



# THE UNIVERSITY *of* EDINBURGH

This thesis has been submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for a postgraduate degree (e.g. PhD, MPhil, DClinPsychol) at the University of Edinburgh. Please note the following terms and conditions of use:

This work is protected by copyright and other intellectual property rights, which are retained by the thesis author, unless otherwise stated.

A copy can be downloaded for personal non-commercial research or study, without prior permission or charge.

This thesis cannot be reproduced or quoted extensively from without first obtaining permission in writing from the author.

The content must not be changed in any way or sold commercially in any format or medium without the formal permission of the author.

When referring to this work, full bibliographic details including the author, title, awarding institution and date of the thesis must be given.

The Impact of the Keswick and Cambridge Holiness  
Movement on British Protestant Missions in Asia (1881-  
1906), with special reference to the Church Missionary  
Society and the China Inland Mission

Okky Chandra Karmawan

Doctor of Philosophy  
The University of Edinburgh  
2020



## Abstract

The religious revivals in later nineteenth-century Britain promoted significant commitment to the cause of overseas mission. One outgrowth of these revivals was the holiness movement, and particularly its expressions in the Keswick movement and in missionary zeal among students at Cambridge University. This thesis explores the contributions of the holiness movement to overseas missions, especially in Asia. It draws on Keswick periodicals, missionary archives, journals, and letters in exploring the connection between the holiness movement and missionary activities in India and China, giving particular reference to three case studies of Asian missionaries: Keswick missionaries, the Cambridge Seven, and Ridley Hall missionaries.

The thesis explores how the holiness movement played an important role in the resurgence of Protestant overseas missions during the later nineteenth century. Holiness teachings were influential both in inspiring British Christians to take up missionary cause and in shaping their mission work. The thesis shows how Holiness-inspired missionaries in India and China engaged in evangelistic, pastoral, educational, and translation and literary work. They were also involved in promoting social welfare programmes among the local people. Their missionary careers continued to reflect certain key holiness emphases, including maintaining personal prayer and Bible reading, emphasising the importance of moral character, and living a simple life. This thesis also shows that holiness-influenced missionaries made important contributions to the development of an indigenous church leadership in Asia.

## Lay Summary

The religious revivals in the late-nineteenth-century Britain produced significant missionary enthusiasm. One outgrowth of these revivals was the holiness movement, and particularly its expressions in the Keswick movement and the holiness movement promoted among students of Cambridge University. Although there have been studies of the Keswick holiness teaching and the Niger Mission, the impact of Keswick teaching on missions in Asia remains significantly under-explored. This thesis is an attempt to fill that gap. It draws on Keswick periodicals, missionary archives, journals, and letters in exploring the connection between the holiness movement and missionary activities in India and China, with particular reference to three case studies of Asian missionaries: Keswick missionaries, the Cambridge Seven, and Ridley Hall missionaries.

Keswick missionaries were those who adhered to holiness teachings propagated at the annual Keswick Conventions, which began in 1875, and who were supported financially by the Keswick Mission Committee. The Cambridge Seven was a group of prominent Cambridge undergraduates, including well-connected sports heroes, who offered themselves in 1884 as missionaries to China. Ridley Hall missionaries were graduates from Ridley Hall, an institution opened in 1881 to prepare evangelical ministers for the Church of England and affiliated to Cambridge University.

The thesis shows that the holiness movement played a significant role in the resurgence of Protestant overseas mission during the later nineteenth century. This movement was influential both in inspiring British Christians to take up the missionary cause and in shaping their mission work. Holiness-inspired missionaries went to India and China, where they engaged in evangelistic, pastoral, educational, and translation and literary work. In some areas their missions approach was similar to that of other missionaries, but in others there were important distinctives, although these reduced over time. It is worth noting that, contrary to some historians who held that there was a lack of social concern as an outcome of the

Keswick theology, some holiness-inspired missionaries were indeed involved in promoting social concern activities among the local people. Their mission lives continued to reflect certain holiness emphases, including maintaining personal prayer and Bible reading, emphasising the importance of moral character, and living a simple life. This thesis also demonstrates that the holiness-influenced missionaries made important contributions toward the development of indigenous church leadership in Asia.

## Acknowledgement

For the completion of this thesis, I realise that there are many people to whom I am indebted. I would like to mention a few who have influenced me deeply and supported me in many ways. The lack of mention of so many others does not mean a lack of gratitude to all the others who have been of great assistance. In particular, I thank my primary supervisor, Professor Stewart J. Brown, for his expertise and insights as a historian. Furthermore, his patience and meticulous supervision have taught me how to be a better scholar. Any deficiencies in this thesis are mine and certainly not a result of any lack of tutelage on his part. I also would like to thank Dr Ian J. Shaw, my secondary supervisor, who was always available and willing to assist me. His vast knowledge and guidance was invaluable for the completion of this thesis. Dr. Andrew Atherstone and Professor Brian Stanley, who examined this work, were insightful for their feedback. I am thankful for their support for this project.

I owe a great debt of gratitude to several institutions who supported me financially for my doctoral study: the Langham Partnership; the School of Divinity, Edinburgh University; and GKY Greenville, my home church in Jakarta, Indonesia. The Langham Partnership did not provide only financial support, but also moral support and prayer for my family. I would like to express my gratitude to Dr Ian J. Shaw and his family, Malcolm and Liz MacGregor who enabled us to enjoy fellowship among the Langham family. I am also grateful that Langham Partnership provided me with an accommodation at Tyndale House and Ridley Hall while I did my research in Cambridge.

I would like to thank the staffs of New College, University of Edinburgh, Cadbury Library, University of Birmingham, British Library and SOAS Library. Special thanks to Elaine Thornton, former archivist at Ridley Hall, who helped me with archival research. My gratitude also goes to the leaders of the Keswick Convention, especially Jonathan Lamb, who helped me have first-hand experience of Keswick Convention 2016. I also would like to thank John and Anne Ruck, former

missionaries to Indonesia, for their friendship and for providing me with an accommodation while I was doing research in Cadbury Library, Birmingham.

I am grateful to my friends in Edinburgh for their encouragement and friendship: James Ross, all the elders and members of Buccleuch Free Church, Fergus' home Bible study group; my friends in New College who made me feel not lonely: Yugi Takayuki, Russell Newton, Lim Khay Tham, and Karl Dahlfred. Thanks are also due to the Indonesian Christian community in Edinburgh, the family of Hendro Lim, and Diana Frost. I also would like to thank Yuzo Adhinarta and all colleagues and friends in Sekolah Tinggi Teologi Reformed Indonesia for their moral support and prayers.

Words cannot express my gratitude to my parents, Toto Chandra and Ivena Soemali, and my sister, Wenny Chandra. We felt a tremendous loss when my brother, Silas Chandra, passed away while I was working on this research. But most of all I thank my family for their patience and constant love: Dickens, Andrea, and Stefan Chandra and especially my beloved wife, Shanti Agustina. She was the one who encouraged me to take this doctoral study and she has accompanied me until this work is finished.

# Contents

<b>Abstract</b> .....	iii
<b>Lay Summary</b> .....	iv
<b>Acknowledgement</b> .....	vi
<b>Contents</b> .....	viii
<b>Introduction</b> .....	1
Historiography of the Keswick Movement, Cambridge, and Ridley Hall ..	11
The Aim of the Thesis .....	21
Methodology.....	25
Outline of Chapters .....	29
<b>Chapter 1</b> .....	31
<b>The Late Nineteenth-Century Holiness Movement in Britain and the     Growing Interest in the Asian Mission</b> .....	31
1.1 The Holiness Teaching, Revival, and the Holiness Movement in the Late Nineteenth Century .....	32
1.1.1 The Origin of the Keswick Movement .....	36
1.1.2 Theological Priorities of the Keswick Movement .....	37
1.1.3 The Historical Context of the Keswick Movement .....	45
1.1.4 Characteristics of the Keswick Movement.....	45
1.1.5 The Keswick Movement and the Welsh Revival.....	47
1.1.6 Cambridge and the Holiness Movements.....	48
1.1.7 Holiness Emphasis in the Annual Letters of Ridley Hall.....	50
1.2 Britain's Growing Interest in Missions and the Opening of Asia.....	53
1.2.1 Britain's Growing Interest in Missions .....	53
1.2.2 The Opening of Asia .....	56
1.2.2.1 India .....	57
1.2.2.1.1 Religious and Cultural Issues in India .....	60
1.2.2.1.2 The Caste System .....	60
1.2.2.1.3 Hinduism and Temple Children.....	64
1.2.2.1.4 The Zenana.....	65
1.2.2.2 Ceylon (now Sri Lanka) .....	66
1.2.2.3 Japan.....	67
1.2.2.4 China.....	68
1.2.2.4.1 Chinese Cultural Issues Encountered by Missionaries ...	73
1.2.2.4.2. Ancestral Veneration .....	73
1.2.2.4.3 Foot Binding .....	77

1.2.2.4.4 Opium Addiction .....	77
1.2.2.4.5 Famine relief .....	79
1.3 Wider Issues of Missions Policy in India and China .....	80
1.3.1. The Role of Women on the Mission Field in Asia .....	80
1.3.2 Education.....	83
1.3.3. Medical Mission .....	86
Conclusion.....	88
<b>Chapter 2 .....</b>	<b>90</b>
<b>The Keswick Holiness Movement and Missions in Asia .....</b>	<b>90</b>
2.1. Missionary Elements in Early Keswick Conventions .....	90
2.1.1 Missionary Sermons in the Main Meetings and Ladies' Meetings.....	91
2.1.2. Missionary Elements in the Missionary Meetings.....	97
2.1.2.1 Testimonies of Overseas Missionaries .....	98
2.1.2.2 Missionary Appeals as Obligation .....	99
2.1.2.3 Missionary Appeals at the End of the Meetings.....	100
2.1.2.4 Missionary Letters and Prayers.....	101
2.2 The Impact of Missionaries from the Keswick Movement on Asia ....	103
2.2.1 The Keswick-inspired Missionaries and Mission Work in Asia ....	104
2.2.1.1 Amy Carmichael .....	104
2.2.1.2 Alice Eveline Luce .....	106
2.2.1.3 Thomas Walker .....	106
2.2.1.4 Gershom Whitfield Guinness.....	107
2.2.1.5 Alex K. Macpherson.....	108
2.2.1.6 Alice Mildred Cable .....	108
2.2.1.7 Florence Marianne Fugill .....	110
2.2.2 The Keswick-inspired Missionaries and Missionary Calling .....	110
2.2.3 The Keswick-inspired Missionaries and their Emphases on Holiness .....	112
2.2.3.1 Emphasis on Holy Living .....	112
2.2.3.2 Emphasis on Holiness Themes.....	114
2.2.3.3 Simple Lifestyle .....	116
2.2.3.4 Communion with God .....	118
2.2.4 The Theology of the Keswick-inspired Missionaries.....	120
2.2.5 Keswick Missionaries and Pentecostalism .....	122
2.3. Keswick Influenced Missionaries Encountering the Asian Context...125	
2.3.1. Hinduism.....	125
2.3.1.1 Caste .....	127
2.3.1.2 Jewellery .....	129

2.3.1.3 Devadasis .....	131
2.3.1.4 The Zenana .....	134
2.3.2 Keswick-Influenced Missionaries and Mission Practice.....	135
2.3.2.1 Preaching and Itinerancy .....	136
2.3.2.2 Education .....	137
2.3.2.3 Medical Work and Disaster Relief.....	143
2.3.2.4 Women and Mission .....	145
2.4 Conclusion .....	146
<b>Chapter 3 .....</b>	<b>151</b>
<b>The Cambridge Seven and Missions in Asia .....</b>	<b>151</b>
3.1. The Mission Activities of the Cambridge Seven .....	152
3.2. The Influence of the Holiness Movement on the Cambridge Seven.....	154
3.3. The Cambridge Seven and their Emphases on Holiness.....	157
3.3.1 Communion with God .....	157
3.3.2 Emphasis on Holy Living .....	159
3.3.3 Emphasis on Holiness Themes.....	161
3.3.3.1 Being Filled with the Spirit.....	161
3.3.3.2 Consecration .....	162
3.4 The Developing Theology of the Cambridge Seven .....	164
3.4.1 Full Salvation.....	164
3.4.2 The Authority of Scripture.....	165
3.4.3 Stanley Smith’s Controversial Views on Universal Salvation .....	166
3.4.4 The Cambridge Seven and Pentecostalism .....	175
3.4.5 Assessment of Changing Theological Views on Holiness on the Mission Field .....	180
3.5. Mission Practices of the Cambridge Seven in Asia .....	182
3.5.1. Particular Responses to Chinese Culture and Religion .....	182
3.5.1.1 Ancestor Veneration .....	182
3.5.1.2 Footbinding.....	185
3.5.2 Overall Missionary Approaches in China .....	185
3.5.2.1 Evangelistic Preaching and Tract Distribution .....	185
3.5.2.2 Work with Opium Addicts .....	188
3.6 The Cambridge Seven and Wider Mission Policy in China.....	194
3.6.1 Medical Work .....	194
3.6.2 Response to Natural Disasters.....	195
3.6.3 The Faith Principle and Fundraising.....	197
3.6.4 Women and Mission .....	201
3.6.5 Education.....	202
3.7 Conclusion .....	204
<b>Chapter Four.....</b>	<b>206</b>
<b>Ridley Hall and Missions in Asia.....</b>	<b>206</b>

4.1 The Impact of the Holiness Movement in Ridley Hall to Missions in Asia .....	207
4.2 Missionary Activities of Ridley Hall Missionaries .....	216
4.2.1 India .....	216
4.2.2 China .....	221
4.2.3 Japan .....	223
4.2.4 Ceylon (Sri Lanka) .....	225
4.3 The Holiness Emphasis of the Ridley Hall Missionaries .....	227
4.3.1 Communion with God .....	227
4.3.2 Emphasis on Holy Living .....	228
4.3.3 Holiness Conferences .....	232
4.3.4 Emphasis on Holiness Themes .....	234
4.3.5 Ridley Hall Missionaries and Pentecostalism .....	235
4.4 Responses of Ridley Hall Missionaries to Issues in Indian and Chinese Culture .....	236
4.5 Ridley Hall Missionaries and Missionary Practice .....	239
4.5.1 Ridley Hall Missionaries and Education .....	239
4.5.2 Ridley Hall Missionaries and Itinerant Preaching and Evangelism .....	242
4.5.3 Ridley Hall Missionaries and Medical Work .....	242
4.5.3 Ridley Hall Missionaries and Social Concern .....	243
4.5.4 Ridley Hall Missionaries and the Role of Women in Mission .....	247
Conclusion .....	248
<b>Conclusion .....</b>	<b>251</b>
<b>The Theological Distinctives of Holiness-Inspired Missionaries Compared to other Evangelical Missions .....</b>	<b>254</b>
The Place of Role Models .....	259
The Theology of Holiness-Inspired Missionaries .....	261
Premillennialism .....	261
Approaches to Theological Study .....	262
Views on the Larger Hope .....	264
Pentecostalism .....	265
Holiness-Inspired Missionaries and Local Asian Cultures .....	267
Holiness-Inspired Missionaries and Mission Practice .....	270
Preaching and Itinerant Evangelism .....	270
Role of Women in Mission .....	271
The Educational Background of Holiness Missionaries .....	274
Holiness-Inspired Missionaries and Educational Work .....	275
Holiness-Inspired Missionaries and Medical Work .....	277
Holiness-Inspired Missionaries and Social Concern .....	278
Holiness-Inspired Missionaries and Racial Attitudes .....	281
Distinctiveness and Differences .....	286
<b>APPENDIX .....</b>	<b>291</b>
<b>Bibliography .....</b>	<b>296</b>

## Introduction

A number of studies of mission history have identified a strong connection between the religious awakenings in North America and Britain in the second half of the nineteenth century, and have noted the increased numbers of candidates for missionary service in the period.<sup>1</sup> According to Stephen Neill, “the new spiritual life into which many Christians entered found expression in a sense of responsibility for personal witness to Christ and for missionary service.”<sup>2</sup> A notable example of this pattern were the interdenominational ‘Faith Missions,’ whose origin, Klaus Fiedler believed, were rooted “in the revival of the second half of the nineteenth century.”<sup>3</sup> Of the revival movement, David Bebbington has observed how it “included not only the mass conversions...but also the raising of churches from an earlier time of quiescence. They were usually outbursts of fresh vigour that stirred whole congregations or even larger bodies of Christians to renewed faith and activism.”<sup>4</sup>

Closely connected to these late nineteenth-century revivals was the growth of the holiness movement, which emphasised a decisive second Christian experience after that of conversion, and a deep, consoling faith in the absolute trustworthiness of God. Its adherents were attracted to premillennialism, believing that the God who could any day bring a second blessing experience, could also break into history any day soon. Should Christ return, he would expect to find his people living out the holy life. With the previous strength of evangelicalism appearing to be on the wane, and rationalism and ritualism on the rise, holiness

---

<sup>1</sup> According to David Bosch, “one of the most significant products of the Evangelical Awakening, in both Britain and North America...was the founding of societies specifically devoted to foreign mission” (David Jacobus Bosch, *Transforming Mission: Paradigm Shifts in Theology of Mission*, American Society of Missiology 16 [Maryknoll: Orbis Books, 1991], 280); In regard to America, Chaney argued that as the result of the Second Great Awakening, “by 1817, the missionary cause had become the great passion of the American churches” (Charles L. Chaney, *The Birth of Missions in America* [South Pasadena: William Carey Library, 1976], 174).

<sup>2</sup> Stephen Neill, *A History of Christian Missions*, Pelican History of the Church; v. 6 (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1986), 275.

<sup>3</sup> Klaus Fiedler, *The Story of Faith Missions* (Oxford: Regnum Books International, 1994), 112.

<sup>4</sup> David Bebbington, *Victorian Religious Revivals: Culture and Piety in Local and Global Contexts* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012), 1.

appeared to many evangelicals an attractive option offering the power to face the challenges of the world.<sup>5</sup>

A growing emphasis on Holiness was seen across a number of religious traditions in the later nineteenth century.<sup>6</sup> During the first two-thirds of the century distinctive evangelical views on holiness were mainly confined to Methodists.<sup>7</sup> However, in the last third of the nineteenth century, ‘holiness’ became an umbrella term for a variety of second-stage spiritual experiences.<sup>8</sup> Even when holiness teaching became more widespread among evangelicals, variations (sometimes quite subtle) in holiness teaching and practice remained. For example, there were variations between Methodist and the Salvation Army expressions (where the words ‘Blood and Fire’ on its flag spoke of redemption and sanctification by the Spirit),<sup>9</sup> and those of Evangelical Anglicans.<sup>10</sup> Other evangelicals, such as J.C. Ryle, who became Bishop of Liverpool, rejected the focus of the holiness movement on experience, arguing that holiness involved personal discipline and effort as well as faith.<sup>11</sup> This thesis will explore three case studies in the period 1881-1906 in which significant numbers were influenced by holiness teaching (largely in the Keswick tradition) and embraced a calling to overseas missionary service. The three case studies will include first, those directly associated with the Keswick convention movement; second, students embracing a Holiness evangelicalism at Cambridge

---

<sup>5</sup> David Bebbington, *Evangelicalism in Modern Britain: a history from the 1730s to the 1980s* (London: Unwin Hyman, 1989), 152.

<sup>6</sup> David Bebbington’s *Holiness in Nineteenth-Century England* (Carlisle: Paternoster, 2000).

<sup>7</sup> David W. Bebbington, *The Dominance of Evangelicalism: The Age of Spurgeon and Moody*, (Leicester: IVP, 2005), 188-94

<sup>8</sup> Valerie A. Abbott, “The Influence of Phoebe Palmer’s Ministry upon The Evangelical Community in Mid-Nineteenth-Century Britain: An Assessment of her Itinerant Ministry in Britain 1859-63” (MLitt Thesis., University of Bristol, 2000), 45, quoted in Christopher E. M. Wigram, *The Bible and Mission in Faith Perspective: J. Hudson Taylor and the Early China Inland Mission* (Zoetermeer: Uitgevers Boekencentrum, 2007), 60.

<sup>9</sup> On the influence of Phoebe Palmer, the Methodist holiness teacher, on William and Catherine Booth see John Kent, *Holding the Fort: Studies in Victorian Revivalism* (London: Epworth, 1978), 310-340.

<sup>10</sup> Bebbington argues that holiness teaching had won the allegiance of the Evangelical Party of the Church of England by the end of the nineteenth century, judging by the evidence of the Islington Clerical Conference (Bebbington, *Holiness*, 89-90).

<sup>11</sup> This is set out in J.C. Ryle’s, *Holiness: Its Nature, Hindrance, Difficulties, and Roots* (London: W. Hunt & Co, 1879).

University; and third, students embracing Holiness evangelicalism while studying specifically at the Anglican training college, Ridley Hall, which was located in Cambridge.

Conferences which emphasised holiness themes and which had annual meetings became common in the later nineteenth century. These included the interdenominational Mildmay Conference, initiated by the Anglican William Pennefather and initially held in Barnet in 1856 before it moved to Mildmay Park in north London in 1864. There were also gatherings for the “promotion of scriptural holiness” held in Oxford in 1874 and in Brighton in 1875, led by Robert and Hannah Pearsall Smith.<sup>12</sup> Although many attending these conferences showed little interest in world mission, Valerie Abbott has noted a connection between holiness teaching and enthusiasm for mission in the work of Phoebe Palmer, who connected holiness and world evangelization. For her, placing emphasis on the power of the Spirit was the way to see the completion of world evangelization and herald the return of Christ.<sup>13</sup> This connection between holiness in the inner life and power for service, together with Palmer’s erosion of clergy-laity distinctions and denominational difference,<sup>14</sup> encouraged significant numbers of lay people to volunteer for the new interdenominational faith missions such as the China Inland Mission.

In 1875, the first holiness convention was held at Keswick in the north of England, the start of what was to be an annual event.<sup>15</sup> The Keswick movement and its teaching became extremely influential, so much so that David Bebbington claims that it “shaped the prevailing pattern of Evangelical piety for much of the twentieth century.”<sup>16</sup> Moira McKay observes how Keswick successfully “institutionalized

---

<sup>12</sup> Bebbington, *Evangelicalism in Modern Britain*, 151.

<sup>13</sup> Abbott, “The Influence of Phoebe Palmer’s Ministry,” 55, quoted in Wigram, *Bible and Mission*, 182.

<sup>14</sup> Fiedler, *The Story of Faith Missions*, 226

<sup>15</sup> James Edwin Orr believes that the Keswick Convention was the fruit of the Second Evangelical Awakening. According to Orr, “the Keswick Convention for the Deepening of the Spiritual Life, an evangelical movement with a truly worldwide influence, budded at gatherings in London, Oxford and Brighton in 1873, ’74 and ’75...but the seed was sown in the great Revival of 1858-59 in the English-speaking world (J. Edwin Orr, *The Fervent Prayer: The Worldwide Impact of the Great Awakening of 1858* [Chicago: Moody Press, 1974], 142).

<sup>16</sup> Bebbington, *Evangelicalism in Modern Britain*, 151.

holiness within the Protestant churches,” without it becoming a sect outside them.<sup>17</sup> The Keswick holiness movement also proved instrumental in promoting enhanced missionary vigour. This was demonstrated by the involvement of James Hudson Taylor, the founder of the China Inland Mission, who spoke at the Keswick Convention in 1883. By 1886 fringe meetings on mission had been introduced at Keswick, and in 1888 they became part of the main event.<sup>18</sup> The Keswick Conventions, according to Handley Moule, an influential Evangelical scholar and leader, “served to a remarkable degree to call attention to the Missionary Commission of the Church of Christ, and to animate ‘the wills of the faithful people’ of God in the way of offers of personal missionary service.”<sup>19</sup> A question to be asked is what was it about the Keswick Convention that encouraged such large numbers of believers to offer themselves for missionary service? A number of official accounts of the Keswick holiness movement refer to the impact of the Keswick Convention upon the missionary cause.<sup>20</sup> Less attention, however, has been paid to the theological and practical aspects of the Convention which were vital in bringing committed believers to take up the missionary call. Moreover, little research has been carried out on the influence of Keswick holiness teaching on the missionary work of those missionaries inspired by the Keswick movement.

Many of those who were inspired by holiness teaching to respond to the missionary call tended to serve with the long-established Church Missionary Society [CMS], or the recently established in China Inland Mission [CIM]. Indeed, the rapid growth in the numbers of candidates sent by those missions coincided with the growing spread of holiness teaching (especially as a result of Keswick influence) in the final third of the nineteenth century. The first party of missionaries sent out by

---

<sup>17</sup> Moira McKay, “Faith and Facts in the History of the China Inland Mission, 1832-1905” (MLitt thesis., University of Aberdeen, 1981), 157

<sup>18</sup> *Ibid.*, 63.

<sup>19</sup> Handley C. G. Moule, *The Evangelical School in the Church of England: Its Men and Its Work in the Nineteenth Century* (London: James Nisbet, 1901), 85.

<sup>20</sup> Eugene Stock, “The Missionary Element,” in *The Keswick Convention: Its Message, Its Method and Its Men*, ed. Charles F. Harford (London: Marshall, 1907); Charles W. Price and Ian M. Randall, *Transforming Keswick: The Keswick Convention Past, Present & Future* (Carlisle: OM Publishing, 2000), 105–126.

the CIM in 1866 numbered just 16, by 1885 there were 200 missionaries, and 650 by the mid 1890s.<sup>21</sup> Recruitment to the CMS was also significantly boosted by holiness-inspired commitments, helping it to recover from the period 1869-72 which its historian Eugene Stock called “an epoch of deep depression,” so much so that in the last two decades of the nineteenth century the number of CMS missionaries grew from 250 to nearly 1,000.<sup>22</sup> This thesis explores why this large influx of holiness-inspired missionaries looked to those societies for mission service.

Eugene Stock, secretary of the Church Missionary Society, was regularly the Chairman of the Keswick missionary meetings, so he had a ready connection with Anglicans who attended the Keswick convention who expressed an interest in mission. Other missionary societies connected with the convention included the Student Volunteer Missionary Union, the British counterpart of the Student Volunteer movement, which met for a few years in connection with Keswick. The emphasis on sanctification for service connected with the ‘evangelization of the world in this generation’ slogan helped to produce “a new generation of pietistic, university educated young British missionaries in the two decades before World War I.”<sup>23</sup>

Women were already widely involved in different aspects of church work in the mid-nineteenth century, as Sunday-School teachers, running social concern projects in churches, and raising missionary support. From the late 1870s, they were able to be Salvation Army officers, and from the 1860s serve as deaconesses in the Church of England.<sup>24</sup> Their role on the mission field has historically been greatly underemphasized. As the wives of missionaries they were present from the very start of mission.

---

<sup>21</sup> Wigram, *Bible and Mission*, 206.

<sup>22</sup> Eugene Stock, *One Hundred Years: Being the Short History of the Church Missionary Society* (London: The Church Missionary Society, 1898), 112; Cox, *British Missionary Enterprise*, 182.

<sup>23</sup> Dana L. Robert, *Occupy Until I Come: A.T. Pierson and the Evangelization of the World* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2003), 256.

<sup>24</sup> Bebbington, *Evangelicalism in Modern Britain*, 129.

As Jocelyn Murray observed, “it is increasingly recognized that women were of fundamental importance in defining, developing, and shaping the course of the modern missionary movement.”<sup>25</sup> The first three women to offer themselves as missionaries for the CMS did so in 1815, and though they were rejected, in 1822 Mary Ann Cooke, who was already in Calcutta, was taken on by them after the previous source of her funding dried up. She started an orphanage which later became a boarding school. A series of mission societies particularly for women followed. By the late nineteenth century, the service of women on the mission field had become “commonplace, with 53% of them being missionary wives, and the rest single women.”<sup>26</sup> By the 1830s specialist mission agencies for women were emerging. William Pennefather’s wife, Catherine, began the informal training of evangelical Anglican women foreign missionaries in 1860 at Christ Church, Barnet, in north London.<sup>27</sup>

Holiness teaching also helped to increase the number of female missionary candidates.<sup>28</sup> Some of the key promoters of holiness teaching were women, notably Phoebe Palmer and Hannah Pearsall Smith. According to Abbott, Palmer’s work emphasised “the spiritual equality of women with men,” which became an important theme at Keswick.<sup>29</sup> Holiness teaching, together with the Keswick movement, proved attractive to women who attended the conventions in large numbers, and often they were the first to respond to the call for missionary service.<sup>30</sup>

---

<sup>25</sup> Jocelyn Murray, “The Role of Women in the Church Missionary Society, 1799-1917,” in *The Church Missionary Society and World Christianity, 1799-1999*, ed. K. Ward and B. Stanley (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2000), 66.

<sup>26</sup> *Ibid.*, 71, 89. The failure to properly count the role of women in mission statistics is attributed by Cox to the “gender politics” of the compilers of the statistics. If missionary wives are counted, by the 1880s “the majority of the missionary workforce was female” – perhaps 54%, a statistic repeated across missions from different theological perspectives (Cox, *British Missionary Enterprise*, 197-98).

<sup>27</sup> Cox, *British Missionary Enterprise*, 189-90.

<sup>28</sup> Fiedler, *The Story of Faith Missions*, 134, 293, 395

<sup>29</sup> Abbott, “The Influence of Phoebe Palmer’s Ministry,” ii, quoted in Wigram, *Bible and Mission*, 212.

<sup>30</sup> Wigram, *Bible and Mission*, 209-10.

A notable example, which will be considered in this study, is that of Amy Carmichael, the first missionary to be supported by funds from the Keswick Convention. Hudson Taylor was a driving force in encouraging single women to go to China as missionaries, many of whom came from the USA. He insisted that they were not subject to harassment in China, and were effective in working fields on their own, although their presence was opposed by some missionaries of other societies in China. Taylor called the deployment of women “the most powerful agency we have at our disposal,”<sup>31</sup> and his willingness to defy public opinion and endorse the significant role single women could play encouraged other missionary societies to recruit more women.<sup>32</sup> C. Peter Williams regarded him as “the leading British exponent of what was nothing less than a revolution in the understanding of the role of women in missionary work.”<sup>33</sup> He was more interested in the spiritual characteristics of candidates than whether they were men or women.<sup>34</sup> By 1890, more than half of the Protestant missionary force in China were women,<sup>35</sup> and as has been noted, a number of the holiness-influenced missionaries in this study are women.

Another significant expression of the holiness movement, which serves as the second case study in this thesis, emerged among students of Cambridge University. Keswick-style meetings were already being held in Cambridge in early 1883.<sup>36</sup> The holiness movement at this time was given particular emphasis by the American evangelists, Dwight L. Moody and Ira Sankey – and their distinctive teaching – including the urgency of evangelism, holy living, and pre-millennial eschatology. Holiness teaching was also heard at the conferences that Moody arranged in America, and these teachings inspired significant interest in overseas

---

<sup>31</sup> *Occasional Papers of the China Inland Mission*, quoted in C. Peter Williams, “The Missing Link: The Recruitment of Women Missionaries in some English Evangelical Missionary Societies in the Nineteenth Century,” in Fiona Bowie, et. Al. (eds.) *Women and Missions: Past and Present* (Oxford: Berg, 1993), 48. 50.

<sup>32</sup> Ruth A. Tucker, “Unbecoming Ladies,” *Christian History*, No. 52, (1996).

<sup>33</sup> Williams, “The Missing Link,” 50.

<sup>34</sup> McKay, “Facts and Faith,” 107

<sup>35</sup> Kenneth Scott Latourette, *A History of Christian Missions in China* (London, 1929), 407.

<sup>36</sup> McKay, “Faith and Facts,” 162.

mission, especially among students.<sup>37</sup> Moody's holiness teaching was very similar to that of Keswick, although not identical.<sup>38</sup> After the Moody and Sankey mission in 1882 to the University, a group of prominent Cambridge undergraduates, who included some well-connected sports heroes – the "Cambridge Seven" – offered themselves in 1884 as missionaries to China with the China Inland Mission, which had been founded in 1865. A conference for collegiate YMCA leaders arranged in 1886 by D. L. Moody in Northfield, Massachusetts, included an address to the students on the topic of mission, proclaiming that 'all should go and go to all.' At that Conference one hundred students volunteered for overseas mission. Inspired by the example of the Cambridge Seven, who in 1884 had toured universities in Britain promoting missions before embarking for China, the 'Mount Hermon 100' similarly toured American colleges in 1886-87. In 1888, the Student Volunteer Movement for Foreign Missions was founded. Although not a mission agency in itself, it "channelled the major life decisions of educated young people into the missionary movement."<sup>39</sup> By 1911, over five thousand student volunteers had gone to the mission field from the USA alone. This movement inspired the Cambridge Inter-Collegiate Christian Union to found Cambridge Student Volunteer Missionary Union (SVMU) in 1892. According to Dana Robert, the Student Volunteer Movement "propelled missions from being an after thought of Protestant churches, to the leading form of global outreach in the twentieth century."<sup>40</sup>

The theological college affiliated to Cambridge University whose spiritual atmosphere and missionary vitality was most deeply affected by the 1882 mission

---

<sup>37</sup> See, Dana L. Robert, *Occupy Until I Come*.

<sup>38</sup> Bebbington, *The Dominance of Evangelicalism*, 197.

<sup>39</sup> Robert, *Occupy Until I Come*, 150.

<sup>40</sup> *Ibid.* For the story of CICCUCU and the student mission movement at Cambridge, see Douglas Johnson, *Contending for the Faith: A History of the Evangelical Movement in the Universities and Colleges* (Leicester: Inter-Varsity Press, 1979); Oliver R. Barclay and Robert M. Horn, *From Cambridge to the World: 125 Years of Student Witness* (Leicester: Inter-Varsity, 2002); Oliver R. Barclay, *Whatever Happened to the Jesus Lane Lot?* (Leicester: Inter-Varsity Press, 1977). For the story of the Student Christian Movement, see Tissington Tatlow, *The Story of the Student Christian Movement of Great Britain and Ireland* (London: Student Christian Movement Press, 1933); Robin H. S. Boyd, *The Witness of the Student Christian Movement: "Church Ahead of the Church"* (London: Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge, 2007).

of Moody and Sankey was Ridley Hall, and this forms the third case study in this thesis. A pivotal figure in encouraging Ridley Hall students to take up missionary cause was Handley Carr Glyn Moule (1841-1920).<sup>41</sup> Handley Moule became the first Principal of Ridley Hall when it was founded in 1881, and then was selected as Norrisian Professor of Divinity at Cambridge University in 1899, serving until his appointment as Bishop of Durham in 1901. He had embraced the Keswick message in 1884, thus establishing a link between Ridley Hall and the Keswick movement, in which he played an important role. He was a regular speaker at the Keswick Conventions and he wrote two important works expressing the Keswick holiness view, *Thoughts on Christian Sanctity* and a commentary on Romans.<sup>42</sup> Under Moule's leadership, 117 Ridley Hall students offered themselves for missionary service.<sup>43</sup>

Andrew Porter has noted that the going forth of many Ridley Hall graduates to mission fields formed a significant contrast to the general decline of CMS recruits during 1860s and 1870s: "the historian of the CMS has presented a wealth of melancholy detail illustrating the general decline in the fortunes of missionary societies...during the 1860s and early '70s." Porter further quoted from the CMS report for 1872 that, "the Committee had the painful duty of stating, for the first time for many years that not one single University man had offered for missionary service."<sup>44</sup> This inspiration of missionary zeal amongst students from Ridley Hall in turn raises interesting questions as to what influenced the students in their

---

<sup>41</sup> For the biography of Handley Moule, see John Battersby Harford and Frederick C. Macdonald, *Handley Carr Glyn Moule, Bishop of Durham: A Biography* (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1922); Marcus L. Loane, *Handley Carr Glyn Moule 1841-1920*, Great Churchmen no. 1 (London: Church Book Room Press, 1947).

<sup>42</sup> H. C. G. Moule, *Thoughts on Christian Sanctity* (London, 1885); H. C. G. Moule, *The Epistle of St. Paul to the Romans*, Second ed., The Expositor's Bible (London, 1894).

<sup>43</sup> F. W. B. Bullock, *The History of Ridley Hall, Cambridge / Vol. 1, To the End of A.D. 1907*, vol. 1 (Cambridge: University Press for the Council of Ridley Hall, 1941), 333. This number is more than that under the leadership of Thomas Wortley Drury, the next Principal, under whom 50 students out of the total of 314 went to overseas mission (Ibid., 1:431).

<sup>44</sup> Andrew Porter, "Cambridge, Keswick, and Late-Nineteenth-Century Attitudes to Africa," *The Journal of Imperial and Commonwealth History* 5, no. 1 (1976): 10.

decisions, and also what kind of impact the Ridley Hall students made on the missionary movement.

There have been important works on the impact of the holiness movement on missions in Africa, most notably by Andrew Porter.<sup>45</sup> These have suggested that the impact of holiness on missionary practice, especially in relation to local culture and the development of local leadership, was not positive.<sup>46</sup> However, there have been few studies on the impact of the holiness movement on missions in Asia, which is the focus of this thesis. As noted earlier, the thesis will provide three case studies of candidates for missionary work in Asia influenced by the holiness movement – first, those associated with the Keswick Conventions; second, those associated with the holiness tradition at Cambridge University more generally; and third, those associated with the Anglican training college, Ridley Hall, where the Principal Handley Moule promoted a holiness emphasis. The thesis will also consider how some aspects of their mission practice in Asia was shaped by the holiness teachings held by these missionaries. It seeks to explore whether the holiness teachings were adapted more effectively or appropriately in Asia than in Africa, and whether there were notable differences in approach among the Keswick missionaries, Cambridge University missionaries, and Ridley Hall missionaries. The thesis focuses on the period when the Keswick-influenced was having a very significant impact on the recruitment of missionaries, especially for the China Inland Mission, and the Church Missionary Society.

---

<sup>45</sup> *Ibid.*, 5–34; Andrew N. Porter, *Religion Versus Empire?: British Protestant Missionaries and Overseas Expansion, 1700-1914* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2004), 223–354.

<sup>46</sup> Porter, “Cambridge, Keswick, and Late-Nineteenth-Century Attitudes to Africa,” 5–34. See also Porter, *Religion Versus Empire?* 223–354; C. Peter Williams, “From Church to Mission: An Examination of the Official Missionary Strategy of the Church Missionary Society on the Niger, 1887-93,” in *Voluntary Religion: Papers Read at the 1985 Summer Meeting and the 1986 Winter Meeting of the Ecclesiastical History Society*, ed. W. J. Sheils and Diana Wood, *Studies in Church History*; 23 (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1986), 391–409.

## Historiography of the Keswick Movement, Cambridge, and Ridley Hall

There have been several official historical accounts of the Keswick Convention since its beginnings in 1875. The first account appeared in 1907, and was entitled *The Keswick Convention: Its Message, Its Method and Its Men*. It was a compilation of twenty-one essays, edited by Charles Harford, the son of the founder of the Keswick Convention, Canon Harford-Battersby. As well as recording the history of early Conventions, the book also discussed the larger impact of the movement, including its international impact. The book was followed by *Keswick from Within* written by J.B. Figgis in 1914 to commemorate the fortieth anniversary. The year 1935 saw the publication of *These Sixty Years: The Story of the Keswick Convention*, celebrating the Diamond Jubilee of the Convention.<sup>47</sup> It was authored by Walter B. Sloan at the request of the Trustees of the Keswick Convention. Sloan, who had attended the Convention thirty-seven times, provided a chronological narrative, emphasising the uniqueness of each Convention. In 1964, as the Council of the Keswick Convention felt the need to make the history and message of the Keswick movement more appealing to a younger generation, the respected evangelical author, John Pollock, wrote *The Keswick Story*.<sup>48</sup> Pollock described the Keswick movement largely through a number of important leaders and speakers of the movement. While he was positive about the movement, Pollock did not cover up the character failures of some figures, especially Robert Pearsall Smith's suspected adultery, which forced his hasty return to the United States. The latest official account of the Keswick Convention was written at the end of the twentieth century by Charles Price and Ian Randall, and was entitled *Transforming Keswick*.<sup>49</sup> In this book, the authors not only presented a narrative history of the Keswick movement during its first one hundred and twenty-five years, but they also assessed its larger impact on evangelicalism. In

---

<sup>47</sup> John Benjamin Figgis, *Keswick from Within* (London, New York, 1914).

<sup>48</sup> John Pollock, *The Keswick Story. The Authorized History of the Keswick Convention* (London, 1964).

<sup>49</sup> Charles W. Price and Ian M. Randall, *Transforming Keswick: The Keswick Convention Past, Present & Future* (Carlisle: OM Publishing, 2000).

addition, they devoted several chapters to some of the more controversial theological issues of the movement.

Along with these accounts of the Keswick movement, there have also been studies of the holiness movement and its influence on nineteenth-century British religious life. In *Trust and Obey: Explorations in Evangelical Spirituality*, David K. Gillett presented the Keswick movement as a distinctive way of pursuing holiness.<sup>50</sup> While many evangelicals who stood in the Reformers' and Puritan tradition recognised the need of inner struggle and conflict in striving for holiness, others were drawn to Keswick teachings which emphasised a quietist faith devoid of any effort. These Keswick teachings profoundly influenced the concept of holiness within evangelicalism down to the twentieth century and thus cannot be ignored. Similarly, James M. Gordon in his *Evangelical Spirituality* considered Keswick holiness teaching to be a major source of spiritual enrichment.<sup>51</sup>

More notably, David Bebbington, the leading historian of the modern British evangelical movement, devoted a full chapter to the Keswick movement and its context in his influential work on evangelicalism from the eighteenth to twentieth century, *Evangelicalism in Modern Britain*.<sup>52</sup> He described various spiritual traditions in Christianity which contributed to the holiness movement. Later, in his Didsbury Lectures delivered in 1998 and published as *Holiness in Nineteenth-Century England*, Bebbington investigated the spirituality of the Keswick tradition, along with the High Church, the Calvinist, and the Wesleyan traditions.<sup>53</sup> The Keswick tradition, he argued, reflected the Romantic influences which were so prevalent in the later nineteenth century. More recently, in 2005, Bebbington published *The Dominance of Evangelicalism*, in which he viewed the Keswick movement as one element that reflected the conservative theological tendency within evangelicalism. In the same year, Ian Randall wrote a study of evangelical spirituality, entitled *What*

---

<sup>50</sup> David K. Gillett, *Trust and Obey: Explorations in Evangelical Spirituality* (London: Darton, Longman & Todd, 1993), 94–128.

<sup>51</sup> James M. Gordon, *Evangelical Spirituality* (London: SPCK, 1991).

<sup>52</sup> Bebbington, *Evangelicalism in Modern Britain*, 151–180.

<sup>53</sup> Bebbington, *Holiness*.

*a Friend We Have in Jesus*.<sup>54</sup> In a chapter on Holy Spirit and holiness, Randall discussed the Keswick spirituality, together with the Calvinist and Wesleyan view of holiness. He analysed the worldwide development and the impact of the Keswick movement, particularly on the Pentecostal spirituality in the early twentieth century.

Although the Keswick movement had no official set of doctrines, Steven Barabas's *So Great Salvation*, published in 1952, was an important work which presented an interpretation of its general theology.<sup>55</sup> While Barabas had never attended any of the Conventions, his book was a successful attempt at analysing Keswick's holiness teachings. In *Five Views of Sanctification*,<sup>56</sup> J. Robertson McQuilkin also presented the Keswick theological perspective, in an account that largely followed Barabas' line of thought. There has also been some criticism of the teaching of the Keswick movement, notably in works by James Packer.<sup>57</sup> For Packer, the doctrine of holiness taught at Keswick contradicted the Reformed view of sanctification.<sup>58</sup> He even labelled Keswick teaching as Pelagian because of the seeming implication that God's power depends on the power of human will.

Writing from within the Keswick circle, W. H. Griffith Thomas argued that its teaching was rooted in a work entitled *The Gospel Mystery of Sanctification* by Walter Marshall, a seventeenth-century English Puritan divine; this, he insisted, demonstrated a link between the older Reformed theology and Keswick theologies.<sup>59</sup> Bebbington, however, denied the connection, arguing that there was

---

<sup>54</sup> Ian M. Randall, *What A Friend We Have in Jesus: The Evangelical Tradition*, Traditions of Christian Spirituality (London: Darton Longman & Todd, 2005), 119–128.

<sup>55</sup> Steven Barabas, *So Great Salvation. The History and Message of the Keswick Convention, Etc* (London: Marshall, Morgan & Scott, 1952).

<sup>56</sup> J. Robertson McQuilkin, "The Keswick Perspective," in *Five Views of Sanctification*, ed. Stanley N. Gundry (Michigan: Zondervan, 1947), 149–186.

<sup>57</sup> J. I. Packer, "'Keswick' and the Reformed Doctrine of Sanctification," *The Evangelical Quarterly* 27, no. 3 (July 1955): 153–167. For another criticism of Packer on Keswick teaching, see J. I. Packer, *Keep in Step with the Spirit: Finding Fullness in Our Walk with God*, New expanded ed. (Leicester: Inter-Varsity, 2005).

<sup>58</sup> For the most recent work critiquing the Keswick teaching of holiness, see Andrew David Naselli, *Let Go and Let God? A Survey and Analysis of Keswick Theology* (Lexham Press, 2010).

<sup>59</sup> W. H. Griffith Thomas, "The Literature of Keswick," in *The Keswick Convention: Its Message, Its Method and Its Men*, ed. Charles F. Harford (London: Marshall, 1907), 223.

no continuity between Marshall's holiness teaching in the seventeenth century and Keswick's in the nineteenth century. An unpublished doctoral dissertation by Cheul Hee Lee, "Sanctification by faith: Walter Marshall's doctrine of sanctification in comparison with the Keswick view of sanctification," is a careful study comparing the concept of holiness in Marshall and Keswick.<sup>60</sup> He concludes that while they have the same essential theology, they differ in practical applications. However, Lee by no means proved that the Keswick teaching was historically derived from Marshall's conception.

An important influence of the Keswick movement was on missionary work. As we have seen, late nineteenth-century and twentieth-century Britain experienced a surge in the number of its foreign missionaries, partly as a result of the Keswick Conventions. Earnest Christians who had already gone through the experience of consecration, which was their "response to God's call for complete abandonment and surrender to Him,"<sup>61</sup> were ready to do whatever God wanted them to do with their life. The experience of being filled by the Spirit was thought to lead inevitably to Christian service, the expression of which was often understood as committing oneself to overseas missions. Eugene Stock, the influential secretary of the Church Missionary Society, pointed out that, "the call to entire dedication of body, soul, and spirit to the service of the Lord, which has been an essential part of the message of Keswick to the Church of Christ, could not fail, in time, to send some of those it influenced in to the foreign mission field."<sup>62</sup>

However, it was not until 1888 that missionary meetings became an official part of the programme at the Keswick Convention. The reason for this was not that the leaders of early Conventions did not support overseas mission, but rather that they feared negative consequences if they deviated from the original purpose. It was Reginald Radcliffe, a zealous evangelical Liverpool solicitor, who invited some

---

<sup>60</sup> Cheul Hee Lee, "Sanctification by Faith: Walter Marshall's Doctrine of Sanctification in Comparison with the Keswick View of Sanctification" (PhD diss., Westminster Theological Seminary, 2005), accessed August 29, 2018, <http://search.proquest.com/docview/305422832/?pq-origsite=primo>.

<sup>61</sup> Barabas, *So Great Salvation*, 148.

<sup>62</sup> Stock, "The Missionary Element," 133.

friends to pray with him for world mission at the 1885 Convention, and such informal prayer meetings continued in the next two Conventions. At the close of the Convention's missionary meeting in 1887, presided over by Radcliffe, around thirty people rose and offered themselves for overseas mission.<sup>63</sup> That meeting, which was attended by Hudson Taylor, H. W. Webb-Peploe, Eugene Stock, and James Johnson, an African clergyman, seemed to be a pivotal moment which stimulated H. F. Bowker's statement that, "Consecration and the Evangelization of the World ought to go together,"<sup>64</sup> and the inclusion of a missionary meeting as part of the official Keswick programme the following year.

The impact of the Keswick Convention on British foreign missions has been considerable. In presenting a historical account of 125 years of the Keswick Convention, Price and Randall observed that, "from the 1880s there has been a strong link between Keswick and the missionary imperative and at times hundreds of young people have stood up at Keswick in response to the missionary appeal."<sup>65</sup> The impact on students of Keswick was particularly notable, as C. Peter Williams observed: "Perhaps the most important impact of Keswick was that the recruitment of graduates, particularly from Cambridge, was beginning to reach unprecedented heights. Thus there were considerably more graduates sent out by the CMS in 1890 than in any previous, or subsequent, year of the nineteenth century."<sup>66</sup>

With such strong connections existing, it is perhaps surprising that apart from the work of Porter and Williams on Africa, there has been comparatively little research on Keswick influences on British missions to other parts of the world. It is perhaps because of the supposedly inward-looking nature of holiness teaching.

John Battersby Harford, in "The Keswick Mission Council," discussed the funds collected since 1888 at the Keswick Convention for missionary purposes. The money was used to support both "Keswick Missioners," who propagated the

---

<sup>63</sup> Radcliffe gained approval from H. F. Bowker, the Chairman of the Keswick Convention, to use the tent for a missionary meeting on Saturday morning in the 1886 and 1887 Conventions.

<sup>64</sup> Stock, "The Missionary Element," 136.

<sup>65</sup> Price and Randall, *Transforming Keswick*, 106.

<sup>66</sup> C. Peter Williams, *The Ideal of the Self-Governing Church: A Study in Victorian Missionary Strategy* (Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1990), 155.

Keswick holiness view in foreign countries, and “Keswick Missionaries,” who worked under existing mission societies. In 1893, Amy Carmichael became the first Keswick missionary: she was supported by the Keswick Committee to travel to Japan under the authority of the Church of England Zenana Missionary Society. Harford provided a valuable list of those who went out as Keswick Missionaries up to 1906.<sup>67</sup> Only those who embraced Keswick beliefs were accepted to be Keswick missionaries. Price and Randall asserted that, “those going overseas under the banner of Keswick should have ‘entered into the full meaning of Keswick’... Interviews for prospective missionaries laid considerable stress on the transformed life.”<sup>68</sup>

There have been some biographical works on Keswick missionaries. Amy Carmichael was perhaps the best known of these, and several biographies on her have been produced; among the more important ones were *Amy Carmichael: The Story of a Lover and her Beloved*, written by Frank Houghton, and *A Chance to Die: The Life and Legacy of Amy Carmichael*, authored by Elisabeth Elliot.<sup>69</sup> *Amy Carmichael: Beauty for Ashes* was the latest biography, written by Iain H. Murray.<sup>70</sup> Carmichael herself wrote a biography on another Keswick missionary, Thomas Walker, entitled *This One Thing*. A biography of Whitfield Guinness entitled *Guinness of Honan* was written by his sister, Geraldine Guinness, known after her marriage as Mrs. Howard Taylor.<sup>71</sup> There was also a biography of Mildred Cable, who was not a Keswick missionary but who responded to the missionary call at a Keswick Convention and embarked on overseas mission; it was entitled *Three Women*, as Cable along with two sisters surnamed French became famous as the Trio.<sup>72</sup> In 2009, Mikeuel Eugene Peterson completed an unpublished doctoral thesis

---

<sup>67</sup> J. Battersby Harford, “The Keswick Mission Council,” in *The Keswick Convention: Its Message, Its Method and Its Men*, ed. Charles F. Harford (London: Marshall, 1907), 149, 154.

<sup>68</sup> Price and Randall, *Transforming Keswick*, 152–3.

<sup>69</sup> Frank Houghton, *Amy Carmichael of Dohnavur: The Story of a Lover and Her Beloved* (London: SPCK, 1981); Elisabeth Elliot, *A Chance to Die: The Life and Legacy of Amy Carmichael* (Old Tappan, N.J.: F.H. Revell Co, 1987).

<sup>70</sup> Iain Hamish Murray, *Amy Carmichael: Beauty for Ashes: A Biography* (Edinburgh: The Banner of Truth Trust, 2015).

<sup>71</sup> Mrs. Howard Taylor, *Guinness of Honan* (London: China Inland Mission, 1930).

<sup>72</sup> William James Platt, *Three Women: Mildred Cable, Francesca French [and] Evangeline French* (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1964).

on Alice E. Luce, “‘Led by the Holy Spirit’: The Missionary Career, Leadership, Thought, and Influence of Alice Eveline Luce.”<sup>73</sup> While these biographical studies described the mission work of Keswick-inspired missionaries, they did not provide detailed examination of the impact of the Keswick movement on their theology and mission service.

In his important article on the impact of the nineteenth-century British holiness movement on the African mission, “Cambridge, Keswick, and late-nineteenth-century attitudes to Africa,” published in 1976, Andrew Porter argued that the failure of the Niger Mission under the leadership of Bishop Samuel Crowther in 1890 was caused in part by the demanding moral standards and ‘uncompromising spirituality’ brought to the region by young missionaries, most of whom were Cambridge graduates who had imbibed Keswick holiness teaching. Under the leadership of Graham Wilmot Brooke, later a leader in the ill-fated CMS Sudan Missionary Party, the missionaries were highly critical of Bishop Samuel Crowther and his agents, who were judged to be lacking in Christian moral character.<sup>74</sup> Bishop Crowther had been consecrated in 1864 as the first black Anglican Bishop, with the hope of fulfilling the ideal expressed by Henry Venn (1796-1873) of creating an independent self-governing African Church. Venn believed that the role of missionary was “primarily to establish indigenous churches which would be self-supporting, self-governing, and self-propagating.”<sup>75</sup> The perceived failure of the African workers to meet the demanding standards of holiness of G. W. Brooke eventually led to the purging of the Niger Mission of many African agents and the replacement of Crowther by a European.<sup>76</sup>

---

<sup>73</sup> Mikeuel Eugene Peterson, “‘Led by the Holy Spirit’: The Missionary Career, Leadership, Thought, and Influence of Alice Eveline Luce” (D.Miss diss., Asbury Theological Seminary, 2009).

<sup>74</sup> Porter, “Cambridge, Keswick, and Late-Nineteenth-Century Attitudes to Africa,” 5–34.

<sup>75</sup> Ian J. Shaw, *Churches, Revolutions, and Empires: 1789-1914* (Fearn: Christian Focus, 2012), 273.

<sup>76</sup> For understanding influences that shaped Wilmot Brooke’s attitude to the Niger Mission, see Andrew Porter, “Evangelical Enthusiasm, Missionary Motivation and West Africa in the Late Nineteenth Century: The Career of G. W. Brooke,” *The Journal of Imperial and Commonwealth History* 6, no. 1 (1977): 23–46.

Porter's article was not the first study of the impact of Keswick on overseas missions. In 1964, J. B. Webster, author of *The African Churches among the Yoruba*, maintained that the missionaries who criticised Bishop Crowther and his African agents were products of "the Keswick revival", and were "willing to use moral reasons to deny black leadership," which suggested that racist attitudes were their primary motive.<sup>77</sup> Two years later, E. A. Ayandele took a similar position when he stated that the young, overzealous missionaries were those "who were determined to put into effect the growing idea of the 'dominant race' and dislodge the Bishop from his nominal episcopate."<sup>78</sup>

The controversy surrounding the Niger Mission was also discussed in C. Peter Williams' article, "From Church to Mission: An Examination of the Official Missionary Strategy of the Church Missionary Society on the Niger, 1887-93."<sup>79</sup> The focus of Williams' study was on the strategy of the CMS in accommodating the new fervour of the missionaries while retaining its loyalty to Venn's ideal of a future African Church. For Williams, the CMS failed to manage properly the Keswick enthusiasts. In another article, Williams maintained that the cause of the failure was "the intense spiritual convictions of the new missionaries, often nurtured in Keswick holiness and looking to Hudson-Taylor-like ideals of a missionary."<sup>80</sup> The need for an assessment of whether this happened in Asia, where Hudson-Taylor-like ideas were even more prevalent is much needed, and whether the same negative consequence of such 'uncompromising spirituality' as had been seen in Africa were repeated.

On the other hand, Steven S. Maughan, in his most recent work, *Mighty England Do Good*, commended the CMS policy of drawing upon the zeal of the British holiness movement, noting that, "in the 1890s it experienced its greatest

---

<sup>77</sup> J. B. Webster, *The African Churches among the Yoruba, 1888-1922*, Oxford Studies in African Affairs (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1964), 44.

<sup>78</sup> Emmanuel Ayankanmi Ayandele, *The Missionary Impact on Modern Nigeria, 1842-1914: A Political and Social Analysis*, Ibadan History Series (London: Longmans, 1966), 213.

<sup>79</sup> Williams, "From Church to Mission," 391-409.

<sup>80</sup> Williams, *Self-Governing Church*, 146.

decade of missionary growth.”<sup>81</sup> While acknowledging the failure of the Niger Mission, Maughan none the less applauded the CMS and its secretary, Eugene Stock, for their support of Keswick teachings. In his view, “adopting the holiness movement and adapting it to established missionary society practice was perhaps Eugene Stock’s greatest achievement at the CMS.”<sup>82</sup>

Studies of Hudson Taylor, founder of the China Inland Mission, have also drawn a connection between Keswick and his missionary thinking.<sup>83</sup> Taylor experienced a second-blessing experience in 1869, and his ‘life of faith’ teaching was marked by holiness influences. Aspects of holiness theology proved well suited to mission, such as dependence on the guidance and direction of the Holy Spirit, and independence of worldly patronage. Indeed, the holiness movement understood becoming an overseas missionary as a quick route to commitment and consecration, reflecting a true willingness to conform with God’s will, and the surest route to present sanctification.<sup>84</sup> Hudson Taylor first spoke at Keswick in 1883, and within a few years was claiming that two-thirds of “those of the China Inland Mission” were now working “among the heathen” as a result of Keswick.<sup>85</sup> Jeffrey Cox has pointed out that “Taylor’s rhetoric of ‘God will provide’ struck a chord with a late Victorian public eager for ‘evangelization of the world in our generation’.”<sup>86</sup>

Among those inspired by Hudson Taylor, the ‘Cambridge Seven,’ outstanding athletes who in 1885 became missionaries in China under the China Inland Mission, were the most well-known. Products of the public school system, the seven were examples of holiness teaching allied to ‘muscular Christianity.’ They included William Cassels from Repton and St. John’s; Stanley Smith from Repton and Trinity College, stroke of the Cambridge eight’s boat and son of a surgeon; Montagu Harry Proctor Beauchamp from Repton and Trinity, son of a baronet; Dixon Hoste, a

---

<sup>81</sup> Steven S. Maughan, *Mighty England Do Good: Culture, Faith, Empire, and World in the Foreign Missions of the Church of England, 1850-1915, Studies in the History of Christian Missions* (Grand Rapids, Michigan; Cambridge: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2014), 152.

<sup>82</sup> *Ibid.*, 156.

<sup>83</sup> See McKay, “Faith and Facts;” Wigram, *Bible and Mission*, especially chapters 6 and 7.

<sup>84</sup> McKay, “Faith and Facts,” 154, 159-61.

<sup>85</sup> Figgis, *Keswick from Within*, 134

<sup>86</sup> Cox, *British Missionary Enterprise*, 184.

gunner subaltern in the Royal Artillery and son of a major-general who was never at Cambridge; Cecil Polhill-Turner from Eton and Jesus College; his brother Arthur Twistleton Polhill-Turner from Eton, Trinity and Ridley Hall (both sons of a Member of Parliament); and C. T. Studd, from Eton, an England cricket international.

Their story has been told by John Pollock in *The Cambridge Seven*.<sup>87</sup> Benjamin Broomhall, moreover, has published *The Evangelisation of the World*, containing a report of the farewell meetings of the Cambridge Seven, their voyage to China, and their initial experiences in China.<sup>88</sup> There have also been biographical accounts of individual members of the Cambridge Seven. Norman Grubb's *C. T. Studd*<sup>89</sup> and Eileen Vincent's *No Sacrifice Too Great*<sup>90</sup> were biographies of Studd. The life and missionary work of W. W. Cassels has been explored by Marshall Broomhall in *W. W. Cassels: First Bishop in Western China*.<sup>91</sup> In 1949, Phyllis Thompson published a biography of D. E. Hoste.<sup>92</sup> Recently, in 2015, John Martin Usher completed an unpublished doctoral thesis on Cecil Polhill. His work provides a biographical study with careful analysis of Polhill's missionary work and influence.<sup>93</sup> Apart from Usher's work, however, there has been little attention to how the holiness views of the Cambridge Seven affected their missionary work. An article from Leigh Goodwin discussed how their holiness views shaped their way of doing mission, and later inspired the PMU, the first Pentecostal missionary organisation.<sup>94</sup> Goodwin then considered the link between the pneumatological view of the

---

<sup>87</sup> John Pollock, *The Cambridge Seven: The True Story of Ordinary Men Used in No Ordinary Way*, History makers (Fearn: Christian Focus, 2006).

<sup>88</sup> Benjamin Broomhall, *The Evangelisation of the World. A Missionary Band: A Record of Consecration, and an Appeal*, Third ed. (London, 1889).

<sup>89</sup> Norman P. Grubb, *C. T. Studd: Cricketer & Pioneer* (Guildford: Lutterworth Press, 1982).

<sup>90</sup> Eileen Vincent, *No Sacrifice Too Great*, 2nd rev. ed. (Gerrards Cross : Bromley: WEC Pubns. ; OM Pub, 1992).

<sup>91</sup> Marshall Broomhall, *W. W. Cassels, First Bishop in Western China* (London: China Inland Mission, 1926).

<sup>92</sup> Phyllis Thompson, *D. E. Hoste: "A Prince with God": Hudson Taylor's Successor as General Director of the China Inland Mission 1900-1935* (London: China Inland Mission, 1947).

<sup>93</sup> John Martin Usher, "'For China and Tibet, and for World-Wide Revival' Cecil Henry Polhill (1860-1938) and His Significance for Early Pentecostalism" (PhD diss., University of Birmingham, 2015).

<sup>94</sup> Leigh Goodwin, "The Pneumatological Motivation and Influences of the Cambridge Seven," *Journal of the European Pentecostal Theological Association* 30, no. 2 (2010).

Cambridge Seven with “early 20<sup>th</sup> century Pentecostal missionary praxis.”<sup>95</sup> Yet, as we shall see, Goodwin neglected the significant impact of the Keswick movement on the Cambridge band.

Ridley Hall, an Anglican theological college in Cambridge, also produced a large number of overseas missionaries, some of whom went to Asia. According to F. W. B. Bullock’s *The History of Ridley Hall Cambridge*, Ridley Hall, opened in 1881, was intended to prepare evangelical ministers for the Church of England. However, Bullock observed, “largely as the result of the Moody and Sankey Mission of 1882 and the visit of the ‘Keswick speakers’ in 1883, the great quickening of religious life and devotion among Cambridge men soon led to offers for missionary service abroad.”<sup>96</sup> The first Principal of Ridley Hall, Handley Moule, began to adhere to Keswick holiness teaching in 1884 and became a regular speaker at the Keswick Convention from 1886. Working closely with John Barton, Vicar of Holy Trinity Church, Cambridge, and a former CMS missionary in India, Moule encouraged Ridley Hall students to offer themselves for the overseas mission. Of the 514 students who entered Ridley Hall during Moule’s Principalship, 117 became missionaries. One of them was Eric Lewis, who joined the Niger Mission under Wilmot Brooke. Such a high concentration of missionary recruits from that one college is significant, meriting research to understand the factors behind this.

### The Aim of the Thesis

The primary aim of this thesis is to explore the impact of the late-nineteenth-century British holiness movements, particularly the Keswick holiness and the Cambridge holiness movements, on the call and motivation to undertake missionary work in Asia, and to offer some assessment of its influence on their mission practice. The thesis will integrate historical and theological perspectives to gain an understanding of motivations, methods and outcomes of holiness-inspired mission in Asia in the late nineteenth century. Such integration allows conclusions to

---

<sup>95</sup> *Ibid.*, 38.

<sup>96</sup> Bullock, *The History of Ridley Hall*, 1:215.

emerge that go beyond the impressions left by biographies or missionary statistics, and suggests that what appeared to be an inward-looking movement had significant outward impact in locations far removed from both the idyllic English Lake District where the Keswick movement had its base and the attractive colleges and scholarly atmosphere of Cambridge University.

The particular focus of this thesis is the twenty-five year period 1881 to 1906. This spans the period between the foundation of Ridley Hall in 1881 (with Handley Moule as the first Principal of Ridley Hall), and the production in 1906 by John Battersby Harford of his significant list of the first Keswick missionaries. It covers the period of years referred to by Eugene Stock in his essay on *The Keswick Convention: Its Message, Its Method and Its Men*, published in 1907. In this work, Stock declared that from the time when missionary meetings had been incorporated into the Keswick Convention programme, “all the societies have gained recruits from Keswick. No other single agency can compare with it in fruitfulness in this respect. There is not a mission-field which is not indebted to the influence of Keswick for one or more of its labourers.”<sup>97</sup>

The CMS had seen a general decline in recruitment in the 1860s and 1870s, but this was remarkably reversed in the 1880s and 1890s, with the Keswick holiness movement undoubtedly playing a key role. As Price and Randall observed, “from the 1880s there has been a strong link between Keswick and the missionary imperative and at times hundreds of young people have stood up at Keswick in response to the missionary appeal.”<sup>98</sup> 1881 also saw the start of the second evangelistic tour of Britain by D. L. Moody and Ira Sankey, who did much to promote evangelistic zeal coupled with holiness and living-by-faith principles. These principles, in turn, stirred many Cambridge students to offer themselves to be overseas missionaries.

The end of the period covered by this thesis also saw the death of Hudson Taylor in 1905. He connected holiness teaching to faith principles, premillennialism,

---

<sup>97</sup> Stock, “The Missionary Element,” 139.

<sup>98</sup> Price and Randall, *Transforming Keswick*, 106.

and mission service. His death marked a significant moment of change, and he was succeeded as the Director of the China Inland Mission by D. E. Hoste, a member of the Cambridge Seven who will be discussed in this thesis.

Other events make 1906 a significant turning point, bringing influences to bear that were quite different from those during the high point of holiness-inspired mission. Pentecostalism emerged in 1906, in part through the revival at the holiness church in Azusa Street, Los Angeles, led by William J. Seymour (1870-1922). It quickly became a global movement that impacted mission. Anderson has noted how quickly after the “the beginning of classical Pentecostalism... people came from as far away as Europe and went back there with the ‘baptism’, and Pentecostal missionaries were sent out all over the world from Azusa Street, reaching over twenty-five nations in two years, including places as far away as China, India, Japan, Egypt, Liberia, Angola and South Africa.”<sup>99</sup> Although the Azusa Street Revival was not the only origin, Brian Stanley asserted that it was “undoubtedly one of the most inspirational sources of the global Pentecostal movement.”<sup>100</sup> A few of the holiness-inspired missionaries in this study came under the influence of Pentecostalism, which had itself been influenced by holiness teaching, but the focus of this study is not Pentecostal missionaries.

1906 was also the year in which the total number of CMS missionaries reached its peak. In his last volume on the history of the CMS, Eugene Stock provided statistics of the CMS missionaries from the late nineteenth century until 1915, noting that in 1906 1,397 CMS missionaries had been sent.<sup>101</sup> It was the highest number of clergymen as well as laymen sent abroad, though not the highest number of women. It could indicate the end of the golden period in which the holiness movement exerted its influence on CMS recruitment.

---

<sup>99</sup> Allan Heaton Anderson, *An Introduction to Pentecostalism: Global Charismatic Christianity* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014), 43.

<sup>100</sup> Brian Stanley, *Christianity in the Twentieth Century: A World History* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2018), 293.

<sup>101</sup> Eugene Stock, *The History of the Church Missionary Society, vol. IV* (London: The Church Missionary Society, 1916), 465.

Limiting this study to the twenty-five years between 1881 and 1906 allows the focus to remain on the period when the influence of holiness, especially Keswick teaching, on overseas missions was of particular significance. This time period enables close attention to be given to some important questions. What themes at the Keswick Conventions inspired participants to offer themselves for the mission field? What were the missionary elements in the holiness teachings? What kind of missionary work did the Keswick-inspired missionaries do in Asia, and how was that work influenced by holiness teaching? What were the main contributions of the Cambridge Seven to mission work in Asia?

This study also considers the influence of Handley Moule on missionaries who graduated from Ridley Hall during his principalship (1881-1899). Andrew Porter has maintained that Moule “established a tradition of education at Ridley which strongly favoured the exposition of doctrine over more critical studies and encouraged a preference for piety over learning.”<sup>102</sup> This thesis will examine Porter’s observation and will consider such questions as: what were factors in the early years of Ridley Hall that so strongly encouraged its students to go to the mission field? To what extent was Handley Moule behind so many of his students taking up the missionary cause? Is it true that holiness teaching promoted by Principal Moule in Ridley Hall led to anti-intellectualism? What did the Ridley Hall missionaries do in Asia and was the influence of holiness teaching evident in their mission activity?

Finally, this thesis will build upon the important work of Porter and others by addressing the question of whether the Keswick emphases were more effective in Asian missions than in African missions, or whether the problems Porter identified regarding the application of holiness teachings in Africa were repeated in Asia. Some scholars have identified racist attitudes as underlying the intolerance of holiness-inspired missionaries toward African Christian leaders, and this thesis will

---

<sup>102</sup> Porter, *Religion Versus Empire?*, 248.

consider whether there is evidence of such attitudes amongst holiness missionaries to Asia.

## Methodology

The principal methodological approach of this thesis will be a close analysis of missionary archives, journals and letters. Major sources have been *The Life of Faith*, a weekly periodical of Keswick holiness teaching, and *The Keswick Week*, an annual periodical of the Keswick Conventions, both of which recorded the sermons delivered at the main gatherings, and what happened in the missionary meetings. Apart from highlighting some important meetings of the Keswick Conventions, *The Life of Faith* mainly contains writings on the Keswick teaching and occasionally some letters of Keswick missionaries. A more complete report of meetings, including Ladies' meetings, can be found in *The Keswick Week*. For the study of the holiness-inspired missionaries in China, particularly those serving with the China Inland Mission [CIM], *China's Millions* has been a valuable source, covering missionary reports as well as letters of the Cambridge Seven and some Keswick missionaries during their service in China. While they give important insights into what was said at missionary meetings, or give first-hand accounts of events on the field, they were also 'in-house' publications designed for faithful supporters, and were not written with the detachment of critical observers.

The missionary archives in the SOAS Library and the CMS library in Birmingham contain unpublished reports and some personal letters, which provide insights into the actions and motivations of individuals, and internal debates and disagreements about significant issues. For example, they reveal the debate between Hudson Taylor and Stanley Smith over universal salvation, which was something kept out of official publications.

For the influence of holiness teaching at Ridley Hall, Handley Moule's *Annual Letter* has been an important source. A box of index cards containing information on Ridley Hall members who became missionaries during Moule's principalship, has been useful in identifying those who went to Asia. These index cards were prepared

by the late Noel Pollard, once Vice-Principal of Ridley Hall in 1980s.<sup>103</sup> The *Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East*, kept in the Cadbury Research Library, University of Birmingham, and *The Church Missionary Gleaner*, held in the British Library London, have also been valuable.

The main challenge in weighing the evidence in missionary reports, magazines, and letters has been the need to maintain critical objectivity. As Arthur Marwick observes, one should be beware of the hidden agendas of an author since “primary sources” can be “created for purposes utterly different from those of the historian.”<sup>104</sup> A historian needs to maintain a “methodological control of the evidence, and of the various levels of interpretation both inherent in and related to the evidence.”<sup>105</sup> Since the purpose of missionary journals was in part for religious edification and in part to raise funds, they often made a selective use of evidence.

The thesis also draws on a number of biographical studies. These include explorations of the life and work of Amy Carmichael, G. W. Guinness, and Mildred Cable, in order to assess the effect of Keswick teaching on their mission. Similarly, biographies of the Cambridge Seven, especially those of Dixon Hoste, C. T. Studd, and William Cassels have been vital for an understanding of holiness teaching in their ministry. Some of these missionary biographies could be said to border on Protestant hagiography, as their subjects were portrayed as largely devoid of human failings. Although the biographies are sometimes the only accessible sources for the study of some missionaries, they generally lack a critical perspective. Two recent unpublished theses on Alice E. Luce and Cecil Polhill offer more critical reflection, especially concerning the Pentecostal influence on their holiness theology.

The authors and publishers of missionary biographies intended to promote missions. They were inspirational works, with no expectation they would be opened

---

<sup>103</sup> This information was provided by Elaine Thornton, a former archivist in Ridley Hall, Cambridge.

<sup>104</sup> Arthur Marwick, *The Nature of History* (Basingstoke: Macmillan, 1989), 228.

<sup>105</sup> J. E. Bradley and R. A. Muller, *Church History: An Introduction to Research, Reference Works and Methods* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1995), 49.

to detailed historiographical inspection. As Julie McColl has observed, publishers found a lucrative market for the sales of missionary biographies, especially from Sunday Schools who used them as prizes. The missionary hero was an important ideological tool and authors created a powerful mythology around them. To achieve this McColl argues there were, “strategic silences and omissions, for example, very few biographies discuss the success rates of conversion within the native population and focus instead on one or two individual stories.” These biographies, McColl believes, were written deliberately to convey “important messages” significant to the author or publisher.<sup>106</sup>

This view of missionary literature finds support in Susan Thorne’s study *Congregational Missions and the Making of an Imperial Culture in 19th-Century England*, with its stress on the influence of missionary societies upon the British public. She argues that their “output of propaganda,” including missionary biographies, many of which were aimed at children, was an “‘important institutional weapon’ for bringing Britain’s working classes into ‘organised religion’s fold’.”<sup>107</sup>

An example of the “strategic silences and omissions” that McColl identifies is the way in which the conflict between Amy Carmichael and Stephen Neill is handled by their biographers. Stephen Neill was a Cambridge graduate who joined Carmichael at Dohnavur in 1924 but left around a year later. He went on to become Bishop of Tinnevely in 1939. Although Amy Carmichael’s biographers, Elizabeth Elliot and Frank Houghton were allowed to access her private papers, Daugherty asserts that they used them “uncritically and for the purpose of exhibiting Carmichael’s great Christian faith.”<sup>108</sup> Houghton chose not to discuss the issue of Neill’s departure, writing only of Carmichael’s anxiety over “one of the new workers,” without mentioning Neill’s name.<sup>109</sup> Elliot, who quotes Carmichael’s diary,

---

<sup>106</sup> J. A. McColl, “Imagining the Missionary Hero: Juvenile Missionary Biographies, c. 1870-1917” (PhD diss., University of Liverpool, 2017), 36-37.

<sup>107</sup> Susan Thorne, *Congregational Missions*, quoted in McColl, “Imagining the Missionary Hero,” 20-21.

<sup>108</sup> Dyron B. Daugherty, *Bishop Stephen Neill: From Edinburgh to South India* (New York: Peter Lang, 2008), 98.

<sup>109</sup> Houghton, 249. Houghton’s description of Carmichael’s feeling of struggle and anxiety which led to Neill’s dismissal is only written briefly. See page 249-50.

emphasizes the pain caused to her by the events leading to Neill's departure, "Poor, poor S... My heart is all one ache for him." She suggests that Neill's explosive temper may have been a factor in the breach.<sup>110</sup> Neill's own autobiography makes no mention of Carmichael or Dohnavur at all.<sup>111</sup> Daughrity, in his recent biography of Neill offers a critical perspective, suggesting the possibility of theological difference as the root of the conflict. Neill's "intellectual prowess" and his familiarity with modern biblical scholarship might have become a serious threat to Carmichael who held to conservative theology.<sup>112</sup> Daughrity suggested that Neill's early years in India were "riddled with conflict," and in Carmichael he found someone "every bit as strong-minded and obstinate" as he was.<sup>113</sup>

The same tendency to produce a selective version of events can be seen in some accounts of the practical benefits of holiness teaching. Moira McKay's study of the China Inland Mission highlights how Mrs Howard Taylor's biography of James Hudson Taylor insisted that "Taylor prayed and God moved people to give without the donors being at all aware that the mission needed money," while in truth, as McKay shows, Hudson Taylor was a very skilled fundraiser. In the early years funds of the CIM were solicited, but later this shifted to making the needs of the mission known without directly appealing for funds to meet those needs. Her studies suggest that Hudson Taylor's approach meant that the CIM, especially in the first ten years of its existence should actually be considered a 'modified' faith mission.<sup>114</sup>

Despite these limitations, the biographies discussed do have value for the historian, if approached in a critical manner. Julie McColl has pointed out the lack of

---

<sup>110</sup> Elliot discuss the ministry of Stephen Neill in Dohnavur in her book, Elliott, *A Chance to Die*, 267-70.

<sup>111</sup> Stephen Neill, *God's Apprentice: the Autobiography of Bishop Stephen Neill* (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1991).

<sup>112</sup> Daughrity, 96, 113. He discussed the conflict more fully in page 96-114; see also Dyron Daughrity, "A Dissonant Mission: Stephen Neill, Amy Carmichael, and Missionary Conflict in South India," *International Review of Mission* 97, no. 384-385 (2008): 103–115.

<sup>113</sup> *Ibid.*, 93.

<sup>114</sup> McKay, "Faith and Facts," 171-82. This view is supported in Wigram's study of Hudson Taylor – see Wigram, *Bible and Mission*, 232-38.

accounts of women missionaries, who were rarely singled out for “individual and extensive treatment.”<sup>115</sup> So the biographies of women missionaries such as Mildred Cable and Amy Carmichael do provide unique insights. It is also important that these are biographies of missionaries who worked in Asia. McColl’s study of missionary biographies notes that there are fewer books about missionaries in India or China, compared to Africa. The ‘heathen darkness’ of Africa was seen as “more mysterious, more dangerous, and altogether more frightening than India.”<sup>116</sup>

## Outline of Chapters

The thesis is organised into four chapters. The first chapter discusses the British holiness movement in the late nineteenth century and the growing interest in Britain in the Asian mission. The first part of the chapter considers the nature of the Keswick holiness movement, and its connection with the Welsh revival; it also discusses the holiness movement among the Cambridge students, especially those of Ridley Hall, and examines the holiness teachings of its Principal, Handley Moule. The second part explores the emergence of mission societies and the early British missions to India, Ceylon, Japan, and China, and the particular issues that were faced by holiness-inspired missionaries in these locations. Chapter two examines the influence of the early Keswick Conventions on overseas missionary activity in Asia. It also analyses the missionary themes used by speakers that most motivated participants in the early Keswick Conventions to take up missionary cause. It then provides brief biographies of some early Keswick-inspired missionaries, noting how the Keswick movement influenced their religious experience and missionary calling and how the Keswick teachings were reflected in their missionary lives and activities. Chapter three explores the connection between the Cambridge Seven and the holiness movement. It considers the mission work of the Cambridge Seven in Asia, analyses how the holiness movement shaped the religious lives of the Seven, and demonstrates how the Seven’s missionary work in Asia reflected the holiness

---

<sup>115</sup> McColl, “Imagining the Missionary Hero,” 39.

<sup>116</sup> *Ibid.*, 42.

teachings. Chapter four provides an analysis of the impact of Ridley Hall on Asian missions. It discusses the features of Ridley Hall that encouraged its students to become missionaries, examines the types of mission work conducted by Ridley Hall men, and considers how they displayed holiness teachings in Asian mission fields. It also addresses the question of whether holiness-inspired missionaries were more successful in Asia than in Africa.

## Chapter 1

### The Late Nineteenth-Century Holiness Movement in Britain and the Growing Interest in the Asian Mission

The holiness movement in the late nineteenth century was a major phenomenon in British evangelicalism. It emerged at the time when evangelicalism felt itself to be confronted by unprecedented challenges. For many evangelicals, Darwinism and theological liberalism were major threats that called on churches in Britain and many other parts of the world to do their utmost to defend orthodoxy. Against this background, the holiness movement brought a fresh impetus, which resulted not only in a renewal of Christian experience, but also led many to a new Christian commitment as an expression of a consecrated life surrendered fully to God. This connection between holiness and zealous activity will be explored in the three case studies in this thesis which consider the impact of Keswick-style holiness on their thinking, their call to mission, and aspects of their work on the mission fields of Asia.

This first part of this chapter will provide an analysis of the British holiness movement in the late nineteenth century, particularly the movements at the Keswick Convention and Cambridge University, and its origins, theological themes, historical context, and important features. The connection between the Welsh revival and the Keswick movement will also be assessed. Subsequent sections will study the holiness movement among the Cambridge students, particularly those of Ridley Hall, and explore the holiness teachings of its Principal, Handley Moule.

Between the three case-studies of holiness-influenced mission considered in this thesis – Keswick missionaries, the Cambridge Seven, and Ridley Hall missionaries – there was significant overlap, and this chapter will consider some of the key theological themes they shared. There will also be discussion of the wider context of the mission fields in Asia to which the holiness-inspired missionaries went, to see how their endeavours fit in with the work of other evangelical

missionaries, and how their approaches differed. The chapter also considers some of the important social and cultural issues holiness missionaries encountered in their mission fields. This sets a background for an assessment in each of the following chapters of whether the responses to them by missionaries in these three case studies were particularly shaped by their distinctive holiness theological emphasis, and whether they were noticeably different from other missionaries in the evangelical tradition.

### 1.1 The Holiness Teaching, Revival, and the Holiness Movement in the Late Nineteenth Century

The Keswick movement, also known as the Higher Life movement, claimed to have rediscovered a scriptural way of pursuing holiness. Its message was particularly addressed to those who already believed in Jesus Christ. Charles Harford summarized its teaching as follows:

The normal experience of the child of God should be one of victory instead of constant defeat, one of liberty instead of grinding bondage, one of “perfect peace” instead of restless worry. It shows that in Christ there is provided for every believer victory, liberty, and rest, and that this may be obtained not by a life-long struggle after an impossible ideal but by the surrender of the individual to God, and the indwelling of the Holy Spirit.<sup>1</sup>

The root of the holiness movement could be found in several prior factors that came together. John Wesley’s teaching of entire sanctification, which he had understood as a distinct and separate development which followed the justification of a converted sinner, was significant. For Wesley, some converts, after a “zealous keeping of all the commandments” accompanied by intense prayer and fasting, could experience another crisis of faith, which would lead them to Christian perfection, described as “that love of God and our neighbor which implies

---

<sup>1</sup> Charles F. Harford, “Introductory Chapter,” in *The Keswick Convention: Its Message, Its Method and Its Men*, ed. Charles F. Harford (London: Marshall, 1907), 6.

deliverance from all sin.”<sup>2</sup> This perfection was to be received “merely by faith” and given “instantaneously, in one moment.”<sup>3</sup>

In the 1830s a similar doctrine was being promoted in the United States by Charles G. Finney (1792-1875), a revivalist preacher of the Second Awakening who was ordained as a Presbyterian minister. Finney professed to have gone through a crisis of sanctification in 1836. He was among the first who referred to the experience of the ‘second blessing’ as “the baptism of the Holy Ghost,” which imparted “the power of a holy life” and “the power of a self-sacrificing life.”<sup>4</sup> In his *Views on Sanctification* (1840), he affirmed the possibility of Christian perfection on earth.<sup>5</sup> This theme was taken up by W. E. Boardman, whose work, *The Higher Christian Life* (1858), became influential in England, particularly among Calvinists.

Holiness teachings became an integral part of the great revival which affected many regions of the United Kingdom in 1859-62. This revival was strongly related to the American revival movement that had started in 1857, and was associated with prayer meetings in a number of cities. It resulted in large numbers of conversions, estimated between 500,000 and 1,000,000 people.<sup>6</sup> In 1858, the news of the American revival reached Ulster, and then spread to Scotland, marking perhaps its

---

<sup>2</sup> John Wesley, “A Plain Account of Christian Perfection,” in *John and Charles Wesley: Selected Prayers, Hymns, Journal Notes, Sermons, Letters and Treatises*, ed. Frank Whaling, Classics of Western spirituality (London: SPCK, 1981), 326, 335.

<sup>3</sup> *Ibid.*, 326.

<sup>4</sup> Charles Finney, “POWER FROM ON HIGH--WHAT IS IT?,” *The Independent ... Devoted to the Consideration of Politics, Social and Economic Tendencies, History, Literature, and the Arts (1848-1921)* 24, no. 1207 (1872): 1. According to James Reeve, Finney was “certainly one of the first to consistently equate Pentecostal terminology with entire sanctification” (James Reeve, “Holiness and the Holy Spirit in the Thought of Charles G. Finney” (PhD diss., Fuller Theological Seminary, 1990), 265, accessed August 29, 2018, <http://search.proquest.com/docview/303913676/?pq-origsite=primo>).

<sup>5</sup> According to Ian Shaw, although a Presbyterian, Finney “moved from the Calvinism of his background...and articulated an Arminian, and at times semi-Pelagian, theology.” Shaw, *Churches, Revolutions, and Empires*, 28.

<sup>6</sup> *Ibid.*, 502.

first national revival movement.<sup>7</sup> In Wales, the revival started in Cardiganshire in 1858 and then across the country, drawing around 80,000 new church members.<sup>8</sup>

In England, the revival was spread by some professional American revivalists, among them James Caughey, Charles Finney and Phoebe Palmer; there were also British revivalists, including Reginald Radcliffe, Brownlow North (a wealthy gentleman), and Richard Weaver (a converted prize-fighter). Caughey, an Irish-born Methodist preacher whose family had moved to the United States when he was a child, visited England in the 1840s and his highly emotive style of preaching invited controversy. When he returned to England in July 1857, he preached in the Midlands in 1858-59, and his meetings claimed 8,000 converts.<sup>9</sup> In his accounts of his preaching, he recorded cases of conversion, and also people who had an experience of sanctification.<sup>10</sup> The holiness movement in America also involved the leadership of women, most notably Phoebe Palmer (1807-74), a Methodist Episcopal evangelist and promoter of holiness. After experiencing a Wesleyan “second blessing” in 1837, Palmer started a weekly prayer meeting at her residence in New York, which later became the well-known Tuesday Meeting for the Promoting of Holiness, attracting 50 to 150 participants.<sup>11</sup> She taught a simple approach to holiness.<sup>12</sup> Her message centered on Christ as “the altar,” upon which anyone who placed his or her full confidence in a simple faith would be directly

---

<sup>7</sup> Stewart J. Brown, *Providence and Empire: Religion, Politics and Society in the United Kingdom, 1815-1914*, Religion, Politics, and Society in Britain Series (Harlow: Pearson/Longman, 2008), 219.

<sup>8</sup> *Ibid.*, 221.

<sup>9</sup> *Ibid.*, 222.

<sup>10</sup> Caughey’s ministry in Britain is discussed in Richard Carwardine, *Transatlantic Revivalism: Popular Evangelicalism in Britain and America, 1790-1865* (Westport CT: Greenwood, 1978), 109-133, with tables on p. 114, and 123.

<sup>11</sup> Marguerite Van Die, “Palmer [Née Worrall], Phoebe (1807–1874),” in *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, accessed May 26, 2018, <http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/10.1093/ref:odnb/9780198614128.001.0001/odnb-9780198614128-e-47031>.

<sup>12</sup> On Palmer’s teaching on holiness, see also Elaine A. Heath, ‘The Quest for Holiness’, in ed. W.J. Abraham and James E. Kirby, *The Oxford Handbook of Methodist Studies* (Oxford: OUP, 2009), 398-412; and Charles White, *The Beauty of Holiness: Phoebe Palmer as Theologian, Revivalist, Feminist and Humanitarian* (Grand Rapids, Francis Asbury Press, 1986).

purified. From 1859 to 1864 she and her husband, Walter Palmer, a New York physician, accepted invitations to speak in many parts in Britain, thus planting her ideas in British evangelicalism. During her holiness campaigns in Belfast, Newcastle, Glasgow, south Wales, and the midlands, more than 17,300 people reportedly claimed justification and several thousand confessed sanctification.<sup>13</sup> Her teachings also had a powerful impact on William Booth (1829-1912) and his wife, Catherine (1829-1890), who later founded the Salvation Army.<sup>14</sup>

The Salvation Army, which was founded in 1878, was prominent in promoting holiness teachings in late nineteenth-century Britain.<sup>15</sup> In 1861 the Booths embraced the teachings of sanctification by faith, after having “completely accepted Phoebe Palmer’s doctrine of holiness.”<sup>16</sup> In that same year, they withdrew their ministry from the Methodist New Connexion to become independent itinerant preachers.<sup>17</sup> In 1865 they formed the East London Christian Mission in Whitechapel, which later in 1869 became known as simply the Christian Mission. By 1878, when the Christian Mission had 57 missions, it changed its name to the Salvation Army with William Booth as its first “General.”<sup>18</sup> In his address at the Conference of the Christian Mission of 1877, Booth emphasized, “Holiness to the Lord is to us a fundamental truth; it stands to the forefront of our doctrines. We write it on our banners.”<sup>19</sup>

The developing holiness movement also found expression in a series of annual meetings held at Mildmay Park. The conferences were initially held in Barnet in

---

<sup>13</sup> Van Die, “Palmer, Phoebe.”

<sup>14</sup> Brown, *Providence and Empire*, 224.

<sup>15</sup> According to E. H. McKinley, the Salvation Army to this day is “the largest Protestant charity in the world and still an effective agency for evangelism among the marginalized in many parts of the world” (*Biographical Dictionary of Evangelicals*, ed. Timothy Larsen (Leicester; Downers Grove, Ill.: InterVarsity Press, 2003), s. v. “Salvation Army”).

<sup>16</sup> John Kent, *Holding the Fort*, 326.

<sup>17</sup> The Methodist New Connexion was the first group of Methodists which seceded from the Wesleyan Methodist Church in 1797, led by Alexander Kilham (1762-98), an ordained Methodist minister. See John T. Wilkinson, “The Rise of Other Methodist Traditions,” in *A History of the Methodist Church in Great Britain*, ed. Rupert Davies, A. Raymond George, and Gordon Rupp, vol. II (London: Epworth Press, 1978), 280–94.

<sup>18</sup> *Biographical Dictionary of Evangelicals*, s.v. “Salvation Army.”

<sup>19</sup> *History of the Methodist Church in Great Britain*, I:209.

1856, but in 1862 they were moved to Mildmay Park in north London, where the chief organiser, William Pennefather, served as Church of England parish incumbent. The Mildmay conferences emphasized holiness teaching and became a pattern for other holiness conventions, such as those held in Perth and Clifton. The leaders of the Mildmay conferences played important roles in shaping the holiness movement of the 1870s. As Pennefather was an Anglican minister, holiness teaching was now influencing the Established Church as well as the Dissenters. This made holiness teaching more acceptable and respectable, and extended its appeal. Furthermore, William Haslam, Rector of Curzon Chapel, Mayfair, and a frequent speaker at Mildmay, invited the American Robert Pearsall Smith, who would become an important figure of the Keswick movement, to speak for the first time in Britain in 1873.

### 1.1.1 The Origin of the Keswick Movement

Robert Pearsall Smith and his wife, Hannah Whitall Smith, had a significant role in preparing the way for the Keswick holiness conferences. In 1873 Pearsall Smith, a glass maker in Philadelphia and a lay preacher, came to England. He claimed to have found the secret of overcoming sin, and his message about placing confidence in the sufficiency of Christ was received with enthusiasm among evangelical Christians.<sup>20</sup>

Pearsall Smith and his wife, who came a year later, quickly achieved fame and addressed a series of large conferences around Great Britain. These included the Oxford Conference, presided over by Robert Pearsall Smith, which was held for ten days from 29 August to 7 September 1874.

Prior to the Oxford Conference, Canon T. D. Harford-Battersby of St. John's Church, Keswick, felt deeply dissatisfied with his own spiritual condition. After reading works of the Smiths, he was encouraged to go to the conference. At Oxford, after hearing a sermon by Evan Hopkins, a vicar of Holy Trinity, Richmond, he

---

<sup>20</sup> Price and Randall, *Transforming Keswick*, 21–4.

experienced what he called the “resting faith,” by which he meant a higher life of faith that transformed his life. Harford-Battersby went on to become one of the architects of the Keswick Convention. The Oxford Conference was deemed successful in promoting biblical holiness and, building on its success, a much larger meeting was held nine months later at Brighton.

Around seven thousand people attended the Brighton Convention which was held for ten days from 29 May to 7 June 1875. There they gathered “for the purpose of personal consecration to God.”<sup>21</sup> Among the addresses, interpretations of Scriptural passages by Hannah Pearsall Smith (who insisted she was not “preaching”) were considered by many to be the best part of the convention.

Harford-Battersby, together with Robert Wilson, decided to convene a similar gathering at Keswick. Both men believed that more people in the north of England should hear the teachings they had received at Oxford and Brighton. The first Keswick Convention was held three weeks after the Brighton Convention, from 28 June to 2 July 1875.

### 1.1.2 Theological Priorities of the Keswick Movement

While there has not been a systematic study of Keswick theology, certain theological themes were highlighted by most Keswick speakers. My study will focus on the theology of the movement from the beginning to around 1906.

The notion of “sanctification by faith” was central to the Keswick movement: for David Bebbington, it was “axiomatic to Keswick.”<sup>22</sup> According to the Keswick teachings, sanctification, like justification, was brought by faith alone, and was received by surrendering oneself to Christ and letting the Holy Spirit conquer sins. This biblical truth, according to the Keswick teachings, was hidden from many believers who thought that the way to justification is different from that of sanctification. While these supposedly “benighted” believers viewed justification as a gift, they held that sanctification was attained only by laborious effort. Keswick

---

<sup>21</sup> Harford, “Introductory Chapter,” 32.

<sup>22</sup> Bebbington, *Holiness*, 81.

teachings, on the contrary, stressed that sanctification was also a gift received through faith rather than effort.<sup>23</sup>

Another important element of Keswick teaching was ‘counteraction.’ According to this doctrine, every believer retained a tendency to sin until the second coming of Christ. Keswick speakers rejected the notion of the eradication of sin, by which believers could be totally freed from the tendency to sin. This implied the possibility of a Christian attaining sinless perfection, a view condemned by Keswick speakers.<sup>24</sup> However, they also believed that the Spirit would be able to counteract the effects of sin.<sup>25</sup>

Keswick’s belief in the concept of counteraction led to two other key theological notions: the “surrender to Christ” and the “rest of faith.” *Transforming Keswick*, the most recent account of the Keswick Convention, affirms that “the message of reliance on Christ, or surrender to Christ” was “at the heart of Keswick.”<sup>26</sup> Since sin was too strong to be defeated by human effort, believers had to surrender to the power of Christ.

A Scripture passage that was often used to support this idea was Galatians 5: 16-18, where Paul instructed believers not to rely on their own strength in fighting against fleshly desires. They might have the will, but not the power. By surrendering to the Holy Spirit, a believer could enter the “rest of faith.” This was by no means a rest from any spiritual conflict or an escape from temptation, but “rest *in* temptation.”<sup>27</sup> This notion of the rest of faith did not belittle the importance of discipline. According to Handley Moule, a significant exponent of Keswick theology,

It is no contradiction to the inviolable claims of discipline and diligence. It does not discredit for one moment the call to watch, to pray, to “keep under the body and bring it into subjection,” to explore and ponder the Scriptures, to use

---

<sup>23</sup> Price and Randall, *Transforming Keswick*, 48.

<sup>24</sup> While Calvinists often criticised the notion of sinless perfection of Methodists’ doctrine of sanctification, John Wesley in fact never taught that. Wesley maintained that although one had attained entire sanctification, he or she was still liable to “involuntary transgressions” out of errors of judgment, so that “sinless perfection is a phrase I never use”; Wesley, “Christian Perfection,” 329.

<sup>25</sup> Barabas, *So Great Salvation*, 95.

<sup>26</sup> Price and Randall, *Transforming Keswick*, 48.

<sup>27</sup> Barabas, *So Great Salvation*, 95.

the sacred benefits of solemn public worship, and in particular of the Holy Communion of the Lord's Body and Blood, to prize and cultivate reverential and loving fellowship with the Church of God.<sup>28</sup>

"Consecration" was another vital theme in the Keswick theology.

Consecration signified the critical moment when the Christian gave up their own will and let the will of God reign in every sphere of their life. Holiness required a denial of self and an acceptance of Christ's guidance in all life decisions. This crucial decision was taken at consecration. The decision of consecration usually involved a crisis, in which there was tension between self-will and God's will. Once believers subjected themselves to Christ, consecration took place. In the early years of the Keswick Convention, some speakers attempted to bring listeners to such a point of crisis, but others rejected such an approach. Charles F. Harford, the son of the founder of the Keswick Convention, contended that

No one would presume to say how this crisis should take place. With some it has taken place on the mountain top where the soul is alone with God... In another the step may have taken place in the crowded tent where, amid the united prayers of God's people... In some cases, as in conversion, it is impossible to tell the exact moment in which the surrender has taken place, but at the same time there is the definite assurance that this step has been taken, that the Spirit of God is ruling in the heart, and that all is at rest.<sup>29</sup>

Once believers experienced consecration, they were ready to be filled by the Holy Spirit. The nature of the Spirit-filled life accordingly became another prominent Keswick theme. Although this topic is not unique to the Keswick movement, "for decades it was at Keswick that people would hear sermons on the fullness and power of the Spirit that were otherwise rare in evangelical Christianity."<sup>30</sup> Keswick theology maintained that only the Holy Spirit could bestow the power for godliness, "enabling the Christian to *be* what he ought to be."<sup>31</sup> Believing that not all Christians experienced the fullness of the Spirit at their conversion, Keswick speakers called on

---

<sup>28</sup> H. C. G. Moule, "The Message: Its Scriptural Character," in *The Keswick Convention: Its Message, Its Method and Its Men*, ed. Charles F. Harford (London: Marshall, 1907), 69.

<sup>29</sup> Harford, "Introductory Chapter," 6–7.

<sup>30</sup> Price and Randall, *Transforming Keswick*, 36.

<sup>31</sup> Barabas, *So Great Salvation*, 130.

believers to recognize their sinfulness, surrender in faith to Christ, and permit the Holy Spirit to become their teacher and guide.<sup>32</sup>

One criticism of the Keswick teaching was the implication that there are two classes of Christians, those who have not been filled by the Spirit and those who have. Evan Hopkins, the editor of the Keswick periodical, *Life of Faith*, grappled with this problem in the 1889 issue. He recognised that the “the Higher Christian Life” was “liable to be misunderstood” since it suggested that, “it is possible to get to heaven either by the high level or the low level.” He tried to solve this problematic phrase by emphasising that there was only one Christian life with different degrees of expressions.<sup>33</sup>

Some Keswick speakers used the phrase, “baptism of the Spirit,” to describe the experience of being filled with the Spirit. For H. W. Webb-Peploe, speaking in 1890, the conception of Spirit’s baptism subsequent to regeneration was “absolutely unscriptural and wholly fatal in its results.” Webb-Peploe recalled how some believers who had been looking for such baptism at the Brighton Convention of 1875 eventually did not receive it, resulting in the “shipwreck of their faith.”<sup>34</sup> Although the phrase “Spirit’s baptism” came to be discouraged at Keswick, some notable speakers, such as F. B. Meyer, an English Baptist minister, and R. A. Torrey, an American revivalist, preached it from the Keswick platform.

In his sermon at the Convention of 1903, Meyer portrayed the baptism of the Spirit as the endowment of spiritual power for service. Meyer believed that just as Christ needed power from the Holy Spirit before he began his ministry, so all believers needed the Spirit’s baptism. He distinguished between “the Spirit being in us” and “the Spirit being mightily upon us;” while the former was about how the Spirit became our sanctifier, the latter was the Spirit as “the equipment for service.”<sup>35</sup> He then shared his own experience when years before at Keswick he had

---

<sup>32</sup> Ibid., 145.

<sup>33</sup> “The Life of Faith,” 1889, 249.

<sup>34</sup> Price and Randall, *Transforming Keswick*, 52.

<sup>35</sup> Evan Henry Hopkins, ed., *The Keswick Week, 1903: Twenty-Ninth Convention* (London: Marshall Brothers, 1903), 177.

told God his spiritual struggle, “My God, if there is a man in Keswick that needs power, it is I!”<sup>36</sup> A few moments afterwards he claimed to hear a voice, “As you received forgiveness from the hand of the dying Christ, now receive the Holy Spirit as an anointing power from the hand of the living Christ.”<sup>37</sup>

When R. A. Torrey spoke at the Keswick Convention of 1904, he invited his hearers to ask for the Spirit’s baptism from Jesus Christ, the “Bestower of the Holy Spirit.”<sup>38</sup> The Holy Spirit would then form “an indwelling Christ in your heart.”<sup>39</sup> Drawing from John the Baptist’s saying “He will baptize you with the Holy Spirit and fire,” Torrey stressed the need of “the Spirit of burning” for a successful ministry.<sup>40</sup> He described the steps needed to be baptised by the Spirit, including the renunciation of sin, complete surrender, and a simple faith.<sup>41</sup> However, a year later Webb-Peploe portrayed the Spirit’s baptism as the initial work of the Spirit in regeneration which united believers to Christ, so that “I do not understand that there must be any fresh baptism of the Holy Ghost for those who are already baptised by one Spirit into one body.”<sup>42</sup>

“Victory” is another central theme in the Keswick theology. According to Bebbington, “victory” was “probably the best known Keswick catchword.”<sup>43</sup> Price and Randall have also asserted that ‘victory’ is “a key word in the vocabulary of the Convention from early days.” It was a spiritual triumph “over sin, the world and the devil.”<sup>44</sup> Keswick speakers maintained that victorious living was not only a hope to

---

<sup>36</sup> Ibid., 178.

<sup>37</sup> Ibid. See also W. Y. Fullerton, *F. B. Meyer: A Biography* (London; Edinburgh: Marshall, Morgan, & Scott, 1930), 65-67. For the fuller discussion of the impact of Holiness Movement to F. B. Meyer, see Ian Randall, *Spirituality and Social Change: The Contribution of F. B. Meyer (1847-1929)* (Cumbria: Paternoster Press, 2003), 81-106.

<sup>38</sup> Evan Henry Hopkins, ed., *The Keswick Week, 1904: Thirtieth Convention* (London: Marshall Brothers, 1904), 112.

<sup>39</sup> Ibid., 114.

<sup>40</sup> Ibid., 150.

<sup>41</sup> Ibid., 170–78.

<sup>42</sup> Evan Henry Hopkins, ed., *The Keswick Week, 1905: Thirty-First Convention* (London: Marshall Brothers, 1905), 157.

<sup>43</sup> Bebbington, *Evangelicalism in Modern Britain*, 170.

<sup>44</sup> Price and Randall, *Transforming Keswick*, 36.

be fulfilled in the future, but also an experience attainable at present, through the power of the Holy Spirit.

Many Keswick speakers embraced premillennial beliefs. Until around the first half of the century, an influential belief among evangelicals was that the Second Coming would be subsequent to the millennium of progressive peace and happiness. Stewart J. Brown described the belief of postmillennialists as follows: "they believed that the world was advancing steadily, under the guidance of providence, towards the millennium. Theirs was an optimistic view of human prospects; they believed in gradual but steady improvement, until the world entered the millennium. Christ would come at the end of the millennium to judge the living and the dead." For premillennialists, the future of the world was much darker and pessimistic as it would become "ever more violent, selfish, cruel, confused, anarchic, and sinful" until the return of Christ in glory.<sup>45</sup>

An influential work which drew Evangelicals to premillennialism was *A Combined View of the Prophecies of Daniel, Esdras, and St. John* (1815), written by James Hatley Frere.<sup>46</sup> This work had an impact on Edward Irving who became an important pre-millenarian figure and, from about 1825, preached the theology of premillennialism and sought to predict the time of Christ's return. Another influential pre-millenarian was Henry Drummond, an affluent banker and politician, who hosted a series of annual gatherings at his country estate at Albury Park in Surrey from 1826, for examining prophetic views. These conferences, each of which lasted for about six days and attended by around fifty people, ended in July 1830. Beginning from 1827, Theodosia, Lady Powerscourt, imitated Albury conferences and hosted annual meetings at her estate near Dublin with the purpose for exploring the subject of prophecy. One member of Powerscourt's circle, who would become a significant figure of a new denomination, was John Nelson Darby (1800-1882).<sup>47</sup>

---

<sup>45</sup> Brown, *Providence and Empire*, 70–1.

<sup>46</sup> Bebbington, *Evangelicalism in Modern Britain*, 82.

<sup>47</sup> Brown, *Providence and Empire*, 71–2.

John Nelson Darby was a Church of Ireland clergyman. While recovering from a riding accident in October 1827, he experienced what he later called “deliverance from bondage.”<sup>48</sup> He described the spiritual experience as follows: “I had found peace to my own soul by finding my oneness with Christ,... I was in Christ, accepted in the Beloved, and sitting in heavenly places with Him. This led me directly to the apprehension of what the true church of God was, those that were united to Christ in heaven: I at once felt that all the parish [system] was not that.”<sup>49</sup> Leaving his parish ministry in the Church of Ireland, he became a leader of a radical movement, called the “Brethren.”

Darby's distinguishing contribution was his theology of dispensational premillennialism.<sup>50</sup> By dispensationalism he meant the division of history into seven dispensations, or epochs, with Revelation foreshadowing future events. Darby believed that after true believers had been lifted up to meet Christ in the air (the rapture), there would be a great tribulation for seven years, until Christ's return “with his saints to reign over the earth.”<sup>51</sup>

Darby's dispensational premillennialism spread to the United States in the 1850s. The significant transatlantic influences on the British holiness movement have already been noted in the work of Phoebe Palmer, and the Pearsall Smiths, and this international dimension to holiness continued later in the century. One significant proponent was D. L. Moody whose emphasis on “evangelism and holy living,” was shaped by premillennial thinking.<sup>52</sup> Although premillennialism remained a controversial but ‘nonessential’ doctrine, with such influential advocates it became widespread and closely associated with both holiness and mission. It was

---

<sup>48</sup> Timothy C. F. Stunt, “Darby, John Nelson,” in *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, accessed May 4, 2018, <http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/10.1093/ref:odnb/9780198614128.001.0001/odnb-9780198614128-e-7141>.

<sup>49</sup> Tim Grass, *Gathering to His Name: The Story of the Open Brethren in Britain and Ireland* (Milton Keynes: Paternoster, 2006), 92.

<sup>50</sup> Alwyn J. Austin, *China's Millions: The China Inland Mission and Late Qing Society, 1832-1905*, Studies in the history of Christian missions (Grand Rapids; Cambridge: W.B. Eerdmans, 2007), 56.

<sup>51</sup> Bebbington, *Evangelicalism in Modern Britain*, 86.

<sup>52</sup> Shaw, *Churches, Revolutions, and Empires*, 498.

especially promoted in the United States through the annual Believers Meetings for Bible Study, known after 1883 as the Niagara Conference and held every summer until 1897; the conferences were largely made up of Presbyterians and Baptists from Calvinistic theological backgrounds.<sup>53</sup>

This pre-millenarianism deeply influenced Hudson Taylor, who learned it from Andrew Jukes, a member of the Brethren, when he undertook medical training in Hull in preparation for going to China.<sup>54</sup> One implication of this theology was that Christ would return only after the gospel had been preached to all people, a belief which persuaded Taylor to found the China Inland Mission.<sup>55</sup>

The connection between premillennialism and mission was expressed by a regular Niagara speaker, A. T. Pierson. In his 1886 paper, "Our Lord's Second Coming, a Motive to World Evangelization," he argued that the hope of the Second Coming of Christ "makes every believer fruitful in the seed of propagation, fits and prompts him to sow seed, and himself become the seed of the kingdom... the imminence of our Lord's coming quickens activity." Losing sight of the imminent return of Christ, Pierson believed, increases inactivity. Citing Matthew 24: 14 ("this gospel of the kingdom shall be preached in all the world for a witness unto all nations; and then the end shall come"), he argued that world evangelisation was necessary before Christ would return, although this did not mean that he expected all the world to be converted.<sup>56</sup> Pierson was thus an important figure in the internationalization of the holiness-inspired missionary movement.

---

<sup>53</sup> Robert, *Occupy Until I Come*, 133.

<sup>54</sup> Austin, *China's Millions*, 54.

<sup>55</sup> Fiedler, *The Story of Faith Missions*, 34; In 1930, another significant figure in the Brethren movement, Anthony Groves, also regarded Christ's return as an important motive for mission: "I consider the testimony of Jesus is to be published through every land, before the Bridegroom comes; this makes my heart feel an interest in heathens, that we may hasten the coming of the Lord" (Grass, *Gathering to His Name*, 109).

<sup>56</sup> Robert, *Occupy Until I Come*, 135-8.

### 1.1.3 The Historical Context of the Keswick Movement

Keswick theology drew its influences from several other Christian traditions.<sup>57</sup> ‘Victory over sin’, ‘full surrender’, and ‘rest’ had been used in Quaker theological discourse long before the emergence of Keswick. Hannah Pearsall Smith, her husband, Robert Pearsall Smith, and Robert Wilson, co-founder of the Keswick Convention, all had Quaker backgrounds. Although Keswick teaching rejected the notion of the eradication of sinful nature, it drew upon the Methodist holiness tradition with its theme of crisis of faith. The Keswick movement then can be seen as “an instance of the nineteenth-century practice of inventing a tradition.”<sup>58</sup>

The Keswick holiness movement was also influenced by Romanticism, which emphasised the importance of emotion, intuition, mystery, and will power. It also had an intense affection for nature. Some of those Romantic values were reflected in the Keswick movement. Since its first appearance, the holiness movement was held in the Lake District, which “symbolised the appeal of nature for the movement.”<sup>59</sup> This was the region where the Romantic poets, William Wordsworth and Samuel Taylor Coleridge, had lived and their poetic tendency was carried on by some important figures of the Keswick movement. Frances Ridley Havergal (1836-1879), perhaps “the greatest Evangelical hymnwriter of the nineteenth century,”<sup>60</sup> was a supporter of the movement. Charles A. Fox, who served in Eaton Chapel, London, was a leading orator at the early Keswick Conventions, who delivered his Keswick messages in a poetical, even mystical tone.

### 1.1.4 Characteristics of the Keswick Movement

One major characteristic of Keswick was the desire for Christian unity. “All one in Christ Jesus” was a watchword from the first Keswick Convention. This motto, chosen by Robert Wilson, was to be “the foundation stone of the harmony,

---

<sup>57</sup> Bebbington already made an articulate presentation of the influences on the Keswick movement in *Evangelicalism in Modern Britain*, 153-65.

<sup>58</sup> Bebbington, *Holiness*, 74.

<sup>59</sup> *Ibid.*, 80.

<sup>60</sup> *Ibid.*, 79.

brotherly love, and fellowship” that bound the believers during the Convention.<sup>61</sup> According to Albert Head, one of the early Chairmen of the Keswick Convention, “the marked sense of division and denominationalism here disappears. The platform is occupied by representatives of many sections of the evangelical Churches of our land, and such is the sense of unity which prevails that the thought does not find expression, ‘To what denomination does the Speaker belong?’”<sup>62</sup>

Another important feature of the Keswick Convention was its emphasis on practicality. Canon Harford-Battersby described the purpose of early Keswick meetings as “the promotion of practical holiness.” The spiritual gatherings were expected to be the place where “the practical outworking of a wholesome relationship with Jesus Christ is to be seen in transformed lives.”<sup>63</sup> This included giving up certain practices regarded as worldly and sinful, including attending the theatre, dancing, and drunkenness.<sup>64</sup> At the Convention of 1898, E. W. Moore gave an example of someone who after attending a holiness meeting had stopped drinking, “he had got liberty...got a heart purified and cleansed from the love of the thing, and so he was free to work for and serve his Master.”<sup>65</sup> S. A. Selwyn, at the Keswick Convention of 1902, pointed to the engagement of Christians with some worldly entertainment as the main cause of the ineffectiveness of Christian witness in Britain:

But perhaps you are sometimes to be found in places where you have neither words nor power to witness; possibly in the theatre, or the ballroom, or some place of the kind, and you a follower of the Lord Jesus Christ! .... Is it not because the Church is now so worldly that God the Holy Spirit is not using her as many of her members are longing that He would?<sup>66</sup>

---

<sup>61</sup> Barabas, *So Great Salvation*, 34.

<sup>62</sup> Albert Head, “The Watchword of the Convention,” in *The Keswick Convention: Its Message, Its Method and Its Men*, ed. Charles F. Harford (London: Marshall, 1907), 116.

<sup>63</sup> Price and Randall, *Transforming Keswick*, 36.

<sup>64</sup> On the attitude of evangelical churches toward certain forms of recreation, see Bebbington, *Dominance of Evangelicalism*, 218-24. Bebbington also discussed the temperance movement in Britain that emerged in the 1820s (*The Dominance of Evangelicalism*, 227-30).

<sup>65</sup> Evan Henry Hopkins, ed., *The Keswick Week, 1898: Twenty-Fourth Convention* (London: Marshall Brothers, 1898), 183.

<sup>66</sup> Evan Henry Hopkins, ed., *The Keswick Week, 1902: Twenty-Eighth Convention* (London: Marshall Brothers, 1902), 97.

Sabbath-breaking was considered an especially serious sin. According to S. A. Selwyn, Sabbath-breaking in Britain was “getting worse year by year,” while Pastor Soltau mentioned specifically novel reading and idleness as examples of sinful habits during the Sabbath. On the meaning of “waste places shall be rebuilt” in Ezekiel 36:33, Soltau explained, “Well, the time you spend in novel reading is a waste place; in needlework, which is often mere frippery; in unnecessary sleep; often the Sunday afternoon walk or the Sunday nap. You have to ask the Lord to cultivate all the waste bits of time, so that there may be none of it that is not going to be fruitful.”<sup>67</sup>

The youngest son of the founder once said that, “If I were to describe in one word the methods adopted at Keswick they might be summed up in the word simplicity.”<sup>68</sup> There was not any special effort to excite feeling or create a sensation at the meetings. Attendees came to the Convention in order to deepen their faith. Barabas insisted that, “in all these meetings there is no attempt to use devices for attracting large crowds. There are no paid singers and no elaborate music... There is a marked absence of anything tending to emotionalism.” Price and Randall have observed that, “It was always unlikely that a Convention which was noted for its moderate Anglican leadership would be carried away by heightened expressions of emotion.”<sup>69</sup>

### 1.1.5 The Keswick Movement and the Welsh Revival

The Welsh revival in 1904-05 was a significant revival in early twentieth-century Britain, often regarded as “forerunner of Pentecostalism.”<sup>70</sup> According to Stewart Brown, the revival was a response to the education problem and the impact of modern culture.<sup>71</sup> The most important figure of the revival was Evan Roberts (1878-

---

<sup>67</sup> Ibid., 16; Evan Henry Hopkins, ed., *The Keswick Week, 1899: Twenty-Fifth Convention* (London: Marshall Brothers, 1899), 161.

<sup>68</sup> Harford, “Introductory Chapter,” 9.

<sup>69</sup> Price and Randall, *Transforming Keswick*, 170.

<sup>70</sup> *The New International Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements*, eds. Stanley M. Burgess and Ed M. Van der Maas (Grand Rapids: Zondervan, 2002), s.v. “Welsh revival.”

<sup>71</sup> The modern culture includes “sport, science, modern Psychology, ‘promiscuous’ literature, socialism, and labour unrest”; Brown, *Providence and Empire*, 418.

1951). By the end of 1904, there were an estimated 32,000 converts in South Wales.<sup>72</sup> The connection between the Welsh revival and the development of Pentecostalism became strong in Britain. The Anglican clergyman, A. A. Boddy, visited Wales during the revival and afterwards became a leader of the English Pentecostal movement. The founders of the Elim Pentecostal Church, George Jeffreys (1889-1962) and his brother, Stephen Jeffreys (1876-1943), were among the converts during the revival.<sup>73</sup> Later chapters in this thesis will explore these connections further through considering the interest in both revival and Pentecostalism of a number of missionaries to Asia influenced by Keswick holiness teaching.

The Keswick holiness movement made some contributions to the Welsh revival, especially through the Llandrindod Wells Convention which was held for the first time in 1903. The holding of that convention was initiated by Jessie Penn-Lewis, who came to the experience of consecration under the ministry of Evan H. Hopkins and later became a Keswick speaker in Ladies' meetings. At Llandrindod, Evan H. Hopkins, F. B. Meyer, Stuart Holden, and Mrs. Penn-Lewis were the speakers of the first Welsh Keswick Convention, with Albert Head as its Chairman.

#### 1.1.6 Cambridge and the Holiness Movements

Alongside the Keswick conventions and other holiness meetings in England, the holiness movement also developed among students, particularly at Cambridge University. This was especially furthered by the visit of the American revivalists, Dwight L. Moody and Ira D. Sankey. Their revivalist campaigns, combining 'practical holiness' and enthusiasm for evangelism, profoundly influenced the British missionary movement which increasingly saw itself part of an international Protestant movement.<sup>74</sup> Their involvement shows how holiness was also an

---

<sup>72</sup> Eifion Evans, *The Welsh Revival of 1904* (London: Evangelical Press, 1969), 129.

<sup>73</sup> *Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements*, eds. Stanley M. Burgess, Gary B. McGee, and Patrick H. Alexander (Grand Rapids: Regency Reference Library, 1988), s.v. "Welsh revival."

<sup>74</sup> Cox, *British Missionary Enterprise*, 185.

increasingly international movement, with the American holiness tradition continuing to shape events in Britain, as it had previously with Phoebe Palmer and the Pearsall Smiths. In November 1882 Moody and Sankey conducted an eight-day mission at the invitation of the Cambridge Inter-Collegiate Christian Union (C.I.C.C.U.), which contributed to heightened religious feeling among many Cambridge students. F. W. B. Bullock believed that, “the Mission undoubtedly roused many from a life of carelessness to the service of Christ.”<sup>75</sup>

The Moody and Sankey mission was followed in early 1883 by visits from several Keswick Convention speakers to Cambridge. Among those affected by this holiness teaching were students of Ridley Hall. Opened in 28 January 1881, Ridley Hall had been founded with the primary purpose of “training such Cambridge graduates as were Evangelicals and candidates for the Ministry of the Church of England.”<sup>76</sup> Its founder, Edward Henry Carr, originally intended that Ridley Hall would become “an authoritative School of Theology, based on the Scriptural principles of the Reformation, interpreted in an Evangelical sense, and comprising in its doctrines all the results of modern learning, of recent investigation, of superior thought, and of Christian experience, which from time to time should be admitted to be trustworthy by accredited Judges.”<sup>77</sup> One outcome of the Moody and Sankey Mission of 1882 was the beginning of daily prayer meetings in Ridley Hall.

The connection between the Keswick holiness movement and Ridley Hall was developed by Handley Carr Glyn Moule (1841-1920), who became the first Principal of Ridley Hall in 1880, and later Norrisian Professor of Divinity at Cambridge University in 1899, and then Bishop of Durham in 1901. He was drawn to Keswick teaching at a conference held at Park Hall, Polmont, on 18 September 1884. After listening to the address given by Evan H. Hopkins, he testified to having found the secret of victorious living. Moule, who first spoke at the Keswick

---

<sup>75</sup> Bullock, *The History of Ridley Hall*, 1:201.

<sup>76</sup> *Ibid.*, 1:1.

<sup>77</sup> *Ibid.*, 1:84.

Convention in 1886, was, according to Bebbington, “the most scholarly exponent of the Keswick position.”<sup>78</sup>

As Principal of Ridley Hall, Handley Moule sought to instill Keswick holiness teachings into his students. According to H. L. C. de Candole, a student at Ridley Hall from 1887 to 1890:

The Christian life of Cambridge...had been passing through a time of severe trial when I went up. Many of the more earnest men had been seeking after the experience of ‘the higher life,’ and – the enemy had been busy sowing tares among the wheat... Among the older men there was the Rev. John Barton...and the Rev. H. C. G. Moule...It was they who by their sympathy and strength first steadied and then guided the minds and hearts of many who were perplexed into an abiding experience of Christ’s indwelling presence. This was the outstanding mark of the religious life of my time at Cambridge.<sup>79</sup>

John Barton became Vicar of Holy Trinity Church, Cambridge, in 1877. His work was important in connecting Keswick holiness teaching with missionary service, as he had formerly been a CMS missionary in India.

### 1.1.7 Holiness Emphasis in the Annual Letters of Ridley Hall

An important source for the holiness emphasis at Ridley Hall during Handley Moule’s leadership is the Principal’s *Annual Letter*. Beginning in 1886, the *Annual Letter* was sent to Ridley Hall graduates throughout the world. It contained news of life of Ridley Hall, reports of reunions of former residents, and a message from the Principal.

One metaphor often used by Handley Moule to describe the life of holiness in the *Annual Letter* was ‘walking with God.’ His opening sermon of the Second Reunion in 1887 underlined the ministers’ need to walk with God in order to obtain power for service. This would lead him to seek “what God seeks – His Will and His Glory.”<sup>80</sup> This came through studying Scripture and by prayer in solitude, which were an indispensable source of power for doing Christian service:

All the more he must recollect that his work is not his food; that his activities and interests are not his life of life. He needs to ask himself, earnestly and

---

<sup>78</sup> Bebbington, *Holiness*, 81.

<sup>79</sup> Harford and Macdonald, *Handley Carr Glyn Moule*, 122.

<sup>80</sup> H. C. G. Moule, *Ridley Hall, Cambridge: Reunion of 1887*. (Cambridge: sn, 1887), 8.

resolvedly, again and again, am I so occupied with the externals of my ministry as to forget and to starve its hidden heart? ... Must I not make more “time for believing,” for deliberate concentration of the soul upon its secret of peace and power, and for the constant renewal in my whole life of “a closer walk with God?”<sup>81</sup>

In 1889, Moule urged Ridley Hall graduates to pursue a “high-level life” every day. This was “a life of *daily* conquering and restful *faith*; a life of *daily* unreserved *self-surrender*; a *daily* letting ‘the life of Jesus be manifest in our mortal flesh’ (2 Cor. iv. 10).” This life of holiness, Moule noted, was a “happy life.” This required time alone with God in the ‘morning watch,’ a term he may have invented, and he urged: “I implore you ... to keep an invariable ‘morning watch,’ quite alone, quite without hurry, before our blessed King and Friend.”<sup>82</sup>

The fullness of the Spirit was recognised as essential for personal spiritual health and performing a joyful and selfless Christian service. His prayer for his students was that in all the circumstances of life and ministry, “may the fullness of the Holy Spirit be ever on you and in you.” It would result in “a deepening love of His Work as His, and in a blissful emancipation from the ambitions and the disquiets which centre in self.”<sup>83</sup>

Moule emphasised Christ as the ground for holiness. The Christian should daily “live on Christ as the life-giving root of all sanctification.” This was not a mere matter of outward conformity: “May your inmost soul in your most retired hour know nothing, as its peace and life, but Christ Jesus *for* you, in His propitiation and intercession, and Christ Jesus *in* you, by His Spirit.”<sup>84</sup> At the 1899 Reunion, the last year of Moule’s headship in Ridley Hall, he preached of how being in Christ would grant a Christian minister an ‘adequacy’ to bear all difficulties and sufferings. “It is first to recollect the objective fact that we *are*, by grace, ‘joined to the Lord’; and

---

<sup>81</sup> Ibid., 6.

<sup>82</sup> H. C. G. Moule, *Ridley Hall, Cambridge: Annual Letter, and List of Members, 1889*. (Cambridge: sn, 1889), 5.

<sup>83</sup> H. C. G. Moule, *Ridley Hall, Cambridge: Annual Letter, 1898* (Cambridge: sn, 1898), 1-2.

<sup>84</sup> Moule, *Annual Letter, 1889*, 7.

then subjectively to turn that fact into living truth by communion with Him and ceaseless use of Him.”<sup>85</sup>

The “adequacy” of Christ and dependency on the Spirit’s power rendered claims of self-reliance irrelevant. In 1902, the Seventh Triennial Reunion, Prebendary Webb-Peploe, a frequent speaker at Keswick Conventions, pressed the listeners, “let us brand it upon our minds and hearts, that *we are nothing*.” He ended his sermon by reminding them of “this principle of ‘power from nothingness’,” which was, “not that we are not strong enough, but not weak enough.”<sup>86</sup>

Another metaphor used by Moule was ‘dwelling with Christ.’ With reference to 1 Chronicles 4:23, he asked, “Are we, for the work, dwelling with Him? ... Are we living a life of holy inward communion with Him?”<sup>87</sup> Dwelling with Christ was an inner activity of the soul that would lead to consecration, the condition of being filled by Christ’s presence, and finally usefulness in God’s service:

I must not let multiplicity of work, or even of worship, overwhelm the quiet place within where *the Lord* meets *me*. In His Word, read with most humble prayer for His Spirit’s light and guidance, I must let Him speak to me. With the unreserved utterance of the regenerate heart, speaking out its repentance, its surrender, its allegiance, its trust, its love, its hope, I must converse with Him. Then He will fill me with His holy, loving presence. He will enable me for “all things” that are His will. He will somehow “use me, even me” in His service.”<sup>88</sup>

Faith was necessary to receive the “the fullness of the blessing of Christ.” At the 1890 Reunion he encouraged Christians to “take Christ, and take Him in His fullness, for all things ... Believe not only that He will, or may, do much for you, but that He IS NOW the full supply of ‘all your need.’”<sup>89</sup> In pursuing Christian holiness, Moule maintained, believers should “live by faith in your Redeemer every moment.”<sup>90</sup>

---

<sup>85</sup> H. C. G. Moule, *Ridley Hall, Cambridge: Annual Letter, 1899*. (Cambridge: sn, 1899), 22–23.

<sup>86</sup> H. C. G. Moule, *Ridley Hall, Cambridge: Annual Letter and Report of Triennial Reunion, 1902*. (Cambridge: sn, 1902), 13, 14.

<sup>87</sup> H. C. G. Moule, *Ridley Hall, Cambridge: Annual Letter, 1892*. (Cambridge: sn, 1892), 7.

<sup>88</sup> *Ibid.*, 8.

<sup>89</sup> H. C. G. Moule, *Ridley Hall, Cambridge: Reunion of 1890*. (Cambridge: sn, 1890), 7.

<sup>90</sup> Moule, *Annual Letter, 1889*, 7.

Although personal prayer and devotional Bible reading were common among all evangelicals, in holiness teaching, they became significant means by which believers surrendered, were consecrated, and were filled with the Spirit.<sup>91</sup> Moule importantly connected the inner spiritual life with Christian service – his was not an inward looking pietism. Without this inner spiritual engagement, for Moule, ministerial labour would be fruitless; indeed, there were times when labours should be reduced to allow for personal devotion.

## 1.2 Britain's Growing Interest in Missions and the Opening of Asia

Keswick speakers maintained that the way to Christian sanctification was by faith in Christ alone, through realizing their own sinfulness and making the step of consecration, an act of surrender of self-will to Christ. This would lead to being filled by the Holy Spirit, and to experiencing the rest of faith and spiritual victory. Premillennial teaching was often added to this, bringing a sense of urgency to the task of preaching the gospel. Many felt called to do whatever God willed them to do and to go wherever God led them, and this included overseas missionary service. Their willingness to take up the missionary cause coincided with the opening of some Asian countries toward Christian expansion. The following sections will explore British Protestant overseas missions and the openings of Asia.

### 1.2.1 Britain's Growing Interest in Missions

British Protestant expansion to Asia had its origins in the late eighteenth century. In 1792 the pamphlet by William Carey (1761-1834), *An Enquiry into the Obligations of Christians to Use Means For the Conversion of the Heathens*, demonstrated that outside Europe and North America, Christianity had a very small presence.<sup>92</sup> He argued that Christians had an obligation to spread the message of salvation to those countries.

---

<sup>91</sup> David Bebbington discusses the importance of prayer, Bible study, and fellowship with Christ as the common practice of faith among evangelicals (Bebbington, *The Dominance of Evangelicalism*, 78–83).

<sup>92</sup> Shaw, *Churches, Revolutions, and Empires*, 95.

At the heart of evangelicalism, according to Brown, was:

a passionate belief that only by being 'converted' ... could people hope to be saved from the everlasting torment of hell and to know the eternal bliss of heaven...The experience of saving grace through Christ led converts...to strive to bring the gospel message of salvation to all people. ”<sup>93</sup>

The evangelical zeal included a commitment to spread the gospel to foreign lands, and this passion for foreign mission was energised by the holiness movement and the expectation of Christ’s imminent return.<sup>94</sup> Carey’s missionary pamphlet inspired the English Baptists to form the 'Particular Baptist Society for Propagating the Gospel among the Heathen' in October 1792, later called the Baptist Missionary Society. In 1795, some Congregationalists and evangelical Anglicans established the Missionary Society, afterwards called the London Missionary Society (LMS). In 1799, Charles Simeon (1759-1836), an influential Church of England evangelical minister, and John Venn, vicar of Holy Trinity Church, Clapham, led a group of Evangelical clergymen and laymen of the Church of England to form the “Society for Missions to Africa and the East,” later called the Church Missionary Society (CMS).<sup>95</sup>

The aims of the CMS, as set out by John Venn, were to follow the lead of the Holy Spirit. Since “spiritual work must be done by spiritual men,” only a missionary who had “heaven in his heart” and was prepared to “tread the world under his foot” was to be sent.<sup>96</sup> Venn also believed that the mission society must stand on church principles instead of high-church principles, which meant, for him, that “If clergymen cannot be found, send out laymen.”<sup>97</sup>

The first two CMS missionaries were not Englishmen, but German students from the Berlin Missionary Seminary, Melchior Renner and Peter Hartwig. After they were ordained as Lutheran clergymen, they were sent to West Africa in 1804.<sup>98</sup> Over the next fifteen years, the CMS sent out 24 missionaries, of whom 17 were

---

<sup>93</sup> Brown, *Providence and Empire*, 22.

<sup>94</sup> *Ibid.*, 32.

<sup>95</sup> *Ibid.*, 111.

<sup>96</sup> Eugene Stock, *The History of the Church Missionary Society: Its Environment, Its Men and Its Work*, vol. I (London: The Church Missionary Society, 1899), 65, 63.

<sup>97</sup> *Ibid.*, I:63–4.

<sup>98</sup> *Ibid.*, I:83.

Germans, and the remaining seven Englishmen; only 3 were ordained.<sup>99</sup> By 1848, according to Henry Venn's Jubilee Statement, 350 missionaries had been sent out by the Society, 102 mission stations had been founded in Africa, Asia, America, and Australasia, and 1,300 native evangelists and teachers had been instructed for gospel work.<sup>100</sup>

Between 1849 and 1861, the CMS sent out 250 missionaries, including 62 University graduates. Venn, as CMS Secretary, had attempted to accelerate missionary zeal at Cambridge by holding "periodical missionary meetings" in the rooms of "some leading friend."<sup>101</sup> However, during 1860s the number of missionaries sent by the CMS declined. Eugene Stock, the CMS secretary, called the period 1869-72 "an epoch of deep depression,"<sup>102</sup> with recruitment affected by controversies over higher criticism and ritualism. It was not until 1887 that the CMS experienced a significant increase of the number of missionaries.

This increase was spurred by the holiness movement of the second half of the nineteenth century, as Stock observed: "I have no doubt that the missions of Mr. Moody and the Mildmay Conference, the Keswick Convention and other similar movements, have indirectly but very effectively tended to the growth of spiritual life in the evangelical section of the Church of England, and have had a real effect upon the Church Missionary Society."<sup>103</sup> Stock was one of the speakers at the informal missionary meeting at the Keswick Convention of 1887. Other speakers, Webb-Peploe and James Johnson, reported the result of the missionary meeting to the CMS committee in London. Later that year the CMS general committee sought to tap into the increase of interest from holiness-influenced Christians, adopting "the Policy of Faith" to decline no suitable candidate "merely on financial

---

<sup>99</sup> Ibid., I:91.

<sup>100</sup> Ibid., I:489.

<sup>101</sup> Eugene Stock, *The History of the Church Missionary Society: Its Environment, Its Men and Its Work*, vol. II (London: The Church Missionary Society, 1899), 55.

<sup>102</sup> Stock, *One Hundred Years*, 112.

<sup>103</sup> G. A. (Georgina Anne) Gollock, *Eugene Stock: A Biographical Study, 1836-1928* (London: Church Missionary Society, 1929), 34.

grounds.”<sup>104</sup> After missionary meetings were integrated into the Convention’s programme a year later, Stock regularly presided at the meetings for twenty-three years.<sup>105</sup> This made him and the CMS an obvious first point of resort for those who felt the call of mission at the Keswick convention meetings. The CMS worked hard to make sure it benefitted from the rise of interest in mission inspired by Keswick. At the 1888 convention, thirty missionaries from the CMS, CIM, and CEZMS attended, and thirteen spoke about their call to mission. Stock challenged those present, “not to question, Lord what wilt thou have me to do? But Lord where wilt thou have me to go.”<sup>106</sup> In 1890, the CMS general committee received a letter that appealed for one thousand missionaries – known as the “Keswick Letter” – and that later found support from E. W. Benson, Archbishop of Canterbury.<sup>107</sup>

### 1.2.2 The Opening of Asia

The following sections will explore the opening of India, Ceylon, Japan, and China to Christian missions and the wider achievement of mission in Asia since the beginning of the nineteenth century. The events associated with the three case studies of Keswick-holiness influenced missionaries, which are explored in this thesis, occurred at a pivotal moment in mission history. In *The Crisis of Missions* (1886), A. T. Pierson argued that there was a providential purpose in the opening of China and Japan’s ports, and changes to official attitudes to missions by the British government in India after the 1857 Sepoy Rebellion. In response, he urged the Church to train and prepare “warriors and workers to carry the gospel through those open doors.” There was a mixture of opportunity and responsibility, and the book presented “marching orders for action.”<sup>108</sup>

---

<sup>104</sup> Eugene Stock, *The History of the Church Missionary Society: Its Environment, Its Men and Its Work*, vol. III (London: The Church Missionary Society, 1899), 333.

<sup>105</sup> Gollock, *Eugene Stock*, 111.

<sup>106</sup> Narlini Arles, “Pandita Ramabai and Amy Carmichael: a Study of their Contributions towards Transforming the Position of Indian Women” (MTh thesis, University of Edinburgh, 1985), 125.

<sup>107</sup> Stock, *The History of the Church Missionary Society*, III:670.

<sup>108</sup> A. T. Pierson, *Crisis of Mission*, quoted in Robert, *Occupy until I Come*, 141-4.

### 1.2.2.1 India

The subjection of many Indian states to British rule, administered by the East India Company from the mid eighteenth century, had opened the way for Christian expansion of missionary work. The arrival of the Rev. David Brown in Calcutta in 1786 was believed to mark "the beginning of a new phase in the Christian invasion of India."<sup>109</sup> The East India Company authorities, however, suspected that missionary activity would antagonise Indians and create social and political instability, and until 1813, it allowed only a few missionaries to enter India under Company licence. The Company was legally obliged to allow missionaries to enter India by means of the 'pious clause' inserted in the Charter Act of 1813 through the efforts of evangelicals within the Company and in Parliament.<sup>110</sup> These included William Wilberforce (1759-1833), a staunch advocate of Anglican overseas mission,<sup>111</sup> Sir John Shore, Lord Teignmouth (1751-1834), once a governor-general of India; and Charles Grant (1746-1823), whose twenty-two years' service in India made him influential in the East India Company. The Charter Act of 1813 also set up an Anglican Church structure in India.

Another important figure in the early Protestant mission in India was an evangelical East India Company chaplain, Claudius Buchanan (1766-1815). In 1791, he came under the influence of John Newton, rector of St. Mary Woolnorth, in London, and then of the evangelicals Isaac Milner and Charles Simeon during his studies in Cambridge. With Newton's support, Buchanan was in 1796 appointed as a chaplain to the soldiers and employees of the East India Company.<sup>112</sup> When Lord Wellesley founded the College of Fort William in August 1800 to educate young British men for positions in the Indian civil service, he appointed David Brown as

---

<sup>109</sup> Stephen Neill, *A History of Christianity in India: 1707–1858* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985), 133.

<sup>110</sup> M. E. Gibbs, *The Anglican Church in India, 1600-1970* (Delhi: ISPCK, 1972), 51.

<sup>111</sup> Samuel H. Moffett, *A History of Christianity in Asia*, 2nd edition., vol. 2, American Society of Missiology series; no. 36 (Maryknoll: Orbis Books, 2005), 263.

<sup>112</sup> Wilbert R. Shenk, "Claudius Buchanan 1766-1815: Laying the Foundation for an Indian Church," in *Mission Legacies: Biographical Studies of Leaders of the Modern Missionary Movement*, ed. Gerald H. Anderson et al., American Society of Missiology series; no. 19 (Maryknoll: Orbis Books, 1994), 256.

provost and Claudius Buchanan as vice-provost and professor of classical languages. Buchanan hoped that the new college would become a means to evangelize India.

Buchanan's 1805 *Memoir of the Expediency of an Ecclesiastical Establishment for British India* was influential in the establishment of an episcopate for India at the renewal of the East India Company's charter in 1813. In 1811 Buchanan published his writing *Christian Researches in India*, which contained his observations of Indian life and religion based on his travels.<sup>113</sup> In his *Apology for Promoting Christianity in India* (1813), he depicted India as a corrupted Hindu society which could be transformed only by Christianity.

The CMS started its missionary work in India in 1815, sending four missionaries, two of whom were English and the other two were Germans. The first English missionaries were both from Yorkshire: Thomas Norton, a shoe-maker, and William Greenwood, a blanket-maker from Dewsbury. Norton was stationed in Allepey, Travancore, where he gathered a congregation, formed schools, and built a church. The German missionaries were Rhenius, who was influenced by Pietism and educated at Berlin Seminary, and Schnarre. Schnarre served in Tranquebar while Rhenius was stationed at Madras and moved to Palamcottah in 1820. In Palamcottah, Rhenius demanded discipline from those who sought baptism. They were required to destroy their Hindu shrines before being received as catechumens, to attend Christian instruction based on catechetical method, and to demonstrate "real evidence of conversion of heart."<sup>114</sup>

By 1865 the CMS had established three colleges in North India: Cathedral College, Calcutta, which was affiliated to the university, Jai Narain's College at Benares, and St. John's College at Agra.<sup>115</sup> One notable missionary sent by the CMS was Thomas Valpy French (1825-1911). An Oxford graduate, he reached Agra in February 1851 and took up intensive language study. Six months later, French was

---

<sup>113</sup> Penelope Carson, "Buchanan, Claudius (1766–1815), East India Company Chaplain," in *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, accessed April 30, 2018, <http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/10.1093/ref:odnb/9780198614128.001.0001/odnb-9780198614128-e-3831>.

<sup>114</sup> Gibbs, *The Anglican Church in India*, 99.

<sup>115</sup> *Ibid.*, 227.

able to deliver his first sermon in Hindustani. He became the first Principal of St John's College, founded in 1852 at the initiative of the local Church Missionary Association in Agra. By 1857 there were 320 pupils in the College.<sup>116</sup> Due to illness, French spent some years in England, and when he returned to India in 1869, he was in charge of a new divinity college in Lahore, in the Punjab, for the training of Indian pastors. In 1878 French was consecrated the first Anglican Bishop of Lahore.<sup>117</sup>

Since the late eighteenth century Protestant missionaries had called for a number of social reforms in India, including an end to infanticide, hook-swinging at Hindu celebrations, and sati (the Hindu custom of burning widows on their husbands' pyres).<sup>118</sup> Their efforts successfully persuaded the East India Company to pass a law banning the practice of sati in Bengal in December 1829.<sup>119</sup> This prohibition was followed in 1830 by Madras and Bombay presidencies.

The renewed East India Company Charter Act of 1833 opened doors of India even wider for the missionary cause. Whereas in 1813 missionaries who wanted to settle in Indian territories under British control still needed to apply for the license issued by the East India Company, from 1833 missionaries no longer needed the consent of the Company to reside in India.<sup>120</sup> Moreover, while the Charter Act of 1813 had applied only to British missionaries, the new Charter in 1833 granted the freedom to reside in India to all missionaries, including those from America and Europe.<sup>121</sup>

Missionary activities in India received a severe blow in 1857 with the widespread rising against British rule known in Britain as the Indian 'Mutiny'. One main cause of the rising was "the belief in the minds of many Indians that the government was engaged in a conspiracy to change the faith of Hindus and

---

<sup>116</sup> Ibid., 187.

<sup>117</sup> Kenneth Scott Latourette, *The Great Century in Northern Africa and Asia, A.D. 1800-A.D. 1914.*, History of the Expansion of Christianity; v.6 (London: Harper, 1944), 134–5.

<sup>118</sup> G. A. Oddie, *Social Protest in India: British Protestant Missionaries and Social Reforms 1850-1900* (New Delhi: Manohar, 1979), 1.

<sup>119</sup> Brian Stanley, *The Bible and the Flag: Protestant missions and British imperialism in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries* (Leicester: Apollon, 1990), 100.

<sup>120</sup> Latourette, *The Great Century*, 111.

<sup>121</sup> Moffett, *A History of Christianity in Asia*, 2:264.

Muslims, and to turn them into Christians."<sup>122</sup> By September 1857, British troops had successfully suppressed the revolt. In 1858, the East India Company's governance was transferred to British crown. This brought a more positive attitude of the government of India toward the work of Christian mission, partly due to an awareness of the potential of missions to challenge the caste system, and promote the education of women.<sup>123</sup> The Prime Minister, Lord Palmerston, declared, "It is not only our duty, but it is our interest, to promote the diffusion of Christianity as far as possible throughout the whole length and breadth of India."<sup>124</sup> By 1890 it was calculated that there were 4,652 evangelical foreign missionaries of all nationalities in India, including 2,118 unmarried female missionaries. From England alone there were now 1,522 missionaries in India, and numbers were rising -- increasing to 1,608 in 1891, with a further 944 unmarried female missionaries in that year. These numbers were dwarfed by those listed as 'helpers' -- who included teachers, catechists, and visitors; they numbered 18,166 in 1891, representing 73 different missionary agencies.<sup>125</sup>

#### 1.2.2.1.1 Religious and Cultural Issues in India

On their arrival in India, the Keswick-holiness influenced missionaries faced a number of pressing social and cultural issues, for which they needed to develop mission responses. In India, in particular these were the issues of the caste system, the zenana, and temple worship.

#### 1.2.2.1.2 The Caste System

One of the main challenges for missionary work in India was the caste system. Caste referred to a "birth group", in which "all within it shared a common lineage and common single ancestor."<sup>126</sup> The caste system was all pervasive and it was

---

<sup>122</sup> Neill, *A History of Christianity in India*, 417.

<sup>123</sup> Robert, *Occupy Until I Come*, 142.

<sup>124</sup> Stock, *The History of the Church Missionary Society*, II:259.

<sup>125</sup> George Smith, *The Conversion of India: From Pantaenus to the Present Time, A.D. 193-1893* (London: John Murray, 1893), 200

<sup>126</sup> Robert Eric Frykenberg, *Christianity in India: From Beginnings to the Present* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008), 44.

considered oppressive, especially for members of the lower castes, something that concerned Western missionaries greatly. According to the nineteenth-century German missiologist Julius Richter, it included “every member of the community from the Maharajah on his throne down to the leather-worker and the sweeper, and governs all with equal rigidity from the cradle to the grave... In short, the caste limits the free-will of the individual to such an extent that, speaking generally, he no longer lives a separate life, but the common life of his caste.”<sup>127</sup> A census in the early twentieth century identified the existence of 2,378 major castes; if all lower castes were counted, there were at least 100,000 castes.<sup>128</sup>

Richter’s view reflects nineteenth-century Western perceptions. More recent studies have shown caste was a far more complex phenomenon than many missionaries at the time would have understood. Bauman indicates that caste was a system of multiple hierarchical relationships, with variations in different locations, and political-economic factors playing a role alongside ideology. He describes it as “a hierarchical socio-religious system based on common if not uncontested understandings of purity and pollution as symbolic markers of a social and hierarchical order, never entirely settled... established and maintained through a complex matrix of power and status relationships.” British attempts to define and rank the castes tended to a “calcification” or ossifying of the system which had been more flexible.<sup>129</sup>

The caste system in India determined one’s occupation and relationships, including with whom one could marry and dine, as Frykenberg observes:

Within the same caste-genus, individuals of different families (kula) could still share a common meal – and drink from the same well. Quite often this also meant that such men shared the same kinds of hereditary occupation. To go beyond such limits was to bring defilement and pollution. To intermarry or inderdine beyond such limits was to cause biological degradation and cosmic

---

<sup>127</sup> J. Richter (transl. Sydney H. Moore), *A History of Missions in India* (Edinburgh: Oliphant Anderson and Ferrier, 1908), 256.

<sup>128</sup> Richter, *A History of Missions in India*, 18-19.

<sup>129</sup> C.M. Bauman, *Christian Identity and Dalit Religion in Hindu India, 1868-1947* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2008), 31-34.

confusion – and thus, to disturb the moral order (dharma), and, therewith, to invite disastrous consequences (karma).<sup>130</sup>

In this caste system, particularly among middle and high classes of society, property was possessed not by an individual, but by a family.<sup>131</sup> If an individual was considered to be breaking caste, he would not only be expelled from his caste, but would forfeit his property rights.

Converts to Christianity were deemed to have broken caste, even if their only association with members of other castes was by eating and drinking with them at the Lord's Supper. This resulted in painful severance of the "closest ties of blood relationship," and difficult legal questions relating to family property. Richter argued, this is "where heathendom and Brahmanism make the life of a young Christian unbearable."<sup>132</sup>

Protestant missionary societies dealt with the caste issue differently. Lutheran missionaries, especially those influenced by pietism, made a distinction between the "caste spirit" and "caste distinctions."<sup>133</sup> While the caste spirit was "a spirit of pride" which could destroy Christian brotherhood and thus must be resisted, most caste practices were viewed as irrelevant to Christian faith.<sup>134</sup> In the later nineteenth century, Lutheran missionaries developed the theology of 'nations,' which held that embracing Christianity should not detach people from their cultural life and communities. One mission society holding this theology was the Leipzig Mission, which opposed any interference with the caste system among Indian Christians, although it still fought against the caste spirit.<sup>135</sup>

The dominant position of other mission societies towards caste, however, was uncompromisingly negative. Many missionaries believed that caste was "the most cursed invention of the devil that ever existed" and "the masterpiece of hell."

---

<sup>130</sup> Frykenberg, *Christianity in India*, 44.

<sup>131</sup> Richter, *A History of Missions in India*, 256.

<sup>132</sup> *Ibid.*, 257.

<sup>133</sup> Duncan B. Forrester, *Caste and Christianity: Attitudes and Policies on Caste of Anglo-Saxon Protestant Missions in India* (London and Atlantic Highlands: Curzon Press and Humanities Press, 1980), 18.

<sup>134</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>135</sup> *Ibid.*, 19.

The Baptist missionaries at Serampore were early main critics at the caste system. They maintained that caste denied Indian people their potential self-development and any prospect of greater social equality. Because the caste system was perceived as a form of idolatry, Christians were required to renounce caste. The Church of Scotland mission, led by Alexander Duff, was also averse to the caste system. However, Duff believed that education should be the primary method in combatting caste.<sup>136</sup>

This hard-line attitude to caste was followed by Anglican missions. In a pastoral letter in July 1833, Daniel Wilson, Bishop of Calcutta, wrote that, “the distinction of castes, then, must be abandoned, decidedly, immediately, finally.”<sup>137</sup> By 1850s almost all the Protestant missions, except for the Leipzig mission, agreed that caste was “a great evil” that must be removed from church life.<sup>138</sup> In 1848 a resolution of the Madras Missionary Conference stated that only those who renounce caste by eating food prepared by a low-caste-Indian should be baptised. This Conference published a Minute signed by almost one hundred missionaries, including those from Presbyterian, Baptist, Methodist, and Congregationalist missions, declaring their opposition to the caste system. This Minute gained support from the Calcutta and Bombay Missionary Conference.<sup>139</sup>

From the late nineteenth century, however, more liberal views of other faiths, as represented by Max Müller and Sir Monier Monier-Williams, meant that missionary thinking grew more open and tolerant on the caste issue.<sup>140</sup> Müller rejected rigid Protestant opposition to caste and pointed to the “salutary features” in the caste system.<sup>141</sup> Norman MacLeod, a Scottish Presbyterian Church leader and friend of Müller, maintained that as the system of Hinduism would be fulfilled in Christianity, so the caste system would be fulfilled in Christian brotherhood.<sup>142</sup>

---

<sup>136</sup> Ibid., 27-9.

<sup>137</sup> Ibid., 38.

<sup>138</sup> Ibid., 40.

<sup>139</sup> Oddie, *Social Protest in India*, 47.

<sup>140</sup> Forrester, *Caste and Christianity*, 136.

<sup>141</sup> Ibid., 139.

<sup>142</sup> Ibid., 141.

Bernard Lucas, a LMS missionary, was unsympathetic to traditional notions of conversion where converts were expected to renounce caste, becoming detached from their society and culture. Lucas asserted, "The Christ came into the world not to destroy any religion but, to fulfil all, not to impoverish any religious life, but, to give fuller and more abounding life to all."<sup>143</sup>

#### 1.2.2.1.3 Hinduism and Temple Children

Christian missionary approaches to Hinduism tended to focus on its "endlessly varied world of gods." To Richter, "it is beyond doubt that along with this polytheism there prevails among great masses of the people gross idolatry, the worship of wooden and stone images, also worship and divine honours for sacred animals... and plants."<sup>144</sup> Of particular concern to missionaries were some of the practices in Hindu temples.

Devadasis literally means slave of god, and originally referred to a caste of women who gave themselves to a life of religious service in the Hindu temples. From this arose a custom of family members dedicating girls to the Hindu temple in the belief it would bring rewards and religious merit. This included not only girls of marriageable age, but also infants. Widows who visited temples often became the mistresses of priests. In 1923, there were over 20,000 devadasis in Bengal alone.<sup>145</sup>

Davesh Soneji described how the life of devadasis had started from the late sixteenth-century, as those who lived, "in quasi-matrilineal communities, had nonconjugal sexual relationships with upper-caste men, and were literate when most South Indian women were not."<sup>146</sup> Their tasks were mainly singing and dancing in front of the gods and worshippers, keeping the temple clean, and fanning the sculptures.<sup>147</sup> The initial focus on religious dancing was degraded over

---

<sup>143</sup> Ibid., 146.

<sup>144</sup> Ibid., 249.

<sup>145</sup> Arles, "Ramabai and Carmichael," 23-5.

<sup>146</sup> Davesh Soneji, *Unfinished Gestures: Devadasis, Memory, and Modernity in South India* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2011), 3.

<sup>147</sup> Swami Harshananda, *All about Hindu Temples*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed, RIMSE Series 6 (Mysore: Sri Ramakrishna Ashrama, 1981), 36.

time to erotic dancing and singing, and eventually sacred prostitution. Once married to gods, these women were eternal brides. Their thinking was controlled so that they would see all they were asked to do as aspects of devotion to the temple.<sup>148</sup> In some contexts, they were considered as “the concubines, mistresses, or ‘second wives’ of South Indian elites.”<sup>149</sup>

Mid-nineteenth century reformers in South India urged Indian authorities to outlaw this practice. But it was only in the 1920s and 1930s, through pressures from Hindu reformers and Christian missionaries, that laws were passed to stop the practice, especially the 1929 Prevention of Dedication Act. As we will see, Amy Carmichael’s work focused on rescuing girls from temples, and providing a home for the devadasis. Other such places of refuge followed in the 1920s across India, such as that opened in 1926 by the Bombay Vigilance Association.<sup>150</sup>

#### 1.2.2.1.4 The Zenana

Another feature of the Indian cultural context was the zenana. The word ‘zenana’ came from a Persian word for secluded apartments for women, often separated by a curtain. The practice of secluding women was common among both Muslims and upper-caste Hindus.

Missionary women who visited Indian women in the zenana were prompted by a desire to improve their condition, often through medical care and educational opportunities, and by an associated desire to introduce them to Christianity. Only women were permitted to visit the zenana. Missionary descriptions of the zenana were often negative, portraying the women as kept in darkness and without education, whose role in life was confined to acting as household servants and breeding children.

However, this highly negative image is countered by the fact that women missionaries were often invited into the zenana by men, who were keen for women

---

<sup>148</sup> Arles, “Ramabai and Carmichael,” 23-25.

<sup>149</sup> Soneji, *Unfinished Gestures*, 3.

<sup>150</sup> Arles, “Ramabai and Carmichael,” 26-27.

to be educated, or at the request of the women themselves.<sup>151</sup> In 1890, it was calculated that 32,659 Indian girls and women were being educated in their homes or zenanas. The zenana mission provided significant opportunities for women missionaries, and furthered the drive to recruit more. It was asserted in 1893 that, “the women of India must be evangelized by women.”<sup>152</sup>

Within the zenana, opportunities for mission preaching were limited. So more general educational work was the focus, together with medical work (for male doctors could not enter). The need to reach women in seclusion led to the formation of a series of specific missions employing women from the 1840s, such as the United Presbyterian Zenana Mission of 1847. In 1852, the Indian Female Normal Society was founded, which in 1880 became the Zenana Bible and Medical Mission. The Church of England Zenana Missionary Society was founded in 1880.<sup>153</sup> As well as giving increased opportunities for women on the mission field, the need to train women for medical work in the zenanas helped open doors for them into medical training.<sup>154</sup> The specific need for zenana missions declined in the late nineteenth century because of the widening idea among India’s elites that female education outside the home was a good idea – and also because of an increased focus on mission to the rural and lower-caste Indians, where seclusion of women was less common.<sup>155</sup>

#### 1.2.2.2 Ceylon (now Sri Lanka)

Moffett has summarised the four centuries of Ceylon's exposure to the spread of Christianity as follows: "110 years of Portuguese imperial patronage and Catholic evangelization (1546-1656), 150 years of Dutch Protestant neglect and commercial exploitation (1642-1796), and 150 years of British religious toleration, Western education, and benign but self-interested economic improvement (1796-

---

<sup>151</sup> Cox, *British Protestant Missionary*, 188-200.

<sup>152</sup> George Smith, *Conversion of India*, 205, 212.

<sup>153</sup> Cox, *British Protestant Missionary*, 188-91.

<sup>154</sup> Antoinette Burton, “Contesting the Zenana: The Mission to Make ‘Lady Doctors for India,’ 1874-1885,” *Journal of British Studies* 35, no. 3 (July 1996): 368-97.

<sup>155</sup> Bauman, *Christian Identity and Dalit Religion*, 170.

1948).<sup>156</sup> Ceylon first came under British rule in 1796, after the British took the island from the Dutch.

In 1804 London Missionary Society became the first Protestant missionary society to enter Ceylon, followed by Baptist Missionary Society in 1812. In 1814 four Methodist missionaries reached the port of Galle, although their leader, Thomas Coke (1747-1814), the pioneer of the British Methodist mission, had died during the voyage. The Wesleyans started building mission schools and preaching the gospel, and some of their converts included Buddhist monks. In 1817 the Church Missionary Society sent four missionaries to establish its mission in Ceylon. Beginning in the 1840s, the CMS supported "the Tamil Coolie Mission," directed to the Tamil workers who were brought from India to work in the British coffee plantations in central Ceylon.<sup>157</sup> Buddhism, however, remained the predominant religion in Ceylon.

### 1.2.2.3 Japan

By the edict of 1639, the Japanese state had cut off most contact with the outside world; this included a refusal to allow Christian missionaries into the country.<sup>158</sup> In 1853, however, this seclusion was broken by the arrival of an American Commodore Matthew C. Perry with four ships at Edo (now Tokyo) Bay. He brought a letter from the President of United States to the Emperor of Japan, proposing opening trade and diplomatic relations between the two nations. Returning to Japan in February 1854 Perry secured the first treaty between United States and Japan.<sup>159</sup> Nevertheless, foreigners were still not granted any rights of residence in Japan.

---

<sup>156</sup> Moffett, *A History of Christianity in Asia*, 2:336.

<sup>157</sup> Gibbs, *The Anglican Church in India*, 263.

<sup>158</sup> The edict resulted in fierce persecutions of the Roman Catholic Church. A number of surviving Christians went underground forming groups which were later known as Kakure Kirishitan or hidden Christians (Daniel H. Bays and James H. Grayson, "Christianity in East Asia : China, Korea and Japan," in *World Christianities, c.1815-1914*, ed. Sheridan Gilley and Brian Stanley (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006), 509).

<sup>159</sup> W. G. Beasley, "The Foreign Threat and the Opening of the Ports," in *The Cambridge History of Japan. Vol. 5, Nineteenth Century*, ed. Marius B. Jansen (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008), 270.

The Treaty of Amity and Commerce between the United States and Japan was agreed at Edo in July 1858.<sup>160</sup> In addition to improving trading relations, the treaty guaranteed that, "Americans in Japan were to be allowed the free exercise of their religion and to erect places of worship for this purpose in the open ports."<sup>161</sup> Although the agreement, which was later emulated in treaties with England, France, and other nations, did not grant permission for preaching Christianity to the Japanese, two American Episcopalian missionaries, John Liggins and Channing Moore Williams, arrived in July 1859, marking the beginning of the Protestant mission in Japan. Christianity remained officially forbidden in Japan until 1873 when the anti-Christian edict was removed from the public notice-boards. In that single year, "a larger number of Protestant missionaries arrived than in any one year of the nineteenth century."<sup>162</sup>

#### 1.2.2.4 China

The beginning of the nineteenth century saw no open doors in China for missionaries. In 1793, the Qianlong Emperor explicitly prohibited the dissemination of the "English religion" in his territory. The next Emperor, the Jiaqing Emperor, also issued an edict of religion against Christianity in 1800. However, despite the illegality of missions in China, an English Presbyterian missionary, Robert Morrison (1782-1834), made his way to the country. Sent by the London Missionary Society, he became the first Protestant missionary to China, reaching Canton in 1807. His significant contributions included the first complete translation of the Bible into Chinese, a Chinese grammar (1815) and a Chinese-English dictionary (1821-1822), to which "subsequent generations of missionaries were indebted for a hundred years."<sup>163</sup>

Another of Morrison's contributions was his suggestion to the directors of the London Missionary Society in 1809 that it send missionaries to Chinese

---

<sup>160</sup> Beasley, "The Foreign Threat," 280.

<sup>161</sup> Richard Henry Drummond, *A History of Christianity in Japan*, Christian World Mission Books (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1971), 144.

<sup>162</sup> *Ibid.*, 164-5.

<sup>163</sup> Moffett, *A History of Christianity in Asia*, 2:288.

communities outside China, that is, from “Siam to Malaysia, Singapore, and down across the Indonesian archipelago to Amboina.” This led to the formation in 1817 of “the Ultra-Ganges Mission,” a mission to Asia beyond India, consisting initially of two missionaries, William Milne and Walter Henry Medhurst (1796-1857). The mission was based in Malacca, one of the British colonies, where Protestantism had been first introduced by the Dutch in the middle of the eighteenth century.<sup>164</sup> Milne opened the first Protestant school free of charge for the Chinese community in Malacca, established a printing press, and published the first Chinese-language Protestant periodical. Together with Morrison, Milne also founded in 1818 the Anglo-Chinese College in Malacca; the college educated Chinese Christian workers for China.<sup>165</sup>

The pioneering work of the German missionary Karl Gützlaff, who founded the Chinese Union in 1844, grew out of the recognition that China’s millions would never be converted to Christianity by the efforts of foreign missionaries alone. Instead, Chinese agents were needed, who would travel into every province of inland China with the gospel. Gützlaff was an inspirational figure, who encouraged many others to work in China, and promoted allowing single women to go to China as missionaries. By 1849, the Chinese Union had 130 members, and claimed 695 converts. However, it was soon subject to widespread criticism by other missionaries, who raised doubts about the claims made by its agents. Mired in controversy, the Chinese Union disintegrated soon after Gützlaff’s death in 1851.<sup>166</sup>

China opened its doors to Christian missions, although reluctantly, after the Opium Wars of 1839-1842 and 1856-1860. After the Treaty of Nanjing, which ended

---

<sup>164</sup> Ibid., 2:289-90.

<sup>165</sup> Koernia Atje Soejana et al., “Christianity in Javanese Culture and Society,” in *A History of Christianity in Indonesia*, ed. Jan S. Aritonang and Karel A. Steenbrink, Studies in Christian Mission; v. 35 (Leiden, Boston: Brill, 2008), 640; Yusak Soleiman and Karel Steenbrink, “Chinese Christian Communities in Indonesia,” in *A History of Christianity in Indonesia*, ed. Jan S. Aritonang and Karel Steenbrink, Studies in Christian Mission; v. 35 (Leiden, Boston: Brill, 2008), 907.

<sup>166</sup> A balanced assessment of Gützlaff’s achievements, and of the charges brought against him and his Chinese agents is found in J.G and R.R. Lutz, “Karl Gützlaff’s Approach to Indigenization: The Chinese Union,” in Daniel H. Bays, ed., *Christianity in China – From the Eighteenth Century to the Present* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1996), 269-91.

the first Opium War, the CMS sent its first two missionaries to China: George Smith, of Magdalen Hall, Oxford, who had worked as Association Secretary of the CMS; and Thomas McClatchie, of Trinity College, Dublin, a former curate of Midsomer Norton. Both of them arrived in China on 4 June 1844. McClatchie took up residence at Shanghai, while George Smith was later, in 1849, consecrated as the first Bishop of Victoria, Hong Kong. Other missionaries, William Armstrong Russell, of Islington College, and Robert Henry Cobbold, of Peterhouse, Cambridge, soon arrived in China and started the new mission at Ningpo.<sup>167</sup> From Ningpo, the CMS missionaries itinerated extensively in Chekiang and formed a number of mission stations. Some important China missionaries were the brothers George and Arthur Evans Moule, who were older brothers of Handley Moule. Other missionary societies also focused their attention on China including the Berlin Missionary Society for China, the Berlin Women's Missionary Society for China, and the Chinese Evangelization Society.<sup>168</sup>

The mid-nineteenth century also saw the Taiping Rebellion (1851-1864), led by Hong Xiuquan, a native of Guangdong. Hong claimed to have received a heavenly vision, in which he met Jehovah and Jesus Christ, his "elder brother," and received a great commission of saving China. He was able to make sense of his vision after reading several Christian missionary tracts written by Liang Fa, the first Chinese Protestant minister ordained by Robert Morrison. In 1843 he gathered his converts in Guangxi to form a sect known as the God-Worshippers' Society, and by late 1850 Hong had around 20,000 followers. In January 1851 he proclaimed himself to be the Heavenly King of the Kingdom of Great Peace (Taiping), appointed by Jehovah and Christ to "cleanse China from its sins, to expose the errors of Confucius, to drive out the demons of Buddhism, and to hurl the usurping Manchu emperor from his throne in Beijing."<sup>169</sup> Hong and his army took control of Wuhan in 1851, and then Nanjing in 1853, which was made their Heavenly Capital. In 1864, this "quasi-Christian movement" was suppressed by Chinese soldiers with the help of foreign

---

<sup>167</sup> Stock, *The History of the Church Missionary Society*, 1:472–3.

<sup>168</sup> See Bays, *Christianity in China*, 288.

<sup>169</sup> Moffett, *A History of Christianity in Asia*, 2:299.

troops led by the British general, Charles George Gordon. For the imperial Manchu government and the elite class or Chinese intellectuals, the Taiping ideology was an “anathema.”<sup>170</sup> Viewing Taiping rebels as Christians despite their unorthodoxy, the Chinese government identified Christianity with social unrest, which proved a great hindrance to missionary activities.<sup>171</sup>

Another important uprising in China was the Boxer Rising (1898-1901). The Boxer movement originated in a secret society from northwest Shandong which combined two peasant customs, “the techniques of the martial arts or “boxing”” and “the practice of spirit possession.” The strong anti-foreign mood that predominated in China encouraged the Empress Dowager and Manchu princes to use the Boxers to get rid of foreign domination. For eight weeks (June 29-August 14) a large number of missionaries, diplomats and journalists within the Beijing legation quarter was besieged by the Boxers until rescued by an international army. The Boxers slaughtered thousands of Chinese Christians and killed 250 foreigners, most of them missionaries, across North China.<sup>172</sup>

One of the most important missionary societies of the second half of the nineteenth century was the China Inland Mission. Its founder, James Hudson Taylor (1832-1905), arrived at Shanghai as a missionary of the Chinese Evangelisation Society. In Shanghai, he met Joseph Edkins of the London Missionary Society, from whom he learned the importance of wearing Chinese costume in order to avoid drawing negative attention. In 1857, Hudson Taylor resigned from the Chinese Evangelisation Society, and formed an independent Ningpo mission with his colleague, Dr. William Parker. In 1860, illness forced him to return home to England. However, in June 1865, at Brighton Beach, Hudson Taylor claimed to receive a “heavenly vision” with a message that “a million a month in China are dying without

---

<sup>170</sup> Bays and Grayson, “Christianity in East Asia,” 496.

<sup>171</sup> John King Fairbank and Merle Goldman, *China: A New History*, 2nd edition. (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2006), 211; Latourette noted that “the T’ai P’ing movement was a Chinese sect, displaying... contact with Christianity, but drawing most of its beliefs and characteristics from its Chinese environment and the erratic genius of its leaders...Only a complete misunderstanding of the message of the New Testament could have led to so great a travesty of the doctrines of Christ as that which existed at Nanking”; Neill, *A History of Christian Missions*, 244–5.

<sup>172</sup> Fairbank and Goldman, *China*, 230-1.

God.” He then prayed for twenty-four “willing skillful” workers, and the next day he opened a bank account with the name of “China Inland Mission.”<sup>173</sup>

Hudson Taylor’s mission was overseen, not from England, but directly from China by the director who would have full authority. Hudson Taylor made it clear that:

As to guidance and direction, it was stated that in every respect what I deemed requisite must be complied with. That where we should go to, where and when different individuals should be located, the positions they should occupy, etc., must be left to me to determine... that in all points save those of conscience on which Christians of various denominations differed, it was to be understood fully that I should direct.<sup>174</sup>

CIM missionaries were expected to be Hudson’s “helpers,” who would “give him prompt and loyal obedience (as his father put it) as they would obey God.”<sup>175</sup> For financial support, the CIM determined to depend solely on God without any constant maintenance from churches or other institutions. It meant that the missionaries “receive no salary, but expect that God will supply their every need through the hands of his children.”<sup>176</sup> Hudson Taylor, moreover, required CIM missionaries to wear Chinese costume.

The China Inland Mission was an interdenominational mission which welcomed candidates from any denomination so long as they adhered to its conservative theology. The mission was open to women and those who were short of educational qualifications, provided that they were high-spirited enough to survive in China. The most important qualification was the spiritual character of the candidates. Austin asserted that, “above all, they must be men and women ‘full of faith and the Holy Ghost’.”<sup>177</sup> Hence, from its inception the CIM had emphasised that missionary work should not be separated from personal holiness.

According to Latourette, the China Inland Mission sought “not to win converts or to build a Chinese church, but to spread a knowledge of the Christian

---

<sup>173</sup> Austin, *China’s Millions*, 80.

<sup>174</sup> *Ibid.*, 104.

<sup>175</sup> *Ibid.*, 103.

<sup>176</sup> Fiedler, *The Story of Faith Missions*, 33.

<sup>177</sup> Austin, *China’s Millions*, 92.

Gospel throughout the empire as quickly as might be."<sup>178</sup> While in 1865 there was no Protestant missionary in eleven of the eighteen Chinese provinces, by 1882 the mission had reached all of the provinces, with missionaries stationed in fifteen provinces.

Hudson Taylor later became an important figure in linking the CIM to the Keswick holiness movement. He was present at the Convention in 1883 and spoke from its main platform ten years later. He was also the first speaker at the unofficial missionary meeting in 1887. Austin argues that it was the addition of Keswick teaching in the second decade of the CIM's work to the pietism and millenarian eschatology that had characterized the CIM's first decade, which had a profound effect: "This passive faith that their lives were in God's hands gave them a spiritual passport into Chinese life."<sup>179</sup>

#### 1.2.2.4.1 Chinese Cultural Issues Encountered by Missionaries

In the following sections, we will consider three major social and cultural issues which the holiness-inspired missionaries encountered in their mission work in China: ancestral worship, opium smoking, and the impact of devastating famines, especially in the 1870s.

#### 1.2.2.4.2. Ancestral Veneration<sup>180</sup>

In 1925 James Thayer Addison reflected on the attitude of Protestant missionaries toward the Chinese practice of ancestral veneration.<sup>181</sup> Drawing from the first three missionary conferences in China, Addison argued that there was a development of thought among Protestant missionaries whereby they became more open-minded in approaching the subject. Ancestral veneration was an important topic in these missionary conferences since, Addison observed, it was regarded as "the national

---

<sup>178</sup> Latourette, *The Great Century*, 329.

<sup>179</sup> Austin, *China's Millions*, 249.

<sup>180</sup> On ancestor veneration – see minutes of the mission conferences in China; on opium smoking and the opium wars – see Austin, *China's Millions*, 48-53; 115-116; on the famine of the 1870s and CIM role see Austin, *China's Millions*, 144-67.

<sup>181</sup> James Thayer Addison, "Chinese Ancestor-Worship and Protestant Christianity," *The Journal of Religion* 5, no.2 (March 1925)

religion of China” and “the most formidable obstacle” to the evangelising effort.<sup>182</sup> For Chinese people, to give up their ancestral rites often meant exclusion from the family, bringing scorn and humiliation.

The views expressed by missionaries at the two General Missionary conferences held in China in 1877 and 1890 reflect the changing attitudes on ancestral veneration. At the 1877 conference, the majority of Protestant British and American missionaries firmly opposed the practice of ancestral veneration. Dr Yates, from the American Southern Baptist Convention, delivered a paper, arguing that equating ancestral veneration with filial piety was “misleading.” Yeats maintained that the sole aim of ancestral veneration was for “propitiating certain imaginary deities of whom they stand in dread.”<sup>183</sup> Ancestral veneration, Yeats continued, was the fundamental religion of the Chinese, and its importance could be seen in how it exerted influence in “social customs, judicial decisions, appointments to the office of Prime minister, and even the succession to the throne.” He defined ancestral veneration as including “not only the direct worship of the dead; but also, whatever is done directly or indirectly, for their comfort; also, all that is done to avert the calamities which the spirits of the departed are supposed to be able to inflict upon the living, as a punishment for inattention to their necessities.”<sup>184</sup> He insisted that Christians should respond to this practice by calling for “nothing short of regeneration,” and “a complete turning from all superstition.”<sup>185</sup>

A similar position was taken at the 1890 Conference by H. Blodget, of the American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions, who acknowledged the connection between ancestral rites and parental affection, but maintained that the practice was based on a “distorted view of filial piety.” It made the Chinese parent

---

<sup>182</sup> *Records of the General Conference of the Protestant Missionaries of China, held at Shanghai, May 10-24, 1877* (Shanghai: Presbyterian Mission Press, 1877), 385.

<sup>183</sup> *Records of the General Conference 1877*, 368.

<sup>184</sup> *Ibid.*, 368-9.

<sup>185</sup> *Ibid.*, 387.

“equal to heaven or Shangti.”<sup>186</sup> “Ancestral worship,” he asserted, should be “uniformly opposed by Protestant Christians. This prohibition of ancestral worship in every form has been the course Protestant missions have taken generally in China. Why should any change be made in this respect?”<sup>187</sup>

However, some missionaries at the 1890 Conference showed more tolerant attitudes on this issue. In his paper entitled “The Worship of Ancestors – A Plea for Toleration,” W. A. P. Martin, an American Presbyterian missionary, pointed to the positive aspects of the practice, especially in strengthening family attachments. Such attachments acted as a moral restraint on Chinese people, who did not want to bring disgrace to their families. Believing that “its objectionable features are its excess, not its essence,” he discouraged any attempt to destroy “the system root and branch.” Martin also argued that the three essential elements of ancestral veneration performed at the family shrine or at the tombs of the departed – “posture, invocation and offerings” – were not in themselves necessarily idolatrous.<sup>188</sup> Instead of condemning the whole system of ancestral veneration, he encouraged an attitude of sympathy, preserving the good and removing the evil “according to the dictates of Christian prudence.”<sup>189</sup> He reminded Conference delegates of the dangers of seeking to impose European cultural norms on Chinese society. Missionaries in China, he insisted, should “refrain from any interference with the native mode of honoring ancestors, and leave the reformation of the system to the influence of the divine truth, when it gets a firmer hold on the national mind.”<sup>190</sup>

A number of Conference speakers supported Martin’s view. Gilbert Reid, from the American Presbyterian Mission, believed that ancestral veneration was not “altogether idolatry,” and there was room for modification, which should be left

---

<sup>186</sup> *Records of the General Conference of the Protestant Missionaries of China, held at Shanghai, May 7-20, 1890* (Shanghai: American Presbyterian Press, 1890), 646.

<sup>187</sup> *Ibid.*, 653.

<sup>188</sup> *Ibid.*, 625-6.

<sup>189</sup> *Ibid.*, 628.

<sup>190</sup> *Ibid.*, 629-31.

to Chinese Christians.<sup>191</sup> Similarly, J. Edkins, from the London Missionary Society, regarded filial piety as the essence of ancestral veneration, making it a “noble institution.”<sup>192</sup> Timothy Richard, from the Baptist Missionary Society, noted that in “ancestral worship” there was a gradation from honour given to God to that given to parents, and he claimed that “such rites in ancestral reverence ... are not idolatrous.”<sup>193</sup> Similarly, the Scottish United Presbyterian missionary, John Ross, maintained it was possible that “the idolatrous practices might be eliminated,” leaving “a residuum” that was not idolatrous.<sup>194</sup>

Some approached the topic from the perspective of “fulfilment” theology. Alexander Williamson, of the United Presbyterian mission, asserted that “we are come to fulfil all that is good in China and impart an additional power for good to everything that tends to the highest welfare of the people and the nation as a whole.”<sup>195</sup> The Wesleyan missionary, W. T. A. Barber, took the view that over time Christianity would expel from ancestral veneration “the old mistaken view.” What was needed was not rejection, but careful instruction, so that Chinese Christians could be guided into “that larger sphere of knowledge and of life where what is essentially true in the worship of ancestors shall find its consummation in the worship of the one great source of all, the one great ancestor, even Our Father which is in heaven.”<sup>196</sup>

Others were uncompromising in condemning ancestral veneration. E. Faber of the General Evangelical Protestant Mission asserted that the notion of propitiating the departed to avert calamities and obtain blessings was the equivalent of “worshipping deities” and it “allows no other interpretation.”<sup>197</sup> C. W. Mateer of the American Presbyterian Mission proposed a resolution “that this Conference records its dissent from this conclusion and affirms its belief that

---

<sup>191</sup> Ibid., 658.

<sup>192</sup> Ibid., 696.

<sup>193</sup> Ibid., 658.

<sup>194</sup> Ibid., 700.

<sup>195</sup> Ibid., 694.

<sup>196</sup> Ibid., 698.

<sup>197</sup> Ibid., 655.

idolatry is an essential constituent of ancestral worship.”<sup>198</sup> The views of the CIM, and especially of its holiness-influenced leader, James Hudson Taylor, towards ancestor veneration will be explored in chapter three.

#### 1.2.2.4.3 Foot Binding

Another practice in China that missionaries were particularly concerned over was that of foot-binding. It was common in almost all areas in China for women “to have their feet tightly bound from an early age, distorting the shape of the foot and leaving it shrunken unnaturally small for an entire lifetime.” This practice from the tenth century was considered “essential” for Chinese women to attain a respectable life, since “ugly” and “huge” feet would mean small chance of a good marriage.<sup>199</sup>

In 1874 the Rev. John Macgowan of the London Missionary Society encouraged a group of working-class and illiterate women to form an anti-footbinding society at his church in Xiamen. Bays argues that this was “the first organized effort of Chinese Christian women” seeking to bring change in Chinese society.<sup>200</sup> Female missionaries added their voice, considering the practice harmful and unnatural. Women teachers at mission schools demanded female students have unbound feet. In 1890s the anti-footbinding movement spread to other cities. Chinese Christians employed as Bible women became important in this movement as many set an example in unbinding their feet. Chinese intellectuals began to oppose the practice, and it was forbidden by the Qing dynasty and largely ceased to be practiced in the 1920s.<sup>201</sup>

#### 1.2.2.4.4 Opium Addiction

Still another pressing social problem in mid and late nineteenth-century China was the addiction of large numbers to opium. A lucrative trade in opium developed from

---

<sup>198</sup> Ibid., 699.

<sup>199</sup> Rana Mitter, *Modern China: A Very Short Introduction* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008), 64-5.

<sup>200</sup> Kwok Pui-Lan, “Chinese Women and Protestant Christianity at the Turn of the Twentieth Century,” in *Christianity in China: From the Eighteenth Century to the Present*, ed. Daniel H. Bays (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1996), 204.

<sup>201</sup> Mitter, *Modern China*, 67.

the 1790s onwards, with opium shipped from India, where it was grown, to China by British merchants. By the 1830s, the opium trade was extremely lucrative. Opium was widely used for medical purposes, and many became addicted to it. In 1839 the Chinese Emperor attempted to stop the trade and outlaw opium smoking. This led to two wars over the opium trade, one between China and Britain from 1839-42, and one between China and Britain and France between 1857 and 1860. In 1842, the Chinese were forced to sign the Treaty of Nanjing, and five treaty ports were opened, in which foreign merchants were allowed to trade and operate under their self-governance.<sup>202</sup> Opium also began to be grown in China itself.

One missionary strategy was to rescue opium addicts. From the middle of the nineteenth century, Catholic missionaries were running opium refuges, and being free of opium addiction was required before a catechumen could be accepted for baptism.<sup>203</sup> In December 1871, Dr James Galt and his wife, sent out by the Edinburgh Medical Missionary Society, opened a hospital for Opium addicts at Hangzhou.<sup>204</sup>

Missionary opposition to the opium traffic itself was strong. The CMS medical missionary W. Welton regretted in 1855 that “England should have given twenty millions sterling to emancipate her slaves, and yet pocket annually six millions sterling by the opium contraband traffic.”<sup>205</sup> In Parliament, evangelicals such as Lord Shaftesbury also spoke against the opium trade. Missionaries from Britain faced an added difficulty that they were associated with the country that sent opium to China.<sup>206</sup> The Methodist missionary David Hill, at the First General Conference of Protestant Missions in China in May 1877, described the evil effects of opium, which was associated with prostitution and was a common cause of

---

<sup>202</sup> Austin, *China's Millions*, 43-50.

<sup>203</sup> A.R. Sweeten, “Catholic Converts in Jiangxi Province: Conflict and Accommodation, 1860-1900,” in ed. D. H. Bays, *Christianity in China from the Eighteenth-Century to the Present* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1996), 25-27.

<sup>204</sup> A. J. Broomhall, *Hudson Taylor and China's Open Century: Refiner's Fire*, vol. 5 (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1985), 314.

<sup>205</sup> Quoted in A. J. Broomhall, *Hudson Taylor and China's Open Century: Over the Treaty Wall*, vol. 2 (London, Hodder and Stoughton, 1982), 237.

<sup>206</sup> A. J. Broomhall, *Over the Treaty Wall*, 2:314.

suicide.<sup>207</sup> The Shanghai Missionary Conference of Protestant missionaries held in 1890 expressed its “unflinching opposition to the opium-traffic.”<sup>208</sup>

Missionaries debated over whether the cure for opium addiction was primarily a medical or a spiritual matter. In time, the medical argument won, and addicts were treated for up to three weeks with medicines used to counteract the effects of withdrawal, which could prove fatal if giving up opium was attempted too quickly. A leading figure in developing effective treatments was Dr John Dudgeon, who worked for the London Missionary Society and used morphine to counteract the side effects of withdrawal, giving recovering opium addicts a gradually diminishing dose. The success rate was high. Dr Harold Schofield, a CIM missionary, began in 1882 injecting morphine using the newly developed hypodermic needle, also with success.<sup>209</sup>

Opium use was widespread in China. One Chinese estimate in Shanxi province, where the problem was at its worst, was that 80% of the urban population, and 60% of the rural population, smoked opium.<sup>210</sup> The rule in Protestant congregations was that an opium smoker could not be baptized until after he had given up opium smoking.<sup>211</sup> In a drug dominated culture, there were sadly those who professed to be clean, and to have experienced conversion and been baptized and admitted into churches, who later went back to the opium habit, some abandoning their faith.

#### 1.2.2.4.5 Famine relief

The need to respond to natural disasters such as famines was a vital part of missionary activity in late nineteenth-century China. Here Timothy Richard of the Baptist Missionary Society, who served in the Shantung and Shansi provinces, was a prominent figure.<sup>212</sup> When a devastating famine hit northern China in 1876-79, with

---

<sup>207</sup> W.T. A. Barber, *David Hill: Missionary and Saint* (London: Charles H. Kelly, 1898), 161-4.

<sup>208</sup> *Records of the General Conference, 1890*, p. li

<sup>209</sup> Austin, *China's Millions*, 247.

<sup>210</sup> *Ibid.*, 270.

<sup>211</sup> *Ibid.*, 244, 249.

<sup>212</sup> See Andrew F. Walls, *The Cross-Cultural Process in Christian History: Studies in the Transmission and Appropriation of Faith* (Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 2002), 236-58.

some nine and a half million deaths, he used the famine to call people to turn to God, but he also spread news of the suffering in wealthy areas of China, and overseas. With David Hill, of the English Wesleyan mission, he became a leading agent in distributing relief funds. Such work won the gratitude of many Chinese: for some the first contact they had with Christians was through their role in disaster relief.<sup>213</sup> Richard, Hill, and John Nevius led the way, but faith missions like the CIM, especially its leader Hudson Taylor, also became involved.<sup>214</sup>

### 1.3 Wider Issues of Missions Policy in India and China

In this final section of the chapter, three broader issues of late-nineteenth-century mission policy will be introduced. These are the role of women (especially single women) on the mission field, the place of education in missions, and the role of medical work in missions. Keswick-inspired holiness missionaries, as we will see in subsequent chapters, were involved in all three areas.

#### 1.3.1. The Role of Women on the Mission Field in Asia

The growth of mission work in nineteenth-century Britain included an increasing role for women. They had been on the mission field from the outset as missionary wives, though their labours were often unreported. They were often already involved in Sunday Schools and other outreach activities in churches at home. One of the initial reasons for the growing involvement of women in overseas mission, as we have seen, was the inaccessibility of upper-class women in Hindu and Muslim societies to male missionaries. Women missionaries were vital in reaching the zenana, the “separate women’s apartments in upper-class Indian homes.”<sup>215</sup>

The first three women to offer themselves to work for the CMS did so as early as 1815. The British and Foreign Schools Society sent Mary Ann Cooke to work in Calcutta, and when its funds dried up in 1822, the CMS took her on. She started

---

<sup>213</sup> On Richard’s role, see Brian Stanley, *The History of the Baptist Missionary Society, 1792-1992* (Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1992), 175-190.

<sup>214</sup> A. J. Broomhall, *Assault on the Nine*, 6:167, 171

<sup>215</sup> Maughan, *Mighty England Do Good*, 188.

an orphanage which became a boarding school.<sup>216</sup> The earliest missionary society that sought to reach women in the zenanas was the Society for Promoting Female Education in the East, known as the Female Education Society, or FES, which had been founded in 1834. After 1880, the Zenana Bible and Medical Mission (ZBMM) focused its work on women living in seclusion,<sup>217</sup> as did the Church of England Zenana Missionary Society (CEZMS). From the 1880s British single women missionaries grew both in numbers and influence. By 1887 the CMS had sent 103 single women as missionaries, 95 percent of whom taught in girls' schools.<sup>218</sup> Brian Stanley notes how the increased role for women in mission from the 1880s onwards coincided with the time of the holiness movement having its most significant influence on missions: "Whereas in the whole period from 1800 to 1879 the CMS had recruited only forty women missionaries (excluding missionary wives), a further forty were recruited in the 1880s alone, whilst in the 1890s the total soared to 315."<sup>219</sup> By 1909, 59 per cent of CMS missionary personnel were female. In some ways, single women missionaries, who served as schoolteachers, doctors, or nurses, had become nearly "the archetype of the missionary."<sup>220</sup> Semple goes further, "it is increasingly recognized that women were of fundamental importance in defining, developing, and shaping the course of the modern missionary movement."<sup>221</sup>

The Keswick and holiness movements were attractive to women. Semple links the increase in single women offering themselves to the CMS for mission with the influence of Keswick.<sup>222</sup> In 1885-87, 17 women were sent out by the CMS, in 1888 alone it was 13. By 1891 the number was up to 36, and 1893 it was 42. In 1895 the number of women missionaries accepted by CMS since its foundation was 348;

---

<sup>216</sup> Rhonda A. Semple, *Missionary Women: Gender, Professionalism, and the Victorian Idea of Christian Mission* (Woodbridge, Suffolk: Boydell Press, 2003), 71.

<sup>217</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>218</sup> *Ibid.*, 190.

<sup>219</sup> Brian Stanley, "Anglican Missionary Societies and Agencies in the Nineteenth Century," in *The Oxford History of Anglicanism, volume III: Partisan Anglicanism and its Global Expansion 1829-c.1914*, ed. Rowan Strong, 132.

<sup>220</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>221</sup> Semple, *Missionary Women*, 66

<sup>222</sup> *Ibid.*, 89.

by 1904 the number had doubled. This was in addition to the missionary wives, who made up 53% of the women who worked with the CMS.<sup>223</sup> The *Centennial Survey of Foreign Missions* suggested that 37% of foreign missionaries were women, and this did not include the missionary wives.<sup>224</sup> To these should be added the work of indigenous Bible women on the mission field who did huge amounts of visitation, reading Scripture to the poor or to patients in hospitals. This led to a series of training institutes for women being established, such as the Bible Women Training Institutes started by the LMS in Shanghai, Madras [Chennai], and Calcutta. According to Cox, by the end of the nineteenth century, the appointment of women to the mission field was uncontroversial to all but those who opposed the whole missionary movement.<sup>225</sup>

As we shall see, Hudson Taylor was a significant influence in encouraging single women to take up mission in China. By 1890, more than half of the Protestant missionary force in China were women, many employed in educational roles.<sup>226</sup> It will be seen in subsequent chapters the reasons why holiness spirituality was important in this increased recruitment.

Women on the mission field were especially active in education and health care. What many Victorians viewed as women's duties in the home – rearing and educating children and the care for the sick and needy – were refocussed into similar activities on the mission field. In consequence education and medical work grew to hold a central role in missions.<sup>227</sup> Later in the century, increasing numbers of professionally trained women became missionaries, seeking to use their expertise as teachers, nurses and doctors in ways that were limited at home. Missions gave a greater role to social concern and works of service, which was part of what has been called the increasing “feminization” of missions.<sup>228</sup> This in turn

---

<sup>223</sup> Jocelyn Murray, “The Role of Women,” 81, 89.

<sup>224</sup> James S. Dennis, *Centennial Survey of Foreign Missions* (New York: Fleming H. Revell, 1902), 257 quoted in Cox, *British Missionary Movement*, 191.

<sup>225</sup> Cox, *British Missionary Movement*, 201, 188.

<sup>226</sup> Latourette, *A History of Missions in China*, 407.

<sup>227</sup> Semple, *Missionary Women*, 2, 10, 22.

<sup>228</sup> *Ibid.*, 37.

prompted male missionaries to put their own professional skills to use in practice alongside more traditional preaching and pastoral activities.<sup>229</sup>

### 1.3.2 Education

The provision of education was an important mission strategy from an early point in Protestant overseas mission. The Danish-Halle mission at Tranquebar from 1706, led by Bartholomew Ziegenbalg, focussed upon education, Biblical translation, understanding local culture with the goal of establishing an indigenous Indian church.<sup>230</sup> Although Carey is noted for his work in Biblical translation, the Serampore Trio included Joshua Marshman, a skilled linguist and educator. The Serampore Trio understood that the evangelisation of India was most likely to be achieved through the work of indigenous converts who possessed translations of the Christian scriptures in their own languages, and who were educated so they could read, study and preach them. Serampore College was established initially for the training of future Christian leaders, and the curriculum included the study of Indian culture and languages.<sup>231</sup> Joshua Marshman also established a network of schools: by 1818, some 10,000 pupils were being educated in 92 schools.<sup>232</sup> Such mission work involved an effective partnership between gospel proclamation, education and social improvement.

When Alexander Duff went to Calcutta he provided a high quality education to attract the Brahmin class, hoping this would lead them to embrace Christianity and then use their social status to influence others to do the same. As the Church of Scotland's first missionary, his thinking was shaped by the Scottish model of mission as practised in the Highlands, where alongside preaching, and Bible distribution, a central role had been given to education as a means of cultural transformation.<sup>233</sup> It

---

<sup>229</sup> Ibid., 231- 232

<sup>230</sup> D.Dennis Hudson, *Protestant Origins in India: Tamil Evangelical Christians, 1706-1835* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2000), 1-29.

<sup>231</sup> Stanley, *The History of the Baptist Missionary Society*, 48-51.

<sup>232</sup> Ibid., 53.

<sup>233</sup> D.E. Meek, "Scottish Highlanders, North American Indians, and the SSPCK: Some Cultural Perspectives," *Records of the Scottish Church History Society* 23, part 3 (1989): 378-96. On the influence of Scottish educational thinking on India, see Ian D. Maxwell, "Civilisation or Christianity?"

was hoped that Western thinking, including the results of Enlightenment science, would undermine the Hindu worldview in those who were highly educated, although this happened in only a small number of cases. Those who benefitted from missionary education were quite capable of taking from missionaries what they wanted, while ignoring the religious message.<sup>234</sup>

In 1854, the British government began to offer grants-in-aid to encourage schools, with the requirement that schools so aided be open to government inspection and certain rules defined by the state. Most mission schools began to accept funds, but the school inspectors were often Hindu Brahmins who did not encourage the Christian religious element of education. In 1880, the government began defining an increasing proportion of the curriculum in state-supported schools, which further curtailed the amount of Christian instruction they could provide.<sup>235</sup>

In 1889 British mission agencies reported they were conducting 15,271 day-schools, which indicates how central education was to the mission task.<sup>236</sup> In India, the number of children being educated in missionary-run schools grew steadily, from 64,043 in 1851, to 122,372 in 1871, and 299,051 in 1890. There were a further 135,565 children in Sunday Schools, and there were an additional 166 Boarding Schools, teaching 7,302 girls and 1,784 orphans.<sup>237</sup>

In China, there was a similar focus on education by Protestant missionaries. After Morrison arrived in China in 1807, alongside translating the Bible into Chinese, with William Milne he opened the Anglo-Chinese School in Malacca, with the aim of training evangelists who could be sent to China. This school moved to Hong Kong in 1842. In 1830 two ABCFM missionaries started a small school for Chinese boys on

---

The Scottish Debate on Mission Methods, 1750-1835," in Brian Stanley, ed., *Christian Missions and the Enlightenment*, 136-140.

<sup>234</sup> Shaw, *Churches, Revolutions and Empires*, 521.

<sup>235</sup> Arles, "Ramabai and Carmichael," 144-148.

<sup>236</sup> Cox, *British Missionary Enterprise*, 202

<sup>237</sup> Smith, *Conversion of India*, 200, 206, 205.

Guangzhou. Presbyterian missionaries also started a school of boys at Ningbo, 100 miles south of Shanghai in 1844-45.<sup>238</sup>

The role of education was discussed extensively at the 1877 General Missionary Conference in Shanghai. Here there is evidence of some difference of opinion, with some pressing for a broader social and educational emphasis. The majority of Conference participants agreed that the work of education was ancillary to evangelisation. But school work was important for preparing Chinese future church leaders and to spread Christian influence. R. Lechler, a Baptist missionary, maintained that educational ministry should view Christian teaching of God, human sin, and salvation in Christ as more important than the introduction of human sciences.<sup>239</sup> To C. W. Mateer, an American Presbyterian missionary, educational work was to be seen not only as a means to convert people, but to equip them to defend Christian truth. Educational work should aim to “destroy heathenism,” and “cause Christian faith and morals to interpenetrate the whole structure of society.”<sup>240</sup> The introduction of natural sciences would then be useful to counteract Chinese superstitions.

The Baptist, Timothy Richard, insisted that education was essential to preparing the ground before large numbers would convert to Christianity in China. He argued for education (including higher education), Western technological advance, literature, reform and social progress. By these means, he hoped that Chinese culture, especially its rising intellectual class, would be permeated with Christian ideals.<sup>241</sup>

In an effort to win the Chinese mind to Christianity, missionary educational efforts in China multiplied. In 1890 there were as many as 17,000 Protestant schools. By 1906, this had increased to 58,000, with 400 higher education

---

<sup>238</sup> Moffett, *A History of Christianity in Asia*, 2: 200, 286-95.

<sup>239</sup> *Records of the General Conference*, 1877, 163.

<sup>240</sup> *Ibid.*, 173.

<sup>241</sup> Stanley, *The History of the Baptist Missionary Society*, 175-190, and Walls, *Cross-Cultural Process*, 236-58.

institutions. Shandong Christian University was founded in 1905 by Baptist and Presbyterian missionaries.<sup>242</sup>

The years 1900-25 continued to be an era of significant institution-building in China by missions, including hospitals and clinics, schools, and even universities, ensuring a significant Protestant presence in China, the size of which had grown from 37,000 in 1889, to 178,000 in 1906.<sup>243</sup> As chapter 3 will show, the CIM had limited time for running schools, reflecting their emphasis on the priority of evangelism and itinerancy, further fuelled by the sense of urgency created by its pre-millennial thinking.<sup>244</sup> However, it will be seen that CIM policy was not entirely consistent over a long period, and education did begin to feature in its activities.

### 1.3.3. Medical Mission

Another growing aspect of mission in the later nineteenth century was that of medical missionary work, including the work of both doctors and nurses. The first medical missionary doctor to China commissioned by the American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions was Dr Peter Parker (1804-88), who worked in the country from 1834-57.<sup>245</sup> Inspired by a lecture given by Parker, what became the Edinburgh Medical Missionary Society was founded in 1841, supporting medical doctors in undertaking mission work.<sup>246</sup> The Medical Missionary Society was founded in 1878, and started a training centre for students and medical mission locations in London. Its journal, *Medical Missions at Home and Abroad* did much to promote the cause of medical mission.<sup>247</sup>

---

<sup>242</sup> Shaw, *Churches, Revolutions, Empires*, 419-20.

<sup>243</sup> Daniel H. Bays, "The Growth of Independent Christianity in China, 1900-37," in *Christianity in China: from the Eighteenth Century to the Present*, ed. Daniel H. Bays (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1996), 307-8.

<sup>244</sup> Cox, *British Missionary Enterprise*, 202

<sup>245</sup> Moffett, *A History of Christianity in Asia*, 2: 294.

<sup>246</sup> A. Ross, "The Scottish Missionary Doctor," in *The Influence of Scottish Medicine: an historical assessment of its international impact*, ed. Derek A. Dow (Carnforth: Parthenon, 1988), 91.

<sup>247</sup> Kathleen Heasman, *Evangelicals in Action: An Appraisal of their Social Work in the Victorian Era* (London: Geoffrey Bles, 1962), 228-9.

In 1873, Lucinda Coombs, a graduate of the Woman's Medical College in Philadelphia was sent out as the first woman to be a medical missionary in China. The first woman's hospital in China was opened in 1875, allowing access from women of all classes, and Chinese women began studying medicine and nursing with the women missionary doctors.<sup>248</sup> However, progress was slow. In 1874, there were only ten medical missionaries in China, and nineteen in 1881. There were sixteen hospitals in 1876, with sixty-one on 1889, and forty-four dispensaries.<sup>249</sup>

Training for missionary nurses was encouraged by various institutions, including those influenced by holiness teaching. The Mildmay Deaconesses Centre offered women starting out in both home and overseas mission training in Biblical studies, cooking, and nursing.<sup>250</sup> From its nursing training programme, Mildmay nurses went on to work in various hospitals at home and overseas.<sup>251</sup> Mrs Blanche Bannister, who in 1885 had been appointed a leader of the Ladies' meetings of the Keswick Convention, started the CMS Olives Deaconess Training Home in 1894.<sup>252</sup>

In India, medical and educational work were closely connected. The Indian Female Normal Society became the Zenana Bible and Medical Mission in 1880.<sup>253</sup> Because few women had the educational background to undertake a full medical training or could afford its cost, many trained as nurses, or attended short-term medical training.<sup>254</sup>

By 1890, there were in India 97 foreign or European and 168 native Christian medical missionaries, with 166 hospitals and dispensaries.<sup>255</sup> Women doctors were especially needed in India to reach and treat women in the zenanas. The London School of Medicine for Women, which started in 1874, attracted a number

---

<sup>248</sup> Dana L. Robert, *American Women in Mission: A Social History of their Thought and Practice* (Macon: Mercer University Press, 1997), 165.

<sup>249</sup> A. J. Broomhall, *Hudson Taylor & China's Open Century: It Is Not Death to Die*, vol. 7 (London: Hodder & Stoughton and the Overseas Missionary Fellowship, 1989), 529.

<sup>250</sup> Cox, *British Missionary Enterprise*, 189, 190.

<sup>251</sup> *Ibid.*, 193.

<sup>252</sup> Sean Gill, *Women and the Church of England: From the Eighteenth Century to the Present* (London: Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge, 1994), 179.

<sup>253</sup> Cox, *British Missionary Enterprise*, 189-90.

<sup>254</sup> Semple, *Missionary Women*, 231

<sup>255</sup> George Smith, *Conversion of India*, 205.

intending to work in medical mission. One was Fanny Butler, a member of the Church of England Zenana Missionary Society. She became the first British woman doctor to practice medicine in India, dying in Srinagar in 1889.<sup>256</sup> The Almora mission station in Northern India was started by the London Missionary Society in 1850 with a school. In 1860, the mission took on a hospital for lepers.<sup>257</sup> The LMS mission station started in 1893 at Kachwa also placed medical mission as central to its strategy. Here they linked the “good works” of Christians to evangelistic activity, starting a tent dispensary, followed by a small hospital. In 1901 the hospital performed 560 operations and treated 8000 outpatients.<sup>258</sup>

## Conclusion

The revival of 1859-62 not only brought a large number of people to conversion, strengthened the faith of others, but also helped to intensify the holiness movement. This was furthered by visits from American revivalist preachers, and also holiness teachers. The holiness movement promoted an experience of consecration, surrender, and rest of faith amongst Anglican evangelicals, Baptists and evangelicals in other denominations.

The connection between this major expansion of mission in Asia, and the deepening of religious devotion inspired by the holiness movement, was significant. As we shall see in subsequent chapters, the holiness experience of being filled by the Spirit prompted many Christians to seek to express their devotion in a practical manner, bringing a surge in missionary recruitment. In the CMS alone, the number of CMS missionaries grew from 250 to nearly 1,000 in the last twenty years of the nineteenth century.<sup>259</sup> This connection was identified by John Barton in his address to the Cambridge University Church Missionary Union in 1894: “the more recent revival of missionary enthusiasm in 1857 was connected with the revival of spiritual

---

<sup>256</sup> E. M. Tonge, *Fanny Jane Butler: Pioneer Medical Missionary* (London: Church of England Zenana Missionary Society, 1930), 10, 50.

<sup>257</sup> Semple, *Missionary Women*, 74.

<sup>258</sup> *Ibid.*, 86-87.

<sup>259</sup> Cox, *British Missionary Enterprise*, 182.

life in our own land, and with great events in the far East, such as the Indian Mutiny, the opening up of China and Japan, and the discoveries of Livingstone.”<sup>260</sup>

The increased commitment to overseas mission work was thus fuelled in part by the enhanced Christian devotion associated with the Keswick-inspired holiness movement. The holiness teachings offered the fullness of the Spirit to every believer, including women, and filled believers with a desire to express their full surrender and entire consecration in sacrificial service. This in turn led many to take up the missionary opportunities that were increasingly being presented, and this was especially the case with women who were drawn into the holiness movement.

The following chapters will look at three case studies of Keswick-influenced holiness missionaries, and consider how the holiness theology shaped their call to mission, their approach to spirituality, and their engagement with key issues in the Asian context.

---

<sup>260</sup> Quoted in Brian Stanley, “Home Support for Overseas Missions in Early Victorian England, c. 1838-1873” (Phd diss., University of Cambridge, 1979), 63.

## Chapter 2

### The Keswick Holiness Movement and Missions in Asia

The emphasis on practical holiness in the early Keswick Conventions was of significant influence in encouraging a number of people to dedicate themselves to foreign mission service. This chapter examines the influence of the early Keswick Conventions on overseas missionary work in Asia. The first part of this chapter analyses the missionary themes that motivated participants in Keswick Conventions from 1887 to 1906 to commit themselves as missionaries. This includes the studies of sermons delivered at the Keswick main meetings and also the discussions at the missionary meetings. The Convention of 1887 saw its “grand missionary turn,” defining one of the distinctive characteristics of the Keswick Convention.<sup>1</sup> The second part of this chapter examines the impact of the early Keswick-inspired missionaries on mission in Asia, giving brief biographies and noting the influence of the Keswick holiness movement on their religious experiences, their theology, and their subsequent missionary work. The final section of the chapter will consider the missionaries’ responses to a series of key issues in the Asian context, and also their approach to certain aspects of mission practice, especially education, medical work, and the role of women. This allows some analysis of whether the experiences of Keswick-inspired missionaries had any noticeable difference from the experiences of other missionaries working in the Asian context.

#### 2.1. Missionary Elements in Early Keswick Conventions

There were several types of meetings held at early Keswick Conventions that had specific purposes for different groups of participants. Missionary elements can be identified in the main meetings and missionary meetings, and occasionally in the Ladies’ meetings.

---

<sup>1</sup> “The Life of Faith,” September 1887, 166.

### 2.1.1 Missionary Sermons in the Main Meetings and Ladies' Meetings

Keswick speakers discussed a number of themes connected to mission service. The dominant ones were aspects of holiness teaching, such as consecration or surrender, being filled with the Spirit, and the notion of sanctification. Keswick speakers believed that missionary service could be one outcome of being filled with the Spirit. Once a believer experienced the fullness of the Holy Spirit, he or she would be empowered to be an effective witness to the gospel, and become open to the possibility of being called to be a missionary abroad.

Charles Inwood, an Irish Methodist preacher, at the 1894 Convention, taught that mission work abroad was a result of being filled by the Spirit. Inwood asserted that it was God's desire for every believer to be filled by the Spirit. The missionary call emerged when he asked those who wanted to experience the fullness of the Spirit to say the following words, "Blessed Spirit of God, take full possession of me," and "Send me to China if I am to be sent there. Put me in the front rank or in a back corner, anywhere blessed Spirit, so long as the will of God ... is wrought out in my life."<sup>2</sup>

At the Convention of 1897, Edward W. Moore, incumbent of Curzon Chapel, Mayfair, declared that, "If a man is filled with the Spirit, he cannot help it, he is a missionary straight away."<sup>3</sup> Such a statement, however, might have aroused feelings of guilt among believers within the audience who did not feel the call to mission if they thought they had the experience of the fullness of the Spirit.

Consecration or surrender was another key theme with a missionary element. Those who yielded their all to God were to be ready to do whatever God tells them to do and go wherever God tells them to go. This commitment would include readiness for foreign missionary service. In a sermon delivered at the Convention of 1896, J. R. Macpherson identified foreign mission service as a way of surrendering

---

<sup>2</sup> Evan Henry Hopkins, ed., *The Keswick Week, 1894: Twentieth Convention* (London: Marshall Brothers, 1894), 103.

<sup>3</sup> Evan Henry Hopkins, ed., *The Keswick Week, 1897: Twenty-Third Convention* (London: Marshall Brothers, 1897), 124.

to God. He exhorted his listeners to imitate Abraham's attitude of "absolute surrender," when he willingly prepared to sacrifice Isaac as God had instructed him. Macpherson then challenged his hearers, "Will you this morning yield your will to God?" Later he proclaimed that, "If it be God's will for you to go to Africa, there is the best place for you...If it be God's will to call us to any service, to go to any place, He will give the grace needful."<sup>4</sup>

Hubert Brooke, the Incumbent of St Margaret's, Brighton, in a Bible Reading in 1898 claimed that the concept of surrender must involve the readiness to suffer. The lack of missionaries going abroad, he believed, was due to a general unwillingness to endure suffering. "There are," he asserted, "not enough missionary soldiers to go out and surrender, and serve, and suffer for Christ to touch one-tenth of the heathen field; and if ten times as many rose up today there are places for them all."<sup>5</sup>

Sometimes the themes of surrender and being filled by the Spirit were brought together when Keswick speakers discussed the mission work. Preaching at the Convention of 1899, George Macgregor, a minister of the Free Church of Scotland, taught that total surrender required the Christian to make no terms with God, even if called to go to a foreign mission field: "You must be ready to say, 'God, I give myself to Thee in absolute surrender, to be filled with Thy Blessed Spirit. Thou mayest do with me what Thou pleasest... until Thou callest me home, or send me hence into the depth of China, there to meet death if need be. There are to be no terms. Lord, I give myself to Thee to be filled with the Holy Ghost'."<sup>6</sup>

Pneumatology was another theme in the Keswick call for missionaries. R. A. Torrey, a well-known American evangelist, referred to how the Holy Spirit made believers zealous for spreading the gospel to the world. Referring to Isa. 4:4, where the Holy Spirit was called the Spirit of fire, Torrey challenged his listeners, "Do you want it? It will burn ... If some of you get it, you will not be in England ... you will be

---

<sup>4</sup> Evan Henry Hopkins, ed., *The Keswick Week, 1896: Twenty-Second Convention* (London: Marshall Brothers, 1896), 114.

<sup>5</sup> Hopkins, *The Keswick Week, 1898*, 179.

<sup>6</sup> Hopkins, *The Keswick Week, 1899*, 166.

in Africa, China, or somewhere else... Love for souls is very expensive, but it is wonderfully glorious. Do you want *the fire?*<sup>7</sup>

In her closing address to the Ladies' Meeting in 1904, Mrs. Jessie Penn-Lewis, who would be a chronicler of the Welsh revival of 1904-05, made a connection between the theme of Pentecost, or the time of outpouring of the Holy Spirit, and evangelisation. Drawing from the Pentecost story, she stated, "We want fire to make us true witnesses, we want fire-words, burning words of love, to win souls," and she asked the audience, "Are we ready and willing for this fire of burning love which equips for service, and sends to the ends of the earth if He calls?"<sup>8</sup> With such an emphasis on a second-blessing type experience, and a close personal encounter with the Holy Spirit, it was not a large step for some to embrace a Pentecostal emphasis.

Another theme related to mission was sanctification. Some Keswick speakers believed that the event of sanctification would produce an eagerness for mission. The strong connection between holiness and the passion for the salvation of non-believers was emphasised by George C. Grubb in his sermon in 1889:

Have you ever thirsted for the salvation of the whole world? This Convention will do you little good until your soul is restless: until, in your dreams at night it may be, you hear a voiceless cry echoing from the millions in India, China, Africa and the Islands of the sea ...Your holiness is a delusion, a mockery, and a snare, unless it results in the desire to save everybody you meet.<sup>9</sup>

At the Convention of 1892, Hubert Brooke emphasised the strong link between sanctification and preaching.<sup>10</sup> Making known the gospel to all nations, he insisted, was the aim of sanctified people.<sup>11</sup> This emphasis on sanctification would lead converts to separate from worldly things. There was also an insistence that sanctification would give the believer the power

---

<sup>7</sup> Hopkins, *The Keswick Week, 1904*, 153.

<sup>8</sup> Hopkins, *The Keswick Week, 1905*, 206.

<sup>9</sup> "The Life of Faith," 1889, 187.

<sup>10</sup> Price and Randall, *Transforming Keswick*, 47.

<sup>11</sup> Evan Henry Hopkins, ed., *The Story of Keswick: Eighteenth Convention, 1892* (London: Office of "The Life of Faith," 1892), 40.

to renounce worldly things – suggesting that the failure to do so signified spiritual as well as moral weakness.

There were several other Keswick themes that, although not directly related to Keswick holiness teachings, promoted mission work. One of them was prayer for non-Christian nations. In a sermon at the 1888 Keswick Convention, Elder Cumming, minister of Sandyford Church of Scotland, Glasgow, portrayed evangelising the world as a vital element in the Lord's Prayer. Jesus had prayed "Thy will be done in earth, even as it is in heaven," and this should remind believers of the world's need of the gospel. "Is it," Cumming asked, "possible that our Lord Jesus should have taught His people a prayer in which the condition of the world, the heathen world, the perishing world, has no place?" No, he insisted, it was "Impossible."<sup>12</sup>

Some speakers portrayed mission service as God's call for Christians. In his address of 1889, Hubert Brooke interpreted Isa. 62:10 as God's call to bring the gospel to all the nations. Brooke then highlighted the large numbers who had not yet heard the gospel:

Do you know that half the nations of the world have not seen a glimmer of it yet? Over seven hundred millions of souls without a ray of Gospel light...Take all the churches of Christ throughout the world, counted by millions of believing souls. If you muster up the whole of the light sent to the millions outside of Christianity, it only amounts to five thousand missionaries. Is that a great light?<sup>13</sup>

At the Convention of 1900, Handley Moule maintained that none who confessed themselves believers could avoid the call to spread the gospel. True believers, Moule asserted, were to be "used by Him in common life as His witnesses in the world."<sup>14</sup>

Obedience to God's will was another Keswick mission theme. At the Convention of 1901, W. Darlow Sarjeant, a Wesleyan Methodist minister, told his audience to beware of being hesitant to obey God's call to mission work: "He has constrained you to go to China, to India, to some of our big cities and spend your

---

<sup>12</sup> "The Life of Faith, 1888," 172–3.

<sup>13</sup> "The Life of Faith, 1889," 172.

<sup>14</sup> Evan Henry Hopkins, ed., *The Keswick Week, 1900: Twenty-Sixth Convention* (London: Marshall Brothers, 1900), 137.

life and strength in His service, and you have said, 'Who am I?' Some of you would have been preaching the Gospel today, but you have been disobedient unto the heavenly calling."<sup>15</sup>

In 1903, in Eskin Street Tent, J. Stuart Holden, once vicar of St. Paul's, Portman Square, London, and home director of China Inland Mission, preached a sermon on "the Lordship of Christ." After defining the Lordship of Christ as "absolute and unquestioning obedience to Christ," he addressed young listeners, "Young fellow, young girl, I tell you what it will mean. If you are going to take Christ as your Lord ... you will have to face the question of going forth with Him possibly into the dark places of the earth."<sup>16</sup> Such highly emotional appeals to people of both genders, with their recognition of the equality of women and men in God's sight, helps explain why there were high numbers of women volunteered for missionary service as a result of Keswick.

Some speakers spoke of missions as a national responsibility. This talk of British providential role to spread the gospel to distant lands, which had been an important missionary motive since around the beginning of eighteenth century, resurfaced within the churches amid the "renewed enthusiasm for empire" during the 1890s.<sup>17</sup> Canon Hay Aitken, in the 1903 Convention, believed that the nation had been experiencing spiritual drought in recent years, and that it would only be replenished as it renewed its commitment to mission. One hopeful sign was the growing number of women missionaries, but this meant that families had to be prepared to see their daughters go into mission service. "Dear sister," he proclaimed in words directed to mothers, "have you been thinking more about getting your daughters 'well married' than of consecrating them to the service of God?"<sup>18</sup>

---

<sup>15</sup> Evan Henry Hopkins, ed., *The Keswick Week, 1901: Twenty-Seventh Convention* (London: Marshall Brothers, 1901), 135.

<sup>16</sup> Hopkins, *The Keswick Week, 1903*, 131.

<sup>17</sup> Brown, *Providence and Empire*, 434.

<sup>18</sup> Hopkins, *The Keswick Week, 1903*, 11, 16.

Expressing love for Christ was another theme in the Keswick appeals for mission work. In a sermon at the Convention of 1899, G. H. C. Macgregor insisted that in order to prove their love for Christ and maintain fellowship with him, Christians must be ready to give up someone close to them for the missionary cause. He challenged mothers and daughters, “Is Christ first in our hearts? Mother, do you give that daughter, who is the very apple of your eye, to go out into the darkness and peril of China to be God’s witness there? Daughter, would you part with that mother, whom you love as life itself, if God calls you to go forth as His witness?”<sup>19</sup>

Another theme connected to missionary activity was that of sacrifice. In 1893, Hubert Brooke highlighted the Christian’s call to sacrifice for the cause of Christ. He pointed out that missionary service was such a potential sacrifice: “And perhaps, at the last, the Lord bids you... to lay down your life on the foreign field, as a drink-offering to complete the burnt-offering. What a wonderful calling!”<sup>20</sup>

Another Keswick missionary theme was the Parousia. In 1893, James Hudson Taylor testified that the hope of Christ’s return was the “paramount motive” and “the greatest personal spur” for his own missionary work. Taylor’s belief in premillennialism was also reflected in his assertion, “This belief, that the Lord would have the Gospel preached as a witness in all the world, ‘and then shall the end come,’ has been a very great stimulus to me in seeking to carry the Gospel into districts in which it had not been proclaimed.” Taylor urged the audience to take up missionary work, for “Who can tell but that some of you may be privileged to bring the last of the elect into the fold?”<sup>21</sup> As the previous chapter has shown, the connection between premillennialism and mission was made by A. T. Pierson, and is evidence of the strong American influence on the Keswick holiness movement, and the connection between holiness and mission.

---

<sup>19</sup> Hopkins, *The Keswick Week, 1899*, 50.

<sup>20</sup> Evan Henry Hopkins, ed., *The Story of Keswick: Nineteenth Convention, 1893* (London: Office of “The Life of Faith,” 1893), 17.

<sup>21</sup> Hopkins, *The Story of Keswick, 1893*, 39–40.

Keswick speakers also referred to the obligation of mission service, which should be felt intensely by each believer. At the Convention of 1896, F. S. Webster, once rector of All Souls, Langham Place, described the world as a ripe field for the gospel. Since all believers had “a debt of service,” Webster warned the audience, “How vast our responsibility then becomes! Woe be to us if we preach not the Gospel.”<sup>22</sup> In the Ladies’ meeting of 1892, Miss Minnie Gollock described the symptoms of a spiritual sickness, one of which was lack of concern about unbelievers: “when you hear of the heathen world and its needs, and there is no stir in your hearts, it is a sure sign that your life is not as strong and healthy as God would have it to be.”<sup>23</sup>

### 2.1.2. Missionary Elements in the Missionary Meetings

Missionary meetings were formally launched at the Keswick Convention of 1888, for the purpose of setting forth “the claim of Christ to His people’s willing service in the cause of the evangelization of the world.”<sup>24</sup> The format of missionary meetings of early Conventions was defined by Eugene Stock. The missionary meetings were held for three hours. While they included sermons, the main portion of the meetings was devoted to testimonies of those who were ready to go for foreign mission, or of missionaries on furlough. Such persons were to speak for only two or three minutes, and no information about any particular mission society was presented at the meetings.

At the Convention of 1888, the first official missionary meeting was held on a Wednesday morning, where a number of missionaries, between twenty and thirty, gave short speeches. On the following Saturday morning, the meeting continued with further testimonies from thirteen missionaries, most of whom joined the Church Missionary Society and China Inland Mission. The 1888 Saturday

---

<sup>22</sup> Hopkins, *The Keswick Week, 1896*, 13–4.

<sup>23</sup> Hopkins, *The Story of Keswick, 1892*, 110.

<sup>24</sup> “The Life of Faith, 1888,” 193–4.

missionary meeting also saw the first voluntary gift of £10 from an anonymous donor, which initiated the Keswick Mission Fund.

### 2.1.2.1 Testimonies of Overseas Missionaries

Speakers often emphasised the sense of urgency and challenged members of the audience to examine themselves on whether they felt the call to foreign mission. However, they also warned their listeners not to take up mission work if it was not their calling. In 1892, Miss Geraldine Guinness, who was to become Hudson Taylor's daughter-in-law, appealed for more missionaries in China:

Dear sisters, do you realise that while this meeting has been going on during these more than two hours, in China alone – and we might speak also, as we have already heard, for India and Africa – more than 2,000 souls have passed away into a Christless future? Do you realise that during the five minutes that I shall speak to you, or possibly ten, one or two hundred more souls will pass away? ...What response have you given to the claims of these souls?<sup>25</sup>

Robert Wilder, the American leader of the Students' Volunteer Movement, came from New York to the Convention in 1891.<sup>26</sup> After presenting data about the number of people around the world who were unreached by Christianity, Wilder described the enormous need for missionaries, "There are 180,000,000 in Africa who never heard of Christ! In India, there are 276,000,000... In China there are 1,200 every hour going into eternity without Christ or hope!"<sup>27</sup> He then stated his strong belief, "If you were united... The evangelisation of the world in the present generation! It is in your power."<sup>28</sup>

Some speakers would refer to the urgent need for more missionaries. At the missionary meeting of 1898, Pandita Ramabai from India pleaded for 1,000 missionaries full of the Holy Spirit to be sent to evangelise the women of India.<sup>29</sup> At the missionary meeting of 1904, the Rev. McGillivray from the Canadian

---

<sup>25</sup> Hopkins, *The Story of Keswick, 1892*, 25–6 Mary Geraldine Guinness was the daughter of H. Grattan Guinness and in 1894 married F. Howard Taylor, second son of James Hudson Taylor.

<sup>26</sup> On how Robert Wilder started Student Volunteer Movement, see chapter 4.

<sup>27</sup> "The Life of Faith, 1891," 201.

<sup>28</sup> Ibid. 'The evangelization of the world in this generation' was a famous watchword of the Student Volunteer Movement (SVM). The emergence of the movement will be discussed in chapter 4.

<sup>29</sup> Hopkins, *The Keswick Week, 1898*, 188–9.

Presbyterian Church remarked that at least three thousand missionaries were needed to evangelise China.<sup>30</sup>

At the missionary meeting held in 1895, a number of missionaries testified that doors for the gospel were opening in many parts of the world, including Asia. From Ceylon, Lucy, sister-in-law of Andrew Murray, a minister of the Dutch Reformed Church in South Africa, asserted that missionary workers were greatly needed there and she “gave all a very warm invitation to go out to Ceylon.”<sup>31</sup> From China, W. W. Cassels and Montagu Beauchamp, two members of the Cambridge Seven, explained that there were still many places in China without missionaries. From Japan, Dr Whitney, an American missionary, stated that amid the crisis affecting that country, there was “a splendid opportunity to extend mission work” among the people.<sup>32</sup>

Stories of sacrifice and martyrdom in the mission fields seemed to make deep impressions on Keswick audiences. In the aftermath of the Boxer Rising, some missionaries from China, instead of being discouraged by its horrors, focused on the providence of God. Dr Purves Smith believed that when all the turbulence was over, “God was going to reap a glorious harvest in China.”<sup>33</sup> E. J. Cooper believed that, “the affliction is light indeed compared with the exceeding weight of glory!”<sup>34</sup>

#### *2.1.2.2 Missionary Appeals as Obligation*

The Keswick missionary meetings would portray mission as a Christian obligation, noting that God’s command necessitated unreserved obedience to the mission call. This kind of presentation made a strong impression and evoked feelings of guilt. In 1891, Miss Davies, a missionary from the Indian Female Normal School and Instruction Society (IFNS), claimed that the mission call was for every believer: “If we have not a call for foreign service we have a command: “Go ye into all the

---

<sup>30</sup> Hopkins, *The Keswick Week, 1904*, 202-3.

<sup>31</sup> “The Life of Faith, 1895,” 412.

<sup>32</sup> *Ibid.*, 413.

<sup>33</sup> “The Life of Faith, 1901,” 557.

<sup>34</sup> *Ibid.*, 558.

world”.”<sup>35</sup> She also pointed out the urgency of mission: “Over 10,000 have died during this Convention time. What other call do you want?” If some people still needed “a special messenger,” she gave a solution, “take me.”<sup>36</sup> In 1896, Miss Dawe, a missionary working in Bengal, exhorted her listeners to respond to the mission call. She contended that, “some...said they were waiting for a call, but what was the Lord’s command but a call? And an open door was the call repeated. When would the workers be so numerous as to exceed the need?”<sup>37</sup>

### *2.1.2.3 Missionary Appeals at the End of the Meetings*

Earnest appeals in short closing addresses, followed by invitations to Keswick participants to express their willingness to be involved in missionary work, often by rising to their feet, intensified the missionary enthusiasm amongst the audience. In closing the meeting of 1895, C. G. Grubb asked those who had received “a definite answer from the Lord to take part in foreign mission work” to rise to their feet. Instantly between 150 and 200 people stood up to answer the call.<sup>38</sup> In 1902, William Dalgetty, a Church of Scotland missionary to India, delivered a missionary appeal in his closing sermon, proclaiming that if any in his audience had listened to the Word of God during the Convention and been filled by the Holy Spirit, “they would no longer abide in Great Britain.” In ending his address, he asked those who would surrender themselves to go into overseas missionary service to stand, and hundreds of people did so.<sup>39</sup>

Sometimes the invitation to stand up was directed not only to those who would take up the mission call, but also to parents who were ready for their children to take up missionary service. At the end of the missionary meeting in 1897, Stock asked parents who were willing to give their children to mission work to stand up, and around ten or twelve parents answered the call. The following year,

---

<sup>35</sup> “The Life of Faith, 1891,” 198.

<sup>36</sup> “The Life of Faith, 1891,” 198.

<sup>37</sup> Hopkins, *The Keswick Week, 1896*, 220.

<sup>38</sup> “The Life of Faith, 1895,” 413.

<sup>39</sup> Hopkins, *The Keswick Week, 1902*, 209.

after the personal testimony of Charles Inwood as to consecrating his children, half the parents present rose, many shedding tears.<sup>40</sup>

There were occasions, however, when the response to the mission call was not made by standing up or raising hands, but by remaining seated. This placed considerable pressure on the hearers since it obliged those who did not feel the mission call to rise to their feet. In 1904, Eugene Stock asked those who were convinced that God was not calling them for mission work to stand, and it was claimed that a great number of people remain seated.<sup>41</sup> In closing the missionary meeting in 1906, Stock asked those who could not go to mission service to stand, and again a large number remain seated.<sup>42</sup>

#### *2.1.2.4 Missionary Letters and Prayers*

Missionary meetings were often opened by prayers and letters by the faithful, aimed at intensifying mission fervour. At the Missionary Meeting of the Convention of 1890, Eugene Stock read a letter written by an anonymous giver of £10 two years before. The donor wrote that he was now a missionary himself and gave another £10 to the Convention. At the missionary meeting at the Convention of 1899, the Chairman discussed the many regions around the world still unreached by missionaries. This was followed by a prayer by H. W. Webb-Peploe, in which he conveyed an eagerness to spread the gospel to every corner of the earth as quickly as possible: "Oh, Lord, we are almost overburdened, until we look into Thy face, and remember our God is Almighty. Give messengers enough to reach all these peoples in one generation."<sup>43</sup>

A study of records in *The Life of Faith* and *The Keswick Week*, two Keswick periodicals, for the period 1887 to 1906, reveals that fifty sermons delivered at the main meetings contained references to overseas mission. There were also five addresses delivered in the Ladies' meetings between 1887 and 1906, which

---

<sup>40</sup> Hopkins, *The Keswick Week*, 1898, 190.

<sup>41</sup> Hopkins, *The Keswick Week*, 1904, 203.

<sup>42</sup> Hopkins, *The Keswick Week*, 1906, 217.

<sup>43</sup> Hopkins, *The Keswick Week*, 1899, 177.

included discussion of missions and encouraged women to consider mission service. There was a striking moment at one Ladies' meeting in 1905. In the Wednesday Ladies' Meeting, before Mrs. Penn-Lewis was about to preach, Sister Eva of Friedenshort, Germany, who served in a women's order in the Lutheran Church, claimed to have received a heavenly vision "calling for the light and for messengers."<sup>44</sup> She confessed to have experienced consecration the previous day after Mrs. Penn-Lewis had spoken about "bringing of gifts to the altar" and "the need of cleansing of our inner relationships with one another."<sup>45</sup> Although she had given away most of her possessions for founding the Deaconess Home in Friedenshort, outside Berlin, that vision impelled her to give up her remaining valuable things, a ring and a clasp, as an offering. Her deed inspired 68 women to place their jewellery, or watches, or coins on the table. The Deaconess Home at Friedenshort later sent women to China as associates of the CIM.<sup>46</sup>

The testimony of missionaries from various parts of the world, who came to Keswick while on furlough, further contributed to the missionary cause. Such missionaries emphasised the great need of more overseas missionaries, and asked the listeners earnestly to examine themselves whether mission work was their call.

The pressure on participants to engage in missionary works could be intense. Some missionaries insisted that mission work was God's command, requiring uncompromising obedience. This approach could arouse feelings of guilt, and meant that some potential missionaries might be motivated more by guilt and fear, than genuine commitment to overseas mission. Furthermore, presenting the foreign mission call as a divine obligation would undermine the importance of mission work at home. Some practices at missionary meetings, such as asking those prepared to take up the mission call to remain seated, and asking those who were not to stand, placed considerable emotional strain on those who did not feel the calling.

---

<sup>44</sup> Hopkins, *The Keswick Week, 1905*, 205.

<sup>45</sup> Walter Sloan, *These Sixty Years: The Story of the Keswick Convention* (London:Pickering & Inglis, 1934), 60.

<sup>46</sup> Pollock, *The Keswick Story*, 126.

China and India were frequently discussed in missionary appeals from the Keswick platforms. From 1887 to 1906, six sermons on missions referred to China and India, while another six sermons alluded to China only. From the commencement of missionary meetings, China and India were regularly represented by missionaries. The Keswick movement directly inspired the sending of at least twelve missionaries, seven to India and five to China.

Japan was another missionary destination mentioned in Keswick meetings, although it was less prominent than China and India. It appeared only once in a sermon of the Convention of 1895. Although Japan was represented in the first official missionary meeting in 1888, its need of missionaries was only occasionally brought up. Nevertheless, Japan became increasingly significant at the beginning of twentieth century, particularly after the Russo-Japanese War of 1904-05.

The combination of all these elements – sermons delivered at the main meetings and the Ladies’ meetings, the testimony of missionaries at the missionary meetings, and the visits by such luminaries as Hudson Taylor, which was “an example of the way consecration led to mission,”<sup>47</sup> as well as missionary prayer meetings held every morning from Tuesday to Friday during the Keswick Conventions – was profoundly influential in encouraging participants to respond to the mission call.

## 2.2 The Impact of Missionaries from the Keswick Movement on Asia

From 1893 to 1906 a number of Keswick missionaries went to Asia, Africa, Palestine, Egypt, Hamburg (to work among the Jews), and Dublin. They were financed by Keswick mission funds, apart from Miss Louisa Townsend who went by her own means. There were altogether twenty-four Keswick missionaries, thirteen of whom served in Asia.

The mission work of some important Keswick-inspired missionaries will now be discussed. This includes the work of the Keswick missionaries who went to India,

---

<sup>47</sup> Price and Randall, *Transforming Keswick*, 107.

represented by Amy Carmichael, Alice Eveline Luce, and Thomas Walker; those who served in China, represented by Gershom Whitfield Guinness and Alex K. Macpherson; and a missionary to Japan, Florence Fugill.<sup>48</sup> It also includes the work of Alice Mildred Cable, who was not formally a Keswick missionary but who was greatly influenced by the Keswick Convention. There will be a consideration of the influence of the holiness movement on the missionaries, both before they went to Asia and during their mission service.

## 2.2.1 The Keswick-inspired Missionaries and Mission Work in Asia

### 2.2.1.1 *Amy Carmichael*

Amy Beatrice Carmichael, a native of Ireland, was appointed on 26 July 1892 by the Keswick Mission Committee as the first missionary they would support financially.<sup>49</sup> Carmichael had been unofficially adopted as a daughter by Robert Wilson, one of the leaders of the Keswick convention. At his home she met holiness-influenced speakers, such as F.B. Meyer, and Hudson Taylor. She felt a strong missionary call in 1892. She left for Japan and arrived at Shimonoseki on 25 April 1893 and at Matsuye on 1 May.<sup>50</sup> However, poor health required her to leave Japan. On 10 July 1894, she reached Shanghai, China, and a week later, after she felt that she made a recovery, she felt God called her "Go to Ceylon."<sup>51</sup> On 28 July, she went to Colombo without consulting the Keswick Mission Committee in advance. Robert Wilson cabled her, expressing his earnest concern about her actions and advised her not to join any mission in Ceylon. Receiving news that Wilson had had a stroke, she returned home at the end of 1894. Learning of a mission opportunity in Bangalore, India, Carmichael applied to the Church of England Zenana Missionary Society [CEZMS]. She was accepted and arrived in India on 9 November 1895.<sup>52</sup> In

---

<sup>48</sup> The entries of the missionaries were ordered by the date of their being accepted as Keswick missionaries.

<sup>49</sup> Houghton, *Amy Carmichael*, 51; see also *Biographical Dictionary of Christian Missions*, ed. Gerald H. Anderson (Grand Rapids, MI: WmB. Eerdmans, 1998), s.v. "Carmichael, Amy."

<sup>50</sup> *Ibid.*, 57–8.

<sup>51</sup> Elliot, *A Chance to Die*, 74.

<sup>52</sup> Houghton, *Amy Carmichael*, 84.

Bangalore, she began the study of the Tamil language, while Thomas Walker, a CMS missionary, helped her with language study and became a co-worker with her in mission. In 1898, she formed a Women's Band, called as the Starry Cluster, to do itinerant evangelisation around Tinnevely District.<sup>53</sup>

In 1901, Carmichael began providing shelter for temple children at Dohnavur, receiving the first temple child, Preena, on 6 March.<sup>54</sup> The work was started without any formal constitution or written rules. This is evidence of the practical holiness strand in Keswick teaching. When rules were written down, there was only passing reference to key doctrines, like the plenary inspiration of Scripture. Daily work was sacred, and the Lord's business.<sup>55</sup>

Apart from the temple children, the Christian residential home and school based in Dohnavur was intended to shelter other girls who converted to Christianity; later, beginning 1918, the home also included boys. The choice of this remote location, surrounded by mountains, and 30 miles from the population centre of Tinnevely allowed protection for the children, and it may also reflect a holiness-style retreat from the 'world.' Thomas Walker and his wife joined them there. The community grew steadily larger, and Carmichael built schools, nurseries, a hospital, and a house of prayer. In 1925, she ended her connection with the C.E.Z.M.S., and in 1927, she established the Dohnavur Fellowship as an independent organisation. The connection between Keswick holiness and revival is seen in the experience of revival reported at Dohnavur in 1905. However, she was disappointed that the revival did not also spread outside to the Hindu and Muslim people, and regretted there had not been enough commitment to prayer for it to continue.<sup>56</sup> In 1919, she was awarded the *Kaisar-i-Hind* medal for her service to the people of India. In 1947, the Madras government passed an act making dedication of young

---

<sup>53</sup> Ibid., 98.

<sup>54</sup> For analysis of Preena's life, see Annie McCarthy, "Agency and Salvation in Christian Child Rescue in Colonial India: Preena and Amy Carmichael," in *Divine Domesticities: Christian Paradoxes in Asia and the Pacific*, eds. Hyaeweol Choi and Margaret Jolly (Canberra: ANU Press, 2014).

<sup>55</sup> Arles, "Ramabai and Carmichael," 168-9.

<sup>56</sup> Ibid., 144-5.

girls to temple gods illegal. According to Myrtle Hill, Carmichael's books, such as *Things as They Are* (1903) and *Lotus Buds* (1909), played a significant role in the passage of the 1947 act.<sup>57</sup>

#### 2.2.1.2 Alice Eveline Luce

Alice E. Luce was the daughter of John James Luce (1847-1923) – a vicar of St. Nicholas Church, Gloucester, and a frequent speaker at the Keswick Conventions – and Alice Charles Stubbs (1848-1925).<sup>58</sup> In 1896, Luce received financial support as one of Keswick missionaries; she then joined the Church Missionary Society and departed for India. In 1898, she was stationed in Azamgarh and, together with Anna Totenham, undertook work in the zenanas, especially educational work, with significant success. Luce served until 1912, when she contracted jungle fever, and poor health forced her to resign from mission service in India. On 7 August 1914, she stated that, "medical opinion gives no hope of my ever being able to return to India."<sup>59</sup>

#### 2.2.1.3 Thomas Walker

Thomas Walker joined the CMS and arrived in Tinnevely, South India, on 1 December 1885. Five years later Walker was appointed to the Chair of a new District Council in Tinnevely, overseeing fifty-five thousand Christians. In 1897, however, he resigned the position due to disagreement with the CMS Home Committee over "matters of ecclesiastical policy."<sup>60</sup> In 1901, Walker and his wife were listed as Keswick missionaries and supported in prayer and finance.<sup>61</sup> Aside from his evangelistic work, Walker was involved in training ordinands and was sought after as a preacher at special meetings and conventions all over India. In

---

<sup>57</sup> Myrtle Hill, "Carmichael, Amy Beatrice (1867–1951)", in *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, accessed September 1, 2016, <http://www.oxforddnb.com.ezproxy.is.ed.ac.uk/view/10.1093/ref:odnb/9780198614128.001.0001/odnb-9780198614128-e-59081?rskey=VXeh8Q&result=1>.

<sup>58</sup> Peterson, "'Led by the Holy Spirit,'" 8. See also *Biographical Dictionary of Christian Mission*, s.v. "Luce, Alice Eveline."

<sup>59</sup> Peterson, "'Led by the Holy Spirit,'" 91.

<sup>60</sup> Gibbs, *The Anglican Church in India*, 336.

<sup>61</sup> "The Life of Faith, 1901," 529.

1900 he was invited by the Metran, Titus 1 Mar Thoma, to undertake a speaking tour among Mar Thoma churches, preaching to crowds of between fifteen and twenty thousand people.<sup>62</sup> Walker undertook twelve annual tours to the Mar Thoma Syrian churches until the time of his death, including speaking at the great annual Maramon (Maramannu) convention, which he co-founded in 1896.<sup>63</sup> One of his legacies was “the self-sufficiency of the Church of South India diocese of Tirunelveli.”<sup>64</sup> In part through his influence, the Reformed Syrian church became increasingly active in mission.<sup>65</sup> Moreover, the preaching tours, according to Gibbs, “must have done much” in shaping “the ethos of the Mar Thoma Church,” which was “strongly Evangelical.”<sup>66</sup> In 1908, Walker published his Tamil Commentary on the Epistle to the Philippians.

#### 2.2.1.4 Gershom Whitfield Guinness

G. W. Guinness was a son of Henry Grattan Guinness (1835-1910), the celebrated evangelist, and Fanny Emma Guinness (1831-1898), who together founded the East London Institute for Home and Foreign Missions. He was accepted by the Missionary Council of the Keswick Convention to be one of the Keswick missionaries after he completed his medical studies. On 11 February 1897, he left for China to do mission work in the Province of Honan, one of most densely populated provinces in China with thirty-five million inhabitants.<sup>67</sup> In 1900, he claimed to have miraculously escaped the Boxer rebellion.

---

<sup>62</sup> Gibbs, *The Anglican Church in India*, 337.

<sup>63</sup> Moffett underlined the importance of the Convention: “the high point of the year for the Mar Thoma Church is still today the Maramon Convention of the Evangelistic Association. Attendance soars above forty thousand to as high as eighty thousand, making it the largest regular annual gathering of Christians anywhere in the world.” (Moffett, *A History of Christianity in Asia*, 2:418).

<sup>64</sup> *Biographical Dictionary of Christian Mission*, s.v. “Walker, Thomas.”

<sup>65</sup> Gibbs, *The Anglican Church in India*, 106.

<sup>66</sup> *Ibid.*, 337.

<sup>67</sup> Mrs. Taylor, *Guinness of Honan*, 99.

### 2.2.1.5 Alex K. Macpherson

After joining the China Inland Mission, A.K. Macpherson was sent to China in September 1904 and he was stationed in Chekiang Province. Although Macpherson attended the Keswick Convention in 1904, he was formally announced as one of the Keswick missionaries in 1906.<sup>68</sup> In his annual report to the Keswick Mission Council 1906-7, he discussed his activity of leading a Bible school, attended by 36 local workers from three vast districts, and teaching them the work of the Holy Spirit. During 1907, he conducted another Bible school, which led to the formation of a Women's Missionary Society.

Macpherson increasingly occupied important positions in his missionary career. Initially he was Assistant Superintendent of East Chekiang and then became Superintendent. In 1936, he was selected to assist the General Director in the Mission Administration at the Headquarters in Shanghai. In 1940, Macpherson was appointed the Regional Director of the Mission's work in the Eastern and Central Provinces. Later in his life, he suffered a two-and-a-half year internment by the Japanese and he died on 11 January 1948.<sup>69</sup>

### 2.2.1.6 Alice Mildred Cable

Mildred Cable departed for China, under the China Inland Mission, in September 1901. She was sent to Hwochow (Huozhou) in Shanshi (Shanxi) province, to join Evangeline (Eva) French (1869-1960). Mildred and Eva were later joined by Francesca Law French, Eva's younger sister, in 1909. Together they became the 'Trio,' a friendship that would last the rest of their lives. The work was primarily educational, involving elementary and secondary schools, a Teacher Training School, and a Bible School for women. Through their work a large church was also started, with a building capable of seating six hundred people. The mission also developed a dispensary and an opium refuge.<sup>70</sup>

---

<sup>68</sup> Hopkins, *The Keswick Week, 1906*, 223.

<sup>69</sup> "China's Millions," 1948, 23.

<sup>70</sup> Platt, *Three Women*, 47-8; see also *Biographical Dictionary of Christian Mission*, s.v. "Cable, (Alice) Mildred."

After twenty-one years of service in Hwochow, Cable and the Frenches claimed to sense God's call to take up a new missionary work in Central Asia among the Muslims. They passed the leadership of Hwochow's school to local Christians, left Shansi in June 1923, and arrived at Kanchow (Ganzhou) in Kansu (Gansu) province, in March 1924. They were met by Dr Kao, a former student of G. Whitfield Guinness in Honan hospital, who had begun mission work in the province.<sup>71</sup> The Trio set up a short-term Bible School and at the end of the term, fifty men and women had been baptised, which marked "a distinct increase for the church."<sup>72</sup> Afterwards they moved to Suchow (Jiuquan) and founded a mission station there in November 1924, with the help of Dr Kao and his band of thirty Christians. Suchow was the last city within the Great Wall of China, where every caravan travelling between Central Asia and China had to stop to gather supplies. It was thus a strategic base for missionary service. At Suchow, they could meet, besides Chinese residents, Mongols, Tibetans, Turkish and Russians, to whom they had a good opportunity to preach the gospel.<sup>73</sup>

Here their work changed from its previous strong educational emphasis to itinerant mission. From Suchow, the Trio visited many places as itinerant missionaries. In 1928, after returning from their furlough in England, they started a more-than-one-year journey to Sinkiang. While in Tunhwang, they were detained to tend the wounds of General Ma Zhongying, the warlord of Kansu Province. After his wounds were healed, the Trio were allowed to leave, and in their last meeting with the General, Cable courageously presented a copy of the New Testament to him.<sup>74</sup> In 1931, they reported that during their itinerating mission in Sinkiang and Kansu for sixteen months, they had visited 2,700 homes, organised 635 meetings in the Gobi oases, presented Christian literatures to as many temple priests as they met, and

---

<sup>71</sup> "China's Millions, 1927," 101.

<sup>72</sup> Jing Tian, "Evangelism and Feminism in China's Northwest: The Double Identities of Mildred Cable, Evangeline French and Francesca French" (Master's Thesis, University of Alberta, 2008), 74.

<sup>73</sup> Platt, *Three Women*, 131.

<sup>74</sup> *Ibid.*, 167.

sold around 40,000 portions of Scriptures.<sup>75</sup> By 1932, they had itinerated around Kansu Province six times, travelled to Urumchi (Wulumqi), the capital of Turkestan, four times, to the Siberian border twice, and spent eight months in Shachow.<sup>76</sup> On 25 August 1936, due to the upheavals in China, all foreigners were ordered to leave Suchow instantly, and so the Trio returned to England.

In 1943, Mildred Cable and Francesca French wrote *The Gobi Desert*, which went into many editions. This important work brought them to Buckingham Palace to meet the Queen, who bought copies as Christmas gifts, and they received the Lawrence of Arabia Medal of the Royal Central Asian Society.<sup>77</sup>

#### 2.2.1.7 Florence Marianne Fugill

As one of the early Keswick missionaries, Fugill sailed for Japan in October 1894 under the CMS and was stationed in Bethany, Hamada, Japan. Here she undertook largely educational work, including Sunday school classes and classes for adults. As her aged mother required care, Fugill felt she needed to return to England to assist her, and later on 15 December 1920, she resigned from the CMS.<sup>78</sup>

#### 2.2.2 The Keswick-inspired Missionaries and Missionary Calling

The impact of the Keswick holiness movement on taking up overseas mission service was evident in the lives of such missionaries as Amy Carmichael, A. Mildred Cable, G. W. Guinness, and Thomas Walker. Carmichael's first contact with the Keswick holiness movement was when she attended the Glasgow Convention in September 1886. She described the experience: "I had been longing for months, perhaps years, to know how one could live a holy life." To that spiritual thirst, one speaker's opening prayer "O Lord, we know Thou art able to keep us from falling" gave her the answer she needed.<sup>79</sup>

---

<sup>75</sup> "China's Millions," 1931, 20.

<sup>76</sup> "China's Millions," 1932, 230.

<sup>77</sup> Platt, *Three Women*, 195.

<sup>78</sup> "The Life of Faith," 1903, 946.

<sup>79</sup> Houghton, *Amy Carmichael*, 22.

In September 1887, Carmichael attended another Convention on Keswick lines at Belfast, where she heard Hudson Taylor speak and met Robert Wilson. She attended her first Keswick Convention in 1888, the year in which missionary meetings first became integral to the Convention programme, and was deeply impressed: "It was an unforgettable time; it meant a new committal of one's whole life."<sup>80</sup> In 1890, she moved to Broughton Grange after Wilson, who had lost his wife and daughter, asked Amy's mother to let her stay with him as daughter.

In early 1892 Carmichael claimed to receive God's call to mission, when the picture of "those dying in the dark – 50,000 of them every day" and the urge to tell the gospel to them were impressed upon her mind, followed by repeated imperative 'Go ye.'" An inner conflict arose as she felt she should stay at home both because of her weak health and because her mother and step-father needed her. The experience of what Keswick teaching called consecration was evident when she decided to obey the call, in spite of feeling that she was "stabbing" someone she loved dearly.<sup>81</sup>

The Keswick influence was also felt by Alice M. Cable and G. W. Guinness when they decided to become missionaries to China. In 1894, in response to the missionary appeal made at the Keswick Convention, Cable stood up and offered herself for the work.<sup>82</sup> Speaking at a CIM farewell meeting at Exeter Hall in early 1897, Guinness mentioned that his decision for missionary work was influenced by several factors: his parents' prayers, Handley Moule's life and sermons, Keswick's message on Jesus's indwelling presence and its missionary meeting, and the Student Volunteer Missionary Union.<sup>83</sup>

Although Thomas Walker had never attended Keswick Conventions, he came under Keswick influence through the Cambridge scholar, Handley Moule. After being ordained in 1882, Walker served as a curate in London. Then, on

---

<sup>80</sup> Ibid., 34.

<sup>81</sup> Ibid., 44-5.

<sup>82</sup> Mildred Cable and Francesca French, *Something Happened* (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1933), 67.

<sup>83</sup> "China's Millions," 1897, 36.

hearing Moule speak at a CMS meeting in 1885, Walker decided to take up mission work. Walker described the experience, “It was at a meeting at Exeter Hall. Moule was speaking; he asked us to put both our hands quite within the Master’s hands. And that meant doing anything, going anywhere; and so I am here.”<sup>84</sup>

### 2.2.3 The Keswick-inspired Missionaries and their Emphases on Holiness

#### 2.2.3.1 *Emphasis on Holy Living*

The holiness emphasis took different forms in Keswick-inspired missionaries. One of them was their insistence that local Christians should exhibit holy living. Several Keswick missionaries expressed frustration with the spiritual lives of many Christians in the mission fields. After she had lived in India for some time, Carmichael observed that, “The saddest thing one meets is the nominal Christian” and she described the Indian church as a “field full of wheat and tares.”<sup>85</sup> In describing the Shaoshingfu district, A. K. Macpherson regretted that there was not “more evidence of spiritual life among the Christians in our district, deeper conviction of sin, greater progress made in the study of the Scriptures, in keeping holy the Lord’s Day, and in giving of their substance for the spread of the gospel among the unreached multitudes.”<sup>86</sup>

The Keswick missionaries insisted that Christian workers must exemplify the highest standards of holy living. In China’s Kaifeng hospital, where Guinness served, it was required “that as far as possible only true Christian men and women be employed on hospital staffs, coolies and door-keepers included.”<sup>87</sup> Mildred Cable believed that leading a holy life was an important requirement for an effective evangelization, particularly among the Muslims. In her address at a

---

<sup>84</sup> Amy Carmichael, *This One Thing: Story of Walker of Tinnevely* (London, 1952), 15.

<sup>85</sup> Elliot, *A Chance to Die*, 117.

<sup>86</sup> Evan Henry Hopkins, ed., *The Keswick Week, 1912: Thirty-Eighth Convention* (London: Marshall Brothers, 1912), 228.

<sup>87</sup> Mrs. Taylor, *Guinness of Honan*, 244.

Queen's Hall Meeting in 1925, Cable spoke of the "God-inspired life which is one that the most illiterate can read and the most bigoted Moslem cannot disprove."<sup>88</sup>

The importance of Christian moral character was also evident when Carmichael was thinking of the criteria for the next leader of the Dohnavur Fellowship. In a letter to May Powell, an Irish doctor who would be one of the leaders of the Fellowship, Carmichael laid down the qualities to be found in future leaders: "She must be just, a woman of character, able to make decisions, possessing the kind of love that is never tired out of loving... and a deep conviction about DF principles."<sup>89</sup>

In *Converting Women*, Eliza F. Kent raised the issue of racism regarding the Dohnavur leadership succession. According to Kent, Carmichael distrusted "the leadership capacities of Indians" and tended to "favour Westerners over Indians as their successors."<sup>90</sup> As a ground of her criticism, Kent pointed out Stephen Neill's sharp criticism toward the Fellowship, in which he served for some time and saw that, during meal times, Europeans and Indians ate separately.<sup>91</sup> However, Elisabeth Elliot, the biographer of Carmichael reported that in the early days of the Fellowship all workers, Indian and European alike, ate together until the Dohnavur family grew and the dining room was not large enough to contain everybody. Moreover, there was a health issue, as explained by Carmichael, "Foreigners did not seem able (though most were certainly willing) to subsist on curry and rice. They needed their tea and bread and butter."<sup>92</sup>

Against Kent's opinion, Elliot maintained that Carmichael longed for an Indian to lead the Fellowship. In 1946 Carmichael once wrote, "Our place is always behind the scenes," which meant that she was "intending to emphasize the great importance of encouraging Indians for leadership."<sup>93</sup> Carmichael actually had seen

---

<sup>88</sup> "China's Millions, 1927," 182.

<sup>89</sup> Ibid., 306.

<sup>90</sup> Eliza F. Kent, *Converting Women: Gender and Protestant Christianity in Colonial South India* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004), 103.

<sup>91</sup> Ibid., 111.

<sup>92</sup> Elliot, *A Chance to Die*, 305.

<sup>93</sup> Ibid., 345.

leadership qualities in Ponnammal and Arulai, but both died before her. One year before Carmichael died, she entrusted the leadership of the Dohnavur Fellowship to four people: an English man and woman (John Risk and May Powell), and an Indian man and woman who had been raised at the community (Rajappan and Purripu, the daughter of Ponnammal). On the criteria for Dohnavur leadership, Carmichael thus put emphasis on the moral character of the candidates regardless of their race.

Walker showed his discontent with the spiritual character of many Christian workers – pastors, catechists, schoolteachers – when he asserted “You have often to pay unspiritual people to do spiritual work – would the apostles have done that?”<sup>94</sup> In a paper presented at the 1902 missionary conference, Walker maintained that one problem that hindered “the influx of God’s power into the church of India” was what he called “an unspiritual agency,” by which he meant Christian workers who had never experienced true conversion. For him, a basic principle of mission work was that “only spiritual men are able to do spiritual work.” The policy of choosing only converted workers was, Walker acknowledged, perhaps overly strict. “But,” he added, “our Master has raised a higher standard. He points to the great pre-requisite for fruitful service, over and beyond a true regeneration, the baptism of the Holy Ghost.”<sup>95</sup>

### *2.2.3.2 Emphasis on Holiness Themes*

The important themes of the Keswick holiness movement, such as the life of surrender, consecration, victorious life, and practical godliness were evident in the service and teaching of some missionaries. A life of consecration, when one surrenders one’s own will in order to do God’s will alone, became a commitment of “Sisters of the Common Life,” a group of native Christian girls formed by Amy Carmichael in 1916. The group began with seven girls, who sought “to live a life of unreserved devotion,” and grew to between twenty and thirty girls who together signed a “confession of love” on 18 March 1916: “My vow. Whatsoever

---

<sup>94</sup> Carmichael, *This One Thing*, 73.

<sup>95</sup> *Ibid.*, 135, 137–8.

Thou sayest unto me, by Thy grace I will do it... Teach us, good Lord, to serve Thee more faithfully; to give and not to count the cost; to fight and not to heed the wounds; to toil and not to seek for rest; to labour and not to ask for any reward, save that of knowing that we do Thy will, O Lord our God.”<sup>96</sup>

The importance of the filling of the Holy Spirit was highlighted in both Carmichael’s and Walker’s mission work. In her early mission work in Arima, Japan, Carmichael held several meetings for the Christians who were “earnestly seeking the filling of the Holy Spirit.” This resulted in what she claimed was an unforgettable experience, in which Christ “drew very near, and to some was given in a fresh, deep sense, the gift of Pentecost.”<sup>97</sup> Walker believed that his preaching success depended on the power of the Holy Spirit. In 1894, during a preaching tour at the invitation of the Anglican Bishop in Travancore, he prayed, “May the Spirit of God deepen the work and make it real...I long to see God at work in men’s hearts.”<sup>98</sup>

In 1902, at a missionary conference in India, Walker called attention to how among some Indian believers, faith in Christ was so emphasised that repentance and holy living were largely ignored. Walker maintained that three facts must be highlighted in order to invigorate a true spiritual church, “sin of every kind must be confessed and forsaken; salvation means deliverance from the power of sin; the true Christian must live a holy life (holy in every detail).” Without such “practical holiness,” he argued, the Christian witness would be ineffective.<sup>99</sup>

In their mission work in China, Cable and Guinness also followed Keswick holiness teachings, including emphasis on moral character. In an address at the London Annual Meeting of 1937, Cable discussed the theme of surrender. She testified that, “there is only one life which is life indeed, and that is the life which is given to the gift of the Son of God, and spent in His service.”<sup>100</sup> Guinness affirmed the teaching of victorious life in a letter to his son: “That confidence be yours, my

---

<sup>96</sup> Amy Carmichael, *Gold Cord: The Story of a Fellowship* (London: Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge, 1932), 158, 161-2.

<sup>97</sup> “The Life of Faith,” 1893, 615.

<sup>98</sup> Carmichael, *This One Thing*, 68.

<sup>99</sup> *Ibid.*, 139-40.

<sup>100</sup> “China’s Millions,” 1937, 124.

son – a life of deliverance and victory, through God’s keeping, and one that is guided step by step in the path of His choosing.”<sup>101</sup>

In Japan, Fugill’s mission also reflected the influence of holiness teaching. In 1913 Fugill reported that a weekly women’s meeting for unbelievers had led to the formation of a Christians’ meeting, as she desired “to lead these women on to know more of God’s keeping power, and to teach them about the Holy Spirit.”<sup>102</sup>

### 2.2.3.3 Simple Lifestyle

Sometimes holiness manifested itself in a life of simplicity, as was the case for Walker and Carmichael. Walker’s missionary life gave evidence of renouncing worldliness. In his private journal he described attending a dinner party as “pleasant, but nothing of profit to the soul,” and noted that he felt “distressed at the inclination of some of our mission party to gaiety and pleasure.”<sup>103</sup> In 1899 Walker declined the offer of a bishopric, because he believed that the position would entail making moral and religious compromises.<sup>104</sup>

The simple life, which also involved financial modesty, was, in Amy’s religious experience, closely connected with the notion of faith. The financing of Dohnavur’s work, she claimed, depended solely on God. Instead of requesting money from other people or institutions, she believed that expressing financial need through prayer was enough.

Although this method of relying on God alone for monetary support was similar to that of the China Inland Mission, Nalini Arles maintained that “one can not conclude that Amy’s principles were merely influenced by them. She was aware of CIM policy but thought for herself and only took from others what went along with her own thoughts.”<sup>105</sup> Arles argued that Carmichael had experienced the faith principle long before she founded the Dohnavur fellowship; when in Belfast she had seen money supplied for “Welcome Hall” without appeals. However, in the *Gold*

---

<sup>101</sup> Mrs. Taylor, *Guinness of Honan*, 273.

<sup>102</sup> Hopkins, *The Keswick Week, 1913*, 263.

<sup>103</sup> Carmichael, *This One Thing*, 126.

<sup>104</sup> *Ibid.*, 98.

<sup>105</sup> Arles, “Ramabai and Carmichael,” 155.

*Cord*, Carmichael confessed that she learned about the method from “the records of those who had proved them before,” and that “the brave books sent out by the China Inland Mission especially were meat and drink to us.”<sup>106</sup> She was also aware of Hudson Taylor’s saying, “Depend upon it, God’s work done in God’s way, will never lack God’s supplies.”<sup>107</sup> Hudson Taylor’s spiritual teaching and approach to mission appealed to Carmichael, and if it were not for health reasons, she would have joined the CIM as a missionary in China.<sup>108</sup> It should be noted that Carmichael’s prolific writings of books and missionary reports in *The Keswick Week* or *The Life of Faith* served as indirect advertising for the needs of the Dohnavur fellowship, so the faith principle was combined with supplying a significant amount of material to which supporters could respond.

Carmichael’s Keswick-influenced thinking led her to reject sales of work, which like Hudson Taylor, she considered “anathema.”<sup>109</sup> This contrasted to the CMS, which encouraged sales of work and raised considerable funds from them.<sup>110</sup> Carmichael also believed that funds raised by raffles, concerts and dramas were “unclean money,” which would rob missions of their power. The disposition of the giver was more important than the amount given.<sup>111</sup> Prayer was believed to be the best means to fund-raise, demonstrating absolute dependence on God.<sup>112</sup> In describing financial support for Dohnavur, she stated that

We do not tell when we are in need unless definitely asked, and even then not always; for often the leading seems to be silent, except towards God, and we fear lest our little children should seem to crowd in among the many claims to help which must press so heavily upon the hearts of givers at home, and intercept anything which would be sent elsewhere. We rely upon the verses

---

<sup>106</sup> Carmichael, *Gold Cord*, 124.

<sup>107</sup> *Ibid.*, 125–6.

<sup>108</sup> *Biographical Dictionary of Christian Mission*, “Carmichael, Amy.”

<sup>109</sup> McKay, “Faith and Facts,” 171.

<sup>110</sup> Stock, *History of the CMS*, III: 58.

<sup>111</sup> Arles, “Ramabai and Carmichael,” 153.

<sup>112</sup> As McKay had done, in discussing the degrees in which the ‘faith principle’ was employed, Arles classified Carmichael’s method as a ‘pure’ faith basis, in which there was no direct solicitation of funds, neither financial needs were made known to public (Arles, “Ramabai and Carmichael,” 213).

which assure us that our Father knows our needs, and we take it that with such a Father, to know is to supply.<sup>113</sup>

#### 2.2.3.4 Communion with God

Quiet time with God is another aspect of holiness teaching that can be seen in the lives and work of Keswick missionaries. This practice of quietness was essential to Cable's understanding of the Christian life. In her devotional work, *Towards Spiritual Maturity*, which she co-authored with Francesca French, quiet time was defined as, "that period of each day which is set apart for God, for the reception of His grace and the opening of the heart to the teaching, correction, and inspiration of the Holy Spirit; for committing the way of life unto the Lord and praying for others."<sup>114</sup> This spiritual exercise was "the first necessity" of a converted life, without which "the education of the soul remains elementary and incomplete."<sup>115</sup> When the Trio started the Women's Bible School, the morning schedule included time for "quiet reflection."<sup>116</sup>

For Guinness, daily communion with God was also vital. He would gather his students every morning, so that "each with his Bible sits alone in silence to have his Morning Watch."<sup>117</sup> To his daughter, Joy, he wrote in 1926 of how "in our endeavour to keep the Morning Watch we must be careful not to give to prayer and Bible reading a wrong emphasis. They are not an end in themselves, only means to an end. The aim should be *to meet God*, to receive afresh His love and give Him our love, to renew our reception of His Spirit and ensure the presence of Christ in our hearts all day."<sup>118</sup>

For Carmichael, quiet time with God was essential in a believer's spiritual life. In her work entitled *Edges of His Ways*, she portrayed quietness as a source of spiritual strength since "it is in quietness that we are fed." This quietness must be

---

<sup>113</sup> Elliot, *A Chance to Die*, 189.

<sup>114</sup> Mildred Cable and Francesca French, *Towards Spiritual Maturity: A Book for Those Who Seek It* (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1939), 23.

<sup>115</sup> *Ibid.*, 19.

<sup>116</sup> Platt, *Three Women*, 45.

<sup>117</sup> Hopkins, *The Keswick Week, 1912*, 238–9.

<sup>118</sup> Mrs. Taylor, *Guinness of Honan*, 305.

prioritised for it was “the central service asked by God of human souls,” and its neglect was the cause of “much lack of spiritual depth and power.”<sup>119</sup>

Thomas Walker shared the holiness commitment to quietness. In an article entitled “The Awakening of India,” published in *China’s Millions 1898*, Walker portrayed India as “a sleeping giant” and maintained that because Christians lacked “the true fire of God,” they were unable to awake the giant.<sup>120</sup> He believed that the source of the problem was self-reliance and lack of prayer, and in response, he stressed the need for quietness with God:

How is it that so much of our busy energy appears to be expended all in vain?... – we have neglected largely the means which God Himself has ordained for true anointing from on high. We have not given prayer its proper place in the plan of our campaign. Much time has been spent in the school, the office, the village, or the Zenana – and little, very little, in the secret chamber. Fellow missionaries! We have toiled much, but we have prayed little.<sup>121</sup>

Their emphasis on the importance of being alone with God, however, could mean that some Keswick missionaries were insensitive to other cultural norms. This was particularly the case in India, which had a strong communal culture. Amy Carmichael and Thomas Walker urged Indian Christians to distance themselves from their family to spend some time with God daily. Once Carmichael taught this practice to a group of Indian boys in a mission school in Pannaivilai. When one of them said that it was impossible to have this quiet time at home, she responded as follows: “So I told them they could in the jungle. They could easily go away there and be quite alone with God.”<sup>122</sup> The jungle, of course, would hardly be a safe place for children to be alone. In the similar manner, Walker pointed to a “lack of personal fellowship with God” as a serious hindrance to the spiritual growth of the Indian church. Aware that Indian home culture made it impossible for native Christians to have a private room for personal prayer and Bible reading, he urged his fellow workers to encourage Indian believers to have quiet time alone with God,

---

<sup>119</sup> Amy Carmichael, *Edges of His Ways: Selections for Daily Reading*, Dohnavur book (London: SPCK, 1957), 34, 55-6.

<sup>120</sup> “China’s Millions,” 1898, 1.

<sup>121</sup> Ibid.

<sup>122</sup> Elliot, *A Chance to Die*, 136.

if necessary, outside their houses, “in the rice-fields or under the tamarind or margosa tree.”<sup>123</sup>

As we have seen, their attendance at Keswick Conventions, for some missionaries, had made no small impact on their decisions to participate in overseas mission. There was also an indirect influence of the Keswick movement to taking up the mission call, as in the case of Thomas Walker, who had been inspired by the preaching of Handley Moule, a prominent Keswick supporter. In Guinness's case, there was a strong interconnection between the Keswick holiness movement and the Cambridge spiritual atmosphere. During his time in Cambridge, his religious experience was deepened and his missionary enthusiasm was kindled. Handley Moule's book, *Thoughts on Christian Sanctity*, “meant much to Whitfield [Guinness],” while the Student Volunteer Missionary Union with its motto, “The Evangelisation of the World in this Generation,” found in him one of its volunteers.<sup>124</sup>

The labours of Keswick missionaries in Asia were shaped by the Keswick holiness teaching. There is evidence in their correspondence that they taught holiness themes to Asians. Thomas Walker travelled widely in India and became an important speaker at many conferences, propagating the message of practical godliness. However, as will be seen later in this chapter, the holiness approach could lead some missionaries to show an intolerance to some Asian cultural practices, and to be highly critical towards Asian Christian converts who did not meet the exacting standards demanded by Keswick missionaries influenced by the holiness movement.

#### 2.2.4 The Theology of the Keswick-inspired Missionaries

The authority of Scripture was vital for the Keswick-inspired missionaries. In the face of the higher criticism, Thomas Walker affirmed the divine authority of the Bible. Although he had studied critical biblical scholarship, he none the less insisted

---

<sup>123</sup> Carmichael, *This One Thing*, 140, 145.

<sup>124</sup> Mrs. Taylor, *Guinness of Honan*, 85.

to his fellow missionaries that, with reference to the Bible, they should not “be afraid of being called old-fashioned and narrow-minded.”<sup>125</sup> Carmichael upheld the authority of the Scripture as well, insisting that the Dohnavur Fellowship was to be based on “the verbal inspiration of the Scripture.”<sup>126</sup>

The CIM missionaries, Guinness and Cable, also adhered to the doctrine of the Bible’s supremacy. Guinness insisted on the authority of Scripture, both the Old and New Testaments: “The Old Testament is not inferior to the New...This should prove its authority and cut the ground from under the feet of destructive critics.”<sup>127</sup> At the annual meeting in 1920 Cable emphasised the importance of the Bible’s authority in recruiting Christian workers in China, “We want men and women who believe that the Bible is the inspired Word of God.”<sup>128</sup>

Their understanding of the second coming of Christ shaped the Keswick missionaries’ ministry. The prospect of Christ’s return, Carmichael wrote, should bring missionary zeal to believers, “Friends, are we hastening the coming? Oh! We have something worth passing on, are we keeping it back?”<sup>129</sup> For Macpherson, the belief of Christ’s second coming should be a strong motivation for believers to manifest “a spirit of true charity.” Writing on his involvement in famine relief in Chekiang, he asserted that, “those who truly are watching for the return of their Lord will be most unceasing in their work of loving sympathy and relief.”<sup>130</sup> Similarly, this belief, for Guinness, should be “a means of awakening many hearts” as well as “the light and strength of our lives,” enabling believers to endure all hardships.<sup>131</sup>

---

<sup>125</sup> Iain Murray, *Amy Carmichael*, 163.

<sup>126</sup> Elliot, *A Chance to Die*, 272.

<sup>127</sup> Mrs. Taylor, *Guinness of Honan*, 304–5.

<sup>128</sup> “China’s Millions,” 1920, 78.

<sup>129</sup> “The Life of Faith, 1896,” 90.

<sup>130</sup> “China’s Millions, 1923,” 57.

<sup>131</sup> Mrs. Taylor, *Guinness of Honan*, 303.

### 2.2.5 Keswick Missionaries and Pentecostalism

There was a theological dispute over the speaking in tongues, particularly in the case of A. Eveline Luce. Luce's sympathy to speaking in tongues became controversial in 1910 when she was caught up in a revival at the orphanage managed by Shorat Chuckerbutty, which had a link with the work of Pandita Ramabai. Although obviously not a foreign missionary, she was a significant figure in India whose Mukti mission in western India had experienced a great revival in 1905.

Sarasvati Mary (Pandita) Ramabai (1858-1922) was an Indian speaker at missionary meetings at Keswick who moved in an increasingly Pentecostal direction. Ramabai was categorised as one of the "trophies of grace," as she was a world-famous Christian who was born of a high caste.<sup>132</sup> She first came into contact with Christianity in Calcutta. In 1882, after being married for almost three years, she was left widowed with a daughter, Manorama. In 1883, she and her daughter moved to England to begin her medical studies. In September 1883, they were baptised and confirmed in the Church of England. She went on to study at the Women's Medical College in Philadelphia, United States, and during her stay there, she took a teaching course, studied the school systems of America, and formed a Ramabai Association, which would support her mission in India.<sup>133</sup> After returning to India in 1889, Ramabai founded an institution called the Sharada Sadan (Home of Learning), with an aim of sheltering and educating high-caste Hindu widows and orphans, in Bombay; the home later moved to Poona in western India. She was soon admitting to her school dispossessed Indian girls and women from all types of caste. In 1898, Ramabai founded Mukti Sadan (House of Salvation), a vast settlement for poor widows and orphans at Kedgaon, near Poona. Later she also built girls' and boys' orphanages in a number of villages, homes for the elderly and infirm women, for the blind, and a rescue home for prostitutes.<sup>134</sup>

---

<sup>132</sup> Frykenberg, *Christianity in India*, 410.

<sup>133</sup> Ramabai Sarasvati and Shamsundar Manohar Adhav, *Pandita Ramabai, Confessing the Faith in India Series*; no. 13 (Madras: Christian Literature Society for the Christian Institute for the Study of Religion and Society, 1979), 49.

<sup>134</sup> Frykenberg, *Christianity in India*, 402.

Ramabai spoke at the Keswick Convention's missionary meeting in 1898, and promoted its teachings. The "great prayer assembly" at Keswick encouraged her to promote efforts for prayer for India. In India, Ramabai also encouraged traditional missionary efforts, including itinerant preaching evangelism, and by June 1905, 30 young women provided itinerating preaching to the villages.<sup>135</sup> In 1919, Ramabai was awarded the *Kaiser-i-Hind* medal for her contributions to Indian society.

On 29 June 1905, the Mukti mission claimed that as a result of the outpouring of the Holy Spirit, several were "slain in the Spirit."<sup>136</sup> In 1906, participants reportedly experienced speaking in tongues. Ramabai stated that the Mukti girls prayed for more than 29,000 individuals by name daily. In 1907, Ramabai described the revival at Mukti as follows:

I have seen not only the most ignorant of our people coming under the power of the revival, but the most refined and very highly educated English men and women, who have given their lives for God's service in this country, coming under the power of God, so that they lose all control over their bodies, and are shaken like reeds, stammering words in various unknown tongues as the Spirit teaches them to speak, and gradually get to a place, where they are in unbroken communion with God.<sup>137</sup>

From Mukti, the revival soon spread across cities and towns in India, including Poona, Bombay, Yeotmal, Manmad, Hoshangabad, Ratnagiri, Dhond, Aurangabad, Gujarat, and Allahabad, where Miss Shorat Chuckerbutty's famine orphanage had a connection with Ramabai's work.

As shall be seen in later chapters, the Keswick emphasis on a second blessing experience, often referred to as Baptism in the Spirit, and the spiritual experiences on the field of mission, meant that some missionaries became open to Pentecostal teachings, although the Keswick Council was not in favour of Pentecostalism. Alice Luce claimed to have received the Holy Spirit's baptism while "two Indian sisters who had received the baptism, were praying for her." She also "spoke in tongues as the Spirit gave utterance."<sup>138</sup> This practice was not in line with Keswick theology and

---

<sup>135</sup> Sarasvati and Adhav, *Pandita Ramabai*, 19.

<sup>136</sup> *The New International Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements*, "Ramabai, Sarasvati Mary (Pandita)."

<sup>137</sup> Sarasvati and Adhav, *Pandita Ramabai*, 224–5.

<sup>138</sup> Peterson, "Led by the Holy Spirit," 83-4.

concerns were raised about Luce. In 1913, Luce told the Keswick Committee that although she believed that she received this spiritual gift occasionally, she did not deem tongues an “essential gift” and hence would not promote the practice.<sup>139</sup>

Reports of the revival movement in Wales and India no doubt influenced Luce’s openness toward what were regarded as the manifestations of the Spirit. *The Life of Faith* contained many articles about the Welsh revival of 1904-5, written by Jesse Penn-Lewis, and the periodical was circulated by the Literature Committee to more than 300 missionaries. It is very likely that the periodical reached Luce, who was a Keswick missionary at the time.<sup>140</sup> The periodical recorded how at one Ladies’ meeting Sister Eva of Friedenshort testified to having received a vision from heaven which had communicated to her valuable insights about mission work. Luce was also probably aware of the revival movement in India that swept across the Khasi Hills, Calcutta, and the Mukti Mission.<sup>141</sup>

Luce’s belief in speaking in tongues soon became increasingly important to her. After she was no longer supported by the Keswick fund as a CMS missionary due to her poor health, Luce claimed that she received divine healing through prayer. She then joined the Assemblies of God, becoming a missionary among the Hispanics in the United States for the next four decades. Luce became influential in formulating the indigenous church principles that, in 1921, were adopted by the General Council of her denomination. These principles included the importance of establishing self-supporting, self-governing and self-propagating local churches, with an emphasis on absolute dependence on the leadership of the Holy Spirit. Luce also highlighted the importance of the Spirit’s manifestations for effective evangelism, such as prophecy, tongues, and healing. Among her important contributions to the Hispanic Christian community was her teaching of the baptism of the Holy Spirit with the initial evidence of speaking in tongues.<sup>142</sup>

---

<sup>139</sup> Price and Randall, *Transforming Keswick*, 158.

<sup>140</sup> Hopkins, *The Keswick Week, 1905*, 215.

<sup>141</sup> Peterson, “Led by the Holy Spirit,” 84.

<sup>142</sup> *Ibid.*, 154, 262, 267.

Thomas Walker viewed the gift of tongues as a sign “given for a special purpose in the early dawn of the Pentecostal day in which we are still living,” but not as “something intended to continue till the end of the day.”<sup>143</sup> Eveline Luce, later in her missionary work in the United States, would portray the gift of tongues as necessary evidence of the Spirit’s baptism. This theological position differed from that of Pandita Ramabai, who witnessed the revival at Mukti mission.<sup>144</sup>

### 2.3. Keswick Influenced Missionaries Encountering the Asian Context

The final section of this chapter will consider the interaction between Keswick missionaries and their holiness teaching within the Asian context. A series of important issues in Asia will be considered, together with an assessment of how holiness thinking and practice responded to them, and an assessment of how typical Keswick missionary responses were compared to those of other evangelical missions. The practice of Keswick missionaries could sometimes offend local cultural practices. One small example was recorded in *China’s Millions* in 1910, when Mary Hodgson reported how she dealt with a Mrs. Chu.<sup>145</sup> On one occasion, when Mrs. Chu had wronged her son, Hodgson “told her she must apologize to her son,” even though in Chinese culture parents never apologized to their children and this would have been regarded as offensive to both parties.<sup>146</sup>

#### 2.3.1. Hinduism

In India, Keswick missionaries encountered a predominantly Hindu culture. In Tinnevely, Walker became concerned he was only reaching Christians or nominal

---

<sup>143</sup> Carmichael, *This One Thing*, 198.

<sup>144</sup> Ramabai wrote that, “I have been asked if I thought that the gift of tongues was the only and necessary sign of the baptism of the Holy Spirit ... there is no Scripture warrant to think that the speaking in tongues is the only and necessary sign of baptism of the Holy Spirit” (Sarasvati and Adhav, *Pandita Ramabai*, 223).

<sup>145</sup> Mary Hodgson was one of the early Keswick missionaries. She joined China Inland Mission and went to China in autumn 1893. She was stationed in Taikang, Honan, and in 1898 married a fellow-missionary, Henry T. Ford, which meant she was no longer supported financially by Keswick Fund.

<sup>146</sup> “China’s Millions, 1910,” 187.

Christians, rather than the Hindu masses, and he was also concerned at the lack of converts from the elite Brahmin community. In 1897 he chose to direct his evangelistic work to reach Hindus, and promote a deeper spirituality among Christians. Walker's holiness beliefs led him to use only converted Indians as translators and helpers, as he was convinced of the need for "spiritual men for spiritual work."<sup>147</sup> Most other missions did not share this restrictive policy regarding Indian mission helpers.

Amy Carmichael described her interactions with Hinduism in *Things as They Are*. She saw the great Hindu temple walls as "a type of the wall Satan has built" to imprison the souls of Indian people.<sup>148</sup> She sought to enter into debates with Brahmins and other groups about the Trinity and the uniqueness of Christ. Although she maintained at times that missionaries should learn Hindu logic and philosophy, and not take a pitying attitude to Hindus, she was not willing to use Indian philosophy in her own apologetic approach, and cautioned against adopting Indian vocabulary into Christian expression. Her approach stood in contrast to that of Sadhu Sundar Singh, who adopted the mantle of a sadhu, an ascetic person devoted to spiritual practice. Carmichael also condemned Brahmin oppression of converts, seeing it as a part of their attempt to control all aspects of Indian society.<sup>149</sup>

The issue of the temple children coloured the whole of Carmichael's view of Hinduism. She blamed the priests of the Hindu temples for debasing women, and turning children as young as five into a "devil's toy," and she condemned Hinduism as a "ghastly whitened sepulchre."<sup>150</sup> Although devadasis was more to do with local practice than with the teachings of Hinduism, she could not make that separation.

However, Keswick holiness teaching did not mean a rejection of all Indian culture and practice. Tamil was spoken by the 'family' at Dohnavur, and Carmichael studied its literature. She taught new recruits Tamil proverbs and local customs, and

---

<sup>147</sup> Arles, "Ramabai and Carmichael," 128, 130.

<sup>148</sup> Carmichael, *Things as they Are*, 107-8.

<sup>149</sup> Arles, "Ramabai and Carmichael," 132, 135.

<sup>150</sup> Carmichael, *Lotus Buds* (London, 1910), 265; Carmichael, *Things as They Are*, 221-22.

advised them “you must learn to think Tamil.”<sup>151</sup> She adapted to Indian culture, in becoming the ‘Amma’ of the family, the workers taking other Indian names, and the children took Carmichael’s Tamil name as their surname. But no Indian dance or folk history was allowed, and there does not appear to be evidence of her developing contextual methods of sharing the gospel.<sup>152</sup> Arles describes the holiness teaching at Dohnavur as a “deculturising process,”<sup>153</sup> but this was not a total rejection of all Indian culture, and there was a selective acceptance of certain aspects. For example, Carmichael happily adopted a simple lifestyle and the wearing of Indian clothes at Dohnavur. There were no servants, or missionary bungalows.<sup>154</sup>

Whilst Carmichael condemned most of the Hindu belief system, in contrast Ramabai sought to challenge Hinduism in a more scholarly way, showing how Vedic texts about women had been misinterpreted. Ramabai was prepared to see good in some aspects of Hinduism, especially its cultural dimensions, and to view Christianity as the ultimate fulfilment of the hopes of Hinduism.<sup>155</sup>

### 2.3.1.1 Caste

Keswick holiness missionaries took slightly varying approaches to caste. For Carmichael, the caste system was nothing less than a hindrance to reform, and the work of the devil. She perceived caste as “the strongest foe to the Gospel of Christ on the Hindu fields of South India.”<sup>156</sup> It was religious and social evil produced by heathenism. In 1899, two girls from the goldsmith caste came to Amy Carmichael, seeking to convert to Christianity through the “Starry Cluster’s” work. Their relatives were horrified at them breaking caste and threatened them with being beaten, or even murdered if they converted. The episode took place at a time of heightened tension over caste at Tinnevely linked to the rights to worship in different temples, and which led to riots, and the Christians were eventually drawn in. The school was

---

<sup>151</sup> Arles, “Ramabai and Carmichael,” 158

<sup>152</sup> Carmichael, *Things as They Are*, 83.

<sup>153</sup> Arles, “Ramabai and Carmichael,” 220.

<sup>154</sup> *Ibid.*, 218.

<sup>155</sup> *Ibid.*, 219-20.

<sup>156</sup> Carmichael, *Things as They Are*, 104.

burned, and the village closed, but the two girls persevered, were baptised and joined the Starry Cluster.<sup>157</sup>

Carmichael followed most missionaries in seeing conversion in India as something to be marked by open confession and a clear break from caste. She argued this was in conformity with the words of Jesus that he came “Not to offer peace but a sword,” and that confrontation was inevitable when someone converted.<sup>158</sup> When Carmichael met an old Indian lady who was a Siva worshipper and wanted to become a Christian, she insisted that the lady had to renounce the custom of smearing Siva’s sign on her forehead. The old woman argued that she would not serve Siva but that she did not want to break her caste. Furthermore, she believed “How can mere ashes affect the internal, the real essential, the soul?” However, for Carmichael, ashes were viewed by others as “sacred” to Siva, and so to retain the custom would “mock at the love of Christ and nullify His sacrifice.”<sup>159</sup>

There was evidence that Carmichael’s negative attitude toward caste was adopted by her followers. In 1905, a woman named Ponnammal, a committed worker in Dohnavur, was in charge of nursing babies in Neyoor. When some young nurses and older women who were new converts refused to do some “motherwork” which was below their caste, Ponnammal set the example by doing those works. In time, “her spirit created a new climate in the place, and the time came when there was not one nurse who would refuse to do whatever needed to be done.”<sup>160</sup> Ponnammal’s act followed Carmichael’s teaching that any kind of work, as long as it was an honest labour, was God’s work and so it was not to be scorned. Amy Carmichael was suspicious of those who claimed large numbers of conversions, observing that the high castes were extremely hard to convert, and success would only come slowly, one convert at a time.<sup>161</sup> Walker held similar views.<sup>162</sup>

---

<sup>157</sup> Arles, “Ramabai and Carmichael,” 130-1.

<sup>158</sup> Carmichael, *Things as they Are*, 41.

<sup>159</sup> *Ibid.*, 78-9.

<sup>160</sup> Elliot, *Chance to Die*, 188.

<sup>161</sup> Arles, “Ramabai and Carmichael,” 137.

<sup>162</sup> Amy Carmichael, *Walker of Tinnevely* (London: Morgan & Scott, 1916), 308-23.

Ramabai had been born a Brahmin, and had married a Sudra, and so took a different approach to the caste system. She believed, as had Alexander Duff, that educating the high castes would bring change that would flow down to the lower castes. However, over time, she saw that more than education was needed to overcome caste rules. Ramabai hoped for a casteless brotherhood, but it would take Christianity time to change the caste system.<sup>163</sup>

### *2.3.1.2 Jewellery*

Holiness of lifestyle was reflected in the “Starry Cluster” at Dohnavur. They were an itinerant evangelistic team, in a context where financial security was paramount, and they lived by faith principles. It became the principle amongst staff at the Dohnavur Fellowship to accept no salary.<sup>164</sup> Not long after the “Starry Cluster” was formed, they decided to cease wearing jewellery. Jewels, which in Indian custom were a symbol of women’s social status, were now considered worldly. Carmichael claimed that she did not impose this resolution as the community’s leader. Rather, she wrote, “Gradually as we sought to know more of our Lord and the power of His resurrection and the fellowship of His sufferings, the conviction grew upon us that these things (i.e. jewels) were out of place in His own chosen workers – His separated ones – and that this conforming to the law of the fashion of this world was of the flesh and not of the Spirit.”<sup>165</sup>

The renunciation of jewellery as a symbol of devotion to God, however, could become a form of cultural imposition since jewellery had a special significance for Indian people. Eliza Kent observes that while jewellery in Western culture was associated with “decadence, excess, and vanity,” in South Indian culture it was “a powerful indicator of the status of a woman and her community, signalling her auspicious married status and her family’s caste and level of material well-being.”<sup>166</sup> Only three kinds of women did not wear jewellery: widows, very low-caste women,

---

<sup>163</sup> Arles, “Ramabai and Carmichael,” 217-9.

<sup>164</sup> *Ibid.*, 129.

<sup>165</sup> Elliot, *A Chance to Die*, 152.

<sup>166</sup> Eliza Kent, *Converting Women*, 223.

and extremely poor women. Kent pointed out that in renouncing jewellery, on one level the members of the Starry Cluster valued God “above all things,” but on another level, “they were broadcasting their disapproval of the values of the newly configured Indian Christian patriarchal family in an idiom recognized clearly by their community.”<sup>167</sup> Richter observed that in the “family system” as it existed among “the middle and higher classes of society,” the individual “has no private property, but house and home, fields and coconut plantations, even the jewellery and ready money, belong to the family as a whole, and individuals only share these as members of the family.”<sup>168</sup> With that understanding, the jewels were not entirely the possession of the wearer, or theirs to give away. In renouncing jewellery, members of the Starry Cluster, prompted by Keswick-holiness type teaching, were placing themselves on a level with widows, the very poor and low caste women.

Jewellery was the married woman’s dowry, evidence of the status and wealth of their husbands. Wearing no jewels was a sign of disgrace and humiliation. Carmichael was aware of this, and was reluctant to interfere with local customs, but viewed through her Western-holiness tradition, jewellery remained worldly, a hindrance to spiritual life, and the wealth they represented could be better used for mission.<sup>169</sup> The approach was controversial locally, and attracted criticism for going against culture and custom, but Carmichael was supported by some Western missionaries. When F. B. Meyer visited Palamcottah in 1899 as a Keswick’s representative, he also preached against jewellery.<sup>170</sup> Rather than understanding it as a cultural practice with a social, rather than religious, basis, the Keswick holiness approach saw wearing jewellery as evidence of a lack of spiritual mindedness, and something to be totally rejected.<sup>171</sup>

---

<sup>167</sup> Ibid., 226.

<sup>168</sup> Richter, *A History of Missions in India*, 256.

<sup>169</sup> Arles, “Ramabai and Carmichael,” 129-30.

<sup>170</sup> Carmichael, *Gold Cord*, 15. Meyer’s holiness meetings in Palamcottah was believed to have left “a deep mark” upon some hearers and “raised the standard for the Church at large” (Carmichael, *Walker of Tinnevely*, 220).

<sup>171</sup> Arles, “Ramabai and Carmichael,” 129-30.

Such public displays of family wealth went against Keswick thinking about the simple life as an expression of holiness, and also the understanding of the way God would provide finance for missions. Carmichael urged all at Dohnavur to live a simple way of life, and even the children gave away toys to those in greater need. This commitment influenced Carmichael's choice of native Christians to be her co-workers in evangelisation. She insisted that their main motivation must be love for God and not for making money. Her emphasis was on spiritual qualities, which was again very similar to the practice of Hudson Taylor in the CIM. She only wanted dedicated workers who were willing to accept hardship and suffering.<sup>172</sup> On 29 November 1896, she wrote to her friends and asked them to pray that God would send earnest workers who were willing to join her out of pure love. She expressed her desire that God

May fit and choose out some Indian Sisters to work with us...only those who know something or are willing to learn something of definite trust in God for daily needs. Here it is most sorrowfully true that "What pay shall I get?" is almost always asked when Mission work is mentioned. Many say it will be impossible to get any on any other than the old lines. But it would roll away a great stone of stumbling if we could answer...the invariable question, "How much do you get for coming to talk to us?" by saying, "We don't get pay. God supplies our needs through His servants...but we come for love of God and you." So do pray. Pray for the burning love.<sup>173</sup>

Ramabai took a less strenuous view of the matter. She considered jewellery superfluous, but did not condemn it from an explicitly Christian perspective.<sup>174</sup>

### 2.3.1.3 Devadasis

The role of temple women in India had developed from the late sixteenth-century.<sup>175</sup> Over time it degenerated in some temples from singing and dancing, and cleaning work in the temples, into prostitution. The temple children, or devadasis, were young girls who were dedicated to serve temple gods. According to Harshananda, the chosen girls would be "married to the deity in the temple in a

---

<sup>172</sup> Ibid., 157-8.

<sup>173</sup> Houghton, *Amy Carmichael*, 91.

<sup>174</sup> Arles, "Ramabai and Carmichael," 219-20.

<sup>175</sup> Soneji, *Unfinished Gestures*, 3.

ceremonial way.”<sup>176</sup> In some contexts, they were viewed as concubines, or mistresses, of South Indian elite men. Attempts to reform the temple practices were started in the mid-nineteenth century, but it was 1947 before the Madras government made these practices illegal.<sup>177</sup>

This issue largely defined the missionary activity of Amy Carmichael. She was not the first to rescue such children, and her ministry was not unique – similar work was already being conducted 400 miles away, and the SPG and the American Madura Mission had also undertaken rescue work.<sup>178</sup> However, few missionaries were prepared to do much to help the temple girls. Some missionaries denied the existence of the practice; others argued that only evangelism was needed, and then as a consequence of changed lives the practice would end.<sup>179</sup> Most of the population were indifferent to the practice. Carmichael became notable for highlighting and opposing the temple practices. Her motivation came from her compassion for the children as victims of abuse, but also from her Keswick holiness beliefs that portrayed the matter as a struggle against the forces of darkness.

In her investigative work into the reasons why girls were given up to be devadasis, Carmichael found that sometimes the parents gave them as an offering to help the parents recover from illness, or viewed the girls as belonging to the god. In some cases, a husband abandoned his wife and gave his girl to the god, or widows might sell their daughters as they needed money to carry out their husbands’ death ceremonies. Sometimes baby girls were deserted by their parents and subsequently adopted by temple women.<sup>180</sup>

From 1901, Carmichael decided that the rescue of temple children was a cause to which “every missionary call had to be subordinated.”<sup>181</sup> This meant she refused invitations to preach. She defended herself against the criticisms that caring for the children was secular work, claiming all work was sacred, and modelled after

---

<sup>176</sup> Harshananda, *All about Hindu Temples*, 36.

<sup>177</sup> Saneji, *Unfinished Gestures*, 3.

<sup>178</sup> Arles, “Ramabai and Carmichael,” 139.

<sup>179</sup> Carmichael, *Lotus Buds*, 333-39.

<sup>180</sup> Houghton, *Amy Carmichael*, 116; Elliot, *A Chance to Die*, 179.

<sup>181</sup> Arles, “Ramabai and Carmichael,” 139.

the servanthood of Christ. In her case, social concern was put before the immediate claims of evangelism, but it provided many evangelistic opportunities with the children.<sup>182</sup> It also involved some deliberate subterfuge as she, and other members of the “Starry Cluster” would visit the Hindu temples in disguise.

Carmichael also worked to bring social and legal changes to help end the practice of devadasis. Rather than it being an isolated holiness-inspired crusade tackled in isolation from its wider social and cultural context, which has been a criticism of some evangelical social concern, her approach was more holistic. As she maintained, Christians should “pray not less for the Reform movement, and the Education movement, and the Civilising movement in India, but far more for the Movement of the breath of God.”<sup>183</sup> She sent a copy of her book, *Things as They Are*, with evidence about the temple practices, to the governor of Madras. At the invitation of the Bishop of Madras, she addressed an educated group of Indians on how the temple girls suffered for “the evils” of the larger society.<sup>184</sup> She urged that Christians in India unite their voices for the legal prohibition of the practice.

Carmichael criticised the indifference of British officials, who feared Hindu protests if action was taken, but she also recognised the difficulty of enforcing British law in close-knit Indian communities. She encouraged missionaries teaching in Indian schools to alert their pupils to the practice so they might also fight the system. She especially supported the work of Indian reformers striving for legal changes to accompany the rescue work she was doing.<sup>185</sup> She was even prepared to break the law, as when some parents, who had given their daughters to the temples, demanded their children back from Dohnavur, believing she followed a higher law in God’s law. She also sought to expose the bribery, corruption and brutality of the police. The policy of accepting any child into the community was retained after her death.<sup>186</sup>

---

<sup>182</sup> Carmichael, *Gold Cord*, 39-41.

<sup>183</sup> Carmichael, *Things as they Are*, 70.

<sup>184</sup> Arles, “Ramabai and Carmichael,” 142.

<sup>185</sup> *Ibid.*, 142, 144.

<sup>186</sup> *Ibid.*, 159.

Although she worked to raise awareness of the issue, to encourage other reformers, and to call on politicians to act, Carmichael avoided direct political action. She feared this would take time away from rescue work. Raising concerns and demanding action was acceptable, but she did not see direct political engagement as part of her gospel work.<sup>187</sup>

#### 2.3.1.4 *The Zenana*

The zenana mission, as we have seen, received much attention at Keswick. Zenana missionaries continued to be well-presented at the Keswick missionary meetings. In 1904, Miss Harding from the Church of England Zenana Missionary Society (CEZMS) pointed to the wide opening of India for evangelisation. She encouraged her listeners to say to themselves, "'The Master calleth for thee.' ... 'Does that mean me?'"<sup>188</sup> The zenana mission involved work that only women could do, and it appealed to the increasing number of women who felt called to mission through Keswick. In 1903 Miss Davis, of the Zenana Bible and Medical Mission, who worked among the women in India, remarked at Keswick: "I see so many girls here in this tent. What are you going to do with your lives?... Will you not put your hands in the hand of Jesus and say: 'Yes, Lord, let us pass over unto the other side?'"<sup>189</sup> At the Keswick convention of 1906, M. H. Mudie, who worked among the Parsees in India, claimed that Bombay, although it had millions of inhabitants, had fewer than 2,000 Christians. Mudie then addressed the women in the audience, "'If some of you dear sisters...could join our devoted Zenana workers, what a blessing it would be to many among the 150 millions of women in India.'"<sup>190</sup>

As with devadasis, some zenana missionaries were willing to openly protest against the practice. Ramabai denounced such forced "seclusion, complete dependence, and absolute ignorance."<sup>191</sup> She considered it a poisonous practice condemning the "Hindu nation to die a miserable and prolonged death if a timely

---

<sup>187</sup> Ibid., 160.

<sup>188</sup> Hopkins, *The Keswick Week, 1904*, 201.

<sup>189</sup> Hopkins, *The Keswick Week, 1903*, 210.

<sup>190</sup> Hopkins, *The Keswick Week, 1906*, 218.

<sup>191</sup> Arles, "Ramabai and Carmichael," 214.

remedy” was not found. Amy Carmichael similarly argued that in Hindu society, with its zenana seclusion for many women, a wife “is never legally free.”<sup>192</sup>

Although women in the West had limited employment opportunities, did not have the vote, suffered from many legal disadvantages, and had limited roles in their own Christian churches, Keswick speakers could none the less be fierce in their denunciations of the zenana. Miss Grimwood from C.E.Z.M.S., who worked in Punjab, told her hearers how women in India had a degraded view of themselves to the point of believing that they were at the same level as an animal: “Dear friends, when the women have got down to be beasts there is not much chance for the nation, and so, young sisters, and old sisters too, who are approved in Christ, and have been winning souls, will you just listen to this call this morning to go out there?”<sup>193</sup> It reflected a highly negative attitude towards an Indian cultural practice on the part of Keswick holiness missionaries.

While Carmichael focussed on rescuing individuals, for Ramabai the solution was changing the whole of society, especially by means of education, which would liberate people through increased knowledge.<sup>194</sup> Carmichael, however, placed less emphasis on education, believing that the only true freedom was salvation. Arles argues that in Carmichael’s response to the zenana question and to women’s education, she was more dualistic than holistic in her approach, seeing a strict separation of social reform and gospel work, although when it came to rescuing children, she was holistic, insisting that social reform needed to be combined with evangelisation.<sup>195</sup>

### 2.3.2 Keswick-Influenced Missionaries and Mission Practice

The final section of this chapter considers the approach of Keswick missionaries to some regular aspects of mission practice, to assess whether their theology brought a particular focus or differences.

---

<sup>192</sup> Ibid.

<sup>193</sup> Hopkins, *The Story of Keswick*, 1892, 23.

<sup>194</sup> Arles, “Ramabai and Carmichael,” 214.

<sup>195</sup> Ibid., 215.

### 2.3.2.1 Preaching and Itinerancy

The main focus of holiness-inspired mission was the urgent task of evangelism. As Hudson Taylor declared: "A million a month in China are dying without God."<sup>196</sup> This evangelistic urgency led many Keswick missionaries to focus on gospel preaching, including itinerant preaching and tract distribution. This was seen in the work of Macpherson with the CIM, which included itinerant evangelizing to a large number of towns and villages around Chekiang. During 1908, he reported to have visited 185 villages in Fenghwa district. He explained the work as follows:

By the sale of more than three thousand Scripture portions, by the pasting up of simple Christian tracts in rest houses and temple gateways, by compound-to-compound visitation, by street-preaching, and by lantern services held in temples and ancestral halls, we have been enabled, during the year 1908, to scatter the good seed in one hundred and eighty-five villages.<sup>197</sup>

A report in 1910 mentioned his five-week itinerating mission, which covered 200 miles and 114 places, where he managed to sell 1,000 Bibles or other Scripture portions.<sup>198</sup> He wrote in 1913 that, "Eleven months out of the twelve were spent among our country outstations."<sup>199</sup>

The importance of preaching was strongly emphasised at Keswick, and was included in stories of work in the mission fields. At the missionary meeting of 1902, the Rev. W. P. Buncombe claimed that a revival had occurred in Japan as the result of united prayer, plain gospel preaching, after-meetings to call for prompt decision, and open-air meetings. This revival, which he called the Twentieth Century Forward Movement, began on 12 May 1902 in Tokyo and led some thousands of people to embrace Christianity.<sup>200</sup>

---

<sup>196</sup> Austin, *China's Millions*, 80.

<sup>197</sup> "China's Millions," 1909, 54.

<sup>198</sup> "China's Millions," 1910, 60.

<sup>199</sup> Evan Henry Hopkins, ed., *The Keswick Week, 1913: Thirty-Ninth Convention* (London: Marshall Brothers, 1913), 260. Macpherson was continued to be registered in *The Keswick Week* as one of Keswick missionaries until 1913 and was excluded from the list afterwards. There is no explanation for the exclusion. Perhaps he got financial support from other source so that he ended the formal connection with Keswick.

<sup>200</sup> Hopkins, *The Keswick Week, 1902*, 208.

Such work was a main part of the task of Keswick missionaries, but, as we have seen above, Keswick missionaries like Carmichael were willing to set it to one side if there was another urgent need, such as that of the temple children. Two other common features of evangelical missionary activity were education and medical work.

### 2.3.2.2 Education

Educational work in the mission field was valued by Keswick missionaries, and it was a field considered especially suited to women missionaries. The appeal for missionary women at the Convention of 1902 was made by Miss Edge, from the Zenana Bible and Medical Mission, who was involved in starting a high school for non-Christian girls in Bombay.<sup>201</sup>

The Keswick-funded missionary Alice Luce, based in Azamgarh, worked in educational ministry connected with the zenanas from 1898 to 1912.<sup>202</sup> Together with Anna Totenham, she undertook work in around “60 zenanas, visiting each home weekly.” She also opened “two new Hindi schools for girls: one in their compound for the servants’ girls and one in Sidahri village, where children of higher castes attend(ed). Each school ha(d) an attendance of 15 to 20 girls.”<sup>203</sup> However, Luce reported that whenever the female students discussed baptism with their families, there was intense opposition “from Hindus, Aryas, and Mohammedans.”<sup>204</sup> As a result, one Hindi school had to be closed. In 1905, Luce served as a Principal at the CMS Girls’ High School at Agra, which was a “new and very difficult charge.”<sup>205</sup> This school opened a Normal Training Class for teachers as well. Luce’s service also included working in a dispensary, where there were as many as 1,000 patients.<sup>206</sup> In

---

<sup>201</sup> Ibid. 209.

<sup>202</sup> Peterson, “Led by the Holy Spirit,” 91.

<sup>203</sup> Ibid., 49.

<sup>204</sup> Evan Henry Hopkins, ed., *The Keswick Week, 1910: Thirty-Sixth Convention* (London: Marshall Brothers, 1910), 266.

<sup>205</sup> Hopkins, *The Keswick Week, 1905*, 214.

<sup>206</sup> Evan Henry Hopkins, ed., *The Keswick Week, 1911: Thirty-Seventh Convention* (London: Marshall Brothers, 1911), 249.

the Annual Report for 1912-13, Luce noted that around 170 pupils, most of them orphans, were under her care in the CMS Girls' Normal School, Benares.<sup>207</sup>

In 1902, Mildred Cable helped restart a girls's school at Hwochow (Huozhou) in Shanshi (Shanxi), as its Principal. Amongst the buildings constructed was a church with seating for six-hundred. The mission work at Hwochow station was steadily expanded to comprise the girls' school, Normal Training College, the Women's Bible School, the Compound Dispensary, and a women's opium refuge. The girls' school consisted of elementary and secondary schools, with the pupils' ages ranging from five to twenty years old. Following the practice of other Keswick missionaries, such as Carmichael and Walker, all of the dozen or more teachers were Christians. They taught students from various regions, some of whom were locals while others came from as far as the borders of Mongolia.<sup>208</sup>

The Normal Training College was founded to prepare young female teachers for mission schools. In summarising the result of the College in 1923, the Trio reported that there were "over sixty former students in mission employment scattered in five of the provinces of China" and "seventy former scholars ... employed as teachers in government schools."<sup>209</sup> Furthermore, it was estimated that almost 1,000 girls had been educated at Hwochow mission school and, at least, nearly 5,000 children were taught by its former students.

The Women's Bible School was instituted in 1912 for senior girls and married women. The purpose of this school was to train women, some of whom might become evangelists or leaders, "to carry with them Christian influence and to do personal work in what might become a self-propagating Christian church."<sup>210</sup> Of the impact of Hwochow's Bible School, the Trio reported in 1923, "We have records of between eight and nine hundred women who have been in residence here for Bible

---

<sup>207</sup> Hopkins, *The Keswick Week, 1913*, 260.

<sup>208</sup> Platt, *Three Women*, 47-8.

<sup>209</sup> "China's Millions, 1923," 137.

<sup>210</sup> Platt, *Three Women*, 45.

instruction for periods varying from a few weeks to the complete Bible Training Institute course of two years.”<sup>211</sup>

Florence Fugill’s work in Japan involved promoting Sunday School education, and associated adult classes. In 1903, in the face of considerable opposition, Fugill conducted a five-day mission, a Sunday school class attended by 100 children, a weekly class for army officers, a night school for men, and other meetings for various types of women such as officers’ wives, teachers’ wives, young ladies, school girls, and ordinary women.<sup>212</sup> Four years later, she reported that there was a high school with 400 girls. Moreover, her hospital work gave her an opportunity to evangelise among wounded Japanese soldiers from the war with Russia.<sup>213</sup> In 1914, Fugill was placed in Hoki, Japan, where she was in charge of 75 children in a CMS Kindergarten.<sup>214</sup>

Educational ministry was believed to be an effective means to reach high-caste Indians. For Thomas Walker, education was “a most *direct* means of evangelizing the higher castes.”<sup>215</sup> In his itinerating mission in North Tinnevely, he found that the former pupils of the mission schools formed “a link of contact for the missionary with the higher classes of Hindus, and a means of access for the evangelist to the society which ordinary street-preaching cannot reach.”<sup>216</sup>

The connection between education and evangelism was clear to Keswick missionaries. In 1891, Miss Davies, a missionary from the Indian Female Normal School and Instruction Society (IFNS), urged a Keswick audience to see the importance of educational work: “You cannot do anything better than lay it at the feet of Jesus, and ask Him to use it where He will.” However, alongside the plea for the gradual work of education, Davies also noted the urgency of mission:, which

---

<sup>211</sup> “China’s Millions, 1923,” 138.

<sup>212</sup> “The Life of Faith,” 1903, 946.

<sup>213</sup> Evan Henry Hopkins, ed., *The Keswick Week, 1907: Thirty-Third Convention* (London: Marshall Brothers, 1907), 248.

<sup>214</sup> Evan Henry Hopkins, ed., *The Keswick Week, 1914: Fortieth Convention* (London: Marshall Brothers, 1914), 261.

<sup>215</sup> *Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: Ninetieth Year, 1888-89* (London: Church Missionary House, 1889), 152.

<sup>216</sup> *Ibid.*, 152.

“requires haste, for many are dying and have never heard that ‘God so loved the world that He gave His only begotten Son, that whosoever believeth in Him should not perish, but have everlasting life’.” Christ’s return, according to Davies, should be another motivation for evangelisation: “He is coming, and then there will be an end of all opportunity for this kind of service.”<sup>217</sup> There was clearly a tension between views of the imminence of Christ’s return and a commitment to the graduate work of education.

Mildred Cable, after twenty years in educational service, insisted that evangelisation should be accompanied by education, which would include instruction on how best to live a holy life. According to Cable, education would help the convert to ensure that

Her mind is no longer controlled by passion, impure thought and selfish impulse, but is Christ-controlled in thought and inspiration, and is furnished on the spiritual side with the knowledge of the Scriptures, on the ethical with a desire to serve and a passion for usefulness in the world, and on the moral with a deliberated choice of purity and nobility of action.<sup>218</sup>

In short, education would enable discipleship to build on what evangelism has started.

The largest body of information about the attitudes of Keswick-trained missionaries to education relates to Amy Carmichael. Her ideas illustrate Keswick views, although they may not have been identical to those of all other Keswick missionaries. In a policy that set her apart from some other missions, she strongly resisted the government grants-in-aid system in India, which, along with providing state grants for schools, also led eventually to state control over many aspects of school life, including staff appointments and curricula, significantly limiting the freedom of missionary schools. To accept the grants would have required payment of fixed salaries against her faith principle, and possibly employing non-Christian teachers. As a result she withdrew plans she had submitted to the government to start a school, nor would she send her children to the local village mission schools. Instead, she began her own school at Dohnavur. Her school was concerned more

---

<sup>217</sup> “The Life of Faith, 1891,” 198.

<sup>218</sup> “China’s Millions,” 1922, 166.

with developing moral and religious character, than with achieving high educational standards.

Although Carmichael had a rich appreciation for Indian culture, her curriculum did not involve the study of Indian history, culture or literature, including Tamil language and poetry. Her Keswick holiness teaching led her to fear that exposure to the outside world (which had already damaged the children) would undermine their spiritual and moral formation. Her policies might have been reasonable if the children had gone on to become self-supporting missionaries in Keswick style, but generally the Dohnavur students had difficulties finding employment, and the Dohnavur policy was reconsidered in 1949.<sup>219</sup>

Another contrast to some other missions was Carmichael's insistence that teachers in her schools be spiritually mature Christians. For Carmichael, the spiritual character of holiness was regarded as a requirement for a Christian worker. She believed that the total absence of converts among Muslims in Bangalore was due to the fact that the mission schools there employed Muslims, Hindus, and unconverted Christians as teachers. This practice "became a heavy burden" to her, and she determined to apply what she had learned in Japan: "In Japan the question had never arisen. No one would have dreamed of asking a Buddhist, of paying a Buddhist, to build the house of the Lord. Nor would a nominal Christian knowingly have been taken into the company of builders."<sup>220</sup>

Thus the focus of Carmichael's educational system was the conversion and consecration of her children. One reason Carmichael decided to educate the Dohnavur children outside the state educational system was that "We could not expose our children to [worldly] influences till New Testament convictions and the New Testament attitude towards life in general had become part of them, something that could not be torn out or laughed out of them."<sup>221</sup> Nancy E. Robbins, a medical doctor who joined the Dohnavur fellowship in 1946, wrote that by using

---

<sup>219</sup> Arles, "Ramabai and Carmichael," 148-50.

<sup>220</sup> Houghton, *Amy Carmichael*, 88.

<sup>221</sup> Carmichael, *Gold Cord*, 89.

Carmichael's method, "in their young and impressionable years the children were not confused by differing standards of Christian behaviour or conflicting views about the Bible."<sup>222</sup> This involved significant isolation from the outside world. It suggests a dualistic world view, with local culture and values regarded as secular, and education to pursue a career as worldly. The focus must be on spiritual and moral formation. This contrasts with Carmichael's more holistic approach to the rescue of temple children.

Her educational approach sets Carmichael apart from the wider trend in Protestant evangelical missions, towards a greater educational focus on the whole person. W. H. Findlay declared at the Decennial Missionary Conference in Bombay in 1892-3 that "the salvation offered in Christ is the salvation of the whole man." Education was not simply a means to salvation, but should take place alongside "and in conjunction with spiritual growth."<sup>223</sup>

Ramabai was closer to this view when she argued that the education of women would increase their knowledge, desire for truth, and impetus for change. After 1910 she emphasised both social service and evangelism. Ramabai, whose work at Mukti focussed on the care and education of child widows, sought to rescue all she could. At one time Mukti had two thousand girls in its care.<sup>224</sup>

The work of Keswick missionaries in the field of education had similarities with, but also differences from the work of missionaries attached to other evangelical mission societies. Keswick holiness did not reject the long, slow work of education in favour of a purely conversionist evangelistic approach, and it continued to view education as a valuable component of mission. But on the whole, Keswick missionaries believed that education should be conducted by consecrated, Christian teachers, and that children should have only limited exposure to local culture, although, as we have seen, the Keswick-influenced Ramabai's work had a broader scope.

---

<sup>222</sup> Nancy Robbins, *Not Forgetting to Sing* (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1967), 61.

<sup>223</sup> Quoted in Arles, "Ramabai and Carmichael," 215-6..

<sup>224</sup> Sarasvati and Adhav, *Pandita Ramabai*, 49.

### 2.3.2.3 Medical Work and Disaster Relief

Another growing dimension of evangelical mission was in the field of health care. Medical work was a significant part of the ministry at Dohnavur, where the team included doctors and nurses, whose primary focus was the needs of the children. The work was also extended by opening a dispensary in the Muslim town of Eruwadi, as a way of outreach.<sup>225</sup>

During the 1890s, the Keswick platform was open to a number of medical missionaries, signifying the Convention's approval of medical missions. The value of medical mission in opening the way for the spread of the Christian message was stressed. In 1892, Dr Gillison described medical missions as "a splendid spiritual vehicle" for the spread of Christianity.<sup>226</sup> Miss Gertrude Broomhall from the CIM shared her missionary experience of how medical work opened China's doors wider, enabling missionaries to develop connections with upper-class women and visit their homes.<sup>227</sup> In 1897, Dr Edith Brown, from the School of Medicine in North India, testified to the effectiveness of medical mission service in India for evangelisation, since the nurses' Christian way of life attracted many women who stayed at mission hospitals and led them to become believers. She appealed for "medical mission work in the whole of India."<sup>228</sup> In 1898, Dr Munro, from Bengal, claimed that the Medical Mission he worked with had spread the gospel to 150,000 people, with 3,000 willing to be baptised.

After assisting with medical work in Chefoo for eighteen months, G. W. Guinness travelled to Kaifengfu, Honan, in June 1902, to start the first medical mission there, and he was soon joined by Sydney H. Carr. Guinness spent most of his life in Kaifeng and oversaw the building of two hospitals for men and women. At Kaifeng, Guinness trained Chinese students to be his medical assistants and evangelists. One of them, Ho Hsiang-kin, gave valuable support to Guinness's medical work and became a respected pastor in Chow-kia-kow. Another student,

---

<sup>225</sup> Arles, "Ramabai and Carmichael," 158, 165.

<sup>226</sup> Hopkins, *The Story of Keswick, 1892*, 26.

<sup>227</sup> "The Life of Faith, 1891," 199.

<sup>228</sup> Hopkins, *The Keswick Week, 1897*, 191.

Kao Kin-cheng, started mission work in Kansu, northwest China, bordering on Tibet. He formed a band of unpaid local missionaries, and within five years, his church was filled with 77 baptised members and many more inquirers.<sup>229</sup>

Guinness combined medical work with concern for the social welfare of the Kaifeng people. He was involved in the work of the Red Cross and the Anti-Opium Society, and in founding the Honan Public Health Association. He also continued to preach and evangelise. In speaking to an audience of eleven hundred men at the Military Academy, he proclaimed Christ to be “the only power for a life of victory over sin.”<sup>230</sup> He also lectured at several schools, ranging from 300 to 1,000 students, concerning “social purity” and the deliverance power of Jesus Christ.<sup>231</sup>

In the following chapter on the Cambridge Seven, work with Opium addicts will be discussed further, but the potential of such work for evangelism was made clear at the Keswick meetings. In 1903 Miss Graham, a missionary of the Presbyterian Church of England mission in China, told a story of how a converted opium-smoker brought the gospel message to a head of a village, which resulted in a mission station being opened in that village.<sup>232</sup>

The Keswick missionary meetings highlighted the importance of medical missions as an avenue for women missionaries. In response to the low status of women in some mission fields, particularly in India, women missionaries emphasised how the gospel was directed equally to both genders, and how Christianity served to elevate the position of women. The opportunities the missions provided to women in education and medical work helped to raise their status and influence in the mission fields.

Chapter three will discuss in greater detail the response of holiness-influenced missionaries to natural disasters, but it is important to note here that the Keswick missionaries were prepared to respond to urgent humanitarian needs.

---

<sup>229</sup> Mrs. Taylor, *Guinness of Honan*, 245–8.

<sup>230</sup> *Ibid.*, 226.

<sup>231</sup> Evan Henry Hopkins, ed., *The Keswick Week, 1923: Forty-Ninth Convention* (London: Marshall Brothers, 1923), 238.

<sup>232</sup> Hopkins, *The Keswick Week, 1903*, 209.

Apart from evangelistic effort, Macpherson was also active in social welfare work, as demonstrated after the disastrous flood that devastated the district of Chenghsien, Chekiang, in 1922. Since no help from the government was forthcoming, the Chinese-Foreign Famine Relief Committee was formed with Macpherson as its co-chairman. They led a group of merchants, gentry, officials and others in acquiring foodstuffs and clothing for the needy.<sup>233</sup> When Cable and the Frenches moved into a new mission field in Central Asia and reached Suchow, the Trio engaged in social work by opening their house to homeless orphans.<sup>234</sup>

#### *2.3.2.4 Women and Mission*

As has been seen, a significant feature of the late-nineteenth-century missionary movement was the increased role of women in mission. As we have seen, Keswick women missionaries were active in educational work among Asian women, as demonstrated in the case of A. E. Luce in India, Mildred Cable in China, and Fugill in Japan. But Keswick women missionaries were not limited to educational roles. Others conducted an extensive itinerant evangelisation, as when Cable and her Trio crossed the Gobi desert. While the focus of Keswick mission was always on saving souls, Cable became involved in promoting social welfare, and Carmichael's mission provided shelter for temple children, combining care, education and evangelical work. The fact that ten of the thirteen Keswick missionaries that went to Asia were women indicates the commitment of the Keswick movement toward women's work in overseas mission.

The connection between the numbers of women from Keswick involved in mission, and Keswick teaching, is made by Maughan, who pointed out the significance of "higher life" culture to evangelical mission work: "Keswick authorized women as equal participants in the 'blessings of spirit' and thus encouraged more independent female roles ranging from expanding leadership in charitable organization to proclamatory preaching itself."<sup>235</sup>

---

<sup>233</sup> "China's Millions," 1923, 56.

<sup>234</sup> Platt, *Three Women*, 131.

<sup>235</sup> Maughan, *Mighty England Do Good*, 141.

## 2.4 Conclusion

The missionary themes highlighted in the sermons and the missionary meetings of the Keswick Conventions inspired a number of participants to take up the missionary cause. According to Steven Maughan, the speakers at Keswick platforms often portrayed missionary work as “an ultimate act of sanctification.”<sup>236</sup> In October 1891 *the Record* claimed that eighty candidates from Keswick had applied to the CMS, at least fifty of whom eventually went to the mission field.<sup>237</sup> Hudson Taylor reckoned that “two-thirds of those of the China Inland Mission were ‘among the heathen’ as the result of Keswick,” although it is unclear whether he meant as a result of attending the convention, or the wider influence of Keswick teaching.<sup>238</sup>

Apart from twenty-four Keswick missionaries who went to Asia and Africa from 1887 to 1906, there were a few other missionaries who can be identified to be closely connected to the Keswick movement. Fanny Woodman, a Sunday school teacher, attended the Keswick Convention in 1888 and felt a call to mission. In 1895 she and her husband joined the CIM to go to China, but later both died of cholera.<sup>239</sup> The Rev. R. J. Ward underwent a significant religious experience at Keswick in 1891, and became a missionary to India.<sup>240</sup> After serving at St Helen’s in Lancashire for 27 years, he went to India as a pastor of a congregation in Madras. At the Convention of 1893, Dr Neil testified that he felt the missionary calling. Although his mother and his ten siblings had pleaded with him not to go, he went and never regretted his decision.<sup>241</sup> A female CIM missionary, S. E. Morris claimed that her missionary call was confirmed after attending the Keswick Convention in 1898. It was reported, “she had felt it very hard to give up her dear ones in order to

---

<sup>236</sup> Ibid.

<sup>237</sup> Anne Bentley, “The Transformation of the Evangelical Party in the Church of England in the later nineteenth century” (PhD diss., University of Durham, 1971), 446.

<sup>238</sup> Figgis, *Keswick from Within*, 134.

<sup>239</sup> Price and Randall, *Transforming Keswick*, 154.

<sup>240</sup> Helen S. Dyer, *Revival in India: “Years of the Right Hand of the Most High”* (London, 1907), 29.

<sup>241</sup> Hopkins, *The Keswick Week, 1900*, 202.

follow Christ to China, until He spoke to her heart at Keswick.”<sup>242</sup> Watkin R. Roberts attended the 1906 Convention which was influential in “confirming his call by God to missionary service.”<sup>243</sup> Later he went to India to serve the Zo tribes of southwest Manipur.

The careers of the Keswick missionaries in Asia demonstrated their high levels of commitment to the missionary cause, and this was undoubtedly influenced by their views on entire consecration and self-sacrifice, including a willingness to lay down their lives. Amy Carmichael served in India for 53 years without furlough until her death in 1951. Thomas Walker remained in the mission field until he died during a preaching tour in India. In China, G. W. Guinness served as a medical missionary, until he died of typhus fever while helping his Chinese patients. Alex K. Macpherson suffered internment by the Japanese near the end of his life, while Mildred Cable travelled across the Gobi Desert to carry the gospel to Muslims, demonstrating “a model of spirituality which issued in courageous risk-taking.”<sup>244</sup>

The Keswick-inspired missionaries transmitted the holiness teachings to local believers and Christian workers in the mission fields. They insisted that only Christian converts should serve in Christian mission, and that only believers should teach in their schools. They demanded that local believers conform to certain moral standards, which could sometimes lead to insensitivity to other cultures in the mission fields. Walker and Carmichael’s insistence on the solitary practice of quietness could impose a Western individualistic culture on Indian Christians who had a more communal culture. Renouncing gold and jewellery was portrayed as a demonstration of consecration and the holy life, but showed little appreciation of the role of jewellery in India as an important symbol of women’s and familial status. In China, Hodgson’s demand that Mrs. Chu apologize to her child fundamentally conflicted with a Chinese cultural norm.

---

<sup>242</sup> “China’s Millions,” 1899, ?

<sup>243</sup> Jonathan Pudaite, *The Legacy of Watkin Roberts* (Meghalaya: Partnership Publishing House, 2009), 8.

<sup>244</sup> Price and Randall, *Transforming Keswick*, 160.

Keswick missionaries all affirmed the authority of the Scripture and looked forward to the second coming of Christ. They agreed on a second-blessing experience, or baptism in the Spirit. This emphasis on the activity and fullness of the Spirit led some further into a Pentecostal understanding of Christian experience than others. Sister Eva of Friedenshort claimed to have received a heavenly vision during the Keswick Convention of 1905. The revivals in Wales and also in India were widely spoken of in Keswick circles. However, the Mission Council of the Keswick Convention did not encourage Pentecostalism, or approve of the practice of speaking in tongues. That said, the conflicts in the mission field, where missionaries believed they were involved in spiritual warfare and called to exercise the spiritual gifts, did lead some missionaries towards a Pentecostal view. Eveline Luce underwent a Pentecostal experience in 1910. The Keswick Mission Council disapproved of this, which caused Luce to move closer to the Pentecostal movement and eventually to join the Assemblies of God.

The Keswick missionaries believed that evangelism was the primary part of mission, and that the way to change society was to change individual people. Faithful preaching was the way to create a social context in which blasphemy, dishonesty, immorality, cruelty and injustice would diminish. They believed that prayer was also a way to change society. Although they did not embrace major social or political reform projects, they did often combine their evangelistic mission with social concern. Although Carmichael took a pessimistic view of Indian society, and of the possibility of changing the wider society, she did combine education and social care in her mission to rescue temple children. As an Indian Christian, Ramabai was more optimistic, and generally more holistic, hoping for major social reforms to come through education and increased knowledge.<sup>245</sup> Both Ramabai and Carmichael were forthright in presenting evidence of social evils in their writings.

The late nineteenth century social and political situation in India tended to push missionaries towards social reform and even protest against social and

---

<sup>245</sup> Arles, "Ramabai and Carmichael," 220-21.

political injustices, and to be less willing to believe that social concern and humanitarian action had little to do with “saving souls.”<sup>246</sup> Some Keswick missionaries reflected this tendency in their work. For Carmichael social action and evangelism always went together when rescuing children. For other Keswick missionaries, education and medical work were routes to proclamation of the gospel. Keswick missionaries, like Cable, Guinness, Carmichael were prepared to put compassion before theological dogma. They would act first in response to need, and then justify that action through religious reflection. Carmichael felt she was led directly by God to work with temple children and abandon itinerant evangelism.

The question remains as to whether the holiness teaching of Keswick missionaries made them intolerant toward local cultural practices, and overly critical of local Christians in Asia. This, Andrew Porter has claimed in his article, “Cambridge, Keswick, and late-nineteenth-century Attitudes to Africa,” was the pattern in Africa. Porter highlighted the attitudes shown by Graham Wilmot Brooke, who in the 1890s led a team of Keswick-influenced young missionaries to West Africa, and became deeply dissatisfied with the Christian moral character of African mission workers. The highly critical attitude of G. W. Brooke toward the failure of the African workers to fulfil his high standard of holiness resulted in the expulsion from the Niger Mission of many African agents.<sup>247</sup> Some writers have suggested racist attitudes were also involved.<sup>248</sup>

The attempt of Thomas Walker to purge the church membership in India, “weeding out those who were living as Hindus,” could be seen as similar to Brooke’s actions.<sup>249</sup> What Walker condemned as “living as Hindus” seemed to include certain Indian customs, such as marriage with unbelievers for the sake of keeping caste; incurring debt for the cost of the wedding ceremony, large dowries or jewels as wedding gifts; Sabbath-breaking owing to celebrating palmyra season, and other

---

<sup>246</sup> Ibid., 238.

<sup>247</sup> Porter, “Cambridge, Keswick, and Late-Nineteenth-Century Attitudes to Africa,” 5-34.

<sup>248</sup> Webster, *The African Churches*, 44; Ayandele, *The Missionary Impact*, 213.

<sup>249</sup> Carmichael, *This One Thing*, 71.

such “superstitious observances.”<sup>250</sup> The day of humiliation and prayer, which Walker led in 1893, was followed by excommunicating people from the church for observing caste, irregular marriages and financial dishonesty. The excommunication of “several hundreds of Christians,” for Walker, was needed to keep the church “healthier.”<sup>251</sup> This has been likened by David Bebbington to the approach of C.F. Hartford-Battersby, the son of the founder of Keswick, who purged the church in West Africa.<sup>252</sup>

However, against this should be set the adoption of local clothes and names, and the use of Tamil, by Carmichael at Dohnavur. So too, Ramabai’s wider engagement with culture (as an Indian) should be noted, and her efforts to change Indian society through education. Keswick medical missionaries trained local doctors, and teachers, and provided they were truly believers, gave them responsibilities. Carmichael worked with an Indian leadership team at Dohnavur. In short, Keswick missionaries were not wholly negative about local culture, or about promoting indigenous leaders. The influence of Keswick theology on the work of Keswick missionaries in Asia may have been in some respects negative, but it was less negative than that which Porter described in Africa.

---

<sup>250</sup> Ibid., 142.

<sup>251</sup> *Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: Ninety-Fourth Year, 1892-93* (London: Church Missionary House, 1893), 158.

<sup>252</sup> Bebbington, *The Dominance of Evangelicalism*, 197.

## Chapter 3

### The Cambridge Seven and Missions in Asia

The going forth of the Cambridge Seven to China was one of the more significant events in the history of nineteenth-century British missions. According to Eugene Stock, “The influence of such a band of men going to China as missionaries was irresistible. No such event had occurred before; and no event of the century has done so much to arouse the minds of Christian men to the tremendous claims of the Field, and the nobility of the missionary vocation.”<sup>1</sup>

Although some were surprised at the decision of these gifted men to become overseas missionaries, Cox suggests it was part of an emerging pattern: “the missions were reaping a harvest of decades of investment in the task of making the missionary profession a respectable one that a normal, educated person might find attractive.” This, Cox notes, was “fraught with contradictions,” for it also served the purposes of mission to associate their work with extraordinary “heroism” and with the sense that a missionary was a “person set apart, with a special calling from God.”<sup>2</sup>

The influence of the Cambridge band after they travelled to China was soon felt. Inspired by their example, thirty-five men applied to the Edinburgh Medical Missionary Society, and thirty-one British students applied for the CMS, and by 1893 there were 140 offers.<sup>3</sup> The issue of *China's Millions* which contained their story sold 50,000 copies and, when Benjamin Broomhall republished it as *The Evangelisation of the World*, another 20,000 copies were sold. Furthermore, it was distributed to all branches of YMCA and YWCA in Britain and the United States, and a copy even reached Queen Victoria.<sup>4</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> Stock, *The History of the Church Missionary Society*, III:284.

<sup>2</sup> Cox, *British Missionary Enterprise*, 184-5.

<sup>3</sup> A. J. Broomhall, *Assault on the Nine*, 6:377.

<sup>4</sup> *Ibid.*; Austin, *China's Millions*, 209.

A significant factor in inspiring the Cambridge Seven to volunteer for overseas mission was the Keswick-influenced holiness movement, and for this reason they form the second of the case studies in this study. The first section of this chapter provides brief biographical studies of each of the Cambridge Seven and discusses their mission activities in Asia. The second section explores how the Holiness devotional teachings influenced the religious lives of the Seven. The third section shows how the Holiness teachings that the Seven received were subsequently reflected in their missionary activities. The fourth section investigates the theological views of the Seven, with special attention to the contentious views of Stanley Smith on universal salvation and the Pentecostal influences on Cecil Polhill, and argues that they retained the importance of Holiness teachings in spite of different theological positions. The final section considers the influence of Holiness teachings on their responses to key issues within the Chinese missionary context, to ascertain whether there was anything distinctive in their missiological response.

### 3.1. The Mission Activities of the Cambridge Seven

It is notable that the mission they chose to serve with was the CIM, rather than the CMS. In the late nineteenth century there were criticisms of missionaries living a comfortable life on the mission fields, settled in a nice bungalow on a mission station, exercising a controlling influence over local people upon whom they looked down, with a lifestyle well above the local people, and even many middle-class supporters of the mission back home.<sup>5</sup> The radical approach of the CIM, abandoning the mission station for itinerancy and life in the field, was more in tune with the sacrifices their holiness teaching encouraged them to make. The CIM as a “faith mission” was “rooted in the reality of widespread frustration with mission bureaucracy and institution maintenance.” The CIM was, according to Cox, an attempt to develop mission not “mired in bureaucracy and professionalism.”

---

<sup>5</sup> Cox, *British Missionary Enterprise*, 203-4.

Professionalism was thought to undermine spirituality, whereas the CIM offered “simple living and sacrifice.” Ironically, the CIM grew to such size that it had to organize and professionalize its operations, but emphasized its difference from other mission societies, along with the SPG, refusing compensation from the Chinese government for the loss of life in the Boxer Rebellion.<sup>6</sup>

The members of the Cambridge Seven were William Cassels; Stanley Smith, stroke of the Cambridge eight’s boat; Montagu Harry Proctor Beauchamp, son of a baronet; Dixon Hoste, son of a major-general, a gunner and sub-altern in the Royal Artillery (the only member who was not matriculated at Cambridge University);<sup>7</sup> Cecil Polhill-Turner and his brother Arthur Twistleton Polhill-Turner (both sons of a Member of Parliament); and C. T. Studd, from an affluent family and a cricketer who played for England.

William Wharton Cassels was born on 11 March 1858 and was ordained in 1882. On 18 October 1895, at Exeter Hall, Cassels was consecrated as the first Anglican Bishop of the new diocese of Western China, with ecclesiastical authority over the missionaries of both the CIM and CMS.<sup>8</sup> Stanley Peregrine Smith was born in London in 19 March 1861.<sup>9</sup> On resigning from the CIM in 1904, he began his own missionary work in East Shansi.<sup>10</sup> He continued as an independent missionary and died at Tse-chow (Jincheng) on 31 January 1931. Montagu Beauchamp was born in 19 April 1860. In China, Beauchamp worked with Cassels in Hsi-Chow and to Paoning before returning to England in 1910 where he was ordained and served as a vicar.<sup>11</sup> Dixon Edward Hoste was born on 23 July 1861. In 1903 he succeeded Hudson Taylor as the head of the CIM.

---

<sup>6</sup> Ibid., 206-08.

<sup>7</sup> Hoste was still regarded as one of the Cambridge Seven, perhaps because he applied to the CIM at the same period as the other six Cambridge men and all the seven were then going to China together.

<sup>8</sup> Marshall Broomhall, *W. W. Cassels*, 182.

<sup>9</sup> A. J. Broomhall, *Not Death to Die*, 7:675; *Biographical Dictionary of Christian Mission*, s.v. “Smith, Stanley P.”

<sup>10</sup> Pollock, *The Cambridge Seven*, 107.

<sup>11</sup> Cecil Polhill and Arthur Polhill, “Two Etonians in China, 1885-1925,” n.d., 46.

Cecil Henry Polhill-Turner was born on 23 February 1860<sup>12</sup> and worked mostly in Tibet, returning to England in 1900. He was the co-founder and the President of PMU, “the first organized and successful Pentecostal missions agency.”<sup>13</sup> Arthur Twistleton Polhill-Turner, the younger brother of Cecil, was born on 7 February 1862.<sup>14</sup> He was ordained in 1890. Charles Thomas Studd was born on 2 December 1860. He remained in China until 1894. From 1900 to 1906, Studd served in India, before in 1910 he started pioneering mission in central Africa.

### 3.2. The Influence of the Holiness Movement on the Cambridge Seven

A significant figure in shaping the spiritual experience of the Cambridge Seven was Dwight L. Moody. His close friend, D. W. Whittle, portrayed Moody’s deep religious experience in 1871 as follows: “God blessed him with the conscious in coming to his soul of a presence and power of His Spirit such as he had never known before.”<sup>15</sup> For believers in holiness teachings, this could have been the moment of consecration for Moody, in which he subjected his own self to God’s will.

Moody held distinctive views on the role of the Holy Spirit in ministry. He often spoke of the need of the “gift of the Holy Spirit for service,” or the spiritual power for an effective ministry.<sup>16</sup> Another feature of Moody’s theology was premillennialism. According to his biographer, James Findlay, it is probable that Moody was influenced by the Irish premillennialist theologian and founder of the Brethren, John N. Darby, who had visited America to spread his eschatological vision between 1868 and 1872.<sup>17</sup> Moody often used premillennial belief as a

---

<sup>12</sup> Usher, “For China and Tibet,” 32.

<sup>13</sup> *Biographical Dictionary of Christian Mission*, s.v., “Polhill, Cecil H.”

<sup>14</sup> In 1902 Arthur and Cecil both decided to remove the Turner from their surnames by deed poll to “suit the times” (Usher, “For China and Tibet,” 32). Thus the name of Polhill will be used throughout this thesis.

<sup>15</sup> James F. Findlay, *Dwight L. Moody, American Evangelist, 1837-1899* (Chicago; London: University of Chicago Press, 1969), 132.

<sup>16</sup> *Ibid.*, 239.

<sup>17</sup> *Ibid.*, 251.

“weapon of evangelism,” and in every major mission he preached on Christ’s return at least once.<sup>18</sup>

Moody’s first great evangelistic campaign in England brought spiritual revival, and one of its results was the conversion of Stanley P. Smith in 1874 after listening to Moody at Eastbourne.<sup>19</sup> In 1882 he was involved in the conversion of D. E. Hoste and the brothers Arthur and Cecil Polhill-Turner, as well as contributing to the spiritual experience of C. T. Studd.

The impact of the Keswick holiness movement can be seen in the religious life of the Cambridge Seven. Stanley Smith confessed to having the experience of consecration in January 1883 when he visited a certain Mr. Price, an elderly Christian who lived in Pakefield, a village south of Lowestoft. In line with Keswick teaching, Price had learned that, “on a definite consecration of the whole self to God ... the Holy Spirit would shed abroad the love of God in the heart.” After his conversation with Price, Smith described how he “had never before seen so vividly the meaning of God’s holiness and of his own sin, nor the demands and the possibilities of faith in Christ.”<sup>20</sup> Charles Studd came under the Keswick holiness influence by reading Hannah Pearsall Smith’s book, *The Christian’s Secret of a Happy Life*. After reading the book in London in September 1884, Studd surrendered himself to God and felt “a willingness to go wherever he was sent.”<sup>21</sup> The religious feeling of Arthur Polhill-Turner and Montagu Beauchamp was also heightened by attending holiness meetings. On 27 October 1884, Arthur Polhill-Turner went to an Edinburgh Holiness Convention with his sister, and he found “the secret of consecration and victory and of constant abiding in the power of the Holy Spirit.”<sup>22</sup> About a week later, on 3 November 1884, Beauchamp went to a holiness meeting at a “Cambridge friend’s parish near Shepherd’s Bush,” after which he had

---

<sup>18</sup> Ibid., 253.

<sup>19</sup> Pollock, *The Cambridge Seven*, 11.

<sup>20</sup> Ibid., 49-50.

<sup>21</sup> Ibid., 69.

<sup>22</sup> Ibid., 79–80.

a serious conversation about China, prayed over it, and decided to become a missionary.<sup>23</sup>

The influence of the Keswick holiness movement is also exemplified in the description of Cassels who was on a journey with Hoste and Smith. They prayed earnestly for “inward purity” and power for missionary service, and later for “the great gift of the Holy Spirit, not in the measure in which He is given to all Christians, but in that fulness which was promised by our Lord.”<sup>24</sup>

The deepening of religious experience of the Cambridge Seven coincided with the urgent need of the China Inland Mission for more workers. The spirituality that resulted from the holiness movement was congenial to the religious experience of the mission founder, Hudson Taylor, who had experienced holiness by faith in September 1869.<sup>25</sup>

From the missionary lives of the Cambridge Seven it can be seen that their spiritual experiences were affected by several holiness strands. D. L. Moody’s mission and the pressing need of missionaries to China that the China Inland Mission represented played a significant role in motivating the Cambridge band. Moody’s emphasis on the need to be empowered by the Spirit and his premillennial teachings might have made the Cambridge men be open to the possibility of going for overseas mission. Once they decided to be missionaries, the CIM, which was also seeking for workers who were “wholly consecrated” and “filled with the Spirit of God,” was ready to channel their aspirations.<sup>26</sup>

Although none of the Cambridge Seven had attended the Keswick Convention before becoming missionaries to China, they did receive Keswick teaching indirectly.<sup>27</sup> The encounter of Stanley Smith and C. T. Studd with holiness teaching brought both of them to the point of consecration. It was also possible that the

---

<sup>23</sup> Ibid., 75.

<sup>24</sup> Marshall Broomhall, *W. W. Cassels*, 57.

<sup>25</sup> Dr Howard Taylor and Mrs Howard Taylor, *Hudson Taylor and the China Inland Mission: The Growth of a Work of God* (London: Morgan & Scott, 1918), 169.

<sup>26</sup> “China’s Millions, 1888,” 76.

<sup>27</sup> The first record that any member of the Seven attended the Keswick Convention was when W. W. Cassels and Montagu Beauchamp spoke in the missionary meeting at the Convention of 1895.

holiness meetings that Arthur Polhill-Turner and Montagu Beauchamp attended were in the Keswick line. After many years of missionary service in China, William Cassels too might have gained some influence of Keswick teaching through the reading of Andrew Murray's work. In a letter to his wife, he wrote, "I have been very much stirred up to prayer today and last night by reading some of Andrew Murray's *Ministry of Intercession*."<sup>28</sup> Of significance to the later view of Cecil Polhill-Turner was the link that Murray made between the Great Commission to Pentecost, arguing that its fulfilment "was made entirely dependent upon the reality of a Pentecostal experience."<sup>29</sup>

### 3.3. The Cambridge Seven and their Emphases on Holiness

#### 3.3.1 Communion with God

One prominent holiness feature in the mission life of the Cambridge Seven was that of keeping fellowship with God through personal prayer and Bible study. Dixon Hoste was convinced that such fellowship with God was a source of power in imparting biblical truth to others and also in pastoral counselling. "If we are faithful and diligent daily in thus giving ourselves to prayer, earnest study of Scripture and meditation thereon," he asserted, "then we may humbly expect to grow in usefulness and power as preachers and Bible teachers, as well as fellow-helpers with and wise sympathetic counsellors of our Chinese colleagues."<sup>30</sup> The discipline of maintaining a daily communion with God was a means of guarding holiness and growing in spiritual strength, preserving them "from the temptations and snares of the devil and allurements of the world."<sup>31</sup>

In like manner, W. W. Cassels valued maintaining daily companionship with God. It can be seen in his desire for his children to live a holy life by keeping daily

---

<sup>28</sup> Unfortunately, the letter was undated. It was probably before 1907 (Marshall Broomhall, *W. W. Cassels*, 369).

<sup>29</sup> Robert H. Glover, *The Progress of World-Wide Missions* (London: J. Clarke and Co, 1925), 369.

<sup>30</sup> Thompson, *D.E. Hoste*, 158.

<sup>31</sup> *Ibid.*, 165.

communion with God. Writing from Ta Yuen on 12 February 1906, he gave the following advice, "Do avoid all evil companions and all hurtful things, and keep close to the Saviour. Remember your prayers and try and get some daily teaching from the Bible."<sup>32</sup>

After being ordained as the Bishop of Western China, this spiritual aspect of communion with God became Cassels' main message to those who were going forth as missionaries. On 8 September 1908, speaking at St. James's Hall, London, Cassels portrayed fellowship with God through prayer as the essential condition for consecration:

Consecration comes by communion. And how important it is for you who are going forth that you should be in constant touch and communion with God... The great essential of communion is prayer. And, if the China Inland Mission stands for anything, it stands for prayer. It was begun in prayer; it has been continued in prayer; and it must go on, if it is to go on, by prayer. Prayer has been the preparation of every triumph, and the secret of every success.<sup>33</sup>

The prominence of this spiritual practice was also evident in C. T. Studd's missionary life. Norman Grubb, Studd's biographer, commented that his habit of morning watch was "one of the great secrets of his life." One of Studd's personal notes, during his mission in Pingyang in early 1886, revealed his own habit of getting up early in the morning, "about 3:30 a.m.," to have a quiet personal Bible reading. Studd stated that his purpose of this practice was to be "a workman approved," and not just a missionary with "a 'pass' degree."<sup>34</sup>

"Waiting upon God, and intercession on behalf of others," Hoste maintained, "are really the most vital and effective parts of my service." As the "the powers of darkness" were everywhere, without prayers of intercession, "little, if anything, is really accomplished."<sup>35</sup> Thompson's biography of Hoste revealed that, "Intercession for his fellow missionaries was regarded as his first duty towards them, and was put before everything."<sup>36</sup>

---

<sup>32</sup> Marshall Broomhall, *W. W. Cassels*, 258.

<sup>33</sup> "China's Millions," 1908, 151.

<sup>34</sup> Grubb, *C.T. Studd*, 57.

<sup>35</sup> Thompson, *D.E. Hoste*, 117.

<sup>36</sup> *Ibid.*, 114.

This emphasis on prayer and intercession was also evident in Cassels' missionary life. His biographer claimed that, "one supreme secret of his life was the place he gave to prayer."<sup>37</sup> From the time of his arrival at Paoning, he preserved every Friday as a day of prayer and fasting. According to his assistant, Miss F. M. Williams: "Every Friday from 12.30 to 3 or 3.30 p.m. we gathered for a time of waiting upon God, specially for the province of Szechwan, and for all the workers and Chinese Christians."<sup>38</sup>

### 3.3.2 Emphasis on Holy Living

The commitment to a strict religious manner of living was another holiness characteristic of the Seven. In selecting candidates to be missionaries, D. E. Hoste considered spiritual character to be the most important qualification for a missionary, arguing that, "the vital thing was that the men and women sent to China should know the power of prayer, and exercise it ... and know they were called of God to serve Him in China."<sup>39</sup> For Hoste, missionaries had to set an example of Christian living: "It must ever be borne in mind that the spiritual value and fruitfulness of our work, individually and as a Mission depends ... upon the nature of our contact and intercourse with the people around us. Is it Christ-like, or is it more or less controlled by the self-life?"<sup>40</sup>

The spiritual life of churches in China became Hoste's focus during his early years there. In his keynote address at the first Annual Meeting after the death of Hudson Taylor, he asserted that, after the pioneering work of itinerating in the numerous regions of inland China, the direction of the Mission now would be "to give attention to the instruction and training of converts." "So much will depend during the next twenty years," he continued, "upon our being able to instruct in the

---

<sup>37</sup> Marshall Broomhall, *W. W. Cassels*, 118.

<sup>38</sup> *Ibid.*, 119.

<sup>39</sup> Thompson, *D.E. Hoste*, 112.

<sup>40</sup> *Ibid.*, 178.

Word of God, and to instil into the churches correct standards of Christian life and Christian doctrine and practice."<sup>41</sup>

Conversion, Cassels believed, should result in holy life, as was indicated in how he presented accounts of converts. For example: "The last I baptised was the landlady of the principal inn in the place. First she gave up opium, then idolatry, then Sunday trading." He related another conversion story from the 'Hundred Temples Market,' in which "the leading Christian" was previously "one of the most wicked men in a very wicked district." After his conversion, he became "a noble Christian."<sup>42</sup>

Another member of the Cambridge Seven, Montagu Beauchamp, insisted that Chinese believers must have a genuine motive in following Christ. After mentioning that there seemed to be a widespread interest in the gospel in five or six counties in Si-chuen and Hu-peh, where "thousands have bought Scriptures and call themselves Christians," he was not impressed with the numbers. For, he insisted, many of them were only nominal Christians, whose "motives may be mistaken or entirely wrong."<sup>43</sup>

Stanley Smith also expected the mission workers to exhibit holy living. Writing from Lugan Fu, he expressed regret over one of his teachers who used to have "great outward profession" but later turned out to be smoking opium and "living an impure life." Smith later described the situation as, "a great blow to me, as I had looked on my teacher as a right-hand man for the Hien work."<sup>44</sup>

The holiness views of Dixon Hoste and Stanley Smith were reflected in their changing practice of baptism in Hungtung, where for a short period both of them worked together. In the spring of 1887, a convention was held in Hungtung which was attended by around 300 people, 216 of whom were baptised in one day. That number was considered to set a new record for the history of the Mission.<sup>45</sup> The

---

<sup>41</sup> Ibid., 106.

<sup>42</sup> "China's Millions, 1894," 101.

<sup>43</sup> "China's Millions, 1904," 99.

<sup>44</sup> "China's Millions, 1889," 84.

<sup>45</sup> Thompson, *D.E. Hoste*, 56.

ground for baptism was not merely on professing faith, but recommendation from native church members. However, fifty of those baptised afterwards became backsliders, most of them lapsing into opium-smoking and returning to idolatry. This incident prompted Hoste to exercise more care in accepting enquirers for baptism. Similarly, after leaving Hungtung, Smith asserted that, “a man should by his changed life give satisfactory evidence of his discipleship before baptism be administered.”<sup>46</sup> He applied this view to his next ministry at Lucheng, where some felt he made “the rules for the entrance into the church needlessly strict and severe.”<sup>47</sup>

### 3.3.3 Emphasis on Holiness Themes

#### 3.3.3.1 *Being Filled with the Spirit*

The fullness of the Spirit was another important holiness theme marking the Cambridge band. Hoste believed that being filled by the Spirit was essential in Christian ministry. When Hoste was appointed to succeed Hudson Taylor as the General Director of China Inland Mission, he wrote to Mrs. Taylor:

Will you pray above all that I may be humble, and may really be kept from seeking my own glory and profit? And oh! For a baptism of the positive love of Christ for His people! Alas! How I need, how I long for a filling of the Spirit of Christ; merely not to seek my own will not be enough, I need the strong love of Christ to constrain me to spend and be spent for others.”<sup>48</sup>

Those words implied that, for Hoste, baptism of Spirit is similar to being filled with the Spirit, and that both meant being enabled by the Spirit for an effective ministry.

Stanley Smith, in like manner, believed in the need to keep “receiving from the Lord’s fullness.” Before they left for China, Smith and George B. Studd would set apart an hour daily to wait for “the outpouring of His Spirit,” and they would meet each other weekly to share their spiritual experience.<sup>49</sup> In 1892, Smith travelled to

---

<sup>46</sup> “China’s Millions, 1892,” 89.

<sup>47</sup> *Ibid.*, 91.

<sup>48</sup> Thompson, *D.E. Hoste*, 93.

<sup>49</sup> “China’s Millions, 1892,” 90.

Chehkiang province, preaching there on two themes, “Draw from the fullness of the Lord” and “Be filled with the Holy Ghost.”<sup>50</sup>

In an article in *China's Millions* of 1896, describing a riot in Chung-king, Cecil Polhill emphasised the need for the fullness of the Spirit to enable believers for holiness and effective witnessing. He asked the readers, “Will you pray ... that we may be filled with the Spirit, and when necessary the gifts of the Holy Spirit, as the Lord may dispose.” They should also pray, “that we may be approved of God ... that we may show the divine life to the Chinese in all its beauty and power.” His desire for an effective mission was closely connected to his premillennial belief: “pray for us as we for you at home; that we may be one, and that so the return of our beloved Saviour may be hastened. O Lord Jesus, come quickly.”<sup>51</sup>

After commencing mission work in China, Cassels became convinced that being full of the Spirit was vital for the empowerment of missionaries: “We feel very much... in a much larger measure to be filled with the Holy Spirit, who is promised to all who ask and believe.” Without power from the Spirit, he believed, “we are to sink down into a low level kind of life, labouring with no particular result.”<sup>52</sup>

### 3.3.3.2 Consecration

Consecration, or surrender, was another holiness theme important to the Seven in their mission. This was evident in Cassels's ministry. He recalled how on one Christmas day he conducted an unusual consecration meeting in closing a service since he was convinced that “the Holy Spirit was manifestly working in our midst.”<sup>53</sup> In that meeting, those present surrendered many things “which might prove a hindrance to them,” such as tobacco or alcohol.<sup>54</sup>

In 1894, at the twenty-eighth Anniversary Meetings of the CIM, held at the Conference Hall, Mildmay, Cassels urged his audience to give what God wanted from them without reserve:

---

<sup>50</sup> Ibid., 92.

<sup>51</sup> “China's Millions, 1886,” 128.

<sup>52</sup> “China's Millions, 1885,” 106.

<sup>53</sup> “China's Millions, 1894,” 132.

<sup>54</sup> “China's Millions, 1894,” 132.

My brothers and sisters, how many of us are hindering God by refusing to yield to Him what is His? Ah! It is an awful thing to rob God (Mal. iii. 8). It may be that there are those here tonight who are keeping back *themselves*: God wants *you*, my brother; God wants *you*, my sister. Will you yield yourself to Him? ... Or it may be that there are those who are keeping back their children or others whom God is wanting. Will you yield them to Him tonight? *God will do a new thing when there is a new spirit of consecration amongst us*. Or again, it may be that there are talents of various kinds which God is wanting. There are jewels, there is finery, there is a balance at the bank which God is wanting, and which has hitherto been refused.<sup>55</sup>

This act of surrender was exemplified in Cassels' own life. In 1907, he declined an offer to succeed G. E. Moule as the Bishop of Mid China. In his reply to the Archbishop of Canterbury regarding this offer, he expressed his belief that God meant for him to remain in West China. He used similar language when he declined an offer to join the home staff of CMS.<sup>56</sup>

Another of the Seven, Montagu Beauchamp, maintained that a consecrated life was vital to happiness, for “every child of God knows that happiness is alone enjoyed in walking in obedience to God’s revealed will.” When once asked about whether he wanted to return to England, he responded that his mission in China was God’s will, and “no further desire enters my head: it is not duty, no, but joy unspeakable and very real.”<sup>57</sup>

For C. T. Studd, reliance on God’s power defined his view of mission from the beginning of his missionary life. Writing in August 1885 from Han-chung he claimed that God “has taught me many lessons, especially that of my weakness, how my best powers and attainments can but hinder Him – that if I live, and do, I must be a hindrance to His working through me.” Studd insisted on the need to put to death his personal will and to let God’s will master him. “Yes, I must be dead; then He can use me for His glory,” he asserted, “Yes, indeed, dead, dead – dead to everything, to everybody, to the opinions not only of the world, but also of the Christian world.”<sup>58</sup> Fourteen years later, he wrote an article arguing that “Religion

---

<sup>55</sup> Ibid., 102.

<sup>56</sup> Ibid., 285.

<sup>57</sup> “China’s Millions, 1886,” 150.

<sup>58</sup> Ibid., 13

consists in surrender to Jesus Christ as a rebel to a king, in accepting His free gift of pardon and salvation bought by His own death on the cross for you, and enlisting in His army to bring this lost world to the knowledge of salvation, vowing and giving utter obedience to a Commander who never made, nor can make, a mistake."<sup>59</sup> Studd's use of military language here probably reflected the influence of the Salvation Army.

Another important holiness accent manifested by the Seven was the willingness to relinquish personal ambition and advancement. In becoming missionaries to China, C. T. Studd and Stanley Smith abandoned their popularity as prominent athletes, while Dixon Hoste and Cecil Polhill gave up promising military careers. In addition, as we will see, when C. T. Studd and Montagu Beauchamp inherited substantial fortunes, they renounced the wealth and continued to live simply as missionaries, following the faith principles of the CIM for their sustenance.<sup>60</sup>

### 3.4 The Developing Theology of the Cambridge Seven

This section highlights the theological views of the Cambridge Seven that were important in shaping their mission in Asia. Particular attention will be given to the universalism of Stanley Smith and Pentecostal influences on Cecil Polhill.

#### 3.4.1 Full Salvation

For the Seven, the holiness themes were inseparable from the notion of conversion. From the beginning of his mission in China, Stanley Smith held to the concept of this full salvation. On 4 May 1885, in Peking, he was reported to hold, besides evangelistic services, gatherings for the missionaries for "the deepening of spiritual life," with the theme "Be filled with the Spirit." Smith believed not only that the fullness of the Spirit was the privilege of all believers, but also that "nothing short of

---

<sup>59</sup> "China's Millions," 1899, 127.

<sup>60</sup> Fiedler, *The Story of Faith Missions*, 33.

a complete submission to God's will and an entire consecration to God, has been allowed to be 'conversion.'"<sup>61</sup>

There was also evidence that Cassels taught the holiness themes to new converts. In August 1888, he wrote:

Every night we had what I may call after-meetings, when we especially dealt with the candidates for baptism. During the early part of the week these were largely occupied with teaching, but as the enthusiasm increased the claims of the Master to full and immediate submission to Him were more and more strongly pressed. All through, salvation in its fullness was our theme.<sup>62</sup>

### 3.4.2 The Authority of Scripture

The Cambridge Seven believed in the inerrancy of the Bible, a belief that was also part of the CIM's statement of faith. Cecil Polhill's belief in inerrancy can be seen in his Pentecostal periodical, *Fragments of Flame*, which was later rebranded as *Flames of Fire: With which is Incorporated Tidings from Tibet and Other Lands*. Launched in November 1911, the first issue defined "The Doctrines We Hold," one of which was "the plenary inspiration of Old and New Testament (entire)."<sup>63</sup> William Cassels also affirmed the plenary inspiration of Scripture over what he called the modernist view. On one occasion he wrote, "The way in which modern views of the Bible are creeping into China is terrible. To me if our Lord is wrong as to His view of the Old Testament, I cannot be sure that He is not wrong in all His statements as to my redemption and the future life. Personally I have become increasingly conservative in my views as the result of recent study of several books." "If the Modernist position is to be accepted," he added, "the ground is all knocked away from under my feet, and I have nothing to stand upon."<sup>64</sup>

Stanley Smith, however, diverged from biblical inerrancy. He probably changed his view on the Bible's authority after he resigned from the CIM. Although Smith believed that the key theme of the Scripture was *religious salvation*, he did not believe that "all that is contained in the Bible or the Scriptures is "God-breathed

---

<sup>61</sup> "China's Millions, 1885," 115.

<sup>62</sup> Marshall Broomhall, *W. W. Cassels*, 121.

<sup>63</sup> Usher, "For China and Tibet," 264.

<sup>64</sup> Marshall Broomhall, *W. W. Cassels*, 329.

Scripture.” Furthermore, “as Scripture distinctly teaches a *progressive revelation* which culminates in Christ, I am bound to admit that there is that which is rudimentary and imperfect in Old Testament *religion*. If so, how much less can I maintain that every passage that touches on science and, to a lesser degree, on *history*, is faultless and absolutely trustworthy?”<sup>65</sup> As for much higher criticism, however, he rejected it. The historical critics, he maintained, only dealt with “the Bible corpse,” and such historical scholarship “leads great numbers of them to wholly give up reading it devotionally, from this they backslide into denying and explaining away the supernatural, which is, of course, to deny Christianity.” For Smith, this critical approach to Scripture can be beneficial only “in literary and intellectual spheres,” but it could “contribute nothing spiritually.”<sup>66</sup>

Smith accepted that some parts of the Bible contained plenary inspiration, such as Paul’s words in Acts 14:16.<sup>67</sup> He also believed in the supernatural events recorded in the Bible, including the virgin birth, resurrection, and ascension:

Belief in the “supernatural” is as easy to me as belief in my own existence, and I have not the least desire to account for or explain away any “miracle” recorded in Scripture; for if I ask myself, What limit am I to place on the possibilities of an Infinite God working miraculously, or (as some would put it) working it accordance with law only known to Himself? I see the question to be as vainly absurd as it is irreverent.<sup>68</sup>

### 3.4.3 Stanley Smith’s Controversial Views on Universal Salvation

After several years of service with the China Inland Mission, Stanley Smith was drawn to a belief in universal salvation, and this eventually led to the end of his connection with the CIM. Later, Smith wrote some books which reflected his universalist beliefs, including *All Shall Know Me*, *The Sequel to “For God and For China,”* *‘The Spiritual Condition of the Heathen’: A Reply to Mr. Henry W. Frost*,

---

<sup>65</sup> Stanley Peregrine Smith, *Reply Letters ... to R.F. Johnston’s Letters to A Missionary* (Shanghai, 1919), 7-8.

<sup>66</sup> *Ibid.*, 13.

<sup>67</sup> *Ibid.*, 31.

<sup>68</sup> *Ibid.*, 39.

*Director of the China Inland Mission in North America and Reply Letters...to R. F. Johnston's Letters to A Missionary.*

Smith drew upon Scripture in support of the doctrine of universal salvation. In interpreting John 12:32 ("I, if I be lifted up from the earth, will draw ALL MEN unto Myself"), he argued that this meant that "All are finally to be drawn to *Himself*, His person, as the actual, and not potential, Saviour of the entire human race."<sup>69</sup> Therefore, "God *glorified* in the *endless joy of all His creatures* is the essence of the gospel, and the deepest truth of Christianity."<sup>70</sup> He further insisted that Hebrews 8:12 taught "nothing less than *the final salvation of the whole human race.*" He claimed that although, "Special privileges of the 'so great salvation' will ever attach to the 'first-fruits of His creatures'," ultimately, "all will be blessed, in the sense of being, at last, 'reconciled to God'."<sup>71</sup> This "principle of universal salvation," which according to Smith was included in the covenant of grace based on Col 1: 20, "extends the reconciling power of 'the blood of the Cross' to the whole fallen angelic world."<sup>72</sup>

The corollary of universal salvation was the rejection of the doctrine of eternal punishment. He argued that this doctrine had resulted from an erroneous interpretation of the word "eternal" in Greek as "endless." For Smith, the word "eternal" meant "'pertaining' or 'belonging to' either of the two great 'eternities' or 'ages' – 'the present age,' or 'the age to come' - which are mentioned in Scripture; and it does not *necessarily* mean lasting right through either of these ages."<sup>73</sup> To support his argument, 1 Cor. 15:28 was considered "the most sublime, most important, and most all-embracing phrase in Scripture."<sup>74</sup> Since "all in all" could be interpreted as "everything in everybody," Smith stated that

This magnificent climax and "end" of revealed religion makes endless punishment *impossible* for me to accept; for, from that view, should it not be

---

<sup>69</sup> Stanley Peregrine Smith, *All Shall Know Me* (London & Wakefield: Nicholson & Sons, 1909), 89–90.

<sup>70</sup> *Ibid.*, 86.

<sup>71</sup> *Ibid.*, 14.

<sup>72</sup> Stanley Smith, *Reply Letters*, 3.

<sup>73</sup> Stanley Smith, *All Shall Know Me*, 33.

<sup>74</sup> *Ibid.*, 41–2.

said that God will be “all” in *some* only? He is “all,” both “in” the saved, and “to” them; but “to” those myriads of millions in supposed endless estrangement from Him, and heart hatred of Him, he is surely not their “all,” and *nothing* “in” them besides.<sup>75</sup>

Furthermore, as to the phrase “eternal punishment,” Smith argued that it means, “Scripturally, nothing more or less than *corrective punishment belonging to the future age* ...however prolonged, designed for *final* good, and *in no case* absolutely endless.”<sup>76</sup>

Smith believed that Christ's atonement was enjoyed by all people. In his view, “that *confidence in the atonement* will finally be begotten by God's Spirit in the hearts of all, I take to be certain; for Scripture dogmatically asserts that ‘every knee will bow *in the name of Saviour,*’ and no *unbeliever* can possibly do that.” He proceeded to expound this conception more fully: “Thus the atonement has provided a means whereby God could safely bestow ‘mercy upon all’ without dishonouring His broken law; and in the Divine *economy*, by substituting the sufferings of Christ, who is God, for the *endless penal* suffering of the whole race.”<sup>77</sup>

Smith later recalled that he had struggled over this issue since 1899, sparked by a position expounded by “an endless hellist archbishop,” [that is, an archbishop who believed in an endless hell] which Smith deemed to be “biased and untrue.”<sup>78</sup> Smith was also disturbed by the idea that a vast number of people who had never heard the gospel would go to hell:

I doubt if *one hundred and some thousand millions* would be beyond the mark. Leaving the odd thousand millions for an *extremely* liberal estimate of the number who have been saved to holiness before God in *this* life; we have remaining *a hundred thousand million* who have died, unsanctified, and, therefore, unsaved. Now how does Christianity attempt to deal with this problem of human destiny? Unless it can be fairly and squarely faced and answered, Christianity must cease to have any claim to be called a universal religion.<sup>79</sup>

---

<sup>75</sup> Ibid., 42–3.

<sup>76</sup> Stanley Peregrine Smith, *The Sequel to “For God and For China”* (Shanghai: Commercial Press, 1919), 23–4.

<sup>77</sup> Ibid., 57–8.

<sup>78</sup> Ibid., 60.

<sup>79</sup> Ibid., i.

In this way it is clear that Smith's missionary work in China was a significant influence on his changing theology. Whereas to Hudson Taylor his vision of a million a month dying without Christ was a profound motivation to mission, to Smith it suggested the failure of mission and drove him to a wider hope. The concept of an endless hell was difficult to reconcile with the goodness of God. In response to the Rev. J. Walter Lowrie of the American Presbyterian Mission, Shanghai, who had attacked Smith's disbelief in an endless hell in his "Now or Never," Smith wrote:

I have long thought that this great subject, as to Scripture exegesis, depends largely on our *fundamental conceptions of God*. Is God Perfect and Infinite Love, and Perfect and Infinite Goodness, or is He a Being who proposes for His own rule of conduct an infinitely lower standard than He sets up for His creatures to attain? Will His final victory over evil be that of "overcoming evil with good," or of adding infinite evil to temporary evil? "Unmerciful" is the last of the black category of sins recorded in Rom. 1: 29-31; if an *absolutely endless* hell be part of God's programme for a *hundred thousand millions* of "His offspring," will Dr Lowrie show me how the sneer of the infidel is to be rebutted, when he says that the God of the Bible and Christians is a Being who is *infinitely* unmerciful?<sup>80</sup>

One argument was that belief in universal salvation would "cool" the missionary spirit, an argument that Smith rejected.<sup>81</sup> "The unspeakable gains of forgiveness of a guilty past," "acceptance with God," and "a life of holy devotion to Him and His cause," were sufficient missionary motives.<sup>82</sup> He maintained that the concept of an endless hell had nothing to do with the missionary motivation; "Indeed one of the keenest men I ever knew in China on endless torment, was a man who hardly ever moved out of his study to save souls."<sup>83</sup> Smith then elaborated his own missionary motivations as follows:

- (1) The love of Christ to me, and mine to Him.
- (2) The command of Christ to preach the gospel to every creature.
- (3) The sense of the awfulness of the *present* sin, sickness, and misery, and the sense of duty to do all I can in the Name of Jesus and in the power of His Spirit to save them *now*.

---

<sup>80</sup> Ibid., 8–9.

<sup>81</sup> Ibid., 89.

<sup>82</sup> Stanley Peregrine Smith, 'The Spiritual Condition of the Heathen': A Reply to Mr. Henry W. Frost, *Director of the China Inland Mission in North America* (Shanghai: Commercial Press, [n.d.]), 18.

<sup>83</sup> Ibid., 20.

- (4) And lastly, the knowledge that what men sow they must reap; and that, if they die impenitent, an awful – because perfectly just, but in no case endless – punishment awaits them in the future state.<sup>84</sup>

Belief in universal salvation did not weaken Smith's belief in holiness teachings. Of the five promises of Jehovah which Smith believed to be included in the covenant of grace, two of them were a promise of Divine help to secure holiness of heart and a promise which includes the *principle* of universal salvation.<sup>85</sup> Furthermore, he affirmed that the new covenant leads to "a higher ideal," which held that "no destiny is seen to be nobler than the yielding up of our wills to the furtherance of the Divine plan."<sup>86</sup> He also referred to William Law, the universalist who authored one of the classic spiritual works, *A Serious Call to a Devout Life*; his example showed that the doctrine "offers no hindrance whatever to a holy life."<sup>87</sup>

Smith's eschatological view reflected a growing distrust among many Christians in nineteenth-century Britain toward the doctrine of eternal punishment. This suspicion was partly due to the awareness brought by British imperialism that Christian believers were only "a minority of the world's population."<sup>88</sup> Such figures as F. D. Maurice, a liberal Anglican, and Henry Bristow Wilson, one of the contributors to *Essays and Reviews*, questioned this doctrine of hell. Maurice was dismissed from his professorial chair at King's College, London, because of his controversial view.<sup>89</sup> T.R. Birks, who was secretary of the Evangelical Alliance, held similar views on hell to Smith, as did some other evangelicals. Birks resigned as Secretary of the Evangelical Alliance in 1870 because of his views, although he did not resign his membership.<sup>90</sup> Stanley Smith might have been one of those "honest

---

<sup>84</sup> Ibid.

<sup>85</sup> Other promises were the forgiveness of sins; a promise of the supply of all need, now and hereafter; and a promise of divine help to secure loyal-hearted service, see Smith, *Reply Letters*, 2.

<sup>86</sup> Stanley Smith, *All Shall Know Me*, 22.

<sup>87</sup> Stanley Smith, *The Sequel to "For God and For China,"* 75.

<sup>88</sup> Brown, *Providence and Empire*, 228.

<sup>89</sup> Geoffrey Rowell, *Hell and the Victorians: A Study of the Nineteenth-Century Theological Controversies Concerning Eternal Punishment and the Future Life* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1974), 1; Brown, *Providence and Empire*, 228.

<sup>90</sup> *Biographical Dictionary of Evangelicals*, s.v. "T.R. Birks."

doubters” who could not believe that a just and loving God could “impose eternal torment upon any creature.”<sup>91</sup>

Within the CIM, Stanley Smith was not alone in refuting the notion of endless punishment. Smith mentioned several names who held a similar eschatological view, such as Mr. Heinrich Witt, a member of CIM China Council, and Miss Coxon, who served in a CIM Girls’ School.<sup>92</sup> William Sharp, a lawyer who joined the CIM as a member of the London Council in 1878, also held such views.<sup>93</sup>

It was Henry W. Frost, the Director of the CIM in North America, who insisted that Stanley Smith must resign over to his controversial views. Frost’s involvement shows the increased influence of North American theological approaches, together with premillennial influences, on the CIM. Whereas Hudson Taylor took a less confrontational approach, Frost was shaped by the strong emphasis on eternal punishment. In 1902 Frost persuaded the London Council to agree to alter the doctrinal basis of the Principle & Practice, and to change the word “eternal” in eternal punishment into “endless” or “unending,” Sharp protested against the proposal and threatened to resign if the alteration was accepted by Hudson Taylor. Smith even claimed that many missionaries in the CIM did not believe in endless punishment.<sup>94</sup> This issue was not new to the CIM. In 1872, William Thomas Berger, the manufacturer of Berger’s Rice Starch who had been the co-founder of the CIM with Hudson Taylor, resigned from the CIM owing to his belief in “non-eternity punishment” or “conditional immortality.”<sup>95</sup>

Hudson Taylor was aware of the Downgrade controversy initiated by C. H. Spurgeon among the Baptists over doctrinal declension, and himself spoke in 1890 of a ‘downgrade’ on the missionary field with reference to the Larger Hope, and the non-eternity of punishment, and vagueness on the inspiration of scripture.<sup>96</sup> One of

---

<sup>91</sup> Brown, *Providence and Empire*, 228.

<sup>92</sup> Stanley Smith, *The Sequel to “For God and For China,”* 42, 54.

<sup>93</sup> A. J. Broomhall, *Assault on the Nine*, 6:174.

<sup>94</sup> Stanley Smith, *The Sequel to “For God and For China,”* 31.

<sup>95</sup> Austin, *China’s Millions*, 62–3, 188–9.

<sup>96</sup> Wigram, *Bible and Mission*, 188. For the discussion of the Downgrade Controversy, see Mark Hopkins, *Nonconformity’s Romantic Generation: Evangelical and Liberal Theologies in Victorian*

the issues confronting missionaries was the eternal fate of the vast numbers dying in China and elsewhere without ever hearing the gospel. At the Ecumenical Missionary Conference in 1900, Taylor asserted that those who died having heard the gospel without believing were without hope; but those who had not heard the message could also not be pardoned and forgiven because of the consequences of their sin.<sup>97</sup>

In 1899, Smith informed Taylor of his views, “in a letter of forty odd pages of close reasoning from Scripture.”<sup>98</sup> While in Geneva in the autumn 1901, Taylor began to study “‘voluminous pages’ from Stanley Smith, as well as a paper from Handley Moule, Bishop of Durham, refuting Smith’s views on ‘conditional immortality’ and ‘final restoration of unbelievers.’”<sup>99</sup> On 1 October 1901, Taylor wrote to Smith to say that he was in fact judging God and telling Him what He must do in matters of judgement and punishment, as well as presenting God as inconsistent and not morally perfect in the matter of eternal punishment.<sup>100</sup> “With much love and deep sympathy with you,” Taylor added, “it is with real pain and distress that I have to come to the conclusion that unless you can further recede from the position you have taken, your return to China in the CIM could not be for harmonious working.”<sup>101</sup>

In July 1902, Smith sent “two very long letters” to Dixon Hoste and Hudson Taylor, defending his theological position on final restoration.<sup>102</sup> While Hoste remained firm in his decision to dismiss Smith, Hudson Taylor was less certain, believing the issue of everlasting punishment was not of the same status as the divinity of Christ or his atonement. While he felt Smith’s views were “wild and

---

*England* (Carlile: Paternoster Press, 2004), 193-248; Bebbington, *Evangelicalism in Modern Britain*, 145-6.

<sup>97</sup> D. Bliss (ed) *Report of Ecumenical Missionary Conference*, 1900, 90, quoted in Wigram, *Bible and Mission*, 188.

<sup>98</sup> Stanley Smith, *The Sequel to “For God and For China,”* 31.

<sup>99</sup> A. J. Broomhall, *It Is Not Death To Die*, 7:491.

<sup>100</sup> Wigram, *Bible and Mission*, 189.

<sup>101</sup> James Hudson Taylor, “Letter from J. Hudson Taylor to S. Smith,” September 30, 1901, CIM/SOAS, file 502.

<sup>102</sup> Stanley Smith, *The Sequel to “For God and For China,”* 32.

unscriptural,” he also described Smith as a “good fellow.”<sup>103</sup> The pain at losing one of the star names of the Cambridge Seven was real. This attitude can be seen in Hudson Taylor’s letter to William Sharp on 6 March 1903:

What I feel a mistake, in the formation of the Mission, was the assumption that views on Eschatology were fundamental. I now see that they are neither fundamental to salvation, nor to the Christian life and do not at all stand on the same footing as the divinity of Christ or His atoning sacrifice. I believe the time will come when it will be possible to admit toleration as far as Eschatology is concerned...If all our brethren could see things as I do, Stanley Smith might be allowed to have a station to himself, on the essential principle of the Mission that it is better to get Chinamen saved than to have them heathen.<sup>104</sup>

Smith claimed that, “it must have been about autumn, 1902, that Mr. Hudson Taylor himself, *admittedly*, modified his views.”<sup>105</sup> If so, it was likely that Smith’s long exposition of the eschatological view had helped to alter Taylor’s position.

But if Hudson Taylor had indeed modified his view as Stanley Smith claimed, this does not mean that Taylor’s eschatology became identical with that of Smith. Taylor himself still believed in an endless punishment, although not as firmly as before. In his letter concerning “the future conduct of the Mission” to Theodore Howard on New Year’s Day 1903, Hudson Taylor admitted that the word “aionios,” which was translated as eternal in the English Bible, was “not necessarily equivalent of endless.” On the other hand, Taylor considered that the Scriptures do not “hold out any hope for those who die impenitent.”<sup>106</sup> In responding to Henry Frost when he withdrew his decision to resign from the CIM, Taylor wrote on 29 September 1903 that “We all believe with yourself – Mr Hoste and I and the other departmental Directors – in everlasting punishment: there is no controversy, no shadow of a controversy among us about any of the fundamental truth.”<sup>107</sup>

Nevertheless, he viewed Stanley Smith as a brother with a weaker faith: “The only

---

<sup>103</sup> Wigram, *Bible and Mission*, 190.

<sup>104</sup> James Hudson Taylor, “Letter from J. Hudson Taylor to W. Sharp,” March 6, 1903, CIM/SOAS, file 502; Smith, *The Sequel to “For God and For China,”* 32.

<sup>105</sup> Stanley Smith, *The Sequel to “For God and For China,”* 32.

<sup>106</sup> James Hudson Taylor, “Letter from J. Hudson Taylor to Theodore Howard,” January 1, 1903, CIM/SOAS, file 506.

<sup>107</sup> James Hudson Taylor, “Draft Letter of J. Hudson Taylor to H. Frost,” September 29, 1903, CIM/SOAS, file 502.

little detail on which you and we do not see perfectly eye to eye – is ... in distinguishing between clear fundamental heterodoxy, and weak orthodoxy. That is all.” Taylor thus stated his attitude toward Smith’s case: “From a heretic, if confirmed, we must separate, that is clear; but from a brother that is weak in his faith, no. Let us confirm his hands that hang down.”<sup>108</sup>

It was likely that Smith shared his theology of the ‘Larger Hope’ with other members of the Cambridge Seven. Smith suggested that Cassels held the same eschatological position. Smith expressed his disappointment to Dixon Hoste concerning the process of reformulating the CIM creed because “Dissenters, like Bishop Cassels and others, were not consulted.”<sup>109</sup> Smith also shared his view with Cecil Polhill, writing in October 1902 that, “I feel I have got a splendid gospel for China. Their ancestors have not all gone to an endless hell. No!”<sup>110</sup> Smith, then, was undoubtedly influenced by his exposure to the needs of China in his mission in Asia. He argued that teaching universal salvation could make the gospel much more appealing to the Chinese who had a Confucian obligation to respect their ancestors, who would otherwise be utterly lost, which did not seem the act of a merciful God. This teaching could make the good news and the Chinese moral imperative go hand in hand. This further supports the suggestion that the Chinese context was shaping aspects of his theology. According to Henry Frost, Smith’s deviation from eschatological orthodoxy was caused by his long engagement with “the mystery of the Christless multitudes of heathenism,” which led to his “unintentional mistake of interpreting the Scriptures by heathenism rather than heathenism by the Scriptures.”<sup>111</sup> The consequence of Smith’s holding to universalism, as has been noted earlier, was his being forced to resign from the CIM in 1904.<sup>112</sup>

---

<sup>108</sup> Ibid.

<sup>109</sup> Stanley Smith, *The Sequel to “For God and For China,”* 51.

<sup>110</sup> Usher, “For China and Tibet,” 135.

<sup>111</sup> Quoted in Austin, *China’s Millions*, 225.

<sup>112</sup> Austin, *China’s Millions*, 447.

### 3.4.4 The Cambridge Seven and Pentecostalism

Leigh Goodwin, in discussing the link between the fullness of the Holy Spirit stressed by the Cambridge Seven and early twentieth-century Pentecostal missionary practice, argued that the Cambridge Seven, whose conception and experience of being filled by the Spirit was shaped by D. L. Moody and Hudson Taylor, in turn influenced the formation of the Pentecostal Missionary Union, the first Pentecostal missionary organisation.<sup>113</sup> Goodwin, however, overlooked the influence of the holiness movement in shaping the religious life of the Cambridge Seven. Chapter two has already shown that a few Keswick missionaries moved towards Pentecostalism. Moreover, while Goodwin discussed the importance of Cecil Polhill in the foundation of the first Pentecostal mission, he insisted that all the Cambridge Seven were important missionary figures who influenced its formation. As shall be discussed, apart from Cecil Polhill, there was no evidence that other members of the Cambridge Seven supported Pentecostalism. The fact that Cecil Polhill resigned from the CIM suggests that Hoste as its highest leader was not entirely friendly to the Pentecostal movement.

Cecil Polhill was drawn to a connection between the baptism of the Holy Spirit and speaking in tongues when – on his journey to Hanzhong with C. T. Studd and his brother, Arthur – he met Griffith John, an influential LMS missionary, at Hankou.<sup>114</sup> Griffith John claimed to have experienced a Pentecostal gift of the ability to speak Mandarin and he perhaps shared his story with the Polhill brothers and Studd.<sup>115</sup> The meeting made such a deep impression that, when going up the Han River, all three stopped studying language books and gave “themselves to prayer” for the supernatural gift of Chinese speech. However, they received no such gift, and had to acquire Mandarin through study. Hudson Taylor warned them to beware

---

<sup>113</sup> Goodwin, “The Pneumatological Motivation,” 38.

<sup>114</sup> Usher, “For China and Tibet,” 62–3.

<sup>115</sup> Noel Gibbard, *Griffith John: Apostle to Central China* (Bridgend: Bryntirion, 1998), 93.

of Satan's wiles "to keep the Chinese ignorant of the gospel."<sup>116</sup> However, Cecil Polhill remained open to the spirit gift of speaking in tongues.

Polhill was interested in the concept of revivalism as well. John Usher provides evidence of a letter from J. C. Hall, a CIM missionary, in which he thanked Polhill for sending him a book entitled *Revival Sermons in Outline: With Thoughts, Themes and Plans: By Eminent Pastors and Evangelists*, edited by Christopher Perren.<sup>117</sup> The book consisted of two main parts: the first part discussed the theory of organising a revival; and the second part provided a number of sermon outlines preached by such prominent revivalist preachers as D. L. Moody, Charles Spurgeon, Charles Finney, and Reuben Torrey. Polhill's interest in revivalism found expression in his fascination with the Welsh revival of 1904-05 and the Azusa Street Mission in Los Angeles; he visited Wales in 1906 and Los Angeles in 1908. He also donated £10 to Evan Roberts in January 1905 and donated £1500 to help with the mortgage of the Azusa Street mission building in 1908.<sup>118</sup>

According to Usher, Cecil Polhill probably attended the meetings of Evan Roberts at Caernarvonshire, North Wales, between 6 December and 14 January 1906. This visit might have become a spiritually formative experience for him. Afterwards, he claimed to have the gift of spiritual laughter in Bedford.<sup>119</sup> In September 1906, his brother, Arthur wrote to him about the charismatic aspects of revivals:

I never said very much in reply to your letter in the Spring- Containing the account of your uncontrollable laughter in prayer meeting; I waited to hear of further developments ...- I'm told the results amongst the unconverted have not been large & now it forms a split amongst the Lord's own people... From observation I have noticed how the most earnest Christians are tempted to go into excess -... we remember our own youthful experiences on the Han river! Now over 21 years ago! & we know that the devil comes also as an angel of light to tempt us...I have had two sad cases of religious earnestness leading to

---

<sup>116</sup> A. J. Broomhall, *Assault on the Nine*, 6:375.

<sup>117</sup> Usher, "For China and Tibet," 152.

<sup>118</sup> *Ibid.*, 151, 165.

<sup>119</sup> Usher pointed out that the "prayer meeting" Arthur referred to was probably held in Bedford. (*ibid.*, 153-4).

mental trouble...These tragedies were all enacted under the impression of being filled with the Spirit.<sup>120</sup>

Arthur Polhill's comment reflected the views of conservative evangelicals toward unusual religious manifestations. He warned Cecil of their danger and reminded him of Hudson Taylor's rebuke of their advocating the speaking in tongues after the incident along Han River back in 1885.

Early in 1908 Cecil Polhill experienced another significant spiritual experience, when he travelled to Los Angeles. There he met George Brown Studd, the younger brother of C. T. Studd, and together they attended the Azusa Street mission between 19 January and 2 February. After he fasted for a month, Polhill claimed to have a Pentecostal experience at the home of the "simple, earnest believing" Mr and Mrs Riggs. The diary of G. B. Studd revealed that on 1 February 1908, "Spent the day at Rigg's. Cecil got his baptism."<sup>121</sup> Two days later, Polhill wrote:

On Monday, February 3<sup>rd</sup>, 1908, He [God] satisfied the longing soul and filled the hungry soul with goodness... Acting on a few simple instructions given in the Spirit, combined with words of promise, I yielded my mouth, and gave my voice; in doing so, was twice filled with laughter and sent to the floor. Then the Lord spoke through me in a new tongue, making use of body and hands in gesture, for about a minute.<sup>122</sup>

This experience of spiritual outburst was similar with that in Bedford. The difference was that this time the spiritual laughter led to his new experience of speaking in tongues. Polhill understood this whole new spiritual experience was the baptism of the Holy Spirit.

A few years later, Stanley Smith was reported to experience the *glossolalia*, that is, to speak in tongues. In January 1911 it was reported that

Mr Smith received the message from the dear Lord that he would baptize him on January 17th and praise God that very night during the waiting meeting the Holy Ghost took complete control of his tongue but having the wisdom that cometh from above, he was not content, but earnestly sought a deeper and fuller manifestation of the abiding of the Triune God.<sup>123</sup>

---

<sup>120</sup> Ibid., 154.

<sup>121</sup> Ibid., 166.

<sup>122</sup> Ibid.

<sup>123</sup> Ibid., 246–7.

Polhill later formulated a pneumatology, in which he made a clear distinction between the baptism of the Holy Ghost and the holiness in the Spirit: “the former power and fire, the latter beauty of life, likeness to the Lord; the former divine energy; the latter quiet restful victory.” Since “a holy life may be powerless in utterance, in liberty, in results; like a beautiful form, but anaemic and lacking physical vigour,” he asserted that if the world needs evangelisation and if Britain needs to recover its Christianity, then “we emphatically insist that in sanctification alone, however essential, as it undoubtedly is, however beautiful to men and well pleasing to God, is in face of this appalling world need and world problem, is utterly insufficient and absolutely fails.” Therefore, he believed, the baptism of the Spirit was greatly needed. This spiritual experience must be “sought, prayed for, waited for, claimed, and no stone left unturned ... until the enduement is given.”<sup>124</sup>

Although Polhill experienced the speaking in tongues, he did not consider it to be the initial sign of the baptism of the Spirit. At the Sunderland Conference of 1914, he asserted that

They should receive indeed the baptism of the Holy Ghost with power, but no direct statement that He should be received with tongues. Therefore they could not definitely go about the world and say, 'You shall receive the Holy Ghost with tongues' ... they must be careful not to go one word beyond what scripture actually commanded lest they should be a stumbling block to some.<sup>125</sup>

On 9 January 1909, together with Alexander A. Boddy, Anglican Vicar of All Saints Church, Sunderland, Polhill founded The Pentecostal Missionary Union (PMU) for Great Britain and Ireland.<sup>126</sup> He was also the treasurer of the PMU and in October 1909 was elected to become the President. From 1910 to 1914, most of the missionaries of the PMU were sent to the borders of Tibet.<sup>127</sup>

Cecil Polhill’s influence on British Pentecostalism was significant. He made considerable donations to promote the Pentecostal movement, such as supporting PMU colleges and students, and financing *Confidence*, the first British Pentecostal

---

<sup>124</sup> Cecil Polhill, “Flames of Fire with Which Is Incorporated Tidings from Tibet and Other Lands,” October 1912.

<sup>125</sup> Ibid., 324.

<sup>126</sup> *Biographical Dictionary of Christian Mission*, s.v. “Polhill, Cecil H.”.

<sup>127</sup> Usher, “For China and Tibet,” 126, 241.

periodical, which had been launched in April 1908 by A. A. Boddy. As a member of the famous Cambridge Seven, his support to Pentecostalism brought “prestige and respect” to the movement.<sup>128</sup> Furthermore, he brought structure to the Pentecostal missions that followed. According to Usher, his way of organising the PMU “demonstrated to the Pentecostal movement how to run a mission professionally,” hence forming a new benchmark for Pentecostal missions.<sup>129</sup> The influence of Hudson Taylor and his CIM was reflected in PMU’s multid denominational feature and its faith principle of not guaranteeing salary to its missionaries.<sup>130</sup>

In July 1915, Polhill resigned from the CIM due to its lack of support for the Pentecostal movement. A year before, the CIM had decided to forbid the use of its buildings for Pentecostal meetings. Further, the CIM refused to accept or retain any missionaries who considered speaking in tongues to be a necessary sign of the baptism of the Spirit. On January 1925, Polhill also resigned from the PMU Council.<sup>131</sup>

In summary, the Pentecostal movement was vital in the spiritual journey of Cecil Polhill. His deep interest in Griffith John’s Pentecostal experience and in the literature on revivalism led him to visit the scenes of the Welsh revival and also of the Azusa Street Mission in Los Angeles, which subsequently led to his experience of spiritual laughter and speaking in tongues. This experience seemed to shape his theology of the Spirit’s baptism, which he came to believe was even more important than holiness in empowering Christian service. Polhill strongly asserted that while it was very important, the life of holiness was insufficient for effective evangelisation. Some decisions taken by the CIM in 1914, which showed its disapproval of Pentecostalism, made Polhill stand down from the Mission.

It is worth noting that although Stanley Smith and Cecil Polhill left the CIM over theological disagreements, both continued to affirm the importance of

---

<sup>128</sup> Ibid., 341.

<sup>129</sup> Ibid., 345.

<sup>130</sup> Peter Kay, “The Pentecostal Missionary Union and the Fourfold Gospel with Baptism in the Holy Spirit and Speaking in Tongues: A New Power for Missions?” *Journal of the European Pentecostal Theological Association* 19, no. 1 (1999), 90

<sup>131</sup> Usher, “For China and Tibet,” 335, 337

holiness for Christian ministry. Smith believed that there was no incompatibility between the belief of “Larger Hope” and the life of holiness. Holy living was not only useful for strengthening Christian witness to non-believers, but an ideal that every Christian must manifest in his/her daily life and one reason for active evangelisation. For Cecil Polhill, before his Pentecostal experience, holiness of life, together with power for service, was necessary for effective missionary work. Both could be obtained only by being filled by the Spirit. After his spiritual ecstatic experience, nevertheless, Polhill placed a new emphasis on the baptism of the Spirit. Without this new spiritual experience, holiness was beautiful, but powerless. According to Peter Kay, Polhill’s legacy through the PMU was to demonstrate that “Pentecostalism was linked with world mission rather than the inner world of religious experience alone.”<sup>132</sup>

The influence of the China mission context should also be noted. The size of the task of mission in China, and the slow progress being made, encouraged some to look for a repetition of the original Day of Pentecost experience, which went beyond what could be achieved by human efforts alone. Openness to Pentecostalism was also encouraged by local Chinese Christianity, in which spiritual warfare, prayer for healings, and exorcism featured, as shall be seen later in this chapter.

#### 3.4.5 Assessment of Changing Theological Views on Holiness on the Mission Field

In *China’s Millions*, Alwyn Austin argued that by separating themselves from both theological liberals and Pentecostals, the CIM had shifted to a “militant fundamentalism.”<sup>133</sup> He pointed to Henry W. Frost, “a charter member of the emerging American fundamentalist movement,” as the main actor behind this shifting. Apart from influencing other CIM leaders to expel those who held liberal and Pentecostal views, Frost was also held responsible in withdrawing the CIM from the Associated Boards of Foreign Mission Societies of North America in 1917 to join

---

<sup>132</sup> Kay, *Pentecostal Missionary Union*, 99.

<sup>133</sup> Austin, *China’s Millions*, 443.

the Interdenominational Foreign Mission Association (IFMA), which was “a fundamentalist bastion.”<sup>134</sup> In 1926, the CIM withdrew from the National Christian Council (NCC) in China, whose theological position became increasingly liberal, after being a member for four years.

However, if what Austin meant by fundamentalism was “militantly anti-modernist Protestant evangelicalism” as defined by George Marsden, this labelling for the CIM would entail several problems.<sup>135</sup> In another essay, Marsden distinguished fundamentalism from evangelicalism: “Fundamentalists are a subtype of evangelicals and militancy is crucial to their outlook. Fundamentalists are not just religious conservatives, they are conservatives who are willing to take a stand and to fight.”<sup>136</sup> In light of this understanding, the CIM’s attempts to withdraw from some associations and dismiss some personnel could be seen as efforts to guard itself from modernist influence rather than actively to fight liberalism. According to Michael S. Hamilton, Henry W. Frost was among the key missionary leaders who “participated in no fundamentalist battles.”<sup>137</sup>

Furthermore, Hamilton pointed out that the IFMA was founded in response to a “perceived need” instead of to a “perceived threat,” because independent evangelical mission agencies were often rejected when they intended to cooperate with mission organizations from denominations.<sup>138</sup> Thus the IFMA did not fit well into the category of fundamentalist. In the case of the CIM’s withdrawal from the NCC, Kevin Xiyi Yao maintained that, “the CIM as a whole did not pursue a persistent policy of fighting modernism and never allowed its own attention and

---

<sup>134</sup> Ibid., 447.

<sup>135</sup> George M. Marsden, *Fundamentalism and American Culture: The Shaping of Twentieth Century Evangelicalism, 1870-1925* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1980), 4.

<sup>136</sup> George M. Marsden, *Understanding Fundamentalism and Evangelicalism* (Grand Rapids: W. B. Eerdmans, 1991), 1.

<sup>137</sup> Michael S. Hamilton, “The Interdenominational Evangelicalism of D. L. Moody and the Problem of Fundamentalism,” in *American Evangelicalism: George Marsden and the State of American Religious History*, ed. Darren Dochuk, Thomas S. Kidd, and Kurt W. Peterson (Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press, 2014), 263.

<sup>138</sup> Ibid., 260.

energy to be diverted from direct evangelism.”<sup>139</sup> Austin’s argument in categorizing the CIM as fundamentalist due to its opposition to Pentecostalism was also untenable, since Pentecostalism received some influence from fundamentalism, by adopting “anti-Modernist and anti-evolution rhetoric.”<sup>140</sup>

### 3.5. Mission Practices of the Cambridge Seven in Asia

#### 3.5.1. Particular Responses to Chinese Culture and Religion

##### *3.5.1.1 Ancestor Veneration*

In Chapter one, the gradual change in attitudes towards ancestor veneration in China among the Protestant missionary community was considered, especially through views expressed at the 1877 and 1890 General Missionary Conferences.<sup>141</sup> This was evident in the paper of W. A. P. Martin in the 1890 Conference entitled “The Worship of Ancestors – A Plea for Toleration.” He argued that “its objectionable features are its excess, not its essence,” and proposed to discourage any attempt to destroy “the system root and branch.”<sup>142</sup>

The CIM left it to Hudson Taylor to be their spokesman. Although Montagu Beauchamp, William Cassels and Dixon Hoste were present at the 1890 conference, they did not make any comment during the discussion. The CIM expected concurrence with the views of their founder, and so it can be assumed his views were their views. Taylor’s response was unequivocal and forthright, “I trust that all those who wish to raise an indignant protest against the conclusion of Dr Martin’s paper will signify it by rising,” and almost all delegates rose.<sup>143</sup> Taylor then condemned the whole practice of ancestral rites: “Ancestral worship is idolatry from beginning to end, the whole of it and everything connected with it. The worship of any being, except Jehovah, is immoral and contrary to God’s law. There

---

<sup>139</sup> Kevin Xiyi Yao, *The Fundamentalist Movement Among Protestant Missionaries in China, 1920-1937* (Lanham; Oxford: University Press of America, 2003), 204.

<sup>140</sup> Marsden, *Fundamentalism and American Culture*, 94.

<sup>141</sup> See Addison, “Chinese Ancestor-Worship and Protestant Christianity.”

<sup>142</sup> *Records of General Conference, 1890*, 625.

<sup>143</sup> *Ibid.*, 660.

can be no toleration of any worship except the worship of Jehovah, until we revise the Ten Commandments.”<sup>144</sup>

This CIM view was supported by other Protestant missionaries. A. Elwin, a CMS missionary in Hangchow, believed that, “The Lord Himself made it narrow,” and that the practice cannot be tolerated since the Chinese did the duty only out of fear.<sup>145</sup> J. C. Gibson, a missionary from the English Presbyterian Mission, argued that the practice of ancestral rites arose “from a selfish fear of the dead.”<sup>146</sup> W. Muirhead, a LMS missionary in Shanghai, maintained that a toleration of the practice would be “most injurious to the interests of the Christian church.”<sup>147</sup>

Addison has suggested an important criticism of the CIM and other Protestant missionaries was their inability to qualify and distinguish the gradation of the term “worship” in Chinese culture. This, he argues, was due to a lack of interest or “sympathy” to study other religions.<sup>148</sup> Similarly, Pfister highlighted the contrast of the attitude between Hudson Taylor and Timothy Richard towards this issue, which was due to Taylor’s conflation of the Chinese term for ‘ancestor’ or ‘spirit’ with the biblical term for ‘God.’ Richard’s knowledge of Chinese culture and Ruist classics made him feel that ancestral rites were not “inherently idolatrous.”<sup>149</sup> Wigram asserted that while Taylor was not against Chinese literature, he did not think that “the time given to mastering it was worthwhile in the light of the urgency of mission.” Taylor’s belief in premillennialism saw him emphasising preaching as the way to “enlighten the Chinese mind.”<sup>150</sup>

However, Taylor’s intolerance toward the ancestral rites could demonstrate his practical way of thinking. Since most of Chinese converts were poorly educated, their commitment to practicing ancestral veneration was driven simply by the fear

---

<sup>144</sup> Ibid., 701.

<sup>145</sup> Ibid., 697.

<sup>146</sup> Ibid., 695.

<sup>147</sup> Ibid., 656.

<sup>148</sup> Addison, “Chinese Ancestor-Worship and Protestant Christianity,” 145.

<sup>149</sup> Lauren F. Pfister, “Rethinking Mission in China: James Hudson Taylor and Timothy Richard,” in *The Imperial Horizons of British Protestant Missions, 1880-1914*, Andrew Porter, ed. (Grand Rapids: Wm. B. Eerdmans, 2003), 211.

<sup>150</sup> Wigram, *Bible and Mission*, 191.

of hungry ghosts. This was evident from testimonies of some missionaries that it was the local Christians themselves who sometimes were most opposed to the practice. While Addison mentioned the possibility of their being “dominated by the convictions of the missionary,” these Chinese Christians were believed to conduct the rites out of fear, rather than filial piety, which led Taylor to conclude that the rites were practically about worshipping demons.<sup>151</sup>

A more sensitive, pastoral approach to the issue than blanket condemnation is seen in Pastor Hsi’s conversion to Christianity, after which he concluded that, “his sacred ancestral tables were no more worshipped.”<sup>152</sup> Geraldine Taylor’s account of Hsi’s life records resistance and horror from his family that he was no longer burning incense and paper to his ancestors, which was overcome when they recognised how much he had changed. However, it took him several months more to remove from his house a tablet bearing the name of his first wife, and thought to be tenanted by one of three spirits. Hsi recorded his struggle to deal with removing this until he found it fallen face down each morning with its base gnawed by rats – “the conviction grew on him that the whole system of ancestral worship was idolatrous and of the devil, and that as a Christian he could have nothing to do with it any more.” His policy with Chinese converts was a gradual one – sure that “ancestral worship is idolatry,” but that “there is much that is tender and beautiful connected with it: memories of the past, gratitude, reverence, and natural affection. We need to discriminate.” The issue, he insisted, was to be handled sensitively: “We need to be very careful in putting this question before young converts and inquirers.” He went on, “Great harm may be done by utterly condemning the best a man has known, before you make sure he has grasped something better.”<sup>153</sup>

---

<sup>151</sup> Addison, “Chinese Ancestor-Worship and Protestant Christianity,” 144.

<sup>152</sup> Mrs. Howard Taylor, *Pastor Hsi: One of China’s Christians* (London: Morgan & Scott, 1905), 4.

<sup>153</sup> *Ibid*, 28-9.

### 3.5.1.2 Footbinding

Another cultural practice encountered in China by the Cambridge Seven was that of footbinding. Although it was not a major issue for them, their opposition to it was similar to that of other Protestant missions, and they believed that renouncing the practice was evidence of genuine conversion. Stanley Smith and his wife reported how Mrs. Chang Ru-the (Ruth), who after hearing the gospel in public meetings and from Mrs. Smith in the women's meetings, was converted to Christianity. She then unbound her feet, although she was already a widow and did not have the right to do so. Two months later, she had to face her village elders and was beaten by her nephew for "disgracing the family name in following the foreigners."<sup>154</sup> Afterwards she was baptised.

In like manner, the wife of Pastor Hsi had desired to unbind her feet after becoming a believer. But Hsi forbade her for fear of being misunderstood by other believers who might perceive Christianity as "conformity to foreign customs" instead of "a change of heart." However, after Pastor Hsi's death, she decided to unbind her feet, as "a testimony to many of her weaker sisters."<sup>155</sup> Her action, according to Mildred Cable, inspired many other Christian women to do the same.

## 3.5.2 Overall Missionary Approaches in China

### 3.5.2.1 Evangelistic Preaching and Tract Distribution

According to Brian Stanley, the focus of the CIM was "the overriding task of evangelism."<sup>156</sup> This emphasis on the urgency of evangelism was furthered by premillennial thinking.<sup>157</sup> One significant proponent of this view was D. L. Moody, whose emphasis on "evangelism and holy living" was shaped by premillennial thinking.<sup>158</sup> This emphasis on the absolute priority of preaching and evangelism is

---

<sup>154</sup> "China's Millions, 1898," 28.

<sup>155</sup> A. Mildred Cable, *The Fulfilment of a Dream of Pastor Hsi's: The Story of the Work in Hwochow* (London: Morgan & Scott, 1917), 80.

<sup>156</sup> Stanley, "Home Support for Overseas Missions," 304.

<sup>157</sup> Cox, *British Missionary Enterprise*, 202

<sup>158</sup> Shaw, *Churches, Revolutions, and Empires*, 498.

evident in the work of the Cambridge Seven in China. Cassels's work in Paoning included giving 2,000 extracts from Scripture to all the shops in Paoning, Pachau, and Tsanghi Hien.<sup>159</sup> Stanley Smith was a highly effective evangelist, including in rural areas, and he also focussed on training evangelists.<sup>160</sup> Beauchamp was possibly the pre-eminent itinerant evangelist among the Cambridge Seven. He "loved the hard evangelistic journey,"<sup>161</sup> and claimed to do itinerant mission in China "very extensively."<sup>162</sup> In July 1888, he wrote from Paoning Fu that he had made five preaching tours. He distributed books, tracts, and "several hundred gospels," and one Sunday evening he also went out preaching in the streets "with a picture of Christ crucified for our banner."<sup>163</sup> In early 1889 Beauchamp spent fifteen days in itinerant preaching, during which he visited eighteen towns, preaching and selling books.<sup>164</sup>

Through this work, Beauchamp initiated missions at Kwei-chau Fu and at Miao-yu-tsao, in Szechwan. At Miao-yu-tsao, he was assisted by Siao, a colporteur from Chong-king. Beauchamp described his mission work:

Every morning at seven the daily Psalm and exposition, which has been a great source of blessing, generally lasted an hour. On market days I had a consecutive course of preaching from John's Gospel, in the morning from 11 to 12.30 and in the afternoon from 1.30 to 3. Again in the evenings from 7.30 to 9 I held a Bible Class, the subject of study being Mark's Gospel. On non-market days, Bible Class at 11 to 12.30, and public Gospel preaching 7.30 to 9. Each night I spoke consecutively from Genesis .... At times I have scarcely known how to close them, so great was the crowd and attention. I had literally thousands coming. There were people from Shen-si, Hu-peh, as well as Si-chuen, representing six counties in every direction, asking me to come and open Gospel Halls.<sup>165</sup>

Cecil Polhill similarly focussed on preaching in China. At Sining, the west of Kansuh, he and his wife spent three "happy years" of "preaching the Gospel, shepherding and teaching the flock, and visiting the Christian homes."<sup>166</sup> They also

---

<sup>159</sup> Austin, *China's Millions*, 36–7

<sup>160</sup> Pollock, *Cambridge Seven*, 107.

<sup>161</sup> *Ibid.*, 109.

<sup>162</sup> "China's Millions," 1894, 39.

<sup>163</sup> "China's Millions," 1888, 139.

<sup>164</sup> "China's Millions," 1889, 28.

<sup>165</sup> "China's Millions," 1904, 130.

<sup>166</sup> Polhill and Polhill, "Two Etonians," 120.

itinerated amongst the Tibetan nomadic peoples. In the time of annual fairs, they visited Kumbum, a monastery with 4,000 monks, preaching in the open-air there and distributed Tibetan and Chinese gospels.<sup>167</sup> In April 1889, they went to Taukor, where Polhill-Turner taught the gospel using the pattern of the “wordless book” on a little scroll, to Tibetans, Mongols, Chinese, and Muslims.<sup>168</sup>

In 1895 Cecil Polhill became leader of the Tibetan Mission Band (TMB), and maintained his focus on itinerant preaching and evangelism. On 20 June 1899, Cecil described his work in Ta-t sien-lu, on the Tibetan border as follows: “We have a regular work now in our little preaching hall on the other side of the river, and often have good audiences. Tuesday and Thursday evenings are in Chinese; Monday, Wednesday, and sometimes Friday mornings are for chats and addresses to Tibetans, when we can get them...On Sunday mornings we speak in both languages.”<sup>169</sup> Arthur Polhill followed his brother in itinerant preaching; in early 1890, he preached and distributed Christian tracts in some twenty markets in the neighbourhood.<sup>170</sup>

The emphasis on itinerant preaching as the primary means of promoting Christianity was not unique to the CIM. The American Presbyterian, John Nevius, asserted the same thing in his *Methods of Mission Work*, published in 1886.<sup>171</sup> He maintained that “the primary and ultimate work” of the missionary was to “use every possible mode of presenting Christian truth,” especially itinerant preaching.<sup>172</sup> The converts of the missionaries, he insisted, should learn the faith, and then teach it to others. This principle of self-propagation was important, as seen in Hoste’s work alongside Hsi in Shanxi, and John McCarthy of the CIM in Hangzhou.<sup>173</sup>

The itinerant preaching of the Cambridge Seven closely demonstrates the connection between holiness and mission, and reflects the influence of North

---

<sup>167</sup> “China’s Millions, 1893,” 106; Polhill and Polhill, “Two Etonians,” 124.

<sup>168</sup> “China’s Millions, 1889,” 134.

<sup>169</sup> “China’s Millions, 1900,” 23.

<sup>170</sup> “China’s Millions,” 1890, 81.

<sup>171</sup> J. Nevius, *Methods of Mission Work* (Shanghai: Presbyterian Press, 1886).

<sup>172</sup> J. Nevius, *China and the Chinese* (Philadelphia: Presbyterian Board of Publication, 1882), 367-9, quoted in Shaw, *Churches, Revolutions and Empires*, 420-1.

<sup>173</sup> A. J. Broomhall, *Not Death to Die*, 7:525.

American theological thinking in these areas, as promoted at events like the Niagara Conference. They were impelled by the view that Christ would return only after all had heard the gospel. Indeed, A.T. Pierson had argued in 1886 that, “the imminence of our Lord’s coming quickens activity.”<sup>174</sup>

### 3.5.2.2 *Work with Opium Addicts*

A significant issue encountered by the CIM missionaries in China was opium addiction, the extent of which, especially in Shanxi province, was discussed in Chapter 1. Their heavy involvement in opium refuges demonstrated their social concern, although their ultimate aim was that the addicts they helped would be converted to Christianity.

The harmful consequences of opium addiction were reported in the CIM periodical *China’s Millions* in 1876:

It is the source of poverty, wretchedness, disease and misery, unparalleled in... any other country. It debases the debased to the very lowest depths of degradation. It closes the eye to all pity. And the heart to all shame and sympathy. See that poor wretch with the emaciated frame; he has parted with his land, his house, his furniture, his children’s and his own clothing and bedding, and either sold his wife or hired her out for prostitution, and *all for opium*, to satisfy an insatiable appetite.”<sup>175</sup>

Soon after James Hudson Taylor arrived in China in 1854, he began witnessing the devastating effects of opium addiction. These included not only drug dependency, but also a large number of suicides and accidental deaths by overdose among opium addicts. Although Hudson Taylor expressed great reservations about social work in mission when millions had never heard the gospel, he found himself unable to ignore the plight of the addicts. After a large number of suicides in 1859 in Ningbo, where he had settled, he opened his first opium asylum. At once, he was overrun by people requesting help, and in three months 133 addicts were admitted. The asylum was not a success, as patients continued to smuggle opium in, or regressed back to addiction after discharge.<sup>176</sup> This failure did not prevent Hudson

---

<sup>174</sup> Robert, *Occupy Until I Come*, 133, 136.

<sup>175</sup> “China’s Millions, 1876,” 82, quoted in Austin, *China’s Millions*, 202-3

<sup>176</sup> Austin, *China’s Millions*, 76-7.

Taylor's CIM from making opium refuges an important part of their work, often as initial missionary outposts, from which tract distribution and preaching could eventually follow.

Missionaries were often called for when there had been an opium suicide or overdose. Harold Schofield, a missionary doctor with the CIM, reported forty cases in Taiyuan in 1882 alone. Of the six he was called to attend, he managed to save four.<sup>177</sup> In the years after the arrival of the Cambridge Seven, the work grew rapidly. By 1890, the CIM was running opium refuges in at least eight provinces, although some offered only a very basic level of shelter and care. These were often the first points of contact with local people. More overt missionary work, including Bible distribution and public preaching, followed once the ground had been prepared by work among opium addicts.<sup>178</sup>

Various approaches were developed to help addicts deal with the physical effects of withdrawal. Despite their holiness beliefs on the power of the Holy Spirit through prayer, the CIM generally adopted a combination of medicines, especially morphine, combined with prayer and Bible reading, as the best way to help addicts to break their addiction. W.G Peat of the CIM attempted to cure addicts without the use of morphine, encouraging prayer and the addicts simply to "hold out." But only two addicts in a hundred managed to withstand the pain of withdrawal, and so he resorted to the use of morphine.<sup>179</sup>

The CIM's most successful work with addicts was led by Hsi Liao-chih (Pastor 'Shengmo' Hsi), who was a converted opium addict, with a background in Confucian scholarship. The family of Hsi had run a Chinese medical business, and he developed his own range of medical treatments in his work with addicts, which seem to have included morphine. He employed Chinese Christians as refuge keepers, and ran a strict regime combining medical treatment alongside prayer, Bible reading and preaching. Through Hsi's work, some 45 opium refuges were started in four

---

<sup>177</sup> Ibid., 243.

<sup>178</sup> Ibid., 246-8.

<sup>179</sup> Ibid., 368.

provinces of north-western China. Hsi claimed to have treated over 300,000 addicts, although most of this was through the work of others in his refuges, and the extravagant figure must be treated with some caution.<sup>180</sup>

So impressive was Hsi as an inspirational leader that the Cambridge Seven decided to put themselves under his direction when they arrived in China. At a time when, as the studies of Porter have shown, holiness-influenced missionaries in Africa were struggling to work under non-white leaders, it was a notable act. They did not find Hsi an easy person to work with, and for some the connection was short. However, they learned from his methods, and sought to put them into practice. Stanley Smith was in 1886 asked by Hsi to help him open an opium refuge in the city of Hungtung, a county city north of Pingyang.<sup>181</sup> Similarly, Beauchamp spent time in 1886 serving in an opium refuge in Sihchau.<sup>182</sup> Cassels at Paoning also ran an opium refuge, and on 30 September 1889, he reported that he was caring for twelve opium patients.<sup>183</sup>

In 1889 Studd was reported to have opened up an opium-refuge at Lungan Fu, which was joined by sixty or seventy men.<sup>184</sup> A year later he was encouraged by the number of opium addicts who had been "cured" in the refuge.<sup>185</sup> According to Norman Grubb, this work of opium-refuge occupied "a great deal of Mr. Studd's time." Within seven years around "800 of these men and women passed through the Refuge, and some went away saved as well as cured."<sup>186</sup>

It was Dixon Hoste, Hudson Taylor's eventual successor, who worked most closely and consistently with Hsi. Hoste brought balance and stability to Hsi's work. They regularly prayed and consulted together, and as Hsi noted "We mutually help one another, without any distinction of native or foreigner, because the Lord has made us one."<sup>187</sup> From Hungtung, Hoste wrote in May 1889 that, during the

---

<sup>180</sup> Austin, *China's Millions*, 14.

<sup>181</sup> *Ibid.*, 283.

<sup>182</sup> "China's Millions," 1886, 124.

<sup>183</sup> "China's Millions," 1889, 26.

<sup>184</sup> "China's Millions, 1892," 90.

<sup>185</sup> "China's Millions, 1890," 104.

<sup>186</sup> Grubb, *C. T. Studd*, 80.

<sup>187</sup> Austin, *China's Millions*, 173; A. J. Broomhall, *Not Death to Die*, 7:245.

previous six months, over 400 people had been helped to overcome their opium addiction. Further, more than twenty families had got rid of their household idols and began to study Scripture, while more than 100 men and women attended Christian worship services and prayed privately.<sup>188</sup>

The Cambridge Seven viewed giving up opium and tobacco, as a sign of the consecration to the holy life. Smith demanded that church members in Luan manifest a strict manner of life. One member, Liang Paolo (Paul), testified how he was encouraged to give up opium and tobacco-smoking.<sup>189</sup> In 1891 at a Chinese Christmas service held in Paoning, Miss. F. M. Williams described how Cassels' message of consecration was connected to giving up certain forms of behaviour:

He dwelt much on God's gift to us, and then asked us all what we were going to give in return. He spoke of sins which should be given up to Jesus, that he might cleanse us from them, mentioning among others idolatry, opium-smoking, and wine-drinking; then of things harmless, perhaps, in themselves but useless, such as tobacco-smoking, extravagance in dress, etc. These things, he said, might be given up for Jesus' sake.<sup>190</sup>

Not all missionaries approved of Hsi's work, which may be behind the condemnation at the 1890 General Conference of Protestant missionaries in China of the increased sale and use of morphine.<sup>191</sup> This caused something of a crisis for the CIM missionaries, who had seen significant success in using morphine to help bring addicts off opium addiction, especially through the work of Hsi. The mission decided to continue to use morphine to help recovering addicts, which was proving effective, but to limit the multiplication of opium refuges, some of which were being opened by new converts, who were inexperienced in helping opium addicts.

Hsi built up a network of refuges, stretching from the base in Shanxi, up to the mountains at Luan (where Stanley Smith worked), to Zhili in the east, to North Henan, to Xian and Shaanxi and Gansu.<sup>192</sup> Much depended on the organising ability of Hsi, and his ability to deal with local Chinese officials. Cassels' work in East

---

<sup>188</sup> "China's Millions, 1889," 154.

<sup>189</sup> "China's Millions, 1898," 27.

<sup>190</sup> "China's Millions, 1894," 164.

<sup>191</sup> *Records of General Conference, 1890*, li.

<sup>192</sup> Mrs. Taylor, *Pastor Hsi*, 214.

Sichuan does not appear to have been a long-term success. The cost of sustaining the whole scheme was very great, and there was a need to recruit and train a steady supply of workers. Hsi raised a significant amount of the money himself, partly through the proceeds of his Chinese medicine business.<sup>193</sup>

The influence of opium refuge work on the CIM was significant. In 1886, Hsi encouraged Hudson Taylor to recruit single women, and have them work under his wife's direction in opening opium refuges. This was a new development – the CIM had not stationed single women alone before – and in 1886-87 eleven women began working at the stations. By 1899 there were 44 unmarried women in Shanxi, ten of them working at women's refuges.<sup>194</sup>

In 1890, the CIM was running opium refuges in at least eight provinces, although some offered only a very basic level of shelter and care. The fruit of the work of the opium refuges was impressive, especially considering they were working with long-standing addicts, and in a Chinese culture suspicious of the Christian message because it was delivered by Westerners who had done so much to promote the opium trade. One CIM missionary reported of his congregation in South Shanxi that twenty-eight out of forty-one baptized converts were former opium addicts; at Pingyang it was 50%; and in one of the largest churches in Shanxi at Ta-ning, it was 90%. He added, "Some of our best men in the church have been opium-smokers." Stanley Smith believed that the refuges often attracted "scamps and vagabonds," but he strongly supported the work – "but God loves them; that is enough."<sup>195</sup> C. T. Studd reported the case of a man who approached him saying, "I am a murderer, an adulterer I have broken all the laws of God and man again and again. I am also a confirmed opium smoker."<sup>196</sup> He was converted, and became a preacher. When he returned to the town where he had committed many crimes, he was arrested, beaten, and imprisoned, but he would not give up preaching.<sup>197</sup>

---

<sup>193</sup> Ibid., 221-5.

<sup>194</sup> Austin, *China's Millions*, 387-89.

<sup>195</sup> "China's Millions, 1893," 110-11; "China's Millions, 1887," 101 quoted in Austin, *China's Millions*, 381.

<sup>196</sup> Grubb, *C.T. Studd*, 84-5.

<sup>197</sup> "China's Millions (North America), 1895," 91, quoted in Austin, *China's Millions*, 381.

The CIM's work in this area was not narrowly confined to individual addicts. There was also more holistic concern to deal with the causes of opium addiction. Through 1877 and 1878 Hudson Taylor campaigned against the opium trade alongside his evangelising mission in China.<sup>198</sup> At the 1888 Missionary Conference in London, Hudson "railed against the opium traffic as destroying the Chinese and counteracting the good works of missions." The West was exporting its worse vices (opium in China, cheap alcohol in Africa), and such cancerous sins needed to be "excised from the mission field."<sup>199</sup> This criticism of the government, and concern about the social issue of opium, came despite his premillennial doubts about the prospect for human progress.<sup>200</sup>

This raises the questions as to whether the work of the Keswick-holiness influenced CIM missionaries was unique, and the degree to which their theology shaped their practice. Certainly other evangelical missions in China ran opium refuges. A small group of missionaries from Oberlin College, Ohio, reached China in 1881, and worked in Shanxi for eight years without a convert, or even being able to open a school, struggling with ill health, discouragement and the difficulties of learning the language. When they opened an opium refuge at Taigu things changed. In 1889, Liu Feng Chih, once a rich merchant, had become hopelessly addicted to opium. His dramatic conversion was similar to that of Hsi, and he was helped through his withdrawal symptoms by morphine. He eventually became a preacher and a teacher in the missionary school.<sup>201</sup>

Gradually, the CIM emphasis on opium refuges declined, in part because of the death of Hsi, but also as the opium problem became less serious. In 1906 there were still 101 opium refuges, but by 1915 this was down to 50.<sup>202</sup> The connection between social concern expressed in care for opium addicts, and evangelism, was effective, with many churches being started in association with the refuges. In this

---

<sup>198</sup> A. J. Broomhall, *Assault on the Nine*, 6:165.

<sup>199</sup> *Ibid.*, 168.

<sup>200</sup> Robert, *Occupy Until I Come*, 167-69

<sup>201</sup> N. Brandt, *Massacre in Shansi* (Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 1994), 9-12.

<sup>202</sup> A. J. Broomhall, *Not Death to Die*, 7:530-1.

area, the work of the CIM seems to contradict criticisms that its holiness-influenced spirituality was “intrinsically an otherworldly movement.”<sup>203</sup> For many such critics, withdrawal into the hands of God characterised Keswick holiness. John Kent called the holiness movement “Anglican evangelicalism turned in on itself, not only withdrawing from society but seeming to abandon it to its fate.”<sup>204</sup> Yet, faced with the needs of opium addicts in China, the Cambridge Seven did what other missionaries did and probably even more, in intervening on a social issue.<sup>205</sup>

In this work holiness theology encouraged them to believe that helping addicts was an aspect of spiritual warfare, setting the power of the Holy Spirit against another power (that of addiction). The chains of addiction were to be broken so that the addict could embrace Christ. In this medicine, prayer and the Bible were all to play a part.

### 3.6 The Cambridge Seven and Wider Mission Policy in China

The remaining section of this chapter will consider issues of wider mission policy in China, to assess the degree to which the missionaries in this case study of the Cambridge Seven repeated, or moved away from, more widely accepted practice, and how much this was influenced by Keswick-influenced holiness teaching.

#### 3.6.1 Medical Work

The work with opium addicts was only one aspect of the involvement of the CIM in medical missionary activity. Hudson Taylor had medical training, graduating as a member of the Royal College of Surgeons in 1862. None of the Cambridge Seven were medical missionaries, although Stanley Smith’s father was a surgeon. The increasing interest in medical mission from the 1880s onwards was repeated in the CIM, and notably this was at a time when Keswick-influenced holiness had its greatest influence. Four other medical missionaries joined in the 1880s. In 1880,

---

<sup>203</sup> Bebbington, *Evangelicalism in Modern Britain*, 176

<sup>204</sup> John Kent, *Holding the Fort*, 167

<sup>205</sup> Bebbington, *Evangelicalism in Modern Britain*, 81

Harold Schofield arrived in China, and William Wilson and E.H. Edwards in 1882. Other missionaries spent their furloughs in the USA where they obtained MD degrees.<sup>206</sup> Wilson started hospitals in Shaanxi, and Sichuan, and Whitefield Guinness and Sydney Carr began medical work in Kaifeng in 1902. By 1906, the CIM had seven hospitals, thirty-seven dispensaries, and in 1909 this was ten hospitals, and sixty-eight dispensaries. This was clearly significant, but the medical mission work of other Protestant missions was much larger. In 1905, there were 310 medical doctors working as medical missionaries (94 being women), running 166 hospitals and 241 dispensaries.<sup>207</sup> Cassels' work at Paoning, which was also associated to the CMS, included a medical mission. During September 1892, 368 patients were treated in the medical clinic.<sup>208</sup> After Cassels became Anglican Bishop of Western China, his diocese included schools for boys and girls and hospitals.<sup>209</sup>

### 3.6.2 Response to Natural Disasters

Alongside their work in helping opium addicts, CIM workers played important roles in famine relief in 1876-77. Although Timothy Richard and David Hill took a lead, Hudson Taylor also alerted the CIM community to the terrible conditions. He wrote in *China's Millions* of "how much of the precious time and strength of our Lord was spent in conferring temporal blessings on the poor, the afflicted and the needy."<sup>210</sup> Hudson Taylor's call for help in famine relief, along with reports from other CIM missionaries, led to £8000 in donations being sent to the CIM. In all, mission societies and the Shanghai Famine relief Committee raised over £50,000. The September 1877 edition of *China's Millions* included fourteen pages about the famine, two on the opium problem, and only two pages to the usual work of the mission. In March 1878, Hudson Taylor instructed missionaries in the famine-affected areas to take on two hundred destitute children, prioritising the orphans,

---

<sup>206</sup> Austin, *China's Millions*, 205.

<sup>207</sup> A. J. Broomhall, *Not Death to Die*, 7:529-31.

<sup>208</sup> *Ibid.*, 36-7.

<sup>209</sup> *Ibid.*, 357.

<sup>210</sup> Quoted in A. J. Broomhall, *Assault on the Nine*, 6:167

and his wife Jennie travelled to China to undertake the work. The need was so great that the CIM missionaries were prepared to set aside their reservations about Timothy Richard (who had been rejected as a candidate by the CIM at the start of his missionary career) and work with him in distributing relief in the worst affected parts of Shanxi.<sup>211</sup> This incident predated the arrival of the Cambridge Seven, but it shows how efforts to alleviate suffering were combined with evangelism in the CIM. The premillennial belief that Christians should be active in faithful service while awaiting Christ's return was also a factor.

This response to pressing social needs was repeated by members of the Cambridge Seven. In June 1889, Polhill-Turner reported from Pachau that he had helped people whose houses were damaged by flooding from the Yellow River, while the work of the Boys' School in Pachau was thriving.<sup>212</sup> In 1891 he was encouraged to see many people coming to him, even from the surrounding countryside, to learn more about Christian truth.<sup>213</sup> The role of CIM women in famine relief enabled them to open up a new area at Hangzhou, and gave them a key role in establishing the church there.<sup>214</sup>

When in 1907, flooding in Jiangsu, Anhui and Henan brought devastation, at least ten CIM missionaries were involved in relief efforts. At Qingjiangpu, one CIM worker led efforts to create areas of dry ground, and drain the city, eventually overseeing 14,000 Chinese labourers. Broomhall wrote of such CIM rescue work that it involved "care of the whole person, not only the soul."<sup>215</sup>

Such rescue work continued in the work of Alex Macpherson, another CIM missionary. As already reported in section 2.3.2.3, in 1922 a disastrous flood occurred in Chenghsien, Chekiang. With no help available from the Chinese government, the Chinese-Foreign Famine Relief Committee was formed with

---

<sup>211</sup> A. J. Broomhall, *Assault on the Nine*, 6:171-2; Austin, *China's Millions*, 102.

<sup>212</sup> "China's Millions, 1889," 163; "China's Millions, 1890," 13.

<sup>213</sup> "China's Millions, 1891," 77.

<sup>214</sup> Wigram, *Bible and Mission*, 210-11; A. J. Bromhall, *Hudson Taylor & China's Open Century: If I Had a Thousand Lives*, vol. 3 (London: Hodder and Stoughton, c1982), 351.

<sup>215</sup> A. J. Broomhall, *Not Death to Die*, 7:528-9.

Macpherson as its co-chairman.<sup>216</sup> He was motivated by the belief that Christians should be found to be actively engaged in works of service at Christ's return. Macpherson believed that, "those who truly are watching for the return of their Lord will be most unceasing in their work of loving sympathy and relief."<sup>217</sup>

The response of the CIM, and the Cambridge Seven, in providing rescue work at times of natural disaster was spontaneous and compassionate, but systematic social work never became a central part of their mission strategy, which remained preaching and evangelism. However, Keswick-influenced holiness, even with a premillennial emphasis, did not prove a barrier to genuine social concern and relief work when faced with urgent needs.

### 3.6.3 The Faith Principle and Fundraising

Hudson Taylor attempted to promote pure-faith principles of fundraising for the CIM, although a 'modified' faith principle was a more accurate description, because of the indirect financial appeals through sharing information on its work in magazines and missionary meetings.

The Cambridge Seven sought to live this faith principle out practically, although there were different approaches to how this should be done. Studd and Beauchamp renounced their great wealth. At the age of twenty-five, when Studd inherited a large sum of money by his father's will, he gave all of it away, prompted by the gospel account of Jesus' conversation with a rich young man. At that moment, Studd wrote, "God seemed to bring back to me all the vows I had made. A few days later the post, which only came every half month, brought letters from the solicitor and banker to tell me what I had inherited. Then God made me just ordinarily honest and told me what to do."<sup>218</sup>

On 13 January 1887, he gave away £25,000, by sending off four cheques of £5,000 each, and five of £1,000 each. He sent one of the cheques for £5,000 to

---

<sup>216</sup> "China's Millions," 1923, 56.

<sup>217</sup> *Ibid.*, 57.

<sup>218</sup> Grubb, *C.T. Studd*, 62.

Moody, and the money was later used to found the Moody Bible Institute in Chicago. He sent the second to George Müller, for his missionary work and orphanage work; he sent the third to George Holland in Whitechapel, and the fourth to Booth Tucker for the work of the Salvation Army in India. He sent the five cheques of £1,000, respectively, to Miss McPherson in London, Miss Ellen Smyly in Dublin, General William Booth of the Salvation Army, Rev. Archibald Brown in London, and Dr Barnardo's Home.<sup>219</sup>

He donated some further thousands mainly to the CIM. Although he had set aside £3,400 for starting family life with Priscilla Livingstone Stewart, his fiancée encouraged him to give even that sum away; the money was donated to the Salvation Army, and nothing of Studd's fortune was left.<sup>220</sup> The simplicity of Studd's life was reflected in his wedding plans. On 14 October 1887 he wrote Priscilla, "No smart wedding clothes for us – just our ordinary clothes, as plain as can be, and I am for being registered at the Consul's and then having a real Hallelujah meeting, just something all for Jesus."<sup>221</sup>

Beauchamp gave up a quarter of a million pounds when he refused the request of his eldest brother, who had no son, that he accept ownership of the family estate of Langley Park, on the condition that he return to England to manage it. Instead, he chose to remain as a missionary in China. During the First World War, in 1915, his second brother, Sir Horace, was killed at Suvla Bay, and Montagu Beauchamp inherited the baronetcy, but without the fortune.<sup>222</sup>

Cecil Polhill took a different path. When he and his family returned to England due to the Boxer uprising, the death of his uncle, Sir Henry Page Turner Barron, left him with a substantial fortune. Polhill chose to remain in England and managed his family inheritance. The frail health of his wife and their three-year-old son, Kenneth, also served to prevent his return to missionary work in China.<sup>223</sup>

---

<sup>219</sup> Ibid., 62-3.

<sup>220</sup> Ibid., 63-4.

<sup>221</sup> Ibid., 81.

<sup>222</sup> A.J. Broomhall, *Assault on the Nine*, 6:426; Pollock, *The Cambridge Seven*, 109.

<sup>223</sup> Usher, "For China and Tibet," 120-3.

However, Polhill made substantial donations to the Pentecostal movement and also to the CIM. Between 1902 and 1914, he contributed almost £14,000 to the CIM.<sup>224</sup>

The private lives of D. E. Hoste and W. W. Cassels were also characterised by self-denial. Hoste received a considerable bequest, which he donated entirely to the Mission. As for Cassels, on one occasion he expressed his preference for "spartan habits" after welcoming some new missionaries to Szechwan:

If I write of my own doings...it must be a tale of some three or four weeks of table-serving and ministering to the brethren in temporal things. In as far as this has been not for myself but for others it has been as acceptable to the Lord as other work. It does, however, appear to me to be very questionable whether the way we encumber ourselves with worldly possessions is altogether pleasing to our Master, and they certainly engross us a great part of our time.<sup>225</sup>

The abandonment of wealth often meant relying on faith for financial support, as can be seen in the life of Charles Studd:

My own family knew nothing of our circumstances, only that we were in the heart of China. The last of our supplies was finished, and there was no apparent hope of supplies of any kind coming from any human source ... We decided to have a night of prayer. We got on our knees for that purpose. I think we must have stayed there twenty minutes before we rose again. We had told God everything that we had to say in those twenty minutes ....The mail man returned at the appointed time .... I opened it and then began to read .... This was the letter - I looked at the signature first, one wholly unknown to me - 'I have,' he said, 'for some reason or other received the command of God to send you a cheque for £100. I have never met you, I have only heard of you, and that not often, but God has prevented me from sleeping tonight by this command. Why He should command me to send you this I don't know – you will know better than I. anyhow, here it is and I hope it will do you good.' The name of that man was Frank Crossley. We had neither of us seen each other or corresponded.<sup>226</sup>

C. T. Studd maintained this attitude of complete dependence on God for financial needs even when he moved to serve an English-speaking church in India.

The faith principle and the act of renouncing wealth, often understood as the outward manifestation of a consecrated heart, practiced by the Cambridge Seven could have reflected not only the influence of Hudson Taylor, but also of the Brethren. George Müller (1805-98), who gave a considerable financial support to

---

<sup>224</sup> Ibid., 335.

<sup>225</sup> Marshall Broomhall, *W. W. Cassels*, 103.

<sup>226</sup> Grubb, *C. T. Studd*, 93–4.

the CIM, provided an example of “living by faith” that inspired Hudson Taylor and he was also regarded as “the grandfather of the faith mission movement.”<sup>227</sup>

Müller’s famous orphanage was primarily founded with the purpose of demonstrating the effectiveness of the faith principle.

Müller’s brother-in-law, Anthony Norris Groves, was a founder of the Brethren movement who gave away all his income, “beyond modest immediate needs,” and went as missionary to Baghdad and India by his own means.<sup>228</sup> Taylor was probably familiar with Groves’ story and told Beauchamp to renounce his wealth. The fact that C. T. Studd donated some of his inheritance to George Müller reflected his influence, which was widespread in holiness circles. In 1899, the year after Müller’s death, A.T. Pierson published a biography, *George Müller of Bristol and His Witness to a Prayer Hearing God*. This biography circulated widely amongst the Keswick network on the mission field, strengthening convictions as to the power of prayer to meet needs.<sup>229</sup>

The CIM’s commitment to the policy of faith of “no appeals and no demands” distinguished its attitude from “mainstream British societies” on the issue of indemnities as the result of the Boxer Rising.<sup>230</sup> While the united American mission boards asked the American government to include indemnities “for societies, individuals and Chinese who had suffered ‘in person or in property in consequence of their being in the service of foreigners,’”<sup>231</sup> Dixon Hoste, as the CIM leader, refused any compensation from Chinese government to the CIM for “lives lost, bodily injury or loss of property.”<sup>232</sup> This action brought praise from the Chinese officials, including the governor of Shan-si, who wrote:

---

<sup>227</sup> Biographical Dictionary of Evangelicals, s.v. “Müller, George”; Austin, *China’s Millions*, 94.

<sup>228</sup> F. Roy Coad, *A History of the Brethren Movement: Its Orgins, Its Worldwide Development and Its Significance for the Present Day* (Exeter: Paternoster Press, 1976), 17.

<sup>229</sup> Robert, *Occupy Until I Come*, 258-9.

<sup>230</sup> A. J. Broomhall, *Not Death to Die*, 7:469; Cox, *British Missionary Enterprise*, 207.

<sup>231</sup> Austin, *China’s Millions*, 425.

<sup>232</sup> A. J. Broomhall, *Not Death to Die*, 7:479. Austin notes that the CIM refused indemnities for CIM personnel but requested them for Chinese Christians killed. There were 156 Chinese adherents who were killed and 73,156 taels (£10,700) in compensation were paid. This was considered a matter between the Chinese government and its own citizens. The payment to the CIM

Mr. Hoste...has come with not spirit of doubtful suspicion, hatred, or revenge, nor does he desire to exercise strong pressure to obtain anything from us ... Jesus, in His instructions, inculcates forbearance and forgiveness, and all desire for revenge is discouraged. Mr. Hoste is able to carry out these principles to the full .... From this time forward I charge you all, gentry, scholars, army, and people ... to bear in mind the example of Pastor Hoste, who is able to forbear and to forgive, as taught by Jesus to do.<sup>233</sup>

### 3.6.4 Women and Mission

Hudson Taylor played a significant role in encouraging women to enter the mission field. He saw how some areas of mission closed to men were open to women – they could reach Chinese women, and Chinese married women had significant influence over their husbands and families.<sup>234</sup> Six single women were included in the 1866 party which sailed with him to China. There were fewer than twenty single women missionaries in China at the time.<sup>235</sup> At the 1877 Shanghai Missionary Conference, Hudson Taylor insisted that women should be "induced to speak of their own work," in the face of a wider lack of encouragement to do so.<sup>236</sup>

There was a strong connection between holiness teachings and the increasing number of women in the mission field. The holiness emphasis on personal dependence on God, and assessing candidates according to their spiritual maturity rather than their merely human attributes, including gender, served attract many women.<sup>237</sup> Fiedler believes that Chinese indigenous leadership developed more rapidly under women, because they sought to assist Chinese pastors in their work, but not supplant them.<sup>238</sup>

Although widely employed by the CIM, women did not work on an equal basis with men. Semple notes "the story of women in the CIM is one in which representation does not match with reality," and she rejects claims that women

---

adherents was the largest to the Chinese adherents of any mission society (Austin, *China's Millions*, 425-6).

<sup>233</sup> "China's Millions, 1902," 36.

<sup>234</sup> Hudson Taylor's comments in *Records of the General Conference*, 1890, 106.

<sup>235</sup> Wigram, *Bible and Mission*, 211, 213.

<sup>236</sup> *Records of the General Conference*, 1877, 155.

<sup>237</sup> Robert, *American Women in Mission*, 197.

<sup>238</sup> Fiedler, *The Story of Faith Missions*, 134, 293, 395

were employed by CIM “in a manner equal to that of men.” There were, Semple argues, dichotomies “not only between male and female workers but also between better-off and well-educated mission members and the lesser-educated lay evangelists.”<sup>239</sup> Hudson Taylor was concerned over what many viewed as the impropriety of single women working alongside men in remote mission stations, and he believed that women’s health did not stand up as well as that of men to mission work.

Although the Cambridge Seven were all men, the work of their wives was vital to their missionary activity, and forms part of the often unseen and unheralded work of women on the mission field. The wives of Montague Beauchamp, Cecil Beauchamp, and Arthur Polhill-Turner, and both the first and second wives of Stanley Smith, were all active missionaries.<sup>240</sup> Over time, the arrival of growing numbers of professional, single, female missionary workers with expertise as teachers, nurses and doctors, pushed missions to give a greater role to social concern and works of service. It was part of what has been called the increasing “feminization” of missions, and this was increasingly reflected in the CIM.<sup>241</sup>

### 3.6.5 Education

As chapter one showed, a major theme of nineteenth-century missionary strategy was education. However, owing to its evangelistic priority, when in 1889 the various British mission agencies reported they were running 15,271 day-schools, the CIM reported that it ran none.<sup>242</sup> Its priority was rather to seek to save as many of the lost as possible before the imminent return of Christ. At the time the exception was the Chefoo School in Shandong Province.

Despite Hudson-Taylor’s focus on itinerant evangelism, in 1881 he announced the start of a school for missionary children, and a hospital for local

---

<sup>239</sup> Semple, *Missionary Women*, 154-5.

<sup>240</sup> *China’s Millions*, 1889, 36; *China’s Millions*, 1891, 98; 1893, 50; Polhill and Polhill, *Two Etonians*, 120, 132-33.

<sup>241</sup> Semple, *Missionary Women*, 37.

<sup>242</sup> Cox, *British Missionary Enterprise*, 201.

people (as well as recuperating missionaries who fell ill) in Chefoo. The school was to provide high quality education (of a standard that CIM missionaries would not have been able to afford at home in Britain), and to instil in the children the theology and values of the CIM. Hudson Taylor hoped that many Chefoo pupils would become future workers for the CIM.<sup>243</sup>

Broomhall provides figures to show that by 1906 education was playing an increasing part in CIM work, noting that, “in the interests of consolidating local churches, the CIM also multiplied its Christian schools, purposely restricting their size.”<sup>244</sup> He stresses, however, that this was different from Timothy Richard’s approach of using schools to win Chinese pupils to subsequent acceptance of Christianity. Richard’s educational approach stemmed from his desire to instill “true Christian civilization” into the minds of Chinese religious leaders as well as social elites. Richard’s argument, that “a few men may make a million converts,” was behind his idea of using indemnity funds after the Boxer Rebellion to set up a University in Shanxi.<sup>245</sup>

In distinction to Richard’s approach, the educational mission of the CIM was seen as a social outcome of spreading the Christian message rather than preceding it: “Propagating the gospel of reconciliation with God through the death of Christ could not but result in social reform.”<sup>246</sup> The results, by 1915, were quite considerable, with the CIM running 237 day schools with 5412 pupils, and 135 boarding schools with 4,295 pupils.<sup>247</sup> But for Taylor, there was a clear difference between his approach and that of Richard. In his sermon at the 1900 Ecumenical Missionary Conference in New York, Taylor presented a stark alternative between two ways of mission. One emphasised preaching and the gradual enlightenment of the people, the other preached for instant conversion without any such social or cultural embellishments.<sup>248</sup> But clearly, the CIM schools were bringing some social

---

<sup>243</sup> Semple, *Missionary Women*, 168-9.

<sup>244</sup> A. J. Broomhall, *Not Death to Die*, 7:525.

<sup>245</sup> Pfister, “Rethinking Mission in China,” 207.

<sup>246</sup> A. J. Broomhall, *Not Death to Die*, 7:525.

<sup>247</sup> *Ibid.*, 531

<sup>248</sup> Wigram, *Bible and Mission*, 133.

and cultural embellishments. Thus, examination of the evidence of CIM work in China suggests this was one of the cases with the CIM where “representation does not match with reality.”<sup>249</sup>

### 3.7 Conclusion

The Cambridge Seven were an embodiment of “British evangelical masculinity” in the late Victorian period.<sup>250</sup> The decision of several well-educated, athletic, and military young men from upper-class backgrounds to offer themselves to be missionaries to China inspired many other young people in Britain to take up the missionary cause. The story of the Cambridge Seven even spread to the United States and was influential in the religious life of John R. Mott and Robert Speer, future leaders of the Student Volunteer Movement.

The most important figures influencing the decision of the Cambridge Seven to go to China were D. L. Moody and Hudson Taylor, both of whom claimed to have experienced the fullness of the Spirit. The Cambridge Seven were also strongly influenced by the holiness teachings from the Keswick movement, which in turn shaped their way of conducting missions in China. In China, they demonstrated the spiritual character of self-denial by renouncing profitable careers, status and fortunes, as was most evident in the cases of C. T. Studd and Sir Montagu Beauchamp.

Yet, although this case study of Keswick-influenced holiness missionaries is a dramatic one, the impact of the Cambridge Seven on the China mission should not be exaggerated. C. T. Studd only served in China for nine years before he was invalided home. Stanley Smith resigned from the CIM in 1904 because of theological disagreements, followed by Cecil Polhill who resigned over Pentecostalism, although both of them still retained their commitment to the holiness teachings. By 1890s, only three of the seven remained firmly connected to the CIM.<sup>251</sup> In the

---

<sup>249</sup> Semple, *Missionary Women*, 26, 154.

<sup>250</sup> Jason Bruner, “The Cambridge Seven, Late Victorian Culture, and the Chinese Frontier,” *Social Sciences and Missions* 27, no. 1 (2014): 7.

<sup>251</sup> Austin, *China’s Millions*, 387

withdrawal of others, health and personal circumstances were factors, but so was the influence of the Chinese context, and the vastness of the needs of the China mission, which promoted interest in the “Larger Hope,” and Pentecostalism. The CIM’s reservations about those issues reflected those of evangelicalism as a whole, although Hudson Taylor was probably more open to accommodating these than were Frost and Hoste. In this case study of the CIM, Keswick holiness teaching, rather like the evangelicalism of which it was a part, worked better as a movement running through and across denominational boundaries, rather than as the framework for creating a single, distinct missionary organisation exactly reflecting its teachings. Although highly gifted, the Cambridge Seven were strong, well-educated, individuals accustomed to privilege and influence. Apart from a short period working under Hsi, their inability to work for long in unquestioning obedience to the CIM leadership was not a surprise, despite their holiness emphasis on self-sacrifice.

## Chapter Four

### Ridley Hall and Missions in Asia

Ridley Hall, opened in 1881, was initially intended to prepare evangelical ministers for the Church of England. Nevertheless, a significant number of its students became missionaries abroad. J. T. Lang and S. Symonds, CMS historians, writing in 1918, believed that, “nothing has done more in later years for the missionary cause in the University than the opening of Ridley Hall in 1881. The inspiring personality and the clear and scholarly teaching of Dr Handley Moule and his colleagues exercised a powerful influence in calling the thoughts of men to our Saviour’s last command.”<sup>1</sup> During the tenure of the first Principal, Handley Moule, 117 out of the 514 students who entered Ridley Hall became foreign missionaries.

Of these Ridley Hall missionaries, 69 joined the CMS to become missionaries to Asia.<sup>2</sup> Of that number, 50 went to India, 9 served in China, 7 worked in Japan, and 3 went to Ceylon. Several of them did not stay in one country for their whole missionary career. Arthur Kington Finimore served in Tinnevely, India, from 1885 and was transferred to Mauritius in 1893.<sup>3</sup> Herbert James Molony went to India in 1890 to serve in the Gond Mission and later, in 1908, he was consecrated as Bishop of Mid-China.<sup>4</sup> William Hedger Elwin joined the Mid China Mission in 1898 before moving to Tokyo, Japan, in 1907 to work among the Chinese students.<sup>5</sup> Horace

---

<sup>1</sup> Septimus Symonds and James Thomason Lang, *One Hundred Years: A Short History of the Cambridge Association of the Church Missionary Society, 1818-1918*. (Cambridge: Cambridge, 1918), 24.

<sup>2</sup> See the Table 1 at the Appendix.

<sup>3</sup> *Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: Ninety-Fifth Year, 1893-94* (London: Church Missionary House, 1894), 181.

<sup>4</sup> *Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: Ninety-Second Year, 1890-91* (London: Church Missionary House, 1891), 107; *Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Ninth Year, 1907-08* (London: Church Missionary House, 1908), 211.

<sup>5</sup> *Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One Hundredth Year, 1898-99* (London: Church Missionary House, 1899), 349; *Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Tenth Year, 1908-09* (London: Church Missionary House, 1909), 205.

McCartie Eyre Price was transferred from West Africa Mission to work in Japan in 1890, and was appointed Bishop of Fuh-Kien, China, in 1906.<sup>6</sup>

This chapter will focus on the impact of Ridley Hall on the Asian mission fields. The first section will consider the characteristics of Ridley Hall that so strongly encouraged its students to go to the mission field. The second section will explore the missionary activities conducted by Ridley Hall men, and the third section will discuss how the holiness teaching they received during their training at the Hall was manifested in their mission fields. The following sections will discuss the attitude of Ridley Hall missionaries toward Pentecostalism, cultural issues in Asian mission fields, and mission practices.

#### 4.1 The Impact of the Holiness Movement in Ridley Hall to Missions in Asia

An important personality in the development of the Church of England missionary work, particularly the CMS, at Ridley Hall was its first Principal, Handley Moule. He was born on 23 December 1841 at Fordington, Dorchester.<sup>7</sup> In 1860 at Trinity College, Cambridge, Moule joined the Church Missionary Union, indicating his early interest in the missionary cause. In 1882 Moule became president of the Church Missionary Union.<sup>8</sup>

His missionary concern was increased by the involvement of family members with the CMS. One of his brothers, George Evans Moule, became a CMS missionary to China. He sailed for Shanghai in 1857 and in 1880 he was consecrated the first Bishop of Mid-China. Another brother, Arthur Evans Moule, went as a missionary to China in 1861 and was later appointed Archdeacon of Shanghai in 1890. By the early

---

<sup>6</sup> *Proceedings, 1890-91*, 197; *Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Eighth Year, 1906-07* (London: Church Missionary House, 1907), 281.

<sup>7</sup> A. F. Munden, "Moule, Handley Carr Glyn (1841–1920), Bishop of Durham," in *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, accessed November 30, 2017, <http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/10.1093/ref:odnb/9780198614128.001.0001/odnb-9780198614128-e-35129>.

<sup>8</sup> *Biographical Dictionary of Evangelicals*, s.v. "Moule, Handley."

twentieth century, in addition to these two brothers, no fewer than twelve Moules had joined the CMS.<sup>9</sup>

Handley Moule was often invited to address CMS meetings. According to Eugene Stock, Moule's missionary speech at the CMS Meeting for Men at Exeter Hall in March 1885 was "one of the most memorable in the whole history of the Society."<sup>10</sup> He spoke at two important CMS Annual Meetings held at St Bride's Church.<sup>11</sup> One of the sermons reflected the concept of the close link between the fullness of the Spirit and the task of mission:

What was it, that great command, last present here to the mind of the Son of God? It was the Missionary watchword... Clothed and filled with the Spirit of loving fire and of living light, they were to give themselves up to be the witnesses of their Lord; *His witnesses*, because the soul of their messages was to be always Himself, and Himself set forth as only witnesses can do it.<sup>12</sup>

Moule also wrote articles for the *Church Missionary Gleaner* which expressed his views on mission. Moule maintained that the ultimate message of a missionary was the "message of God *in Christ*."<sup>13</sup> When one is brought to receive the message, one will receive the "salvation in Christ Jesus" from the power of sin and the fear of death, and will obtain the eternal glory. On the benefits of civilization brought by missionary effort, Moule considered these as "secondary blessings" and "good things for the world."<sup>14</sup>

He believed in the importance of indigenous church leadership. For Moule, "the great hope of the future must be, under God, with the native churches." He further elaborated his hope of the emergence of consecrated local Christians who would devote themselves to the evangelization of their own countries:

It will be a glorious day when "a great company of preachers," firm and warm in believing life, strong and sober, while all alive in love, bent simply and only on glorifying their Lord, spreading and deepening His Kingdom, shall go out in their own lands to lead their own people to the Lord; negro preachers, Bantu

---

<sup>9</sup> *Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Third Year, 1901-02* (London: Church Missionary House, 1902), 22.

<sup>10</sup> Stock, *The History of the Church Missionary Society*, III:319.

<sup>11</sup> *Ibid.*, III:302.

<sup>12</sup> *Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Fifteenth Year, 1913-14* (London: Church Missionary House, 1914), lxviii.

<sup>13</sup> "The Church Missionary Gleaner," April 1901, 54.

<sup>14</sup> "The Church Missionary Gleaner," January 1920, 5.

preachers, Arabs, Persians, Indians of every race, Chinese, Japanese. Let us pray for the hastening of that day.<sup>15</sup>

Although Moule was not active in Cambridge after being appointed Bishop of Durham, he did not lose his interest in overseas missions. He observed that since the beginning of the twentieth century the CMS suffered from a lack of manpower, indicating the waning of missionary enthusiasm. He then wrote a missionary invitation, "So the Lord's call was never so loud as it is today: 'Whom shall I send and who will go for Us?'"<sup>16</sup>

Interestingly, Handley Moule denied that he encouraged Ridley Hall students to take up the overseas missionary cause, claiming that, "In those great days of missionary zeal it was constantly my duty at Ridley Hall to press urgently upon men the claims of the home field."<sup>17</sup> Nevertheless, the historian of Ridley Hall believes that Moule played an important role in shaping his students' missionary attitudes "unconsciously and unintentionally." Some students sensed that Moule's call for overseas missionaries was made "far more warmly and fervently" than that for ministers at home.<sup>18</sup> The topic of overseas missions also often came up during informal conversations between Moule and his students.

Another prominent figure who influenced the holiness tendency in overseas missions was John Barton (1836-1908). Born in Havant, Hampshire,<sup>19</sup> he entered Christ's College, Cambridge, in 1855, and played a key role in the Church Missionary Union. When Barton was appointed its secretary, he drafted a series of resolutions, signed by thirteen members of the Union, which stated: "We the undersigned members of the University of Cambridge, who have felt that the call to missionary work abroad has been especially addressed to ourselves; and have resolved in God's

---

<sup>15</sup> "The Church Missionary Gleaner," January 1920, 5.

<sup>16</sup> Ibid.

<sup>17</sup> Harford and Macdonald, *Handley Carr Glyn Moule*, 120.

<sup>18</sup> Bullock, *The History of Ridley Hall*, 1:216.

<sup>19</sup> Charlotte Fell-Smith, "Barton, John (1836–1908), Missionary," in *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, accessed October 19, 2017, <http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/10.1093/ref:odnb/9780198614128.001.0001/odnb-9780198614128-e-30631>.

strength to give ourselves to that work if He makes our way plain before us.”<sup>20</sup> They committed to meet and to pray for each other and for missionary cause in the University.

In 1859 Barton was accepted as a missionary by the CMS. After arriving at Calcutta in 1860 and being ordained as a priest in the following February, Barton superintended a CMS college at Agra and an orphanage at Sikandra. In 1865 he was in charge of the Cathedral Mission College in Calcutta and in 1871 became the Secretary of the Madras Mission. In 1877 he returned to England to become the Vicar of Holy Trinity Church, Cambridge, which had a long-standing tradition of supporting the missionary cause.

Barton was an early participant in the Keswick movement. According to his wife, Emily Barton, “We had been present at one of the earliest of the Conventions started by Canon Battersby at Keswick.”<sup>21</sup> This may have been the Convention of 1878. In 1889 Barton requested prayer at the missionary meeting of the Convention for his mission as an acting Bishop to Tinnevely, India.<sup>22</sup> He counselled students in spiritual matters and helped maintain the holiness atmosphere at Ridley Hall.

When Ridley Hall was opened in 1881, Barton was appointed to the Council. In the early 1880s, Barton worked to promote the missionary cause, reinvigorating the Day of Intercession for Foreign Missions, which was started in Great St Mary’s Church on St Andrew’s Day in 1873.<sup>23</sup> As the Association Secretary of the CMS, he began a system of collecting funds for mission in every college, by which a student would personally bring him the money that his college had collected. Barton then used these individual meetings with the student collectors to persuade the students to consider a missionary career. During the next sixteen years following Barton’s return to Cambridge, 140 Cambridge students offered themselves to be missionaries, of whom 97 were accepted. One of the Ridley Hall students, Arthur John Shields, asserted that, “It would be impossible to estimate the great

---

<sup>20</sup> John Pollock, *A Cambridge Movement*, (London: Murray, 1953), 20.

<sup>21</sup> Emily Barton, “The Memoirs of Emily Eugenia Barton,” n.d., 87.

<sup>22</sup> “The Life of Faith, 1889,” 204.

<sup>23</sup> Cecil Edward Barton, *John Barton: A Memoir* (London, 1910), 102.

missionary influence exercised by Mr. Barton upon the University. The direct call to the mission field came to many through him.” Shields recalled his own experience of bringing the annual CMS collection of Jesus College to John Barton, and how as a result of their meeting “the missionary vocation came to me.”<sup>24</sup> Edwin Albert Douglas, another Ridley Hall member, recalled that, “I had known and loved Mr. Barton all through my University career.” At the Keswick Convention of 1889, Douglas was asked to accompany Barton for a one-year mission in Tinnevely, India, to which he agreed.<sup>25</sup>

Under Moule’s leadership and with Barton’s support, Ridley Hall maintained a strong missionary ethos. This missionary ethos intensified with the mission of Moody and Sankey to Cambridge in November 1882. Bullock, the historian of Ridley Hall, observed that their mission deepened the religious feeling of the Ridley Hall students, some of whom offered themselves “more unreservedly to God’s work, especially in the foreign missionary field.”<sup>26</sup> Eugene Stock admitted that the CMS “owes a whole succession of Cambridge missionaries to the influences of that period.”<sup>27</sup> When Philip Ireland Jones, Vice-Principal of the Hall, was asked in December 1884 about the long-term results of the Mission, he replied, “I think there is not one man here whose life was not influenced, more or less, by Moody’s Cambridge Mission.”<sup>28</sup>

The Moody and Sankey Mission was followed up the next year by the arrival of several Keswick Convention speakers. H. W. Webb-Peploe, Evan Hopkins, E. W. Moore, C. A. Fox and H. F. Bowker were invited to hold the first Convention at Cambridge on “Keswick lines” and address several meetings from 30 January to 2 February 1883.<sup>29</sup> These meetings strengthened the link between the Keswick Conventions and Ridley Hall. More evangelical students from Cambridge attended

---

<sup>24</sup> Ibid., 104-5.

<sup>25</sup> Ibid., 122-3.

<sup>26</sup> Bullock, *The History of Ridley Hall*, 1:201.

<sup>27</sup> Stock, *The History of the Church Missionary Society*, III:284.

<sup>28</sup> Ibid.; Bullock, *The History of Ridley Hall*, 1:212.

<sup>29</sup> Stock, *The History of the Church Missionary Society*, III:285; Bullock, *The History of Ridley Hall*, 1:205.

the Conventions, and also the Mildmay Conferences. C. Hope Gill dedicated himself to be a missionary when attending the Keswick Convention in 1885.<sup>30</sup>

Another significant episode that raised the interest in overseas missions among Cambridge students was the going forth of the Cambridge Seven. Inspired by the consecration of Stanley Smith and C. T. Studd to be CIM missionaries, a meeting of the Cambridge University Church Missionary Union was held on 1 December 1884, at which F. E. Wigram, the Honorary Secretary of the CMS, met “a number of graduates and undergraduates who desired to dedicate themselves to the Lord’s work abroad.”<sup>31</sup> This number evidently included students from Ridley Hall. On 17 December 1884 Moule reported to the Council that, “Several of the students have been led to face the question of personal Missionary Service; and there is reason to expect that several will ultimately offer themselves to the Church Missionary Society.”<sup>32</sup> At the farewell meeting for the Cambridge Seven in February 1885 at Cambridge, Stanley Smith’s address inspired Herbert J. Molony to become a missionary.<sup>33</sup> At around the same time, P. Ireland Jones, the Vice-Principal of Ridley Hall, was accepted by the CMS for service as a missionary to India.<sup>34</sup>

In 1886, the missionary feeling at Cambridge was further aroused by the visit of W. H. M. Hay Aitken, a famous preacher. During the Lent Term Aitken conducted mission services at Great St Mary’s and he also spoke at Ridley Hall. In April of that year no fewer than thirty-one Cambridge students signed a letter to the CMS stating that they “wished to make a ‘prospective offer’ of themselves for missionary service, if the Lord should open the way.”<sup>35</sup> Eight of these were members of Ridley Hall, seven of whom became missionaries to Asia: A. I. Birkett, R. B. Marriott, H. J. Molony, W. S. Moule, J. Neale, H. S. Phillips, and Sydney Swann.<sup>36</sup>

---

<sup>30</sup> Pollock, *The Keswick Story*, 81.

<sup>31</sup> Stock, *The History of the Church Missionary Society*, III:315; Bullock, *The History of Ridley Hall*, 1:215.

<sup>32</sup> Bullock, *The History of Ridley Hall*, 1:211.

<sup>33</sup> Marshall Broomhall, *W. W. Cassels*, viii.

<sup>34</sup> Stock, *The History of the Church Missionary Society*, III:318.

<sup>35</sup> Bullock, *The History of Ridley Hall*, 1:222; Stock, *The History of the Church Missionary Society*, III:327.

<sup>36</sup> Bullock, *The History of Ridley Hall*, 1:222.

Another important event that stirred up missionary feeling in Cambridge was the visit of Robert P. Wilder, a representative of the Student Volunteer Movement in America, in February 1892. In 1883 Robert Wilder founded the Princeton Foreign Missionary Society, with membership open to any students who were willing to subscribe to a pledge, "We, the undersigned, declare ourselves willing and desirous, God permitting, to go to the unevangelized portions of the world."<sup>37</sup> In 1886, the Mount Hermon summer Bible study meeting was held by the Intercollegiate YMCA under the auspices of D. L. Moody, who also presided at the meetings. At the end of the conference, Robert Wilder successfully collected 100 students to sign the missionary pledge and started the Student Volunteer Movement.<sup>38</sup> From autumn 1886, Robert Wilder and John N. Forman, among the first to become a volunteer, made a missionary tour for a year to 162 colleges in America and Canada, and recruited 2,106 students, a number that Parker believes "nearly as many missionaries as had been sent from the U.S. in the entire preceding century."<sup>39</sup> By 1898 the SVM had recruited 4,000 volunteers from 839 educational institutions in the United States and Canada, and 1,173 of them went as missionaries to 53 countries. The purpose of the SVM was expressed in its famous watchword, "The Evangelization of the World in This Generation," which was later adopted by the Student Volunteer Missionary Union at the Liverpool Conference in 1896. The watchword, however, later came under attack because it seemed to endorse premillennial beliefs. Arthur Pierson, to whom the motto was attributed, was certainly a premillennialist who emphasized the sense of urgency over Christ's return.<sup>40</sup>

At Cambridge Wilder "immediately gained a remarkable influence over the earnest Christian undergraduates."<sup>41</sup> Not only did his visit inspire the formation of

---

<sup>37</sup> Tatlow, *The Story of the Student Christian Movement*, 18.

<sup>38</sup> The story of the origin of the SVM in the United States can also be found in Michael Parker, *The Kingdom of Character: The Student Volunteer Movement for Foreign Missions (1886-1926)* (Lanham: University Press of America, 1998).

<sup>39</sup> Parker, Introduction to *The Kingdom of Character: the Student Volunteer Movement for Foreign Missions (1886-1926)*, by Michael Parker (Lanham: University Press of America, 1998).

<sup>40</sup> Parker, *The Kingdom of Character*, 66–7.

<sup>41</sup> Stock, *The History of the Church Missionary Society*, III:373.

the Student Volunteer Missionary Union, but on 13 February 1892, 54 students signed a letter to the CMS stating their willingness to become foreign missionaries. About half of them had been inspired to do so by Wilder's addresses.<sup>42</sup> A number of Ridley Hall students signed the letter and eight of them eventually went to Asia as missionaries: Louis Byrde, E. A. Causton, W. H. Elwin, E. A. Hensley, B. Herklots, R. S. Heywood, H. W. Moule, and F. W. Rowlands.<sup>43</sup>

At Ridley Hall, special prayer meetings for missionary work abroad were held every Friday.<sup>44</sup> Missionary topics were often discussed at the triennial reunion of the former students. In the Second Triennial Reunion in 1887, a special devotional meeting was opened by the reading of letters from P. Ireland Jones and A. J. Shields, former Ridley men who were then missionaries in India, followed by an address related to missionary work from John Barton.<sup>45</sup> At the fourth Triennial Reunion in June 1893, A. T. Polhill-Turner, one of the Cambridge Seven, was present during his furlough and spoke about the purpose and work of the Student Volunteer Missionary Union.<sup>46</sup> At that reunion, the subject of "Spiritual truths learned in the Mission field" was discussed, and by 1899 this had become the "leading" topic at the Hall's annual reunions, and the Principal hoped it would become a "permanent feature."<sup>47</sup>

The discussions at the fifth Reunion of 1896 provided evidence of the missionary enthusiasm among the students of Ridley Hall during Moule's principalship. John Barton admitted that he "could not imagine a Ridley Hall man who had not at some time or other earnestly asked him 'Ought I to be a missionary?'"<sup>48</sup> At the same time, there was also reason for concern over this zeal for the missionary calling. Barton often reminded students that the ministry at home was no less important than overseas missions. W. H. Stone, who served at St.

---

<sup>42</sup> Stock, *The History of the Church Missionary Society*, III:373.

<sup>43</sup> Bullock, *The History of Ridley Hall*, 1:268; Stock, *The History of the Church Missionary Society*, III:374.

<sup>44</sup> Bullock, *The History of Ridley Hall*, 1:210.

<sup>45</sup> *Ibid.*, 1:229; Moule, *Reunion of 1887*, 13.

<sup>46</sup> Bullock, *The History of Ridley Hall*, 1:276.

<sup>47</sup> Moule, *Annual Letter, 1899*, 37.

<sup>48</sup> H. C. G. Moule, *Ridley Hall, Cambridge: Annual Letter, 1896* (Cambridge: sn. 1896), 15.

James', Hatcham, suspected that some of the students who put down their names to take up mission work were motivated by romantic feelings toward mission work and that some were not mature enough to make such an important life-decision.<sup>49</sup> H. F. S. Adams, Vicar of St. Paul's, Stratford, delivered a paper – entitled "The Comparative Claims of the home field and the foreign field upon the Christian Minister" – at the Reunion, which offered students guidance on how to decide whether to enter ministry at home or mission abroad. Adams recalled that during his time as a Cambridge student, there was a general impression that if a Christian were genuinely consecrated, "he must go abroad." Adams then proceeded to emphasise that both Christian service at home and mission abroad were equally important, and which sphere of work one would enter should be a matter of his "strong personal conviction," which should be determined only after a long and impassioned waiting on God.<sup>50</sup>

Some of the factors behind the strong missionary commitments at Ridley Hall have been discussed by Andrew Porter and Steven Maughan.<sup>51</sup> They pointed to the significant roles of Handley Moule and John Barton, both of whom had special affinity with the CMS, Moody and Sankey's mission and the going forth of the Cambridge Seven, in inspiring missionary feeling among Cambridge students. The *Annual Letters* of Ridley Hall show how certain activities within the Hall, particularly the reunion of its former students, promoted missionary commitments. Moule and Barton connected the Keswick movement and the missionary cause to Ridley Hall.

It is worth noting that two important late nineteenth-century movements from America brought significant impact to the missionary response among Ridley Hall members, Moody and the Student Volunteer Movement. The connection between the SVMU and Ridley Hall can be seen in the person of Louis Byrde of Corpus Christi College, who played a vital role in forming the SVMU in 1892.<sup>52</sup> Byrde

---

<sup>49</sup> Ibid., 17.

<sup>50</sup> Ibid., 12.

<sup>51</sup> Porter, "Cambridge, Keswick, and Late-Nineteenth-Century Attitudes to Africa," 13; Maughan, *Mighty England Do Good*.

<sup>52</sup> Tatlow, *The Story of the Student Christian Movement*, 25.

became the leader of the Executive Committee of the SVMU, taking care of the SVMU finances and handling most of its secretarial work. In October in that same year, Byrde entered Ridley Hall and he later became a missionary to China.<sup>53</sup>

There was also transatlantic connection between American Christian students and Cambridge students. On one hand, Handley Moule recommended the practice of Morning Watch, which had been formalised in Ridley Hall through the Morning Watch Union, to John R. Mott, the leader of the Student Volunteer Movement, during his first visit to Cambridge in 1894. On the other hand, Mott introduced the American watchword of the SVM – ‘the evangelization of the world in this generation’ – to Cambridge students. This, according to Brian Stanley, forms an important example of “the transatlantic character of nineteenth-century evangelicalism.”<sup>54</sup> The connection between the Morning Watch and the Watchword was clearly expressed in the first article in the opening number of the British journal of *The Student Volunteer*, when student volunteers could pray in private for the spread of Christianity in the world.<sup>55</sup>

## 4.2 Missionary Activities of Ridley Hall Missionaries

### 4.2.1 India

Missionary work in India was well established by the time Ridley Hall was founded, and such work included that of the Anglican mission society, the CMS. India was a vital part of the British Empire, and the Established Church of England was especially active in the India mission, giving particular attention to educational work. Christian missions of all denominations became active in forming schools and universities in India. By 1837, although Lord Auckland wanted to keep government-subsidised schools secular, missionaries were providing most of the English-language education in Bengal. Mission schools were arguably more successful

---

<sup>53</sup> Bullock, *The History of Ridley Hall*, 1:278.

<sup>54</sup> Brian Stanley, “Hunting for Souls: the Missionary Pilgrimage of George Sherwood Eddy,” in Pieter Holtrop and Hugh McLeod (eds.), *Missions and Missionaries*, Studies in Church History Subsidia 13 (EHS, 2000), 128.

<sup>55</sup> *Ibid.*, 128-9.

because they were free of charge and overall provided a higher standard than government schools, which required fees.<sup>56</sup> The Educational Despatch in 1854 required each of the Presidency cities, which were the administrative centres of British governance in India, to have a Department of Public Instruction, and funds for schools and colleges would be provided by the government. In 1857, the first three universities were founded in Madras, Bombay, and Calcutta. Some advantages of the new policy for mission schools were their qualification for government grants-in-aid and the possibility of affiliation to the new universities.<sup>57</sup> The despatch also removed the restrictions against the availability of Bibles in government school libraries. Moreover, it allowed teachers to explain Christian teachings to pupils after class. This policy was seen as “a significant step forward” for Evangelical Christians.<sup>58</sup> By the 1860s many mission schools received the grants and they constituted almost half of all non-Indian schools.

The most prominent feature of the missionary activities in India conducted by the Ridley Hall missionaries was their involvement with education. Out of fifty Ridley Hall missionaries who served in India, thirty of them, or more than half, were engaged in education. In Travancore, Jacob Thompson became the Principal of the Cambridge Nicholson Institution in Cottayam in 1888.<sup>59</sup> It was recognised as a training college by the Madras Educational Department and so gained “a high place in the estimation of the public.”<sup>60</sup> There was also Cottayam College, where for a short period in 1893 Cuthbert Edward Reynolds Romilly, formerly Curate of St. James’ Church, Bermondsey, served as Acting Principal. The College affiliated with Madras University in 1892.<sup>61</sup> At Pallam, a village four miles south of Cottayam, there was the Buchanan Institution, where Edwin Bellerby, previously Curate of St. Silas’, Lozells, Birmingham, became principal in 1893.<sup>62</sup> During the year of 1902-03 the

---

<sup>56</sup> Penelope Carson, *The East India Company and Religion, 1698-1858* (Suffolk: Boydell & Brewer, 2013), 209.

<sup>57</sup> Gibbs, *The Anglican Church in India*, 205–6.

<sup>58</sup> Carson, *The East India Company and Religion*, 211.

<sup>59</sup> *Proceedings, 1888-89*, 159.

<sup>60</sup> *Proceedings, 1892-93*, 163.

<sup>61</sup> *Proceedings, 1893-94*, 165.

<sup>62</sup> *Ibid.*, 166.

Institution had more than two hundred pupils and it also had eleven branch schools, which Bellerby visited occasionally.<sup>63</sup>

Other missionaries from Ridley Hall were involved with educational institutions in many parts of India. In Masulipatam (Machilipatnam), two Ridley Hall graduates taught at the Noble College from 1887. Charles Wiliam Arden Clarke was its Principal while Henry James Tanner, former Curate of St. James's, Hereford, was its Rugby-Fox master.<sup>64</sup> Under the leadership of C. W. A. Clarke, the College was reported to experience "well-deserved academic successes."<sup>65</sup> In Calcutta, Charles Bird Clarke, formerly Curate of the parish church, Islington, took charge of the Christian Boys' Boarding School in 1895.<sup>66</sup> During C. B. Clarke's short furlough, the School was placed temporarily under the leadership of Charles Grant, Curate of St. Philip's and St. James', Ilfracombe.<sup>67</sup> Due to his poor health, Clarke was replaced in 1903 by Arthur Fawsit Ealand, formerly Curate of Holy Trinity, Marylebone.<sup>68</sup> Ealand reported that in 1908, out of 300 graduates, one-fifth were involved in mission work, while some others were employed by the government.<sup>69</sup> In the Punjab, Edmund Francis Edward Wigram, son of F. E. Wigram, and John Anthony Wood, a former Curate of Holy Trinity, Cambridge, worked in different periods at the Lahore Divinity School as the Principal and the Vice-Principal.<sup>70</sup>

In the North-West Provinces, John Mapletoft Paterson, a former Curate of Portman Chapel, London, took charge of the Mission High School at Gorakhpur. A

---

<sup>63</sup> *Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Fourth Year, 1902-03* (London: Church Missionary House, 1903), 299.

<sup>64</sup> *Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: Eighty-Ninth Year, 1887-88* (London: Church Missionary House, 1888), 154.

<sup>65</sup> *Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: Ninety-Ninth Year, 1897-98* (London: Church Missionary House, 1898), 270.

<sup>66</sup> *Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: Ninety-Sixth Year, 1894-95* (London: Church Missionary House, 1895), 130.

<sup>67</sup> *Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: Ninety-Seventh Year, 1895-96* (London: Church Missionary House, 1896), 165; *Proceedings, 1897-98*, 270.

<sup>68</sup> *Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Fifth Year, 1903-04* (London: Church Missionary House, 1904), 172; *Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Second Year, 1900-01* (London: Church Missionary House, 1901), 205.

<sup>69</sup> *Proceedings, 1907-08*, 109.

<sup>70</sup> *Proceedings, 1895-96*, 211; *Proceedings, 1898-99*, 217.

CMS report described the school as follows: “The Gorakhpur High School is recognized as the best school in the district, and the most successful in the government examinations.”<sup>71</sup> At Lucknow, the largest city in the North-West Provinces, A. I. Birkett, a former Curate of Christ Church, Derby, was for some time in charge of the Normal School for training teachers and the High School, before he was transferred to Rajputana in 1900.<sup>72</sup> The value of mission schools was also acknowledged in Jabalpur, where they were at one time attended by 1,300 pupils. Ernest Augustus Hensley, the superintendent of the district, mentioned that its educational work was “the strongest feature” of the mission at Jabalpur and observed that, “By far the majority of all the men in Government offices have passed through our schools.”<sup>73</sup>

Ridley Hall missionaries in India were, of course, involved in evangelization, sometimes coupled with pastoral work among those who had been converted to Christianity. The evangelistic and pastoral work at Multan, which had a population of two million, was taken up by Cecil. E. Barton and William Francis Cobb, a former Curate of St. George’s, Sheffield.<sup>74</sup> They ministered at a local church which had, in 1895, around fifty baptised believers.<sup>75</sup> Their evangelising activities included weekly open-air preaching, attended by audiences of between 50 and 200, and itinerating preaching.<sup>76</sup> During the winter of 1896-97, Barton made a preaching tour in the district of Mozaffargarh, travelling around 150 miles, and visiting 15 villages.<sup>77</sup> Three years later, in early 1899, Cobb spent nine weeks in camp itinerating to the Mozaffargarh district and then to the south of Multan, where “the gospel had not been preached for twelve or fifteen years.”<sup>78</sup> At Bhagalpur, Behar, two Ridley Hall

---

<sup>71</sup> *Proceedings, 1894-95*, 146.

<sup>72</sup> *Proceedings, 1895-96*, 192.

<sup>73</sup> *Proceedings, 1900-01*, 260–1.

<sup>74</sup> *Proceedings, 1893-94*, 115; *Proceedings, 1894-95*, 163.

<sup>75</sup> *Proceedings, 1894-95*, 178.

<sup>76</sup> *Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: Ninety-Eighth Year, 1896-97* (London: Church Missionary House, 1897), 231–2.

<sup>77</sup> *Proceedings, 1897-98*, 231.

<sup>78</sup> *Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-First Year, 1899-1900* (London: Church Missionary House, 1900), 259.

men took charge of the mission work: Clarence Garland Mylrea and Stanley Ramey Morse, a former Curate of St. Peter's, Derby.<sup>79</sup> Apart from exercising pastoral responsibility for the local congregation, in the early 1898, Mylrea made an evangelistic tour in the Purneah area, which "had never before been trodden by the foot of the messenger of the gospel," while Morse conducted an itinerating mission to "the east and the west of Bhagalpur."<sup>80</sup>

The Band of Associated Evangelists was formed in several districts in India to promote missionary outreach. At Lucknow, the Band included several graduates from Ridley Hall: A. I. Birkett, Joseph Sewell Gray, previously Curate of St. Andrews, Newington, and E. A. Hensley, formerly Curate of Christ Church, Hampstead.<sup>81</sup> At Marpha, another Band of Associated Evangelists was formed with H. J. Molony as its leader. In one report Molony described the work of the band as follows: "I find by our record of work that we have preached to the heathen about 140 times during the year. Our congregations have averaged seventeen listeners, and in this way we have preached the gospel to about 2,400 people...We have daily prayers and Sunday services wherever we are, also Sunday school."<sup>82</sup> In Bengal, the centre of the Associated Band of Evangelists was in Santirajpur under the charge of C. B. Clarke from 1893 until 1895, and later of A. F. Ealand from 1901 until 1903.<sup>83</sup> Clarke mentioned that the band took part in outdoor preaching, visiting local people, addressing gatherings, and holding Bible classes.<sup>84</sup>

The pastoral work in Marpha deserves mention as the congregation was a successful example of self-support. It can be seen from the CMS report in 1895-6:

Mr. Molony refers with excusable pride to the new church, to its whitewashed walls, its home-made furniture, its chalice and paten and alms-bowl of bell-metal turned and polished at Mandla – a local industry – and "looking beautiful"; but more especially to the fact that the whole cost of building and furnishing has been provided through the offertories at the native services,

---

<sup>79</sup> *Proceedings, 1895-96*, 165.

<sup>80</sup> *Proceedings, 1898-99*, 188.

<sup>81</sup> *Proceedings, 1887-88*, 196; *Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: Ninety-Third Year, 1891-92* (London: Church Missionary House, 1892), 95; *Proceedings, 1893-94*, 103; *Proceedings, 1894-95*, 148.

<sup>82</sup> *Proceedings, 1892-93*, 112.

<sup>83</sup> *Proceedings, 1894-95*, 130; *Proceedings, 1903-04*, 185.

<sup>84</sup> *Proceedings, 1894-95*, 130.

with no outside gift except the communion linen, which Mrs. Williamson bestowed.<sup>85</sup>

Molony also gave an account of pastoral activities among his congregation. One year after he was transferred to Jabalpur in March 1905 and became the Secretary of the Central Provinces and Rajputana Mission, he described his duties, which included being “responsible for daily prayers, Sunday services, two weekly Bible-readings, inquirers (ten adults have been baptized in the year), and the many petty affairs that pertain to a Christian congregation.”<sup>86</sup>

#### 4.2.2 China

Between 1860 and 1905, the number of Protestant missionaries in China increased significantly from about 100 to 3500, and most mission societies were especially active in educational work.<sup>87</sup> By 1906, it is estimated that there were 57,000 students in more than 2,500 mission schools. Ridley Hall missionaries were active in this evangelistic work in China. They included Hugh Mortimer Eyton-Jones, a Ridley Hall missionary active in extensive itineration around the Fuh-Ning region. At Fuh-Ning church, an evangelistic service, called an “opportunities meeting,” was held every Sunday evening.<sup>88</sup> In Ningpo W. H. Elwin was in charge of evangelistic work, which included a program called the “station class” for men.<sup>89</sup> The “station class” was a method by which Christians and those who were interested in Christianity in the region were invited to spend two weeks in Bible study in the city.<sup>90</sup> In Shanghai, Charles John FitzSimen Symons was in charge of an evangelistic mission. In the report of 1897-98, Symons and his mission team conducted well-attended daily

---

<sup>85</sup> *Proceedings, 1895-96*, 206.

<sup>86</sup> *Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Seventh Year, 1905-06* (London: Church Missionary House, 1906), 175.

<sup>87</sup> Daniel H. Bays, *A New History of Christianity in China*, Blackwell Guides to Global Christianity (Chichester: Wiley-Blackwell, 2012), 69.

<sup>88</sup> *Proceedings, 1891-92*, 184.

<sup>89</sup> *Proceedings, 1898-99*, 348.

<sup>90</sup> *Proceedings, 1901-02*, 376.

afternoon meetings in the chapel in Nanking Road, and those who wanted a closer study of Christianity gathered every Wednesday evening.<sup>91</sup>

Before being appointed Archdeacon of Kien-ning in 1917, Hugh Stowell Phillips, served as a missionary in several regions in South China.<sup>92</sup> In 1888 he arrived at Fuh Chow and according to a report in 1892 he helped build a small church for a leper community at Ku-Cheng.<sup>93</sup> In 1897, he made several evangelizing efforts in Kien-Yang, including distributing Bibles and Christian tracts among the students who came to the city to sit the government examination. He also conducted open-air preaching and made a weekly visitation to “a village of the blind.”<sup>94</sup>

Educational work was a significant aspect of the mission in China conducted by Ridley Hall students. In 1898, Henry William Moule, son of Bishop Moule, was in charge of three Boys’ Schools in Hang-Chow.<sup>95</sup> W. S. Moule, son of Archdeacon A. E. Moule, also engaged in educational work.<sup>96</sup> In 1898, in Ningpo, in the Province of Cheh-Kiang, Moule became the Principal of Trinity College, which was deemed “the leading educational institution in the Mission.” He continued to head the college after being appointed Archdeacon of Chekiang by Bishop Molony in 1910.<sup>97</sup>

One purpose of Trinity College, Ningpo, was to train local people to be missionaries or pastors. Moule explained that those who wanted to be church workers connected to the CMS were required to go through a period of probation for some years, after which they would enrol in the theological class for two years. Then they might become lay missionaries of the CMS or pastors of local churches. Later, they might be presented to the Bishop for ordination.<sup>98</sup> The influence of

---

<sup>91</sup> *Proceedings, 1897-98*, 350.

<sup>92</sup> *Proceedings, 1888-89*, 185; *Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Nineteenth Year, 1917-18* (London: Church Missionary House, 1918), 99.

<sup>93</sup> *Proceedings, 1891-92*, 185.

<sup>94</sup> *Proceedings, 1898-99*, 347.

<sup>95</sup> *Ibid.*, 359.

<sup>96</sup> *Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: Eighty-Ninth Year, 1887-88* (London: Church Missionary House, 1888), 207.

<sup>97</sup> *Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Twelfth Year, 1910-11* (London: Church Missionary House, 1911), 216; *Proceedings, 1913-14*, 193.

<sup>98</sup> “The Church Missionary Gleaner,” March 1903, 35.

Trinity College can be seen in a CMS report following the retirement of W. S. Moule, after thirty-seven years of service:

We have been privileged to give the first Chinese principal to a mission middle school in Chekiang, the first Chinese pastor to Tokyo, the first Chekiang missionary of the CHSKH [Chung Hua Shen Kung Hui or Church of China] to Shensi; and the first Chinese bishop to the Anglican Church in China. All the pastors in the Chekiang church today and most of the evangelists and school-masters are old college boys.<sup>99</sup>

Ridley Hall missionaries were also active in the publication of Christian literature. W. S. Moule supervised a printing press in Ningpo and in 1905 he translated *Kellogg's Expository Commentary on Leviticus* into Chinese.<sup>100</sup> In 1913, the *Proceedings* gave the following account of Moule's literary contributions:

Archdeacon W.S. Moule wrote expository commentaries in Chinese on the Book of Exodus and the Epistles to the Romans and Ephesians; and exposition of the Thirty-nine Articles and of the Constitution of the Chung Hua Shen Kung Hui (Church of China); and two other books, one "The Tabernacle and Priesthood Explained," and the other "The Second Coming of our Lord."<sup>101</sup>

After being transferred from Jabalpur, India, to become Bishop of Mid-China diocese in 1908, H. J. Molony continued in his commitment to famine relief efforts. Following a severe flood in 1911 in the Chuki district which caused extensive damage to the crops, the CMS report in 1912-13 observed that "With the aid of funds contributed both at home and in the mission field in response to an appeal put forth by Bishop Molony, relief was given to many of the distressed Christians."<sup>102</sup>

#### 4.2.3 Japan

Among the Western missionaries travelling to Japan after 1859, special mention needs to be made of the Ridley Hall student John Batchelor. For forty-six years he served the Ainu people of Japan and was called "the Apostle of the Ainu."<sup>103</sup>

---

<sup>99</sup> *Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Twenty-Sixth Year, 1924-25* (London: Church Missionary House, 1925), 68–9.

<sup>100</sup> *Proceedings, 1905-06*, 320.

<sup>101</sup> *Proceedings, 1913-14*, 193.

<sup>102</sup> *Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Fourteenth Year, 1912-13* (London: Church Missionary House, 1913), 201.

<sup>103</sup> *Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Twenty-Fifth Year, 1923-24* (London: Church Missionary House, 1924), 78.

Batchelor joined the CMS in 1879 and reached Hakodate at the same year. In 1882 he returned to England and studied at Ridley Hall for one term before going back to Japan. He worked in the island of Yezo and learned the language of Ainu, in which “he is the first person who has ever preached the gospel.”<sup>104</sup> The first Ainu Christian was Kanari Taro, who was baptized on Christmas day in 1885.<sup>105</sup> A mission school for Ainus was founded at Horobetsu in 1887 with thirteen pupils and Taro was appointed the schoolmaster.<sup>106</sup> While at the end of 1891 there were only nine Ainu people who had been baptized, in 1893 there was a significant increase in the number of church members with 171 baptisms and around 200 catechumens. In 1910 Batchelor became Archdeacon and in 1924 he retired from active service. His service was acknowledged by the Japanese government and he was made an “unofficial member of the Hokkaido Government.”<sup>107</sup> Batchelor produced a translation of the whole New Testament in the Ainu language.<sup>108</sup>

Another evangelistic effort was made by Reginald Henry Consterdine, a former Curate of Holy Trinity, Cheltenham.<sup>109</sup> In 1897 he was placed in Tokushima station, where he attempted to bring the gospel to people in a highland region.<sup>110</sup> At Fukuyama, Sydney Swann conducted evangelistic and pastoral work for some time before taking up the work of chaplaincy at Kobe in 1895.<sup>111</sup> In 1898 Frederick William Rowlands joined the CMS staff at Kagoshima, serving for several years before he resigned in 1908 and worked as an independent missionary.

There was also an evangelistic effort among Chinese students in Tokyo conducted by W. H. Elwin. By the end of 1905, in the aftermath of the Russo-Japanese war, it was estimated that more than 8,000 Chinese students had gone to

---

<sup>104</sup> *Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: Eighty-Third Year, 1881-82* (London: Church Missionary House, 1882), 198.

<sup>105</sup> *Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: Eighty-Seventh Year, 1885-86* (London: Church Missionary House, 1886), 204.

<sup>106</sup> *Proceedings, 1887-88*, 224.

<sup>107</sup> *Proceedings, 1923-24*, 78.

<sup>108</sup> *Proceedings, 1897-98*, 399.

<sup>109</sup> *Proceedings, 1893-94*, 212.

<sup>110</sup> *Proceedings, 1896-97*, 376-7.

<sup>111</sup> *Proceedings, 1894-95*, 283.

study in Japan.<sup>112</sup> In 1907 Elwin was sent by the CMS to Japan, after previously serving in China for almost ten years.<sup>113</sup> This mission work was considered very important as many of those educated by the missionaries later occupied important positions in the Chinese government. During the revolution in China it was estimated that around seventy percent of the Nanking revolutionary government officials had studied in Tokyo.<sup>114</sup>

The work of missionary education was taken up by Horace Price, who was transferred from the West Africa Mission to Japan in 1890. He was stationed at Osaka and became Principal of The Boys' High School which started with 21 new pupils, of whom 7 were Christians. He soon started a Saturday Bible class at the request of the non-Christian students.<sup>115</sup> At the end of 1899 he became the Principal of the Divinity School and also the Secretary of the diocese of Osaka.<sup>116</sup> This educational ministry ended when he was appointed the Archdeacon of Osaka in 1901 and later consecrated Bishop of Fuh-Kien in 1906.<sup>117</sup>

#### 4.2.4 Ceylon (Sri Lanka)

Many Ridley Hall missionaries served with the Tamil Coolie Mission. This Mission arose from the need of missionaries to serve the large number of Tamils who came from Tinnevely, South India, to work in coffee planting in south-central Ceylon. Because some of these coffee workers, often called coolies, were Christians, there had been an agreement since 1854 that the planters would cover the costs of bringing over and supporting local catechists from Tinnevely, while the CMS would provide missionaries to oversee the local catechists.<sup>118</sup> William Welchman, a former Curate of St. Paul's, Leamington, superintended the catechizing among the coolies at Kandy district from 1894.<sup>119</sup> Kandy was a vast area containing 500 estates with

---

<sup>112</sup> Hopkins, *The Keswick Week, 1906*, 216.

<sup>113</sup> "The Church Missionary Gleaner, 1915," 180.

<sup>114</sup> *Proceedings, 1913-14*, 207.

<sup>115</sup> *Proceedings, 1890-91*, 197-8.

<sup>116</sup> *Proceedings, 1900-01*, 465.

<sup>117</sup> *Proceedings, 1901-02*, 398; *Proceedings, 1906-07*, 281.

<sup>118</sup> Gibbs, *The Anglican Church in India*, 263.

<sup>119</sup> *Proceedings, 1895-96*, 297.

around 100,000 coolies. Another district, Haputala, was under the supervision of John William Fall from 1895.<sup>120</sup> In 1914 A. K. Finnimore, who previously served in Tinnevely and Mauritius, India, became responsible for the Tamil Coolie Mission in central division, which covered 14 districts containing 200,000 coolies, most of them non-Christians.<sup>121</sup>

Educational work was important for the missionaries in Ceylon. While elementary teaching was usually included in the Tamil Coolie Mission, there were also colleges in Ceylon. J. W. Fall was in charge of St. John's College at Chundicully, Jaffna, for three years before he moved to Haputala in 1895. At Kandy Henry Percy Napier-Clavering was Principal of Trinity College until 1900.<sup>122</sup>

As has been described above, the mission activities of the Ridley Hall missionaries comprised not only evangelistic work, but also educational, famine relief, and literary work. Questions concerning the best method of communicating the gospel, whether priority should be given to civilization or direct preaching, had been debated in Britain since the eighteenth century. In 1835, the India missionary Alexander Duff delivered an influential speech at the Church of Scotland General Assembly, gaining considerable support for the civilizing method in mission.<sup>123</sup> On the other hand, in England, most evangelical missions from the late eighteenth to the mid-nineteenth centuries supported the priority of direct preaching over civilization. By mid-1830s, however, English mission theorists accepted, based on experience, "the wisdom of a practical partnership between the two."<sup>124</sup>

The missionaries also made considerable use of itinerating and outdoor preaching. Since Scripture played a key role in holiness teaching, there was a need for Bible translation, especially among the Ainu people. In China the missionaries were active in the translation of Bible commentaries.

---

<sup>120</sup> *Proceedings, 1894-95*, 288.

<sup>121</sup> *Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Sixteenth Year, 1914-15* (London: Church Missionary House, 1915), 168.

<sup>122</sup> *Proceedings, 1900-01*, 378.

<sup>123</sup> Maxwell, "Civilization or Christianity?", 136-40. .

<sup>124</sup> Brian Stanley, "Christianity and Civilization in English Evangelical Mission Thought, 1792-1857," in *Christian Missions and the Enlightenment*, ed. Brian Stanley, Studies in the History of Christian Missions (Grand Rapids; Cambridge: W. Eerdmans Pub; Curzon Press, 2001), 176, 192.

### 4.3 The Holiness Emphasis of the Ridley Hall Missionaries

The holiness teaching of the Principal of the Ridley Hall, Handley Moule, profoundly influenced the way his students conducted their missions. Ridley Hall missionaries who served in Asia exhibited several holiness features, which will be discussed in this section.

#### 4.3.1 Communion with God

One such holiness feature was an emphasis on personal communion with God. At the Reunion of 1899, Robert Buchanan Marriott shared his seven-year experience as a missionary in India, describing how he needed to draw “spiritual strength direct from God” in the midst of the severe climate, the demanding work of evangelisation, and the feeling of loneliness.<sup>125</sup> Charles Massey Gough, who served as a missionary to Narowal, India, also stressed a similar point. After seven years in the mission field, he found that the gospel was not desired, he felt his work seemed to be a failure, and that missionary work was “utterly unromantic.” He then gained renewed confidence from the “power of communion” with Christ.<sup>126</sup>

Another missionary from Ridley Hall, the Rev. A. K. Finnimore pointed out the importance of prayer in a very challenging situation. In 1886, Finnimore was appointed as the Chairman of the Native Church Council for North Tinnevely a district comprising 1600 square miles and 500,000 residents, among whom there were 5,270 Christians among 235 villages. The sense of heavy responsibility and the feeling of loneliness and inexperience put him under considerable strain. Aware of his need for spiritual help, he devoted much of his time to prayer, which for him proved “the most powerful weapon.”<sup>127</sup> Afterwards he held gatherings for native Christian workers and believers, at which they practiced prayer and Bible study.<sup>128</sup>

---

<sup>125</sup> Moule, *Annual Letter*, 1899, 37.

<sup>126</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>127</sup> *Proceedings*, 1887-88, 163.

<sup>128</sup> *Proceedings*, 1888-89, 155.

#### 4.3.2 Emphasis on Holy Living

Ridley Hall missionaries, especially C. M. Gough, were concerned over the motives of their converts. Gough mentioned that in the Narowal district many Indian people from the lower castes desired to become Christians not because they embraced Christian teaching, but rather to improve their social status, as the status of Christian was preferable to their own caste.<sup>129</sup> In order to guard against such nominal converts, Gough applied strict requirements to any catechumens who sought baptism. In particular, Gough insisted that catechumens keep the Sabbath regularly, as Sunday observance would test the sincerity of their faith. Because a large number of potential Narowal converts worked for Moslem or Hindu landowners, they were compelled to work on Sundays. Gough demanded that new converts made “at least some genuine attempt” to come to Sunday worship and even suffer dismissal from employment, if necessary, “for the sake of Christ.”<sup>130</sup> Once he had insisted on the strict observance of the Sabbath from those seeking baptism, Gough reported that the number of baptisms became very small.<sup>131</sup>

The insistence on practical Christian living as a requirement for baptism also characterised the mission of H. J. Molony. While he served as a missionary at Patpara, India, he noted that many children from an orphanage built during the famine of 1896 asked to be baptised. Molony insisted on Christian behaviour in determining whether a child was admitted into the church membership, as was shown in the following extract from Molony’s annual report:

I have lately examined thirty children who desired to be Christians; seven boys and eight girls I passed and baptized on Christmas Day ... I found that they knew practically nothing about idolatry, sorcery, and witchcraft, but that all their ideas were Christian .... All those baptized know the Lord’s Prayer, Ten Commandments, and Apostles’ Creed, and satisfied me that they had grasped for their own souls the essential truths of sin and of salvation through Jesus Christ. They also had a good report as to character, conduct, and knowledge from the catechists in charge. I rejected some because I was told that they

---

<sup>129</sup> *Proceedings, 1901-02, 249.*

<sup>130</sup> *Proceedings, 1898-99, 224.*

<sup>131</sup> *Proceedings, 1901-02, 249.*

were quarrelsome, disobedient, or idle, and others because they seemed to be wanting in knowledge of the truths of salvation.<sup>132</sup>

That commitment to a life characterised by holiness should be demonstrated before an individual was admitted to a Christian community was evident in John Batchelor's mission among the Ainu people. Batchelor began his work in Piratori, where he met Chief Penri, who became his teacher of the Ainu language and gave him "a corner of his hut."<sup>133</sup> Batchelor used the hut to hold Sunday services, and as the base from which he itinerated. He had a great hope that Penri would become Christian as he took "a very great interest in the religion of Jesus," but found that intemperance was "his great stumbling-block." Japanese rice wine was commonly used in all kinds of Ainu ceremonies, religious or secular. Batchelor wrote his hopes for the chief, "I earnestly hope and pray strength will be given him from on high, and he will become a conqueror of self and a true follower of Jesus."<sup>134</sup> Unfortunately, after about two years, Batchelor gave up his hopes for "poor old" Penri, who had "entirely given himself up to strong drink."<sup>135</sup>

Another holiness characteristic reflected in the work of some Ridley Hall missionaries was dissatisfaction with the spiritual life of native members of the congregations. C. M. Gough, who was a Vicar of Steeple Claydon before coming to India, was convinced that the majority were "Christians only in name," as many of them neglected Sunday services, married unbelievers, or became Christian for mixed motives. He then expressed his hope, "I look forward to the day when God will in His own way and time raise up some Indian 'Moody,' who shall be used to bring thousands of merely nominal Christians to the feet of Christ."<sup>136</sup>

This disappointment was shared by C. G. Mylrea, who reported that the majority of church members in Bhagalpur were indifferent to Christian teachings and had no enthusiasm to share the gospel with others.<sup>137</sup> Mylrea also pointed out

---

<sup>132</sup> *Proceedings, 1899-1900*, 243-4.

<sup>133</sup> *Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: Eighty-Fifth Year, 1883-84* (London: Church Missionary House, 1884), 212.

<sup>134</sup> *Ibid.*, 213.

<sup>135</sup> *Proceedings, 1885-86*, 203.

<sup>136</sup> *Proceedings, 1902-03*, 237.

<sup>137</sup> *Proceedings, 1897-98*, 195.

the members' lack of understanding of sin and holiness, observing that for them a "grievous fall is often looked upon as misfortune, rather than as an offence against God's holiness."<sup>138</sup> From Multan in India, W. F. Cobb, who superintended the missionary work there, spoke of the congregation there as lacking of love and being divided among themselves, and mentioned that there were some incidents which caused "great sorrow and shame."<sup>139</sup> In China, W. S. Moule, who was appointed as an Archdeacon in Chekiang in 1910, made negative comments concerning the spiritual condition of the Christians in the district: "Unbelief is chilling the very life out of the Chinese church."<sup>140</sup> He then pointed out several examples of unchristian behaviour in different regions. In Chuki, some believers continuously asked for the missionaries' help in law courts while some others gave little thought to teaching their children about Christianity. In the East Lake District, the spiritual life of the congregations was growing cold as many Christians did not attend Sunday worship and allowed their children to marry non-Christians, whereas in Ningpo members of one congregation were involved in gambling.<sup>141</sup>

Missionaries responded differently to what they perceived as the low moral and spiritual standards in their congregations. One example can be seen from the report in 1905 by James Punnett Butlin, a missionary to Western India, who found that quarrelling, fighting, and drinking were common among the church members at Malegam. In response, Butlin endeavoured to "cleanse the church."<sup>142</sup> He preached a series of sermons on practical themes, exploring the biblical teachings on such matters as anger, slander, and Sabbath-breaking. He also held a series of meetings for deepening devotional life, discussing the themes of prayer, Bible-reading, consecration, and the second coming of Christ. To deal with the issue of drunkenness, he formed a temperance society. One result was that during a prayer meeting, "People came forward and made up quarrels and

---

<sup>138</sup> *Proceedings, 1898-99*, 188.

<sup>139</sup> *Proceedings, 1905-06*, 195-6.

<sup>140</sup> *Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Thirteenth Year, 1911-12* (London: Church Missionary House, 1912), 182.

<sup>141</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>142</sup> *Proceedings, 1905-06*, 217.

confessed sins. Many who had never opened their mouths in prayer before now did so for the first time in the confession of sin.”<sup>143</sup>

In South India Edwin Albert Douglas took several steps to remedy what he viewed as the spiritual errors of the congregation in Mengnanapuram. Among the “weaknesses” of the church members were, “The light view of sin, the ‘cheap’ idea of forgiveness... lying and deceit, the passion for money and the law courts, the ‘blindness in part’ to the truth of the keeping power of Christ, the withering influence of caste spirit, and the bondage of custom.” Douglas personally visited church members and held special mission services in various stations for Christians and missionary agents. As a result, he claimed, a few believers no longer felt content with a “lower level” of Christian life, but sought the “higher life and fuller liberty of the Spirit,” themes from the Keswick teaching.<sup>144</sup> Another missionary in South India, Edmund Stileman Carr, who replaced T. Walker as the Chairman of the District Church Council, mentioned his longing for the outpouring of the Holy Spirit in order to make live “a mass of dry Christian bones,” because many church members in Tinnevely were involved in irregular marriages and others became backsliders.<sup>145</sup> A day of prayer for humiliation and intercession was then fixed on 12 December 1897, to ask for God’s blessing in addressing those spiritual problems.<sup>146</sup>

Ridley Hall missionaries also worked for a stricter exercise of discipline. Butlin asserted that when several native mission agents in Malegam were found in the state of extreme drunkenness, they were severely fined by the CMS.<sup>147</sup> More often, the disciplinary process led to excommunication. In Narowal Gough stated that nominal Christians were weeded out once “their true characters became evident.”<sup>148</sup>

---

<sup>143</sup> *Proceedings, 1905-06*, 217.

<sup>144</sup> *Proceedings, 1900-01*, 345.

<sup>145</sup> *Proceedings, 1897-98*, 284.

<sup>146</sup> *Ibid.*, 285.

<sup>147</sup> *Proceedings, 1905-06*, 217.

<sup>148</sup> *Ibid.*, 191.

### 4.3.3 Holiness Conferences

The practice of holding holiness meetings in Britain was transmitted to the mission fields. Under Moule's leadership, Ridley Hall students became familiar with Keswick teaching and gatherings, and the visit of Keswick speakers in 1883 encouraged Ridley Hall members to attend the holiness conventions. Bernard Herklots, who served as a clergyman in Leeds after several years as a missionary with the CMS to India, wrote about the importance of attending holiness gatherings such as Keswick:

As a further suggestion, the holding ... of Church or interdenominational Conventions, for leading our people with ourselves into deeper experiences of the gift of the Holy Ghost. How much has "Keswick," and all the gatherings ... which directly or indirectly have sprung from it, not done for the spiritual life of the Church of Christ? If you cannot go to Keswick, or get your people there, then bring Keswick in some form or other to you. Let there be in your town or parish a humble and united waiting upon God for the gift in a new and more glorious degree of the Holy Spirit.<sup>149</sup>

The Keswick periodicals revealed the attendance of several Ridley Hall members at the Keswick conventions, where they spoke at the missionary meetings. They included J. M. Challis in 1900, C. G. Mylrea in 1903, C. H. Gill in 1904, and W. H. Elwin in 1906.<sup>150</sup> M. E. Gibbs states that H. J. Molony, Edmund Wigram, and Edmund Carr were "directly the product of Keswick," which suggests their participation in the Keswick Conventions. In addition, she has briefly mentioned that the Keswick movement "made its impact on India" by British missionaries who "travelled through the land holding meetings in the principal centres."<sup>151</sup>

Conferences for deepening devotional life were held in Malegam and Mengnanapuram, and many other mission centers. In Sacheapuram, North Tinnevely, A. K. Finnimore organized a series of nine holiness meetings for the native agents who gathered there during the Quarterly Church Council in October 1887, the impact of which was "to give a quieter and more spiritual tone" to the

---

<sup>149</sup> Bernard Herklots, *The Future of the Evangelical Party in the Church of England* (London, 1913), 78.

<sup>150</sup> Hopkins, *The Keswick Week, 1900*, 202; Hopkins, *The Keswick Week, 1903*, 210; Hopkins, *The Keswick Week, 1904*, 201; Hopkins, *The Keswick Week, 1906*, 216.

<sup>151</sup> Gibbs, *The Anglican Church in India*, 335–6.

Council's proceedings.<sup>152</sup> At the missionary meeting of the Keswick Convention in 1904, C. H. Gill mentioned that two holiness conventions had been held in India. In Kagoshima, Japan, F. W. Rowlands arranged a series of holiness meetings in 1902 after experiencing what he called "a sense of divine visitation."<sup>153</sup> In China, H. W. Moule, after one Chinese New Year, held a series of devotional meetings in order to address the low attendance at Sunday classes and weekly prayer meetings.<sup>154</sup> In Ningpo, China, W. H. Elwin, at the time chairman of the Native Church Council, appointed a Committee to arrange for a holiness conference.<sup>155</sup> While Gibbs singled out Thomas Walker as the main promoter of holiness conventions in India, this section of the thesis has shown that Ridley Hall members also played an important role, not only in India, but in China as well.

As the late nineteenth-century British holiness movement reached the mission fields in Asia, some missionaries showed sympathy for the movement. In 1896 E. A. Douglas took 14 students from Tinnevely to attend a student conference in Madras, the aim of which was "a trumpet-call to students to systematic Bible-study and a waiting upon God for a fuller endowment of the Holy Spirit, and to take their part in the evangelization of India." After hearing the practical message of Robert Wilder on the theme of the fullness of the Spirit and John R. Mott's "burning words" on personal holiness, 170 students decided to keep "Morning Watch" and 41 students declared their commitment to evangelize India.<sup>156</sup> The link between the Student Volunteer Movement in America and Ridley Hall was apparent in their affinity to Keswick holiness teaching. Robert Wilder and John Mott, both the leaders of the Student Volunteer Movement, were heavily influenced by holiness movement thinking. According to Parker, "the leaders of the SVM who spoke regularly at the Northfield conferences, when not speaking on mission themes,

---

<sup>152</sup> *Proceedings, 1887-88*, 163.

<sup>153</sup> *Proceedings, 1901-02*, 420.

<sup>154</sup> Probably in 1918, *Proceedings, 1917-18*, 109.

<sup>155</sup> *Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Sixth Year, 1904-05*, (London: Church Missionary House, 1905), 377.

<sup>156</sup> *Proceedings, 1896-97*, 265.

invariably joined the swelling chorus of holiness speakers.”<sup>157</sup> In affirming the notion of “total consecration,” Mott was influenced by J. E. K. Studd, while Robert Wilder was “a devotee of Morning Watch.”<sup>158</sup> From North-West India, E. A. Hensley, who was in charge of mission work at Jabalpur, gave an account of spiritual movement that he longed for; this movement was influenced by a woman who had had a spiritual experience under the ministry of Pandita Ramabai at Mukti village, in the Maratha country. One result was the religious experience of a teacher of Church of England Zenana Mission Society, who after a communion service on September 1, 1906, felt to be “under deep conviction for about three hours, yearning for the Spirit’s fullness, and in the night she yielded herself unreservedly to God, and received His gift of the fullness of the Spirit.” A few days later other teachers were affected, and many of them received the “definite blessing.”<sup>159</sup>

#### 4.3.4 Emphasis on Holiness Themes

Ridley Hall missionaries emphasized holiness themes such as consecration and the power of the Holy Spirit for effective mission service. C. M. Gough, a few months after his arrival in 1893 at Quettah, India, stated that in response to what he termed the widespread spiritual darkness and ignorance in India, they urgently needed “more workers, more heart-whole consecration, more prayer, more of the power of the Holy Ghost.”<sup>160</sup> In Lucknow, in North-West India, J. S. Gray gave a similar account of the spiritual condition of the local people, referring to the power of the Holy Spirit as the only effective means to “awaken these dead souls.”<sup>161</sup> At the CMS farewell meeting on 30 November 1904, held at the Exeter Hall, A. I. Birkett, the leader of Bhil mission, insisted that for successful missionary work, both church members at home and missionaries abroad needed to be fully consecrated.<sup>162</sup> W. S. Moule, in the Training College that he led, emphasized the teaching of “dwelling in

---

<sup>157</sup> Parker, *The Kingdom of Character*, 37.

<sup>158</sup> *Ibid.*, 37, 39.

<sup>159</sup> *Proceedings, 1906-07*, 182.

<sup>160</sup> *Proceedings, 1893-94*, 133.

<sup>161</sup> *Proceedings, 1891-92*, 95.

<sup>162</sup> “The Church Missionary Gleaner,” November 1904, 163.

Christ, and Christ in us,” and spoke of the importance of “Christ being near us and in us, to keep us from morning till night, in whatever occupation we were engaged.”<sup>163</sup>

This holiness emphasis reflected Principal Moule’s influence on the missionaries who had been his students at the Ridley Hall. The concept of dwelling in Christ or living a life of inward communion with Christ, a main theme in Handley Moule’s *Annual Letters*, was taught in China by his nephew, W. S. Moule. The practice of the morning watch was also taught in India. Some missionaries testified to the spiritual benefit of prayer and keeping fellowship with God in the mission fields, among them A. K. Finnimore. Although Finnimore had studied at Ridley Hall only briefly during the Long Vacation Term in 1882,<sup>164</sup> before Principal Moule had fully embraced the Keswick movement in 1884, he may have later embraced Moule’s holiness teaching by reading his annual letters. From 1884 bulletins were circulated to all members of the Ridley Hall community together with personal letters of the Principal, offering guidance to his former students “in their pastoral work and in their own personal religious experience.”<sup>165</sup>

#### 4.3.5 Ridley Hall Missionaries and Pentecostalism

There is no evidence that any Ridley Hall missionaries before 1906 were drawn towards what would later be known as Pentecostalism. The theological curriculum in Ridley Hall was highly effective in shaping and affirming evangelical Anglican positions for its students. The Principal taught Christian doctrine three times a week, as well as the history and contents of the Prayer Book.<sup>166</sup> He also gave an exposition on the Greek New Testament in the morning: “Mr. Moule’s Greek New Testament readings were a great feature of Ridley life, highly appreciated by the members of the Hall. Occupying some 15 minutes each week-day, he usually went through an

---

<sup>163</sup> *Proceedings, 1892-93*, 198.

<sup>164</sup> Bullock, *The History of Ridley Hall*, 1:190.

<sup>165</sup> *Ibid.*, 1:211.

<sup>166</sup> Bullock, *The History of Ridley Hall*, 1:230.

entire Epistle, taking a few verses every day...He translated the Greek, adding comments, partly exegetical, partly devotional, and the men took notes.”<sup>167</sup>

The theological education at Ridley Hall distinguished its missionaries from Keswick missionaries and the Cambridge Seven regarding Pentecostal teachings. Except for Montagu Beauchamp and Arthur Polhill, neither the Cambridge Seven nor the Keswick missionaries received formal training in evangelical Anglican theology before going to Asian mission fields. This might explain how Alice Luce, Cecil Polhill, and Stanley Smith could be more receptive to Pentecostal experience and theology. The fact that Ridley Hall missionaries embraced mainstream Anglican theology might also call Porter’s negative view of the theological training at Ridley Hall into question. While Porter argued that Ridley Hall education “encouraged a preference for piety over learning,” Ridley Hall training was sufficient to make its missionaries cautious about Pentecostal teachings.<sup>168</sup>

#### 4.4 Responses of Ridley Hall Missionaries to Issues in Indian and Chinese Culture

The attitude of some Ridley Hall missionaries towards Hinduism was primarily antagonistic. They often likened Hinduism to darkness and insisted that Indian people needed Christianity to give them light. J. S. Gray who served in Lucknow wrote, “The heathen in Lucknow and in the district around have for ages been in such thick darkness and superstition that they have fallen into a very deep sleep, and nothing but the power of the Holy Ghost can awaken these dead souls.”<sup>169</sup> A similar observation was shared by W. Welchman in his early missionary career in Ceylon: “My first impressions on landing were that heathenism is a very real power. I had never felt what it really meant until I saw it in all its blackness and horror. The discovery made me feel more than ever the blessed privilege of being called to bring Light to such dark lives.”<sup>170</sup>

---

<sup>167</sup> Ibid., 1:180.

<sup>168</sup> Porter, *Religion Versus Empire?*, 248.

<sup>169</sup> Proceedings 1892-3, 103.

<sup>170</sup> Ibid., 169.

Any involvement with Hinduism was seen as an idolatry so that any kinds of Hindu practice could not be tolerated. This was particularly evident in the missionary work of E. S. Carr in South India. He excommunicated Indian Christians who engaged with Hindu customs. In the South India district of Tinnevely, he reported that between 1892 and 1897, 1,100 church members were excommunicated out of a total of 52,451.<sup>171</sup> After 1897, the number excommunicated was between 250 and 400 annually.<sup>172</sup> According to Carr, who at the time was the Chairman of the District Church Council, a legislative body for the Christian churches in connection with the CMS, disciplinary cases mainly involved irregular marriages, relapsing into Hinduism or Islam, or being involved in pagan ritual.<sup>173</sup> One of the areas most affected was Alankulam, where, according to CMS report in 1895, excommunications caused the number of the congregation to fall from over 2,000 to 200.<sup>174</sup>

Irregular marriage was a violation to the Indian Christian Marriage Act of 1864, which held that a marriage “had to be performed before an ordained minister, in a house of worship, and the officiant had to speak words to the effect that the marriage did not contravene any of the regulations that defined legal marriage.”<sup>175</sup> Eliza Kent gave an example of this issue when Robert Caldwell of the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel complained of Indian Christians’ modifying the ceremony of marriage, in which “in place of a formal wedding in a church, rural Christians often conducted very simple ceremonies in their home that consisted only in reciting the Lord’s Prayer and a relative’s tying the south Indian symbol of marriage, the *tali*, around the neck of the bride.”<sup>176</sup>

The people who were excommunicated because of irregular marriages could be accepted as members again in the church if they were willing to show repentance by cancelling the marriages and be married according to the law. Carr

---

<sup>171</sup> *Proceedings, 1897-98*, 285.

<sup>172</sup> *Proceedings, 1900-01*, 342.

<sup>173</sup> *Proceedings, 1898-99*, 278.

<sup>174</sup> *Proceedings, 1894-95*, 213.

<sup>175</sup> Eliza Kent, *Converting Women*, 169.

<sup>176</sup> *Ibid.*

reported in 1905 that, “many who had been subjected to discipline in previous years sought restoration, and were even willing to lose the thali (marriage badge) and be married properly, a course which indicated genuine repentance.”<sup>177</sup> This act of removing the ‘tali’ was considered as “a great disgrace to them.” In many cases of irregular marriages, Indian Christians married unbelievers who came from the same caste, which is why they performed the marriage at home rather than at a church. In order to be reconciled to the church, while the Indian Christians needed to remove their marriage badge, “the non-Christian party,” as Carr recorded, “in many cases being baptized after a course of instruction, and giving some evidence, at least, of reality.”<sup>178</sup>

Not all Ridley Hall missionaries took uncompromising attitudes towards caste. In 1894 H. J. Molony observed that the Gond Christians were not willing to join missionaries in Holy Communion or Christmas dinner. Their reason of their holding back from eating together with them, according to another CMS missionary, E. R. Jackson, was that they were afraid “their neighbours and acquaintances will not eat with them or give their sons and daughters in marriage with their children.”<sup>179</sup> Although Molony considered this reluctance as “a real barrier” to “our brotherhood in Christ,” he did not take any measure to discipline those church members.<sup>180</sup> But it is interesting to note that for Molony this behaviour was not a “caste” issue since “it is certainly not religious but social.”<sup>181</sup> Two years later he reported that this “social exclusiveness” was “diminishing.”<sup>182</sup>

At Ningpo in China, W. S. Moule’s wife was in charge of twenty-one pupils in a Girl’s Boarding School, all of whom had “unbound feet.”<sup>183</sup> The fact that all the girls came from families which practiced foot-binding indicates that W. S. Moule opposed the custom.

---

<sup>177</sup> *Proceedings, 1904-05*, 287–8.

<sup>178</sup> *Proceedings, 1902-03*, 287.

<sup>179</sup> *Proceedings 1893-4*, 113.

<sup>180</sup> *Ibid.*, 112.

<sup>181</sup> *Proceedings 1893-4*, 112.

<sup>182</sup> *Proceedings 1895-6*, 205.

<sup>183</sup> *Proceedings 1892-3*, 202.

## 4.5 Ridley Hall Missionaries and Missionary Practice

### 4.5.1 Ridley Hall Missionaries and Education

The CMS tended to combine preaching with educational work in a broad sense. According to Steven Maughan, two significant CMS figures, Eugene Stock and Frederick Wigram, the CMS Secretary, believed that “evangelization was complex and depended on the direct evangelism provided by itinerant preaching of the gospel, but also on the more diffuse culturally transformative efforts provided by educational work, medical missions, literary work, and the like.”<sup>184</sup>

The CMS records show that in Asia, nineteen Ridley Hall missionaries were involved purely in educational work, thirteen missionaries focused on itinerant evangelization, and twenty others engaged both in education and itineration. Elementary teaching became an especially significant form of ministry as it was believed to be an effective means to introduce Christianity to children. This reflected the work of Anglican schools among children in Britain, which according to a report of 1861, provided education to “76% of all day school children in England.”<sup>185</sup>

Ridley Hall missionaries increasingly saw education as an effective means for evangelisation. C. H. Gill described his experience of Bible teaching at schools in Allahabad as a way of reducing the prejudice of Indian pupils towards Christianity: “I have found each hour a good opportunity for a simple explanation of some passage of a Gospel, and a straight talk about Christ.”<sup>186</sup> W. Welchman wrote from his own experience as a missionary in Ceylon, “The longer I remain out here the more I feel that ... school work is the most important evangelistic agency that can be employed.” One effect of the mission schools was that “the lessons learnt are repeated in the homes of the children,” and he gave an example of a father who became a Christian after “hearing his little daughter repeat the words of the gospel

---

<sup>184</sup> Maughan, *Mighty England Do Good*, 157.

<sup>185</sup> Shaw, *Churches, Revolutions, and Empires*, 215.

<sup>186</sup> *Proceedings 1890-91*, 107.

which she had been taught at school.”<sup>187</sup> From Masulipatam, C. W. A. Clarke highlighted the importance of educational mission in reaching high caste Indians, “No missionary in the world can have finer opportunities for influencing and moulding the educated classes of a country than the educational missionary in India.”<sup>188</sup>

The work of the theological colleges was no less important as they trained many future Indian evangelists, preachers and pastors. Seven Ridley Hall missionaries became principals of theological colleges in Asia. While in Japan H. McC. E. Price was the Principal of the CMS Divinity School, Osaka (1900-1903), six others served as principals in India: W. F. Cobb at St. John’s College, Lahore (1905); C. Grant at the Divinity School, Bengal (1904-1908);<sup>189</sup> R. S. Heywood at the CMS Divinity College, Poona (1894-1901); P. Ireland Jones at the CMS Divinity School, Calcutta (1885-1892); R. F. Pearce at the CMS Divinity School, Cossipur (1911-1915); E. F. E. Wigram at St. John’s Divinity School, Lahore (1896-1907); and J. A. Wood at St. John’s Divinity School, Lahore (1907-1911) and Edwardes College, Peshawar (1914-1920).<sup>190</sup>

Although educational work was pursued by most mission societies, its particular prominence among Ridley Hall missionaries may have been owing to the influence that John Barton brought to Cambridge as an experienced missionary in India. Barton himself was initially averse to the notion of educational missions, until he met Alexander Duff, the pioneer of educational missions in India, soon after arriving in Calcutta. He then expressed the view, in a letter to the CMS Committee, that an effective missionary should be able to teach not only the Bible, but also other subjects:

If the teacher is to have that influence over the pupil... – then it is absolutely necessary that the teacher should be able to direct his pupil’s other studies, and to show him that Christianity does not unfit a man for the practical duties

---

<sup>187</sup> *Proceedings, 1898-99*, 311.

<sup>188</sup> *Proceedings 1888-9*, 146.

<sup>189</sup> C. Grant was in capacity of Acting Principal.

<sup>190</sup> Bullock, *The History of Ridley Hall*, 1:338–40.

of life, but gives him a new motive, that of love for the Saviour who died for him, to devote his time, his talents, and his energies to the glory of God.<sup>191</sup>

When he served in St John's College, Agra, he taught Indian pupils, alongside the Bible, a number of subjects such as history, mathematics, geography, and English grammar.<sup>192</sup> Barton's confidence in educational mission and his teaching experience in India, appears to have been replicated in the Ridley Hall holiness missionaries in their work in Asia.

Unlike Carmichael's rejection of the government grants in her Dohnavur educational work, the CMS mission schools continued to receive the government grants, including those served by the Ridley Hall missionaries. This represents a significant difference of approach between the holiness missionary case studies. The government grants enabled mission schools to offer higher education and become respected educational institutions. Their students were equipped to pass government examinations and many of them occupied positions in Indian government. Neill observes that mission schools helped make "Christianity intellectually respectable in the main cultural and administrative centres of Indian life," as well as providing growing local church with "almost all the highly educated Indian ministers." Without this "prosperous middle-class element," Neill argued, "the Indian church could not so rapidly have become self-governing and self-supporting."<sup>193</sup>

While Carmichael insisted that mission schools only employed Christian believers, the Ridley Hall missionaries were prepared to recruit non-Christians to be teachers in their schools when need arose. After S. R. Morse recruited six new teachers for the High School at Bhagalpur, it was reported that while the new teachers were no doubt, "competent", "unhappily the dearth of Christian teachers was so great that only four of the twelve [teachers now] employed in the school were converts."<sup>194</sup> The Divinity School at Calcutta, where Charles Grant served as

---

<sup>191</sup> Barton, *John Barton*, 37.

<sup>192</sup> *Ibid.*, 36.

<sup>193</sup> Stephen Neill, *A History of Christianity in India*, 330.

<sup>194</sup> *Proceedings, 1899-1900*, 207.

Vice-Principal, appointed two Hindu Bengali lecturers on Sanskrit, mathematics, and science, because it was deemed “impossible to find Christians who were qualified for the work.”<sup>195</sup> While the Ridley Hall missionaries preferred to appoint Christian converts to teach at mission schools, they would appoint non-Christians in order to maintain a certain standard of education, although they hoped this would be only a temporary measure. C. B. Clarke, Principal of Christian Boys’ Boarding School at Calcutta, was grateful that the teaching staff in 1899 was “almost entirely composed of Christians,” with seven Christian teachers and only one Hindu, compared with two Christians and six Hindu teachers in 1895.<sup>196</sup>

#### 4.5.2 Ridley Hall Missionaries and Itinerant Preaching and Evangelism

Although many Ridley Hall missionaries were active in education, many others focused their work on itinerating evangelisation. In India, some Ridley Hall missionaries were involved in the Band of Associated Evangelists. Some missionaries conducted evangelistic tours or held weekly open-air preaching, while some others combined it with pastoral responsibility. Evangelistic mission tours were also conducted in China, together with distribution of Bibles and Christian tracts. In Japan, John Batchelor conducted significant mission work. He was not only the first preacher who communicated the gospel in Ainu language, but also active in founding church, mission school, and in the work of Bible translation.

#### 4.5.3 Ridley Hall Missionaries and Medical Work

The Ridley Hall missionaries who went to Asia did not embark on further training in medicine or become directly involved in medical work, but they recognised its value. In an article of the *Church Missionary Gleaner*, Moule encouraged young believers to think of missionary calling as a privilege, and ask themselves, “Can it be graciously granted to me as a clerical missionary, as a medical missionary – doctor

---

<sup>195</sup> Ibid., 188.

<sup>196</sup> Ibid., 189.

or nurse – as teaching missionary, to share in the experience which I have seen fire the hearts and kindle the words of dear friends of my own...?”<sup>197</sup>

Working among the Gonds in India, H. J. Molony recognised the value of medical mission, reporting that “People come constantly to us and confess that their own medicine-men can do no good, but that our medicines do benefit them. I believe most strongly in a little simple doctoring of these superstitious people.”<sup>198</sup>

#### 4.5.3 Ridley Hall Missionaries and Social Concern

An important characteristic of missionary work of the Ridley Hall men in India was their social concern, which found a particular expression in famine relief. India was regularly visited by famines. In 1837-38, a severe famine afflicted the Ganges, Doab, Rohilkhand, and a great area of Bengal, and a million people were reported to have died of hunger. Another famine in 1876-79 devastated the northern and eastern part of the sub-continent. In the last decade of the nineteenth-century, during which time Ridley Hall missionaries arrived, India was twice afflicted by great famines. In 1896-97, a severe famine affected an area of 228,000 square miles with a population of 80 million. This was followed in 1900 by a more severe famine, described as “the very worst recorded on the tear-stained pages of India’s history,” afflicting more than 240,000 square miles and 141 million human beings.<sup>199</sup>

During the famine of 1896, in Jabalpur, Charles Hope Gill, a former Curate of North Shields, participated in famine relief from March onwards. He was also involved in medical work with the help of S. R. Morse, another Ridley Hall man from Bhagalpur mission station. Gill believed that social work provided him opportunities to further the evangelistic effort:

In July we determined to open a poor-house for the relief of the poor starving villagers .... We fed them with diet suited to their condition, and told them daily of the Bread of Life and Saviour of the World. We believe that many of these poor people, touched by our human love, have learned about the Divine Love, and believe in their hearts; but so far only one has been baptized. Up to date

---

<sup>197</sup> “The Church Missionary Gleaner,” January 1920, 4.

<sup>198</sup> *Proceedings 1893-4*, 112.

<sup>199</sup> Richter, *A History of Missions*, 193, 218, 234, 237–8.

some 850 famine people have been received and kept for periods varying from a month to six months.<sup>200</sup>

Further, at Murwara, an outstation of Jabalpur, Gill opened a “children’s kitchen,” from which in 1896 around 120 children were fed daily, and a “children’s poor-house,” where in the same year 163 children were cared for.<sup>201</sup> In July 1900 E. A. Hensley mentioned that “a Home for widows and deserted wives” was opened in Jabalpur due to the scarcity of food.<sup>202</sup>

From the Gond country, H. J. Molony reported in 1896 on his engagement with the work of famine relief, noting that at Marpha a relief centre was opened where 534 people were cared for and around 3,851 kilos of grain were distributed, while at Patpara, an orphanage and a temporary leper refuge were started.<sup>203</sup> Molony wrote, “I cannot speak too highly of the hard work done by all our Mission agents in this famine time. We distributed between £3,000 and £4,000 in penny meals, and the work was done almost entirely by Christian hands.”<sup>204</sup> In 1900, Molony was again involved in famine relief in cooperation with the local government. As he described the work, “The Government ‘kitchen’ at Marpha, in which from 100 to 200 children were fed daily, was managed by the Mission. About 300 families also were aided with grants of cloth and blankets.”<sup>205</sup> The similar kitchen was opened at Patpara, where there was also the ministry of orphanage and medical work, with 1,237 patients receiving treatment.<sup>206</sup>

In Lucknow, Stanley Ramey Morse, a former Curate of St. Peter’s, Derby, aided people made homeless by a great flood in mid-1915. It was reported that 12,000 houses had been knocked down, and in consequence 50,000 people became homeless. Morse, who was in charge of the High School, said that “we had to open

---

<sup>200</sup> *Proceedings, 1896-97*, 214.

<sup>201</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>202</sup> “The Church Missionary Gleaner, 1901,” 45.

<sup>203</sup> *Proceedings, 1896-97*, 216; “The Church Missionary Gleaner,” November 1900, 171.

<sup>204</sup> *Proceedings, 1897-98*, 219–20.

<sup>205</sup> *Proceedings, 1900-01*, 263.

<sup>206</sup> *Ibid.*, 264.

our high school and fill all the class-rooms with two or three families in each, as well as the big hall, which is full.”<sup>207</sup>

The social concern of the Ridley Hall missionaries also addressed day-to-day problems in local communities. Stuart Harrington Clark, a former Curate of Christ Church, Gypsy Hill, reached Calcutta at the end of 1900 and took charge of several pastoral organisations connected with the Old Church, including “a Parochial Home for Destitute Girls,” “Temperance Recreation Hall” for local men to combat the habit of drunkenness, and the “Young Women’s Boarding Home” for needy Eurasian girls.<sup>208</sup>

In times of natural disaster, their holiness theology did not prevent Ridley Hall missionaries from involvement in relief work. Such relief work was a common part of evangelical mission at the time, as seen in the work of Timothy Richard and David Hill, a missionary from the Wesleyan Methodist Missionary Society, during the great famine in north China from 1876 to 1879.<sup>209</sup> At Peking, two CMS missionaries, Collins and W. Brereton, engaged in famine relief work and distributed over £2,000, collected by CMS friends in England.<sup>210</sup> When another great famine plagued Central China in 1911, due to a crop failure resulting from floods, Bishop Molony engaged in relief work in Chuki district, while Charlotte Diggs “Lottie” Moon, a female Southern Baptist missionary, shared her own food with starving children at P’ing-tu until she died in 1912 from malnutrition.<sup>211</sup> In India, during two famines in 1896-97 and in 1900, evangelical missionary societies provided shelters for 24,360 children, widows, and orphans. In 1901 it is estimated that there were 115 orphanages with 8,960 children residents.<sup>212</sup>

The involvement of Ridley Hall missionaries in compassionate care in Asia reflected the social concern among evangelical Anglicans at home. William

---

<sup>207</sup> “The Church Missionary Gleaner,” December 1915, 182.

<sup>208</sup> *Proceedings, 1901-02*, 192; *Proceedings, 1903-04*, 171.

<sup>209</sup> Bays, *A New History*, 70.

<sup>210</sup> Stock, *The History of the Church Missionary Society*, III:224.

<sup>211</sup> Mary Clabaugh Wright, ed., *China in Revolution: The First Phase 1900-1913* (New Haven: Yale UP, 1971), 49; Shaw, *Churches, Revolutions, and Empires*, 409.

<sup>212</sup> Richter, *A History of Missions in India*, 240, 410.

Pennefather, the founder of the Mildmay Conference in 1864 that promoted holiness, together with his wife, Catherine Pennefather (1817/18-93), had initiated a program for the care of orphans in 1855. At St Jude's, Mildmay Park, Islington, in north London, Pennefather built a training home for equipping women to be nurses and missionaries, an elementary school for poor children, and a soup kitchen for poor and sick people. In 1877, a medical mission was launched at Bethnal Green, perhaps the first medical mission hospital in London.<sup>213</sup> By 1892, the hospital had received around 5,000 patients and 150,000 visits from poor people.<sup>214</sup> In the same year, aside from Bethnal Green hospital, Mildmay institutions had twenty missions in London with about eighty deaconesses, a mission to the Jews, and a cottage hospital.<sup>215</sup>

The involvement of some Ridley Hall missionaries in promoting temperance in the Asian mission fields reflected the evangelical temperance work of advocates of holiness teaching at home, notably that of F. B. Meyer. After becoming teetotal in 1872, Meyer embraced a campaign against alcohol abuse among the working classes, which he described as "the giant evil of our time."<sup>216</sup> Meyer promoted the Gospel Temperance or Blue Ribbon movement, which had started in the 1870s, and through his campaign in 1887 in Leicester, it was claimed that some 100,000 people signed the pledge. Signing the pledge, for Meyer, was "a confession of sin" and "a desire for deliverance," indicating that his campaign against drink was a spiritual crusade. He also campaigned against grocers' liquor licences, portraying the drink traffic as a "spiritual enemy."<sup>217</sup> As head of the National Free Church Council, he encouraged the 1904 annual meeting in Newcastle to organise efforts to eliminate the drink traffic. In 1905 he opened the 'Old Nelson Coffee-House' in Lambeth to

---

<sup>213</sup> Harriette J. Cooke, *Mildmay, or, The Story of the First Deaconess Institution* (London: Elliot Stock, 1892), 106; Shaw, *Churches, Revolutions, and Empires*, 213.

<sup>214</sup> Cooke, *Mildmay*, 161.

<sup>215</sup> D. W. Bebbington, "Pennefather, William (1816–1873), Church of England Clergyman" in *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, accessed February 12, 2018, <http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/10.1093/ref:odnb/9780198614128.001.0001/odnb-9780198614128-e-21868>.

<sup>216</sup> Randall, *Spirituality and Social Change*, 111.

<sup>217</sup> *Ibid.*, 112.

provide an alternative to the social life of the public house. Apart from temperance movement, Meyer also campaigned against other “social evils” such as prostitutions and neglected children. As a promoter of holiness theology, his “social vision,” according to Randall, was “distinctly conversionist.”<sup>218</sup>

#### 4.5.4 Ridley Hall Missionaries and the Role of Women in Mission

None of Ridley Hall missionaries was female; however, they did recognise the important, and increasing, role of women in missionary work. The wives of some Ridley Hall missionaries were especially involved in work with women. In Gorakhpur, it was reported, the wife of J. M. Paterson “is just as much a missionary as her husband.” Her mission work included “visiting sick women in the hospital, Eurasian women, addressing educated Christian women, and taking classes of girls in the Orphanage.”<sup>219</sup> In Cottayam, the wife of E. Bellerby took part in the Sarah Tucker Institution in teaching Tamil girls sewing and singing, and made use of her medical knowledge in helping families.<sup>220</sup> In Ningpo, the wife of W. S. Moule was in charge of a Girls’ Boarding School.<sup>221</sup>

E. A. Causton, a Ridley Hall missionary who served in Narowal, acknowledged the importance of the work of missionary women: “I must also mention the splendid work the ladies are doing; they are always at it, going from village to village, doing the Master’s work, reading and teaching the girls and women, and are almost always warmly received. It is a thing that strikes you wherever you go. One must admire their zeal, their devotion, their self-sacrifice, their pluck. Would that their numbers were doubled!”<sup>222</sup>

---

<sup>218</sup> *Ibid.*, 111, 130.

<sup>219</sup> *Proceedings 1894-5*, 147.

<sup>220</sup> *Proceedings 1893-4*, 166.

<sup>221</sup> *Proceedings 1892-3*, 202.

<sup>222</sup> *Proceedings 1895-6*, 217.

## Conclusion

The influence of the holiness movement was significant in inspiring many Ridley Hall members to take up the mission to Asia. From America, the love of God through Christ that Moody brought to his meetings not only helped many unbelievers to experience conversion, but brought those who already professed to be Christians to a desire to share the gospel message with other people in other countries. The Student Volunteer Movement, which became an important religious phenomenon in America, found many volunteers among Cambridge students and Ridley Hall members. In Britain, the Keswick holiness movement exerted its impact upon Ridley Hall especially through Handley Moule, who also embraced a commitment to overseas missions. Also, within Cambridge, the Cambridge Seven with their high profile, the missionary experience and zeal of John Barton, and the presence of the Church Missionary Union with its connection with CMS all combined to form a powerful spiritual dynamic that raised missionary feeling among Ridley Hall members.

A number of Ridley Hall missionaries did undertake itinerant evangelism, but their strong emphasis on educational work underlines their understanding of the importance of it as a mission strategy. They were committed to training both future Christian and non-Christian leaders. Their heavy educational emphasis, and willingness to accept government grants, sets them apart from many other holiness missionaries. Through their educational work, many Asian clergy, as well as teachers, medical doctors and other professionals were produced in the mission fields. During the time of famine, some Ridley Hall missionaries were involved in relief work, regarding such work as part of their Christian calling, as well as a vital auxiliary to their evangelizing mission.

However, their strict emphasis on a strict adherence to Western moral standards could be detrimental to a sympathetic understanding of local culture. Being caught up in the holiness movement at Britain, Ridley Hall missionaries sought not only conversions of local people, but also what they viewed as the

improvement of their moral character. Some Ridley Hall missionaries were dissatisfied with the 'unholiness' of local Christians, which could range from a light view of sin and holiness to certain clearly unchristian forms of behaviour. Because the holiness-inspired missionaries believed that they had personally experienced consecration, responded selflessly to the missionary calling, and often left promising future occupations at home, many no doubt believed that the people they served in the mission fields should experience similar levels of religious commitment and be prepared to pay the price of following Christ. However, the Ridley Hall definitions of Christian morality were often very Western in orientation, and the missionaries could be intolerant to people from another culture who did not meet their standards. This rigid attitude can be seen from how some Ridley Hall missionaries impose strict requirements for new believers' baptism and strengthen ecclesiastical discipline, with some forms of behaviour punishable by excommunication. Missionaries objected to the preference of local believers to marry within the same caste, even if it meant marrying unbelievers. In Narowal, the decision of C. M. Gough to reject new believers for baptism due to their working on Sundays suggested an intolerant attitude. For Gough the risk of losing their livelihood was the price that Narowal Christians had to pay to follow Christ.

The holiness doctrines were not exclusively held by Ridley Hall missionaries. Other CMS missionaries affirmed the holiness teachings as well. J. A. F. Warren wrote of his experience when teaching in a mission school in Jabalpur: "the wistful expression on many faces is most touching, especially when any reference is made to Christ's ability to keep us day by day from the power of sin."<sup>223</sup> J. Ilsley who served at Kotagala, Ceylon, reported that family prayer and Bible reading became "the rule in the Christian households."<sup>224</sup> He told how the practice of Morning Watch was kept by "a Christian conductor who gets up every morning at four o'clock in order to have two hours of undisturbed reading of the Scriptures and

---

<sup>223</sup> *Proceedings 1895-6*, 203.

<sup>224</sup> *Ibid.*, 296.

secret prayer before going to his work at six o'clock."<sup>225</sup> These might demonstrate that the impact of the holiness movement was more widespread and influential than just Ridley Hall, and had a role in shaping wider missions practice.

---

<sup>225</sup> Ibid.

## Conclusion

The thesis has explored the connection between the holiness movement and missionary activities in Asia, with particular reference to three case studies – missionaries inspired directly by the Keswick Convention, the Cambridge Seven, and missionaries who underwent theological training at Ridley Hall. The thesis has shown how holiness, as a new movement within British Christianity, played a significant role in the resurgence of British Protestant overseas mission in the late nineteenth century. It helped to inspire British Christians to take up the missionary cause and also shaped their mission work. K. S. Latourette argued that the growth of Protestant mission in the nineteenth century was “not due entirely or even primarily to favourable external conditions, but chiefly to internal vigour.”<sup>1</sup> While such changes in the international context as the Treaty of Nanjing, and the Sepoy Rebellion were undoubtedly external influences on the expansion of Asian missions,<sup>2</sup> clearly the holiness movement provided extra “internal vigour” to the British Protestant missionary movement. While it has been recognised that “there has been a strong link between Keswick and the missionary imperative,” there has been no sustained study of the factors in the Convention that influenced participants to become overseas missionaries, or what they did on the mission fields of Asia.<sup>3</sup> This thesis has sought to provide such a study.

This exploration of the missionary dimension of the holiness movement has challenged the view that the holiness movement was essentially inward-looking. According to J. I. Packer, the major shortcoming of Keswick holiness teaching was that “It grasps neither the Augustinian vision of a life that glorifies God by praise,

---

<sup>1</sup> Kenneth Scott Latourette, *The Great Century, A.D. 1800 - A.D. 1914 in Europe and the United States of America*, History of the Expansion of Christianity; v.4 (London; New York: Harper, 1941), 33.

<sup>2</sup> In July 1886, at YMCA’s meeting at Mt. Hermon, Arthur T. Pierson lectured that the opening of the world to evangelisation was God’s providence which inspired his belief that “the world could be evangelized completely by the year of 1900” (Dana L. Robert, “The Crisis of Missions”: Premillennial Mission Theory and the Origins of Independent Evangelical Missions,” in *Earthen Vessels: American Evangelicals and Foreign Missions, 1880-1980*, ed. Joel A. Carpenter and Wilbert R. Shenk (Oregon: Wipf & Stock, 1990), 35).

<sup>3</sup> Price and Randall, *Transforming Keswick*, 106.

obedience, service ... nor the Wesleyan goal of ardent, endless love toward God and man.” He concluded that the holiness teachings as presented at Keswick were “self-centred rather than God- or neighbour-centred.”<sup>4</sup> This study suggests that was not always the case.

A number of aspects of Keswick and its holiness teaching had a powerful influence in encouraging believers to take up the missionary call. Service in overseas mission was presented as an expression of Christian sanctification and being filled with the Holy Spirit. Missionary meetings became part of the Keswick convention programme from 1888, highlighting the urgent needs of mission, and challenging members of the audience to examine themselves as to whether they were called to overseas mission. A range of motives were called on, sometimes, as we have seen, guilt and fear, rather than from love or a genuine sense of vocation.

Holiness teaching inspired a missionary response, and also set the pattern for how missionaries and their converts were expected to live in very different cultural contexts from that of Britain. As these case studies have shown, holiness was not uniform in its expression. Whilst the Cambridge Seven might seem “a caricatured list of muscular Christians,” theirs was a spirituality of men coming from a social elite, and not typical of all Keswick-inspired missionaries.<sup>5</sup> Holiness-influenced missionaries took with them into the mission fields a conviction of the importance of daily Quiet Time with God, or the Morning Watch as an essential component of missionary life. Through personal Bible reading and prayer, came spiritual strength and renewal as God’s love was received afresh. All the missionaries in the case studies in this book regarded such regular communion with God as “the most powerful weapon,” enabling Christians both to live a holy life and to be effective in Christian service. Since holiness teachings offered the fullness of the Spirit to every believer, men and women alike, and a desire to express full surrender and entire consecration in sacrificial service, taking up missionary opportunities became an attractive outlet for increasing numbers of women.

---

<sup>4</sup> Packer, *Keep in Step with the Spirit*, 125.

<sup>5</sup> Porter, “Cambridge, Keswick, and Late-Nineteenth-Century Attitudes to Africa,” 21.

A central part of Keswick teaching was consecration, an act of surrender to God's will and of complete obedience to God's command – which included the duty to spread the Christian message. Macpherson urged the Keswick convention in 1896 to imitate Abraham's attitude of "absolute surrender," as seen in his willingness to sacrifice Isaac, in responding to the call to mission.<sup>6</sup> To R. A. Torrey consecration meant "to go, in His strength, wherever He bids me to go, to do whatever He would have me to do, to be whatever He would have me to be."<sup>7</sup> C. T. Studd declared, "I must be dead; then He can use me for His glory, dead to everything, to everybody, to the opinions not only of the world, but also of the Christian world,"<sup>8</sup> which also suggests an independence of mind and willingness to defy expectation and convention. The consequences of those living out Keswick teaching on the consecrated and sacrificial life for global evangelisation, seemed to be such that, according to S. A. Selwyn in 1903, "there is very little doubt that even in this generation the world would be evangelised."<sup>9</sup> Keswick teaching also emphasised dependence on the Holy Spirit, and the power this would bring. As Edward Moore declared at the Convention in 1897, "If a man is filled with the Spirit ... he is a missionary straight away."<sup>10</sup>

Holiness teachings on consecration could lead to a subjective and impressionistic tendency in Christianity, especially as individuals sought to interpret God's call. Cassels twice refused offers to be the Bishop of Mid-China and join the home staff of the CMS because he believed that God called him to remain in West China. Mildred Cable and the French sisters decided to take up missionary work in Central Asia and travelled across the Gobi Desert because they felt this was God's call. Amy Carmichael left itinerant missionary activity to focus on rescuing temple children because she believed that that was God's intention for her. Belief in God's call made working under authority difficult sometimes. Some members of the

---

<sup>6</sup> *The Keswick Week, 1896*, 114.

<sup>7</sup> *The Keswick Week, 1904*, 177.

<sup>8</sup> "China's Millions," 1886, 13

<sup>9</sup> *The Keswick Week, 1903*, 134.

<sup>10</sup> *The Keswick Week, 1897*, 124.

Cambridge Seven found their sense of divine calling incompatible with unqualified adherence to the leadership of Hudson Taylor and Hsi, and by the middle of the 1890s only three of the Cambridge Seven were “in full communion” with the CIM.<sup>11</sup>

Consecration involved sacrifice and renunciation, and the adoption of a simple lifestyle – from some of the Cambridge Seven relinquishing of inherited fortunes, to Thomas Walker rejecting a dinner party as worldly pleasure. Cassels maintained his own “spartan habits,”<sup>12</sup> while Carmichael and her associates followed F. B. Meyer and Keswick in seeing jewellery as worldly. Carmichael renounced family ties and her adoptive father Wilson, in pursuing the cause of overseas mission. Perhaps this emphasis on renunciation and simplicity was less evident in the Ridley Hall missionaries, reflecting their theological training and the different missionary support policy of the CMS. While Studd took Jesus’s command to the rich young man literally, Ridley Hall avoided literalist interpretations of such passages.

### The Theological Distinctives of Holiness-Inspired Missionaries Compared to other Evangelical Missions

The emphasis on consecration and surrender could lead to an implicit, and sometimes explicit, condemnation of other missionaries. Walker believed that most missionaries in general had neglected personal communion with God and that this hindered the success of mission: “Fellow missionaries!” he declared, “We have toiled much, but we have prayed little.”<sup>13</sup> Amy Carmichael insisted that for both missionaries and Indian workers, the main motivation must be love for Christ. She was appalled when other missionaries argued that Indians were unwilling to do mission work without a salary, and she insisted that such arguments reflected a lack of faith.<sup>14</sup> She preferred the fully consecrated Indian women known as the Starry Cluster.

---

<sup>11</sup> Austin, *China’s Millions*, 387.

<sup>12</sup> Marshall Broomhall, *W. W. Cassels*, 103.

<sup>13</sup> “China’s Millions,” 1898, 1.

<sup>14</sup> Houghton, *Amy Carmichael*, 87-8.

Walker, Carmichael and the CIM, all agreed that conversion was an essential requirement for someone entering mission work. In China, Guinness hoped that only Christian converts would be accepted to be coolies and door-keepers at Kaifeng Hospital. In India, Carmichael was unhappy with mission schools that employed Muslims, Hindus, or nominal Christians as their teachers. This went against the trend in other missions – Cox notes that in Punjab alone in 1890 “Seventy percent of the roughly 750 mission schoolteachers were non-Christian.”<sup>15</sup> Ridley Hall missionaries, however, were reluctantly prepared to employ Hindu teachers in the CMS schools where necessary, to ensure a high standard of education.

In an effort to promote their views among local Christians in the Asian mission field, holiness-influenced missionaries would conduct holiness meetings on the Keswick model. In her early missionary career, Carmichael held several gatherings in Arima, Japan, for spiritual renewal, and Walker spoke in many holiness conventions in India and Ceylon. In China, Stanley Smith held gatherings for missionaries for “the deepening of spiritual life.”<sup>16</sup> A number of Ridley Hall missionaries also held holiness meetings modelled on Keswick and other conventions in many parts in India, China, and Japan. They also used mission reports and personal letters from the field to promote holiness concepts of surrender, consecration, the fullness of the Spirit, and victorious life, and spoke of them in public gatherings.

Harford-Battersby described the purpose of early Keswick meetings as “the promotion of practical holiness.”<sup>17</sup> The Keswick missionaries, the Cambridge Seven, and some of the Ridley Hall missionaries discussed in this thesis insisted that local believers and Christian workers must lead holy lives. This led to an insistence on behaviour that would reflect the strict standards of the missionaries, but that could be difficult to achieve for local Christians in overwhelmingly non-Christian cultures.

---

<sup>15</sup> Jeffrey Cox, *Imperial Fault Lines: Christianity and Colonial Power in India, 1818-1940* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2002), 196.

<sup>16</sup> “China’s Millions,” 1885, 115.

<sup>17</sup> Price and Randall, *Transforming Keswick*, 36.

These demanding standards of behaviour were often added to a profession of faith as requirements for the baptism of converts or for maintaining church membership. Asian Christians were required to reject a range of behaviour considered unacceptable in churches in Britain and America, such as backsliding, gambling, smoking, drunkenness, and opium and tobacco-smoking. To this was added prohibition of some local practices, such as foot-binding in China and wearing jewellery and marriage according to local custom in India, which were cultural practices rather than fundamental aspects of Christianity.

This was not entirely different from other non-holiness inspired evangelical missions, which also expected consistent Christian moral character and personal devotion. But certain areas were given greater emphasis by the holiness-influenced missionaries. For Walker, Studd, Smith, and Cassels, conversion should include “nothing short of ... entire consecration.”<sup>18</sup> This stance made them appear critical of what previous missionaries had done and the standards that those missionaries had applied. Walker’s widespread excommunications of Indians in 1893 for observing caste, irregular marriages and financial dishonesty were a rebuke to earlier missionaries who had been more tolerant on such issues. Walker preferred to lose “several hundreds of Christians” in order to keep the church “healthier.”<sup>19</sup>

Some Ridley Hall missionaries expressed dissatisfaction with the spiritual life of whole congregations in India. C. M. Gough was sure that the majority were “Christians only in name,” as many of them neglected Sunday services, married unbelievers, or became Christian for mixed motives. He longed for an Indian “Moody,” to “bring thousands of merely nominal Christians to the feet of Christ.”<sup>20</sup> Similarly, E. S. Carr in South India, excommunicated 1,100 church members,<sup>21</sup> with a further 250 to 400 removed annually.<sup>22</sup> The key issues were irregular marriages, lapsing into Hinduism or Islam, or pagan ritual.<sup>23</sup> As a result of the work of Carr and

---

<sup>18</sup> “China’s Millions,” 1885, 115.

<sup>19</sup> *Proceedings 1892-3*, 158.

<sup>20</sup> *Proceedings, 1902-03*, 237.

<sup>21</sup> *Proceedings, 1897-98*, 285.

<sup>22</sup> *Proceedings, 1900-01*, 342.

<sup>23</sup> *Proceedings, 1898-99*, 278.

E. A. Douglas in 1895 in Tinnevely, numbers in the congregation at Alankulam fell by ninety percent. This suggests significant intolerance of holiness-influenced missionaries to local Christians who did not conform to their high moral standards.

Another area of holiness teaching which set apart holiness-influenced missionaries in Asia was the exercise of the 'faith principle' in fund-raising. The rhetoric of "God will provide," according to Porter, struck a chord with a late Victorian public eager for "the evangelization of the world in our generation."<sup>24</sup> Although there is some evidence that Amy Carmichael followed similar principles in her early ministry in Belfast, she attributed her adoption of the faith principle and non-solicitation of funds policy for the work at Dohnavur to reading CIM literature. Yet Arles argued that Amy Carmichael selectively drew on Hudson Taylor, only taking "what went along with her own thoughts."<sup>25</sup> One thing she did take from him was the principle that "God's work done in God's way, will never lack God's supplies."<sup>26</sup>

For financial support, the CIM was determined to depend solely on God without constant public appeal for funds from churches or other institutions. While the CIM presented its approach to fundraising as based on the 'pure' faith principle, its publications and missionary meetings did serve as an indirect form of appeal for financial donations, and meant that the CIM funding model became more of a 'modified' faith principle. When the CIM opened the Chefoo School, they did not directly request funds, but from 1892 onwards *China's Millions* presented the case for the need for the school and indicated its expected cost, without making an explicit appeal. Some parents of children from international expatriate communities also contributed to the costs. Here, as in other areas, the CIM was willing to modify adherence to its stated principles.<sup>27</sup>

Hudson Taylor inspired others in the CIM to follow the pure faith approach. The decision to serve with the CIM, rather than the CMS, was in part a response to

---

<sup>24</sup> Cox, *British Missionary Enterprise*, 184.

<sup>25</sup> Arles, "Ramabai and Carmichael," 155.

<sup>26</sup> Carmichael, *Gold Cord*, 125–6.

<sup>27</sup> Semple, *Missionary Women*, 170.

the radical 'faith mission' approach of the CIM, rejecting mission bureaucracy and institutional maintenance, and abandoning the comfortable mission stations for itinerancy and simple life in the field, which seemed more in tune with the sacrifices the holiness teaching demanded. C. T. Studd kept to the faith principle in money matters, even after he was no longer with the CIM. This was not uniform, however, among the Cambridge Seven. Cecil Polhill chose not to give away the considerable fortune he received. Instead he spent much of it supporting the Pentecostal movement and the PMU that he founded, although that organization then adopted the 'faith principle.'

The commitment to the faith principle of not soliciting support was not prevalent among the Ridley Hall missionaries, which may reflect a different approach to biblical interpretation, contrasting to the literalism of Studd, and also their decision to serve with the CMS. Despite this, at times the CMS policy became closer to that of the CIM. In 1887 the CMS general committee, seeking not to miss out on the increase of interest from holiness-influenced Christians, adopted "the Policy of Faith" and announced that it would decline no suitable candidate "merely on financial grounds."<sup>28</sup>

A strong distinction between the CIM faith policy and that of other mainstream missionary societies is seen in its response to the issue of indemnities after the Boxer Rising.<sup>29</sup> While the United American mission boards asked the American government to claim indemnities "for societies, individuals and Chinese who had suffered,"<sup>30</sup> Dixon Hoste, as leader of the CIM, decided to refuse any compensation from the Chinese government for "lives lost, bodily injury or loss of property."<sup>31</sup> This was shaped by holiness thinking that mission should not benefit from unconsecrated money, such as that coming from the Chinese government. Also, the CIM was convinced that death in service to God was not defeat, but "gain," so compensation was not needed for those who had made the ultimate act

---

<sup>28</sup> Stock, *The History of the CMS*, III: 333.

<sup>29</sup> A. J. Broomhall, *Not Death to Die*, 7:469; Cox, *British Missionary Enterprise*, 207.

<sup>30</sup> Austin, *China's Millions*, 425.

<sup>31</sup> A. J. Broomhall, *Not Death to Die*, 7:479.

of surrender and self-sacrifice, and who were believed to gain a heavenly reward through martyrdom. This attitude deeply impressed the Chinese. The governor of Shanxi called on Chinese people to: “to bear in mind the example of Pastor Hoste, who is able to forbear and to forgive, as taught by Jesus to do.”<sup>32</sup> Not all members of the families in Britain of the deceased CIM workers agreed with this policy, nor did all Chinese converts. At least one local deacon, named Liu, a former opium smoker who was converted under the ministry of Pastor Hsi and who helped missionaries escape during the Boxer Rising, expressed great dissatisfaction about the CIM’s attitude on this indemnity issue.<sup>33</sup> Liu then left his church in Hung-tung and eventually became a Roman Catholic.

### The Place of Role Models

The Keswick holiness movement and its teaching had a powerful effect on the missionaries in these three case studies; Hudson Taylor claimed that two-thirds of the CIM missionaries received some influence from Keswick.<sup>34</sup> To have this impact it needed powerful advocates, who served as promoters and role models. The challenges of coming to a balanced and objective assessment of the work of some of the people, and seeing beyond their rather hagiographical biographies, was discussed in the Introduction. But it is also the case that such hagiographical biographies helped to ensure that many holiness-influenced missionaries – such as Carmichael and the Cambridge Seven – became role models, helping to popularise the holiness movement.

Very significant in popularising the holiness emphasis was D. L. Moody, whose emphasis on the need for the Spirit’s empowerment and the sense of urgency and accountability brought by his premillennial teachings, undoubtedly encouraged the Cambridge Seven and some students at Ridley Hall to enter foreign mission. The direct influence of Moody on the conversions of Hoste, Arthur and

---

<sup>32</sup> “China’s Millions,” 1902, 36.

<sup>33</sup> Mrs. Taylor, *Pastor Hsi*, 82.

<sup>34</sup> Figgis, *Keswick from Within*, 134.

Cecil Polhill Turner, and his impact in the deepening commitment of Stanley Smith and Studd was noted in chapter three. Moody's "practical holiness" and activist enthusiasm was appealing in an age of increasing uncertainty in theological study in universities like Cambridge, and it helped draw the British missionary movement into the international Protestant movement.<sup>35</sup> So great was his influence, despite his lack of formal theological training or even much formal education, that the Vice-Principal of Ridley Hall, in 1884 declared "I think there is not one man here whose life was not influenced, more or less, by Moody's Cambridge Mission."<sup>36</sup>

Moody and Hudson Taylor influenced each other. As Moody's emphasis on the empowering of the Spirit and his premillennial teachings stirred a concern for the lost, the CIM which was seeking workers who were "wholly consecrated" and "filled with the Spirit of God,"<sup>37</sup> benefitted. Taylor's influence on the Cambridge Seven was enormous. After Dixon Hoste read *China's Spiritual Need and Claims*, he declared that, "The lines of simple and direct faith in God for temporal supply and protection... commended themselves greatly to me."<sup>38</sup> Hudson Taylor influenced Smith and Studd, and Smith in turn influenced William Cassels, who decided to work with the CIM even though he had initially planned to serve with the CMS (he later worked jointly with the two societies).<sup>39</sup> Amy Carmichael was also influenced by Hudson Taylor, and she became a significant influence upon others as well.

At Cambridge, Moule made holiness appealing to students by giving it a scholarly aspect – Bebbington describes him as "the most scholarly exponent of the Keswick position."<sup>40</sup> Moule popularized the Morning Watch, introducing the practice to John R. Mott, the leader of the Student Volunteer Movement, and thus further shaping "the transatlantic character of nineteenth-century evangelicalism."<sup>41</sup> Moule created a climate in which some thought "it was a higher

---

<sup>35</sup> Cox, *British Missionary Enterprise*, 61, 185

<sup>36</sup> Bullock, *The History of Ridley Hall*, 1:212.

<sup>37</sup> "China's Millions," 1888, 76.

<sup>38</sup> Thompson, *D.E. Hoste*, 23.

<sup>39</sup> Marshall Broomhall, *W. W. Cassels*, 36; A. J. Broomhall, *Assault on the Nine*, 6:338.

<sup>40</sup> Bebbington, *Holiness*, 81.

<sup>41</sup> Stanley, "Hunting for Souls," 128.

and holier vocation to go to the heathen than to work at home,” and as an Anglican, pointed students to the CMS.<sup>42</sup> Two, however, Beauchamp and Arthur Polhill-Turner, joined the CIM.

Moule’s work in the spiritual formation of his Ridley Hall students was also seen in the devotional life and missionary calling of the Keswick missionaries, Walker and Guinness, demonstrating the strong connections between individuals in the three case studies. The theological curriculum at Ridley Hall, where Moule taught, shaped and affirmed the students’ orthodox evangelical positions, and may have made the missionaries less interested in the Larger Hope, and Pentecostalism.<sup>43</sup> Moule also brought a focus on Biblical languages.<sup>44</sup> Alongside that of Moule, John Barton’s influence was significant at Cambridge.<sup>45</sup> Barton helped forge the connection between Cambridge and Keswick, having been present at the earliest of the Conventions.<sup>46</sup>

Cox argues that through the acceptance and promotion of the well-educated (if not theologically trained) Cambridge Seven, the missionary profession became a respectable one that an “educated person might find attractive.” To Cox, this was “fraught with contradictions,” for the mission was also presenting their work at the same time as one of “heroism” and that a missionary was a “person set apart, with a special calling from God.”<sup>47</sup>

## The Theology of Holiness-Inspired Missionaries

### Premillennialism

This readiness of the holiness-influenced missionaries to be engaged in overseas mission work was encouraged by belief in the imminent return of Christ.

Premillennialism, as promoted by D. L. Moody and others, emphasized the urgency

---

<sup>42</sup> Bullock, *The History of Ridley Hall*, 1:216.

<sup>43</sup> *Ibid.*, 230.

<sup>44</sup> *Ibid.*, 1:180.

<sup>45</sup> Harford and Macdonald, *Handley Carr Glyn Moule*, 122.

<sup>46</sup> Emily Barton, “The Memoirs,” 87.

<sup>47</sup> Cox, *British Missionary Enterprise*, 184-5.

of evangelism and the importance of being found to be living a holy life when Christ returned. Added impetus to mission was given by the belief that Christ would return only after the gospel had been proclaimed to all people. It was Pierson's view that the hope of the Second Coming of Christ "makes every believer fruitful in the seed of propagation," and that "more mission effort would hasten Christ's return."<sup>48</sup> Hudson Taylor declared in 1893, that the hope of Christ's return had become the "paramount motive" and "the greatest personal spur" for his missionary work.<sup>49</sup>

Robert has stressed how premillennialism brought "a single minded emphasis on evangelization," by which she meant that the "Proclamation of the gospel took precedence over such traditional missionary activity as education and medicine," which "seemed to be delaying the proclamation of the Word."<sup>50</sup> Polhill's eschatological beliefs helped drive him to evangelise Tibet, proclaiming in his work *Flames of Fire* "The pre-millennial Advent of our Lord" as a fundamental theological belief.<sup>51</sup>

While premillennialism was upheld by the Keswick missionaries and Cambridge Seven, it was less prominent among the Ridley Hall missionaries. Moule gave equal weight to aspects of premillennial and postmillennial teachings, maintaining that "amidst the divergency of interpretations," there was a "profound agreement" on Christ's "personal glorious Coming and Triumph," which should inspire "a more ardent longing" and "a holier walk."<sup>52</sup>

### Approaches to Theological Study

The case study of the Ridley Hall missionaries highlighted their emphasis on biblical exposition and doctrine, which in turn reflected the formal theological education they received. W. S. Moule translated several biblical commentaries into Chinese and wrote a number of books, while Bernard Heklots defended basic evangelical

---

<sup>48</sup> Robert, *Occupy until I Come*, 135-7.

<sup>49</sup> Hopkins, *The Story of Keswick, 1893*, 39-40.

<sup>50</sup> Robert, ""The Crisis of Missions"," 32.

<sup>51</sup> Usher, "For China and Tibet," 264.

<sup>52</sup> H. C. G. Moule, *Outlines of Christian Doctrine* (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1889), 114.

doctrines and Scripture against biblical criticism. In Japan, John Batchelor produced a translation of the whole New Testament in the Ainu language.<sup>53</sup>

Some Keswick missionaries, such as Thomas Walker, had formal theological training, but Amy Carmichael was largely self-taught. Apart from Montagu Beauchamp and Arthur Polhill, the Cambridge Seven lacked formal theological training. This might explain why some were more receptive to alternate theological views, such as “the Larger Hope” and Pentecostalism. The primary qualification for many holiness missionaries was high moral and spiritual character, rather than theological training. This raises the question as to whether the holiness movement was anti-intellectual. Porter claimed that the promotion of holiness among Cambridge students served to “reinvigorate the anti-intellectual traditions of the Evangelical party,”<sup>54</sup> and that Moule “favoured the exposition of doctrine over more critical studies and encouraged a preference for piety over learning.”<sup>55</sup> This is unfair on Moule, who became Norrisian Professor of Divinity at Cambridge University after his time at Ridley Hall, writing several biblical commentaries published by Cambridge University Press. Moreover, Moule attempted to keep religious exercises and study in balance at Ridley Hall – for him “the duty of study being recognised as the primary duty of the place and not as subordinate to direct religious work and devotional exercises.”<sup>56</sup> There was an emphasis on the study of biblical language, both Hebrew and Greek.<sup>57</sup> Sixteen Ridley Hall students during Moule’s principalship were awarded University prizes and scholarships. Between 1881 and 1899, fourteen Ridley Hall students were awarded First Class degrees, three of whom became missionaries to Asia.<sup>58</sup>

The late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries were a time of significant theological change in Britain and North America, with the growing influence of

---

<sup>53</sup> *Proceedings of CMS, 1897-98*, 399.

<sup>54</sup> *Ibid.*, 13–14.

<sup>55</sup> Porter, *Religion Versus Empire?*, 248.

<sup>56</sup> Bullock, *The History of Ridley Hall*, 1:208.

<sup>57</sup> *Ibid.*, 1:230.

<sup>58</sup> *Ibid.*, 1:335–6.

higher criticism which became of increasing concern to evangelicals.<sup>59</sup> Keswick influences and North-American premillennialism tended to reinforce the conservative evangelicalism of the holiness missionaries in this study. As Arthur Pierson declared at the Convention of 1904, “let the Holy Spirit illumine the Word and your eyes, and you will never have doubts of the inspiration of the Word of God, if all the higher critics in Christendom should unite to say that you had been deceived.”<sup>60</sup>

### Views on the Larger Hope

The notable exception to this theological conservatism was Stanley Smith, of the Cambridge Seven, who came to embrace a Larger Hope theology, taking the view that “eternal punishment” was “*corrective punishment belonging to the future age ... designed for final good, and in no case absolutely endless.*”<sup>61</sup> Whereas for Hudson Taylor the vision of a million a month dying without Christ was a motivation to mission, for Smith it drove him to embrace a wider hope.<sup>62</sup> Smith echoed the distrust of some nineteenth-century Christians toward the doctrine of eternal punishment. The issue was not new, and had led to the resignation of the wealthy CIM supporter, Berger, in 1872 over “conditional immortality,”<sup>63</sup> after Müller threatened to withdraw his support.<sup>64</sup> The Downgrade controversy had been initiated by C. H. Spurgeon, and Hudson Taylor warned in 1890 of a ‘downgrade’ on the missionary field with reference to the Larger Hope, and the non-eternity of punishment, and vagueness on the inspiration of Scripture.<sup>65</sup>

---

<sup>59</sup> This is seen for example in the ‘Downgrade Controversy’ amongst English Baptists, led by C. H. Spurgeon. For controversies over the growth of liberalism among Presbyterians in Scotland – see A. P. F. Sell, *Defending and Declaring the Faith: Some Scottish Examples, 1860-1920* (Exeter: Paternoster Press, 1987).

<sup>60</sup> Hopkins, *The Keswick Week, 1904*, 107.

<sup>61</sup> Stanley Smith, *The Sequel*, 23–4.

<sup>62</sup> *Ibid.*, i.

<sup>63</sup> Austin, *China’s Millions*, 62–3, 188–9.

<sup>64</sup> A. J. Broomhall, *Refiners Fire*, 5:340.

<sup>65</sup> Wigram, *Bible and Mission*, 188.

The views at Ridley Hall were set by Handley Moule, who Taylor consulted over Smith's views. Moule rejected "conditional immortality" and the "final restoration of believers."<sup>66</sup> The American premillennial influence on the CIM's doctrinal stance can also be seen in Frost's insistence on replacing "eternal" with "endless" or "unending" punishment in the CIM's Principles & Practice. To Austin this represented a shift of the CIM to a "militant fundamentalism,"<sup>67</sup> but as chapter 3 shows, Hamilton argued that Frost was one of the key missionary leaders who "participated in no fundamentalist battles."<sup>68</sup> His intervention demonstrates the large fundraising power of the CIM's USA body.<sup>69</sup> Hudson Taylor's approach appeared less hard-line than Frost; Hudson Taylor considered Smith's views "unscriptural," whilst he still regarded him as a "good fellow."<sup>70</sup> Smith claimed that Cassels shared his eschatological position, but Hoste and Polhill did not, warning that he was interpreting Scripture "in [a] totally different way" from what he ought to.<sup>71</sup>

Smith argued that his theological approach produced a "splendid gospel for China" because in his scheme – "Their ancestors have not all gone to an endless hell."<sup>72</sup> But to Frost, Smith was "interpreting the Scriptures by heathenism rather than heathenism by the Scriptures."<sup>73</sup>

### Pentecostalism

Keswick theology, with its emphasis on a second blessing experience, sometimes called baptism in the Spirit, opened the way for some to embrace Pentecostalism, despite resistance to Pentecostalism from the Keswick leadership. To Torrey, the Spirit's baptism enabled Christians to live in holiness and powerful ministry,

---

<sup>66</sup> A. J. Broomhall, *It Is Not Death To Die*, 7:491.

<sup>67</sup> Austin, *China's Millions*, 443.

<sup>68</sup> Hamilton, "'The Interdenominational Evangelicalism'," 263.

<sup>69</sup> Stanley Smith, *The Sequel*, 31.

<sup>70</sup> Wigram, *Bible and Mission*, 190.

<sup>71</sup> Usher, "For China and Tibet," 135.

<sup>72</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>73</sup> Austin, *China's Millions*, 225.

whereas Meyer saw it was for empowering believers for service.<sup>74</sup> Not all agreed with this terminology. Webb-Peploe maintained that the Spirit's baptism is received at the time of conversion. Goodwin has argued that there was a direct connection between teaching on the fullness of the Holy Spirit by Moody and Hudson Taylor and the eventual development of the Pentecostal Missionary Union, but Goodwin's argument needed to include more information about the influence of Keswick teaching in order to be fully convincing.<sup>75</sup>

Alongside the impact of second-blessing theology, the influence of the mission context and the religious life of the local Christians should also be noted. The size of the mission task in China and India, and the slow progress that was being made, encouraged some to look for a repetition of the original Day of Pentecost experience, which would transcend human efforts in achieving conversions across Asia. One issue was the difficulty of learning the Asian languages. The meeting of the Polhills and Studd with Griffith John, and his claim to have received a Pentecostal gift of the ability to speak Mandarin, led them to abandon language study and unsuccessfully seek the supernatural gift of Chinese speech. To Hudson Taylor the language barrier was another of Satan's wiles "to keep the Chinese ignorant of the gospel."<sup>76</sup>

The numbers of those discussed in this thesis who progressed from second-blessing holiness to Pentecostalism were small. As chapter two showed, among the Keswick missionaries, Alice Luce moved in a Pentecostal direction, and highlighted the importance of prophecy, tongues, and healing for effective evangelism. Thomas Walker saw the gift of tongues as a sign "given for a special purpose in the early dawn of the Pentecostal day" but not as "something intended to continue till the end of the day."<sup>77</sup>

---

<sup>74</sup> *The Keswick Week, 1903*, 177.

<sup>75</sup> Goodwin, "The Pneumatological Motivation and Influences of the Cambridge Seven," 38.

<sup>76</sup> A. J. Broomhall, *Assault on the Nine*, 6:375.

<sup>77</sup> Carmichael, *This One Thing*, 198.

Of the Cambridge Seven, Smith reported experiencing *glossolalia* in 1911.<sup>78</sup> Cecil Polhill embraced Pentecostalism, but his brother Arthur warned him of the genuineness of his experience of speaking in tongues.<sup>79</sup> Studd was more open.<sup>80</sup> But it was mainly Cecil Polhill's experiences linked to the Welsh revival and his visit to Asuza Street in Los Angeles that led him to Pentecostalism, rather than his experiences in Asia. Polhill's main legacy, according to Kay, was to link Pentecostalism to world mission rather than the "inner world of religious experience alone."<sup>81</sup> Polhill was convinced that fresh power was needed because the life of holiness alone was insufficient for mission. He saw the Pentecostal mission movement as "essentially evangelistic," and this is what was needed rather than introducing "educational innovation or medical expertise."<sup>82</sup>

This was not a direction the Ridley Hall missionaries moved in. While Porter argued that Ridley Hall education "encouraged a preference for piety over learning," their theological training may have made the holiness-influenced missionaries more cautious about Pentecostal teachings.<sup>83</sup> Most missionaries influenced by Keswick holiness teaching repeated the suspicions of this new expression of Christianity. Being 'All One in Christ' did not mean all embracing the new ecstatic experiences of Pentecostalism.

### Holiness-Inspired Missionaries and Local Asian Cultures

The Cambridge Seven placed a special emphasis on adaptation to local culture, which set them apart from some other missionaries. Although Hudson Taylor worked hard to reinforce the rules on wearing Chinese clothing, many missionaries never felt comfortable in them, always remaining "quintessentially English."<sup>84</sup> It was through the work of the Chinese convert Hsi that evangelical Christianity in China

---

<sup>78</sup> Usher, "For China and Tibet," 246–7.

<sup>79</sup> See the next section.

<sup>80</sup> Usher, "For China and Tibet," 62–3.

<sup>81</sup> Kay, "Pentecostal Missionary Union," 99.

<sup>82</sup> Usher, "For China and Tibet," 270.

<sup>83</sup> Porter, *Religion Versus Empire?*, 248.

<sup>84</sup> Semple, *Missionary Women*, 155.

began to look genuinely Chinese, but Cassels withdrew from the freer church structures associated with Hsi, and formed an Anglican part of the mission with Polhill, and Studd and Smith had to be sent to Luan after disagreements with Hsi.

Amy Carmichael was probably more successful than most at adopting Indian dress and she spoke Tamil, but Arles still considered her mission at Dohnavur to represent a “deculturising process.”<sup>85</sup> The adaptation to Indian culture was selective. The condemnation of jewellery by Carmichael and Walker reduced a complex social and cultural practice linked to family status and relationships, to a black or white matter of spirituality based on Western norms of Keswick holiness spirituality. Walker and Carr did not hesitate to excommunicate those involved in irregular marriages. The emphasis on time alone with God imposed a Western individualism on an Indian culture that emphasised collectivism.

Sometimes the missionaries found it was difficult to see what constituted a cultural issue. In Japan, Batchelor claimed that ninety per cent of the population in many Ainus villages were “drunkards.”<sup>86</sup> In truth, the use of alcohol in these villages was a cultural issue, and was integral to all religious and public ceremonies. Batchelor’s uncompromising approach to the use of alcohol created “animosity” with local wine-sellers who took him to court.<sup>87</sup>

The attitudes of the Keswick-influenced holiness missionaries to other local cultural and religious practices have been explored in the case studies. The 1890 missionary conference in Shanghai suggested that the majority of missionaries viewed ancestor veneration as connected with idolatry, but there was disagreement over the extent of the idolatrous element in the practices. Hudson Taylor condemned the whole practice as idolatrous, but Addison suggested that such a wholesale condemnation represented a failure to understand gradation in “worship” within Chinese culture.<sup>88</sup> Pfister argued that, unlike Richard, Taylor

---

<sup>85</sup> Arles, “Ramabai and Carmichael,” 220.

<sup>86</sup> *Proceedings*, 1883-4, 213; *Proceedings*, 1885-6, 204.

<sup>87</sup> *Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: Eighty-Sixth Year*, 1884-5 (London Church Missionary House, 1885), 205.

<sup>88</sup> Addison, “Chinese Ancestor-Worship and Protestant Christianity,” 145.

conflated the Chinese term for “ancestor” or “spirit” with the biblical term for “God.”<sup>89</sup> Wigram ascribes this to a lack of detailed study of Chinese culture, which had resulted from the sense of urgency in mission, as shaped by premillennialism.<sup>90</sup> The Chinese convert, Hsi, took a more pastorally sensitive approach, arguing that the total rejection of ancestral veneration should not be forced on young converts and inquirers.<sup>91</sup>

In China, some missionaries, such as Smith and Studd, as well as the wife of W. S. Moule in Ningpo, opposed footbinding and required women to unbind their feet to prove their earnestness as Christians. An example was set by Hsi’s wife, although only after Hsi’s death, because he had feared unbelievers’ accusations that they were seeking to impose Western cultural practices.

In India, caste was opposed by Keswick missionaries as “the most cursed invention of the devil that ever existed.”<sup>92</sup> Walker and Carr believed it was inseparable from Hinduism, and to Carmichael, it was “the strongest foe to the Gospel of Christ on the Hindu fields of South India.”<sup>93</sup> They could only be certain about a person’s conversion when they broke with caste. To holiness missionaries, caste with its restrictions and separations seemed a practical manifestation of the spiritual evil they were opposing, robbing people of the liberty of the gospel they proclaimed. This matched the attitudes of other Protestant missions, with the exception of the Leipzig Mission. However, while H. J. Molony of the Ridley Hall missionaries saw caste restrictions as a “real barrier” to brotherhood in Christ, he interpreted the issue as social rather than religious. This meant that he chose not to discipline church members who practiced it, and he found that the problem slowly but steadily diminished as a result of his more tolerant policy.

The attitudes of the Keswick-holiness inspired missionaries to major cultural and religious issues on the mission field were generally similar to those of other

---

<sup>89</sup> Pfister, “Rethinking Mission in China,” 211.

<sup>90</sup> Wigram, *Bible and Mission*, 191.

<sup>91</sup> Mrs. Taylor, *Pastor Hsi*, 75-6.

<sup>92</sup> Forrester, *Caste and Christianity*, 27

<sup>93</sup> Carmichael, *Things as They Are*, 104.

evangelical missions. In two other aspects of Hindu culture, the zenana and the role of temple children, their views were particularly strong. Keswick speakers could be fierce in their denunciation of the zenana, despite women in the West having limited employment opportunities, no right to vote in elections, suffering from many legal disadvantages, and having limited roles in their own Christian churches.

A number of Keswick missionaries, including Carmichael, joined missions to women in the zenana. To Carmichael, devadasis appeared a physical manifestation of spiritual evil which held children captive and open to abuse. Releasing such children was considered a major victory in spiritual warfare. Such was the urgency of rescue work that from 1901 it became to Carmichael the cause to which “every missionary call had to be subordinated.”<sup>94</sup>

## Holiness-Inspired Missionaries and Mission Practice

### Preaching and Itinerant Evangelism

The primary approach to mission by Keswick holiness-influenced missionaries was itinerant preaching, and this could only be set aside if there was another very pressing need, such as that of the temple children. Of the Ridley Hall missionaries, thirteen focused on itinerant evangelization, twenty others engaged both in education and itinerancy, and nineteen focussed mainly on education. This significant place for itinerant evangelism by those trained in an Anglican college might seem surprising, given that the Anglican model in England at this time was parish-based ministry.

According to Stanley, the CIM’s work emphasised “the overriding task of evangelism” with a determination to evangelise “the whole of inland China with the greatest possible speed,” this urgency being furthered by pre-millennial thinking.<sup>95</sup> This reflected Moody’s approach, which had such a significant influence on the Cambridge Seven.<sup>96</sup> Smith was a highly effective evangelist, including in rural areas,

---

<sup>94</sup> Arles, “Ramabai and Carmichael,” 139.

<sup>95</sup> Stanley, “Home Support for Overseas Missions,” 304.

<sup>96</sup> Shaw, *Churches, Revolutions, and Empires*, 498.

and he trained other evangelists.<sup>97</sup> Beauchamp was possibly the pre-eminent itinerant evangelist of the group, and itinerant evangelism led Cecil Polhill into Tibet.

This emphasis was not unique among Protestant evangelical missionaries, and was promoted in the works of the American Presbyterian Nevius.<sup>98</sup> Although physical needs were to be met through acts of kindness, “the primary and ultimate work” of the missionary was to “use every possible mode of presenting Christian truth,” especially itinerant preaching.<sup>99</sup> However, the CIM’s emphasis on evangelism, whilst often leaving church planting to Chinese converts, was different from the approach of other missions.<sup>100</sup> The workers were placed in stations organized on denominational or national lines, and so the CIM work under Cassels in Sichuan was distinctly Anglican in tone, but because of its interdenominational nature, there was no single church structure, in comparison to the CMS which worked with the Anglican model.

The rugged individualism associated with itinerant evangelism may reflect aspects of holiness spirituality. The muscular holiness of the Cambridge Seven made the missionaries incline to heroic pioneering work in China, rather than long settled periods aiming at steady growth of Chinese Christian communities through education or building a local church. However, generalisation is difficult, and such tendencies were seen in other case studies. Of the Keswick missionaries, Macpherson and Mildred Cable conducted itinerant evangelization widely, the latter travelling across the Gobi Desert to spread the Christian message to Central Asia among the Muslims.

### Role of Women in Mission

The connection between holiness and the increasing number of women on the mission field has been shown in this study to be strong. Holiness was presented as

---

<sup>97</sup> Pollock, *Cambridge Seven*, 107.

<sup>98</sup> J. Nevius, *Methods of Mission Work*.

<sup>99</sup> J. Nevius, *China and the Chinese*, 367-9, quoted in Shaw, *Churches, Revolutions and Empires*, 420-1.

<sup>100</sup> Semple, *Women Missionaries*, 161.

gender neutral. Making spiritual qualities and consecration the primary qualification, rather than theological education or ordination, helped the CIM to attract many away from traditional denominational agencies.<sup>101</sup> Their role models were female -- Palmer, Hannah Pearsall Smith, and Carmichael. An increased number of educated women, trained as teachers and nurses and doctors, sought opportunities overseas that were denied them at home. As Dana Robert has pointed out, by the late nineteenth century the work of education had become the "linchpin" and "hallmark" of women's mission, while medical work became "the most popular and least propagandistic form of missionary social service" that was "pioneered and dominated by women."<sup>102</sup> This was coupled with increasing awareness about opportunities in the mission field where only women could serve, such as in the zenana.

Of thirteen Keswick missionaries who went to Asia, ten of them were women. They undertook a range of ministry, but tended to emphasise the needs of women and children, such as in the educational work of Luce and Carmichael in India, Fugill in Japan, and Cable in China, who also established a Normal Training College and Women's Bible School.

Although none of the Ridley Hall missionaries was female, they recognized the important role of women in missionary work, especially their wives. The CMS described the wife of J. M. Paterson as "just as much a missionary as her husband."<sup>103</sup> In Ningpo, the wife of W. S. Moule was in charge of a Girls' Boarding School.<sup>104</sup> E. A. Causton reported "the splendid work the ladies are doing," among the villages, reading and teaching the women and children, and calling for greater numbers of women recruits.<sup>105</sup> Similarly, the work of the wives of the Cambridge Seven were vital in their missionary activity, and forms part of the often unseen and unheralded work of women in the mission field.

---

<sup>101</sup> Robert, *American Women in Mission*, 197.

<sup>102</sup> *Ibid.*, 413.

<sup>103</sup> *Proceedings 1894-5*, 147.

<sup>104</sup> *Proceedings 1892-3*, 202.

<sup>105</sup> *Proceedings 1895-6*, 217.

By 1890, more than half the Protestant missionary force in China were women, many employed in educational roles.<sup>106</sup> Cox claims that their role was underreported by missionary societies because of “gender politics.”<sup>107</sup> However, because of their focus on spiritual qualification for the work, holiness missionaries had fewer reservations about highlighting the work women were doing. Carmichael became a female religious celebrity. Fiedler argued that national leadership with the CIM developed more quickly under women, because their role was to closely assist Chinese pastors in working with women and children, not supplant them.<sup>108</sup> Hudson Taylor’s openness to women working on some mission fields on their own, was opposed by a number of missionaries of other societies in China.<sup>109</sup>

Semple shows that, between 1866 and 1886, the number of women joining the CIM was no higher than other mainline Protestant societies and the work they did in the mission field was similar to that of women in the LMS and Scottish Presbyterian missions. This changed in the 1880s when the number of women in the CIM increased rapidly, and recruits as a whole tended to be better off and more well-educated.<sup>110</sup> However, Semple cautions that “the story of women in the CIM is one in which representation does not match with reality.” Despite the large numbers of women in the CIM, men were promoted more quickly, indeed, in 1900 Hudson Taylor called for more men to be sent rather than more women. Over time, women moved into more supportive roles, although some still pioneered and itinerated, and starting Chefoo School allowed women with children to remain active on the mission field. Generally, the CIM reduced deployment of single women, often citing the difficulty over where to house them. Semple concludes, “The CIM did not escape the gendered influences that had shaped women’s work in the older missions.”<sup>111</sup> This was in part due to the constraints placed by growing

---

<sup>106</sup> Latourette, *A History of Christian Missions in China*, 407.

<sup>107</sup> Cox, *British Missionary Enterprise*, 196.

<sup>108</sup> Fiedler, *The Story of Faith Missions*, 293, 395.

<sup>109</sup> Wigram, *Bible and Mission*, 210.

<sup>110</sup> Semple, *Missionary Women*, 154-55.

<sup>111</sup> *Ibid.*, 231.

“British middle-class values” which overrode the ideals of holiness-inspired mission service.<sup>112</sup>

### The Educational Background of Holiness Missionaries

A notable feature of late-nineteenth-century mission was the increased number of university students or graduates offering themselves for missionary service. This trend was reflected in the holiness missionaries in these case studies, especially the Cambridge Seven. The Keswick holiness movement was particularly successful in channelling the missionary fervour of Cambridge students. The CIM especially benefitted, as Douglas Hooper of Ridley Hall noted: “at Cambridge, there was a feeling that the more deeply spiritually taught men must join the C.I.M. in preference to the C.M.S.”<sup>113</sup> This indicated a change from the CIM’s early intention to attract lay workers quickly, without the need for a long education, as they would be expected only to communicate a “straightforward message.”<sup>114</sup> From the late 1880s, the CIM recruits, “inspired by Keswick and the Student Volunteer Movement,” increasingly had more higher education.<sup>115</sup>

According to Semple, this created “a marked dichotomy,” not only between male and female workers but also between well-educated missionaries and lesser-educated lay evangelists. She argues this was part of an attempt to reduce the cultural and educational difference between the CIM and other Protestant societies in China by increasing “the mission’s status and yet retaining a distance in terms of their character of faith.” At Chefoo School, the CIM tried to create the “professional social ideal.” This was part of a “gradual gentrification and professionalization” across the mission. By the 1890s, children raised at Chefoo were “more properly middle class and British than the previous generation of workers had been.”<sup>116</sup> To

---

<sup>112</sup> Ibid., 185, 189, 231.

<sup>113</sup> Charles Harford-Battersby, *Pilkington of Uganda*, 2nd ed. (London: Marshall Brothers, 1899), 52.

<sup>114</sup> Semple, *Missionary Women*, 157

<sup>115</sup> Ibid., 157-8.

<sup>116</sup> Ibid., 155.

Cox, it was “a harvest of decades of investment in the task of making the missionary profession a respectable one that a normal, educated person might find attractive.”

### Holiness-Inspired Missionaries and Educational Work

Education was a central part of nineteenth-century mission strategy. Of the holiness-influenced missionaries in these three case studies, those from Ridley Hall placed the greatest emphasis on it. Out of more than fifty Ridley Hall missionaries who served in India, nineteen were involved purely in educational mission, and twenty others engaged both in education and itineration. Several also became principals of theological colleges in India, China, and Japan, and their work helped with the training of future Asian evangelists, preachers, and pastors. This thesis has confirmed the view of Maughan that, through the influence of the CMS leaders Stock and Wigram (CMS Secretary), evangelization was seen as involving both direct evangelism through preaching, and also “more diffuse culturally transformative efforts provided by educational work, medical missions, literary work.”<sup>117</sup> The CMS included emphasis on civilising alongside preaching.

This work on the mission field also reflects the Ridley Hall missionaries’ upbringing within the Church of England, which was a major provider of popular education. To this was added the influence of Barton. Porter notes how Barton’s views had changed after a meeting in India with Duff, moving away from a conviction that “evangelism by means of village preaching was infinitely preferable and in every way superior to school-teaching.”<sup>118</sup> Although Carmichael rejected government grants in her Dohnavur educational work, the CMS mission schools, including those served by the Ridley Hall missionaries, did accept government grants. These helped to ensure a higher standard of education, equipping students to pass government examinations. The result, according to Neill, was that Christianity become intellectually respectable within the main cultural and

---

<sup>117</sup> Maughan, *Mighty England Do Good*, 157.

<sup>118</sup> Andrew Porter, “Changing People, Changing Places,” *International Review of Mission* 88, no. 351 (2009), 394.

administrative centres of Indian life, as well as providing growing local churches with “almost all the highly educated Indian ministers.”<sup>119</sup>

The focus of Carmichael’s educational system was the conversion and consecration of her children, which involved isolating them from ‘worldly’ influences,<sup>120</sup> different approaches to Christian behaviour, or conflicting beliefs about the Bible.<sup>121</sup> This was reflected in her educational curriculum at Dohnavur, which focused on spiritual and moral formation rather than vocational training. This downplaying of vocational training contrasts to her more holistic approach to the rescue of temple children. Carmichael stood against the arguments at the Decennial Missionary Conference in Bombay in 1892-3 that education was not simply a means to salvation. However, not all Keswick-influenced missionaries elevated preaching over education to the same extent as Carmichael. Luce, Cable and Fugill were particularly active in fostering female education in Asia. Walker believed educational work to be “the most effectual way” to spread Christianity in India, especially among the higher castes.<sup>122</sup>

Despite the CIM’s initial renunciation of education as a part of mission, the development of the school and hospital at Chefoo after 1881 suggests a change of approach. A high quality education of the type enjoyed by middle-class children in Britain was offered as well as an educational mission to missionary children.<sup>123</sup> Yet, the CIM still was reporting in 1889 that, unlike other missions, it ran no schools.<sup>124</sup> Schools, when they were officially recognized, were portrayed as primarily “in the interests of consolidating local churches,” rather than for the aim of spreading civilization.<sup>125</sup> Even as late as 1900, Taylor contrasted approaches to gradual enlightenment with his preference for preaching for instant conversion.<sup>126</sup>

---

<sup>119</sup> Neill, *A History of Christianity in India*, 330.

<sup>120</sup> Carmichael, *Gold Cord*, 89.

<sup>121</sup> Robbins, *Not Forgetting to Sing*, 61.

<sup>122</sup> *Proceedings, 1888-89*, 153.

<sup>123</sup> Semple, *Missionary Women*, 168-9.

<sup>124</sup> Cox, *British Missionary Enterprise*, 201.

<sup>125</sup> Pfister, “Rethinking Mission in China,” 207.

<sup>126</sup> Wigram, *Bible and Mission*, 149.

Nonetheless, by 1915, the CIM was educating almost 10,000 pupils in its schools.<sup>127</sup> Education became over time another of the cases in which the CIM ideals did not “match with reality.”<sup>128</sup>

Approaches to educational mission by holiness missionaries were therefore not uniform, and were shaped by factors such as personal and educational background. For some, this made their educational approach closer to that of other missions.

#### Holiness-Inspired Missionaries and Medical Work

At the end of the nineteenth century, all the major missionary organisations recognized the role of medical mission and social services in evangelisation. The increasing numerical dominance of women in the mission field increased this trend. Semple notes how in the London Missionary Society and Scottish Presbyterian missions, indirect evangelism through education and health became of increasing importance, with a strong emphasis on the need for qualifications to do such work, rather than just high spiritual standards and a sense of call.<sup>129</sup>

In the CIM, Hudson Taylor’s medical background, and the Chefoo project from 1881 with its school and hospital, indicates a respect for medical mission. Medical work at Chefoo became a central feature of the CIM mission in Shandong Province.<sup>130</sup> By the 1890s, medical missions were being promoted from the Keswick platform, where they were described in 1892 as “a splendid spiritual vehicle” for the spread of Christianity.<sup>131</sup>

Of the three case studies, it was the Cambridge Seven who worked especially in rescuing victims of opium addiction, which was such a serious problem in China. Ridley Hall missionaries who went to China do not seem to have taken up this work. Despite Hudson Taylor’s early unsuccessful efforts, he gave great support to the

---

<sup>127</sup> A. J. Broomhall, *Not Death to Die*, 7:531

<sup>128</sup> Semple, *Missionary Women*, 26, 154.

<sup>129</sup> *Ibid.*, 231

<sup>130</sup> *Ibid.*, 164.

<sup>131</sup> Hopkins, *The Story of Keswick, 1892*, 26.

work of Hsi “Shengmo” in rescuing addicts.<sup>132</sup> All the Cambridge Seven initially chose to work under him (although for all but Hoste it was only for a short time), and a number of them repeated aspects of his work in their own mission. Taylor also campaigned for politicians to end the Opium trade.

The CMS did open hospitals and dispensaries for medical work, and some addressed opium-smoking, but the rescue of opium addicts seems to have been an issue to which the CIM gave more prominence than did other Protestant evangelical missions.<sup>133</sup> Those suffering from addiction were viewed with compassion, and the work provided opportunities for evangelism, but they also saw it as an aspect of spiritual warfare, breaking the chains of another oppressive power (that of addiction) which claimed the allegiance of the sufferer. Opium addiction appeared the physical embodiment of control by spiritual evil. In overcoming this, medicine and prayer and the Bible were all to play a part.

#### Holiness-Inspired Missionaries and Social Concern

Holiness teaching and the premillennial emphasis on the urgency of evangelism did not prevent holiness-inspired missionaries from demonstrating social concern through philanthropic activities. They were not, however, active in moves for wider social reform. In his discussion of the first fifty years of Keswick, Ian Randall observed that, “social change was not on the agenda.”<sup>134</sup> Although some key promoters of holiness teaching, such as F.B. Meyer, also believed that evangelisation had a social dimension, they were “always a minority.”<sup>135</sup> The focus on “inner spirituality and on the return of Christ” created an evangelicalism which, when it looked at the world, “was characterised by little other than deep foreboding.”<sup>136</sup> Similarly, David J. Bosch pointed out that one weakness of the faith mission movement was “virtually no interest in the societal dimension of the

---

<sup>132</sup> Austin, *China’s Millions*, 14.

<sup>133</sup> Bebbington, *Evangelicalism in Modern Britain*, 81

<sup>134</sup> Ian M. Randall, “Spiritual Renewal and Social Reform: Attempts to Develop Social Awareness in the Early Keswick Movement,” *Vox Evangelica* 23 (1993): 82.

<sup>135</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>136</sup> Randall, “Spiritual Renewal and Social Reform.” 82.

Christian gospel.”<sup>137</sup> Because Christ’s return was imminent, nothing should hinder from preaching the gospel to all nations with “the greatest speed.”<sup>138</sup> Dana Robert argued that premillennialism brought “a single minded emphasis on evangelization,” giving gospel proclamation “precedence over such traditional missionary activity as education and medicine.”<sup>139</sup> Premillennialists were impatient with the educational and social reform work emphasized by denominational missions because they seemed to be delaying the widest possible proclamation of the Word and the subsequent return of Christ.

In the light of this, the social concern of holiness-inspired missionaries may seem surprising. The Cambridge Seven, and the Keswick and Ridley Hall missionaries all engaged in some social concern projects. As well as the CIM helping those with opium addiction, Mildred Cable, together with the French sisters, fed homeless orphans and opened their house for them. Alex K. Macpherson, who believed in Christ’s return as a strong motive for social action, was in charge of the famine relief committee in Chekiang in 1922. G. W. Guinness was involved in several associations for promoting social welfare, besides his responsibility in medical mission in Kaifeng hospital. Similarly, the case study of the Ridley Hall missionaries showed their social concern activities during recurrent famines in India.

In 1878, the need was so great that the CIM was prepared to work with Timothy Richard and others in distributing relief in the worst affected parts of Shanxi.<sup>140</sup> Such spontaneous response to needs was repeated by members of the Cambridge Seven in response to flooding and famine, such as Arthur Polhill who engaged in relief work during the flood in Pachau in 1889. Famine relief also opened up opportunities for women, but also enabled the starting of churches in areas where it had been undertaken.<sup>141</sup>

---

<sup>137</sup> Bosch, *Transforming Mission*, 333.

<sup>138</sup> Ibid.

<sup>139</sup> Robert, ““The Crisis of Missions”,” 32.

<sup>140</sup> Quoted in A. J. Broomhall, *Assault on the Nine*, 6:178-80.

<sup>141</sup> A. J. Bromhall, *A Thousand Lives*, 3:351

This more nuanced understanding of the attitude of holiness missionaries to social concern supports the view of Brian Stanley, who argued that the belief in premillennialism did not necessarily lead to “an indifference to social issues,” or “automatically imply political quietism,” but could “impel Christians towards agitation against the wickedness of the world.”<sup>142</sup> Just as Harry Guinness, eldest son of Henry Guinness, an evangelist and a trainer of home evangelists and foreign missionaries, spoke out against the rubber atrocities conducted by Belgian concessionary companies in the Congo Free State, so too holiness-influenced missionaries in Asia spoke against other social evils, such as devadasis and the opium trade.

This thesis has also demonstrated that alongside their Christian compassion for those in need, when a particular issue like devadasis or opium addiction was seen as an aspect of spiritual warfare, holiness-influenced missionaries could be moved to urgent and sometimes radical action, overcoming theological reservations and convictions about the primacy of preaching. It could be argued that while the “innate radicalism” of Keswick was limited at home, it found more expression in practice on the mission fields.<sup>143</sup> There was also a premillennial concern to be faithful in action should Christ return. But on the whole, the holiness missionary activism was a short-term crusading approach, rather than an attempt to remodel society.

Carmichael’s work in rescuing children was clearly driven by compassion and social concern, and she took her campaign further, raising awareness of the issue of devadasis, encouraging other reformers, and calling on politicians to act, but she drew back from becoming openly involved in politics and working for major social reforms. She feared this would take time away from rescue work. Direct political engagement was not part of her understanding of mission.<sup>144</sup> While Hudson Taylor

---

<sup>142</sup> Brian Stanley, “The Future in the Past: Eschatological Vision in Britain and American Protestant Missionary History,” *Tyndale Bulletin* 51 (2000): 107.

<sup>143</sup> Randall, “Spiritual Renewal and Social Reform,” 82.

<sup>144</sup> Arles, *Ramabai and Carmichael*, 160.

called for political action to end the opium traffic, he left the campaigning to politicians.

### Holiness-Inspired Missionaries and Racial Attitudes

Porter's studies of the impact of the nineteenth-century British holiness movement on foreign missions in West Africa highlighted the negative impact the imposition of heightened moral expectations brought to the region by a contingent of young missionaries who were influenced by Keswick holiness teaching.<sup>145</sup> Out of seven missionaries in the Niger party, four were Cambridge graduates, including Charles F. Harford-Battersby, son of the founder of the Keswick Convention. Bishop Samuel Crowther and his African clergy were severely criticised for failing to match the expectations of Keswick holiness set by G. W. Brooke. After only two months of observation, Brooke was certain that "there is no hope of success until we have first taken down the whole of the past work so that not one stone remains upon another."<sup>146</sup> This eventually led to the expulsion of many Africans from the Niger Mission and the replacement of Crowther as bishop by a European. Brooke's party believed that the task of reform needed to begin with the leadership of the church.<sup>147</sup> Although at first the CMS administration at home did not agree with replacing the bishop, Samuel Crowther was eventually forced into retirement, and was replaced by a European.<sup>148</sup>

Scholars such as Webster and Ayandele ascribed the negative attitudes of holiness-inspired missionaries toward African Christian leaders to racist tendencies.<sup>149</sup> Porter agreed that from the late 1870s onwards the tendency was growing to view all Africans "in the light of an unfavourable social stereotype," even

---

<sup>145</sup> For Porter's interpretation of the impact of Keswick-inspired missionaries on the Niger Mission, see Porter, "Cambridge, Keswick, and Late-Nineteenth-Century Attitudes to Africa," 5–34 and; Porter, *Religion Versus Empire?*, 223–354.

<sup>146</sup> Quoted in Porter, "Cambridge, Keswick, and Late-Nineteenth-Century Attitudes to Africa," 26.

<sup>147</sup> Williams, "From Church to Mission," 397.

<sup>148</sup> Porter, *Religion Versus Empire?*, 243.

<sup>149</sup> Webster, *The African Churches Among the Yoruba*, 44; Ayandele, *The Missionary Impact on Modern Nigeria*, 213.

among missionaries.<sup>150</sup> While believing that ascribing all the negative attitudes to racism was “simplified and exaggerated,”<sup>151</sup> he did admit that, “In order to explain the failure of West Africans to respond rapidly in the expected fashion, Christian missionaries fell back on the only explanations to hand, those furnished by pseudo-scientific racialism. The ‘African mind’ came to be seen as ‘crooked’, ‘peculiar’, and idiosyncratic.”<sup>152</sup>

Porter highlights how Brooke’s mission methodology emphasised the Keswick focus on “personal holiness,” premillennial belief, and a hostility to Western-style institutions, such as schools, colleges, hospitals, and orphanages, especially those where theological and secular training were mingled.<sup>153</sup> For Brooke, “saving men from the power of Satan” and “building up political, commercial, and social civilization” were quite distinct.<sup>154</sup> Education was not to be spoken about as if it were in any sense ‘religion,’ mission by civilisation was rejected. The minister’s duty was to press “on each individual hearer the duty of immediate repentance and submission to Christ and tell them that Christ is shortly coming again.”<sup>155</sup> This reflected premillennial thinking,<sup>156</sup> and also the influence of Hudson Taylor and the CIM, which Brooke took “as his guide.”<sup>157</sup> He believed that the focus of missionary work was to share “the simple gospel message to the greatest number possible of ignorant heathen in the shortest possible time.”<sup>158</sup>

This thesis has highlighted how Keswick-influenced missionaries in the Asian field reflected some of these patterns, but were significantly different in others. There was no Asian Anglican bishop until 1912 when Vedanayagam Samuel Azariah (1874-1945) was consecrated in India, almost 50 years after the consecration of

---

<sup>150</sup> Porter, “Cambridge, Keswick, and Late-Nineteenth-Century Attitudes to Africa,” 27.

<sup>151</sup> Porter noted that Brooke also showed intolerance toward his “white colleagues” who were below his Christian standards (Porter, “The Career of G. W. Brooke,” 30).

<sup>152</sup> Porter, “Cambridge, Keswick, and Late-Nineteenth-Century Attitudes to Africa,” 27.

<sup>153</sup> Porter, *Religion Versus Empire?*, 255.

<sup>154</sup> *Ibid.*, 198.

<sup>155</sup> *Ibid.*, 200.

<sup>156</sup> Porter, “The Career of G. W. Brooke,” 39.

<sup>157</sup> *Ibid.*, 35.

<sup>158</sup> Porter, *Religion Versus Empire?*, 199–200.

Crowther. However, according to Azariah's biographer, he was influenced in part by Thomas Walker, who believed he and other Christian leaders were "capable of, and responsible for, building a new India through Christian evangelism rather than through nationalist politics."<sup>159</sup> Harper suggests the long delay in appointing an indigenous Bishop in India was in fact due to distrust among Indian Christians of Indian clergy who might protect the interest of their own caste or language group.<sup>160</sup> E. S. Carr, of Ridley Hall, encouraged the idea of indigenous leadership, urging the raising up of "apostles to their own countrymen," and praying that the European missionaries would not thwart their work, or impair their usefulness by insisting on their own methods or preconceived ideas.<sup>161</sup>

In China, the Ridley Hall missionary H. J. Molony, who became Bishop in Cheh-Kiang, appointed Sing Tsaе-Seng as the first Chinese Archdeacon in 1911,<sup>162</sup> and subsequently in 1918 as his assistant bishop.<sup>163</sup> Carmichael worked with an Indian leadership team at Dohnavur.<sup>164</sup> Cable passed the leadership of the girls' school in Hwochow to local Christians.

The CIM is noted for how advanced it was in giving leadership opportunities to local Chinese Christians. However, despite this policy on the field, Semple has highlighted implicitly negative racial attitudes at Chefoo School in Shandong Province. Here there was no strict segregation between boys and girls, or on racial grounds until 1891. But after that there was a much more conscious separation between races, and soon it was effectively closed to non-white children, either Chinese or mixed-race, although this does not seem to have been official policy.<sup>165</sup>

---

<sup>159</sup> Susan Billington Harper, *In the Shadow of the Mahatma: Bishop V.S. Azariah and the Travails of Christianity in British India*, Studies in the History of Christian Missions (Grand Rapids, Mich.: Richmond: W. B. Eerdmans; Curzon Press, 2000), 68.

<sup>160</sup> *Ibid.*, 172.

<sup>161</sup> *Proceedings, 1898-99*, 278.

<sup>162</sup> *Proceedings, 1910-11*, 7.

<sup>163</sup> *Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Twentieth Year, 1918-19* (London: Church Missionary House, 1919), 10.

<sup>164</sup> This goes against Elizabeth Kent's assertion that Carmichael showed racist attitude in entrusting Dohnavur leadership to only Europeans. See page 99-100.

<sup>165</sup> Semple, *Missionary Women*, 168, 155.

The same attitudes were apparent in the issue of missionaries marrying local Chinese Christians. In 1881, the CIM leadership objected to the marriage of George Parker to a Chinese woman, and they were sent to Gansu, away from public notice.<sup>166</sup> Even more shocking was the desire of Anna Jakobsen, a CIM missionary from Norway, to marry Ch'eng Hsiu-chi, a very able Chinese evangelist. Henry Frost described the relationship as "unnatural and serious." Hudson Taylor refused to agree to the marriage because it would expose CIM women to "unwanted attentions from unsuitable men."<sup>167</sup> Jakobsen was sent to Hunan to start an opium refuge where she worked for five years, before she married Ch'eng. After the marriage she was ostracized by both Europeans and Chinese, although Ch'eng served faithfully till his death in 1915.<sup>168</sup>

In Semple's view, mixed marriage was rejected out of fear of offending supporters back home. For all its emphasis on faith and radical holiness principles, the middle class values of its donors about propriety and respectability, shaped aspects of the CIM'S policy, including some negative racial attitudes.<sup>169</sup> These affected the education given to missionary children at Chefoo, protecting the children from Chinese cultural influences, and even from playing with the children of Chinese workers. Some newly arrived children were punished for speaking Chinese. The attempt to build the "holiness milieu" of the mission into a middle-class educational environment, meant that some of the values Chefoo promoted were the ones from which holiness advocates had originally sought to break free.<sup>170</sup> One of the reasons for the increase of exclusive, middle class values was Hudson Taylor's tendency later in life to surround himself with well-educated recruits, and promote them first.<sup>171</sup>

Against this should be set the initial willingness of the Cambridge Seven to put themselves under the leadership of Hsi, a native convert. With most of them it

---

<sup>166</sup> Ibid., 169

<sup>167</sup> Austin, *China's Millions*, 390.

<sup>168</sup> Semple, *Missionary Women*, 169.

<sup>169</sup> Ibid., 187-8

<sup>170</sup> Ibid., 179, 183, 187-8.

<sup>171</sup> Ibid., 188.

was not long lasting, but Hsi did have a major impact on their missionary activities, especially the Opium refuge work. The one who worked longest with Hsi was Hoste, and it did seem to be a genuine collaboration. Single women missionaries also put themselves under the protection of Mrs Hsi. However, over time foreign missionaries increasingly took control of indigenous congregations. After 1900, the CIM began to look more like other missions.<sup>172</sup>

The efforts of the Keswick-influenced missionaries to encourage indigenous leadership in the Asian field suggest that the connection between holiness teaching and negative racial attitudes which Porter and others have observed in West Africa was not as prevalent in Asia. Keswick medical missionaries trained local doctors, teachers, and pastors, and, provided they were believing Christians, gave them responsibilities in the mission. To be sure, some racial stereotyping presented Asians as at a higher level of evolutionary development than Africans, and this may have been an influence on the holiness missionaries' more respectful attitudes toward Asian people.

As they did in Africa, Keswick-inspired missionaries in Asia confronted spiritual problems and moral weakness in the congregations, applied strict requirements for baptism, and used excommunication to purify the church. The rigorous policy of church discipline conducted by Walker, a Keswick missionary, was continued by Carr, of Ridley Hall, who succeeded him.<sup>173</sup> Gough, in Narowal, insisted on Sunday observance for Christians even at the risk of their losing their livelihood. More generally, Ridley Hall missionaries attempted to persuade local church members to adopt a more Christian manner of living by means of preaching, personal visitation, or forming societies, such as a temperance society to help local believers avoid drunkenness. There appear some similarities to the intolerant attitude shown by Brooke's party in Africa, but in Asia these attempts to raise standards were aimed at church members and adherents, rather than at indigenous

---

<sup>172</sup> Austin, *China's Millions*, 443.

<sup>173</sup> *Proceedings, 1894-95*, 210.

leaders, for indigenous leadership was less well developed than in Africa. Keswick missionaries were negative about local culture, or promoting indigenous leaders, but in a selective way. The impact of Keswick theology on purifying Christianity in Asia was clearly in some respects negative, but perhaps less negative than that which Porter described in Africa.

Cox suggests “missionary racism” was “institutional rather than ideological,” because missions supported “Christian universalism.”<sup>174</sup> If the self-governing, self-supporting, self-propagating aim was to be achieved, indigenous clergy needed to be trained. Only a few missions rejected ordination of indigenous Christians. In 1889, British mission societies reported they had 1,280 ordained foreign workers overseas, and 1,744 ordained “natives” – 58% of the total missionary force. If other “native” staff were included, the number rose to 84% of the missionary workforce.<sup>175</sup> By the 1880s the overall missionary workforce was overwhelmingly female and non-white,<sup>176</sup> trends which were reflected among holiness missionaries.

### Distinctiveness and Differences

These three case studies have shown that the Keswick missionaries, the Ridley Hall missionaries and the Cambridge Seven were three separate strands of one movement. There were clearly common areas. Carmichael, as we have seen, drew on Hudson Taylor; Moule and Barton at Ridley Hall had close connections to Keswick; and Keswick-type meetings were repeated in Cambridge. But there were also significant differences not only between the groups represented by the three case studies, but also among individuals within the case studies. Ridley Hall missionaries came closer to institutional models of mission such as the CMS practiced. Some members of the Cambridge Seven held markedly divergent views on Pentecostalism and the Larger hope.

Holiness-influenced missions had ideals that helped attract financial support and missionary candidates, but they were under pressure to reflect the ideals of

---

<sup>174</sup> Cox, *British Missionary Enterprise*, 199.

<sup>175</sup> *Ibid.*, 199-200.

<sup>176</sup> *Ibid.*, 202.

their supporters, which sometimes created tensions. Over time, their distinctive ideals eroded, and they often began to look more like other missions. Yet, there were times when other missions adopted practice similar to the holiness missions, such as when the CMS adopted a form of the faith principle in accepting recruits that it did not yet have the funds to support. They did not want to miss out on the increase interest in mission prompted by the holiness movement. The holiness missions may have influenced the older missionary societies in other ways. Williams claimed that the CMS “changed its image from that of a rather conservative establishment society, somewhat hostile to revivalism and unattractive to the really “committed”, to one which would appeal to the desires for consecration and sacrifice which abounded.”<sup>177</sup>

The practice of the older missionary societies also influenced the holiness missions. Although Hudson Taylor put great emphasis on itinerancy, Pfister notes how Taylor’s premillennial belief did not keep him “from planning institutionalized support for the growing number of mission stations under his ultimate supervision.”<sup>178</sup> In 1888, Taylor insisted that, “It is not itinerant versus settled missionary work. Both are essential and important, and, so far from being antagonistic, are mutually dependent on each other.”<sup>179</sup> Taylor argued that itinerancy was only the “avant-garde” of the mission, so that “Once a station was established, other, more standard modes of missionary activity would naturally begin to take place.”<sup>180</sup> These included school and hospitals. Despite its early ideals and fresh approaches, by 1906 the CIM, according to Cox, “bore a suspicious resemblance to the old established societies that it scorned... plagued with institutionalization, racism, and periodic retrenchment.”<sup>181</sup>

Keswick missionaries who were sent to China under the CIM engaged in forming or serving educational, medical or residential institutions within their

---

<sup>177</sup> Williams, *The Ideal of the Self-Governing Church*, 151.

<sup>178</sup> Pfister, “Rethinking Mission in China,” 205.

<sup>179</sup> James Johnston, ed., *Report of the Centenary Conference on the Protestant Missions of the World: Held in Exeter Hall (June 9th-19th), London, 1888*, vol. 2 (London: James Nisbet, 1888), 29.

<sup>180</sup> Pfister, “Rethinking Mission in China,” 205.

<sup>181</sup> Cox, *Protestant Missionary*, 184.

mission fields, such as Guinness in Kaifeng hospital, and Mildred Cable as the Principal of a girls' school. Ridley Hall missionaries in Asia were heavily involved in education, some devoting most of their missionary careers to it: W. S. Moule was Principal of Trinity College, Ningpo, for thirty-seven years.<sup>182</sup> Amy Carmichael certainly built schools, nurseries, and a hospital, although the focus at Dohnavur on family perhaps prevented it from becoming a large-scale institution. Moreover, Dohnavur's education was influenced by a dualism, where the salvation of the souls and spiritual and moral formation was more important than education for a career.

When the holiness-influenced missionaries did demonstrate social concern, they tended to view such concern as a means to evangelisation. This was different from other Protestant missionaries who emphasized the development of the whole person, though admittedly their ultimate goal was also saving souls. At the Centenary Protestant Missionary Conference in London in 1888, it was argued that medical missions were not merely "an occasional auxiliary to Missionary work," but "an embodiment of the Divine Idea."<sup>183</sup> While Timothy Richard also saw social work as mainly a means to spread the gospel, his belief in the theology of fulfilment meant that he placed high importance on education and literature.<sup>184</sup> The Keswick missionaries also did not follow the trend among some other missionaries in India of viewing social reform, social protest and humanitarian activism as part of their mission.<sup>185</sup> Rather the holiness-influenced missionaries viewed education, medical work, and social care as important mainly in preparing the way for evangelism.

The pattern of ideals being the basis for a new work, but gradually being lost was also seen in the area of leadership. Hudson Taylor's leadership style had initially attracted the Cambridge Seven. They expected to be Hudson's "helpers," who would "give him prompt and loyal obedience (as his father put it) as they would obey God."<sup>186</sup> Yet this did not last long. When Studd declared himself "dead to

---

<sup>182</sup> *Proceedings, 1924-25*, 69.

<sup>183</sup> Oddie, *Social Protest in India*, 33.

<sup>184</sup> Pfister, "Rethinking Mission in China," 26-29.

<sup>185</sup> Oddie, *Social Protest in India*, 238.

<sup>186</sup> Austin, *China's Millions*, 103.

everything, to everybody, to the opinions not only of the world, but also of the Christian world,"<sup>187</sup> it indicated an independence of mind and willingness to defy expectation and conventions. Studd only served in China for nine years before he was invalided home, but he was by then operating semi-independently. By the 1890s only three of the seven remained firmly connected to the CIM. Such highly gifted, well-educated, strong-minded individuals were used to privilege and influence. Apart from Hoste, their example of holiness surrender and self-sacrifice in working under Hsi did not last long.

Although initially a British movement, Keswick-type holiness was profoundly shaped from an early period by American influences. Phoebe Palmer, the Pearsall Smiths, D. L. Moody, and A. T. Pierson were all highly influential on the British movement. The transatlantic influences went both ways – and such leading figures in the British holiness movement as J. N. Darby, A. N. Groves, and George Müller, and later Hudson Taylor had a significant impact on American evangelicalism.

David Bebbington claimed that holiness and the Keswick movement “shaped the prevailing pattern of Evangelical piety for much of the twentieth century.”<sup>188</sup> Holiness was a heightened form of evangelicalism, with greater emphasis given to certain theological themes, such as sanctification and consecration, shaped by premillennial approaches to the interpretation of the Bible. These three case studies have shown that just as it highlighted certain key doctrinal and devotional themes, holiness-influenced mission also tended to give heightened emphasis to certain themes in mission. These were especially the urgency of evangelism and preaching in the light of the imminent return of Christ. In their social concern there was a similar heightened selective emphasis on certain issues, such as opium addiction and the rescue of temple children, especially where the work could be seen as an aspect of spiritual warfare and deliverance. But elsewhere their activities looked similar to those of other Protestant evangelical missions, such as the work of the Ridley Hall missionaries in education. They did not reject medical work or

---

<sup>187</sup> Austin, *China's Millions*, 103.

<sup>188</sup> Bebbington, *Evangelicalism in Modern Britain*, 151.

famine relief, but gave them less emphasis than in other missions, and they were not interested in promoting wider social reform. Holiness certainly brought a wave of recruits to mission, and fresh thinking and ideals, but Protestant mission as a whole was not permanently transformed. By 1906, the wave of recruits inspired by Keswick-type holiness was receding, and so were its distinctive ideals. Keswick-holiness inspired mission was beginning to look increasingly like that of other evangelical missionary organizations.

## APPENDIX

Table 1. The List of Names of the Ridley Hall Missionaries that went to Asia with their stations:<sup>1</sup>

No.	Name	Sphere of Labour
1	Armitage, Philip	Missionary to Allahabad, India (1900-01)
2	Barton, Cecil Edward	CMS Missionary at Multan, Punjab and Srinagar, Kashmir, India (1893-1906)
3	Batchelor, John	Missionary (C.M.S) at Hakodate, Japan (1887/9 - 1927)
4	Bellerby, Edwin	Vice-Principal CMS College, Kottayam, Travancore, India (1890-94), Principal of the Buchanan Institution, Pallam, Travancore (1894-1912), Missionary at Kottayam (1913-16).
5	Birkett, Arthur Ismay	Missionary at Lucknow, India (1887-1905), Lusadia, Ahmedabad (1905-12), diocese Bombay (1913- )
6	Boyer, J. W.	Missionary at Trivandrum, South India
7	Butlin, James Punnett	Missionary at Aurangabad (1899-03), Malegam (1906-06), Poona, India (1906-07)
8	Byrde, Louis	Missionary Diocese Victoria (Hong Kong) (1898-1907), Missionary to Chinese students at Tokyo (1907-09), Yungchow, China (1909-13), Kwangsi (1913-17), Archdeacon Kwangsi (1914-17).
9	Carr, Edmund Stileman	Missionary in Palamcotta, India (1887-1915), Honorary Secretary of Zenana Bible Medical Mission (1916-33)
10	Causton, Ernest Augustus	Missionary at Narowal, Punjab (1895-96), Lahore (1896-1900), Allahabad, India (1900-02)
11	Challis, James Marsh	Missionary at Agra (1893-1900), Principal of Jay Navayans College, Benares (1900-04), Jabalpur (1904-05), Principal at St. John's College, Agra, India
12	Clark, Stuart Harrington	Missionary at Punjab (India)

<sup>1</sup> This list was arranged based on index cards which were prepared by the late Noel Pollard, once Vice-Principal of Ridley Hall in 1980s. These index cards, which are kept at the Ridley Hall library, contain information on Ridley Hall members who became missionaries during Moule's principalship.

No.	Name	Sphere of Labour
13	Clarke, Charles Bird	Principal of the Boys' School, Calcutta (1892-1904), Burdwan (1905-09), CMS Chairman of Nadia Church Council, India (1910-12)
14	Clarke, Charles William Arden	Principal of the Noble School, Masulipatam, India (1886-1906), Fellow of University of Madras (1900-)
15	Cobb, William Francis	Missionary at Multan, Punjab (1894-1907), Principal of St. John's College, Lahore, India (1905)
16	Consterdine, Reginald Henry	Missionary at Matsuye, Japan (1893-96), Tokushima (1896-1900)
17	Crockett, Arthur Walcott	Chaplain of Old Church, Calcutta, India (1895-97)
18	Davis, George Brocklesby	Missionary at Amritsar, Punjab, India (1905-19)
19	Davis, Philip Brocklesby	Missionary at United Provinces Mission, India (1902-1911)
20	Douglas, Edwin Albert	Missionary at Diocese Tinnevelly, South India (1889-1905)
21	Ealand, Arthur Fawsit	Missionary at Shirkarpur (1900-1903), Principal St. Paul's School, Calcutta, India (1903-14)
22	Elliott, Ernest Wriothesley	Principal of the Noble School (C.M.S.) of Masulipatam, India (1883-85)
23	Elwin, William Hedger	Missionary at Ning-po, Mid-China (1898-1907), to Chinese students at Tokyo (1907-24)
24	Eyton-Jones, Hugh Mortimer	Missionary at Fuh-Ning, South China (1889-97)
25	Fall, John William	Vice-Principal of Trinity College, Kandy (1889-1901), Principal of St. John's College, Jaffna, Ceylon (1891-94), Superintendent of Tamil Coolie Mission, Haputale (1895-97), Missionary at Colombo (1897)
26	Field, Claude Herbert Alwyn	Missionary at Peshawar, Punjab, India (1892-1903)
27	Finnimore, Arthur Kington	Missionary at Diocese Tinnevelly, India (1885-93), Diocese Mauritius (1893-1901), Diocese Colombo (1909-22)
28	Fitzpatrick, Thomas Henry	Principal of Harris School, Rojapettah, Madras, India (1895-1900)
29	Fothergill, Clifford Douglas	Principal of High School at Dera Ismail Khan, N. India (1896-98)

No.	Name	Sphere of Labour
30	Gill, Charles Hope	Missionary at Shikarpur, Bengal (1886-90), Jabalpur (1890-98), Secretary of CMS at Allahabad (1898-1905), Bishop of Travancore (1905-24), India
31	Goodchild, Thomas C.	Missionary at Hang-chow (1898-1906), Ningpo (1901-11), Hengchow, China (1911-17)
32	Gough, Charles Massey	Missionary at Quetta, Baluchistan, India (1892-95), Batala (1896), Narowal (1897-1906), Clarkabad (1906-15), Acting Secretary of CMS Punjab and Sindh Mission (1914-15), Secretary (1915-23)
33	Grant, Charles	Missionary in Krisnagar, Bengal, India (1895-97), Principal of Boys' School, Calcutta (1897-98), Vice-Principal of Cathedral Divinity School, Calcutta (1898-1904), Acting Principal of CMS Divinity School, Bengal (1904-08)
34	Gray, Joseph Sewell	Missionary at Lucknow (1891-93), Secundra (1893-95), Benares (1896-99), India
35	Hensley, Ernest Augustus	Missionary at Lucknow, India (1893-99), Jabalpur (1900-18), CMS Secretary in Central Province and Rajputana (1907-18)
36	Herklots, Bernard	Missionary at Diocese Lucknow, India (1901-1905)
37	Heywood, Richard Stanley	Principal of Divinity School, Poona, Western India (1894-1901), at Girgaum (1903-18)
38	Hooton, Walter Stewart	Diocese Madras, Tinnevely, India (1895-97)
39	Jones, Philip Ireland	Principal of CMS Divinity School, Calcutta, India (1885-92), Krisnagar (1890-92), Secretary CMS Punjab (1900-03), Diocese Lahore (1905-22)
40	Markby, Frederick Edward	Missionary at Gondland, India (1898-99), Mutra (1899-1900), Gorakhpur (1901-02), Amritsar (1902-03), Chaplain at Cochin (1903-04)
41	Marriott, Robert Buchanan	Missionary at Shikarpur, Bengal, India (1891-98)
42	Molony, Herbert James	Missionary to Mandala (1890-1904), Jabalpur (1905-07), North-West Provinces, India, Bishop of Mid-China (Chekiang), China (1908-28)
43	Morse, Stanley Ramey	Missionary at Bhagalpur, Bengal, India (1895-1903), Principal of CMS High School, Lucknow (1904-20)
44	Moule, George Herbert	CMS Miss at Kumamoto, Japan (1902-05); Taketa (1905-08); Hakata (1908-11)

No.	Name	Sphere of Labour
45	Moule, Henry William	Missionary at Hangchow, Mid-China (1896-1900), Shao-Ling (1900-02), Hangchow (1902-13; 1915-22), Ningpo (1913-15)
46	Moule, Walter Stephen	Vice-Principal CMS Trinity College Ningpo, China (1888-98), Principal (1898-1918), Archdeacon in Chekiang (1901-25)
47	Mylrea, Clarence Garland	Missionary at Calcutta, India (1894-96), Bhagulpur, Bengal (1897-1903), Lucknow (1903-16)
48	Napier-Clavering, Henry Percy	Principal CMS Trinity College, Kandy, Ceylon (1890-1900), CMS Missionary Christ Church, Ceylon (1907-08), Acting Principal Trinity College, Kandy (1911-12), Secretary C.E. Zenana Mission (1912-16), CMS Secretary for Ceylon (1919-20)
49	Neale, John	Missionary at Hangchow, China (1887-94)
50	Newberry, Herbert Edward Lightfoot	Missionary at Diocese Tinnevelly, India (1900- )
51	Newbery, Lionel Archibald McCintock	Missionary at Bengal, India (1896-1901)
52	Paterson, John Mapletoft	Missionary at Gorakhpur, India (1891-95), Agra (1895-1900), Bharatpur (1902-05), Karachi (1914-16), Srinagar (1916-18)
53	Pearce, Robert Freeman	Principal of Church Missionary College, Calcutta, India (1902-09), Principal of CMS Divinity School, Cossipur (1911-15), Nadia (1915-20), Calcutta (1920-22), Chapra (1922-23), CMS Secretary Diocese Calcutta (1925-35), Honorary Canon of Calcutta (1927-36)
54	Phillips, Hugh Stowell	Missionary in Nangwakau (1888-91), Kienyang (1891-1900), Kienning (1901-29), Archdeacon of Kienning (1917-29) China
55	Price, Horace MacCartie Eyre	Principal of C.M.S. Boys' School, Osaka, Japan (1890-97), Acting Secretary CMS Osaka (1897-98), Principal CMS Divinity School, Osaka (1900-03), Archdeacon of Osaka (1900-06), Bishop of Fukien, China (1906-18)
56	Romilly, Cuthbert Edward Reynolds	Missionary at Alwaye, Travancore, India (1887-1905)
57	Rowlands, Frederick William	Missionary at Kagoshima, Japan (1897-1908)

No.	Name	Sphere of Labour
58	Sandys, Edward Theodore	Chairman of Calcutta district Church Council, India (1891-99), Secretary CMS Calcutta (1900-25), Canon of Calcutta (1917-30)
59	Shields, Arthur John	Missionary at Bengal, India (1882-92), Central Secretary Hibernian CMS (1892-95)
60	Sinker, Robert	Missionary at Karachi, Sindh, India (1895-98), Hyderabad (1899-1901)
61	Swann, Sydney	Missionary at Fukuyama, Japan (1890-95), Chaplain to English Congregation, Kobe (1895-96)
62	Symons, Charles John Firzsimen	Missionary at Ningpo, China (1887-96), Shanghai (1896-1919)
63	Tanner, Henry James	Rugby Football Master in CMS Noble School at Masulipatam, India (1887-1901)
64	Thompson, Jacob	Missionary at Cottayam, India (1888-98), Ceylon (1899-1920)
65	Welchman, William	Missionary at Colombo, Ceylon (1892-95), Tamil Coolie Mission (1895-99)
66	Weston, Walter	Missionary at Kumamoto, Japan (1888-89), Kobe (1889-95), Chaplain at Yokohama (1911-15)
67	Wigram, Edmund Francis Edward	Acting Principal Baring High School, Batala, India (1893-94), Missionary at Lahore (1891-92), Amritsar (1895-96), Principal of St. John's Divinity School (CMS) at Lahore (1896-1907), Canon of Lahore (1912-15).
68	Wigram, Marcus Edward	CMS Missionary at Lahore, India (1901-03); Peshawar (1903-12); Bannu (1912-25), Allahabad (1929-30), Meerut (1930-31), Honorary Canon, Lahore (1932-37)
69	Wood, John Anthony	Vice-Principal of St. John's Divinity School, Lahore, India

## Bibliography

### Primary Sources:

Barton, Emily. "The Memoirs of Emily Eugenia Barton," n.d.

Cable, Mildred, and Francesca French. *Something Happened*. London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1933.

———. *Towards Spiritual Maturity: A Book for Those Who Seek It*. London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1939.

Carmichael, Amy. *Edges of His Ways: Selections for Daily Reading*. Dohnavur book. London: SPCK, 1957.

———. *Gold Cord: The Story of a Fellowship*. London: Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge, 1932.

———. *Lotus Buds*. London, 1910.

"China's Millions," 1885.

"China's Millions," 1886.

"China's Millions," 1888.

"China's Millions," 1889.

"China's Millions," 1890.

"China's Millions," 1891.

"China's Millions," 1892.

"China's Millions," 1893.

"China's Millions," 1894.

"China's Millions," 1897.

"China's Millions," 1898.

"China's Millions," 1899.

"China's Millions," 1900.

"China's Millions," 1902.

"China's Millions," 1904.

"China's Millions," 1908.

"China's Millions," 1909.

"China's Millions," 1910.

"China's Millions," 1920.

"China's Millions," 1922.

"China's Millions," 1923.

"China's Millions," 1927.

"China's Millions," 1931.

"China's Millions," 1932.

"China's Millions," 1937.

"China's Millions," 1948.

"Church Missionary Gleaner," April 1901.

"Church Missionary Gleaner," March 1903.

"Church Missionary Gleaner," December 1915.

"Church Missionary Gleaner," January 1920.

Hopkins, Evan Henry, ed. *The Keswick Week, 1894: Twentieth Convention*. London: Marshall Brothers, 1894.

———, ed. *The Keswick Week, 1896: Twenty-Second Convention*. London: Marshall Brothers, 1896.

———, ed. *The Keswick Week, 1897: Twenty-Third Convention*. London: Marshall Brothers, 1897.

———, ed. *The Keswick Week, 1898: Twenty-Fourth Convention*. London: Marshall Brothers, 1898.

———, ed. *The Keswick Week, 1899: Twenty-Fifth Convention*. London: Marshall Brothers, 1899.

———, ed. *The Keswick Week, 1900: Twenty-Sixth Convention*. London: Marshall Brothers, 1900.

- , ed. *The Keswick Week, 1901: Twenty-Seventh Convention*. London: Marshall Brothers, 1901.
- , ed. *The Keswick Week, 1902: Twenty-Eighth Convention*. London: Marshall Brothers, 1902.
- , ed. *The Keswick Week, 1903: Twenty-Ninth Convention*. London: Marshall Brothers, 1903.
- , ed. *The Keswick Week, 1904: Thirtieth Convention*. London: Marshall Brothers, 1904.
- , ed. *The Keswick Week, 1905: Thirty-First Convention*. London: Marshall Brothers, 1905.
- , ed. *The Keswick Week, 1906: Thirty-Second Convention*. London: Marshall Brothers, 1906.
- , ed. *The Keswick Week, 1907: Thirty-Third Convention*. London: Marshall Brothers, 1907.
- , ed. *The Keswick Week, 1910: Thirty-Sixth Convention*. London: Marshall Brothers, 1910.
- , ed. *The Keswick Week, 1911: Thirty-Seventh Convention*. London: Marshall Brothers, 1911.
- , ed. *The Keswick Week, 1912: Thirty-Eighth Convention*. London: Marshall Brothers, 1912.
- , ed. *The Keswick Week, 1913: Thirty-Ninth Convention*. London: Marshall Brothers, 1913.
- , ed. *The Keswick Week, 1914: Fortieth Convention*. London: Marshall Brothers, 1914.
- , ed. *The Story of Keswick: Eighteenth Convention, 1892*. London: Office of "The Life of Faith," 1892.
- , ed. *The Story of Keswick: Nineteenth Convention, 1893*. London: Office of "The Life of Faith," 1893.
- Herklots, Bernard. *The Future of the Evangelical Party in the Church of England*. London, 1913.
- Johnston, James, ed. *Report of the Centenary Conference on the Protestant Missions of the World: Held in Exeter Hall (June 9th-19th), London, 1888*. Vol. 2. London: James Nisbet, 1888.

"Life of Faith," 1887.

"Life of Faith," 1888.

"Life of Faith," 1889.

"Life of Faith," 1891.

"Life of Faith," 1893.

"Life of Faith," 1895.

"Life of Faith," 1896.

"Life of Faith," 1901.

"Life of Faith," 1903.

Moule, H. C. G. *Ridley Hall, Cambridge: Annual Letter, 1892*. Cambridge: sn, 1892.

———. *Ridley Hall, Cambridge: Annual Letter, 1896*. Cambridge: sn, 1896.

———. *Ridley Hall, Cambridge: Annual Letter, 1898*. Cambridge: sn, 1898.

———. *Ridley Hall, Cambridge: Annual Letter, 1899*. Cambridge: sn, 1899.

———. *Ridley Hall, Cambridge: Annual Letter, and List of Members, 1889*. Cambridge: sn, 1889.

———. *Ridley Hall, Cambridge: Annual Letter and Report of Triennial Reunion, 1902*. Cambridge: sn, 1902.

———. *Ridley Hall, Cambridge: Reunion of 1887*. Cambridge: sn, 1887.

———. *Ridley Hall, Cambridge: Reunion of 1890*. Cambridge: sn, 1890.

Polhill, Cecil. "Flames of Fire with Which Is Incorporated Tidings from Tibet and Other Lands," October 1912.

Polhill, Cecil, and Arthur Polhill. "Two Etonians in China, 1885-1925," n.d.

*Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: Eighty-Third Year, 1881-82*. London: Church Missionary House, 1882.

*Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: Eighty-Fifth Year, 1883-84*. London: Church Missionary House, 1884.

*Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: Eighty-Sixth Year, 1884-85*. London: Church Missionary House, 1885.

- Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: Eighty-Seventh Year, 1885-86.* London: Church Missionary House, 1886.
- Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: Eighty-Ninth Year, 1887-88.* London: Church Missionary House, 1888.
- Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: Ninetieth Year, 1888-89.* London: Church Missionary House, 1889.
- Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: Ninety-Second Year, 1890-91.* London: Church Missionary House, 1891.
- Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: Ninety-Third Year, 1891-92.* London: Church Missionary House, 1892.
- Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: Ninety-Fourth Year, 1892-93.* London: Church Missionary House, 1893.
- Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: Ninety-Fifth Year, 1893-94.* London: Church Missionary House, 1894.
- Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: Ninety-Sixth Year, 1894-95.* London: Church Missionary House, 1895.
- Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: Ninety-Seventh Year, 1895-96.* London: Church Missionary House, 1896.
- Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: Ninety-Eighth Year, 1896-97.* London: Church Missionary House, 1897.
- Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: Ninety-Ninth Year, 1897-98.* London: Church Missionary House, 1898.
- Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One Hundredth Year, 1898-99.* London: Church Missionary House, 1899.
- Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-First Year, 1899-1900.* London: Church Missionary House, 1900.
- Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Second Year, 1900-01.* London: Church Missionary House, 1901.
- Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Third Year, 1901-02.* London: Church Missionary House, 1902.
- Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Fourth Year, 1902-03.* London: Church Missionary House, 1903.

*Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Fifth Year, 1903-04.* London: Church Missionary House, 1904.

*Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Sixth Year, 1904-05.* London: Church Missionary House, 1905.

*Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Seventh Year, 1905-06.* London: Church Missionary House, 1906.

*Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Eighth Year, 1906-07.* London: Church Missionary House, 1907.

*Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Ninth Year, 1907-08.* London: Church Missionary House, 1908.

*Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Tenth Year, 1908-09.* London: Church Missionary House, 1909.

*Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Twelfth Year, 1910-11.* London: Church Missionary House, 1911.

*Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Thirteenth Year, 1911-12.* London: Church Missionary House, 1912.

*Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Fourteenth Year, 1912-13.* London: Church Missionary House, 1913.

*Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Fifteenth Year, 1913-14.* London: Church Missionary House, 1914.

*Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Sixteenth Year, 1914-15.* London: Church Missionary House, 1915.

*Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Seventeenth Year, 1915-16.* London: Church Missionary House, 1916.

*Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Eighteenth Year, 1916-17.* London: Church Missionary House, 1917.

*Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Nineteenth Year, 1917-18.* London: Church Missionary House, 1918.

*Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Twentieth Year, 1918-19.* London: Church Missionary House, 1919.

*Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Twenty-Fifth Year, 1923-24.* London: Church Missionary House, 1924.

*Proceedings of the Church Missionary Society for Africa and the East: One-Hundred-And-Twenty-Sixth Year, 1924-25.* London: Church Missionary House, 1925.

*Records of the General Conference of the Protestant Missionaries of China, held at Shanghai, May 10-24, 1877.* Shanghai: Presbyterian Mission Press, 1877.

*Records of the General Conference of the Protestant Missionaries of China, held at Shanghai, May 7-22, 1890.* Shanghai: Presbyterian Mission Press, 1890.

Ryle, J. C. *Holiness : Its Nature, Hindrances, Difficulties, and Roots.* London: William Hunt and Co., 1879.

Smith, Stanley Peregrine. *All Shall Know Me.* London & Wakefield: Nicholson & Sons, 1909.

———. *Reply Letters ... to R.F. Johnston's Letters to A Missionary.* Shanghai, 1919.

———. *The Sequel to "For God and For China."* Shanghai: Commercial Press, 1919.

———. *'The Spiritual Condition of the Heathen': A Reply to Mr. Henry W. Frost, Director of the China Inland Mission in North America.* Shanghai: Commercial Press, [n.d.].

Taylor, James Hudson. "Draft Letter of J. Hudson Taylor to H. Frost," September 29, 1903. CIM/SOAS, file 502.

———. "Letter from J. Hudson Taylor to S. Smith," September 30, 1901. CIM/SOAS, file 502.

———. "Letter from J. Hudson Taylor to Theodore Howard," January 1, 1903. CIM/SOAS, file 506.

———. "Letter from J. Hudson Taylor to W. Sharp," March 6, 1903. CIM/SOAS, file 502.

### **Secondary Sources**

Addison, James Thayer. "Chinese Ancestor-Worship and Protestant Christianity." *The Journal of Religion* 5, no.2 (March 1925): 140-149.

Anderson, Allan Heaton. *An Introduction to Pentecostalism: Global Charismatic Christianity.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014.

Anderson, Gerald H., ed. *Biographical Dictionary of Christian Missions.* New York; London: Macmillan Reference USA, 1998.

- Austin, Alwyn J. *China's Millions: The China Inland Mission and Late Qing Society, 1832-1905*. Studies in the History of Christian missions. Grand Rapids; Cambridge: W.B. Eerdmans, 2007.
- Ayandele, Emmanuel Ayankanmi. *The Missionary Impact on Modern Nigeria, 1842-1914: A Political and Social Analysis*. Ibadan History Series. London: Longmans, 1966.
- Barabas, Steven. *So Great Salvation. The History and Message of the Keswick Convention, Etc*. London, 1952.
- Barber, W. T. A., *David Hill: Missionary and Saint*. London: Charles H. Kelly, 1898.
- Barclay, Oliver R. *Whatever Happened to the Jesus Lane Lot?* Leicester: Inter-Varsity Press, 1977.
- Barclay, Oliver R., and Robert M. Horn. *From Cambridge to the World: 125 Years of Student Witness*. Leicester: Inter-Varsity, 2002.
- Barton, Cecil Edward. *John Barton: A Memoir*. London, 1910.
- Bauman, C.M. *Christian Identity and Dalit Religion in Hindu India, 1868-1947*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2008.
- Bays, Daniel H. *A New History of Christianity in China*. Blackwell Guides to Global Christianity. Chichester: Wiley-Blackwell, 2012.
- . "The Growth of Independent Christianity in China, 1900-37." In *Christianity in China: from the Eighteenth Century to the Present*, edited by Daniel H. Bays. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1996.
- Bays, Daniel H., and James H. Grayson. "Christianity in East Asia : China, Korea and Japan." In *World Christianities, c.1815-1914*, edited by Sheridan Gilley and Brian Stanley. Cambridge History of Christianity; vol. 8. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006.
- Beasley, W. G. "The Foreign Threat and the Opening of the Ports." In *The Cambridge History of Japan. Vol. 5, Nineteenth Century*, edited by Marius B. Jansen. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008.
- Bebbington, David. *Evangelicalism in Modern Britain: a history from the 1730s to the 1980s*. London: Unwin Hyman, 1993.
- . *Holiness in Nineteenth-Century England*. Didsbury lectures; 1998. Carlisle: Paternoster, 2000.
- . "Pennefather, William (1816–1873), Church of England Clergyman | Oxford

Dictionary of National Biography." Accessed February 12, 2018.  
<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/10.1093/ref:odnb/9780198614128.001.0001/odnb-9780198614128-e-21868>.

- . *The Dominance of Evangelicalism: The Age of Spurgeon and Moody*. History of Evangelicalism; vol. 3. Leicester: InterVarsity Press, 2005.
- . *Victorian Religious Revivals: Culture and Piety in Local and Global Contexts*. Oxford, [England], Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012.
- Bosch, David Jacobus. *Transforming Mission: Paradigm Shifts in Theology of Mission*. American Society of Missiology 16. Maryknoll: Orbis Books, 1991.
- Boyd, Robin H. S. *The Witness of the Student Christian Movement: "Church Ahead of the Church."* London: Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge, 2007.
- Bradley, J. E. and R. A. Muller, *Church History: An Introduction to Research, Reference Works and Methods*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1995.
- Brandt, Nat. *Massacre in Shansi*. Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 1994.
- Broomhall, A. J. *Hudson Taylor & China's Open Century: Over the Treaty Wall*. Vol. 2. London: Hodder & Stoughton and the Overseas Missionary Fellowship, 1982.
- . *Hudson Taylor & China's Open Century: If I Had a Thousand Lives*. Vol. 3. London: Hodder & Stoughton and the Overseas Missionary Fellowship, 1982.
- . *Hudson Taylor & China's Open Century: Refiner's Fire*. Vol. 5. London: Hodder & Stoughton and the Overseas Missionary Fellowship, 1985.
- . *Hudson Taylor & China's Open Century: Assault on the Nine*. Vol. 6. London: Hodder & Stoughton and the Overseas Missionary Fellowship, 1988.
- . *Hudson Taylor & China's Open Century: It Is Not Death To Die*. Vol. 7. London: Hodder & Stoughton and the Overseas Missionary Fellowship, 1989.
- Broomhall, Benjamin. *The Evangelisation of the World. A Missionary Band: A Record of Consecration, and an Appeal*. 3rd ed. London, 1889.
- Broomhall, Marshall. *W.W. Cassels, First Bishop in Western China*. London: China Inland Mission, 1926.
- Brown, Stewart J. *Providence and Empire: Religion, Politics and Society in the United Kingdom, 1815-1914*. Religion, Politics, and Society in Britain Series. Harlow: Pearson/Longman, 2008.
- Bruner, Jason. "The Cambridge Seven, Late Victorian Culture, and the Chinese

- Frontier." *Social Sciences and Missions* 27, no. 1 (2014): 7–30.
- Bullock, F. W. B. *The History of Ridley Hall, Cambridge / Vol. 1, To the End of A.D. 1907*. Cambridge: University Press for the Council of Ridley Hall, 1941.
- Burton, A. "Contesting the Zenana: The Mission to make 'Lady Doctors for India,' 1874-1885." *Journal of British Studies* 35, no. 3 (July 1996): 368-97.
- Cable, A. Mildred. *The Fulfilment of a Dream of Pastor Hsi's: The Story of the Work in Hwochow*. London: Morgan & Scott, 1917.
- Carmichael, Amy. *This One Thing: Story of Walker of Tinnevelly*. London, 1952.
- . *Walker of Tinnevelly*. London: Morgan & Scott, 1916.
- Carson, Penelope. *The East India Company and Religion, 1698-1858*. Suffolk: Boydell & Brewer, 2013.
- . "Buchanan, Claudius (1766–1815), East India Company Chaplain." In *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*. Accessed April 30, 2018.  
<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/10.1093/ref:odnb/9780198614128.001.0001/odnb-9780198614128-e-3831>.
- Carwardine, Richard. *Transatlantic Revivalism: Popular Evangelicalism in Britain and America, 1790-185*. Westport CT: Greenwood, 1978.
- Chaney, Charles L. *The Birth of Missions in America*. South Pasadena: William Carey Library, 1976.
- Coad, F. Roy. *A History of the Brethren Movement: Its Origins, Its Worldwide Development and Its Significance for the Present Day*. 2nd ed. Exeter: Paternoster Press, 1976.
- Cooke, Harriette J. *Mildmay, or, The Story of the First Deaconess Institution*. London: Elliot Stock, 1892.
- Cox, Jeffrey. *Imperial Fault Lines: Christianity and Colonial Power in India, 1818-1940*. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2002.
- . *The British Missionary Enterprise since 1700*. London: Routledge, 2008.
- Daughrity, Dyron. "A Dissonant Mission: Stephen Neill, Amy Carmichael, and Missionary Conflict in South India." *International Review of Mission* 97, no. 384-385 (2008): 103–115.
- . *Bishop Stephen Neill: From Edinburgh to South India*. New York: Peter Lang, 2008.

- Drummond, Richard Henry. *A History of Christianity in Japan*. Christian World Mission Books. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1971.
- Dyer, Helen S. *Revival in India: "Years of the Right Hand of the Most High."* London, 1907.
- Elliot, Elisabeth. *A Chance to Die: The Life and Legacy of Amy Carmichael*. Old Tappan, N.J.: F.H. Revell Co, 1987.
- Evans, Eifion. *The Welsh Revival of 1904*. London: Evangelical Press, 1969.
- Fairbank, John King, and Merle Goldman. *China: A New History*. 2nd ed. Cambridge, London: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 2006.
- Fell-Smith, Charlotte. "Barton, John (1836–1908), Missionary | Oxford Dictionary of National Biography." Accessed October 19, 2017.  
<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/10.1093/ref:odnb/9780198614128.001.0001/odnb-9780198614128-e-30631>.
- Fiedler, Klaus. *The Story of Faith Missions*. Oxford: Regnum Books International, 1994.
- Figgis, John Benjamin. *Keswick from Within*. London, New York, 1914.
- Findlay, James F. *Dwight L. Moody, American Evangelist, 1837-1899*. Chicago; London: University of Chicago Press, 1969.
- Finney, Charles. "POWER FROM ON HIGH--WHAT IS IT?" *The Independent ... Devoted to the Consideration of Politics, Social and Economic Tendencies, History, Literature, and the Arts (1848-1921)* 24, no. 1207 (1872): 1.
- Forrester, Duncan B. *Caste and Christianity: Attitudes and Policies on Caste of Anglo-Saxon Protestant Missions in India*. London and Atlantic Highlands: Curzon Press and Humanities Press, 1980.
- Frykenberg, Robert Eric. *Christianity in India: From Beginning to the Present*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008.
- Fullerton, W. Y. F. B. *Meyer: A Biography*. London; Edinburgh: Marshall, Morgan, & Scott, 1930.
- Gibbard, Noel. *Griffith John: Apostle to Central China*. Bridgend: Bryntirion, 1998.
- Gibbs, M. E. *The Anglican Church in India, 1600-1970*. Delhi: ISPCK, 1972.
- Gill, Sean. *Women and the Church of England: From the Eighteenth Century to the Present*. London: Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge, 1994.

- Gillett, David K. *Trust and Obey: Explorations in Evangelical Spirituality*. London: Darton, Longman & Todd, 1993.
- Glover, Robert H. *The Progress of World-Wide Missions*. London: J. Clarke and Co, 1925.
- Gollock, G. A. (Georgina Anne). *Eugene Stock: A Biographical Study, 1836-1928*. London: Church Missionary Society, 1929.
- Goodwin, Leigh. "The Pneumatological Motivation and Influences of the Cambridge Seven." *Journal of the European Pentecostal Theological Association* 30, no. 2 (2010): 21–38.
- Gordon, James M. *Evangelical Spirituality*. London: SPCK, 1991.
- Grass, Tim. *Gathering to His Name: The Story of the Open Brethren in Britain and Ireland*. Milton Keynes: Paternoster, 2006.
- Grubb, Norman P. *C.T. Studd: Cricketer & Pioneer*. Guildford: Lutterworth Press, 1982.
- Hamilton, Michael S. "The Interdenominational Evangelicalism of D. L. Moody and the Problem of Fundamentalism." In *American Evangelicalism: George Marsden and the State of American Religious History*, edited by Darren Dochuk, Thomas S. Kidd, and Kurt W. Peterson. Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press, 2014.
- Harford, Charles F. "Introductory Chapter." In *The Keswick Convention: Its Message, Its Method and Its Men*, edited by Charles F. Harford. London: Marshall, 1907.
- . *Pilkington of Uganda*. 2nd ed. London: Marshall Brothers, 1899.
- Harford, John Battersby. "The Keswick Mission Council." In *The Keswick Convention: Its Message, Its Method and Its Men*, edited by Charles F. Harford. London: Marshall, 1907.
- Harford, John Battersby, and Frederick C Macdonald. *Handley Carr Glyn Moule, Bishop of Durham: A Biography*. London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1922.
- Harper, Susan Billington. *In the Shadow of the Mahatma: Bishop V.S. Azariah and the Travails of Christianity in British India*. Studies in the History of Christian Missions. Grand Rapids, Michigan: Richmond: W. B. Eerdmans; Curzon Press, 2000.
- Harshananda, Swami. *All about Hindu Temples*. 2nd ed. RIMSE Series 6. Mysore: Sri Ramakrishna Ashrama, 1981.

- Head, Albert. "The Watchword of the Convention." In *The Keswick Convention: Its Message, Its Method and Its Men*, edited by Charles F. Harford. London: Marshall, 1907.
- Heasman, Kathleen. *Evangelicals in Action: An Appraisal of their Social Work in the Victorian Era*. London: Geoffrey Bles, 1962.
- Heath, Elaine A. "The Quest for Holiness." In *The Oxford Handbook of Methodist Studies*, edited by W. J. Abraham and James E. Kirby. Oxford: OUP, 2009.
- Hill, Myrtle. "Carmichael, Amy Beatrice (1867–1951)." In *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*. Accessed September 1, 2016.  
<http://www.oxforddnb.com.ezproxy.is.ed.ac.uk/view/10.1093/ref:odnb/9780198614128.001.0001/odnb-9780198614128-e-59081?rskey=VXeh8Q&result=1>.
- Hopkins, Mark. *Nonconformity's Romantic Generation: Evangelical and Liberal Theologies in Victorian England*. Carlisle: Paternoster Press, 2004.
- Houghton, Frank. *Amy Carmichael of Dohnavur: The Story of a Lover and Her Beloved*. London: SPCK, 1981.
- Hudson, D. D. *Protestant Origins in India: Tamil Evangelical Christians, 1706-1835*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2000.
- Johnson, Douglas. *Contending for the Faith: A History of the Evangelical Movement in the Universities and Colleges*. Leicester: Inter-Varsity Press, 1979.
- Kay, Peter. "The Pentecostal Missionary Union and the Fourfold Gospel with Baptism in the Holy Spirit and Speaking in Tongues: A New Power for Missions?" *Journal of the European Pentecostal Theological Association* 19, no.1 (1999): 89-104.
- Kent, Eliza F. *Converting Women: Gender and Protestant Christianity in Colonial South India*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004.
- Kent, John. *Holding the Fort: Studies in Victorian Revivalism*. London: Epworth Press, 1978.
- Larsen, Timothy, ed. *Biographical Dictionary of Evangelicals*. Leicester; Downers Grove, Ill.: InterVarsity Press, 2003.
- Latourette, Kenneth Scott. *A History of Christian Missions in China*. London, 1929.
- . *The Great Century, A.D. 1800 - A.D. 1914 in Europe and the United States of America*. History of the Expansion of Christianity; v.4. London; New York: Harper, 1941.

- . *The Great Century in Northern Africa and Asia, A.D. 1800-A.D. 1914*. History of the Expansion of Christianity; v.6. London: Harper, 1944.
- Loane, Marcus L. *Handley Carr Glyn Moule 1841-1920*. Great Churchmen no. 1. London: Church Book Room Press, 1947.
- Lutz, J. G. and R. R. Lutz. "Karl Gutzlaff's Approach to Indigenization: The Chinese Union." In *Christianity in China – From the Eighteenth Century to the Present*, edited by Daniel H. Bays. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1996.
- Marsden, George M. *Fundamentalism and American Culture: The Shaping of Twentieth-Century Evangelicalism, 1870-1925*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1980.
- . *Understanding Fundamentalism and Evangelicalism*. Grand Rapids: W. B. Eerdmans, 1991.
- Marwick, Arthur. *The Nature of History*. Basingstoke: Macmillan, 1989.
- Maughan, Steven S. *Mighty England Do Good: Culture, Faith, Empire, and World in the Foreign Missions of the Church of England, 1850-1915*. Studies in the History of Christian Missions. Grand Rapids, Michigan; Cambridge: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 2014.
- Maxwell, Ian Douglas. "Civilization or Christianity? The Scottish Debate on Mission Methods, 1750-1835." In *Christian Missions and the Enlightenment*, edited by Brian Stanley. Studies in the History of Christian missions. Grand Rapids; Cambridge: W.B. Eerdmans Pub; Curzon Press, 2001.
- McCarthy, Annie. "Agency and Salvation in Christian Child Rescue in Colonial India: Preena and Amy Carmichael." In *Divine Domesticities: Christian Paradoxes in Asia and the Pacific*, edited by Hyaeweol Choi and Margaret Jolly. Canberra: ANU Press, 2014.
- McQuilkin, J. Robertson. "The Keswick Perspective." In *Five Views of Sanctification*, edited by Stanley N. Gundry. Michigan: Zondervan, 1947.
- Meek, Donald E. "Scottish Highlanders, North American Indians, and the SSPCK: Some Cultural Perspectives." In *Records of the Scottish Church History Society* 23, part 3 (1989): 387-96.
- Mitter, Rana. *Modern China: A Very Short Introduction*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008.
- Moffett, Samuel H. *A History of Christianity in Asia*. 2nd ed. Vol. 2. American Society of Missiology Series; no. 36. Maryknoll: Orbis Books, 2005.

- Moule, H. C. G. (Handley Carr Glyn). *Outlines of Christian Doctrine*. London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1889.
- . *The Epistle of St. Paul to the Romans*. Expositor's Bible. London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1894.
- . *The Evangelical School in the Church of England: Its Men and Its Work in the Nineteenth Century*. London: James Nisbet, 1901.
- . "The Message: Its Scriptural Character." In *The Keswick Convention: Its Message, Its Method and Its Men*, edited by Charles F. Harford. London: Marshall, 1907.
- . *Thoughts on Christian Sanctity*. London, 1885.
- Murray, Iain Hamish. *Amy Carmichael: Beauty for Ashes: A Biography*. Edinburgh: The Banner of Truth Trust, 2015.
- Murray, Jocelyn. "The Role of Women in the Church Missionary Society, 1799-1917." In *The Church Missionary Society and World Christianity, 1799-1999*, edited by K. Ward and Brian Stanley. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2000.
- Naselli, Andrew David. *Let Go and Let God? A Survey and Analysis of Keswick Theology*. Lexham Press, 2010.
- Neill, Stephen. *A History of Christian Missions*. Pelican History of the Church; Vol. 6. Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1986.
- . *A History of Christianity in India: 1707–1858*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1985.
- . *God's Apprentice: The Autobiography of Stephen Neill*, edited by E. M. Jackson. London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1991.
- Nevius, J. *Methods of Mission Work*. Shanghai: Presbyterian Press, 1886.
- Oddie, G. A. *Social Protest in India: British Protestant Missionaries and Social Reforms 1850-1900*. New Delhi: Manohar, 1979.
- Orr, J. Edwin. *The Fervent Prayer: The Worldwide Impact of the Great Awakening of 1858*. Chicago: Moody Press, 1974.
- Packer, J. I. *Keep in Step with the Spirit: Finding Fullness in Our Walk with God*. New expanded ed. Leicester: Inter-Varsity, 2005.
- . "'Keswick' and the Reformed Doctrine of Sanctification." *The Evangelical Quarterly* 27, no. 3 (July 1955): 153–167.

- Parker, Michael. *The Kingdom of Character: The Student Volunteer Movement for Foreign Missions (1886-1926)*. Lanham: University Press of America, 1998.
- Pfister, Lauren F. "Rethinking Mission in China: James Hudson Taylor and Timothy Richard." In *The Imperial Horizons of British Protestant Missions, 1880-1914*, edited by Andrew Porter. Grand Rapids: WmB. Eerdmans, 2003.
- Platt, William James. *Three Women: Mildred Cable, Francesca French [and] Evangeline French*. London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1964.
- Pollock, John. *A Cambridge Movement*. London: Murray, 1953.
- . *The Cambridge Seven: The True Story of Ordinary Men Used in No Ordinary Way*. History Makers. Fearn: Christian Focus, 2006.
- . *The Keswick Story. The Authorized History of the Keswick Convention*. London, 1964.
- Porter, Andrew. "Cambridge, Keswick, and Late-Nineteenth-Century Attitudes to Africa." *The Journal of Imperial and Commonwealth History* 5, no. 1 (1976): 5–34.
- . "Changing People, Changing Places." *International Review of Mission* 88, no. 351 (2009): 390-98.
- . "Evangelical Enthusiasm, Missionary Motivation and West Africa in the Late Nineteenth Century: The Career of G. W. Brooke." *The Journal of Imperial and Commonwealth History* 6, no. 1 (1977): 23–46.
- . *Religion Versus Empire?: British Protestant Missionaries and Overseas Expansion, 1700-1914*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2004.
- Price, Charles W., and Ian M. Randall. *Transforming Keswick: The Keswick Convention Past, Present & Future*. Carlisle: OM Publishing, 2000.
- Pudaite, Jonathan. *The Legacy of Watkin Roberts*. Meghalaya: Partnership Publishing House, 2009.
- Pui-Lan, Kwok. "Chinese Women and Protestant Christianity at the turn of the twentieth century." In *Christianity in China: From the eighteenth century to the present*, edited by Daniel H. Bays. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1996.
- Randall, Ian M. "Spiritual Renewal and Social Reform: Attempt to Develop Social Awareness in the Early Keswick Movement." *Vox Evangelica* 23 (1993): 67–86.

- . *Spirituality and Social Change: The Contribution of F. B. Meyer (1847-1929)*. Cumbria: Paternoster Press, 2003.
- . *What A Friend We Have in Jesus: The Evangelical Tradition*. Traditions of Christian Spirituality. London: Darton Longman & Todd, 2005.
- Richter, Julius. *A History of Missions in India*. Translated by Sydney H. Moore. Edinburgh: Oliphant Anderson & Ferrier, 1908.
- Robbins, Nancy. *Not Forgetting to Sing*. London: Hodder and Stoughton, 197.
- Robert, Dana L. *American Women in Mission: A Social History of their Thought and Practice*. Georgia: Mercer University Press, 1997.
- . *Occupy Until I Come: A. T. Pierson and the Evangelization of the World*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 2003.
- . ““The Crisis of Missions”: Premillennial Mission Theory and the Origins of Independent Evangelical Missions.” In *Earthen Vessels: American Evangelicals and Foreign Missions, 1880-1980*, edited by Joel A. Carpenter and Wilbert R. Shenk. Oregon: Wipf & Stock, 1990.
- Ross, A. “The Scottish Missionary Doctor.” In *The Influence of Scottish Medicine: an historical assessment of its international impact*, edited by Derek A. Dow. Carnforth: Parthenon, 1988.
- Rowell, Geoffrey. *Hell and the Victorians: A Study of the Nineteenth-Century Theological Controversies Concerning Eternal Punishment and the Future Life*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1974.
- Sarasvati, Ramabai, and Shamsundar Manohar Adhav. *Pandita Ramabai*. Confessing the Faith in India Series; no. 13. Madras: Christian Literature Society for the Christian Institute for the Study of Religion and Society, 1979.
- Sell, A. P. F. *Defending and Declaring the Faith: Some Scottish Examples, 1860-1920*. Exeter: Paternoster Press, 1987.
- Semple, Rhonda Anne. *Missionary Women: Gender, Professionalism, and the Victorian idea of Christian Mission*. Woodbridge, Suffolk: Boydell Press, 2003.
- Shaw, Ian J. *Churches, Revolutions, and Empires: 1789-1914*. Fearn: Christian Focus, 2012.
- Shenk, Wilbert R. “Claudius Buchanan 1766-1815: Laying the Foundation for an Indian Church.” In *Mission Legacies: Biographical Studies of Leaders of the Modern Missionary Movement*, edited by Gerald H. Anderson, Robert T.

- Coole, Norman A. Horner, and James M. Phillips. *American Society of Missiology Series; no. 19.* Maryknoll: Orbis Books, 1994.
- Sloan, Walter B. *These Sixty Years: The Story of the Keswick Convention.* London: Pickering & Inglis, 1934.
- Smith, George. *The Conversion of India: From Pantaeus to the Present Time, A.D. 193-1893.* London: John Murray, 1893.
- Soejana, Koernia Atje, Budi Subanar, Alle G. Hoekema, Raymundus I Made Sudhiarsa, and Karel A. Steenbrink. "Christianity in Javanese Culture and Society." In *A History of Christianity in Indonesia*, edited by Jan S. Aritonang and Karel A. Steenbrink. *Studies in Christian mission; v. 35.* Leiden, Boston: Brill, 2008.
- Soleiman, Yusak, and Karel Steenbrink. "Chinese Christian Communities in Indonesia." In *A History of Christianity in Indonesia*, edited by Jan S. Aritonang and Karel Steenbrink. *Studies in Christian mission; v. 35.* Leiden, Boston: Brill, 2008.
- Soneji, Davesh. *Unfinished Gestures: Devadasis, Memory, and Modernity in South India.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2011.
- Stanley, Brian. "Anglican Missionary Societies and Agencies in the Nineteenth Century." In *The Oxford History of Anglicanism. Volume III: Partisan Anglicanism and its Global Expansion 1829-c.1914*, edited by Rowan Strong. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2017.
- . *Christianity in the Twentieth-Century: A World History.* Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2018.
- . "Christianity and Civilization in English Evangelical Mission Thought, 1792-1857." In *Christian Missions and the Enlightenment*, edited by Brian Stanley. *Studies in the History of Christian missions.* Grand Rapids; Cambridge: W.B. Eerdmans Pub; Curzon Press, 2001.
- . "The Future in the Past: Eschatological Vision in Britain and American Protestant Missionary History." *Tyndale Bulletin* 51 (2000): 101-20.
- . "Hunting for Souls: the Missionary Pilgrimage of George Sherwood Eddy." In *Missions and Missionaries*, edited by Pieter Holtrop and Hugh McLeod. *Studies in Church History Subsidia* 13, 2000.
- . *The Bible and the Flag: Protestant Missions and British Imperialism in the Nineteenth and Twentieth centuries.* Leicester: Apollos, 1990.
- . *The History of the Baptist Missionary Society, 1792-1992.* Edinburgh: T&T

- Clark, 1992.
- Stock, Eugene. *One Hundred Years: Being the Short History of the Church Missionary Society*. London: The Church Missionary Society, 1898.
- . *The History of the Church Missionary Society: Its Environment, Its Men and Its Work*. Vol. I. London: The Church Missionary Society, 1899.
- . *The History of the Church Missionary Society: Its Environment, Its Men and Its Work*. Vol. II. London: The Church Missionary Society, 1899.
- . *The History of the Church Missionary Society: Its Environment, Its Men and Its Work*. Vol. III. London: The Church Missionary Society, 1899.
- . *The History of the Church Missionary Society: Its Environment, Its Men and Its Work*. Vol. IV. London: The Church Missionary Society, 1899.
- . “The Missionary Element.” In *The Keswick Convention: Its Message, Its Method and Its Men*, edited by Charles F. Harford. London: Marshall, 1907.
- Stunt, Timothy C. F. “Darby, John Nelson (1800–1882), Member of the so-Called (Plymouth) Brethren | Oxford Dictionary of National Biography.” Accessed May 4, 2018.  
<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/10.1093/ref:odnb/9780198614128.001.0001/odnb-9780198614128-e-7141>.
- Sweeten, A. R. “Catholic Converts in Jiangxi Province: Conflict and Accommodation, 1860-1900.” In *Christianity in China: From the Eighteenth Century to the Present*, edited by Daniel H. Bays. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1996.
- Symonds, Septimus, and James Thomason Lang. *One Hundred Years: A Short History of the Cambridge Association of the Church Missionary Society, 1818-1918*. Cambridge: Cambridge, 1918.
- Tatlow, Tissington. *The Story of the Student Christian Movement of Great Britain and Ireland*. London: Student Christian Movement Press, 1933.
- Taylor, Dr Howard, and Mrs Howard Taylor. *Hudson Taylor and the China Inland Mission: The Growth of a Work of God*. London: Morgan & Scott, 1918.
- Taylor, Mrs. Howard. *Guinness of Honan*. London: China Inland Mission, 1930.
- . *Pastor Hsi: One of China’s Christians*. London: Morgan & Scott, 1905.
- Thomas, W. H. Griffith. “The Literature of Keswick.” In *The Keswick Convention: Its Message, Its Method and Its Men*, edited by Charles F. Harford. London: Marshall, 1907.

- Thompson, Phyllis. *D.E. Hoste: "A Prince with God" : Hudson Taylor's Successor as General Director of the China Inland Mission 1900-1935*. London: China Inland Mission, 1947.
- Tonge, E. M. *Fanny Jane Butler: Pioneer Medical Missionary*. London: Church of England Zenana Missionary Society, 1930.
- Tucker, Ruth A. "Unbecoming Ladies." *Christian History* no. 52, 1996.
- Van Die, Marguerite. "Palmer [Née Worrall], Phoebe (1807–1874), Methodist Episcopal Evangelist and Exponent of Holiness | Oxford Dictionary of National Biography." Accessed May 26, 2018.  
<http://www.oxforddnb.com/view/10.1093/ref:odnb/9780198614128.001.001/odnb-9780198614128-e-47031>.
- Vincent, Eileen. *No Sacrifice Too Great*. 2nd rev. ed. Gerrards Cross : Bromley: WEC Pubns.; OM Pub, 1992.
- Walls, Andrew F. *The Cross-Cultural Process in Christian History: Studies in the Transmission and Appropriation of Faith*. Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 2002.
- Webster, J. B. *The African Churches among the Yoruba, 1888-1922*. Oxford Studies in African Affairs. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1964.
- Wesley, John. "A Plain Account of Christian Perfection." In *John and Charles Wesley: Selected Prayers, Hymns, Journal Notes, Sermons, Letters and Treatises*, edited by Frank Whaling. Classics of Western spirituality. London: SPCK, 1981.
- White, Charles. *The Beauty of Holiness: Phoebe Palmer as Theologian, Revivalist, Feminist and Humanitarian*. Grand Rapids: Francis Asbury Press, 1986.
- Wigram, Christopher E. M. *The Bible and Mission in Faith Perspective: J. Hudson Taylor and the Early China Inland Mission*. Zoetermeer: Uitgevers Boekencentrum, 2007.
- Wilkinson, John T. "The Rise of Other Methodist Traditions." In *A History of the Methodist Church in Great Britain*, edited by Rupert Davies, A. Raymond George, and Gordon Rupp. Vol. II. London: Epworth Press, 1978.
- Williams, C. Peter. "From Church to Mission: An Examination of the Official Missionary Strategy of the Church Missionary Society on the Niger, 1887-93." In *Voluntary Religion: Papers Read at the 1985 Summer Meeting and the 1986 Winter Meeting of the Ecclesiastical History Society*, edited by W. J. Sheils and Diana Wood. Studies in Church History; 23. Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1986.

———. *The Ideal of the Self-Governing Church: A Study in Victorian Missionary Strategy*. Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1990.

———. “‘The Missing Link’: The Recruitment of Women Missionaries in some English Evangelical Missionary Societies in the Nineteenth Century.” In *Women and Missions: Past and Present: anthropological and historical perceptions*, edited by Fiona Bowie, Deborah Kirkwood, Shirley Ardener. Oxford: Berg, 1993.

Wright, Mary Clabaugh, ed. *China in Revolution: The First Phase 1900-1913*. New Haven: Yale UP, 1968.

Yao, Kevin Xiyi. *The Fundamentalist Movement among Protestant Missionaries in China, 1920-1937*. Lanham; Oxford: University Press of America, 2003.

#### **Unpublished Dissertations:**

Arles, Narlini. “Pandita Ramabai and Amy Carmichael: a Study of their Contribution towards Transforming the Position of Indian Women. MTh thesis, University of Edinburgh, 1985.

Lee, Cheul Hee. “Sanctification by Faith: Walter Marshall’s Doctrine of Sanctification in Comparison with the Keswick View of Sanctification.” PhD diss, Westminster Theological Seminary, 2005.

McColl, J. A. “Imagining the Missionary Hero: Juvenile Missionary Biographies, c.1870-1917.” PhD diss, University of Liverpool, 2017.

McKay, Moira. “Faith and Facts in the History of the China Inland Mission, 1832-1905.” MLitt thesis, University of Aberdeen, 1981.

Peterson, Mikeuel Eugene. “‘Led by the Holy Spirit’: The Missionary Career, Leadership, Thought, and Influence of Alice Eveline Luce.” D.Miss. diss., Asbury Theological Seminary, 2009.

Reeve, James. “Holiness and the Holy Spirit in the Thought of Charles G. Finney.” PhD diss, Fuller Theological Seminary, 1990.

Stanley, Brian. “Home Support for Overseas Missions in Early Victorian England, c.1838-1873.” PhD thesis, University of Cambridge, 1979.

Tian, Jing. “Evangelism and Feminism in China’s Northwest: The Double Identities of Mildred Cable, Evangeline French and Francesca French.” Master Thesis, University of Alberta, 2008.

Usher, John Martin. “‘For China and Tibet, and for World-Wide Revival’ Cecil Henry

Polhill (1860-1938) and His Significance for Early Pentecostalism.” PhD diss., University of Birmingham, 2015.