland as part of a wider Orange diaspora, it also enabled the Scottish identity of the Order discussed in chapter five to be reconciled with the significant and continuing influence of Irish immigrants on Orangeism in Scotland. Beyond this, chapter five also revealed the underwhelming response of Scottish Orangemen to Home Rule. In turn, recognising this further highlights the distinctions which existed between the Order in Scotland and Ireland, with differing identities across the jurisdictions. This is of tremendous significance, because without such recognition, the Orange Order in Scotland may be passed off as an exclusively Irish construction. Therefore, or so the argument runs, sectarianism in Scotland itself is essentially an Irish problem brought over to Scotland. Instead of this serene depiction of an enlightened and ecumenical society, chapter five demonstrated the acutely Presbyterian inflection of the Scottish Order's sectarianism, speaking to longstanding anti-Catholic roots within Scotland and its religious practice.

Distinctly more modern, in Glasgow the Order's efforts to cater to the changing appetites of juvenile and female Orange lodges also reveals that the Order was surprisingly attuned to the increasing demands of women and young people in Edwardian society. Undoubtedly a conservative organisation in many ways, the degree of autonomy which was afforded to women, albeit with significant boundaries, and the efforts made to involve Orangeism in an emergent youth culture in Scotland at this time defies many of the socially conservative ideas with which the Order is often correctly associated. That the Order in Scotland embraced female and juvenile Orangeism to such an extent, and that these were rejected in Ireland in the same period, again speaks to the distinctions between Irish and Scottish Orangeism. It is these distinctions which have justified the comparative aspect of this thesis.

Whether it is in James Joyce's somewhat unflattering depiction of Orangemen in *Ulysses*, or in the less profound scene of an Orange lodge in Danny Boyle's recent *T2 Trainspotting*, released a century later, portraits of Orangeism from outside the Order are rarely flattering. The reasons for this are clear enough, and the Order is perhaps a justified, as well as a ripe, target for caricature. It may be as necessary today as it was a hundred years ago to lance the sectarian boil with comedy as well as disdain, but it is crucial that those scholars who concern themselves with Scottish and Irish history do not allow their own depictions of the Orange Order to mirror these

caricatures. Doubtless, part of the reason why the Orange Order went largely unexplored until the turn of the twenty-first century was the difficulty of accessing Orange source materials. However, a part of it was also surely a degree of complacency or hubris on the part of some historians that what little there was to be known about Orangeism could be observed in the image of a drunken, violent, bowler-hatted and besashed, Orangeman.

This thesis has been informed by an unprecedented range of Orange materials accessed through the Grand Lodges of Ireland and Scotland, while also making use of many materials which have long been open to scholars interested in the topic. In any case, it is clear now that a lack of materials cannot serve as justification for a lack of detailed study of Orangeism. Hopefully, complacency and hubris on the part of historians interested in sectarianism and depicting the Orange Order are soon similarly confined to the dustbin of history. As this thesis has shown, while there might be some basis for Orange caricatures, they are far from the complete picture. By building on existing works on the Orange Order and offering new avenues for exploration, this thesis has contributed to the important study popular unionism in Ireland and Scotland. Rather than focus on the extreme fringe of sectarian animosity, it has highlighted how we can seek to understand its more everyday realities.

The Orange Order has had an indelible impact on Irish and Scottish society over the last 200 years, and it seems as though this will continue for some time to come, though this is for other studies to consider. What this thesis has done, though, is to seek to make a significant contribution to our understanding of Orangeism as a diverse and influential historical movement. While in no way sympathetic with the aims or objects of the Loyal Orange Institution, it has taken as its premise the relatively simple idea that Orangeism is a historical subject worthy of the respect of historians and of careful study. Above all, it is hoped that the arguments and evidence presented here have been enough to justify this.

## Appendix I: Royal Arch Purple District, Belfast and the 1911 Census

Purple Chapter	Position	First Name	Surname	Address	Census Match	Age (1911)	Birthplace	Occupation	Skilled?	Religion	Literate
980	Chaplain	William	McKnight	34 Berlin Street	Y	35	County Antrim	Blacksmith	Skilled	Church of Ireland	Y
1942	D.M.	Henry	Hodgins	25 Nrthumberland Street	Y	28	City of Belfast	Blend Server	Unskilled	Church of Ireland	Y
2046	Registrar	John	Armstrong	12 Kilronan Street	Y	35	County Antrim	Bricklayer	Skilled	Presbyterian Church	Y
980	D.M.	Samuel	Warring	22 Brougham Street	Y	38	Armagh	Builder	Unskilled	Methodist	Y
1116	Registrar		Cavan	124 Donegal Avenue	Y	43	England	Builders Clerk	Skilled	Church of Ireland	Y
980	Lecturer	Robinson	Orr	22 Brougham Street	Y	22	Londonderry	Carpenter	Skilled	Presbyterian	Y
980	Registrar	Robert	Graham	6 Manr Drive	Y	39	County Fermanagh	Carpenter and Joiner	Skilled	Church of Ireland	Y
873	Treasurer	Robert	Hawthorne	57 Howe Street	Y	26	Belfast City	Carpenter House Property	Skilled	Church of Ireland	Y
980	Treasurer	Robert	Crawford	8 Laganview Street	Y	40	County Monaghan	Carter	Unskilled	Methodist	Y
1870	Lecturer	John	Reynlds	12 Shipboy Street	Y	33	Belfast City	Carter	Unskilled	Church of Ireland	Y
1902	W.M.		Mullen	1 Jaffa Street	Y	50	County Down	Carter	Unskilled	Church of Ireland	Y
1116	Treasurer	John	Peoples	17 Baltic Avenue	Y	50	County Antrim	Carters Dispatch Clerk Flour Mill	Skilled	Presbyterian	Y
1002	Lecturer	Stewart	Turner	251 Nrth Queen Street	Y	18	County Armagh	Clerk	Skilled	Presbyterian	Y
1317	W.M.	Thomas	Meekin	83 Hopeton Street	Y	56	County Antrim	Coal Vendor	Unskilled	Church of Ireland	Y
1116	D.M.		Armstrong	69 University Road	Y	42	Belfast	Departmental Foreman Warehouse Handkerchief	Skilled	Church of Ireland	Y

1267	Lecturer	John	Leader	3 Gardner Street	Y	55	Kent England	Dock Labourer	Unskilled	Church of Ireland	Y
866	Treasurer	William	Tate	121 Snugville Street	Y	37	County Antrim	Driller Textile	Unskilled	Presbyterian	Y
1942	W.M.	James	Crooks	22 Tenth Street	Y	37	Belfast City	Engine Driver in Flax Mill	Skilled	Presbyterian	Y
154	Treasurer	Alexander	Davis	106 Grosvenr Road	Y	45	Ballynahinch, County Down	Engine Fitter at Works	Skilled	Church of Ireland	Y
929	Registrar	Thomas	Keers	21 Evalina Street	Y	29	Belfast City	Engine Fitter at Works	Skilled	Presbyterian	Y
2039	D.M.	W.C.	Adams	Agincourt Avenue	Y	41	Belfast	Engine Fitter at Works	Skilled	Presbyterian	Y
154	D.M.	David	Ireland	29 Willowfield Drive	Y	46	Armagh	Engineer in Flour Mill	Skilled	Protestant of Presbyterian	Y
924	Lecturer	John	Erskine	2 Caledor Street	Y	59	County Armagh	Flax Dresser	Unskilled	Church of Ireland	Y
1267	W.M.	Robert	Howard	72 Newington Avenue	Y	31	County Tyrone	Foreman Stone Cutter	Skilled	Presbyterian	Y
971	W.M.	Robert	Armstrong	41 Percy Street	Y	41	County Louth	Forman Brass Moulder	Skilled	Church of Ireland	Y
149	Registrar	Thomas	Boyle	40 Wensley Street	Y	48	Belfast City	General Labourer	Unskilled	Church of Ireland	Y
671	Registrar	John	Beattie	58 Avon Street	Y	26	County Down	General Labourer	Unskilled	Church of Ireland	Y
980	W.M.	J.	Pillar	?	Y	53	County Armagh	General Labourer	Unskilled	Church of Ireland	Y
1116	W.M.		Adamson	71 Tates Avenue	Y	49	County Down	General Labourer	Unskilled	Church of Ireland	Y
1267	Lecturer	James	Carson	22 Rowan Street	Y	20	Belfast	General Labourer	Unskilled	Presbyterian	Y
1870	D.M.		Larkin	81 Matchett Street	Y	35	Belfast	General Labourer	Unskilled	Methodist	Y
1870	Lecturer	Henry	Higginson	29 Lorton Street	Y	40	County Antrim	General Labourer	Unskilled	Church of Ireland	Y
1902	Registrar		Henderson	16 Leopold Street	Y	N/A	City of Belfast	General Labourer	Unskilled	Presbyterian	Y
1902	Lecturer	R	Henderson	16 Leopold Street	Y	20	Belfast	General Labourer	Unskilled	Presbyterian	Y
1942	Lecturer	Joseph	McKeown	65 Wilton Street	Y	39	County Tyrone	General Labourer	Unskilled	Church of Ireland	Y
929	Lecturer	Joseph	McGrath	37 Dack Street	Y	24	County Armagh	Hairdresser	Unskilled	Methodist	Y

2046	W.M.	William	Irwin	24 Bowness Street	Y	49	County Armagh	Holder Fitter	Skilled	Congrationalist	Y
924	Treasurer	Robert	Karr	18 Carlisle Street	Y	52	County Roscommon	Inspector SPC of Animals	Skilled	Presbyterian	Y
2046	D.M.	Edward	Peel	20 Wilton Street	Y	53	Belfast City	Iron Moulder	Skilled	Wesleyan Methodist	Y
149	W.M.	William	Irwin	37 Hillman Street	Y	31	Antrim	Joiner	Skilled	Church of Ireland	Y
671	Chaplain	George	Wilson	24 Queen Victoria Street	Y	22	County Down	Joiner	Skilled	Presbyterian	Y
745	W.M.	Robert	Thompson	124 Agnes Street	Y	41	County Monaghan	Joiner	Skilled	Presbyterian	Y
671	W.M.	Robert	Ferguson	9 Josephine Street	Y	55	County Derry	Labourer	Unskilled	Presbyterian	Y
866	Lecturer	William Alexander	Johnston	2 Glenfarne Street	Y	36	Belfast City	Labourer	Unskilled	Church of Ireland	Y
1870	Treasurer		Bourden	16 Comber Street	Y	49	Belfast	Labourer	Unskilled	Presbyterian	Y
866	Registrar	Samuel	McLaughlin	23 Arkwright Street	Y	36	County Tyrone	Labourer General	Unskilled	Church of Ireland	Y
1883	W.M.	James	Gass	9 Valentine Street	Y	36	Belfast	Labourer in Biscuit Factory	Unskilled	Presbyterian	Y
671	Lecturer	William	Millar	72 Newcastle Street	Y	40	County Down	Labourer in Iron Works	Unskilled	Methodist	Y
1902	Treasurer	Hugh	Houston	34 Danube Street	Y	32	Belfast	Lamp Lighter	Unskilled	Presbyterian	Y
1002	W.M.	James	Pritchard	32 Bootle Street	Y	42	County Down	Life Assurance Agent	Skilled	Church of Ireland	Y
154	Chaplain	John	Fergie	30 Denmark Street	Y	65	City of Belfast	Linen Sample Maker	Unskilled	Presbyterian	Y
924	Registrar	Thomas	Smith	30 Up. Townsend Street	Y	42	Belfast	Linen Sample Maker	Unskilled	Church of Ireland	Y
1870	Chaplain	Thos.	Intwhistle	11 Singleton Street	Y	20	Ireland	Painter	Unskilled	Church of Ireland	Y
2046	Lecturer	John	Sinclair	249 Tennant Street	Y	43	County Antrim	Painter in Shipyards	Unskilled	Presbyterian	Y
2039	Chaplain	James	McCallum	Pevril Street	Y	19	Belfast	Riveter	Skilled	Presbyterian	Y

924	W.M.	Hugh	McMillan	6 Madrid Street	Y	37	Belfast	Saddler	Skilled	Congrationalist	Y
971	Lecturer	William	Seddon	?	Y	45	England	Ship Constructor	Skilled	Church of Ireland	Y
1942	Lecturer	James	Bell	20 Glentilt Street	Y	37	County Tyrone	Shipyards Labourer	Unskilled	Presbyterian	Y
971	Lecturer	Nathaniel	Rodgers	70 Bentick Street	Y	49	Belfast	Steam Ferry Toll Collector	Unskilled	Presbyterian	Y
1267	Treasurer	James	Gamble	89 Gainsborgh Drive	Y	45	Co W Meath	Stone Cutter	Skilled	Church of Ireland	Y
2039	Treasurer	Thomas	Ward	41 Cultra Street	Y	62	Antrim	Tailor	Skilled	Presbyterian	Y
1902	D.M.	Robert	Carr	34 Carrington Street	Y	36	County Down	Telephone Lines Man	Unskilled	Church of Ireland	Y
1267	Chaplain	Andrew	McVeigh	117 Nelson Street	Y	26	Belfast City	Textile Worker	Unskilled	Presbyterian	Y
924	Inside Tyler	William	Sheppard	29 Castlereagh Place	Y	34	County Cavan	Tram Conductor	Unskilled	Presbyterian	Y
980	Lecturer	John	Beattie	5 Oregon Street	Y	39	England	Tramways Overhead Lineman's Assistant	Unskilled	Presbyterian	Y
924	D.M.	John	Harkness	74 Sugarfield Street	Y	40	County Antrim	Van - Driver	Skilled	Church of Ireland	Y
149	Chaplain	Thomas	Cunningham	?	N						
149	Treasurer	Joseph	Calmont	48 Hillman Street	N						
154	W.M.	W.	Williams	176 Donegal Road	N						
154	Registrar	Jos. A.	Culbert	57 Sandy Row	N						
671	D.M.	John	Cunningham	42 Epworth Street	N						
671	Treasurer	John	Kirkwood	64 Newcastle Street	N						
671	Lecturer	Robert	Barr	71 St. Leonard Street	N						
745	Treasurer	David	Barry	6 Garrow Street	N						

866	W.M.	W.H.W.	Dade	32 Rathgar Street	N						
866	D.M.	James	?	214 Hillman Street	N						
866	Chaplain	Rev. R. C.	Marshall	?	N						
866	Lecturer	John	Connly	22 Woodvale Street	N						
873	W.M.	?	Bates	27 Brookmount Street	N						
873	D.M.	Thomas	Dunne	?	N						
873	Chaplain	G.	Whitecroft	40 Bowness Street	N						
873	Registrar	?	Hawe	136 Silvio Street	N						
873	Lecturer	John	Howe	136 Silvio Street	N						
873	Lecturer	Robert	Vance	32 Mountcastle 28	N						
924	Chaplain	?	Thompson	13 Newington Street	N						
924	Lecturer	Samuel	Shanks	?	N						
929	W.M.	J.	Alexander	Gainsford Drive	N						
929	D.M.	Edward?	Porter	86 Nrthumberland Street	N						
929	Treasurer	John	Beattie	10 Lindsay Street	N						
971	Treasurer	John	Dalzell	?	N						
980	Inside Tyler	Robert	Moore	72 Bright Street	N						
1002	D.M.	?	McKnight	71 Alexandra Park Avenue	N						
1002	Registrar	James	Edgar	71 Alexandra Park Avenue	N						
1002	Treasurer	Alex	McKnight	71 Alexandra	N						

				Park Avenue							
1002	Lecturer	Henry	Hay	71 Alexandra Park Avenue	N						
1002	Inside Tyler	Samuel	Preston	251 Nrth Queen Street?	N						
1116	Chaplain	Hugh	Mack	70 Howard Street South	N						
1116	Lecturer	William	Gregg	14 Tavanash Street	N						
1267	D.M.		?	39 New? Street	N						
1317	D.M.		Gault		N						
1317	Chaplain		Campbell	28 Foreman Street	N						
1317	Registrar	?	McRuiston	?	N						
1317	Lecturer	George	Hamilton	34 Lorton Street?	N						
1317	Lecturer	Robert	Whirter	35 Hopeton Street	N						
1870	Registrar	Matthew	Mullen	?	N						
1883	Registrar	John	Patterson	19 Spencer Street	N						
1902	Lecturer	J	Topping	21 Walton Street	N						
1942	Chaplain	John	Martin	72 Perment Street	N						
2005	W.M.	D.W.	Field	9 Walsely Street	N						
2039	W.M.		Lynas	Dunlop	N						
2039	Registrar	David	?	Churchill Street	N						
2039	Lecturer	Thomas	Bradbury	Nelson Street	N						
2039	Lecturer	James	?	?	N						

*Sources: Royal Arch Purple District Chapter Number 1, Belfast, Reports 1913-1914 (Unpublished), accessible at the Museum of Orange Heritage, Belfast; 1911 Census.*

## **Bibliography**

### 1. Primary sources

- i. Reports and minutes of Orange Order meetings
- ii. Orange publications and materials
- iii. Newspapers
- iv. Memoirs and letterbooks
- v. Government documents and police report
- vi. Miscellaneous

### 2. Secondary sources

- i. Unpublished PhD theses
- ii. Published materials

### **Primary sources:**

- i. Reports, minutes and membership rolls of Orange meetings

Blantyre Bluebell Female Loyal Orange Lodge Number 7, *Minutebook* (Unpublished) accessible at the offices of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, Olympia House, Glasgow;

Blantyre Bluebell Female Loyal Orange Lodge Number 7, *Membership roll book* (Unpublished) accessible at the offices of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, Olympia House, Glasgow;

- County Grand Lodge of Belfast, *Report of proceedings of the County Grand Lodge of Belfast, 1910* (Belfast, 1910), accessible at the Museum of Orange Heritage, Belfast
- County Grand Lodge of Belfast, *Report of the proceedings of the County Grand Lodge of Belfast, 1911* (Belfast, 1911), accessible at the Museum of Orange Heritage, Belfast
- County Grand Lodge of Belfast, *Report of the proceedings of the County Grand Lodge of Belfast, 1912* (Belfast, 1912), accessible at the Museum of Orange Heritage, Belfast
- Grand Orange Council of the World, *Triennial Report, 1912* (Toronto, 1912), accessible at the Museum of Orange Heritage, Belfast
- Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report of proceedings of the Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, June 1910* (Dublin, 1910), accessible at the Museum of Orange Heritage, Belfast
- Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report of proceedings of the Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, December 1910* (Dublin, 1911), accessible at the Museum of Orange Heritage, Belfast
- Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report of proceedings of the Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, June 1911* (Dublin, 1911), accessible at the Museum of Orange Heritage, Belfast
- Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report of proceedings of the Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, December 1911* (Dublin, 1912), accessible at the Museum of Orange Heritage, Belfast
- Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report of proceedings of the Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, June 1912* (Dublin, 1912), accessible at the Museum of Orange Heritage, Belfast
- Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report of proceedings of the Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, December 1912* (Dublin, 1913), accessible at the Museum of Orange Heritage, Belfast
- Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report of proceedings of the Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, June 1913* (Dublin, 1913), accessible at the Museum of Orange Heritage, Belfast
- Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report of proceedings of the Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, December 1913* (Dublin, 1914), accessible at the Museum of Orange Heritage, Belfast

- Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report of proceedings of the Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, June 1914* (Dublin, 1914), accessible at the Museum of Orange Heritage, Belfast
- Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Report of proceedings of the Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, December 1914* (Dublin, 1915), accessible at the Museum of Orange Heritage, Belfast
- Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Monthly reports of the executive of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland* (Unpublished), accessible at the offices of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, Olympia House, Glasgow
- Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report of proceedings of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland 1909-1910* (Glasgow, 1910), accessible at the offices of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, Olympia House, Glasgow
- Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report of proceedings of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland 1910-1911* (Glasgow, 1911), accessible at the offices of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, Olympia House, Glasgow
- Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report of proceedings of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland 1911-1912* (Glasgow, 1912), accessible at the offices of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, Olympia House, Glasgow
- Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report of proceedings of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland 1912-1913* (Glasgow, 1913), accessible at the offices of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, Olympia House, Glasgow
- Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report of proceedings of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland 1913-1914* (Glasgow, 1914), accessible at the offices of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, Olympia House, Glasgow,
- Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Report of proceedings of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland 1914-1915* (Glasgow, 1915), accessible at the offices of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, Olympia House, Glasgow
- Imperial Grand Orange Council of the World, *Report of the sixteenth triennial meeting of the Imperial Grand Orange Council of the World 1912* (Toronto, 1912) accessible at the Museum of Orange Heritage, Belfast

Imperial Temperance Loyal Orange Lodge Number 929, *Minute book of Imperial Temperance Loyal Orange Lodge Number 929* (Unpublished), accessible at Museum of Orange Heritage, Belfast

Juvenile Loyal Orange Lodge Number 1, *Bi-monthly reports* (Unpublished), accessible at the offices of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, Olympia House, Glasgow

Lily of Scotland Female Loyal Orange Lodge, *Membership roll book* (Unpublished) accessible at the offices of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, Olympia House, Glasgow, 1910

Orange and Protestant Friendly Society, *Minutes of the Orange and Protestant Friendly Society, 1911-1921* (PRONI: LAB/1/25/1)

Royal Arch Purple District Chapter Number 1, Belfast, *Reports 1913-1914* (Unpublished), accessible at the Museum of Orange Heritage, Belfast

Star of Temple Loyal Orange Lodge Number 365, *Membership roll book* (Unpublished) accessible at the offices of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, Olympia House, Glasgow

Star of Temple Loyal Orange Lodge Number 365, *Minutebook* (Unpublished) accessible at the offices of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, Olympia House, Glasgow

ii. Orange publications and materials

*Broadsheet containing a number Orange and anti-Home Rule songs, c.1912* (PRONI: D1477/1)

Collection of Orange Stamps (PRONI: D3815/J)

*Demonstration, Ulster Hall Program 27th Sept. 1912* (PRONI: D1556/23/8)

Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Laws and ordinances of the Orange Institution* (Belfast, 1916), (PRONI: D3019/2/5/a)

Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *Ritual and forms of ceremonies of The Orange Institution of Ireland* (Belfast, 1923), (PRONI: LIB/1373)

- Grand Orange Lodge of Ireland, *12th July Church Service* (PRONI: D3815/4/119)
- Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Coatbridge District Loyal Orange Lodge Number 22: Bye-laws* (Glasgow, 1912), accessible at the offices of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, Olympia House, Glasgow;
- Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Juvenile lodge ritual, 1905* (Glasgow, 1905), accessible at the offices of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, Olympia House, Glasgow
- Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Laws and Constitutions of the Loyal Orange Institution in Scotland* (Glasgow, 1907), accessible at the offices of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, Olympia House, Glasgow
- Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, *Ritual of introduction to the Orange Order* (Glasgow, 1902), accessible at the offices of the Grand Orange Lodge of Scotland, Olympia House, Glasgow;
- Imperial Grand Orange Council, *Letter from R. H. Wallace, October 1911* (PRONI: D3815/A/76)
- Orange Hall receipts for 6 shillings shooting practice* (PRONI: D1540/3/65A and B)
- Orange Songsheet* (1912), (PRONI: D3815/J/375)
- Program for the Belfast 12th July celebrations 1910* (PRONI: D3815/H/3)
- Program for 12th July Grand Concert 1913* (PRONI: D3815/H/132)
- Young, Robert, *The Orange minstrel, or Ulster melodist: consisting of historical songs and poems* (Londonderry, 1832)

iii. Newspapers

- Belfast Morning News* (20 December 1911 - 30 September 1912)
- Belfast Newsletter* (29 May 1797 - 18 July 1912)
- Belfast Telegraph* (30 August 2019)

*Belfast Weekly News* (16 February 1905 - 17 December 1914)

*Freeman's Journal* (18 July 1912 - 23 July 1912)

*Daily News and Leader* (30 September 1912)

*Daily Record* (10 July 2009 - 1 September 2009)

*Dublin Daily Express* (18 January 1912 - 1 May 1914)

*Dublin Evening Telegraph* (21 July 1911)

*Forward* (11 March 1911 - 2 August 1913)

*Glasgow Herald* (8 July 1912 – 30 March 1914)

*Glasgow Times* (5 June 2021)

*Irish News* (20 December 1911 - 14 July 2020)

*Irish Times* (13 July 1910 - 25 May 2009)

*New-York Daily Tribune* (11 January 1859)

*New York Times* (13 July 2021)

*Portadown News* (11 May 1912)

*Scottish Referee* (15 April 1910)

*Scottish Sun* (17 June 2021)

*The Guardian* (30 May 2021)

*The Herald* (7 May 2017 - 13 August 2021)

*The National* (2 February 2019)

*The Observer* (24 October 1999)

*The Scotsman* (18 July 1912 - 13 July 1914)

*The Times* (13 July 1910 - 18 June 2020)

iv. Memoirs and letterbooks

Braithwaite, W.J., *Lloyd George's Ambulance Wagon: being the memoirs of William J. Braithwaite, 1911-1912*, H.N. Bunbury (ed.), (London, 1957)

Corkey, Rev. William, *Glad Did I Live* (Belfast, 1961)

Wallace, Colonel R.H., *Letterbook* (PRONI: D/1889/1/2/3)

Wolff, Sir Henry Drummond, *Rambling recollections*, Vol. II (London, 1908)

v. Government documents and police reports

*Census of Ireland, 1911: province of Ulster: city of Belfast*. (Dublin: HM's Stationary Official, 1912)

*Glasgow Boundaries Act, 1911*

*Hansard Third Series*, Vol., XXXI, col. 780-800

*Hansard Fifth Series*, Vol., XXVIII, col. 1239

*Letter regarding Orange Halls and drilling 1* (PRONI: D1889/4/2/1)

*Registration of Orange and Protestant Friendly Society branch: rules of the Ballynahinch District Branch* (Belfast, 1912), (PRONI, COM/41/1/23/7)

RIC Crime Special Branch, *Importation of arms and secret drilling in Ulster* (The National Archive, CO904/182)

vi. Miscellaneous

*Annual reports 1895, 1912-61, of: the National Union of Conservative Associations for Scotland (i-ii); the Scottish Unionist Association (iii-vii); and of the Western Division, SUA (viii-x): 1912. Report of the western Divisional Council of the National Union of Conservative Associations for Scotland for the Year 1911-1912* (National Library of Scotland: Acc. 10424/27 (ii)), pp 34-37

*Calvin, John, A treatise on relics: translated from the French original with an introductory dissertation on the miraculous images, as well as other superstitions of the Roman Catholic an Russo-Greek Churches, Valerian Krasiński (tr.), (Edinburgh, 1870)*

Glasgow Conservative and Glasgow Unionist Associations, a series of unbound reports, 1888-1941, *Report 1911*, accessible at the National Library of Scotland, Acc. 10424/26 (ii)

Kaufmann, Eric, 'Orange Order membership data, with a focus on Ireland, Canada, and Scotland, 1852-2002' [computer file, accessible at: Colchester, U.K. Data Archive [distributor], SN 1007, [www.data-archive.ac.uk](http://www.data-archive.ac.uk)]

Nil By Mouth, *History of Sectarianism* (2018), accessible at: <https://nilbymouth.org/history> [Accessed 27 August 2019]

Paton, C.I., *Catechism of the principles of Protestantism* (Edinburgh, 1879)

Primrose League, Scottish Branch, 1885-1920: Grand Council (Scotland), *Minutebook*, no. 2. 1913, accessible at the National Library of Scotland: Acc. 10424/2

The British Medical Journal (editorial), '*National Insurance Act. First Report of the Commissioners (1912-1913)*', in *The British Medical Journal II*, no. 2741, (12 July 1913), pp 67-70

### **Secondary sources:**

#### i. Unpublished PhD theses

Booker Jr., Ronnie Michael, 'Orange Alba: the civil religion of loyalism in the southwestern Lowlands of Scotland since 1798', (Unpublished PhD Thesis, University of Tennessee Knoxville, 2010)

Butcher, Deborah, 'Ladies of the lodge: a history of Scottish Orangewomen, c. 1909-2013' (Unpublished PhD Thesis, London Metropolitan University, 2014)

Clark, Stuart, 'The Scots in Ireland under the Union: the boundaries of Britishness c.1800-1925', (Unpublished PhD Thesis, University of

Edinburgh, 2020)

Logan, Norma Davies, *Drink and Society: Scotland 1870-1914* (Unpublished PhD Thesis, University of Glasgow, October 1983)

McFarland, Elaine, 'The Loyal Orange Institution in Scotland, 1799 to 1900', (Unpublished PhD Thesis, University of Glasgow, 1986)

Ritchie, D.L., "They do not become good Scotsmen': a political history of the anti-Irish campaign in Scotland, 1919-1939', (Unpublished PhD Thesis, University of Glasgow, 1986)

Smith, Joan, 'Commonsense thought and working class consciousness: some aspects of the Glasgow and Liverpool labour movements in the early years of the twentieth century', (Unpublished PhD Thesis, University of Edinburgh, 1980)

ii. Published materials

Bailey, Peter, "Will the real Bill Banks please stand up?' Towards a role analysis of mid-Victorian working-class respectability', in *Journal of Social History* XII, no. 3 (Spring, 1979), pp 336-353

Bambery, Chris, *A people's history of Scotland* (London, 2014)

Barr, Colin, *Ireland's empire: the Roman Catholic Church in the English-speaking world, 1829–1914* (Cambridge, 2020)

Barr, Colin and Ó Corráin, Daithí, 'Catholic Ireland, 1740-2016', in Eugenio Biagini and Mary Daly (eds), *The Cambridge Social History of Modern Ireland* (Cambridge, 2017), pp 68-87

Bennet, S.A., 'Not proven: the verdict', in *Scots Law Times* XII (2002), pp 97-98

Bew, Paul, and Patterson, Henry, *The British state and the Ulster crisis: from Wilson to Thatcher* (London, 1984)

Bew, Paul, *Ideology and the Irish question: Ulster unionism and Irish nationalism, 1912-1916* (Oxford, 1994)

Blacker, William, and Wallace, R.H., *The formation of the Orange Order, 1795-1798: the edited papers of Colonel William Blacker and Colonel Robert H. Wallace*, Cecil Kilpatrick (ed.), (Belfast, 1994)

- Bowman, Timothy, *Carson's army: the Ulster Volunteer Force, 1910-22* (Manchester, 2007)
- Boyle, J.W., 'The Belfast Protestant Association and the Independent Orange Order, 1901-1910', in *Irish Historical Studies* XIII, no. 50 (Sept., 1962), pp 117-152
- Brooks, David, *The age of upheaval: Edwardian politics 1899-1914* (Manchester, 1995)
- Brown, C.G., *The social history of religion in Scotland since 1750* (London, 1987)
- Brown, C.G., *The death of Christian Britain: understanding secularisation 1800-2000* (London, 2001)
- Brown, S.J., 'Outside the Covenant': the Scottish Presbyterian churches and Irish immigration, 1922-1938', in *The Innes Review* XLII, no. 1 (Spring, 1991), pp 19-45
- Bruce, Steve, *No Pope of Rome: anti-Catholicism in modern Scotland* (Edinburgh, 1985)
- Bruce, Steve, Glennding, Tony, Paterson, Ian, and Rosie, Michael, *Sectarianism in Scotland* (Edinburgh, 2004)
- Bryan, Dominic, *Orange parades: the politics of ritual, traditions and control* (London, 2000)
- Bryce, David, *The undaunted: a history of the Orange Order in Scotland from 1799 to 1899* (Self-published, 2012)
- Buckley, A.D., 'The chosen few: Biblical texts in the regalia of an Ulster secret society', in *Folk Life* XXIV, no. 1 (1985), pp 5-24
- Buckley, A.D., 'On the club': friendly societies in Ireland', in *Irish Economic and Social History* XIV (1987), pp 39-58
- Buckley, Sarah-Anne, and Riordan, Susannah, 'Childhood since 1740', in Eugenio Biagini and Mary Daly (eds), *The Cambridge social history of modern Ireland* (Cambridge, 2017), pp 327-343
- Budge, Ian, and O'Leary, Cornelius, *Belfast: approach to crisis – a study of Belfast politics, 1613-1970* (London, 1973)
- Cameron, Ewen, *Impaled upon a thistle: Scotland since 1880* (Edinburgh, 2010)

- Carpenter, Paul, 'Mimesis, memory and the magic lantern: what did the knock witnesses see?' in *New Hibernia Review / Iris Éireannach Nua* XV, no. 2 (2011), pp. 102–120
- Checkland, S.G., *The upas tree: Glasgow, 1875-1975* (Glasgow, 1976)
- Checkland, Olive and Sydney, *Industry and ethos: Scotland, 1832-1914* (Edinburgh, 1989)
- Clark, Peter, *British clubs and societies 1580-1800: the origins of an associational world* (Oxford, 2000)
- Coleman, James, 'The Scottish Covenanters', in Gareth Atkins (ed.), *Making and remaking saints in nineteenth-century Britain* (Manchester, 2016), pp 177-189
- Coleman, Patrick, "'In harmony": a comparative view of female Orangeism, 1887-2000', in A. McCarthy (ed.), *Ireland in the world: comparative, transnational and personal perspectives* (London, 2015), pp 110-136
- Connolly, S.J., 'The moving statue and the turtle dove: approaches to the history of Irish religion', in *Irish Economic and Social History* XXXI (2004), pp 1-22
- Connolly, S.J., (ed.), *Belfast 400: people place and history* (Liverpool, 2012)
- Connolly, S.J., 'Public space and civil conflict', in Dominic Bryan, S.J. Connolly and John Nagle (eds), *Civic identity and public space: Belfast since 1780* (Manchester, 2019), pp 114-133
- Cordery, Simon, 'Friendly societies and the discourse of Respectability in Britain, 1825-1875', in *Journal of British Studies* XXXIV, No. 1 (Jan., 1995), pp 35-58
- Cordery, Simon, *British Friendly Societies, 1750-1914* (Basingstoke, 2003)
- Cousins, Mel, 'The creation of association: the National Insurance Act, 1911 and approved societies in Ireland', in Jennifer Kelly and R.V. Comerford (eds), *Associational culture in Ireland and abroad* (Dublin, 2010), pp 154-164.
- Cowan, I.B., 'The Covenanters: a revision article', in *The Scottish Historical Review* XLVII, no. 143 (1968), pp 35-52
- Craig, Maggie, *When the Clyde ran red* (Edinburgh, 2011)
- Cross, Colin, *The Liberals in power (1905-1914)* (London, 1963)

- Daly, T.P., 'James Craig and Orangeism, 1903-1910', in *Irish Historical Studies* XXXIV, no. 136 (Nov. 2005), pp 431-448
- De Bhaldráithe, Eoin, 'Mixed marriages and Irish politics: the effect of 'Ne Temere'', in *Studies: An Irish Quarterly Review* LXXVII, no. 307 (1988), pp 284-299
- Delaney, Enda, *Demography, state and society: Irish migration to Britain, 1921-1971* (Liverpool, 2000)
- Delap, Lucy, 'The Freewoman, periodical communities, and the feminist reading public', in *The Princeton University Library Chronicle* LXI, no. 2 (2000), pp 233-276
- DeLap, Lucy, *The feminist avant-garde: transatlantic encounters of the early twentieth century* (Cambridge, 2007)
- Devine, Tom, (ed.), *Scotland's shame? Bigotry and sectarianism in modern Scotland* (Edinburgh, 2000)
- Devine, Tom, 'The sixties in Scotland: a historical context' in *Scottish Cultural Review of Language and Literature* XX (2013), pp 23-46
- Dewar, Rev. M.W., Brown, Rev. John, Long, Rev. S E., *Orangeism: a new historical appreciation* (Belfast, 1969)
- Dingle, A.E., *The campaign for prohibition in Victorian London* (London, 1980)
- Donaldson, Peter, *Remembering the South African War: Britain and the memory of the Anglo-Boer War, from 1899 to present* (Liverpool, 2013)
- Dudley-Edwards, Ruth, *The faithful tribe: an intimate portrait of the loyal institutions* (London, 2000)
- Dunn, Peter "Own flesh and blood"? Ulster unionism, Scotland and home rule, 1886-1914', in *Irish Historical Studies* XXXVII, no. 146 (November, 2010), pp 203-220
- Durkheim, Émile, *Elementary forms of religious life*, J.W. Swain (trs.), (London, 1915)
- Edwards, Jennifer and Knottnerus, J.D., 'The Orange Order: parades, other rituals and their outcomes', in *Sociological Focus* XLIII, no. 1 (Feb., 2010), pp 1-23

- Elliott, Marianne, *When God took sides: religion and identity in Ireland – unfinished history* (Oxford, 2009)
- Ervine, St. John, *Craigavon – Ulsterman* (London, 1949)
- Evershed, Jonathan, *Ghosts of the Somme: commemoration and culture war in Northern Ireland* (Notre Dame, 2018)
- Fahey, D.M., 'The politics of drink: pressure groups and the British Liberal Party, 1883-1908', in *Social Science* LIV, no. 2 (Spring, 1979), pp 76-85
- Febvre, Lucien, *A new kind of history: from the writings of Febvre*, Peter Burke (ed.), K. Folca, (trs.), (London, 1973)
- Ferriter, Diarmaid, 'Drink and society in twentieth-century Ireland', in *Proceedings of the Royal Irish Academy: Archaeology, Culture, History, Literature* CXV no. 1000. 'Food and Drink in Ireland' (2015), pp 349-369
- Field, John, 'British historians and the concept of the labour aristocracy', in *Radical History Review* no. 19 (Winter, 1979), pp 61-85
- Fitzpatrick, David, 'The Orange Order and the border', in *Irish Historical Studies* XXXIII, no 129 (March, 2002), pp 52-67
- Fitzpatrick, David, 'Exporting brotherhood: Orangeism in South Australia', in *Immigrants and Minorities* XXIII, no. 2/3 (2005), pp 277-310
- Fitzpatrick, David, *Descendancy: Irish Protestant histories from 1795* (Cambridge, 2014)
- Fitzpatrick, 'Ernest Blythe – Orangeman and Fenian', *History Ireland* XXV, no. 3 (2017), pp 34-37
- Foerster, R.F., 'The British National Insurance Act', in *The Quarterly Journal of Economics* XXVI, no. 2 (1912), pp 275-312
- Foster, John, Houston, Muir, and Madigan, Chris 'Sectarianism , segregation and politics on Clydeside in the latter nineteenth century', in M.J. Mitchell (ed.), *New perspectives on the Irish in Scotland* (Edinburgh, 2008) pp 65-96
- Fraser, T.G., 'Orangeism, parading, and the Northern Ireland Peace Process', in *New Hibernia Review / Iris Éireannach Nua* II, no. 2 (Summer, 1998), pp 71-84

- Fraser, W.H., and Maver, Irene, 'The social problems of the city', in W.H. Fraser and Irene Maver (eds), *Glasgow Vol. 2, 1830-1912* (Manchester, 1996), pp 352-394
- Gallagher, Tom, *Glasgow: the uneasy peace, religious tension in modern Scotland* (Manchester, 1987)
- Jessica Gerrard, 'Little soldiers' for socialism: childhood and socialist politics in the British socialist Sunday school movement', in *International Review of Social History* LVIII, no. 1 (2013), pp 71-96
- Gheeraert-Graffeuille, Claire, and Vaughan, Geraldine, 'The Catholic "Other"', in Claire Gheeraert-Graffeuille and Geraldine Vaughan (eds), *Anti-Catholicism in Britain and Ireland, 1600–2000* (Basingstoke, 2020), pp 1-17
- Gibb, Andrew, *Glasgow the making of a city* (London, 1983)
- Gibbon, Peter, *The origins of Ulster Unionism: the formation of popular Protestant politics and ideology in nineteenth-century Ireland* (Manchester, 1975)
- Gilbert, B.B., *The evolution of National Insurance in Great Britain: the origins of the welfare state* (London, 1973)
- Gitre, E.J., 'The 1904-05 Welsh Revival: modernisation, technologies, and techniques of the self', in *Church History* LXXII, no. 4 (2004), pp 792-827
- Goldring, Maurice, *Belfast: from loyalty to rebellion* (London, 1991)
- Gray, Robert, *The labour aristocracy in Victorian Edinburgh* (Oxford, 1976)
- Greenway, J.R. 'Bishops, brewers and the liquor question in England 1890-1914', *Historical Magazine of the Protestant Episcopal Church*, LIII, no. 1 (March, 1984), pp 61-75
- Grey, Tony, *The Orange Order* (London, 1972)
- Grigg, John, *Lloyd George: the people's champion 1902-1911* (London, 1978)
- Haddick-Flynn, Kevin, *Orangeism: the making of a tradition* (Dublin, 1999)
- Hall, Donald, 'Muscular Christianity: reading and writing the male social body', in Donald Hall (ed.), *Muscular Christianity: embodying the Victorian age* (Cambridge, 1994), pp 3-17

- Harbinson, J.F., *The Ulster Unionist Party, 1882-1973: its development and organisation* (Belfast, 1973)
- Harris, Jose, *Private lives, public spirit: Britain 1870-1914* (Oxford, 1993)
- Harrison, Brian, *Drink and the Victorians: the temperance question in England 1815-1872* (London, 1971)
- Harrison, Brian, 'For church, queen and family: the Girls' Friendly Society, 1874-1920', in *Past and Present* LXI, no. 1 (1973), pp 107-138
- Hepburn, A.C., 'Work, class and religion in Belfast, 1871-1911', in *Irish Economic and Social History* X (1983), pp 33-50
- Hepburn, A.C., *A past apart: studies in the history of Catholic Belfast, 1850-1950* (Belfast, 1996)
- Hepburn, A.C., *Catholic Belfast and nationalist Ireland in the era of Joe Devlin, 1871-1934* (Oxford, 2008)
- Hirst, Catherine, *Religion, politics and violence in nineteenth-century Belfast: the Pound and Sandy Row* (Dublin, 2002)
- Hobsbawm, Eric, *Labouring men: studies in the history of labour* (London, 1964)
- Hobsbawm, Eric, 'Lenin and the aristocracy of labour', in *Marxism Today* (July 1970), pp 207-210
- Hobsbawm, Eric, and Ranger, Terence, (eds), *The invention of tradition* (Cambridge, 1993)
- Holmes, Andrew, 'The experience and understanding of religious Revival in Ulster Presbyterianism, c. 1800-1930', in *Irish Historical Studies* XXXIV, no. 136 (2005), 361-385
- Holmes, Andrew, *The shaping of Ulster Presbyterian belief and practice, 1770-1840* (Oxford, 2006)
- Holmes, Andrew, *The Irish Presbyterian mind: conservative theology, evangelical experience, and modern criticism, 1830-1930* (Oxford, 2018)
- Hopkin, Deian, 'The membership of the Independent Labour Party, 1904-1910: a spatial and occupational analysis', in *International Review of Social History* XX, no. 2 (1975), pp 175-197

- Houston, C.J., and Smyth, W.J., *The sash Canada wore: a historical geography of the Orange Order in Canada* (Toronto, 1980)
- Hume, David, Mattison, Jonathan, Scott, David, *Beyond the banners: the story of the Orange Order* (Co. Down, 2009)
- Hutchinson, I.G.C., *A political history of Scotland, 1832-1924* (Edinburgh, 1986)
- Hutchison, I.G.C., 'Glasgow working class politics' in R.A. Cage (ed.), *The working class in Glasgow* (Beckenham, 1987), pp 98-142
- Hutchinson, I.G.C., 'Scottish Unionism between the two world wars', in C.M.M. MacDonald (ed.), *Unionist Scotland, 1800-1997* (Edinburgh, 1998), pp 73-99
- Jackson, Alvin, 'The failure of Unionism in Dublin, 1900', in *Irish Historical Studies* XXVI, no. 104 (Nov. 1989), pp 377-395
- Jackson, Alvin, *The Ulster Party: Irish Unionists in the House of Commons, 1884-1991* (Oxford, 1989)
- Jackson, Alvin, 'Unionist politics and Protestant society in Edwardian Ireland', in *The Historical Journal* XIII No. 4 (Dec, 1990), pp 839-866
- Jackson, Alvin, 'Unionist myths, 1912-1985', in *Past and Present* CXXXVI (Aug., 1992), pp 164-185
- Jackson, Alvin, 'Unionist history', in Ciaran Brady (ed.), *Interpreting Irish history: the debate on historical revisionism 1938-94* (Dublin, 1994), pp 253-68
- Jackson, Alvin, *Colonel Edward Saunderson* (Oxford, 1995)
- Jackson, Alvin, *The two unions: Ireland, Scotland, and the survival of the United Kingdom* (Oxford, 2012)
- Jackson, Alvin 'Mrs Foster and the rebels: Irish unionist approaches to the Easter Rising, 1916–2016', in *Irish Historical Studies* XLII, no. 161 (2018), pp 143-160
- Jackson, Ben, *The case for Scottish independence: a history of nationalist political thought in modern Scotland* (Cambridge, 2020)
- Jaimeson, Lynn, and Toynbee, Claire, (eds), *Country bairns: growing up 1900-1930* (Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Press, 1992)

- Jarman, Neil, *Material conflicts – parades and visual displays in Northern Ireland* (Oxford, 1997)
- Jarman, Neil, 'Material culture, fabric of identity', in D.W. Miller (ed.), *Material cultures: why some things matter* (London, 1998), pp 121-147
- Jarman, Neil, *Displaying faith: Orange, green and trade union banners in Northern Ireland* (Belfast, 1999)
- Jarman, Neil, 'The Orange Arch: creating tradition in Ulster', in *Folklore CXII* (2001), pp 1-21
- Jarman, Neil, and O'Halloran, Chris, 'Recreational rioting: young people, interface areas and violence' in *Child Care in Practice XII*, no. 1 (2008), pp 2–16
- Jess, Mervyn, *The Orange Order* (Dublin, 2007)
- Johnson, Alice, "Some hidden purpose'? Class conflict and co-operation in Belfast's Working Men's Institute and Temperance Hall 1865-1900', in *Social History XLII*, no. 3 (2017), pp 399-419
- Jones, Emrys, *A social geography of Belfast* (London, 1960)
- Jones, Thomas, *David Lloyd George* (Oxford, 1951)
- Kaufman, Eric, 'The dynamics of Orangeism in Scotland, social sources of political influence in a mass-member organisation, 1860-2001', in *Social Science History XXX*, no. 2 (Summer, 2006), pp 263-292
- Kaufmann, Eric, *The Orange Order: a contemporary Northern Irish history* (Oxford, 2007)
- Kaufmann, Eric, 'The Orange Order in Scotland since 1860: a social analysis', in M.J. Mitchell (ed.), *New perspectives on the Irish in Scotland* (Edinburgh, 2008), pp 159-190
- Kerrigan, Colm, *Father Mathew and the Irish Temperance Movement 1838-1849* (Cork, 1992)
- Kerswell, Timothy, 'A conceptual history of the labour aristocracy: a critical review', in *Socialism and Democracy XXXIII*, no. 1 (2019), pp 70-87
- Kinealy, Christine and Grosse, Christine, 'Les marches orangistes en Irlande du Nord. Histoire d'un droit', in *Le Mouvement Social* no. 202 (Jan.–Mar., 2003), pp 165-181

- Larkin, Emmet, 'The Devotional Revolution in Ireland', in *The American Historical Review* VXXII (1972), pp 625-52
- Larkin, Emmet, *The Roman Catholic Church and the creation of the modern Irish state, 1878-1886* (Dublin, 1975)
- Lawrence, Jon, 'Class and gender in the making of urban Toryism, 1880-1914', in *The English Historical Review* CVIII, No. 428 (1993), 629-652
- Le Bon, Gustave, *The crowd: a study of the popular mind* (London, 1947)
- Lee, R.M., 'Intermarriage, conflict and social control in Ireland: the decree 'Ne temere'', in *The Economic and Social Review* XVII, no. 1 (1985), pp 11-27
- Leonard, Madeleine, 'What's recreational about 'recreational rioting'? Children on the streets in Belfast' in *Children and Society* XXIV (2010), pp 38-49
- Lloyd, John, 'Ireland's uncertain peace', in *Foreign Affairs* LXXVII, no. 5 (Sep.-Oct., 1998), pp 109-122
- Lloyd-Jones, Naomi, 'Yes? Or no? Four nations or one?' in *History Today* LXV, no. 2 (2015), pp 22-25
- Lloyd-Jones, Naomi, and Scull, Margret, 'Introduction', in Naomi Lloyd-Jones and Margret Scull (eds), *Four nations approaches to modern "British" history: a (dis)united kingdom?* (London, 2018), pp 3-31
- Loftus, Belinda, *Mirrors: William III and mother Ireland* (Dundrum, 1990)
- Lummis, Trevor, *The labour aristocracy 1851-1914* (Aldershot, 1994)
- Mac Bhloscaidh, Fearghal, 'The Caledon Lockout: revolution and counter-revolution in rural Ulster, 1918-1922', in *International Labor and Working Class History* XCVIII (Fall, 2020), pp 216-236
- Macdonald, Jonathan, *To greet my Glasgow brethren: a history of Orangeism in Glasgow* (Glasgow, 2020)
- Machin, G.I.T., *Politics and the churches in Great Britain 1869-1921* (Oxford, 1987)
- MacPherson, D.A.J., 'Migration and the female Orange Order: Irish Protestant identity, diaspora and empire in Scotland, 1909-40', in *The Journal of Imperial and Commonwealth History* XL, no. 4 (2012), pp 619-642

- MacPherson, D.A.J., 'The emergence of women's Orange lodges in Scotland: gender ethnicity and women's activism, 1909-1940', in *Women's History Review* XXII, no. 1 (2013), pp 51-74
- MacPherson, D.A.J., *Women and the Orange Order: female activism, diaspora and empire in the British world, 1850-1940* (Manchester, 2016)
- MacPherson, D.A.J., and MacRaid, D.M., 'Sisters of the brotherhood, female Orangeism on Tyneside in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries', in *Irish Historical Studies* XXXV, no. 137 (May, 2006), pp 40-60
- MacRaid, D.M., *Irish migrants in modern Britain, 1750-1922* (Basingstoke, 1999)
- MacRaid, D.M., *Faith, fraternity & fighting: the Orange Order and Irish migrants in northern England, c. 1850-1920* (Liverpool, 2005)
- Maguire, Martin, 'The organisation and activism of Dublin's Protestant working class, 1883-1935', in *Irish Historical Studies* XXXIX, no 113 (May, 1994), pp 65-87
- Malcolm, Elizabeth, *'Ireland sober, Ireland free': drink and temperance in nineteenth century Ireland* (Dublin, 1986)
- Malcolmson, W.P., *Behind closed doors: the hidden structure within the Orange camp [the Royal Arch Purple Order] examined from an evangelical perspective* (Banbridge, 1999)
- Mansergh, Martin, 'Home Rule in Ireland, an historical and political perspective on devolution' in Susan Finding, Philippe Cauvet and Moya Jones (eds), *"Unfinished business": governance and the four nations* (Bourdeaux, 2011), pp 62-83
- Marshall, W.S., *'The Billy Boys', a concise history of the Orange Order in Scotland* (Edinburgh, 1996)
- McAuley, J.W., 'Under an Orange banner: reflections on the northern Protestant experiences of emigration', in Patrick O'Sullivan (ed.), *The Irish worldwide: history, heritage, identity*, Vol. 5 Religion and Identity (London, 1996), pp 43-70
- McBride, Ian, *The Siege of Derry in Ulster Protestant mythology* (Dublin, 1997)
- McCracken, Rev. Gordon, *Bygone Days of Yore: the Story of Orangeism in Glasgow* (Glasgow, 1990)

- McDowell, M.L., *A cultural history of association football in Scotland, 1865-1902* (New York, 2013)
- McDowell, R.B. *The Church of Ireland 1869-1969* (Abingdon, 1975)
- McFarland, Elaine, *Protestants first: Orangeism in nineteenth century Scotland* (Edinburgh, 1990)
- McFarland, Elaine, 'Marching from the margins: Twelfth July parades in Scotland, 1820-1914', in T.G. Fraser (ed.), *Following the drum: the Irish parading tradition* (Basingstoke, 2000), pp 60-77
- McGarry, Fearghal, 'Revolution, 1916-1923', in Thomas Bartlett (ed.), *The Cambridge History of Ireland IV* (Cambridge, 2018), pp 258-296
- McGaughey, Jane, *Ulster's men: Protestant unionist masculinities and militarization in the north of Ireland, 1912-1923* (Montreal, 2012)
- McNeill, Ronald, *Ulster's stand for union* (London, 1922)
- Mecham, Mike, *William Walker: social activist and Belfast labourist, 1870-1918* (Dublin, 2019)
- Millar, S.R., *Sounding dissent: rebel songs, resistance, and Irish republicanism* (Michigan, 2020)
- Miller, D.W., 'Presbyterianism and 'modernisation' in Ulster', in *Past and Present* LXXX (1980), pp 66-90
- Miller, D.W., 'Mass attendance in Ireland in 1834', in S.J. Brown and D.W. Miller (eds), *Piety and power in Ireland 1760-1960* (Belfast, 2000), pp 158-179
- Miller, D.W., *Queen's rebels: Ulster loyalism in historical perspective* (Dublin, 2007)
- Moloney, Ed, *Paisley from demagogue to democrat?* (Dublin, 2008)
- Moloney, Ed, *Voices from the grave: two men's war in Ireland* (London, 2011)
- Moorhouse, H.F., 'The significance of the labour aristocracy', in *Social History* VI, no. 2 (May, 1981), pp 229-233
- Morgan, Austen, *Labour and partition: the Belfast working class, 1905-23* (London, 1991)

- Morris, N.K., 'Traitors to their faith? Protestant clergy and the Ulster Covenant of 1912', in *New Hibernia Review / Iris Éireannach Nua* XV, no. 3 (2011), pp 16-35
- Morris, R.J., 'Reading the riot commission: Belfast, 1857' in *Irish Historical Studies* XLIII, no. 164 (Nov., 2019), pp 194-220
- Moulton, Mo, "'You have votes and power': women's political engagement with the Irish Question in Britain, 1919-23", in *Journal of British Studies* LII (Jan., 2013), pp 179-204
- Myerly, S.H., *British military spectacle: from the Napoleonic Wars through the Crimea* (Massachusetts, 1996)
- Nairn, Tom, *The break-up of Britain: crisis and neo-nationalism*, 2nd Edn. (London, 1981)
- Neal, Frank, *Sectarian violence – the Liverpool experience 1819-1914* (Manchester, 1998)
- Nugent, Jay, and Ewan, Elizabeth, (eds), *Children and youth in premodern Scotland* (Woodbridge, Boydell & Brewer, 2015)
- O' Cathain, Mairtin, ' 'For we are the Brigeton Derry Boys': social and political linkages between Derry and Glasgow in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries', in William Kelly and John R. Young (eds), *Ulster and Scotland, 1600-2000* (Dublin, 2004), pp 43-56
- O'Leary, Brendan, *A Treatise on Northern Ireland Vol. I, Colonialism* (Oxford, 2019)
- Patterson, Henry, *Class conflict and sectarianism: the protestant working class and the Belfast labour movement, 1868-1920* (Belfast, 1980)
- Patterson, Henry and Kaufmann, Eric, *Unionism and Orangeism in Northern Ireland since 1945: the decline of the loyal family* (Manchester, 2007)
- Post, Charles, 'Exploring working-class consciousness: a critique of the theory of the labour-aristocracy' in *Historical Materialism* XVIII, no. 4 (2010), pp 3-38
- Pryke, Sam, 'The popularity of nationalism in the early British boy scout movement', in *Social History* XXIII, no. 3 (1998), pp 309-324
- Pugh, Martin, *The Tories and the people, 1880-1935* (Oxford, 1985)
- Purdue Olwen, (ed.), *Belfast: the emerging city 1850-1914* (Dublin, 2013)

- Quinn, J.F., *Father Mathew's crusade: temperance in nineteenth-century Ireland and Irish America* (Amherst, 2002)
- Radford, Mark, 'Closely akin to actual warfare', in *History Ireland* (Winter, 1999), pp 27-31
- Reid, Fred, 'Socialist Sunday Schools in Britain, 1892–1939', *International Review of Social History* XI, no. 1 (1966), pp 18–47
- Reid, J.M., *Glasgow* (London, 1956)
- Roberts, D.A., 'The Orange Order in Ireland: a religious Institution?' in *The British Journal of Sociology* XXII, no. 3 (1971), pp 269-282
- Rock, Paul, 'Rioting', in *London Review of Books* (17–30 September, 1981), pp 19-30
- Rosenwein, B.H., 'Worrying about emotions in history', in *The American Historical Review* CVII, no. 3 (June, 2002), pp 821-845
- Rosie, Michael, 'Protestant Action and the Edinburgh Irish', in M.J. Mitchell (ed.), *New Perspectives on the Irish in Scotland* (Edinburgh, 2008), pp 145-158
- Royle, S.A., *Portrait of an industrial city: 'Clanging Belfast', 1750-1914* (Belfast 2011)
- Ryan, A.P., *Mutiny at the Curragh* (London, 1956)
- Samuel, Raphael, 'British dimensions: 'four nations history'' in *The Historical Workshop Journal* XL (1995), pp iii-xxii.
- Scull, Margaret, *The Catholic Church and the Northern Ireland Troubles, 1968-1998* (Oxford, 2019)
- Searle, G.R., *A new England?: peace and war 1886-1918* (Oxford, 2005)
- Senior, Hereward, *Orangeism in Ireland and Britain 1795-1836* (London, 1966)
- Senior, Hereward, 'The early Orange Order, 1795-1870', in T.D. Williams (ed.), *Secret societies in Ireland* (Dublin, 1973), pp 36-46
- Sibbett, R.M., *Orangeism in Ireland and throughout the Empire, 2 Vols.* (Belfast, 1915).

- Smith, Joan, 'Class, skill and sectarianism in Glasgow and Liverpool, 1880-1914', in R.J. Morris, (ed.), *Class, power and social structure in British nineteenth-century towns* (Leicester, 1986), pp 158-215
- Smyth, Jim, 'The men of no Popery: the origins of the Orange Order', in *History Ireland* III, No.3 (Autumn, 1995), pp 48-53
- Snell, K.D.M., 'The Sunday-School movement in England and Wales: child labour, denominational control and working-class culture', in *Past and Present* CLXIV, no. 1 (1999), pp 122-167
- Stedman Jones, Gareth, 'Class struggle and the Industrial Revolution', in *New Left Review* XC (March-April 1975), pp 35-69
- Stewart, A.T.Q., *The Ulster Crisis* (Glasgow, 1967)
- Storey, Earl, *Traditional roots: towards an appropriate relationship between the Church of Ireland and the Orange Order* (Dublin, 2002)
- Thompson, E.P., *The making of the English working class* (London, 1991)
- Thomson, Patricia, 'Field', in Michael Grenfell (ed.), *Pierre Bourdieu, key concepts* (Stocksfield, 2008), pp 65-80
- Tohall, Patrick, 'The Diamond fight of and the resultant expulsions', in *Seanchas Ardmhacha: Journal of the Armagh Diocesan Historical Society* III, no. 1 (1958), pp 17-50
- Tonkin, Elizabeth, and Bryan, Dominic, 'Political ritual: time and temporality' in A. Bonholm, (ed.), *Political rituals* (Gothenburg, 1997), 14-36
- Townend, Paul, *Father Mathew, Temperance and Irish Identity* (Dublin, 2002)
- Townsend, Charles, *Political violence in Ireland: government and resistance since 1848* (Oxford, 1983)
- Travers, Daniel, and Ward, Paul, 'Narrating Britain's war: a four nations and more approach to the people's war' in Manual Braganca and P. D. Tame (eds), *The long aftermath: cultural legacies of Europe at war, 1936-2016* (New York, 2016), pp 77-95
- Urquhart, Diane, *Women in Ulster politics, 1890-1940* (Dublin, 2000)
- Vaughan, Geraldine, *The 'local' Irish in the West of Scotland, 1851-1921* (Basingstoke, 2013)
- Vigne, Thea, *Edwardian childhoods* (Routledge, London, 1977)

- Waite, A.E., *A new encyclopaedia of freemasonry* (New York, 1994)
- Walker, Graham, 'The Protestant Irish in Scotland', in T.M. Devine (ed.), *Irish immigrants and Scottish society in the 19th and 20th centuries* (Edinburgh, 1991), pp 22-67
- Walker, Graham, 'The Orange Order in Scotland between the Wars', in *International Review of Social History* XXXVII, no. 2 (1992), pp 177-206
- Walker, Graham, *Intimate strangers: political and cultural interaction between Scotland and Ulster in modern times* (Edinburgh, 1995)
- Walker, Graham, 'The Irish Presbyterian Anti-Home Rule Convention of 1912' in *Studies: An Irish Quarterly Review* LXXXVI, no. 341 (1997), pp 71-77
- Walker, Graham, *A history of the Ulster Unionist Party: protest, pragmatism and pessimism* (Manchester, 2004)
- Waller, P.J., *Democracy and Sectarianism: A political and social history of Liverpool, 1868-1939* (Liverpool, 1981)
- Walvin, James, *A child's world: a social history of English childhood, 1800-1914* (London, 1982)
- Ward, Rachel, *Women, unionism and loyalty in Northern Ireland: from tea-makers to political actors* (Dublin, 2006)
- Webb, Sidney, and Webb, Beatrice, *Industrial Democracy* 2 vols. (London, 1897)
- Webster, Joseph, *The religion of Orange politics: Protestantism and fraternity in contemporary Scotland* (Manchester, 2020)
- Williams, C.R., 'The Welsh Religious Revival 1904-5' in *The British Journal of Sociology* III, no. 3 (1952), pp 242-259
- Wilson, D.A. (ed.), *The Orange Order in Canada* (Dublin, 2007)
- Wilson, Timothy, *Frontiers of violence: conflict and identity in Ulster and Silesia 1918-1922* (Oxford, 2010)
- Wolffe, John, *God and Greater Britain: religion and national life in Britain and Ireland, 1843-1945* (London, 1994)
- Wolffe, John, 'A comparative historical categorisation of anti-Catholicism', in *Journal of Religious History* XXXIX, no. 2 (2015), pp 182-202

- Wolffe, John, 'Protestantism, monarchy and the deference of Christian Britain, 1837-2005', in C. G. Brown and Michael Snape (eds), *Secularisation in the Christian World: essays in honour of Hugh McLeod* (Oxford, 2016), 57-75
- Wright, D.M., Rosato, Michael, Raab, Gillian, Dibben, Chris, Boyle, Paul, O'Reilly, Dermot, 'Does equality legislation reduce intergroup differences? Religious affiliation, socio-economic status and morality in Scotland and Northern Ireland: a cohort study of 400,000 people', in *Health and Place XLV* (2017), pp 32-38
- Wright, Sam, *Crowds and riots: a study in social organization* (London, 1978)
- Yates, Nigel, *Anglican ritualism in Victorian Britain, 1830-1910* (Oxford, 1999)
- Zimmermann, Georges-Denis, *Songs of Irish rebellion - political street ballads and rebel songs 1780-1900* (Dublin, 1967)